

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

September 20, 2021
Start: 10:08 a.m.
Recess: 12:20 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing (Virtual Room 3)

B E F O R E: Inez Barron
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Ydanis Rodriguez
Eric A. Ulrich
Laurie A. Cumbo
Alan N. Maisel

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dr. Denise Maybank, Interim Vice Chancellor for
Student Affairs and Enrollment Management
CUNY

Ryan Camire, Director for Mental Health and
Wellness
CUNY

Remy Salas, Campaign Director
CUNY Rising Alliance

Anna Compton, CUNY Student
Hunter College

Azania Sammie Maitland, CUNY Student
Hunter College

Gregory Kuhlman, Director of Personal Counseling
Brooklyn College

Lisa Nishimura, Engagement Coordinator
Young Invincibles

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: We can start the
3 recordings. PC recording is underway.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Backup is rolling.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Recording to the cloud
6 all set.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Sergeant Polite?

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Good morning
9 and welcome to the remote hearing on the Committee on
10 Higher Education. Will Council members and staff
11 please turn on their video at this time? Thank you.
12 To minimize disruptions, please place all cell phones
13 and electronics to vibrate. You may send your
14 testimony to testimony@Council.NYC.gov. Once again,
15 that's testimony@Council.NYC.gov. Chair Barron, we
16 are ready to begin.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning and
18 thank you joining the Committee on Higher Education
19 for this very important oversight hearing on mental
20 health resources for students at CUNY. I am Council
21 member Inez Barron and I am the Chair of the
22 Committee on Higher Education and a proud CUNY alum.
23 During today's hearing, which will be an update on
24 the Committee's October 2020 hearing, we will examine
25 a longstanding issue that has been exacerbated by the

2 pandemic, but remains critical to the success and
3 wellbeing of the entire CUNY community: access to
4 mental health resources. The college experience is a
5 uniquely challenging period of transition as student
6 adapt to new academic, financial, and social
7 expectations. Additionally, many college aged
8 individuals are in a critical age of development
9 known as emerging adulthood which is characterized by
10 a complex physical and psychological-- no.
11 psychosocial transitions. It is during this
12 vulnerable period, between the ages of 18 to 25,
13 where many mental health disorders may emerge. With
14 the exception of dementia, emerging adults experience
15 more of every diagnosed mental health disorder than
16 any other group. Prior to the pandemic, a 2019
17 health CUNY survey found one in six CUNY undergrads
18 experienced depression and moderate to severe
19 psychological distress. One in five reported
20 experiencing anxiety disorders and, most worryingly,
21 75 percent of students who reported symptoms of
22 depression, anxiety, or psychological distress have
23 not seen a mental health professional in the previous
24 year. Now, while we have been all deeply affected by
25 the immense suffering loss and social upheaval caused

2 by the pandemic, young adults, in particular, have
3 been disproportionately impacted. In a recent CDC
4 survey, 63 percent of young adults reported
5 experiencing anxiety and depression, a rate second
6 only to that of essential workers and unpaid
7 caregivers. Moreover, this is only compounded by the
8 continued racism, continued white privilege, and
9 continued oppression that exists in our everyday
10 lives. We owe it to CUNY students, most of whom are
11 black and brown, and a great majority of whom are
12 graduates from public schools where the city and
13 state failed to meet their mental needs and now they
14 continue to struggle in college. Most of these
15 students are also well income and many are first-time
16 generation college students. We know that academic
17 success is closely tied to a student's mental well-
18 being and these students deserve culturally competent
19 counseling, including academic and career counseling.
20 We are adding turning point not only in this city,
21 but in the country and we must meet the moment. At
22 today's hearing, the committee will seek to gain a
23 better understanding of mental health resources
24 offered at CUNY, including issues and ongoing
25 concerns that emerged or were complicated by the

2 pandemic. This includes student experiences, as well
3 as how the University and campuses promote available
4 mental health services to students. The committee
5 will also seek to understand utilization rates, as
6 well as how to better serve students in a post
7 pandemic world. Finally, the committee is interested
8 in understanding how CUNY ensures its counseling
9 services are culturally responsive to the
10 universities diverse student population. In,
11 preparing for this hearing, I would like to thank Mr.
12 Omowale Clay [sp?], My Chief of Staff, Ms. Indigo--
13 M. Indigo Washington, my Director of Legislation in
14 CUNY liaison, Chloe Rivera, the committee's senior
15 policy analyst, Amy Briggs, the committee's counsel,
16 Michelle Peregrine, the committee's financial
17 analyst, and Frank Perez, the committee's community
18 engagement representative. Lastly, I would like to
19 thank all of the Council staff, including especially
20 the sergeant-at-arms who are working very hard behind
21 the scenes to make this hearing possible. And before
22 we hear from the administration, I'm trying to find
23 them pull up my next-- I want to read into the
24 record a letter which I received from the black

2 faculty of CUNY. And if you bear with me, I should
3 be able to get it. I believe this is it. Yes.

4 The Association of black faculty and
5 staff of CUNY consist of a range of faculty and staff
6 across CUNY who work in various disciplines,
7 departments , and programs. This hearing on mental
8 health resources for CUNY students in view of the
9 reopening of campuses in the midst of a pandemic is
10 very timely. Members of our Association review the
11 status of how CUNY students have been affected by the
12 reopening. Although classes began on August 25th,
13 2021, we found that there were a number of issues
14 which are affecting student enrollment in individual
15 campuses because of the readiness of the reopening of
16 campuses which has been left up to individual
17 campuses. This has resulted in morped differences
18 across the campuses and in and even this regarding
19 the implementation of those plans. Research on the
20 dire impact of COVID on the black and brown community
21 is well documented. These race related and economic
22 factors should be taken into account to ensure the
23 success of black, Latino, and people of color
24 students who often face financial hardships and
25 serious challenges in maintaining social distance of

2 their homes and community and have not been
3 adequately supported by CUNY. Regarding instruction
4 modes, in person instruction varies widely with one
5 percent in person instruction in New York City Tech
6 to 28 percent in person instruction into Hunter
7 College. Hybrid instruction varies from six percent
8 at Medgar Evers College to 38 percent at Hunter
9 College. In an online survey of the current climate
10 around COVID and their experiences with remote
11 learning, 124 of 227 Sikh students said they
12 preferred fully online classes. 52 of 227 stated
13 that they preferred hybrid courses-- a mix of online
14 and in-person classes. Only 27 students preferred in
15 person only. When asked how much they were concerned
16 about the Delta variant, 115 of 227 students said
17 they were very concerned and 55 of 227 students said
18 that they were somewhat concerned. In person
19 courses are not only about social distancing in the
20 classroom, but also how students travel to campus.
21 Some students take trains, subways, and buses to get
22 to campus. There are risks of getting COVID 19 in
23 Delta. We are not only students or staff, but also
24 someone's children, partner, parent, sibling, and
25 grandchild and friend. Not all college students live

2 by themselves. Many of us live with parents and
3 grandparents in children who are not vaccinated.
4 Education is super important to everyone, but if I
5 can get to the same knowledge online is going to
6 school, why should I risk my life? The
7 recommendation that instruction modes increased in
8 the spring semester should be revisited.

9 Ventilation. Although campuses were
10 reviewed to ensure that proper ventilation protocols
11 were being used, there are some campuses that still
12 have ventilation problems. For example, at Queens in
13 Hunter College, some windows cannot be opened. All
14 areas that have evidence of ventilation problems
15 should be closed toe faculty, staff, and students
16 until there is an independent verification that these
17 areas are properly ventilated. There are no clear
18 contact tracing protocols for students and one
19 college, after being told that they were exposed to
20 COVID 19, students were asked to sit in the last row.
21 Some colleges are relying on an audio system with
22 respect to student vaccination.

23 Student comments: been exposed to a
24 person who had positive COVID, although he was
25 vaccinated. That had put my entire family on high

2 alert because most of us are vaccinated and my
3 youngest of 13 months isn't. This is making it very
4 stressful for everyone in the household. This can
5 happen inside a campus even if precautionary actions
6 are being taken into consideration. I suggest going
7 back to fully online classes until everyone of all
8 ages have been vaccinated or there is no trace of
9 this disease that will be menace to our homes.

10 Student performance. The rush to
11 return students to campus without protocols that
12 allow for all students to return without interruption
13 to their instruction will have a disparate impact.
14 We're very concerned about the October 7 deadline for
15 students taking in person or hybrid classes to be
16 fully vaccinated. It is our understanding that
17 students who fail to meet this deadline will be
18 dropped from classes without refunds. So far, we
19 fear this policy will have a disproportionate adverse
20 effect on black and brown students who come from the
21 communities with the lowest vaccination and rampant
22 misinformation about the vaccine. They stand the
23 possibility of not only losing this semester, but
24 perhaps a significant interruption in the educational
25 careers. We hope that the administration is

2 sensitive to these concerns and develops strategies
3 to mitigate the impact on these vulnerable
4 populations. Even more troubling, it appears that
5 there is no appeal process for students who do not
6 meet the October 7th deadline.

7 In summary, CUNY must go beyond strong
8 words and move to strong and decisive action to
9 address issues of equality, racial justice, and anti-
10 blackness. The pandemic has exacerbated these
11 issues. CUNY must delve deeper into the structural
12 funding policies and unofficial practices that
13 continue to sustain the inhospitable community that
14 black, Latino, and people of color students and
15 faculty and staff experience at CUNY. We fear that,
16 without serious intervention, these continued actions
17 will lead to a precipitous decline of students of
18 color, faculty, and staff engaged at CUNY. This
19 would be a grave miscarriage of racial justice.

20 Black, Latino, people of color students
21 have been negatively impacted by COVID. There should
22 have been a uniform plan and timeframe that accounted
23 for and gave weight to maximum proof of vaccination
24 for returning students and faculty to campus. It
25 appears that the accelerated reopening was driven by

2 budgetary needs rather than the health of the
3 students. We recommend that the chancellery revisit
4 its reopening plans and consult with medical
5 professionals, faculty, campus advisors, staff, and
6 student leaders so that the views of all stakeholders
7 are given full consideration. Given the health and
8 safety concerns, we must act as one university and
9 not 25 separate campuses. Respectfully, the CUNY
10 Association of Black Faculty and Staff.

11 And I think that that letter will help to
12 guide many of the questions and discussions that we
13 are going to engage in in today's hearing. And with
14 that, I will now turn it back to Amy, our counsel, so
15 that she can direct us further.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair
17 Barron. My name is Amy Briggs. I serve as counsel
18 to the Committee on Higher Education at the New York
19 City Counsel. I will be moderating today's hearing
20 and calling panelists to testify. Before we begin,
21 please remember that everyone will be on mute until I
22 call on you to testify. After you are called on, you
23 will be unmuted by a member of our staff. Note that
24 there will be a few seconds delay before you are
25 unmuted and we can hear you. For public testimony, I

2 will call up individuals in panels. Please listen
3 for your name and I will periodically announce the
4 next few panelists. Once I call your name, a member
5 of our staff will unmute you, the sergeant-at-arms
6 will set a clock and give you the go ahead to begin
7 your testimony. All public testimony will be limited
8 to three minutes. After I call your name, please
9 wait for the sergeant-at-arms to announce that you
10 may begin before starting your testimony. For
11 today's hearing, the first panel will include
12 representatives from CUNY followed by Council member
13 questions, then public testimony. For CUNY, we will
14 have Dr. Denise Maybank, interim Vice Chancellor for
15 student affairs and enrollment management, and Ryan
16 Camire-- I'm sorry. Hopefully I pronounced that
17 correctly-- University director for mental health
18 and wellness who will be answering questions. I will
19 now administered the oath to the administration.
20 When you hear your name, please respond once a member
21 of our staff unmute you. Dr. Maybank and Director
22 Camire, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
23 truth, and nothing but the truth before this
24 committee and to respond honestly to Council member
25 questions? Vice Chancellor Maybank?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I do.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

4 Director Camire?

5 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: I do.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Vice
7 Chancellor Maybank, you may now begin your testimony.

