

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND
FRANCHISES

----- X

September 24, 2021
Start: 10:10 a.m.
Recess: 2:12 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing (Virtual Room 2)

B E F O R E: Francisco Moya
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Carlina Rivera
Diana Ayala
Barry Grodenchik
Stephen T. Levin
Antonio Reynoso
Joseph C. Borelli
Deborah Rose

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lisa Orrantia, Land Use Counsel
Akerman LLP

Jordan Press

Shiva Ghomi, Director of Planning and Community
Development
Aufgang Architects

Nicola Iervasi
Mare Nostrum Elements

Kevin Albert
Mare Nostrum Elements

Silas Leavitt, Housing Development Coordinator
HANAC

Renzo Ramirez
32 BJ

Catherina Gioino, Head of Community Partnerships
and Advocacy
Oonee

Eric Palatnic, Land Use Counsel
Eric Palatnic PC

Sean Campbell, Treasurer
Teamsters Local 813

Will Fisher, Assistant Vice President Government
And Community Relations
New York City Economic Development Corporation

Daniel Kaplan, Senior Partner
Fairfax Collaborative Architects

Sumitha Amairaj
Economic Development Corporation (EDC)

Lauren George

John Beutler, Senior Vice President of
Development
Radson Development

Joe DeGenova, CEO
Center for Union Community Services

Gabby Guilart, Deputy Political Director
Hotel Trades Council

Stuart Beckerman, Land Use Counsel
Hirschen, Singer, Epstein LLP

Meredith Marshall, Cofounder and Managing
Partner
BRP Companies

Mary Serafy
BRP Companies

Zach Schwanbeck
BRP Companies

Shay Alster

Andy Cohen

Sean Stafford, New York City Resident

Zach Kadden, Director of Development
Madison Realty Capital

Meenakshi Srinivasan, Senior Land Use and Zoning
Advisor
Kramer Levin

Toni Finger, Environmental Counsel
Kramer Levin

Vincent Accornero, Chairman
Land Use Committee
Community Board One Staten Island

Deborah Given, New York City Resident

Helen Northmore, New York City Resident

John Kilcullen, New York City Resident

Leticia Remauro, New York City Resident

Reverend Dr. Demetrius Carolina, Pastor
First Center Baptist Church

Nikki Odlivak, President and CEO
Community Agency for Senior Citizens (CASC)

Kamillah Hanks, New York City Resident

Michael Harwood, New York City Resident

Sally Jones, Member
St. George Civic Association and
Staten Island Democratic Association

Dale Smith, Leadership Counsel
Youth Filled Impact

Elizabeth Morgan, Director of Youthful Impact
Program
Central Family Life Center

Icisis Cruz, New York City Resident

Reverend Judy Brown, Senior Pastor
Bethel Community Church

Jan Koehler, New York City Resident

David Jones, New York City Resident

Theo Dorian, President
St. George Civic Association

Richenda Kramer, New York City Resident

Benjamin Donsky, New York City Resident

Neil Barry, New York City Resident

Joseph Caccamo, New York City Resident

Stephanie Echevarrieta, Program Assistant
Youth Filled Impact

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: PC recording done.

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Backup is rolling.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and welcome
5 to today's remote New York City Council hearing on
6 the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. At this
7 time, we ask that Council members and Council staff
8 please turn on their video for verification purposes.
9 To minimize disruptions, please place all cell phones
10 and electronic devices to silent or vibrate. If you
11 have a testimony you wished to submit, you may do so
12 at testimony@Council.NYC.gov. Once again, that is
13 testimony@Council.NYC.gov. We thank you for your
14 cooperation. Mr. Chair, we are ready to begin.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Good
16 morning. I am Council member Francisco Moya, Chair
17 of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I am
18 joined remotely today by Council members Grodenchik,
19 Rose, Levin. I saw Borelli, Ayala, and I believe we
20 have the Speaker on, as well. Before we begin, I
21 know that LU number 834 on today's agenda for the
22 Windemere proposal will be laid over. Today we will
23 hold public hearings on the 62-04 Roosevelt Avenue
24 rezoning and the 48-18 Van Dam Teamsters rezoning,
25 both relating to property in Queens. The 495 11th

2 Avenue rezoning in Manhattan, the 1776 48th Street
3 rezoning, and the 270 Nordstrom Avenue rezoning, both
4 relating to property located in Brooklyn, and led to
5 52 Victory Boulevard and River North read zoning
6 proposals, both relating to property in Staten
7 Island.

8 First, we will vote on a number of items
9 heard by the subcommittee at our September 10th
10 meeting. We will vote to approve LU number 832 and
11 833 for the 2840 Knapp Street rezoning proposal
12 relating to property in Council District 48 in
13 Brooklyn. The proposal seeks a zoning map amendment
14 to change an R5 district to an R6 district and a
15 related zoning text amendment to establish a
16 mandatory inclusionary housing area utilizing option
17 one and option two.

18 We will also file pursuing a letter of
19 withdrawal in accordance with Council rule 11.6 LU
20 number 836 and 8374 the 629-639 West 142nd Street
21 rezoning proposal. On September 23rd, 2021, the
22 applicant submitted a letter of withdrawal of the
23 application.

24 We will also vote to approve with
25 modifications LU number 838 four citywide zoning text

2 amendment proposed by the Department of City Planning
3 and the MTA known as Zoning for Accessibility or ZFA.
4 The proposal would establish a systemwide easement
5 requirement requiring developers of transit adjacent
6 sites to first obtain a determination as to the need
7 for easement volumes to facilitate future station
8 access and it will also create an expanded
9 authorization framework for the transit improvement
10 floor area bonus program, expanding the area of
11 applicable a data to all R9 and R10 districts
12 citywide in applying the program to a larger radius
13 for eligible sites. Our modifications would include
14 adding the city Council to the list of recipients to
15 the MTA annual report for the easement program, would
16 clarify the resiliency measures in conjunction with
17 accessibility improvements would be among the
18 allowable types of station upgrades, and would
19 establish a maximum threshold for additional floor
20 area for sites under the proposed authorization
21 mechanism.

22 We will also vote to approve LU number
23 839 for the 10602 Rockaway Boulevard-- Rockaway
24 Beach Boulevard rezoning proposal relating to
25 property in Council member Ulrich's district in

2 Queens. The proposal seeks a zoning map amendment to
3 change an R5D C23 district to an M15 district.

4 Council member Ulrich is in support of the proposal.

5 And, finally, we will also vote to
6 approve LU numbers 840 and 841 for the 307 Kent
7 Avenue proposal relating to property in Council
8 member Levin's district in Brooklyn. The proposal
9 seeks a zoning map amendment to change an M31
10 district partially to an M15 district and partially
11 to an M14 R6A special mixed-use district as well as a
12 related zoning text amendment to establishing
13 mandatory inclusionary housing area in the special
14 mixed-use district portion of the rezoning area.
15 However, approval will facilitate a new nine story
16 primarily commercial and community facility building.
17 Council member Levin is in support of the proposal.

18 And now, I will take the opportunity to recognize any
19 of the local members who may want to say remarks
20 before our vote. Counsel, do we have any members
21 that are looking to speak before the vote?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, Council
23 member Levin has a hand raised.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Council member
25 Levin?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
3 much, Chair. I just want to quickly acknowledge the
4 long-standing work that the applicant at 307 Kent
5 Avenue put into this proposal. This was an
6 application from two partners who have long ties to
7 this piece of property going back generations. Both
8 of their parents owned the property before then. So,
9 these are-- I do believe these individuals have the
10 best interest of Williamsburg at heart and want to do
11 the right thing and this was a very manageable
12 process in terms of negotiations and the outcome that
13 we found suitable is that this will be a ground-up
14 commercial development with the increased FAR. There
15 will be a set-aside of 10 percent of the commercial
16 FAR for below-market rents at no more than 75 percent
17 of the market rate. The owners of the property now
18 have agreed to not develop, lease, or knowingly sell
19 the property to somebody to develop into self
20 storage. That we felt was the important, but also
21 the best mechanism that we had to ensure that that
22 does not become an outcome in the instance that they
23 sell the property. And then there are certain
24 sustainability measures that they have agreed to take
25 as part of the development of this parcel. So, with

2 that, I just want to encourage my colleagues to vote
3 aye and, once again, thank the applicants for their
4 working with us in good faith. Thank you, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I now call
6 for a vote to file pursuant to letter of withdrawal
7 LU 836 and 837 to remove them from our calendar, to
8 approve LU 832, 833, 839, 840, and 841. And to
9 approve with modifications I have described LU 838.
10 Counsel, please call the role.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Moya?

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I vote aye.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council member
14 Levin?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council member
17 Grodenchik?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Come back to
20 Council member Grodenchik. Council member Ayala?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council member
23 Borelli? Council member Grodenchik?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye. I'm
25 sorry about that.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Quite all right.
3 Council member Borelli? Council member Borelli? If
4 you can hear me, raise your hand. Chair, we appear
5 to be having a technical issue with Council member
6 Borelli's audio. So I think we can come back to him.
7 The vote--

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can leave it open.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: currently stands at
10 for the affirmative zero and the negative with no
11 abstentions at the moment and the vote will remain
12 open with your permission.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yep. Absolutely.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: In that case, as
15 soon as we have word that we can sort out Council
16 member Borelli, we can move to the remote meeting
17 procedures.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: All make that
20 announcement, Chair, if that is all right with you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Hey, guys.

23 Sorry.

24

25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh. Excuse me.
3 Council member Borelli, on a vote of the land use
4 items?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all. I
6 apologize.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That's okay.
8 Chair, the vote is currently five in the affirmative,
9 zero in the negative with no abstentions. We will
10 continue to leave the vote open.

11 And with that, I am Arthur Huh, counsel
12 to this subcommittee. Members of the public whereas
13 to testify for today's hearings. If you wish to
14 testify and are not already registered, we ask that
15 you please do so now by visiting the New York City
16 Council website: www.counsel.NYC.gov/landuse.

17 Members of the public may also review A live stream
18 broadcast of this meeting at the Council's website.

19 As a technical note for the benefit of the viewing
20 public, if you need an accessible version of any of
21 the presentations shown today, you may send an email
22 request to landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. When
23 called to testify, individuals a. Before the
24 subcommittee will remain muted until recognized by
25 the Chair to speak. Applicant teams will be

2 recognized as a group and called first, followed by
3 members of the public. When the Chair recognizes
4 you, your microphone will be unmuted. Please take a
5 moment to check your device and confirm that your
6 microphone is on before you begin speaking. Public
7 testimony will be limited to two minutes per witness.
8 If you have additional testimony you would like the
9 subcommittee to consider or if you have written
10 testimony you would like to submit instead of
11 appearing here before the subcommittee, you may email
12 it to landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. Please
13 indicate the LU number and or project name in the
14 subject line of your email. During the hearing,
15 Council members with questions should use the zoom
16 raise hand function. The raise hand button should
17 appear at the bottom of your participant panel.
18 Council members with questions will be announced in
19 the order as they raise their hands and Chair Moya
20 will recognize them to speak. Witnesses are
21 requested to remain in the meeting until excused by
22 the Chair as Council members may have questions.
23 Finally, there will be pauses over the course of this
24 meeting for various technical reasons and we ask that
25 you please be patient as we work through any issues.

2 Chair Moya will now continue with today's agenda
3 items.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Arthur.

5 Before we begin with our hearings, I also would like
6 to take this opportunity to wish Council member Ayala
7 very happy birthday today. I hope you have a good
8 day and what better way to spend your birthday than
9 with the Zoning and Franchising Committee. So happy
10 birthday--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yay.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Councilwoman. I will
13 now recognize the Subcommittee counsel to review
14 procedures but he just did.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You're welcome. And now
17 I open the public hearing on LU numbers 852 and 853
18 for the 6204 Roosevelt Avenue rezoning proposal
19 seeking a zoning map and zoning text amendment and
20 relating to property in Council member Van Bramer's
21 district in Queens. I will remind the viewing
22 public, for anyone wishing to testify on this item,
23 if you have not already done so, you must register
24 online and you may do that now by visiting the
25

2 Council's website. Counsel, if you could please call
3 up the first panel for this item.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
5 for this item will include Lisa Orrantia, Nicola
6 Iervasi, Shiva Ghomi, Kevin Albert, Richard Windslow,
7 Paula Duran, Jordan Press, Staci Oyago, and Silas
8 Leavitt.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Counsel, if
10 you please administer the affirmation.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please
12 raise your right hands and state your name for the
13 record.

14 LISA ORRANTIA: Lisa Orrantia.

15 JORDAN PRESS: Jordan Press.

16 NICOLA IERVASI: Nicola Iervasi.

17 KEVIN ALBERT: Kevin Albert.

18 SHIVA GHOMI: Shiva Ghomi.

19 SILAS LEAVITT: Silas Leavitt.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: All right. I'm not
21 sure I heard everybody, but, panelists, please raise
22 your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
23 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
24 testimony before this subcommittee and in answer to
25 all Council member questions?

2 LISA ORRANTIA: Yes.

3 UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, counsel.

7 When you are ready to present your slide show, please
8 say so and it will be displayed on screen by our
9 staff and slides will be advanced for you when you
10 say next. As a technical note for the benefit of the
11 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of
12 this presentation, please send an email request to
13 landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. And now, if the
14 panelists would please restate your names and
15 organizations for the record, you may begin.

16 LISA ORRANTIA: Good morning. My name
17 is Lisa Orrantia from Akerman LLP. I am land use
18 counsel on behalf of Woodside 63 Management LLC.
19 Should I begin the presentation?

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You can begin.

21 LISA ORRANTIA: Thank you. Can we start
22 with slide one, please? Good morning. Again, my
23 name is Lisa Orrantia, land use counsel from Akerman
24 LLP. Thank you for your time today. Steve Leicher
25 [sp?] from Woodside 63 Management LLC couldn't join

us here today, but we are joined by co-applicant Mare Nostrum Elements, as well as other applicant members. The proposed zoning and text amendments will allow the development of a 13 story mixed use building in Community District two in Woodside, Queens. It will include a new home for Mare Nostrum, a Woodside-based nonprofit performing arts organization and additional space for other community artists. Next slide, please. The site is located at a transit and is bounded by Roosevelt Avenue and the elevated seven line, 63rd Street and the Long Island Railroad tracks in Woodside, Queens. Next slide, please. The site is currently improved with one and two-story commercial buildings that were constructed before 1960 and there are no residential or community facility uses at the site. Next slide, please. The proposal is to change the R6 and R6 with C14 overlay district to a C44 district and designate a mandatory inclusionary housing area that will be mapped for options one and two coterminous with the rezoning area. These actions will allow a moderate increase in density at a transit hub to facilitate new development that will improve housing opportunities for the areas growing population. It will include

2 permanently affordable housing units, and it will
3 increase community facility offerings by adding
4 affordable performing arts space. Next slide,
5 please. And Shiva Ghomi from Aufgang Architects will
6 present the following slides.

7 SHIVA GHOMI: Thank you, Lisa. Good
8 morning, everyone. Thank you so much for the
9 opportunity for presenting this application today.
10 My name is Shiva Ghomi. I am the director of
11 planning and community development at Aufgang
12 Architects. As you can see, this slide and Lisa
13 mentioned to the proposed building is a 13 story I
14 building. We aim for a high quality an architectural
15 design for this development and the aim and the goal
16 was to be as respectful, as much as possible, to the
17 community's character. The proposed setbacks that we
18 can see in the renderings are, you know, the goal of
19 it is to make the building more attractive and
20 mitigate the impact of the overall size of the
21 development and also to create some sort of open
22 spaces, open balconies and terraces. The proposed
23 development is just over 210,000 square feet and it
24 will contain 516 accessory parking's that are
25 required by zoning codes and also 213 dwelling units

1 that 54 of them are going to be permanently
2 affordable. The performing arts space will take up
3 approximately 7500 square feet in the cellar area and
4 there is going to be local retail on the ground
5 floor, as well. Next slide, please. This project
6 features sustainability criteria and principles
7 that they are following. There are going to be
8 proposed green roofs and solar panels on the roof.
9 High-efficiency heating and cooling system. Low flow
10 plumbing features. Air sealing and insulation in
11 high performance windows. There is going to be
12 energy saving appliances implemented into the
13 project. We are going to be mindful of reducing off
14 gassing VOC materials to improve the quality of the
15 indoor air quality. The efficient air circulation
16 with, you know, high efficiency HVAC system is going
17 to be proposed. And as I mentioned, there is going
18 to be second floor terraces and also third floor open
19 space for the residents to have access to. Next,
20 please. The entrances for the parking area, arts
21 space, residential, and portion of the commercial and
22 retail of the ground floor are all located on 63rd
23 Street and additional commercial access and
24 entrances, as you can see on the site plan, are going
25

2 to be provided on Roosevelt Avenue. Next, please.
3 Based on the feedback that we received by the
4 community board, they increased the number of family
5 units, twos and threes, in the proposed dwelling
6 units unit count and, as you can see on this site,
7 we're going to have 41 studios, 101 one-bedroom, 60
8 two-bedrooms, and 11 three-bedroom units. Next,
9 please. Okay. I will pass it to Nicola and Kevin to
10 talk to you about the performing arts space. Thank
11 you.

12 KEVIN ALBERT: Hi, everyone. Thanks
13 for the opportunity to present this project. My name
14 is Kevin Albert and I am here with Nicola Iervasi.
15 We are co-artist directors and cofounders of Mare
16 Nostrum Elements. The entire arts node will be, as
17 it was mentioned, approximately 7500 square feet of
18 which our organization will have 2000 square feet to
19 use for rehearsals, performances, and classes and to
20 make available to alumni of our main program, the
21 Emerging Choreographer Series, and o the general
22 dance and theater public for deeply affordable,
23 hourly rentals of 10 to 15 dollars an hour. So, if
24 you see on the top left and bottom left, MNE One and
25 MNE two, those are the two studios that we are going

2 to have. The arts node will also include a 2000
3 square foot-- that's the CA Space to the right of
4 our MNE number one-- to be made available to
5 individual artists, performing artists, and small
6 entities at 10 to 15 dollars an hour from the get-go.
7 Queens Com Art, which is a newly formed nonprofit,
8 will run this space and will benefit from the vast
9 pool of dancer, teachers, choreographers, and theater
10 makers connected to our organization. The arts node
11 will also include five smaller studios to be made
12 available at deeply affordable rates to performing or
13 visual artists for shorter or long term rentals. The
14 main lobby of the arts node will be used as an art
15 gallery exhibiting the works made in the space. The
16 developer has agreed to offer us a column free space
17 with 12 foot clearance. This is very important for
18 legitimate dance. We're going to have legitimate
19 dance here in Queens. Also, the developer has agreed
20 to give us a sprung wood dance floor. This is very
21 helpful for an organization like this. Also,
22 communal restrooms. You'll see that the bottom
23 right. Restrooms. That is for all the spaces so
24 that then the artists have to dig into their own
25 studios to build restrooms. The developers also

2 agreed to a blatant sign on Roosevelt directing the
3 public to the entrance and a mural by local artists,
4 Xehan Wazehd [sp?] That is available from the train.
5 We thank Councilman Van Bramer for all of his support
6 in connecting us to this project and we have faith in
7 this development team. They had been very responsive
8 to all of our suggestions to follow through on their
9 promises to see this advancement in New York in
10 Queens thrive. And thank you, once again, for
11 allowing us this opportunity.

