

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING
AND FRANCHISES

----- X

October 12, 2021
Start: 10:08 a.m.
Recess: 4:31 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING - VIRTUAL ROOM 1

B E F O R E: Francisco P. Moya,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Diana Ayala
- Joseph C. Borelli
- Barry S. Grodenchik
- Brad S. Lander
- Stephen T. Levin
- Keith Powers
- Antonio Reynoso
- Carlina Rivera

A P P E A R A N C E S

Zachary Bernstein
Fried Frank, Land Use Counsel to Boston
Properties

Richard Monopoli
Head of Development for the New York Region for
Boston Properties

Robert Paley
Director of Transit Oriented Development at the
MTA

Andrew Cleary
KPF Architects

Wesley O'Brien
Special Counsel, Fried Frank

Allan Zepeda
Boston Properties

Lisa Friedman
Boston Properties

Marissa Williams
Representative of 32BJ SCIU

Santos Rodriguez
Testifying on behalf of Gary LaBarbera, President
of the Building and Construction Trades Council
of Greater New York

Felicia Park-Rogers
Director of Regional Infrastructure Projects for
Tristate Transportation Campaign

Lisa Orrantia
Land Use Counsel from Akerman LLP on behalf of
the applicant 824 Metropolitan Avenue

Frank Lang
Director of Housing for St. Nicks Alliance

Jonathan Keller
Senior Planner in the Brooklyn Office of
Department of City Planning

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Alicia West

DEP's Director of Public Design Outreach

Winston Von Engel

Director of the Brooklyn Borough Office of the
NYC Department of City Planning

Ziggy Gollan(SP?)

Department of City Planning

Angela Licata

Deputy Commissioner of Sustainability at New York
City Department of Environmental Protection

Michael DeLoach

Deputy Commissioner, Public Affairs at New York
City Department of Environmental Protection

Kevin Clarke

Portfolio Manager at New York City Department of
Environmental Protection

Mark McEntire

Department of Environmental Protection

Ahmed Tigani

Deputy Commissioner at New York City Department
of Housing and Preservation and Development

Nicholas Molinari

Chief of Planning and Neighborhood Development
for the New York City Department of Parks and
Recreation

Andrea Parker

Executive Director of Gowanus Canal Conservancy

Lynn Neuman

Member of the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for
Justice

David Kutz

President of Arts Gowanus

Johnny Thornton

Executive Director of Arts Gowanus

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Andrew Foley
Associate Director of Development at Jonathan
Rose Companies

Aaron Koffman
Managing Principle of the Hudson Companies

David Yudelson
New York Lawyer of Environmental and Land Use
Matters

Charlie McGuckin
Professional Engineer with Roux Environmental
Engineering

Amy Motzny
Watershed Senior Planner for Gowanus Canal
Conservancy

Karen Blondel
Founding Organizer with the Gowanus Neighborhood
Coalition for Justice

Martin Bisi
Owner of Bisi's Studio and Old American Can
Factory

Brad Vogel
Resident of Gowanus and as a Member of Voice of
Gowanus Community Coalition

Ben Margolis
Executive Director of SBIDC

Diana Reyna
Working as an Advisor to support a development
team of the Old American Can Factory

Sandy Hornick
Zoning and Land Use Consultant working with the
Old American Can Factory

Ariel Krasnow
Architect and Urban Designer

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Mostafal Bey(SP?)
Proud Member of the Gowanus Neighborhood
Coalition of Justice

Sabina Ranowski(SP?)
Proud Member of the Gowanus Neighborhood
Coalition for Justice

Marquez Reagan
Proud Member of the Gowanus Neighborhood
Coalition for Justice

Ejaz El Nualbun(SP?)
Proud Member of the Gowanus Neighborhood
Coalition for Justice

Renzo Ramirez
Union 32BJ

Ralph Osorio
Union 32BJ SCIU

Ledell York
Union 32BJ

Tom Devaney
Municipal Arts Society

Ken Baer
In Opposition to the Gowanus Rezoning

Miranda Sielaff
In Opposition to the Gowanus Neighborhood
Rezoning

Winslow Dennis
In opposition of Gowanus rezoning

Valerie Fenimore(SP?)
In opposition of Gowanus rezoning

Lori Raphael
Senior Vice President with the Brooklyn Chamber
of Commerce

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

1 Joseph Sutkowi
2 Waterfront Design Associate Director at the
3 Waterfront Alliance

4 William Thomas
5 In support of the rezoning of Gowanus as the
6 Executive Director of Open New York

7 John Tritt
8 Deputy Political Director for Service Employees
International Union Local 32BJ

9 Lucy Koteen
10 New York City Sierra Club Group

11 Tom Oesau
12 Naturally Occurring Cultural Districts New York
and Arts and Democracy

13 Chrissy Remein
14 River Keepers, Hudson River Watershed Project
Manager

15 Jack Riccobono
16 Member of Voice of Gowanus

17 Madelaine Britt
18 Policy Analyst at Citizens Housing and Planning
Council

19 Douglas Hanau
20 Lived in Community Board Six and Council District
39 for 23 years

21 Sarah Jean Avery
22 Member of the Parks Club City Council

23 Toby Hyde
24 Proud Resident of CB6 and in agreement of the
Gowanus rezoning

25 Andie Corso
Proud Member of GNCJ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

1
2
3 Emily Chiavelli
4 Artist and Events and Programs Coordinator for
5 Arts Gowanus

6 Myra Gonzalez
7 In opposition of the Gowanus rezoning

8 Ira Lichtiger
9 Principal of the Bluestone Organization

10 Brendan Cheney
11 Director of Policy and Communications at the New
12 York Housing Conference

13 Ahmed Elrawi
14 Mechanical Engineer

15 Rachel Cohen
16 VOREA Construction Company

17 Jo Anne Simon
18 Assembly Member

19 Sandye Renz
20 Lived in Gowanus for over 30 years

21 John Goldman
22 Testifying for Cynthia Simmons

23 Linda La Violette
24 Resident and Member of the Community Advisory
25 Group to the EPA and a Member of Voice of Gowanus

Diana Gruberg
Landscape Director of Gowanus Canal Conservancy

Harrison Grinnan
Resident of Greenpoint and in support of rezoning

Jim Bushong
Architect and in favor of rezoning

Austin Celestin
Student at MYU

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Denny Salas

In support of the rezoning

Chris Rio

Super on a building on Dean Street

Todd Fine

In opposition of the rezoning

Tamara Staples

Lives in the Gowanus area and also has a studio
in Gowanus

Joan Salome-Rodriguez

In opposition of the rezoning

Jay Marcus

Development team for the Gowanus Green Project

Lee Altman

CB6 Resident

CB6 Resident and works along the banks of the
Gowanus as an Architecture and Urban Design
Professor

Brady Meixell (Speaking on behalf of Jesse
Solomon)

Development Specialist of the Southwest Brooklyn
Industrial Development Corporation

Joseph Alexiou

Journalist and a New York City Tour Guide

Sasha Chavchavadze

Long Time Member of the Gowanus Artist Community

Casey Dillenburg (SP?)

Manager of 413 Bond Street LLC

Sue Wolfe

President of the Friends of Thomas Green Park

Debbie Stoller

Resident of Gowanus

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONT.)

Renee Monroe
Member of Broadway Residents Coalition in SoHo

Andrew Cichon

Victoria Cambranes
Lives in Greenpoint and family were victims of
the 2005 Greenpoint rezoning

Seth Hillinger
Resident of Carroll Gardens

George Fiala
Publishes Red Hook Star-Revue

Bora Lee
Chief of Staff at Fifth Avenue Committee

Nydia Velazquez
Congresswoman

Victoria Hillstom
In opposition of the rezoning

Zeke Luger
I'm a Queens Resident and a Statistics Major at
Queens College

1 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Live stream Chair. I will
2 tell the Sergeant recordings.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it.

5 SERGEANT MARTINEZ: PC recording is under way.

6 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Cloud is started. Sergeant
7 Biondo, could you give the opening?

8 SERGEANT PEREZ: Backup is rolling.

9 SERGEANT BIONDO: Good morning and welcome to
10 today's Remote New York City Council Hearing for the
11 Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. At this time,
12 would all panelists please turn on their video for
13 verification purposes.

14 To minimize disruptions, we ask you to please
15 place all electronic devices to vibrate or silent
16 mode. If you would like to submit testimony, please
17 send via email to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.
18 Again, that is landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.
19 Thank you for your cooperation, Chair Moya we are
20 ready to begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Good morning, I am
22 Council Member Francisco Moya, Chair of the
23 Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I am joined
24 remotely today by Council Members Ayala, Grodenchik,
25 Powers, and Borelli.

1
2 Today, we will hold public hearings on 343
3 Madison Avenue Proposal relating to property in
4 Manhattan. The 824 Metropolitan Avenue Rezoning
5 relating to property located in Brooklyn and the
6 Gowanus Neighborhood Plan in Gowanus Canal CSO
7 facilities Actions both relating to property in
8 Brooklyn. But first, we will vote on a number of
9 items heard by the Subcommittee at our September 24th
10 and October 5th meetings. Please note that the LU
11 Numbers 842, 843 and 844 on today's agenda for the
12 River North Proposal as well as the LU's 859 and 860
13 for the 270 Nostrand Avenue Proposal as well as LU's
14 854, 855, 856, for the Eleventh Avenue Proposal are
15 also being laid over.

16 We will vote to approve LU's -

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yes.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Excuse me. We should also be
20 laying over 861 and 862.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm sorry, and 861 and 862 and
22 we will vote to approve LU's 852, 853 for the 62-04
23 Roosevelt Avenue Rezoning relating to property in
24 Council Member Van Bramer's district in Queens. The
25 proposal seeks a Zoning Map Amendment to change the

1
2 R6 and R6 C1-4 District to a C4-4 District and a
3 related Zoning Text Amendment to establishing a
4 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing area utilizing Option
5 One and Two.

6 Council Member Van Bramer is in support of the
7 Proposal. We will vote to approve LU Numbers 854,
8 855, 856, sorry. Sorry about that, we're
9 straightening out that paragraph for the Eleventh
10 Avenue.

11 We will also vote to approve LU's Number 857, 858
12 for the 252 Victory Boulevard Rezoning Proposal
13 relating to property in Council Member Rose's
14 District in Staten Island. The Proposal seeks a
15 Zoning Map Amendment to change the existing R3-2, R3X
16 District to a mixed of R3-2 and R6B Districts with
17 partial C1-3 overlays and a related Zoning Text
18 Amendment to establish an MIH area utilizing Option
19 One and Option Two. Council Member Rose is in
20 support of the Proposal.

21 We will vote approve LU Numbers 861, 862 for the
22 1776 48th Street Rezoning Proposal relating to
23 property in Council Member –

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair?

25 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yes.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry, that's - that
3 paragraph should be struck.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: My apologies. Uhm -

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: 863 will be the next one.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: 863. We will vote to approve
7 LU Numbers 863 for the 48-18 Van Dam Teamsters
8 Rezoning relating to property in Council Member Van
9 Bramer's District in Queens. The Proposal seeks a
10 Zoning Map Amendment to change the M2-1 District to
11 an M1-5 District. Council Member Van Bramer is in
12 support of the Proposal.

13 We will vote to preconsider LU's Number 879 and
14 880 for the Broadway and 11th Street Rezoning
15 relating to property in Council Member Van Bramer's
16 District in Queens. The Proposal seeks a Zoning Map
17 Amendment to change an R5 District to a Special Mixed
18 Use District as MX-23 pairing an R7A District with an
19 M1-4 District and a related Zoning Text Amendment to
20 establish a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing area,
21 utilizing Option One.

22 Council Member Van Bramer is in support of the
23 Proposal and finally, we will vote to approve LU's
24 Number 875, 876, 877, 878, for the 130 St. Felix
25 Street Rezoning relating to property in Majority

1
2 Leader Cumbo's District in Brooklyn. The Proposal
3 seeks a Zoning Map Amendment to change an existing
4 C6-1 District to the Special Downtown Brooklyn
5 District to a C6-4 and C6-6 District. A related
6 Zoning Text Amendment to establish an MIH area
7 utilizing Option One and the Workforce Option. A
8 Special Permit to Modify Various Bulk Requirements
9 and another Special Permit to waive Accessory Off
10 Street Parking Requirements. Majority Leader Cumbo
11 is in support of this District.

12 And I now call for a vote to approve LU's 852,
13 853, 856, 858, 863, Preconsidered LU's 879 and 880
14 and LU's 875 through 878. Counsel, if you could
15 please call the roll.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I just want to offer a
17 minor correction. You said 856. We are not voting
18 on 856, we are voting on 857. That's just a -

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm sorry, 857, okay.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, on a vote of the Land
21 Use items. Chair Moya?

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I vote aye on all.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Grodenchik?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Ayala?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Borelli?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Moya, the vote is currently five in the affirmative, zero in the negative with no abstentions. We will keep the vote open for a period of time.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you and now, before we begin with our hearings, I will recognize the Subcommittee Counsel to review the Remote Meeting Procedures.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Moya. I am Arthur Huh, Counsel to this Subcommittee. Members of the public wishing to testify were asked to register for today's hearings. If you wish to testify and have not already registered, we ask that you please do so now by visiting the New York City Council website at www.council.nyc.gov/landuse to sign up. Members of the public may also view a livestream broadcast of this meeting at the Council's website. As a technical note, for the benefit of the viewing public, if you need an accessible version of any of

1
2 the presentation shown today, please send an email
3 request to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

4 When called to testify, individuals appearing
5 before the Subcommittee will remain muted until
6 recognized by the Chair to speak. Applicant teams
7 will be recognized as a group and called first
8 followed by members of the public. When the Chair
9 recognizes you, your microphone will be unmuted.

10 Please take a moment to check your device and confirm
11 that your microphone is on before you begin speaking.

12 Public testimony will be limited to two minutes
13 per witness. If you have additional testimony you
14 would like the Subcommittee to consider or if you
15 have written testimony you would like to submit
16 instead of appearing before the Subcommittee, you may
17 email it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

18 Please indicate the LU Number and/or project name
19 in the subject line of your email. During the
20 hearing, Council Members with questions should use
21 the Zoom raise hand function. The raise hand button
22 should appear at the bottom either your participant
23 panel or the primary viewing window. Council Members
24 with questions will be announced in order as they
25

1
2 raise their hands and Chair Moya will the recognize
3 members to speak.

4 Witnesses are requested to remain in the meeting
5 until excused by the Chair as Council Members may
6 have questions. There will be pauses over the course
7 of this meeting for various technical reasons and we
8 ask you to please be patient as we work through any
9 issues.

10 Chair Moya will now continue with today's agenda
11 items. One quick additional procedural announcement.
12 We anticipate a large hearing for today. If you have
13 signed up and you have registered and you are waiting
14 in the meeting, please be patient. We will get to
15 you and we will get everyone's testimony. There is
16 nothing for you to do in terms of raising hands. The
17 raise hand function is not going to do anything for
18 you if you are waiting for your testimony.

19 If you are here and you are waiting to testify,
20 you're in the right place and please be patient. And
21 Chair Moya will now continue with today's agenda
22 items.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I do see Council
24 Member Powers's hand is up.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: For later, after this
3 presentation.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Alright, thank you sir. Thank
7 you Arthur. I now open the public hearing on LU's
8 Number 867 and 868 for the 343 Madison Avenue - MTA
9 Headquarters Proposal seeking two Zoning Special
10 Permits and relating to property in Council Member
11 Powers's District in Manhattan, uh, I will remind the
12 viewing public for anyone wishing to testify on this
13 item, if you have not already done so, you must
14 register on line and you may do that by visiting the
15 Council's website.

16 Now, before I call up the first panel, let me
17 turn it over to my colleague Council Member Powers.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thanks. Are they doing a
19 presentation first or should I just jump? Yeah,
20 okay, so I will do questions after they do their
21 presentation.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Got it. Okay, we'll come back
23 to you. Before we begin, I see that we have Council
24 Member Levin on. Can we take his vote now?
25

1 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. On a continuing vote of
2 the Land Use items Council Member Levin?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Chair, we have a
5 vote currently at six in the affirmative, zero in the
6 negative and no abstentions and we will continue to
7 keep the vote open for Council Member Reynoso.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, and Counsel, if you can
9 please call up the first panel for this item.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel for this
11 item includes Zachary Bernstein Land Use Council for
12 the applicant, Rich Monopoli and Robert Paley
13 representing the applicant and Andrew Cleary as a
14 Project Architect.

15 We will also have available for question and
16 answer Jay Stewart, Wesley O'Brien, Luke Wilson,
17 Allan Zepeda, Lisa Friedman, Nancy Doon and Steve
18 Cass. Panelists please raise your right hands. Do
19 you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and
20 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
21 Subcommittee and in answer to all Council Member
22 questions?

23 PANEL: Yes.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you. When you are
3 ready to present your slideshow, please say so and it
4 will be displayed on the screen by our staff. The
5 slides will be advanced for you when you say next.
6 As a technical note, for the benefit of the viewing
7 public, if you need an accessible version of this
8 presentation, please send an email request to
9 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And now, Mr.
10 Bernstein, you and your team may begin.

11 I will ask all the panelists as they first begin
12 any remarks or in response to questions. Please,
13 once again state your names and organizations for the
14 record and then you may begin your testimony.

15 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Okay, thank you Chair Moya.
16 Good morning Council Member Powers and Committee
17 Members. I'm Zachary Bernstein with Fried Frank,
18 Land Use Counsel to Boston Properties. Please start
19 the presentation.

20 This is a joint application of Boston Properties
21 in the MTA, for the redevelopment of the MTA's former
22 headquarters site at 343 Madison Avenue. Here today
23 with me is Richard Monopoli of Boston Properties,
24 Robert Paley from the MTA and Andrew Cleary of KPF
25 Architects. Next slide please.

1 On the left here is a map of the East Midtown Sub
2 District of the Special Midtown District.

3 Highlighted in orange, is the 343 Madison site which
4 is located in the Vanderbilt Corridor Subarea. Under
5 the Vanderbilt Corridor Zoning Rules, the applicant
6 seek an increase in floor area from 15 FAR to 30 FAR
7 through the public realm improvement bonus. The
8 application will facilitate a building of
9 approximately 750,000 square feet.

10 The application also seeks the companion special
11 permit for modifications to height and setback and
12 mandatory and mandatory district plan elements for a
13 building utilizing additional floor area under the
14 public realm improvement bonus. Bob will give some
15 background on the projects importance for the MTA.
16 Next slide, please.

17 ROBERT PALEY: Thank you Zach. I'm Bob Paley,
18 Director of Transit Oriented Development at the MTA.
19 This project has been long in the planning. In 2015,
20 MTA moved out of our Madison Avenue building and
21 consolidated staff at 2 Broadway.

22 Following an RFP and a competitive bidding
23 process, the MTA Board approved the selection of
24 Boston Properties to develop the property under a 99
25

1
2 year ground lease. Under the approved transaction,
3 Boston Properties will be paying to MTA yearly rental
4 payments as well as full property taxes. As
5 contemplated by the RFP, these payments will provide
6 critical ongoing funds in support of MTA's capital
7 budget. Next slide, please.

8 The project will provide both onsite and offsite
9 transit improvements. Off site, there will be three
10 scopes of circulation improvements within the 42nd
11 Street Subway Station. On site, the project will
12 construct the first direct entrance to the Long
13 Island Railroads new station on the east side, which
14 we refer to as East Side Access. Zach will walk
15 through the details of the offsite improvements
16 first. Next slide, please.

17 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Thank you Bob. On the screen
18 now is the 42nd Street Subway Station, the Lexington
19 Line platform shown in green at an angle at the left
20 of the screen runs at a diagonal. The Flushing Line
21 platform shown in purple runs east, west, a left
22 below the Lexington Line.

23 The proposed offsite improvements provide three
24 critical packages of improvement to these platforms,
25

1
2 which I will walk through one by one. Next slide,
3 please.

4 The first improvement is expansion of the two
5 staircases leading from the northbound 456 platform
6 to allow an additional passenger lane, increasing
7 lane capacity by one third on these stairs. This
8 will contribute to better on-time performance on the
9 Lexington Line. Next slide, please.

10 This is a photo illustrating the expansion of
11 each of these transfer stairs. Allowing an
12 additional lane up and down on each. Next slide,
13 please.

14 Moving down to the Flushing Line platform, the
15 second scope of work is construction of a new passage
16 way and a pair of staircases at the center of the
17 platform, where no stair exists today. The
18 additional stairs will reduce the time passengers are
19 lined up on the platform waiting to move toward their
20 destination. To connect this stair, a new passage
21 way will be constructed underneath Lexington Avenue,
22 which you can see at the upper left of the page as an
23 extension of the existing mezzanine level. Next
24 slide, please.

1
2 Here is a rendering of the new passage way that
3 will be constructed under Lexington Avenue to connect
4 the mezzanine with the new platform stairs. Next
5 slide please. And this is a photo of the existing
6 condition of the platform. As you can see, there's a
7 significant platform length to reach a stair. Next
8 slide, please.

9 And this is a rendering of the proposed new
10 stairs uhm, allowing the platform to clear much
11 faster. Next slide, please. The third scope of
12 offsite improvements is widening the east end stair
13 from four lanes to six lanes. This stair is
14 currently a bottleneck in passenger flow causing
15 backups on the platform. The expansion will provide
16 improved passenger flow and a better rider
17 experience. Next slide, please.

18 This is an image of the existing east end stairs
19 illustrating the 33 percent expansion that is
20 proposed from four lanes to six lanes. Next slide,
21 please. And here is a rendering of the proposed new
22 stairs showing the six lanes. On the whole, the
23 offset work will substantially improve the level of
24 service on these platforms, generally speaking from
25

1
2 levels DNE to BNC greatly improving service for
3 customers from Queens and the westside of Manhattan.

4 I'll turn it back to Bob to introduce the onsite
5 improvements. Next slide, please.

6 ROBERT PALEY: So, next year, MTA will introduce
7 the new east side access terminal for the Long Island
8 Railroad. The new platforms are located 160 feet
9 below Park Avenue. Riders will get from their trains
10 to the new concourse using a set of three escalator
11 banks from track level. The largest escalator bank
12 is at 45th Street, located at the southern end of the
13 platform. You can see on the slide, the indication.
14 The largest escalator bank is at 45th Street, located
15 at the southern end and using currently planned
16 street exits north and south of the development site.
17 Riders using this escalator bank would need to travel
18 north or south to exit to the street. Next slide,
19 please.

20 The redevelopment of 343 Madison allows our first
21 direct escalators between street level and the
22 concourse. The direct access will be located in line
23 with our largest escalator bank to the platform
24 directly in the desired path of travel of many
25 riders. As compared to traveling north or south to

1
2 exit, this entrance will substantially reduce travel
3 times for riders. Rich Monopoli from Boston
4 Properties will walk you through this major
5 improvement. Next slide, please.

6 RICHARD MONOPOLI: Thank you Bob. I'm Rich
7 Monopoli, Head of Development for the New York Region
8 for Boston Properties. Thank you for having us
9 today. This slide shows the existing site conditions
10 with the ESA concourse adjacent to Bedrock below the
11 site.

12 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Rich?

13 RICHARD MONOPOLI: Yes.

14 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: The slide still needs to
15 advance, I'm sorry.

16 RICHARD MONOPOLI: Next slide, please.

17 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: There we go.

18 RICHARD MONOPOLI: So, this slide again shows the
19 existing conditions, uh, with the ESA concourse
20 adjacent to Bedrock below the site. The ESA
21 concourse is in the bottom left hand of the slide.
22 Next slide, please.

23 The new direct entrance will connect the street
24 level and the ESA concourse level. Construction of
25 this improvement involves excavation through Bedrock

1
2 to 50 feet below grade. Next slide, please. After
3 the excavation of the Bedrock, we will install and
4 maintain the following station elements. Three
5 escalators to reach the station 50 feet below grade.
6 A new stairway alongside the escalators, and an ADA
7 elevator between street level and the concourse
8 level. This rendering shows these three elements
9 leading to and from the concourse. Next slide.

10 And here is a rendering of the new entrance
11 itself looking south from 45th Street. We've
12 recessed the building above to allow the double
13 height transparent entrance to stand out prominently
14 from the rest of the building. This will become a
15 well known connection point in East Midtown.

16 With that, I'll turn it to Andrew Cleary of KPF
17 to tell you more about the building itself. Next
18 slide, please.

19 ANDREW CLEARY: Thank you Rich. Next slide,
20 please. Uh, I'm Andrew Cleary with KPF, the
21 Architect for the building. Uhm, as you can see here
22 in this diagram, the site footprint is 25,000 square
23 feet, which is relatively small for an office
24 development.
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 28
2 Within this footprint, the site planning is
3 guided by the MTA's Vent Building, which already
4 exists on the south of the site and the new transit
5 entrance plan for the north. We're pushing the
6 building back from Madison Avenue as required. To
7 create a seven foot wide sidewalk and we're widening
8 the 45th Street sidewalk to 15 feet wide. Next
9 slide, please.

10 Taking those considerations into account, our
11 core with the elevators will be at the eastern edge
12 of the site. This is known as a side loaded core
13 configuration. The building lobby will be along
14 Madison Avenue and required loading docks will be
15 along 44th Street with retail at the 44th Street
16 corner and along 50 or 45th street. Next slide,
17 please.

18 The architecture of the building starts with
19 looking at its function. At the left is an
20 illustration of our initial massing study showing a
21 simple podium and tower with the elevating and core
22 layered in. From there, we begin to articulate the
23 architecture taking into account the drop-offs of the
24 elevator banks as the building rises. The center
25 diagram illustrates the buildings recess along the

1
2 entirety of the northwest corner. Highlighting the
3 new transit entrance as a distinctive element of the
4 streetscape. The right hand diagram illustrates the
5 setbacks at the south of the building, breaking up
6 the building massing as the building rises. Next
7 slide, please.

8 In response to comments received during public
9 review, including from the Yale Club, we have lowered
10 the street wall to be in line with the Yale Club to
11 the east. This reduction was included in the plans
12 approved by City Planning Commission. Next slide,
13 please. This is a context elevation, which shows the
14 building in context to the Madison Avenue
15 streetscape. The reduced street wall height of 295
16 feet is below that of our southern neighbor at 335
17 Madison and similar to the height of the Yale Club to
18 our east. The total building height of 1,050 feet is
19 lower than One Vanderbilt and similar to that of the
20 Chrysler Building, both of which you can see in the
21 background a few blocks away. Next slide, please.

22 Here is a rendering of the building from 44th
23 Street and Madison Avenue, showing the buildings
24 cantilever over the MTA's Vent Building that already
25 exists on the site. We have paid particular

1
2 attention to creating a recess of the corner of the
3 Yale Club to highlight the decorative coining along
4 that buildings edge. Next slide, please.

5 And here is a view from East 45th Street Madison
6 Avenue showing another view of the transit entrance
7 sitting proud with the building recessed above. Next
8 slide, please. Team is proud of the place this
9 building will hold on the skyline. It compliments
10 its neighbors while making a distinctive addition to
11 East Midtown. This is a rendering looking from the
12 west with One Vanderbilt to the south and Chrysler
13 Building, uh, the Chrysler Building in the
14 background. Next slide, please. And this is an
15 areal view looking from the northwest. Next slide,
16 please. And a view looking northeast.

17 With that, I'll pass it back to Zach to wrap up
18 the presentation.

19 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Thank you Andrew. That's the
20 conclusion of our main presentation. We're happy to
21 take any questions.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you very
23 much for your testimony. I just got a couple of
24 quick questions before I turn it over to Council
25 Member Powers. Uhm, and you might have answered this

1
2 one already but I just want to make sure that we
3 talked about this.

4 At the CPC Public Hearing, a representative of
5 your neighborhood to the south of Madison Avenue,
6 noticed concerns of the loading dock on 44th Street.
7 Uh, with the potential traffic implications. Have
8 you already followed up with them about their
9 concerns?

10 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Yes. Yes, we've been
11 actively engaged with that neighbor to the south.
12 Uhm and engaged our operations personnel from Boston
13 Properties with their operations personnel to talk
14 about best managing 44th Street from a loading
15 perspective. And you know, we may get into
16 conversation about that with Council Member Powers as
17 well. Uhm, 44th Street is a very important street in
18 this area both for pedestrians accessing the Yale
19 Club and the retail in our building as well as
20 serving functions for the building to the south and
21 Yale Clubs loading and our loading. So, there's a
22 lot to balance there and we have been actively
23 engaged with that neighbor thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, and then also in light
25 of sort of the evolving attitude toward office

1
2 environments generally. What went into your thinking
3 in planning the main lobby space and how if at all
4 has that changed and how do you balance that with the
5 aim of fostering a lively streetscape, especially
6 along Madison Avenue.

7 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: That's a great question.

8 Uhm, and I think it goes to the evolution of office
9 lobbies and retail in Midtown and around the city.
10 And the plan while, you know in the plan view, we
11 showed separate colors for retail and lobby. The
12 idea is to have a very activated lobby and with the
13 retail space really extending into the lobby and so,
14 the public can utilize the retail space at the corner
15 of 44th Street and it really keeps more activity in
16 street activation for more hours with that type of
17 approach.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, and uhm, you were
19 seeking a maximum available 15 FAR, which you noted.
20 Is the same as what was requested and granted for One
21 Vanderbilt? You yourself referred to this site as
22 the smaller version of One Vanderbilt. What do you
23 say in response to both the Community Boards at the
24 BP and some of the City Planning Commission who have
25 questions, the justification of this bonus amount?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Uhm, one thing I'll say is just a matter of mass. The One Vanderbilt site is nearly twice as large than the 343 Madison site. And so, 15 FAR bonus is a lot more floor area at One Vanderbilt than it is here. So, the total bonus received here even though it is nominally 15 FAR is actually a lot less in terms of square footage. Uhm, and you know the offsite improvements here actually are directly listed in the zoning for the east Midtown zoning.

These were queued up as priority improvements by the MTA together with City Planning and the amount of floor area being received for those offsite improvements is exactly what was laid out in the East Midtown zoning. For the onsite improvements, they are not specifically listed in that zoning but its been approached by City Planning and the MTA in a way that one is consistent with bonuses granted for transit improvement prior to the enactment of East Midtown but also with very close reference to the different typologies of improvements of the levels of improvement that were established in the context of these midtown. These are Type One, Type Two's, and

1
2 Type Three's, which give different amounts of floor
3 area for different levels of improvements.

4 And I know we've had questions about this along
5 the way. I hope we've made a compelling presentation
6 of the degree of excavation required to get uh, five
7 stories below grade. The major custom extra long
8 escalators, three of them to get passengers up and
9 down you know same with the depth of elevator, that
10 servicing the platform and the stairs and I'll add on
11 to that, you know some of the consideration of the
12 utility of an improvement is what benefit does it
13 give to riders and as Bob tried to explain, this is
14 going to be the marquee entrance and exit point for
15 east side access. I think it's hard for people to
16 really feel the importance of this because that's not
17 a station that is opened yet. It's not a station any
18 of us are using yet.

19 I've had the privilege of going down there. The
20 MTA has actually built this out. It's there. The
21 lights are on. It just hasn't opened the service yet
22 and this will be the main place that passengers come
23 in and out just by virtue of the layout of the
24 station and the largest escalators from the train
25 platform level come up straight to 45th Street. So,

1
2 uh, you know in addition to sort of the level of
3 improvements and the work that's being done, the
4 function of this will really be a tremendous benefit
5 to riders.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, and uh, my last question
7 before I turn it over to Council Member Powers, is
8 how if it all does the CPC street wall modification
9 effect your ability to realize the full 30 FAR on the
10 site? And along the same lines, how if at all does
11 that change affect your sort of daylight evaluation
12 scores?

13 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: That's a good question. Uhm,
14 bringing down the street wall effectively brought
15 down floor to floor heights in different parts of the
16 building and so, we've got the same number of floors
17 effectively. And the same amount of floor area a
18 little less ideal with the slightly floor to floor
19 heights but we found it workable and acceptable. So,
20 it doesn't affect the total floor area of the
21 building. Uhm, there's a moderate impact on daylight
22 evaluation but I'll say just given the location of
23 the building and the surrounding built up context,
24 there really aren't moves up and down with the

1
2 building that have a significant impact on those
3 scores.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you. That's it
5 for me. I want to turn it over now to Council Member
6 Powers for a few questions.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. Thank you
8 Chair Moya and thank you to the team at 343 Madison
9 for the presentation. I've seen it a few times but I
10 uh, see it again.

11 A few questions I wanted to follow-up on. Just
12 in the grand scheme of looking at all the different
13 improvements, I mean, I think with Chair Moya's point
14 was the point that Community Board made, which you
15 are getting a really big bonus. I understand the
16 comparison to One Vanderbilt with your getting 15 FAR
17 on top of 15 FAR as a result of the improvements.
18 Can you talk to us just a little bit about the
19 process for determining which improvements were made?
20 You know what that process is? I think with the
21 dialogue with the MTA and also, any other
22 improvements that were considered as part of that
23 process that maybe you deemed more feasible or in the
24 sort of scaling of the project realize that some are
25 better than others? Can you talk to a us a little

1
2 bit about other improvements that you had considered
3 as part of this dialogue with the MTA?

4 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Yeah, I mean, I'll say the
5 MTA put this building up for RFP and selected what to
6 them was the best bidder. And so, the package of
7 improvements was prepackaged for the developer. It
8 was the offsite priority improvements for which the
9 floor areas had already been worked out in the East
10 Midtown process. And then the MTA worked with City
11 Planning to right size the improvements. You know,
12 through City Planning's lens of past transit
13 improvements to what could utilize the full FAR here.
14 Really to essentially use I would say leverage. The
15 Vanderbilt Corridor zoning, which was already in
16 effect to get the best entrance that the MTA could
17 here. And then Bids were taken from developers to
18 deliver that.

19 And so, this was, I guess I'll call it a bit of a
20 prebaked package that MTA worked out with City
21 Planning to get the most that MTA could to service
22 that access on the site as sort of incentivize by the
23 zoning bonus.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: But are you aware of any
25 other - I'm just asking, I understand they were kind

1
2 of prepackaged. Any other improvements that came up
3 with the discussions between the applicant and well,
4 I guess MTA is sort of a joint applicant here but you
5 know between the two parties?

6 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Bob?

7 ROBERT PALEY: Yeah, so, I just want to
8 underscore what Zach said. Before we issued the RFP
9 for the development of this - our former headquarters
10 site, we undertook a very comprehensive examination
11 of what our needs were in East Midtown. And the two
12 sets of improvements, the offsite, the onsite, really
13 were very much at the top of the list. Onsite, this
14 is the only potential opportunity we had to create
15 this entrance. Before we considered redeveloping our
16 headquarters. We were looking at entrances in the
17 45th Street, you know which is, you know sort of the
18 same place that this is located essentially but it
19 was just not feasible. You cannot close 45th Street
20 to create a pasture entrance.

21 So, when we made the decision to redevelop the
22 property, we included that as a requirement for
23 developers to build. Similarly, when we package the
24 RFP, we put the list of priority improvements into
25 the RFP because we wanted to create a level playing

1
2 field for the bidders to bid because as you, I
3 believe know, MTA will use the revenues from the
4 project to construct the offsite improvements.

5 So, this becomes the funding source for those
6 offsite improvements and these were after the
7 improvements made in connection with One Vanderbilt,
8 the next set of priority improvements.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Got it, well, you kind of
10 stole my next question but let me ask it anyway. So,
11 for the offsite improvements, onsite we understand
12 it's part of your building. The entrance is right
13 there in the lobby but for the offsite improvement, I
14 think you said - can you just restate what
15 arrangement that is? Who is paying for it? Who
16 built it?

17 ROBERT PALEY: Yes, so the revenues come from the
18 ground rent of the building and then that becomes a
19 source for our capital investment. We currently
20 don't have a source for these improvements, so this
21 is tied into the development of the property.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: So, eventually the lease
23 is paying for the offsite improvements to occur. Is
24 that correct?

25 ROBERT PALEY: Right. That's correct.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Uhm, the Borough
3 President in her conversations with you and her,
4 recommendation had and I think, I believe the
5 applicant has agreed to this but wanted to hear more
6 about it. Had asked for some more, some sort of art
7 or cultural programming that's part of this program,
8 part of this building. I won't uh, guess why she
9 didn't - I mean, well I won't associate any
10 particular reason for asking but we certainly had a
11 dialogue on the past about making East Midtown excuse
12 my language because I love East Midtown, but a little
13 less boring in the after-hours and add a little bit
14 of life to it. And I mean, I'm sitting in East
15 Midtown so I am allowed to say that I think to. But
16 anyway, I know there's been a dialogue about that.
17 Can you give us a status update on where the building
18 is and where the proposal is when it comes to adding
19 in some sort of art programming or arts in the open
20 spaces and potentially some cultural arts
21 programming.

22 RICHARD MONOPOLI: Yeah Zach, can I jump in here?

23 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Please.

24 RICHARD MONOPOLI: Yeah Council Member Powers,
25 uhm, we agree with your assessment of Midtown and

1
2 we'd like to change that and we're making big steps
3 to do so. I'll come back to that but in terms of the
4 project and our commitment and our discussion with
5 Borough President Brewer, we have really kind of
6 permitted to three elements. And those are first,
7 art in the transit areas that we can effectuate
8 through the program that MTA coordinates, called Arts
9 and Transit.

10 So, we're happy to have local artists and provide
11 spaces for that. And then secondly, when we do have
12 vacant retail space, we're happy to provide pop up
13 space for artists to come display and/or work in
14 those retail areas. And then lastly, on a more
15 permanent basis, we committed to provide either 500
16 square feet of grade or 1,000 square feet below grade
17 for a timeframe of about five years, just basically
18 at cost. So, the artists or the studio would pay
19 just the tax and the operating on the space, no rent.

20 And that could be pretty effective and pretty
21 powerful in terms of livening 45th Street for
22 example. That 500 square foot on 45th Street would
23 approach nearly half of the retail that we have on
24 45th. So, I think that could be pretty effective.

1
2 In terms more broadly, how BXB looks at the world, we
3 agree with your assessment

4 We working with Borough President Brewer years
5 ago, when we were repositioning the public space at
6 601 Lex, the public, the privately owned public
7 space, which is not opened. It is a beautiful pop
8 space available to the public, fully activated and
9 engaged with the street on 53rd. We want to continue
10 that momentum and that does have activity after
11 hours.

