

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

1

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

October 4, 2021  
Start: 10:09 a.m.  
Recess: 12:04 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING - VIRTUAL ROOM 1

B E F O R E: Antonio Reynoso,  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Justin L. Brannan  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
D. Diaz  
Daniel Dromm  
Oswald Feliz  
James F. Gennaro  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Kevin C. Riley  
Kalman Yeger

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

2

1

2

A P P E A R A N C E S

3

Edward Grayson  
Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
Sanitation

4

5

Ricky Cyrus  
Assistant Chief of the Law Enforcement Division

6

7

Stephen Harbin  
Chief of Cleaning Operations

8

Liz McMillan  
Member WE ACT for Environmental Justice serving  
on the Climate Justice Working Group

9

10

Kalvis Mikelsteins  
Director of Operations at the Dumbo Business  
Improvement District in Brooklyn

11

12

Robert Camacho  
Lives in Bushwick

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

3

1

2

SERGEANT BRADLEY: Okay, now we are streaming

3

live. Sergeants, will you begin your recordings? PC

4

Recording is up.

5

SERGEANT LUGO: Cloud is good.

6

SERGEANT BRADLEY: Sergeant Lugo, you may begin

7

the opening.

8

SERGEANT LUGO: Good morning everyone. Welcome

9

to today's Remote New York City Council Hearing of

10

the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste

11

Management. At this time, would all panelists please

12

turn on your videos. To minimize disruption, please

13

place electronic devices to vibrate or silent. If

14

you wish to submit testimony, you may do so at

15

[testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Again, that's

16

[testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).

17

Thank you for your cooperation. Chair Reynoso,

18

we are ready to begin.

19

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Sergeant Lugo. I

20

want to start off by acknowledging that we've been

21

joined by Council Members Brannan, Chin, and Riley.

22

Good morning. I am Council Member Antonio

23

Reynoso and I am the Chair of the Committee on

24

Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. Welcome to

25

this oversight hearing on Street and Sidewalk

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

4

1  
2 Cleanliness in New York City. Today, we will also be  
3 hearing Intro. 471 sponsored by Council Member Danny  
4 Dromm related to the prohibiting of obstructing signs  
5 on sidewalks, flagging and curbstone.

6 A year ago, this Committee held a hearing on  
7 sidewalk and street cleanliness in the face of  
8 drastic budget cuts to the Department of Sanitation.  
9 Streets were being cleaned and litter baskets were  
10 being emptied less frequently. New Yorkers were  
11 reporting overflowing litter baskets, garbage on the  
12 streets and sidewalks and an increase in rat  
13 sightings. Fortunately, this year's budget restored  
14 some of the funding to the department's cleaning  
15 operations and created a new precision cleaning  
16 initiative.

17 Unfortunately, overflowing garbage baskets and  
18 street litter, continues to afflict our city. Litter  
19 baskets are not being filled with litter but in some  
20 cases, they are being filled with full bags of  
21 household or business garbage. This is illegal and  
22 is adding to the garbage on our streets. We need  
23 businesses and households to dispose of garbage  
24 properly and keep litter baskets for their intended  
25 use.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

5

1  
2       Alternate side parking was suspended for most of  
3 last summer and it has been effect with reductions  
4 for over a year now. While parked cars do not have  
5 to move so often, we need to better understand how  
6 this is effecting street cleanliness and the ability  
7 of the department street sweepers to efficiently and  
8 effectively do their job.

9       If traffic patterns are back to where we were  
10 pre-pandemic, we should return to regular alternate  
11 side parking rules so that – to do what they are  
12 intended. Help remove litter from our streets. I  
13 look forward to hearing DSNY's testimony on how we as  
14 a city and as individuals can do a better job of  
15 keeping our streets and sidewalks clean. I am  
16 interested in understanding how changes to alternate  
17 side parking rules have impacted the presence of  
18 litter in our streets and sidewalks. As well as  
19 remaining challenges to curbing unlawful dumping of  
20 household and commercial waste in public litter  
21 baskets.

22       Now, before the Administration testifies –  
23 actually, we're just going to move forward with the  
24 Commissioner and Sergeant correct me if I'm wrong and  
25 I do want to acknowledge that we are being joined by

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

6

1

2 Council Member Kalman Yeger. We've been joined by  
3 Council Member Cabrera as well. Thank you.

4

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. Uhm, if  
5 Council Member Dromm is able to join, then if you are  
6 okay with it Chair, we will allow him to give his  
7 opening?

8

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, please.

9

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Alright, so thank you. I am  
10 Counsel Jessica Steinberg Albin and I will be  
11 Moderating this hearing. Before we begin, I'd like  
12 to remind everyone that you will be on mute until you  
13 are called on to testify.

14

At which point, you will be unmuted by the host.  
15 During the hearing, I will be calling on panelists to  
16 testify. Please listen for your name to be called,  
17 as I will periodically be announcing who the next  
18 panelists will be. We will first be hearing  
19 testimony from the Administration, followed by  
20 testimony from members of the public.

21

During the hearing, if Council Members would like  
22 to ask a question of the Administration or a specific  
23 panelist, please use the Zoom raise hand function and  
24 I will call on you in order. We will not be limiting  
25 time for Council Member questions. For members of

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

7

1  
2 the public, we will be limiting speaking time to five  
3 minutes, in order to accommodate all who wish to  
4 speak today.

5       Once you are called on to testify, please state  
6 your name and the organization you represent, if any  
7 when it is your turn to speak. We will now call on  
8 representatives of the Administration to testify.  
9 Appearing today for the Department of Sanitation,  
10 will be Commissioner Edward Grayson, Ricky Cyrus  
11 Assistant Chief of Enforcement and I believe that is  
12 all from the Administration.

13       At this time, I will administer the affirmation  
14 to each representative of the Administration. I will  
15 call on each of you individually for a response.  
16 Please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell  
17 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth  
18 before this Committee and to respond honestly to  
19 Council Member questions? Commissioner Edward  
20 Grayson?

21       EDWARD GRAYSON: I do.

22       COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ricky Cyrus?

23       RICKY CYRUS: I do.

24  
25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

8

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant Chief, oh, I'm  
sorry. Thank you. Do you mind saying that one more  
time Mr. Cyrus?

RICKY CYRUS: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, and I believe we have  
been joined by Stephen Harbin, Chief of Cleaning  
Operations. Mr. Harbin, do you affirm to tell the  
truth before this Committee and to respond honestly  
to Council Member questions? Mr. Harbin, are you  
able to hear? Okay, my apologies if he is not on.  
Uhm, thank you Commissioner. You may begin your  
testimony.

EDWARD GRAYSON: Good morning. Thank you.  
Good morning Chair Reynoso and members of the New  
York City Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid  
Waste Management. I am Edward Grayson, Commissioner  
of the New York City Department of Sanitation, and I  
am joined by Stephen Harbin, Chief of Cleaning  
Operations, and Ricky Cyrus, the Assistant Chief of  
the Law Enforcement Division.  
Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on the  
Department's efforts to keep our city clean and to  
provide comments on behalf of the Administration on  
Intro. 471.



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

9

1  
2 Our Department's mission is to keep New York City  
3 healthy, safe and clean. We celebrated our 140<sup>th</sup>  
4 birthday earlier this year and, despite the change  
5 from the Department of Street Cleaning to the  
6 Department of Sanitation, in name only, our  
7 commitment to cleaning our city has not wavered in  
8 over those 140 years. I have been a proud member of  
9 this Department for nearly 23 years now, and my  
10 parents were as well for decades before me.

11 Just about one year ago, I testified in front of  
12 this Committee in my first hearing as Sanitation  
13 Commissioner on this very topic. Then, the city was  
14 on the cusp of the second wave of COVID infections,  
15 without approved vaccinations, dealing with  
16 tremendous budget cuts and facing the prospect of  
17 widespread layoffs.

18 Today, we face many of the same challenges we did  
19 a year ago, but the outlook is brighter. Our city is  
20 on the path to recovery; our schools, restaurants,  
21 theaters, and workplaces are open. Then, service  
22 cuts and manpower shortfalls, combined with pandemic-  
23 related increases in the use of our streets and  
24 public spaces, had certainly led to more litter on  
25 our streets, overflowing corner baskets, and an

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

10

1  
2 overall sense that the city was dirtier than it had  
3 been in years.

4 Today, we still face several of those challenges,  
5 particularly regarding changes in New Yorkers'  
6 attitudes and behavior, but we have seen a dramatic  
7 improvements as well. As I will describe, several  
8 budget cuts have been restored, and we have put new  
9 programs in place. New Yorkers have joined us in  
10 record numbers to help clean up their blocks and  
11 their neighborhoods. And we have honed our approach  
12 to the persistent challenges regarding illegal  
13 dumping and doing everything we can to work toward a  
14 cleaner city.

15 This year's Recovery Budget, released by Mayor de  
16 Blasio in April, included several new and restored  
17 cleaning initiatives aimed at supporting our city's  
18 recovery. In the Executive Budget, the  
19 Administration restored baseline funding for the  
20 Department's litter basket collection services. In  
21 partnership with the City Council, the Administration  
22 added an additional \$8.6 million in funding for  
23 supplemental litter basket collection, making a total  
24 of more than \$17 million in new or restored funding  
25 for litter basket collections in the fiscal year.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

11

1  
2 Today, DSNY is funded to run 588 litter basket  
3 trucks each week, a 116 percent increase from the 272  
4 trucks per week we were running in July 2020. This  
5 additional service has contributed to cleaner streets  
6 and improved quality of life in our communities. The  
7 Department of Sanitation has also created the  
8 Precision Cleaning Initiative, with teams to conduct  
9 targeted cleanings of litter conditions, illegal  
10 dumping, and overflowing baskets. These conditions  
11 are eyesores that affect New Yorkers' quality of life  
12 and threaten New York City's recovery. Teams are  
13 dispatched based on DSNY field observations, 311  
14 complaints and referrals from other city agencies and  
15 community groups.

16 To date, PCI crews have collected more than  
17 10,000 eyesore conditions and emptied a total of  
18 25,000 additional litter baskets citywide. We have  
19 also restored our dedicated syringe litter staff with  
20 our Environmental Police Unit to conduct proactive  
21 patrols in areas with the highest concentrations of  
22 syringe litter. These six dedicated officers are  
23 specially trained to properly handle syringes and  
24 other potentially hazardous waste.  
25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

12

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Since the restoration in March, our dedicated team of EPU officers has collected a total of 27,485 syringes from New York City streets. This Fiscal Year, we have also received more than \$4 million in funds from City Council members through the New York City Clean Up initiative, our highest total since the program began seven years ago. I thank all of the members for their commitment to our mission and for their partnership as we work to keep New York City clean.

All 8.8 million New Yorkers, as well as the millions of visitors and commuters, have a role to play in keeping our city clean. Litter and trash does not just magically appear on city streets. Each piece, bag or pile has a person associated with it. Someone who tossed it on the ground, dumped it on the corner, or threw it out a car window. As we recover and move along toward a post-COVID New York City, I ask all New Yorkers to do the right thing. Don't litter, use our corner baskets properly. Clean up after your dog. Move your car for alternate side parking. Sweep the sidewalk in front of your home or business. And if you see a litter condition that

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

13

1  
2 DSNY needs to bring attention to, please let us know  
3 by calling 311.

4 In the past year, the Department has greatly  
5 expanded our Community Clean Up program, working with  
6 volunteers and community partners across the five  
7 boroughs. DSNY provides tools and operational  
8 support for neighborhood cleanups. We have  
9 introduced a Community Clean-Up Van to raise  
10 awareness and support these events. The Department  
11 lends tools, trash bags, masks, brooms, dustpans and  
12 other tools to volunteers and can now deliver these  
13 tools directly to the volunteers through the new  
14 community clean-up van.

15 The Department has partnered with an estimated  
16 7,200 New Yorkers on 278 volunteer cleanups during  
17 Fiscal Year 2021, which ended on June 30, 2021. The  
18 cleanups represent a 546 percent increase from Fiscal  
19 Year '20 and a 186 percent increase from pre-pandemic  
20 Fiscal Year 2019. We encourage all New Yorkers to  
21 chip in and help us keep New York City clean. The  
22 City Cleanup Corps is Mayor de Blasio's new deal  
23 inspired program. The Corps is intended to foster  
24 the city's economic recovery by empowering and  
25 employing 10,000 New Yorkers to refresh and

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

14

1  
2 revitalize our city to make it welcoming to  
3 residents, workers, and tourists.