8 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Thank you.

9 I'm hoping you can hear me?

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

11 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Thank you.

12 So, good morning, Chairperson Barron and members of
13 the Committee on Higher Education. Thank you for the
14 opportunity to provide testimony before you as we
15 offer an update for mental health services for the
16 City University of New York and its students. Excuse
17 me. My name is Denise Maybank and I am honored to
18 serve as the interim Vice Chancellor for student
19 affairs and enrollment management for CUNY. I began
20 my tenure at the City University of New York with the
21 opportunity to come before you on October 14th, 2020
22 as you and the Committee on Mental Health,
23 Disabilities, and Addictions received testimony on
24 mental health services at CUNY. I must admit I was
25 excited about the opportunity to come downtown and to

2 be in the same space with all of you and to finally
3 meet you in person and the rug was pulled out from
4 under me. It is my hope we will get to that day when
5 I will be able to meet you in person rather than
6 continue in the Brady Bunch space we are in today.
7 From the experience I had last year, I know you were
8 keenly aware of the need for mental health services
9 among college students and we just heard Chairperson
10 Barron talk more about that in her introductory
11 comments. But the fact is, college students of all
12 ages, from all racial and ethnic background, at all
13 socioeconomic levels, and participating in all levels
14 of study experience challenges that are associated
15 with mental health and the need for support. You are
16 also clearly aware of the impact this pandemic has
17 had on the socioemotional well-being and mental
18 health of our students. As you know, today, I am
19 accompanied by Ryan Camire who serves as the
20 University director of mental health and wellness.
21 He is also prepared to offer perspective on
22 university wide mental health services and data. My
23 focus today is on providing you with updates on
24 mental health needs, resources, and services across
25 CUNY since we last came together for this purpose.

2 So I will not repeat previous testimony as I know you
3 have the written version from last year. But I may
4 reference some of the previous information for
5 purposes of context. So I want to respond to just a
6 couple of the things that Chairperson Barron shared
7 from the letter before I jump into my prepared
8 testimony because I think it relevant. As you know,
9 we came before the committee, I think it was last
10 month, even, to share information about reopening
11 plans. And so, as I listened to the overtures and
12 the passion from the black faculty and staff of the
13 University, I certainly understand the concerns that
14 they are expressing. Some of those issues, I
15 believe, we will need to provide the committee with
16 more information on as we go forward. So a copy of
17 the communication or, at least, bullet points from
18 that communication would be very useful because I
19 don't want to leave it unaddressed. The things they
20 raised in terms of concern about their own health and
21 wellbeing and the space that we are asking people to
22 provide instruction in matters. It is not something
23 that we are ignoring or that we are casting a blind
24 eye on. It's important that we pay attention to
25 ventilation, to space, to distancing, and to all of

2 those things. I was trying to keep up and take notes
3 and make sure that I could hit some of these points,
4 so please forgive me if I don't get to everything
5 that was really significant, but I definitely want to
6 be certain that I, along with the team of folks from
7 the City University of New York who are here today
8 and listening today, that we do get back to you in
9 response to those things. I want to make sure that I
10 talk a little bit about where we are with the October
11 7th deadline, that that deadline was established in
12 the context of the policy for student vaccination.
13 So it was said as a 45 day date from the time that
14 the vaccination was approved by the FDA. So that is
15 how that date comes into being and we can go into
16 more depth about how we are going to manage that.
17 But, yes. Campuses will be in a position to think
18 about what is happening with individual students and
19 to be able to respond to that, as well. So I did
20 want to make sure I hit those things and to let you
21 know that we are not insensitive to what all of this
22 means because each of us is impacted by what is
23 happening with the Delta variant. Each of us is
24 impacted by the interaction with people we don't know
25 the status of. We don't know if people are

2 vaccinated. We don't know what jeopardy we may put
3 ourselves in and I understand the commute now that
4 I'm doing it in New York. I totally get it. When
5 you're sitting on a train, whether a commuter train
6 or a subway, and you're near people, you start to
7 wonder. You really start to wonder and I know that,
8 if I get a tickle in my throat, I'm afraid to cough
9 because I don't want anybody to think that anything
10 is going on with me in that moment. So, I totally
11 understand that I am not insensitive. I may be
12 making light right now, but I truly do understand
13 the impact of all of that and what we are concerned
14 about taking home to older members of our family, to
15 younger members of our family and to possible
16 impacts. So I did not want to go past that without
17 some recognition and the commitment to getting back
18 to you on the points that were made. And we will
19 gladly receive that more specifically. So I am going
20 to go back to the prepared testimony and offer some
21 things about what we heard last time when we were
22 present here because I think that that is important.
23 I, as a newbie to the CUNY experience, listened to
24 students testify last year and learned of their pain
25 and concern firsthand. I heard experience that left

2 me concerned about our ability to meet the needs of
3 students stressed by life's circumstances, compounded
4 by the unprecedented factors of the pandemic. I had
5 to accept mental health issues and services as a
6 critical area on which I need to focus effort and
7 attention. Through the voice of Juvani, she let us
8 know the significant impact being inflicted by the
9 pandemic on students in the presence of limited
10 resources across the University. Amber emphasized
11 the urgent need for mental health services and her
12 person experience with long wait times and time
13 limited service. Neha drew attention to the lack of
14 awareness of services, insufficient services, and the
15 need for better marketing, communication, and
16 coordination to increase access for students. Anna
17 confronted us with the reality of seeking continuity
18 of care and services to manage anxiety as she
19 transferred to CUNY and the difficulty she
20 experienced in connecting with services despite
21 having insurance which so many think is the answer to
22 it all. The top three presenting problems identified
23 by students were CUNY counseling services and through
24 the technology-based support services were and
25 continue to be anxiety, depression, and academics

2 and, likely, how all of those things come together,
3 as well. Counseling center directors advocate the
4 need for additional practitioners to meet the
5 burgeoning demand for services. Students come to the
6 place they know to find help with the elusive and
7 unknown experiences of remote learning challenges,
8 displacement, loss of friends and family, general
9 anxiety, and intensified mental health and emotional
10 distress. Already stressed counseling centers and
11 practitioners were and are being challenged to
12 respond to an increased demand for services. I will
13 tell you that the individuals who serve our students
14 through out counseling centers are amazingly
15 committed to what they do far and beyond the things
16 that we might just think in the ordinary course of
17 the responsibility. They are concerned, committed,
18 and making every effort to go above and beyond to be
19 certain they are providing the needed support to our
20 students, whether that be in individual, in group, or
21 through other tools that we have at our disposal.
22 What did we do based on what we heard? So I will
23 start by saying to Juvani, Amber, Neha, and Anna,
24 along with the others who testified last year, we
25 heard you and your voices continue to resound in my

2 ears, certainly. I had the privilege of getting
3 acquainted with those representative from Young
4 Invincibles and we still meet with them and hear the
5 things that they know from the experiences of working
6 with students from CUNY. I think about the young
7 woman who, last year, couldn't testify because it
8 just became overwhelming for her and I reached out to
9 her, as well, last year. And so, it is a matter of
10 recognizing just what is real in this space that is
11 just clouded by COVID, but also is real for our
12 students without any additional pressure. They have
13 the pressure of being a student while also managing
14 all of the other roles in their lives and we need to
15 be ready and responsive to support them and to be
16 certain they can accomplish the ends for which they
17 come. So as you may recall, \$5 million of the funds
18 received by the University through the federal CARES
19 Act was allocated to expand mental health related
20 tools and services. Funds were distributed to
21 campuses in a portion of the funds was designated
22 centrally to support the procurement of university
23 wide tools. We had the opportunity to procure tools
24 and resources for access to quality mental health
25 services, addressing the needs we know our Paramount

2 for our population of students in the practitioners
3 serving them. Crisis text line has been operational
4 for six months and over 600 students have utilized
5 the crisis texting service to discuss issues such as
6 academics, anxiety, and depression-- the top three
7 presenting concerns. Crisis text line is free,
8 available 24 hours, seven days a week and do support
9 through trained counselors for those in crisis and is
10 accessible from anywhere in the United States. Over
11 200 faculty and staff have completed training with
12 Cognito software to respond to students with mental
13 health needs into provide appropriate resources.
14 This suite of real-time simulation products helps to
15 educate faculty and staff about mental health in
16 suicide prevention, which supports improved academic
17 performance, student retention, and campus safety.
18 Nearly 5000 international and out-of-state students
19 have access to Talk Space with enrolled users
20 reporting anxiety and depression as the two top
21 issues of concern. Talk Space is the most convenient
22 and affordable way to connect with a licensed
23 therapist all from the privacy of one's own personal
24 device. Students can send their therapists a text,
25 audio, picture, or video message at any time and they

2 will respond daily, five days a week. Talk Space
3 will remain available at least through the next two
4 semesters the supplement services for students using
5 the virtual learning environment or preferring this
6 option. Over 20 percent of the faculty and staff
7 across the University have completed the grief and
8 bereavement and self-care and resilience Blackboard
9 courses offered since fall 2020. These courses were
10 offered to support employees in their own care into a
11 them in better understanding the experiences been
12 shared during the pandemic. The 10 Minute Mind
13 mindfulness course has 34,972 registered CUNY users
14 with over 80 percent of the users being students and
15 using the course more than three times weekly. This
16 online, guided mindfulness meditation program,
17 focusing on reducing stress and anxiety by 10 minute
18 daily mindfulness exercise is available to all
19 students, faculty, and staff for daily mindfulness
20 meditation practices. Sometimes, you just need to
21 pull away and have some time to ground yourself in
22 the midst of all that is going on around you. Tele-
23 counseling has been successful at CUNY with usage
24 numbers and requests for services remaining steady
25 throughout the 2021 academic year. While adherents

2 with counseling services has risen dramatically,
3 specific figures for the academic year are still
4 being tabulated and results will be provided to the
5 Council when calculations are complete. Marketing
6 and communication was raised as a concern last year
7 and it has increased with the support of the central
8 office communications team. This includes a revamped
9 website, a larger social media presence,
10 communications sent directly to students regarding
11 until health support, and press briefings on major
12 initiatives. We have monitored a number of marketing
13 and communication metrics following the feedback
14 during the last year. Since the start of the COVID
15 19 pandemic, CUNY's social media accounts have posted
16 about mental health or ovarian to hundred times,
17 reaching more than 700,000 unique users. In that
18 time span, we have posted about mental health on
19 twitter 94 times, yielding 459,280 impressions and
20 7290 engagement. On Facebook, we have posted about
21 mental health 49 times, reaching 114,194 users and
22 yielding 122,810 impressions and 2964 engagements.
23 On Instagram, we have posted about mental health 57
24 times, reaching 138,099 users in yielding 151,955
25 impressions. Now, I did not check to see how this

