

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

October 12, 2021
Start: 10:41 a.m.
Recess: 1:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 2

B E F O R E: Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Laurie A. Cumbo
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Oswald Feliz
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Carlos Menchaca
Kevin C. Riley
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Mark Treyger
Jimmy Van Bramer

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Vito Mustaciuolo
General Manager and Chief Operating
Officer
NYCHA

Brian Honan
Vice President
NYCHA

Javier Almodovar
Director, Heating Management Services
Department
NYCHA

Calcedonio Bruno
Vice President of Operational Analysis
and Contract Management
NYCHA

Adalkiris Vargas

@

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to the
3 computer started.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to the cloud
5 all set.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Sergeant
7 Sidowsky, with your opening statement, please.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS SIDOWSKY: Yes. Good
9 morning and welcome to today's remote New York City
10 Council hearing of the Committee on Public Housing.
11 At this time would all council members and council
12 staff please turn on their video. To minimize
13 disruption, please place electronic devices on
14 vibrate or silent mode. If you wish to submit
15 testimony you may do so at testimony@council.nyc.gov.
16 Once again, that is testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank
17 you, Chair. We are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [gavel] Good
19 morning and thank you for attending today's hearing
20 by the Committee on Public Housing. I am Council
21 Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel and I chair the Public
22 Housing Committee. This morning I am joined by
23 Council Member Diaz Sr., Council Member Riley,
24 Council Member Treyger, Council Member Gjonaj,
25 Council Member Feliz, and Council Member Van Bramer.

1
2 Nearly two years ago in January 2020 this committee
3 convened a hearing on the very same topic we're
4 hearing today to discuss - NYCHA's preparedness for
5 the heating season. The adequate provision of heat
6 and hot water has been a persistent issue at NYCHA
7 and today the committee is interested to learn what
8 progress NYCHA has made since it entered into the HUD
9 agreement and whether NYCHA has delivered on its duty
10 to provide decent, livable housing for its residents.
11 The laws of New York City require that property
12 owners provide adequate heat and hot water to
13 tenants. This means hot water 365 days a year, a
14 minimum internal temperatures must be maintained from
15 October 1 through May 31. These requirements apply
16 to all property owners, private and public. Today we
17 are talking about NYCHA's 713 boilers, 1492 vacuum
18 tanks, and 847 instantaneous water heaters. In 2020
19 the federal monitor approved a heating plan which
20 established policies to monitor heating metrics and
21 create a 24/7 heat desk which would dispatch staff to
22 correct deficiencies during the heating season within
23 a maximum of 48 hours. Today we expect to hear the
24 progress of these policies and the real time
25 assessment regarding the success of its

1
2 implementation. This is not supposed to be a aha or
3 got you moment at all. Best practices evaluate
4 benchmarks, assess and reassess progress. Those are
5 the goals of reducing disruption to heat service and
6 faster restoration that is being met, and if not what
7 we can we do differently? This is the time to be
8 introspective and transparent as the 48-hour maximum
9 hour's time is to set, is set to decrease a 24-hour
10 maximum outage time by 2024. This committee expects
11 an update on the implementation of this plan and
12 whether it has succeeded in meeting its goals thus
13 far. In addition to hearing about heat and hot water
14 service the committee expects an update on the many
15 reports of service interruptions to gas and
16 electricity at NYCHA developments, especially since
17 the 2021 Superstorm Sandy thousands of residents at a
18 time has struggled with recurring outages, recurring
19 utility outages. Some resident families rely on
20 generators to keep their lights on. And others are
21 spending as many as several months waiting for gas
22 service to be restored, and I cannot count how many
23 times I received calls from residents requesting hot
24 plates and asking that million-dollar question, how
25 long will my gas be out, to which I never have an

1 answer. There are policies in place so we know what
2 the answers should be in theory or what is actually
3 happening in practice. When outages are classified
4 as chronic and thousands of residents are making
5 identical complaints we cannot say that these are
6 isolated events or out of the normal. This is the
7 norm and it's always unacceptable. So how we will do
8 better. As I've said over and over and over again
9 these conditions will be unacceptable for any New
10 York City landlord. And so there's no reason why we
11 should consider them acceptable for NYCHA. As
12 always, the goal today is to listen first and
13 foremost to our NYCHA residents and to learn how the
14 City Council can improve the provisions of essential
15 services to our families and neighbors that are
16 residents of the NYCHA. With that, I want to quickly
17 thank committee staff, Audrey Sun, Ricky Charlay,
18 Jose Conde, and Lou Zangalier, and my staff, Naomi
19 Hopkins and Everton Smith. And I will now turn it
20 over to our committee counsel, Audrey Sun, to go over
21 some housekeeping matters for today's hearing. Thank
22 you.
23

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thanks very
25 much. I am Audrey Sun, counsel to the City Council's

1
2 Committee on Public Housing. Before we proceed, I
3 want to remind everyone that you will be on mute
4 until you are called on to testify. When it's your
5 turn I'll call your name and you will be prompted to
6 unmute. Ah, so we will, ah, begin the hearing with
7 testimony from the administration. Um, but before
8 that I would just like to acknowledge that we've also
9 been joined by Council Member Ayala. Um, so now
10 we'll turn to testimony from the administration. Ah,
11 a reminder to all council members to please use the
12 Zoom hand raise function if you would like to ask any
13 questions. After the administration we will hear
14 from, ah, any members of the public who are present
15 to testify. I will now administer the oath to the
16 administration, which is represented by Brian Honan,
17 Javier Almodovar, Vito Mustaciuolo, and Calcedonio
18 Bruno. After I say the oath please wait for me to
19 call your name and respond one by one. Please raise
20 your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
21 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth before
22 this committee and to respond honestly to council
23 member questions? Vito Mustaciuolo.

24 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I

25 do.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Javier Almodovar.

3 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Audrey, um, we
4 have trouble getting some of our staff, um, in, um,
5 in the room. Um, Javier, Cal, a few others have
6 been, um, having trouble with the link. Um, so
7 they're not here right now.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK. Are you able to
9 proceed with testimony, um, without them, or do you
10 need a minute for them to be able to join?

11 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I think if we
12 can...

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [inaudible]

14 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: OK, if Cal
15 [inaudible] then we just have to get Javier. But,
16 um, we'll work on it while the, ah, um, general
17 manager reads testimony and, ah, and then we can move
18 on from there. Um, OK.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, so I'll just
20 continue to administer the oath to those present and
21 then once, um, the rest of NYCHA is represented I'll
22 readminister the oath to those [inaudible].

23 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Thank you, thank
24 you.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, remind me whose
3 names I've called already.

4 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Javier was the
5 last one you did.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, OK. Um,
7 Calcedonio Bruno.

8 ADMINISTRATIVE HOUSING SUPERINTENDENT

9 BRUNO: Present. I do.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Brian Honan.

11 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um, yes.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much,
13 you may begin when ready.

14 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

15 Chair Alicka Ampry-Samuel, members of the Committee
16 on Public Housing, and other distinguished members of
17 the City Council. Good morning. I am Vito
18 Mustaciuolo, NYCHA's chief operating officer. I am
19 pleased to be joined by Javier Almodovar, director of
20 NYCHA's heating management services, Calcedonio
21 Bruno, vice president of operational analysis and
22 contract management, and other members of NYCHA's
23 team. NYCHA's more, NYCHA's more than 20, ah, 12,000
24 employees show up to work every day with one goal in
25 mind - to provide our residents with a safe, decent,

1 and supportive home. I appreciate this opportunity
2 today to discuss our efforts to deliver heat and hot
3 water to our residents along with other basic
4 services. This is at the core of our
5 responsibilities as a landlord and we know how
6 impactful service interruptions can be for our
7 residents. With the support of Mayor de Blasio over
8 the past several years we have made significant
9 improvements to the way we deliver services to our
10 residents. Together with our Blueprint for Change
11 strategies to transform the authority, these
12 operational changes are enabling us to better serve
13 our residents and improve their quality of life.
14 That includes our work to improve heating services.
15 As a result of these efforts, we have reduced the
16 time it takes to restore heat outages by nearly 20,
17 from 8.8 hours in 2018-2019 to 7.3 hours in 2020-
18 2021, and brought down the number of outages by 52%.
19 In addition to Mayor de Blasio's support, NYCHA's
20 transformation, as guided by the HUD agreement signed
21 in January of 2019, as well as our partnership with
22 our residents, the federal monitor, HUD, and others
23 in the community, including members of the council.
24 In December of 2019 federal monitor Bart Schwartz
25

1 approved our heating action plan, which we developed
2 in partnership with his team and in accordance with
3 the requirements of the HUD agreement. The action
4 plan outlines the procedures and protocols we follow
5 to previous and respond to outages in our aging
6 heating plants. It also details how we communicate
7 with residents about outages and repairs, provide
8 warming centers in certain scenarios, and investigate
9 outages that cannot be restored within 12 hours. We
10 posted the action plan on our website, informed
11 present leadership about it, and trained staff. We
12 also created individual heating action plans for
13 every development in our portfolio and posted them on
14 our website. These individual plans acknowledge that
15 each development has its own unique challenges which
16 need to be addressed. For instance, Baruch Houses is
17 in a flood zone and is susceptible to constant
18 flooding, and its boilers have exceeded their life
19 expectancy, requiring frequent welding. This
20 development is getting a new direct steam station
21 that is elevated nearly 15 feet above sea level as
22 well as other improvements. It should be noted that
23 many of Baruch's outages last year were planned for
24 construction-related work and that the rate of
25

1 outages there has declined. As another example in
2 line with the action plan for Whitman Houses we
3 replaced the development's mobile boiler with a new
4 boiler plant, instantaneous hot water heaters, and
5 vacuum tanks. In accordance with the HUD agreement
6 we are required to restore all outages within an
7 average of 12 hours, faster than what is required for
8 a private landlord with 85% of the outages having to
9 be resolved within 24 hours. In the last heating
10 season we met this requirement while resolving 92% of
11 total outages within 12 hours. Fewer than 1% of
12 outages, one outage, actually, lasted longer than 24
13 hours. No heating outages lasted more than 48 hours,
14 compared to one outage in 2018, 19, and 2020. In
15 addition, we are working more closely with our sister
16 agencies and utility partners to improve the response
17 to gas and electrical outages. For gas outages that
18 means working with DOB, the Department of Buildings,
19 and National Grid and Con Edison to complete the
20 inspections, permitting process, and service
21 restoration as quickly as possible. And in the event
22 of a gas outage NYCHA will connect residents to New
23 York City Human Resources Administration, which can
24 provide a restaurant allowance for meal purchases and
25

1 to not-for-profit organizations that deliver meals.

2 Our heating operation is vast and our nearly 2200

3 buildings across the city we have nearly 1400 boilers

4 and about 1800 pieces of distribution equipment and

5 around 1700 water heaters. Our 624 full-time heating

6 staff include heating plant technicians, maintenance

7 workers, plumbers, oil burner specialists,

8 electricians, electrician helpers, and their

9 supervisors. They maintain systems that span boiler

10 plants, heating distribution pipes, and apartment

11 radiators. NYCHA's buildings and infrastructures are

12 old, so it's unfortunate, it's an unfortunate reality

13 that there will be breakdowns in our heating

14 equipment and systems. But in focusing on preventive

15 maintenance and repairs and implementing operational

16 improvements, we've been able to reduce the number of

17 outages. The number of total heat outages decreased

18 from 1224 in 2018-2019 to 819 in 2019-2020, to 584

19 last heating season, a 52% reduction. We introduced

20 planned outages scheduled for warmer days in 2018-

21 2019 heating season so that we could do necessary

22 repairs to improve the heating systems' performance

23 and prevent unplanned outages when the weather is

24 colder. In the last heating season there were 120

1
2 planned heat outages restored within an average of
3 seven hours. Every we strive to improvement and to
4 minimize outages, planned our unplanned, and any
5 impacts to our residents' quality of life. By
6 focusing intensely on our response we've also been
7 able to reduce the length of outages considerably.
8 From 2018-2019 heating season, the last year heating
9 season, we brought down the average time to restore
10 total outages by nearly 20%, again, from 8.8 hours to
11 7.3 hours, below the 12-hour restoration target. We
12 want to keep bringing these numbers down even more.
13 To improve heat services for residents we have
14 implemented a 24/7 staffing model for repair teams,
15 established a 24/7 heat desk that monitors potential
16 service disruption from various data and dispatched
17 by staff accordingly, hired 70 additional heating
18 plant technicians. We brought on 56 plumbers and 12
19 electricians dedicated to resolving heating issues as
20 part of our enhanced staffing model. We've
21 established a situation room to coordinate and focus
22 on resources on expediting service restoration when
23 necessary. We set up daily calls to strategize the
24 service issues. We've created a schedule of annual
25 preventive maintenance with inspections and heating

1
2 equipment so any unnecessary or necessary repairs can
3 be made. We've procured third-party management of
4 heating plants at over 40 developments and are
5 utilizing contractors for specialized repairs across
6 our portfolio. We have in place 67 mobile boilers,
7 um, placed as needed, and also staged in geographic
8 areas. We've developed a process to open warming
9 centers for residents when necessary. In addition,
10 we are investing 28 million in city operating funding
11 to replace approximately 400 heating equipment
12 components such as hot water boiler replacements,
13 heat control panels, and tanks. We are also working
14 to improve the tracking of outages and assets and
15 examining with the monitor's team the root cause of
16 outages to prevent future recurrences. As part of
17 our transformation efforts, we enhanced our
18 communication with residents. That means we are now
19 ensure that residents are notified of outages or in
20 advance of scheduled repairs for building flyers and
21 robocalls, enabling residents to automatically less
22 us know if they're still experiencing a service
23 disruption when they receive robocalls, alerting them
24 for service restoration. This data helps us better
25 address lingering issues. We also post information

1 about outages on our website as well as apartment
2 temperatures for the developments where we're
3 installing indoor temperature sensors. Our website
4 provides more transparency than ever before,
5 enhancements guided by our discussions with advocates
6 and residents. We're also posting information about
7 outages on social media. We have improved the
8 process for collecting resident data on outages in
9 other ways, such as by updating the questions
10 residents are asked with submitting heat complaints
11 to the customer contact center, or My NYCHA app.
12 This facilities issues, diagnosis, diagnosis, and
13 repair staff employment. In addition, we rolled out
14 a upgraded My NYCHA app that will allow residents to
15 receive notifications about outages on their smart
16 phones. We do request that residents report issues
17 through either CCC or My NYCHA system, as this
18 enables us to most effectively respond to issues.
19 My NYCHA is available in Spanish and our CCC
20 representatives can connect callers to an interpreter
21 who speaks their language. Since it was launched in
22 2016 nearly 112,000 residents have used My NYCHA app
23 to create over two million work orders, excuse me.
24 To improve heat services for our residents for the
25