4       Since its launch six months ago, the Corps has  
5 contributed significantly to cleaning the city's  
6 streets and sidewalks in neighborhoods across the  
7 five boroughs. To date, it has helped remove more  
8 than 600,000 bags of trash and cleaned over 25,000  
9 rain gardens of trash and debris. Additionally, the  
10 Corps has been active in helping our neighbors  
11 impacted by Hurricane Ida. Since Ida hit, Corps  
12 members have helped remove 72,000 bags of debris and  
13 cleared rain gardens and storm drains of trash and  
14 debris to help mitigate possibility of flooding.

15       Illegal Dumping Illegal dumping is a particularly  
16 pervasive problem in New York City today. There are  
17 any number of reasons that drive this. Unpermitted  
18 contractors renovating homes and storefronts,  
19 businesses trying to save money and not hiring a  
20 private carter, unscrupulous operators dumping in the  
21 dark of night. Illegal dumping occurs when someone  
22 removes trash from a vehicle and leaves it in a  
23 public or private space. It is a major problem in  
24 many parts of the city, leading to unsightly and  
25 unsafe conditions for residents, particularly in

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

15

1  
2 areas with vacant lots, dead ends, overpasses,  
3 railroad lines, and industrial zones.

4 To combat illegal dumping, DSNY employs a team of  
5 Sanitation Police Officers who stakeout known dumping  
6 locations, investigate 311 complaints, and impound  
7 vehicles that are involved in an illegal dumping  
8 activity. Fines for illegal dumping start at \$4,000  
9 and can be as high as \$18,000 for repeat violators.  
10 DSNY also conducts enforcement of improper disposal,  
11 which is a lesser violation that generally involves a  
12 smaller quantity of material and does not use a  
13 vehicle. The number of 311 requests for enforcement  
14 of improper disposal increased to 5,094 in FY21, up  
15 from 3,837 in FY19. This summer, we recently  
16 launched a pilot program of increased, concentrated  
17 enforcement.

18 Between late July and early August, we  
19 concentrated our efforts in Brooklyn Community Board  
20 5 and issued 24 summonses for illegal dumping, 15  
21 summonses for littering from a motor vehicle, nine  
22 summonses for improper disposal, and additional  
23 summonses for related violations. And some higher  
24 level enforcement actions, including 16 vehicle  
25 impounds and even one arrest. We removed litter and

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

16

1  
2 debris from several public sites, leading to cleaner  
3 and safer streets for residents of these  
4 neighborhoods.

5 A similar enforcement surge in the Hunts Point  
6 section of the Bronx also yielded very positive  
7 results. And to date, we have issued 143 violations  
8 related to illegal dumping and impounded 83 vehicles.  
9 We hope that this increase in enforcement and  
10 potentially other efforts among the five boroughs in  
11 the coming weeks will prompt all residents and  
12 businesses to follow the rules and keep our city  
13 clean.

14 Intro. 471, sponsored by Council Member Dromm,  
15 would prohibit obstructions or nuisances in or upon  
16 sidewalks, flagging's or curbstones. Streets and  
17 medians and streets established - hold on. And  
18 streets and establish a rebuttable presumption  
19 regarding the responsibilities for the placement of  
20 signs constituting such obstructions or nuisances.  
21 This legislation is aimed at holding the party  
22 identified on an A frame sign, known as a sandwich  
23 board sign, responsible for creating the sidewalk  
24 obstruction, rather than the building abutting the  
25 sidewalk where the sign has been improperly placed.



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

17

1  
2 This bill would also expand in public areas for  
3 unlawful placement of A frames to include traffic  
4 medians.

5       The bill contains a rebuttable presumption that  
6 the individual or the business named on the A frame  
7 is responsible for placing the sign on the sidewalk  
8 or the median. The Department receives many  
9 complaints about improper placement of signs by  
10 businesses in front of other businesses, in the  
11 street or on traffic medians. This practice is also  
12 readily used by real estate businesses to promote  
13 open houses. The Department looks forward to working  
14 with the City Council to move forward on this  
15 important piece of legislation.

16       In conclusion, on behalf of our 9,700 employees,  
17 I want to thank the City Council for your support in  
18 our effort to clean our streets, sidewalks and public  
19 spaces. Our frontline workers are the true heroes of  
20 this effort, working day after day in all manner of  
21 conditions, doing the tireless work of picking up  
22 litter, emptying corner baskets, and collecting our  
23 trash and recycling. For 140 years, our employees  
24 have worked to make New York City neighborhoods

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

18

1  
2 cleaner and to improve the quality of life for our  
3 residents and visitors.

4 I thank you for the opportunity to testify this  
5 morning and we are now happy to answer your  
6 questions.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much  
8 Commissioner. Before we turn to the Administration  
9 questions, I would like to turn the floor over to  
10 Council Member Dromm to give an opening on his bill,  
11 Intro. 471.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very much and I  
13 apologize for being a little bit late. I had some  
14 technology problems with my iPad. It's great to see  
15 you Commissioner and again, thank you for coming out  
16 to Jackson Heights last week to uh, you now, announce  
17 the City Cleanup Corps and you did a fantastic job.  
18 Thank you.

19 Clean streets and sidewalks are an environmental  
20 justice issue. Sadly, certain communities are left  
21 with inadequate resources to deal with the ever  
22 present scourge of littering, dumping and so on. The  
23 challenges are immense in the district I represent  
24 because not only is it an EJ community, but it is  
25 also a destination attracting shoppers from all over

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the east coast. The pandemic has added new challenges to keeping our streets and sidewalks clean. This crisis has only highlighted the danger of illegal signs and other obstructions, especially as an extraordinary measure, the city has permitted the use of otherwise public sidewalks and streets for certain commercial structures. There are, however, limits to the scope and size of such accommodations to our business community.

Unauthorized obstructions often create dangerous bottlenecks on sidewalks. Not only does this impede social distancing but it is especially hazardous for pedestrians who are very young, very old and or disabled.

Even before the pandemic, A frame signs for example, unacceptably littered my district sidewalks. This prompted the drafting of Intro. 471, which would prohibit the placing of signs and other obstructions on sidewalks or streets and establish a rebuttable presumption that the identifying information on a sign obstructing the sidewalk is the party responsible for the obstruction.

Many interest space on our city's and streets but we must always balance those interests with the need

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

to maintain the health and safety of us all.  
Individuals navigating the streets and sidewalks on  
my district and throughout the city deserve to have  
sidewalks and streets clear of unnecessary  
obstructions and that is what Intro. 471 aims to  
address. Thank you Chair Reynoso on hearing this  
bill. I appreciate your work throughout the years to  
make sure sanitation issues are a priority for this  
Council and thank you Commissioner and I look forward  
to working with you on passing this legislation.  
Thank you again.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member  
Dromm. I would like to now just administer the oath  
to Stephen Harbin, Chief of Cleaning Operations.  
Stephen Harbin, do you affirm to tell the truth, the  
whole truth and nothing but the truth before this  
Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member  
questions?

STEPHEN HARBIN: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much. Uhm,  
Administrative panelists, please stay unmuted if  
possible during this question and answer period.  
Thank you. We will now turn it over to questions  
from Chair Reynoso. Chair Reynoso.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

21

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much Committee Counsel. I just want to thank Council Member Danny Dromm for this legislation. I think that our sidewalks have become inundated with obstructions. Whether it's public benches, signs, poles, mailboxes, a-frames, you name it. It seems like every idea related to you know attempting to build convenience makes it more inconvenient for pedestrians. You know, dads in stroller like I am, folks in wheelchairs and so forth. So, I'm extremely grateful to Council Member Dromm for this great idea and I'm looking forward to assisting him in the passage of this legislation.

I wanted to ask a couple of questions here Commissioner. For the most part, and I just want to make sure that the general public understands, practically all the money has been restored when it comes to Department of Sanitation or that we've reverted back to pretty much the same space we were in prior to the pandemic in the Department of Sanitation when it comes to cleaning services. Is that a true statement more or less?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Yes Chair, more or less that is right.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

22

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And when I say more or  
3 less, I'm talking about the money part. We got most  
4 of the money back. So, I guess why I'm asking that  
5 question is because the general public should assume  
6 that the City of New York should be able to return  
7 back to a state of cleanliness that they were used to  
8 prior to the pandemic.

9 EDWARD GRAYSON: That would be a fair assessment.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, so and I apologize  
11 again Commissioner because I think I'm going to,  
12 something that I can't stand doing but I think I need  
13 to do here because I don't have enough information.  
14 And hopefully maybe you have more stats and more data  
15 that could help clarify my statement. Is, I've been  
16 talking to a few folks anecdotally and they've been  
17 telling me that they still feel that the streets are  
18 as dirty or dirtier than they were prior to the  
19 pandemic. The budget was passed on June 30<sup>th</sup>, so  
20 July 1<sup>st</sup>, the increase into the budget of the  
21 Department of Sanitation should have taken its course  
22 and should have been in there.

23 So, we're talking several months here of a fully  
24 funded cleaning program of the Department of  
25 Sanitation and it seems like the streets are still as

1

2 dirty as they were before. So, I guess what I would  
3 ask is, has I guess the cleanliness rating that  
4 exists citywide, uhm, how have the restorations  
5 effected them?

6

EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you for your question  
7 Chair and I know exactly what you feel. I talk to  
8 the constituents, I'm out there and there's  
9 definitely a sense that people - so, there's a couple  
10 of things going on. The cleanliness rating uhm, our  
11 score card. You know we just put out the MMR a  
12 little while ago. So, we definitely finished last  
13 year, about two percentage points or so behind where  
14 we normally fall.

15

For the first two months of the Fiscal Year,  
16 we're about the same as we were you know in the pre-  
17 pandemic. But on the same token, that's respective  
18 of just one facet. That's one statistic that doesn't  
19 paint a picture of what's going on and what people  
20 see. You know, there's the concentrated view point  
21 and the truth of objective cleanliness versus  
22 subjective opinion. And what I mean by that is that  
23 if you think it's dirty sir, it is. I can't tell you  
24 anything otherwise. I can give a million stats to  
25 the Council today and if you feel that it's dirty, I

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

24

1  
2 recognize that that's the feeling and we are  
3 definitely trying to combat that.

4       Respectively though, the increase in basket  
5 service, the PCI resources that have been able to  
6 come out and do some really targeted cleanups. Uhm,  
7 two things to that. What we are definitely seeing is  
8 while the restoration of a lot of or services and  
9 some new services have happened, the behavior change  
10 that occurred over the 18 months with people misusing  
11 litter baskets at a record where we had - they were  
12 just putting household refuse in litter baskets.  
13 That continues. Illegal dumping has continued and  
14 also, just in front for the residential side,  
15 curbside tonnage also stays up.

16       So, more and more, we're picking up more in front  
17 of everybody's house, which means that there's just  
18 an overall continued generation increase. We haven't  
19 normalized yet. What we're hoping, as we've only  
20 gotten you know now three months into this Fiscal  
21 Year, we're hoping to see a few things pan out as  
22 well. We're coming on the backend of our hiring  
23 cycle. So, thankfully, we were able to hire new  
24 sanitation workers. You know, at the end, before the  
25



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

25

1  
2 winter comes in we'll have onboarded another 840  
3 sanitation workers.

4 Now, what that does is that gives us the ability  
5 to fill the posts that we were not filled for last  
6 year and have more bandwidth. So, more bandwidth,  
7 definitely means more cleaning and I don't mean more  
8 than the budgeted, I just mean, we get in addition to  
9 what's been budgeted and what we plan to run, anytime  
10 we have an available person, we put it out on another  
11 cleaning function. Meaning we run an additional  
12 broom. We run an additional basket truck. We run an  
13 additional MLP.

14 So, having the human beings back in and actually  
15 have them hired because we work throughout. We were  
16 not working remotely. Not one sanitation worker was  
17 picking up garbage from home. But now that we're  
18 going to be at a very good headcount coming in for  
19 the remainder of the Fiscal year leading through  
20 winter, we think we're going to see some positive  
21 results that can help combat how people are feeling.

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, I appreciate that.  
23 So, you kind of answered the second question that I  
24 was going to ask. It's just I guess the feeling,

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

26

1

2 people want to feel like they are in a clean city and  
3 you know, its been tough.

4

5 I do want to talk about this Precision Cleaning  
6 Initiative that exists that is new, which is supposed  
7 to handle the litter you know dumping and basket  
8 cleaning services are supposed to help with that.