12 We want that to be activated in the live on
13 nights and weeks and we've done so with a really cool
14 food and beverage program from local operators here
15 in New York. Not chains, local operators and I think
16 we'd like to pursue that kind of thing here. For
17 example, in that southern edge of the lobby, we have
18 a retail way out there. That could be the coffee
19 that turns into the quicksand which then turns into
20 the wine bar in the evening. We want to keep that
21 activation going both on Madison and on 44th and on
22 45th. So, we agree with your assessment and we want
23 to work to improve that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Got it, uhm, just in the
25 - I'll be respectful of everyone's time here, so I

1
2 won't ask too much more. But just, we have had some
3 conversations with one of your neighbors the Yale
4 Club who I think is impacted by the space on the
5 scale of the building, based on some of the retail
6 and the sort of streetscape have you know, I think
7 certainly expressed their concerns and comments that
8 they want to be able to still be fully functional,
9 operational and operational and not have this impact
10 their operations as to why. Can you just give us a
11 status update on your conversations with them at this
12 moment? And any outstanding issues that you see that
13 need to be resolved before we close this application
14 out?

15 RICHARD MONOPOLI: Zach, do you want me to take
16 that?

17 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Yeah, I guess I'll say you
18 can supplement. We've been actively engaged with the
19 Yale Club throughout this process both about the
20 temporary construction operations and about the
21 permanent situation after the building goes up. You
22 know, it's unfortunate 44th Street has been a bit of
23 a construction zone for a while and I think there is
24 a bit of fatigue on that. You know, ventilation for
25 eastside access. There is an event building there

1
2 that was under construction for a while. 44th Street
3 needs some love and we think there are – we will be
4 working hard to uhm, stage construction operations in
5 a way that is respectful of the Yale Club and does
6 not interfere with their operations and after we're
7 open, they have their loading on 44th Street, they
8 have a retail on 44th Street. We are engaged with
9 them on potentially improving their sidewalk area
10 creating a bump out and a sidewalk widening for
11 better pedestrian circulation around their building.
12 And we look forward to working with you and them. I
13 think there are a lot of opportunities on better
14 retail activation on 44th and our building and
15 streetscape improvements really make amends for what
16 has long been a little bit of a difficult operating
17 environment on 44th.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you. I'll be
19 respectful, I know we got a lot of applications and a
20 long hearing and I send my condolences or my best
21 wishes to Chair Moya on a day ahead. But anyway,
22 thank you to the folks at 343 Madison and we'll
23 continue to talk as this moves forward. Thanks so
24 much.

25 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council Member
3 Powers. Thank you for your well wishes. I now am
4 going to turn over to Council Member Grodenchik for a
5 few questions.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Chair.
7 Just a couple of quickies. Uhm, is there a number on
8 the value of these improvements from the MTA?

9 ROBERT PALEY: Uhm, the offsite improvements I
10 think are in the range of \$80-some million. I don't
11 have the latest numbers. That was a conceptual
12 estimate we had some time ago but that's you know, we
13 can certainly update that and onsite is really the
14 developers uhm, you know work that the developer
15 would undertake that work.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: And is it safe to
17 presume because I don't like to presume too much in
18 New York City government, that the improvements will
19 be done for the MTA - the improvements that will
20 benefit the MTA ridership, will be done and will be
21 usable before the building goes up or after the
22 building goes up?

23 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Yeah, I mean, it's a
24 requirement of a TCO for the building under zoning to
25 complete the bonused improvements. And you know, in

1
2 particular the onsite entrance is the first scope of
3 work as the building starts to go up.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Well, some of that's
5 going to go in the excavated area, right? Did I get
6 that right? Where you are excavating 30,000 cubic
7 feet of Manhattan?

8 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Well, yeah, I mean that's
9 being excavated since it's all Bedrock specifically
10 to get all the way down and link up with that below
11 grade concourse. That's excavation that wouldn't
12 otherwise be done for the building. And so, that is
13 the first order of operation.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: And you had
15 mentioned, someone had mentioned, one of the
16 applicants had mentioned that some of the FAR that
17 would be granted, assuming that we vote to approve
18 this uhm, would be absorbed by improvements to the
19 MTA property. Can you give us a number? Because
20 you're getting an incredibly large bonus in my
21 opinion. And I was wondering how much of the FAR
22 would be absorbed?

23 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: The bonuses all go into the
24 building on site. The improvements that generate the
25 bonus are both offsite and onsite.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Uhm, but somebody
3 said that some of the FAR is being absorbed. So, I
4 just wanted to know, are you getting – if you're
5 getting an extra 15 FAR, is that reduced to 12? Is
6 it reduced to 13,14 because of the improvements? Or
7 did I misconstrue what you were saying?

8 ZACHARY BERNSTEIN: Oh, I mean there may be a
9 small amount of that that is taken up by the
10 improvements themselves but by and large, the bonus
11 is in the building.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay, thank you Mr.
13 Chairman.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Barry.
15 Counsel, do we have any other Council Members with
16 questions?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
18 with questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no further
20 questions, the applicant panel is excused. Before we
21 call up the next panel, I just want to say that we've
22 been joined by Council Member Reynoso and Council
23 Member Lander. But why don't we take Council Member
24 Reynoso – do you want to take the vote now or should
25 we wait until after this –?

1 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I can take it now Chair.
2
3 I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Continuing -

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Oh, sorry, I apologize.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Thank you, uh,
7 Council Member Reynoso, aye on all. Mr. Chair, the
8 vote is now seven in the affirmative, zero in the
9 negative with no abstentions. The items are adopted
10 and referred to the full Land Use Committee.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, thank you. Now,
12 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish
13 to testify on the 343 Madison Avenue MTA headquarters
14 proposal?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair Moya, we have a
16 few public speakers who have signed up to speak.

17 For members of the public here to testify, please
18 note again that witnesses will generally be called in
19 panels of up to four names at a time. If you are a
20 member of the public signed up to testify on 343
21 Madison Avenue proposal, please stand by when you
22 hear your name being called and prepare to speak when
23 the Chair says that you may begin.

24 Please also note that once all panelists in your
25 group have completed their testimony, you will be

1
2 removed from the meeting as a group and then you may
3 continue to view the stream broadcast of this hearing
4 at the Council website. And we will now hear from
5 the uh, first public witness panel, which will
6 include Marissa Williams, Santos Rodriguez and
7 Felicia Park-Rogers. Marissa Williams will go first
8 followed by Santos Rodriguez.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just before we
10 begin, I just want to remind the members of the
11 public that you will be given two minutes to speak.
12 Please do not begin until the Sergeant at Arms has
13 started the clock.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Whenever you're ready Felicia.
16 We just got to unmute you, hold on one second.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Marissa Williams will be the
18 first speaker followed by Santos Rodriguez.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sorry Michael.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 FELICIA PARK-ROGERS: Should I speak now or did
22 you call somebody else?

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sorry, no, that was my fault.
24 I messed up Felicia, sorry, we're going with Marissa.

1
2 MARISSA WILLIAMS: Good morning, can you all hear
3 me?

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

5 MARISSA WILLIAMS: Okay, great. Good morning
6 Chair Moya and members of the Subcommittee. My name
7 is Marissa Williams and I am a Representative of 32BJ
8 SCIU. As you know, 32BJ is the largest property
9 service union representing 85,000 property service
10 workers across the city.

11 We represent workers who maintain, clean and
12 provide security services in buildings like the one's
13 being discussed at 343 Madison Avenue. We estimate
14 that this rezoning, which will allow the construction
15 of almost one million gross square feet of commercial
16 office space will lead to the creation of 29
17 cleaners, 13 security and other new building service
18 jobs.

19 We believe that the best way to make sure that
20 developments like the one's proposed have a positive
21 impact on building service workers is for the
22 developers to make a formal commitment to pay the
23 prevailing wage.

24 We are pleased to let you know that the developer
25 affiliated with this project, Boston Properties, has

1
2 a track record of creating good jobs throughout their
3 portfolio and a long time partnership with 32BJ. BXP
4 has reached out and made an early and credible
5 commitment to create prevailing wage building service
6 jobs at this site. We have full confidence that BXP
7 will continue to be a responsible employer and
8 presence in the community and are in support of this
9 project.

10 We know that this development will continue to
11 uphold the industry standard and provide
12 opportunities for working families to thrive in
13 Manhattan. We need good paying jobs that can lift
14 our neighbors up. On behalf of 32BJ SCIU, I
15 respectfully urge you to approve this project. Thank
16 you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
18 testimony.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Santos Rodriguez will be the
20 next witness followed by Felicia Park-Rogers.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: If we can unmute Santos?
23 There we go.

24 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you very much. Good
25 morning all. I am Santos Rodriguez. I am here to

1
2 testify on behalf of Gary LaBarbera, President of the
3 Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater
4 New York and vicinity.

5 On September of 2020 and May 2021 and August
6 2021, the Building and Construction Trades Council
7 testified in support of this project. We continue to
8 support the 343 Madison Avenue project today. The
9 Building and Construction Trades Council is an
10 organization of local building and construction
11 trades unions that are affiliated with 15
12 international unions in the North American Building
13 Trades Union.

14 Our local union affiliates represent
15 approximately 100,000 union construction workers.
16 The Building Trades mission is to raise the standard
17 for all living, for all workers, to advocate for a
18 safe work condition and to collectively advance
19 working conditions for our affiliates members as well
20 as all workers in New York City.

21 Boston Properties 343 Madison Avenue Project is a
22 significant investment in Midtown Manhattan that
23 sends a strong message and that New York City will
24 recover and rebound from the pandemic. The project
25 consists of 753,000 square feet and rise 1050 feet

1
2 tall with a Class A office space above ground floor
3 retail. The building itself is designed to increase
4 sustainability, accessibility, and wellness by
5 maximizing energy use reductions and has an indoor
6 air quality with ventilation and utilizing other
7 green technology materials and equipment. Notably,
8 the project will develop a new east side access
9 entrance and other upgrades to stairs and passageways
10 that will improve access to and circulate through
11 various transportation facilities, including a New
12 York City Transit seven line and a four, five, and
13 six lines.

14 These upgrades to our city's transportation
15 infrastructure will assist communities navigating
16 through Midtown Manhattan, as well as increase tax
17 revenue for the MTA city and state. This project is
18 an opportunity to create hundreds if not thousands of
19 new construction jobs -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Expired.

21 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: And will support the middle
22 class life style providing area standard wages and
23 benefits to support workers and their families. We
24 testify in support of this project. Thank you very
25 much Mr. Chairman.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Santos. Good to see
3 you.

4 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Likewise.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your testimony
6 today.

7 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Felicia Park-Rogers will be
9 the next and last speaker on this panel.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 FELICIA PARK-ROGERS: Hi, I'm the Director of
12 Regional Infrastructure Projects for Tristate
13 Transportation Campaign. An organization that fights
14 for a safe, fast and fair transportation options that
15 reduce our car dependence in New York, New Jersey and
16 Connecticut.

17 I am here today as a Transit Advocate to express
18 our support for the 343 Madison Avenue Project to
19 redevelop the MTA's vacant headquarters near Grand
20 Central Terminal. Among multiple benefits, this
21 project will help jumpstart New York's economic
22 recovery from COVID-19. This project is located in a
23 key business and transit hub. Indeed it is hard to
24 find a more transit rich development spot in the five
25 boroughs.

1
2 As one of the transit advocacy groups that spent
3 the last year successfully advocating for than \$15
4 billion in emergency funds to save our precious
5 transit system, we are especially pleased that this
6 project will unlock revenue to support the MTA's much
7 starved capital plan and to fund critically needed
8 public realm and transit improvements.

9 With that said, our support primarily stems from
10 the LIRR Rail Station entrance, enhance subway
11 station circulation and the accessibility
12 improvements that the proposed development will
13 bring. Our review of the project leads us to
14 conclude that it is designed in such a way to honor
15 both the historic place, east Midtown and Grand
16 Central hold in our city's transit and architectural
17 history, as well as meaningfully responding to the
18 needs of the modern transit user. All while
19 addressing sustainability concerns.

20 This project expands the passenger flow and
21 capacity of the 42nd Street Subway Station while also
22 providing vital connectivity to the soon to be
23 completed east side access terminal tracks. The
24 transit improvements include multiple improvements to
25 enhance pedestrian flow at the 42 Street Station for

1 the aging subway lines, as well a new southern entry.
2 These are all very badly needed improvements.

3
4 If we fail to transform our transit system to
5 appropriately handle future demand, we will fail to
6 bring back riders and we will add to the congestion
7 that is currently choking our streets, costing our
8 city -

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 FELICIA PARK-ROGERS: As much as \$20 billion a
11 year in lost revenue. I'm almost done.

12 In a time where we need to encourage people to
13 use mass transit, not cars, we should be bold about
14 developing density. But thoughtfully around transit
15 hubs. This proposed project is a good example of
16 both. Thank you very much for your time.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
18 testimony today. That being the last panelist, uh,
19 do we have any Council Members that have any
20 questions for this panel?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
22 with questions for this panel.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no more
24 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
25

1
2 excused. Counsel, if you could please call up the
3 next panel.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any members of
5 the public who wish to testify on the 343 Madison
6 Avenue MTA headquarters proposal, please use the
7 raise hand function now. The meeting will briefly
8 stand at ease while we check for any newly registered
9 members of the public.

10 Once again, if you wish to testify on the 343
11 Madison Avenue MTA headquarters proposal, please use
12 the raise hand button now. Chair Moya, I see no
13 other members of the public who wish to testify on
14 this item.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no members
16 of the public who wish to testify on LU Numbers 867
17 and 868 for the 343 Madison Avenue MTA headquarters
18 proposal, the public hearing on these items is now
19 closed and they are laid over.

20 I now want to open the public hearing on
21 Preconsidered LU's for the 824 Metropolitan Avenue
22 rezoning proposal which weeks a zoning map and zoning
23 text amendment. And relates to property in Council
24 Member Reynoso's district in Brooklyn. I will remind
25 the viewing public for anyone wishing to testify on

1
2 this item. If you have not already done so, you must
3 register online and you may do that now by visiting
4 the Council's website.

5 Do we have Council Member Reynoso present and
6 does he want to say any opening remarks?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, it appears that we
8 have temporarily lost Council Member Reynoso. I
9 don't see him in the meeting.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Counsel, please call up
11 the first panel for this item.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel for this
13 item will include Lisa Orrantia, Land Use Counsel for
14 the Applicant.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Orrantia, please raise
17 your right hand and state your name for the record.

18 LISA ORRANTIA: Lisa Orrantia.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
20 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
21 your testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer
22 to all Council Member questions?

23 LISA ORRANTIA: Yes.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just as a
3 reminder, when you are ready to present your
4 slideshow, please say so and it will be displayed on
5 the screen by our staff. Slides will be advanced
6 when you say next. Once again, anyone who requires
7 the – an accessible version of this presentation, you
8 may send an email request to
9 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

10 And now, you may begin with your testimony. We
11 just ask that before you begin with your first
12 remarks that you just restate your name and the
13 organization for the record.

14 LISA ORRANTIA: Thank you. Good morning, my name
15 is Lisa Orrantia, Land Use Counsel from Akerman LLP
16 on behalf of the applicant 824 Metropolitan Avenue
17 owner. Can you please pull up the presentation?
18 Thank you for hearing our application today.

19 This Proposed Zoning and Text Amendment affects
20 property located at a street intersection in
21 proximity to public transportation. In the
22 Greenpoint Williamsburg neighborhood of Brooklyn,
23 Community District One, these actions will allow
24 moderate increase in density and the introduction of
25 residential use to facilitate an eight story mixed

1 use building with permanently affordable housing.

2 Next slide, please.

3
4 A project area is located at the intersection of
5 Metropolitan, Bushwick and Orient Avenues. Next
6 slide, please. A project area has been partially
7 mapped in a C8-2 district. And partially mapped as a
8 residential district with commercial overlay since
9 1961.

10 CA Districts are mainly mapped along major
11 traffic arteries, allowing automotive and heavy
12 commercial uses and function as a bridge between
13 commercial and manufacturing uses. Instead of having
14 the typical auto and heavy commercial uses, this
15 surrounding area is mostly residential, mixed
16 commercial and residential and nonconforming
17 manufacturing. Next slide, please.

18 Part of the development site has been used as an
19 open lot for truck parking since 1966. And the
20 remainder is improved with a three story residence
21 built in 1910. Next slide, please.

22 Rezoning area includes a small part of the rear
23 yard of another three story building constructed in
24 1910 and a gas station at the corner of Metropolitan
25

1
2 Bushwick Avenue and that is expected to continue
3 operating. Next slide.

4 The proposed rezoning advances the planning goals
5 of adding density at a transit oriented site,
6 supporting the productive use of under utilized land
7 and addressing the need for affordable housing. The
8 proposed actions would extend the R7A District that
9 exists to the west and to the south, including over a
10 portion of the corner gas station lot and an overlay
11 that exists to the east to establish a continuous and
12 uniform zoning district designations.

13 Under the new district, uh, building heights
14 would be consistent with several seven and eight
15 story buildings within two blocks of the site. And
16 the proposed districts would create an opportunity
17 for mixed use, new mixed uses in an area where a
18 substantial amount of recent as of right development
19 has not included affordable units.

20 The proposed rezoning boundary includes the
21 corner lot that is used as a gas station. It's not
22 owned by the applicant and it can lawfully continue
23 after the rezoning. Even though there's no plan to
24 redevelop the gas station lot, the existing C8 zoning
25 designation would allow new heavy commercial uses

1
2 that are not appropriate for the area. In contrast,
3 the proposed actions would support sustainable
4 development including commercial uses that are suited
5 to the character of the neighborhood. And the
6 proposed text amendment would map the area for MIH
7 options one and two. Next slide, please.

8 The proposed development is in each story mixed
9 use building with ground floor commercial space,
10 capable of being partitioned into two establishments
11 and 36 dwelling units including nine permanently
12 affordable units. Two, three bedroom units were
13 added at the Community Boards request. The owner
14 will be seeking a new commercial tenant with the help
15 of a future partnership with the North Brooklyn
16 Chamber of Commerce and the Southwest Brooklyn
17 Industrial Development Corporation. Ideal uses would
18 be hardware, contractors establishment or art music
19 and dance studio. Fifteen permanent jobs are
20 anticipated for this site. Next slide.

21 Sustainable features will include solar panels on
22 the roof in compliance with welding code, plus high
23 performance windows, smart heating and cooling and
24 energy efficient appliances. The owner also agreed
25 to add plantings and seeding to outdoor recreation

1
2 areas on the terraces in response to the Community
3 Boards request. Next slide.

4 The building will be developed under MIA Option
5 One instead of Option Two as initially proposed, to
6 provide deeper affordability at the Community Boards
7 request. About nine units will be set aside for
8 households earning 60 percent AMI consisting of two
9 studios, four one bedrooms, two- two bedrooms, and
10 one three bedroom and St. Nicks Alliance will be the
11 administering agent for the affordable units. Next
12 slide.

13 The owner is also planning to install network
14 nodes to the roof to help grow neighborhood access to
15 high quality broadband and Wi-Fi service at low cost.
16 The network would deliver signal throughout the
17 buildings units plus NYCHA properties, Williamsburg
18 and Sumner Houses to the south, as well as to the
19 broader east Williamsburg, Bushwick and Bedford
20 Stuyvesant communities. Next slide.

21 Community Board One in the Borough President's
22 Office recommend approval with conditions. Community
23 Board voted 27 in favor and one opposed and the owner
24 will comply with the recommended conditions, which
25 are to comply with safety requirements, minimize air

1
2 conditioning noise, and seeking a diverse ground
3 floor tenants.

4 Regarding the Borough President recommendation,
5 we believe the rezoning boundaries consistent with
6 sound policy and land use objectives and the owner
7 will evaluate the recommendation as to changing the
8 affordable bedroom mix to increase the number of two
9 and three bedrooms. But currently the proposal is to
10 provide a proportional bedroom mix in compliance with
11 the zoning resolution.

12 In addition, the owner has agreed to develop
13 under MIH Option One, engage St. Nicks Alliance as
14 the local administering agent, partner with North
15 Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce to seek arts and culture
16 or nonprofit entity as a potential ground floor
17 tenant, incorporate sustainable features, coordinate
18 with DEP and DOT and Parks. And again, partner with
19 locally based organizations and community groups when
20 hiring and contracting for the project. About 65
21 construction jobs are anticipated. And that
22 concludes the presentation. Thank you very much.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for you
24 testimony today. I have no questions for the
25 applicant. I want to give the opportunity to turn it

1
2 over to Council Member Reynoso. I know he had a few
3 remarks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you Chair. I
5 really appreciate that you give me the opportunity to
6 speak here uhm and want to thank 824 Metropolitan for
7 coming by. This is a very good application that has
8 come in. It seeks to help build units in an area
9 that is right for development that actually has a I'm
10 sorry, that actually has a like a very old uhm and
11 like decrepit you know building that is in need of
12 disrepair. It seems abandoned and I'm happy to see
13 that we'll get something new. We're also seeing a
14 significant amount of as of right development
15 happening in and around this area. Almost all
16 without any mandatory inclusionary housing, so no
17 affordable housing happening in this area.

18 So, to have an applicant come in to be able to
19 modify the zoning text here or amend a text here,
20 would allow for them to build higher but also allow
21 us to get some affordable housing. One of the
22 biggest concerns I have is this lot next door. It's
23 a significant lot. It's very large and should
24 someone want to build on it, uhm I'm concerned that
25 they will do the bare minimum. We're holding 824

1
2 Metropolitan to a very high standard as to what we
3 want to see happen there, including bedroom units,
4 the affordability range, renting to non-for-profits,
5 using the commercial space for arts and so forth.
6 And all these things that they're doing is because of
7 uh, the private applicant is coming to us to
8 negotiate those terms.

9 I will not be able to negotiate the terms of the
10 corner lot that is currently a gas station, which
11 will be a bigger building than this one and I think
12 that my community should have a say as to exactly
13 what they want to see there. So, I guess mine is not
14 a question but Chair, I just want to make sure that
15 we know before any voting happens in the future that
16 this lot is of huge concern for me and I think that
17 we should consider this application or this applicant
18 with their lots only and remove the lot next door.

19 Outside of the opportunity to negotiate, I do
20 want to say that our area has become inundated with
21 residential development, which I think is important
22 for the future of the city and the future of
23 Brooklyn. We are lacking opportunities of
24 manufacturing and commercial space. This site being
25 a commercial space could be invaluable and could

1
2 serve a purpose. There is current zoning that we're
3 lacking. So, I just want to say on a technical
4 standpoint here, the rational to maintain this site
5 as is, is to ensure that we have a commercial space
6 that could balance out the amount of residential
7 development that we're getting.

8 So, again, the lot in which 824 Metropolitan sits
9 seems appropriate for development at an increase in
10 FAR while the lot on the corner that is adjacent to
11 this one, should remain a commercial space in an
12 effort to again, entertain a space for commercial
13 tenants. So, thank you again for giving me the
14 opportunity to speak here. I want to thank 824
15 Metropolitan for coming and discussing their plan and
16 that's it. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Council
18 Member Reynoso. Counsel, do we have any Council
19 Members who wish to ask any questions to this panel?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
21 with questions for this panel.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no further
23 questions, the applicant panel is excused. Counsel,
24 are there any members of the public who wish to
25 testify on 824 Metropolitan Avenue rezoning?

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes Chair, we do have
3 currently one public witness signed up to speak. We
4 will now hear from Frank Lang. Frank Lang with
5 public testimony on this item.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Can we unmute the panel?

8 FRANK LANG: Yes, hi, my name is Frank Lang. I'm
9 sorry. I am the Director of Housing for St. Nicks
10 Alliance. I'm here to really just reiterate what was
11 explained to the Committee already. St. Nicks
12 Alliance is a 46 year old not-for-profit social
13 service and housing organization. We have been
14 retained to provide administrative agent services to
15 do the marketing and lease up of the affordable units
16 in this project on Metropolitan Avenue. If the
17 project is approved than and it begins construction,
18 we will do that and we'll be ensuring that we follow
19 the mandatory inclusionary and HPD marketing
20 guidelines and do the kind of outreach that allows
21 local residents who are interested in the housing to
22 get access. So, thank you all very much.

23 SERGEANT LEONARDO: Chair, you are on mute.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Frank
25 for your testimony today. Counsel, do we have any

1
2 Council Members that have any questions for the
3 panelist?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see no members with
5 questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no further
7 questions, the applicant is now excused.

8 FRANK LANG: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Counsel, if you
10 can please call up the next panel.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any other
12 members of the public who wish to testify on the 824
13 Metropolitan Avenue rezoning proposal, please use the
14 raise hand function now. The meeting will briefly
15 stand at ease while we check for any additional
16 members of the public who may have registered to
17 testify.

18 Chair, it appears we do have one additional
19 participant signed up to speak. This next panel will
20 be - we'll hear from Victoria calling in by phone.

21 VICTORIA: Hello. Can you hear me?

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

24 VICTORIA: Hello everyone. I'm not familiar with
25 Metropolitan Avenue specifically, however, we worked

1
2 on the loft bill with Senator Salazar. Certainly our
3 senators and assembly members to see that 1,000
4 buildings, loft buildings went into rent
5 stabilization. There is currently a building at
6 Opera House with a forged CFO to deny those loft
7 tenants their rights. I think I speak for everyone
8 in New York, that we do not believe that City Council
9 and the City of New York should be rezoning during a
10 pandemic. When the public is not able to properly
11 participate. The loft board is not enforcing the
12 laws to put our affordable units that we already have
13 into rent stabilization. And I would simply note
14 that the entire city of New York from SoHo to Gowanus
15 to the Seaport is very adamantly opposed to any
16 rezoning's and up zoning's without proper
17 displacement studies.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Wait, Victoria, Victoria?

19 VICTORIA: Proper environmental impact studies.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Is your testimony specific to
21 824 Metropolitan Avenue?

22 VICTORIA: Yes, I am specifically speaking to
23 this project. Nobody believes that any rezoning or
24 up zoning should be going on during the pandemic,
25 when the public is not able to properly participate

1
2 and unfortunately City Planning and the city has not
3 conducted current environmental impact studies.
4 There have not been proper displacement studies and
5 the city has not put the affordable loft units we
6 have into rent stabilization. We see no reason for
7 this and quite frankly, it was Mr. Reynoso on St.
8 Nicks that caught lying in this area. In this
9 footprint.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you so much for
11 your testimony.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Let me turn it
14 over to our Counsel.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see no members with
16 questions and nor do I see - that was the last
17 speaker on this panel.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'll take this opportunity
20 Mr. Chair with your permission to make a brief
21 procedural announcement. Once again, for members of
22 the public viewing and/or registered and already in
23 the meeting, we do anticipate a lengthy hearing
24 today. If you have registered and you have
25 successfully logged in, there is nothing further for

1
2 you to do. We ask that you please do not use the
3 raise hand function. We will get to everyone and we
4 will hear everyone's testimony in order. And again,
5 we just ask that everyone please be patient.

6 For those of you waiting to testify, there is no
7 reason to use the raise hand function. We will get
8 to everyone in order. Thank you. And with that
9 Chair, I believe we have no other members of the
10 public signed up to testify on this item.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. There being no
12 other members of the public who wish to testify on
13 the Preconsidered LU's relating to 824 Metropolitan
14 Avenue rezoning. The public hearing is now closed
15 and the items are laid over.

16 I now open the public hearing on LU Numbers 869
17 through 874 and 888 for Gowanus Neighborhood Plan
18 Proposal, requesting Zoning Map and Zoning Text
19 Amendments, City Map Changes, disposition of the city
20 owned property and related urban development action
21 area project approvals and amendments and the Mercy
22 Home UDAP amendment. With all actions together,
23 intended to facilitate the creation of the special
24 Gowanus mixed use district and relating to property
25 in Council Member Lander's and Council Member Levin's

1
2 district in Brooklyn. These actions would transform
3 an area of Brooklyn currently zoned for limited
4 industrial and commercial development to a much
5 higher density mixed use, mixed income neighborhood.

6 The Department of City Planning estimates that
7 these actions will result in approximately 8,495 new
8 housing units, including approximately 2,950
9 affordable units 1.5 acres of new park land for areas
10 of new waterfront open space. And significant
11 projected commercial and community facility space.

12 At the same time, we will hold our hearing on LU's
13 Number 884 through 887 for actions related to the
14 proposed Gowanus Canal CSO facilities including city
15 map changes affecting Douglas Street and 5th Street.

16 A site selection action and a site selection
17 acquisition action. These actions are related to the
18 headend facility to be located on the east side of
19 the canal between DeGraw and Butler Streets Council
20 Member Levin's District and the Owl's Head facility
21 at 2nd Avenue and 5th Street in Council Member
22 Lander's District.

23 Once again, anyone wishing to testify on these
24 items who is not already registered online, you must
25 do so now by visiting the Council's website to sign

1
2 up. And now, I just want to acknowledge Council
3 Member Lander for some opening remarks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you so much Chair
5 Moya. Thank you to all the members of our community
6 who are here this morning and to the many hundreds
7 more who have engaged thoughtfully with every element
8 of this very detailed plan. We don't always agree of
9 course but over the past few years, we've had a
10 robust democratic dialogue about the future of
11 Gowanus. That conversation has already had a
12 profound influence on the plan we're considering
13 today and it will continue to shape it today and in
14 the weeks to come.

15 Thank you to the individuals of the City Planning
16 team, the staff at City Hall and city agencies, the
17 Council's Land Use staff and Community Board 6 who
18 have put in thousands of hours to support this plan
19 in process. There have been many engaging moments
20 along the way, scores, maybe hundreds of meetings.
21 The Community Board 6 public hearing, which was held
22 at the Old Stone House inside and outside in-person
23 and online making room for a wide array of opinions
24 and expression really exemplified the kind of public
25

1
2 deliberation around hard issues that I believe we
3 need more of.

4 Finally, a big thank you to Chair Moya. This is
5 going to be a long hearing and I appreciate your
6 being a partner. I'll be here for all the testimony
7 with you. To my colleagues and especially to my
8 friend and neighbor Steve Levin, who really has been
9 a real partner in all of this work.

10 New Yorkers are skeptical of rezoning's and with
11 good reason, too often rezoning's have displaced low
12 income and working class tenants, strained existing
13 infrastructure, enrich speculators and developers and
14 change neighborhoods with little input and little
15 benefit for existing residents. Our city's reactive
16 land use processes too rarely provide a meaningful
17 opportunity for neighbors to shape the future of
18 their community or achieve broader, long term public
19 goals.

20 But I continue to believe that if we get it right
21 and there is still critical work to do, the Gowanus
22 rezoning could be different and could genuinely
23 deliver a more inclusive, affordable, sustainable,
24 and economically vibrant neighborhood right at a time
25 when we need it. Our neighborhoods have changed a

1
2 lot in recent years. Recent studies including the
3 racial equity report, which was released in July,
4 shows steeply rising rents and home values,
5 displacement of Black and Latino residents and
6 growing income inequality between White and Black and
7 Hispanic households in our neighborhood. We've seen
8 new as of right luxury development with no affordable
9 housing and an influx of bars, hotels and
10 recreational activities in Gowanus serving wealthier
11 families. We can expect those trends to continue if
12 we do nothing.

13 So, beginning with bridging Gowanus in 2013, we
14 launched a public conversation about how we could
15 genuinely increase affordability and create a more
16 integrated neighborhood. Support the super fund
17 cleanup and increase sustainability and resilience in
18 the face of climate change, preserve and strengthen
19 the creative mixed use character we love in Gowanus.
20 Address critical infrastructure needs and genuinely
21 maximize public develop, public benefit from private
22 development. No easy task.

23 But as a result of engagement, of criticism, of
24 organizing. The plan we are evaluating today has
25 been dramatically improved. The plan for Gowanus

1
2 Green is 100 percent affordable. 950 units, a new
3 school, waterfront park community space in
4 combination with MIH, the overall plan would create
5 nearly 3,000 units of genuinely affordable housing.
6 35 percent of the total new units in a community that
7 has seen almost none in recent years.

8 It includes creative approaches to keep the area
9 mixed use with mid-blocks remaining zone for
10 manufacturing and industrial and the innovative
11 Gowanus mixed zoning for new development. It
12 includes new zoning tools for schools and transit
13 improvements. We've landmarked five historic
14 buildings including the Powerhouse and the Old
15 American Can Factory. And there are aggressive
16 sustainability requirements including the strongest
17 stormwater rule in the country for new development.
18 Requirements for rooftop wind green or solar, for
19 resilient new shore walk way, all of which will work
20 together with super fund remediation.

21 But there is still critical work to do if we're
22 going to shape a plan that community can support. I
23 remain strongly committed to the three core demands
24 put forward by the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for
25 Justice, NYCHA tenant leaders and many others in our

1
2 community. First, City Hall has not yet committed to
3 an adequate funding package to address the
4 dilapidated conditions that our neighbors in NYCHA's
5 Gowanus Houses and Wyckoff Gardens continue to
6 endure.

7 Second, we must ensure that development permitted
8 by the rezoning would not add CSO pollution to the
9 canal but instead works with super fund remediation
10 to make it cleaner and that we address issues of
11 flooding. The new stormwater rule is a critical step
12 here but there is more to do and we need strong
13 commitments to long term community oversight.

14 Council Member Levin and my terms are ending soon
15 and it's crucial that the community has strong,
16 enduring, meaningful voice and implementation to make
17 sure the commitments made are commitments kept.
18 Beyond those issues, we're working on a wide array of
19 details, investments in community facilities like the
20 Old Stone House and Pacific Street Library. Support
21 for artists, manufacturing business and workforce
22 development, more public open space and many other
23 issues we'll hear about today.

24 I said at the time of the release of Community
25 Board 6's thoughtful and extensive recommendations

1
2 when they voted to approve with modifications that I
3 would take them as marching orders when the proposal
4 reached the Council. I know today's hearing will
5 elevate them loud and clear. I look forward to the
6 city's answers on these and other questions to a
7 partnership with the Chair and my colleagues and
8 especially to public testimony from my neighbors.
9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council Member
11 Lander for your opening remarks and feel free to send
12 me lunch, dinner, whatever it is that you like and
13 then just please include the rest of the stat that's
14 on here as well.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here, here.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Now, Counsel, if you could
17 please call up the first panel for this item.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel for this
19 item will include Jonathan Keller for DCP, Alicia
20 West for DDP. Also available for question and
21 answers, we will have Winston Von Engel, Ziggy
22 Gollan(SP?) of DCP, Angela Licata, Michael DeLoach
23 and Keven Clark for DEP, Mark McEntire, Ahmed Tigani
24 and Nicholas Molinari.

1
2 Panelists, please raise your right hand and state
3 your name for the record. Do you affirm to tell the
4 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
5 your testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer
6 to all Council Member questions?

7 PANEL: Yes, I do.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. When you're ready
10 to go through your slide presentation, please say so
11 and it will be displayed on screen and slides will be
12 advanced for you by our staff when you say next.
13 Once again, anyone who requires an accessible version
14 of this presentation may send an email request to
15 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And now, Mr.
16 Keller, you and your team may begin. I'll ask all
17 panelists as you first begin your testimony to please
18 state your names and organizations for the record and
19 you may begin your presentation.

20 JONATHAN KELLER: Thank you. This is Jonathan
21 Keller from the Department of City Planning and I'll
22 wait for the slides to come up.

23 Let me just resize this for myself. Great.
24 Again, thank you Chair Moya and also, thank you to
25 Council Member Lander. Good morning, again my name

1
2 is Jonathan Keller, I'm the Senior Planner in the
3 Brooklyn Office of City Planning and for the past six
4 years have been the project manager for the Gowanus
5 neighborhood plan.

6 I'm also joined by my Brooklyn Office colleagues
7 Winston Von Engel, Ziggy Gollan. And of course some
8 of our core agency partners, not all of them that
9 have worked on this plan but the core partners of
10 Department of Environmental Protection, Parks and
11 Recreation and Housing and Preservation Development,
12 and Environmental Remediation.

13 The presentation about to give is a shortened
14 condensed version, as Council Member Lander noted.
15 There's a lot here. The full presentation is on our
16 website at newyorkcity.gov/gowanus. Next.

17 We are here to talk about Gowanus and we will but
18 first, I do want to touch on the overarching
19 existential questions that have arisen in the past 18
20 months. COVID-19 has upended life as we know it.
21 The virus attacks and exploits the physical, the
22 biological and yes, the most vulnerable. But the
23 virus also attacks vulnerabilities in our systems, in
24 our social environmental systems and our institutions
25 and we've seen most starkly that the virus exploits

1
2 and exacerbates the racial injustices and inequities
3 woven into these systems and institutions. Next
4 slide.

5 With so much rapid change, some have asked the
6 fundamental questions. Has the pandemic changed our
7 reality or our understanding of reality? Has it
8 upended previous health beliefs, assumptions,
9 standards, that good comprehensive planning is based
10 on. That the Gowanus plan is based on? And has the
11 need for the plan changed? Clearly, it's even more
12 urgent in laying bare the persistent inequities of
13 our society. COVID-19 has highlighted tenants and
14 principles imbedded in our planning for Gowanus
15 issues, such as equity, inclusion, environmental
16 justice, open space in urban form, housing security,
17 just to name a few.

18 We need more housing to help alleviate crowded
19 situations across the city. We need more outdoor
20 spaces to just be and be safely and Gowanus has a
21 lack of open space today. And it also highlights our
22 need for job generation and giving a broader group of
23 people access to jobs and housing in open space in
24 high opportunity areas. Next slide.

1
2 After 18 months, people are more mad at each
3 other than ever, more stressed and fractured. It's
4 in times like these that we look for hope and at our
5 best, good planning is a vehicle for hope. And our
6 planning can give us hope when it's flexible enough
7 to respond to the unforeseen and permanent enough to
8 stand the test of time. And the Gowanus plan does
9 this. It responds to the needs of today and the
10 future. With significant new affordable homes, new
11 jobs and new open space including a new waterfront
12 park, new schools and incentives to keep Gowanus
13 mixed use and improvements to the infrastructure in
14 NYCHA communities. And a resilient shoreline, a
15 greener canopy and catalyzing ground field cleanups.
16 Next slide.

