Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing

Stephanie Jones, Legislative Counsel

Leah Skrzypiec, Legislative Policy Analyst

Noah Meixler, Legislative Policy Analyst

J. Florentine Kabore, Financial Analyst



###### **THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

**Committee Report of the Governmental Affairs Division**

Jeffrey Baker, Legislative Director

Rachel Cordero, Deputy Director, Governmental Affairs Division

**COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING**

**Hon. Diana Ayala, Chair**

##### October 21, 2021

**PROPOSED INT. No. 499-A** By Council Members Koslowitz, Kallos and Rivera

**TITLE:** A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to allowing corporations, partnerships and other business entities to obtain newsstand licenses; and to repeal section 20-241 of the administrative code of the city of New York

**PROPOSED INT. No. 1145-A** By Council Members Koo, Powers, Levine, Cornegy, Grodenchik, Reynoso, Chin, Kallos, Cabrera, Gjonaj, Ayala, Holden, Gibson, Adams, Koslowitz, Levin, D. Diaz, Riley, Rodriguez, Maisel, Vallone and Ulrich

**TITLE:** A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to creating an exception to the item pricing requirement for retail stores with scanners available for consumer use

1. **INTRODUCTION**

On October 21, 2021, the Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, chaired by Council Member Diana Ayala, will hold a vote on two bills: Proposed Introduction Number 499-A (Int. 499-A), in relation to allowing corporations, partnerships and other business entities to obtain newsstand licenses; and to repeal section 20-241 of the administrative code of the city of New York; and Proposed Introduction Number 1145-A (Int. 1145-A), in relation to creating an exception to the item pricing requirement for retail stores with scanners available for consumer use. The Committee previously heard testimony from the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection (DCWP) (formerly the Department of Consumer Affairs), worker and trade groups, business associations, and other interested stakeholders and this feedback informed the final versions of the bills.

1. **BACKGROUND**
2. **Newsstands**

Historically, newsstands were ubiquitous in New York City. In the 1950s over 1,500 locations provided periodicals and sundries around our City.[[1]](#footnote-1) Today, just over 350 newsstands are in operation.[[2]](#footnote-2) According to the Newsstand Operators Association, most newsstands are run by immigrants who make a modest income from running these small businesses,[[3]](#footnote-3) as consumer demand for print periodicals has lessened.[[4]](#footnote-4) City newsstands were historically operated by independent owners, and the style of stands varied considerably, giving way to concerns about structural safety and aesthetic value.[[5]](#footnote-5) In the mid-1990s, the City convened a Streetscape Task Force to recommend improvements to the City’s street environment, which led to amendments to newsstands’ regulatory structure. Local Law 29 of 1997 allowed the Department of Transportation to offer a single franchise for the construction and maintenance of newsstands, which would eventually replace the old structures.[[6]](#footnote-6) Current operators were given the opportunity to become franchisees.[[7]](#footnote-7) While Local Law 29 was repealed, the current oversight structure for newsstands was established by a subsequent resolution[[8]](#footnote-8) and local law.[[9]](#footnote-9) The franchise contract was offered to CEMUSA in 2005, and then to JCDecaux, which acquired CEMUSA in 2014.[[10]](#footnote-10)

When Local Law 41 of 1998 repealed Local Law 29 of 1997, the new law repealed the old law’s allowance for corporations and partnerships to operate newsstands.[[11]](#footnote-11) That allowance has never been reinstated. Instead, newsstands can only be operated by single person who require a license, which must be renewed every two years for a fee of $1,076.[[12]](#footnote-12)

The prohibition on operating a newsstand as a corporate entity, such as a corporation or limited liability company, means that newsstand operators must run their businesses as sole proprietors. But being able to incorporate, like many businesses choose to do, has its advantages. Incorporating would shield the operators’ personal assets - such as their homes or college savings accounts – from being used to satisfy business debts and lawsuits.[[13]](#footnote-13) It would also allow the operators to bring a family member or an employee into the business.[[14]](#footnote-14)An employee who has worked at a newsstand for decades is unable, under the current law, to become a partner at the newsstand and take over from the existing operator after they retire.[[15]](#footnote-15) According to Robert Bookman, counsel to the New York City Newsstand Operators Association, there are “countless examples of current newsstand employees who are eager to do this and become an owner, but have no legal means of doing so.”[[16]](#footnote-16) Existing newsstand operators have therefore advocated for their right to form corporate entities, as the 1997 law allowed.[[17]](#footnote-17)