1 long term we must replacing aging, faulty
2 infrastructure while we make operational
3 improvements. Over the next several years we are
4 replacing 359 boilers across 80 developments, with
5 approximately 2 billion in city, state, and federal
6 funding. Since 2019 we have installed 47 boilers as
7 part of this pipeline. Keep in mind that outages are
8 not always due to boiler failures. They are often
9 due to issues with other parts of NYCHA's aging
10 infrastructure, such as the distribution system and
11 other aging components. An example of this is the
12 recent issue at Woodside Houses, which needs its
13 entire advanced management system replaced, including
14 the burner, the combustion control, computer module,
15 heat and water, sump pump, and gas valves. This is
16 why we are taking a comprehensive approach to
17 improving heat service, planning investments in
18 heating systems as a whole, underground distribution
19 systems, pipes in walls, heating components, and
20 boilers. And we're not just replacing in kind, but
21 are putting in place more effective systems. For
22 example, to improve hot water services we're
23 incorporating moderate designs in our new heating
24 plants, decoupling hot water equipment from heating
25

1
2 equipment so that issues with one don't affect the
3 other. We are also, where possible, electrifying gas
4 stoves, moving away from steam distribution, and
5 improving the building envelope, all things that help
6 reduce outages and keep residents safe and
7 comfortable. HUD's energy performance contracting,
8 or EPC, enabled us to replace boilers and modernize
9 heating system with the assistance from energy
10 service companies, without spending capital dollars
11 up front. The improvements are funded by the cost
12 savings from reduced energy consumption. Last year
13 we finished investing over 300 million at 70
14 developments through four EPCs, several years ahead
15 of schedule and beyond our initial investment goal.
16 By its [inaudible] building management and department
17 temperature sensors at 47 developments we can now
18 monitor building temperatures and heating and hot
19 water systems in real time. The system improves the
20 distribution of the heat from the buildings, reduces
21 overheating and underheating. It makes the heating
22 system greener and more energy efficient. These new
23 controls generally provide temperatures of 72 to 74
24 degrees, above New York City's requirement of 68,
25 though lower than some residents may be accustomed

1 to. NYCHA is also taking advantage of direct install
2 programs with local utilities. Through these
3 programs local vendors are compensated by the
4 utilities to repair and replace apartment radiator
5 valves and traps at no cost to NYCHA. This work
6 improves steam distribution and residents' comfort.
7 Through the state's weatherization assistance program
8 we plan to bring 30 million in energy and water
9 efficiency upgrades, including new boilers to up to
10 8000 apartments and 65 developments. To date, nearly
11 15 million of the work is underway or complete at 32
12 developments. In 2019 NYCHA released a design build
13 RFP with the goal of transitioning the heating- and
14 domestic hot water-producing systems at eight
15 developments to high efficiency clean electric heat
16 pumps. These and other technologies lead towards the
17 decarbonization of our buildings for Local Law 97,
18 greenhouse gas reduction goals, while also enhancing
19 the systems' performance and resident comfort. In
20 2020 we released an RFP seeking a team to retrofit a
21 select building to achieve near net zero energy
22 performance by 2021. Together with our other energy
23 efficiency work this trail-blazing, first of its kind
24 demonstration project, will help with the city meet
25

1
2 its ambitious climate goals while improving
3 residents' quality of life. As part of this work, we
4 recently released a five-year update to our
5 sustainability agenda, which developed a road map for
6 cutting edge technologies, such as electric heat
7 pumps and geothermal and hydronic conversions as
8 NYCHA advocates for new funding to recapitalize our
9 assets. Other ways we will improve service to
10 residents including issuing more user-friendly hand-
11 holds for staff, developing a plan to assist
12 vulnerable residents in the event of a heat outage,
13 and creating a work order quality assurance program,
14 while we evaluate each heating season as well as our
15 resident communication systems. We will also
16 continue to install apartment temperature sensors at
17 a total of 60 developments, technology that enables
18 us to better deploy staff and analyze data.
19 Providing reliable and comfortable heat is one of our
20 top priorities, as we work to improve or deliver a
21 service to residents. We are committed to continued
22 progress in this area by making substantial
23 improvements to our operations as well as strategic
24 investments from new heating plants and systems to
25 improved staffing models. Our residents' quality of

1
2 life drives everything we do, especially when it
3 comes to delivering basic services such as heat and
4 hot water. While we have reduced the time it takes
5 to restore heat outages and the number of outages
6 significantly, there's more work to be done. Thank
7 you very much for your partnership. With your
8 support and the support of other members of the
9 community we will keep making a difference for our
10 residents. We look forward to our continued
11 collaboration on NYCHA's transformation and we're
12 happy to answer any questions that you may have.
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
15 Vito, thank you so much. Um, we have also been
16 joined by Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. So just
17 getting started, jumping right into it.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry, Chair, ah,
19 sorry to interrupt. Just really quickly, before they
20 begin, ah, I, I'd like to administer the oath to
21 Javier Almodovar, um, so that he can be ready to
22 answer questions on the record.

23 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Hello, good morning.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning. Ah,
25 Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell

1 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
2 in your testimony before this committee and to
3 respond honestly to council member questions?

4 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: I do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. You may
6 proceed.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
8 Audrey. Please define an outage for us.

9 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Ah, good morning,
10 ah, good morning. Um, outages are defined as two
11 different types. Um, planned outage, and we also
12 have unplanned outages. Planned outages are, um, to
13 correct a condition identified. It causes service
14 disruption if left unattended. Ah, it's a corrective
15 maintenance, um, protocol that we follow. So when we
16 visit some of these sites during our routine
17 inspections of the boiler rooms and, and ancillary
18 equipment rooms if we see something that it requires
19 attention we schedule an unplanned outage to address.
20 I'm sorry, a planned outage to address it.
21 Controlled, ah, service disruption, we take the
22 system down. We have all the staff and all the
23 materials in place to correct that, that condition.
24 In essence this is corrective maintenance. The
25

1 second reason why we would create a planned outage is
2 for ongoing capital improvement work. We want to
3 meet the, ah, the schedule of the construction so
4 that we complete the work on time, and so we work
5 with capital projects and the contractors to, to
6 [inaudible] plan controlled service disruption so
7 that they can perform their work and stay on
8 schedule. That's a planned outage. Now, an
9 unplanned outage is the exact opposite. It, it's, it
10 created, ah, or unforeseen event. If something
11 happens where the system goes down unexpectedly then
12 we create an unplanned outage. In both cases, um, we
13 create outages for either a development, building, a
14 stair hall, or apartment line. And, again, in both
15 cases residents in the affected area receive a
16 robocall. The difference between the two is that
17 with a planned outage the robocall goes out 48 hours
18 in advance of the scheduled work and the scheduled
19 take-down of the, ah, of the system. An unplanned,
20 if the robocall goes out within the hour of the
21 creation of that, ah, planned outage.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.
24 How many heat and hot water outages have occurred so

1 far this heating season? I think we're 12 days into
2 it?
3

4 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Oh, yeah, we've had,
5 we, we haven't had the, the, um, ah, opportunity to
6 provide heat because the temperatures have been above
7 55 since the start of October, and so because of that
8 we've had no heating outages at all. All of our
9 outages, a total of 81, have been for [inaudible].

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, so for all
11 of the outages that were no hot water, which ones
12 were planned and which, how many were planned and how
13 many were unplanned?

14 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: 26 were planned and
15 55 were unplanned.

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: And
17 if I can give an update, as of this morning we
18 currently have, ah, two unplanned, um, hot water
19 outages, and six planned.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And for the
21 ones that were, ah, so for either one which
22 developments had the most outages so far?

23 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So far today?
24 That...

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And, and, and,
3 and in that same vein, um, when you explain, when you
4 say which developments can you let us know, um,
5 what's unique about that particular development or
6 those particular developments? Just to give us a
7 sense of what's going on.

8 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So, unfortunate I
9 don't have the exact, ah, development that has had
10 the most, um, outages so far, ah, for this heating
11 season, but I do have it for the last season.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, well, you
13 can talk about the last heating season. That's,
14 that's fine. Um, and I know, I think the
15 developments are listed so is there a way to give,
16 to, to take a quick look to see those developments
17 and maybe compare them to the last heating season?
18 Just as we're talking now?

19 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Are we, are we
20 comparing the outages that are on the, ah...

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The
22 developments themselves, because you were just saying
23 you don't have the, the names of the developments for
24 right now, but you can let us know about the last
25 season, and so I'm saying, OK, we can talk about the

1 last season just to see if there's any, um,
2 [inaudible].
3

4 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: I just want to make
5 I understand your question. [inaudible] so I'm
6 looking at the work site right now and it's listing
7 these developments that have a service disruption.
8 So you're asking me to compare, for example, Castle
9 Hill, which is the one that's on there now and it's a
10 planned outage, right? Ah, and it's for the
11 installation of a vacuum [inaudible] which is an
12 ancillary piece of equipment. Do you want to know
13 how this development fared last year?

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Exactly, to
15 see if there were any lessons learned and if that was
16 part of like planned or [inaudible].

17 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Got you. So, um,
18 it, it'll have to be from, from memory 'cause I don't
19 have the exact information from last year in front of
20 me. But I could tell you that, ah, at Castle Hill,
21 um, it's an advanced water management system. It had
22 some issues with the advanced water management system
23 that was related to some of our ancillary equipment,
24 which is why today we're in building 11 replacing a
25 piece of that ancillary equipment, so we can get the

1 [inaudible] back and forth. The next one on the list
2 is Dyckman. Dyckman was, was [inaudible] last year
3 but at Dyckman the reason why the outage is going on
4 today...
5

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Wait, just say
7 it one more time because I'm, I'm having a little
8 trouble hearing you. You just finished talking about
9 Castle Hill, so now you just said something, you're
10 talking about Dyckman now, right?

11 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Dyckman.

12 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
13 Council, yep, Javier is going down the list of our
14 current open hot water outages.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

16 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Correct.

17 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
18 Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. So
20 the current hot water outages, when you said, when
21 you mentioned Dyckman they're on the current list
22 now.

23 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Right.
24
25

1 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But you
2
3 mentioned something about last year and so I wanted
4 to get that in, just to be clear...

5 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Oh, I'm sorry, OK
6 [inaudible].

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...'cause
8 there's a point.

9 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Last year Dyckman
10 didn't do too, too badly. It, it wasn't on our
11 radar, in other words. It, it, it fared fairly well.
12 Um, now as far as the work that's going on at Dyckman
13 today, at Dyckman, this work is actually related to a
14 laundry room that's being installed. It, it really
15 has nothing to do with our equipment. We took the
16 equipment down so that the construction of that
17 laundry room can continue. Have steamfitters on site
18 right now that are making some connections to that
19 laundry room and that's why we took the system down.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, now go
21 back to Castle Hill.

22 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Castle Hill.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um-hmm. So,
24 so go back, so go back to Castle Hill. What is
25 happening now and then give it to me just from your

1
2 memory, like you were saying, just kind of going off
3 of memory what was happening.

4 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So at, at Castle
5 Hill what's going on now, we're replacing a piece of
6 ancillary equipment and one of the tanks. It's a
7 vacuum tank. It helps with heat distribution and
8 condensate return to the boiler. Ah, Castle Hill has
9 an advanced water management system in the boiler
10 room that controls the entire plant that, um,
11 records, ah, ah, condensate coming back and, and
12 steam output, and so what, by replacing this piece of
13 equipment we're hoping to improve the condensate
14 return from the system back to the boiler and prevent
15 any, any, ah, ah, service disruption that may be
16 related to the lack of condensate return from the,
17 from the system to the boiler.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. And
19 how many, just looking at your current list right now
20 in front of you, we're not talking about heat because
21 of the temperature, right now it's warm outside,
22 we're talking about hot water. So, um, how many
23 individual residents, um, have been impacted due to
24 the lack of hot water?

1 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So, so, so for, in
2
3 total for, for planned is, ah, 1594, and unplanned is
4 2454, which would be, ah, roughly 4080 residents
5 about, roughly.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And I
7 know that there is, again, a difference between
8 planned and, um, unplanned. So what's the average
9 time to restore hot water?

10 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Ah, currently, right
11 now, we're at nine hours right now.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And, um,
13 and going back to heat, what is the average time to
14 restore heat? Just going back to what the actual
15 requirements are.

16 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: That's, that's,
17 that's a very, that's a very good question. So the
18 requirement is, is for [inaudible] and for the past
19 three heating seasons we've, we've met that
20 requirement and actually showed a reduction in the,
21 ah, number of hours to restore. Last heating season
22 we ended at 7.3 hours, 7.3. Ah, the heating season
23 before that we were at 7.7. We're talking about
24 heat, right, and the heating season before that we
25 were at 8.7, almost 9.

1 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Now can
2 you go back so, um, and I, and I do want to say,
3 Vito, just in your opening testimony, I was pretty,
4 um, impressed, a little shocked at those numbers. I
5 think you quoted some 92%, um, and I thought that was
6 pretty [inaudible], pretty good, right?
7

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
9 Thank you. We're, we're doing better, we're doing
10 much better.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Um, you
12 know, but I do have to say there are no residents to
13 testify this morning, so will you stay here in a
14 different [inaudible] go with it right now.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
16 Well, we're not perfect, Councilwoman, but, but we
17 are doing better.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I know, I
19 know, I know. Um, but just going back to, to, wait a
20 minute now, your communication to the residents and
21 what your numbers tell you, um, how reliable, um, is
22 the actual system itself, the, the day that you, um,
23 have on Maximo like what, how reliable is that system
24 right now and can you just talk a little bit about
25 the system?

1 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: You want to talk
2
3 about the system Maximo...

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah, how
5 reliable is NYCHA's data on Maximo?

6 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Ah, I would say
7 it's, it's pretty reliable. I mean, ah, Maximo
8 tracks all of our work orders and, um, while we
9 create them they, the system automatically closes
10 them out [inaudible] pretty active.

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
12 Yeah, and if I could also add, Council, that, um, you
13 know, the interactive, ah, part of the R system that
14 we put in place, um, when we restore heat or hot
15 water, excuse me, um, or the outages declared
16 restored, right, we do send a, a robocall out to the
17 residents and it does encourage them to, um, respond,
18 to tell us yes, ah, it's been corrected, or not it
19 has not been. Um, I don't have the statistics on the
20 [inaudible] calls from last year. We can certainly
21 get them to you. Um, but it was fantastic. It was
22 great because it helped us identify where there were
23 still issues that our residents were experiencing in
24 their apartments, even though our technicians, our
25 staff, made the repairs in the boiler room, right.