9

10 Uhm, can you go through very quickly exactly how that  
11 program workers? How many staff members are in it?

12

13 When and how do you feel you need to deploy those

14

15 teams? I guess, what systems or processes used to

16

17 determine where they should be? Uhm, and uh, does

18

19 this kind of carry or cover some of the cleaning

20

21 service programs that were not fully restored in the

22

23 FY22 budget?

24

25 And just that I'm sorry, I just want to

26

27 acknowledge that we've been joined by Council Member

28

29 Feliz and Council Member Gennaro. Thank you so much

30

31 for being on.

32

33 So, Commissioner, can you just go through the

34

35 Precision Cleaning Initiative and then I'm going to

36

37 ask a couple more questions and I want to allow for

38

39 Council Members that probably have tons of questions

40

41 to get an opportunity to speak and I can come back to

42

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

27

1  
2 you later on. So, just the Precision Cleaning  
3 Initiative please.

4 EDWARD GRAYSON: Sure, so the Precision Cleaning  
5 Initiative is approximately 54 crews a week uhm that  
6 go out. So, what we have is and before we had the  
7 dedicated headcount, we were doing - it was an  
8 overtime program but we were approved and now we're  
9 doing the hiring. So, it's an additional 54 crews a  
10 week. How we intake those complaints are the places  
11 where we have the highest concentration of you know,  
12 311 complaints and/or Council and Community Board  
13 callings, coupled with naturally the DSNY Field  
14 Supervisors that are driving around the city all day.

15 And we're really trying to target, make sure that  
16 we have earmarked additional crews, because what  
17 would happen is, if we had to divert an existing  
18 resources before we implemented this PCI, we would  
19 literally be taking from a basket truck that is  
20 already overtaxed, move them over to clean up a drop  
21 off that had to be immediately handled and then  
22 again, lose productivity on both sides of the  
23 equation. And as we, one of the reasons why we're  
24 talking today, the longer something that's an eyesore

25

1  
2 sits in the street, I contributes directly to that  
3 feeling we're talking about.

4       So, the beauty of this program is, making sure  
5 that we have these crews that we can deploy. It gets  
6 us faster, so maybe we don't have to wait a day or  
7 two to deploy. We can deploy immediately or on the  
8 next shift. So, that's how we've been running this  
9 program. Its been very successful. I mean really  
10 because in between also on ancillary travel from  
11 condition to condition, these crews pick up litter  
12 baskets along the way. So, you're getting a  
13 supplemental service or a supplemental turnaround on  
14 something that normally would have taken an extra  
15 couple of hours before the scheduled service.

16       So, its been beneficial on not only what's been  
17 called in on the proper condition that they're  
18 responding to but on the ancillary travel from  
19 condition to condition, each crews are making  
20 periodic stops along the way to also add value to the  
21 communities they're working in.

22       CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Really excited about that  
23 team. It makes a lot of sense instead of moving you  
24 know, taking from Peter to pay Paul and moving  
25 resources around that way, that we actually have a

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

29

1  
2 team that can address that. I'm surprised we didn't  
3 have something like that earlier. So, I'm very happy  
4 to see that you have those resources.

5 And now, my last questions are going to come from  
6 regarding alternate side parking, which is something  
7 that I, I, it's just something that I want to be able  
8 to deal with before I leave this Council. So, I want  
9 to talk to you about, are you letting us know, are  
10 these reforms going to be permanent? Is the first  
11 question and how will the city make the determination  
12 to return to regular alternate side parking schedule?  
13 Should it not be permanent because at this moment, I  
14 guess I'll have to preference the question. It's  
15 just it's terrible.

16 In my, and I have used the front of my house. In  
17 the front of my house, a car parks there, it means  
18 that for two weeks, my street didn't get cleaned.  
19 It's just accumulating garbage and I haven't seen the  
20 same amount of fines or the parking violations as  
21 usual. So, these folks are being very bold and  
22 because of it, we're seeing just disgusting streets.  
23 Clogged drains and so forth. So, I kind of want to  
24 know, is it coming back? This is my informal  
25 advocacy for it to come back and how are you going to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

determine or what criteria are you using as to when you will bring it back?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Chair, I thank you for the question and you know, I definitely uh, mechanical broom sweeping is definitely our most effective way to clean New York City streets. We have testified before the Council to that fact for years. And I have to tell you that, the biggest issue with alternate side parking or people moving for the broom, it's just that. It's the noncompliance. Your own example was a prime - the challenge of having the reduced sweeping schedule for the parts of the city that were getting multiple times per week, is that when they go to one time a week, if somebody doesn't move their car, now you go - you now wait a whole week to get a mechanical broom.

And then we rely as a city, uhm, on the homeowner or the business owner to come out and do their job on the 18 inch or be subject to that violation. So, mechanical sweeping is the greatest thing. As the Sanitation Commissioner, uhm, I'd sweep every street every day because I'm just a - but like I said, that's not a - and that's not a cheeky way of answering the question. Uhm, where are we seeing the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

31

1  
2 biggest impact? In the Community Boards in the city  
3 that had multiple time sweep. Where we're now down  
4 to just the one day. Uhm, but it's funny because  
5 while it sounds like we're down to one day, it's not  
6 directly binary to a 50 percent reduction in  
7 sweeping. Because what happens is that the Monday  
8 and Tuesday schedule has been reduced in every place  
9 that there was a day to sweep that street. However,  
10 we run brooms every single day.

11 So, when you think about it, there are plenty of  
12 areas of the city that only had one time a week  
13 sweep. Those areas were not impacted. The weird  
14 part for us, is we're seeing a lack of compliance on  
15 moving in both, in both, all areas of the city. So,  
16 it's not, the places that only had one time a week  
17 sweep, with theoretically those mechanical broom  
18 reductions didn't impact them at all. It's less  
19 compliance there and it's less compliance, which is  
20 compounded in the areas that now had multiple time  
21 sweep that only get it once.

22 Because what we were basically getting on your  
23 block Chair is another opportunity, where if we  
24 didn't get them on - you know, maybe we got in front  
25 of your house on Monday, but we didn't get there on

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

32

1  
2 Thursday. But at some point and time there was an  
3 added opportunity. However, if the person was a  
4 scofflaw, we would have missed you both days.

5 So, it's you know when you think about it, there  
6 is a level of compliance that's needed. That is the  
7 ultimate thing with the mechanical broom. It is our  
8 most effective tool as long as we have open curb  
9 space.

10 Speaking about the mechanical broom program, just  
11 so everybody understands as well, all the places, the  
12 residential streets that were signed for alternate  
13 side parking are the streets that are impacted by the  
14 reduction. The metered areas are still getting swept  
15 every day, six days a week like they used to. The  
16 open spaces, no parking anytime, no standing anytime,  
17 bus stops. All the - what Department of Sanitation  
18 calls O-work. Which is an open street. There, to  
19 the best of our ability, we've always gotten to those  
20 curbs as long as there was nothing blocking us while  
21 we're on our mechanical broom routes.

22 So, this really does hit only residential blocks  
23 that are alternate side parking signed that had  
24 multiple days on the same side of the street. And  
25 that's not to say, like I said, I miss having that



1  
2 opportunity. But it was just an opportunity to  
3 clean. Compliance is still the ultimate tool.

4 To answer your question, will there be a  
5 restoration? Will there be a change? I do believe  
6 that there's one coming. We're still working. We're  
7 working with the Administration on trying to  
8 formulate what is the right basis to judge that?  
9 There have been many discussions that have happened  
10 with, is there new technology? Is there new things  
11 coming down the pipe? And I think to answer your  
12 question sir honestly, it's that right now, the  
13 current program is while there are still some people  
14 who will gladly tell us that they don't quite get it,  
15 it is still the easiest one to explain. We're coming  
16 one time a week, the last day on the sign.

17 To try to implement something multiple times as a  
18 rule. However, I don't know how to explain that  
19 outside of that community board that makes it fair  
20 for everyone to get it. Because there are laws,  
21 there's posted laws involved. So, I want to work  
22 with the Council. That's the main thing for that  
23 question I want to put out there and I am definitely  
24 here to discuss the rest of everyone's concerns with  
25 it. We look forward to working with the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Administration. To working with Council to figure out, what is the right program for alternate side? There are parts of the city that we've learned throughout the pandemic that clearly could survive with one day a week. They really could. They had two days and they aren't dramatically impacted.

Now again, I go back to objective versus subjective. To me, they don't look as bad. But if you're the homeowner, you may think it looks terrible. So, again, we think operationally. There are parts of the city that did prove that they could go with a reduced schedule. But then there are clearly parts of the city that proved that they cannot. That that second opportunity, even though there's always the rotating x-factor of compliance, that the more opportunities that are afforded to the block face would certainly help combat the illegal, you know the litter and the dirtiness.

And then lastly, just to alternate side, we still go back to - we are writing summonses. We are definitely writing summonses for it. We're not the only ones who write that summons as well. But there is, the Department of Sanitation is writing summonses for littering. We are writing summonses for dirty

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

35

1  
2 sidewalks. We are doing what we have to do to try to  
3 encourage residents and businesses to do the right  
4 thing. We are certainly doing what we want to do to  
5 the best of our ability with the people in violation  
6 of the mechanical broom compliance. Because to us  
7 though, that summons is a tool to try to help  
8 somebody move. I would much rather have compliance  
9 because the summons on the car still leaves dirt in  
10 front of your house. It doesn't, it doesn't solve  
11 the problem. It only gives me a way to nudge  
12 compliance. Our main goal is always compliance for a  
13 clean street.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I think Chief Harbin has  
15 something to say.

16 STEPHEN HARBIN: Good morning Chair and fellow  
17 Council Members. Again, my name is Stephen Harbin, I  
18 am the Chief of Cleaning Operations of New York City  
19 Sanitation. I am fairly new to this role but as far  
20 as working in the field and dealing with cleaning  
21 resources, I have been with the Department for  
22 Sanitation for 32 years. And in my role, I've worked  
23 with cleaner resources. I live in Community Board 5  
24 in Brooklyn, which is one of the most, I guess, what  
25 you would say illegal dumped on Community Board in

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

36

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the city. And it's an irritation to me and I take it personal when people drop off things and we clean it and they drop it off again.

So, uhm, with regards to that, I empathize with all of you, especially in those Community Boards likewise yourself Council Member Reynoso. With regards to cleaning conditions and so forth, it irritates me too. Uhm, I am honored that I have been picked in this role though to uh, share the resources to get the streets clean. To get the drop-offs picked up. To get the lots cleaned, to get the derelict vehicles off the street.

We've had some challenges yes, just as we are all aware of because of COVID. Cuts, major cuts, that greatly impeded us but as you and the Commissioner had mentioned, things are being restored. And I am looking forward to working with those resources to clear and to clean the streets of New York City. For myself, to represent this great agency. For yourselves and for the people of New York City. And I look forward to working with everyone and working with our staff in a collaborative effort to achieve this goal. And uhm, I'm all in to work with each and

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

37

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

every one of you and I thank you for this opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Chief and congratulations on your new appointment.

STEPHEN HARBIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Welcome to the Committee hearings that you will be frequenting on a regular basis. Commissioner, I just wanted to clarify, do you have statistics on how many summonses have been given? Look, homeowners and look, I'm not a homeowner but I live in a house and if the streets are not clean, you know the acorns come back onto the sidewalk and paper gets back onto the sidewalk and it's just the wind will bring it back up and you know the streets are absolutely dirty. It makes it harder for the sidewalk to be maintained clean, so I don't want to not do enforcement on homeowners and on business but the biggest problem is the city. And we can't find you or you can't get summonses for dirty streets because of the cars. So, the cars are my biggest issue. It's the vehicles blocking your ability to clean these streets. So, I want to ask, how many summonses or the rate of summonses and whether or not they've changed to pre-pandemic levels

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

considering that the city has gone to pre-pandemic levels when it comes to vehicle use.

So, it means that I would expect the same amount of violations happening if not more, considering the change in culture of people that have cars and that are leaving them parked?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Great question. Uhm, yes, we are definitely writing summonses. I believe the first three months of this Fiscal Year, we're somewhere in the neighborhood on just on parking summonses alone for the statutes that we write to. I believe we're close to about 100,000 summonses so far. But I will ask Chief Cyrus of our Enforcement Division to get a lit bit granular, because that's a very good point. Chief Cyrus, please weigh in.