Newsstands have struggled in recent years. A 2018 Pew Research study found that 43 percent of U.S. adults say they get their news via news websites or social media, which is more than the 16 percent of adults who get their news from print newspapers.[[18]](#footnote-18) According to the New York City Newsstand Operators Association, the pandemic has also caused newsstand operators to struggle: “Sidewalk newsstands depend on street traffic and are primarily located in business areas, in Midtown and lower Manhattan. The amount of office worker foot traffic is nowhere near what it was. These are extremely challenging times for newsstands.”[[19]](#footnote-19) Thus, giving newsstand operators the ability to partner at more populated and therefore lucrative newsstand locations may create more stable businesses in this field.

1. **Item Pricing**

In New York City, retail stores are required to comply with the City’s item pricing law that requires all products offered for sale to be individually labeled with a price sticker.[[20]](#footnote-20) The law also sets out specific exemptions. Provided that a shelf price is listed, the following products do not require individual pricing labels: milk; small products priced under one dollar; eggs; fresh produce; items such as gum, candies or chips that weigh less than five ounces; cigarettes and tobacco products; frozen juice; ice cream; jarred baby food; bulk items; items sold in vending machines; items sold for in-store consumption; frozen, bagged foods; and items that are on sale for less than a week and are displayed in a separate section at the end of an aisle.[[21]](#footnote-21) Under the definition of ‘retail store’, the legislation also specifies that this does not include stores: with less than two full-time employees; that make less than $2 million in annual gross sales; or that primarily sell food for consumption on the premises.[[22]](#footnote-22)

Over the past few years, the Council has revisited the issue of item pricing. For example, in 2011, this Committee held an oversight hearing on DCWP’s enforcement of supermarket regulations after there was concern that supermarkets were regularly overcharging customers. At the hearing, industry representatives testified that, due to technological advancements with check-out and price scanners, individual item pricing was somewhat redundant. The industry also argued that, due to high rates of inventory turnover, relying on price stickers may actually increase the chances of improper pricing.[[23]](#footnote-23) Similarly, in 2017, the City enacted Local Law 5, which gives retail stores a 30-day window to remedy a first-time item pricing violation. To avoid the payment of a civil penalty, the retailer must submit evidence that the violation has been cured within 30 days of the notice of violation and prior to the commencement of an adjudication of such notice of violation.[[24]](#footnote-24) At the Committee hearing on an earlier version of Int.1145-A, advocates detailed the difficulties retailers have marking the price of each item at a store. Advocates explained that due to human error it is nearly impossible for an employee to correctly mark the price of each one of the thousands of items in a store, which leaves the store vulnerable to fines from DCWP.[[25]](#footnote-25) According to one advocate, “creating an exception for the item-pricing requirement would eliminate one of the biggest fines this industry sees.”[[26]](#footnote-26)

In recent years, jurisdictions across New York State have taken action to enable retailers to use new technologies to prevent stores from needing to label individual items. In 2010, Westchester County passed a new amendment allowing retailers to apply for a waiver of the item-pricing law on an annual basis provided that the retailer demonstrates that: its checkout scanners are at least 98 percent accurate; price check scanners are readily available to consumers throughout the store; and shelf labels are provided for all items.[[27]](#footnote-27) Laurence Gottlieb, director of Westchester County’s Office for Economic Development, justified the exemption for retail stores saying: "Given the economic climate, we must ensure we are stripping away the red tape that constricts smart business growth. This amendment strikes the right balance between protecting the interests of the consumer and the needs of business owners -- interests that should not be mutually exclusive."[[28]](#footnote-28) Similar item pricing legislation has also been enacted in Nassau, Suffolk, Rockland, Erie, Renssalear and St. Lawrence counties.[[29]](#footnote-29)

1. **LEGISLATIVE ANALYSIS**
2. **Int. 499-A**

Int. 499-A would amend existing law to explicitly allow current and new licensees to hold a newsstand license as a business entity - such as a corporation, partnership, limited liability company or other association - as long as each shareholder, partner, member or principal does not have another source of income, excluding investment income, that exceeds what is earned by operating the newsstand (Section 20-229 (a)). Existing law has been interpreted only to allow operators to hold a newsstand license in their personal capacity.

