



Legislation Details (With Text)

**File #:** Res 0191-2024    **Version:** A    **Name:** To prohibit prosecutors from using creative expression as evidence against a criminal defendant without clear and convincing proof that there is a literal, factual nexus between the creative expression and the facts of the case (A. 127/S. 1738).

**Type:** Resolution    **Status:** Laid Over in Committee  
**In control:** Committee on Public Safety

**On agenda:** 2/28/2024

**Enactment date:**    **Enactment #:**

**Title:** Resolution calling on the State Legislature to pass, and the Governor to sign, A. 127/S. 1738, to prohibit prosecutors from using creative expression as evidence against a criminal defendant without clear and convincing proof that there is a literal, factual nexus between the creative expression and the facts of the case

**Sponsors:** Nantasha M. Williams, Althea V. Stevens, Yusef Salaam, Shahana K. Hanif, Julie Menin, Sandy Nurse, Erik D. Bottcher, Kevin C. Riley, Carlina Rivera, Shaun Abreu, Amanda Farías, Carmen N. De La Rosa, Alexa Avilés, Shekar Krishnan, Pierina Ana Sanchez, Tiffany Cabán, Crystal Hudson, Julie Won, Chris Banks, Sandra Ung, Selvena N. Brooks-Powers

**Indexes:**

**Attachments:** 1. Res. No. 191, 2. February 28, 2024 - Stated Meeting Agenda, 3. Hearing Transcript - Stated Meeting 2-28-24, 4. Proposed Res. No. 191-A, 5. Committee Report 5/1/24, 6. Hearing Testimony 5/1/24, 7. Hearing Transcript 5/1/24, 8. Minutes of the Stated Meeting - February 28, 2024

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
2/28/2024	*	City Council	Introduced by Council	
2/28/2024	*	City Council	Referred to Comm by Council	
5/1/2024	*	Committee on Public Safety	Hearing Held by Committee	
5/1/2024	*	Committee on Public Safety	Laid Over by Committee	
5/1/2024	*	Committee on Public Safety	Amendment Proposed by Comm	

Proposed Res. No. 191-A

Resolution calling on the State Legislature to pass, and the Governor to sign, A. 127/S. 1738, to prohibit prosecutors from using creative expression as evidence against a criminal defendant without clear and convincing proof that there is a literal, factual nexus between the creative expression and the facts of the case

By Council Members Williams, Stevens, Salaam, Hanif, Menin, Nurse, Bottcher, Riley, Rivera, Abreu, Farías, De La Rosa, Avilés, Krishnan, Sanchez, Cabán, Hudson, Won, Banks, Ung and Brooks-Powers

Whereas, A. 127, introduced by Assembly Member Catalina Cruz and pending in the New York State Assembly, and companion bill S. 1738, introduced by State Senator Brad Hoylman and pending in the New York State Senate, seek to amend the Criminal Procedure Law by prohibiting prosecutors from using creative

expression as evidence against a criminal defendant without clear and convincing proof that there is a literal and factual nexus between the creative expression and the facts of the case, in an effort to protect freedom of expression in New York State; and

Whereas, Article I, Section 8 of the New York State Constitution protects the right to freely express oneself, whether through speaking, writing or other creative outlets, enhancing protection of free expression guaranteed in the First Amendment of the United States Constitution; and

Whereas, According to the New York State Court of Appeals, New York State is “a cultural center for the Nation” that has “long provided a hospitable climate for the free exchange of ideas”; and

Whereas, In criminal proceedings in the United States, courts have perpetrated a disturbing trend of admitting creative expression into evidence as proof of wrongdoing; and

Whereas, Admitting creative expression into evidence to convict criminal defendants has a chilling effect on fundamental rights which the Federal and New York State Constitutions safeguard, and exacerbates bias against black and brown defendants who exercise their rights in particular forms of expression, like rap music, that are the subject of discriminatory associations linking black and brown people with criminal conduct; and

Whereas, Standards for the admissibility of evidence in New York State criminal proceedings do not adequately protect a defendant’s creative expression from being used against them; and

Whereas, An enhanced standard demanding clear and convincing proof that creative expression has a literal and factual nexus to the facts of the case would provide stronger protection of fundamental rights and would mitigate the risk such evidence poses for exacerbating racial biases that judges and juries show against black and brown criminal defendants, especially; now, therefore, be it

Resolved, That the Council of the City of New York calls on the State Legislature to pass, and the Governor to sign, A. 127/S. 1738, to prohibit prosecutors from using creative expression as evidence against a criminal defendant without clear and convincing proof that there is a literal, factual nexus between the creative

expression and the facts of the case.

Session 13  
LS #7182  
01/17/2024

Session 12  
LS #7182  
3/15/22  
NC