12 LISA ORRANTIA: Thank you, Kevin. Next
13 slide, please. The project was refined over the
14 course of several meetings with the community board
15 and we are happy to have the strong support of both
16 the community board and borough president as a result
17 of this collaboration. Some of the highlights we'd
18 like to identify for you are a signed MOU with the
19 co-applicant regarding the 7500 square feet of space
20 to be used for community arts, attractive signage on
21 the corner of Roosevelt Street, a change from MIH
22 option two, and the initial application to option
23 one, plus there is a commitment to provide additional
24 affordable units that will get us to 30 percent of
25 residential floor area reserved for households

2 earning 60 percent AMI. There is also a completed
3 agreement with 32BJ so that prevailing wage jobs with
4 benefits are available to the permanent building
5 service employees. Electric vehicle charging
6 stations and car share spaces are included in the
7 building-- will be included, as well as New York
8 City Mesh which will provide independent, fast,
9 reliable internet connection accessible to all New
10 Yorkers. Next slide, please. So, local nonprofit,
11 HANAC, will administer the affordable units and
12 handle the marketing and lease up process and the
13 owner will work with local organizations like
14 Woodside On The Move, as well as the Community Board
15 and elected officials to advertise the availability
16 of residential units. Next slide, please. Front
17 storage for 116 bicycles will be included as required
18 by the zoning resolution and, in response to the
19 community board strong interest in providing support
20 for alternatives to car travel, the owner intends to
21 partner with Oonee, which is a local company that
22 designs attractive and secure bicycle storage
23 structures for both inside and outside the building.
24 Next slide please. That concludes our presentation.
25 Thank you very much.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I just have
3 one quick question. To have a plan in place to
4 address the local hiring during construction
5 generally and how do you respond to some of the
6 Borough President's recommendations around jobs
7 specifically?

8 LISA ORRANTIA: We don't have a GC hired
9 yet. There is agreement, as I said, with 32 BJ for
10 the permanent building service employees and could
11 instruction is planned on being a mix of union and
12 nonunion labor.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Okay. That is it
14 for me and I want to invite my colleagues to ask any
15 questions. If you have any questions for the
16 applicant panel, please use the raise hand button.
17 Counsel, do we have any Council members with
18 questions?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, Council
20 member Grodenchik has a hand raised for a question.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You are up, Barry G.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
23 Chairman. I just wanted to ask a question of the
24 gentleman who presented on the arts. Is that going
25 to be permanent for the life of the building? How is

2 that insurance and into what we're talking about
3 today?

4 KEVIN ALBERT: Jordan, would you like
5 me to talk to that or would you like me to respond?

6 LISA ORRANTIA: Oh, I can-- Oh. Sorry.

7 JORDAN PRESS: I was going to suggest,
8 Kevin, if you guys just wanted to describe the length
9 of the agreement that you have at this point.

10 KEVIN ALBERT: Yeah. Right now, we
11 have been offered a 10 year lease and we are in
12 conversations to find out a way to make it in
13 perpetuity. At this present moment, we don't have
14 that agreement in place, but I do see a willingness
15 to continue talking about that. We have reached out
16 to other organizations with Steve Leischer who are
17 doing similar things or trying to do similar things
18 to try to find a way to keep it in perpetuity to
19 match, you know, the increase in building size which
20 will also be in perpetuity. But right now, we don't
21 have an agreement beyond a 10 year lease and, but,
22 like I said, we are still negotiating and working out
23 some of those details.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you very
25 much. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Council
3 member Grodenchik. Are there any other Council
4 members with questions?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
6 no other members with questions at this time.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
8 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.
9 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish
10 to testify on the 6204 Roosevelt Avenue rezoning
11 application?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair Moya.
13 We have approximately three public witnesses who
14 signed up to speak.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: From members of the
17 public here to testify, please note again that
18 witnesses will generally be called in panels. If you
19 are member of the public signed up to testify on this
20 item, please standby when you hear your name being
21 called and prepared to speak with the Chair says that
22 you may begin. And please note, again, that once all
23 panelists in your group have completed their
24 testimony, you will be removed from the meeting as a
25 group in the next group of speakers will be

2 announced. Once removed, you may continue to view
3 the live stream broadcast of this hearing the Council
4 website. And we will now hear from the first panel
5 which willing Renzo Ramirez and Catherina Gioino. In
6 my apologies for that. First speaker Renzo Ramirez.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just a quick reminder to
9 the members of the public, you will be given two
10 minutes to speak. Please do not begin until the
11 sergeant-at-arms has started the clock. Now you may
12 begin.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

14 RENZO RAMIREZ: Good morning, Chair Moya
15 and members of the subcommittee. My name is Renzo
16 Ramirez and I am a representative of 32 BJ and a
17 Queens resident. As you know, 32 BJ is the largest
18 property service union representing 85,000 properties
19 service workers across the city. We represent
20 workers who maintain, clean, and provide security
21 services and buildings like the one being discussed
22 at 6204 Roosevelt Avenue. 32 BJ supports responsible
23 developers who invest in the communities where they
24 build. I am happy to report that the developers
25 affiliated with this project have made a credible

2 commitment to creating prevailing wage building
3 service jobs at this site. Their commitment is an
4 investment in Queens by providing wages and benefits
5 that give working families opportunity for upward
6 mobility and economic security. We estimate that
7 this rezoning, which will allow the construction of
8 213 units including 64 permanently affordable units,
9 will lead to the creation of four new cleaning jobs.
10 We are in support of this project and we are
11 confident that the developers will be a responsible
12 employer and have positive presence in the community.
13 For these reasons, we respectfully urge you to
14 approve this rezoning. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Do we have
16 the next panelist ready?

17 CATHERINA GIOINO: Thank you very much for
18 inviting me--

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

20 CATHERINA GIOINO: Sorry.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No. You can start.
22 That's okay.

23 CATHERINA GIOINO: Hi, there. I'm
24 Catherina Gioino. I'm the head of community
25 partnerships and advocacy for Oonee. As a born and

2 raised Queens resident coming from a low income
3 single mom, I don't need to explain how unnecessary
4 this business partnership with me is so inclusive and
5 necessary. Oonee provides free bicycle parking to
6 everyone and it will be providing a needed and,
7 fortunately, lacking service in our city's
8 infrastructure. Oonee is a black and brown phone
9 company that will provide over 1506 care bicycle
10 parking spaces that are free, again, for all New
11 Yorkers and New Jerseyans who happen to live near a
12 location or happened to pass by. And that is just a
13 drop in the bucket given how only one in four--
14 given how one in four households in New York have had
15 their bikes stolen in the last five years. Given the
16 6204 location to both several subway stops and in LAR
17 station, having a secure bicycle parking location for
18 people living in this area, as well as commuters is a
19 major asset-- well, provide communities a major
20 asset to both Queens and the city. We are in support
21 of this project and I know that my team and I are
22 very excited to work with the group behind this
23 project. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
25 for your testimony.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was the
3 last speaker for this panel.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Do we have any
5 Council members who have any questions for this
6 panel?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
8 no members with questions for the panel.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
10 more questions for this panel, the witness panel is
11 now excused.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: All right. If
13 there any members of the public who yet wish to
14 testify on the 6204, Roosevelt Avenue rezoning
15 proposal, please press the raise hand but now. The
16 meeting will stand IDs briefly while we also check
17 for any newly registered members of the public.
18 Chair, it appears that we may have an additional
19 speaker. Okay. So we are getting that settled. Is
20 there a Peter Chu present in the meeting and seeking
21 to testify on this item, the 6204 Roosevelt Avenue
22 proposal? Peter Chu? If you can hear us, please
23 raise your hand. We're working on getting the next
24 speaker in.

25 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, just
3 finalizing. We did get word that there was possibly
4 an additional speaker, so we're still working out
5 that technical detail. Okay. Chair, my apologies.
6 I don't think we were able to resolve whether there
7 was another speaker and/or there may be technical
8 difficulties. I'll take this reminder to remind all
9 of the viewing public that anyone wishing to submit
10 written testimony may do so by sending an email to
11 landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. And with that,
12 Chair, I say no other members of the public who wish
13 to testify.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you,
15 Arthur. There being no other members of the public
16 who wish to testify on LU numbers 852 and 853 for the
17 6204 Roosevelt Avenue rezoning proposal, the public
18 hearing on these items is now closed and they are
19 laid over.

20 I now open the public hearing on LU
21 number 863 for the 48-18 Van Dam Teamsters rezoning
22 proposal which seeks a zoning map amendment and
23 relates to property in Council member Van Bramer's
24 district in Queens. I will remind the viewing public
25 for anyone wishing to testify on this item that if

2 you have not already done so, you must register
3 online and you may do that now by visiting the
4 Council's website. Counsel, if you can please call
5 the first panel for this item.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry, Chair. One
7 moment, please.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yep.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
10 for this item will include Eric Palatnic, land use
11 counsel for the applicant, and Sean Campbell on
12 behalf of the applicant. Panelists, please raise
13 your right hands and state your name for the record.

14 ERIC PALATNIC: Eric Palatnic.

15 SEAN CAMPBELL: Sean Campbell.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Do you
17 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
18 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
19 subcommittee and in answer to all Council member
20 questions?

21 SEAN CAMPBELL: Yes.

22 ERIC PALATNIC: Yeah.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you. Just
25 as a reminder, when you are ready to present your

2 slideshow, please say so and it will be displayed on
3 screen by our staff. Slides will be advanced when
4 you say next. Once again, anyone who requires an
5 accessible version of this presentation may send an
6 email request to landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov.
7 And now, if the panelists would please raise state
8 your names and organizations for the record, you may
9 begin.

10 ERIC PALATNIC: Eric Palatnic, land-use
11 attorney representing Teamsters Local 813.

12 SEAN CAMPBELL: Good morning, Sean
13 Campbell representing Local 813 4818 Van Dam Street
14 Holdings. Property holdings.

15 ERIC PALATNIC: And we ready for the
16 presentation, Chair Moya.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

18 ERIC PALATNIC: Thank you to members of
19 the Council and the committee for spending the time
20 on this and for your continued dedication to New York
21 City. My name is Eric Palatnic. It is a pleasure to
22 be before you for every rezoning for the property at
23 4818 Van Dam Street. Next slide, please. The
24 rezoning, if it were to be approved-- You can switch
25 to the next slide, if possible. In the rezoning, if

2 it were to be approved and rezone the block front
3 that you see here from an M21 district to an M15
4 district, it would facilitate the enlargement of the
5 existing two-story building that the Teamsters have
6 substantially invested in and allowed for a four-
7 story enlargement of the building to create a
8 Teamsters phase building to include local 813 as well
9 as other unions within the Long Island city community
10 that may need an office. There is a strong demand
11 for union space with record-keeping and meeting rooms
12 and ample parking, none of which already exists in
13 the Long Island city area and Sean and his
14 organization on anxious to expand the building. Next
15 slide, please. You can see the site here in more
16 detail. Next slide. You can see some imagery here
17 of the existing building that Sean and his
18 organization have redeveloped an old factory
19 warehouse building and they are currently located
20 there right now and, as I'm talking, you can just
21 click through the next four or five slides, please,
22 to give the viewing audience a chance to see what the
23 property looks like. It is this building that we
24 would ask that for stories on top of. And you can
25 click to the end of the photographs, please. This

2 should take you to page nine. This shows you page 9
3 which shows you the proposed zoning map. It is page
4 nine on the-- next slide, please. It shows you the
5 proposed rezoning which is, on the left side, the
6 existing zoning, and M21. You can stop there. Go
7 ahead of the next slide, please. That's fine. I can
8 talk. And it would rezone the site to an M15 as you
9 say on the right side. Next slide, please. This
10 imagery shows you the addition the Teamsters wish to
11 add to the building. You can see on the left side of
12 the building the garage door entrances. That would
13 be the space for off street accessory parking
14 voluntary. I say to the Teamsters when they have
15 meetings or their organization, their members need to
16 come in about and they need to do other business
17 within the building and, of course, New York City and
18 Long Island city parking is a premium. I would also
19 like to pay special attention to the park that is in
20 the left corner there that imagery. That will be a
21 pocket park that the Teamsters have signed a
22 restrictive declaration and had to create their,
23 which will be nice addition to this otherwise
24 concrete corner of Van Dam Street. Next slide,
25 please. The next few images I will just click

2 through rather quickly, but it shows you how the
3 building is proposed to layout. I will come out some
4 special attention to the conference rooms, the large
5 room, the off street parking, off street bicycle
6 parking, and ample circulation for vehicles. Next
7 slide, please. I can provide you-- actually, I
8 didn't realize you put an appendix here. I can show
9 you the remainder of the plans, if you'd like, but I
10 think it is probably best if I stop. Open it up to
11 any questions and give anybody any time to speak. I
12 would also like to call out that the community board
13 did vote to support the application, as did
14 Councilman Van Bramer indicate his support so far. I
15 will let him speak for himself. I believe he is
16 here. And also the Borough President voted in
17 support of it. We have also met with numerous local
18 community groups and Sean has a longstanding
19 relationship with LaGuardia Community College, a very
20 young intern program that he can speak to, as well,
21 as well as his commitment to arts and promoting that
22 within the building as much as he can. Thank you
23 very much for giving us the time to speak.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I know you
25 might have mentioned it before, Eric, and I'm sorry.

2 You incorporated any of the community board or the
3 Borough President recommendations onto the proposal?

4 ERIC PALATNIC: Well, the community
5 board-- most of the community board
6 recommendations-- Well, we've included a lot of the
7 community board recommendations. Let me start there.
8 There was a lot of discussion about bicycle parking
9 in off street bicycle parking. That has been
10 included within the proposal. Sean spent extensive
11 amount of times meeting with the rather strong
12 cultural arts dedication and Long Island City. And
13 it is sort of the arts above New York and Sean has
14 met with the Arts Committee of Community Board Two,
15 as well as with some other local artists and has
16 agreed-- I will let him speak to the agreement that
17 he has made. They can't promise any are space
18 officially because they are union and, as such, they
19 have a fiduciary responsibility to their members and
20 that doesn't include being an art gallery. Having
21 said that, they have a strong love of art and I will
22 let Sean explain the personal commitments they have
23 made to the community to allow our to be displayed
24 within the building and any vacant storefronts and
25 things to that affect. So, we have done our best to

2 accommodate the community's concerns. The final
3 thing I believe they has four or a like Jake vehicle
4 charging stations. We could not accommodate those on
5 the site. The engineering and the intricacies and
6 the levels of work that need to accomplish that are
7 beyond the abilities of the Teamsters right now as
8 they are under extreme duress due to COVID and
9 getting their union fund and getting the building
10 actually constructed. But everything else that was
11 asked for they fully desire to comply with.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you. So,
13 now I want to see if any of my colleagues have any
14 questions for this panel.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see no
16 members with questions for this panel.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
18 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.
19 Counsel, there any members of the public who wish to
20 testify on the 48-18 Van Dam Teamsters rezoning
21 application?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any
23 members of the public who wish to testify on the 48-
24 18 Van Dam Teamsters rezoning proposal, please press
25 the raise hand and now for the 48-18 Van Dam

2 Teamsters rezoning proposal. The meeting will very
3 briefly stand at ease while we check on members of
4 the public. Chair Moya, I see no other members of
5 the public who wish to testify on this item.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
7 other members of the public who wish to testify on LU
8 numbers 863 for the 48-18 Van Dam Teamsters rezoning
9 proposal, the public hearing is now closed and this
10 item is laid over.

11 Okay. I now want to open the public
12 hearing on LU numbers 861 and 8624 that 1776 48th
13 Street rezoning proposal requesting zoning map and
14 zoning text amendment and relating to property in
15 Council member Yeger's district in Brooklyn. Once
16 again, anyone wishing to testify on this item who has
17 not already registered online must do so now by
18 visiting the Council's website to sign up. Counsel,
19 can you please call this panel for this item?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: the applicant panel
21 for this item, Chair will include Eric Palatnic, land
22 use counsel for the applicant. Mr. Palatnic, a
23 reminder that you remained under oath.

24 ERIC PALATNIC: Thank you very much for
25 the reminder and thank you very much, again, to the

1 committee for making the time to hear with me again
2 and I am happy to report that we have been busy
3 during COVID trying to get things moving. So, thank
4 you very much for taking the time to hear it. This
5 application is another well supported application. I
6 am happy to be here with the support of the Community
7 Board, and I believe of the Councilman, as well, to
8 support a rezoning of 18th Avenue from what is R5 to
9 R6B. next slide, please. You can see the imagery--
10 Pull up the application, please. You can see on the
11 screen that's about to be shared-- next slide,
12 please. And next slide, please. The proposal is to
13 redevelop an existing building that sits at the
14 corner with this building that you are seeing right
15 here. If approved, it would allow for a three-story
16 building that would have five dwelling units. It
17 would be approximately 8000 square feet and would
18 have ground floor commercial. Next slide, please.
19 More imageries so you can see what it would look
20 like. Next slide, please. Next slide, please. You
21 can see here the block FRONT in which the property is
22 located is a commercial block FRONT, yet despite
23 being commercial block front, right now it is zoned
24 purely R5. You will notice a large school across the
25

1 street, as well as multiple dwellings across the
2 street, which is rather at this with its R5 zoning
3 right now. So the request is to make it an R6B
4 zoning district. It should also be noted that we
5 have the support of all of the neighbors around us.
6 Next slide, please. This shows you the site in
7 greater detail. It shows you and you can see right
8 here on this map how this is the only block front on
9 the entire block that doesn't have a commercial
10 overlay. It is somewhat at odds with the remainder
11 of the block. Next slide, please. The proposed
12 zoning district change is depicted here. Again, you
13 can see on the left side how this is the only block
14 front without a commercial overlay and you can see
15 that it is staunchly within an R5 district over the
16 as [inaudible 00:54:41]-- Pardon the interruption.
17 The as built conditions are larger than an R5 and
18 rather more similar to an R6B which is the request.
19 Next slide, please. This just shows you the zoning
20 change in greater detail. I would like to pause the
21 presentation here. I know you have a busy agenda. I
22 believe I have shown you a lot about we are proposing
23 and I would like to open it up from any questions or
24

2 go through any more of the applications in greater
3 detail should the committee desire.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I have no questions for
5 the applicant. Counsel, do we have any Counsel
6 members who wish to ask any questions on this item?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see no
8 members with questions for this item.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
10 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.
11 Counsel, there any members of the public who wish to
12 testify on the 48th Street rezoning application?

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any
14 members of the public who wish to testify on the 48th
15 Street rezoning proposal, please press the raise hand
16 button now. The meeting will briefly stand at ease
17 while we check for any members of the public, Chair.
18 Chair, I see no other members of the public who wish
19 to testify on this item.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. No other members
21 of the public who wish to testify on the LU number
22 861 and 8624 that 1776 48th Street rezoning proposal,
23 the public hearing is now closed and the items are
24 laid over.

2 Okay. I now open the public hearing on
3 LU numbers 854, 855, 856 for the 495 11th Avenue
4 rezoning proposal requesting zoning map and zoning
5 text amendment's and a related site section and
6 acquisition action relating to property in Speaker
7 Johnson's district in Manhattan. Once again, anyone
8 wishing to testify on this item who has not already
9 registered online must do so now by visiting the
10 Council's website. I want to take a moment right now
11 to see if we have the Speaker on or-- Okay. We are
12 going to go to the applicant first. So, counsel, if
13 you can please call the first panel for this item.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, the
15 applicant panel for this item will include Lisa
16 Orrantia, land use counsel for the applicant, Will
17 Fisher for EDC, Jonathan Butler, Joe DeGenova for the
18 developer, Dan Kaplan, Ben Abelman for the architect,
19 Sumitha Amairaj, EDC, Brooke Escorik, EDC, Hudwick
20 Secsenna, Sam Schwartz, and Lauren George,
21 representing the applicant. That's a lot of names,
22 but if you could all raise your right hands and state
23 your name for the record.

24 DANIEL KAPLAN: Daniel Kaplan.

25 WILL FISHER: Will Fisher.

2 SUNITHA AMAIRAJ: Sunitha Amairaj.

3 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible 00:59:32]

4 LAUREN GEORGE: Lauren George.

5 LISA ORRANTIA: Lisa Orrantia.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And I do see

7 Johnathan Butler. Panelists, do you affirm to tell

8 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth

9 in your testimony before this subcommittee and in

10 answer to Council member questions?

11 LISA ORRANTIA: Yes.

12 PANEL: Yes.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. When you are
15 ready to go. The slide presentation, please say so.

16 It will be displayed on the screen and slides will be
17 advanced for you by our staff when you say next.

18 Anyone who requires an accessible version of this

19 presentation may send an email request to

20 landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. Now, if the

21 panelists would please read state your name and

22 organization for the record, you may begin.