The bill contains deeming provisions (Section 20-229 (b) (2)) that would help DCWP to enforce a limit on two newsstand locations per licensee. This bill would also prohibit any licensee from renting or attempting to rent out their newsstand; doing so would be a basis for license revocation (Section 20-229 (c) and Section 20-232, respectively). Finally, in Section 7, the bill requires DCWP to mail current newsstand licensees, before their next license renewal, a letter explaining: (i) the process by which current newsstand licenses may convert their newsstand license to one held by a corporation, partnership, limited liability company or other association, including the requirements of Sections 20-110 and 20-111 of the Administrative Code, which impose on licensees a requirement to gain approval from the DCWP Commissioner or their designee in writing when certain corporate changes take place, to prevent a license becoming void; and (ii) any requirements of Tobacco Retail Dealer licensees or Electronic Cigarette Retail Dealer licensees that would be imposed as a result of holding the licenses as a corporation, partnership, limited liability company or other association.

Additionally, this bill would repeal Section 20-241, which contains the existing provision limiting newsstand licensees to two locations. The requirement that newsstand licensees operate from no more than two locations would instead be set forth in Section 20-229 (b) (1) of the bill. Subsequent sections in the subchapter would be renumbered accordingly.

1. **Int. 1145-A**

This bill would exempt certain retail stores that sell certain stocking keeping units – items with a “SKU” scannable bar code – from being required to label each physical item with a price, provided the item and the store meets certain conditions. Section 20-708.1 (a) (3) of the existing law defines “retail store” as a store that sells stock keeping units, but excludes any business that: (i) is not open to the general public, has members who pay a direct fee to qualify for membership and is not required to collect sales tax on transactions with members; (i) has the owner as the business’s only full-time employee, or certain people in the owner’s family and only two additional full-time employees; (ii) had annual gross sales of stock keeping items of less than two million dollars, unless part of a certain, larger retail entity with annual gross sales of stock keeping items of two million dollars or more in the previous calendar year; and (iii) engages primarily in the sale of food for on-premises consumption or otherwise engages in a specialty trade exempted by the DCWP Commissioner by promulgated rule.

Section 1 of the bill adds a definition of “price scanner” to Section 20-708.1 (a) of the Administrative Code. “Price scanner” would mean a “laser scanning or other computer assisted price checking mechanism used in conjunction with scanner codes.” Section 2 amends Section 20-708.1 (c), which exempts certain items from being priced individually by a retail store, provided the store provides a shelf price and a price look-up function. Int. 1145-A would add a paragraph 15 to the list of exempted items; paragraph 15 would exempt any stock keeping item from being individually labeled with a price, provided that the item is able to be scanned by a price scanner, and the retail store selling it, offering it for sale or exposing it for sale has a sufficient number of clearly marked and functioning price scanners, in proportion to retail size, in adequate locations. The Commissioner of DCWP would be required to promulgate rules clarifying this requirement.

Section 3 of this bill makes a technical edit to the title of Section 20-708.1 (d), which more clearly describes the information contained therein.

This bill would take effect 120 days after it becomes law, except that DCWP may take such measures necessary for the bill’s implementation, including promulgating rules, before such date.

Proposed Int. No. 499-A

By Council Members Koslowitz, Kallos and Rivera

..Title

A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to allowing corporations, partnerships and other business entities to obtain newsstand licenses; and to repeal section 20-241 of the administrative code of the city of New York

..Body

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Subdivision f of section 20-228 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as added by local law 5 for the year 2013, is amended to read as follows:

f. Stoop line stand. A stand or booth operated on a sidewalk for the sale or display of the articles enumerated in subdivision b of section 20–233 of this subchapter, which shall be subject to the restrictions and requirements of sections 20–233 through [20–241] 20-241.1 of this subchapter.

§ 2. Section 20-228 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended by adding a new subdivision g, to read as follows:

g. Dependent child. A child or stepchild who is financially dependent on a parent or guardian.

