|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Committee on Higher Education: | Emi Briggs, *Counsel*Chloë Rivera, *Senior Policy Analyst*Michele Peregrin, *Financial Analyst* |
| Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and international Intergroup Relations: | Brenda McKinney, *Counsel*Cristy Dwyer, *Legislative Policy Analyst*Aliya Ali, *Principal Financial Analyst* |



**The Council of the City of New York**

Briefing Paper of the Human Services Division

Jeffrey Baker*, Legislative Director*

Andrea Vazquez*, Deputy Director*

**Committee on Higher Education**

Hon. Inez D. Barron, *Chair*

**Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations**

Hon. Jimmy Van Bramer, *Chair*

**October 6, 2021**

**Oversight: CUNY Cultural Corps and Service Corps**

1. **Introduction**

 On October 6, 2021, the Committee on Higher Education, chaired by Council Member Inez D. Barron, and the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations, chaired by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer, will hold a joint oversight hearing on the *CUNY Cultural Corps and Service Corps*. Witnesses invited to testify include representatives from the City University of New York (“CUNY” or “University”) Administration and the New York City (“NYC” or “City”) Department of Cultural Affairs (DCLA), as well as the Professional Staff Congress at CUNY, the University Student Senate, the University Faculty Senate, student groups, advocacy groups and organizations, and other interested stakeholders.

1. **Background**

*City University of New York*

CUNY was established in 1961 pursuant to state legislation that united seven existing municipal colleges and a graduate school into an integrated citywide system of public higher education.[[1]](#footnote-1) Today, CUNY is the largest urban public university in the United States (U.S.) serving more than 271,000 degree and non-degree seeking students and over 228,000 adult and continuing education course registrations across the City.[[2]](#footnote-2) With more than 1,400 academic programs, 200 majors leading to associate and baccalaureate degrees, and 800 graduate degree programs, CUNY offers learning opportunities at every level—from certificate courses to Ph.D. programs—through a system that now includes seven community colleges, 11 senior colleges, the Macaulay Honors College, five graduate and professional schools, and an assortment of research centers, institutes and consortia.[[3]](#footnote-3)

For the fall 2019 semester,[[4]](#footnote-4) total University enrollment identified as majority (30.2 percent) Hispanic; 25.2 percent Black; 21.2 percent Asian/Pacific Islander; 23.1 percent white; and 0.3 percent American Indian/Alaska Native.[[5]](#footnote-5) Among senior colleges, white students comprised the majority (27.1 percent) of enrollment, while 26.2 percent identified as Hispanic; 23.3 percent Asian/Pacific Islander; 23.1 percent Black; and 0.3 percent American Indian/Alaska Native.[[6]](#footnote-6) Among community colleges, majority (38.1 percent) of students identified as Hispanic; 29.2 percent Black; 17 percent Asian/Pacific Islander; 15.3 percent white; and 0.4 percent American Indian/Alaska Native.[[7]](#footnote-7)

 According to the CUNY 2018 Student Experience Survey (SES),[[8]](#footnote-8) 17 percent of community college student respondents have children that they are financially supporting, compared to 11 percent of senior college students.[[9]](#footnote-9) With regard to food insecurity, 11 percent of community college students respondents said they were “always” or “usually” worried about having enough food in the past 12 months, while nine percent of senior college student respondents “always” or “usually” worried.[[10]](#footnote-10) In response to whether they currently have a regular and adequate place to sleep, five percent students across the University said no.[[11]](#footnote-11) Additionally, 56 percent of respondents said they had a job that paid, and 53 percent of respondents worked 21 to 35+ hours over a typical week.[[12]](#footnote-12) Lastly, because the 2018 SES does not include student responses to socio-economic status, according to the 2016 SES, 52 percent of respondents across the University reported a household income of $29,999 or less, 32 percent of whom reported a household income of $14,999 or less.[[13]](#footnote-13)