2 stacks up against one of the more popular things that
3 are going on out there in terms of all of these
4 spaces. Facebook, Instagram, and so forth, but I
5 know it's better than it was last year for us. So,
6 you know, I'm hoping that we can keep up with Beyoncé
7 and Jay-Z and whatever is happening in Drake's life
8 at any given moment, but we're doing better in making
9 sure that students know what is happening at CUNY in
10 these spaces. To announce the new crisis text line
11 service, the press release was published that
12 received 9945 page views and 4501 unique visitors.
13 We also created a social media toolkit with various
14 graphics and language shared by social media channels
15 across CUNY's 25 colleges. A CUNY brief newsletter
16 from February 2021 announced the crisis text line
17 service and other mental health resources and was
18 opened by 79,425 members of the CUNY community,
19 including 69,253 students. Since the summer, we have
20 added a mental health resources footer to each CUNY
21 brief newsletter helping students access our resource
22 hub quickly and easily. Our mental health resource
23 hub webpage received 45,639 page views and 30,125
24 unique visitors. Our CUNY student continuity page,
25 now known as the CUNY Student Survival Guide, was

2 launched in April 2020 to host an abundance of mental
3 health tips and resources and has since received
4 59,419 page views and 50,615 unique visitors. Those
5 are all numbers. There are faces and people behind
6 those numbers and that is what matters most. We need
7 to know that the information is landing. We need to
8 know that students are getting what they need from
9 all of these opens, these likes, these impressions,
10 and connections. That is what matters most. And so,
11 we need to be about the business of figuring out
12 impact, as well. When I came before you last year,
13 though full-time equivalent of mental health
14 practitioners available across the University was
15 108. As we begin this academic year, there has been
16 an increase in the FTE number of practitioners
17 providing mental health services across the
18 University. We have more substantially increased the
19 number of clinicians available to CUNY students
20 through the stimulus funding I will talk about in a
21 moment. The counselor to student ratio CUNY was one
22 to 2550 in the fall of 2019. That same ratio
23 improved in fall 2022 one to 2374 students. For
24 spring 2021, the ratio was reduced to one clinician
25 for every 2151 students. Campuses have made the

2 decision to invest in staffing to provide more direct
3 services resulting in this reduction in the ratio.

4 At the time that I finalize my written testimony, I
5 did not have the details I am about to share with
6 you. We want you to know that campuses were able to
7 add 54 part-time and nine full-time clinicians using
8 the CARES Act funding, taking us to total full-time
9 a: of 146 practitioners. This increase in

10 practitioners reduced the clinician to student ratio
11 for the spring semester to one clinician for every
12 1621 students, bringing us much closer to the IACS
13 standard. And IACS is the International

14 Accreditation of Counseling Services. Bringing us
15 closer to their standard of one clinician for every
16 1500 students. These are temporary lines based on
17 one times stimulus funds. The need for additional
18 base budget investment is necessary to establish
19 permanent positions beyond the next couple of years.

20 What investments have been made? As Chairperson
21 Barron emphasized during the last related hearing,
22 the commitment of funds to address these issues is
23 critical. The investment in CUNY is necessary in
24 order to assure reasonable levels of service to me
25 student mental health needs. The federal stimulus

2 dollars providing to colleges and universities have
3 helped us me some of those means. Under the CARES
4 Act. Comparable amounts have been designated from
5 the Coronavirus Response and Relieve supplemental
6 Appropriations Act, known as CRRSA, and the latest
7 American Rescue Plan Act, ARPA, and those funds will
8 be available, as well. These resources, along with
9 the \$1 million allocation from the state,
10 specifically for mental health services, provide a
11 recent allotment of funds that will total \$14,400 to
12 enhance mental-- I'm sorry. \$14,400,000 to enhance
13 mental health services. Yeah. That wasn't
14 impressive at all when I said it the first time.
15 Which is supplemented by increased funding and for
16 the individual colleges, as well. The use resources
17 certainly make a difference, but additional
18 investment in commitment required to address the need
19 for more practitioners, reduction in wait time, and
20 enhanced service ozone response to increased demand
21 due to pandemic -related stressors. The \$1 million
22 provided by the state will afford opportunity to
23 establish some permanent positions, but will not get
24 us to those being added through-- will not get us to
25 the same level of the number being added from

2 stimulus funds into the level of FTE necessary to
3 mirror the IACS standard. Additional investment is
4 required. So, all that said, there is still more
5 that needs to be done. You are probably aware of the
6 initiatives to alleviate some of the stressors that
7 exist for CUNY students. I highlight two initiatives
8 in particular: the CUNY Comeback Program coupled with
9 the release of transcript and diploma holds for those
10 with outstanding debt to the university. The CUNY
11 Comeback program was launched by Chancellor Matos
12 Rodriguez to relieve the tuition and fee debt of
13 approximately 50,000 CUNY students using up to \$125
14 million in federal stimulus funds. This debt
15 forgiveness initiative is complemented by a policy
16 change lifting transcript and diploma holds for
17 students with outstanding debt to the university.
18 These initiatives created the opportunity for
19 students to reenroll starting this semester and to
20 advance their educational and career goals. This
21 semester, we have heard students express an added
22 anxiety of having to socialize in person again. Our
23 marketing and communications team is rolling out a
24 Here For You mental health campaign to showcase the
25 best of CUNY's mental health resources. We will have

2 new graphics of these resources, graphics of 40 new
3 mental health tips, welcoming video messages from
4 counseling center staff members, in a revamped mental
5 health webpage. We are also launching CUNY's very
6 first student podcast with the inaugural episode
7 featuring our own CUNY trustee, Juvani Piquant,
8 discussing the importance of mental health and her
9 personal experiences. By making CUNY's commitment to
10 students' mental health clear priority, we hope to
11 support their success during this unprecedented in
12 transitional semester. I mentioned the directors and
13 clinicians and I again want to emphasize that they
14 are committed to serving our students and they
15 continue to advocate for resources necessary to make
16 a difference. Who would know better what is needed
17 than those who are confronted with that need? Does
18 the counseling psychologist and someone who has
19 worked in campus counseling centers, I know what it
20 means when you know there might be a term limit for
21 services and you are drawing close to the close of
22 that with a client you have worked with for a while.
23 And you know that more may be necessary, but we have
24 to do what is therapeutically appropriate and also
25 allow for as many students to get what they need as

2 possible. So, just herald the work of our counseling
3 center staff, but recognize there is so much more
4 that we need to do to support them and assure they
5 are provided with the services necessary. Our
6 colleagues at Healthy CUNY survey students regarding
7 their well-being from a variety of perspectives. The
8 data and analyses help us to have a good sense of
9 what is happening in this regard among CUNY students.
10 Recently, these researchers surveyed students
11 regarding their health insurance status and use of
12 health services. Preliminary analysis indicates 10.2
13 percent of survey respondents lacked health
14 insurance. Referral for services to address mental
15 health needs of CUNY students will remain a reality.
16 Healthcare insurance is essential for this purpose.
17 This is a reality deserving attention in response in
18 order to assure access to necessary mental health
19 services. According to a preliminary analysis of the
20 recent student parents survey conducted by CUNY, 81
21 percent of students utilizing counseling reported it
22 been very helpful and 96 percent of students
23 utilizing services reported it being somewhat helpful
24 or very helpful. We are grateful to know that this
25 segment of students is highly satisfied with the

2 counseling services they have received and we
3 recognize the need to extend that experience for
4 other students who do not express this level of
5 satisfaction. I hope, should I have the privilege of
6 coming before you on this topic again, that I will be
7 able to bring you news of greater investment in
8 mental health services, resulting in an even more
9 improved clinician to student ratio. Along with data
10 and information about the effective uses of resources
11 and services being made available, the City Council
12 has been incredibly supportive of CUNY and we would
13 certainly welcome additional recurrent City Council
14 funding directly targeted at increasing mental health
15 staffing capacity. I will not blow smoke or pretend
16 we will be able to immediately conquer it all or
17 fully meet the mental health needs of our students.
18 What we will do is to continue to track our
19 improvement in doing so. We will continue to focus
20 on and set proximal goals to that end. We will work
21 to increase mechanisms for accountability and to
22 gather the creative responses of 25 unique colleges
23 and schools addressing the mental health needs of
24 more than 234,000 students who entrust the
25 partnership in their destiny to those of us at CUNY.

2 Thank you for this opportunity to provide an update
3 on where we are and to remain accountable to you as
4 city leaders, to the people of the city of New York,
5 whom we all serve, and, most importantly, to the
6 students of the City University of New York who
7 deserve our support, our commitment, and
8 responsiveness to their mental health needs. I
9 conclude with this quote from John Maxwell: The
10 pessimist complains about the winds. The optimist
11 expects it to change. The leader adjusts the sails.
12 End quote. We are poised for that sail adjusting
13 with you, on behalf of CUNY students, as we continue
14 to navigate through this experience that is COVID and
15 seek to offer appropriate support to be certain CUNY
16 students thrive. We are available for your
17 questions.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
19 testimony. Before I turned to Chair Barron for
20 questions, I would like to remind Council members to
21 use the raise hand function in so to indicate that
22 they have a question for this panel. Chair Barron?

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very
24 much, Ms. Briggs. And I want to thank Dr. Maybank
25 for her testimony and for making that connection to

2 previous attendants at hearings and the topics that
3 we had addressed in that and bringing it forward to
4 this time. I do appreciate that. Before I oppose my
5 questions, I do want to acknowledge that we have been
6 joined by Council member Ulrich who was a member of
7 this committee. First, I have about four categories
8 of questions in the first one, the first third of
9 questions talks about the COVID virus itself. The
10 safety protocols that are being implemented because
11 of COVID. So, my understanding that each campus has
12 their own plan. Is that the case?

13 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Yes. Campuses
14 were expected to submit plans for approval in,
15 everything, and our most recent testimony prior to
16 this one, it was about reopening. In scope,
17 submitted information was provided during this time.
18 But, yes. Each campus or those expected to submit a
19 point in that was reviewed and had to be approved for
20 central office operations.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you.
22 I don't know if you have the information before, but
23 we would like to know at which phase of resuming in
24 person instruction is each college campus and are
25

2 there any campuses that have fully resumed in person
3 instruction?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So, I don't
5 have the specifics and we will get that information
6 for you, but in person instruction is happening on
7 just campuses. I think there might only be one that
8 doesn't have in person classes at all. But there are
9 in person classes happening on campuses throughout
10 the system. So, we will get it up to Don where we
11 are in the process.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. What
13 percentage of CUNY students are fully vaccinated and
14 can we have that disaggregated by campus?

15 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So we have
16 that information. I have the privilege of managing
17 the responsibility for making sure the uploaded
18 information gets approved in the system, so we are
19 maintaining data on that and we do know how many
20 students are enrolled in person and in hybrid classes
21 and, therefore, must be vaccinated in order to
22 participate in those classes. So, we've been most
23 closely monitoring are in person enrollment
24 information. And before I get off, I can probably
25 pull that up. I just don't want to stop working the

2 camera and paying attention to start to stare at the
3 computer to try to find it all.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

5 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: But we do have
6 some of that information in will get that back to
7 you. I will tell you that we also are paying
8 attention to the overall number of students and where
9 they are in their vaccinations status, as well. So,
10 we saw an increase over time and with the constant
11 overtures to say that you need to be vaccinated, you
12 need to upload your information. We saw a
13 significant increase in the number that or putting
14 that information in who are enrolled in in person
15 classes. So, I know, at one point-- let me not
16 guess. Let me not for percentages out there because
17 I will be guessing, but I will get that information
18 and we will get it to you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I
20 understand the policies that all students must be
21 vaccinated in submit documentation by September 27 or
22 phase academic consequences. So, how many campuses
23 are insuring in person instruction is as safe until
24 the 27th?