§ 3. Section 20-229 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as amended by local law 64 for the year 2003, is amended to read as follows:

§ 20-229 License required. a. No person shall [maintain or] operate a newsstand or newsstands unless licensed pursuant to this subchapter, and unless [the operation of the newsstand is his or her principal employment] such person has no other income, excluding investment income, which exceeds the income such person earns from the operation of the newsstand or newsstands; provided, however, that if such person is a corporation, partnership, limited liability company or other association, each shareholder of such corporation, each partner of such partnership, each member of such limited liability company or each principal of such other association, respectively, shall have no other income, excluding investment income, which exceeds the income such shareholder, partner, member or principal earns from the operation of such newsstand or newsstands. No license shall be issued to [an individual] a person for the operation of a newsstand that is not a replacement newsstand and that has been constructed and installed by a franchisee pursuant to a franchise unless such operator has reimbursed such franchisee for the costs of construction and installation of such newsstand as determined by the department in accordance with paragraph two of subdivision c of section [20-241.1] 20-241 of the code.

b. 1. No person shall be issued more than two licenses to operate a newsstand pursuant to this subchapter.

2. For purposes of determining the number of licenses held by a person pursuant to paragraph 1 of this subdivision, the following provisions shall apply:

(a) A natural person shall be deemed to hold the license issued in the name of such natural person's dependent child, a partnership in which such natural person is a partner, a corporation in which such natural person is an officer, director or shareholder, or a limited liability company in which such natural person is a member, manager or officer.

(b) A corporation shall be deemed to hold the license issued in the name of:

(1) An officer, director or shareholder of such corporation;

(2) Another corporation where such corporation and such other corporation share a common officer, director or shareholder, or such corporation or any of its officers, directors or shareholders has any direct or indirect interest in such other corporation;

(3) A limited liability company where such corporation or any of its officers, directors or shareholders is a member, manager or officer of such limited liability company, or such corporation or any of its officers, directors or shareholders has any direct or indirect interest in such limited liability company; or

(4) A partnership where such corporation or any of its officers, directors or shareholders is a partner in such partnership, or such corporation or any of its officers, directors or shareholders has any direct or indirect interest in such partnership.

(c) A limited liability company shall be deemed to hold the license issued in the name of;

(1) A member, manager or officer of such limited liability company;

(2) Another limited liability company where such limited liability company and such other limited liability company share a common member, manager or officer, or such limited liability company or any of its members, managers or officers has any direct or indirect interest in such other limited liability company;

(3) A corporation where such limited liability company or any of its members, managers or officers is an officer, director or shareholder in such corporation or such limited liability company or any of its members, managers or officers has any direct or indirect interest in such corporation; or

(4) A partnership where such limited liability company or any of its members, managers or officers is a partner in such partnership, or such limited liability company or any of its members, managers or officers has any direct or indirect interest in such partnership.

(d) A partnership shall be deemed to hold the license in the name of:

(1) A partner of such partnership;

(2) Another partnership where such partnership is a partner in such other partnership, such partnership and such other partnership share a common partner, or such partnership or any of its partners has any direct or indirect interest in such other partnership;

(3) A corporation where such partnership or any of its partners is an officer, director or shareholder in such corporation, or such partnership or any of its partners has any direct or indirect interest in such corporation; or

(4) A limited liability company where such partnership or any of its partners is a member, manager or officer in such limited liability company, or such partnership or any of its partners has any direct or indirect interest in such limited liability company.

c. No person applying for or holding a newsstand license shall rent or attempt to rent the newsstand to another person.

§ 4. Section 20-232 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as amended by local law 80 for the year 2021, is amended to read as follows:

§ 20-232 Revocation. In addition to any other basis for [revoking] revocation, a newsstand license may be revoked upon a finding by the commissioner that the location listed in such license was not utilized for a period of two consecutive months or more [or], that the newsstand licensee is not using the stand primarily for the sale of newspapers and periodicals, or that the newsstand licensee rented or attempted to rent the newsstand to another person. If the commissioner chooses to exercise such power of revocation, the commissioner shall first notify the licensee of an anticipated revocation in writing and afford the licensee thirty days from the date of such notification to correct the condition. The commissioner shall notify the licensee of such thirty-day period in writing. If the licensee proves to the satisfaction of the commissioner that the condition has been corrected within such thirty-day period, the commissioner shall not revoke such license. The commissioner shall permit such proof to be submitted to the commissioner electronically or in person. The licensee may seek review by the commissioner of the determination that the licensee has not submitted such proof within fifteen days of receiving written notification of such determination.