*The Importance of Internships*

In today’s job market, college graduates need more than just their degree to be competitive.[[14]](#footnote-14) Employers are interested in hiring people with experience and, for college students, that often means an internship.[[15]](#footnote-15) Per the National Association of Colleges and Employers (NACE),

*An internship is a form of experiential learning that integrates knowledge and theory learned in the classroom with practical application and skills development in a professional setting. Internships give students the opportunity to gain valuable applied experience and make connections in professional fields they are considering for career paths; and give employers the opportunity to guide and evaluate talent.*[[16]](#footnote-16)

Academic internships, which are three-way partnerships among an institution of higher education, the internship site and the student, offer students meaningful work experience that gives them an edge they would not have otherwise.[[17]](#footnote-17) In fact, education experts consider internships to be a “high-impact practice” that all institutions of higher education should strongly encourage students to pursue during their enrollment,[[18]](#footnote-18) while others argue that they should be required for graduation.[[19]](#footnote-19)

According to the Association of American Colleges and Universities’ 2021 report, *How College Contributes to Workforce Success*, which presents findings on their survey of representative samples of executives and hiring managers from companies and organizations that employ college graduates, more than four-in-five employers would be either “somewhat more likely” or “much more likely” to consider hiring recent college graduates if they had completed an active or applied experience in college.[[20]](#footnote-20) At the top of the experience list was internships and apprenticeships, followed by working in community settings with diverse community partners.[[21]](#footnote-21) Moreover, multiple studies have shown that students graduating with internship experiences, in general, are more likely than students without those experiences to find employment upon graduation.[[22]](#footnote-22)

However, for many low-income college students, internships are not always a viable option[[23]](#footnote-23) as many are unpaid.[[24]](#footnote-24) The National Survey of College Internships (NSCI) 2021 Report, which presents findings from more than 12,000 U.S. college students who participated in the study in the spring of 2021, found that nearly 40 percent of internships were unpaid.[[25]](#footnote-25) While, in general, an intern is only exempt from the requirements of the New York State Minimum Wage Act and Wage orders if they are not in an employment relationship (per the U.S. Department of Labor[[26]](#footnote-26)), not-for-profit organizations and institutions of any type may have unpaid interns, if they meet all the criteria for an intern who is not in an employment relationship.[[27]](#footnote-27)

Effectively, unpaid internships can act as a gatekeeping mechanism keeping low-income, first-generation and/or students of color from participating in potentially life-changing experiences and even in particular industries.[[28]](#footnote-28)

*The Importance of Diversity within the Role of Art and Culture*

The arts are among the most impactful ways to “effect social change, explore racial and ethnic representations and reflect a community’s history and identity, and provide an opportunity to engage diverse audiences in transformational learning.”[[29]](#footnote-29) Encouraging and supporting the arts and culture community is important as it has been shown that art can have therapeutic properties that provide comfort in disquieting times.[[30]](#footnote-30) Amplifying diverse voices in the arts enables creativity and problem solving in all areas.[[31]](#footnote-31) It also helps both individuals and organizations produce better outcomes and results.[[32]](#footnote-32)

While culturally diverse BIPOC[[33]](#footnote-33) and LGBTQ+[[34]](#footnote-34) communities in NYC represent and provide an important voice in the City’s art and cultural sector,[[35]](#footnote-35) they continue to face numerous disparities and barriers to equity and equality.[[36]](#footnote-36) A recent DCLA study found that in NYC, staff at cultural institutions are on average 38 percent people of color and 62 percent white non-Hispanic.[[37]](#footnote-37) In contrast, U.S. Census data shows 67 percent of NYC’s population identifies as BIPOC and 33 percent white non-Hispanic.[[38]](#footnote-38) The data also revealed disproportionate representation by pay-grade and position, where positions such as “Curator”[[39]](#footnote-39) were primarily held by individuals identifying as white, while the jobs with the fewest white workers were maintenance and security.[[40]](#footnote-40) Advocates assert that the COVID-19 pandemic has made such gender, racial, and economic disparities “even worse overall,”[[41]](#footnote-41) whith some research showing that minority and immigrant-serving arts organizations in NYC have been the hardest hit by the pandemic.[[42]](#footnote-42)