17 To make this all happen, the city is proposing a
18 number of land use changes that need to go through
19 the public review process. Next slide. These
20 actions would effect an 82 blocked area in Brooklyn
21 Community Districts 2 and 6. Next slide.

22 Again, this is a high level overview of the plan
23 and the zoning proposal and we've shortened it a lot
24 and we'll zoom through it. I know we want to get to
25 the questions and of course the public testimony.

1
2 Next slide. Once referred to as Gowanus Creek, the
3 canal was originally a wide title creek with numerous
4 small tributaries. Next slide.

5 The canal was crucial to the growth of Brooklyn,
6 especially the growth of surrounding Brownstone
7 Brooklyn. However, around the time and just after
8 World War II, the canal was a shell of its mere time
9 self as a number of changes disrupted businesses
10 throughout the area, including highway trucking.
11 Next slide.

12 By the 60's, the community was having regular
13 discussions about what to do with the neighborhood
14 and how the area can be cleaned up. And then what it
15 should be used for and how to support and plan for
16 residential growth while also supporting jobs and
17 businesses. Next slide. Those existential
18 questions, messy and hard discussions kept going on
19 the new millennium. With study and report after
20 study and report asking, what should we do with
21 Gowanus and who should it be for and who? Next
22 slide.

23 Uhm, and these are those reports and studies.
24 Next slide. Meanwhile, these hard conversations of
25 how to grow equitably and sustainably were occurring

1
2 as the adjacent neighborhoods were down zoned.
3 Restricting new home building in designated historic
4 districts. Next slide. These actions have had a
5 chilling effect on housing growth with real
6 implications for existing or perspective residents in
7 these neighborhoods that are some of the wealthiest,
8 healthiest and most transit abundant and proximate
9 job centers in the city. Next slide.

10 In response to community requests and area wide
11 zoning proposal was put forth, along with a proposal
12 for the city owned public place site, also known as
13 Gowanus Green. Next slide. In parallel, the
14 neighborhood and community advocated for super fund
15 designation of the canal, which occurred in 2010. In
16 2013, the decision laid out the proposed remedy and
17 steps to be taken by responsible parties to clean up
18 the canal.

19 And that work is now showing tangible results.
20 In the first remedial target area north of 3rd
21 Street, has been completed, dredging started last
22 November. Next slide. And of course has noted by
23 Council Member Lander, from 2013 to 2015, Council
24 Members Brad Lander and Stephen Levin in
25 collaboration with other elected officials in the

1
2 Center for Community Development, led a community
3 driven planning process called, Bridging Gowanus.
4 Building upon its foundation of community planning
5 and advocacy, the Gowanus Neighborhood Study launched
6 in August of 2016, as part of a comprehensive effort
7 to plan for the neighborhoods future. Next slide.

8 One of the first exercises we undertook was
9 taking a broad look at key existing conditions and
10 we'll just note a few of them. Next slide. Two of
11 the biggest influencers of land use patterns in
12 Gowanus are the canal and the 1961 zoning resolution.
13 The canal and its original industrial purpose bisects
14 the neighborhood and significantly influenced land
15 use patterns and block and lot sizes. Next slide.

16 While most of the rezoning area is outside of the
17 flood plain, many of the canal blocks are within the
18 flood plain, which is the image on the left. And as
19 you can see on the righthand map, this tracks what
20 the blocks primarily impacted by Super Storm Sandy in
21 2012. Next slide.

22 Here we're noting the median income in the census
23 tracks that comprise the rezoning area is \$115,000.
24 The tracks with NYCHA has a median income of \$39,000.
25 The neighborhood is well served by public transit.

1
2 There are five bus, subway stations that ring the
3 rezoning area in multiple bus lines along major
4 Brooklyn corridors. Next slide.

5 To sum this up, why act now? Years of debate and
6 disagreement about how the neighborhood should or
7 shouldn't change. How to clean up the canal and
8 brown fields in a coordinated way, major
9 environmental, economic, social and technological
10 events and shifts that have rapidly reshaped what it
11 means to find a home, to find a job, to raise or not
12 raise the family, to live a good life. We know what
13 - that the status quo is not what the community
14 wants. And years of no action have left brown fields
15 to sit and contamination to spread while housing
16 crisis explodes and climate change has made us more
17 vulnerable and less resilient. Next slide.

18 It's within this context that the community
19 requested a neighborhood study. And what we set out
20 to solve for when we launched our engagement and
21 outreach process in October 2016. Next slide. And
22 to get from, we have these challenges to what do we
23 want the future to be like and how can we shape it?
24 When we launched in October of 2016, we asked the
25 community about how to approach studying Gowanus and

1
2 what resulted was a collaborative four plus year
3 process. Next slide.

4 This resulted in the very robust Gowanus
5 framework. Next slide. And the framework was used
6 to advance both non-zoning and zoning related
7 strategies of the neighborhood plan. Next slide. I
8 will be running through these very quickly.

9 Since we released the June 2018 framework, we
10 made progress on a number of fronts including on
11 sustainability and resiliency goals and strategies.
12 Next slide. On advancing community and culture
13 resources. Next slide. On supporting the super fund
14 clean up and planning for upland brown field
15 remediation. Next slide.

16 On advancing fair housing goals, making progress
17 on our planning for the city owned Gowanus screen
18 site and our NYCHA commitments. Next slide. On
19 economic and job development, including releasing a
20 framework for the Gowanus portion of the Southwest
21 Brooklyn IBZ. Next slide. On transportation and
22 final slide or next slide for this section. And on
23 land use and urban design principles. Next slide.

24 A product of years of virtuous and iterative
25 feedback clips, the zoning proposal under public

1
2 review are a suite of land use actions that would
3 effectuate in a collaborative and comprehensive plan
4 for the neighborhood defined by the one's and future
5 clean vibrant and thriving Gowanus Canal. Next
6 slide.

7 I want to touch on a really important part of
8 this. The zoning proposal is an opportunity to
9 transform the neighborhood and fulfill the
10 communities vision for a mixed use sustainable and
11 thriving neighborhood. A cornerstone of the proposal
12 is its ability to promote a mixing of uses throughout
13 the neighborhood and in mixed use developments and
14 this slide is showing how we're doing it through a
15 neighborhood level basis on a block by block basis
16 but also in a building level basis. Next slide.

17 This next slide will talk to the building level
18 basis specifically around new plan to renovated open
19 space, basically along the canal and around Thomas
20 Green Playground where density in bulk envelopes are
21 sufficient to accommodate it. We're proposing non-
22 residential use incentives that allows developers to
23 increase their total maximum FAR with non-residential
24 uses only.
25

1
2 One would incentivize the inclusion of a wide
3 range of non-residential uses allowed in the proposed
4 districts. Excuse me, and the other would
5 incentivize a more specific set of uses that include
6 light industrial arts related cultural and civic uses
7 and repair and production services. This is what the
8 Council Member referred to as the Gowanus mix
9 incentive. Next slide.

10 The canal is undoubtedly the emerald necklace of
11 the plan. We've worked tirelessly and passionately
12 to ensure we leverage the canal sense of place and
13 promote the creation of an exciting urban environment
14 and we crafted building envelopes to go along with the
15 proposed density along the canal that are flexible to
16 promote excellent building design while being
17 prescriptive about base heights and tower location in
18 order to be sensitive to adjacent contacts.

19 These regulations are sensitive to transitions
20 toward upland blocks in the low rise brownstone
21 context while also being sensitive toward the canal
22 and future waterfront esplanade while also providing
23 enough flexibility. They promote variation in
24 building form and world class architecture. Next
25 slide. If the canal is the emerald necklace of the

1
2 plan, then the Gowanus Green is the crown jewel. The
3 city owned site is an opportunity to deliver on
4 decades of community organizing. Next slide.

5 Master plan with a private site to the south in
6 mind. Gowanus Green would revitalize a brown field
7 site, just a short equal distant walk between two
8 subway stations by mapping new parkland and new
9 streets that would institutionalize sound urban
10 design principles. Next slide. The project would
11 include approximately 950 units of affordable
12 housing, space for a new school and a new one and a
13 half acre waterfront park. Next slide.

14 And as you can see here, which was presented to
15 CB6 last November, is the commitment to 100 percent
16 affordable housing at Gowanus Green serving a broad
17 range of needs and New Yorkers. At least 50 percent
18 of rentals will be for extremely low and very low
19 income households. Including 15 percent dedicated to
20 formally homeless households. Moderate income
21 households will make up no more than 40 percent of
22 rentals and there will also be senior housing for
23 those over 62 years of age. Along with supportive
24 housing and some affordable homeownership. Next
25 slide.

1
2 The open spaces of the project are designed to
3 capture rain water and clean it through a series of
4 bioswales and rain gardens. It's also part of the
5 overall goal of the project to capture 100 percent of
6 the stormwater that falls on the site and play its
7 part in the overall community goal of reducing CSO's
8 and making Gowanus a greener, more resilient
9 neighborhood. Next slide.

10 The park at Gowanus Green is a key element. Not
11 only to the proposed 100 percent affordable
12 development but as part of an overall public realm
13 and open space network. The park will be funded by
14 the city with a development team constructing the
15 park. There will be a dedicated funding stream for
16 long term maintenance of the park. The park will
17 first go through a community design process. The
18 timing of the park and really the timing of the
19 entire site is dependent on a few variables,
20 including whether the site is used in conjunction
21 with the staging for the super fund dredging. And
22 completing the remediation of the entire site
23 pursuant to DEC and EPA review. Next slide.

24 Gowanus Green together with the urban design
25 framework noted above will set the stage for a

1
2 transformative new phase for the Gowanus Canal and
3 its surrounding. Next slide. Another long time
4 coming, a city sponsored project is Mercy Homes,
5 which is also on for this hearing an amended UDAP.
6 The amendment would facilitate a larger project than
7 originally contemplated along 4th Avenue. The
8 project will include 43 affordable units plus one
9 super unit at a proposed affordability up to 80
10 percent AMI. There would be some ground floor retail
11 space on 4th Avenue and the building will include
12 social services, residential amenities and a rooftop
13 farming program. Next slide. Uh, next slide, sorry.

14 Uh, and finally, it will just touch on a little
15 bit of the waterfront access plan. The Gowanus Canal
16 is a unique water body that requires unique zoning
17 regulations to guide its development and construction
18 of a continuous shore public walkway. The WAP will
19 institutionalize a framework for a continuous shore
20 public walkway that will be instructed over time.
21 And through a mix of public and private investment.
22 Next slide.

23 Together with the provisions to promote mixed use
24 buildings through innovative use incentives and
25 select ground floor use requirements, the WAP would

1
2 create a vibrant, active and resilient waterfront.
3 Next slide. Modifications in the WAP would help
4 ensure that the future shoreline is appropriately
5 elevated while allowing for a shore public walkway
6 with sufficient design flexibility to accommodate a
7 variety of uses activities and experiences. Next
8 slide.

9 Coupled with the proposed zoning changes, the
10 modifications in the special district and planned
11 open space investments, the WAP would also provide a
12 significant amounts of new open space and a new urban
13 tree canopy in a former industrial area that is
14 mostly hardscaped. These provisions would generate
15 new waterfront neighborhood parks and open spaces and
16 reconnect the community to the Gowanus Canal. That's
17 my last slide and I will be handing it off to my
18 colleague at DEP to talk about the salt lot
19 application. Next slide.

20 ALICIA WEST: Thanks Jonathan. Good morning
21 Council Members. My name is Alicia West and I am
22 DEP's Director of Public Design Outreach. I am
23 pleased to be here today to present the ULURP
24 applications for the Gowanus Canal combined sewer
25 overflow Owls Head facility. Next slide please.

1
2 So, as many of you know, in 2010 the U.S. EPA
3 designated the Gowanus Canal a super fund site,
4 identifying a number of potential responsible parties
5 including New York City and National Grid. The EPA
6 has required the city to remediate the petroleum
7 based contaminates of the canal and reduced combined
8 sewer overflows; CSO's for short, you will hear me
9 say CSO's a lot uhm into the canal. The city will
10 construct two underground CSO tanks and associated
11 head houses to intercept and store the combined sewer
12 overflow during wet weather events. So, this will
13 continue the city's ongoing work with both grey and
14 green infrastructure projects to limit CSO's into the
15 canal.

16 The first CSO facility is located at the head end
17 of the canal and that features an eight million
18 gallon tank. That project went through ULURP in 2017
19 and is nearing construction with a scheduled
20 completion date in late 2030. The second facility,
21 the one we're here to discuss today, is located at
22 the bend of the canal and we call this the Owls Head
23 site. And that will have a four million gallon tank.
24 Next slide please.

1
2 So, to build our Owl's Head facility, the city is
3 moving forward with four ULURP actions, and that's
4 what we're here to present today. So, these actions
5 include the site selection and acquisition of four
6 privately owned lots. Site selection of a city owned
7 lot and two city map amendments. Next slide please.

8 Here is aerial of the Owl's Head site overlaid
9 with the Block and Lot information of the parcels we
10 plan to site select and acquire. Block 977, Lot 3 is
11 already owned by the city and is home to the
12 Department of Sanitations salt shed and plow storage
13 as well as a composting and nursery facilities
14 operated by big reuse in partnership with Gowanus
15 Canal Conservancy, GCC for short. We're working
16 closely with Sanitation and these organizations to
17 relocate their operations during construction and
18 reestablish permanent facilities for them onsite.

19 We're also in contact with property owners and
20 tenants on the parcels to be acquired. Like we did
21 for the acquisition for the first tank, the city will
22 provide relocation services for business tenants,
23 where we're also working with the South Brooklyn
24 Industrial Development Cooperation in our outreach to
25 the tenants and we've already hosted one forum

1
2 together to answer questions. Next slide please.

3 Next slide. There we go.

4 Uhm, the first city amendment, sorry, the first
5 city map amendment would de-map 5th Street between 2nd
6 Avenue and the canal. This is at the Owls Head site.

7 And then next slide please. Uh, one more. The

8 second city map amendment is at the site of the

9 northern tank and that would de-map Douglas Street,

10 which is a peeper street between Nevins and the

11 Canal. So, we're just cleaning up the city map with

12 this action. Next slide, thank you.

13 So, here is illustrative slide of the conceptual

14 layout for the use of the site. The salmon colored

15 triangle is the area that will be used for the DEP

16 tank and the associated Head House. The yellow areas

17 will be used for construction staging, relocation of

18 DSNY operations, big reuses and GCC's facilities and

19 public open space along the waterfront. We're

20 working with Council Member Lander's office to graft

21 a productive public engagement process for the

22 development for the design development of the site.

23 And we know there is a great deal of interest in the

24 site and as we embark on the design, it's really

25

1
2 important for all of us to ensure that we have a
3 clear line of communication with the public.

4 So, that is my brief presentation and we are
5 happy to answer any questions you have about these
6 applications.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you so much
8 for your testimony. A couple of questions before I
9 turn it over to my colleague Council Member Lander.
10 Just going back to the beginning. Community Board 6,
11 local elected officials, the Brooklyn Borough
12 President, and the recommendations of the Gowanus
13 Radical Equality Report are united in calling for a
14 significant investment at the Gowanus Houses and the
15 Wyckoff Gardens NYCHA developments as part of this
16 plan. Why is this issue still unresolved?

17 JONATHAN KELLER: Thank you Chair Moya. Uhm, we
18 agree, it's absolutely critical. It's very important
19 that residents you know benefit from the rezoning,
20 including our you know friends and families in the
21 NYCHA communities just outside the rezoning area in
22 the investments made in the neighborhood. We have
23 been working, we, the administration and the city has
24 been working and been active with discussions with
25 NYCHA. Council Members Levin and Lander offices and

1
2 both Gowanus and Wyckoff tenant leaders about
3 priority capital investments. This has been ongoing
4 over the summer for many months now and we continue
5 to work together to determine a package of
6 improvements for these NYCHA sites.

7 As we have said, again the Administration has
8 said publicly, we are committed to addressing the
9 priority capital needs at these two sites within this
10 plan and you know as a DCP representative, I can't
11 talk to all of those conversations that have been
12 going on between NYCHA tenant leaders and the Council
13 Members but it's something that we are going to work
14 through in the next few weeks as we look towards
15 resolution.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Uhm, and was there ever
17 any consideration to incorporate investment in NYCHA
18 as part of the neighborhood plan from the early
19 stages or no?

20 JONATHAN KELLER: Yeah, it's as Council Member
21 Lander will know, this has been a long and winding
22 process to be honest. You know early, in the early
23 days. It's something that we had talked about with
24 the working groups and I'll share it. It was a very
25 humbling experience where I believe it was in one of

1
2 the weeks, we came out with some of the
3 recommendations and we came back and said, you know
4 funding NYCHA during this process is not something
5 that we were considering and that we were hoping to
6 decouple. The next week you know, East Harlem had
7 come through City Council and we did make a major
8 investment and we had come back and frankly had a
9 very humbling and honest discussion with folks that
10 this is an ongoing you know target. And that you
11 know, their advocacy and their organizing and the
12 organizing of folks all around the city can make a
13 difference. And that what we say is something that
14 is always you know going to be up for discussion
15 throughout this entire process.

16 And so, here we are. Uhm, we first made a
17 commitment in the Gowanus framework in June 2018 that
18 we would look at investing in these communities. A
19 lot has changed since then. Warren Houses has gone
20 into RAD and that should and has been advancing. And
21 we are now looking at Gowanus Houses and Wyckoff for
22 the appropriate package that will, you know, will get
23 us to a decision.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, so can we be confident
25 that the issues that we're talking about with NYCHA

1
2 will finally be addressed in the coming weeks before
3 the Council votes?

4 JONATHAN KELLER: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you. Switching to
6 the affordable housing piece here. The Gowanus
7 Neighborhood plan is projected to provide nearly
8 3,000 affordable housing units representing over a
9 third of the projected units. How does that amount –
10 how does this amount of affordable housing comparing
11 that with the major Brooklyn rezoning of the prior
12 administration like Greenpoint and Williamsburg in
13 downtown Brooklyn, how does this all amount to here?

14 JONATHAN KELLER: Uhm, you're asking for sort of
15 a comparison between –

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, comparison of the
17 affordable housing.

18 JONATHAN KELLER: Sure, I think uhm, you know I
19 will give an answer, Winston would be maybe better if
20 there's a follow-up on downtown Brooklyn and Ahmed
21 also Tigani is our colleague from HPD if he has
22 anything to sort of help or fix from my statement.

23 You know these are very different times. Uhm,
24 and you know this is also something we had lots of
25 conversations with community board on. Back in those

1
2 days, we didn't have in downtown Brooklyn, you know
3 we didn't even have voluntary inclusionary housing.
4 Greenpoint Williamsburg was were there first was
5 included in an areawide basis. And we have been
6 innovating on this over time and now we have
7 mandatory inclusionary housing.

8 And so, as a baseline, we now have somewhere
9 between 20 and 30 percent depending on the options
10 that are ultimately selected and in Gowanus, uhm, you
11 know we also have a city owned site which is also
12 where we have committed to 100 percent affordable
13 housing. And so, that is how we get to 3,000
14 affordable units. You know as many people note,
15 downtown Brooklyn was you know planned for a lot of
16 commercial that is still, is coming online a little
17 bit later than projected and a lot of housing was
18 built. And so, in terms of the ultimate numbers, I'd
19 have to look to Winston if he has any off the top of
20 his head. Otherwise, we can follow-up with the exact
21 numbers that have been produced. And Ahmed, also if
22 you want to add anything there.

23 AHMED TIGANI: Uh, absolutely. So thank you for
24 the question Council Member. Yeah, I'm sorry
25 Winston, did you want to speak first.

1
2 WINSTON VON ENGEL: No, go ahead Ahmed. Feel
3 free to respond and I'm happy to follow up on
4 Brooklyn.

5 AHMED TIGANI: Thank you sir. So, I would just
6 add that part of the approach here is to also look at
7 housing as HB's Office of Neighborhood Strategies has
8 made as our critical lens from a holistic multi
9 perspectives, from multiple perspectives. And here,
10 what we're doing within not only the larger rezoning,
11 using MIH as a pathway to ensuring that there is
12 affordable housing as part of this plan and expanding
13 diversity and access. You know, especially a credit
14 to DCP, to DEP and Parks and other agencies, there
15 are a lot of elements in this rezoning that embraces
16 this as a live, work neighborhood. As a diverse
17 work, live neighborhood. There is uh, substantial
18 investments in Parks, creating strong visual
19 corridors and a vibrant waterfront space. There is a
20 focus on making sure that we're opening up streets to
21 more accessible pedestrian access. A lot of that
22 really originates with the ideas and proposals put
23 forward by the community through this long process.

24 So, it's a neighborhood that lends itself to
25 inviting affordable housing and housing of all types.

1
2 We're going to put in the measures to make sure that
3 affordable housing is part of that mix and coupled
4 with the city investment and smart planning to ensure
5 that the neighborhood has all the amenities and
6 elements of being a place where people want to come
7 live and work. It will lead us to a place where that
8 kind of development will happen.

9 So, we hope that mixture of our policies and
10 investments will lead to the housing that we need to
11 see done and our requirements will ensure that
12 affordable housing happens along with it.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, the plan also calls
14 for -

15 WINSTON VON ENGEL: [INAUDIBLE 2:00:38].

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, I'm sorry. Winston, did
17 you want to say something?

18 WINSTON VON ENGEL: I was just -

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

20 WINSTON VON ENGEL: I was just going to point out
21 that the Gowanus plan Chair Moya uhm, has about
22 double the number of percentagewise of affordable
23 housing. This administration is really focused on
24 affordable housing and this plan and Gowanus, really
25 doubles down on that.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, I would just love to
3 see how that all breaks down if you could send it to
4 us before the vote, that would be very helpful.
5 Also, the plan calls for 950 units at the Gowanus
6 Green site, a former manufactured gas plant. Does
7 the city have full confidence that this site can be
8 fully remediated to be safe for a housing
9 development?

10 JONATHAN KELLER: Yes, absolutely but Ahmed, do
11 you want to take this? And we also have Mark
12 McEntire from OER here who can also help.

13 AHMED TIGANI: Well, I'll defer to Mark who is
14 obviously the expert. But I'll just say that you
15 know, in our conversations with both our federal and
16 state partners, the EPA and DEC which both have
17 really been helpful in thinking about the right way
18 to do this. Have stated that they will work with us
19 closely to make sure that this site is remediated to
20 be protective of all public health and environmental
21 concerns. I think from the start, it's been our
22 focus to make sure that whatever we do, that we're
23 building it so that it's safe and contributes
24 positively to the neighborhood and there is a
25 tremendous amount of confidence, especially given

1
2 that we are a city that has seen large scale projects
3 happen. Has seen affordable housing happen on sites
4 that were formerly environmentally in need of
5 remediation. Move forward and continue to prosper
6 successfully.

7 So, at this site, we have all confidence that
8 both with our federal and state partners along with a
9 highly prepared development team that we have a
10 strategy to make sure that's safe. But I'll defer to
11 my colleague with more details.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Mark, how about that.

13 MARK MCENTIRE: Sure, hey. Mark McEntire,
14 Director of OER. Yes, uh, the city can have
15 confidence that go on a screen, public place, as well
16 as the other areas that the rezoning would designate
17 per housing can be safely remediated. They will be
18 brought; all of these properties where housing is to
19 be built, will be brought to state residential
20 standards and when that's achieved and it's achieved
21 all across the state on a daily basis. When it's
22 achieved, Gowanus Green will be safe for the school,
23 for the park, and for the housing and. And it will
24 be done.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you Mark. Uhm,
3 the Borough Presidents report recommended relocating
4 the Gowanus EMS station in order to free up an
5 additional site for 100 percent affordable housing.
6 Have you considered this recommendation at all?

7 JONATHAN KELLER: Uh, that was something that had
8 come up not much at all to be honest Chair. I would
9 say you know that area had been rezoned as part of
10 the 363, 365 Bond Street rezoning in 2009. It's not
11 something that is currently part of the plan and I
12 would just note you know that conversations are not
13 precluded from advancing in the future. But you know
14 some of the things we have heard from the Community
15 are making sure that there is adequate infrastructure
16 soft and hard in the neighborhood to accommodate for
17 the growing population in the future.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thanks. I just want to go
19 quickly back to one quick question. We were talking
20 about the remediation. So, what is the timeline for
21 the remediation and construction of the Gowanus
22 Green? What are the phases and what year will it be
23 fully complete?

24 JONATHAN KELLER: Sure, I think I can start us
25 off a little bit and then hand it over to Ahmed to

1
2 finish it on that. Uhm, so, I'll tell you what we
3 know. We know that the site is remediated right now
4 by National Grid as part of the remediation of the
5 manufactured gas plant that is being overseen by DEC.
6 The site will need to be completely remediated
7 further by the development team. So, National Grid
8 is essentially handling the hotspots where the tanks
9 were. The underground tanks of the manufacture gas
10 plant and the development team has applied to DEC for
11 the Brownsville Cleanup program and that is being
12 overseen by DEC and reviewed also by EPA.

13 That will need to be done, that full remediation
14 before anything can happen on the site. There is the
15 potential need for the site to be used in conjunction
16 with the super fund drudging as a station site.
17 That's something that the city frankly does not want
18 to see. We would like to bring this generational
19 benefit and opportunity to the neighborhood as soon
20 as we can and using it as a staging site would mean
21 you know the site could be used for a number of
22 years. And so, if we can find an alternative staging
23 site that would ramp up the timeline to uh, in the
24 next few years. And there would be, I think, this is
25

1
2 where Ahmed can talk to the phasing once the site is
3 ready to be constructed on.

4 But if the site is needed to be used for a
5 staging site, then it is up to really the timeline
6 for the dredging of the canal. And you have three
7 remedial target areas for the canal. The first one
8 is completed and they are starting to do the capping
9 and then they will do the sediment to encourage
10 natural habitats and organisms and life to come back
11 to the canal. Very exciting. RTA2 and 3 are
12 starting and those are at this moment in time
13 anticipated to run through I believe the end of the
14 decade if not a little bit before the end.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, thank you. Now, I want
16 to talk about sort of the mixed use. Both the
17 Borough President and the Community Board, they
18 recommended that the Gowanus mix provision uh, to
19 incentivize arts, light industrial and nonprofit
20 space to be strengthened. Are you confident that the
21 developers will use the incentives as currently
22 proposed and how much arts and light industrial space
23 do you project will result from the Gowanus mix
24 zoning tool?

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 110
2 JONATHAN KELLER: Yeah, that's a great question.
3 Yeah, we are confident in it. We worked very hard
4 and for a long time with Council Member Lander to
5 come up with something that was reflective of the
6 uses in the community today and that we want to see
7 reinforced in part of the community in the future.

8 The two incentives are you know focused along the
9 canal, around Thomas Green Playground. In my
10 presentation, I noted where density and envelopes are
11 sufficient to accommodate it and they're on larger
12 sites and they're on developments where an incentive
13 can be accommodated quite easily.

14 I'll also say that, and this should come as no
15 surprise to Council Member Lander and others that
16 have heard me answer this question before, but we
17 also have a very interesting, very happy you know
18 coming together, a synergy between ground floor flood
19 protections in new buildings pursuant to appendix G.
20 You can dry flood proof; you can wet flood proof.
21 One is a little bit more expensive than the other.
22 Putting ground floor commercial or nonresidential or
23 industrial or arts on the ground floor can be used as
24 a way to actually harden these buildings. And so, we
25 think because of the proximity to the canal that they

1
2 are in flood zones that this will be an incentive
3 readily taken up by the developers and we look
4 forward to that occurring and we crafted the
5 incentive with that in mind.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, okay, I just want to -
7 I got just a couple more questions before I turn it
8 over. On sort of the labor and workforce development
9 angle here, uh, previous neighborhood of wide
10 rezoning's have included language honoring a letter
11 from former Deputy Mayor Glenn. The city would honor
12 labor and wage standards created in conjunction with
13 32BJ on city initiated rezoning's. Will this honor -
14 it serve the workers commitment? Will that have a
15 similar commitment also to the construction jobs that
16 are being created in this rezoning?

17 JONATHAN KELLER: Well, we are obviously still
18 negotiating the POA and that will continue. My
19 understanding is all of what you had said, you know
20 had worked really well for the other rezoning's
21 around the table here. I know Ahmed is ready to
22 speak specifically on details for you know the city
23 owned site that we have, Gowanus Green. Ahmed.

24 AHMED TIGANI: Sure, I mean, Council Member, as
25 you know we work through the Hire NYC program but

1
2 separate and apart, since October 2019, any project
3 that we put \$2 million or more into it, is required
4 to submit a job outreach plan and that is a
5 requirement where development teams are required to
6 submit information on their plan out to the workforce
7 to engage the workforce within a three mile radius of
8 the project.

9 Through the phasing and throughout the project,
10 HPD monitors the progress of those goals and requires
11 development teams to submit quarterly reports. And
12 it's a citywide program but of course, these are
13 elements that we're talking about specifically how it
14 would apply here in Gowanus. I also do want to
15 mention the prevailing wage law here also applies.
16 You know the city's policies require that in rezoning
17 areas, prevailing wage must be paid to all building
18 service employees in new and existing building where
19 at least 30 units of residential housing receives
20 city financial assistance of \$ 1 million or more.

21 As for the specifics of the POA, I know that you
22 know that's being negotiated now but HPD has these
23 particular elements and we work closely with SBS on
24 them.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Well, I would really like to
3 see where we're at with that prior to that vote
4 Ahmed. As you know Hire NYC has not been a
5 successful program. And so, I can sit here and go
6 through the list of things of how many local hires
7 have we had. Give me the zip codes of the local
8 hires that we had in all the rezoning's. It's not
9 going to amount to much.

10 So, I do not want us to be consistently towing
11 that line, that we're using Hire NYC when it actually
12 has not worked in the previous neighborhood
13 rezoning's that we've done in the past. So, it's
14 important for us to know how that is going, at least
15 for me as Chair to know how that is going -

16 AHMED TIGANI: Yes, Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Before we take a vote. Also,
18 with that, how will the city agencies require and
19 support local hiring and sourcing and the
20 construction it is protected by this plan?

21 JONATHAN KELLER: Sorry, I was taking notes on
22 your question. Could you state that again for me?

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Sure, how will the city
24 agencies require and support local hiring and
25 sourcing in the construction protected by this plan?

1
2 JONATHAN KELLER: That's actually something that
3 our other agencies would need to help me with and I
4 don't have that answer for you right now. So, we can
5 get back to you before the vote.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: So, which agency would be
7 required to answer that?

8 AHMED TIGANI: So, Council Member, I'll just
9 reiterate again, HPD does work with the development
10 team who was also here today to craft and implement a
11 local workforce outreach plan. We will work with
12 them -

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: What is that workforce plan?

14 AHMED TIGANI: So, it's again based on the
15 parameters of the Hire NYC program but specifically,
16 it's develop and engage possible workforce within a
17 three mile radius of the project that has information
18 about current and future employment needs guiding
19 that workforce development.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, we really need to kind
21 of resolve that issue before we go into that vote.
22 It is extremely important for me to understand where
23 we are with this. If we have revamped the Hire NYC
24 program like you have been touting, it is really
25

1
2 important for us to see where that has improved as
3 you are going through this process.

4 AHMED TIGANI: Yes sir.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: And then lastly, Community
6 Board 6, local elected officials, Borough President
7 and the recommendations of the Gowanus racial equity
8 report are united in calling for an investment in the
9 neighborhood level of workforce development and adult
10 education strategy to help address the disparity, not
11 economic opportunities but do you support these
12 recommendations?

13 JONATHAN KELLER: Uhm, we, yes, generally
14 speaking, we've been very open to workforce
15 development. Specifically, I would need to get back
16 to you on that specific recommendation.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [LOST AUDIO 2:14:52].

18 JONATHAN KELLER: Sorry, Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: That is my last question. I
20 see that we've been joined by -

21 JONATHAN KELLER: Chair?

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah.

23 JONATHAN KELLER: Oh, no, sorry you were breaking
24 up from me, so I just wanted to make sure I didn't
25 miss anything from you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [BROKEN AUDIO] I'll turn it
3 over to Council Member Lander. I just want to give
4 Chair Salamanca the opportunity to ask a few
5 questions.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you Chair Moya.
7 Can you hear me?

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright thank you.
10 Good afternoon everyone. I just have a few questions
11 regarding this rezoning. What capital investments
12 has the administration committed to for this
13 rezoning?

14 JONATHAN KELLER: We've been working together
15 with the community and the Council Member - well, for
16 a number of years, even beyond six years when we
17 officially started you know so, in terms of what we
18 have committed to in the past few months, uh, we've
19 you know it's been largely focused on mitigation for
20 open space in school yards to playgrounds. If you
21 want a list of things that have been committed to
22 during the entire process, I would have to get back
23 to you on the specific bullet points of those.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Is there a dollar -
25

1
2 JONATHAN KELLER: And that's mainly just because
3 we've been doing this for so long and I don't want to
4 miss anything off the top of my head.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, is there a
6 dollar amount that has been committed up to this date
7 and I know more probably will as we go through this
8 process here in the Council. But is there a dollar
9 amount that you can say that you've committed to so
10 far?

11 JONATHAN KELLER: No, there is not a committed to
12 dollar amount.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, uhm, in this
14 rezoning, this proposed rezoning, how many lots are
15 being rezoned? And if you can tell me how many lots
16 and of that total amount, that number, how many are
17 private and how many are public?

18 JONATHAN KELLER: These are good questions. Uhm,
19 if you want like down to the exact number, we can get
20 that to you. If you would like the top of my head, I
21 will give that to you as well.

22 There's 200 acres in the rezoning area.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yeah.

24 JONATHAN KELLER: Uhm, our largest site is
25 Gowanus Green, that's city owned and that's about

1
2 five and a half acres. And then we also have Mercy
3 Home, which is not necessarily city owned but it's
4 part of a city sponsored project that has taken a
5 number of years to come to fruition, which is
6 probably about 5,000 square feet.

7 And so, the vast majority of you know and I'm not
8 including Thomas Green Playground and the EMS
9 station, you know etc. Uhm, but the vast majority of
10 the land being rezoned and the development that is
11 projected is going to be on privately owned sites.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, and uhm, the
13 publicly owned lot that is going to be rezoned, are
14 you planning on building affordable housing there?

15 JONATHAN KELLER: Yes. Gowanus Green will be 100
16 percent affordable.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: What will the AMI
18 structure be? And the reason I ask is because this
19 neighborhood is one of the wealthiest neighborhoods
20 in the City of New York and I want to ensure that
21 low-income families have an opportunity to live in
22 this neighborhood.

23 And so, I'm just curious to know what's the AMI
24 structure. I know that the MIH will also be part of
25 this project and I'm also curious to know what are

1
2 the options? The options that are being presented,
3 whether it is Option One, Two, or Three for MIH.

4 JONATHAN KELLER: Sure, I'll take the MIH
5 question first and then I'll hand it over to Ahmed
6 for the Gowanus Green and also Mercy Home projects.
7 But for MIH, we certify the ULURP application with
8 MIH Options One, Two and Three. We've also - we know
9 and we've heard from Council Member Lander publicly
10 that you know his desire is for this to be selected
11 as MIH One and Three.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, well, if I
13 know my colleague Council Member Lander, he's going
14 to really fight for that MIH Option One. Maybe we
15 could strike off Option Two but that's for a
16 different discussion.

17 AHMED TIGANI: And uh, Council Member if I can
18 add in to answer your question about the AMI
19 structure for Gowanus Green. So, for this project
20 we're hoping to deliver 950 units of 100 percent
21 affordable project. At least 50 percent of the
22 rental units will be dedicated to extremely low and
23 very low income households. Those income averaging
24 would be from uh, at or below 50 percent of AMI, so
25 that's approximately \$51,200 for a family of three.

1
2 And this includes at least a 15 percent of the rental
3 units dedicated to formerly homeless households. No
4 more than 40 percent of the rental housing will be
5 dedicated to moderate income households. That's with
6 incomes averaging between 80 percent to 120 percent
7 AMI. So, approximately \$81,920 to \$122,884 family of
8 three.

9 Senior housing we provided for seniors 62 years
10 of age and older. There's a supportive housing
11 component that will be provided to formerly homeless
12 disabled individuals and homeless families with a
13 disabled household. And there is an affordable
14 homeownership component for incomes averaging between
15 80 percent to 130 percent AMI. Approximately \$81,920
16 to \$133,120 for a family of three.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Uhm, lets say that
18 this rezoning goes as planned and gets approved
19 before the you know, when it has to. Uhm, how soon,
20 what commitment is HPD making in terms of building
21 these affordable housing units? Because we do, we do
22 understand that HPD has a backlog and there are
23 projects that were approved years ago in the Council
24 and HPD still has not closed on these projects. So,
25

1
2 what's the timeline or timeframe to close on this
3 affordable housing project that started building?

4 AHMED TIGANI: Thank you for the question. You
5 know, as we mentioned, we do have a considerable
6 number of affordable housing projects we are trying
7 to make a reality.

8 I think part of the timing here is going back to
9 a point that DCP made earlier, we are trying to
10 figure out the staging question for the EPA work.
11 The question about the super fund cleanup sequencing.
12 All of that will go into the process of figuring out
13 when we can really focus and get this done. So, it's
14 right now, there's not a determined time but we are
15 trying to work to make sure that all the pieces are
16 in play that can happen now, so that when ready to
17 press go, we can press go.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, then my last
19 line of question has to do with the NYCHA development
20 that's nearby. Uhm, a few years ago, I visited the
21 Gowanus with Council Member Lander. It was an
22 extremely hot summer day and we drove around and we
23 spoke, he and I spoke about the NYCHA developments
24 and maybe the opportunity to add capital improvements
25 that they need as part of this rezoning.

1
2 Uhm, what commitments has this administration
3 made to ensure that the NYCHA developments are
4 benefiting from this rezoning?

5 JONATHAN KELLER: Yes, thank you and I'll answer
6 that. I wanted to just go back and actually add a
7 little bit to your other question to note. On
8 Gowanus Green, the programming, the breakdown that
9 Ahmed went over, that you know we didn't materialize
10 that you know out of thin air. Like everything
11 Gowanus, there's been a deep amount of engagement and
12 organizing and advocacy from the Council Members but
13 also the community and we've held a number of
14 community visioning sessions. And so, this is really
15 responsive to what the community wants and I've
16 really frankly, just I've only heard a lot of praise
17 for that programming as in the reception of it. And
18 then on Mercy Homes, I believe the AMI's are up to 80
19 percent AMI.