23 WILL FISHER: Good morning. We are ready

24 for the slides. Hi. Good morning, Chair Moya and

25 members of the subcommittee. I am will Fisher,

1 assistant vice president of government and community
2 relations at the New York City Economic Development
3 Corporation, EDC. Today, I am pleased to introduce
4 the 495 11th Avenue project on behalf of the entire
5 development team. This project secures much-needed
6 affordable housing in a transit and amenity rich part
7 of Manhattan, in addition to providing other valuable
8 economic development programming that will add to New
9 York City's resurgence from COVID 19. Next slide,
10 please. The applicant for this project is 495 11th
11 Avenue owner Realty LLC, a joint venture of Radson
12 Development and Kingspoint Heights together with EDC.
13 For the site selection and acquisition action, the
14 applicants are the New York City Department of
15 Citywide Administrative Services, DCAS, and the New
16 York City Police Department. The applicant
17 representative is EDC. Next slide. This project has
18 reached today's milestone as a result of advocacy by
19 Speaker Cory Johnson and Manhattan Community Board
20 Four and I would like to thank each of them on behalf
21 of the entire team for their partnership and
22 collaboration. To activate the site at the
23 community's recommendation, EDC released an RFP in
24 2015 and selecting the development team that is here
25

1 before you in 2017. Over the last six years, the
2 team has worked closely with Community Board Four to
3 make changes to the proposal in direct response to
4 their input, resulting in an overwhelming vote of
5 support earlier this year. We could not have reached
6 the stage without their hard work and want to thank
7 them once again. This proposal includes the goals
8 which you see here on the page of maximizing
9 affordable housing with cross subsidy from commercial
10 use, not using city subsidy, providing a range of
11 income levels for affordable housing, accommodating
12 the existing NYPD parking on-site, and incorporating
13 a grocery store. Our team is proud to have
14 accomplished each of these goals and, for more
15 details, I am pleased to introduce Lisa Orrantia from
16 Akerman. Lisa? And next slide.

18 LISA ORRANTIA: Thank you, Will. Good
19 morning. Lisa Orrantia from Akerman LLP, land use
20 counsel for 495 11th Avenue owner, Realty LLC. Thank
21 you to the committee for hearing this application
22 today. The site is located on 11th Avenue between
23 West 39th Street and West 40th Street in Hells
24 Kitchen, Community District Four, Manhattan. The
25 site is currently zoned M15 and it's located west of

1 the Special Hudson Yards District. Next slide,
2 please. The sites lot area is just under 25,000
3 square feet and it is surrounded by Javits Convention
4 Center structures and transportation uses. Next
5 slide, please. The site is unimproved and has been
6 used for NYPD vehicle parking since 1993. A Lincoln
7 tunnel entrance ramp is located across the street
8 from the site. West is a garage for the Javits
9 Center. North of the site is, on 40th Street, is an
10 MTA bus depot. Next slide, please. The 100 feet
11 tall Lincoln tunnel ventilation structure is located
12 to the south of the site. This portion of West 39th
13 Street is mapped, but unopened and the 30 foot wide
14 southern have of West 39th Street is reserved for
15 emergency access and maintenance. Next slide,
16 please. A proposed map and text amendment's to
17 change to a C64 district and map the site within the
18 Special Hudson Yards District will facilitate
19 development that is part of the continuous expansion
20 of the Special District as C64 districts to the east.
21 It is compatible with the area is high density
22 transit oriented business and residential character.
23 It will allow housing, office, vehicle storage, and
24 large supermarket uses which will meet the goals of
25

2 the RFP and will maximize they affordable housing
3 program by excluding police vehicle parking storage
4 floor space from floor area, producing the required
5 setback from West 39th Street and allowing a total 24
6 FAR. That area would be mapped for MIH and developed
7 under option two, however, all units will be subject
8 to income restrictions for affordability. The site
9 selection and acquisition actions will allow the
10 building to include a permanent space for police
11 vehicles to serve a new bike command center on West
12 42nd Street. Next slide, please. And John will
13 continue the presentation.

14 JOHN BEUTLER: Thank you very much,
15 Lisa, and thank you very much to the New York City
16 agencies EDC, NYPD, and DCAS for making this project
17 possible. My name is John Beutler. I am the senior
18 vice president of development for Radson Development,
19 codeveloper of this project. I would like to now go
20 over some of the programming elements that will be
21 included in this project. First, there will be a
22 14,000 square foot grocery store occupying the ground
23 floor and seller, almost 39,000 square feet of
24 replacement parking for NYPD, about 13,000 square
25 feet of office space, a 680 key hotel tower, and a

350 unit affordable housing tower. Next slide, please. In this slide, we would like to go over some of the key elements as well as the following slides of the programming. The south tower will be predominately contained by the hotel usage with the base of the building occupying hotel usage, as well, including conference rooms, guestrooms, and amenities spaces. Again, the retail space will be confined to the grocery store and cellar where a grocery store will serve the community and programs included in the program. Next slide, please. The north tower is the taller of the towers. It'll rise 57 stories and include 274 units of affordable housing available to families and individuals earning incomes between 90 percent and 165 percent of AMI, as well as 75 supportive units. There will be amenity space located on the fifth floor, including the supportive housing offices, as well as other residential amenities. The north tower will also include other amenity space related to the affordable housing and the NYPD parking will be confined within the base of the building with office space wrapping around the base to have light and air windows that will better serve connection to the community. Next slide,

1 please. This is a breakdown of the affordability and
2 unit types we plan to include. 176 units will be
3 serving incomes between 155 and 165 percent of AMI.
4 98 units will serve incomes between 90 percent and
5 110 percent of AMI with 75 units also serving
6 individuals and families of supportive housing. Of
7 these units, 114 units will be designated as MIH.
8 Again, the total affordable housing of all housing
9 within the project will be 350 units. Next slide,
10 please. So, we would like to mention that the
11 community for word was the essential partners
12 throughout this process. Earlier this year when
13 going to their vote, we received unanimous approval
14 from the community board. They were named trickle
15 part in deciding the unit mix as well as introducing
16 supportive housing into this project. As a condition
17 for the support, we would continue working with them,
18 as well as the Hells Kitchen Hudson Yards alliance, a
19 BID in designing the public plaza that will be
20 adjacent to this project. While this clause was not
21 part of the ULURP action, it remains a very important
22 part to the community and we will continue working
23 with them on the design of this plaza. Next slide,
24 please. And affordable housing that this project
25

2 will create, we want to pay mention to the economic
3 activity that will also be created by the project.
4 About 1500 construction jobs will be created and
5 almost 400 permanent jobs. We will be committed to
6 local hiring when selecting our general contractor
7 and selecting MWBE subcontractors were appropriate.
8 We have also reached agreement with Hotel Trades
9 Council and 32 BJ to serve on this project. And with
10 that, I would like to hand the next part of the
11 proposal and presentation over to Joe DeGenova for
12 the supportive housing portion of the project.

13 JOE DEGENOVA: Thank you, John. Next
14 slide, please. Good morning. My name is Joe
15 DeGenova and I am the CEO of the Center for Urban
16 Community Services. I would like to start by saying
17 thank you to Speaker Johnson and to Community Board
18 Four for insisting that supportive housing the
19 included in this project. As you can see here from
20 the list of things that we too, we have a lot of
21 experience helping people transition from being
22 homeless to being housed. We are considered one of
23 the creators of the supportive housing model. We
24 have been providing services in supportive housing
25 since the early 80s and we currently provide services

2 in over 2700 units of supportive housing. Next
3 slide, please. Our service staff will be on site.
4 This shows you what the design of the office space
5 looks like. As John said, there will be 75 units of
6 supportive housing scattered throughout the building.
7 It will provide services on site and will provide the
8 full complement of services and then some that are
9 provided in supportive housing. I'm very excited
10 about this project. As you all know, there is a real
11 need for more supportive housing. I want to thank
12 you for your time and attention this morning. I'm
13 going to turn it over to Dan Kaplan.

14 DANIEL KAPLAN: Good morning, Chair Moya
15 and Council members. Next slide. Next two slides,
16 please. Next slide. Yes. I am Dan Kaplan, senior
17 partner of Fairfax Collaborative Architects. I will
18 briefly discuss the design of this project. This is
19 an elevation of the west side of Manhattan that shows
20 the with Hudson Yards and job it's in the center and
21 our project in yellow. Two towers. The residential
22 tower is 680 feet and the hotel tower is 653 Feet.
23 Next slide. So, in crafting this project, we were
24 very cognizant about bringing light and air to the
25 residential units and came up with this idea of

1 stepping the two towers away from each other. So,
2 the residential steps from the West and the hotel
3 steps from the East. Next slide, please. In the
4 next slide, you can see how the project looks from
5 the various vantage points. On the left is from the
6 East looking West with the two towers in the hotel
7 stepping away in the residential on the right. In
8 the center is the residential tower from 11th Avenue
9 and 43rd Street looking south with its setbacks. And
10 on the right side from Hudson River Park with the
11 residential buildings stepping back in the hotel.
12 Next. We gave the residential building pride of
13 place at the corner of 40th and 11th Avenue and
14 brought the residential scale down to the street in
15 conversations with the community board with a strong
16 residential corner entrance. To the right is the
17 NYPD entrances into the left in that gray box is the
18 grocery store entrance. Next slide, please. In
19 contrast to the residential, the hotel is more
20 commercial and faces south and you can see the
21 various hotel entrances here and on the left side we
22 will get into the design of that open space that
23 Jonathan referenced previously. Next slide, please.
24 From a sustainability point of view, we all are
25

1 meeting or exceeding Leed Gold certification and a
2 number of very energy efficient and habitat related
3 goals. It is, I think, the most important thing we
4 are doing here is avoiding the all glass building and
5 creating a substantially opaque façade which could be
6 highly insulated. Next slide, please. Just on a
7 ground floor plan arrangement, on the right hand
8 side-- I will go clockwise. On 40th Street are the
9 entrances to the NYPD garages, the loading. There is
10 an office space entrance on 40th Street close to the
11 corner. As I said before on the corner of 40th and
12 11th is a residential entrance. The supermarket mid-
13 block on 11th Avenue. The three hotel entrances and
14 the hotel entrance and access to the 39th Street open
15 space that is immediately to the left and south of
16 the project. Next. On the setback roofs, there are
17 green roofs and outdoor space accessible to the
18 residential tower on the setback with river views and
19 in the middle, in the courtyard to the hotel, went
20 with a green buffer between the hotel and the
21 residential building. Next slide, please. And the
22 next slide after that. As Johnathan mentioned, the
23 public open space is very important to all. It is
24 not a part of this ULURP, but we wanted to show it to
25

2 you. It will be reviewed by DOT subsequent to the
3 ULURP. It's a 30 by 125 foot wide space. It's
4 immediately-- Well, in the 39th Street street bed
5 extension. The spaces around it are very
6 constrained. There is the vent structure to the
7 Lincoln Tunnel. There's the Lincoln Tunnel itself
8 below this space and to the left is a Javits employee
9 entrance. Nevertheless, we have endeavored to make a
10 very green space here. The other constraint I
11 neglected to mention is that everything will have to
12 be removeable and moveable, so we've created this
13 work with landscape architects of moveable chairs and
14 moveable-- and removeable planters that are of
15 substantial size. Next slide, please. So this is a
16 view from the east looking west. You can see the
17 amount of greenery that we were able to achieve with
18 these large, moveable planters and the open seating
19 that is in coordination with the BID standards all
20 accessing the hotel and the Javits employee entrance
21 to the left. And I think, with that, that is the
22 conclusion of our presentation. Next slide, please.
23 And we look forward to any questions and comments.
24 Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I have just
3 one quick question for the panel. I understand that
4 the West 39th Street pedestrian plaza improvements
5 were subject to the review by the DOT after the
6 conclusion of ULURP. How confident are you that what
7 you're proposing for this space will successfully
8 built?

9 LISA ORRANTIA: Yeah. I'll take that
10 question. That is correct. The improvements to West
11 39th Street in the city street would be subject to a
12 DOT application for revocable consent. We understand
13 that that petition is fairly straightforward and we
14 believe that the design put forward in these
15 conceptual drawings will be approved through that
16 process.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Great. Thank
18 you. Let me check with our counsel to see if there
19 is any Council members who have any questions for
20 this panel.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see no
22 members with questions for the panel.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
24 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.

2 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish
3 to testify on the 495 11th Avenue rezoning proposal?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair. We
5 have approximately two public speakers who have
6 signed up to speak. For those members of the public
7 here to testify, please note, again, that witnesses
8 will be called in panels. If you are a member of the
9 public signed up to testify on this item, please
10 stand by way and you hear your name being called and
11 prepared to speak with the Chair says that you may
12 begin. Please also note that, once all panelists in
13 your group have completed their testimony, you will
14 be removed from the meeting as a group in the next
15 group of speakers will be announced. Once removed,
16 participants may be able to view the live stream
17 broadcast of this hearing that the Council website.
18 We will now hear from the first panel which will
19 include Renzo Ramirez and Gabby Gilmart. The first
20 speaker will be Renzo Ramirez.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Renzo, hold on just one
23 second. As a reminder for members of the public, you
24 will be given to minutes to speak. Please do not

2 begin until the sergeant-at-arms has started the
3 clock. Renzo, whenever you're ready, you can begin.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

5 RENZO RAMIREZ: Good morning, Chair
6 Moya and members of the Subcommittee. I name is
7 Renzo Ramirez and I am a member of 32 BJ SEIU. As
8 you know, 32 BJ is the largest [inaudible 01:20:34]
9 union representing 85,000 properties service workers
10 across the city. We represent workers to maintain,
11 clean, and provide security services and buildings
12 like the ones being discussed at 495 11th Avenue.
13 Radson development, which was selected by the New
14 York City Economic development Corporation to develop
15 the site is seeking a rezoning in order to build two
16 towers: a 56 story commercial tower with a hotel and
17 [inaudible 1:21:03] residential tower. The rezoning
18 would allow for the construction of 275 residential
19 units. 100 percent of the residential units will be
20 affordable. It will also allow for the construction
21 of a community facility that will consist of 75
22 supportive housing units for formerly homeless
23 individuals and families. We estimate that this
24 development will create about four properties service
25 jobs. These jobs should help uplift working families

2 and give workers dignity. The developers seeking
3 this rezoning have reached out to 32 BJ and have made
4 a credible commitment to providing prevailing wage
5 jobs to the future building service workers at this
6 site. 32 BJ supports responsible developers who
7 invest in the community where they build. We know
8 that this development will continue to uphold the
9 industry standard and provide opportunities for
10 working families to thrive. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your
12 testimony.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker
14 well-being Gabby Guilmart.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

16 GABBY GUILMART: Hi. Good morning,
17 Council members. My name is Gabby. I am the deputy
18 political director for the Hotel Trades Council, the
19 union for New York City's hotel workers, and I'm here
20 today to offer our support for this project. The
21 developers behind this project have approached this
22 in a thoughtful and responsible manner by reaching
23 out early in the process to key stakeholders,
24 including the Hotel Trades Council. We are confident
25 that this project will benefit workers in New York by

2 creating hundreds of good jobs-- good and high-
3 quality hotel jobs. We would like to encourage all
4 of you to support the Slaughterhouse project for this
5 reason. Thank you for considering this proposal and
6 hearing my testimony today.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Gabby. Thank
8 you for your testimony. Counsel, do we have any
9 Council members who have questions for this panel?

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
11 no members with questions for this panel.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
13 questions for this panel, the witness panel is
14 excused. Counsel, do we have any other members of
15 the public who wish to testify?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any
17 other members of the public who wish to testify on
18 the 495 11th Avenue rezoning proposal, please press
19 the raise hand but now. The meeting, Chair, will
20 briefly stand at ease while we check for any
21 additional members of the public. Chair Moya, I see
22 no other members of the public who wish to testify in
23 the 11th Avenue rezoning proposal.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
25 other members of the public who wish to testify on LU

2 numbers 854, 855, and 856 for the 495 11th Avenue
3 rezoning proposal, the public hearing is now closed
4 and the items are laid over.

5 I now want to open the public hearing on
6 LU numbers 859, 860 for the 270 Nordstrom Avenue
7 rezoning proposal which seeks a zoning map amendment
8 and a zoning text amendment and which relates to
9 property in Council member Cornegy's district in
10 Brooklyn. I will remind the viewing public, for
11 anyone wishing to testify on this item, if you have
12 not already done so, you must register online and you
13 may do that now by visiting the Council's website.
14 Council, can you please call the first panel for this
15 item?

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, the
17 applicant panel for this item will include Stuart
18 Beckerman, land use counsel for the applicant,
19 Meredith Marshall, Mary Serafy, Andy Cohen, Zack
20 Schwanbeck, and Shay Alster.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Counsel, if you could
22 please administer the affirmation.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please
24 raise your right hand and state your name for the
25 record.

2 MARY SERAFY: Mary Serafy.

3 ZACH SCHWANBECK: Zach Schwanbeck.

4 SHAY ALSTER: Shay Alster.

5 ANDY COHEN: Andy Cohen.

6 STUART BECKERMAN: Stuart Beckerman.

7 MEREDITH MARSHALL: And Meredith
8 Marshall.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Do you
10 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
11 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
12 subcommittee and in answer to COUNCIL member
13 questions?

14 PANEL: Yes.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

16 MARY SERAFY: I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just as a
19 reminder, we are in receipt of your slideshow
20 presentation and our staff will display it on screen
21 whenever you are ready. Slides will be advanced for
22 you when you say next. Once again, anyone who
23 requires an accessible version of this presentation
24 may send an email request to

25 landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. And now, if the

2 panelists would please raise state your names and
3 organizations for the record, you may begin.

4 STUART BECKERMAN: Hi. I'm Stuart
5 Beckerman. I did from the law office of Slater and--
6 sorry. Hirschen, Singer, and Epstein. I'm a partner
7 at Hirschen, Singer, and Epstein. And the first
8 speaker will be Meredith Marshall who is cofounder
9 and managing partner of BRP companies and we'll start
10 with the first slide.

11 MEREDITH MARSHALL: Thank you. That
12 will be the next slide. Yes. Just to give a bit of
13 context, I think, will be helpful here. Again, I
14 Meredith Marshall. Good morning. Thank you for the
15 opportunity to present before the Council. I am
16 managing partner and cofounder of BRP Companies. We
17 are a fully integrated real estate investment
18 development firm based in New York City. We were
19 founded in 2003 and, after my wife kicked me out of
20 my apartment-- our business out of the apartment, we
21 had a storefront-- we had a storefront on 739 Fulton
22 Street not too far away from our developments in
23 Bedford Stuyvesant. We are a vertically integrated
24 firms. We have a development firm. We have a
25 construction outfit. We have a property management

1 group and we have an equity fund targeting transit
2 oriented workforce and affordable housing throughout
3 the five boroughs. We built about 2.5 million square
4 feet of mixed income developments and we're proud to
5 say that we are the largest MWBE development firm in
6 the state of New York, probably in the tri-state area
7 and probably one of-- top three firms in the country
8 doing like work. We are an award-winning group in
9 Bedford Stuyvesant and Central Brooklyn, including
10 East New York and Fort Greene. We own about 1300
11 units, about 85 percent service low income population
12 and very low income population and including
13 supportive housing developments. We are showing
14 developments here in Bedford Stuyvesant that we have
15 completed starting with the Garvey in 2009, 100
16 percent affordable targeting incomes between 40 and
17 60 percent. Then we moved on to the Bradford in
18 2011. Again, financed by HPD and HDC. 105 units,
19 100 percent affordable targeting incomes from 30
20 percent up to 130 percent of AMI. And then we have
21 two 80/20 projects owing to the 421A which are 20
22 percent below 80 percent of AMI and the balance
23 market rate development. The first two developments
24 were heavily subsidized by the city and includes
25

1 city-owned land. The subsequent two projects were
2 private sites, no city subsidy, but still 20 percent
3 affordable to area residents making at or below 80
4 percent of AMI. Next slide, please. What we found
5 in our developments as we build-- we are large
6 affordable developer and we have now some of the
7 largest developments in the city outside of Bedford
8 Stuyvesant like the Bronx, [inaudible 01:31:21], we
9 have the National Urban League site in Harlem. And
10 what we found was, you know, the affordable
11 development target AMI that have a strict regulatory
12 constraints and what we need in certain marks,
13 particularly Bed Stuy-- and we did this with
14 Councilman Cornegy-- is to build naturally occurring
15 affordable housing on the market rate side and then
16 target a low income population on the inclusionary
17 side and that is what we attempted to do. And, quite
18 frankly, we proposed an R8A development which would
19 give us a bowl because 7.2, about 477 units. And
20 when we went to the community board in the Borough
21 Pres., we didn't get support that we thought we would
22 get, although it was close. For the community board,
23 I think we had a 60/40 split against the R8A. We
24 went back to the drawing board. We heard the
25

1 community. We went to the Department of City
2 Planning headed by our good friend Winston Barnangle
3 [sp?] And Wayne came up with a compromise R7D R7X
4 which would generate 380 unit development targeting
5 the essential workers, healthcare workers, education
6 workers, workers that have been here for left out of
7 the affordable housing developments that we have
8 built, but can't afford, you know, market rate
9 brownstone acquisition. We have 114 units at 30
10 percent using MIH option four. We have 30-- about
11 30,000 square feet of retail of which 5000 square
12 feet would be targeted to a community use. We want
13 to work with and have targeted a minority manager--
14 a minority firm that is a manager of these
15 developments that we have worked with in the past and
16 some of our developments and what they will do is
17 they will target small users from 1000 square feet
18 your maybe 1500 feet and they would lease the units
19 at below market rates to those community residents.
20 Again, we are seeking a rezoning from R7X to R7D.
21 It will be mapped with MIH, so we have some
22 permanently affordable housing and we care support.
23 Now I will turn it over to my colleague, Mary Serafy,
24 to get into the details. Thank you so much.
25

2 MARY SERAFY: Good morning, everyone. Next
3 slide, please. On this slide, just want to represent
4 the different scenarios of zoning. The current
5 zoning is an R7A and one thing I would really like to
6 highlight on this is that the current inclusionary is
7 voluntary, so someone could potentially build this
8 site with no inclusionary and no affordability at
9 all. Original proposed R8A with a C2-4 overlay, as
10 Meredith mentioned, yielded 487 units and changing it
11 from voluntary inclusionary to mandatory inclusionary
12 with 144 units. Our revised and approved City
13 Planning district is an R7X/R7D. Also with the C2-4
14 overlay yielding 380 units and 114 of those will be
15 mandatory inclusionary. I will pass this to start
16 Beckerman right now and I will come back in a few
17 slides.