1 So, so that has been a tremendous tool. Um, I think
2 the other, you know, value point that I want to make,
3 too, is especially, um, for this year, you know,
4 Javier and his team started, ah, doing the overhauls,
5 the inspections, um, as early as February, ah, to
6 ensure that we go into this heating season in much
7 better shape. We also, um, weekly, um, in, in fact
8 sometimes even more often, um, have conversations
9 with the federal monitor's team and what they have
10 been doing is sending staff out as well, ah, to
11 evaluate our heating plans. And they've been sending
12 us reports that are invaluable. It's a third set of
13 eyes that are being put on the heating plans. We had
14 a great conversation with the federal monitor and HUD
15 last week about the use of these reports. Um, I want
16 to thank Dan Purnell, um, from the federal monitor's
17 team, ah, and his staff, who were really on top of
18 these issues, ah, and in fact, um, what was also
19 unique about this year is HUD kind of gave a
20 challenge and just gave us a scenario and asked us to
21 play out the scenario, um, and I think we did
22 extremely well. Again, always room for improvement,
23 ah, but I think that with the collaboration with the
24 federal monitor, um, with HUD, and with all that
25

1
2 external partners it's, it's keeping us on, on our
3 toes. Ah, and Javier is constantly improving on the
4 process. Um, our staffing levels are better than
5 we've ever seen before, ah, this year we testified
6 electricians and electrician helpers over to Javier
7 so healthy as direct control over now plumbers and
8 electricians, all to support his operation. And so
9 we've made a lot of fundamental changes. Um, and
10 communication, there's always room for improvement.
11 Ah, I think we're doing much better, um, but
12 certainly more work, more work to be done.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, I, I
14 appreciate that, because that was, you know, just
15 looking at the, you know, right now we're at the
16 beginning of the heating season so we don't have a
17 lot of, you know, like [inaudible] to go over, and
18 just looking at the numbers from last year and
19 listening to your testimony, um, that's [inaudible]
20 ask that question how reliable the data because...

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
22 Sure.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...that's all
24 we have to go with right now, um, and so.

25

1
2 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Ah, Council
3 Member, can I just add to, to on what Vito said, too.
4 So, um, the IVR system that was set up, ah, with the
5 robocalls that are interactive, that's something that
6 the council and especially this committee really
7 encouraged, um, in response to the batch closings.
8 Um, before the criticism were, was that a, um,
9 residents would call in, ah, an issue, an outage
10 would be declared. The, um, heating system would
11 come back and then the work orders would close.
12 Javier and team and, and, and, you know, with the
13 leadership of, ah, of Vito have now made it, um, we
14 don't close them until we're hearing from residents
15 that they're actually receiving heat. So it is, it's
16 much, it's much better, it's much more accurate, and
17 we're hearing less recurring problems as a result.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That is huge.
19 That, that is definitely huge. And, um, I, I want to
20 just touch on something quickly before we move on,
21 um, into the federal monitor question. Um, well,
22 questions related to the agreement. Vito, you
23 mentioned the Energy Performance Contract program and
24 in your testimony you said the system is [inaudible].
25

1
2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I'm
3 sorry, I'm sorry.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ahuh. Um, you
5 talked about a development, um, that was able to be
6 modernized and, um, I just wanted to ask questions
7 about, oh, here it is. The system improves the
8 distribution of heat throughout buildings, reducing
9 overheating and underheating. It makes the heating
10 system greener and more efficient. These new
11 controls generally provide temperatures of 72 to 74
12 degrees, above New York City's requirement of 68
13 degrees, though lower than some residents may be
14 accustomed to, and so I just wanted to touch on that.
15 How's that going and can you speak to that because,
16 um, I do know the required temperature, you know,
17 clearly much lower than some residents are accustomed
18 to. We're used to having 75 degrees, especially in
19 our senior buildings. So can you speak to, um, the
20 opportunity to have a warmer temperature in some of
21 these buildings?

22 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
23 Sure. I'm gonna start and then I'm going to ask
24 Javier to, to kind of jump in as well. Ah, so the
25 system that we're talking about there really, it

1 monitors the internal temperatures and, and, um, we,
2 we're following that very closely. Um, the system
3 is, as I mentioned in my testimony, designed to
4 maintain, ah, and regulate the heat between 72-74.
5 Um, without these controls and without these, um,
6 these, ah, sensors, that we historically overheated
7 our buildings, um, provided temperatures sometimes
8 in, in the upper seventies. Um, and I've been out to
9 a number of our buildings and temperature readings
10 sometimes up to 78, even 82 designs. Um, that was my
11 comment about, um, um, perhaps some residents were
12 accustomed to seeing higher temperatures. But I also
13 want to thank the City Council because when I was at
14 HPD, um, something that, that we had worked hard on,
15 um, was to increase the nighttime temperature, ah,
16 and I'm grateful to the council for, for doing that.
17 Um, so the nighttime temperature now is 62 designs.
18 Before that it was, ah, it was much, much lower, um,
19 it was only 55. Um, so there have been significant,
20 um, improvements, and that's for all property owners.
21 Um, but we're able to better, um, control the
22 temperatures, um, with these sensors, um, and, again,
23 it makes for a much more, ah, energy-efficient, um,
24 heating system. It does get some use, some getting
25

1 used to for our residents because, you know, they may
2 see fluctuations. It may drop down to 70, 72 degrees
3 before the heat, um, turns back on and brings it back
4 up to 74. Um, so it, you might see some
5 fluctuations, um, as opposed to a constant, ah,
6 temperature. But Javier, if you want to add to, to
7 what we've experienced with these systems?
8

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And Javier,
10 before you start I just wanted to, um, also put into
11 context, too, that a lot of the calls that we get,
12 you know, is either it, it's just way too cold,
13 right, or way too hot, and then when someone goes out
14 with their, you know, their instrument, their, their
15 tool they will say that it's appropriate temperature,
16 you know, or [inaudible] like maybe a different
17 timing. So I just wanted to put that out there. OK,
18 Javier.

19 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Um, so what, first
20 let me just touch a little bit more about how the
21 system actually works. It, yes, it's regulating the
22 indoor temperature. The way it does that is that
23 this is the part that the residents are not too
24 accustomed to as well. It, it, it, um, shuts the
25 system down when the temperatures reach, ah, the set

1 point of 74. Once 74 [inaudible] you guys hear me?

2 Can you hear me?

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes.

4 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: I just lost

5 [inaudible] Cal Bruno is the only person I see know.

6 Um, at any rate, so, ah, the system shuts down and

7 when it shuts down, once it's satisfied, ah, you

8 don't feel the heat in the pipe, and that's, that's

9 the part that the residents are most not accustomed

10 to, and so what we find is that when the system does

11 shut down, ah, getting more calls. And when we go

12 into the apartment while the, the system may, may not

13 be activated at that time the temperatures in the

14 apartment are actually within the range that, that's

15 why you, you're hearing from many residents that,

16 that it's either too cold or it's too hot and the

17 temperature is still not where I want it to be. The

18 system is designed to, to, um, shut down at that high

19 point, which is 74, 74-75, and then it kicks back in

20 at around 70 and it regulates between that, those two

21 temperature settings.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Got it.

23 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: But, again, what,

24 what we've been fighting is that when the system is,

1
2 is on the closed, ah, end of it there's no heat going
3 through, ah, the pipe. That's where we see an
4 increase in, ah, [inaudible].

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I see Vito has
6 his hand raised.

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
8 Thank you, Councilwoman. Um, I also want to add,
9 too, that when we install these systems we do have a
10 program that, that, where we try to inform our
11 residents about these new systems. Ah, it's
12 educational program. Um, so we are communicating
13 with our residents. It's, it's a bit, it's different
14 for a lot of our residents. So it does take some
15 getting, ah, accustomed to. Um, but we do have, um,
16 outreach staff that go and meet with the residents.
17 They, ah, talk about these new systems, um, and we do
18 that in advance of the systems coming on line.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. OK.
20 Well, thanks. I just wanted to touch on that, um,
21 before I forget to ask a question about temperatures.
22 So jumping directly into the next conversation, the
23 federal monitor is tasked to assist NYCHA to seek
24 regulatory relief from HUD, the City of New York, and
25 the State of New York. Has NYCHA identified or

1
2 flagged regulations they need relief from, and if so
3 what are they, um, and how do these regulations
4 impede NYCHA, just the work that you're doing? So
5 can you just speak a little about, you know, you
6 mentioned already that you've had conversations with
7 the federal monitor, um, can you just talk about some
8 of the flagged regulations and relief?

9 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So Javier and, and
10 his team and Vito and his team meet with the monitor
11 weekly. Um, we can't speak, you know, for them and I
12 wouldn't even try to pretend to. But I, I can tell
13 you what we've done so far. Um, early on, you know,
14 after the...

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, so just,
16 so remember, I'm not asking about the federal
17 monitor. I'm just asking what have....

18 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yep, yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...[inaudible]?

20 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yep, yeah,
21 exactly. Um, I just wanted to start off there. I,
22 it would never want to speak to that team. Um, and
23 so, um, right away we designed build. It was
24 something that we saw was a big team point, right,
25 um, and oftentimes when, um, and we would, you know,

1 we helped, you know, in Albany to fight for that, to
2 make sure that NYCHA was included when other agencies
3 were getting this benefit, um, and all of the state-
4 funded heating projects and the city-funded heating
5 projects are using this method. Um, on top of that
6 we also, um, went to HUD to seek for a waiver to make
7 sure that we could use the benefit that the state,
8 um, that state gave us, um, because HUD has some
9 rules against, ah, design build and we were able to
10 do that successfully. So right there we're cutting
11 down on the time for new boiler plants, um, ah, in
12 the construction, ah, of them. So that is a major
13 hurdle right there. The, the other, um, team point
14 that we see right now, and it's something that's
15 included in the trust legislation, um, but we can, we
16 can do it separately as well, is around procurement.
17 Right now NYCHA has to go with the lowest responsive
18 bidder, um, when we bid out a project. And
19 oftentimes when you get the lowest responsive you get
20 a, um, a contractor who comes in low, later on there
21 has to be change orders. This causes delay in the
22 project. It also doesn't give you the best, um,
23 contractors that are available out there. We would
24 like to go to a system that allows us to go with best
25

1 value. Um, that gives you better quality contractors
2 who will have more realistic bids, um, so we can cut
3 down on those change orders, we'll have better
4 projects that will come in on time, ah, as well. So
5 right there those will be two huge things that, um,
6 the state can do, ah, in order to help us, especially
7 with new, newer plants.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. So
10 under the actual agreement the HUD, it states that
11 NYCHA has to replace or address approximately 500
12 boilers by 2026. So that's, um, in the written
13 language. Um, how are you on dealing with this
14 particular target and is it something that's
15 realistic by 2026?

16 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um, I would leave
17 that to both Javier and Vito on the timelines of the
18 agreement.

19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
20 Yeah, I'm sorry. I was looking for some numbers but,
21 um, right now we are on target to achieve those
22 goals. Um, if I can get some, some numbers I'll,
23 I'll share some numbers with you, um, but as of right
24 now we're on target.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And, and I
3 just, I can wait for you to answer, just like the
4 timelines and targets of the agreement, only because,
5 um, you know, everyone else is talking about COVID
6 having, ah, been an issue and, you know, some
7 projects are not on track and everything else, so I
8 don't want you to say that you're on target and, you
9 know.

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: And
11 I appreciate that. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible].

13 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
14 Yeah, yeah, and, and COVID certainly did impact, um,
15 all of us, um, um, and our heating department as well
16 as capital, um, and in fact it continuously impacts
17 us in way that we didn't even anticipate. Um,
18 trying, trying to find materials and, and parts for,
19 ah, for heating plants. Um, it is, ah, becoming a
20 challenge, um...

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, and, and
22 I'm asking, and I'm asking that question to, again,
23 when I say is it a realistic target, um, because my
24 next question is, um, does [inaudible] have anything
25 to do with you being able to meet that target and,

2 um, what does the, does the agreement speak to, you
3 know, those issues.

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Got
5 it.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Like what
7 would happen if you can't because it's just going to
8 cost too much money now and you don't see where it's
9 coming from, you know, just, so just being able to
10 push through those issues? And I just want my
11 colleague to know that I'm going to continue to move
12 forward with the questions because I don't see any
13 hands raised, so I just wanted to put that out there
14 for my colleagues.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: OK.
16 So if, Councilwoman, if you want to, ah, go on to the
17 next question we're getting...

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: ...
20 the information, um, for that question.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So I'm
22 starting on, ah, so it stated that October 1, 2020,
23 during the heating season NYCHA would restore heat to
24 affected units within 24 hours, and in no event more
25 than 24, I mean, 48 hours when there is a short, oh,

1
2 I don't even understand. Has NYCHA been able to meet
3 all of its goals during last heating season of, ah,
4 making sure that none of the outages went beyond 48
5 hours? And if not, um, even if it's one development
6 can you just speak to the why? Why were you not able
7 to stick within the 48 hours, and now that we have a
8 new heating season, um, is there any, you know,
9 clearly there's a plan, but what is it?

10 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Um, so we have been
11 meeting the, ah, the 12-hour, ah, obligation. You
12 can hear me, right? I just want to make sure.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes.

14 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Can you hear me?

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes.

16 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Um, and we, this
17 last heating season, as I said, we, we ended the
18 heating season with a, um, average response time of,
19 average response time of 7.3 hours for heat, ah, and,
20 and I think Vito had testified earlier that we were
21 at, ah, 92% of the total heat hours were addressed
22 within, um, 12 hours, um, and fewer than 1% of the
23 outages lasted, ah, longer than 24, but we had none
24 that went over 48 at all. Um, I don't have the exact
25 details on the ones, and forgive me for this. Ah,

1
2 I'll, I'll get back to you, of course. The one that
3 went over 24 hours, I don't want to misspeak, so we
4 like giving the exact details on the time, happened
5 with that one that went over 24 hours last year. But
6 this year, um, so, we're, we continue to, to aim to
7 improve year after year. That's always goal, ah, and
8 we've been doing that for the past three years, and
9 I'm hoping that this year is no different.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, and so
11 again it's just to figure out if maybe that one, um,
12 you know, there's a pattern and what's happening, and
13 if that one, um, will not be the one this year but
14 there may be a similar development with those same
15 issues and then that will be the one because the
16 focus was on that other one and so, again, just
17 trying to, you know, get a, a clear understanding as
18 to what's happening because there is still this need
19 to replace and address approximately 500 boilers by
20 2026. And so just ensuring that you can continue to
21 be on track for providing heat and hot water to all
22 of your customers, all of your residents, um, just
23 would be helpful. So as you're still trying to
24 figure that out I am going to, unless you have
25 something to say right now.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Nope, I'm good.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Um, so I'm gonna press pause because I do see a hand up for one of my colleagues. So Audrey.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sure. Ah, we'll now, we'll now turn to Council Member Riley for some questions. Ah, just in the interest of time please, ah, be sure to keep your questions to five minutes. The Sergeant at Arms will keep a timer and let you know when your time is up.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Ah, thank you, Chair. Ah, thank you, Counsel. I think I'll be way shorter than five minutes. Um, but I think, ah, thank you, ah, Chair for, for the question. It was very, ah, very straight to the point. I think, ah, my only, my concern this winter is projected to be one of the most coldest winters, um, according to the World Almanac, um, resources and, ah, being that a lot of, ah, places, like I represent Edenwald, which is a huge complex in my, ah, in my district and every winter it, it's always a shortage, ah, or, in a, in a building or the heat goes out in the building. So, ah, just knowing that this winter will be one of the coldest winters, can you just walk me, I'm sorry if

1
2 you did this already but I was doing something in the
3 background, but can you just walk me through the
4 procedures, ah, if, ah, a building has to go, um,
5 without power or without heat how do you get the
6 power and the heat, how fast, um, do you do, ah, does
7 NYCHA contact the residents? Um, and how fast will
8 the heat, um, be put back up, um, when it goes out?