25 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So students--

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How are campuses
3 ensuring that?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So, anyone who
5 is not uploaded information into the system for
6 approval is to be tested. Testing is available in
7 their testing sites. I believe there are 20 testing
8 sites and, Ryan, you know better and I see you
9 nodding your head, so I am going with that. There
10 are 20 testing sites and students can use those
11 resources to make sure that they are approved to be
12 on campus physically. I am trying to remember--

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if they are not
14 vaccinated, they can provide or present, rather,
15 documentation that they are--

16 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Of testing.
17 Of a negative test.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: A negative test of
19 COVID.

20 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Within seven
21 days of the time that they are--

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Say again?

23 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: The test must
24 be within a seven day period of the time they're
25 coming.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Within seven days.
3 Okay.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So, the
5 expectation is that you are uploading your proof of
6 vaccination that that, then, goes through a process
7 of approval and then you are in the system for
8 receiving a pass that gives you access so that there
9 is no question about your status. And, as I said, if
10 you can't, then you test in that same system will
11 then indicate that you are approved to be on campus.
12 You mentioned the date of the 27th. That date was
13 set based on the 45 day date of October 7th so that
14 there would be time to approve information that was
15 uploaded. So, we are hoping that students have
16 fulfilled the fully vaccinated protocol. In other
17 words, if you have the two dose series, that you are
18 two weeks beyond her last dose or that, if you are
19 taking no one does protocol with Johnson and Johnson,
20 that you have that in our two weeks beyond the date
21 of that vaccination. And--

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And is Lemus--
23 Yes. I'm sorry. Go ahead.

24 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: No. No,
25 please.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there a separate
3 office or division or department that's dedicated to
4 doing that so that we know what the reporting is?

5 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Separate
6 office for--?

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: For validating the
8 information that is being presented by students that
9 they are vaccinated.

10 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: How we--

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How we are making
12 sure that that is being tracked and monitored and not
13 going to fall between the cracks any place?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: The
15 information is been uploaded into the CUNY First
16 process in system that has been designated in that
17 way and there are individuals who have been
18 identified as location vaccine authorities. We just
19 call them LVA's for sure. So, everything gets an
20 acronym at CUNY. So, that LVA's are responsible for
21 going in and reviewing what has been uploaded and
22 doing the approval so that it then moves forward so
23 that it becomes a pass for accessing campus. They
24 are also reviewing medical exemptions and religious
25 exceptions that are being submitted.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: For those campuses
3 that have different policies, I would think that
4 would be, perhaps, a negative impact. If a student
5 wants to take classes at a visiting campus as a
6 visitor they are in the protocols are different, I
7 mean, we talk about pathways in the advantage of
8 pathways that there would be this seamless movement
9 around all 25 campuses, and I am wondering how is it,
10 now, that these 25 campuses in this instance have
11 their own unique protocols and programs and how that
12 is going to impact the student who wants to take or
13 monitor outclassed intake a class as a visiting
14 student at a different campus which may have very
15 different protocols?

16 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Okay. So,
17 that helps me because the policy is the policy.
18 There is one policy, but there may be different
19 processes. One policy, multiple processes and
20 protocols may exist. So, the approval in the
21 documentation that is associated with your
22 vaccination status is specific to the student and
23 goes with the student. So, whatever the circumstance
24 may be on the next campus, the student is approved.
25 They are vaccinated. We have that information. So,

2 it is then just a matter of whatever the processes
3 may be about how are you show your pass. That you
4 have a pass at that point. Because it is student
5 specific. It is tied to the student, not the campus.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

7 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: For the very
8 reason that you identified, Chairperson Barron.
9 Yeah. Because we have students that are, you know,
10 have been around for any reason. I may work in the
11 Bronx and so I wanted--

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: to take
14 classes there and live in Queens. So, yeah.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. So, there
16 seems to be or I have been told that there may be an
17 issue with students who have what is called that
18 breakthrough, even though they are fully vaccinated.
19 They do contract the virus again or test positive for
20 the virus again and may not have any symptoms. If a
21 student tests positive, even though they may be fully
22 vaccinated, how does that instructor, that staff
23 person, the faculty person, going to know, wait a
24 minute. This student shouldn't be here? And
25 particularly in light of the HIPPA laws which provide

2 particularly needed protection to individuals? So,
3 doesn't instructor get a notice of, well, one of you
4 students has tested positive? How does the
5 instructor-- I hope been told that instructors got
6 no notice that one of your students has tested
7 positive. Can that be the case? And if the student
8 is either, oh, gosh. I've got to get this last class
9 before I stay home or, for whatever reason, not
10 removing themselves, how then is that class
11 population going to be protected?

12 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Chairperson,
13 Barron, in all honesty, I don't know that I'm the
14 best person to respond to that with any detail. All
15 I can tell you is that, if a person tests positive,
16 they do not have access to the campus. That is the
17 best that I can offer at this point, but we will get
18 back to you and let you know if there is any notice
19 that says anything. But, you know, we-- as you
20 said, HIPPA and FERPA causes us to have to be careful
21 about what we say--

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

23 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: and how we
24 communicate that.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, who is
3 responsible on campus for monitoring that students,
4 faculty, and staff are, in fact, masked in keeping
5 social distanced on campus?

6 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: That might
7 differ with each campus protocol.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Each campus
9 should have someone designated for that. Is there a
10 title for that person?

11 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I'm not
12 familiar with that. As I said, there may be others
13 who would be better to respond to that. I have not
14 monitored that and didn't check it before coming for
15 this purpose. So, I'm not really in the best
16 position to respond to that.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, we know
18 that, when public schools opened last week, there
19 were, I believe, 53 cases or thereabouts 80 cases of
20 people who tested positive. Looking at the higher
21 education programs, what will it take to trigger a
22 shift from in person instruction to distance learning
23 and does that vary from campus to campus?

24 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I think that
25 that would be something that would happen primarily

2 from central setting some standards, but I can't
3 speak to what it would be at this point because I'm
4 not privy to us having had a conversation about that
5 very directly. It may be-- And I know that there
6 are things embedded in the individual plans for
7 campuses about what would change in that regard. So,
8 again, just not the best person to respond to that.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So if you--

10 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: But given
11 you've posed the question, I'm sure someone will be
12 able to get back to you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. So
14 we'll be looking forward to having that answered
15 because I'm sure that CUNY has been forward thinking
16 to say, well, listen, we've got this program now. We
17 have these hybrid models, but just in case--

18 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: there's a surge, we
20 want to know what is that threshold that would
21 trigger that response.

22 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: And as I said,
23 I know there are things in the individual plans, but
24 I think there, you know, is probably a statement at

2 the central level, as well. I'm just not aware right
3 now.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. We received
5 information about a photo that was shared that showed
6 900 students in a lecture hall. A photo shared by a
7 parent of Hunter College auditorium packed with
8 students with the comment "approximately 900
9 students, according to the professor". If that is
10 the case, how can-- why did that happen?

11 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I can't
12 imagine where that happened or how that could have
13 happened because we are required to keep a reasonable
14 level of distance and I don't know of any spaces that
15 people were being allowed in to that extent. I'm not
16 familiar with that, Chairperson.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. But, well,
18 again, it was reported to us that that was the case
19 and we will share that with you, as well, so that you
20 can pursue it further. I'd like to move on now to
21 general questions and questions about staffing. I
22 was pleased to hear the movement in the ratio that
23 approaches what it is that the standards say should
24 be achieved. Pleased to know that it went from one
25 to 2500 down to one to 2334-- 374 down to one to

2 2161. And I believe the last number you gave me was
3 even lower than that.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Yes. It is
5 below 2000. So it is one to 1661, I believe, is the
6 number.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

8 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I'm sorry.
9 Six-- 1600-- Yeah. That's right. 61, I think, is
10 right. Ryan, please jump in here. I'm not looking
11 at my notes right now. I'm looking at the screen.
12 Are you allowed to unmute or no?

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'll ask---

14 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: It's 1621.

15 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: 21. Thank
16 you.

17 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: You're welcome.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. How were you
19 able to achieve that in such a short period of time?
20 I think that's commendable. I have to say that. And
21 how were you able to achieve that?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Well, we added
23 54 part time and nine full time clinicians and so
24 when we were able to do that using the stimulus funds
25 that were made available-- because, I think, to a

2 person-- and I'm going to give you, Ryan, a chance
3 to respond to this. I believe, to a person, the
4 counseling center directors were saying we need
5 additional clinicians. That's what we need. It's
6 like it's nice to have the tele-counseling and all of
7 those things, but we need additional clinicians. So
8 given the opportunity to do so, they employed on a
9 temporary basis.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Hm.

11 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: clinicians.

12 Ryan, you want to--

13 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yes. Just before I
14 delve into that, I just want to thank Chair Barron
15 and the committee for having us both here again.
16 Yes. You know, we understood that the CARES stimulus
17 funding would come with some direction to invest in
18 mental health. Based on, you know, many things we've
19 been hearing and based on our appearance before the
20 Council last year and discussions with various
21 stakeholders across the university, that it was
22 important to have additional funding for mental
23 health and, specifically, for staffing. So, when the
24 stimulus funding was made available to campuses, they
25 jumped at the chance to be able to hire part-time

2 clinicians. And they really saw the benefits of
3 adding additional staff to their roles in order to
4 continue to provide services at a higher level to
5 campus students.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. So you
7 said that the funds were able to have additional
8 hiring of 54 part-time and nine full time. So what
9 now are the total numbers?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: The total--

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Or additional
12 workers?

13 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: The total full
14 time equivalent of the equivalent clinicians
15 available is 146.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And part time?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: That's
18 everybody. So, that accounts for--

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's everybody.

20 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: how much time
21 is--

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How much time they
23 give. So can you break that out? Can you
24 disaggregate that so that we'll know how many are
25 part time and how many are full time?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Overall, the
3 146, how many are part time and how many are full
4 time?

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

6 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Is that--
7 Okay. So, yes. We should be able to do that.

8 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Absolutely. We can
9 break that down for you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I do want to
11 acknowledge we've been joined by Council member
12 Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo who is a member of this
13 committee. Thank you. How are students-- How do we
14 determine the number of hours a student may need in
15 terms of interacting and whether it should be in
16 person or whether it can be tele-counseling. How do
17 we determine that?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I can tell you
19 that some of that is determined by the present
20 [inaudible 1:06:54]. That, you know,
21 therapeutically, what seems appropriate, there are
22 standards that have been set for years in the
23 counseling and psychology context and in college
24 counseling context that look at what it is that seems
25 reasonable in terms of offering support to students

2 and students sometimes being able to get a series of
3 sessions and then leave and come back and that being
4 therapeutic in the process. But I am going leave
5 Brianna talk more specifically about CUNY and how we
6 make that decision here.