RICKY CYRUS: Good morning. Thank you for having me. So, for parking summonses in the first three months, we have written approximately 97,395 summonses of which, is broken down. In July, we wrote 40,469. Augusts around 41,753 and 15,173 in September so far.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And Assistant Chief Cyrus, can you just clarify to me, how many of those summonses are for vehicles parking violations versus

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

39

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

homeowners? Like, breakdown the homeowners versus -  
the homeowners, commercial, I guess sidewalk versus  
street, I guess if you can do that?

RICKY CYRUS: Those numbers are just for parking.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, okay.

RICKY CYRUS: For those summons in July, we wrote  
25,000. In August around 24,000 and in September  
around 10,000.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, and then how many of  
those summonses did you write around the same time  
this year two years ago? Do you have that  
information? Like, two years ago, same month to  
date, how many violations were written?

RICKY CYRUS: I don't have that information in  
front of me right now, but I am willing to get them  
to you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright Chief, yeah, if you  
find that information, can you get it to me? I have  
a ton of more, I have a lot of questions but I'm  
going to hold back because I want my Council Members  
to get an opportunity to speak and I can always, I'll  
be here the whole day, so I'll come back to it.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

40

1  
2       So, uhm, Committee Counsel, I think Jessica is  
3 going to handle that work. Thank you so much  
4 Commissioner and I'll be back.

5       EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Chair.

6       COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. I will now  
7 call on other Council Members to ask their questions  
8 in the order they have used their Zoom raise hand  
9 function. If you would like to ask a question and  
10 you have not yet used the Zoom raise hand function,  
11 please raise it now. You should begin once I have  
12 called on you and the Sergeant has announced that you  
13 may begin delivering your testimony.

14       First, we will hear from Council Member Cabrera  
15 followed by Council Member Chin. Council Member  
16 Cabrera.

17       COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much  
18 Committee Council and to the Chair. Thank you for  
19 your leadership. You hit on a lot of the questions  
20 that I was very interested in covering. And  
21 Commissioner welcome and to Assistant Commissioner.  
22 I wanted to point out first that uh, timeout  
23 interview, they did a survey of 27,000, they polled  
24 city dwellers in an urban center across multiple  
25 continent.



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

41

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

And New York City came within the top three dirtiest. Uh, dirtiest city even though we line in the top five cities overall and the top most exciting cities in the world, and yet, this is something that is not just perceived by New Yorkers but from all over the world. That is unfortunately the perception and I think in reality a lot of our neighborhoods. So, I just wanted to point that out.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Second, in terms of what Council Member Reynoso mentioned in terms of enforcement, I have to be honest with you. We need more enforcement. I mean, I believe that that is the problem. I think a lot of the things that we're facing in the city right now, whether it is crime, whether it is related to cleanliness, is that we need to get back to what used to work. It worked before, why is not working right now? I don't see the level of ticketing and I would have loved to see and I only wish that your team was a bit more prepared because this is the only way we could compare in contrast, but even if they were high right now, we need to give more tickets. Because that's what people respond to.

24

25

They're going to respond to their wallets and that's the only way you're going to be able to do

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

42

1

2

what you used to do before and it worked so well

3

before. And I can't wait until we get also back

4

Monday and Wednesday twice a week and get back to

5

again, what works. This is no secret to the level of

6

effectiveness and efficiency and to the credit to the

7

Department of Sanitation on the way you had it

8

before. I think if we return back to exactly what we

9

were doing before, we'll get the same results.

10

But the last thing and I'm going to just point

11

this out and it's more of a question. Last time I

12

asked this question, I pointed out to you that the

13

Bronx proportionately has less sanitation workers

14

than the other borough like Manhattan and Brooklyn

15

and I'm grateful that they have what they need. But

16

our sanitation workers have to double dumping in

17

terms of the trucks and we have less workers.

18

Now, I heard you and the good news, you hired

19

more people but I imagine there was also attrition

20

that took place, people that retire. How many more

21

prior to January are we over the numbers that we had

22

back in January in terms of the Bronx Sanitation

23

workers?

24

EDWARD GRAYSON: Councilman, what I will do is,

25

dynamically for the Bronx, I do not have that. Uhm,

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

43

1

2 we are going to finish our last group of new hires  
3 before November, so our last class goes in in  
4 November. Your Bronx garages will definitely be back  
5 to full if not a little bit over pre-pandemic  
6 staffing. Uhm, you know on the relative term. But  
7 I'll have a grid sent to your office, absolutely of  
8 where the numbers hit.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Commissioner, I just  
10 want to say, my goal here is not pre-pandemic. What  
11 I'm trying to say is that pre-pandemic,  
12 proportionately, proportionately, we were not getting  
13 our due. And what I'm hoping is that we get our due.  
14 That we get proportionate compared to the other  
15 boroughs. We are way below. The union, the  
16 sanitation unit, in fact they brought it to my  
17 attention.

18

And, and so, what I'm hoping is not that we go  
19 back to the pre-pandemic, that we go above that  
20 because they are doing more work here and they have  
21 more area coverage. Because they have to go a longer  
22 distance between staff versus Manhattan and  
23 everything's just - you know how it works. You know  
24 this better than I do. The work is, I don't want to  
25 call it easier but it's more streamlined. That you

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

44

1

2

would as you see in the Bronx, the Bronx is one of

3

the hardest place and this is why when there's snow

4

and we're anticipating more snow this year, you

5

always have to get from the other borough. We never

6

have enough, never.

7

And that's just accentuates the fact that we're

8

lacking. And I know my colleagues here from the

9

Bronx, Council Member Feliz, Council Member Riley and

10

others share the same sentiment that we here in the

11

Bronx and this is the overall story with just about

12

everything. It's a bit frustrating that we don't get

13

our fair share. And that's all we're asking for.

14

We're not asking for more, we're just asking for fair

15

share proportionally to other boroughs.

16

EDWARD GRAYSON: Understood sir. Thank you for

17

your question. I will give those numbers though, so

18

you can see it.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I appreciate that

20

Commissioner. I appreciate your follow-up.

21

EDWARD GRAYSON: You got it.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much.

23

Thank you so much Mr. Chair.

24

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Council Member

25

Cabrera, I really appreciate your questioning and I

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

45

1  
2 guess, I want to share in the sentiment to kind of be  
3 a part of this caucus, returning alternate side of  
4 the street parking to normal because I think the  
5 Mayor is making a decision based on politics as  
6 opposed to it being on data and information. I  
7 believe Mayor de Blasio thinks the City of New York  
8 is very grateful that alternate side of the street  
9 parking has been reduced.

10 And I think it made sense during the pandemic but  
11 now that we're you know coming out of it or at least  
12 when it comes to vehicle usage, we should rethink  
13 whether or not that's politically savvy or make  
14 sense. Uhm, and I'm also part of the ticket more  
15 caucus as well. Council Member, I'm sorry, Committee  
16 Counsel.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair and thank you  
18 Council Member Cabrera. We will next hear from  
19 Council Member Chin followed by Council Member Riley.  
20 Council Member Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Thank you  
22 Chair. Thank you Commissioner. Good to see you. I  
23 have two questions. One is that rat problem.  
24 Especially now with all these open restaurants and in  
25 the residential neighborhood in my district, that's

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

46

1  
2 the biggest complaint that we get. The rats are you  
3 know running around and the garbage situation because  
4 there are a lot of these open restaurants. And so, I  
5 want to see like how Sanitation is working with the  
6 businesses to make sure that they clean up after  
7 themselves so that we can alleviate this problem.

8 And my second question is on the syringe  
9 collection. Because you were talking about you know  
10 Sanitation was able to do the collection and in my  
11 district, we've been asking for syringe box,  
12 especially in Sara D. Roosevelt Park and the  
13 residents there has been you know asking for that  
14 service. Do you work with the Parks Department to  
15 you know collect syringes in the park area and the  
16 playground? So, those are my two questions. Thank  
17 you.

18 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Councilwoman. First  
19 and foremost for the opening dining, so we - our  
20 enforcement division goes out and makes sure that all  
21 the restaurants have a private card of who is  
22 supposed to service their business as always. And  
23 additionally, we are doing our regular code  
24 enforcement for the dirty area during the commercial  
25 routing times.

1  
2           What we definitely have seen and what everybody  
3 can see is a definite change in behavior, on the  
4 streets that are hosting an outdoor structure, the  
5 place of the set out may have changed. Simply  
6 because normally, let's say a business would have put  
7 their garbage out right directly in front of the  
8 store. Well if not, if there's a dining structure  
9 there, they're going to put it off center or you know  
10 to the next available open space.

11           To that end, that's been something that's  
12 happening along the streetscapes but for the  
13 enforcement of what we do with that, all the  
14 commercial garbage, we do carter enforcement  
15 regarding, we go in and check store fronts and we  
16 talk to business owners to make sure that they have  
17 the private carter and a schedule that can meet their  
18 needs and number two, we can right summonses if they  
19 don't. And we have written summonses for those who  
20 fail to produce the fact that they have a carter that  
21 services their material.

22           And additionally, we can write for the  
23 cleanliness of the front of their property and we  
24 definitely, I would definitely like to know exactly  
25 what blocks are and I know that's widespread. But if

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

48

1  
2 you have definite places where you can point out,  
3 please definitely get it to our team here so we can  
4 work on something with you in your neighborhood that  
5 can be a little bit more tailored. Perhaps it's  
6 messaging. Perhaps we could do some - another thing  
7 where we give literature out to make sure that the  
8 business owners understand what the rules are.

9 We're not against summoning at all but I  
10 wouldn't mind doing any walk through with you or you  
11 could just forward us your hotspots and we could just  
12 send Chief Cyrus's people in to do some education. I  
13 just want to definitely make sure that we're going  
14 out there armed with the ability to properly  
15 communicate what the problems are.

16 That's to the first question. To the second  
17 question, uhm, we do work with the Parks Department.  
18 Most of the time, it's to get the litter, the syringe  
19 litter that's in and around that's not in a Sharks  
20 container. We do not put out Sharks containers for  
21 public drug use so to speak. That's not part of a  
22 program that we host, however, we do go to known -  
23 right now the syringe team has been going around to  
24 areas where its been observed. Where there's large  
25 amounts of syringe litter for what is perceived to be



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

49

1  
2 public drug use and we go and we try to proactively  
3 clean that up. We worked in a few playgrounds, so if  
4 this is uh, in all the parts of the city, just on  
5 request. We can certainly work with the Parks  
6 Department. We can certainly work with any Council  
7 Member who has a place that they know is a hot spot  
8 for what is public drug use. It's naturally part of  
9 a bigger team effort so to speak. Why is there  
10 public drug use?

11       You know the other things that, we're there for  
12 the backend to try to make sure that any of the  
13 syringes that are left, we can properly dispose of  
14 and keep not just the eyesore but any health  
15 conditions that could arise from that.

16       That's our main focus but we would gladly work  
17 with you to find out where that is and we could  
18 certainly discuss with our partners in Parks, if  
19 there's another program that they are hosting. Like  
20 I said, we don't host putting out Sharks containers  
21 publicly but we go by. This team goes by and does  
22 proactive sweeps in known areas where there's drug  
23 use.

24       COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, yeah, we'll  
25 definitely follow-up with you.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

50

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

EDWARD GRAYSON: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: To work on those because especially you know rat issues that these – the restaurants are in residential neighborhoods. You know you have a resident upstairs. Like, especially the lower eastside, in my district and you know we had issues with bars and now the open restaurant, it just really adds to it.

So, we definitely will follow-up with you to work on it. Thank you.

EDWARD GRAYSON: You got it.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Commissioner.  
Thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you and I just want to, the best way to handle the rat problem is called containerized waste. This is one of the only large cities in the world that doesn't do containerized waste, which would make it impossible pretty much for any vermin to be able to eat or get into our garbage system. I've been trying to push that for quite some time here and haven't been too successful because I don't know who carries that bill. But whoever carries that bill, we should be pushing it forward because containerized waste is the way of the future

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

51

1  
2 and it will make the job easier actually for the  
3 Department of Sanitation while also reducing the  
4 numbers of rats that exist in this city. Thank you.  
5 Thank you Council Member Chin.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. Thank you  
7 Council Member Chin. We will now hear from Council  
8 Member Riley followed by Council Member Feliz.  
9 Council Member Riley.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you Council. Can  
11 you hear me well? Thank you Chair Reynoso and thank  
12 you Commissioner Grayson. First and foremost, I  
13 would like to thank Commissioner Grayson, the  
14 sanitation has been amazing in my district with  
15 helping me out with a few issues such as cleaning up  
16 areas where a lot of pollution is going, such as  
17 furniture and TV's.