9 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: OK. So, um, what,
10 what we do is through routine, ah, site visits, if we
11 notice that a system went down unexpectedly, um, we
12 immediately create an unplanned outage work order and
13 within the hour of the creation of that outage work
14 order in Maximo a robocall is sent out to the, ah,
15 affected population, right. So if it's a single
16 building then everyone in that building will get the
17 robocall to inform the residents that there's an
18 issue related to the heat and that we're on it and
19 we're, we're working on it. Now, um, it's, its
20 difficult to say, ah, what will break down because,
21 you know, some of our systems are old, ah, but
22 through our protocols that we have in place, like the
23 routine, ah, site visits that we do daily, if we see
24 something wrong, as I just said, we, we make an, ah,
25 an outage work order for that, and in addition to

1 that we have a 24-hour heat desk that monitors two
2 key performance, ah, indicators for it. The first
3 one is work orders, um, and the other one is CHAS
4 alarms, right? CHAS alarms are our computerized
5 heating automated system that sends trouble alarms
6 via email to the entire heating staff when there's an
7 issue in a boiler plant. If there's an issue in the
8 boiler plant, as you would imagine, if the plant goes
9 down then, you know, the entire system goes down, and
10 so what my heat desk does is they monitor those two
11 key performance indicators 24 hours a day. Um, and
12 the work orders, when we see a spike in work orders,
13 whether it's in a single building, a stair hall, or
14 an entire development then we dispatch staff to that
15 site, if we don't have staff on site. As you can
16 imagine, we do have staff that work different shifts
17 and, ah, the heat desk works, because they work 24
18 hours they can, they can dispatch staff accordingly
19 when staff has already gone home. So we do have
20 roving teams that work at night and we do have
21 specific sites that have an a.m. and p.m. watch as
22 well. And so if, if Edenwald is one of those sites
23 then we would communicate with that staff first to
24 make sure that they go and inspect whatever the issue
25

1
2 so that we're responding as quickly as we possibly
3 can, and the goal is to identify what the issue is
4 and assign the appropriate staff to, ah, restore that
5 service as quickly as possible.

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Ah,
7 Council Member, Council Member, I hope that you're
8 wrong [laughs]. Ah, or that the almanac is wrong.
9 Um, but we, we are...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I hope so, too.

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
12 Yeah, but we are positioned, um, and, and as Javier
13 has said, um, we have, ah, a really good playbook
14 here, um, and we also are increasing the number of
15 mobile heating plants, um, both...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: OK.

17 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: ...that we own as well
18 as that we're renting. Ah, in fact, we're bringing,
19 um, six more on, um, that we currently didn't have,
20 um, you know, just in preparation, ah, for what may
21 be and the inevitable, um, but that's a last resort.
22 Um, Javier and his team have done a great job in, in
23 getting services restored without us having to
24 install, um, a mobile unit. Um, but we do have those
25 available, um, should we need to. Um, Chair, can I

2 go back to your question about the replacement, um,
3 per the HUD agreement, the action plan?

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Only if Riley
5 is finished.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Yes, yes.

7 [laughter]

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: My
9 apologies.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: No, no, no, it's
11 all right. I'm, ah, finished. Thank you, Vito,
12 thank you, Javier. I see Brian Honan on the call.
13 Brian works, I worked very well with Brian for years
14 so, ah, Brian is usually on top of a lot of the
15 issues that I have in my district. So thank you very
16 much, Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, you're
18 welcome. But Vito, before you go back to that, I
19 just need to...

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
21 Absolutely.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Can you just
23 clarify again the parent, um, work order, um, and the
24 child. [laughs]

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

3 Child, sure. [laughs] Go ahead, Javier.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ah, but, ah,

5 and, um, to that at what point does it actually

6 close? Just to clarify that real quick.

7 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So with, with the

8 outage work order, it gets closed after we've

9 confirmed, not only after we've completed the work

10 and, and put the system back on line, but after

11 we've confirmed that the services that we provide our

12 residents are, are, are being supplied. So we'll

13 visit a number of apartments before to confirm, of

14 course, before we close that [inaudible].

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

16 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: You're very welcome.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, Vito.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

19 Thank you, ah, Chair. Um, so I want to go back to

20 your question about the, um, about where we are with

21 respect to the target and the agreement. As of

22 today, um, we are on target to achieve, um, the

23 replacement of the 297 boilers, um, by the end of

24 2026. In fact, right now we have 311 replacements

1 that are in various stages, um, of progress, um, and
2 we've already replaced 64. Um, so...

3
4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The 311 is out
5 of the 500?

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Ah,
7 so, no, the, the, actually, ah, CP Capital is
8 required to replace 297 boilers.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Um,
11 that, that's what we reported, ah, to HUD. Um, we
12 can go over the numbers, um, you know, later, if you
13 like. Um, but [inaudible] we are on target. We do
14 have the funds in place, ah, to achieve that, um,
15 using a combination of city, state, and federal
16 dollars, right, and that's as of today. Um, we don't
17 anticipate any problems. Um, we've been seeing a lot
18 of forward progress. Um, just looking here, so the
19 agreement requires, um, Capital, it says to replace
20 297 boilers by, ah, December 31, 2026. Again, we
21 have 311 that are actively, um, in progress. 64 have
22 already, um, been replaced. That's against the 297.
23 Ah, and then through, ah, sure.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How
25 [inaudible] because 311 is more than 297. [laughs]

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: So
3 it does. So, right, right. So, so, again, I guess
4 in, in anticipation we're, our, our goal is to do
5 better. Um, we're required to do 297...

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
8 Right now we have, right now we have 311.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Um,
11 right, yes, I'm sorry. Um, so we do have a little
12 wiggle room there and, God forbid, if, if one or two
13 fall out, um, but we do, um, intend on going through
14 with the 311. Um, and again, the funds are in place
15 for that. Um, so as of today we are in good shape
16 with respect to our obligations, um, pursuant to the
17 agreement.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. All
19 right, thanks. So, um, now I want to ask questions
20 about the city and its obligations and promises that
21 were, um, made. On January 31, 2018, Mayor de Blasio
22 released a press release that stated that the city
23 plans to invest 200 million to replace boilers and
24 upgrade heating systems at 20 NYCHA developments.
25 This funding was supposed to go towards replacing

1
2 outdated boilers, modernizing heating system
3 controls, and hot water, or hot water-making
4 technology. And these renovations would be finished
5 by 2022. So I know you just mentioned, um, the work
6 that you're doing and utilizing funding from city,
7 state, and the feds. But just specifically speaking
8 to the 200 million. Did NYCHA begin replacing the
9 boilers at Morris 1, Morris 2, Taft, Cypress Hills,
10 Farragut, Sotomayor, Rheingold, Fiorentino, Long
11 Island Baptist, and Robinson, and are we on track to
12 finish these renovations by 2022, which is next year?

13 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

14 Right. Please bear with me. Does somebody have the
15 page with the phase 1 and phase 2? I'm sorry, just
16 bear with me for one minute. Javier, if you can
17 locate that, um, before I [inaudible].

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, and while
19 you're looking at that, I just want to say
20 [inaudible]

21 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: I'm on mute, I'm so
22 sorry. I'm on mute, I'm sorry.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um, um, while
24 Vito is looking that up you already know that I do a
25 lot of, um, DMs and stuff, direct messages on social

1
2 media. So according to residents, sometimes the
3 workers will measure the heat in the bathroom or a
4 kitchen, but not in actual livable space. It's not
5 realistic for residents to be relegated to one part
6 of their apartment, so when you're talking about
7 closing out a ticket or a work order can you speak to
8 that specific issue, where they, a worker will go in
9 and they will close out because there's adequate heat
10 in the bathroom or kitchen?

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: So
12 we should not be taking temperature readings in
13 kitchens or bathrooms.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, OK.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Um,
16 so we will reiterate that, reinforce that with our
17 staff.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: But
20 we should not be taking the temperature readings in
21 those rooms.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: OK?
24 Great. Ah, Chair, um, with respect to your question
25 about the, the city capital dollars, um, so since the

1
2 mayor's, ah, January 31, um, 2018 press release we
3 have begun, um, replacing the boilers at, as you
4 said, Morris 1, Morris 2, Taft, Cypress Hills,
5 Farragut, Sotomayor, Rheingold, Fiorentino, Long
6 Island Baptist, and Robinson, and we are tracked, we
7 are on track to complete these by 2022. Ah, what has
8 been completed to date - Long Island Baptist,
9 Fiorentino, Robinson, Sotomayor. Um, Taft and
10 Farragut are scheduled to be complete in 2022. And
11 Morris 1, 2, and Morrisania and Rheingold, um,
12 sometime late in 2023. So we're on track right now,
13 um, with respect to the city capital commitment. We
14 can send you this information after the hearing.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

16 Thank you, thank you. Um, OK, inspections. During
17 the February 6, 2018 hearing NYCHA stated that your
18 organization was working on ways to ensure that
19 service tickets were [inaudible], oh, OK. Um, now
20 I'm talking about your communication to the
21 residents. How many NYCHA units are registered with
22 the My NYCHA app?

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

24 Sure. Well, we don't, I don't have the unit count.
25 I do know that we have right now about 112,000 users.

2 And to date since the implementation of the app, um,
3 they have collectively put in about 2 million more
4 tickets.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: 112,000 users
6 on the My NYCHA app. So those...

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
8 Right.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and those
10 are all residents.

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
12 Those are all residents.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, OK. OK,
14 OK. I'm going to stop there. We have been joined by
15 Council Member Salamanca and I do see that our
16 Majority Leader Cumbo has her hand raised. So I'm
17 going to stop there. Audrey?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sure. Um, thanks so
19 much for joining us, Majority Leader. Ah, we'll now
20 turn to questions from you. Ah, in interest of time
21 please keep your questions to five minutes. Ah,
22 following the Majority Leader we will move to
23 questions from Council Member Salamanca.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.
25

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
3 much, and thank you so much, Chair Ampry-Samuel for
4 conducting this very important hearing today. Um, I
5 heard earlier, um, in the testimony the question that
6 was regarding, um, the lowest bidding and discussions
7 around how we always have to pick the lowest bidder,
8 which often doesn't, um, mean that we're getting the
9 greatest quality or the greatest service and the
10 issue around change orders. My question is on this
11 level and many others, I'm seeing during my time in
12 office from the Obama administration to the Trump
13 administration and now we're into the Biden
14 administration, as well as we've had issues now, um,
15 or victories, rather, where, um, the Democrats are in
16 the majority, um, on the federal and state level.
17 What can be done at this critical point right now on
18 branches of government to change those types of
19 policies and practices so that we're not just
20 consistently, um, giving way to the lowest bidders
21 who, um, unfortunately often don't look like our
22 community, don't have, um, you know, we're pushing
23 for this M/WBE dynamic, but if the lowest bidder is
24 who's always going to win, that's not going to allow
25 many of our M/WBEs to win. So my question is for

1
2 that one is there any legislation in place, is there
3 any kind of movement, because I feel like sometimes
4 we get caught in the well this is the way it's always
5 been, it's always been this way, so it's always gonna
6 be this way, or when these changes in, in parties
7 happen do we rush to the boards to try and get some
8 of these things to happen? And can you speak about
9 other federal and state legislation that's on the
10 boards right now that's looking to change some of the
11 policies that have always kept us in this, um, rat
12 wheel of trying to change things?

13 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um, thank you so
14 much, Majority Leader. And this is something that I
15 think we've talked about plenty of times throughout
16 the years, that even when NYCHA gets money oftentimes
17 residents say the quality contractors is not, you
18 know, someone that, um, people feel good about and
19 the work, even when it gets done, you know,
20 oftentimes these people, um, thinking it probably
21 could have been done better. Um, the way to do it
22 better is by changing this, ah, procurement system.
23 And yes, we do have legislation in Albany that would
24 allow us to go with rather than lowest responsive
25 bidder, go with best value. That means the company

1 that, um, comes with the best possible offer that
2 could get the work done in a reasonable amount of
3 time, we would be allowed to, to make the argument
4 that that's the contractor we should go to. In
5 addition, um, in that legislation we also have M/WBE
6 goals because there is no reason why you can't get
7 the best contractors and also make sure that you are
8 also getting, ah, contractors from within the
9 community with strong M/WBE goals. Those things are
10 not opposite. They should be both, you know, the
11 goal of, you know, any agency, um, especially NYCHA.
12 So Senate Bill 6999, um, I talk about this so much
13 that I know it off the top of my head...

14
15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Um-hmm.

16 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: ...um, has those
17 provisions in it, um, and, you know, it's something
18 that we're pushing, um, as well. We have also talked
19 to the sponsors about, 'cause that's a, a massive,
20 40-page bill talking about just taking those things
21 out of that bill and making it separate just on, you
22 know, procurement as well. We're happy out of the
23 way, but we need to, you know, kind of get our arms,
24 you know, that are tied behind our backs right now,
25 untying the, the, you know, untying them and, and

1 know, doesn't happen easy, um, but it's something
2 that we're gonna continue to, um, bring up to, um, we
3 new administration in place, we've been having
4 conversations with them. We've been telling them
5 that this is, you know, really something, without
6 short of giving us money, this is something that, you
7 know, Albany can do, um, to really, really help us
8 get quality work. Um, in addition...

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Let me just say
11 this, Brian, and please remember your thought. This
12 is the type of bill and discussion that needs to be,
13 that our, our constituents, our residents in public
14 housing need to be aware of so that they can push
15 this forward. We have a, a very interesting, what is
16 it, eight months coming up and there are gonna be a
17 lot of people meeting with those constituents. We
18 need for them to be articulate in what they're
19 advocating for and what they're asking for, and they
20 need to be educated about this so that they are
21 asking the right questions and pushing the right
22 agenda for something as important as this, um, we
23 need to be more connected with our brothers and
24 sisters in Albany in pushing this forward and getting

1 this information out to the residents. So I'll,
2
3 please continue.

4 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure, sure. And,
5 and I agree with totally and any...