7 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yes. Thank you, Vice
8 Chancellor Maybank. I think what's-- we've been
9 doing a lot of learning, of course, over the course
10 of the last 18 months through the pandemic and with
11 the ability to offer services as tele-counseling and
12 ability to offer sort of unique technological
13 advances to supporting mental health, we have learned
14 that students respond very differently to the
15 available needs. And some students respond better to
16 tele-counseling and some students just want, you
17 know, someone that they can send a text to, you know,
18 in a time of crisis and other want to sit in an
19 office with a clinical staff member. So I think the
20 important thing we have learned and what we have
21 tried to do during the course of the last 18 months
22 is start where the student is. And, you know, after,
23 of course, the psychological assessment to determine
24 the means, as Dr. Maybank indicated, how are the
25 student feel most comfortable proceeding? And we

2 think it is important for the students needs to be
3 met so that they can chart the course of their own
4 services and it is something that we will continue to
5 do as we continue with the known normal, as much as I
6 hate that phrase. But, you know, we definitely would
7 like to see a continued footprint of some of the
8 things that worked really well, including tele-
9 counseling going forward.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. As you
11 send the information about how many of the counselors
12 are full-time and part-time, we would also like to
13 have that information disaggregated by campus, if you
14 would. Well, what is the impact-- are you also
15 using interns as a part of the counseling services
16 that you provide to your students? Or are they only
17 seen by clinicians who have already completed their
18 training?

19 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: No. We
20 definitely use interns and I'm going to be quiet and
21 let Ryan talk about that, but I just wanted to talk
22 broadly about the importance of that. I remember
23 doing my own internship in a counseling center in the
24 significant experience that that is in the
25 opportunity to be supervised by those who are doing

2 this work on a regular basis makes such a difference
3 in your perspective about the importance of working
4 in a counseling center and providing services to
5 students. So, Ryan?

6 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yes. And I will echo
7 that to say that, as a clinician myself who also went
8 through training in clinical settings, it is very
9 important to be in a position to train and then to be
10 trained and then to train as a clinician. Because it
11 really creates a circular path in terms of the work
12 that we do. Yes. We need to use interns from
13 various disciplines within our counseling centers.
14 Large amounts of psychologists, but also social
15 workers, mental health counselors, and various
16 iterations to be able to do training within the
17 counseling centers and also to receive supervision
18 that all lines with the exemplary work that is done
19 in our counseling centers. We have also been very
20 mindful of where the clinicians in training are
21 coming from in trying to make sure that we give our
22 CUNY students an opportunity to be able to serve in a
23 capacity with experiential learning should be able to
24 provide them with these experiences. And, of course,
25 we have students from all over the city to be able to

2 do these internships, but we also want to make sure
3 that CUNY students are receiving services from both
4 types.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: With the funding
6 that you have received that allows you to hire
7 additional staff, how long will that funding remain
8 in place so that these persons can remain on staff?

9 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So, we can
10 talk about two different sets of money. So, the
11 money that came from the state, the million dollars,
12 I believe that that is a permanent provision, so that
13 gives us the opportunity to hire permanent staff. I
14 am certain that the campuses were use those resources
15 to do just that. I doubt that that money will be
16 used to supplement teleservices or anything like
17 that. The money that is coming from the stimulus
18 funds use money that is time-limited. And I know
19 that the CARES Act money was extended to the next
20 year, to 2022 and then we have a new infusion of
21 money through the CRSSA and the ARPA money, as well.
22 So, we aren't doing comparable amounts of money
23 there. So, I can say we can probably be three years
24 out from this year with those resources, but beyond
25 that, we are going to need some additional resource

2 those or ways to make certain that those positions
3 can be made permanent and made available. In make
4 people available to see your students, whether it be
5 in groups and individual or another types of
6 services. The psychoeducational services and so
7 forth.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. And as
9 you give the information about the breakdown of part-
10 time and full-time in disaggregated by campus, if you
11 would also give us current full-time mental health
12 counselor to student ratio at each campus, that would
13 be helpful.

14 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Okay. Thank
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you., You
17 had mentioned several programs that are available for
18 students. I think you said the crisis text line--

19 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You said Talk
21 Space. You talked about in mindfulness programming
22 and tele-counseling and you gave both numbers as to
23 how students are utilizing or, at least, interacting
24 with these platforms or these programs. How are we
25

2 going to get the word out to every CUNY student that
3 these programs exist?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: And so, we
5 also have bolstered our communications and marketing
6 efforts in an effort to do that and that is why say,
7 you know, I am not sure what the best trending is
8 for, you know, when you really have made it, you
9 know, and Instagram or on Facebook or whatever it is.
10 I just know we are better than we were, but we still
11 have more that we can do, certainly, so we have the
12 addition of the website in the addition of the briefs
13 that go out with the extra tickler at the bottom.
14 And so, we are hopeful that we will be able to push
15 information about these resources and services on a
16 regular basis. On some scheduled basis so that
17 students will see a. It is a matter of keeping it in
18 front of folks and making sure that faculty know
19 about what resources are out there so that they can
20 announce it and being certain that other students are
21 sharing it, as well. That word-of-mouth, that peer-
22 to-peer experiences often the best way to get
23 students to use the resources that are available.
24 Ryan, do you want to add to that?

2 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yeah. So, I think the
3 communications plan also is-- and the fact that we
4 have spent on technology is a multi prong approach
5 because we think it is important not only to speak
6 directly the students, but also to make sure faculty
7 are aware of these resources so that they can
8 communicate them. So, step members, even those who
9 are outside of a mental health role will know about
10 the resources. So, if they are able to communicate
11 with the student, they should feel comfortable to do
12 so. So, we find that or we feel that it is
13 important, you know, to expand the communication not
14 just directly to students who are very busy in their
15 schoolwork, etc., but also to make sure that everyone
16 the community, as a CUNY community, is aware whatever
17 resources are available.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. And
19 particularly talking about staff, Dr. Maybank, in
20 your testimony, believe you said that there was an
21 opportunity for staff and faculty to be trained in
22 some types of procedures that they can use or share
23 with their students. I didn't have a chance to write
24 down what that program was.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Cognito is the
3 tool and it is a simulation-based interaction so that
4 you get to know how to approach the student with
5 information into provide them with resources. What
6 things might be said and how you can respond because,
7 more often than not, we are afraid to say the wrong
8 thing, so we say nothing. And we want to armor
9 faculty and staff with-- we want to empower them by
10 helping them know it is better to step in and to
11 offer assistance. When someone is suicidal, what can
12 you say? What do you do? Where do you direct them?
13 And how do you make that meaningful and that
14 experience without feeling like, you know, shouldn't
15 go there. That's not my stuff. I don't know what to
16 do with that, or just going to walk away. No. You
17 need to engage because people are looking for
18 support. You know, often, to cry for help in some
19 way that you even were aware. They were reaching out
20 in some way. And so, how do we empower faculty and
21 staff should then be able to do that? And so, that
22 is one of the tools that is helping get people ready
23 for that in no way that doesn't-- we are not asking
24 you to go now I'm being trained as a counselor. Were

2 just trying to give you the tools that will allow you
3 to have the interaction.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. The next
5 question in this area is can you describe why
6 counselors were once on a faculty line and are now on
7 the administrative line and how has this impacted the
8 responsibilities and ability to serve students? And
9 what is that number that we are looking at?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I'm going to
11 defer to Ryan on that switch because I am unfamiliar,
12 but being on a faculty line versus being on an
13 administrative line shouldn't change the way the
14 services being provided, but I am going to let Ryan
15 respond.

16 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Sure. And it's a great
17 question and one that predates my time at CUNY by
18 quite some time, but I will take a stab at it. It is
19 my understanding that the role of College counseling,
20 as a doubled over the years and it was felt that the
21 positions of college counselor should be an
22 administrative role rather than in a faculty role.
23 There are still faculty counselors that exist at
24 CUNY. I could not tell you of the top of my head how
25 many, unfortunately, but it is my understanding that

2 the shift in College counseling to a more public
3 health model rather than an advisement model that
4 occurred in higher education over the years is the
5 reason for that switch. I would have to get some
6 detail from my predecessors at CUNY to be able to
7 provide more details, however.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, what you--

9 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: And that is a
10 national thing, Chairperson Barron. That is not just
11 something happening here. So, as people are retiring
12 or leaving roles, they are not being replaced with
13 faculty lines. They are taking the news other
14 administrative titles or classifications.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, you alluded to
16 the fact that, even though the lines that they are on
17 may be different, there still offering the same type
18 and level of services?

19 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Yeah. Because
20 were still hiring people with doctoral degrees in
21 counseling with licensed social workers. Ryan, you
22 would be better to kind of talk about who it is we--

23 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yes. We are still
24 hiring those who, you know, have degrees in
25 psychology and social work and other mental health

2 disciplines-- licensed professional counselors
3 should be able to provide mental health specific
4 work. So, the lines are not disappearing themselves.
5 They're just been transferred from a faculty position
6 who may have a dual role of providing, you know,
7 education and courses and advisement to someone who
8 is specifically designated to do the mental health
9 treatment services for the University.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Will there be any
11 distinction in their title or in their ability to
12 have the opportunity to move up, let's say, in a
13 department? If they were interdepartmental and they
14 were assigned to a department, there would be that
15 opportunity, I think, to move in that department. Is
16 that the same with the administrative line?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I think it is
18 different. There is a different kind of tenure read
19 because faculty get tenure and that is a different
20 process. But the other issues that are associated
21 with the faculty line, as well, whereas we do not
22 have access to them over the summer. But when you
23 have that administrative line, you have that longer
24 period in the year, as well. There are other ways of
25 establishing longevity in that classification system.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And will the
3 salaries be the same?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I don't know
5 the answer to that.

6 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: I will say that the
7 salaries are analogous to-- between the faculty
8 lines in the higher education associate-- the higher
9 education officer lines. That is obviously a union
10 question for the PSC to discuss, but the salary lines
11 are identical between the faculty progression and the
12 higher education officer progression when it comes to
13 the counseling-- those that are appointed in
14 counseling. Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I'm
16 going to try to move briefly through the rest of my
17 questions. Or rather I should say quickly through
18 the rest of my questions so that my colleagues can
19 have an opportunity to pose questions also. Moving
20 on to the mental health Access for students, what are
21 the different ways that students can access campus
22 mental health resources and can you provide data on
23 students who are utilizing teleconferencing services
24 sources in person counseling?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Ryan, I'm
3 going to be quiet.

4 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: I think the major
5 inroad-- well, it's changed a little bit over the
6 past 18 months, obviously. So, we have relied more
7 on electronic technology to be able to have folks
8 emailing in and connecting into the zoom meeting. As
9 we are working on this transition back to on campus
10 that the importance of word-of-mouth and faculty and
11 staff referrals and your information becomes more
12 important. So, we are in something of a transitional
13 time right now, but I can certainly look at the data
14 from last year and get back to you with the details
15 of what the footprint looks like.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, are there
17 any limits on how students may ask those mental
18 health resources? For example, is there a maximum
19 number of sessions that a student may have with the
20 counselor? Is that separate the beginning? So they
21 are going in, you know, each student is allowed three
22 sessions? Four? Eight? Is that a set number?

23 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: The last time we collect
24 those data was pre-pandemic to discuss session limits
25 and I think we are in a different place right now to

2 be able to look at that figure. And I can certainly
3 collect some data and get it back to you. Typically,
4 the way it works is depending on the volume of
5 students in the clinicians available, there is a set
6 limit that is sorted out so that at the beginning of
7 each student's time with the counseling center.
8 Since we have had such an increase with the part-time
9 hires that we have mentioned before incident or you
10 have been virtual, those numbers may be sort of quite
11 distorted from where they had been. But I will
12 collect some information from the counseling centers
13 and I can get back to you on that certainly.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Our
15 students allowed to access different resources? For
16 example, can they use both teller counseling and in
17 person counseling or they restricted to one form once
18 they are in this counseling?