In the last year, many of the City’s cultural institutions have also entered into virtual dialogues about the impact of systemic inequities within their own community. Several groups have formed organically, such as Culture@3’s[[43]](#footnote-43) “anti-racism working groups,” to consider next steps.[[44]](#footnote-44) While some organizations have sought to “re-develop their conception of their collection and audit their institutions as a whole”[[45]](#footnote-45) to evaluate appropriate representation that amplifies all voices, other attempts have been denounced as little more than quickly posted or tokenistic “we must do more”-type statements on cultural websites, with some offerings being met with outright skepticism, and described as “gestures that felt both aggrandizing and too little, too late.”[[46]](#footnote-46) Specifically, the Metropolitan Museum of Art was criticized for “its apparent silence on the issue of ongoing Black Lives Matter protests[[47]](#footnote-47) around the world,” and the Whitney Museum of American Art cancelled its *Collective Actions: Artist Interventions In a Time of Change* exhibition when it came under fire for exploiting the artists in the collection, rather than uplifting their voices.[[48]](#footnote-48) Thus despite these efforts, and despite the conversations and acknowledgement about the role of systemic racism and discrimination, advocates argue that there is more work to do, especially at the City level.[[49]](#footnote-49) For example, despite the agency’s efforts to enhance diversity and address issues around discrimination and the arts,[[50]](#footnote-50) DCLA still does not have a dedicated page on their website for the LGBTQ+ community or a dedicated gender or LGBTQ+ liaison,[[51]](#footnote-51) both of which are suggestions for improvement that have been made to the agency in the past.

*CUNY Cultural Corps*

In response to a 2015 DCLA survey,[[52]](#footnote-52) which measured diversity among employees and board members of over 1,000 cultural organizations within the five boroughs, “each with specific ties to communities, each with vastly different organizational structures and sizes, and each integral to the diversity of culture that defines New York City,”[[53]](#footnote-53) DCLA launched a 2016 initiative to finance paid internships for CUNY students at 32 cultural organizations, known as the CUNY Cultural Corps.[[54]](#footnote-54) Today, the CUNY Cultural Corps creates opportunities for a diverse cross section of students to experience work in all areas of the City’s cultural sector at museums, concert halls, zoos, and botanical gardens.[[55]](#footnote-55) At present, the internship partners students with paid positions in over 80 non-profit cultural institutions[[56]](#footnote-56) across all artistic disciplines. Participating cultural organizations include The Metropolitan Museum of Art, The New York Botanical Garden, The Queens Museum, The New York City Ballet, Bronx Council on the Arts, DanceNYC, Hi-Arts (Hip-Hop Theater Festival), The Leslie-Lohman Museum, the Morris Jumel Mansion, the Museum of Chinese in America, Queens County Farm Museum, The Jewish Museum, Times Square Alliance, and Wave Hill, to name a few.[[57]](#footnote-57)

 Typically, student Corps members are expected to work 10 hours per week for 24 weeks over two academic semesters (240 hours total), and placements begin in September/October of each school year.[[58]](#footnote-58) In addition to receiving a wage of $15 an hour, prior to starting their site placements, students complete a pre-program professional development training and participate in ongoing cultural enrichment activities throughout the year.[[59]](#footnote-59) Cultural Corps eligibility criteria require students:[[60]](#footnote-60)

* Be working towards a degree at a CUNY college (Community College, Senior College, or Graduate School);
* Be registered for at least 12 credits (for undergraduates) or 9 credits (for graduate students) while enrolled in the program;
* Have a cumulative Grade Point Average of at least 2.5;
* Have earned at least 24 college credits by the end of summer 2021 (12 college credits for community college students);
* Have addressed any remedial education needs prior to beginning Fall 2021 classes;
* Be available to work part-time (12 hours/week) during the semester(s) as part of program; and
* Have the proper work authorization required by the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services.