20 AHMED TIGANI: That's correct. 30 to 80 percent
21 AMI with ten units financed by the States Office for
22 people with Developmental Disabilities.

23 JONATHAN KELLER: I wanted to get that on the
24 record. Uhm, and so back to your, sorry, to your
25 NYCHA question, the Administration has met with NYCHA

1
2 tenant leaders who represent Gowanus and Wyckoff
3 houses. As I noted I think a little bit earlier, the
4 Warren Houses has gone into RAD I believe in the past
5 year and has been advancing through its capital needs
6 there.

7 But we have met, the Administration has met
8 several times with NYCHA tenant leaders at the other
9 two houses to develop capital investment proposals.
10 And we will continue to work with them throughout the
11 rest of this process and I know we're also working
12 closely obviously with the Council Members Lander and
13 Levin in this as well.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: But, you know and I'm
15 going to wrap it with this. What is their - I just
16 feel that when these rezoning's happen and they get
17 approved in different neighborhoods, we tend to
18 forget about NYCHA. And they have big capital needs.
19 Have you met with NYCHA leadership? Not just a
20 tenant but NYCHA, you know the president and ask
21 what's their capital needs? What's the dollar amount
22 to fix these NYCHA developments that are adjacent or
23 are within the rezoning?

24 JONATHAN KELLER: Yes, that has been part of the
25 dialogue, absolutely. Off the top of my head, it's I

1
2 believe for Gowanus Houses, it's north of \$200
3 million is the physical needs assessment and we can
4 get the exact breakdown for you. And Wyckoff is less
5 than that, though absolutely significant. Uhm, I
6 think it's closer to 74, 75 but we can get those
7 numbers to you as well.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright.

9 JONATHAN KELLER: It's been definitely top of
10 mind, center of the conversation, meaningful
11 investment means being real on what the needs are.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, well, I hope
13 as we uh, I know this is the first hearing and I know
14 that there's going to be many meetings as we get to
15 the finish line and I really, really encourage my
16 colleague and the administration to include these
17 NYCHA developments, their capital needs as part of
18 this overall capital dollars that will be invested in
19 this neighborhood.

20 And then finally, I just want to congratulate you
21 Ahmed on your new position. You and I have worked
22 for many years and uhm, I'm extremely proud of you
23 and congratulations Commissioner.

24 AHMED TIGANI: Thank you so much sir.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you Mr. Chair.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Chair, why you gassing his
3 head up? Enough already with that title. He can
4 pick up that extra mile.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: It's well deserved.
6 It's well deserved.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It is, no, we love you Ahmed.
8 Anyway.

9 AHMED TIGANI: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Chair
11 for your comments and for your questions. I now want
12 to turn it over to Council Member Lander for his
13 questions.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much to
15 both Chairs. To Chair Moya and Land Use Committee
16 Chair Salamanca and I'll actually start just by
17 responding to a couple of things Chair Salamanca put
18 out there. First, we definitely do plan to exclude
19 the moderate income MIH Option, MIH Option Two and
20 just leave One and Three, which are the deeper
21 affordability options choose able under MIH and we'd
22 love to go deeper but those are the options that are
23 available.

24 At Public Place, it really was strong community
25 pressure that pushed for a plan that had originally

1
2 been presented as 75 percent affordable to make it
3 100 percent affordable. And I'm grateful the
4 Administration responded but really, that was a
5 strong community demand and a push for real deep
6 affordability and you know, this is not as you say
7 Chair Salamanca, a community that has - you know it's
8 one of the wider, wealthier, more exclusive areas in
9 the city. We wanted to do that racial impact study,
10 which the new legislation will require on future land
11 use actions but doesn't require here and we did it
12 voluntarily to really dig in. I'm pleased with those
13 improvements. I hope I'll have the help of both
14 Chairs with a couple of additional things that we're
15 pushing for the community preference requirement. We
16 would like to include Community Boards 2 and 7 in
17 addition to Community Board 6 in the affordable
18 housing on public place and an MIH, which the
19 administration has not done previously and obviously
20 subject to some litigation and policy debate.

21 But I think this is an area that Council should
22 push forward on both here and on SoHo/NoHo. Because
23 if we want MIH to be inclusive, than we need to make
24 sure the areas that we're including in community
25 preference are. And we're also pushing for the Mercy

1
2 Home project. The community welcomed two family
3 shelters just a couple of blocks away on 4th Avenue
4 and we'd like to see families that have their kids at
5 the local public school PS124 who were there, have a
6 priority option for the permanently affordable
7 housing created.

8 So, I'm not even going to ask the administration
9 about that because they are going to give me as much
10 as they are my friends, word salad about it. And so,
11 I'm just going to ask my Chairs to help me push hard
12 for it. We can win those things in this rezoning
13 from the Administration but it's going to take
14 pushing. So, thank you.

15 I am going to pick up on the NYCHA questions,
16 which were both asked and I really want to start here
17 by on the one hand saying, for the individuals who
18 have been working on this rezoning, you know Jonathan
19 front and center as the person whose like done the
20 most work and stands in front of it. But everybody
21 else who is on this call, like, you guys have put a
22 lot of hard work into this rezoning and I really
23 appreciate it.

24 I do need to say on this NYCHA issue, it's just
25 very frustrating for the community to have

1
2 articulated from the beginning, this is the top
3 community priority and still be here at what is the
4 final public hearing on the rezoning and not have a
5 number, not have a commitment.

6 I understand you're stuck in a structure that
7 City Hall has created where that gets negotiated
8 after the final hearing in a points of agreement
9 letter between the Council Member and the
10 Administration and I appreciate your saying that you
11 take it seriously and are going to take it seriously.
12 But I just need to start by saying like, it's a
13 failure of our public process that here we are at
14 this final thing. There are so many other details
15 and public housing residents and leaders despite all
16 those years of conversation can't see anything today.
17 And I'm frustrated for them and it's a flaw in our
18 process. So, I am glad Jonathan that you gave the
19 Chair the numbers because you're right, the PNA is
20 \$300 million in total capital needs at those two
21 developments. And they all should be funded.

22 The residents have on their own in dialogue with
23 an architect that Council Member Levin secured. Done
24 a bunch of internal workshops and processes to
25 identify top priorities for prepare. We've shared

1
2 that memo with you. It actually corresponds fairly
3 significantly with what NYCHA had indicated were core
4 repair needs. But just so people know what we're
5 talking about, like, we're not talking about uhm, you
6 know new amenities. We're talking about bathroom and
7 kitchen renovations to remove mold, replacing broken
8 fixtures and appliances and meeting code
9 requirements. Overdue upgrades to electrical and
10 heating systems, reliable elevators, lighting and
11 waste infrastructure. Uhm, NYCHA estimated a kind of
12 \$120 to \$130 million. We think the cost of those
13 repairs is probably closer to \$200 million. That's
14 still not the whole PNA but it is what the residents
15 are prioritizing.

16 So, I just want to really clarify, when you say
17 significant commitment, you are talking about meeting
18 those core basic needs that these buildings have,
19 yes?

20 JONATHAN KELLER: Yes. Yeah, it's significant,
21 meaningful investments, I think. You're absolutely
22 right and I think it's not - I've been educated along
23 the way, it's not as easy. You know, obviously
24 nothing is easy with NYCHA but it's not as easy as it
25

1
2 seems to make sure that we take care of the residents
3 in their homes.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, I appreciate that
5 and I'm going to take it that that includes all of
6 the things I just listed. Uhm, and as long as it
7 does, we'll be able to work closely with the
8 residents after this hearing. Get to real numbers,
9 get to a real priority list and be able to come back
10 to Chair Salamanca answering his questions. But most
11 importantly doing right by the residents here.

12 So, we'll hear more about that I'm sure in public
13 testimony. I also just want to make sure in terms of
14 ongoing oversight, you know residents also, just have
15 experience as it sounds like you have a lot of
16 frustration on their own over the years in having
17 NYCHA work with them and really provide clear
18 communication.

19 So, NYCHA resident leaders are asking that the
20 city commit to an ongoing process. At least
21 quarterly meetings, a designated liaison, you know
22 regular updates. You know, real Section 3 hiring,
23 accountability on tenants rights and that, you know
24 they will have a line to City Hall and NYCHA through
25

1
2 the implementation of those repairs. Does the
3 Administration agree to that?

4 JONATHAN KELLER: That all sounds like the stuff
5 that we've been talking about so far and that my
6 understanding, yeah. That we're going to, the
7 numbers are part of it, which we don't have yet but
8 the other part is the sort of the soft stuff that you
9 were talking to.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, I'm taking that as
11 a yes on NYCHA led resident oversight body on the
12 NYCHA repairs and that we will be able to codify that
13 in the points of agreement going forward.

14 Okay, I want to move to issues around combined
15 sewer overflow and flooding. Uhm, obviously this is
16 a longstanding issue in Gowanus relating to cleaning
17 the canal, relating to the super fund project and
18 obviously made even more palpable in the wake of the
19 flooding and the wake of Hurricane Ida. 4th Avenue
20 has been flooding for about 100 years. We've got
21 pictures of flooding on 4th Avenue from about the
22 1950's and this rezoning involves more housing there.
23 So, we need, this is an opportunity of time when we
24 must invest in the infrastructure.

1
2 I want to start with CSO's and I think these are
3 probably questions for DEP. Uhm, you know another
4 core principle of all of ours, has been that any
5 development pursuant to the rezoning, can't generate
6 additional CSO volume into the canal. Can't risk
7 polluting the remedy as the EPA calls it. I'm
8 grateful to DEP for the work to develop the 2021
9 unified stormwater rule, which has stricter standards
10 for stormwater management.

11 But there are a lot of questions that are
12 remaining. So, the EPA raised a series of issues in
13 a letter to the city based on the draft Environmental
14 Impact Statement before the final Environmental
15 Impact Statement was issued. Can you address their
16 concerns, I guess both in summary here and are you
17 going to address them in more detail in writing.

18 MICHAEL DELOACH: Yes, so we, we, you know the
19 city obviously has made a considerable investment
20 reducing CSO's into the canal using a variety of
21 approaches from reconstruction of the pump stations
22 to installation of high level storm sewers to convey
23 the sewer water. We also have three large scale
24 sewer reconstruction projects in the area currently.
25 Obviously, like you mentioned the fourth coming

1
2 unified stormwater rule has two elements to help
3 increase capacity in the combined sewers. And then
4 obviously we have the new tanks which are coming
5 online.

6 There are some questions about monitoring and
7 remediation that we are currently having discussions
8 with EPA about. There's a little difference of
9 interpretation of the original rod but I think we're
10 optimistic that we can find a compromise that will
11 you know, achieve everybody's goals, and ensure that
12 we're you know following the super fund rules but
13 also ensuring that the community knows that you know
14 the CSO, the non-increase in CSO's as a result of the
15 development is achieved.

16 So, those conversations continue and are sort of
17 highly technical and have a lot of lawyers involved
18 but I'm very optimistic as is our Commissioner at DEP
19 that will figure out a way to move forward in a
20 meaningful way.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So, let me just ask a
22 couple of those details. I mean first, do you commit
23 that the rule will be in effect prior to the first
24 sewer connection that would come from development in
25 the rezoning area.

1
2 MICHAEL DELOACH: Yeah, so we're just about to
3 open up public comment in the rule making and we hope
4 to have it in effect in early 2022. So, we think
5 that it should work properly and we'll figure out
6 ways if there's one or two that are in jeopardy that
7 we'll figure out a path forward to do it but it
8 should be fine.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Uhm, and then I know —

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Part of the issue with
12 EPA is around monitoring of implementation and
13 effectiveness of the new rule by measuring that
14 changes in sanitary and stormwater. It's my
15 understanding that's mandated by the EPA's Executive
16 Administrative order, which you know they're pretty
17 good at enforcing. But there is going to be, DEP is
18 going to monitor the implementation and effectiveness
19 of the new rule in a way that ultimately satisfies
20 the EPA under its authority.

21 MICHAEL DELOACH: That's sort of the crucks of
22 what's happening right now with our ongoing
23 discussions. There is some conversation about
24 different outfalls, numbers of outfalls that we're
25 having but yes, we have always intended to do

1
2 monitoring and remediation if needed. We need to
3 drill down a little bit on some of the specifics but
4 yes, that is the intent of DEP in honoring the order.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And look, I mean the EPA
6 super fund authority is more than like the Council's
7 negotiating rezoning authority. So, I'm pretty
8 confident there that the EPA is going to ultimately
9 insist on something that the community can rely on
10 and that the DEP will find, has to find a way to
11 satisfy it.

12 So, my one question here that I think is, I'm not
13 sure the EPA is pushing on but it makes a lot of
14 sense to me. I'm not an expert here but talking to
15 the Gowanus Canal Conservancy and a lot of other
16 experts, they have set recommended lowering the lot
17 size threshold currently at 25,000 square feet down
18 to perhaps 10,000 square feet. At least in the
19 Gowanus area to capture the greater number of the
20 development sites. Is that something DEP is
21 considering and would consider it?

22 MICHAEL DELOACH: So, the rule requires 20,000
23 square feet right now, not 25,000 and we did a pretty
24 thorough review of the inventory of lots, sort of
25 reached the sweet spot for that. But uhm, we'd be

1
2 happy to talk to you about you know something more
3 focused on Gowanus and see if there's an opportunity
4 to I know, we've heard this often from the
5 environmental group, so we'd be happy to talk about
6 it. We're anxious to get the rule going with the
7 20,000 but we would love to talk to you about you
8 know greater successes we could have in the future.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I understand citywide
10 there might be a lot of lots between 10,000 and
11 20,000, which are in places that are much less strong
12 from a market point of view or much less
13 consequential from a stormwater point of view but
14 trying that in Gowanus seems like we should look at
15 it.

16 I want to move on uh, and I don't want to take
17 too much longer with all of my questions because I
18 really do want to get to hearing from the community.
19 So, I may save some for later but let me just ask -

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just a reminder, it was a ten
21 minute time limit. I'm going to give you more time
22 Brad but if we can move it - you can come in for a
23 second round.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's fine. Absolutely,
25 well, I can definitely wait on my colleagues sorry.

1
2 So, let me just and then I'll even try to just
3 abbreviate. So, I just want to ask like two more
4 questions.

5 Uhm, one is that issues of street flooding, which
6 are related to but not necessarily directly connected
7 to CSO's were obviously raised by the Ida Flood. So,
8 we have been seeking some commitment now for
9 infrastructure improvements to address the flooding
10 at 4th Avenue near Carroll to address dangerous flash
11 flooding. I know that you guys have been looking at
12 this. Are you prepared today to commit to some path
13 forward here and the Mayor and DEP announced in the
14 last week or two some other steps forward. Some that
15 are really welcome like getting, moving on the long
16 term control plan studies and committing that they
17 will involve new rainwater estimates. But you've
18 also talked about doing ten at risk neighborhood
19 cloudburst studies. And boy, it sure feels like
20 Gowanus perhaps together with Red Hook make the whole
21 water shed. It should be included, so uhm, would you
22 commit to doing one of those cloudburst studies?

23 MICHAEL DELOACH: Yeah, I think that that would
24 be fine. We're going to just - you know, there's a
25 little bit of criteria that we're setting for how

1
2 we're going to evaluate the neighborhoods but
3 internally, we think that this could be a good
4 opportunity to study the area, including Red Hook.
5 So, yes, I think that is a realistic goal that we'll
6 be able to achieve.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright and how about - I
8 don't want to wait until the end of the cloudburst
9 study to get a commitment for infrastructure
10 improvements at 4th and Carroll because we've known
11 its flooded there for 100 years. This is a moment to
12 make sure we make you know a real plan you know with
13 real investment going forward.

14 MICHAEL DELOACH: I think we'll be in good shape
15 there as well.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright, I'll pause here
17 so I can turn it over to colleagues and come back.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Council
19 Member. I believe we have Council Member Grodenchik.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Chair. And
21 thank you to my colleague Brad Lander for taking a
22 breath there. Uhm, many of my questions have been
23 asked by Chair Moya and Council Members Lander and
24 Chair Salamanca. Uhm, I do want to reiterate as a
25 product of New York City Public Housing, and a member

1
2 of this Subcommittee, I'm very deeply concerned as
3 all of my colleagues have previously stated that -
4 and Councilman Lander brought out that this has been
5 an issue that has been from the get go and it's still
6 not resolved. And we have seen from this
7 administration uhm, a lack sometimes of transparency
8 in terms of dollar figures whether it's NYCHA or many
9 other issues that we have dealt with them on. And
10 uh, I do want to thank all those involved in this.
11 The professionals from the city but especially the
12 people from the community who have worked so hard to
13 make this a better uhm, plan.

14 Do we have a number, a ballpark figure on the
15 value of the amenities to the community of Gowanus?
16 The Parks, NYCHA, DEP, all that. How much money are
17 we spending here?

18 JONATHAN KELLER: Yeah, we don't have a sort of a
19 rolled up number.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Will you have one
21 before I have to vote on this? I mean, this is a big
22 number. It's 200 acres and I you know I don't have a
23 problem spending money but I want to make sure I know
24 what I'm spending it on. Uhm, on the combined CSO
25 tank, the CSO tanks, do we know how much rain because

1
2 I dealt with this issue many, many years ago. How
3 much rain would have to fall on the water shed before
4 the tanks get filled up?

5 JONATHAN KELLER: Good question. DEP, do we have
6 that off hand? I'm sure we have that somewhere from
7 someone.

8 MICHAEL DELOACH: We definitely have those
9 numbers. I don't have them off hand but Council
10 Member, we can follow-up with you specifically with
11 the numbers.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Would you send that
13 information to the Council staff and then uhm, I'm
14 sure that they will get it to me but I just want to
15 make sure it's not you know a very low number. Uhm,
16 I've dealt with this issue in parts of Queens and we
17 want to make sure that if people think that they are
18 going to get a CSO retention that it really is not
19 something that is at a very low end of the range.

20 JONATHAN KELLER: Yeah, we do have uh - I think
21 can we state the size of the tanks, the gallons?

22 MICHAEL DELOACH: Eight and four, eight million
23 and four million.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: 12 million but the
25 water shed itself may be bigger than 200 acres. I

1
2 don't know how big it is. I'm not as familiar with
3 that topography. I'm not familiar at all with the
4 topography over there. So, I would appreciate
5 getting that.

6 Uhm, and I think that uhm, the rest of my
7 questions have already been asked. So, I thank the
8 Chair for indulging me and for Council Member Lander
9 as well. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. So, I just want to
11 make a quick statement because I know Brad, you have
12 some questions but we're really trying to minimize
13 this. We have a lot of participants that are here
14 and maybe going to it for like three hours or so.
15 So, we're kind of limiting the time as well, so if
16 you can just be mindful of the time clock, that would
17 be greatly appreciated. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I got it and I see
19 Council Member Levin is here, so I'll certainly defer
20 to him now but honestly, when you come back to me, I
21 will just say what issues I am continuing to be
22 continuing to be concerned about. And that so people
23 can know we are paying attention and we'll be
24 fighting for them in the subsequent weeks without
25 requiring more back and forth between me and them.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I appreciate that.
3 Let me turn it over to Council Member Levin with some
4 questions.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thanks very much Chair.
6 Can you hear me okay?

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Ten minute clock. We can hear
8 you okay. Just a reminder we have a ten minute clock
9 going.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, yeah, no problem. I
11 appreciate everyone's patience here. I'm sorry, I
12 was at an event just now and then obviously I'm
13 outdoors right now, so I apologize if it's loud in
14 the background here.

15 So, uh, I want to thank the Administration for
16 their testimony and thank Council Member Lander in
17 particular for uhm, you know the thousands of hours
18 that he's put into I think this, this, getting this
19 rezoning to this point. And I don't think that
20 there's a single rezoning that the city has ever done
21 in my -- that I'm aware of, that's ever had this level
22 of community input and this level of discussion.
23 Just the number of meetings uhm, that we've had, I
24 think are easily over 100 if not over 200 meetings.

1
2 And uhm, so the communities had a real voice in
3 this and the goal here is to have a revitalization of
4 the Gowanus area that is forward thinking. That is
5 uhm, going to be a model for sustainable development.
6 So, not adding more CSO's by having a strong
7 framework for environmental stewardship to dovetail
8 with the super fund process with the EPA. Uhm, so, I
9 want to just acknowledge all the hard work that's
10 gone into this.

11 My questions for the Administration are primarily
12 on the NYCHA developments that are adjacent to the
13 rezoning area. I'm not sure who is best to field
14 these questions but uhm, uh, we have identified as
15 part of the project needs assessments at least two
16 developments, Gowanus Houses and Wyckoff Gardens.
17 Easily, over \$200 million, at least \$300 million
18 worth of outstanding capital needs in these
19 developments. How has the city and the Housing
20 Authority approached these capital needs? For
21 example, uhm, Gowanus Houses, which is a fairly large
22 development uhm, they've had a boiler outages for
23 almost ten years now pretty consistently. And what
24 is the plan to make sure that those project needs are
25 getting addressed?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JONATHAN KELLER: Thank you Council Member. I've been answering the NYCHA questions to the best of my ability uhm on behalf of the Administration today. But before I do answer your question, I just wanted to say thank you for your comments on outreach. Uhm, honestly I think you know, the same can be said and thanked to both you and Council Member Lander for helping to facilitate and support those messy conversations. Honestly, whenever I'm asked that question, I first say, you really need strong leadership to create that space. And so, we are very thankful to both of you for helping us do that for so long at that level of engagement too.

Uhm, but I would say on when I sort of answered before you joined, you know we don't have numbers today for specific investments. In terms of how we're thinking about it one, we have been in NYCHA and City Hall have been meeting with NYCHA tenant leaders to look over and talk about the priorities. We also just got today I believe your and Council Member's staff sent over a list of priorities. Which we are very eager for and excited to review. And I think we did respond that we would review them quickly and get back to you very shortly.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, uhm, I mean in
3 general, how does the Administration approach
4 longstanding capital needs in the hundreds of
5 millions of dollars in our NYCHA developments? I
6 mean, part of the problem – I mean, I'll give an
7 example. In the kind of the intersection of our
8 waste water system in NYCHA developments, like
9 Gowanus houses, the buildings on the northern block
10 you know have backup of stormwater and sewage backup
11 in their apartments when there's heavy rain. So, how
12 does the administration approach this kind of
13 enormous question? What are you doing? What are you
14 doing about advocating in Washington right now to
15 make sure that this is covered in as part of the
16 infrastructure reconciliation bill. Things like
17 that. I mean, what's the long-term strategy?

18 JONATHAN KELLER: Yeah, I won't be able to talk
19 to the long-term strategy you know, I agree you know
20 personally. It's critical but in terms of how we're
21 advocating in Washington and what the strategy is
22 over the citywide, I won't be able to speak to. But
23 for this rezoning or this plan, uhm, you know I think
24 that is something that we – in one of the reasons and
25 I hear the critique and I hear the criticism but that

1
2 is one of the key reasons that we have noted for the
3 process of engagement to really make sure that they
4 are impactful before people's lives. Because at the
5 end of the day, we're talking about people's lives
6 and their, you know long, long-term needs. And also
7 I'm sure you know synergies with other effects that
8 will help you know the buildings be sustainable and
9 resilient.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uhm, so my next question
11 is for DEP, just about how and this could be for you
12 Jonathan as well. How is the Administration
13 committing to making sure that there's no added CSO
14 impact as a result of this rezoning? How do you
15 measure that? What kind of metrics are you using?
16 And uh, what's the timeline on the retention tanks as
17 that process is moving forward?

18 JONATHAN KELLER: [INAUDIBLE 2:52:55].

19 MICHAEL DELOACH: [INAUDIBLE 2:52:55]. Yeah, go
20 ahead Jon.

21 JONATHAN KELLER: No, I was just going to say,
22 sorry Michael. I was going to say I'm going to kick
23 it over to you DEP and then I'll add anything if I
24 feel I need to.

1
2 MICHAEL DELOACH: Yeah, I was just going to say
3 you know, through a combination of efforts, that's
4 how we're going to achieve you know the final numbers
5 for doing you know like the high level storm sewers.
6 We obviously have the eight million and the four
7 million tank but the rule is really the most
8 important component to reducing this DSO. And
9 Councilman as you know, the rule requires more onsite
10 stormwater management and reduce release rates for
11 stormwater entering the sewers. And then second, the
12 rule requires that newer redeveloped lots that are
13 20,000 square feet or larger or create 5,000 square
14 feet or more of impervious area. Prioritize green
15 infrastructure that keeps that runoff on the site
16 until the system can handle it.

17 So, in terms of the tanks, I don't have the final
18 dates at my disposal, 2030 I think is the second
19 tank. Alicia, do you have the first tank date by
20 hand?

21 ALICIA WEST: The first tank is 2030. The second
22 tank is 2028.

23 MICHAEL DELOACH: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Sorry and which tank is
25 which? I'm sorry, the first tank is the?

1
2 ALICIA WEST: Sorry, first tank is the Head End
3 site in your district and the second is the Owls Head
4 tank in Council Member Lander's district.

5 MICHAEL DELOACH: Which is the ULURP action that
6 we're doing today.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And uhm, and then other -
8 can you speak to other sustainability measures put
9 forward in this rezoning? So, not just stormwater
10 retention but aspects of carbon footprint impact of
11 this rezoning and what measures we're going to be
12 requiring of developments to reduce the carbon
13 footprint?

14 JONATHAN KELLER: Yeah, so I think I can take
15 that. In addition to the stormwater rule, uhm,
16 actually the City Council legislation that you all
17 passed actually in the past couple of years, is
18 actually going to be front and center in Gowanus
19 since the sites are - development sites are quite
20 large. Uhm, which actually is a great synergy with
21 the stormwater rule for the requirement for the
22 rooftops of buildings. We saw that and actually
23 responded in the special district to actually uh,
24 create more flexibility for the rooftop and solar
25 panels if that is the choice of a developer to allow

1
2 more coverage. And then I would also say along the
3 canal and other areas that are in the flood zone,
4 they would be built to appendix G resiliency codes.

5 MICHAEL DELOACH: And I would just say
6 Councilman, another additional tool that's being used
7 is the cloudburst study that the you know, Councilman
8 Lander and you have pushed for us to include in the
9 Mayor's new plan. So, we're also you know taking
10 that very seriously.

11 JONATHAN KELLER: And I would add one more thing
12 for Gowanus Green, where we have more control and
13 also where the Stellar development team, which they
14 will actually be here in a little bit to testify and
15 take any questions that you have. There's also a lot
16 of sustainability and resiliency goals there
17 including capturing 100 percent of stormwater through
18 - well, I think the through is where we're still
19 working on it but innovative measures including
20 bioswales, underground infrastructure but the goal is
21 to be a real model. For the rest of the development,
22 that will come along. Hopefully they can reach above
23 that and go higher than the bar set from Gowanus
24 Green.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, I see that my time
3 is up. I know that we have a busy day today, so I
4 just want to thank you all for uhm, for your
5 testimony, for answering these questions. Just to
6 reiterate that the three central demands by GMCJ and
7 the recommendations at the Community Board, I feel
8 just like Council Member Lander [INAUDIBLE 2:57:05].
9 And they have to be addressed and the demands must be
10 met for this to actually pass this Council.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Council
12 Member. Let me turn it over to Council Member
13 Lander.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Chair. I have
16 a couple more like remarks, so people know what we're
17 pushing on but not ask any more questions. I think
18 it's just one challenge in this process. On the one
19 hand, as we've said over and over again, this has
20 been so collaborative and involved so much engagement
21 and been so transparent and then at the end we have
22 this hearing and then it kind of goes back and we do
23 the negotiating behind you know behind closed doors.

24 And that's frustrating for people and I get that.
25 And I know the Administration gets it as well. But,

1
2 so, I just want to let folks know, we are pushing on
3 the Community Planning Taskforce of Oversight and
4 Accountability that Community Board 6 calls for. We
5 think that that's critical. There are a range of
6 issues around mixed use that have been touched on but
7 we're still pushing on more investments in the
8 industrial business zone, which are critical. Some
9 additional issues around the details of Gowanus use.
10 There's a whole action here. The Salt Lot which we
11 are you know working hard to make sure and I
12 appreciate the Administration's commitment but that
13 it includes public open space and the Salt shoreline
14 and good public engagement and interim locations for
15 the uses that are there.

16 Uhm, there's public space issues. Public open
17 space issues identified in the EIS. Some of which
18 are addressed through the Gowanus Green Park. But we
19 are pushing hard for additional open space on the
20 Salt Lot and a number of other opportunities as well.
21 We've got capital priorities for investment in Bold
22 Stone House and Pacific Library. I mentioned the
23 flood mitigation on 4th Avenue.

24 And there's actually a lot more even in just what
25 the Community Board 6, long, good recommendation that

1
2 I assume Community Board 6 is going to summarize in
3 their testimony. So, I want to let folks know that
4 even though we're not going to further back and forth
5 with the administration here because we want to get
6 to public testimony, those things and more are
7 strongly on our minds. And Council Members Levin and
8 I who have worked so closely together through this
9 process and are now fortunate to have the partnership
10 with Chairs Moya and Salamanca will be pushing very
11 hard for in the next few weeks.

12 We want to get to – you can hear, we want to get
13 to a way that we and the community can support this
14 action because inaction has many, many problems
15 associated with it. But we have to get there on
16 those issues in order to be able to bring something
17 that we feel that our community can support. Thank
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council Member
20 Lander. Let me ask our Counsel if there is any other
21 Council Members who have their hands raised to ask
22 any questions for this panel.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no other
24 members with questions for the panel.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. There being no further
3 questions, the applicant panel is excused. Counsel,
4 are there members of the public who wish to testify
5 on the Gowanus Neighborhood Plan Mercy Home or
6 Douglas Street or Owls Head, Gowanus Canal, CSO
7 facility proposals?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we will now begin to
9 hear from approximately 70 members of the public
10 signed up to testify.

11 For members of the public here to testify, please
12 note again that witnesses will be called generally in
13 groups of four. If you are a member of the public
14 signed up to testify on this item, please stand by
15 when you hear your name being called and prepare to
16 speak when the Chair says that you may begin. Please
17 also note that once all panelists in your group have
18 completed their testimony, you will be removed from
19 the meeting as a group and the next panel of speakers
20 will be introduced.

21 Once removed, participants may continue to view
22 the livestream broadcast of this hearing on the
23 Council website. We will now hear from the first
24 panel, which will include Andrea Parker, Lynn Neuman,
25 David Kutz or Kutz and Johnny Thornton. The first

1 speaker will be Andrea Parker followed by Lynn
2
3 Newman.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just one quick reminder for
6 the public. Members of the public, you will be given
7 two minutes to speak. Please do not begin until the
8 Sergeant at Arms has started the clock. And you may
9 begin now.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 ANDREA PARKER: Thank you. Hi, I'm Andrea
12 Parker, Executive Director of Gowanus Canal
13 Conservancy. We are a proud member of the Gowanus
14 Neighborhood Coalition for Justice and we will not
15 support the rezoning unless our top three demands are
16 met. Full capital funding for local public housing,
17 net zero CSO, and a creation of a community-based
18 taskforce. And it's been great to hear the Council
19 Members really elevate these demands in their
20 questions today.

21 I'd like to use my time to discuss the need for
22 the taskforce to ensure the city is accountable for
23 long-term commitments to open space in the
24 neighborhood. So, Gowanus is severely lacking in
25 open space. Through the proposed rezoning will add

1
2 critical open spaces to the neighborhood, these
3 increases will still be a fraction of the ratio that
4 the city recommends.

5 Additionally, we have seen in too many prior
6 rezoning's that the city promises open space but does
7 not commit to a firm timeline and funding. In the
8 2005 Williamsburg Green Point rezoning, the city
9 promised a 27 acre Bushwick Park. After years of
10 advocacy by community members and elected officials,
11 the city finally acquired the land for the park but
12 today, 16 years after that original promise, less
13 than 20 percent is open to the public.

14 From watching this process unfold on our sister
15 waterfront, we know that the city's promise is not
16 enough. It must be backed up by binding commitments
17 to timeline process and funding. Public space in
18 Gowanus is complicated. There are needs for site
19 remediation, coordination with new sewer
20 infrastructure and multiple overlapping agencies.
21 But improving existing open space and providing new
22 open space is absolutely critical to building a more
23 resilient and a just neighborhood.

24 So, the points of agreement must provide clear
25 timeline process and funding commitments for new

1
2 parks and for needed improvements in existing parks
3 to support a growing population. I'm really you know
4 thankful to hear again that the taskforce is on the
5 agenda of things to still work out. But I really
6 just want to push this Council to ensure that all of
7 the commitments in this rezoning are transparently
8 reported to this community-based taskforce so that
9 the incoming Council Members -

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 ANDREA PARKER: Have the tools to hold the city
12 accountable. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
14 testimony.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Lynn Neuman will be the next
16 speaker followed by David Kutz.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 LYNN NEUMAN: My name is Lynn Neuman, I represent
19 50 Brooklyn, a member of the Gowanus Neighborhood
20 Coalition for Justice. As Andrea stated, we do not
21 support the rezoning unless GNCJ's top three demands
22 are met. As we've heard today, through this ULURP
23 process and leading up to it and negotiations around
24 our number one demand up front funding for public
25

1
2 housing have not been transparent and we do not want
3 an 11th hour negotiation behind closed doors.

4 I've been part of the community involved in
5 envisioning the future of Gowanus for ten years and
6 the city must commit to and fund the taskforce that
7 Andrea had mentioned, to ensure compliance with
8 public and private commitments and timely adherence
9 to the requirements. Working with locally invested
10 parties produces greater civic support and a more
11 resilient community. Given that Gowanus is a flood
12 zone area with increasing risks due to climate
13 change, efforts to build resiliency are critical.

14 It's also extremely important that the city
15 invest in community health and social resilience.
16 The Wyckoff Gorham Hill Gowanus Farm and Flee Market,
17 also known as Gowanus Produce, does this and should
18 be included in the points of agreement. The market
19 is a new community initiative operating on Saturdays
20 on Wyckoff between Bond and Hoyt adjacent to public
21 housing. It brings affordable fresh produce to an
22 area of Gowanus that is already food insecure and
23 provides the opportunity for local makers of arts,
24 crafts and other goods to sell their products
25 supporting local entrepreneurs. It provides

1
2 community education and programming and healthy
3 cooking, participatory arts, and mentorship in
4 training local residents to run the market and its
5 programs.

6 The rezoning will only make accessible access to
7 affordable food harder to come by and the potential
8 for storefront opportunities more expensive.

9 Community resiliency requires building connections
10 and the market provides the opportunities for these
11 connections to be made and to be strengthened. The
12 rezoning would significantly alter the neighborhood
13 with the potential for fracturing existing
14 communities along economic and racial lines.

15 I strongly encourage you –

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 LYNN NEWMAN: To support this community
18 initiative. It's number five ask of the NCJ. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
21 testimony today.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: David Kutz will speak next
23 followed by Johnny Thornton.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.
25

1
2 DAVID KUTZ: Good afternoon. I'm David Kutz, the
3 President of Arts Gowanus and we are proud members of
4 GNCJ and support their demands. In earlier
5 testimony, I suggested it was imperative that the DCP
6 included any EIS study of the creative community in
7 Gowanus. In the FDIS, the DCP has declared that
8 artists don't need to be studied because they don't
9 work full time in their studios and are not
10 incorporated entities.

11 The FDIS further refers to working artists as
12 freelancers. And although a common enough expression
13 had been working dependently for many, many years. I
14 can tell you the term freelancer can be considered
15 offensive. I wonder, how does the DCP know what the
16 business circumstances are for the artists in the
17 neighborhood. Without a study, how do they know that
18 no mitigation is required.

19 This coming weekend, Arts Gowanus will have our
20 25th Gowanus open studios event with over 400 artists
21 participating. We know that some artists work full
22 time in their studies and are incorporated
23 businesses.

24 In earlier testimony, I stated that Arts Gowanus
25 is working on an agreement to provide affordable and

1
2 sustainable artist workspaces. We have made progress
3 on this and have a handshake agreement with several
4 developers. Council Member Lander is working hard on
5 behalf of the creative community to get more
6 developers involved with a pending CBA. The goal of
7 having no less than 200 subsidized artists studios
8 seems possible.

9 But we all know it ain't over until it's over and
10 we are hopeful and we are anxious. If we don't
11 secure a CBA, the guarantees artist studio spaces,
12 the creative community in Gowanus will vanish. Like
13 it has in many other neighborhoods in New York's
14 history. If Arts Gowanus, with the help of Council
15 Member Lander cannot secure guaranteed to the
16 creative community, we urge you to vote no on the
17 rezoning.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

19 DAVID KUTZ: I had one more interesting point.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. We got to wrap it
21 up David, so really quickly please.

22 DAVID KUTZ: I'll make it really very brief.
23 Which is that Jonathan Keller just testified in his
24 presentation that ground floor artist studio spaces
25 would create a hardening circumstance for flood

1 mitigation. And I would love to understand better
2 what that means.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, thank you David. Thank
5 you for your testimony.

6 DAVID KUTZ: Hey thanks for the extra few seconds
7 thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You got it. You got it.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Johnny Thornton will be the
10 next and last speaker on the panel.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Johnny, you're up.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

13 JOHNNY THORNTON: Good afternoon. My name is
14 Johnny Thornton and I am the Executive Director of
15 Arts Gowanus. A nonprofit organization that
16 advocates for affordable and sustainable arts
17 community in Gowanus. Arts Gowanus is a proud member
18 of the GNCJ and we wholeheartedly support their
19 demands.

20 Firstly, I want to address the FEIS study, which
21 I personally found to be highly problematic. The
22 FEIS states freelance artists who lease studio spaces
23 are not accounted for in the estimates of directly
24 displaced employment because the studio spaces are
25 not the regular place of business. My question is,

1
2 how do you categorize artists leasing the studio
3 spaces as freelancers? And how do you know that
4 their studios are not their regular place of business
5 without actually studying them?