18 START BECKERMAN: Okay. Next slide,
19 please. Okay. First of all, good morning, Chair
20 Moya, and Council members. Thank you for hearing us.
21 So, this slide shows one of the rationales for this
22 proposal. You know, really does support the
23 increased density, but also the commercial overlay.
24 We have excellent access to transit. We are on the
25 corner of Nostrand and Dekalb. It's at the

1 [inaudible 01:35:41] and the G train subway station
2 is one block away and directly in front of our site
3 is the stop for the B44 select bus service which
4 provides transit to other subway lines. Both
5 Nostrand and Dekalb are major commercial corridors.
6 On the opposite side of Dekalb is a superblock with a
7 Home Depot and, on the opposite side of Nostrand, is
8 a large medical facility. And as this slide shows,
9 we are the only block front out of the six block
10 fronts around us, including ours, that does not allow
11 commercial use. You've got for the block fronts have
12 commercial overlays and the fifth is in the M15 which
13 also allows the commercial use which is, of course,
14 exemplified by the Home Depot. And, so mapping the
15 C24 will fill in the gap that currently exists and
16 zoning in regard to the commercial overlays. Next
17 slide, please. So, this aerial shows the context in
18 which our site since and, as you can see, there are
19 several buildings of comparable size nearby. on
20 our block and down the street is 13 Spencer Court
21 which is 31 Kosciuszko Street. It is 12 stories.
22 It's 135 feet tall. It was constructed prior to the
23 Bed Stuy rezoning in 2012. In less than a quarter-
24 mile always the night to development Lafayette
25

2 Gardens were buildings on Mars highest 20 stories.
3 And to the north in the lavender, I guess it is. In
4 the light purple, there is a large swath of M zoned
5 land which extends to the waterfront and the Brooklyn
6 Navy Yard and also to Dumbo and Williamsburg and that
7 encompasses the superblock to the north which has the
8 Home Depot and also PS 54. So, this commercial
9 institutional context surrounding the site actually
10 reflects this areas history as an urban renewal area.
11 The site is one of the very few large-scale sites in
12 the neighborhood available for redevelopment and it
13 represents, in our view, buffer between the
14 commercial manufacturing area to the north and the
15 residential area that surrounds us. So, on that
16 note, I will turn the microphone over to Mary Serafy.
17 Next slide, please.

18 MARY SERAFY: Thanks, Stuart. The next two
19 slides are representing massings. Again, comparing
20 our original proposed R8A and our approved R7X R7D
21 zoning. I know it is coming up soon. Next slide.
22 Great. Thank you. Thanks. We had a lot of meetings
23 with Community Board and we worked closely with City
24 Planning and listening to the concerns of mostly bulk
25 and height issues, in particular, on Kosciuszko

1 Street. Our original scheme had 14 stories along
2 Nostrand and Dekalb, the heavily transit oriented
3 streets with 12 stories on Kosciuszko which more
4 townhome row. Our revised proposal is now reducing
5 the heigh on Kosciuszko to nine stories and 13
6 stories along Dekalb and Nostrand Avenue. What is
7 also does is it lets us break up the street wall
8 which we'll see in a few minutes with the rendering.
9 I can talk more about it. We did maintain the
10 commercial. Just to understand, the commercial
11 overlay is along Dekalb Avenue 100 feet back, along
12 Nostrand Avenue 100 feet back, and there is a section
13 of Kosciuszko that has no commercial overlay. The
14 next slide, please, is a view from the Kosciuszko
15 side to just represent our careful consideration of
16 the townhome row. And then next slide. These are
17 renderings of the two scenarios. To emphasize
18 [inaudible 01:40:24] vision, you will see the base of
19 the building is somewhat of a townhome like straight
20 and faces in trying to maximize the light and air on
21 the upper floors of a combination of both contextual
22 design and making it as light as possible on the
23 floors above. This represents the commercial spaces
24 predominantly on Dekalb Avenue across from, as Stuart
25

1 mentioned, the Home Depot site and as well as on
2 Nostrand Avenue. Ted talk a little bit about the
3 project overall, you know, the project will be highly
4 miniaturized to all residents. Sustainability in
5 BRP's preview has always been very important and is
6 encouraged and, you know, we maximize the
7 sustainability for all of our properties. And I
8 think, yeah. The next slide will break out more of
9 the commercial space. The building, as mentioned by
10 Meredith, will contain 5000 square feet for local
11 tenants in the community along-- we have highlighted
12 the spaces along Dekalb as well as on the corner of
13 Kosciuszko and Nostrand Avenue. We have the big box
14 commercial user right at the corner, providing the
15 parking for zoning as required, as well as bike
16 storage is required. And we don't have the amenity
17 plan, but the amenities are both provided on the
18 lower and the highest levels so that, as mentioned,
19 all tenants have access to use from the higher floors
20 and, you know, all the amenities being provided. I
21 think, on that note, that is the end of the
22 presentation. I just want to thank you for this
23 opportunity to present to the board.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you very
3 much. Just a couple questions here. The application
4 was modified a City Planning to reduce the density
5 from the proposed R8A to a mixed R7D and R7X. Have
6 you heard any input from the Community Board or the
7 Borough President on this modification?

8 MEREDITH MARSHALL: We haven't heard
9 directly from them. We know that we had some-- we
10 didn't have support for the R8A 7.2 FAR. And, in
11 fact, when we had early conversations, the community
12 board wanted us to consider the 7D and the 7X. So,
13 we assume that we have some support. Again for the
14 R8A, we had about a 40 percent about at that
15 Community Board for the support of the 7.2 FAR.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. In this
17 application proposes using the MIH workforce option
18 at 30 percent of the floor area at an average of 115
19 AMI.

20 MEREDITH MARSHALL: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Units priced at the
22 upper end of this affordability range appeared to
23 actually be at or above current market rate prices in
24 the area. What is the rationale for this supported
25

2 workforce option here and have you considered the MIH
3 option two?

4 MEREDITH MARSHALL: We did. We had a
5 greater affordability, but it only works in this
6 instance-- this is not a public site. We have built
7 on public sites and, again, we are one of the largest
8 affordable developers in the city and it just doesn't
9 work without the greater bulk. So, there is a trade-
10 off. If we have the 7.2, we can provide greater
11 affordability. With a smaller building, we have to
12 use the option where we blend at 115 percent of AMI
13 to make that work. That being said, kind of disagree
14 with the 130 being above market. We have market rate
15 projects and buildings not too far away in the market
16 is above the 130 percent of AMI, particularly with
17 the one-bedroom units and the smaller units. The
18 market has moved in Bedford Stuyvesant.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: God A. And have you
20 made a commitment to good paying and quality jobs on
21 this site?

22 MEREDITH MARSHALL: We have a history
23 of working with 32 BJ on all of our sites that have
24 Affordable New York or 421A and, in fact, one
25 development in Councilman Salamanca's district with

2 100 percent affordable housing, we still have 32 BJ
3 as our partner on that site.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [inaudible 01:45:29]

5 MEREDITH MARSHALL: This project, we
6 will. We haven't concluded that with 32 BJ only
7 because we don't own the site. We are contract
8 vendee and if we don't get the zoning, we don't know
9 what the current developer would do. So that's the
10 only-- And, quite frankly, I spoke to Carl Bragg's
11 team about that. If this moves forward at this
12 level, we would have a deal with 32 BJ.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Development
14 includes 176 on-site parking spaces, more than
15 required by zoning at a time when many developers
16 with applications before us are seeking to waive
17 parking entirely. What is your rationale behind
18 including such a large number of parking spaces?

19 MEREDITH MARSHALL: Well, again, we
20 own-- I don't know-- seven or eight parking garages
21 and we have three in Bedford Stuyvesant. Parking is
22 at a premium now on from COVID. A lot of folks are
23 driving now and, in effect, we were fortunate enough
24 to secure a great brand for the grocery store and
25 they will have about 20,000 square feet and we will

2 need the parking. We will need transient parking
3 during the day and we believe we will need additional
4 parking for the permanent residence of the building
5 going forward. So, three years ago we were reducing
6 parking, but post COVID, we are really looking--
7 well, our entire approach to parking, quite frankly.
8 So, we think 176 attended parking spaces will be
9 adequate for the development, given our proposed
10 uses.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Okay. That's it
12 for me. Is there any other Council members that may
13 have questions for this panel?

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
15 no members with questions for this panel.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
17 further questions, the applicant panel is excused.
18 Counsel, is there any members of the public who
19 wishes to testify on the 270 Nostrand Avenue rezoning
20 application?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: For any members of
22 the public who do wish to testify on the 270 Nostrand
23 Avenue rezoning proposal, please press the raise hand
24 but now and, Chair, the meeting will briefly stand at
25 ease while we check for any additional members of the

2 public. Chair, I see no other members of the public
3 who wish to testify on this item.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: There being no other
5 members of the public who wish to testify on LU
6 numbers 859 and 860 for the 270 Nostrand Avenue
7 rezoning proposal, the public hearing is now closed
8 and the items are laid over.

9 I now open the public hearing on LU
10 number 857 and 858 for the 252 Victory Boulevard
11 rezoning proposal which seeks a zoning map amendment
12 and a zoning text amendment and which relates to
13 property in Council member Rose's district in Staten
14 Island. Once again, for anyone watching online who
15 wishes to testify on this item, if you have not
16 already done so, you must register online and you may
17 do that now by visiting the Council's website.
18 Counsel, would you-- Oh, I'm sorry. I would like to
19 acknowledge that we have our Council member, Council
20 member Rose here with us today and thank you, Council
21 member Rose for your patience today. I would like to
22 turn it over to you for some remarks.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much,
24 Chair Moya. And I want to say happy birthday to
25 Council member Ayala. I just have very limited

2 remarks about like victory Boulevard project I just
3 want to say that, after working closely with the
4 applicant team for the 252 Victory Boulevard
5 rezoning, they have incorporated several of my
6 suggestions to make this project and asset to our
7 community. It was an example of what working
8 collaboratively at its best. It really was an
9 example of how these projects can move along and wind
10 up with a project that everyone is satisfied with.
11 So, I look forward to hearing from the applicant team
12 and any members of the public who wish to testify
13 today. Thank you, Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And I have remarks
16 on North River, but I will wait until let's called.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you,
18 Council member. Counsel, if you can please call up
19 the first panel for this item.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
21 for this item includes Eric Palatnic, land use
22 counsel for the applicant, and Alex Harrow, project
23 architect.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Counsel, if you could
25 please administer the affirmation.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please
3 raise your right hands and state your name for the
4 record.

5 ALEX HARROW: Alex Harrow.

6 ERIC PALATNIC: Eric Palatnic.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to
8 tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the
9 truth in your testimony before this subcommittee and
10 in answer to COUNCIL member questions?

11 ALEX HARROW: I do.

12 ERIC PALATNIC: Yes. I do.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: and just as a reminder,
14 when you are ready to go through your slideshow,
15 please say so and it will be displayed on screen by
16 our staff. Once again, anyone who requires an
17 accessible version of this presentation may send an
18 email request to landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov.
19 And now, if the panelists would please restate your
20 names and organizations for the record, you may
21 begin.

22 ERIC PALATNIC: Hello. My name is Eric
23 Palatnic. I'm an attorney representing the owner of
24 252 Victory Boulevard. Thank you sharing. Alex will
25 introduce himself after. I'll commence with the

1 application. As you can see, this is the proposed
2 building in front of you. It's a handsomely design
3 building that, as the Councilwoman just said, has
4 been very, very much a collaborative effort between
5 US, the Community Board, and the borough president's
6 office. It has resulted in a proposed rezoning of
7 the property from an R32 to an R6B with the
8 commercial overlay. Next slide, please. If the
9 rezoning were to be approved, as the next slide will
10 be describing, it would allow for five-story building
11 that would have approximately 34 dwelling units, 12
12 of which would be affordable at an average of 60
13 percent AMI. Next slide, please. The next slide
14 will show you the location of the property, which is
15 located on Victory Boulevard. Next slide, please. I
16 apologize. Location of the property is located on
17 Victory Boulevard. You can see diagonally across the
18 street is a large structure. That is that as the
19 Jersey Street garage. Some of you may have become
20 familiar with that. It is the subject right now, I
21 believe, of an RFP to redevelop that for residential.
22 The site is vacant and rests within a hillside
23 preservation district. The proposed action is asking
24 to build within the hillside preservation district
25

2 and it will alleviate 30 percent slope point which is
3 allowable and satisfactory within the district. Next
4 slide, please. The next few pictures are going to
5 show you what the property actually looks like. As
6 you will see in the pictures that are about to be
7 displayed, and is nothing dramatic other than a
8 hillside. Please show the next few slides. Next
9 slide. And you can just keep clicking through the
10 pictures so that people can get a flavor for what it
11 looks like. As I said a moment ago, it is a
12 hillside. The building-- you can stop when you get
13 out of the pictures, please. The building will be
14 built into the hillside so that the people from the
15 top that live above it will not be obstructed in
16 their views. Next slide, please. This slide shows
17 the proposed zoning district on the right. On the
18 left is what exists right now. In the middle of the
19 page, although it's a very busy page, you can see the
20 extension of the commercial overlay and it will be an
21 R6B district. And next slide, please. This shows
22 you further the continuation. Now, if you can click
23 to the plans, plans. And I will let Alex Harrow
24 describe the plans. So, Alex?

2 ALEX HARROW: Good afternoon. I'm Alex
3 Harrow, Aspire Collaborative Architects. Can we go
4 to the next slide, please? Eric, we're not in the
5 plans, yet. Do you want to cover any of this?

6 ERIC PALATNIC: Go to the next few
7 slides, please so he gets to the plans.

8 ALEX HARROW: Next. Next slide. Keep
9 going. Next. One more.

10 ERIC PALATNIC: There you go.

11 ALEX HARROW: So, this is just starting to
12 show it. This is just a diagrammatic rendering here,
13 but it shows on the left hand side we are in the
14 hillside-- Special Hillside Preservation District
15 and we are on a pretty steep slope. Part of our area
16 does have steep slope and you can see on the lower
17 left hand corner, if you look at the site map on the
18 left hand side, the lower left hand corner is 128
19 feet, upper right corner is 200 feet. So we are
20 close to 72-- actually, it's almost at 75 foot
21 incline from one corner of the side to the other.
22 Next. Next slide, please. There we go. Okay. This
23 is a rendering showing what the project is proposed
24 to look like at the moment. We have a number of
25 things in here that are unique to this design. The

2 first one is you can see it's a five story-- it's a
3 six story building. Five stories plus a lower level
4 of parking which is on the lower level and sort of in
5 the middle to the left hand side of the drawing. You
6 can see a car down there. That's the lowest level.
7 That is one level completely filled with parking.
8 Because we are on such a steep portion of Victory
9 Boulevard and you can see as you go up the slope a
10 little bit up the sidewalk, you'll see another car
11 entering the property. At the next level, we have
12 another parking area within the building, as well.
13 You can also see here we are a few stories-- we are
14 actually-- it's really technically only two stories
15 at the front, which is the lower portion of the
16 rendering and then we have three more residential
17 floors that step back as the site actually steps
18 back. We are trying to incorporate a lot of green
19 space on the roof of the building and green roof
20 within the building terraces, as well. We are also
21 breaking up the façade. It doesn't quite show it as
22 clearly here, but we are trying to break up the
23 façade so that it doesn't appear as monolithic as he
24 move up the street. Next slide, please. This is
25 just a view of the entry of the building showing that

2 we will also have a daycare in a small commercial
3 component. Next slide, please okay. We want to show
4 a couple of things. Number one, cellar level. We
5 have parking, we have 31 parking spaces down in the
6 cellar, 28 at the upper level over there which will
7 be at the same level as the daycare, commercial area,
8 and residential lobby. Residential lobby is shown in
9 yellow which will be able to enter the building and
10 they can go IN a covered area back to the front were
11 they will not have to be exposed to the weather.

12 Next slide, please. Okay. This one shows the
13 daycare. Daycare is 7500 square feet. We also have
14 dedicated some parking for daycare to come in. This
15 is an important point. Daycare is accessed from the
16 sidewalk as well as a separate entrance to the
17 daycare from within the parking, from the upper
18 parking garage which you can see on the lower left-
19 hand corner. The attitude or the blue dots show
20 where the entry is accessible for the daycare. Next
21 slide, please. Next slide. This shows the
22 commercial component which would enter solely from
23 the sidewalk area. Next slide, please. And then we
24 drove showing floor and with a number of units that
25 you can see. We have 46 total residential units, 12

2 of them are affordable. Next slide, please. Next.

3 One more, please. Is this our last slide? Got it.

4 Here we go. And then, on the right hand side of the

5 roof shows the setbacks. Because it is such a steep

6 slope, as I mentioned before, we were very conscious

7 of trying to not build something that is going to

8 have two larger presence from the sidewalk as you are

9 walking or driving. We wanted something that was

10 going to work with in the slope. In addition to

11 working with slope, we have a height limitation on

12 the property. We have pulled the building farther

13 forward which also allows us to keep the top of the

14 building below the site level from the single-family

15 houses that are above us on Avon and Rose, the

16 streets that are behind the building which are not

17 even seen from this. So, their views out their

18 windows will not be obstructed by our buildings, and

19 important point that we were trying to maintain.

20 Plus, you can see appear that were trying to

21 incorporate solar panels, as well as green roof,

22 recreation area for the residents. We have a lot of

23 tears space of which we plan to build some of this

24 out as green roof and planted, as well. Next slide.

25 Then, the only other things that we have-- these are

2 some of the points that I made earlier. Building is
3 located closer to Victory Boulevard precisely for the
4 reason to keep visibility open for the residents who
5 are above us. We are going to facet the façade,
6 setback the green roofs. Other than that, the only
7 other things I can tell you is we have stormwater
8 retention, we will be utilizing energy Star
9 appliances, high-efficiency and high efficacy LED
10 lighting, insulating glass, higher levels of
11 insulation. The 2020 energy code is actually quite--
12 it's actually really terrific and really strong. So,
13 this will be incorporated to every aspect of the
14 building. Next slide, please. Eric, I think this is
15 back to you.