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

7 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: ...that we can do
8 for the [inaudible] on this we'd be, we'd be happy to
9 do that. Um, and just one last thing, too, that I
10 want to say is your former colleague, um, um,
11 Congressman Torres, too, on the federal level, um,
12 has been working with us to see if we can get a bill
13 nationally to make sure that not only is this
14 something that we can do for NYCHA, but we can do for
15 public housing authorities throughout the country as
16 well.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Can you talk to
18 us a little bit, I'm sorry, can you talk to us just
19 to briefly summarize what, um, I love to say that,
20 Congress Member Ritchie Torres, um, what his bill is,
21 is specifically calling for.

22 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yes. I think his,
23 his bill calls for a more streamlined approach, um,
24 for, ah, procurement and also for allowing public
25 housing authorities to get the best contractors, you

1 know, that are, are possible, not just going with the
2 lowest responsive bidder. Um, again, when you get
3 the lowest you often get what you pay for, and you
4 often get change orders that cause frustration to
5 everyone. It causes frustration especially to the
6 residents, but it causes frustration to the authority
7 as well and it's something that nobody can, nobody
8 likes to see and, ah, and I think it, it erodes
9 trust.
10

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Got it. Thank
12 you so much. Thank you for the extra time, Chair
13 Ampry-Samuel.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I just
15 wanted to just add that a lot of times we see this,
16 um, on a state level and on a federal level where we
17 have a bill where certain components of the bill
18 makes a lot of sense, but in order for, you know,
19 everyone to be satisfied, um, it'll include things
20 that not everybody is, um, on board with. And so
21 this particular public trust bill is something that
22 they've had a, a public hearing on. Um, I want to
23 say it was last year, December.

24 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um-hmm.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 68
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It could have
3 been [inaudible].

4 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yep, it was last
5 December, yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Last year
7 December and, um, on a state level and a lot of the
8 state legislators spoke on their opinion about the
9 bill and, um, other, even city representatives, and
10 the residents are very keyed in to what the language
11 of the bill states because there's been a, a, a
12 public trust conversation tour [laughs] [inaudible]
13 the NYCHA development, and the resident leaders have
14 been very open and vocal about their opinion. And,
15 again, there are some pieces, components to the bill
16 that, that's dynamic and those things that we
17 actually advocated for, um, but, again, we have to
18 continue having conversations with the future of
19 public housing, um, and what is going to happen with
20 the future of public housing and the opportunities
21 for residents to, you know, be owners and have more,
22 you know, a stake and an opinion and input and
23 feedback, and so, um, it's a very interesting bill
24 and complicated [inaudible]. That's it for me. I
25

1
2 mean, I have more questions but I know that Council
3 Member Salamanca's hand is raised.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
5 Salamanca? Excuse me, ah, also just a reminder to
6 other who are present, if you have questions to also
7 use the Zoom raise hand function and we'll call on
8 you. Thanks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.
10 Ah, thank you, Madam Chair. Ah, good morning, um,
11 everyone. Um, first I want to thank you, Madam
12 Chair, on this such an important hearing, um,
13 especially on utilities and preparing for the winter.
14 Um, ah, the Chairwoman, Council Member Ayala and
15 myself, we have the third largest NYCHA portfolio in
16 the City of New York and one of the, when I go around
17 and I speak to my constituents, ah, at Jackson
18 Houses, at Melrose Houses, at Steadman [inaudible]
19 consolidated it's always the same issue when winter
20 is coming. Am I gonna have hot water? Is my boiler
21 is gonna be working. Am I gonna have heat or am I
22 gonna be sleeping with a coat this winter? So my
23 question to, you know, um, um, you guys at NYCHA, um,
24 I'm gonna make about six years now in March as a
25 Council Member and for up to six years every year my

1
2 NYCHA developments at the same locations are having
3 the same issues. What's gonna be so different this
4 winter?

5 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

6 Sure. Council Member, ah, it's Vito. I'll start,
7 um, and then I'll see if Javier wants to, um, add
8 anything. Um, again, I, I think, you know, as we,
9 um, as I testified and as we tried to respond to
10 questions, um, I think we're much better prepared
11 this year than we have been in previous years. Um, a
12 lot of effort went into preparing for this heat
13 season. Um, we, we've, ah, made a number of
14 significant investments. Um, I would love to, to,
15 um, spend some time with you and just talk about your
16 developments, um, and we can go over...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yeah, so I
18 have three minutes. We can do that now. We have
19 three minutes and I would like to do that on the
20 record. Well, what's gonna happen with Steadman
21 [inaudible] Consolidated because for the last five-
22 and-a-half years I've been in office their boilers
23 does not work in the winter and they have no hot
24 water.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

Javier, I'm sorry, do you have information on that particular development?

DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: No, I don't have the details on that particular development. Um, no, I don't. I don't.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: This is the problem. You're always unprepared when it comes to these hearings. You know we're gonna ask you these questions.

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

But, so, with all due respect sir, we, we don't have, ah, the, the plan for every single development in front of us, um, at this point in time. We can certainly share with you, um, the plan for each of your developments, um, but we don't have it prepared for this hearing to talk about every single development and the investments that we've made or are planning to make, right. But I can assure you that, that a lot of effort, um, has gone into, ah, preparing for this heat season, more so than even in previous years.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Council Member

Salamanca, can you, can you name those three again?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Ah, they are
3 Steadman [inaudible] Consolidated, Jackson Houses,
4 and Melrose Houses.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So those three
6 during this hearing right now, we're only asking for
7 three.

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
9 Yes, and we...

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And it's in
11 the same line, it's in the same line of questions,
12 you know, that I had before. What were the issues
13 with the developments from the previous hearing
14 season and knowing that you have all these, you know,
15 amazing statistics, what's happening now, um, because
16 that's, that's kind of a little bit of what, you
17 know.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: And
19 we will do our best to get answers to those, um,
20 specific developments before the end of the hearing.
21 Um, if not we will certainly send you something in
22 writing, um, outlining the plan for these particular
23 developments. But we'll do our best to try to get
24 the information before the end of the hearing.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: What's your
3 policy on winterizing the boilers?

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I'm
5 sorry, winterizing boilers?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: The boilers,
7 every year, you know, like when, if someone owns a
8 home you get someone in to come and check your
9 boiler, check your pipes, and ensure that they're
10 working. What is your policy to doing this at NYCHA
11 developments?

12 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
13 Sure. And I'll just start and then I'll definitely
14 hand it off to Javier. Um, so as I mentioned
15 earlier, um, we actually started our preparation for
16 this heat season last February. Um, we took
17 advantage of some of the warmer, ah, days and we
18 started doing our, um, inspections. Um, Javier will
19 talk more specifically about that. Um, I, I do want
20 to, again, thank the, the federal monitor, um,
21 because they really have been tremendous partners in,
22 in helping us prepare for this heat season. Um, and
23 they have staff that are out there, um, every day,
24 um, along with our staff doing inspections of the
25 heating plants, finding, um, issues, sending us

1 reports and pictures. It really has been a
2 tremendous value, so I do want to thank them publicly
3 for that. Um, Javier, if you could please speak to
4 the council member, um, about the preparedness and
5 what you do.

7 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So, um, preparedness
8 involves our, ah, annual, ah, overhaul and inspection
9 process that we perform on the, on the boilers. And
10 what we do is we take them apart, open them up, ah,
11 clean them internally and externally, lubricate them,
12 and replace the worn parts, and make any follow-up
13 repairs that are required on that piece of equipment.
14 Um, then...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

16 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Sorry. Once the
17 staff is done with that process [inaudible] advisor
18 comes out, inspects that work to do a sort of like a
19 QA inspection on it, and point out any other areas
20 that require additional follow-up. The additional
21 follow-up could be, ah, a piece of pipe that may need
22 to be replaced, ah, an equalizer line that, that, ah,
23 houses the water, ah, leveling devices on the boiler,
24 or it could be boiler welding, welding on that, ah,
25 boiler that needs to be done, for which we have

1
2 contractors to, ah, do. Um, and then once that
3 follow-up is done the boiler is put back on line. It
4 gets hydrostatic and tested and, ah, a team of burner
5 mechanics comes out and does a combustion analysis on
6 our larger boilers to ensure that it's running
7 efficient, and then it's put back on line.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Madam Chair,
9 may I ask a quick follow-up question? Thank you.
10 Um, so, ah, thank you, ah, Javier. Ah, so my
11 question is this, this maintenance work is performed
12 to every boiler at every NYCHA development in the
13 City of New York?

14 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Yes, yes
15 [inaudible].

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Once a year
17 this is done.

18 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Once a year, yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And this is
20 documented, like we can sit down one day and, and,
21 and I can go visit and you can, you can, you can show
22 me with documentation that every boiler in the City
23 of New York once a year gets maintenance?

24 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: We, we have a p.m.,
25 ah, work order that the staff [inaudible].

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: All right.

3 Um, and then my last question is how many boiler, how
4 many boilers do we have in, in, in total for all
5 NYCHA developments?

6 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Ah, just give me one
7 minute. Bear with me, OK?

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: While Javier is
9 looking for that, Council Member, I do have an update
10 on at least one of the three developments that you
11 mentioned, Jackson. All right, that is in phase 1 of
12 the state funded, um, projects. It's in design, it's
13 design build. Um, so we'll get back to you with, ah,
14 a more solid date, um, when we expect completion.
15 But that one is funded and it is in the pipeline.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: OK.

17 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Hi, hello, can you
18 hear me?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes, yes.

20 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: I want to answer
21 your question. So, um, conventional boilers, to the
22 larger boilers we have 600, I'm sorry, 710. Um, and
23 the smaller package boilers are, we have 642. I'm
24 sorry, my math was a little bit off. Just give me
25 one minute. A total of 1852 boilers is we have.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: OK. All
3 right. All right. Well, I, um, I, I look, I will
4 look forward to the follow-up and the, and the
5 follow-up on the questions that I have regarding my
6 three NYCHA developments that every year, um, suffer
7 from having access to hot water and heat during the
8 winter seasons. Thank you, Madam Chair, for allowing
9 me to speak.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just real
11 quick, um, Council Member Salamanca. You're OK with
12 any follow-up at all with Jackson, that they're in a
13 design build process [inaudible]?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I mean, he,
15 he can tell me it's on a pipeline, we all know what
16 the pipeline means at NYCHA, you know, it's, it's
17 probably back on a curve for, you know, for some
18 time. But I'll, I'll let them, I'll, I'll allow them
19 to follow our property.

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: If
21 I can add to, we just took a look at last year's, um,
22 heat outages. Ah, for Stebbins-Hewitt there were two
23 unplanned heat outages, um, lasting 10 hours. That
24 was last heat season. Melrose had two unplanned heat
25

1 outages, restored within 5.8 hours. And Jackson we
2 did not have any unplanned heat outages last year.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: OK. Thank
5 you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, so, so,
7 um, I know you're [inaudible] I understand that. But
8 just real quick, um, Vito, because those are the
9 issues that we have in the district, across the
10 district, and I keep hearing it over and over and
11 over. It may not be the development but it's those
12 individual apartments. Could it be an issue where,
13 um, there's a problem with like a piping and getting
14 to an individual apartment, 'cause I hear from the
15 same residents every year, and it's been an ongoing
16 issue and, and Brian knows my issue in Brownsville
17 Houses with those same individual unique apartments.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

19 Chair, um, absolutely. There could be, um, issues
20 within the apartment. I mean, what we're talking
21 about really here is, um, we're replacing the heating
22 plants, um, and what we need to kind of focus on, um,
23 and, and have been focused on is all the ancillary
24 parts to the system, right, the distribution system
25 in particular, right. And so, yes, the heating

1 plant, new heating plants are fantastic. Um, but we
2 need to, um, get a focus on, on how do we distribute
3 the heat from the heating plant to the apartment.
4 And that's gonna require major capital, um,
5 investment. Ah, it means going to every apartment,
6 ah, replacing, um, steam lines, right, ah, it's a,
7 it's a major undertaking. Um, you know, going back
8 to the integrated IVR system that has really helped
9 us identify the issues that you're talking about,
10 right, very specific to and you need [inaudible]
11 apartments, right. Um, oftentimes it's nothing more
12 than replacing a radiator valve, um, or a steam
13 valve, right, um, which, which has helped us
14 tremendously. Um, but, again, the reality of it is,
15 is that we need, um, in excess of 70 billion dollars,
16 right, we need to actually go in and replace, um, the
17 infrastructure of our buildings. Ah, the
18 distribution point from the heating plant to the
19 delivery in the apartment.
20

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: You said 7-0,
22 7-0?

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: 70,
24 70 billion, I think is right, and correct if I'm
25 wrong.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How did we go
3 from, we went from 38 billion, now we have 70 billion
4 already?

5 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, the, um,
6 we're, we're still at 40, but the, ah, the national
7 number, ah, the national number is 70 billion. Ah...

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]

9 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, yeah.

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
11 Yeah, we need, we need more. We need a lot of money
12 [laughs].

13 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: [laughs] Vito's
14 got big plans. He's got big...

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
16 Yeah, leave me alone. I just have, of course I do.
17 I would love to see all of our systems replaced.

18 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So true, yep.

19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Ah,
20 Chair, Chair, while I have the opportunity, um, I did
21 tell you that I would get back to you on a question
22 that you asked me. I do have the information now.
23 Um, so, it has to do with the My NYCHA app.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes.

1
2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Um,
3 I could give you some quick numbers. Um, so
4 currently we have 111,855 distinct users, right,
5 representing 92,756 unique apartments. That's an
6 increase over the same time last year. Last year at
7 the same time we had 102,820 users, right, and they
8 processed 86,820, um, unique apartments. So we're
9 doing much better. Um, we're getting more residents
10 to sign up for My NYCHA app. Ah, we've made a number
11 of systems upgrades to My NYCHA app. It does provide
12 for real time, um, updates on, on issues. Ah, so we
13 encourage all of our residents, um, it's fantastic
14 that we're up to almost 112,000. We'd like to see
15 all of our residents, um, sign up for My NYCHA app.
16 So the more that we can all do to encourage folks to
17 do that, ah, it's, it's been a, it's fantastic tool.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, thanks for
19 that information. So we're moving on to third-party
20 vendors. During the February 6, 2018, hearing, um,
21 Property Management, the chief of staff of Property
22 Management, Kathy Pennington at the time, stated that
23 the transfer of, the transfer of 69 developments to a
24 third-party management system would enable NYCHA
25 staff to increase focus on the remaining boilers in

2 the portfolio. So today how many boiler rooms are
3 managed by a third-party vendor?

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
5 Javier?

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The number and
7 percentages.

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
9 Sure.