6 This neighborhood is vibrant and desirable for a
7 reason. To not fully examine the impact that this
8 rezoning will have on the existing arts community is
9 a huge misstep and an insult to the cultural workers
10 of Gowanus. Though we are disappointed in the FEIS
11 and the lack of consideration to cultural workers,
12 Arts Gowanus has been working closely with Brad
13 Lander and several developers to create a community
14 benefits agreement that would ensure the artist
15 community would continue to exist and thrive in
16 Gowanus.

17 We've reached a preliminary understanding with a
18 few developers that we feel is good and we thank Brad
19 Lander for his efforts and his promise to bring more
20 developers into the CBA. The goal is to provide 200
21 subsidized artist work studios to keep Gowanus thrive
22 in creative community. With Brad's help, we are
23 hopeful this will happen. If assigned iron clad
24 contract is not completed by the time of final vote,
25

1
2 we believe this will be a death blow to the creative
3 community in Gowanus.

4 If you want to see what's at stake in this
5 rezoning, we invite you to come to Gowanus open
6 studios this weekend with over 400 artists in 100
7 locations. It is clear, there is a lot to lose if
8 this community benefits agreement is not
9 accomplished. We urge you to vote no on this
10 rezoning CBA if this CBA is not done. And I also,
11 would also love to know what was meant by what
12 Jonathan Keller said as pairing to what David just
13 said.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Johnny. Thank you
15 for your testimony today. Counsel, do we have any
16 Council Members that wish to ask this panel any
17 questions?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, no Chair I see no members
19 with questions.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Uhm, thank you for your
21 testimony. So, please, yeah, you're good Brad?
22 Okay. There being no more questions for this panel,
23 the witness panel is now excused. Counsel, can you
24 please call up the next panel.
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
3 Andrew Foley, Aaron Koffman, Aaron Koffman, David
4 Yudelson and Charlie McGuckin. The first speaker
5 will be Andrew Foley followed Aaron Koffman.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 ANDREW FOLEY: Hello, my name is Andrew Foley,
8 I'm Associate Director of Development at Jonathan
9 Rose Companies. One of the development partners at
10 Gowanus Green along with three other developers, 5th
11 Avenue Committee Hudson Companies in Bluestone
12 Organization.

13 Today, I'm joined by Aaron Koffman of Hudson
14 Companies, as well as two key members of our
15 environmental team Dave Yudelson and Charlie
16 McGuckin, who can speak to the ongoing environmental
17 remediation of the site.

18 I think the staff presentation covered the key
19 benefits of our project very well. So, just to
20 summarize, 950 units of 100 percent affordable
21 housing, 50 percent of which will be below 50 percent
22 AMI. A network of open spaces including one and a
23 half acre public park. A site for future public
24 school, neighborhood serving retail and a deeply
25 sustainable and resilient design that will be a model

1
2 for future development. Including innovative storm
3 water, waste water strategies to combat CSO's,
4 buildings elevated way above current flood plain
5 levels and a range of green building strategies to
6 reduce the carbon footprint.

7 So, our team initially proposed a vision for
8 Gowanus Green almost twelve years ago and since that
9 time, has been working extensively with both the city
10 agencies and the community to make our plan even
11 better and more responsive to the community needs.
12 As a result of that work, Gowanus Green will be more
13 affordable, provide more open space to the community
14 and be more sustainable and resilient than we
15 initially were. So, this is an exciting moment for
16 the project, for the neighborhood and we really look
17 forward to getting started.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
19 testimony Andrew.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Aaron Koffman will be the
21 next speaker followed by David Yudelson.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 AARON KOFFMAN: Good afternoon and thank you
24 Chair Moya, Chair Salamanca and of course, our
25 Councilman Brad Lander for their incredible

1
2 dedication to this rezoning effort never mind our
3 partner city agencies.

4 Just to elaborate, I'm Aaron Koffman, Managing
5 Principle of the Hudson Companies. One of the four
6 members of Gowanus Green as Andrew mentioned. I want
7 to speak briefly further about the affordable housing
8 part and giving some more details. As we said, this
9 is 100 affordable housing for all 950 units. At
10 least 50 percent of the rental housing will be
11 dedicated to extremely low, very low income
12 households with incomes averaging at or below 50
13 percent AMI, including at 15 percent of rental units
14 dedicated to formerly homeless households.

15 No more than 40 percent of rental housing will be
16 dedicated to moderate income households, averaging
17 between 80 and 120 percent AMI. There will be senior
18 housing for uhm, I had the word senior, I'm sorry,
19 older adult housing for those individuals age 62 and
20 older. Supportive housing, formerly homeless,
21 disabled individuals or homeless families with a
22 disabled head of household. And an affordable home
23 ownership component, which has always been in our
24 proposal. Even in the one that we were designated
25 with in May of 2008 and it remains here today with

1
2 the Open Door program for households averaging
3 between 80 and 130 percent AMI.

4 The landscaping will include bioswales, swale
5 trails, active rain gardens and of course the
6 playground and the waterfront park, that has long
7 been a centerpiece of our proposal in terms of
8 countering CSO's and we are very proud of the project
9 that we have been putting forth in partnership with
10 the city, in partnership with bridging Gowanus, in
11 partnership with neighborhood organizations. Thank
12 you for your time.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
14 testimony Aaron.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: David Yudelson will speak
16 next followed by Charlie McGuckin.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: David Yudelson, if you can
19 hear me, we need you to accept the unmute request.

20 DAVID YUDELSON: Okay, I accept it. Can you hear
21 me now?

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 DAVID YUDELSON: Great, thank you. Thank you
25 for having us and giving us this opportunity to

1
2 present. I'm going to make two fine points. One is
3 that we've been coordinating with the United States
4 Environmental Protection Agency, the New York State
5 DEC and the New York City office of Environmental
6 Remediation, to ensure that this development is
7 perfectly safe for all of its occupants and for the
8 environment.

9 We have committee to DEC to having vapor
10 mitigation irrespective of whether testing is
11 required or shows that it's required. The other very
12 important thing is that the way to combat combined
13 sewer overflows, is by redeveloping the sites with
14 the unified stormwater rule. These sites remain
15 fallow. The same amount of rain will fall on the
16 ground and the same amount will enter the combined
17 sewers.

18 With the redevelopment, the stormwater gets
19 treated. It gets controlled, it gets retained and
20 that is the only mechanism that's practical to limit
21 the amount of CSO events. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you David. Thanks for
23 your testimony today.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Charlie McGuckin.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1
2 CHARLIE MCGUCKIN: Hi, my name is Charlie
3 McGuckin. I am a Professional Engineer with Roux
4 Environmental Engineering. Roux will be representing
5 the Gowanus Green team in preparing environmental
6 studies, investigation and remedial action planning.

7 To date, we've done some site assessment work,
8 some initial investigation in parallel with National
9 Grid performing their remediation work. We've
10 received comments from New York State DEC and EPA and
11 the city agencies. We are committed to addressing
12 all of the concerns and that the process will be
13 following completion of National Grids remediation
14 work. We would be doing additional investigation and
15 remediation under a document called, a Side
16 Management Plan that will govern the site going
17 forward.

18 And that remediation will be conducted at the
19 same time as development happens. So, any additional
20 removals or protection measures as Dave Yudelson had
21 mentioned, vapor mitigation will all be incorporated
22 into the remedial design program. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Charlie
24 for your testimony today.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
3 speaker on this panel.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Is there any Council
5 Members that have any questions for this panel?

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
7 with questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no more
9 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
10 excused. And Counsel, can you please call up the
11 next panel please.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel will include Amy
13 Motzny, Karen Blondel, Martin Bisi, and Brad Vogel.
14 The first speaker on the panel will be Amy Motzny
15 followed by Karen Blondel.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 AMY MOTZNY: Good afternoon, I'm Amy Motzny
18 Watershed Senior Planner for Gowanus Canal
19 Conservancy. We are a proud member of the Gowanus
20 Neighborhood Coalition for Justice and we will not
21 support the rezoning unless our top three demands are
22 met. Capital funding for NYCHA, net zero CSO and the
23 creation of a community-based taskforce.

24 Today, I want to discuss what is still needed for
25 the city to meet our second demand to ensure new

1
2 development does not increase combined sewage
3 overflow to the canal. As part of this demand, we
4 have repeatedly requested the city provide accurate
5 and up to date modeling of the sewer system to
6 realistically account piece of [LOST AUDIO 3:20:25]
7 and future increase in precipitation.

8 We commend DEP for adopting new citywide
9 stormwater rule that the EIS shows will achieve net
10 zero. This assessment is based on complex models
11 that are only as reliable as the data that informs
12 them. Our community has looked to EPA to review
13 these data but they are not able to assess net CSO
14 impacts due to the use of outdated rainfall data.

15 Given EPA's inconclusive assessment and the local
16 impacts of recent storms, the city must commit to
17 additional measures to track implementation and plan
18 for a change in climate. To effectively meet our
19 demand, the city must commit to the following prior
20 to the approval of the rezoning. One, the unified
21 stormwater rule must be in effect prior to the first
22 site sewer connection in the rezoning area and the
23 city must provide transparent reporting on its
24 implementation.

1
2 Two, as mentioned by Council Member Lander,
3 Gowanus must be included as one of the neighborhoods
4 the city - again, this is for a cloudburst study, as
5 outlined in the Mayor's recent report. We're happy
6 to hear the city thinks this is possibility. It will
7 be critical for determining infrastructure,
8 priorities for flood mitigation and is the resiliency
9 study or hydrology study the community has been
10 asking for-for years.

11 Three, it's great to hear the city is working
12 with EPA to resolve monitoring requirements as
13 outlined in the executive order by the EPA. But we
14 want to reiterate the importance of their commitment.
15 In particular to compliance with Paragraph 73C,
16 monitoring for stormwater controls. This is how
17 we're going to track impacts of the unified
18 stormwater rule and without it, the city can't
19 confirm this rezoning -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

21 AMY MOTZNY: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Amy. Thank you for
23 your testimony today.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Karen Blondel will be the
25 next speaker followed by Martin Bisi.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

KAREN BLONDEL: Can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you Karen.

KAREN BLONDEL: Okay, my name is Karen Blondel and I'm a Founding Organizer with the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice. I am totally against this rezoning unless the three demands that the community and I have spend over five and a half years ratifying our met.

Our number one demand is upfront funding for local public housing campuses. That's Wyckoff Gardens and Gowanus Houses respectively. Please note that this demand was made in protest to the privatization empoisoning of public housing residents here in New York City that was publicized and it was even a lawsuit in the southern district.

I want to thank Council Member Lander who has showed up and let the community speak truth to him and also, I'd like to thank Council Member Levin. You still owe me half of your salary. The idea to bring in architectural design into the process with public housing came from GNCJ and we love that you're using our work but it's another example of how Black women's work is being erased in this process.

1
2 I also noticed that throughout the slides, I
3 didn't see any Black people or people of color in Mr.
4 Keller's slides.

5 Lastly, I'd like to talk about Community Board 6
6 and 7's presence in this rezoning. Please do not
7 forget that over the time of the pandemic, five last
8 trucking warehouse companies as well as Amazon and
9 UPS has moved into the Red Hook Community Board 6
10 District. That means they'll be here in the same
11 streets with all these new additional pedestrians.

12 Also, with construction comes deconstruction and
13 in the case of Community Board 6, we have seen many
14 trees cut down in response to resiliency process and
15 this is the reason why we really need our third
16 demand met, which is a community taskforce with some
17 bite. And -

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

19 KAREN BLONDEL: Finally, to combine sewer
20 overflow issue. One more second. Not only do we not
21 want any additional in the canal, we don't want it to
22 come into the Lorraine bond pipe that is connected to
23 the canal. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Karen. Thank you
25 for your testimony.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Martin Bisi will be the next
3 speaker followed by Brad Vogel.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 MARTIN BISI: I'm Martin Bisi, Owner of Bisi's
6 Studio and Old American Can Factory since 1979. I'm
7 affiliated with Voice of Gowanus and Gowanus Artists
8 in Alliance.

9 I was in my recording studio the night of Ida. I
10 still get PTSD whenever it rains, as there was eight
11 feet of flooding in the adjacent building and five
12 feet in my basement threatening my studio. Also, a
13 nearby resident was found dead in the canal. Not
14 enough time went by before the final EIS was approved
15 by City Planning Commission.

16 This event was contradicted by Congresswoman
17 Velazquez and State Assembly Member Simon. Also,
18 contradicts the City Council's own legislation last
19 week, calling for a plan to protect all neighborhoods
20 and the Mayor's own words to redo all the data.
21 Also, last year's \$50 million in sewer upgrades and
22 park slope failed us.

23 I urge the Subcommittee to not vote and send this
24 back to City Planning as this is not ready. Also,
25 CB2 has rejected this rezoning and I hope Council

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Member Steve Levin will honor this. I believe speculation on this plan is already greatly increasing commercial property values in contradiction to what the EIS predicted would happen. My building with 300 cultural workers and small businesses is advising its tenants to have a three year exit strategy, as the building could be sold. And that also contradicts the demands of the CB6 Resolution. My business displaced would be into a much less affordable industrial business zone. I, myself am Latinx and I'm in the 40 to 50 AMI zone.

I want to emphasize that NYCHA funding does not rely on this rezoning, so this should still happen now or under the next administration.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

MARTIN BISI: Okay, thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Martin. Thank you for your testimony.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Brad Vogel will be the next and last speaker on this panel.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

BRAD VOGEL: Good afternoon, my name is Brad Vogel and I'm here today solely in my capacity as a

1
2 resident of Gowanus and as a member of Voice of
3 Gowanus Community Coalition.

4 I'm here today because we have heard so much both
5 in this Subcommittee hearing already and over the
6 last decade about the Gowanus rezoning but so much of
7 it is sound and fury signifying nothing. It is to
8 use, a phrase that was tossed about before, a deluge
9 of word salad.

10 It's about euphemisms and really strangely or
11 Orwellian things thrown around that when you actually
12 step back and look at it, do not make sense. For
13 example, a massive rezoning putting huge numbers of
14 new residents in a flood zone. What has always been
15 a flood zone for hundreds of years. It does not make
16 sense. Affordable housing is also thrown around. It
17 is being used here as a trojan horse to permit luxury
18 units and development.

19 The EIS is deeply flawed and it does not
20 adequately take into effect the comprehensive impacts
21 of this proposed rezoning. I really today want to
22 call on Council Member Stephen Levin because I do
23 think he has it in him to do the right thing here.
24 To do the better thing and to not just defer. Don't
25 just take everyone else's word for what this is

1
2 about. There has been so much direction of this
3 towards racial issues when really, if you step back
4 from it, this is about a land use issue. There are
5 so many factors of this like flooding. Hurricane Ida
6 made this clearly a much different issue.

7 I urge all the members of this Subcommittee to
8 vote no. We also should be considering the rezoning
9 separately from two tanks. The tank consideration
10 should be coming first. They should be built before
11 we have any rezoning. Thank you very much.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Brad. Thank you
13 for your testimony today. Uhm, do we have any
14 Council Members looking to ask any questions to this
15 panel?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No Chair, I see no members
17 with questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, there being no more
19 questions for this panel. The witness panel is now
20 excused. Counsel, if you could please call up the
21 next panel please.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
23 Ben Margolis, Diana Reyna, Sandy Hornick and Ariel
24 Krasnow. The first speaker will be Ben Margolis
25 followed by Diana Reyna.

1 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

2 BEN MARGOLIS: Good afternoon. I'm Ben Margolis,
3 resent Executive Director of SBIDC. A nonprofit that
4 has supported Gowanus essential businesses and
5 workers for four decades. I'm testifying today on
6 behalf of the Old American Can Factory, a haven for
7 the Gowanus industrial and cultural community for
8 over three decades and a paragon of Gowanus mixed
9 uses. In it's own report, engines of opportunity,
10 the City Council highlighted the Can Factory calling
11 it a model for how like manufacturing and creative
12 production can be incubated, supported and expanded.

13 As early as 2016, the Can Factory presented an
14 expansion plan that would allow for long-term
15 commitment to Gowanus mixed uses to be retained and
16 supported on site coupled with artist housing,
17 specially for aging artists, all in addition to the
18 MIH required. Unfortunately, the proposed rezoning
19 as written for this site, not only makes that
20 expansion plan feasible but incentivizes future
21 owners to build all residential and crucially offers
22 no protection to Gowanus mixed users.
23 That directly threatens 300 Korean workers and

24 would lead to further loss of much needed production
25

1
2 space in Gowanus but there is an easy fix. The Can
3 Factory has submitted a request to the Council to
4 revise the Section 139-48 authorization approved by
5 CPC. Including a commitment to preserve in
6 perpetuity no less than 20 percent of FAR for Gowanus
7 mix. It's our understanding from conversation with
8 the Council Land Use team that this requested
9 clarification is within the scope. With this
10 modification, the Council would immediately secure a
11 minimum of 60,000 square feet of Gowanus mixed uses
12 and crucially support the largest concentration
13 currently existing within the entire rezoning area.

14 So, I implore you to help those in the creative
15 industries that help make this neighborhood unique
16 and beloved in the first place. Thank you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Ben. Thank you for
18 your testimony.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Diana Reyna will be the next
20 speaker followed by Sandy Hornick.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 DIANA REYNA: Thank you very much. Hello, my
23 name is Diana Reyna and I served in government for
24 over two decades as former New York City Council
25 Member and Deputy Brooklyn Borough President. Today,

1
2 I'm working as an Advisor to support a development
3 team of the Old American Can Factory.

4 The old American Can Factory is a vibrant
5 community of currected businesses in the creative
6 sector of interdisciplinary talents. For over 30
7 years the Can Factory has been providing and
8 retaining mixed use across subsidized studios faces
9 preserving 300 local jobs in the Gowanus community.

10 In previous years leading up to the Gowanus
11 rezoning, the Can Factory had actively participated
12 in the bridging Gowanus community process as a
13 potential development site for its future expansion.
14 After numerous conversations with the Department of
15 City Planning and several iterations of planning
16 designs, the Can Factory is now limited to grow.
17 Financially constraint and landmarked.

18 These challenges can only be addressed by the
19 City Council. As noted in the recommendation
20 response from the Office of the Brooklyn Borough
21 President, DCP's proposal for the Can Factory, zoning
22 lot merely incentivizes development without any
23 protections for existing tenants.

24 Permitted development would only significantly
25 less space for Gowanus mixed uses than exist today.

1
2 The sole public benefit would be future affordable
3 housing development pursuant to MIH. Such an outcome
4 would have long lasting negative impact on the arts
5 and culture ecosystem in Gowanus. Borough President
6 Adams urged modification of the proposed zoning to
7 permit the Can Factory's expansion and to maintain
8 its unique tenant mix. The new mixed use development
9 would accommodate residential use under a set of
10 prescribed conditions with a legal mechanism to
11 ensure preservation of current uses.

12 With modification actions by the City Council,
13 the Can Factory would like to maintain existing sky
14 exposure regulations on their zoning lot.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

16 DIANA REYNA: So, that building height would be
17 determined by suitable minimum floor plates combining
18 the C82 exposure plain with a maximum height of 285
19 feet would reasonably accommodate the DCP proposed
20 bulk. Furthermore, the as of right expansion of the
21 creative industry work spaces at the Can Factory will
22 produce a minimum of 60,000 square feet of Gowanus
23 mixed uses in perpetuity, additional affordable
24 housing through the MIH regulations and a financially
25 workable landmarked building. Currently, none of

1
2 this is possible as proposed by DCP. Thank you for
3 your leadership.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Always good to see
5 you Diana. Thank you.

6 DIANA REYNA: You too, thank you.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sandy Hornick will be the
8 next speaker followed by Ariel Krasnow.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

10 SANDY HORNICK: Good afternoon Council Members.
11 I am Sandy Hornick, Zoning and Land Use Consultant
12 working with the Old American Can Factory.

13 For most of my five decade professional career, I
14 have served at the Department of City Planning
15 including serving as both the Zoning Director and
16 later Director of Strategic Planning.

17 The Can Factory is forced with a unique mix with
18 creative individuals and businesses that have helped
19 define Gowanus for over 30 years and makes Gowanus
20 Brooklyn and New York more complete and far more
21 interesting places. While the Can Factory is
22 generally profitable, it has kept its flow in order
23 to foster its unique mix of uses. As a result, it
24 does not generate revenues sufficient to fully
25 upgrades these buildings. All now more than a

1 century old. One of the goals of the Can Factory's
2 proposed expansion is to use market rate uses that
3 would place the entire campus on a sound financial
4 footing. As proposed, the zoning text preclude such
5 an expansion. As approved by CPC, a drafting area
6 requires 75 percent of the space to be used for
7 nonresidential uses. Almost of all of it would be
8 nonfinanceable. Even at the intended 50 percent
9 requirement because of the MIH requirement, which we
10 support, just over one third of the floor area would
11 have to financially support the remainder of the
12 building. This is prescription for failure.
13
14 Regrettably these limitations may well make the most
15 - at all residential throughout the most retractive
16 alternative.

17 This is not what we want to see but is what is
18 pushed for by the current text. At 20 percent, the
19 Can Factory would preserve in perpetuity, a minimum
20 of 60,000 square feet of space, six times the FAR for
21 Gowanus mixed uses incentivized elsewhere in the
22 special district. Doing so requires changes to the
23 text. The proposed changes for the authorization are
24 within the currently permitted height and setback
25 regulations and within the proposed permitted use and

1
2 floor area regulations. As such, these changes would
3 be consistent with decades long parameters of what
4 constitutes – what changes our permitted within the
5 scope of the action.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

7 SANDY HORNICK: That's fine, thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Sandy. Thank you
9 for your testimony today.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ariel Krasnow will be the
11 next and last speaker on this panel.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

13 ARIEL KRASNOW: Hello, my name is Ariel Krasnow,
14 I am an Architect and Urban Designer and I've been
15 the Managing Director of the old American Can Factory
16 since June of this year. I also serve on Community
17 Board 6 and I have done so since 2013 with a focus on
18 housing and industrial business retention. My
19 association with the Can Factory dates back to its
20 inception 30-years-ago. Over the decades, XO
21 projects, the developer and operator company for the
22 Can Factory has shaped it into a cultural and
23 business anchor at 3rd Street and 3rd Avenue in
24 Gowanus.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 186
2 The existing businesses, 100 businesses and
3 nearly 300 workers are all currently qualified as
4 Gowanus mixed uses in the proposed zoning. But the
5 proposed zoning has no requirement to retain them.
6 The Can Factory has always envisioned that it would
7 become a core part of a reimagined Gowanus, in which
8 light industry, commercial and cultural businesses
9 flourished alongside and within a walkable mixed use
10 community.

11 A decade ago, the Can Factory embarked on this
12 plan to expand the Can Factory into a comprehensive
13 complex that would add uses to reinforce the existing
14 businesses. Such as an artist and related retail
15 educational facilities, performance event and gallery
16 spaces, nonprofit organizations and a residential
17 component comprised of artist residencies, senior
18 housing for artists and lived work spaces.

19 The Can Factory is a business. It has grown and
20 thrived since 1980, since the 1980's by generating
21 value through creative efficient management
22 operations and planning within a mission to offer
23 decently sized, well-maintained spaces to a community
24 of light industrial cultural and arts businesses.
25 The expansion plan is necessary to preserve the

1
2 existing structures and provide the benefits of the
3 broadened uses.

4 This is exactly the type of business that the New
5 York City should support in this rezoning. At far
6 less cost and less risk than other city funded
7 initiatives with similar economic and development
8 plans. The CPC authorization is not consistent with
9 other land use incentive programs.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

11 ARIEL KRASNOW: And we will be submitting our own
12 recommendations forth way. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, Ariel, thank you so much
14 for your testimony today.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
16 speaker on this panel and I don't see any members
17 with questions for this panel.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOLA: Okay, there being no more
19 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
20 excused. And Counsel, if you can please call up the
21 next panel please.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
23 Lucia Marquez Reagan, Sabina Ranowski, Mostafal
24 Bey(SP?) and Ejaz El Nualbun. Please forgive me.

1
2 Lucia Marquez Reagan will be the first speaker
3 followed by Sabina Ranowski.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

5 MOSTAFAL BEY: Ready to go.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Go ahead.

7 MOSTAFAL BEY: I'm Mostafal Bey, a proud Member
8 of the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition of Justice and
9 our coalition will not support the rezoning unless
10 our top three demands are met. Full capital funding
11 for local NYCHA developments, net zero CSO's, and the
12 creation of a taskforce to hold the city accountable
13 and all parties accountable for commitments they made
14 through the rezoning process.

15 Several years ago, the Mayor indicated to us at a
16 meeting at St. Francis in downtown Brooklyn that the
17 community center funding is there but Gowanus Houses,
18 however nothing transpired. We couldn't get in touch
19 with anyone. They were just diverting us to other
20 directions and it's still not operational. Recently,
21 last month, they had a meeting with a turn key
22 organization that's supposed to be managing the
23 programs of the community center. However, there was
24 no any or very little community support or lets say
25 interaction in terms of that process. We're not

1
2 going to allow people from the outside to come in and
3 regulate and dominate what we do in our community.

4 Again, it's against the let's say the
5 participation of the community because we're left
6 outside of the mix. That's why we came here today.
7 To let you know that we will not tolerate it and
8 we're going to hold everyone accountable. You want
9 to run for Mayor, City Council, Comptroller, then
10 we're going to be at your steps, in your face to ask
11 you to keep your word. Don't show up here and you
12 know give us the talk, then nothing happens.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

14 MOSTAFAL BEY: We're going to hold you
15 accountable.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
17 testimony today.

18 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Very good afternoon,
19 I'm Angelina Martinez-Rubio, taking over as Counsel
20 for the Subcommittee. I know all of you on this
21 panel are the same location, so and Mostafal just
22 went, so I'm gong to call on Lucia Marquez Reagan as
23 the next speaker please.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we not have Lucia? I see
2
3 you waving now.

4 SABINA RANOWSKI: I am Sabina Ranowski, the order
5 was Mostafal first, Sabina Ranowski second, Lucia
6 will be next.

7 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, got it, thank
8 you.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 SABINA RANOWSKI: Thank you. Good afternoon, my
11 name is Sabina Ranowski, I'm a Proud Member of the
12 Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice. I work
13 at 5th Avenue Committee. I'm also on the Board of
14 Friends of Thomas Green Park and I'm a Cad Member for
15 the EPA Super Fund, Gowanus Super Fund Cleanup Group.

16 My family has been in Gowanus for decades. We
17 have one of the last remaining stained glass studios
18 in New York City let alone Gowanus. My child attends
19 public school here. I work and rent here. I'm
20 extremely rent burdened and my parents cannot afford
21 to retire here. We need, we desperately need deeply
22 affordable housing in this community and throughout
23 New York City. GNCJ though is not going to support
24 this rezoning unless the city meets its obligation to
25 first fully fund local public housing. \$274 million

1
2 is needed and it should not be a negotiation and
3 that's why myself and over 1,600 supporters online at
4 gncj.org stand with our community at Gowanus Houses
5 and Wyckoff Gardens. And we have our eyes on
6 accountability and resident led decision making for
7 this demand.

8 We're also seeking from this rezoning, a
9 commitment for oversight and a plan for environmental
10 racial and economic justice for our community and
11 neighborhood. This is a formerly red line area,
12 heavily polluted and it lacks open and green space
13 that is already disproportionately affected by
14 climate change.

15 So, we need investment in our community to build
16 better solutions. We need a commitment to funding
17 not only public housing but to grow green space and
18 envision a parks improvement district. We need to
19 invest in community health and social resilience.
20 We're still lacking an emergency preparedness plan
21 for our community and we want to see know your rights
22 trainings brought in for public housing, not just for
23 rent regulated tenants.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.
25

1
2 SABINA RANOWSKI: And again to bring deeply
3 affordable housing through MIH and beyond. Thank
4 you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

6 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, so the next
7 speaker is Lucia Marquez Reagan.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hold on. Hold on.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You're still mute.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You're still on mute. Hold
12 on. There you go.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 LUCIA MARQUEZ REAGAN: Hello, my name is Lucia
15 Marquez Reagan at 5th Avenue Committee and I'm a
16 proud Member of the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition
17 for Justice. Our coalition will not support the
18 rezoning unless our top three demands are met.

19 Full capital funding for local NYCHA
20 developments, net zero combined sewage overflow and
21 the creation of a taskforce to help the city and all
22 parties accountable for the commitments made through
23 the rezoning process.

24 In addition to these demands, I want to highlight
25 affordable housing demands. Centering CB6 NYCHA

1
2 residents and to prioritize our lowest income
3 residents, seniors and those with disabilities and
4 the availability of affordable units. The city must
5 also commit to a significant number of Section 8
6 vouchers for existing NYCHA residents, so they can
7 move to newly created affordable housing.

8 As Keller mentioned in the earlier presentation,
9 COVID has highlighted a need for housing and job
10 creation among many other needs. Both housing and
11 job creation can be addressed as a part of GNCJ's
12 demand for full upfront capital funding for NYCHA
13 developments at Wyckoff Gardens and Gowanus Houses.
14 The funding spent to improve NYCHA developments must
15 adhere to HUD Section 3 hiring policies, to ensure
16 NYCHA residents not only get the safe and healthy
17 housing they deserve but also, are hired to complete
18 the work.

19 As Council Member Lander mentioned in an earlier
20 discussion, NYCHA funding is absolutely necessary for
21 the health and wellbeing of residents. It's people
22 lives, their families lives and the health of our
23 community. We need full capital funding. We can
24 make the change. We can do better and we need it
25 now. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
3 testimony.

4 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The last speaker on
5 this panel is Ejaz El Nualbun(SP?). I apologize if I
6 mispronounced the name.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 EJAZ EL NUALBUN: Great, okay. My name is Ejaz
9 El Nualbun. I'm a proud member of the Gowanus
10 Neighborhood Coalition for Justice. I reside in
11 Gowanus Houses and my demands are within this poem
12 that I'm going to read, which everyone knows I read
13 poetry. And uh, this will tell you exactly how I
14 feel and I represent all my tenants and all my
15 friends in Gowanus Houses and in NYCHA housing
16 everywhere.

17 It's called, We Shall Rise all to NYCHA. The
18 tenants slumlord is hot under fire. The media has
19 reported you as irresponsible, habitual slumlord
20 liar. We refuse to have you pacify and romance us
21 like cupid. We the people are rising and we ain't
22 stupid. You made it impossible to enjoy our
23 dwellings and our lives but we still, we are here and
24 we rise in size.

1
2 What are you people monsters from Mars? You are
3 causing our living conditions to be so damn hard.
4 There is privy in your power that puts you above the
5 law. Cheating all of us and robbing the core.
6 Listen up tenants everywhere, understand all you
7 here, never be seduced into fear. Know that it's
8 criminality, intrusion, causing confusion and
9 occasion, there is hostile invasion to our
10 environment.

11 This battle of tenants rights is why we fight,
12 until you give us back a new NYCHA intact. Our
13 reconstruction all over the city that shall save the
14 lives of many, this is a numbers game. You the
15 culprit, you must take the blame. We are your judge
16 and jury. Behold our fury. We are energetic and
17 motivated with eyes on the prize and together, all
18 over the states, we shall rise, we shall rise.

19 It is a responsibility to look towards the
20 betterment of all living in the neighborhood, that we
21 may live peacefully and fairly as we should.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

23 EJAZ EL NUALBUN: It's only fair for the small
24 business man to receive a helping hand. Let him
25 stay. What more can we say? Can there be another

1
2 way to persuade the powers behind the system to make
3 them listen if they would? Just listen closely to
4 the cries of everyone surviving in the neighborhood.
5 Thank you.

6 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I don't see any
7 Council Members with questions for the panel. Chair,
8 you're on mute.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Angelina. Thank
10 you. Uh, seeing no questions from my colleagues,
11 this panel is now excused. So, Counsel, if you can
12 please call up the next panel.

13 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panel six will be
14 Renzo Ramirez, Ralph Osorio, Ledell York, and Thomas
15 Devaney. So, first speaker will be Renzo Ramirez and
16 followed by Ralph Osorio.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 RENZO RAMIREZ: Can you hear me?

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

20 RENZO RAMIREZ: Alright. So, good afternoon. My
21 name is Renzo Ramirez and I am here on behalf of my
22 Union 32BJ. And the 85,000 building service workers
23 32BJ represents in New York City to express our
24 support for this rezoning. 32BJ supports responsible
25 developers who invest in the communities where they

1
2 build. I'm happy to report that many of the
3 developers in the rezoning area have made incredible
4 commitments to creating prevailing wage, building
5 service jobs for the future of building service
6 workers at their sites. This commitment is an
7 investment in the community by providing wages and
8 benefits that give working families an opportunity
9 for upward mobility and security.

10 We support the rezoning and we are confident that
11 many of the developers will be responsible employers
12 and have made a positive impact on the community.
13 For reasons we specifically urge you to approve this
14 rezoning. On behalf of New York City 32BJ
15 membership, we support this rezoning. Thank you so
16 much for your time.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Renzo. Thank you
18 for your testimony today.

19 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Our next speaker on
20 this panel will be Ralph Osorio followed by Ledell
21 York.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 RALPH OSORIO: Good afternoon Chair Moya and
24 members of the Subcommittee. My name is Ralph Osorio
25 and I'm here on the behalf of my Union 32BJ SCIU.

1
2 And on 85,000 building service workers 32BJ
3 represents in New York City to express our support
4 for the rezoning.

5 32BJ supports responsible developers who invest
6 in our communities where they build and I'm happy to
7 report many developers in the rezoning area have
8 credible commitments to create affordable housing for
9 the community. The Gowanus rezoning will also create
10 almost 8,500 new housing units, nearly 3,000 are
11 below market rates. This commitment is an investment
12 in the community and will give working families an
13 opportunity of upward mobility and security.

14 As someone who has lived and worked in Brooklyn
15 for over 42 years, I understand how important these
16 jobs and affordable housing can be to those
17 communities. We support the rezoning and are
18 confident that many of the developers will have
19 responsible employers and will make a positive impact
20 on the community.

21 For these reasons, we respectfully urge you to
22 improve the rezoning and on behalf of New York City
23 32BJ membership, we support the rezoning. Thank you
24 guys for listening.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Ralph. Thank you
3 for your testimony today.

4 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on
5 this panel Ledell York followed by Thomas Devaney.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 LEDELL YORK: Good morning Chair Moya and members
8 of the Subcommittee. My name is Ledell York. I am
9 here on behalf of my Union 32BJ and the 85,000
10 building service workers. 32BJ represents New York
11 City to express our support for this rezoning, 32BJ
12 supports responsible developers who invest in the
13 communities where they build. I'm happy to report
14 that many of the developers in the rezoning area have
15 made incredible commitments to create affordable
16 housing for the community.

17 The Gowanus rezoning will also create almost
18 8,500 new housing units, nearly 3,000 below market
19 rate. This commitment is an investment in the
20 community that will give working families opportunity
21 for upward mobility and security. We support the
22 rezoning and we are confident that many other
23 developers will be responsible employees and make a
24 positive impact on the community.

1
2 For these reasons we respectfully urge you to
3 approve this rezoning. Thank you on behalf of New
4 York City 32BJ membership we support the rezoning.
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

7 LEDELL YORK: You're welcome.

8 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The last speaker on
9 this panel is Thomas Devaney.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 THOMAS DEVANEY: Good afternoon. Tom Devaney,
12 Municipal Arts Society. MAS recognizes the decades
13 long planning effort by the city and Gowanus
14 community an inherent challenge in envisioning a
15 future for the neighborhood as complex as Gowanus is.

16 We are encouraged by the waterfront plan, the
17 prospect of a new park, reductions in stormwater
18 flows, 100 percent affordability to Gowanus Green and
19 a potential new school. We are pleased with the
20 racial impact study as a good faith effort to wrestle
21 with competing development priorities and underlying
22 disparities in Gowanus. The report also reinforces
23 the shortcomings of zoning at MIH. MIH has tools to
24 reduce disparities of equality but many serious
25 issues remain about the city's commitment to address

1
2 conditions at nearby NYCHA housing. And including
3 them in the proposal, coordination with ongoing super
4 fund cleanup deficiencies in the SEQR evaluation and
5 above all, ensuring that this is the best plan for
6 Gowanus.

7 The proposal falls the familiar zoning path,
8 framed under the banner of increasing housing
9 affordability of MIH. MIH is a blunt tool that is
10 more about increasing market rate in affordable units
11 than it is about ensuring that Gowanus is accessible
12 to all members of the community.

13 As a city and in Gowanus, we should not be
14 planning just for growth. For Gowanus to be the big
15 step the city takes to ensure lower income residents
16 to remain in the community, the NYCHA's, Wyckoff
17 Gardens, Gowanus Houses, must be engaged and included
18 in a neighborhood affordability and quality housing
19 strategy.

20 A fair housing plan needs to be put in place in
21 addition to MIH. As one of MAS's primary advocacy
22 items, the Gowanus rezoning bring to light
23 deficiencies in the city's SEQR process, particularly
24 the reliability of the development forecast and
25 questionable analysis of the full impacts of the

1
2 plan. We estimate the potential development of over
3 80 percent of the lots in the rezoning area have not
4 been addressed under SEQR. With the horrible impacts
5 of Hurricane Ida freshly in our minds, we expect the
6 city to follow through on transparently -

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 THOMAS DEVANEY: In their responsibilities and
9 coordinating with the EPA and the federal cleanup.
10 Thank you for allowing me to comment on this
11 proposal.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Thomas. Thank you
13 for your testimony today. Uhm, was that the last
14 panelist?

15 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yeah, that was the
16 last panelist Chair. I see no Council Members with
17 questions at this time. So, we can move on to the
18 next panel, which will be Ken Baer, Miranda Sielaff,
19 Winslow Dennis, and Valerie Fenimore. So, the first
20 speakers will be Ken Baer followed by Miranda
21 Sielaff.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Ken, hold on one second. Ken,
25 you're still muted. Hold on.

1

KEN BAER: Okay.

2

3

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: There you go.

4

5

KEN BAER: Fine now. Okay. I hope I have my full two minutes.

6

7

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You got your two minutes Ken, don't worry.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

KEN BAER: Okay, thank you. I'm testifying in opposition to the Gowanus rezoning. The EPA has noted that this rezoning uses forward plays and models from 2008. It also does not include a full cumulative analysis of development projects that would use the Red Hook sewage treatment plan and another in Bay Ridge. For these reasons, the EPA and FEMA must participate in the preparation of this process. Excuse me, in preparation of this project.