18 My question kind of piggybacks off of Council  
19 Member Chin. There's a huge rat issue that's going  
20 on in my district now, predominantly residential.  
21 These rats kind of look like cats. They are huge and  
22 they're like going through different houses. So, I  
23 just wanted to - uh, I guess you kind of answered  
24 what you're doing to kind of address that.

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

My follow-up question is also abandoned cars. There's a ton of abandoned cars in my district, especially during COVID being that a lot of individuals couldn't go to the DMV. Is there any update on what Sanitation is doing about abandoned cars? And also, under the underpasses of a lot of subway stations in my community is a ton of garbage and that's one of the locations that Sanitation is helping me out with. But I just want to know uhm, if the Council Members don't get in contact with Sanitation, is there any procedures that you guys kind of go under these underpasses and clean them out. If you do, is that once a week, once a month, what does that procedure look like?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Councilman and thank you for your partnership and your leadership. You've definitely pointed us towards a number of conditions that it was great that we could work together and get it cleaned up.

To the rat problem, uh, number one, first and foremost, it's definitely if you're going to talk to your constituents. You know, the way that they set out if there's any way potentially that they could take more and more of a shift to - if they're maybe

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

in areas where we have more plastic bags set out in the residential side as opposed to garbage can set out. And I'm not talking about a steel trap. I mean even just a receptacle. Sometimes that helps because it's clearly easier for vermin in fact to get into a plastic bag than it would be to be into a container.

So, there's some messaging that we can certainly put out on our end as well to encourage people to whenever possible use a receptacle as opposed to a bag particularly in the route areas.

The other thing I want to definitely point out -

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'm sorry, Commissioner Grayson, I'm sorry. Can you just repeat that. That's information I've never heard of. You're saying in residential areas for example, you can put out your entire basket, the actual trash can. You guys would prefer that than just the loose pieces of bags?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Well, preference is, to what - if you have an area where you have a lot of rats eating from the street, then theoretically, I mean I'm just - the can would be better. So, we would service the can for them. Obviously this respective to the homeowner.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

54

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A lot of people don't, if you don't have the storage, we see a lot of places that have high density so to speak or middle density where it's multiunit homes. If you don't have a ton of storage to put out 15 cans, you're going to put out a bag, you know a set of bags. It really depends on the respective property owners ability to store it in between collection dates. However, if they put it out in a can, we would service - we do both types of set out. We service the cans that are at the curb and we also service the bags that are at the curb.

This is an encouragement for anybody who if you're saying that you notice that the rat population is up or those are the complaints, you can ask the constituents that you're talking to, how do you set out the garbage? Do you put out just the bag from the kitchen or do you put it out -

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I know, I know a lot, I know personally on my block, a lot of people do the garbage bags but they do not do the cans because sometimes and I don't want to put a blame on Sanitation because I know that they're kind of rushing but sometimes when they do put the cans out, their cans might end up in the street. Because it

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

55

1  
2 could be windy that day, there's no garbage in it, so  
3 it kind of flies around. So, I know that was the  
4 issue why a lot of constituents aren't putting out  
5 the cans but maybe there's a way we could kind of  
6 figure out you know how they could put out the cans  
7 more than the bags. But I do agree that I think the  
8 cans will be a better suit.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And also, Commissioner, I  
10 also thought that the Sanitation workers preferred  
11 the bags over the cans. So, I'm just trying to use  
12 this as a learning and teachable moment. Because I  
13 thought you know it was always more convenient for  
14 bags than it is for trash cans as well. And I know  
15 Council Member Riley, you got all the time in the  
16 world, so don't feel like -

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Oh, no, no, no, go ahead,  
18 go ahead Chair. It's alright.

19 EDWARD GRAYSON: Oh, no, Chair I appreciate the  
20 context. So, being a former Sanitation worker, I  
21 could tell you that moving throughout the route, if I  
22 don't have to make the return trip with the can, you  
23 know because if I take the can from the curb and  
24 bring it to the truck, I have to bring the can back.  
25 That's part of my job.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

56

1  
2       So, every time I'm on a block where there's bags  
3 set out and I don't have to make the second trip  
4 back, hurray for me. However, and I'm not trying to  
5 be cheeky, that's great because it leads to one less  
6 trip back to the curb. However, what I'm saying is  
7 speaking in context, if you notice on a particular  
8 block you're talking to a constituent that says, I  
9 have a lot of rats around here, then while it may be  
10 easier for me, your Sanitation worker to go only once  
11 to the truck instead of twice to bring your can back,  
12 I would rather you not have rats.

13       Therefore, what I'm saying is, if you put out a  
14 can, I'm picking it up either way. You know that's  
15 the way - so, now this really does put the maybe to  
16 the point of, what is right for the respective  
17 constituent in their setup. We also do definitely  
18 recognize that there are homeowners that just do not  
19 have space. So, for them, they don't want to host a  
20 can. They want to be able to just take the kitchen  
21 bag, you know, they can store two bags and then bring  
22 it out. We understand that and we're going to come  
23 by and clean it up. However, speaking solely to any  
24 place where you are concerned, any Council Member has  
25 constituent's that are concerned about vermin or



1  
2 vector, a can may help alleviate some of the  
3 opportunities for them to interact in front of the  
4 house.

5       Naturally, I am not an expert on the way rats  
6 behave but clearly food source and the availability  
7 of it is going to change the way that they do behave.  
8 If they have less availability, there should by proxy  
9 be less in front of the property or they'll just move  
10 on.

11       The one thing I do want to circle back to though  
12 Council Member Riley is, make sure that – I want to  
13 know where your hot spots are for that because we  
14 also partner with the Department of Health and maybe  
15 there's some more batting or some other things that  
16 we could do directly to the actual rat population.

17       COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Okay.

18       EDWARD GRAYSON: Because that's where we're about  
19 the litter and then the abatement of rats is through  
20 the Health Department. Like we don't have  
21 exterminators that go out. They have the teams that  
22 look at that. So, that's another resource that I  
23 definitely want to know where your challenges are.  
24 To the MTA properties or the underpass properties, if  
25 they are city owned, we were driving past them

1  
2 anyway. So, what we do is we do make those  
3 observations. We encourage our partners that own –  
4 that may be the responsible party for that property.  
5 AKA the MTA, State DOT etc.

6 And we say to them hey, do you notice this dirt  
7 and litter or drop off or unsafe condition on your  
8 property that's an eyesore to New York City you know  
9 residents and we encourage them in writing, calls,  
10 etc., to do the right thing. We also work through  
11 you know intergov to try to get more of that  
12 communication happening.

13 What winds up happening sometimes is, we work  
14 together locally and we just cross that imaginary  
15 line and go clean it up. Now what happens is, is  
16 that it takes awhile to schedule that because number  
17 one, it's an – now it becomes a scheduled cleanup  
18 with department resources that we weren't planned for  
19 but we go do it because we want to take care of the  
20 mess. You know and a lot of times public spaces that  
21 have this dividing line that is uncertain, that's  
22 where it winds up. It winds up in a quagmire where  
23 you're not telling us, hey, can you help me clean  
24 this up and it may or may not be definitively DSNY's  
25 but then we wind up trying to do what we can to help.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

59

1  
2       And by the way, I looked – that is something that  
3 we've done for years. My entire career here, we have  
4 worked locally and tried to encourage our partners.  
5 You know whether it be the state government, federal  
6 government, MTA, who ever owns respect said piece of  
7 land that should be doing it with their resources to  
8 not tax us to do it. But we try to work on it.

9       COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: And the abandoned cars?

10       EDWARD GRAYSON: Abandoned cars. Uhm, big  
11 problem definitely. We've definitely seen that. Our  
12 challenge – we're doing a lot of great work. We –  
13 our tag and tow operations were diminished throughout  
14 the pandemic. Thankfully, we've been able to do a  
15 lot more of them and the numbers are looking good as  
16 we lead into the rest of this Fiscal Year and moving  
17 onward. The big challenge for the Department with  
18 abandoned vehicle is, if it has a plate on it, even  
19 if and I'm going to say this frankly, even if from  
20 the outward appearance, anybody could decipher that  
21 it's a fake license plate.

22       You don't need to be a trained professional. It  
23 looks that cheesy and fake. It can even be a vanity  
24 plate that says this is a fake plate. If it has a  
25 plate on it, it is now, I can't tow it. I can't deem

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

60

1

2 it derelict. It has to meet specific criteria. So,  
3 we work with the PD, the wheelhouse officers to try  
4 to identify cars that are parked there that we get  
5 the feedback on illegal cars. On people who haven't  
6 moved the car. If its got a displayed plate, all I  
7 can do is summons it for not moving for the broom or  
8 not moving because it's parked too close but we work  
9 with PD on the ones.

10 As far as the derelict vehicles go, if it's  
11 derelict and we call it in, we get that towed, all we  
12 need is six hours of turnaround time and if it's  
13 something that's completely abandoned, we have a very  
14 high turnover rate on what we tag and what gets  
15 removed. The bigger challenge in many neighborhoods  
16 throughout the city is what is clearly people using  
17 their vehicles either as a temporary shelter. Or  
18 there just - there's a lot of cars out there or the  
19 advent of the people who are parking illegally on the  
20 street because they are into some kind of selling the  
21 car or various parts of repair. Where they leave the  
22 car parked on the street with a plate displayed and  
23 then I can't tow it.

24 But we definitely work with the wheel officer and  
25 our number of derelict vehicles removed and tagged

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

61

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

and towed has significantly gone up and I think we're going to get back to pre-pandemic levels if not more than that because that's also subjective to how many instances are reported.

But we're in a good place to start that to be in a really have higher numbers and be able to respond more quickly into the rest of this Fiscal Year.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you Commissioner.  
Thank you Chair Reynoso.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Council Member Riley. And we've also been joined by Council Member Darma Diaz as well.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. Thank you Council Member Riley. We will now hear from Council Member Feliz.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you so much everyone for this very important hearing. Thank you Chair. Thank you Committee Counsel and also thank you to the Department of Sanitation for all the work they do in our city.

So, I have a few questions about garbage dumping problems and my apologies if someone already asked them. I actually had another meeting, so I had to jump on about 20 to 30 minutes after the questions

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

62

1

2 started. So, in some areas of our city, there are  
3 literally mountains of garbage due to illegal  
4 dumping. It's so bad that it seems like the people  
5 doing the garbage dumping, it seems like they  
6 literally think that it's legal due to the fact that  
7 there's very little to no enforcement.

8 They come at all hours of the day and literally  
9 dump garbage, everything on the list. Mattresses,  
10 toilets, furniture, everything. So, my question is,  
11 can you give us a breakdown of tickets and summonses  
12 that you've given out by borough? So, for example,  
13 20,000 in the Bronx, 20,000 in Brooklyn. So,  
14 breakdown of the amount of tickets and summonses that  
15 you have given out.

16 EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Council Member. Uhm,  
17 yes, we can do - we can give you some granularity.  
18 I'm going to ask Assistant Chief Cyrus; he runs our  
19 enforcement division. His team goes out and fights  
20 illegal dumping. They are the ones that do the  
21 impounds. They are the one's that write those  
22 summonses. So, we're going to give you some granular  
23 details on where we are currently and he will also  
24 tell you where he thinks we're headed. Chief.

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

63

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

RICKY CYRUS: Good morning again. So, so far for this year we have given out 122 summonses for illegal dumping. Uhm, we have impounded 87 vehicles throughout the city for illegal dumping. The thing with illegal dumping is most of the time, we would have to catch them in the act. We have moved into surveillance cameras, where we can use the video recording. If we can clearly see the license plate, we can clearly see that the person the item out of that vehicle, whether it's a truck, left side, right side, uhm, then once we locate that vehicle, we can impound that vehicle.

The responsible party is the vehicle owner. It's just like the regular red light ticket or bus lane ticket. The owner of the vehicle is responsible for that ticket. So, the owner of the vehicle is responsible for uhm, whoever dumps of it. These summonses spot the first offense at \$4,000.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Chief, just to follow-up, I think one was a breakdown by borough but also, can you further explain that illegal dumping has to happen through vehicles? If a person, an individual walks up and dumps something, what is that called, if there is no vehicle?

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

64

1

2

RICKY CYRUS: That's called improper disposal.