10 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Right now it's, um,
11 ah, 53 in total that are managed. Ah, and we have
12 two third-party contractors. The first one is
13 National Grid. They have, um, 30 boiler rooms and
14 the second one is [inaudible], they have 23.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
16 That's as of today, Chair. Ah, we are looking to see
17 if we gained in efficiency, um, by assigning some
18 additional heating plants to those two vendors, but
19 that's where we stand as of today.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, that's
21 what percentage of your buildings?

22 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Um, wow, I would
23 have to do the math somehow.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just quick.
25 OK.

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

3 While Javier does that, I think it's important to
4 note, too, that even though we did move these, um,
5 heating plants over to third-party, um, conversely we
6 also increased our head count, right, so it's not as
7 if we reduced our, ah, in-house, um, staffing levels.
8 We've actually increased our in-house staffing
9 levels. So we reallocated those staff to, um, other
10 developments, but we also increased our staffing.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

12 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Javier, Javier, do you
13 have the percentages?

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It's
15 [inaudible].

16 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: It's going to take a
17 while.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Moving away
19 from that.

20 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Sorry.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um, looking at
22 last heat season how many heat and hot water orders
23 and outages were in developments that were under a
24 third-party management system?
25

1
2 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Um, very good
3 question. Overall, um, they had a total, now this
4 is, ah, total heat work orders. Total amount of, ah,
5 work orders was 51,265. That's both heat and hot
6 water. 36,948 were for heat and 14,317 were for hot
7 water.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And can
9 you explain how does NYCHA track the performance of a
10 third-party vendor? And how do you compare that,
11 like the boiler room is managed by the third party to
12 the boiler rooms that are managed by NYCHA?

13 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So the, the way we
14 try to start with the way we track it versus, we, we
15 track it the same way we track ours. Maximo and,
16 and, ah, the two key performance indicators the I
17 mentioned earlier, Maximo and, and CHAS alarms. Um,
18 these developments are subject to that as well.
19 Residents can make work orders, just like they can at
20 any other development, so naturally we see a spike in
21 the work orders at any of these sites, then we're
22 gonna ask the vendor what's going on, and if we see a
23 CHAS alarm they also, the vendor, being they, they
24 also get the CHAS alarm and, and they know to respond
25 to a CHAS alarm. When we don't see a response we, we

1 communicate with those vendors, ah, direct them. So
2 we, we, we track their performance the same way we
3 track...
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How long is
6 the wait time between, like looking to see the
7 response and then saying OK, let's just step in.

8 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Well, we, we, we, we
9 look for something within the hour from...

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh.

11 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: ...from that. And if
12 we do see a spike in the work orders to my, to my
13 heat desk, as I said before the heat desk operations
14 24 hours a day, and so when we do see a spike we, we
15 communicate with them right away. Um, it's also
16 important to point out that, ah, during the normal
17 course of the day when we see a spike we'll
18 communicate with Property Management first to confirm
19 that there's, that there's an issue. After hours
20 then we're communicating with the third-party vendors
21 and we're using our roving times to, ah, to, to also
22 confirm that there is a problem at those sites. So,
23 um, when we communicate with the, ah, development
24 staff during the normal course of the day, that's
25 8:00 to 4:30 and they find an issue we, we require

1 that vendor to be there within that hour. And
2 normally they are 'cause they're, they're either
3 within the area or, or within that [inaudible].

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK, OK.

5 So when someone shows up to the apartment to do a
6 check can you just explain what that looks like? So
7 is it a, a member of the third-party vendor team and
8 a member of your team? What, what does that look
9 like?
10

11 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: So the way, the way
12 that works, um, it's Property Management staff that,
13 um, visit the apartment. The third-party vendor does
14 not visit the apartment. They manage and maintain
15 the equipment in the basement and in the boiler room.
16 Um, but let me, let me just point out that before we
17 went into the third-party agreement with the
18 contractor and, and provided them with the portfolio
19 that they have, we ensure that the development staff
20 is training them on what to look for when they go
21 into an apartment and, and inspect the, ah, ah,
22 working off of a work order that was generated by,
23 ah, the resident, a heat complaint, in this instance.
24 Train them on what to look for and, and how to, ah,
25 correct any condition that's related to the in-unit

1
2 equipment. And once that's done if the program does
3 not, um, correct or the problem is bigger than just
4 the apartment, then the vendor gets involved. And at
5 that point if there's a service disruption that's
6 related to the equipment then we create the, the, ah,
7 service disruption outage work order [inaudible].

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. So,
9 um, and, and that, that, ah, that infamous question
10 about the, the log books in the boiler room. Um, can
11 you just speak a little bit to who, like what's
12 happening now with those, the log books in the boiler
13 room, who's writing in the log books, and, um, and
14 does NYCHA have plans to replace the boiler log
15 books with the hand-held devices, technology,
16 moderate technology?

17 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: That's, that's,
18 that's three questions in, in that one, ah,
19 statement. So we'll, we'll start with who, who, ah,
20 writes in the log book. Anyone that visits the
21 boiler room writes in the log book, primarily the,
22 the, ah, boiler operator. That's the individual
23 that's in the plant that's there to perform the
24 safety checks and all the [inaudible] that must be
25 recorded in that, ah, boiler room, ah, log, right?

1
2 And then you're, you're second part of your question
3 is, um, related to whether or not we're gonna move
4 away from the log book, is that right? Did I
5 understand that right?

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes, but going
7 back to the log book, too, just, um, like when we're
8 talking about in the context of a third-party vendor
9 and who's doing what, just trying to get a sense of,
10 um, so the information is given to the Property
11 Management staff for the person that's working for
12 like a NYCHA employee? Is that the only person
13 that's touching the log book, or?

14 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Well, with the
15 third-party, ah, vendor their, their staff, their
16 boiler operators are the ones that are writing in the
17 log book.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh.

19 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: And, and as I said
20 before anyone that visits that boiler room for
21 whatever reason, whether they're just perform a, a,
22 a visual inspection or, or checking up on, on, on an
23 employee that might be working in the boiler room
24 also has to record the reason for them being in that,
25 in that boiler room in the log book [inaudible].

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

3 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

4 Chair, when I go to a boiler room the staff asks me
5 to sign the log book as well, right, and the book is
6 required, um, by both local as well as state
7 regulation.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK, OK. I
9 was just, I was just wondering, you know, just as you
10 were talking remembering that...

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

12 Right.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the, the
14 data and information that's being put into the log
15 book and transcribing that into the Maximo system or,
16 you know, if there's just, just conversations around
17 that.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

19 Sure. Well, a lot of the information resides in both
20 places, so obviously if it's related to a repair, um,
21 then it's in Maximo as well. But, again, the log
22 books are required, um, and we just confirmed again,
23 um, that at both the local as well as the state
24 level, um, they, they are still required.

25 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I
3 actually have a bound book in the, in the boiler
4 room.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Um, and
6 I'm just gonna note here, too, that, um, going back
7 to the conversation around the individual apartments
8 and the possibility of just needing to replace a
9 valve or, you know, just trying to figure out, ah,
10 why those individual apartments may not have heat and
11 hot water. Um, if you look at Florentino,
12 Florentino, as an example, um, Florentino received
13 new boilers, right?

14 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
15 Right.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But no valves
17 in the apartments, and because the windows are old
18 and lack insulation the fact that they have a new
19 boiler doesn't necessarily, I mean it's, it's good,
20 it's needed, but it may not help the individual, um,
21 residents and the individual apartments actually feel
22 the new boilers because of all those other issues in
23 the, in the apartments.

24 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
25 Precisely.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And so then
3 goes, I guess, back to what you were all saying
4 around you have the boilers, but you have all these
5 other issues related to it, and I just wanted to
6 point out Florentino as one of those, and the fact
7 that Florentino is listed as one of the developments,
8 ah, for direct funding and to address those issues,
9 um, [inaudible] everything else [inaudible].

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
11 Sure. We, we will get this as a, um, both the
12 windows as well as the, ah, the valves in the
13 apartments and we'll get back to you. I appreciate
14 that. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Anything
16 like just your level of expertise and experience to
17 speak to Florentino? I mean, that's doing kind of
18 investigative research for just your experiences and
19 to say, OK, well, if we had this, you know, the
20 families, they would have no complaints.

21 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I think
22 Florentino's, oh sorry.

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: No,
24 No, go ahead.

1
2 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Florentino, I
3 think, as you know, council members, is a very high
4 needs development. Ah, ah, the capital needs are
5 very high and that, that is why, um, we are looking
6 to transfer it over to PACT. Um, it, um, you know,
7 has issues from the roof to the windows to, you know,
8 the, if you see there is scaffolding, so there are
9 brick issues there, um, as well as the heating
10 system. Um, it's just a, it's lot, it's a small
11 development with a lot of needs.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, 'cause you
13 seem, so if you have this major, again, so the
14 boilers are needed, right, that major investment is
15 needed. Um, but just trying to figure out what else
16 so that the family inside that unit or that
17 development could feel, um, this massive investment
18 in the building. And so is there a need to have, um,
19 if you replace the boilers for there to be a
20 weatherization contract at the same time because you
21 know that, that would address that one concern?

22 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I think, I think
23 is the frustration over the way we've looked at
24 capital, um, because the way we get money, right? So
25 we get money to replace like one thing. We get money

1
2 to replace boilers, or we get money to replace roofs,
3 or we get money to replace, you know, do brick work.
4 Um, but really what is needed is to comprehensively
5 take care of the issues at a development, ah, in
6 order for the folks in Florentino to say like we feel
7 confident that you're not gonna have issues is by
8 taking care of all of those things, right? And so
9 when we're looking at the federal money that we
10 possibly could be getting, we're not going to be
11 looking at, you know, doing one component at a time.
12 We're gonna be looking at, you know, addressing all
13 of those, all those issues and then we can feel
14 confident that, you know, saying that, yes, when we
15 get a new boiler you're also gonna have new windows
16 and you're also gonna have, ah, a roof that is, you
17 know, in good shape, um, and so the building is gonna
18 hold the heat in, um, and you're not gonna have, you
19 know, the new boiler acting well, um, but it's going
20 out the window, literally.

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
22 Which goes back to our big need.

23 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um-hmm, yes, all,
24 all roads lead to [inaudible].

25

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, all right.

3 Um, thank you. Now I'd like to have like a, an
4 example. Um, we have been joined by Council Member
5 Gibson. Um, so moving into gas outages. How many
6 gas outages are currently active on NYCHA, right now?

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: As
8 of today?

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: As of today.

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: We
11 have 61 gas outages, um, that are impacting, we have
12 61 gas outages impacting 2454 apartments. Now when I
13 say gas outage, Chair, um, it could either be, um,
14 again an apartment, ah, in one case, ah, a line of
15 apartments, a building, um, and I don't believe we
16 have any full developments. Um, but we do have
17 buildings, ah, that the entire building is currently
18 experiencing a gas outage.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And, um, when
20 you say 61 outages, across how many developments is
21 that? We'll, we'll, we're getting that [inaudible]
22 right now.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. Um,
24 and what is the, so I know there are different types

1 of gas outages, so what is the main cause of gas
2 outages right now? What's the main cause?
3

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

5 Sure. I will start and I will ask, ah, Cal Bruno to
6 jump in, um, and assist here. I mean, basically, um,
7 Chair, what we're looking at, it's a gas leak, um,
8 that's been reported either to us, ah, to the utility
9 company, or to the fire department and, and because
10 of the age of our buildings and most of our gas pipes
11 are, are still the original gas pipes, um, it's,
12 it's, um, impossible to isolate where the leak is
13 with the shut-off valve. Um, so it would require
14 them a shut-off of the entire building. Um, if there
15 is a valve, um, for a riser then we're able to
16 isolate to a line of apartments, right, and then also
17 there is the Local Law 152, um, that was passed that
18 requires all owners to do inspections of their gas
19 lines every four years and, um, a number of our
20 current outages are related to Local Law 152
21 inspections, which are proactive inspection, right,
22 um, so we actually have a, a contractor that performs
23 these inspections for us. Um, if they detect, ah, a
24 gas leak, um, and we have a, a period of time to, ah,
25 to respond to, um, or if we can't, um, isolate the

1
2 leak then we have to do a shut-down. So right now of
3 the, um, total number of gas outages, um, 10 of those
4 are due to Local Law 152 inspections.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And when you
6 have those, the, the ones related to the local law
7 inspections, um, what's the timeframe of there being
8 a gas outage if there's nothing, um, if there are no
9 flags, ah, from that outage, or, you know, that was,
10 that would require you to trigger something else?

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
12 Yeah, sure. Cal, do you want to speak, um, to the
13 chair's question about the...

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And just a, a
15 picture...

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
17 Sure.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do the
19 inspections usually lead to [laughs].

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
21 Yeah, absolutely.

22 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Sure.

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Cal
24 could give you the details, and, and Chair, I'm
25 sorry, before, ah, Cal jumps in, um, you asked the

1 number of developments impacted. There are 51
2 developments, um, that currently have, ah, gas
3 outages.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And the 61
6 outages represent 51 developments?

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
8 Correct.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

10 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Sure, so, to, in
11 response to your question, so as, as we're doing
12 Local Law, ah, 152 inspections and there's, ah, any
13 evidence of leak, whether it's smelled, ah, or, or
14 something that leads us to testing it right away, we
15 immediately shut down for safety purposes, right. So
16 any, any leak at all, whether it's a single riser, an
17 apartment and/or building gets shut down. So the
18 inspections, this proactive approach, has helped us
19 really look at other conditions that are not leaking
20 that allow us to make other kind of repairs to
21 prevent leaks. But we've experienced 10 active leaks
22 that we've shut down and where, you know, treated
23 once it's shut down like any other gas leak, because
24 it's gas and because of the utmost attention it gets
25 because of safety, you know, we immediately shut

1 down. We, we, we isolate the line and then we go to
2 a series of steps, ah, to start to test and repair
3 and replace the pipes and then we test them once
4 again before we restore the gas.

5
6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, so
7 purposes of the residents being able to, and also my
8 colleagues, um, understanding the, the, the
9 difference in how, um, gas can be restored, can you
10 just go through, um, just the timeline because some
11 restorations will take six months and some can be,
12 um, 90 days or, or three weeks. So can you explain
13 what happens?

14 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah. I'm gonna
15 just go through like the series of steps pretty much
16 the way it happens for all gas outs and then if
17 there's any specific questions, you know, I'll, I'll
18 be more than happy to answer them. Basically, it
19 starts with a smell of gas is reported and it gets
20 investigated. So then either the gas line or the
21 entire building, if necessary, is shut down. Um,
22 scope, a scope of work is created by our plumbing
23 supervisors and they're sent to what, we have a
24 licensed master plumber that handles all the
25 oversight and all the filing related to any, any gas

1 work. The licensed master plumber prepares an
2 asbestos scope of work and gives it our asbestos
3 investigation unit. Our asbestos investigation...

4
5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Stop right
6 there, timelines.