§ 5. Section 20-241 of the administrative code of the city of New York is REPEALED and section 20-241.1 of such code is renumbered section 20-241.

§ 6. Section 20-241.2 of the administrative code of the city of New York is renumbered section 20-241.1.

§ 7. The department shall mail the following information to each newsstand licensee prior to their next license renewal: (i) an explanation of the process by which such licensee may convert their newsstand license to one held by a corporation, partnership, limited liability company or other association, including the requirements of sections 20-110 and 20-111 of this code; and (ii) the requirements of licensees to engage in business as a retail dealer, pursuant to subchapter 1 of this chapter, and as an electronic cigarette retail dealer, pursuant to subchapter 35 of this chapter, that would be imposed on such licensee as a result of holding each such license as a corporation, partnership, limited liability company or other association.

§ 8. This local law takes effect 120 days after it becomes law, except that section 7 of this local law takes effect immediately

BAM/SJ

LS 10525/Int. 1774-2017

LS 317

10/13/21 10:55 PM

Proposed Int. No. 1145-A

By Council Members Koo, Powers, Levine, Cornegy, Grodenchik, Reynoso, Chin, Kallos, Cabrera, Gjonaj, Ayala, Holden, Gibson, Adams, Koslowitz, Levin, D. Diaz, Riley, Rodriguez, Maisel, Vallone and Ulrich

A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to creating an exception to the item pricing requirement for retail stores with scanners available for consumer use

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Subdivision a of section 20-708.1 of the administrative code of the city of New York, subdivision a as added by local law number 84 for the year 1991 and subparagraph (a) of paragraph 3 of subdivision a as amended by local law number 27 for the year 1998, is amended to read as follows:

a. Definitions. The following terms shall have the following meanings for the purpose of this section:

1.   "Stock keeping unit", known in the industry as "SKU", shall mean each group of items offered for sale of the same brand name, quantity of contents, retail price, and variety within the following categories:

(a)   Food, including all material, solid, liquid or mixed, whether simple or compound, used or intended for consumption by human beings or domestic animals normally kept as household pets and all substances or ingredients to be added thereto for any purpose;

(b)   Napkins, facial tissues, toilet tissues, paper towelling and any disposable wrapping or container for the storage, handling, serving, or disposal of food;

(c)   Detergents, soaps and other cleansing agents; and

(d)   Non-prescription drugs, feminine hygiene products and health and beauty aids.

2.   "Stock keeping item" shall mean each individual item of a stock keeping unit offered for sale. This shall include two or more pieces packaged for sale together.

3.   "Retail store" shall mean a store engaged in selling stock keeping units at retail. A store which is not open to the general public but is reserved for use by its members shall come within the provisions of this definition unless the members must pay a direct fee to the store to qualify for membership and the store is not required to collect sales tax on transactions with members. A retail store shall not include any store which:

(a)   Has as its only full-time employee the owner thereof, or the parent, spouse, domestic partner or child of the owner, and in addition thereto not more than two full-time employees; or

(b)   Had annual gross sales of stock keeping items in the previous calendar year of less than two million dollars, unless the retail store is part of a network of subsidiaries, affiliates or other member stores, under direct or indirect common control, which, as a group, had annual gross sales of stock keeping items in the previous calendar year of two million dollars or more; or

(c)   Engages primarily in the sale of food for consumption on the premises or in a specialty trade which the commissioner determines, by rule, would be inappropriate for item pricing.

4.   "Item price" shall mean the tag, stamp or mark affixed to a stock keeping item which sets forth, in arabic numerals, the retail price thereof.

5.   "Advertised price" shall mean the price of a stock keeping unit which a retail store has caused to be disseminated by means of promotional methods such as an in-store sign, or newspaper, circular, television or radio advertising.

6.   "Shelf price" shall mean the tag or sign placed at each point of display of a stock keeping unit, which clearly sets forth the retail price of the stock keeping items within that stock keeping unit.