16 ERIC PALATNIC: Yeah. This is a good
17 time to conclude. This just provides the
18 affordability paradigm that we spoke about earlier
19 where we are at 26 percent of the floor area will be
20 provided as MIH option level two and add a level of
21 60 percent. Excuse me. Option one.

22 ALEX HARROW: Excuse me. Can I make one
23 last comment?

24 ERIC PALATNIC: Okay, Alex.
25

2 ALEX HARROW: Okay. I apologize. I just
3 need to correct what I said. The streets just to top
4 of us are Rosewood and Bathier [sp?]. Apologies.

5 ERIC PALATNIC: Thank you, Alex.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Well, you
7 answered my question just now, Eric. So, I have no
8 further questions. I want to turn it over to Council
9 member Rose if she has any questions or any of my
10 other colleagues.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, again,
12 Chair. I don't have any questions and I don't have
13 any questions because, like I stated, we worked very
14 closely with the team and they incorporated all of
15 the aspects that we felt were important to making
16 this project not only a good green project, but one
17 that would be an asset to the community and one that
18 would meet a community need by providing take care
19 spaces for daycare. And the public amenities.
20 Parking was a very important issue and they provided
21 off the street parking. So, basically, they did
22 everything that we requested and so I am in support
23 of this project.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you,
25 Council member Rose. The applicant panel is excused.

2 Counsel, I there any members of the public that wish
3 to testify on the 252 Victory Boulevard rezoning
4 application?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any
6 members of the public who wish to testify on the 252
7 Victory Boulevard rezoning proposal, please press the
8 raise hand button now. Chair, the meeting will
9 briefly stand at ease while we just confirm there are
10 no additional members. Chair, does appear that we--
11 I believe we have one speaker for this item. The
12 speaker panel will include one speaker, Shawn
13 Strafford. Shawn Stafford will be testifying on
14 this item.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Shawn Stradford,
17 whenever you're ready.

18 SHAWN STRADFORD: I think this is supposed
19 to be for the--

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Which item are you
21 testifying for, Shawn?

22 SHAWN STRADFORD: North River.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Not yet.

24 SHAWN STRADFORD: Okay.

25 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [inaudible 02:05:14]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: You're early.

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: All right, Shawn. Thank
4 you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And with that,
6 Chair, I see no other members of the public who wish
7 to testify on this item.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
9 members of the public who wish to testify on LU
10 numbers 857, 8584 the 252 Victory Boulevard rezoning
11 proposal, the public hearing is now closed and the
12 items are laid over.

13 I now open the public hearing on LU
14 numbers 842, 843, 844 for the River North rezoning
15 proposal which seeks a zoning map amendment, a zoning
16 text amendment, and zoning special permit all of
17 which are related to property in Council member
18 Rose's district in Staten Island and, as a reminder--
19 And I will remind the viewing public, for anyone
20 wishing to testify on this item, if you have not
21 already done so, you must register online and you may
22 do that now by visiting the Council's website. I no
23 one to recognize Council member Rose for some opening
24 remarks.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, again,
3 Chair Moya. Today, again, we have an application
4 before us that has been rejected by local community.
5 The residents are concerned that the proposed density
6 is unprecedented and will be used by future
7 applications for city agencies to approve similar
8 density across the north shore. So sorry. Someone
9 is ringing my doorbell.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: That's okay, Council
11 member Barron will give you time. Don't worry. It's
12 fine.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Should I go answer
14 it? I'll let them wait. So, I look really-- So,
15 this proposed density is unprecedented and will be
16 used by future applicants or city agencies to approve
17 similar density across the North Shore. So we are
18 looking forward to the applicant's response to this
19 concern. I'll also share my constituent's concerns
20 about the height of the proposed buildings. My
21 previous remarks that were submitted to the
22 Department of City Planning reflect as much. I
23 cannot support this application with the proposed
24 allowable building heights. I certainly have
25 concerns about the proposed affordability on this

2 site also. The additional density requested for this
3 site calls for additional affordable housing above
4 and beyond the requirements of MIH. I cannot support
5 this proposal with the current level of affordability
6 on this site. I look forward to hearing what kind of
7 commercial uses will be provided on site. The St.
8 George community would benefit from the inclusion of
9 a grocery store and community-oriented uses such as
10 daycare programming. I cannot support this project
11 without additional community benefits for our local
12 residents. I look forward to hearing more from the
13 applicant and the feedback from the community and I
14 thank you again, Chair Moya.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Council
16 member Rose for your opening statement. With that,
17 Counsel, if you can please call up the first panel
18 for this item.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
20 for this item will include Zach Kadden on behalf of
21 the developer, Meenakshi Srinivasan, land use and
22 zoning advisor, Dan Kaplan, Ben Abelman, project
23 architects, and Tony Finger, land use counsel for the
24 applicant.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, counsel. If
3 you can please administer the affirmation.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, if you
5 can please raise your right hands and state your name
6 for the record.

7 DAN KAPLAN: Dan Kaplan.

8 BEN ABELMAN: Ben Abelman.

9 ZACH KADDEN: Zach Kadden.

10 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Meenakshi
11 Srinivasan.

12 TONI FINGER: Toni Finger.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Do you
14 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
15 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
16 subcommittee and in answer to all Council member
17 questions?

18 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Yes.

19 TONI FINGER: I do.

20 DAN KAPLAN: Yes.

21 BEN ABELMAN: Yes.

22 ZACH KADDEN: I do.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you. As a
25 reminder, we have your slideshow presentation and

2 whenever you are ready to go through it, please say
3 so and our staff will display it on the screen. Once
4 again, anyone who requires an accessible version of
5 this presentation may send an email request to
6 landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov. And now, if the
7 panelists would please restate your names and
8 organizations for the record, you may begin with the
9 presentation.

10 ZACH KADDEN: Zach Kadden, Madison Realty
11 Capital. Are we ready to start?

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yep.

13 ZACH KADDEN: Perfect. Good afternoon,
14 Chair Moya, subcommittee. I am Zach Kadden, director
15 of development at Madison Realty Capital is the
16 applicant for the River North proposal. We are very
17 excited to present the River North project to you
18 today. Next slide, please. To orient everyone, here
19 is a quick aerial view of the St. George area. You
20 can see the project site highlighted OR outlined in
21 orange as well as its proximity to Staten Island's
22 public transportation: the Staten Island Ferry, New
23 York City Ferry, the railway, and local bus stops.
24 The River North project will complement and enhance
25 ongoing land use projects and activities that have

supported and strengthened the North Shore community of Staten Island. Next slide, please. Madison is committed to seeing this project through to completion and, over the last several years, has assembled and engaged a stellar team including FX Collaborative, the architects, Star Whitehouse, landscape architects, and Langan, the environmental consultants, to make this project happen. Next slide, please. Madison has an excellent inconsistent record in developing mixed-use residential buildings with affordable housing, as well as economic development projects in many parts of the city. Our professionalism to oversee and advance projects through a robust public process and to construct complete in contribute to neighborhoods is a testament to our vision and commitment to implement River North that world delivers substantial benefits to the community. You can see here in the top produce a project in Woodside where we actually broke ground in in February. We finished the foundation and we are excited to bring a public school-- a K-5 476 student public school, as well as 478 affordable units to Woodside Queens. Next slide, please. Another slide switch. Madison is also no stranger to

1 Staten Island where we have completed several
2 projects in the North Shore, including downtown
3 Plaza, a.k.a. 364 Bay Street on the left which had
4 completed construction and leased up. So, Crunch
5 Fitness is attendant there, which many of you may
6 know, as well as The View, 224 Richmond Terrace,
7 which is the center image which is only a few lots
8 over from our site. We finished the construction
9 there, leased, and sold it which is, those are said,
10 adjacent to River North. And on the right and side,
11 this is very important. This is an image which is
12 just an example of Madison. We invest and we
13 believed to be boots on the ground in the communities
14 we develop in. So, during COVID, we knew that
15 Richmond University Medical Center was hit
16 particularly hard by the pandemic. We partnered with
17 the frontline food trucks which is that image in the
18 background just to give essential workers free food,
19 coffee, and put a smile on their face during the
20 heights of the pandemic. Next slide, please. River
21 North will be a transit oriented mixed-use
22 development which will include three residential
23 buildings with 750 units of which 225 will be set
24 aside under MIH option two. The ground floor will be
25

1 activated by local retail and hopefully community-
2 oriented retail as the Council member mentioned
3 earlier, and created in enhanced pedestrian
4 environment with street trees that will improve
5 connectivity. There will be new public open spaces
6 on-site, passive and active, as well as new parking
7 capacity. Also, we have an agreement already for 32
8 BJ for building services and we are working closely
9 with Building Skills and Youth Build Impact to
10 provide local opportunities for members in the
11 community. Next slide, please. Here's a quick
12 overview. We actually engage Carp Strategies, an
13 urban planning consultant to analyze the economic
14 impact during the construction and operating phase of
15 the project. So, quickly, to run through the
16 bullets, you will see, under construction phase, we
17 assume about 590 jobs per year with 100 A.D. jobs at
18 peak employment, produce over 450 million in economic
19 output that will circulate throughout the Staten
20 Island economy, result in over 22 million--
21 estimated in 2024 total tax revenue, including city
22 and state taxes. That is during construction.
23 Moving on to once the buildings are completed and put
24 into operation, total annual economic output in the
25

1 first year of operation is 52.8 million. 4.8 million
2 in total tax revenue in the first year of operation
3 and then also 48 permanent jobs but there could be as
4 many as 200 new communitywide jobs as a result of
5 this project. Next slide, please. Bringing new
6 affordable housing to this neighborhood is one of our
7 primary goals. We are proposing 30 percent of the
8 floor area, or option two under MIH, which would, we
9 figure, would be approximately 225 unit, would cover
10 three income bands and here you see the breakdown of
11 what we are proposing between the 60 percent AMI
12 band,, the 80 percent AMI band, and the 110 percent
13 AMI band. And also, you can see that we have
14 weighted the distribution to the slightly lower end
15 which is about the 60 percent AMI trench. Next
16 slide, please. Just to give you an idea of how the
17 AMI translate to family types, we thought it would be
18 helpful to have this visual. For example, a
19 household of four with single income healthcare
20 worker earning 45 to 50,000 dollars would qualify
21 around 40 percent AMI, or dual income family of four
22 earning together A.D. thousand would be 60 percent of
23 AMI. A single MTA worker earning 65,000 would be a
24 80 percent of AMI in total income employees officer
25

2 in teacher with the child earning about 100,000 would
3 be at 100 percent AMI. With that, will turn over the
4 presentation to Ben Abelman and Dan Kaplan at FX
5 Collaborative, the architects for the project. Thank
6 you.

7 BEN ABELMAN: Next slide, please. And good
8 afternoon now to the Council members and thank you
9 for giving us the opportunity to present this
10 project. As that mentions, the site is located
11 adjacent to the civic infrastructure of downtown St.
12 George and is within a 10 minute walking radius of
13 the St. George ferry terminal and the largest transit
14 in Staten Island. What is important in this image is
15 the two overlaid colors that you see. The pink color
16 to the right of the image is the Special St. George
17 district. In the green color is the Special Hillside
18 Preservation district which the site is currently
19 zoned. As you can see, the site sits at the abutment
20 of these two special districts and is, in fact, at
21 the base of the hill fronting onto Richmond Terrace
22 and Stuyvesant Place, two vital corridors of the St.
23 George area. Next slide, please. Hillside's
24 preservation district is mapped throughout Staten
25 Island largely within low density single family

1 residential zoning districts. The R6 district, which
2 the River North project sits, mapped within the
3 Special Hillside Preservation district, is an anomaly
4 within this district. And the controls crafted
5 within the special district are very responsive to
6 the conditions to which you see on the screen here.
7 Next slide, please. And less the conditions that you
8 see on our site. This image show the adjacencies of
9 the two special districts. Again, green is the
10 Hillside Preservation district. Purple is the
11 Special St. George district. And we can see that the
12 site sits at the low end of the hillside fronting on
13 Stuyvesant Place and Richmond Terrace on a block
14 which its natural topography has already been
15 compromised by the existing presence of the Castleton
16 Park apartment complex in its parking structure which
17 is built onto the site. Next slide, please. As of
18 right development would be governed by the Special
19 Hillside Preservation district in the R6 district
20 that the site is currently mapped. The Hillside
21 Preservation district limits the location of building
22 footprints to locations which are not in steep slope
23 areas. As you can see on site B with the saturated
24 blue color, that is the only feasible building
25

2 footprint site on the two lots that make up the River
3 North property today and, in the end, the site, if to
4 be developed as of right would only be able to
5 achieve less than 50 percent of its entitled floor
6 area because of the limitations of the underlying
7 zoning. Next, please. Next slide. Thank you. And
8 so-- No. Back one. Sorry. Our approach to the
9 project is to merge the ideals embedded within these
10 two special districts. From the Hillside
11 Preservation district, our intent is to leave as much
12 of the site unbuilt as possible, preserving 50
13 percent of open space on the site. In terms of the
14 St. George district, we have looked to its bulk
15 language where it requires street walls and building
16 bases with active ground floor uses with building
17 forms and towers above which are perpendicular to the
18 waterfront to provide view corridors through the
19 site. So, now, Dan Kaplan will walk you through the
20 strategies and discuss how this plays out in the
21 design.

22 DAN KAPLAN: Next slide, please. Dan
23 Kaplan, senior partner. FX Collaborative. So, from
24 a site planning principles and open space, really two
25 headlines. Number one is, instead of a continuous

1 wall of buildings, we have subdivided the site into
2 three buildings which also provides three open
3 spaces, three bands of greenery that we call green
4 fingers that come down from the hillside onto
5 Richmond Terrace. Second is that those green
6 corridors provide habitat preservation, stormwater
7 retention which recent events have made even more
8 critical, and, basically, allows for open space and
9 view corridors, which is the second principle. By
10 setting the building on your right significantly
11 lower and creating gaps between the two buildings--
12 the three buildings, we've allowed views from the
13 upland, including the Castleton Park apartment
14 buildings to the rear of your screen and, on your
15 left, Hamilton Avenue-- and I'll show you that in a
16 moment. Next slide, please, which is a plan of the
17 site plan showing the three buildings and, basically,
18 the three open spaces. In conversations with the
19 Council member, we have included two publicly
20 accessible open spaces-- one a passive open space at
21 the corner of Hamilton Avenue and Stuyvesant Place
22 and another one between building two and building
23 three which is active open space. Next slide,
24 please. This shows an image of the new passive open
25

2 space at the corner of Hamilton Avenue and Stuyvesant
3 Place and actually is an endcap to Stuyvesant Place
4 in St. George. It is well appointed with green
5 spaces, with seating, and paving. It is nestled by
6 the building and then wraps up Hamilton Avenue and
7 also you can see here the effect of setting back the
8 buildings from Hamilton Avenue, allowing for the
9 upland uphill single family houses to have an
10 uninterrupted view down the hill. Next slide,
11 please. This shows the proposed active open space
12 that's off Stuyvesant Place with a gracious opening
13 to the sidewalk-- to the reconstructed sidewalk, I
14 should say, two new, in purple, equipment areas, a
15 recreational lawn in the center, and seating at the
16 end of the page. Next slide. Architecturally and
17 massing wise, we've created strong contextual basis
18 with active uses, screen parking, and strong texture
19 and architecture. For the upper building massing,
20 it's well tailored with multiple step backs and set
21 backs pulling away from the surrounding context.
22 Next slide, please. Over the evolution of the
23 project and working in dialog with various
24 stakeholders, we have significantly modified that
25 massing and reduced the height. Most significantly,

2 the building to the right, which was building three
3 which was reduced eight stories to open up views from
4 the Castleton Park apartment house. In addition, the
5 two build-- the two taller buildings were reduced by
6 approximately 30 feet. Next slide, please.

7 Architecturally, we have sought to anchor the
8 building into the St. George context by looking
9 carefully at the architecture and material pallet and
10 avoided the all glass paradigm that you see in a lot
11 of new buildings. Next slide, please. Here is a
12 view that shows those bases and the architectural
13 treatment. This is looking down Stuyvesant Place
14 showing the two new buildings and the green spaces
15 coming through. Next slide, please. Go ahead. This
16 aerial shows how the three buildings step. They are
17 a family together and working together. They do not
18 all match, but they share the same DNA with the lower
19 building in the foreground opening up views from
20 Castleton Park apartments. Next slide, please. And,
21 finally, the skyline view between the careful
22 massing. The selections and materials, the opening
23 up of the buildings and subdividing them into three
24 parts and the green fingers coming down from the
25 hillside. We have created an ensemble of buildings

2 that compliments the skyline of St. George. And,
3 with that, I'll turn it over to Meenakshi who will
4 discuss the zoning actions. Thank you.

5 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Thank you. Next
6 slide, please. Good afternoon, Chair Moya, Council
7 member Rose, and member of the zoning subcommittee.
8 I am Meenakshi Srinivasan, senior land use and zoning
9 advisor at Kramer Levin representing the applicant.
10 And I really appreciate the opportunity to present
11 today. The project requires three zoning options.
12 The first is a zoning map amendment to change the R6
13 C2-2 overlay district which is a medium density
14 district within the Special Hillside Preservation
15 district that is now currently along Richmond Terrace
16 and Stuyvesant Place to an R7-3 C2-4 district
17 overlay. This is also a medium density district
18 within the special St. George district. The second
19 action is a zoning text amendment to the Special St.
20 George district to incorporate the R7-3 zoning which
21 is, basically, the parallel of the underlying R7-3
22 regulations. The text amendment would also create a
23 new special permit to make bulk regulations in order
24 to support a superior site plan and open design.
25 And, finally, the text amendment would also extend

1 the mandatory inclusionary housing designation to the
2 rezoning area. The third action is a special permit
3 pursuant to the proposed text to waive bulk
4 regulations to allow the proposed project and the
5 carefully crafted environmental protection design.
6 The next slide, please. So, just to recap, the River
7 North project in the zoning package are based on
8 sound planning principles and will harness time-
9 tested tools to achieve quality development to Staten
10 Island's North Shore. Revamping the site of special
11 Hillside Preservation District, response to an
12 existing, alternate degraded condition and the sites
13 match the topography and the isolation from the
14 remainder of the Hillside district. Mapping it
15 within St. George reflects St. George's evolution
16 into an urban center over the past several decades
17 and the city's plans for the waterfront across
18 Richmond Terrace. Mapping the site into an R7-3
19 district provides the additional FAR that can be used
20 to address that area needs. The infusion of
21 approximately 225 units of affordable housing will
22 improve housing opportunities in the community and a
23 significant [inaudible 02:29:56]. The additional
24 public open space [inaudible 02:30:07] outdoor

2 resources available to those who live around the
3 neighborhood and the additional density brings
4 important secondary effects. It provides critical
5 mass of population to support a wider range of retail
6 and commercial offerings and it advances the city's
7 signature land use policy of promoting higher density
8 in transit rich areas. Finally, the special permit
9 waivers allow [inaudible 02:30:26] controls to be
10 tailored to this unique site in order to provide the
11 best possible site plan and building form. Height
12 and setback waivers will allow public open space
13 [inaudible 02:30:36]. It will facilitate the
14 preservation of green space on the site areas, has
15 visual amenities, and [inaudible 02:30:43] site, and
16 the special permit would allow the project inspired
17 skyline more texture and distinctive design. And
18 with that, we are happy to answer any questions and,
19 of course, thank you again for allowing us to testify
20 here today. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just a
22 couple questions before I turn it over to Council
23 member Rose for her questions. And I am not sure if
24 I missed this, but are you in full control of all the
25 parcels within the special permit boundaries?

2 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: We are not. So, we
3 have control of our parcels in the other parcels are,
4 you know, no different private ownership.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm sorry. Could you
6 repeat that? I heard you say you not, but I couldn't
7 hear the rest.

8 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Yes. We're not.
9 We are not in control the properties outside of our
10 site which you've seen the design for, but I think,
11 you know, as the environmental impact statement
12 looked at this area overall, there really is only one
13 site that we believe will develop under the proposed
14 rezoning and that was analyzed as part of that
15 document and our review. The other sites within the
16 parcel are built out, are two smaller constraints,
17 and the site to the north, which is the triangular
18 site, there's no change, really, within in terms of
19 its density. So it is density neutral and rezoning
20 zoning included within the Special St. George
21 district because, otherwise, it would be an often
22 site between-- within St. George.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. And you were
24 talking about this before, you know, with the FAR.