19 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: They are not restricted
20 per se. I mean, we would like to encourage our
21 students to use whatever resources are available to
22 them. If someone is working with the counselor and
23 in the counseling center, however, we would prefer
24 them not to have another counselor through a
25 different service that they would use just to make

2 sure that we're providing the best care available.
3 But there is no restrictions on anything that we are
4 offering in terms of services." The question that
5 does come from students from time to time and our
6 counselors are happy to discuss what they think is
7 the best option.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, what do
9 students do when they have exhausted all campus
10 resources?

11 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: When they have exhausted
12 all their campus resources, they can work along with
13 their counsel or and other case managers that may be
14 of employee in the counseling centers to help them
15 transition to an outside source of mental health
16 support. This is also important, obviously, for
17 folks that are in need of a higher level of support
18 then we can provide and so we do have staff that are
19 able to help them with that transition. We will
20 certainly not turn anyone away and move someone comes
21 back and says that that didn't work for me, we will
22 continue to work with them until a plane comes
23 together.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, does CUNY track
25 those students and consider their needs and tried to

2 make sure that, once they have exhausted what CUNY
3 has to offer, that there is still ongoing outreach?
4 Do you track those students or do you just send them
5 to a person and hope that they follow through?

6 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: I believe-- Again, this
7 is a question that I would have to get some more
8 details on from the counselors--

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

10 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: but I do believe that
11 they are attracting terms of, you know, this is the
12 plan that we have set with the student and, you know,
13 we will follow-up to make sure that that happens.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And then--

15 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I believe it
16 was Amber-- I'm sorry, Council member--

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No. God ahead.

18 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Chairperson.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. Continue.

20 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I believe that
21 it was Amber last year that talked about that. It
22 was either Amber or Anna that talked about that last
23 year and talked about the fact that they felt that
24 there should have been a little more connectedness.

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: And so, it is
3 something on my radar we can definitely take a look
4 of that and, if it is inadequate, certainly figure
5 out how we might put plans in place for better
6 tracking and communication. It's about how we
7 communicate with students, really, in that regard
8 because, when you make a referral, you don't want
9 them to feel like you are just pushing them off or
10 passing them on, but that you're still there with
11 them. They're still our students.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. And
13 how many referrals to counselors make and to whom do
14 you find that there is a particular type of issue
15 that gets more of a referral than others?

16 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: I would not say that
17 there's an issue, per se, that would get a referral
18 to others. I think it has to do with the level of
19 treatment that the student needs and is able to
20 provide. I will just give one example. For
21 medication management, most of our campuses do not
22 have a psychiatrist on staff. So, that is something
23 that we would need to connect a student with an
24 outside clinician for. But we, you know, it would

2 not necessarily be issue based, but more of level of
3 service based.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do counselors have
5 an opportunity to, in a structured way, meet with
6 other counselors to share information or to discuss
7 protocols or any other pertinent issues?

8 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yes. We have a twice
9 monthly counseling center directors meeting which
10 takes point is now virtually, but will resume in
11 person hopefully. And, basically, it's a meeting
12 with all of the directors, plus myself, and just as
13 stated, Dr. Maybank is come to that meeting, as well,
14 and it's a time for us to discuss protocols and
15 communicate between campuses, but also from central
16 to campuses and vice versa. So, we have that regular
17 arrangement.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can sessions be
19 extended to include other family members?

20 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Yes. Absolutely. We
21 offer services that incorporate family, couples
22 counseling as needed. Obviously the family unit in a
23 persons community and social ties are important to
24 their mental health, so we do offer those as
25 appropriate.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: The other
3 thing that I wanted to add is just as a matter of
4 practice in counseling psychology and counseling
5 centers, there is a matter of case management and so,
6 often, there is consultation with colleagues around,
7 you know-- it's like, I'm kind of stuck. I've been
8 seeing this person and I really would like some help
9 with this. And so there are ways to engage to the
10 benefit of your student client. And to be able to
11 share information and to learn from one another,
12 also, in that process which can be really useful.

13 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Absolutely.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How long is the
15 waiting list? Or how long does-- How much time does
16 it take for a person to get services either in person
17 or virtual? And can we find out what that is by each
18 campus?

19 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: I can certainly find
20 that out for you. Again, we've been-- the numbers
21 are a bit askew because we've been online and we've
22 been trying to offer with the virtual service,
23 obviously, a much more rapid response because we are
24 capable of doing it because we're--

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

2 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: and enhancing weekend
3 services and evenings, etc. So, we will get numbers
4 back to you on that. I can tell you that,
5 traditionally, we like to-- the counseling directors
6 like to keep it very low, but, again, we can get
7 numbers back to that.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And very important
9 for me, how are addressing the significance and
10 importance of having counselors that are culturally
11 reflective of the students that we are serving? And
12 trained in cultural sensitivity for the students that
13 we are dealing with? What are the number of
14 counselors that are black that are on our campuses?
15 What are the number that are Latino? Because those
16 are the major groups that we have at CUNY. So, what
17 are those numbers and, if they are not of those
18 ethnic groups, what kind of sensitivity training?
19 And I know they are counselors and they're
20 professionals, but what kind of sensitivity training
21 do they receive?

22 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Sure. We will certainly
23 get back to you with numbers. We had provided some
24 numbers last time around, but, obviously, since we've
25 done hires, we want to update those for you. So

2 we're certain to do that. And I will say, in terms
3 of ongoing training and professional development,
4 it's a big piece of what we do in the counseling
5 centers themselves, but also from central office and
6 a lot of the work that I try to do revolves around
7 professional development around many, many issues.
8 You know, we have recently had several campuses train
9 in anti-black racism and supervision and how to deal
10 with those issues in treatment and in supervision.
11 So that is a regular clinical matter, as well as a
12 training matter, just as one example. So, there are
13 many, many more and I would be happy to provide you
14 with more detailed responses about the professional
15 development that we do.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. How has
17 CUNY made efforts to reach immigrant and first
18 generation college students who may not be aware of
19 mental health services available on their campus?
20 The particular segment that we need to carve out for
21 them to make sure that they know? Because it may not
22 be a part of their culture to even acknowledge that
23 there are these kinds of issues.

24 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Sure. That's always
25 been-- I'm sorry. Please.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: No. You go
3 ahead. You go ahead, Ryan.

4 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: No. And the question
5 has come up before and it's something that we are
6 definitely looking at in terms of improving and
7 working on because it is very difficult and we've
8 offered, you know, a particular service this time
9 around and for international and out of state
10 students for the pandemic, but I think we need to be
11 as clear with our communications as we're being to--
12 in other areas to target those specific groups. And
13 so I will defer to Dr. Maybank for more comment on
14 that.

15 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: I just believe
16 that, you know, making sure we had Talk Space an
17 option for our students who were in other countries
18 or in other states, that was one way that we were
19 engaging them, but I agree that, you know, we have to
20 make certain students understand that this is a
21 service that is a part of the experience for them as
22 a student at CUNY and make certain that they know how
23 to access that infor-- access those services and
24 resources because it is important and people who are
25 having that cross cultural experience as an

2 international student coming into this space may have
3 particular stressors for which they would need
4 support, as well. So, it is of concern and something
5 which we are paying attention to.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And can you confirm
7 that each individual college has updated their
8 website to reflect all mental health services
9 available to students this semester?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Can't tell you
11 that today, but we certainly can check.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. Thank you.
13 And then, just shifting a few questions for faculty--
14 regarding faculty and staff. In addition to CUNY's
15 employment assistance program, EAP, do CUNY employees
16 have access to mental health resources through the
17 university?

18 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Outside of the employee
19 assistance program, they don't have any University-
20 provided mental health benefits. However, I
21 understand the EAP benefits that are on offer are
22 quite good. I would defer to my Human Resources
23 colleagues in that area. We do attempt, in and as
24 Dr. Maybank spoke about before, we offered some
25 Blackboard courses on selfcare and bereavement and

2 grief. And while those courses were sort of a dual
3 role for helping to help students, as well, we
4 understood that some folks may be using them for
5 information for themselves, as well. So, I would
6 defer to Human Resources for the actual offerings.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And the next
8 question in this category is do colleges provide
9 faculty and staff with information on identifying
10 students that may need a referral for mental health
11 counseling? And, I imagine, if that's a part of
12 Cognito, as you mentioned-- I would imagine that
13 that is a part of that, but are there other--

14 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: You're a quick
15 study, Chairperson Barron. You got that one. So,
16 yeah. So that is designed for that purpose, but
17 there are other ways, as well, that, you know--
18 because there's something called-- oh, goodness. I
19 just lost that fast, Ryan. First Aid-- Is it mental
20 health--

21 DIRECTOR CAMIRE: Mental Health First Aid.
22 Yes.

23 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Mental Health
24 First Aid. Thank you. And then QPR is another
25 program. So there are different things that some of

2 my colleagues who are in counseling psychology, they
3 would know about and be able to offer in their campus
4 setting. But we wanted to make sure that Cognito was
5 available across the board and that is why that one
6 was purchased centrally. But there are a number of
7 different tools that help those who are not in the
8 field of counseling and psychology and psychiatry to
9 get the tools to be able to have that conversation
10 and to know when, to say what, and what to do to get
11 students connected with resources.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. So,
13 you've talked about the \$5 million allocated through
14 CARES and you've talked about CUNY having an
15 additional 1.9 million added since adoption. In
16 addition, cuties budget includes 77.1 million for FY
17 23 should be allocated at the discretion of the
18 community colleges. How has CUNY campuses spent
19 their allocation for FY 21?

20 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: We were deaf I
21 have to get back to you on that because that would be
22 something we would have to gather from each of them.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

24 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: As Ryan worked
25 diligently to get that number of 54 and nine for us--

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

3 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: You know, it
4 takes a little do to make sure we are getting it for
5 you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: To date--
7 illicitly also be a question that you can get back to
8 us on. To date, how much of the federal funding
9 earmarked for mental health has been allocated to
10 each of the community colleges and what was the
11 methodology used for distribution of these funds?
12 Who made the decision of mandated distribution
13 inherent from each of the eight packages? Was it
14 based on student population? Was it based on
15 demonstrated me through the past number of students?
16 What were the formula?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: We will get
18 that for you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thanks.

20 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: And you said
21 you are particularly are interest in that at the
22 community college.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. What is the
24 base line funding comprised of city tax levy for in
25 FY 22 for mental health resources for students at the

2 community college and, then, what is the total
3 budget? And we will send you these in writing. Then
4 what is the total budget for mental health services
5 including all revenue streams for FY 22?

6 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Got it.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And there
8 are two other questions and we will put them in
9 writing to you. One is of the \$77 million in federal
10 aide in FY 23 for community college, what portion of
11 this funding will be allocated towards mental health
12 and do the community colleges have enough funding to
13 deliver the support necessary to its student
14 population? And, if not, what is the deficit?
15 Again, we will send you these in writing. And I
16 wanted to know, what had been individual campuses
17 efforts and successes in getting additional funding
18 through other sources than through the usual
19 pipeline? Have they made those efforts and have they
20 been successful?

21 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Ryan, do you
22 know of any particular circumstances?