While little has been published about the effect of the COVID-19 pandemic on the CUNY Cultural Corps program, the Council seeks to learn in detail exactly how students and their partnering organizations have been affected, and as a result, what changes will occur moving forward in the next academic year.

*CUNY Service Corps*

Launched in 2013 in response to local needs resulting from Hurricane Sandy, the CUNY Service Corps is a civic-oriented student workforce development program.[[61]](#footnote-61) It serves as a public service pipeline for CUNY’s diverse student body while also providing students with training, paid work experience, and in some instances college credit.[[62]](#footnote-62) The 24-week program places students in community based organizations and government agencies to work on projects that improve the City’s short- and long-term civic, economic, and environmental sustainability.[[63]](#footnote-63) The projects are focused on four thematic areas: (1) A Healthier City; (2) A More Resilient and Greener City; (3) A Better Educated City; and (4) An Economically Stronger City.[[64]](#footnote-64)

The eligibility criteria for the CUNY Service Corp is similar to that of the Cultural Corps, except it is limited to students enrolled in the five participating campuses: Hostos Community College, John Jay College, LaGuardia Community College, New York City College of Technology and Queens College.[[65]](#footnote-65) In addition, students must meet the following requirements: [[66]](#footnote-66)

* Qualify for Federal Work Study;
* Be enrolled full-time (at least 12 credits for undergraduate and 9 credits for graduate students) in spring 2021 and plan to enroll full-time during the 2021-2022 academic year;
* Have a cumulative Grade Point Average of at least 2.5;
* Have earned at least 24 college credits by the end of summer 2020 (12 college credits for community college students);
* Have addressed any remedial education needs prior to beginning fall 2021 classes;
* Have the proper work authorization required by the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS); and
* Make the one-year commitment to the program.

As the Service Corps is meant to be representative of CUNY’s diverse community, over 40 percent of the Service Corps student body are first generation college students, 50 percent are from low- income households, and almost 40 percent are non-native English speakers.[[67]](#footnote-67)

In addition to providing students with meaningful work experiences, the Service Corps is also intended to help communities and partner organizations to realize concrete benefits.[[68]](#footnote-68) Since its 2013 launch, CUNY Service Corps members have completed over 1 million hours of service at over 150 participating organizations.[[69]](#footnote-69) Seventy-six percent of Service Corps community partners reported that students’ work hours increased the organization’s capacity.[[70]](#footnote-70) Ninety-one percent thought CUNY students and alumni were desirable employees, and 97 percent considered CUNY as an institution that promotes public service.[[71]](#footnote-71) Relatedly, participating students reported gains in workplace skills, personal development, academic motivation, increased career readiness, and awareness of social issues.[[72]](#footnote-72)

1. **Issues and Concerns**

As in all aspects of life, the emergence of the COVID-19 pandemic in early 2020 severely disrupted campus life and compelled institutions of higher education to close physical campuses, cancel intercollegiate sporting events and other activities, shutter dormitories, and move exclusively to remote instruction and learning.[[73]](#footnote-73) Student internship programs were not exempt from such changes. The new NCSI surveyed 12,130 college students between November 2020 and March 2021 in order to better understand student internship participation, access, effectiveness and the overall impact of COVID-19.[[74]](#footnote-74) According to the study, internship participation during the pandemic was very low with only one in five participants reporting having an internship.[[75]](#footnote-75) The shift to online modalities also appeared to complicate access and equity issues.[[76]](#footnote-76) Not only did online internships present technological issues such as insufficient internet access and equipment, online positions were more likely to be unpaid, and participating students were more likely to come from upper-income families.[[77]](#footnote-77)

It appears that the CUNY Service Corps was able to successfully launch its 2019-2020 program, but there is little detail as to how the program specifically responded to the COVID-19 pandemic. It does not appear as though the Service Corps was available to students during the 2020-2021 academic year, but applications for the 2021-2022 academic year are now open.[[78]](#footnote-78) During today’s hearing the Committees will seek a more detailed overview of the Service Corps’ pandemic response and its impact on students.