2 Is there any zoning districts in Staten Island that
3 allows for a 6.0 FAR with 26 stories?

4 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: There's two issues.
5 One is the FAR and one is the height. There is no
6 [inaudible 02:33:00] allows R7-3 right now in Staten
7 Island and, perhaps, it will never happen. But I
8 think it's worthwhile, Council members, to understand
9 that zoning districts, there's no sort of magic
10 number to zoning districts. I think the questions
11 before your body and for the City Planning Commission
12 is to see whether they propose zoning district in the
13 benefits that it entails and its design can fit
14 within the system context. And, I think, in this
15 particular case, this site is very unique and I think
16 I just want to be clear. I don't think what we are
17 proposing year is going to set a precedent elsewhere
18 within the district, but what makes the site so
19 unique is a few things. One is that its proximity to
20 mass transit and the best mass transit on the island.
21 The second is that it is the largest so. Third is
22 that it's the existing built context really supports
23 a taller building and I think you will find that in
24 other parts of Staten Island. So, the density and
25 messing is really unique and what we believe is

2 wholly appropriate for the site because of its
3 existing context. So, the site sits at the foot of
4 the hill and just behind it is the tallest building
5 in Staten Island which is Castleton Apartments. It
6 also suits on a major corridor within St. George.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You're answer--

8 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: You want me to stop
9 there. And one last point is--

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah.

11 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: that is also across
12 the--

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: So the answer is no,
14 right? Correct?

15 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Yes. And I thought
16 I answered that initially. Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you. Just
18 making sure.

19 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Now, I know you spoke
21 about open spaces earlier. Is there a phasing plan
22 to the construction on the site? I know you showed
23 on the presentation that you had in open space. Is
24 that currently open now or is there is good or when
25

2 the open space to the public will be delivered on-
3 site?

4 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Well, I can answer
5 that question. This is not a large-scale wage is
6 phased over multiple years. There is a construction
7 period that is roughly, I think, two to three years
8 and, Zach, correct me if I'm wrong. And, within that
9 period of construction, all three buildings will be
10 developed in that period, both public spaces will be
11 developed. So, we're not talking about something
12 that will come online years from now. By the time
13 the development is completed in the period of two to
14 three years, the public spaces will also be
15 delivered.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: So two to three years
17 before the public open space can be delivered on-
18 site?

19 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Right. Because
20 that is construction phase for the project.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Is there any way
22 to open the passive open space before the project is
23 fully completed?

24 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: I mean, we can look
25 at that. Part of it is just-- it just takes he

2 because there is overlaps between buildings in terms
3 of the construction. So, you know, is just something
4 that we can definitely consider. And, Tony, I don't
5 know if there is anything reflected [inaudible
6 02:36:44] that speaks to this.

7 TONI FINGER: Good morning. I am Toni
8 Finger, and environmental Council. Kramer Levin.
9 So, no do believe that there are conditions in the
10 restrictive tech that the open space comes online.
11 And I believe it is before occupancy of the third
12 building. So, I think the sites have to be
13 constructed first before those open spaces can come
14 online.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Just two more
16 questions and that I am going to turn it over to
17 Council member Rose. What kind of environmental
18 mitigation is required for this development and are
19 there any unmitigated impacts that exist there?

20 TONI FINGER: Yeah. So, the environmental
21 impacts consist of there were traffic impacts
22 identified at several intersections. Most of them
23 are able to be mitigated with standard measures which
24 include channels signal timing changes. However,
25 during the construction phase in the operational

2 phase, there will be two intersections that remain
3 unmitigated. There will also be construction noise
4 impacts. To deal with construction noise, the
5 applicant has committed to noise reduction measures
6 that go beyond what is required by the New York City
7 noise control code in order to reduce those levels.
8 They are also offering air-conditioning units for
9 certain residences that will be affected by noise so
10 that they will be a have alternate means of
11 ventilation with a closed window condition so that
12 they wouldn't experience impacts. There will be some
13 unmitigated noise impacts at some façades and I
14 believe that Castleton Park South Playground for some
15 limited period of time. But, again, construction
16 impacts are temporary. They occurred during
17 construction hours and they are not a constant state.
18 They are intermittent depending on a specific
19 activity that is occurring or the equipment that is
20 being used at that time.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: So, how are you going to
22 assure the construction on this site will not affect
23 traffic congestion on Richmond Terrace, especially at
24 the peak commuting times?

2 TONI FINGER: Well, there was an analysis
3 done for construction traffic and, with respect to
4 the impacts that were identified, most of them were,
5 again, able to be mitigated away with standard signal
6 timing changes. There are two intersections that are
7 not able to be mitigated. And that is Richmond
8 Terrace at Jersey Street and Richmond Terrace at Wall
9 Street.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. That is it for
11 me. I know we have a large number of folks who were
12 also looking to testify. So, I'm going to cut my
13 questions there in turn it over to Council member
14 Rose for questions.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Chair
16 Moya, and thank you for your questions. They were
17 spot on. I appreciate you asking them. I wanted to
18 know how to you plan to respond to the local resident
19 concerns about the precedent setting density that,
20 you know, is being requested in this application. As
21 soon know, this has been the major issue surrounding
22 this development.

23 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Thank you, Council
24 member Rose. So, to answer that question-- Well,
25 first, I think, just to be clear, earning kind of, as

2 you know, many rezoning's or mappings that take place
3 well have to go through ULURP, before a community
4 board, and before the City Planning Commission and,
5 of course, the City Council. We feel very strongly
6 that this density in this mapping that they are
7 proposing over here is not going to create a
8 precedent elsewhere on the island that relate to this
9 site and its location which warrants this density.
10 And that includes, as I said before, just its
11 proximity to mass transit, the ferry terminal, the
12 wheel bay terminal, the bus ferry, and the bus lines,
13 and it provides a lot of infrastructure for
14 commuters, for people to go to outside the island, as
15 well as within the island. I think the other thing
16 is that the density that goes along with the R7-3 we
17 understand, is greater than what is seen on the
18 island, but we believe that it can be masked in a way
19 which is what's proposed over here and it is
20 supported by the existing context. So, we don't
21 believe we will find these sites elsewhere which
22 would a hell for taller buildings. This particular
23 site, because you have Castleton Apartments just
24 behind it, but it is not only the tallest building,
25 but it is also about, I think, 70 feet above the

2 grade at Richmond Terrace. So, it sits atop of a
3 hill and we sit at the bottom of the hill and we're
4 on a major corridor and then, across the street, is
5 the [inaudible 02:42:24] site and, even though the
6 project may be dormant or may want to wait, the
7 Special St. George district anticipates that
8 something significant is going to happen over there.
9 So I think the land uses that exist in context and
10 the infrastructure of mass transit really allows the
11 sit to be rezoned without any real ill effect and--

12 ZACH KADDEN: Meenakshi, I just want to
13 jump in for one second.

14 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Yes. Go ahead,
15 sir.

16 ZACH KADDEN: Land use, I guess, to more
17 directly answer the Council members question is,
18 after our last meeting, FX Collaborative has been
19 working through the night and we are figuring out a
20 way to respond to the height question that you think
21 would be meaningful and, you know, address your
22 concern.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I look
24 forward to having that conversation about, you know,
25 how we have sort of circled back and are looking at

1 that. I appreciate that. And, you know, just wanted
2 to say to Meenakshi, I know that you addressed the
3 infrastructure in terms of transportation which would
4 be minimally impacted because, as you stated, it's
5 arrived at the ferry terminal, a major transportation
6 hub. So, there really wouldn't be any transportation
7 impact. However, you know, there are other
8 infrastructure issues that would be impacted and so,
9 you know, I would like to know how that figures into
10 your equation.
11

12 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Right. I think one
13 thing is that, in terms of in plans, most of the
14 categories are screened, really, and were not
15 analyzed as a part of the draft and final EIS. And
16 as Toni mentioned before, in terms of traffic, there
17 really are just two intersections that are not, sort
18 of, mitigated in one of them is actually closer
19 towards Bay Street and, while it's not a part of our
20 project, we recognize and understand that a part of
21 the Bay Street rezoning, the city committed to do
22 traffic monitoring for that intersection. So, you
23 know, we believe that that would be addressed in the
24 future with a city plan and monitoring plan. I think
25 the other impacts are really what Toni talked about

2 which was, essentially, construction impacts and
3 those will be temporary and we are working in her
4 mitigation in place to screen those, as well. So, if
5 we look at the overall sort of what are the effects
6 of this project and were talking about these two
7 intersections, some potential, I guess, you know, in
8 terms of construction, but that would be,
9 essentially, temporary, and then we look at the other
10 side of the equation and which is about affordability
11 and no such a significant infusion of affordable
12 housing in this neighborhood. And we have heard what
13 you have said, Council member, about the level of
14 affordability or the amount of affordability in our
15 team is working on that to see how we can, you know,
16 increase that and address your concerns. But that is
17 a big infusion in the area which we think provides
18 significant benefits. And then, you know, I don't
19 want to go through all the other issues, but we are,
20 obviously, dividing new open space and also just the
21 economic benefits and the secondary effects for the
22 North Shore and for-- economically and--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yeah. Thank you,
24 Meenakshi, and--

2 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: [inaudible
3 02:46:40]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I wanted to ask
5 you, as every borough in New York City was impacted
6 by the remnants of hurricane Ida, you know, it really
7 brought a lot of attention to our ability of our
8 sewers in their ability to, you know, contain, you
9 know, the water. Commuters briefly tell us about the
10 runoff in the drainage and, you know, the impacts of
11 building into the hillside will have on our ability
12 to address run of, drainage, and, you know, our sewer
13 capacity?

14 MEENAKSHI SRINIVASAN: Right. And
15 alternate over to Dan and Ben, but, you know, the
16 whole approach to what our site has been really
17 known-- you know, being good neighbors both from a
18 sustainable and a car logical standpoint, so we are
19 including measures that will take care of our site
20 and I want to turn that over to Dan and to Ben.

21 DAN KAPLAN: Thank you. So, I think a
22 couple points. Number one is that we are maintaining
23 50 percent of the site as an unbuilt area so that
24 there will be a recharge of the groundwater.
25 Secondly, we are creating a new sidewalk with 20

2 trees with bio soils at the base. And, third, we
3 will have either on inside cistern and or blue roofs
4 which retain water so that really this site should be
5 a model for stormwater management.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Could you
7 provide me with the proposed bedroom mirror's, you
8 know, of the development? That was something that
9 came up at our meeting. Can you provide that?
10 Everybody has do in the headlight looks, so, I
11 guess--

12 DAN KAPLAN: No. We are just--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Then at our
14 next meeting? Okay.

15 DAN KAPLAN: We can provide that to you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And, you know, we
17 did talk about the affordable-- increasingly
18 affordability amounts for this development. Have we
19 explored that yet?

20 ZACH KADDEN: Correct. So, we heard you
21 loud and clear and we're just looking at our
22 underwriting and, again, in response to the high
23 concerns, you will have a response that addresses
24 your comments on increased affordability, as well.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. And have
3 you had any conversations with any businesses or
4 community organizations who my tenant the outcome
5 Marshall and community facilities sites and is there
6 enough square footage to actually provide a grocery
7 store or a daycare facility on that site?

8 ZACH KADDEN: So, just to clarify, it is
9 not community facility. It's retail we're talking
10 about. And, actually, in the last two weeks, we've
11 had a few local daycare centers on Staten Island to,
12 I believe, have two or three existing establishments
13 reach out to us and express interest in opening in
14 St. George and we looked at rough square footage is.
15 Building three would almost be a perfect fit for that
16 use. And then, for the retail space in building one,
17 we have actually had a few brokers reach out on
18 behalf of their clients who are on an operating
19 supermarkets on the island in our interested in
20 finding and using building one's location for their
21 establishment. So, it sounds like to work over
22 though uses that we have been talking about for a
23 while have expressed interest. Obviously, we have
24 discussed how challenging it is this far out in the
25 process, but it is exciting for us and, obviously,

2 for the community that two of our targeted uses
3 already were the first out of the gate to connect
4 with us on opportunities at River North.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: All right. I know
6 that a lot of grocery stores have a certain square
7 footage requirement in a just wanted to make sure
8 that, you know, the retail space could accommodate
9 those square footage needs. That's a yes?

10 ZACH KADEN: Understood.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. And how
12 will cars enter in exit this property where are the--

13 ZACH KADDEN: Ben, do you want to take
14 that?

15 BEN ABELMAN: Yeah. I'm happy to walk
16 everybody through. So there will be three parking
17 facilities and two of which are actually within one
18 building. It's just there is no connection between
19 those independent facilities in that one building.
20 So, building one, which is the building closest to
21 the St. George ferry terminal, there will be one
22 parking entrance on Hamilton that actually brings
23 cars onto the second story. And that will utilize
24 the parking facility on floors two and three of
25 building one. On Stuyvesant Place, beyond 53 feet

2 from the intersection of Stuyvesant Place and
3 Richmond Terrace, there will be an entry into a below
4 grade parking facility in building one. And then, in
5 building three at the furthest northwest portion of
6 the site, there will be an entrance off of Richmond
7 Terrace to access parking on the second and third
8 story of that building. And in total, you know,
9 we're, you know, budgeting about 340 spaces. You
10 know, and that's what's required per zoning. But,
11 you know, as, you know, design occurs, we'll look to
12 provide as much parking that can fit in the space.
13 We are providing the requirement.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So there's no
15 parking in building two at all?

16 BEN ABELMAN: Building two is the smallest
17 building footprint and, you know, the two parking
18 facilities are within, you know, 50 foot or to 100
19 foot walk. So, you know, and on the same kind of
20 campus. So, we would look to create pathways to
21 bring users/residents to those other parking
22 facilities.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Will those
24 pathways be internal or--?

2 BEN ABELMAN: It's, you know, a good
3 compliment. It would be a combination. You know, we
4 want to avoid unnecessary excavation. So, you know,
5 outdoor paths or, you know, potentially below grade
6 paths connecting is something that we are looking
7 into.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Chair,
9 thank you so much for allowing me to ask these
10 questions. I know that my community has questions.
11 So and I will be meeting with this development team,
12 so I'll get any answers that I need. So, thank you,
13 again, for this opportunity.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Councilwoman
15 Rose. I now want to just check with our counsel to
16 see if we have any other colleagues that will have
17 questions for this panel.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair Moya. I
19 see no members with questions for this panel.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: All right. Seeing that
21 there are no further questions, the applicant panel
22 is excused. Counsel, are there any members of the
23 public who wish to testify on the River North
24 rezoning application?
25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair. We
3 have approximately 22 public witnesses that have
4 signed up to speak.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: For members of the
7 public here to testify, please note, again, that
8 witnesses will generally be called in groups of up to
9 four names at a time. If you are a member of the
10 public who has signed up to testify on the River
11 North rezoning proposal, please stand by when you
12 hear your name being called and prepare to speak when
13 the Chair says that you may begin. Please note,
14 again, once all panelists in your group have
15 completed their testimony, you will be removed from
16 the meeting as a group and the next group of speakers
17 will be introduced. Once removed, participants may
18 continue to view the livestream broadcast of this
19 hearing on the Council website. We will now hear
20 from the first panel which will include Vincent
21 Accornero, Deborah Givens, Helen Northmore, and John
22 Kilcullen. The first speaker on the panel will be
23 Vincent Accornero followed by Deborah Givens.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just a reminder to
25 members of the public, you will have two minutes to

2 speak. Please do not begin until the sergeant-at-
3 arms has started the clock. Before we start, I see
4 Council member Rose has her hand up. I'm sorry. Can
5 we unmute Council member Rose?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Uh--

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hold on, Council
8 member. We've got to unmute you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Chair, I just
10 wanted to ask, before the public testifies, if we
11 could ask the development team to stay to hear the
12 testimony.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah. I think we may
14 have lost them, Councilwoman.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. All right.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I apologize.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm sorry. I--

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No. That's okay.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I should have
20 mentioned it before. Okay. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you,
22 Councilwoman. We will now begin with Vincent.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Vincent, whenever
25 you're ready, you may begin.

2 VINCENT ACCORNERO: Thank you, Mr.
3 Chairman. Ladies and gentlemen, my name is Vincent
4 Accornero, chairman of the newly and use committee
5 for Community Board One Staten Island. Thank you for
6 the opportunity to speak today. Council member Rose,
7 good afternoon. This is a letter that we address
8 took Council member Rose continually lead to
9 resolution that was passed near unanimously by
10 Community Board One regarding the River North
11 application. As you know, Community Board One had
12 preliminary discussions with the developer and hosted
13 an extremely lengthy and comprehensive public hearing
14 that was well attended and provided voluminous
15 testimony. Also, the land use committee and full
16 board spent time prior to familiarize themselves with
17 the proposal. After discussion, Community Board One
18 unanimously approved the following resolution:
19 whereas this application seeks to rezone the proposed
20 area from an R6 [inaudible 02:58:51] district within
21 the Special Hillside Preservation District to an R7
22 C3/C2-4 withing the Special St. George District and
23 whereas this application in in the Special Hillside
24 Preservation District which was designed to give
25 oversight to building and steep slope and whereas the

2 application seeks to obliterate the Special Hillside
3 Preservation District in any area of the steepest
4 slope in Community Board One whereas it is
5 unprecedented for any proposal to be removed from
6 this district and whereas the existing R6 district
7 provides the greatest bulk in high of any district in
8 Staten Island whereas the Special St. George District
9 provides parking and other development controls,
10 designed and adopted specifically for this area and
11 whereas this development is asking for multiple
12 authorizations and waivers all intended to maximize
13 density and bulk in a district that can be developed
14 without this extreme, contorted level of relief
15 whereas this application has been extremely fast
16 tracked through the Department of City Planning and
17 saddled new representatives in the administration
18 with a decision that should be left for the MB hereby
19 resolved, Community Board One opposes all the actions
20 proposed by this application and strongly suggests
21 they build within a uses zoning control so as
22 not to completely disregard all previously crafted
23 zoning.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

25 VINCENT ACCORNERO: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Vincent.

3 Next, we have Deborah.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Can we unmute Deborah?

6 DEBORAH GIVENS: Muted? Yes. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: There you go, Deborah.

8 DEBORAH GIVENS: Okay. Good afternoon,

9 Committee Chair Moya, Council member Debbie Rose, and

10 Council members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and

11 Franchises. My name is Deborah Gibbons. I am you to

12 oppose the project. I am a former Staten Islander,

13 born and raised and educated on Staten Island and I

14 am here to speak on behalf of all the Staten

15 Islanders who are missing this opportunity to testify

16 due to short notice as this application is being

17 pushed through the approval process with some level

18 of expediency unheard of. As City Planning

19 Commissioners Cirillo stated during the last CPC

20 sessions on this matter that the emphasis has been on

21 the hide of these buildings and that is a major

22 concern new unit showed be, but this has been to the

23 exclusion of discussing other objectionable aspects

24 of this project this large. Many were identified in

25 the final EIS. My concerns and objections are

1 divided into two. First, the lack of transparency in
2 many forms. First, the lack of true community
3 engagement by the applicant. Where were the sit
4 downs? Workshops? Public meetings? Feel-good
5 sessions inviting the community into the project?
6 Two, the lack of scrutiny. This application is
7 skating through the approval process ahead of
8 comprehensive planning considerations and the racial
9 equity analysis that is so desired by the city
10 Council and that was introduced in 2019 with an eye
11 on future projects. A project of this size should be
12 reviewed through the new critical lenses as it will
13 be completed well into the future. Three, the lack
14 of disclosure of the housing specifics. No
15 floorplans, no housing unit designs, no breakdown on
16 the number of apartments by household size and income
17 were made available nor was there and as overweight
18 scenario and renderings or drawings as requested by
19 the commission. I tell you these are not good signs.
20 My other major concern is the MIH option two being
21 proposed. As this project was going through the
22 approval process, option one was mentioned, but it
23 seems to have been--
24