The major legal flaws in the city's rezoning plan are many. There are many inconsistencies and contradictions. Number two, the record of decision requires that any development under New York City's purview, not compromised the environmental cleanup of the canal.

Three, additional sewage load from new development would not put pressure on old sewers and would risk additional combined sewer overflows into

1
2 the canal. The EPA has cited delays in the design
3 and construction of CSO retention tanks as a problem.
4 The EPA has concluded that new watershed models need
5 to be prepared. The city does not take into account
6 its own climate and sea level projections and that
7 the canal is in a floodplain.

8 There was a question before regarding how much
9 the tanks could handle in terms of additional you
10 know rainfall and they measured it gallons. They
11 didn't measure it in terms of inches of rain, which I
12 think is critical and you know speaks to the fact
13 that the city -

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 KEN BAER: Needs to put things in plain English.
16 Let me just conclude. The city must do its due
17 diligence and recognize deficiencies of this plan.
18 In doing so, the logical conclusion this body will
19 come to is that it should reject the zoning plan.
20 Thank you.

21 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on
22 this panel is Miranda Sielaff followed by Winslow
23 Dennis.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.
25

1
2 MIRANDA SIELAFF: Hi, my name is Miranda Sielaff
3 and I'm speaking in opposition to the Gowanus
4 Neighborhood rezoning. I'm a resident who lives in a
5 rent stabilized apartment one block from the Gowanus
6 Canal. This neighborhood is my home and I want to
7 make sure the health and safety of my neighbors and I
8 are protected as sites are cleaned up and developed.
9 I want Gowanus to be safe for future residents who
10 may live on land or near water that has been subject
11 to environmental abuse for decades.

12 Nothing about this plan has taken into
13 consideration the realities of climate change. I
14 support Nydia Velazquez and Assembly Member Jo Anne
15 Simons calls for the assessment to be redone. In the
16 letter to de Blasio they wrote, they said, our city
17 has already felt the brunt of climate change. It
18 cannot afford projects that fall short of protecting
19 human health and the environment. The city needs to
20 account for the fact that much of Gowanus is a flood
21 zone and experienced intense flooding in the recent
22 storms.

23 Spillover effects can happen around the canal and
24 in places like Red Hook where the Bond Lorraine sewer
25 extends an environmental justice area. The EPA has

1
2 also criticized the plan for the water modeling
3 inconsistencies and the lack of any EJ analysis and
4 has continued to lambast the city for its sewage
5 problems and lack of compliance with the super fund
6 orders and the Gowanus canal, including building a
7 2CSO tanks that are required for the current
8 residents. It don't include the new 30,000 residents
9 that will come to this neighborhood.

10 So, as I ran home from the subway through the
11 flooded streets on the night that Superstorm Ida hit,
12 I was terrified but I know I'm lucky because I wasn't
13 swept away in the water like Michael Robinson who
14 died in the storm and whose body was found in the
15 Gowanus Canal the next day.

16 City Council needs to wake up. Climate change is
17 here. It is taking lives. This is no time to be
18 pleasing big real estate developers at the cost of
19 the health and safety of residents. I think you
20 should delay a vote on this plan until it has been
21 reworked with data that reflects the reality of
22 climate change or vote no on the Gowanus rezoning.

23 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Our next speaker is
24 Winslow Dennis and followed by Valerie Fenimore.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

1
2 WINSLOW DENNIS: Hi there. I don't know if
3 everybody can see me but uhm, thank you for this
4 opportunity to speak. I join the previous speakers,
5 all the previous speakers points. I believe that you
6 know that the city's plan is short sided at the
7 current state. As stated by previous speakers,
8 basing the EPA study on 2008 record you know
9 landfall, I mean rainfall numbers is short sided
10 considering the existence of climate change and the
11 fact that the area has seen increased rainfalls in
12 the last 12 years since then.

13 I also think that the Gowanus Green plan is short
14 sided in the fact that they have done very little to
15 remediate the poison, the toxins that exist in the
16 soil there and building affordable housing on there
17 is only making matters worse because we're putting
18 our most vulnerable New Yorkers into housing,
19 potential housing in communities and schools where
20 the poisonous toxins are going to only seep out of
21 the ground and cause future health problems for all
22 of them.

23 I think that the Gowanus rezoning needs to be
24 reconsidered and I ask, why wouldn't we at this point
25 try and apply some of this - the monies and some of

1
2 the you know the resources towards fixing the NYCHA
3 housing that exists in the Gowanus projects. I've
4 seen those and I think that the money and some
5 efforts there could be better used. So, I oppose,
6 thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
8 testimony today.

9 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uhm, the last speaker
10 on this panel is Valerie Fenimore.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we have Valerie?

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: She's still muted.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah.

15 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I understand
16 we're having some technical issues unmuting.
17 Valerie, if you can hear us, can you please accept
18 the unmute request you are receiving. Should we move
19 on Chair and call the next panel?

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, Valerie, you can come
21 back after if you can unmute yourself now.

22 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, so moving on to
23 panel number eight. We're going to call on Lori
24 Raphael, Joseph Sutkowi, William Thomas, and John

1
2 Tritt. So, the first speaker is Lori Raphael
3 followed by Joseph Sutkowi.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 LORI RAPHAEL: Good afternoon Council Members.
6 My name is Lori Raphael and I'm a Senior Vice
7 President with the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce. The
8 Brooklyn Chamber supports the Gowanus rezoning and
9 recognizes it as an opportunity to advance in
10 equitable economic recovery.

11 Rezoning Gowanus presents a unique opportunity to
12 transform a mostly an accessible waterfront into a
13 resilient clean, publicly accessible community
14 resource while addressing rising sea levels, other
15 climate threats and reducing the CSO's.

16 New York City was fighting a housing crisis even
17 before the health and economic crisis brought on by
18 COVID-19. The rezoning is expected to create
19 approximately 3,000 affordable housing units with
20 nearly 70 percent of the apartments located on
21 waterfront sites, making a relatively affluent and
22 majority White neighborhood more equitable and
23 diverse.

24 As the city's economy struggles to recover,
25 projects like Gowanus can unlock potential new tax

1
2 revenue, refill the construction pipeline with good
3 paying jobs and help local businesses keep their
4 doors open. The rezoning is designed to ensure that
5 land is appropriately remediated before any
6 development occurs. Development sites will need to
7 be fully remediated by property owners and government
8 agencies at every level will ensure oversight and
9 enforcement and a rigorous formal review followed by
10 the required remediation process.

11 In addition to affordable housing and good paying
12 jobs, rezoning Gowanus will accomplish the cleanup of
13 former industrial sites, the creation of open space
14 along the revitalized waterfront. The installation
15 of environmental resilience measures and protection
16 of the Gowanus mix. The community of artists and
17 makers.

18 The Brooklyn Chamber urges the City Council to
19 fully support this plan.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 LORI RAPHAEL: To put Gowanus and the city back
22 on track. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Lori.

24 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker is Joseph
25 Sutkowi followed by William Thomas.

1 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

2 JOSEPH SUTKOWI: Thank you Chairs. Thank you
3 Council Members. My name is Joseph Sutkowi and I'm
4 the Waterfront Design Associate Director at the
5 Waterfront Alliance. Waterfront Alliance believes
6 that if done right, a districtwide Gowanus rezoning
7 offers an opportunity to make progress towards a more
8 just resilient and green neighborhood and waterfront.
9 We are in support of the project.
10

11 The Gowanus rezoning will result in a long
12 awaited cleanup of the contaminated land around the
13 canal and the creation of abundant open space along
14 the waterfront that's open to the general public and
15 not just residents of the planned new buildings.
16 Open space will also play an important role in
17 preparing the neighborhood for climate change.

18 The edge of Gowanus represents unkept potential
19 and at the same time is in an area where the power of
20 climate risk is undeniable. For complex waterfront
21 projects of this nature, Waterfront Alliance
22 recommends that the project teams go through the
23 waterfront edge design guidelines or WEDG
24 verification process. Through the lens of WEDG,
25 which is a credit system for resilience, public

1
2 access and innovation at the water's edge, similar to
3 like a lead. We assess the climate adaptation
4 strategies open space designs and ecological features
5 in the proposal.

6 In 2019, the Brooklyn Borough Board adopted a
7 resolution encouraging all waterfront ULURP
8 applicants to use WEDG and we verified nine projects
9 in New York and New Jersey including several in
10 Brooklyn. Many of the credits in the WEDG standard
11 align closely with the recommendations from BP Adams
12 and CB6 through the WEDG verification process. We
13 assess the extent to which an individual project
14 conducted equitable engagement plans, avoided a
15 reduced risks from coastal hazards including sea
16 level rise. Provided quality public access to the
17 waterfront. Reduced and managed stormwater quality
18 among many other priorities.

19 We strongly encourage developers to work with
20 Waterfront Alliance through our WEDG verification
21 process to meet their commitments. Projects are
22 encouraged to engage early in the process to inform
23 designs and maximize performance and we urge this
24 Committee include a WEDG verification requirement in
25 the approval of the plan. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Joseph.

BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be William Thomas followed by John Tritt.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

WILLIAM THOMAS: Hello everyone. My name is Will Thomas. I'm here to support the rezoning of Gowanus as the Executive Director of Open New York. We're an independent grassroots pro-housing organization. Allowing more homes here will help to alleviate New York's housing shortage and help to fight displacement in other neighborhoods.

So, the Council ought to know that New York has a terrible housing shortage but I want to throw out some numbers to remind everyone how bad it is. Between 2010 and 2017, median rents increased by double median wages. Homelessness has reached the highest level since the great depression. Pre-COVID, one out of every ten elementary school students in New York City public schools attended from homeless shelters. So, right now, post-pandemic, we need all the affordable housing we can get and the thousands of below market homes that this rezoning offers are a great place to start.

1
2 But in addition, the 5,000 market rate homes that
3 this rezoning will allow will also help by preventing
4 displacement proactively in other neighborhoods. The
5 median household income in the rezoning areas were
6 well over six figures. Gowanus is a very desirable
7 neighborhood and although it will likely be many
8 families first choice, if the wealthy can't find any
9 places to live here, they will simply bid up the
10 price of existing housing until they can move into an
11 existing place on the market.

12 The families who would have otherwise lived in
13 those homes will instead move to more affordable
14 neighborhoods. If we don't let young professionals
15 live here, they are not going to disappear, they are
16 going to further displacement pressures deeper in
17 Brooklyn. In places like Sunset Park, Flatbush and
18 Midwood.

19 And lastly, and before the City Council I would
20 like to ask the Council to consider recommending that
21 parking minimums be removed from the proposal
22 entirely. It's well known that parking minimums
23 significant raise housing costs. Gowanus is a
24 transit rich neighborhood where the subways are under
25 capacity compared to the city as a whole.

1 So, in summary, our housing crisis is immense and
2 I would ask the entire Council and specifically
3 Council Member Lander to prioritize a solution and
4 especially over any esthetic concerns. Thank you.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you William.

7 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, Chair, the last
8 speaker on this panel is John Tritt.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 JOHN TRITT: Okay, good afternoon Chair Moya and
11 members of the Subcommittee. My name is John Tritt,
12 I am the Deputy Political Director for Service
13 Employees International Union Local 32BJ and I'm
14 speaking here this afternoon on behalf of Vice
15 President and New York Regional Director John Santos.

16 We are the largest property service union in the
17 country and represent more than 85,000 workers in New
18 York City, including 16,000 members who live and work
19 in Brooklyn. Our members are the residential
20 cleaners, security guards, handy persons and supers
21 like those who ultimately maintain the planned
22 residential buildings proposed for the Gowanus
23 neighborhood.

24 32BJ members support a responsible rezoning for
25 Gowanus that will create good new jobs and build

1
2 affordable housing at a time when working families
3 desperately need both. While the city has leaned on
4 essential building service workers, these workers who
5 are often low-income workers and come from
6 communities of color have been disproportionately
7 impacted by the pandemic. The new building service
8 jobs created by this plan will offer essential
9 workers opportunities for good jobs by providing them
10 access to family sustaining wages, affordable health
11 care and other important benefits that will help
12 workers build and recover after this devastating
13 years or year and a half really.

14 The Gowanus rezoning will also create almost
15 8,500 new housing units, nearly 3,000 at below market
16 rates. This means thousands of families who
17 otherwise could not afford to live in the community,
18 can now build a future for themselves and the next
19 generation in the neighborhood with a wealth of
20 resources.

21 In conclusion, as we emerge from this
22 unprecedented year, we will continue to face the
23 harsh realities of the COVID-19 pandemic for a long
24 time to come. It is crucial to advance projects that
25 will bring good employment opportunities and

1
2 affordable housing to people whose lives have been
3 shattered by the pandemic. With this rezoning,
4 families have the opportunities to build their lives
5 in a manner in which they can thrive. We also submit
6 a petition to the Council signed by over 300 of our
7 members in support of this rezoning. We respectfully
8 urge you to support it. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you John. Thanks for
10 your testimony today.

11 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I don't see any
12 Council Members with questions at this time. So, I
13 can move on to the next panel, which will be Lucy
14 Koteen, Tom Oesau, Chrissy Remein and Jack Riccobono.
15 So, the first speaker will be Lucy Koteen followed by
16 Tom Oesau.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

18 LUCY KOTEEN: Hi, hello, uhm, I'm a Member of the
19 New York City Sierra Club Group which opposes this
20 rezoning at this time. It was made very clear today
21 that this is nothing - there's nothing more than
22 speculation about the future and frankly, a lot of
23 happy talk from all the presenters.

24 Nothing could be clearer that this proposed
25 process is backwards. First, you clean all the

1
2 toxins, place the retention tanks in – which will at
3 best be installed by 2030. Then you study the area
4 for some years and then you begin the discussion as
5 to the sustainability of adding 35,000 more people to
6 what is now a toxic flood site. This is about water,
7 air, sewer capacity, flood zones, climate change, sea
8 level rise, overwhelming rainfall. Peoples homes
9 where basements serve as retention tanks for excess
10 water and sewage backs up out of their toilets. This
11 is not about land.

12 Wisely, Congressman Nydia Velazquez and
13 Assemblywoman Jo Anne Simon demanded a new EIS
14 because it was obvious that the one now is totally
15 inadequate. Using the 2008 rainfall levels measured
16 at JFK Airport, has nothing to do with the
17 measurement of rainfall in a flood zone where
18 basements are four or more water a feet after Ida.
19 According to an EPA administrator, the parcel of land
20 where low-income housing and a school will be placed,
21 can never be remediated.

22 This is about the need for a new paradigm where
23 the City Council stops deferring to the local Council
24 Member because the sewer shed, air, the ocean, the
25 rivers and canals do not live in any one district.

1
2 That absurdity has to stop. Climate change demands
3 that business as usual must stop. Business as usual
4 is the City Council Members being influenced by the
5 money and pressure placed on them by developers. You
6 must vote the interest of the whole city and not
7 segment parcels into pieces of land under the
8 discretion of -

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 LUCY KATEEN: Uhm, one more, I call this love
11 canal in reverse. First, you define the land as
12 toxic and then you build the houses. Ten years
13 later, when people get sick, the government; meaning
14 taxpayers, pay millions because they permitted this
15 program to go forward despite knowing the land is
16 toxic. Meanwhile, you all have gone onto your next
17 job.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Lucy for
19 your testimony today. Really appreciate it, thank
20 you so much.

21 LUCY KOTEEN: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Can we please call
23 the next panelist please.

24

25

1
2 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Apologies, I was
3 muted. Uhm, the next speaker will be Tom Oesau
4 followed Chrissy Remein.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 TOM OESAU: Hello, thank you for the opportunity
7 to testify. My name is Tom Oesau and I'm here on
8 behalf of Naturally Occurring Cultural Districts New
9 York and Arts and Democracy. Our two organizations
10 have been collaborating with the Gowanus community
11 for over a decade to facilitate connections and
12 explore important issues facing the neighborhood.

13 This includes NOCDNY is a relative cultural
14 partner with a resident leadership at Gowanus Houses
15 to reactivate the Gowanus Community Center in
16 preparation for its reopening.

17 As a proud member of the Gowanus Neighborhood
18 Coalition for Justice and in support of all of its
19 priorities, we will not back the Gowanus Neighborhood
20 plan without full funding for capital needs at
21 Gowanus Houses and Wyckoff Gardens, net zero CSO, and
22 a Gowanus zoning commitment taskforce. Based on our
23 background NOCDNY and Arts and Democracy are
24 positioned to speak on the role that community-based
25 arts and culture play in neighborhoods. Cross

1
2 pollinating with other sectors to maintain and
3 realize comprehensive healthy and vibrant
4 neighborhoods.

5 To assure that these systems thrive, the rezoning
6 must reinvest in community assets and cultural hubs,
7 especially the time they reopen the Gowanus Community
8 Center. The center operates as a lifeline for the
9 community, a place for gathering and organizing
10 during crisis like Sandy and COVID. With funding
11 committed to reopen the center, its design,
12 organizational structure and programming must be
13 expedited and community led.

14 Number two, recognize community networks,
15 including relationships between cultural practices,
16 industry and the Gowanus mix. Match making through
17 an accountability taskforce can sustain network
18 building beyond its stated importance in a planning
19 document.

20 Number three, assure access and affordably for
21 artists and cultural producers in order to preserve
22 and strengthen the character of the community and to
23 actively serve longstanding and new residents.

24 Number four, zoning for industrial spaces should
25 prioritize the hiring of local residents, especially

1
2 public housing residents to retain and capacitate
3 local talent and enterprise.

4 Number five, commercial and retail spaces should
5 serve existing residents, not simply introduce high
6 end surfaces that equate to consumer displacement.

7 And finally, public spaces should be accessible
8 to all and be designed through an inclusive and
9 participatory process. Design should consider not
10 only principles of gathering and belonging but buffer
11 the problem that -

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 TOM OESAU: Development actually instilled dis-
14 belonging. Thank you for your time.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Tom.

16 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker is
17 Chrissy Remein followed by Jack Riccobono.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 CHRISSY REMEIN: Hello, I'm Chrissy Remein.
20 Sorry, thank you. Hello, I'm Chrissy Remein, I'm
21 River Keepers, Hudson River Watershed Project
22 Manager.

23 River Keeper is a member supported watchdog
24 organization dedicated to protecting and restoring
25 the Hudson River. And we're finding the need to

1
2 advocate with our waterfront communities increasingly
3 important. Hurricane Ida has made clear that New
4 York City's efforts to adapt our sewer system and our
5 communities to new rainfall patterns, wind and
6 associated flooding are inadequate.

7 Today, however, we're not here to discuss new
8 plans to safeguard community members or sweeping new
9 stormwater management plan for Gowanus. Instead,
10 we're here to discuss rezoning Gowanus to bring more
11 residents and potential more stormwater and sewage to
12 an overburdened and vulnerable community and water
13 way.

14 River Keeper agrees with the recommendations of
15 our colleagues at GGC and GNCJ. Most crucially,
16 River Keeper cannot support this rezoning plan
17 without as a condition of approval, a thorough
18 climate adapted stormwater and sewage management plan
19 for the neighborhood. This can be accomplished
20 through a long-term control plan that accounts for
21 climate change, a Gowanus specific cloudburst study
22 and effectuated unified stormwater rule, and a
23 mechanism to monitor and report stormwater and sewage
24 loading. You've heard some of these before, so I'm
25 hoping to amplify these points of agreement here.

1
2 So, one to go over in a little bit of detail, the
3 city must develop an LTC for Gowanus Canal that
4 accounts for climate change and utilizes climate
5 change projections. The current LTC doesn't use
6 these, though the Mayor's report recently recommends
7 they be used by 2023. So, these need to be a
8 condition of rezoning.

9 Two, the Gowanus Neighborhood must be included as
10 one of the ten neighborhoods that the city advances
11 for its upcoming study. Doing so will make good on
12 demands the community has had for ten years for
13 hydrology study.

14 Three, the unified stormwater rule must be in
15 effect prior to the first site sewer connection the
16 rezoning area. Absent the rule, we are likely to see
17 an increase of three million gallons of stormwater
18 annually. So, either the finalized rule or the
19 requirements of the forth coming rule must be put
20 into place.

21 And last fourth, to ensure the requirements of
22 the unified stormwater rule are being complied with.
23 DEP must commit to annual monitoring through modeling
24 of net changes in sanitary and stormwater loading

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 225
2 within the Gowanus sewer shed. As mandated by EPA's

3 —

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 CHRISSY REMEIN: Administrative order without
6 discussion please. So, I'll leave it there and say
7 thank you and we're looking forward to and committed
8 to working with City Council to ensure these points
9 of agreement are met for the benefit of New Yorkers
10 and their waterways. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

12 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The last speaker on
13 this panel Chair is Jack Riccobono.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 JACK RICCOBONO: Hello, can you hear me?

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you Jack.

17 JACK RICCOBONO: Alright, thank you. Hi Chair
18 Moya and Council Members. Thank you for the
19 opportunity to address you today. I am a Member of
20 Voice of Gowanus, a coalition of community groups and
21 concerned citizens fighting for a just and
22 sustainable future for Gowanus.

23 The 82 block rezoning area under your
24 consideration lies in a FEMA Flood Zone A that
25 experienced severe flooding during Hurricane Sandy

1
2 and Ida, including the recent tragic death by
3 drowning of local resident Michael Robinson during
4 Ida flashfloods. The rezoned area also includes 133
5 documented toxic sites including multiple
6 manufactured gas plant sites. The city's own sea
7 level rise projections show that future storm event
8 will increase flood risk and the risk of toxic
9 exposure. Given these and other facts and what the
10 law prescribes, the community has been advocating for
11 months to have relevant state and federal agencies
12 bring their scientific expertise to bare on the
13 Gowanus Environmental Impact Statement or EIS.

14 Our Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez and Assembly
15 Member Jo Anne Simons have joined the community in
16 demanding the redrafting of the dangerously flawed
17 Gowanus EIS. CB2 voted the proposal down and EPA
18 recently submitted formal comments to the city
19 outlining serious flaws, errors and inconsistencies
20 in the city's impact analysis.

21 Council Members, we ask that you set aside policy
22 positions on development, housing and a host of other
23 vital issues and consider that even if you are in
24 favor of this action, the rezoning will be at
25 significant legal risk unless the EIS complies with

1
2 state and federal law. Without a legally sufficient
3 and comprehensive EIS, you have not been given the
4 impact analysis that would allow you to properly
5 assess the zoning action. And if you vote in favor
6 of this rezoning, without being given such analysis
7 in advance, you will be complicit in the city's
8 failures.

9 As such, we strongly encourage you –

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 JACK RICCOBONO: To stand for due process and
12 transparency and vote your conscience and vote no on
13 the Gowanus Neighborhood Plan. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Jack.

15 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the
16 last speaker on that panel and I see no Council
17 Members with questions. So, I can move on if you are
18 okay, to the next panel, which will be Madelaine
19 Britt, Douglas Hanau, Sarah Jean Avery and Toby Hyde.
20 So, the first speaker will be Madelaine Britt and
21 followed by Douglas Hanau.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 MADELAINE BRITT: Hi, good afternoon and thank
24 you for the opportunity to testify today. My name is
25 Madelaine Britt and I am a Policy Analyst at Citizens

1
2 Housing and Planning Council. CHPC would like to
3 thank the City Council, Community Boards two and six,
4 DCP and all the other stakeholders involved for their
5 dedication and hard work throughout this process.
6 Rezoning Gowanus was a key recommendation and HPD's
7 where we live plan, to affirmably further fair
8 housing in New York City.

9 Seeing this rezoning through is a step in
10 fulfilling the city's promise to advance racial
11 equity in our housing stock and neighborhoods. The
12 proposed plan will increase racial and economic
13 diversity in Gowanus by making the neighborhood more
14 accessible to low-income households and New Yorkers
15 of color. These benefits are highlighted in the
16 recent racial equity report from City Council Land
17 Use 5th Avenue Committee, as well as Columbia
18 University.

19 According to this study, the Gowanus rezoning
20 will result in more than twice the recent rate of new
21 affordable housing and reach deeper affordability
22 levels that would be met otherwise. Only 15 percent
23 of the 13,500 new units that have been built in
24 Community Boards two and six since 2014 are
25 affordable to low-income households.

1
2 By contrast, 35 percent of the projected
3 development under this rezoning will be affordable to
4 households earning before 40 and 80 percent AMI,
5 which is significant. In addition to advancing
6 racial equity and fair housing goals, the Gowanus
7 Neighborhood Plan includes key strategies to bolster
8 climate resiliency. Creating more open space,
9 remediating environmental hazards and improving sewer
10 and water infrastructure.

11 Yet, as we saw from the tragedy brought by
12 Hurricane Ida, creating a more resilient New York
13 also means building and investing in housing, until
14 every New Yorker has access to high quality
15 affordable housing, occupants of substandard, poorly
16 maintained and illegal housing will remain at the
17 greatest risk of injury and loss during disasters and
18 climate events.

19 This includes NYCHA residents, who represent a
20 crucial constituency of the neighborhood plan. CHPC
21 applauds Council Members Lander and Levin, Borough
22 President Adams, and the other community leaders and
23 stakeholders who have demanded funding for
24 improvements at Wyckoff Gardens and Gowanus Houses
25 alongside the rezoning. This is a chance for the

1
2 city to deliver on multiple promises to put its
3 stated commitments to fair housing into action.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 MADELINE BRITT: We thank the Council for its
6 support and would be happy to answer any questions.
7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
9 Madelaine for your testimony today.

10 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will
11 be Douglas Hanau followed by Sarah Jean Avery.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 DOUGLAS HANAU: My name is Douglas Hanau. I have
14 lived in Community Board Six and Council District 39
15 for 23 years. I bought a single family house 23-
16 years-ago and that house had doubled in value, more
17 than doubled in value. Its become a piggybank for me
18 and my family, which is great for us but which is
19 terrible policy.

20 The reason its gone up is historic designation,
21 restrictive zoning and uhm, basically having no
22 additional supply. People like me and a lot of other
23 people who live in Community Board Six are benefiting
24 tremendously from restrictive zoning and it's
25 essentially causing the community to be red lined.

1
2 There is no affordable housing. This community
3 does not support affordable housing no matter what
4 they say. Every single community housing application
5 and any housing application that comes in front of
6 the Community Board is denied similarly. Often or
7 historic reasons but for a lot of other reasons.

8 The other issue is climate. We cannot fight
9 climate change with houses that were built and
10 maintained in amber for 5,200 years. We have to
11 build newer, better, more resilient, more climate
12 friendly housing and we're not doing that.

13 Another reason is gentrification. If they are
14 not moving into our community, they are moving into —
15 people are moving into Sunset Park. People are
16 moving into downtown Brooklyn, Fort Greene, where
17 housing is being built and they are frankly taking
18 housing away from other people who are being priced
19 out.

20 Young people in New York have no where to go.
21 They can't move into our community. My kids have my
22 house. So, good for them but their friends can't
23 move into my community. The last issue is, for ten
24 years we have negotiated, this community has
25 negotiated means ten years people have no where to

1
2 live. So, it is time to support this and to pass
3 this and to build more housing -

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 DOUGLAS HANAU: In Community Board Six and CD39.
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Douglas.

8 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on
9 this panel is Sarah Jean Avery followed by Toby Hyde.
10 Sarah Jean Avery is next.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 SARAH JEAN AVERY: Hello, my name is SJ Avery. I
13 am a Member of the Parks Club City Council which is
14 proud to be a member of the GNCJ, whose top demands
15 are needed repairs to NYCHA housing, no new CSO's in
16 the canal and the creation of a Gowanus zoning
17 commitment taskforce.

18 I have lived half a block away from 4th Avenue for
19 over 30 years. For most of us who live in areas that
20 are being rezoned, the experience inevitably feels
21 like something that is being done to us. The very
22 way we promote neighborhood changes through
23 "rezoning" underlines the antiquated notion that
24 neighborhood change should be done simply by decide
25 of the height and density of new construction. And

1
2 how that can build on a defined parcel of land. Yes,
3 we are reminded that there have been years of
4 hearings sponsored by community boards, elected
5 officials or even city agencies. And it resulted in
6 [INAUDIBLE 4:31:48] with suggestions. Jonathan
7 showed us lovely pictures of those meetings.

8 I only wish I had the time to illustrate how many
9 of those suggestions did not end up in the Gowanus
10 plan. However the privacy of demands for NYCHA
11 repairs, for no new CSO's in the canal, and a
12 commitment taskforce were due to sustained advocacy
13 subsequent to those meetings. In our hearts we know
14 that the bulk of what ends up in a rezoning plan are
15 the results of meetings with city officials and
16 developers, often before official rezoning talks
17 begin.

18 We rely on points of agreement negotiated by our
19 council representatives to make sure that at least a
20 few of our most important concerns are reflected in a
21 final document. So, I am pleading that in advocating
22 for the Gowanus Zoning Commitment Taskforce, it be
23 endorsed by all of the City Council Members. You
24 have recently advanced very progressive legislation
25 related to stormwater management, racial disparities

1
2 and environmental impact. Establishing a Gowanus
3 Zoning Commitment Taskforce provides the opportunity
4 to test -

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 SARAH JEAN AVERY: The mechanism for measuring
7 the effectiveness of that legislation. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you SJ. Thank you for
9 your testimony today.

10 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The last speaker on
11 this panel is Toby Hyde.

12 TOBY HYDE: Good afternoon folks. Thank you very
13 much for hearing my testimony. I'm a proud resident
14 of CB6 and I'm excited that this proposal has made it
15 this far to City Council and I'm proud to support the
16 Gowanus Rezoning. Which will bring over 8,400 new
17 homes and roughly 3,000 which will be permanently
18 affordable to my neighborhood and really impressed by
19 the moves that DCP has made with Gowanus Green.

20 However, I'm sick of seeing my friends move. Out
21 of parks, out of Gowanus, out of my neighborhoods
22 into Sunset Park, into Terrace and to Bay Ridge. Way
23 up to Harlem and Northern Manhattan, upstate New
24 Jersey. We need to build more housing. We need to
25 build more housing everywhere and especially here in

1
2 Brooklyn in places that people want to live. Study
3 after study shows many which based in New York City
4 show that building more housing in fact does relieve
5 pressure on housing prices.

6 Housing prices in Gowanus average about \$700,000
7 in fall 2011 up to over \$1.2 million most recently
8 according to Zillow. That's an average annual
9 increase of about 5.2 percent annualized growth.
10 That's well above the overall rate in Brooklyn.

11 Moreover, why build here? This is an area well
12 served by transit. We know people want to live here.
13 The EIS points out that potential impact of the
14 rezoning will be that more riders will be on transit.
15 Great, we're on more trains. We can do that. We
16 have the technology. We have the trains. We want
17 more trains. Further, this will be as Madelaine and
18 others have pointed out, a step forward in terms of
19 racial justice. The Regional Plan Association
20 pointed that out this morning as well.

21 In a borough that is 35 percent non-Hispanic,
22 White Gowanus is 62 percent. The average median
23 income in Gowanus is over twice the boroughs rate in
24 a city that in a metro area that by standards is
25 among the most segregated. I've seen the renderings

1
2 in Gowanus. They look great. The waterfront access,
3 the new housing, I want to live in that community.
4 Please build this. Please get this done. Please
5 fund NYCHA. We should fund NYCHA, not just for the
6 purposes -

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 TOBY HYDE: Of the rezoning, but it's the right
9 thing to do. Please get this done and let's move
10 forward.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Toby.

12 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the
13 last speaker on that panel. And I don't see any
14 Council Members with questions at this time.

15 So, we can move onto the next panel, which will
16 be Andie Corso, Emily Chiavelli, Georgia Parks, and
17 Myra Gonzalez. The first speaker will be Andie Corso
18 followed by Emily Chiavelli.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 ANDIE CORSO: Thank you. Thank you all. It's a
21 privilege to be here. My name is Andie Corso. I
22 live at Burgon and Evans. I'm right down the street
23 from Wyckoff Gardens and I worship at St. Lydia's at
24 304 Bond Street. St. Lydia's is a proud member of
25

1
2 GNCJ and fully supports the three demands that have
3 to be met before saying yes to this proposal.

4 I'm especially concerned about the full funding
5 for NYCHA capital repairs. When I look at my
6 neighbors at my church and my neighbors where I live,
7 these are people who already live here. Who have
8 lived here for generations and deserve capital
9 investment. It is not possible to say yes to this
10 proposal without meeting that demand. I also just
11 want to echo the real importance of the third demand
12 of having a committee that is providing ongoing
13 accountability.

14 Too many times the promise is yes, this is going
15 to happen and then it does not happen without
16 sustained accountability. I'm concerned that Council
17 Members Lander and Levin will be transitioning from
18 their roles. That accountability has to be with the
19 community in order to make sure uhm, that this policy
20 comes true.

21 I just appreciate everyone's concerns about this.
22 I came today for the exciting fifth hour of this
23 testimony because of my faith. I want to live in a
24 New York where money is invested in residents in the
25 community, so we have a community that's accessible

1
2 across all income levels. We have a community that's
3 safe and resilient and there is the opportunity to do
4 that but it does not include an existing plan without
5 meeting the three demands from GNCJ. Thank you so
6 much.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Andie. Thank you
8 for your testimony.

9 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will
10 be Emily Chiavelli followed by Georgia Parks.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 EMILY CHIAVELLI: Hi, can everyone hear me?
13 Yeah? My name is Emily Chiavelli and I am a Member
14 of the Gowanus Art Community. I'm currently a
15 Working Artist as well as the events and programs
16 Coordinator for Arts Gowanus.

17 I'd like to first address the final Environmental
18 Impact Study. As it states, "freelance artists who
19 lease studio spaces are not accounted for in the
20 estimates of directly displaced employment. Because
21 the studio spaces are not their regular places of
22 business."

23 My work with Arts Gowanus has showed me beyond a
24 shadow of a doubt that many artists in our
25 neighborhood are in fact small business owners who

1
2 work full time in their studios. I don't really
3 understand the categorization of artists solely as
4 freelancers based on no study and evidently anecdotal
5 evidence.

6 There are many reasons I love living in Gowanus
7 but the primary one is the extensive and diverse arts
8 community. Not considering how this rezoning will
9 effect art workers in Gowanus, is not just
10 detrimental to the artists and cultural workers, it's
11 detrimental to the neighborhood as a whole, both
12 culturally and economically.

13 Arts Gowanus has been working closely with Brad
14 Lander and several developers to finalize a community
15 benefits agreement in order to preserve the integrity
16 of the art community in Gowanus.

17 If signed, the agreement will create over 200
18 highly subsidized art studio spaces in Gowanus, which
19 is crucial to keeping the art community lively and
20 progressive in our community and in New York City as
21 a whole. I urge you to vote no on the rezoning if a
22 CBA contract is not signed before you vote. If you
23 move forward with the rezoning without this agreement
24 in place, you are responsible for obliterating one of
25

1
2 the most thriving artist neighborhoods left in New
3 York City.

4 Artists being pushed out of rezoned neighborhoods
5 is an old story in Brooklyn but now we're running out
6 of places to go. You have the chance to preserve the
7 identity of Brooklyn as a global cultural hub, which
8 is an identity that it will lose if it continues to
9 be inescapable to artists.

10 Lastly, Gowanus Open Studios is this weekend.
11 I'd like to fight and encourage everyone to come see
12 for yourselves the 400 artists across 100 locations
13 in Gowanus for participating this weekend. So you
14 can see for yourselves how crucial they are to the
15 vibrancy of this neighborhood. I demand you vote no
16 on rezoning if the CBA is -

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

18 EMILY CHIAVELLI: Not accomplished. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

20 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, the next
21 speaker on this panel is Georgia Parks and she will
22 be followed by Myra Gonzalez.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi Georgia, if you can hear
25 us, you're up. Hi Georgia. Okay, let's -

1
2 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I'm going to call on
3 the next panelist here. Myra Gonzalez, it appears
4 that Georgia was not available. So, we can call on
5 her after if she is around. Myra Gonzalez will be
6 next.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, thank you.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 MYRA GONZALEZ: Hello, can you hear me?

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

11 MYRA GONZALEZ: Okay. My name is Myra Gonzalez.
12 I live at 423 5th Street Brooklyn New York. It is on
13 the corner. It is a corner property and on 5th
14 Street. It is right on the corner. I am directly
15 across the street from the project or what we now
16 call or what we've always called the Lot.

17 My parents purchased this building in 1969. I
18 grew up there. I went to 58, I went to 142. I went
19 to John Jay. I, as well as a few of my few other
20 homes, which of three, there are only three on that
21 block. I have lived there full time. I can't speak
22 to the other owner properties but I can only tell you
23 that as one of the ones living there on 5th Street,
24 we don't think that I feel like I have not been
25 consulted as what's going on across the street. I

1
2 hear all kinds of things from all kinds at times. I
3 hear the pounding of the cranes. I hear all of the
4 work going on and although that's really good
5 progress, I also smell all of the work that's going
6 on because of the canal.

7 That canal has been there forever. The tanks
8 have been there since my parents bought the building.
9 The tanks came down, everything is fine and now all
10 of this is going on. My problem is, is that every
11 time there is a community board meeting or any kind
12 of meeting, that I should be included in, I have been
13 constantly ignored. I have written, I have emailed,
14 I have called to all of our community leaders.
15 Constantly ignored.

16 Now, we have a sign that we have had there since
17 the 1920's. Since before the train elevation was
18 created. Because of your zoning, we have not been
19 able to get any -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 MYRA GONZALEZ: For the sign. I need help and I
22 don't know who else to turn to but this Community
23 Board or this zoning group. Because your zoning is
24 impacting me directly.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 243
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Myra.
3 Thank you for your testimony today.

4 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, the next and
5 last panelist for this panel is Georgia Parks, if
6 she's available.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Georgia, can you hear us?

9 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It looks like Georgia
10 is having trouble with her audio.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, so -

12 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Should we just move on
13 and see if we can get her?

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: And then we'll try to get her
15 back on.