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: There have been
24 some efforts in the past. One that comes to mind
25 immediately is the substance abuse grant from the New

2 York State Office of-- OASIS, they renamed it. So I
3 have trouble remembering the new name. New York
4 State OASIS. So they have a grant for five campuses.
5 More recently, I would have to get back to you on
6 that, but there are opportunities that do present
7 themselves.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Well,
9 that concludes the questions that I have and I do
10 want to thank you for, at the outset, responding to
11 the fact that we did receive a letter from the CUNY
12 black faculty and staff and that you would be
13 interested in getting a copy of that. we will make
14 sure that we get that to you and that you have
15 indicated that you would love to respond to them and
16 be involved with that. So we do appreciate that and,
17 at this time, I want to thank you for coming and I
18 will turn it now to the host, our counsel, Amy
19 Briggs.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair
21 Barron. Seeing as we have no other Council members
22 waiting to ask questions, we can now turn it over to
23 the public testimony portion of this hearing and we
24 have concluded the administration's testimony.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you to the
3 administration for coming, once again.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I would
5 like to remind everyone that we will call individuals
6 in panels. Once your new move called, a member of
7 our staff will unmute you and you may begin your
8 testimony once the sergeant-at-arms sets the clock
9 and gives you the cue. All testimony will be limited
10 to three minutes. Remember, there is a few second
11 delay would you are unmuted before we can hear you.
12 And please wait for the sergeant-at-arms to announce
13 that you may begin before starting your testimony.
14 The first panel for public speaking with include Remy
15 Salas from CUNY Rising Alliance, Anna Compton from
16 the New York Public Interest Research Group, and
17 Xenia Sami Maitland. Remy Salas, you may begin your
18 testimony. I will now call on Remy Salas to begin
19 his testimony.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time begins now.

21 REMY SALAS: Hello, everyone in the entire
22 Higher Education Committee and Chair Barron. My name
23 is Remy Salas. I am the campaign director for the
24 CUNY Rising Alliance, as well as a professor in the
25 Department of Ethnic and Race Studies at CUNY BMCC

2 and a proud union member for the PSC CUNY. CUNY is
3 lagging way behind on the recommended ratio of one to
4 1000 clinical professional counselors per student.
5 This is according to the Accreditation of Counseling.
6 Right now, CUNY averages one mental health counselor
7 to 2700 students which is unacceptable. The CUNY 19
8 pandemic has been devastating for all students trying
9 to cope with how it impacts their lives while they
10 are still pursuing their education. As a professor,
11 it breaks my heart to see many of my former student,
12 even active students, not have enough support to help
13 them thrive, causing many to struggle academically
14 and even going as far as dropping out. CUNY has so
15 much untapped potential in human capital and great
16 students not to provide the efficient mental health
17 resources. The demand for more clinical
18 professionals arose way before the pandemic.
19 Advisors can be very vital to any student's mental
20 health where they can speak, clear their minds, and
21 provide students the direction and guidance on how to
22 deal with life's challenges while completing their
23 education. I would also like to add that and note
24 that there are more than 50 percent of CUNY students
25 that live below the poverty line and face housing and

2 food insecurity. Some are even living in shelter as
3 they fight to improve their lives and fight to
4 improve the lives of their families. It is our
5 responsibility to ensure that students are given all
6 the tools and resources they need to be healthy and
7 successful. Once again, I want to thank everyone at
8 the Higher Education Committee and all the members of
9 the committee for the opportunity for students,
10 staff, and entire community. Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
12 testimony. I will now call on Anna Compton.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time begins now.

14 ANNA COMPTON: Good morning. Thank you
15 for having me. My name is Anna Compton and I am a
16 senior at Hunter College. This is not my first time
17 testifying on mental health. Although there have
18 been improvements, we need to ensure that resources
19 are not only available, but accessible. Transferring
20 in 2019 was not easy, especially with the student
21 with an IEP from a two-year SUNY to a four year CUNY.
22 It was extremely isolating and the only reason I
23 learned about services like the counseling center was
24 because I registered with the Accessibility Office.
25 I quickly learned that this wouldn't be easy and, top

2 of this, the intake appointment would take four to
3 six weeks. I was told by friends of mine to be
4 careful with how much I shared because they are quick
5 to send you to the outside provider. I immediately
6 communicated that I was fine with short-term
7 sessions, but I was still referred off-campus. I was
8 given a list of 10 therapists in the city that took
9 my insurance. With this list came many barriers.
10 Many of these providers should not take my insurance
11 and, for those that did, the waiting period for an
12 intake would be about eight weeks and sessions were
13 not guaranteed and could take up to 12 weeks. On top
14 of this, many of the providers were an hour away
15 and/or only had sessions during class times and had
16 limited hours or they never called me back. In March
17 2020, I was desperate. Distance learning with a
18 disability was brutal. I just needed someone to
19 listen, even if it was only for session. I
20 essentially begged Hunters counseling services to do
21 short-term sessions, but was given the same list of
22 referrals that they gave me in September 2019. It is
23 also important to know that, before we even and
24 online learning, I had been in their offices three
25 times and in one of these visits, my counselor even

2 sat down with me and we called the referrals together
3 and she was able to see that they weren't working.
4 Once July 2020 rolled around, I got a call back. I
5 begin sessions with a therapist, but it was not a
6 positive experience and I had to end immediately.
7 Fall 2020, I was able to complete a handful of
8 sessions and then December came around and, as I
9 settled in, I was told that my therapist at been
10 transferred to another facility and I was able to
11 stay with this place, but I get sessions rolling
12 until around April. And this being our first
13 semester fully online, my mental health was at an
14 all-time low this point in April and I'm reminded of
15 this on the daily with my GPA and grades from last
16 semester. We are now in fall 2020 and I am starting
17 this process all over again. In the last five
18 months, I have had four sessions, similar to my
19 summer situation. There's only one open time for her
20 to meet with me. I asked if it was possible to see
21 another therapist in house and she told me I would
22 have to be waitlisted for an intake appointment and
23 it could take up to six weeks. I understand
24 therapists cannot be available to us 24/7, but in
25 these cases, I feel that campuses need to help

2 students find a solution and meet us halfway. I
3 think there should be--

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

5 ANNA COMPTON: counselors available--
6 Oh, sorry. Sorry. Am I cut off?

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You may continue.

8 ANNA COMPTON: Okay. Can I continue?
9 Okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

11 ANNA COMPTON: So, I think, in
12 situations like this, there needs to be some kind of
13 emergency session available. I'm sorry. I'm almost
14 done. Not only do we need more counselors, but we
15 need more counselors to work with students with
16 disabilities, students who are [inaudible 01:49:34]
17 housing insecure, students of color, and LGBTQ
18 students. We needed this before the pandemic you
19 certainly need it now. We need direct actions from
20 our New York leaders to invest in in prioritize the
21 well-being of public school students. This includes
22 the governor, City Council, the Board of Trustees,
23 and campus presidents. We need to look at how other
24 colleges are addressing mental health in invest in
25 options that work for all CUNY students and ensure

2 that the wellness fees we are paying for our actually
3 being utilized for us and by us. NYPERG is calling
4 for more funding for on-site mental health services
5 on campus and to decrease wait times like the ones
6 I have experienced. I also asked for the creation of
7 a funded outreach should be created so we can
8 destigmatize mental health in extend support to more
9 students so that they can receive the help they need.
10 I believe this can be done with the help and support
11 of the city Council by ensuring adequate funding for
12 mental health services, passing new deal for CUNY,
13 and we can bring about structural change for
14 educational experiences for students. Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
16 testimony. I will now call on Azania Sammie Maitland
17 to testify.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time begins now.

19 AZANIA SAMMIE MAITLAND: Good almost
20 afternoon. My name is Azania Sammie Maitland and I
21 am speaking as a student at Hunter College. Thank
22 you for inviting me to testify. Today I will be
23 speaking on the importance of mental health support
24 service on campus. We are trying times in which the
25 very fabric of our society and notions of who we are

2 as Americans and residents of New York State have
3 been stretched nearly to the breaking point. So,
4 it's no surprise that the psychological resilience of
5 many has been rendered threadbare. College students
6 inhabited a precarious mile marker on the road that
7 is life. It is a journey of judgment, obstacles, and
8 becoming. It is the process of professionalizing
9 personhood, to be sorted and sideload into the career
10 in which your actual survival and societies tied to.
11 Even in the most privileged of circumstances, it can
12 trigger an existential crisis. So, what is the
13 trajectory for students who are facing poverty, food
14 insecurity, housing insecurity, and the myriad of
15 challenges that working-class New Yorkers must
16 overcome every single day to successfully navigate
17 the road of life? Side, yet of equal consideration,
18 I implore all decision-makers and agenda setters to
19 take into account the need for culturally competent
20 mental health services. There are difficult
21 dialogues to be unpacked within discussions about
22 racism in America and if the objective is mending in
23 healing in the service of wellness healthy
24 personhood, to best navigate the road of life, then
25 asking black students should cross racial lines on

2 that journey to appease may be quite tumultuous. We
3 must share him for access to LCSWs and counselors of
4 color. NYPERG is calling for more funding for onsite
5 mental health services on campus and to decrease wait
6 times. I am also asking you to consider providing
7 the funding for creating an outreach program so we
8 can take the shame out of needing mental health
9 support and extend these support services to students
10 who may have never reached out for help before. An
11 outreach program could also enable data collection to
12 gain a qualitative understanding of the human impact
13 these expanded support services have. With the
14 commitment of the City Council to ensure adequate
15 funding for mental health services in the passage of
16 the new deal for CUNY, we can repave potholes, reduce
17 gridlock, and widen lanes that enable more people to
18 have safe and successful journeys down the road of
19 life. Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
21 testimony, Azania. I will now turn it to Chair
22 Barron for questions.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Ms.
24 Briggs. I want to thank the panelists for coming and
25 sharing their testimony with us and it seems like

2 there is a steady recurring theme which talks about
3 the long wait time and how long it takes to get an
4 appointment and when those referrals are given, they
5 are not responsive or they are not appropriate, given
6 the time, or the provider is just not willing, for
7 whatever their reason, to engage in that. And that
8 is really troubling. To Professor Salas, you have
9 heard CUNY. They have said they have come down and
10 the ratio is now-- I think it's one to 1600 odd
11 students which is approaching what the International
12 Accreditation of Counseling services required. So,
13 we should be seeing some-- We should make sure that
14 that's, in fact, happening which is why I did ask for
15 disaggregation of the numbers of counselors per
16 campus so that we can see is it equitable? Is it
17 appropriate for the number of students that any
18 particular campus has? So, we will be involved in
19 checking that and seeing that and sharing that with
20 you. And to the CUNY students, be encouraged.
21 You're on a journey that is beginning or midway of a
22 lot of other things that are going to be open to you
23 and please keep us informed of how things are going.
24 And we certainly need to look at the issue of not
25 being able to get a referral. That is an appropriate

2 response. And particularly, knowing that you have
3 tried for three months-- I think it was Azania
4 said-- over a period of three semesters, such a
5 limited response and even having her counselor on
6 site sitting there with her and validating the
7 experience that she had. So we do thank you for
8 coming and sharing your concerns and raising these
9 issues to us and we will stay in tune with getting
10 answers to those questions. Thank you. I will turn
11 it back now to the host.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair
13 Barron. Our next panel of public testimony in order
14 of speaking will be Gregory Kuhlman Brooklyn College
15 at CUNY and Lisa Nishimura from Young Invisibles.
16 Gregory Kuhlman, you may now begin your testimony.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time begins now.