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

2 DEBORAH GIVENS: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Deborah.

4 Counsel, who is the next panelist? Sorry.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker
6 will be Helen Northmore who will be followed by John
7 Kilcullen and, Chair, I would just like to make a
8 brief technical announcement. For members of the
9 public, if you have already completed the
10 registration process and you have successfully logged
11 into the zoom meeting and you are here waiting to
12 testify, there should be no reason to use the raise
13 hand function. Just for sorting logistical purposes,
14 we will ask that you not raise your hand. If you
15 have raised your hand, please lower it. Your name
16 will be called in order once it is your turn to speak
17 in your ability to speak will be enabled once your
18 turn is called. Thank you. The next speaker is
19 Helen Northmore who will be followed by John
20 Kilcullen.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

22 HELEN NORTHMORE: Without harmful zoning
23 concessions for River North with its unmitigated
24 adverse effects, more than 1000 units of affordable
25 housing are already predicted by the city in the up

1 sound Staten Island areas which start across the
2 street: the St. George Special District, the Bay
3 Street Corridor District, and the Special Stapleton
4 Waterfront District. Madison Realty Capital plans to
5 squeeze 750 apartments, 1300 people, and 340 plus
6 automobiles into three buildings bordering Richmond
7 Terrace. The North Shore rail line was shut down in
8 1953, so approximately 73 percent of North Shore
9 transit riders use the bus to get to work. The S40
10 bus running along Richmond Terrace is the primary
11 route. The MTA says Richmond Terrace is already
12 inadequate for the traffic on it. About 30 percent
13 of all S40 trips are already late throughout the day,
14 making fairy connections difficult. When the roads
15 are too congested, the proposed traffic signal timing
16 won't work. The research has been done. Three plus
17 years of construction will make things worse. The
18 Castleton Park Apartments property, containing its
19 sewer lines right of way, actually bisects the River
20 North building one and building two as seen on the
21 illustration today. Has the New York City cup
22 housing Development Corporation given its opinion on
23 Madison Realty Capital's plan to buy the Castleton
24 Park property since HDC floated over \$70 million in
25

2 loans and bonds for Castleton Park Apartments
3 mortgages? If the zoning use change now, thereby
4 inflating the cost of the land in St. George, why
5 does the guarantee that even a single River North
6 dwelling will be completed? Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Helen.
8 Thank you for your testimony today.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The last speaker
10 on this panel will be John Kilcullen. John
11 Kilcullen.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

13 JOHN KILCULLEN: Good afternoon, Chair
14 Moya and Zoning and Franchises Subcommittee Council
15 members and Council member Rose. Thank you for
16 holding this hearing today regarding items River
17 North. My name is John Kilcullen and I am in
18 opposition to all three agenda items. As you may
19 have heard, Staten Islanders, including our Borough
20 President and Community Board One, many local civic
21 associations, and our own Staten Island Commissioner,
22 and City Planning Commission are opposed to this
23 rezoning. It is not as of right development of the
24 said property. The argument against rezoning isn't
25 about [inaudible 03:06:57] property owners to build

2 up their property, affordable housing, or. This
3 proposed rezoning moves to large in the wrong
4 location. And the alteration of a hard-fought and
5 much treasured zoning district, the Special Hillside
6 Protection District, is-- please note, the Castleton
7 Park Towers predate the special district and actually
8 sit upon the flattest part of this area of St.
9 George. At this time, Staten Island does not need R7
10 zoning. The recently rezoned St. George [inaudible
11 03:07:36] High Zone District, and the newly rezoned
12 Bay Street corridor do not include R7 zoning and have
13 not been fully developed or maxed out. ., Many
14 developments have not taken advantage of the St.
15 George high-rise district in the glut of unfinished
16 or failed development projects has [inaudible
17 03:07:55] and lighthouse won't hide the fact that
18 Staten Island does not need this up zoning. This is
19 simply the case of a developer crying before
20 construction starts and their only concern is to
21 maximize their end profits, not the community. And
22 I'd like to point out that the point to-- the view
23 that they have talk [inaudible 03:08:18]--

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

25 JOHN KILCULLEN: Thank you for your--

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, John. Thank
3 you for your testimony today. Are there any Council
4 members who have any questions for this panel?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
6 no members with questions for this panel.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: This panel is now
8 excused. Thank you, again, for your testimony. If
9 you can please call up the next panel.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Once again, just
11 as a reminder for all members of the public who have
12 successfully registered and logged into the meeting,
13 there should be no need to use the raise hand
14 function. Everyone will have a chair that's to be
15 called in order. The next panel will include Renzo
16 Ramirez, Leticia Remauro, Dr. Demetrius Carolina, and
17 Nikki Odlivak. We will start the panel with Renzo
18 Ramirez followed by Leticia Remauro.

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.
20 Starting time.

21 RENZO RAMIREZ: Good afternoon, Chair
22 Moya, and members of the Subcommittee. My name is
23 Renzo Ramirez and I am a member of 32 BJ SEIU. I am
24 here today on behalf of my union to express our
25 support for the proposed River North project. 32 BJ

1 is the largest property service union in the country,
2 representing 85,000 property service workers in New
3 York City, including janitors, security guards, handy
4 persons, and supers that work in buildings similar to
5 the proposed River North project. 32 BJ supports
6 responsible developers who invest in the communities
7 where they build. I am happy to report that the
8 developers affiliated with River North, Madison
9 Realty Capital, have made a credible commitment to
10 creating prevailing wage building service jobs at
11 this site. This commitment means that workers in
12 Staten Island will have access to families sustaining
13 wages, retirement, and quality health benefits in a
14 time where New Yorkers need them the most. We
15 estimate that the mixed-use development like the one
16 proposed by the developer will be permanently staffed
17 by an estimated 20 building service workers. The
18 River North project will also have approximately 225
19 affordable housing units in accordance with the
20 mandatory inclusionary housing program. Building new
21 permanently affordable housing in a centrally located
22 area with access to mass transit is important to our
23 members and their families. For these reasons, we
24 are in full support of this project. We have
25

2 confidence that Madison Realty Capital will be a
3 responsible employer and presence in the community.

4 For these reasons, we respectfully urge you to
5 approve the rezoning. Thank you so much.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Renzo.
7 Thank you for your testimony today.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will hear
9 from Leticia Remauro followed by Dr. Demetrius
10 Carolina.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

12 LETICIA REMAURO: Good morning. Or good
13 afternoon. Thank you for letting me speak and thank
14 you, Chairman, into our Council member, Debbie Rose.
15 Failure to plan is planning to fail is,
16 unfortunately, on Staten Island, we have failed at
17 planning and that failure has caused us to have
18 homeless shelters spring up in residential
19 neighborhoods right next to elementary schools. It
20 has caused us to have uncharacteristic buildings
21 being shoved into neighborhoods where they don't
22 belong. In this failure to plan, because we are
23 fearful of what might happen next. I am here to ask
24 for Council member Rose in the rest of the committee
25 to really consider a negotiation on this site. You

1 know, this project is surrounded by buildings that
2 are taller. This project is going to provide for
3 seed news and young people a place where they can
4 live. And up until now, too many of our young people
5 and our seniors have been pushed off of Staten Island
6 because we don't have rental apartments or affordable
7 rentals. When you have a responsible development
8 poignant in front of us, it is really important that
9 we take a look at how to make this work. Again,
10 Castleton Park Apartments are tall. We have the
11 accolades. We have Irbi [sp?]. We have wonderful
12 areas where we can make things work and this is the
13 right place next to public transportation. This is a
14 place where young people can stay on Staten Island
15 before they get married and buy a home. This is a
16 place where seniors can retire and sell their home in
17 have a place to live right next to the Staten Island
18 ferry. This is a walkable neighborhood in this
19 project actually fits into this neighborhood because
20 not everywhere on Staten Island is suitable for a
21 tall building and so we must recognize that the Bay
22 Street Corridor, the Richmond Terrace Corridor--

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

2 LETICIA REMAURO: are there places that we
3 should look for these projects in urge you to take a
4 good look at this project and to negotiate.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you,
6 Leticia. Thank you for your testimony today.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker
8 on the panel will be Dr. Demetrius Carolina who will
9 be followed by Nikki Odlivak.

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

11 DR. DEMETRIUS CAROLINA: Good
12 afternoon, Chair Moya, and certainly our phenomenal
13 Councilwoman Debbie Rose, and certainly the
14 Subcommittee. My name is Rev. Dr. Demetrius
15 Carolina, executive director of the largest black and
16 brown nonprofit in Staten Island and pastor of the
17 First Central Baptist Church. I am here to support
18 the development of the River North project and just
19 asking this committee and our councilperson and all
20 of those in Staten Island to consider the fact that
21 now is the time for monumental change into
22 opportunity has come for us to really think out-of-
23 the-box, to rethink development into also think about
24 the social determinants over economic well-being of
25 this borough in the community yet to come, as was

2 mentioned before. This is a unique area in the
3 borough and this development may not necessarily open
4 the door for equal types of development in other
5 areas of the borough because we understand that that
6 is not necessarily a reality. But one thing that is
7 a reality is we need development, especially in a
8 historically underserved and underdeveloped area on
9 the North Shore of Staten Island. This is a walkable
10 community and with proper negotiation, planning,
11 discussions, and meetings, I am certain that we, an
12 intelligent, wonderful, thriving borough can come to
13 some double solutions for this development project.
14 Let's not throw the baby out with the bathwater, but
15 lets it down and make some meaningful development
16 plans for the future. Not just for others who are
17 presently here, but for those who are yet to come.
18 Thank you for your time and your consideration.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
20 for your testimony.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The last speaker
22 on this panel will be Nikki Odlivak.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

24 NIKKI ODLIVAK: Thank you for this
25 opportunity to testify today. My name is Nikki

1 Odlivak and I am president and CEO of Community
2 Agency for Senior Citizens, better known as CASC.
3 Also, I am a resident of the St. George neighborhood
4 on Staten Island for almost 40 years and have been
5 working in St. George for over 20 years. CASC has
6 been serving older adults age 60 years and older and
7 their caregivers since 1985 and would provide
8 assistance to seniors to remain as independent as
9 possible and thrive in their Staten Island community
10 by providing different kinds of services. I'm
11 cutting my testimony. You have my written testimony.
12 CASC programs assist over 8000 people annually and we
13 expect that number to rise with baby boomers aging at
14 an unprecedented rate. Some advocates have called it
15 a tsunami of aging older adults. One of the most
16 frequent questions CASC receives from senior callers
17 and their families is how can we access affordable
18 housing? Unfortunately, there is no good news on the
19 subject. CASC assists with housing applications for
20 local, affordable housing, but wait lists, years, and
21 the available apartments at an affordable rate are
22 few. I am here to support River North Liberty Towers
23 development. It is long time overdue that our
24 beautiful waterfront is developed into an exciting,
25

2 thriving, and welcoming North Shore. We need the
3 housing. We need housing for seniors who can no
4 longer live in private homes. We need housing for
5 seniors who are being asked to leave apartments and
6 to and for families because, after 20 to 30 years of
7 living there, the families are now selling these
8 private dwellings or they can get much more rent from
9 new tenants. We need more housing for young adults
10 who are just starting their careers, but cannot
11 afford moving out over their parents homes, and we
12 need more housing--

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

14 NIKKI ODLIVAK: for young families where
15 it is a safe place to live and flourish. There's
16 more my written testimony.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you,
18 Nikki. Thank you for your testimony today. Is that
19 the last of our panelists?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That was the last
21 speaker on this panel. Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Is there any Council
23 members who have questions for this panel?

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
25 no members with questions for the panel.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
3 more questions for this panel, the witness panel is
4 now excused. Thank you all for your patience today
5 and thank you for coming here to testify. Counsel,
6 if you could please call up the next panel.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will
8 include Linda Cohen, Kamillah Hanks, Michael Harwood,
9 and Sally Jones. We will begin with Linda Cohen
10 followed by Camilla Hanks.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Speakers are being
13 brought in. Once again, we will start with Linda
14 Cohen followed by Kamillah Hanks. Excuse me, Chair.
15 The first speaker on this panel, we will take
16 Kamillah Hanks to start who will be followed by
17 Michael Harwood. Kamillah Hanks.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

19 KAMILLAH HANKS: Good morning, Chair
20 Moya, and members of the Zoning and Franchises
21 Subcommittee and Council members, Council member Rose
22 and community members that are here today. Thank you
23 for the opportunity to testify. I enjoyed Community
24 Board One in several of my elected officials,
25 community stakeholders, and many residents of the

North Shore in opposition of the River North project.

My commentary, much like what you will hear to say--

and it will be brief and on both sides. I've been a

long-time proponent of creating a master plan that

uses sensible development that takes into

consideration of the existing neighborhood and builds

responsibly and has real community benefits and

provides affordability that is inclusive on all

income levels. To that end, the Madison Realty

Capital's River North project in its current

iteration does not address any of the above. This

project raises deep concerns with building heights

and current placement being built on Richmond Terrace

is yet another example of our district being planned

in piecemeal with no consideration of long-term

impacts on our infrastructure, our schools, public

transportation options, roads, sewers, healthcare

facilities, and, most importantly, our community.

While Madison is proposing zoning variance with three

buildings, 25, 26, and 11 stories, our communities

are dealing with flood damage, homeless shelters,

broken streets, vacant storefronts, and long

commutes. The problem of our waterfront and St.

George district are becoming as faded as the coming

2 soon window decals that adorn many of the different
3 development projects. The city Council has the last
4 word on the approval process and the city Council, at
5 its core, was tasked with representing the interest
6 of its constituents, the residents of the city of New
7 York. The residents of the St. George neighborhood
8 have declared their opposition to this project and
9 for good reason. I urge city Council to support the
10 residents of the North Shore and vote against the
11 North Shore River project in its current form. We
12 deserve better and I encourage other developers to
13 consider our thoughtful commentaries offer today and
14 resubmit a proposal that reflects the domains of our
15 community. Thank you so much.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Kamillah.
17 Good to see you. Thank you so much.

18 KAMILLAH HANKS: Good to see you, too.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your
20 testimony today. Thank you.

21 KAMILLAH HANKS: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Our next speaker
23 will be Michael Harwood followed by Sally Jones.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 MICHAEL HARWOOD: Good afternoon. River
3 North and R7 zoning is wrong for St. George, wrong
4 for the North Shore, and wrong for Staten Island. It
5 is also wrong for the cause of affordable housing.
6 The only people it is right for the developers in the
7 real estate interests and I say that as a homeowner
8 and as well as a landlord of 12 units in St. George.
9 Current R6 zoning would allow 176 apartment units
10 which is in keeping with those zoning changes that
11 were recently enacted. This project seeks to explode
12 that zoning to 900 units, of 500 percent increase
13 above R6. It would also increase the allowed height
14 nearly 800 percent. That means that this up zoning
15 would be a property value gift by the city to this
16 developer of nearly a quarter billion dollars in
17 value and what public amenity are they offering in
18 return? Practically nothing. No waterfront
19 promenade, no score. There is no room for parking
20 for this hypothetical grocery store and there is
21 minimal space, mostly public space mostly for the
22 residents. Their offer of 30 percent units of
23 affordable housing is also illusory. Studio one-
24 bedroom apartments starting at \$1700 a month are only
25 slightly below the existing market rate already and I

2 know that, as a landlord in the neighborhood. But
3 adding over 700 new market rate units will actually
4 displace existing borderline groups in this
5 neighborhood. The city Council recently approved the
6 St. George rezoning and Bay Street Corridor rezoning
7 which are designed to provide several hundred units
8 of affordable housing more appropriately distributed
9 through the area instead of cramming all these units
10 in one location and this gift of over \$200 million in
11 value will be an invitation to other developers to
12 build more R7 projects here and all over the area
13 near the ferry terminal. St. George already has a
14 population density of 19,000 people per square mile
15 and if you add another 2000 residents here, it will
16 be triple the density of the rest of the island, even
17 before these other projects come online. We don't
18 need massive density increases. We need open space
19 consistent with the existing hillside topography and
20 public amenities that will encourage future residents
21 and businesses to locate here because of the
22 neighborhood character. We need responsible planning
23 consistent with the existing zoning that integrates
24 the--

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

2 MICHAEL HARWOOD: and, as the community
3 board unanimously voted, this neighborhood is opposed
4 to this project in its entirety and I urge the
5 counseling committee to vote against it. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Michael.
7 Thank you for your testimony today.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker
9 will be Sally Jones and then we will try to get Linda
10 Cohen again. Next speaker, Sally Jones.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

12 SALLY JONES: Thank you, Chair Moya and my
13 Council member Debbie Rose. My name is Sally Jones.
14 I am a member of the St. George Civic Association,
15 the Staten Island Democratic Association, am on the
16 board of the Unitarian Church of Staten Island, I am
17 a founding member of Peace Action of Staten Island,
18 as well as other civic groups. I live at 110
19 Hamilton Avenue, up the street from the proposed
20 project. I have lived in our 1910 home for 43 years,
21 since August 1979, across the street from Curtis High
22 School. I am opposed to this River North project for
23 the following reasons: Its height and density is out
24 of scale with the neighborhood of mostly one to four
25 family homes and smaller scale apartment buildings.

2 It violates hard-fought for zoning protections to
3 protect the hillside and harbor views. It pushes the
4 St. George waterfront into a high rise building
5 syndrome. It will create very few sustainable jobs.
6 It comes on top of other in limbo projects that we
7 live with one to three blocks from the project. The
8 never build wheel, the sparsely visited Empire
9 Outlets. The huge, empty, unfinished block-long
10 garage that is right across the street and which is
11 also ugly. The uncompleted hotel next to the ferry
12 terminal whose construction was stopped due to
13 bankruptcy. The community's vision of the waterfront
14 is for public access, green space, and maintaining
15 stunning harbor views. It should not be built up
16 with high rises and make us a Fort Lee look alike. I
17 urge this committee and the City Council to deny this
18 project.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Sally.
20 Thank you for your testimony today.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And we will now try
22 to hear from Linda Cohen once again. Linda Cohen.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Do we have Linda?
25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I do see Linda
3 Cohen. Linda Cohen, if you can hear us, we will ask
4 that you accept an invitation to unmute if you see
5 one so that we can take your testimony. Okay. We
6 appear to be having some issues with Linda Cohen.
7 Chair, we will try to get her testimony in a
8 subsequent panel.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And that concludes
11 the current panel.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Thank you--
13 Well, let me just check-- Are there any Council
14 members who have questions for this panel?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
16 no members with questions for this panel.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Well, thank you
18 very much. I thank you all for your patience today
19 and thank you very much for your testimony during
20 this hearing. This panel is now excused. Counsel,
21 if you can please call up the next panel?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel will
23 consist of Dale Smith followed by Elizabeth Morgan
24 followed by Icisis Cruz followed by Reverend Judy L.

Brown. The first speaker on this panel we will hear from is Dale Smith.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

DALE SMITH: Yes. Good morning to the members of the Zoning and Franchises Subcommittee and to our great Council member, Debbie Rose. Hello. I am Rev. Dale Smith and I would like to thank you for having me today and I am leadership counsel at Youth Filled Impact and a reverend for [inaudible of 03:30:15] Baptist Church. I am here today in support of the proposed River North project in Staten Island. At Leadership Council Youth Filled Impact, I am responsible for supporting the program participants in their personal development. I work with local youths [inaudible 03:30:27] in their academic and leadership development goals through structural activities, lessons, workshops, and events. We also provide ongoing counseling support services and guidance so they can achieve success. As the heart of my work with local Staten Island youth, I am committed to supporting the development and growth into the smallest residents in the community. But it is also important that every child's community supports him or her and has resources necessary for

2 them to succeed. Therefore, I support River North.