3

So, if I walk out of my house and take my bag of

4

garbage and I put it on the corner basket, that's

5

improper disposal. If for illegal dumping to happen,

6

it has to be from a vehicle.

7

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can you talk about the

8

difference in fine structure for those two? So, like

9

if I go in with my bag and I throw it in, I get fined

10

how much? If I put it in my car, open my trunk and

11

then throw it out, how much are the difference in

12

finances for that?

13

RICKY CYRUS: So, the difference in fines, it

14

ranges from improper disposal is \$100 to maximum

15

\$250, \$300. For illegal dumping from a vehicle, it

16

starts at \$4,000 and it goes all the way up to

17

\$18,000. And illegal dumping from a vehicle, if me,

18

my brother, my cousin, go and dump, that's an

19

individual ticket for each person. So, if we catch

20

three people in that particular vehicle, that will be

21

\$4,000 summoned for each person in that vehicle.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah, so you mentioned 122

23

summons. Is that for the whole year for 2021?

24

RICKY CYRUS: Yes, that is for year to date.

25



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

65

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: And how many of those have  
3 been in the Bronx? How many summonses of those?

4 RICKY CYRUS: We've had 23 of those summonses in  
5 the Bronx.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay. Okay, my next  
7 question is, is there a process that the Department  
8 of Sanitation follows in high dumping areas? So, for  
9 example, an automatic process where you know new  
10 cameras are installed and you know some enforcement  
11 tools are also installed. So, hopefully you know put  
12 an end to that problem.

13 RICKY CYRUS: So, yes, we have a taskforce that  
14 monitors certain areas in the city every night. Uhm,  
15 we've had specific blitz in certain neighborhoods in  
16 the past month. So, in August, we had a blitz in  
17 Brooklyn 5, Community Board 5, which we had 16  
18 impounds, 27 illegal dumping summonses were issued.  
19 We issued 15 violations for littering from a vehicle  
20 and we even had one arrest.

21 And we did the same thing in the Bronx too at the  
22 end of August, which we had 19 impounds, 15 illegal  
23 dumping violations and nine summonses were issued  
24 from littering from a vehicle. We plan on moving  
25 throughout the city in different neighborhoods. How

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

66

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

we come up with a neighborhood is from our officers going out and doing investigations. We get it from Council Members, Community Boards, 311's and just the community members reporting to us, telling us where they have problems, so that we can go out and attack the legal dumping.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay, no more questions. Thank you.

RICKY CYRUS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I worry about Council Member Feliz. He said, okay, you didn't seem confident there Council Member. I guess, I guess, I hope Chief and Commissioner, I hope you guys hear the common threat here of a want for more enforcement. That hearing, that when he heard the number 22 out of the Bronx, it seemed underwhelming and it almost makes it feel like you know considering the amount of illegal dumping that he's witnessing. That 22, you might be able to just do that in his district alone. So, uhm, but what you're saying is now there is a way, if we get you a camera - so I guess what I want to ask, I have I think installed at least 12 cameras for the NYPD here in my district. If one of those cameras is located by a sites that gets a significant

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

67

1

2 amount of illegal dumping, can you use those cameras  
3 to identify vehicles in which illegal dumping has  
4 happened or are you going to need an independent  
5 camera to do that work?

6

RICKY CYRUS: At this time, we need an  
7 independent camera because we don't have access to  
8 NYPD's camera.

9

EDWARD GRAYSON: Oh, Councilman, I want to jump  
10 in. I'm thrilled to know that you have additional  
11 cameras placed that you funded and added to the  
12 community and we will certainly continue that  
13 conversation where the Chief was starting because if  
14 there is available imagery that we can have access  
15 to, we will gladly include that into our enforcement  
16 program. Because what we now have is the mechanism  
17 by the legislation that we can enforce off the  
18 camera.

19

So, I don't believe that I need to overall and  
20 I'm saying this without discussing it with my  
21 lawyers, but just like you're assuming, I am also  
22 assuming that if there is available cameras that I  
23 can get the imagery from, we can proceed down a path  
24 of enforcement. Even if it just gets us on the right  
25 investigative start. We could certainly use that

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

68

1  
2 footage to start either an investigation, if not  
3 directly enforce off of that imagery.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That's good to know  
5 Commissioner. I'm learning a lot. I've been doing  
6 this for what seven and a half years and I learn  
7 something new every day when I get on these Committee  
8 hearings. I didn't know that I thought you had to be  
9 caught in the act and that you couldn't use cameras.  
10 It had to be, you had to – I know the dog poop is the  
11 one that I remember that you got to catch them in the  
12 act. That even a camera doesn't work. You know  
13 we're trying to solve problems here, so hearing this  
14 stuff is really helpful uhm to me and I hope to other  
15 Council Members. So, thank you. Thank you for that  
16 and I don't know Council Member Feliz, if you have  
17 any follow-up or you feel okay? You good? Alright,  
18 alright, Committee Counsel.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Alright, thank you Chair and  
20 thank you Council Member Feliz. We will now hear  
21 from Council Member Darma Diaz. Council Member Diaz.  
22 Council Member Diaz, one moment, you need to be  
23 unmuted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you. To repeat  
25 myself because it's worth saying twice if not three

1  
2 times. Thank you Chair for this much needed  
3 conversation. I want to thank you Commissioner  
4 Grayson for working with us so closely in Community  
5 Board 5, where at one point, had the most dumping in  
6 New York City, so it seems.

7 My question was going to go more toward cameras.  
8 Again, thank you Chair for bringing up the  
9 conversation about cameras. It's definitely much  
10 needed. Diaz is kind of getting tired of bragging  
11 around the district and identifying so if we can  
12 figure out a way to get cameras, it would be amazing.  
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Council Member,  
15 Council Member Diaz. I think there's a revelation  
16 Commissioner Grayson related to these cameras. Uh, I  
17 really think folks are like, my precinct is going to  
18 hear from me. I have one dumping site that's right  
19 next to a camera and uh, you know, now that I know  
20 that I'm going to ask my precinct if they can give  
21 access to the garage or to the supervisor or whoever.  
22 And I agree with you that, there might not be  
23 something we do readily now but once I call the  
24 Mayor's Office and let him know that I would  
25 appreciate if the NYPD give access to the Department

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

70

1

2 of Sanitation for that, I do see it being a problem.

3 But it could help solve a lot of issues because I

4 think again enforcement is the biggest issue we're

5 having here. So, I'm really excited about that.

6 Committee Counsel, are there any other Council

7 Members that are looking to ask questions or a second

8 round?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see Council Member

10 Feliz's Zoom hand is raised. So, Council Member

11 Feliz, please ask your questions.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. So, could you

13 give us a breakdown or a brief summary of the caught

14 in the act rule? Is that for summonses or is that to

15 impound the vehicle, caught in the act dumping

16 garbage?

17 EDWARD GRAYSON: Understood. I appreciate the

18 question and again, I'm going to have Chief Cyrus.

19 Chief, take it away.

20 RICKY CYRUS: It depends on the type of

21 violation. We have action violations and these

22 action violations; you would have to catch that

23 person in the act. As you talked about K9, improper

24 disposal if somebody's dumping something into a

25 litter basket, that can be caught in the act. Or if

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

71

1

there is mail in that litter basket, we can write an  
S2P or S16 for that violation. So, only the action  
violations we have to catch them in the act. If we  
have a violation, we can write them to the property.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay, so if someone is  
dumping garbage in the Bronx and you don't catch them  
in the act, you wouldn't be able to give them a  
summons?

10

RICKY CYRUS: It depends on the type of  
violation. If it's just improper disposal, no, we  
wouldn't be able to give them a summons unless we  
catch them in the act.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay, so under what  
conditions would you be able to give a summons for  
garbage dumping without catching someone in the act?

17

RICKY CYRUS: So, if, if in that bag, that person  
dropped into the litter basket, we open it and we  
find some kind of identifier, whether it's a box from  
Amazon or a mail, we can write a violation based on  
that. But we have to find something that would  
identify that person as where the garbage is coming  
from.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: What about someone coming  
with a truck or a car and dumping garbage?

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

72

1

2 RICKY CYRUS: So, if we catch them in the act, we  
3 can impound that vehicle. But if there is some kind  
4 of video surveillance, if we have a camera in that  
5 location and we can identify them off of that camera,  
6 we can get that information. But we clearly have to  
7 have the plate and we have to see where the person's  
8 dumping that debris from.

9 EDWARD GRAYSON: Also, if I may add some other  
10 context? Chief, remind them about the affidavit that  
11 can be also filled out, which is now after the fact  
12 by a witness.

13 RICKY CYRUS: Right, so if someone witnessed it,  
14 they can fill out an affidavit. They get in contact  
15 with us, we provide them an affidavit and we can  
16 write a summons based on that persons eye witness  
17 account.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Okay, and you also  
19 mentioned that last, well, this year so far, you've  
20 been given about 122 summonses and about 20-ish were  
21 in the Bronx. Uhm, how would you describe the  
22 current enforcements tools that we finally have and  
23 how much of that is allocated to the Bronx?

24 RICKY CYRUS: Can you repeat the question? I  
25 didn't hear you correctly.



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

73

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah, so could you describe the current enforcement tools that we have now and also, kind of roughly describe how much of that is allocated to the Bronx? So, cameras, uhm, people I guess patrolling an area, to see if they catch someone in the act?

7

8

RICKY CYRUS: So, in terms of Sanitation Police, we have nine Sanitation Police and two Lieutenants assigned to the Bronx. Enforcement Agents, we have two Lieutenants, six Sergeants and 24 Agents assigned to the Bronx. At this time, we don't have any cameras in the Bronx. We are still in the infancy stage of our cameras. Uhm, we currently have four cameras that we are using and those four cameras are between Brooklyn, Queens and Staten Island.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

We are in the process of working with vendors to see which economically how it will work for us to purchase more cameras. At this time, the cameras that we purchase cost around \$10,000 each. We are working with two vendors right now, which are looking very promising. We have a pilot program that we should be starting some time this month. We got another vendor to supply us with four cameras. And hopefully, we'll be able to use those cameras.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

74

1  
2 Those run in the cost of around \$6,000 to \$8,000.  
3 Hopefully, they would work for the particular needs  
4 that we have. And we're also working with another  
5 vendor to see how we can streamline price, so that we  
6 can purchase more cameras in the not too distant  
7 future. So, we're asking you guys where you can,  
8 help us fund these cameras because -

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: What do these cameras do  
10 Assistant Chief Cyrus? What do they do exactly?

11 RICKY CYRUS: So, we put those cameras in the  
12 dead ends or known dump locations and the ones that  
13 we have right now, we have a live stream of it. So,  
14 we can sit at the office or we can sit two or three  
15 blocks away from that location, where we can see the  
16 activity that's happening in that area.

17 We've had incidents where our members were  
18 patrolling on one side of the neighborhood and  
19 illegal dumping was happening on the cameras on the  
20 other side and we were able to go and catch them in  
21 the act. So, these cameras have video surveillance  
22 cameras and we have live feeds that is monitored at  
23 our head courters and it's monitored in the field by  
24 a mobile app.  
25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

75

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

EDWARD GRAYSON: So, to add some context, just to paint a picture, uhm, our ability to write summonses and do enforcement after action off of a camera, is relatively new. So, we're in the process of figuring out the right way to get these cameras in. Where does the funding come from. Right now, we have partnerships and we're trying to leverage existing cameras, much to what you mentioned Chair, like there are other cameras out there. So, we're trying to make it scalable, proof out the enforcement angle on it with regard to, it's circumstantial so we have to capture a plate and that plate has to be able to be traced back to someone, so that we can the after action enforcement, similar to a red light summons.

We take a picture of the plate and then no matter what, whoever owned the vehicle is presumed to have some culpability of how that legal dumping occurred because their vehicle was used in a legal dumping. So, we have a couple of things that are really what Chief Cyrus said earlier, we're at our infancy. Where we're looking to continue to expand what the program can be. So, between the fact that we can use the cameras for proactive enforcement to what the Chief's point was, we could actually see if we're

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

76

1  
2 patrolling somewhere else, we can get alerted that  
3 there is an illegal dumper at another part of the  
4 neighborhood that we're patrolling in and go make  
5 that happen, that interaction happen in real time.  
6 Or if for some reason, it misses our opportunity to  
7 respond, hopefully the camera can grab - well, we  
8 still have to clean it up. The camera can grab the  
9 information, we can then go after the fact and at  
10 least do summonsing or enforcement on the illegal  
11 person who dumped.