1. **Finance**

According to the 2020 Mayor’s Management Report, “in Fiscal 2020, DCLA continued to fund CUNY Cultural Corps, one the agency’s signature workforce development programs that creates opportunities for CUNY students to work in the City’s cultural sector.”[[79]](#footnote-79) According to DCLA, the budget allocated to CUNY Cultural Corps for FY22 is $650,000 which is used to cover costs associated with compensating program participants and program management. Additionally, according to the New York City Council Budget, [[80]](#footnote-80) the total funding allocated for CreateNYC initiatives was $1.4 million in Fiscal 2021. CreateNYC[[81]](#footnote-81) is NYC’s cultural plan that provides a long-term framework for promoting greater equity, access, diversity, and expanding opportunities for all residents to participate in the City’s cultural life. CUNY Culture Corps is one of the programs under the CreateNYC initiative.

1. **Conclusion**

At this hearing, the Committees will seek an overview of both the CUNY Cultural and Service Corps as well as information on the programs’ successes and how they can be expanded across the University. Additionally, the Committees are interested in learning about the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on both the Cultural Corps and Service Corps, and how student opportunities and success may have been affected.

1. CUNY, “Mission & History” (n.d.), *available at* <https://www.cuny.edu/about/history/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Office of New York City Mayor Bill de Blasio, Mayor’s Management Report (Sept. 2020), 239, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/mmr2020/2020_mmr.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. CUNY, “Academics” (n.d.), *available at* <https://www.cuny.edu/academics/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Note: Fall 2019 data is the latest available data on CUNY’s website. *See* <https://www.cuny.edu/about/administration/offices/oira/institutional/data/current-student-data-book-by-subject/#Race>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. CUNY Office of Institutional Research and Assessment, Total Enrollment by Race/Ethnicity and Colleges: Percentages, CUNY - Fall 2019 (Apr. 11, 2020), *available at* <https://www.cuny.edu/irdatabook/rpts2_AY_current/ENRL_0015_RACE_TOT_PCT.rpt.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Note: 2018 Student Experience Survey data is the latest available data on CUNY’s website. *See* <https://www.cuny.edu/about/administration/offices/oira/institutional/surveys/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. CUNY, 2018 Student Experience Survey (updated Mar. 9, 2020), *available at* <https://public.tableau.com/app/profile/oira.cuny/viz/2018StudentExperienceSurvey/CoverPage>. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. CUNY, 2016 Student Experience Survey (updated Nov. 23, 2016), *available at* <https://public.tableau.com/app/profile/oira.cuny/viz/2016StudentExperienceSurvey/MainMenu>. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Charles Westerberg and Carol Wickersham, “Internships Have Value, Whether or Not Students Are Paid” The Chronicle of Higher Education (Apr. 24, 2011), *available at* <https://www.chronicle.com/article/internships-have-value-whether-or-not-students-are-paid/?utm_source=pocket_mylist>. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. National Association of Colleges and Employers (2018). Position statement: U.S. internships. Bethlehem,

PA: NACE, *available at* <http://www.naceweb.org/about-us/advocacy/position-statements/positionstatement-us-internships/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. *Id.*; *See also* Office of Disability Employment Policy, Inclusive Internship Programs: A How-to Guide for Employers, U.S. Department of Labor (n.d.), 1, *available at* <https://www.dol.gov/sites/dolgov/files/odep/pdf/inclusiveinternshipprograms.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Kuh, G. D. (2008). *High-impact educational practices: What they are, who has access to them, and why they*

*matter*. Washington, DC: Association of American Colleges and Universities. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. Busteed, B. & Auter, Z. (Nov. 27, 2017). Why colleges should make internships a requirement. Gallup:

<https://news.gallup.com/opinion/gallup/222497/why-colleges-internships-requirement.aspx> [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. Ashley Finley, How College Contributes *to* Workforce Success, Association of American Colleges and Universities (2021), 28, *available at* <https://www.aacu.org/sites/default/files/files/research/AACUEmployerReport2021.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. *See* Callahan, G., & Benzing, C. (2004). Assessing the role of internships in the career-oriented employment of graduating college students. *Education & Training* 46(2), 82-89;*See also* Coco, M. (2000). Internships: A try before you buy arrangement. *SAM Advanced Management Journal* (07497075), 65(2), 41; *See also* D’Abate, C. (2010). Developmental interactions for business students: Do they make a difference? *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies*. 17(2), 143-155. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. *Supra* note 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. *See* Silva, A. (2020). Unpaid internships and equality of opportunity: a pseudo-panel analysis of UN data. Applied Economics Letters, 1-5. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. Matthew T. Hora, Jared Colston, Zhidong Chen and Alexandra Pasqualone, National Survey of College Internships (NSCI) 2021 Report, Center for Research on College-Workforce Transitions at the University of Wisconsin-Madison (2021), 9, *available at* <https://ccwt.wceruw.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CCWT_NSCI-2021-Report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. *See* U.S. Department of Labor, Fact Sheet #71: Internship Programs Under The Fair Labor Standards Act (updated Jan. 2018), *available at* <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/whd/fact-sheets/71-flsa-internships>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. New York State Department of Labor, Wage Requirements for Interns in For-Profit Businesses (2021), *available at* <https://dol.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2021/03/p725.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. Matthew T. Hora, Jared Colston, Zhidong Chen and Alexandra Pasqualone, National Survey of College Internships (NSCI) 2021 Report, Center for Research on College-Workforce Transitions at the University of Wisconsin-Madison (2021), 9, *available at* <https://ccwt.wceruw.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CCWT_NSCI-2021-Report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. *See, e.g*., Californians for the Arts, *Anti-Racism Resources* (last visited Apr. 13, 2021), *available at* <https://www.californiansforthearts.org/anti-racism-resources>. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. Melena Ryzik, Wesley Morris, Mekado Murphy, Reggie Ugwu, Pierre-Antoine Louis, Salamishah Tillet and Siddhartha Mitter, *Art That Confronts and Challenges Racism: Start Here,* NYT (June 4, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/04/arts/racism-writings-books-movies.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. *See, e.g.,* Caroline Turner, *The Business Case for Gender Diversity: Update 2017*, Huffington Post (Apr. 30, 2017), *available at* <https://www.huffpost.com/entry/the-business-case-for-gender-diversity-update-2017_b_590658cbe4b05279d4edbd4b>; Sangeeta Badal, *The Business Benefits of Gender* *Diversity*, Gallup (Jan. 20, 2014), *available at* <https://www.gallup.com/workplace/236543/business-benefits-gender-diversity.aspx>. [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Note: BIPOC is an acronym that stands for Black, Indigenous and People of Color. *See* Sandra E. Garcia, *Where did BIPOC Come From?*, NYT (June 17, 2020*), available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/article/what-is-bipoc.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. LGBTQ+ people use a variety of terms to identify themselves. This Briefing Paper generally utilizes the acronym LGBTQ+, which stands for “lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer.” *See* Human Rights Campaign, *Glossary of Terms* (last visited Apr. 13, 2021), *available at* <https://www.hrc.org/resources/glossary-of-terms?utm_source=GS&utm_medium=AD&utm_campaign=BPI-HRC-Grant&utm_content=454854043827&utm_term=gay%20terms&gclid=Cj0KCQjwpdqDBhCSARIsAEUJ0hP4IjAsJNt8zhev_1LfPiGSrWEtYudyfN6ffuI_iWfD_9L_TAHhwIMaAvoEEALw_wcB>. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. Note: This is especially the case where NYC has the distinction of being one of the largest LGBTQ+ populations in the world, the largest self-identifying lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender community in the U.S. *See* Leonhardt, D, New York Still Has More Gay Residents Than Anywhere Else in U.S., New York Times (Mar. 23, 2015), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/03/24/upshot/new-york-still-has-more-gay-residents-than-anywhere-else-in-us.html?_r=1&abt=0002&abg=0>. [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. S*ee, e.g.,* By Brian Purnell and Jeanne Theoharis, H*ow New York City became the capital of the Jim Crow North,* Washington Post (Aug. 23, 2017), *available at* <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/made-by-history/wp/2017/08/23/how-new-york-city-became-the-capital-of-the-jim-crow-north/>; *See also* Ese Olumhence, *Black New Yorkers Describe Racism as ‘Inescapable’ in Quietly Released Human Rights Report*, The City (June 9, 2020), available at <https://www.thecity.nyc/2020/6/9/21286102/black-new-yorkers-describe-racism-as-inescapable-in-quietly-released-human-rights-report>. [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, *CreateNYC: Equity and Inclusion*, *available at* <https://createnyc.cityofnewyork.us/the-cultural-plan/issue-areas/eq/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. Sami Abu Shumays, *The SVOG Fiasco is Emblematic of Arts Funding in the US (*Apr. 10, 2021), *available at* <https://abushumays.medium.com/the-svog-fiasco-is-emblematic-of-arts-funding-in-the-us-fdd25e7a3397>. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. *See* Hakim Bishara, *Immigrant-serving Arts Organizations Hit Hardest During Pandemic, Study Says* (Dec. 17, 2020), *available at* <https://hyperallergic.com/607491/immigrant-serving-arts-organizations-hit-hardest-during-pandemic-study-says/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. Culture@3 is a daily call for leaders in the New York City art and cultural community, which was launched by the Cultural Institution Group in March 2020 and convenes virtually at 3:00 p.m. each day. Up to 700 leaders are on the listserve or call and regularly discuss issues related to the pandemic, reopening plans, funding and the community. *See, e.g.,* Robin Pogrebin and Michawel Paulson, *The Daily Call that 200 Arts Groups Hope Will Help Them Survive* N.Y. Times, (May 12, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/05/12/arts/coronavirus-new-york-.culture.html> [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Elisa Shoenberger, *What does it mean to decolonize a museum?,* MuseumNext (Sep. 18, 2020), *available at* <https://www.museumnext.com/article/what-does-it-mean-to-decolonize-a-museum/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. Holland Cotter, *Museums are Finally Taking a Stand, But Can They Find Their Footing?*, New York Times (Jun. 11, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/11/arts/design/museums-protests-race-smithsonian.html> [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. *See, e.g.,* Jerusalem Demsas, *The effects of Black Lives Matter protests*, Vox (Apr. 9, 2021), *available at* <https://www.vox.com/22360290/black-lives-matter-protest-crime-ferguson-effects-murder?fbclid=IwAR1rNnGEvrS5CokD69ALE-4jwnvvwFEGyJwoQvnwlFulyR4lZvnLA145vTU>. [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. *See* Nedia Ulaby, *After Protest, Whitney Museum Cancels Show By Artists It Meant To Celebrate,* NPR (Aug. 20, 2020), *available at* <https://www.npr.org/2020/08/25/905955460/after-protest-whitney-museum-cancels-show-by-artists-it-meant-to-celebrate>. [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. Conversations on the Culture@3 daily call; *See also* NYC Museum Educators Roundtable, *NYCMER’s Statement on Racial Violence and Discrimination* (last visited Apr. 14, 2021), *available at* <https://nycmer.org/nycmers-statement-on-racial-violence-and-discrimination/>; Derrick Cliffton, *Activists Demand New York City Pride Be Led by Queer and Trans BIPOC* (Feb. 3, 2021), *available at* <https://www.them.us/story/new-york-city-pride-be-led-by-queer-trans-bipoc>; NYC Department of Cultural Affairs, *CreateNYC LGBTQ Focus Group, Meeting Notes* (Feb. 22, 2017), *available at* <https://createnyc.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/CreateNYC_Appendix-Sect4_LGBTQ.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. *See*, e.g, SMU Data Arts, *Study Compares the Diversity of New York City's Arts and Culture Workforce Against General Population to Identify Gaps* (2019), *available at* <https://culturaldata.org/pages/nyc-workforce-demographics-study>. [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. *See, e.g.,* Amy Zimmer, *Meet NYC's First-Ever Gender Equity Coordinator for Public Schools*