7 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yep.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So timelines.
9 Smell gas, triggers this inspection. Um, what's the
10 timeline between the, they smell the gas and then
11 inspector coming out to do the research.

12 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Right, so any, any
13 work order or any report of smell gas is considered
14 an emergency. We have supervisors, maintenance
15 workers at every development. Those folks go out
16 immediately to investigate, immediately, right. Ah,
17 once they confirm it's a leak they isolate the line,
18 line, on the spot. They either shut down a valve if
19 it's available to that riser that's leaker and if not
20 they'll shut down the whole building. They
21 immediately isolate the line and then they, ah, call
22 our supervisor plumbers to come and isolate it even
23 better. They either separate or lock it down to make
24 sure that nothing can happen until testing and
25 repairs are made.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

3 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

4 Councilwoman, if I can, I think to your question,
5 too, um, so for 2021, um, we've been averaging 96
6 days to restore gas with this, um, from the time of
7 an outage. Ah, that's down from last year where the
8 average was 116 days. Ah, but as Cal's, you know,
9 talking about, it's a very...

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, but

11 that's, so, so, and that's, so, so Cal was just, so
12 he stopped at the inspection part, right, and then
13 was gonna go into, um, the process...

14 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

15 Where he can go through the whole process.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah, so I

17 wanted to get that understanding, um, because when
18 you just said average time 96 days, again, sometimes
19 it will be three months, sometimes it will be six
20 months, right? And then we have residents that's,
21 that's, you know, complaining about a little more,
22 and so, um...

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

24 Sure, so right now...

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 101
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...[inaudible]
3 but I'm just trying to get a sense of what's the
4 difference.

5 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
6 Right, and if I can, before Cal goes back to the
7 process, of the 61 that we have right now only two of
8 them are over six months, um, and both of them have
9 passed DOB inspection, so we hope to have the
10 services restored, um, in, in a few days. So those
11 are the outliers. That's not the norm.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

13 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: On
14 average, on average it's about three months, right.
15 But, Cal, sorry, please go back to the process.

16 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah, and some of
17 the factors that affect the time it takes to restore
18 is, of course, the size of the building, right, so
19 how many residents live there. The more, the bigger
20 the building the more pipe you have to replace, the
21 more residents you have to access to get into
22 apartments. It's also the asbestos investigation
23 that gets performed. Sometimes you have to actually
24 do abatement, so that adds another step. You have to
25 do the abatement before you can start replacing the

1
2 pipes. Um, so definitely the size of the, ah,
3 building and number of residents that live there, the
4 asbestos investigation, and then sometimes it's
5 really the configuration of the pipe, ah, itself can
6 add additional time in order to replace it.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

8 [inaudible] as an example.

9 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: I'm sorry?

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Let's talk
11 about, I was gonna say this now, I was gonna say, um,
12 Park, what's, what's the one, um, Brian? 1636 Park
13 Place?

14 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Is it the?

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I'm
16 sorry, which one are you?

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I think it's,
18 um, is that Park Rock?

19 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Park Rock is, yes.
20 Park Rock, yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I think it's
22 1634 Park Place.

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
24 Park Rock, right? Don't see any current gas outages.

2 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It's in Langston,
3 Langston Hughes? Langston Hughes had a very long
4 outage, too.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]

6 VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: One second, let me
7 just look. One second.

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

9 Again, right now the oldest outage that we have, um,
10 is impacting three apartments at, ah, Brook Allen,
11 and, again, that passed inspection, um, so we do
12 expect that that should be restored, um, shortly.
13 That's the oldest gas outage that we have. And, and
14 three, three apartments are, are involved in it.
15 Chair, I, I just wanted through Cal, what Cal
16 described to [inaudible].

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Promise,
18 promise.

19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
20 Absolutely.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Promise.

22 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: It
23 requires that we get into every apartment multiple
24 times. Um, so there's a lot of coordination that
25 needs to happen with our residents and we work

1
2 closely with our team leadership. Ah, we work
3 closely with Property Management. And, again, it
4 does really require, um, multiple access. I'm sorry,
5 Crown Heights. The only gas outage that I see right
6 now, Crown Heights, 1646 Park Place, right. It's one
7 building, 25 apartments, and the gas outage was
8 reported on September 7. I think there was a broken
9 gas valve in an apartment that resulted in the gas
10 outage. It is currently assigned to a vendor. I, I
11 can get you more details on, on when we expect to
12 have service [inaudible].

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thanks. So,
14 um, you, you'll get back to me on the details, but I
15 just, so can you, um, can you just explain, um, that
16 process? So they called September 7, there was a gas
17 outage. I know the apartment. Um, there was a, an
18 issue. She actually called the fire department,
19 someone came in. They closed it, and so just, they
20 had to shut down the entire line, right. And...

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: It
22 looks like, yes. Go ahead, Cal.

23 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah, I was gonna
24 say the process in, in general, and it would apply
25 there, too, but we can provide the specifics if, you

1 know, given a little time, is that once we shut, we
2 make the line safe by shutting it down and isolating
3 it. Then we, we have to, ah, we work with our
4 asbestos unit to go out and do an asbestos
5 investigation. If there's any abatement that's
6 needed they perform the abatement and then let us
7 know everything is clear to do physical work, ah, to
8 the gas line. If no abatement is needed, they, they
9 provide us that information and then we, we file, ah,
10 the work with the Department of Buildings. Ah, we
11 request a permit. That usually happens immediately.
12 That, that's never our slowdown. Once we get the
13 permit we can physically do the work, right? We've
14 gotten clearance that there's no asbestos that we're
15 gonna impact. Ah, we've gotten the Department of
16 Buildings permit. Now we start the physical work.
17 So now we access the, the units. You know, we put
18 out notices. We, ah, conduct meetings to make
19 everyone aware of the work that we want to do, and we
20 actually physically replace the line, the gas line,
21 in each, in each unit. Um, in doing so we obviously
22 disconnect the stoves, ah, to start, and then we put
23 a whole new line in and once that line has been
24 completed, um, what we do then is we pretest to make
25

1
2 sure that that line that we just installed that it's,
3 it's holding pressure, there's no leak. Once we're
4 satisfied with, with that pretest we then, ah, we
5 work with the Department of Buildings and they come
6 out and they do a DOB inspection. Upon passing their
7 inspection they give us authorization to turn on the
8 gas. We then work with the utility company...

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So how long
10 does it take to get the DOB to come in and inspect
11 from, from just an average timeframe?

12 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
13 DOB, um, they're out there.

14 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
16 We've had no delays at all.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: The
19 [inaudible]

20 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah, I would say
21 that's a matter of days.

22 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: The
23 buildings department have been fantastic partner.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.
25

2 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah, that, that's
3 a matter of days.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

5 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Um, so when we...

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
7 Yeah, at best, at best.

8 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Yeah. Then we
9 work with the utility company. They come out. They
10 do, ah, their own inspection. Ah, and then once,
11 once everything is passed with utility, ah, utility
12 department inspections they actually turn the gas on
13 and then our plumbers reconnect stoves, ah, and at
14 that point...

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So is it a
16 utility company?

17 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: I'm sorry?

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, so there
19 it is. Is it the, the utility company? Is that the
20 timeframe that's taking so long?

21 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: No, I mean, it, it
22 varies because every different component takes a
23 number of days. There's several tests that are done.
24 So I wouldn't say it's always one particular area.
25 Again, it, it depends on the size of the building,

1 depends on the complexity, ah, and configuration of
2 the piping, um, and it also depends, obviously, on
3 your ability to get in and do several different
4 things in the residents' apartments. You, you're
5 getting in to disconnect the stove. You're getting
6 in to run new piping. You're getting in to do the
7 pretest at times, and then you're getting with the
8 utility company 'cause they like to spot check some
9 of the apartments and then finally you're getting in
10 again, ah, to reconnect the stoves. So we really
11 require the resident to be home, you know, three,
12 four times during these process, and so that, all
13 that takes time. Ah, not, not that I want to say,
14 you know, none of this is something that the resident
15 could help, but it just takes time and that's what
16 adds to the days, you know, and, and going back to
17 the configuration, when you're doing whole buildings
18 there's, there's times that, you know, pipes run
19 through basements and runs through different rooms,
20 so sometimes that adds a little bit of time because
21 you're changing all the piping.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. I was,
24 um, the reason why I mention, um, Crown Heights is
25 because it's a four-story walkup old tenement

1 building, so it's not like a massive development like
2 Langston Hughes that Brian mentioned, um, a few
3 minutes ago that's 20-something stories, you know?
4 Um, so I just was trying to get a understanding of,
5 you know, we have the same timeframe and you have a
6 short walkup, that's a very small development, tall
7 building unit.
8

9 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Right. So, so the
10 physical work is less...

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]

12 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: Right, so I'm
13 sorry. So the physical work is less 'cause you have
14 to change less piping, obviously, right, so that's,
15 that's, that's, there's time savings there. But all
16 the other steps, the preinspection, the DOB
17 inspection, the inspection with the utility company,
18 and all that, all that is still time-consuming and
19 all that happens regardless of the size.

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

21 Right, and the asbestos investigation.

22 VICE PRESIDENT BRUNO: And if there's
23 asbestos need to be abated you gotta include that.
24 Also, in some of our buildings, not, not a lot, are
25 small. Because of the configuration some of the

1
2 pipes sometimes are actually inside the wall, so
3 that's call concealed. They're concealed piping.
4 What we like to do if we come across that is we
5 actually core drill and, ah, put the piping in a new
6 location to make it easier to inspect and to access.
7 So we've also come across, although it's, it's
8 something that only happens rather rarely, that the
9 pipes are actually concealed in some of our older
10 constructions and we place them outside to, you know,
11 future access and reference and, and inspections, and
12 that also adds, ah, another step to the process.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And the,
14 the next, so when I speak to the National Grid like
15 about Crown Heights, um, I'm told that they're always
16 ready to go in, um, and do whatever it is that they
17 need to do from their side, but it's DOE, I mean it's
18 DOB, and, um, NYCHA plumbers that are always the hold
19 up. And so I'm just trying to get a understanding
20 of...

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
22 Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...you know,
24 how to streamline and, you know, how to put some
25 policies in place to help with the...

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

3 Sure.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the

5 progress.

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

7 Yeah, I mean, we'll certainly have that conversation

8 with Nat Grid. I mean, I was on a call with Con

9 Edison last week. Um, that doesn't seem to be the

10 same, ah, issue with Con Edison. Certainly DOB is

11 not a delay at all. Um, they've been fantastic, and

12 in fact the Commissioner has even offered, um, you

13 know, for some of these [inaudible], ah, to come out

14 on, on a day's notice, ah, to meet...

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Wow.

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

17 ...our plumbers out there. Um, yeah, so they,

18 they've been great partners. Um, Nat Grid, um, we'll

19 have a conversation with them similar to the

20 conversation we had with Con Edison. Ah, ending

21 with...

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]

23 just let me know. What, what do you think, just from

24 your expertise and your just being in this field for

1
2 so many years and hearing the concerns and the
3 complaints? What, like what are we doing wrong?

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

5 Chair, with, I, I think, um, you know, three months
6 average, I mean, for the, for the resident, it's
7 three months too long, right. On average that's
8 about what we, when I was at HPD, um, I remember
9 dealing with, ah, privately owned buildings that had
10 gas outages that far exceeded the 20 months. Um,
11 again, as Cal indicated, it's a very labor-intensive
12 process. I think we're doing well. Ah, I think we
13 can certainly do better. Ah, the good thing about
14 when we're doing the gas repipes, um, is that we
15 should not see, ah, if there is, God forbid, a gas
16 leak in any of those buildings in the future part of
17 our scope of work is we're installing shut-off
18 valves, right so we can isolate where the leaks are.
19 Um, you know, we don't have to shut down a complete
20 building. So we're being smart about the work that
21 we do, um, in response to, to a gas outage. Um,
22 again, I'm going to go back to our big ask, the
23 billions. You know, I would love to be able to say
24 that, that we have the funds to come in and, and do a
25 full gas repipe with every building, because, again,

1
2 most of our buildings have the original piping in
3 them. Um, so that's like if you're asking my wish
4 list, ah, that's on my wish list.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. OK. Um,
6 and I'm good. I'm done with, moving on. Thank you
7 so much about the gas. Moving quickly to, ah,
8 electrical outages.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Before we, ah, excuse
10 me, Chair. Ah, just before we move into this next
11 set of questions I just wanted to, um, say a quick
12 reminder to the members of the public that are
13 waiting. Thank you so much for your patience. Ah,
14 we will, ah, um, we will turn to you for your
15 testimony as soon as the questions with the
16 administration have concluded. Thank you all.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.
18 Electrical outages. How many electrical outages
19 occurred in NYCHA in 2020?

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
21 Electrical outages - 23. I'm sorry, Chair
22 [inaudible].

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, wait, no,
24 before, before we go to electrical outages, one last
25

1 comment, you can comment on this, um, what do you
2 provide their residents when there is a gas outage?

3
4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Oh,
5 certainly. So historically we have only given
6 residents hot plates, um, which make no sense because
7 you can't cook a meal on a hot plate. Um, starting
8 last April, um, we started purchasing slow cookers as
9 well. Ah, and in fact we've purchased over 10,000
10 slow cookers to date. Ah, and I want to thank one of
11 our [inaudible] residents who gave us that idea. Um,
12 she, she did it, um, for some of the residents when
13 they experienced a gas outage and I thought it was
14 fantastic. Um, so now we provide our residents with
15 both, ah, a hot plate as well as slow cooker. So you
16 can prepare a full meal. Um, hot plates are
17 generally delivered the same day or day after, um,
18 again, depending on access. Um, and then the slow
19 cookers, um, follow, um, but we're providing both.
20 We also provide residents with, um, other services.
21 Our, um, family partnership and resident engagement,
22 ah, do outreach. Ah, what we try to do is, um, you
23 know, if a resident, um, receives Meals on Wheels,
24 um, we'll work with our partners at DFTA to increase
25 the, ah, food delivery. If a resident qualifies but

1
2 is not signed up we encourage them to sign up. Ah,
3 we also work with our partners at HRA, ah, to
4 increase allowances for those residents that are, um,
5 likely receiving assistance from HRA. Ah, and we
6 also provide residents with a number of other, ah,
7 sources where they can, um, you know, food resources,
8 pantries and the like, um, so, so there's a lot of
9 interaction, um, ah, with our residents and, and I
10 think the slow cookers, again, I, I want to thank on
11 of our TA leaders. Ah, that was really a brilliant,
12 um, suggestion, something [inaudible].

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you have to
14 [inaudible] cooker? Do you have to request a slow
15 cooker or is [inaudible]?

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: No,
17 no, we, we offer every household a slow cooker.
18 Yeah, you don't have to request it. We offer it.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And I
20 will say that not everyone, um, receives a slow
21 cooker and had no idea about the slow cooker.