12       So, it helps on both real time enforcement and  
13 after action enforcement whenever the circumstances  
14 marry up to the camera being viable and the image  
15 captured being viable. So, it really does have some  
16 widespread potential and we are definitely looking to  
17 expand the use of it as a tool to help combat illegal  
18 dumping and help give the at least knowledge to the  
19 people who do illegally dump, that while we may not  
20 be there, there is someone watching me. And that  
21 it's not - we might not always be there to make the  
22 impound or arrest or have that in-person interaction  
23 but we certainly would have the ability now at least  
24 to go and find you afterwards. So, it's definitely  
25 going to be a tool to move forward with.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

77

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, Commissioner you're about to open up [INAUDIBLE 59:27]. Uhm, are these cameras capital eligible? So, should a Council Member want to give to the Department of Sanitation \$80,000 for eight cameras to put in an area that has a lot of dumping. Do you know if OMB would approve that designation by a Council Member?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Well, we just announced with Council Member Moya in Queens that he's buying us ten for \$100,000. So, I'm going to say yes.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That is, this is good news. You're in for a treat Commissioner Cyrus if you like cameras because I did not know this. It's a new program obviously but I did not know that we can -- so we give, I gave the Police Department a lot more than \$100,000 for ten cameras. I gave, trust me, I gave like \$250,000 for like four cameras. So, this is like chump change to solve for a problem that we've had for a long time.

I'm really excited about this opportunity. I'm upset that I don't have anymore Council budget seasons to be able to help out and the next Council Member is going to take credit for it. But I personally have three sites in my district that are

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

78

1  
2 out of control and arguably might have ten sites in a  
3 district that should use, should need cameras. So,  
4 I'm definitely going to let the future Council  
5 Members know, Council Member Feliz gets to be on the  
6 ground floor of this, so congratulations to you. But  
7 uh, this is very interesting and I'm really excited  
8 about the opportunity for that. So, so, thank you  
9 for that information and Chief Cyrus and Commissioner  
10 Grayson, I think this is good news for me and good  
11 news for New York. Council Member Feliz, go ahead.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah, one final question.  
13 So, would you say that the cameras, that that is the  
14 only tool missing for us to be able to finally, once  
15 and for all resolve that problem, the garbage dumping  
16 problem? We've had garbage dumping in some areas for  
17 many years, if not decades.

18 So, I'm just wondering, what exactly is needed  
19 and whether [INAUDIBLE 1:00:59].

20 EDWARD GRAYSON: I appreciate the question and I  
21 want to say wholeheartedly that cameras are not a  
22 syllable. They are not the missing tool to end it  
23 because unfortunately, as long as I'm going to  
24 arguably say you're younger than me sir, but for my  
25 45 years as a New York City you know in and around

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

79

1  
2 the boroughs, I could tell you now that illegal  
3 dumping happens because we have bad actors out there.

4 So, cameras do not stop bad actors but they  
5 certainly will help us. The other thing that I am  
6 thankful for and we get to move forward with this.  
7 Right now, we're onboarding one of our last groups of  
8 hiring. To that end, we get to now give some  
9 enforcement personnel, allocate you know new  
10 enforcement team members for Sanitation Police and  
11 Chief Cyrus's you know wind of the department. And  
12 we're also looking to onboard more Sanitation  
13 Enforcement Agents. So, it is a tool in the toolbox.

14 Number one, we need people to actually become  
15 better actors. So, we need those that illegally dump  
16 - anything that's illegally dumped or improperly  
17 disposed of you know in the nomenclature they're in,  
18 that's done by someone making a terrible decision  
19 that impacts the quality of life for the neighborhood  
20 that they happen to be in.

21 So, we need them to do their part, but when they  
22 don't, we need the resources which helps with the PCI  
23 teams that we've had to go out and do more. We need  
24 Chief Cyrus to have his headcount, so he could do  
25 more sweeps. And again, the effect of camera or

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

80

1  
2 moving toward the direction. I like you one day hope  
3 that illegal dumping never happens and uhm, and  
4 hopefully, maybe this is the start of you know in the  
5 next round of the city that we can totally stomp it  
6 out. I really do hope that that happens. I don't  
7 think that cameras is the silver bullet but I got to  
8 tell you and the Chairman brought it up. This is  
9 relatively new for us to be able to do this and I'm  
10 excited to see what we can do to really further  
11 refine what the final solution on cameras and  
12 cleaning. What does that look like? Is there, you  
13 know, we have to evolutionary with the people we  
14 serve. So, how do we continue to move forward? I  
15 think this next step with the cameras is definitely  
16 going to be a huge help for us.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you so much.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member  
19 Feliz. It looks like we have another questions or  
20 two from Council Member Diaz. Council Member Diaz.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you. My question is  
22 for Assistant Chief in reference to the cameras. So,  
23 I have a hotspot. You guys do an amazing job, six  
24 months later, we have - is it possible to move the  
25 camera to another condition? Another spot, hey, you



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

81

1

2

know what? Now it's not full to Pennsylvania

3

anymore, it's Junction. What's the process, if there

4

is a process?

5

RICKY CYRUS: The cameras we have are very

6

mobile. We can move them from location to location.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Perfect.

8

RICKY CYRUS: So, that wouldn't be an issue.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Wonderful. Then, my second

10

question would be, I rent, I go to Budget, I rent a

11

truck, I'm observed, the cameras catch that I dumped.

12

Would the summons be given to Budget because they own

13

the vehicle or would Darma's because I rented, you

14

have my driver's license attached to it, I would also

15

be given a summonsed? Are they summonsed for the

16

dumping?

17

RICKY CYRUS: In situations with a rental

18

vehicle, we would have to catch them in the act.

19

Uhm, at this time, we cannot write that summons to

20

Budget because they are renting that vehicle to me or

21

somebody else and I'm the back person.

22

At this time, the laws don't allow us to go into

23

Budget and get your information and write them a

24

summons from that. So, for rental companies, we

25

would have to catch them in the act in order to

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

82

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

impound the vehicle and write the person who rented the vehicle that summons.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Okay, thank you for confirming what I have heard. Chair, it's more conversation for us to have in the future because definitely it's an issue, at least in my district it is. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Assistant Commissioner Cyrus should get a percentage of every camera that gets borrowed moving forward because he did a great pitch but also Council Member Diaz just talked about, that's a new piece of legislation there. Is there anything we could write legislatively? So that Department of Sanitation could reach out to budget. There's a credit card on file, they could have charged the person directly through their credit card for care or no.

But Council Member Diaz, it's a good point here. A lot of the illegal dumping that happens are on like these rented U-Haul trucks and not necessarily a personal vehicle. So, that's good to know and it's interesting and we want to be as helpful as possible. So, any ideas you, the Department of Sanitation has,

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

83

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

please keep letting us know. We'll do what we can to make your life easier for sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: But just, my understanding is DS rents a vehicle to get to summons, budget will go after Diaz to pay that summons. It's not clear to me why is that interchangeable?

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: No, no, so no, so you can't, you got to get - if you're caught Council Member, if you're caught in the act yes. But if you're in a video for example, there is nothing they can do. So, I want them to get caught in the act and the video.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I agree. I agree.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: All hands on deck. Alright, thank you.

RICKY CYRUS: From our point of view, we would love that to be able to go to the budget, get the information from that person and be able to write that person a summons. But at this time, unfortunately, we cannot do that.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member Diaz and it looks like Council Member Riley has additional questions. Council Member Riley.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

84

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you. Just a remark and one more question. I love the camera idea. I'm actually going to implement two within my district just to try it out. I love the idea that it's mobile also. So, thank you so much for doing that.

And a follow-up question to garbage are being picked up by sanitation workers. If a house owner has video of a Sanitation worker kind of not putting back the trash can properly, is there any disciplinary action that happens to the worker or, or, or what is the process of that if you could prove that?

EDWARD GRAYSON: Oh, no, great question. It's heartbreaking to us when people forward us complaints of our Sanitation workers not bringing a can back or throwing out the can. We've had them. We suspend the employee. We look into it and if they have - if you have them on video, we will absolutely take disciplinary action against the Sanitation worker involved. We've done it. Sadly, we had an incident last week, where we just had to do it. And most of our employees are incredible and every now and again, if they are having a bad day or they've done something wrong out there behind the truck, we

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

85

1

2 discipline them for that. I'm happy to report that I  
3 am usually every single day proud of all members of  
4 service. But every now and again, someone does  
5 something wrong and when they do, we have a  
6 disciplinary process that we enact on that.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Alright, thank you  
8 Commissioner. Thank you Chair.

9

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, there are no other  
10 Council Members with questions. If you have any  
11 additional questions for the administration.

12

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I do not. I just want to  
13 thank Department of Sanitation for their amazing  
14 work. Arguably one of the greatest agencies in all  
15 of the City of New York, so I just want to thank you  
16 guys for your great work and good information. I'm  
17 looking forward to hearing testimony from the general  
18 public as well but great job. Thank you so much.  
19 Thank you Commissioner.

20

EDWARD GRAYSON: Thank you Chair.

21

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Commissioner  
22 Grayson, Chief Harbin and Assistant Chief Cyrus. We  
23 will now turn to public testimony. I would like to  
24 remind everyone that we will be calling on  
25 individuals one by one to testify. Each panelist

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

86

1  
2 will be given five minutes to speak. Please begin  
3 once the Sergeant has started the timer and given you  
4 the queue to begin. Council Members who have  
5 questions for a particular panelist should use the  
6 Raise hand function in Zoom and I will call on you  
7 after the panelist has completed their testimony.

8 For panelists, once your name is called, a member  
9 of our staff will unmute you and the Sergeant at Arms  
10 will give you the go ahead to begin upon setting the  
11 timer. Please wait for the Sergeant to announce that  
12 you may begin before delivering your testimony.

13 I would like to now welcome Liz McMillan of We  
14 Act for Environmental Justice followed by Kalvis  
15 Mikelsteins of the Dumbo Improvement District  
16 followed by Robert Camacho. Liz McMillan, you may  
17 begin when the Sergeant calls time.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Liz McMillan, are you still  
20 available to testify? If so, please unmute your mic.  
21 Okay, we will move on and if she's available we will  
22 come back to her. We will now hear from Kalvis  
23 Mikelsteins of the Dumbo Improvement District.  
24 Kalvis Mikelsteins, you may begin when the Sergeant  
25 calls time.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

87

1

2

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3

4

KALVIS MIKELSTEINS: Thanks very much. Can you  
hear me okay?

5

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we can hear you.

6

7

8

9

10

11

KALVIS MIKELSTEINS: Perfect, thank you. Good  
morning Chair Reynoso, Commissioner Grayson and  
distinguished Committee Members. Thank you for  
allowing me to speak today. My name is Kalvis  
Mikelsteins, Director of Operations at the Dumbo  
Business Improvement District in Brooklyn.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Like many BIDS in the city, we maintain a robust  
sanitation program, in order to keep the sidewalks  
and streets clean and clear for New Yorkers and  
visitors alike. I've come in front of your Committee  
to speak briefly regarding an issue that is ever  
present not just in Dumbo, but many parts of the  
city, especially the business districts and  
commercial corridors. The amount of trash and  
recycling bags put out for collection by medium and  
large scale residential and commercial properties is  
ever increasing, particularly as online ordering and  
home deliveries continue to grow.

24

25

These piles of trash bags stacked four to five  
feet high and lined up on narrow streets is both

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

88

1  
2 unsightly and hazardous, spilling into bike lanes and  
3 parking spaces. These piles often attract illegal  
4 dumping, further exacerbating the situation.

5 In our BID in Brooklyn, this is seen on many  
6 streets, where residents and visitors alike struggle  
7 to navigate around these piles. I've seen  
8 individuals pushing strollers, unable to pass narrow  
9 stretches of sidewalk on Water Street. I've seen  
10 cyclists having to leave bike lanes to avoid trash  
11 bags. And despite our BID and City Sanitation teams  
12 best efforts, illegal bags dropped almost every  
13 night.

14 I understand that the city budget plays a  
15 disproportionate role in DSNY's ability to handle the  
16 inordinate amount of waste generated in the city, and  
17 so I urge City Council Members to consider new  
18 alternatives to address the issues of improper waste  
19 storage and illegal dumping. While increased  
20 enforcement would be helpful, stronger interagency  
21 ties between DSNY, DOT, DOB, the NYPD, BIDs, and  
22 other city bodies concerned with improving the public  
23 realm, could yield a better understanding of the  
24 issue.