16 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, so I don't see
17 any Council Members with questions for this panel, so
18 we can move onto the next panel, which is Ira
19 Lichtiger, sorry if I mispronounced that. Brendan
20 Cheney, Ahmed Elrawi, and Rachel Cohen. Uhm, Ira
21 Lichtiger will be the first one and followed by
22 Brendan Cheney.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time. Ira, you may
24 begin.
25

1
2 IRA LICHTIGER: Thank you. Thank you Council
3 Members. Thank you specifically Council Members
4 Lander and Levin for your steadfast commitment to
5 this process. I am Ira Lichtiger, I am a Principal
6 of the Bluestone Organization, which is one of the
7 four developers of Gowanus Green, joint developers.
8 I really signed up to be available for follow-up
9 questions on Gowanus Green if there are any. But
10 uhm, having listened the last couple of hours, I'd
11 like to say that although there are complex,
12 obviously complex considerations at play here and you
13 know, I think I can say that we support many of the
14 requests made today including of course the full
15 funding of the local NYCHA repairs among others.

16 Uhm, though imperfect, there's really - it comes
17 down to a choice of voting yes or no on this
18 rezoning. And though it's not perfect, voting yes
19 will bring public and private investment into the
20 Gowanus area, which will lead to remediating the
21 brown fields, improved water retention and water
22 retention infrastructure, critically needed
23 affordable housing, and increased economic and racial
24 diversity. And the reality of city politics is that
25 voting no will lead to many more years of delay in

1
2 getting there for this neighborhood. So, I thank you
3 again for this process and for your support.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Ira.

5 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on
6 this panel is Brendan Cheney followed by Ahmed
7 Elrawi.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 BRENDAN CHENEY: Good afternoon, my name is
10 Brendan Cheney, I'm the Director of Policy and
11 Communications at the New York Housing Conference.
12 We are a nonprofit affordable housing policy and
13 advocacy organization.

14 I'm testifying in support of the Gowanus rezoning
15 as long as it also includes a dedicated capital
16 commitment to repairs and upgrades at the local NYCHA
17 developments. As you are well aware, we're facing an
18 ever growing housing homelessness crisis.

19 Homelessness is at or near record highs. Capital
20 repairs needs at NYCHA total \$40 billion and growing.
21 Nearly one million New Yorkers are rent burdened and
22 New York is rated one of the most segregated cities
23 in the country.

24 New York City desperately needs more affordable
25 housing and policies that will reverse and repair our

1
2 history of racial discrimination. Every neighborhood
3 must contribute to the city's affordable housing
4 development but bringing affordable housing to this
5 neighborhood is particularly important. According to
6 the recent racial equity report from Columbia
7 University, the rezoning will take wealthier, wider
8 and lower density neighborhood and make it more
9 diverse and affordable.

10 Up zoning in higher income neighborhoods like
11 Gowanus is a policy with wide appeal. It was one of
12 our recommendations, one of the recommendations of
13 the United for Housing Coalition, a coalition formed
14 by New York Housing Conference and joined by 90
15 partner organizations in New York City.

16 The Gowanus Plan came out of an in-depth and
17 inclusive community planning process that should be
18 replicated in future rezoning's. It produced a plan
19 that includes mapping mandatory inclusionary housing
20 throughout much of the rezoning area. Generating an
21 estimated 3,000 units of desperately needed
22 affordable housing.

23 The community plan also includes funding for the
24 two adjacent public housing developments, Gowanus
25

1
2 Houses and Wyckoff Gardens. Preserving NYCHA is just
3 as important as building new affordable housing.

4 We also want to note that affordable housing
5 creates jobs and economic spending. Research has
6 found that 100 units of affordable housing
7 construction creates 230 jobs and \$46 million in
8 economic activity.

9 As the city's economy struggles to recover,
10 opportunities like Gowanus rezoning can create needed
11 affordable housing, unlock new tax revenue, refill
12 the construction pipeline and help local businesses.
13 New York Housing Conference supports this rezoning
14 and funding for adjacent NYCHA sites and the
15 community planning process used here should be
16 replicated in our neighborhoods in the city. Thank
17 you for this opportunity to testify.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 BRENDAN CHENEY: And I'm happy to answer any
20 questions.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Brendon.

22 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker is
23 Ahmed Elrawi and then be followed by Rachel Cohen.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

25 AHMED ELRAWI: Hello. Hello.

1

BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We can hear you.

2

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Ahmed? Ahmed, if you can unmute yourself.

3

4

AHMED ELRAWI: Hello?

5

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yep, we can hear you Ahmed.

6

AHMED ELRAWI: Hello.

7

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Can you hear us?

8

AHMED ELRAWI: Uhm, my name is Ahmed Elrawi. I

9

am a Mechanical Engineer and also in the

10

neighborhoods I have my oldest son is attending

11

school on 3rd Avenue Ministry, which is very close to

12

the location of the project.

13

Also, I work for an engineering firm that is a

14

part of rezoning. I am very excited for the

15

development of the neighborhood. And the projects

16

are taking a very mindful approach to integrate with

17

the fabric of Gowanus. The project also has a highly

18

design goal in mind and I really, I fully support the

19

rezoning and that will improve the planning of the

20

neighborhood.

21

Beside two things, for the affordable housing, we

22

need a lot of affordable housing and it's an issue

23

for housing for people here. And I was very happy to

24

hear that Gowanus development is going to be housing

25

1
2 apartments and this is going to help to improve the
3 housing quality for people who live in the city and
4 who cannot afford buying houses or living in a condo,
5 condominium. Uhm, those kind of expensive
6 properties.

7 Also, for the climate change issue, we are
8 thinking like a lot of consideration about the uh,
9 climate issue while residing there. It's called
10 local loaning survey which has a vision of 2025 to
11 lower the CO2 emissions in New York City. So, uh -

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 AHMED ELRAWI: The concern about - yeah, okay.
14 Thank you very much for having me. Thanks.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Ahmed.

16 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker on
17 this panel is Rachel Cohen and if we can locate her
18 from our last panel, the next speaker after Rachel
19 will be Georgia Parks.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 RACHEL COHEN: Hi, my name is Rachel Cohen and I
22 am representing the VOREA Construction Company. I'm
23 here to express our support for the Gowanus rezoning.
24 After years of planning, hundreds of hours of
25 community meetings and input from thousands of

1
2 residents, it's our responsibility to continue to
3 move ahead with the progress that has already been
4 made. There are so many amazing benefits that will
5 come from this rezoning including a more robust,
6 affordable housing offering, opportunity for job
7 creation, continued growth in the already thriving
8 arts community, as well as supporting environmental
9 justice.

10 As a New York City resident and a member of this
11 community, I believe we have a responsibility to the
12 city to get this done. Thank you so much.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
14 testimony.

15 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, we are trying
16 to locate Georgia Parks but it doesn't look like she
17 is available. So, Assemblywoman Simon I believe will
18 be next, if we have her available. Is the
19 Assemblywoman ready?

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I see Georgia there.

21 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Apologies. Georgia is
22 here. So, Georgia, if you are ready.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Georgia, we can't hear you.
24
25

1
2 BACKUP COMMITTEE COUNSEL: So, Chair, we have –
3 if we're moving on, we have Assembly Member Jo Anne
4 Simon is ready.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi, Assemblywoman, how are
6 you? Good to see you.

7 JO ANNE SIMON: Hi, I'm good. I'm good. It's
8 good to see you in your new capacity.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you.
10 Please, go right ahead.

11 JO ANNE SIMON: Thank you. Can I ask you a
12 question? How long do I have?

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You have two minutes but don't
14 worry please.

15 JO ANNE SIMON: I'm sorry.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You have two minutes but it's
17 okay.

18 JO ANNE SIMON: Okay because I'm likely to take a
19 little bit longer than that and I wanted to give you
20 a heads up. Hey, it's pearls of wisdom right?

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No, no, no. Don't worry
22 Assemblywoman please.

23 JO ANNE SIMON: Alright, thank you. Thank you.
24 Uhm, okay, so thank you for the opportunity to
25 testify. Uhm, I want to start out by saying that

1
2 last month Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez and I sent a
3 letter to Mayor de Blasio and held a press conference
4 the week after Hurricane Ida, to call attention to
5 the flaws in the DEIS and to urge the city to revise
6 the Gowanus rezoning DEIS to address significant
7 inconsistencies and contradictions that were
8 identified by EPA.

9 It's fairly mindboggling that the city thought it
10 could ignore the EPA's recommendations and it issued
11 a final EIS without correcting those contradictions
12 and using updated modeling for example, instead of
13 data from 2008.

14 The city's recalcitrant with following EPA's
15 orders for the super fund site combined with its use
16 of pre-Sandy, pre-Super Fund data in the DEIS tells
17 us that New York City is making believe that it can
18 do business as usual. The city shouldn't play games
19 with data to evade remediation and costs. Mother
20 nature will not be fooled. The city must plan for
21 the future and focus and focus on the public's
22 health.

23 In the aftermath of two severe storms that
24 claimed the lives of over a dozen New Yorkers, we
25 really must address climate change as the Code Red

1
2 crisis that it is. And act to ensure the health and
3 safety of current and future residents of the area.

4 Now, I base the challenge for this rezoning
5 proposal and the areas current and future residents
6 can be reduced to one word, climate. Climate change,
7 climate justice, it is all about climate and we
8 ignore the significant climate concerns at our
9 parrel. We can't cover it up. We can't make believe
10 that climate change will not happen. It's happening
11 as we speak and we all know it. This rezoning is
12 taking place in one of the most polluted areas of our
13 country. Which has been subjected to 150 years of
14 contamination by industrial waste and raw sewage.

15 Nearly the entire Gowanus area is in a flood
16 plain. There are so many variables that we can't
17 control for in a large rezoning, let alone a project
18 of the size, complexity and consequence of the
19 Gowanus Super Fund area rezoning that we need as many
20 tools as possible to control and shape a healthy and
21 safe implementation as possible.

22 So, this mornings daily news featured an article
23 about this rezoning today and got many of the facts
24 wrong. So, a little bit of history is called for
25 unless the Committee and the Council make a decision

1
2 based on a faulty premise and misinformation. The
3 article opens by saying for nearly ten years,
4 community groups, elected officials,
5 environmentalists and residents have been hard at
6 work planning for the future of the Gowanus
7 neighborhood in Brooklyn.

8 Well, it's incorrect because its been much
9 longer. In 2008, the EPA undertook to assess the
10 merits of whether the Gowanus Canal and its uplands
11 qualified for designation as a super fund site. The
12 City Planning Commission had already issued a
13 proposal for rezoning the area. It had indeed been a
14 refreshing engagement of community, working together
15 with City Planning for once, which had not happened
16 much before that.

17 And I participate in that effort and was not at
18 all pleased with the results although there were a
19 lot of problems. The advent of super fund
20 designation was really very destructive to the
21 community in many ways and we see vestiges of that
22 now. But for many years and many decades, people
23 wanted to develop the public place site which is the
24 areas largest into senior housing and that included
25 me, who supported the super fund designation. It

1
2 also included Council Member de Blasio, who along
3 with the Bloomberg Administration opposed the super
4 fund designation. And at that time, we didn't know
5 just how toxic the site was.

6 So, bridging Gowanus was a good process and I
7 commend Council Member Lander for bringing people
8 together there but in fact -

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm going to have to ask you
10 to wrap it up, okay.

11 JO ANNE SIMON: Okay. So, I'm going to wrap up
12 by saying number one, the city's planning proposal
13 covers 82 blocks. It includes much broader than the
14 Gowanus rezoning in 2008. It is much bigger than
15 bridging Gowanus and it doesn't identify, it uses
16 2008 water and sewage data. The EPA has told it to
17 go back and redo whole sections of the EIS because
18 the city has been very recalcitrant and not following
19 the EPA's orders in remediation.

20 And so, we're planning as if the city has done
21 that which it has thus far not done and it is
22 critical to whether or not this will be a safe
23 proposal. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Can we call the
25 next panel?

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
3 Sandye Renz, Cynthia Simmons, Linda Laviolette, and
4 Dina Gruberg. The first speaker will be Sandy Renz
5 followed by Cynthia Simmons.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sandye Renz, if you can hear
8 us, you will need to accept the unmute request.

9 SANDYE RENZ: Okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi Sandye. We can hear you.

11 SANDYE RENZ: Hi. Okay, hi. Okay, my name is
12 Sandye Renz and I have lived in Gowanus for over 30
13 years. I don't understand why anyone has faith that
14 this rezoning will be any different from the majority
15 of rezoning and development that has happened in this
16 city from Peter Stuyvesant to Robert Moses to
17 Bloomberg and de Blasio.

18 I live on the corner, well, between 3rd and 4th
19 Avenue and the nightmare that is 4th Avenue. I
20 participated in the touted community engagement,
21 which was a complete sham. A contaminate public
22 relations move like changing the name of public place
23 to Gowanus Green. The bugaboo of affordable housing
24 is a crowd pleaser. Atlantic Yards, which
25 conveniently changed its name to Pacific Park has yet

1
2 to supply the promise to affordable housing after 15
3 years. I agree with many of the decenters who spoke
4 so eloquently today on this rezoning. Their reasons
5 are all valid, especially the focus on climate.

6 During Ida I watched while the walls of my
7 basement became waterfalls. There is not enough open
8 space in this proposal, nor is there any access to
9 the canal. Please wait, why is the big rush to make
10 the correct decision about rezoning this enormous and
11 wonderful neighborhood? Please vote no. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Sandye. Thank you
13 for your testimony today.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next will be Cynthia Simmons
15 followed by Linda Laviolette.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 CYNTHIA SIMMONS: Hello, my name is John Golden,
18 I'm borrowing Cynthia Simmons registration. She is
19 my neighbor and I think that's okay. We're in
20 agreement. We're both in opposition to this proposal
21 and the reasons that I'm opposed are straight
22 forward. It's just, it's the wrong place to put tall
23 buildings. First, it's commonsense to build the
24 tanks first and not put the buildings up later. You
25 are not protected unless you have the tanks.

1
2 And second, it adds congestion to a neighborhood
3 and we're talking about putting up buildings that are
4 35 stories high in a neighborhood of mostly four
5 story buildings. I think there hasn't been enough
6 discussion about negotiating height limits to some
7 places that are you know more reasonably tall. And
8 so, would not interfere as much with the environment.
9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we'll hear from Linda
12 La Violette followed by Diana Gruberg.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Linda, if you can hear us, we
15 need you to accept - there we go.

16 LINDA LA VIOLETTE: Okay. Hello Council Members.
17 My name is Linda Laviolette, I'm a resident and
18 member of the Community Advisory Group to the EPA and
19 a member of Voice of Gowanus.

20 I have been a neighborhood activist for over 40
21 years and I oppose this Gowanus rezoning. This plan
22 puts our community at dire risk from the
23 environmental impacts of climate change and
24 overdevelopment. I support Congresswoman Velazquez
25 and Assembly Member Jo Anne Simon who told Mayor de

1
2 Blasio on September 8th that they find serious
3 problems with the city's Gowanus neighborhood
4 rezoning.

5 The Gowanus flood zone is already struggling with
6 climate change. This proposed rezoning will only
7 accelerate and magnify those environmental problems.
8 One of the big problems is lack of sewer
9 infrastructure. The rezoning is overreaching and bad
10 urban planning. It's Council Member Brad Lander's
11 failed attempt at a unified field theory of urban
12 planning. Except it is nothing like the panacea he
13 is promising.

14 The EIS was full of bad data and faulty
15 environmental analysis. It's proposing to bring an
16 additional 31,000 people to live in a polluted flood
17 zone, that does not have sewer infrastructure to
18 transport and process raw human sewage. This human
19 poop ends up in the Gowanus Canal that is being used
20 as New York City's de facto open sewer.

21 Never build in a flood zone. It's the first rule
22 of urban planning. Additionally, the Environmental
23 Impact Statement identified 133 toxic sites in an 82
24 block rezone, more than one per block. What happens
25 when the next flood spills -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

LINDA LA VIOLETTE: Those toxins to our community basement and homes? Please vote no on the Gowanus rezoning.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Linda.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be Diana Gruberg.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

DIANA GRUBERG: Good afternoon. I am Diana Gruberg, Landscape Director of Gowanus Canal Conservancy. We are a proud member of GNCJ and will not support the rezoning unless our top three demands are met. Full capital funding for local public housing, net zero CSO and a creation of a community-based taskforce.

However, I would like to use my time to focus on a different ULURP action in Gowanus before you today. The Gowanus CSO facility. Because this item was accelerated to move with the rezoning, I doubt many others will speak to it. We haven't heard much about it so far. This action will place a CSO tank at the salt lot where GCC has held stewardship and education programs for the past ten years.

1
2 I ask you to use the multiple actions before you
3 to ensure that the salt lot remains an educational
4 and equal logically productive public space into the
5 future. With the new learning facility, stewardship
6 center and salt marsh restoration integrated into the
7 CSO tank.

8 A publicly accessible salt lot is critical to
9 mitigate the current severe lack of open space in
10 Gowanus, which will be exacerbated by the overall
11 rezoning, as shown in the city's FEIS. The salt lot
12 is critical for supporting people and ecosystems. In
13 the last ten years, GCC has hosted over 5,000
14 students here for field trips, over 5,000 community
15 stewards who distribute compost and propagated plants
16 and a paid used employee training program for teens
17 from local public housing.

18 The salt lot is also the most biodiverse site
19 along the Gowanus Canal. Where 17,000 square feet of
20 native ecosystems and public space are home to over
21 280 species of plants, marine life, shorebirds,
22 invertebrates and small mammals.

23 A successful long-term design will require deep
24 outreach and partnership with both current site
25 occupants and the larger community. We do appreciate

1
2 the efforts that the agencies have made to work with
3 us over the past ten years.

4 On the brink of a new administration, we ask
5 today that as part of this ULURP approval, you
6 require that future administrations and agency staff
7 do the same. With a commitment to public space,
8 restoration and community outreach as part of the
9 salt lots future design. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thanks for your
11 testimony today.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, that was the last
13 speaker on this panel and there don't appear to be
14 any members with questions for this panel.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great, okay, thank you so
16 much. This panel is now excused. Counsel, can you
17 please call up the next panel?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
19 Harrison Grinnan, Jim Bushong, Austin Celestin, and
20 Denny Salas. We'll begin with Harrison Grinnan
21 followed by Jim Bushong.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 HARRISON GRINNAN: Hello, my name is Harrison
24 Grinnan. I'm a resident of Greenpoint. I am here to
25 support the rezoning. I think that it's you know

1
2 it's not a perfect proposal but I think that we
3 really have to work with what we can get.

4 As the DCP pointed out on one of their great
5 slides that I really enjoyed, you can see that every
6 other surrounding area has been downzoned under the
7 Giuliani and Bloomberg Administration's. This meant
8 that this area has experienced a profound housing
9 crisis. And has really contributed to the lack of
10 housing in the region as a whole, which has been very
11 detrimental to the city as a whole. So, just kind of
12 focusing in on that. Recently, there was a
13 Superstorm, which not full superstorm but a tropical
14 storm that hit the city, Ida. During that, dozens of
15 people died in Queens who were drowned in their
16 homes.

17 The reason for that is because they were living
18 in illegal, unsafe basement apartments. The reason
19 that people choose to live underground is not because
20 they want to, it's because they can't afford anywhere
21 else. The reason that that happens is because we
22 don't build anywhere for people to live. We can give
23 them vouchers but there's no where for them to go.
24 There is more than 100,000 people that live in
25

1
2 illegal basement units in New York and we only built
3 100,000 units in the last ten years.

4 So, even if we built every single unit for the
5 next decade, there would still be people in basements
6 in the end. We need to build more and this 8,000
7 homes right now, including 3,000 affordable, which is
8 going to be a great bite out of that shortage that we
9 experience. But we need to do more even than that.
10 We need to kind of expand the scope if possible. We
11 need to work to make this the start of something
12 better. Not just, like not just this rezoning, we
13 need to think of this as a building block towards a
14 greater future for the entire city.

15 As far as things about this specific proposal,
16 Brooklyn CB6, which includes Gowanus is much wider
17 than the city average and simply by virtue the mixed
18 income housing, the rezoning stands to further
19 integrate and fair house the community. It's final
20 for the Whiter and wealthier parts of the city to
21 allow this mixed income housing to stem displacement
22 and residential segregation. Especially as New York
23 is among its most segregated in the city, segregated
24 city's in the country. Thank you for your time.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
3 testimony.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Jim
5 Bushong followed by Austin Celestin.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 JIM BUSHONG: Hi, I'm Jim Bushong and I'm
8 testifying in favor of the rezoning. As an architect
9 in New York City, this is exactly the type of
10 thoughtful urban planning the city needs.

11 This rezoning would successfully add density to a
12 transit rich location while preserving the spirit of
13 the existing neighborhood through square footage that
14 has been specifically set aside for Gowanus mix of
15 uses. Creating a dynamic mixed use neighborhood and
16 not just a residential monoculture.

17 This enhanced density will also support new and
18 existing commercial activity in the rezoned areas.
19 From a resiliency standpoint, as we've heard
20 development along the Gowanus Canal will include
21 remediation of contaminated sites and further
22 investment to the shoreline infrastructure will then
23 make upland neighborhoods more resilient.

24 The Gowanus rezoning allows for appropriately
25 scaled buildings that are inviting at the pedestrian

1
2 realm with building bases that present a low rise
3 scale along street frontages and along the canal with
4 significant setbacks required for the few sites that
5 are allowed to have towers.

6 One of the real opportunities with this rezoning
7 is the creation of new contiguous waterfront open
8 space, along a former blighted canal. These
9 waterfront pedestrian zones will have been extremely
10 successful in many locations throughout the city and
11 this is an excellent place to create much needed
12 passive and active recreation space in this area.

13 And finally, one of the most important aspects of
14 this redevelopment as we've heard is the creation of
15 thousands of MIH units in an area that is no longer
16 affordable to the average New Yorker. The Gowanus
17 rezoning provides significant investment in an area
18 that without it, will remain a remnant of an
19 abandoned industrial past. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Austin Celestin will be next
22 followed by Denny Salas.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 AUSTIN CELESTIN: Good afternoon. Good
25 afternoon, my name is Austin Celestin. I am a

1
2 Student at MYU. I can't think of a better rezoning
3 proposal for an area like Gowanus. A transit rich,
4 high market, high demanded disproportionately White
5 neighborhood with a six figure median income.

6 8,500 new housing units, 3,000 of which
7 affordable with several dedicated for low-income
8 brackets. I don't know what would be worse. Not
9 passing this plan or letting it be the last. It's
10 obvious we're in a housing crisis. We have the most
11 expensive rents in the country. We build last
12 housing last decade, then during the Great Depression
13 and last housing since 1970, that we did in just the
14 1920's alone.

15 All of this while demand perspective tenants,
16 buyers and investors are at record highs. With any
17 semblance of the slumping market well in the past.
18 This plan presents a major step to cultivate that
19 demand. Embrace that desire to build higher and
20 larger and address the housing crisis.

21 We saw rents fall slightly when people left the
22 city and numerous studies demonstrate the correlation
23 between abundant housing and lower rents. More
24 housing, both market rate and affordable is needed to
25 solve this crisis and Gowanus is a perfect

1
2 opportunity. There are valid concerns regarding
3 mandatory inclusionary housing. Up until recently,
4 MIH has burdened lower income areas with brackets
5 dictated by the citywide average, creating a lose,
6 lose gamble where the project would either fail
7 financially or bolster gentrification.

8 But Gowanus is a neighborhood where the mandatory
9 program would actually work. The median incomes are
10 far above the citywide average resulting in AMI
11 brackets below the neighborhoods average. Opening up
12 the transit rich area to new working and middle class
13 residents. Mandatory Inclusionary Housing is
14 designed for affluent areas like Gowanus, SoHo,
15 Greenwich Village and Brooklyn Heights would quite
16 appropriately and improve the rezoning. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
18 testimony today.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Denny Salas will be the next
20 and last speaker on this panel.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 DENNY SALAS: Thank you Council Members. Good
23 afternoon Council Members. I hope all of you are
24 well. My name is Denny Salas and I won't take up too
25

1
2 much of your time regurgitating some of the comments
3 made by other supports of this plan.

4 But let's be honest, how is this even a debate?
5 We're talking about creating 3,000 affordable homes
6 in our city. Last year the partnership for New York
7 City did a study where they found that the affordable
8 home shortage for 2021 will be between 650,000 and
9 760,000 homes and those figures have born out.
10 Sometimes I'm confounded by the objections to
11 building more homes for working class families who
12 need it, especially when building affordable homes in
13 our wealthiest neighborhoods. I urge this Council to
14 approve this project that help people that make this
15 city great. Thank you for your time and I hope you
16 all have a wonderful day.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Denny. Thank you
18 for your testimony.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
20 speaker on this panel and I don't see any members
21 with questions for the panel.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing no uh, anyone
23 that has questions for this panel, this panel is now
24 excused. Counsel, if you can please call up the next
25 panel.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, we're going to try to
3 hear once again from Georgia Parks. Georgia Parks
4 first and then we will also try Valerie Fenimore.
5 Georgia Parks, if you can hear me, we need you to
6 accept the unmute request. I see Georgia Parks. I
7 see her name on the list. Uhm, if you see an unmute
8 request Georgia Parks, we need you to accept the
9 unmute request in order to begin testifying.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Georgia, can you hear us? You
11 can unmute yourself.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh, here we go, okay. We
13 should have Georgia Parks.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Georgia, we can see you but we
15 can't hear you. Alright, Georgia, we're going to try
16 this one more time.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Georgia Parks we see your
18 presence in the meeting. If you can hear us, you can
19 begin testifying.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, let's move onto the next
21 one.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Let's try Valerie Fenimore.
23 Valerie Fenimore, if you can hear me -

24 VALERIE FENIMORE: Can you hear me?

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

VALERIE FENIMORE: Can you hear me?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We can hear you. Who is this?

VALERIE FENIMORE: Great, great. Hi, this is Valerie Fenimore and I've owned a house on Nelson Street in Carroll Gardens since 1974. I am against building 8,500 new apartments in a neighborhood which is already overcrowded and overused. I need answers regarding the overuse of our sewer system.

An example, look at the Gowanus Canal on 9th Street when it rains. St. Mary's Park, there are people standing there shoulder to shoulder now, what will happen when there are at least 8,500 new occupants?

The local school, which is PS 58 is so crowded that the pre-K is a mile away from the main building. And the traffic problem, it already takes 25 minutes to go up Smith Street from Nelson to Atlantic Avenue. Using the public transportation, the 57 bus travels on Smith Street and the S and G trains are overcrowded too. And what about the services that my tax money pays for? The Police Department, the Sanitation Department, the Parks Department, the MTA, the DOT. 8,500 more people in this already

1
2 overcrowded neighborhood? What are the people at the
3 City Planning thinking about? Thank you so much for
4 your time.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Valerie. Who do we
6 have next Arthur?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry, I was muted. We're
8 going to try to get Georgia Parks, can you hear me?

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Hello.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Hello, is that Georgia Parks?

11 UNIDENTIFIED: No, this is not Georgia Parks.
12 This is Valerie Fenimore again.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Valerie.

14 VALERIE FENIMORE: Georgia was in my house since
15 ten o'clock this morning. She had to pick up her
16 grandchildren. So, she wants to testify but she
17 can't because she's obviously not here. So, is there
18 a way to wait for her?

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We're going to keep going. If
20 she can make it before the hearing is over, she can
21 always log back in but she can always submit her
22 testimony to the council at the email that we have.

23 VALERIE FENIMORE: Okay, I will tell her. Thank
24 you.

25 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you so much. Okay.

1

VALERIE FENIMORE: Thank you.

2

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Bye, bye.

3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL:

4

Landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Okay, Chair, we'll

5

move to the next panel, which will be Chris Rio, Todd

6

Fine, Tamara Staples, and Joan Salome-Rodriguez.

7

First speaker will be Chris Rio followed by Todd

8

Fine.

9

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10

CHRIS RIO: Okay, thank you for the opportunity

11

to speak today. I appreciate it. Uh, I was

12

initially for this rezoning, however, I'm a Super on

13

a building on Dean Street off the hill and after the

14

last two storms, I'm completely against the rezoning

15

as it's planned right now. It's evidence that the

16

sewage handling of the stormwater overflow is

17

completely inadequate. I've had tenants that have

18

called up at night saying there is water coming into

19

their apartments. And after the first storm, they

20

showed me a video. Water was coming up even higher.

21

I was more concerned about whether or not to pick up

22

the phone in the morning.

23

A simple Google search on the amount of

24

stormwater per acre is 27,000 gallons per acre. And

25

1
2 the Gowanus rezoning is 200 acres. It comes out to
3 about five millions gallons of water per inch of
4 rainfall.

5 The overflow tanks as proposed under the old
6 rules and old wording is 12 million gallons in total,
7 which obviously is completely inadequate and will
8 lead to more flooding, more damages to the residents
9 of Gowanus. So, I propose that the vote is postponed
10 until the Council can comply with the EPA's
11 recommendations and criticisms of the current review.
12 And I feel that there is no damage in waiting on
13 this; however, it's greater damage to both the
14 residents and the property if this vote is rushed and
15 voted yes. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Chris.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Todd Fine will be the next
18 speaker followed by Tamara Staples. Todd Fine.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 TODD FINE: Yes, hello. Uhm, so in Brooklyn in
21 New York City and across the world, a lot of people
22 are mourning the destruction of Grand Prospect Hall.
23 Which is developed by a company called Gowanus Cubes
24 and it's clearly part of the speculation associated
25 with the Gowanus rezoning.

1
2 Typically, historically, when we do these major
3 rezoning's and we set out these massive waves of
4 speculation, we involve the Landmarks Preservation
5 Commission. We do surveys of this area. And we
6 didn't do it in that case. In fact, I never heard
7 anything from Landmarks the entire time. The DIS
8 didn't lead to any individual landmarks. Uhm, and as
9 a result, we are destroying an Opera Hall, a German
10 Opera Hall from 1892. Which is unparalleled in New
11 York, maybe even in the entire country in terms of an
12 immigrant opera hall.

13 We're going to have the same situation with the
14 SoHo/NoHo rezoning, which is even more incredulous.
15 I mean, it's just unbelievable that Landmarks
16 Preservation Commission hasn't been involved in the
17 public process at all in that. And I don't know
18 where the preservation issues on Gowanus start but it
19 would be so crazy for this City Council to do
20 anything related to SoHo or even Gowanus without any
21 LPC participation, without any new individual
22 landmarks, without any consideration at all.

23 And this is a huge oversight and the issue with
24 Grand Prospect Hall, which is being reported on in
25 Europe across the city, is going to be triple, 100

1
2 fold with the SoHo/NoHo rezoning. It is a reason
3 alone to delay this process. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Tamara
6 Staples followed by Joan Salome-Rodriguez. Tamara
7 Staples.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 TAMARA STAPLES: Hi. I am Tamara Staples. I
10 live in the Gowanus area and I also have a studio
11 here. I'm a full-time artist and my concern today is
12 about affordable space for artists. There was some
13 talk about a four year study with public engagement
14 but what I understand and what I've come to know is
15 that the final environmental impact study is
16 problematic because it doesn't leave room for artists
17 as full time employers, employees.

18 Like we are - and they stated, freelance artists
19 who lease studio space are not accounted for in the
20 estimates of directly displaced employment because
21 studio spaces are not their regular place of
22 business.

23 If I, I mean, I've moved around the city chasing
24 studio space and the prizes have gone up and I've
25 been chased out and I see what's happening on 4th

1 Avenue. It's coming down to my neighborhood and it's
2 only a matter of time until I'm displaced again. And
3 I'm a full-time artist and I can't sustain my income
4 without the studio.
5

6 And you know, it's like, the question is where do
7 we go from here. We keep getting pushed out and you
8 know more importantly, what is a community without
9 artists? It's a business center and there's no heart
10 and I just wanted to offer my opinion on that and I'm
11 sorry, I'm in an industrial space, so now I'm hearing
12 the upstairs neighbor. Which is fine it's like a
13 court space but as the walls get painted and you know
14 all these things happen, I can see that I'm going to
15 be displaced again and displaced again.

16 So, please keep us in mind as artists and
17 affordable space for artists. I've been working with
18 Arts Gowanus and they've been working with Brad
19 Lander and come see Open Studios this week. There
20 are 400 open studios and you'll see all the artists
21 here and the vibrant community that we have that's
22 through Gowanus network. So, would love to have you
23 come out and see what's happening.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

25 TAMARA STAPLES: Thank you.

1

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Tamara.

2

3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. The next and last speaker on this panel will be Joan Salome-Rodriguez.

4

5

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6

JOAN SALOME-RODRIGUEZ: Hi, can you hear me?

7

Hello?

8

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

9

JOAN SALOME-RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Hi, good

10

afternoon. My name is Joan Salome-Rodriguez and I

11

oppose the Gowanus rezoning unless the EPA's

12

Assemblywoman Simons and Congresswoman Nydia

13

Velazquez's demands of the Mayor to reevaluate the

14

flood risk and sewage issues that were evaluated

15

based on 2008 rainfall numbers is done. Those

16

demands are met.

17

My family has lived in this area since World War

18

I, both in Gowanus Houses and the Long Bond Street

19

that directly parallels the canal. I live on

20

President and Bond now. The city needs to do much

21

more now to ensure responsible development of this

22

area in the future, especially with record setting

23

storms now being the norm.

24

How can using rainfall numbers from 2008 before

25

Superstorm Sandy and before the recent storms Ida and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Henry that flooded homes, not just on the canal but blocks away and even killed one resident, assure us that this plan is safe. I'm well aware of the city's affordable housing crisis but building 8,500 units for up to 31,000 residents on a flood plain with insufficient infrastructure to bare the influx, is just more of the same bad ideas that led to damage Gowanus Houses and Red Hook Houses that has yet to be repaired since Hurricane Sandy.

The Council should be considering repurposing the empty office towers in Midtown for the needed housing. This proposed development is too dense and too high. During Sandy, I watched a house boat float over a 12 foot fence that was already at its base eight feet over the canal itself. The house boat landed on the dumpster in the lot on the other side of the fence. This plan does not adequately address 20 feet of rising flood waters. It does not address the lack of infrastructure to deal with sewage and population density.

I urge you to vote against the plan until the issues raised by our elected's and the EPA are addressed. Thank you.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Joan.

JOAN SALOME-RODRIGUEZ: You're welcome.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That was the last speaker on this panel Mr. Chair and I see no members with questions for the panel.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, seeing no questions, this panel is now excused. If you can please call up the next panel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next panel will include Jay Marcus, Lee Altman, Jesse Solomon, and Eric McClure. First speaker will be Jay Marcus followed by Lee Altman.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jay Marcus, if you can hear us, you need to accept the unmute request.

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: There you go Jay.

JAY MARCUS: Hi, thanks. Hi, my name is Jay Marcus and I am also with the development team for the Gowanus Green Project. I'm with the Committee and I'm available for questions for Council later on.

Also, I did want to just from what we heard; we did want to add a couple of points. One is that you know we are excited about the opportunity to clean up the site and that's why we added - we requested to be

1
2 added to the brown field remediation. And intend to
3 do so in a very open process consistent with the
4 Gowanus Justice Organizations request. We do support
5 the concept of a community oversight panel and we'll
6 very much look forward to working with them and
7 keeping all the information open regarding the clean
8 up of it.

9 The second thing I do want to make sure I address
10 because a lot of people addressed it and for us, as a
11 nonprofit social economic justice organization, it is
12 important. Is we do intend to work with our partners
13 to be active in terms of trying to meet local hiring
14 requirements. Section 3, you probably are familiar
15 with both many of you, with Locomotive Force
16 Innovation, our affiliate corporation that has placed
17 over 850 low income New Yorker's in jobs a year and
18 we look forward to really bringing that here on the
19 local hiring. I do want to mention also that we are
20 proud of our track record in at least the projects
21 we've developed. I know apartments are similar on
22 meeting MWBE subcontractor goals in our project.

23 So, we bring a lot of that dedication. And
24 again, I'll repeat what I said at the Community
25 Board, we really do want people like Voices of

1
2 Gowanus to hear that we are looking forward to
3 keeping them at the table if the project ends up
4 being rezoned and being part of who we listen to as
5 you move forward first on the environmental
6 remediation of this site.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 JAY MARCUS: And then on the development of the
9 affordable housing. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Jay. Thank you for
11 your testimony.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be Lee
13 Altman followed by Jesse Solomon.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 LEE ALTMAN: Good afternoon everyone. Chair and
16 for Committee Members, my name is Lee Altman, I am a
17 CB6 resident and have spent many years working along
18 the banks of the Gowanus as an Architecture and Urban
19 Design Professor as well as professionally at Escape,
20 landscape architecture.

21 Escape has been lucky enough to help support the
22 planning efforts led by the Gowanus Canal Conservancy
23 with the Gowanus Low Lance Plan. I'm speaking in
24 support of the proposed rezoning because it improves
25 critical infrastructure and public access to the

1
2 canal. I've been pleased to see how the waterfront
3 access plan has been responsive to the Gowanus Low
4 Lance Plan and it works with the unique conditions of
5 this narrow and land water body. Typical New York
6 City waterfront zoning is designed for wide rivers
7 like the Hudson and the proposed rezoning provides
8 more flexibility and incentives to design title
9 wetlands, active program areas, and community
10 amenities specific to the Narrow Gowanus.

11 As noted by Andrea Parker, this neighborhood
12 needs more open space, more ecological areas, more
13 positive contemplating space and more active
14 community gathering space. The details of WAP and
15 the overall rezoning enable this critical work. I
16 support the modifications to the WAP that build in
17 resilient higher elevations for the primary path and
18 would like to see even greater incentivization around
19 water access, as this is critical to the community,
20 particularly on public sites.

21 I request that the city address a collective
22 agency vision for publicly owned street ends. These
23 are critical interfaces between the canal, the street
24 network, private sites and public esplanades.
25 They're also a messy zone of overlapping agency

1
2 jurisdictions including DOT, FDNY and EP. These
3 conflicting needs create challenges to the creation
4 of public space along the Gowanus.

5 We don't want to miss this opportunity to improve
6 the canals resilience permeability and to reduce
7 urban heat island effect in this vulnerable
8 neighborhood. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Lee.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
11 Jesse Solomon followed by Eric McClure if we still
12 have him. Jesse Solomon.

13 BRADY MEIXELL: Hi, I'm speaking on behalf of my
14 fellow Jesse Solomon today who had to step away. I
15 am Brady Meixell and I a Development Specialist of
16 the Southwest Brooklyn Industrial Development
17 Corporation.