7.   "Computer-assisted checkout system" shall mean any electronic device, computer system or machine which indicates the selling price of a stock keeping item by interpreting its universal product code, or an in-house product code, or by use of its price look-up function.

8.   "Price look-up function" shall mean the capability of any checkout system to determine the retail price of a stock keeping item by way of the manual entry into the system of a code number assigned to that particular stock keeping unit by the retail store or by way of the checkout operator's consultation of a file maintained at the point of sale.

9.   "Inspector" shall mean the commissioner or his or her designee.

10. “Price scanner” shall mean a laser scanning or other computer assisted price checking mechanism used in conjunction with scanner codes.

§ 2. Subdivision c of section 20-708.1 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as added by local law number 84 for the year 1991, is amended to read as follows:

c. Certain items exempted. The following stock keeping items need not be item priced as provided in subdivision b of this section provided that a shelf price and a price look-up function are maintained for such stock keeping items:

1. Milk.

2. Stock keeping items which are under three cubic inches in size, and weigh less than three ounces, and are priced under one dollar.

3. Eggs.

4. Fresh produce not packaged for final retail sale.

5. Products sold through a vending machine.

6. Food sold for consumption on the premises.

7. Snack foods such as cakes, gum, candies, chips and nuts offered for sale in single packages and weighing five ounces or less.

8. Cigarettes, cigars, tobacco and tobacco products.

9. Food offered for sale in bulk.

10. Frozen juice.

11. Ice cream.

12. Frozen foods packaged for final retail sale in plastic bags.

13. Stock keeping items on sale for one week or less, where such stock keeping items are not otherwise item priced, are located in a segregated display at the end of an aisle, and the sale period, the name of the product and the advertised price are clearly and conspicuously posted on a sign at the point of display. Failure to display this information shall be deemed a deceptive practice under section 20-701 of this code.

14. Baby food packaged in jars.

15. Any stock keeping item that is capable of being scanned, and which is sold, offered for sale, or exposed for sale at a retail store that has, as determined by rule of the commissioner, a  sufficient number, in proportion to the retail store size, of clearly marked and functioning price scanners for consumer use, in adequate locations.

§ 3. Subdivision d of section 20-708.1 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as added by local law number 84 for the year 1991, is amended to read as follows:

d.   [Scanner] -Checkout scanner accuracy. In a retail store with a laser scanning or other computer-assisted checkout system, an inspector shall be permitted to compare the disclosed retail price of any one stock keeping item within any stock keeping unit sold in the retail store, whether or not exempt under subdivision c of this section, not to exceed five hundred stock keeping items at any one inspection, with the programmed computer price. The retail store shall provide such access to the computer as is necessary for the inspector to make the determination. The inspector shall also make note of undercharges on the inspection report. In the event that the programmed computer price exceeds the lowest price a retail store is permitted to charge for a stock keeping item under subdivision e of this section, this shall be deemed a deceptive practice under section 20-701 of this code.

§ 4. This local law takes effect 120 days after it becomes law, except that the commissioner of consumer and worker protection may take such measures as are necessary for its implementation, including the promulgation of rules, before such date.