22 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: OK,
23 it's something that we just recently started.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah, um-hmm,
25 I, I understand that.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I'm, I'm only saying that because, again, um, the Crown Heights development I had to, I asked them what were they offered, um, I think it was a couple weeks ago. And, um, and when I mentioned the slow cooker, um, some of the residents were excited about that, hearing that information for the first time. So I understand that it's, it's new. Um, so, OK, moving, just putting the next, um, this will be the, the end of my questioning. Um, if my, I don't think my colleagues have any other questions. Um, but just putting into context the electrical outages, just knowing that over the summer, um, you know, we had some serious electrical outages that were probably due to the preventing, preventing a black-out and brown-outs, um, the utility companies would step in and turn down the wattage, the voltage, and so, um, I just want to get a sense from NYCHA, like just what are you doing, how are you preparing, the communications that you have, um, with Con Edison, and so I'm just starting out with how many electrical

1 outages occurred in 2020? And you can also speak to
2 2021, this past, um, summer season.

3
4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

5 Sure. So we're, we're pulling the numbers, um, with
6 respect to, um, what we experienced this past summer.

7 Um, as you mentioned, um, voltage reductions are, um,

8 I guess unfortunately necessary in order to save the

9 grid, ah, from a failure. Um, it impacts not only

10 NYCHA but all properties, ah, and primarily where it

11 impacts us the most is, ah, elevator service. Um, so

12 when the voltage drops down to a certain level our

13 elevators, um, don't operate. Um, we had a really

14 productive conversation with the vice president, um,

15 for emergency NYCHA [inaudible], um, and that was

16 just the beginning. We will continue to have

17 dialogue with Con Edison on how we can improve lines

18 of communication. Um, I would love for them to be

19 able to give us, um, sufficient notice before voltage

20 reduction so we can, one, alert our residents of the

21 potential, ah, that there will be disruption in

22 service, and then also, two, for us to safely bring

23 our elevators out of service, um, and so this way

24 they're not, ah, they don't go out of service with

25 the voltage reduction, um, um, is, is implemented.

1
2 Ah, that's gonna take some time. Um, they're,
3 they're committed to working with us. Um, I don't
4 know how much advance notice we'll be able to
5 receive. Um, but we do get a lot of communication
6 also through the New York City, ah, Emergency
7 Management, ah, Department. Ah, they've been great
8 partners as well. Um, but we need, we need to, ah,
9 do better, getting better information to us, ah, from
10 the utility companies and [inaudible]. Um, you know,
11 like I said, the, the vice president for, ah,
12 emergency management is committed to working with us,
13 um, and we'll continue to work with them.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

16 Yeah, as we replace our elevators, um, I think it's
17 encouraging. Um, as we do replace our elevators the
18 newer, um, elevators, um, do have a battery, um,
19 system, battery backup that will allow for when
20 there's a voltage reduction, um, for the elevator to
21 at least safely go down to the first floor. Um,
22 that's part of, um, obviously the replacement, the
23 complete upgrade of an elevator. Um, most of our, a
24 lot of our, about 45% of our elevators are past their
25 life expectancy. But as we start to replace

1 elevators, ah, we're using the newer technology that
2 will account for some of these, um, issues.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What's the
5 percentage of as we're talking about elevator
6 outages, um, and electrical outages, what's the
7 percentage of elevator outages being due to the
8 decrease in the voltage, as opposed to, um, just
9 actual normal, just the issues with the elevator
10 itself?

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
12 Yeah, Chair, that I, I don't have that information in
13 front of me but we can certainly get back to you with
14 that. That's a great question.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And when you
16 mentioned the, um, like the backup battery and being
17 able to at least go down to the first floor, is it
18 the elevator returning to the first floor because
19 it's, it's stuck because of decrease in the voltage
20 or are you saying the backup, um, battery that will
21 allow for the elevator to function, period, go up and
22 down, or just down?

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
24 Yeah, no, no, so the backup battery is really only
25

1
2 designed to allow the elevator to go down to the
3 first floor safely and then it shuts down.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

5 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

6 But, again, what it avoids are, um, traffic in
7 individual, um, in an elevator, between floors, um,
8 and then it, it takes the elevator out of service in
9 a way that's much more controlled than just, um, the
10 way the older devices are, where it just shuts down
11 completely. Restoration is a lengthier process when
12 that happens.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And, um, just
14 going back to your conversations with the utility
15 companies as it relates to electrical outages, um,
16 have there been conversations around the possibility
17 of when they do decide to decrease the voltage in a
18 certain community or area, um, what would that look
19 like for the NYCHA development in that same community
20 where the entire community is, the voltage is being
21 decreased? Um, is there like a plan or conversation
22 around possibly, um, you know, pressing a lever
23 where, you know, it excludes the NYCHA developments?

24 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

25 Yeah, unfortunately, ah, that's a conversation we

1 might want to have with Con Edison. Um, but that was
2 not, um, that, that didn't seem one to be possible.
3 Yeah, I would love to be able to say that NYCHA would
4 be exclude from any impacts on the voltage
5 reductions, um, or power, um, outages but I don't
6 believe that that's possible. Again, I think just
7 advance, you know, communication, ah, even if they,
8 um, and, and I know that oftentimes, um, they don't
9 have a lot of notice prior to the voltage reduction,
10 but as, you know, if they can give us notice in
11 advance that would be of tremendous value.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. All
14 right. Um, so with that I am done with my line of
15 questions. Um, I would definitely say that, um, you
16 know, I, I look forward to being able to hear what's
17 happening with not just your conversations, your
18 ongoing conversations with Con Ed as it relates to,
19 um, outages and preventing those outages so elevators
20 can work properly, um, but also any, um, updated
21 conversations with National Grid and DOB and everyone
22 else, um, so that we can expedite the process of
23 getting gas outages restored, um, in less than three
24 months, um, because we already know, we hit the
25 holidays, we hear it, especially around Thanksgiving

1 and, and Christmas. Um, and also, too, as we started
2 out these entire conversation related to the
3 preparedness for, um, the winter season and having
4 adequate heat and hot water for the residents, um, I
5 appreciate, um, where you are right now compared to
6 where you were three and four years ago, um, and look
7 forward to your ongoing conversations with the
8 federal monitor to make sure that all residents
9 receive the proper services that they deserve. Um,
10 and so with that, how many generators do you have for
11 the record [laughs]?

12
13 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: How
14 many generators?

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ah, yes
16 [laughs].

17 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Can
18 you repeat that for me?

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]
20 generators.

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: Um,
22 yeah, yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible].

24 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I,
25 I...

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]
3 heat and hot water [laughs],

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: I,
5 I know how many, how many mobile boilers we have.
6 Um, we're getting the number of generators for you
7 right, right now.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. We
9 already spoke of that. We did, actually about
10 mobile boilers?

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: But
12 that was in my testimony. Currently we have 62
13 either in place or on standby, right.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO: So,
16 again, what we're doing, um, a, um, a capital project
17 to replace a heating plant we install mobile units to
18 run the system. Ah, but we also have, um, mobile
19 units that we purchased, um, in the event of a
20 building or, um, outage. Ah, we also rent mobile
21 units. So right now there are 62 in total, ah, and
22 we have seven more on order, ah, four that we're
23 renting and three that we're purchasing, and we
24 should get them sometime in November.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, and the
3 generators, um, how many generators do you have in
4 relation to the conversation we were just having with
5 the elevators? [laughs]

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
7 Yeah, sure. Um, [inaudible]. Yeah, and
8 unfortunately, um, I, I don't believe that we have
9 enough generators to, um, all right, we have 28
10 generators of various sizes, and pretty good,
11 depending on the, um, extent of a, of a voltage
12 reduction or a power outage, if it, if it encompasses
13 a large geographic area, ah, it's just not practical
14 for us to install, ah, a generator [inaudible] those
15 locations. Um, so, and, and also depending on the
16 duration. If Con Edison tells us that they expected
17 to see, ah, the interruption restored in, in a matter
18 of hours, ah, it doesn't make sense for us to install
19 a generator. Um, so we do use them, um, when there's
20 going to be a prolonged, ah, interruption in service.
21 Again, currently we have 28, um, in our inventory,
22 and they're staged geographically throughout the five
23 boroughs.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK, OK.
25 And, um, right before I close for the record I just

1 wanted to go back to the, the issue at, um, in
2 Brownsville Houses. So Brownsville Houses has a new
3 BMS system that is not providing correct temperature
4 reading. Thus it sends false signals to the heating
5 plant, essentially not providing adequate heating.
6

7 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

8 Javier.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [laughs]

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

11 [laughs] Let's take a look at that.

12 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: We definitely will

13 be...

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible]

15 people could know I, I, I'm addressing this.

16 Brownsville Houses has a new BMS system that is not
17 providing correct temperature reading. Thus it sends
18 a false signal to the heating plant, which
19 essentially, wait, heating plant essentially not
20 providing adequate heating. So the problem with the,
21 the, that particular building not providing adequate
22 heat is because of the false reading that it's
23 sending to the heating plant.

24 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:

25 Understood. So Javier and his team leader will

1
2 coordinate with Capital and we'll do some, some
3 troubleshooting here and see what the problem is,
4 absolutely.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, because
6 people will figure this problem out. We're gonna
7 figure it out. [laughter]

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
9 [laughs] Absolutely. Before, before the weather
10 breaks.

11 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Absolutely.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: All right.
13 Um, with that, thank you so much, everyone.

14 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
15 Appreciate it.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I look forward
17 to working with you during the season.

18 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MUSTACIUOLO:
19 Same. Thank you so much, Chair.

20 DIRECTOR ALMODOVAR: Thank you very much.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Ah, we
22 will now turn to testimony from members of the
23 public. Ah, please listen for your name. When I
24 call your name somebody on our staff will unmute you
25 and the Sergeant at Arms will set the timer to three

1 minutes, ah, and announce that you may begin. Ah, I
2 would now like to welcome Adalkiris Vargas to
3 testify.
4

5 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Good afternoon.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

7 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: For the sake of my
8 connection I'm gonna turn off my video, but can you
9 guys hear me?

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes.

11 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: OK. So, good
12 afternoon everyone. My name is...

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Wait, wait,
14 Ms. Vargas, before you stop, I see the clock is going
15 and I want to actually stop the clock. Um, and I
16 just want to allow Ms. Vargas to, you've heard
17 everything, you've been here the whole time.

18 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And so,
20 please, you can just move forward with your question
21 without being stressed about a clock. OK?

22 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: OK, thank you, I
23 appreciate it. I actually have a written statement
24 so I'm just gonna go through it as soon as I can.

25 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Perfect.

1 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: I appreciate it.
2
3 Thank you. So my name is Adalkiris Vargas. I'm a,
4 um, Harlem River Houses resident and I'm also, ah,
5 taking part of the We Act For Environmental Justice,
6 um, and together we are fighting for healthy housing
7 for all NYCHA residents, some here today to testify
8 on the utilities in public housing and winter
9 preparation. Um, over the past several years vital
10 utilities such as, um, hot water, heat, and
11 electricity has failed the NYCHA residents, including
12 myself, for sometimes months. Utilities, um, outages
13 prevent residents from being able to fulfill basic
14 needs, such as cooking for their families, storing
15 food, um, when the electricity is out, and regulating
16 safe indoor temperatures during the summer and the
17 winter as well. Um, sometimes it gets extremely cold
18 or extremely hot. In my apartment our temp will get
19 extremely high and there's no way to control it, and
20 it's not safe to keep the windows open. Um, not only
21 the outages in public, um, not only the outages
22 below, um, not only the outages are public health
23 issues is, um, also a financial burden for some of
24 the families, especially during the COVID. When we
25 don't have no electricity or gas we are forced to,

1
2 um, provide for our families and not everybody has
3 that, um, opportunity to do so. So I'm basically
4 here to say that as a New York City, um, housing
5 resident we are entitled and we deserve to have the
6 same, um, the same, um, service and response as other
7 public, um, residents and, um, we deserve the same
8 rights to be, you know, to have a, a decent and
9 healthy place to live, and we want to held NYCHA
10 accountable to make sure that the response time and
11 the preparedness for it, it's basically [inaudible],
12 that's basically what I have to say. Thank you for
13 your time.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
15 much. Which development are you in?

16 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Ah, sorry, Harlem
17 River Houses.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And do you use
19 the My NYCHA app?

20 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: I actually do. Um, I
21 wish that it could be more, um, I don't want say
22 [inaudible] but easy to get around, especially for
23 older people I don't think it's the best thing to
24 use. And also for myself, I have noticed that I have
25 put tickets and sometimes they get closed and I don't

1
2 get a notification or I don't get an update on the
3 work order. So there's no follow-up, um, on that. I
4 don't know if they have, I mean, they do have our
5 cell phones, our email, but there's no follow-up when
6 there's an update on the work order. For example, we
7 have [inaudible] on the front of the building. I put
8 a work order for that and then I went back into the
9 portal and the work order was closed.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK, OK.

11 Um, so you heard the testimony about the work orders
12 being closed as it relates to heating issues.

13 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Right.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um, have you
15 used the My NYCHA app and then turn around and, you
16 know, saw a work order possibly closed, um, without
17 addressing a heat or hot water or anything, I'm just
18 trying to get a understanding.

19 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Ah, fortunately for me
20 I haven't had, um, that case. But it comes to, um,
21 so what happens is basically when I don't have heat
22 most of the people on my floor 'cause my apartment,
23 my apartment building is very small. We only have
24 four floors and 12 apartments per, um, for the, for
25 the whole building. So, um, when I put a ticket, by

1
2 the time I turn around and come back home from work
3 we already have hot water or heat. It's already
4 restored. So I haven't like been to that position
5 where I have to put a ticket and it hasn't been
6 attend to. Ah, when I did the testimony I did like
7 overall for all NYCHA residents that I know, for
8 example, my mom lives in NYCHA and she experienced,
9 um, you know, having, not having heat for a few days
10 or hot water.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK, all
12 right. Well, thank you so much for...

13 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...your
15 testimony today and, um, apologies for not having you
16 aboard to be able to testify before.

17 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: No, it's fine, I was
18 here. I was listening to all the good information.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, all right,
20 so I appreciate you. Thank you so much.

21 ADALKIRIS VARGAS: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Audrey?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, thanks, thanks
24 very much. This concludes the public testimony. If
25 we've inadvertently forgotten to call, call on

1 anyone, ah, please raise your hand using the Zoom
2 raise hand function and we'll try to hear from you
3 now. Seeing no hands raised, I will now turn it back
4 over to Chair Ampry-Samuel to close the hearing.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, thank you
7 so much, everyone. Sergeant at Arms, thank you for
8 all that you do. Um, so now that will conclude the
9 New York City Council Committee on Public Housing
10 hearing on October 12, 2021. [gavel]

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 5, 2021