18 SBIDC is a local economic development corporation
19 whose mission is to provide advocacy and services to
20 help businesses in Southwest Brooklyn grow and create
21 employment opportunities for local residents. We
22 strongly urge City Council to only approve the
23 Gowanus rezoning ULURP actions should the priority
24 demands of the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for
25 Justice be met.

1
2 First, that there is upfront funding for full
3 capital needs at Wyckoff and Gowanus Houses. Second,
4 that there is net zero combined sewage overflow. And
5 third, that the city support and fund the Gowanus
6 Zoning Commitment Taskforce.

7 Additionally, this rezoning needs to address the
8 local skills gap with targeted multiyear workforce
9 investment and by following through on the city's
10 commitment to the neighborhood and neighboring
11 industrial business zone. There is a critical need
12 for targeted workforce development, adult education
13 and local hiring investments to ensure that
14 individuals with barriers to employment benefit from
15 increased locally economic activity and investment.

16 Moreover, local businesses in Gowanus have hiring
17 needs and have expressed to skills gap. Failing the
18 skills gap require city funding across a ten year
19 period for three programmatic areas. Bridge
20 programming for CB6 residents with barriers to
21 employment and with a focus on public housing
22 residents. Business training programs for local
23 BIPOC businesses and entrepreneurs and funding for an
24 industrial job training program for LMI Youth to help

1
2 them take advantage of the rich careers available in
3 the industrial sector in Gowanus.

4 We also believe it is critical for the city to
5 follow through on its commitment to the industrial
6 business zones and provide the infrastructure
7 investments necessary to allow the neighboring
8 Gowanus IBC to thrive and grow. This should include
9 a commitment of \$5 million dollars to bring high
10 speed broadband access to the Gowanus IBZ investing
11 in an open access fiber conduit system in the IBZ
12 vision study area. As well as a DOT mobility study
13 of the area, looking at providing more flexibility
14 around loading requirements and developing loading
15 and unloading zones on each block of the IBZ.

16 We urge the Subcommittee to ensure the rezoning
17 is paired with the paired with the proper
18 reinvestments into the community, fully meeting the
19 capital needs for local public housing, net zero CSO
20 and the Gowanus Zoning Commitment Taskforce. Thank
21 you.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.
24
25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
3 speaker on this panel and I see no members with
4 questions for the panel.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uh, this panel is now
6 excused. Counsel, if you can please call up the next
7 panel.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
9 Sasha Chavchavadze, Joseph Alexiou, Cassey
10 Dillenburger, and Sue Wolfe Sasha will be the first
11 speaker followed by Joseph Alexiou, then Cassey
12 Dillenburger.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 JOSEPH ALEXIOU: Hello, my name is Joseph Alexiou
15 and I am a Journalist and a New York City Tour Guide
16 and an Author of The Definitive History of the
17 Gowanus Canal, which is called Gowanus Brooklyn's
18 Curious Canal. In my book it falls the detail the
19 development of Gowanus in Brooklyn from farmland to
20 city and particularly the connections between
21 developer millions and governmental regulators and
22 the use of public assets.

23 And one thing I found that over 150 years under
24 multiple generations of city government, this
25 repeated mistake of the city was to ignore the advise

1
2 of scientists and engineers over that of the public
3 money or private money that is available to develop.

4 And so, this hubris, particularly the part where
5 we ignore the power of nature to destroy or harm us
6 in our homes and to refuse to promote public interest
7 over private ones, is something that I saw happening
8 again and again. And that's how we ended up with a
9 polluted terrible atmosphere that we have in this
10 neighborhood today.

11 In August, the city voted down the Brooklyn
12 Botanic Garden development over here in Crown Heights
13 in Brooklyn. And I want to say thank you and this is
14 a great thing that you guys did. And the reason that
15 it was done, that was given by the City Council, was
16 that it was out of scale and inappropriate for the
17 location.

18 So, given that and there are many issues in the
19 development plan, in the city you know rezoning plan
20 which are valid and worth discussion. It all comes
21 down the crucks of the public police site. Which has
22 been rebranded as one person previously said, as
23 Gowanus Green. And this is something that Brad
24 Lander might call a failure of public process. If he
25 were to examine exactly what was going on here and

1
2 what's happening here is that we have this large
3 scale development on a publicly owned site, which was
4 gifted for community use and it was a site of intense
5 pollution, which we cannot ever totally remove. We
6 can remediate it. We can take care of some of it but
7 that doesn't take away the fact that under the ground
8 there are plumes of manufactured gas and gas coal tar
9 that make this place -

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 JOSEPH ALEXIOU: A toxic environment and an
12 unhealthy environment for people to live. And yet
13 still, we want to build apparently thousands of units
14 of 30 story buildings on a site, which we know to be
15 in a flood zone. So, let's say this again. A toxic
16 waste site -

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Your time is up.
18 Thank you, we really appreciate it. Thank you for
19 your testimony today.

20 JOSEPH ALEXIOU: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Sasha
22 Chavchavadze followed by Casey Dillenburger.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 SASHA CHAVCHAVADZE: Hello, my name is Sasha
25 Chavchavadze and I'm a long time Member of the

1
2 Gowanus Artist Community. I have maintained a studio
3 at 543 Union Street for 30 years and spearheaded many
4 community arts projects.

5 I am against the Gowanus rezoning as it stands
6 for the following reasons: I support the demands of
7 the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice, which
8 have not adequately been met. Particularly in regard
9 to CSO remediation and support of the NYCHA
10 community.

11 As a member of the Arts Gowanus Artist Advisory
12 Group, I demand that the community benefits agreement
13 be negotiated to ensure that the Gowanus artist
14 community will survive and be finalized. I applaud
15 Brad Lander for his support of this initiative and
16 urge all parties to step up to the table immediately
17 to make this happen.

18 Speaking for myself as one of 20 artist owners of
19 543 Union Street, a 1900 box factory that has been an
20 important arts building since the 1970's, I
21 respectfully ask that the MIH Law, which has been
22 inexplicably applied to our building be taken off and
23 placed where it belongs, on incoming developers.

24 This would give our 20 older artist owners the option
25

1
2 to live, work in the building we have struggled so
3 long to maintain.

4 As Founder of Produce Gowanus, a nonprofit
5 gallery that was a cultural hub at 543 Union for ten
6 years, I challenge incoming developers who seem
7 poised to erase the culture, history and light of
8 Gowanus. To proactively support the many grassroots
9 cultural initiatives existing in our community, such
10 as the Hall of Gowanus. A community currected archive
11 of Gowanus artifacts that currently has no permanent
12 homes. Thank you so much for your time.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next speaker will be Casey
14 Dillenburger followed by Sue Wolfe.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 CASEY DILLENBURGER: My name is Casey
17 Dillenburger, I am the Manager of 413 Bond Street
18 LLC. We own two properties in the rezoning area, 98
19 4th Street located along Bond Street in the canal and
20 413 Bond Street in the regular L-shaped lot between
21 3rd Street and 4th Street with frontage on the canal.

22 As property owners, we have been intentional
23 about providing spaces for the locally owned creative
24 businesses and industries that have become synonymous
25 with the Gowanus neighborhood. 98 4th Street is

1
2 currently home to 67 small business with over 300
3 workers. 413 Bond Street has approved plans for a
4 similar but larger development that contains these
5 very same uses, which we anticipate will result in
6 450 to 500 additional local jobs.

7 We're opposed to two specific components of the
8 Gowanus rezoning that undermine our ability to
9 develop such uses on our site at 413 Bond Street.
10 Including one, the proposed visual corridor and
11 supplemental public access area that required
12 midblock between Bond Street and the canal and the
13 proposed waterfront yard and shore public walkway
14 requirements.

15 The proposed visual corridor requires an
16 unobstructed area at least 50 feet wide, extending
17 along the eastern boundary of our property and the
18 proposed waterfront yard requires an unobstructed
19 area of at least 30 feet along the properties
20 shoreline.

21 City Planning has stated that each waterfront
22 parcel will be required to provide only 15 to 20
23 percent of its lot area for public access. But this
24 percentage does not include any required visual
25 corridor. Our analysis of the zoning text adjust

1
2 that together, these regulations would reduce our
3 usable lot area by as much as 40 percent. This would
4 make the redevelopment of 413 Bond Street infeasible,
5 even with the proposed MI4 Zoning designation.

6 A result that would be inconsistent with the
7 city's stated objective to support existing clusters
8 of economic activity and promote development of new
9 job generating uses. If the city believes that the
10 visual corridor is necessary on our block, we
11 respectfully request that it is instead located on
12 the adjacent site that is proposed to be rezoned for
13 residential development and has a more regular
14 footprint and would therefore, not be a severely
15 burden.

16 Even having to accommodate -

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

18 CASEY DILLENBURGER: A portion of the visual
19 corridor or up line connection on our site, would
20 significantly restrict our intended nonresidential
21 development. Thank you for the opportunity to
22 testify today.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next and last speaker on
25 this panel will be Sue Wolfe.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

SUE WOLFE: I'm Sue Wolfe. Can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

SUE WOLFE: I'm Sue Wolfe, President of the Friends of Thomas Green Park and a member of the Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice.

Our coalition will not support the rezoning unless our top three demands are met. Full capital funding for local NYCHA developments, zero CSO and a creation of a taskforce, which has been mentioned.

In addition, I wanted to speak about our concerns about Thomas Green Park, located in Gowanus between Nevins and 3rd and Douglas and Degraw Streets. The DDD pool in this park will be dug up by National Grid to remove the storage tanks, [INAUDIBLE 5:46:36] it and replaced by a new park.

During this period, National Grid, the Parks Department and Councilman Stephen Levin have "guaranteed that a temporary pool will be developed." So, there is no time our neighborhood will be without a pool and the programs that go with it. There will be a new and needed park developed across Nevins Street extending to the Gowanus Canal walkway. We request that Nevins Street between Douglas and

1
2 Degraw, be de-mapped so there will be one continuous
3 park from 3rd Avenue to the Gowanus Canal walkway.

4 We have two additional concerns. The EPA's
5 impact noted that this rezoning in its current form
6 does not protect human health. This must be
7 addressed. As noted by Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez
8 and Assemblywoman Jo Ann Simon, the underground
9 cleanup under Gowanus Green development is not
10 adequately, especially for a public school,
11 residential homes and a public park which will be
12 adversely effected by this contaminated area. Thank
13 you very much.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Sue. Thank you for
15 your testimony today.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
17 speaker on this panel and I see no members with
18 questions for the panel.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. This panel is now
20 excused and if you can please call up the next panel.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
22 Debbie Stoller, Lorna Novi, Renee Monroe, and Andrew
23 Cichon. Debbie Stoller will speak first followed by
24 Lorna Novi.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

1
2 DEBBIE STOLLER: Hi, my name is Debbie Stoller
3 and I live here in Gowanus. First, I did the math
4 for Chairman Moya that Jonathan Keller refused to do.
5 And I wanted to tell you guys that the 100 percent
6 affordable development that they spent so much time
7 talking to you about represents less than three
8 percent of this entire massive rezone. 97 percent of
9 which is going to be public development and of that
10 75 to 80 percent of the units created are going to be
11 high end luxury apartments.

12 And even at MIH Level One, 40 percent of New
13 Yorker's won't even qualify to apply for the vast
14 majority of those units. But I'm not really here to
15 talk about that. I'm here to talk about my
16 neighborhood in Gowanus. Now, I don't know if you've
17 ever been here but the Gowanus sits in between Park
18 Slope, which is a slope and Gobble Hill and Gorham
19 Hill, which are hills. And whenever it rains, all
20 the rain from those communities comes down into our
21 low neighborhood of Gowanus. And currently, our
22 sewers aren't able to handle all that much rain. And
23 so, whenever it rains, we start pumping raw sewage
24 into the Gowanus Canal. That's gross but it's not as
25 terrible as what's been happening since climate

1
2 change. With Henry and Ida, so much rainfall in such
3 a short period of time that raw sewage started
4 backing up into people's homes which had never
5 happened before. The streets to be rezoned were
6 under a feet of water creating hazardous and
7 dangerous conditions and one of our neighbors,
8 Michael Robinson, actually died in eastbound floating
9 in the Gowanus Canal the next day.

10 Look, we've heard a lot about green grooves and
11 bioswales and things that are supposed to handle all
12 the additional water and sewage created through this
13 rezone, but we have no idea if that's going to work.
14 And you have no idea if that's going to work. That's
15 because the EIS that the city used rainfall data from
16 2008. Now, the EPA has criticized them for that. Jo
17 Anne Velazquez and Simon have begged the city to go
18 back and redo the EIS with accurate data.

19 Listen Council Member, this is your first chance
20 to show that you are not just paying lip service to
21 climate change. Don't vote on this. Demand that the
22 city gives you accurate EIS data so that you can make
23 a determination about whether -

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 DEBBIE STOLLER: Is going to be safe or whether
3 it's going to create an environmental catastrophe in
4 my neighborhood. Thank you so much.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Debbie. Thank you
6 for your testimony today.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay next, we will hear from
8 Lorna Novi or Novi.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Lorna, if you can hear me and
11 if you see an accept an unmute request, we need you
12 to accept the unmute request in order to begin
13 speaking.

14 Okay, we're going to go - we'll come back to
15 Lorna. Try Renee Monroe next. Renee Monroe.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 RENEE MONROSE: Hi, thank you for letting me
18 speak today. My name is Renee Monroe, I'm a Member
19 of Broadway Residents Coalition in SoHo.

20 BRC is a member of the Citywide People's Land Use
21 Alliance and we stand in solidarity with Voice of
22 Gowanus whose in that organization and other groups
23 fighting up-zoning, rezoning's and all the all
24 assaults on historic districts across the city. Such
25 as the Seaport Coalition, Saving SoHo/NoHo in

1
2 Chinatown and we object to all the up-zonings across
3 the city that are being rushed through during this
4 pandemic.

5 We support real affordable housing and we reject
6 this notion of trickle down housings of policy for
7 achieving that. We support the artists and artist
8 community of Gowanus. The city is also coming for
9 the SoHo/NoHo artist community and live workspaces
10 there as well.

11 When I heard Brad Vogel speak, his words rang
12 like an echo chamber. We in SoHo have been saying
13 the same things almost word for word. Our up-zoning
14 too is a massive rezoning in a flood zone, which has
15 always been a flood zone. Canal Street has that name
16 for a reason. When it is proposed, affordable
17 housings in the SoHo up-zoning is set in the lowest
18 spot in Manhattan. You can imagine what happened
19 during Hurricane Ida.

20 As in Gowanus, affordable housing component is a
21 trojan horse for luxury housing and commercial
22 development. And the SoHo/NoHo's Chinatown final
23 EIS, like the one in Gowanus is deeply flawed. The
24 data is out of date and it complete ignores the
25 comprehensive impact, the up-zoning will have on our

1
2 already dense neighborhood and local burdened
3 infrastructures. The racial issues that board out of
4 the Mayor's PR office are a misdirection away from
5 the real issue, which is land use and a deregulation
6 and destabilization of the housing market.

7 Imagine our case, the city is the one who erased
8 the Chinatown in Asia community and the entire
9 process from day. The city is denying the hundreds
10 of vulnerable rent stabilized tenants who we displace

11 -

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You can wrap it up. It's
13 okay.

14 RENEE MONROSE: Alright, the city is denying the
15 hundreds of rent stabilized tenants will be slashed
16 particularly in Chinatown. Hurricane Ida showed how
17 vulnerable the city is to flooding. This needs to be
18 properly addressed before any rezoning is approved.

19 BRC opposes the Gowanus up-zoning and asks the
20 Subcommittee to vote no on the rezoning. Thank you
21 for letting me speak.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you Renee.
23 Thank you for your testimony.

24

25

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
3 Andrew Cichon and then we will try once again to hear
4 from Lorna Novi. Next will be Andrew Chichon.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 ANDREW CHICHON: Greetings from my basement. Uh,
7 yeah, it's not pretty. It doesn't smell so good down
8 here. Uhm, it was interesting watching my drain
9 become a fountain of urine and excrement in my
10 basement during Ida. It's ugly.

11 Sadly, I can't find people to come rip off my
12 sheetrock and replace the insulation that's acting
13 like a wick and drawing that smell up into the rest
14 of the house because they are all fixing uh, I guess
15 other people's basements and ground floors.

16 So, even suggesting doing anything before we fix
17 this CSO issue is ridiculous. I've been a 19-year
18 resident of Nelsen Street and this is just a farce.
19 You know, I totally support Congresswoman Nydia
20 Velazquez and Assembly Member Jo Anne Simon. They
21 told you know Mayor de Blasio last September that
22 they find serious problems with the city's
23 neighborhood rezoning.

24 You know, we've had Sandy, we've had Henry, we've
25 had Ida. That's all in nine years. Two of those

1
2 have been a matter of eight days. Uhm, there's just
3 no way this can go forward. This is irresponsible
4 and this will be a horrible legacy for the City
5 Council to live with going forward. I implore you to
6 say no to this rezoning. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Andrew, thank you
8 for your testimony today.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, it appears we have
10 lost Lorna Novi, so that was the last speaker on this
11 panel and I see no members with questions for this
12 panel.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. The panel is now
14 excused and if we can call up the next panel.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will include
16 Victoria Cambranes, Seth Hillinger and George Fiala.
17 Victoria Cambranes then Seth Hillinger.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 VICTORIA CAMBRANES: Hello everyone. Can you
20 hear me?

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

22 VICTORIA CAMBRANES: Perfect. Uhm, my name is
23 Victoria Cambranes, I live in Greenpoint. My family
24 were victims of the 2005 Greenpoint rezoning. They
25 were displaced. Uhm, and I was also one of eight

1 candidates who ran for Steve Levin's seat in the
2 Council this past June.

3
4 Now, although all of us candidates differ greatly
5 in our opinions, one place where we unanimously and
6 wholeheartedly agreed on was the opposition to the
7 Gowanus rezoning. Now whether that opposition was
8 due to lip service or principle matters little now.
9 What does matter is that during an election year,
10 politicians know that they have to speak to the
11 public interest. And that public said a resounding
12 no. What does that tell you about Brad Lander and
13 Steve Levin's decision on the table right now? It
14 means that they do not have to speak to the public
15 interest, which is in opposition to this rezoning.

16 Now, all eight candidates also promise to uphold
17 the three demands of the GNCJ. These demands, which
18 to this date have not become part of the rezoning
19 proposal. The fact that Levin and Lander refused to
20 even pay lip service to these demands, shows that
21 they're not even willing to write a promise on a paper
22 napkin which they can wipe their butts with
23 afterwards. That's how little they care about their
24 Black and Brown neighbors in public housing. That's
25 who little they care about the undocumented workers

1
2 who will fall to their death because they are using
3 nonunion labor on most of these worksites. That's
4 how little they care about the property owners who
5 currently in Greenpoint are filing a class action
6 lawsuit against the city for the damage that is being
7 done. All of us had to take water out of our
8 basements during Ida. All of us are now gathering
9 and saying that the rezoning proposal that was done
10 here, was an unmitigated disaster. And the same
11 thing is going to be proposed in Gowanus.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

13 VICTORIA CAMBRANES: That is absolutely
14 unacceptable and it's time that the city smartens up
15 and realizes that this city cannot handle these kinds
16 of rezoning's anymore. Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be Seth
18 Hillinger followed by George Fiala.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 SETH HILLINGER: Hi, my name is Seth Hillinger.
21 I am a Resident of Carroll Gardens, raising two
22 children here and I have been a resident of New York
23 since 1999. I have seen a lot in this neighborhood
24 and I am opposed to the rezoning and am demanding a
25 redo of the EIS.

1
2 As a parent raising two children, I am thinking
3 about them and their children and their children's
4 children. I'll be the first to tell you that yes,
5 this neighborhood is fairly White and that needs to
6 change.

7 But what a load of crap to think that this
8 neighborhood is somehow more rich and exclusive than
9 any other part of Brooklyn. Where the average median
10 home price in all of Brooklyn is \$975,000. He is
11 pulling wool over your eyes when he says things like
12 that. And the solution is not build affordable homes
13 on top of a toxic waste site. This is just
14 perpetuating the issues that poor people see across
15 this country, putting them in danger. How do we
16 ensure that 50 years from now, the Gowanus doesn't
17 end up like Flint Michigan? Where people still don't
18 have clean drinking water. Or worse, people develop
19 cancer related to living on top of a toxic site.

20 Who will they hold accountable? This rezoning
21 was rushed without the necessary time to study the
22 land and let it heal and recover from the effects of
23 the oil and gas industries. It is a test to our
24 commitment to fixing the environmental damage we have
25 inflicted on this earth.

1 And our politicians are choosing greed over good.
2
3 The Gowanus Green, in my opinion, should become an
4 urban forest and a historical site. It is the place
5 where Washington evaded the British. It is the place
6 where the industrial revolution centered on change.
7 And from my tech background, it is even the place
8 where the future –

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

10 SETH HILLINGER: Of things like EDFT's(SP?) are
11 being created. Cryptopunks were invented there but
12 most people don't know that.

13 If you need more space for housing, there are
14 more creative solutions in this city. Post-COVID
15 office spaces will remain vacant in Manhattan –

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Seth, if you can wrap it up.

17 SETH HILLINGER: We can reoccupy them. Thank
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
20 testimony today.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next and last speaker on
22 this panel will be George Fiala.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 GEORGE FIALA: Yes, hello, I'm George Fiala, I
25 Publish a Newspaper the Red Hook Star-Review in the

1
2 joining Red Hook neighborhood. We share part of the
3 Gowanus Canal. In any case, I don't have that much
4 to say except that I was at the first bridging
5 Gowanus meeting and my impression of that meeting was
6 that Councilman Lander was presenting a plan that he
7 already believed in. That the city already believed
8 in and he was presenting it to the community, never
9 asking anyone in the community, any resident or the
10 bulk of residents, what they actually wanted.

11 No one - I'm not sure that anyone ever took a
12 poll of people who live in the community, whether
13 this was what they wanted. The fact is it's what the
14 city wants because the city depends on real estate
15 taxes. It's what real estate developers want who
16 started a specular frenzy before the super fund was
17 begun and it's continued through today.

18 In fact, I believe last week or two weeks ago,
19 there is already you know an application to build an
20 eight story building on Union Street where the
21 rezoning will happen. Everybody knows the rezoning
22 is going to happen but nobody knows why except for
23 the fact that it's just figure that real estate
24 always wins, as Joseph Felexio(SP?) once said at a
25 forum that I saw him in.

1
2 In any case, I'm just saying that it's a done
3 deal and it's a deal that's based upon money and real
4 estate and political careers and it's just a little
5 bit unfortunate to see. And you know what? I'm
6 going to say - I'm going to end by saying, we had a
7 local issue here in Red Hook just last week and the
8 Chairperson of the Board of Standards Appeals
9 rejected an idea to build a 15-story building here in
10 Red Hook. And when she was asked to come see Red
11 Hook -

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

13 GEORGE FIALA: To see for herself how great it
14 would be, she said, I'm a regular Red Hook, so I
15 really know this area. This is where I play. I play
16 because it has so much that's not residential to
17 offer. It has so much that's pretty to offer and
18 there's hardly any place left in New York that has
19 that grid. And Gowanus will be one less place after
20 this. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you George. Thank you
22 for your testimony today.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
24 speaker on this panel and I see no members with
25 questions for this panel.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 309
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uhm, do we have any
3 questions for this panel?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I see no members.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Nope, okay. Thank you so
6 much. This panel is now excused. Are there are any
7 other members of the public who wish to testify?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we have an upcoming
9 panel, which will consist of Bora Lee and Robert
10 Maloney. Bora Lee will testify first and then Robert
11 Maloney.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: So, Bora Lee, if you can hear
14 me, we just need you to accept the unmute request.
15 Thank you.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 BORA LEE: Can you hear me?

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you.

19 BORA LEE: Okay, hi, my name is Bora Lee, I'm the
20 Chief of Staff at Fifth Avenue Committee. A
21 nonprofit comprehensive community development
22 corporation. Whose mission is to advance economic
23 social and racial justice.

24 I'm in support of the Gowanus scene and the
25 overall rezoning, as it helps families with further

1
2 housing. I also support the MTG's demands and
3 priorities including upfront capital funding for
4 local NYCHA communities and ensuring local
5 accountability related to the commitments of the
6 rezoning.

7 I want to advocate that the city invest in local
8 workforce development, adult education, bridge
9 programming and expand the SYEP for local law and
10 moderate income residents. The economic inequalities
11 in CB6 six track along racial lines and the city
12 needs to make significant multiyear funding
13 commitments in efforts like [INAUDIBLE 6:05:53]
14 coming together integrate a workforce development
15 program, supporting residents of Gowanus and Red
16 Hook.

17 People forget the history of CB6, which is
18 predominantly people of color. Today Gowanus and the
19 grounding needs are very different. CB6 is over 60
20 percent White while the city is just 32 percent
21 White. [INAUDIBLE 6:06:13] partner of Gowanus Green
22 would proceed 950 units of affordable housing and
23 leave public parks and leave public school a
24 remediated brown field site.

1
2 Opponents had indicated that the land isn't safe.
3 But manufactured gas prices have been successfully
4 remediated in the past. This is not something that's
5 new. We need affordable housing. If not there then
6 when? It's been around in the community for 43 years
7 and we will not build if it was safe or healthy.
8 It's just a matter of fact. I grew up in Park Slope.
9 It's a block from Gowanus and my immigrant parents
10 had their small businesses here and had the
11 opportunity to thrive in the community. But
12 opportunities is what New York City is known for are
13 not available in CD6 anymore. For low and moderate
14 income people, especially people of color without the
15 rezoning. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Bora. Thank you for
17 your testimony today.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will hear from
19 Robert Maloney.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Robert Maloney, if you can
22 hear us, we just need you to accept the unmute
23 request in order to begin testimony.
24
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 312
2 Robert Maloney, if you can hear me, we just need
3 you to unmute to accept the unmute request, otherwise
4 unmute your device in order to begin your testimony.

5 Okay, we seem to have some technical difficulties
6 with Robert Maloney. Next, we will hear from the
7 Representative Nydia Velazquez or someone on her
8 behalf.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Great thank you Council Members
11 Brad Lander, Council Member Moya I was hoping to the
12 Congresswoman would be able to join. She is just
13 landing in DC. She is working to pass the President
14 Biden's Build Back Better Act, which would dedicate
15 resources needed to lead the charge on climate
16 resilient infrastructure and social needs.

17 So, I have a statement for Congresswoman Nydia
18 Velasquez. I support the goals of creating an
19 integrated neighborhood with affordable housing but
20 it is vitally important that it is truly affordable,
21 safe and we do it right.

22 I have concerns of the neighborhood rezoning and
23 the Environmental Impact Statement as prepared by the
24 city, it's flawed with inconsistencies and
25 contradictions and most importantly, it does not

1
2 probably take into consideration the impacts of
3 climate change on the Gowanus community and on the
4 ongoing cleanup of the Gowanus Canal, which as we
5 know is an EPA super fund site.

6 In a letter with Assemblywoman Jo Anne Simon, I
7 asked the city to revisit the draft of the
8 Environmental Impact Statement for the Gowanus
9 rezoning, highlighting EPA's comments on a DEIS
10 related to the cleanup. Which DEPA sent to the
11 Director of City Planning on August 8th. EPA has yet
12 to see direct responses to its comments and
13 questions, which are not adequately addressed in
14 FEIS.

15 I want formal responses to concerns raised. Now,
16 as we've heard the EPA Record of Decision issued in
17 2013 requires that any future development under the
18 city's purview, not compromise the cleanup remedy.
19 Specifically stating that redevelopment projects must
20 prevent additional sewer load. High density
21 residential development can put more pressure on old
22 sewers, risking overflowing and contamination.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Uh, can I continue?
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You got to wrap it up really
3 quickly.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Okay. So, while the unified
5 stormwater rule is a good step for new development,
6 we must make sure that sanitary flows, black water,
7 are also taken into account. In order to ensure that
8 the rezoning does not increase combined sewer
9 overflows, the canal and surrounding area, uhm, the
10 city must comprehensively study the sewer system
11 drainage hydrology and implement tools to guarantee
12 that new development does not add to the problem.

13 Uh, as we've heard old data is used, old rainfall
14 data. If you undercount 50 percent, you're projects
15 will not hold water. So, uh, the City Council uh,
16 the city is out of compliance with EPA's latest
17 orders on CSO controls. Yet the city assumes in the
18 EIS that those measures are a done deal.

19 So, the Congresswoman outlines this in a letter
20 and she wanted to emphasize that the City Council has
21 the ability to compel its agencies to comply with EPA
22 orders. The city needs to adequately account for the
23 fact that Gowanus is a flood zone and take into
24 account its infrastructure and the City Council as
25 the condition of the rezoning, can require that the -

1

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I got to -

2

UNIDENTIFIED: That the agency fully comply with
EPA's orders.

3

4

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I got to - I'm sorry that I
got to cut it off but you know you're submitting the
testimony. Thank you very much for your testimony
today and we thank the Congresswoman's testimony as
well. Counsel, if we can go to the next panelist.

5

6

7

8

9

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker will be
Victoria Hillstom who will be followed by Zeke Luger.
Victoria Hillstom next.

10

11

12

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13

VICTORIA HILLSTOM: Hello. Hello.

14

CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi.

15

VICTORIA HILLSTOM: Thank you, this is Victoria
Hillstom. Thank you very much for having me. I
would first like to support everyone in Gowanus.
They have first said very clearly that the community
was not able to properly participate with a rezoning
during the pandemic.

16

17

18

19

20

21

Our Council Members and the Mayor are termed out
and no one feels that any of these massive rezoning's
should be going through. There have not been proper
environmental impact studies. There have not been

22

23

24

25

1
2 proper displacement studies. There are many, many
3 problems with this rezoning and I hope that I speak
4 for all of New York that this is very reckless of the
5 City Council to even consider a massive rezoning
6 during a pandemic. This should not be our priority.

7 It is reckless to assume that all of these
8 agencies were working from home. We were not part of
9 the Paris Agreement. We are not even complying with
10 the standards for construction that major city's in
11 the world have implemented.

12 So, I would just like to say to City Council,
13 whether it be the up-zoning in the seaport, the
14 rezoning in SoHo, and or Gowanus, it is extremely
15 improper that you are pushing these things through in
16 the dying days of this administration. And we will
17 not forget it. You can kiss your careers goodbye.
18 It is reckless. Stephen Levin, I am very
19 disappointed that this has continued as with Mr.
20 Lander. And I think that it is time to listen to New
21 York City residents. We don't believe MIH is even -

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

23 VICTORIA HILLSTOM: A good plan. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Victoria. Thank you
25 for your testimony today.

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we'll hear from Zeke
3 Luger.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 ZEKE LUGER: Can you hear me?

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes, we can.

7 ZEKE LUGER: Thanks. So, hi, my name is Zeke
8 Luger, I'm a Queens Resident and a Statistics major
9 at Queens College. I learned about New York City's
10 land use issues during the Flushing rezoning. I
11 since then have been active on land use issues around
12 the city.

13 People keep referencing the Gowanus Racial Impact
14 Study by Lance Freeman of Columbia University. The
15 study is meant to preview future studies to be
16 required under the Racial Impact Study Bill. The
17 Gowanus Report is used by supporters of the Gowanus
18 Neighborhood Plan, it's a talking point to say this
19 rezoning will bring integration into the city to the
20 tone for DCP's offering since previous neighborhood
21 rezoning's.

22 DCP's rezoning's have been known to incentivize
23 landlords to harass and evict their rent regulated
24 tenants in the rush to rebooming the luxury market.
25 These evictions displaced long time working class

1
2 communities and deplete New York City's precious
3 supply of affordable housing.

4 The bill requires that racial impact studies will
5 calculate a "displacement risk" and that's largely
6 reflecting the number of rent stabilized units in
7 this study area. Activists demanded this provision
8 to ensure these residents futures are accounted for
9 in any large scale changes to zoning laws.

10 Have any of you read this study? Uhm, did you
11 read on page 5 how Mr. Freeman dismisses even the
12 possibility of residential displacement? Freeman
13 concludes on page 34 that the risk of displacement
14 for Black and Latino families in the area is low
15 since the vast majority of low-income families reside
16 in regulated affordable housing. Describing rent
17 regulated households as protected, especially since
18 rent laws were strengthened in 2019.

19 I've been in Flushing a lot lately where
20 residents have showed me the rent stabilized
21 buildings are still facing MCI upgrades to raise the
22 rent and are still seeing the rent stabilized
23 buildings demolished. Calling these vulnerable
24 residents protected is such an insult to everyone
25 whose ever been priced out of a home, fought the city

1
2 to acknowledge that this happens and official
3 government documents.

4 And it contradicts the purpose of the Racial
5 Impact Study Bill. We know the study is nonsense for
6 any number of reasons and actively attacks the
7 experience of New Yorkers.

8 DCP enacts the Council's Racial Impact Study
9 Bill. With this degree of disrespect for New York's
10 long time vulnerable residents, you'll make sure that
11 everyone knows what you are doing. This rezoning
12 will displace residents -

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

14 ZEKE LUGER: Placed in this rezoning. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you for your
16 testimony today.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the last
18 speaker on this panel and I am not seeing any members
19 with questions for this panel.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, uh, seeing that there is
21 no questions for this panel, the panel is now
22 excused. If you could please call up the next panel.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any members of
24 the public who wish to testify on the Gowanus
25 Neighborhood Plan Mercy Home UDAP or Gowanus Canal

1 CSO facilities at Douglas Street or Owl's Head
2 Actions, please press the raise hand button now. The
3 meeting will briefly stand at ease while we check for
4 any members of the public who may have registered.
5

6 I'll take this moment to remind the viewing
7 public that testimony may be submitted to the Council
8 at landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Testimony to
9 the Land Use Council on any of the items heard today
10 can be sent by email to
11 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

12 And with that Chair, I see no other members of
13 the public who wish to testify on these items.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, thank you very much.
15 Let me just turn it over to Council Member Lander for
16 some brief closing remarks.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you so much Chair
18 Moya. First, I just want to thank you for sticking
19 here and listening to all of my constituents and
20 Council Member Levin's constituents and folks that
21 are residents of the city. It is no secret that Land
22 Use and planning and real estate development and
23 affordable housing and climate infrastructure matters
24 are a passionate interest to people in our city. And
25 I really thought it was valuable to sit here and

1
2 listen to everyone. There are very strong and
3 different points of view on this rezoning as on all
4 rezoning's.

5 I think some things do ring clear together
6 though. Everyone wants to make sure we get real
7 investments in the Gowanus Houses and Wyckoff Gardens
8 and make sure our neighbors in public housing have
9 the decent conditions that they deserve. Everyone
10 wants investment in stormwater infrastructure and
11 making sure that we continue to clean the Gowanus
12 Canal in ways that are consistent with the super fund
13 cleanup. And that also address issues of flooding
14 and everyone wants to make sure that commitments made
15 are commitments kept. I appreciate that there are a
16 set of people that don't believe that the Gowanus
17 rezoning is the way to do that.

18 I would say to people, we know what the status
19 quo looks like. If this rezoning is rejected, we
20 will not get 3,000 units of genuinely affordable
21 housing. We won't get significant investments in
22 public housing. I think we'll miss the opportunity
23 to make some new and significant stormwater
24 investments alongside the super fund, which would
25 continue on its own.

1
2 And we just really have to grapple with that. I
3 want to push back a little on something my friend
4 George Fiala said. Because this plan has changed
5 substantially as a result of the input of residents
6 over the last eight years or so when we started.
7 Gowanus Green was 75 percent affordable, not 100
8 percent affordable and not anywhere near as deeply
9 affordable.

10 The plan was much less mixed use. The midblock's
11 were going to be rezoned and there was no Gowanus mix
12 zone. That came from community pressure. There were
13 no tools for new schools or transit improvements.
14 Unlike one piece of testimony, Landmarks Preservation
15 Commission did work with us, it just already got done
16 a couple of years ago because this process is taking
17 a while. We landmarked some of the best historic
18 buildings in the area, the Powerhouse, the Old
19 American Can Factory and several more. And we have
20 some of the most aggressive sustainability
21 requirements in development in the United States
22 previously. The strongest stormwater rule in the
23 country. Requirements for rooftop wind, greener
24 solar, a resilient shore walkway. All aligned with
25 super fund remediation.

1
2 We have more to do and we heard it today. So, I
3 appreciate Chair that you're going to work together
4 and I heard Chair Salamanca with me and Council
5 Member Levin to win what is necessary for our
6 neighbors to live in public housing. To win
7 additional commitments on stormwater and CSO's, to
8 guarantee real oversight. And there's a bunch of
9 other details as well. This stuff is hard. I don't
10 really want to glad game it or like sugarcoat it,
11 there are people who really have strong
12 disagreements. I do feel proud of this community and
13 this Council for wrestling with these issues in a
14 really thoughtful, really passionate, really dig down
15 deep into the weeds way. That is what people expect
16 of us. That we maximize the public interest as much
17 as we possibly can, given the realities and
18 opportunities that are in front of us.

19 So, I thank you for your patience. I thank
20 everybody who came out to testify and I look forward
21 to working with you and with the community in the
22 coming weeks. Uhm, as we negotiate with the
23 administration in advance of the Subcommittee, the
24 Committee and ultimately the Council's vote on the
25 Gowanus rezoning. Thank you so much.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you Council Member
3 Lander. Uhm, okay, there being no other members of
4 the public who wish to testify on LU Numbers 869
5 through 874 and 888 and LU Numbers 884 through 887,
6 the public hearing is now closed and the items are
7 laid over. That concludes today's business. I will
8 remind the viewing public that for anyone wishing to
9 submit written testimony for items that were heard
10 today, please send it by emailing it to
11 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And I would like
12 to thank of course the members of the public, my
13 colleagues, the Subcommittee Council. In particular,
14 all of the Land Use Staff for their incredible work
15 on this very difficult projects but also, really
16 dedicating a lot of their time and effort to really
17 make this hearing happen. We thank you so much for
18 what you do. My Copilot is always Arthur Huh and
19 Angelina, thank you as always for being great and of
20 course, our Sergeant at Arms who really keep
21 everything moving and functioning. As always, we
22 thank you all for that and for participating in
23 today's meeting.

24 This meeting is hereby adjourned. Thank you
25 everyone.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 12, 2021