 (Feb. 27, 2017), *available at* <https://www.dnainfo.com/new-york/20170227/upper-west-side/kimberly-shannon-gender-equity-nyc-schools/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. Ithaka, S+R (January 28, 2016). Diversity in the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs Community, *available at* <https://sr.ithaka.org/publications/diversity-in-the-new-york-city-department-of-cultural-affairs-community/> [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. Andrew Chow, “New York City to Help Fund Internships at Cultural Organizations” The New York Times (Sept. 8, 2016) *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/09/09/arts/new-york-city-to-help-fund-internships-at-cultural-organizations.html> . [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. CUNY, Cultural Corps (2021), *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/culturalcorps/> [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. CUNY, Cultural Corps, Participating Organizations List (2021), *available at* <http://www1.cuny.edu/sites/culturalcorps/participating-organizations-list/> [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. *Id*. at 27. <http://www1.cuny.edu/sites/culturalcorps/participating-organizations-list/> [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. CUNY, Cultural Corp, Prospective Host Site FAQ (2021), *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/culturalcorps/prospective-host-site-faq/> [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
59. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
60. CUNY Cultural Corps (2021). Academic Year Internship Eligibility Requirements, *available at* <http://www1.cuny.edu/sites/culturalcorps/academic-year-internship/> [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
61. CUNY Service Corps, About Us*, available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/about/#1456180939571-984052b9-afe5>; CUNY Office of Research, Evaluation & Program Support, Program and Partners, *available at* <https://www.cuny.edu/about/administration/offices/evaluation/programs-partners/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
62. CUNY Service Corps, About Us: Program Overview*, available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/about/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
63. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
64. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
65. *See id.;* CUNY Service Corp, “Application Deadline Extended until March 31st” (Mar. 25, 2019) *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/2019/03/25/application-deadline-extended-until-march-31st/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)
66. CUNY Services Corps, Prospective Members, *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/members/prospective/> [↑](#footnote-ref-66)
67. CUNY Service Corps, *About Us*, *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/about/#1456180939571-984052b9-afe5>. [↑](#footnote-ref-67)
68. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-68)
69. CUNY, Service Corps,About Us: Program Model & Outcomes, *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/about/#1456180934944-038d2b01-c4c0>. [↑](#footnote-ref-69)
70. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-70)
71. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-71)
72. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-72)
73. Andrew DePietro, “Here’s a Look at the Impact of Coronavirus (COVID-19) on Colleges and Universities in the U.S.” FORBES (Apr. 30, 2020), *available at* <https://www.forbes.com/sites/andrewdepietro/2020/04/30/impact-coronavirus-covid-19-colleges-universities/#69a4b76c61a6>. [↑](#footnote-ref-73)
74. Matthew T. Hora, Jared Colston, Zhidong Chen and Alexandra Pasqualone, National Survey of College Internships (NSCI) 2021 Report, Center for Research on College-Workforce Transitions at the University of Wisconsin-Madison (2021), 18, *available at* <https://ccwt.wceruw.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CCWT_NSCI-2021-Report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-74)
75. Kevin Gray, “Study Shows Impact of Pandemic on Internships” National Association of Colleges and Employers (Jun. 11, 2021) *available* at <https://www.naceweb.org/talent-acquisition/internships/study-shows-impact-of-pandemic-on-internships/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-75)
76. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-76)
77. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-77)
78. CUNY Service Corps, *Student Application*, *available at* <https://www1.cuny.edu/sites/servicecorps/members/prospective>. [↑](#footnote-ref-78)
79. 2020 Mayor’s Management Report. Available at <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/mmr2020/2020_mmr.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-79)
80. Report of the Finance Division on the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2021 Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report for the Department of Cultural Affairs. Available at

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2021/03/126-DCLA.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-80)
81. CreateNYC: A Cultural Plan for All New Yorkers. (July 2017). Available at <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/cultureplan/createnyc-finalplan.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-81)