3 Children and teenagers growing up in Staten Island

4 should be able to grow up in stable homes-- ones

5 their parents or parent can afford. They should have

6 community spaces and public open spaces where they

7 complain, learn, and enjoy the neighborhood, breaking

8 the cycle of poverty. Many of our community members

9 include students that are homeless in this would

10 provide them with affordable housing that is

11 desperately needed for them to have a brighter

12 future. The North Shore has grown tremendously in

13 recent years. We welcome change, but must be mindful

14 that long-term residents don't get left behind. The

15 River North provides inclusivity. Please help the

16 North Shore grow in a substantial way by meeting the

17 needs of new and existing residents and ensuring that

18 the youth of today have opportunities for their

19 future. I thank you for that time.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Dale. Thank

21 you for your testimony.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker

23 on this panel will be Elizabeth Morgan. Elizabeth

24 Morgan who will then be followed by Icisis Cruz.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 ELIZABETH MORGAN: Good afternoon. Good
3 afternoon, members of the Zoning and Franchises
4 Subcommittee and our phenomenal leader, Council
5 member Debbie Rose. My name is Elizabeth Morgan and
6 I am speaking today in support of River North. In my
7 role at the Central Family Life Center, I am the
8 director of the youthful impact program which provides
9 youth ages 17 to 24 with opportunity to earn their
10 high school equivalency diploma, construction skills,
11 leadership soft skills, and offers other social
12 services. River North presents the North Shore with
13 a unique opportunity for 225 units of newly
14 constructed, income-based, affordable housing and
15 approximately 7800 square foot public plaza, a
16 significant visual and safety improvement to the
17 streets from the front and sidewalk along Richmond
18 Terrace and Stuyvesant Place. All developed in a
19 global manner. River North will achieve the equity
20 in part through its partnership with Youthful Impact.
21 Youthful Impact has begun working with River North
22 project partner, Building Skills New York to place
23 Staten Islanders in construction jobs, including
24 those created by the project. When River North is
25 approved, I look forward to continuing our work with

2 Building Skills New York to harvest the economic and
3 career opportunities that River North will create for
4 young people on the North Shore. Additionally,
5 located near multiple means of public transportation,
6 including the ferry terminal, River North will be
7 positioned to draw visitors to our community where
8 they can support the numerous businesses,
9 restaurants, and cultural institutions that the
10 island has to offer. I am urging you to vote to
11 support River Door. Thank you for your time and
12 consideration.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Elizabeth.
14 Thank you for your testimony today.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker
16 on the panel will be Icisis Cruz who will be followed
17 by the Rev. Judy Brown.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

19 ICISIS CRUZ: Good afternoon do members of
20 the Zoning man Franchise Subcommittee. My name is
21 Icisis Cruz. I am a 20 years old NYCHA resident who
22 lives in Staten Island, New York for the past six
23 years. I support the River North project and would
24 very much like to see it move forward. It would
25 bring housing in jobs to the community. I would love

1 to have the opportunity to move into my own apartment
2 into wine over these beautiful new homes that are
3 affordable, as well. Over the past year, I am proud
4 to say that I was able to achieve my high school
5 equivalency through Youth Filled Impact. As a
6 graduate from the class of 2021, I am grateful to the
7 many new opportunities that have opened up for me.
8 After achieving my diploma, I went on to receive my
9 community [inaudible 03:34:32] certification. Today,
10 with my high school diploma and my health
11 certificate, I am fortunate to be interning with
12 North well Health. This pandemic has been hard, but
13 it has also made it clear how important the health
14 industry is and I am honored to be a part of that
15 world now. Over the past year and a half, I have
16 been able to turn my life around. I have also seen
17 my dreams develop. River North is an opportunity for
18 young adults like myself to pursue their dreams where
19 they can afford to live and be part of a grown
20 community in Staten Island. Although I have followed
21 the health career and [inaudible 03:35:07] are on the
22 construction track and are looking forward to working
23 alongside architects, contractors, and being offered
24 job opportunities, those homes never happened on the
25

2 North Shore for youth like me. I hope you will
3 support this project and give young Staten Islanders
4 the opportunity to stay in their home Borough while
5 having access to resources and jobs needed to
6 succeed. Thank you. Emerging you devote to support
7 River North. Thank you for your time and
8 consideration.

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you,
10 again, for your testimony today. We can call up the
11 next panelist.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panelist,
13 the next and final panelist, for this panel will be
14 the Rev. Judy Brown.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Judy Brown, we can
17 see you. Judy Brown, if you see any requests to--
18 there we go.

19 REV. JUDY BROWN: Yes. Good afternoon,
20 all. My name is Rev. Judy L. Brown and I am the
21 senior pastor of the Bethel Community Church in
22 Tompkins will, as well as the executive director of
23 the African Refuge. I am here to support River North
24 because, you know, in the climate that we live in, I
25 really cannot say no to housing. Housing is the

1 essential right and so housing is needed. I do
2 believe that there is some negotiations conversations
3 that are needed to make the project work. I believe
4 that River North will bring labor to the island. The
5 developers are willing to work with the community, as
6 well is bringing union jobs as well as have an open
7 shop and will work with nonprofits. So, it has many,
8 many valuable parts to it. And so, I just want to
9 say that this is a unique opportunity and we can work
10 it out so that there is housing that is meeting the
11 requirements of our city Councilwoman, Debbie Rose,
12 and meeting the requirements of our community be and
13 we have a win-win. I am kind of rushed this morning,
14 but thank you so much. I think this is going to be a
15 wonderful addition to the island. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Reverend.
18 Thank you for your testimony today. Is that the last
19 of the panelists?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. There was
21 the last speaker on this panel.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. Do we have any
23 Council members who wish to ask this panel any
24 questions?

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I see no members
3 with questions for the panel.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
5 more questions for this panel, the witness panel is
6 now excused and, counsel, if you can please call up
7 the next panel.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel well
9 be Jan Koehler, David Jones, and Theo Dorian.
10 Starting with Jan Koehler who will be followed by
11 David Jones.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

13 JAN KOEHLER: I am not sure if I chose the
14 right thing. I have lived in this neighborhood for
15 most of the past 50 years. I've seen all of these
16 spectacular failures. In fact, one of them since the
17 middle of my panoramic view. It is a 20 story,
18 unfinished, empty hull. Before starting another
19 project, why not finish what we have? How about the
20 building at the base of Nicholas Street? Is that
21 for? That sat empty for years and years. Who is
22 going to live here? Who is going to take all these
23 apartments? What I see is a the neighborhood that
24 has, really, no urban amenities. They don't exist
25 here and people moving into a place like that are

2 going to expect that. So, that is all I have to say.
3 I don't feel real good about this. Don't think the
4 neighborhood is ready for it and I don't think it
5 will be successful. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Jan. Thank
7 you for your testimony today. I just want to
8 acknowledge that we have been joined by Councilwoman
9 Rivera. I know that you had a previous chairing a
10 previous committee and I want to take a pause right
11 here to see if we can just quickly take her vote and
12 proceed from here.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair. On a
14 continuing vote of the land use items, Council member
15 Rivera?

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: If we can unmute the
17 Councilwoman? Yep.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you, Mr.
19 Chair. I vote aye.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, the vote
22 currently stands at six in the affirmative, zero in
23 the negative, and no abstentions. We will continue
24 to keep the vote open until the end.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you,
3 Councilwoman.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: In the next speaker
5 on this panel will be David Jones who will be
6 followed by Theo Dorian.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

8 DAVID JONES: Yes. Thank you very much for
9 giving me this opportunity to speak. So much of what
10 I have to say has been shared by my fellow neighbors
11 and much of my objection to this project has been
12 stated both high realities, lack of amenities, and
13 just the general inappropriateness of this particular
14 project. Staten Island St. George, was one of the
15 principles involved in bringing on the Historic
16 District. It didn't go as far as we would've liked
17 to, but it was with the idea in mind of both
18 appreciation of the architecture in the quality of
19 life that so made St. George what it is today. Yes,
20 the neighborhood is walkable. The neighborhood is
21 wonderful. Most people know each other,
22 surprisingly. It is unlike a great many communities.
23 It is not New York City. It is not Brooklyn. It is
24 not any of Queens or any of those places. This is a
25 very unique spot. Much of our view areas have been

1 robbed. We have been robbed of our view corridors.
2 Our views, the spectacular views we have held here,
3 have been taken away and we're not Fort Lee, New
4 Jersey. We are not a cookie-cutter community where
5 we are all crammed in here. The supporters are
6 people who do not live here, who do not really
7 understand what St. George is about. I appreciate
8 their interest for their programs in the work that
9 they do, but it is-- we already are saturated with
10 programs, as it were and--

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

13 DAVID JONES: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. You can
15 wrap it up if you were about to end right there. We
16 can give you couple seconds.

17 DAVID JONES: Well, was just going to say
18 we have supported Project Hospitality. We have
19 supported Starlight and many, many others. To close
20 this out, I guess, we need to have more input from
21 the people who will be affected by this proposal in
22 this project has been fast tracked and we need to put
23 the brakes on this.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Thank you. Thank
3 you for your testimony. Let's call up the next
4 panelist.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next and final
6 panelist for this group will be Theo Dorian.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

8 THEO DORIAN: Hello. My name is Theo
9 Dorian. I am the president of the St. George Civic
10 Association and our Association opposes both the
11 proposed zoning change in the proposed development.
12 I heard several speakers today talk about the need
13 for engagement with the community and, indeed,
14 Madison Capital was eagerly and frequently pursuing
15 us and our members at the onset of this project.
16 When we presented our list of objections, a few of
17 which I might have a moment to share with you, we
18 never heard from them again. None of us have ever
19 had any engagement with them. It literally stopped
20 the moment we had imposed this plan. All of the
21 people who have spoken in favor of it today, I note,
22 have been clergy and people from programs outside of
23 St. George and I, like the previous speaker,
24 wholeheartedly endorse and applaud their missions,
25 but a general effort to bring more people to the

2 neighborhood should not be concentrated on this area.

3 There are parts of our neighborhood that can

4 effectively hold taller, denser construction without

5 harm to the existing infrastructure and arride those

6 protections, but this is emphatically not one of

7 them. Speaker Leticia Remauro mentioned that it is

8 surrounded by tall buildings. This is extremely

9 untrue. To date, no down or mid-hill construction--

10 anything east of Hamilton Avenue-- has been higher

11 than the neighboring houses and the buildings across

12 the street, the tallest of them are four to six

13 stories. The very tallest are at the crest of that

14 hill and they already place incredibly heavy burden

15 on the traffic patterns and the water supply and

16 other factors in that area. So, this falls in a

17 district that was only recently rezoned as a special

18 district and, since that time, there has been no

19 construction in the area. Under the current zoning--

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

21 THEO DORIAN: to build a reasonable project

22 that fulfills the goals of many of-- of everybody

23 who spoke today without having to place this

24 extraordinary burden on a block that already is the

25 densest neighborhood of Staten Island. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Theo. Thank
3 you for your testimony today.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will hear from
5 one final speaker on this panel. Richenda Kramer
6 will be next. Richenda Kramer.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

8 RICHENDA KRAMER: Hello?

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi.

10 RICHENDA KRAMER: Okay. It doesn't have
11 video. I am a Staten Islander. I live in the St.
12 George area about a quarter of a mile from the ferry
13 and I totally oppose this project. The Bay Street
14 development plan is planning several hundred
15 apartments that they're putting up. We have already
16 got two Irbi [sp?] Projects that are a quarter of a
17 mile on the other side of the ferry from this
18 proposed project. They haven't been able to hold
19 their tenants and they are very empty, apart from all
20 of the affordable apartments there. There've been
21 other buildings. There was a building at the bottom
22 of Victory Boulevard that also took about-- it took
23 Sandy to make people buy in it. To rent those
24 apartments. There are no services in this area and I
25 don't see how it would be possible to put a

2 supermarket in this project which would need access.

3 I mean, supermarkets have several large deliveries a

4 day and it doesn't sound as if it is going to be

5 possible for them to move in and out of something as

6 the streets of Hamilton Avenue that would be

7 impossible because of the hill. Stuyvesant and

8 Victory and Richmond Terrace are extremely busy and

9 Stuyvesant Place, you can't really take a truck going

10 up there. I mean, I don't understand. And Richmond

11 Terrace, as already noted, is very busy with two bus

12 services. It is also on the route from the bus depot

13 on Rector Street.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

15 RICHENDA KRAMER: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

17 RICHENDA KRAMER: Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Is that the last

19 panelist for this panel?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Any Council members that

22 have questions for this panel?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I see no

24 members with questions for this panel.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
3 more questions for this panel, the witness panel is
4 now excused and, counsel, if you can please call up
5 the next panel.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next panel
7 will include Stephanie Echevarrieta, Benjamin Donsky,
8 Neil Barry, and Joseph Caccamo. We will hear first
9 from Stephanie Echevarrieta followed by Benjamin
10 Donsky.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

12 STEPHANIE ECHEVARRIETA: Can everyone
13 hear me?

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: All right. Stephanie,
15 we've got a big echo here, so hold on one second.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Stephanie, if you
17 have two devices connected with audio, perhaps we
18 could try muting one of those. Stephanie, I think we
19 will try to come back for you in this panel but,
20 again, we will recommend that if you have two devices
21 connected to this meeting, perhaps we will try muting
22 one of them and speaking through the other and we
23 will come back to you. We will go to Benjamin Donsky
24 and then Neil Barry.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 BENJAMIN DONSKY: Good afternoon, Council
3 members. Thank you for the opportunity to speak. My
4 name is Benjamin Donsky. I am an urban planner, but
5 today I'm here as a Staten Island resident who is
6 concerned with both housing affordability and
7 protecting our environment. And because of that, I
8 am strongly in favor of the River North proposal.
9 While some Staten Islanders like to think that our
10 relative geographic isolation translates to being
11 insulated from the city's larger . It is
12 increasingly difficult for young families like mine
13 to afford to live here. Families are priced out of
14 apartments that have multiple bedrooms because
15 roommates with two incomes and no kids can afford to
16 pay more in rent. And the problem on the North Shore
17 is particularly acute because it is the part of the
18 island that is most impacted by rising rents in
19 Manhattan and Brooklyn. While this project won't
20 solve our housing shortage all by itself, it is part
21 of a much larger solution not only for the borough,
22 but for the entire city. We also need to relieve
23 pressure to develop wetlands and environmentally
24 sensitive areas in Staten Island and concentrating
25 residential density new major public transit

2 facilities will help to begin to correct this
3 unsustainable course that we are on. I am personally
4 the owner of a two unit house in walking distance of
5 a Staten Island railroad stop. The second unit is a
6 one bedroom apartment and, while increasing the
7 number of transit accessible one bedroom apartments
8 is against my own direct, immediate financial
9 interests, I want my kids to be able to afford to
10 live nearby when they become adults and I recognize
11 the importance of this project for the greater
12 community. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you,
14 Benjamin, for your testimony.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will hear
16 from Neil Barry and then Joseph Caccamo.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

18 NEIL BARRY: Hello. My name is Neil
19 Barry. Yes. Can you hear me?

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: We can hear you, Neil.

21 NEIL BARRY: Yes. I thank you for the
22 opportunity to talk in front of this zoning. Council
23 member Rose, who is [inaudible 03:54:57]. She's
24 good. Listen, I just heard Benjamin speak about
25 what was just talked about. I don't have a prepared

1 statement. The only thing he left out of there is it
2 is such a segregated community, Staten Island. And
3 so that isolation is intentional and is by design and
4 anything that is uncomfortable to someone is Staten
5 Island is they don't want to move forward. And
6 there's been many projects and they keep blaming it
7 on the project itself, but it's the people. The
8 people don't like the projects because they don't fit
9 the design of the segregation that is in these
10 communities. I have some very good friends around
11 here, but we need to be a little bit more effective
12 than a little bit more honorable about the people.
13 Like the young lady from [inaudible 03:55:32]. Two
14 is a prime example of, given a visual opportunity to
15 see these high-rises and what it might look like to
16 maybe-- you know, especially some of our neighbors
17 like New Brighton and West Brighton. They have never
18 seen the opportunities that exist and maybe with
19 these three buildings and these outlets and this
20 baseball field and the [inaudible 03:55:52] that's
21 not in service, there is an opportunity. So I'm not
22 coming at it from the zoning. This is ridiculous.
23 This has been, for years, the same zoning and things
24 change and people have to accept change and they
25

2 don't want to accept change. Things are different
3 now. There's diversity. There should be some
4 inclusion in every area. I didn't come to talk long
5 because I'm working right now, but I thank you for
6 the opportunity. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next speaker
9 will be Joseph Caccamo, and then we will try to get
10 Stephanie Echevarrieta, again. Next speaker is
11 Joseph Caccamo.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

13 JOSEPH CACCAMO: Council members, my name
14 is Joe Caccamo. I am speaking today in support of
15 River North. Thank you for allowing me the
16 opportunity to testify about this important project.
17 The developers behind River North have a record of
18 actually delivering on the proposals that they put
19 forward. The proposals in particular include
20 investments into the North Shore community that is
21 sorely needed. With approximately 225 units of
22 affordable housing, ample public open space, and
23 improved sidewalks and streetscapes, River North will
24 bolster the North Shore status as a gateway to Staten
25 Island in its many restaurants, retail, and cultural

2 institutions. Furthermore, I was pleased to hear
3 about the partnerships that the River North team has
4 formed as a part of this project. For instance,
5 River North team is working with Building Skills New
6 York to ensure Staten Island others can access and be
7 trained for construction jobs before, during, and
8 after the development of River North project. I was
9 even more pleased to hear that the River North team
10 is working with community organizations and
11 stakeholders that I know interest to ensure that
12 these opportunities reach the people of Staten
13 Island. Again, thank you for hearing my testimony
14 today and I urge you to vote in favor of River North.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you for your
16 testimony today, Joseph.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And now we will
18 just see if we can reach Stephanie Echevarrieta.
19 Stephanie Echevarrieta. Chair, pleased stand by and
20 we will see if we can bring her in.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

22 STEPHANIE ECHEVARRIETA: Hello?

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Hi, Stephanie. How are
24 you?

2 STEPHANIE ECHEVARRIETA: Hi. I
3 apologize for that before.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: No. No worries.

5 STEPHANIE ECHEVARRIETA: Good
6 afternoon, members of the Zoning and Franchises
7 Subcommittee. My name is Stephanie Echevarrieta and
8 I am here today in support of River North. As the
9 program assistant for Youth Filled Impact, I
10 responsible for the management of the office as well
11 as to help support the students in their community
12 service efforts. Because I work closely with them,
13 you see the ways in which stable opportunities and
14 resources can help change their lives. As students
15 are provided with [inaudible 03:58:47] which builds
16 leadership, strength, and work ethic and provides
17 opportunity for critical thinking, this is why we
18 need thoughtful partners to bring new housing jobs in
19 community facilities to the area. This will allow
20 our community to grow and flourish. Our borough,
21 although sometimes forgotten, is a community of
22 ambition, aspirational youth, and hard-working New
23 Yorkers. We deserve to have a River North. It will
24 fill a serious housing gap, providing apartments for
25 those of varying income levels, including our youth

2 and their families. It will also help spur local
3 businesses which means new jobs for our students and
4 neighbors. These are not little things. This is how
5 we change generations future, by showing them that
6 there is a community that supports. I hope you will
7 vote in favor as I truly think this project will be
8 an opportunity to help hundreds of Staten Island you
9 and young adults. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Stephanie.
11 Thank you for our testimony today. Is this the last
12 panelist?

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, that was
14 the last speaker on this panel.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Do we have any
16 Council members establish this panel any questions?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Chair. I see
18 no members with questions for the panel.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
20 questions for this panel, the witness panel is now
21 excused. And, counsel, if you can please call up the
22 next panel.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any
24 other members of the public at this time who wish to
25 testify on the River North rezoning proposal, please

2 press the raise hand button now. Chair, the meeting
3 will briefly stand at ease while we check for any
4 additional members. Chair, I see no other members
5 of the public who wish to testify on this item.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. There being no
7 other members of the public who wish to testify on LU
8 numbers 842, 843, and 844 for the River North
9 rezoning proposal, the public hearing is now closed
10 in the items are laid over. That concludes today's
11 business and I will remind the viewing public that
12 for anyone wishing to submit written testimony for
13 items that were heard today, please submit it by
14 emailing to landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair?

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yes?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Pardon me. Before
18 you say the next thing, we will-- With your
19 permission, I'll just close the vote.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Oh, I'm sorry. Yep.
21 Absolutely.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of six in
23 the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no
24 abstentions, the items are approved and referred to
25 the fall Land Use Committee.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Great. And thank you.

3 And, with that, I would like to now thank the members
4 of the public, my colleagues, the Subcommittee
5 counsel, land use and other Council staff, as well as
6 the sergeant-at-arms for participating in today's
7 meeting. This meeting is hereby adjourned. Thank
8 you very much.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 10, 2021