18 GREGORY KUHLMAN: Hi. I am Greg Kuhlman.
19 I'm the director of what we call personal counseling
20 at Brooklyn College and I am very grateful for the
21 opportunity to speak with you today. And I am also
22 want to express my gratitude and appreciation to the
23 Vice Chancellor, to the Chancellor, to Ryan Camire
24 for all of their efforts to improve the resources for
25 mental health at CUNY and at Brooklyn College. And I

2 believe that, in spite of these efforts, that we have
3 a long way to go. And I would like to highlight a
4 couple of things for you. One is that these outside
5 referrals to communities services for students are
6 great when the student is motivated and has the
7 resources to take advantage of them. But, for most
8 CUNY students, especially the most disadvantaged
9 group, it is really not a viable option and they are
10 concerned that their family is going to see the
11 explanation of benefits from their insurance
12 provider, they don't have the co-pay, you heard about
13 the difficulties that, I think, even a relatively
14 intelligent and articulate student had making these
15 connections. And so, that is why our model what
16 Brooklyn college is we attempt to provide group
17 counseling services on an ongoing basis to every
18 student who needs them. And, so far, we have been
19 able to do that. It is a challenge educating
20 students that that is a first-class service that
21 sometimes is better than individual counseling. I
22 think I don't have that much time to highlight a lot
23 of different things, so I am just going to say that,
24 when you are looking at student to counselor
25 ratios, would urge you to pay attention to a couple

2 of things. I think it's really important to have
3 permanent full-time counselors for continuity of
4 care. If a student comes in on Monday seeking
5 services because they are suicidal, it's not a great
6 idea to have the counselor not available until the
7 following Monday or even in three days. There is a
8 role for part-time counselors, but most of the
9 counseling needs to be done by fulltime professionals
10 to provide that kind of continuity of care and,
11 especially, when you are using a lot of interns and
12 other trainees who need pretty intensive supervision.
13 There is a role for them, too, but it has to-- there
14 has to be a core of stability and professionalism.
15 Okay. I'm done.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
17 testimony. I will now call on Lisa Nishimura.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time begins now.

19 LISA NISHIMURA: Good afternoon. My name
20 is Lisa Nishimura and I am the engagement coordinator
21 at Young Invincibles. As you know, Young Invincibles
22 is a policy and advocacy nonprofit dedicated to
23 elevating young adults in the political process and
24 expanding economic opportunities for our generation.
25 We work with young adults to ensure that our voices

2 are at the table when it comes to higher education,
3 healthcare, workforce development, and civic
4 engagement. I want to thank the New York City
5 Council, Chairwoman Inez Barron, in the Committee on
6 Higher Education for the opportunity to testify at
7 today's hearing. So, today's hearing is for the
8 Committee on Higher Education and is held at a
9 crucial time for New York's college students. We
10 have seen how the COVID 19 pandemic has indoor
11 miscellany impacted college students mental health.
12 According to active minds, more than 80 percent of
13 college students reported that COVID 19 had
14 negatively affected their mental health. For CUNY
15 students, more than half reported experiencing
16 anxiety and/or depression, but have stated that they
17 needed mental health support as a result of the COVID
18 19 pandemic. However, even though half felt they
19 needed mental health support, it does not mean that
20 they actually received services or quality care given
21 limited capacity. According to a national survey
22 from Inside Higher Ed and College Post, after a year
23 into the pandemic, more than 60 percent of college
24 students nationwide reported having fair or poor
25 mental health and, out of those, about 60 percent

2 graded their campuses mental health services a C or
3 lower. This particular statistic is not surprising
4 those CUNY students have expressed similar sentiments
5 in regards to campuses mental health services such as
6 waiting time to see a counselor. Some of our
7 advocates at Young Invisibles stated there were
8 counselor waitlist with no guarantee. Some students
9 reported that they were told that they would be able
10 to see a campus counselor within three to four weeks,
11 but ended up ultimately waiting more than six months
12 with no updates on when they would be seen. To
13 highlight this issue, about 86 percent of CUNY
14 students who have anxiety, depression, or serious
15 psychological distress have not visited a campus
16 mental health center within the last 12 months,
17 according to Healthy CUNY. This could be due to
18 various factors such as inaccessibility to these
19 centers, that of being able to see a counselor or
20 even stigma. In addition, students have expressed a
21 lack of diversity of mental health professional on
22 their campus, vocalizing how they do not feel
23 represented which can affect the student's ability to
24 connect with their counselor and ultimately continue
25 seeking services. The urgency to resolve the core

2 issues of mental health services expressed by
3 students is even more critical, given this could be a
4 matter of life and death. According to Active Mind,
5 suicide is the second leading cause of death among
6 young adults. Among CUNY students, about 10 percent
7 ages 18 to 25 had serious thoughts of suicide while
8 about six percent ages 26 and older had the same
9 thoughts, according to Healthy CUNY. Giving the
10 city's commitment to public higher education system,
11 supporting CUNY must be elevated as a priority so
12 that all students who seek services receive them. I
13 am asking the city to increase investments on campus
14 mental health resources that would help increase
15 capacity such as investing in peer to peer mentoring
16 programs that would supplement services students are
17 receiving. This would be both-- I'm almost done.
18 This would both increase capacity while also giving
19 students the job. In addition, it would also help
20 build a pipeline to a more diverse pool of
21 counselors. Given the urgency of this matter, I
22 strongly urge the city to help fund hiring more
23 counselors for CUNY to meet the ever-increasing demand
24 of students seeking support. Lastly, I recommend
25 that the city support Senate Bill S844 which requires

2 CUNY and SUNY campuses to have at least a ratio of
3 one mental health professional to 1000 students. I
4 urge the Committee on Higher Education to consider
5 the concerns and solutions of other students and
6 student-led organizations speaking today. Thank you
7 for your time.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
9 testimony, Lisa. I will now turn it to Chair Barron
10 for any questions.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I want
12 to thank this panel for coming and sharing their
13 testimony and I'm glad to see that the CUNY
14 administration is still on the line to hear directly
15 from you what your concerns are. And, Dr. Kuhlman,
16 you talked about group counseling which is something
17 that I had thought of previously but didn't bring up
18 in this session and it would be interesting to know
19 how popular is your group counseling sessions, what's
20 the percentage of students who are in group
21 counseling as opposed to those who are in one to one
22 counseling, and what's been the response of students
23 to group counseling? I can see that there is an
24 advantage to peers sitting down and talking about
25 similar kinds of issues, but I also think there might

2 be something that has a greater need than what would
3 be talked about in a group counseling. So, how
4 popular is the group session? How many students are
5 generally there? How often do they mean and how
6 often does that compare to individual one to one?
7 Professor Kuhlman, can you answer that? Oh, okay.
8 Well, if you can find that information out and send
9 that to us, we would be glad to--

10 GREGORY KUHLMAN: I was muted.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, okay.

12 GREGORY KUHLMAN: I was not able to unmute
13 myself. The host has control of that, which is
14 appropriate. And I can say I don't have exact
15 figures for you, but maybe a quarter of students or a
16 third of students are motivated to take advantage of
17 the kind of unlimited group counseling and it is not
18 suitable for all students if they have trauma or they
19 have a high level of risk. We would want to follow
20 them individually. But having the group counseling
21 option allows us to direct our resources to, you
22 know, the higher clinical priorities and with respect
23 to group counseling, you know, it is really
24 interesting how students can watch more experience--
25 students who have more experience in counseling, the

2 less experienced students can learn from the more
3 experienced students how to use counseling, how to
4 participate in it so that they get the maximum value
5 from counseling. So, it really, in some ways, for
6 most students, it is more valuable experience than
7 individual counseling and it is kind of a
8 counterintuitive thing, but it is supported by
9 research in the field.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. And to
11 Ms. Nishimura, we thank you, again, for your comments
12 and highlighting the need for a population that
13 reflects the diversity of students should be involved
14 in and providing services. And, again, we hear about
15 the long delay in getting a response wait time, that
16 waitlist, and that seems to be a recurring theme that
17 we are hearing. So, as I said, Dr. Maybank is here
18 and she is taking notes copiously. So, I'm sure
19 that, as the program goes forward, she will include
20 that. And, Dr. Maybank, if the host couldn't meet
21 you, what is the forms of counseling that are
22 presented it if you could come in your responses to
23 says we posed earlier questions, indicate how many
24 campuses are utilizing group counseling for meeting
25 the mental health needs of students and how effective

2 counselors or the students that have indicated how
3 that is been for them? So if you could find that
4 information and share that with, we would appreciate
5 that, as well.

6 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: Most
7 definitely. And I just want to echo Dr. Kuhlman's
8 characterization. Group as a therapeutic
9 intervention matters. I've seen it work. I've seen
10 it work in so many ways for so many young people over
11 the course of my career that I definitely hope that
12 we will take a look at that. And even if you have a
13 waitlist group, it matters. Things come to a head
14 and can be addressed in that context, as well. So,
15 definitely we will look at that.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good. Okay.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh, Chair Barron,
18 apologizes. You are muted.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I just
20 wanted to pose another question to Dr. Maybank. And
21 it gets back to an earlier topic that I raised with
22 you regarding part-time and full-time. I'm not
23 familiar with all the intricacies of that, but I
24 think-- I think getting little notes here that it
25 may be that part-time counsel may work as few as five

2 hours per week. And so, as you break down that
3 information for me as to the number of part-time and
4 the number of full-time, if you would further
5 disaggregate it so that I'll know, of the part-time
6 people, how many hours or days or whatever they are
7 working. And the other question is does the ratio--
8 I don't have information about the International
9 Accrediting Counseling Services, but do they have
10 different standards for different titles or is it
11 blanket that they have one counselor per 1500
12 students which is an amazing amount.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: There is a
14 rather lengthy document that provides standards
15 associated with counseling services. And so, the
16 thing that most universities are looking for,
17 campuses are looking for, is that ratio. You know,
18 that is the thing that most people go to, so it is
19 set as a standard and they have a statement that
20 says, you know, that the advice is 1000-1500. And
21 so, it depends on the nature of the campus. It
22 depends on the setting. It depends on the market in
23 which you sit, as well. And so, they have kind of
24 set that as the overall standard, but they talk about
25 different types of clinicians in the documents that

2 they produce and in the different ways that the
3 services can be structured and may offer different
4 ways of engaging students. So, I can get you a
5 link--

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

7 VICE CHANCELLOR MAYBANK: So that you
8 can kind of explore their website.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you.
10 And I have a note that Dr. Kuhlman has raised his
11 hand. I don't know if that is before or if that's
12 from now. So, if it is for now, the host can unmute
13 you and you can pose or whatever your comment is.

14 GREGORY KUHLMAN: Hi. Thank you very much
15 for recognizing me. I would just like to urge that
16 when we look at student to counselor ratios, that we
17 be careful that we are looking at-- not at FTE
18 students, because you can't counsel a quarter of a
19 student or a half of a student. So I would like to
20 urge that we look at the ratio of counselors to
21 actual enrolled student persons, not FTE according to
22 the number of credits for which they are enrolled.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh. Interesting.
24 That makes sense. Yes. Thank you, Dr. Kuhlman. And

2 I will now turn it back to our host, Amy Briggs, to
3 take us further. Thank you to the panel.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.
5 Chair, seeing no other Council members waiting to ask
6 questions, we have now heard from everyone that has
7 signed up to testify and we appreciate your time and
8 presence. If we have inadvertently missed anyone
9 that would like to testify, please use the raise hand
10 function in zoom and I will call you in the order of
11 your hands being raised. Seeing no one else, I would
12 like to note that written testimony which shall be
13 reviewed in full by committees staff submitted to the
14 record up to 72 hours after the close of this hearing
15 by emailing it to testimony@Council.NYC.gov. Chair
16 Barron, we have concluded public testimony for this
17 hearing.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Seeing
19 that there is no further business before this body,
20 we are no adj--

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 12, 2021