JG/SJ

LS # 7428

10/13/21 7:32 PM

1. Gary M. Stern, “Are NYC Newsstands Nearing Oblivion?” *Observer*, September 3, 2014, available at: <https://observer.com/2014/09/are-nyc-newsstands-nearing-oblivion/> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. “Newsstands” NYC Open Data, available at: https://data.cityofnewyork.us/Transportation/Newsstands/kfum-nzw3 [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Robert Bookman, New York City Newsstand Operators Association, testimony before the Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, September 14, 2021, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3343894&GUID=DD334618-5D68-4C09-8C69-26680DA98B89&Options=ID|Text|&Search=499> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Gary M. Stern, “Are NYC Newsstands Nearing Oblivion?” *Observer*, September 3, 2014, available at: <https://observer.com/2014/09/are-nyc-newsstands-nearing-oblivion/> [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *See* Hannah Howard, “How New Yorkers Are Fighting to Save the City’s Struggling Newsstands”, *Thrillist*, May 12, 2017, available at: <https://www.thrillist.com/lifestyle/new-york/how-new-yorkers-are-fighting-to-save-the-citys-struggling-newsstands>; and Local Law 29 of 1997, available at: <http://www.laguardiawagnerarchive.lagcc.cuny.edu/pages/FileBrowser.aspx?LinkToFile=FILES_DOC/NYCC_DOCS/Bills/int955.htm>. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Local Law 29 of 1997, available at: <http://www.laguardiawagnerarchive.lagcc.cuny.edu/pages/FileBrowser.aspx?LinkToFile=FILES_DOC/NYCC_DOCS/Bills/int955.htm>; New York City Department of Transportation, “Coordinated Street Furniture”, <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/infrastructure/streetfurniture.shtml> (last accessed on September 10, 2021). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Local Law 29 of 1997, available at: <http://www.laguardiawagnerarchive.lagcc.cuny.edu/pages/FileBrowser.aspx?LinkToFile=FILES_DOC/NYCC_DOCS/Bills/int955.htm> [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Resolution 1004 of 2003, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=440224&GUID=37D96881-60CB-4F14-9C14-DDB5A1C5E1E5&Options=Advanced&Search>=. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Local Law 64 of 2003, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=440441&GUID=40123AC2-00A4-4295-9093-E7A77948C1B7&Options=ID|Text|&Search=64>. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. New York City Department of Transportation, “Coordinated Street Furniture” <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/infrastructure/streetfurniture.shtml> (last accessed on September 10, 2021). [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Local Law 41 of 1998, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=431204&GUID=97738387-8CB3-4BA0-AC0B-3A99686CBBC1&Options=ID|Text|&Search=41> [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. NYC Business, “Newsstand License”, <https://www1.nyc.gov/nycbusiness/description/newsstand-license> (last accessed on September 10, 2021). [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Robert Bookman, New York City Newsstand Operators Association, testimony before the Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, September 14, 2021, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3343894&GUID=DD334618-5D68-4C09-8C69-26680DA98B89&Options=ID|Text|&Search=499> [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Robert Bookman, New York City Newsstand Operators Association, testimony before the Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, September 14, 2021, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3343894&GUID=DD334618-5D68-4C09-8C69-26680DA98B89&Options=ID|Text|&Search=499> [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Robert Bookman, New York City Newsstand Operators Association, testimony before the Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, September 14, 2021, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3343894&GUID=DD334618-5D68-4C09-8C69-26680DA98B89&Options=ID|Text|&Search=499> [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Robert Bookman, New York City Newsstand Operators Association, testimony before the Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, September 14, 2021, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3343894&GUID=DD334618-5D68-4C09-8C69-26680DA98B89&Options=ID|Text|&Search=499> [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Elisa Shearer “Social media outpaces print newspapers in the U.S. as a news source”, *Pew Research Center*, December 10, 2018, available at: <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2018/12/10/social-media-outpaces-print-newspapers-in-the-u-s-as-a-news-source/> [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. Jane L. Levere, “What Does the Future Hold for Newsstands in a Post-Pandemic World?”, *Adweek*, March 26, 2021, available at: <https://www.adweek.com/commerce/what-does-the-future-hold-for-newsstands-in-a-post-pandemic-world/> [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. N.Y. Admin. Code §20-708.1(b). [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. N.Y. Admin. Code §20-708.1(c). [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. N.Y. Admin. Code §20-708.1(a). [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. New York City Council, Committee on Consumer Affairs ‘Oversight: DCA’s Enforcement of Supermarket Regulations’, January 6, 2011, hearing transcript, available at: <file:///C:/Users/lskrzypiec/Downloads/Hearing%20Transcript%20(1).pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. New York City Local Law 2017/5, available at: <file:///C:/Users/lskrzypiec/Downloads/Local%20Law%205.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. New York City Council, Committee on Consumer Affairs, December 18, 2018, hearing transcript, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3704322&GUID=0226C596-0054-4329-99CD-49323058200D&Options=ID|Text|&Search=1145> [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Nelson Eusebio, National Supermarket Association, Testimony before the Committee on Consumer Affairs, December 18, 2018, hearing transcript, available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3704322&GUID=0226C596-0054-4329-99CD-49323058200D&Options=ID|Text|&Search=1145> [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. “Changes to Item Pricing Law” Westchester County, available at: <https://www.westchestergov.com/previous-releases/3782-changes-to-item-pricing> [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-29)