25



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

89

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

While there are many potential approaches that could be tested, none will be effective without a comprehensive approach led by City Hall to bring all relevant city agencies to the table. Working together, pilot programs such as the DSNY Clean Curbs program should be extended to include residential properties. Dear Committee Members, we must think both critically and creatively about solutions to manage waste disposal in dense, heavily trafficked parts of the city. While increased enforcement is helpful indeed, I believe the creative policy solutions, paired with technological advances, are what we need to solve this issue. Thank you for your time.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much. We will call on Robert Camacho to testify followed by Liz McMillan if she is back on. Robert Camacho, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

ROBERT CAMACHO: How we doing. I want to take the time to thank Antonio and all the Committee members and also Sanitation. I'm just a little - I've lived in Bushwick all my life. My father owned a home. We have a two family home. We had two

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

90

1  
2 families homes and all of a sudden we have these  
3 humungous buildings in there. They don't put the  
4 garbage out at the time it is supposed to be because  
5 I know you are supposed to be giving out tickets but  
6 we talk about tickets all the time. If you're making  
7 money and you're making a lot of it, just like the  
8 businesses and what he said. Guess what? That  
9 ticket is nothing to him. But to someone like me  
10 that's on a broke income in a two family home, it's a  
11 lot.

12       So, we really need to find out what's going on  
13 with that. They are not bringing supers into these  
14 buildings to make sure that they sweep the 18-inches  
15 in front of the building. So, they're not giving  
16 jobs for the people in the community. They're  
17 bringing that same dirty bucket in the van and  
18 cleaning all the other buildings that they're doing.  
19 So, they are not helping the community, one.

20       Two, in regards to parking, parking is a big  
21 issue. I clean 18 inches over my curb. I clean the  
22 snow. I put salt and sand. I clean it. Now the  
23 city has the audacity to turn and bring bike racks  
24 and put everything and disenfranchise the community  
25 that I've been there for 40 years cleaning and you

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

91

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

put something to make money. That's one. Then you turn around and you move alternate street side parking and I can't park because across the street there's a bus stop. Up the block there's the train. So, we got people with out of state plates that lived in Bushwick for 30 months. By law, they have to change their plates and I'm paying the insurance and paying taxes on my property and on my car, and you got out of state plates that don't move their care when it's alternate. And I told the guy from the sweeper, I have pictures. Jersey, Florida, North Carolina, Pennsylvania, they don't move. That \$25 is nothing to them or that \$45 is nothing to them because it costs \$300 a month and they're paying \$3,000 rent. So, they don't care that \$45.

We need to hit them people on a residential block, no out of state plates. Commercial plates or out of state plates because they take all the parking in our block and we can't park. Now, I can't - I'll pay extra taxes for me to keep my park in the front. I'm disabled. I use my car to go to the - I can't go nowhere, I'm stuck with a shopping cart because I can't move when I come back, I got nowhere to go. I

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

92

1  
2 can't park nowhere. It takes me three or four hours  
3 one.

4 Two, Sanitation is doing a good job. They are  
5 doing a good job. We need to get these cars to be  
6 moved. We need to get these people that are not  
7 cleaning up front 18 inches over the curb. To start  
8 picking up their crap. Or not \$25 or \$45 even me  
9 \$50, \$60 every time. But if I clean next door and  
10 you got one next door and he don't clean and  
11 everything blows over, then I get the ticket.

12 So, is it fair? Because you got an LLC and they  
13 don't bring businesses. We need to address those big  
14 buildings that are coming into the two and three  
15 family homes are residential blocks that are doing  
16 this to us, one. Two, they're out of state 18  
17 cleaning the curb. 311 forget about 311. I prefer  
18 directly working with Sanitation because by the time  
19 311 call, we have more garbage than we had when we  
20 called it the first time.

21 So, that's not working with us. We really need -  
22 watch when the leaves start falling. That alternate  
23 street side parking that you got one time, what am I  
24 going to do, move the leaves across the street? Pick  
25 up mine and everybody else don't pick up and all the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

93

1  
2 leaves come to me. Now, everybody get tickets? No,  
3 we need a better approach on that. Community  
4 parking, I don't mind paying, I know a lot of people  
5 on my block. We have more houses, two or three  
6 family home and people that live in their homes that  
7 are seniors, that are old timers that are not going  
8 nowhere, not selling their property. We have people  
9 that want to stay here and invest in our community  
10 and continue to make the community light. Those tree  
11 pits, crap all over. You know what they do with the  
12 bags? When your garbage – and I want to thank the  
13 Commissioner because I do that. I take my plastic  
14 can. I put it in the curb. I put my bag inside, I  
15 put my lid. The bad part is that sometimes I get  
16 Sanitation says I'm doing a nice job. He come by  
17 passing, he don't pick the lid up and take the  
18 garbage can out and leave. But now, I told him,  
19 there's garbage there. So, now he picks it up, takes  
20 my cans and put it.

21 Across the street, all those bags of garbage. I  
22 am the only one that put in a rubber can and put the  
23 garbage can inside and put the lid. That works  
24 because the rats don't go around and they leave. We  
25 really need to put the bags in there real nice with

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

94

1  
2 the lid because it's a two, three family house. You  
3 can do big buildings; we don't know how they can do  
4 it. So, I want to thank you and take the time for  
5 allowing me to testify and Reynoso, we love you. I  
6 know I'm going to work with you and we're going to  
7 have a wonderful time because I know you're going to  
8 be the man for it.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Camacho,  
10 appreciate it and I actually have a couple of  
11 questions for Assistant Chief for the conversation or  
12 the testimony by Robert Camacho. Uhm, are the fine  
13 structures similar for let's say a two family home  
14 versus someone that has a ten, ten, a building with  
15 ten apartments on it? Do they get the same type of  
16 fine regardless of the size of their property?

17 RICKY CYRUS: Yes, the fines are the same.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'm just saying, uhm, the  
19 Council Members that are here there's just a ton, a  
20 ton of legislation opportunities here to have the  
21 fine structure be the same for a single family home  
22 uhm as a you know a ten unit building. You're right,  
23 it's the cost of doing business for them versus a  
24 homeowner that could be on a fixed income.

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

95

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

So, I think that is something I want to look into for sure. So, that's one. The other one was Camacho, we're working on this, it's not necessarily just the community plates, it's scamming. It's insurance scamming. They say that they are from Jersey and from Florida and Pennsylvania. They don't move their cars. It's obviously that they are New York Cars but they want to get cheaper insurance so they go somewhere else. The people that have to solve for that, we tried here. We can't do that in the Council. It has to be the state, the states. So, we got to talk to our assembly member and our state senator because they can solve for that.

We even had a permit where you have to sign up with the Department of Transportation or DMV to get a temporary permit to be able to park in city streets if you have out of state plates. Which means, if you come in from New Jersey, you go on a website, under the website you say, I'm going to come to Bushwick for three days and we'll say oh, that costs you \$7 and you put this placard in front of you thing. If you stay longer than a certain amount of time. One, we're getting money off of that but if you stayed longer, they'll give you tickets or tow your car or

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

96

1

2 whatever it is. We don't even need to charge you or  
3 any New York City folks any money. Should we do  
4 that? The entire scamming industry will go, will  
5 fall apart.

6 So, we want to figure out a way we could solve  
7 for this problem where our residents don't get hit.  
8 They don't need to pay extra because they are not  
9 doing anything wrong. So, that's it.

10 ROBERT CAMACHO: Councilman, I want to thank you  
11 because I know you're not responsible for those cars  
12 and those people coming here but we really need to  
13 focus on that because they don't move.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

15 ROBERT CAMACHO: And the sweeper can't go by.  
16 And now, listen to this one. The people in the block  
17 double park because you know double park is illegal.  
18 Everybody that's double parked will get \$120 fine and  
19 the guy that don't move his car, and you get \$45  
20 fine. So, I'd rather take the change to get the \$45  
21 than \$120 fine, \$150 for double parking.

22 That's what I'm trying to tell you. They get in  
23 there car; they wait until the street get clean and  
24 then these people that don't have out of state plates  
25 and then they move. So, you're going to get a - I



COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

97

1  
2 prefer getting a \$45 than \$120 because of double  
3 park. So, it's kind of, it's kind of and the sweeper  
4 can't go by them arguing. It's so sad but the guy  
5 wants to work, do his job but he can't go around it.  
6 He is there 15, 20 minutes because now the cars are  
7 double parked. The guys with the Jersey,  
8 Pennsylvania and if he does two or three cars go by  
9 and that's it. It's got to be done and the blocks  
10 don't get cleaned. It don't get cleaned at all.  
11 Some of the residential stores, the same thing. The  
12 owners don't have nobody sweeping their front,  
13 cleaning 18 inches over the curb. Sanitation can  
14 only do so much. We got to start banging them with  
15 the tickets. Every day, every day. If you want,  
16 give me a book. I will go and start banging them  
17 myself. I will go in there and start banging  
18 everybody. Don't worry about it.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Camacho is joining the  
20 caucus. The increase fine caucus. Uhm, that's what  
21 it is. So, Commissioner Cyrus, Chief Cyrus, get to  
22 it. The more tickets you give, we'll give you the  
23 bigger cookie basket we'll give you during Christmas,  
24 but we really want to make sure that we were focused

25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

98

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

on that. Thank you Camacho for your time. I really appreciate it. Committee Counsel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much for your testimony and thank you Chair. We will now see if Liz McMillan if you are - I see you. Liz, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

LIZ MCMILLAN: Thank you Chair Reynoso and Committee Members for your time this morning. I am Liz McMillan and I am a member WE ACT for Environmental Justice serving on the Climate Justice Working Group. WE ACT is a community-based organization that has been fighting for and with residents in Northern Manhattan to address the environmental health hazards that disproportionately affect communities of color.

Today I'd like to testify to my experience living in Central Harlem with the declining sidewalk and street cleanliness. It seems as though there is more trash and vermin than about three years ago. I can barely walk down the street without a trash wind tunnel collecting artifacts as I go. The trash cans provided on street corners are overflowing and left over or possible put their trash from collection day

1  
2 make it hard to enjoy your block on nice weather  
3 days. Not to mention the possibility of storm drains  
4 becoming overflowed because of trash in the street  
5 clogging and making it impossible for rain water to  
6 drain properly.

7       If that isn't enough, rodents have now taken over  
8 some streets where it is notorious to walk down a  
9 block and have several dart back and forth in front  
10 of your feet. It's just not fun. Not a fun sight  
11 especially at night. And with many construction  
12 projects around in Harlem, it seems the number has  
13 doubled. Not only is it unsightly but has to be  
14 highly unsanitary nor safe for children and pet dogs  
15 to have around. There has to be more that can be  
16 done. This is why I felt it important to lend my  
17 voice to the testimonies here to ask for the city to  
18 step in and do, if not look into it thoroughly, but  
19 take some actions in resolving these issues and help  
20 return New York City back into a safer, cleaner  
21 city.

22       Thank you for your time for allowing me to  
23 provide testimony on such an important issue. Thank  
24 you.

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

100

1

2

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much for your  
3 testimony. Chair Reynoso, do you have any further  
4 questions for any of our panelists today?

5

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I do not.

6

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. If we have  
7 inadvertently missed anyone who has registered to  
8 testify today and is yet to have been called on,  
9 please use the Zoom raise hand function and you will  
10 be called in the order that your hand has been  
11 raised.

12

Seeing none, I will now turn it over to Chair  
13 Reynoso to offer his closing remarks. Chair Reynoso.  
14 And Chair, oh, I apologize, we've been joined by  
15 Council Member Gibson.

16

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, we've been joined by  
17 Council Member Gibson. Welcome. Thank you so much  
18 to the Committee Counsel, to the Sergeants, to both  
19 Chief's Harbin and Cyrus and our Commissioner for  
20 being here with us today. I feel like it was a very  
21 productive hearing. There obviously is an increase in  
22 the amount of trash we're seeing and we're hoping to  
23 solve for it. It seems like a lot of people here are  
24 leaning towards more enforcement. We've also learned  
25 about opportunities and ways Council Members could

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

101

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

assist to Department of Sanitation with this work.  
Uhm, and also how we can lay our garbage that could  
assist related to rat mitigation and so forth. Just  
overall a very thoughtful and productive hearing.

So, I'm extremely grateful to everyone. Have a  
great Monday and rest of the week. Thank you so much  
and this point, this meeting is now adjourned.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you everyone, we've  
ended live.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 2, 2021