CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

June 16, 2021

Start: 10:13 a.m. Recess: 12:59 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 2

B E F O R E: Alicka Ampry-Samuel

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicka Ampry-Samuel

Diana Ayala Laurie A. Cumbo Ruben Diaz, Sr. Oswald Feliz

Vanessa L. Gibson

Mark Gjonaj Carlos Menchaca Kevin C. Riley

Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

Mark Treyger Jimmy Van Bramer

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Diana Blackwell

Beverly Macfarlane

Margaret Massac

Brian Honan NYCHA

Al Ferguson NYCHA

Vlada Kenniff NYCHA

Josephine Bartlett NYCHA

Diana Blackwell

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Computer has started.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to today's remote New York City Council hearing of the Committee on Public Education. At this time would all panelists please turn on their video for identification purposes. To minimize disruption, please silence your electronic devices. And if you wish to submit testimony, you may do so via email at the following address: testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your cooperation. We are ready to begin.

UNIDENTIFIED: Chair Ampry-Samuel?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good morning,
everyone. This hearing is now [gavel] this hearing
is now coming to order. The Committee on Public
Housing oversight hearing, NYCHA waste management
issues and pest problems, June 16, 2021. We are now
coming to order. I am Alicka Ampry-Samuel and I
chair the Public Housing Committee. I am joined by
Council Members, Council Member Ayala, Council Member
R. Diaz, Sr., Council Member Treyger, Council Member
Riley, Council Member Menchaca, Council Member
Gjonaj, Council Member Feliz, and Council Member

But

with managing garbage storage and removal, along with

mounds of trash taller than some development fences.

24

25

21

22

23

24

25

No New Yorker would consider these conditions acceptable and there is absolutely no reason we should consider them acceptable for our NYCHA residents. As the chair of the Committee of Public Housing I am committed to seeing NYCHA follow through on its plans to solve these problems. Rather than simply sticking a Band-Aid on the issue, NYCHA is working and should be working to address the underlying that are contributing to its waste and pest problems. On January 31, 2019, HUD, NYCHA, and the federal monitor entered into an agreement to address fiscal issues at NYCHA. This included a number of action plans related to mold, heat, lead, and pests that were all approved by the federal monitor. I have chaired hearings on all of the topics related to these action plans and now this is one of the last focal points of that agreement with the release of the pest and waste management plan. This final plan is comprehensive and ambitious. hope is that today's hearing will be a productive conversation on how we can learn more about the plan and how NYCHA is working to change the way it addresses the pest and waste concerns. interested to learn about the practical

2	implementation of NYCHA's plan, how it is being
3	funded, and how COVID-19 has affected the development
4	and rollout of this plan. We will also hear two
5	pieces of legislation. We have a bill from Council
6	Member Cabrera, who was with us today, which would
7	require 311 to directly accept NYCHA complaints and
8	make information on those complaints public. And we
9	also have a resolution at the request of Speaker
10	Johnson calling on the State of New York to pass
11	existing legislation that was introduced in the state
12	by Assembly Member Khaleel Anderson and State Senator
13	Michael Gianaris that would give a prorated rent
14	reduction to tenants who suffer interpretation to
15	their utility services. Together with my colleagues
16	we are seeking to not only identify the challenges,
17	but also work with NYCHA to come up with and bring
18	about real changes and remedies. I also want to say
19	that we are joined this morning by Diana Blackwell
20	from the Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board and
21	local resident, as well as Margaret Massac, NYCHA
22	resident, Claudia Perez from the Washington Houses
23	Resident Council and I'm not sure if Beverly were
24	following this here, from Taft Houses, and Melanie
25	Perez. And so with that I will now turn it over to

1

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

committee counsel, Audrey Sun, to go over some housekeeping rules for today's hearing. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, thanks very much, Ah, before I begin with the housekeeping items, would you like to hear from Council Member Cabrera?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes. Council Member Fernando Cabrera, we'll hear from you now, related to your bill.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, thank you so much, ah, Madam Chair, and to the Committee on Public Housing for the opportunity to allow me to speak on the NYCHA 311 bill 7681 today. I am often frustrated and saddened to stand at press conferences over and over again to complain about the same old problems the NYCHA neighbors are being forced to deal with for so long. Daily NYCHA residents are forced to live in inhumane conditions because of the neglect and lack of transparency of this agency. unimaginable that NYCHA would allow tenants to live without heat in the winter months, to live with rodents and molds in their apartment as, ah, today, Madam Chair, you're leading this, ah, this hearing today and, and going over this specific issue, to

2	live with broken entrance doors which make our
3	tenants unsafe, elevators that at times go without
4	repairs for months, and the lack of cleanliness in
5	the NYCHA staircases. This is why I have submitted
6	this bill that will allow NYCHA residents to finally,
7	finally use the city's 311 system to register
8	complaints and make service requests since NYCHA's
9	system is dysfunctional and unaccountable. This bill
10	will bring transparency and accountability today.
11	Allowing NYCHA buildings to be processed with the 311
12	system just makes sense. The 311 system works, so we
13	should allowing it to work for all. Our NYCHA
14	neighbors are no less than others, so let us not
15	treat them as second-class citizens. Let us, ah,
16	examine our 311 system. The mission is to provide
17	the public with a quick, easy access to all the New
18	York City services and information while offering the
19	best customer services. The 311 also provides
20	insight to improve our city government through
21	accurate and consistent measurement, analysis of
22	service delivery, and now this will be allowed
23	through all of the complaints that will come through,
24	ah, our NYCHA tenants. We're finally gonna have a
25	way to hold them accountable. The council will get

real time, ah, data with 311. Madam Chair, thank you so much for allowing it come, ah, through, ah, this committee. And I want to thank, ah, the staff, our counsel as well, for working on this bill. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I also want to recognize that the resolution that I just referred to with the state is, Council Member Carlos Menchaca introduced that legislation, and I just want to introduce that resolution. I just want to, um, check to see if Council Member Menchaca wanted to speak on this bill, just wanted to double check.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes, ah, can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes.

ya doing, Chair? Ah, really good to be here with you and everyone here on the committee and NYCHA and all the advocates. I, I just want to say that, ah, we are in this council, ah, supporting some state legislation that needs to get passed as soon as possible. The NYCHA Utility Accountability Act is something that really resonates with many members in my district in Red Hook, who, like many of the

2 residents across the entire city, have for years now been plagued by gas stoppages, electrical outages, 3 4 laden, ah, ah, drinking water that has been impacted 5 by lead. Too often those of us fortunate enough to 6 represent NYCHA residents make it a big deal, ah, and 7 come to the press and talk about this openly. bring it to the committee, and we are trying our best 8 to do the work of oversight over this agency. 9 10 has not been enough. And so many of the residents have joined forces to really make it clear that we 11 need, um, relief, cash relief, and that this failure, 12 ah, is not only massive in scale, it has massive 13 14 impact in people's homes and wallets. Ah, this cycle 15 is beyond maddening and needs to stop, and this is 16 why this accountability allows for compensation, compensation for these failures. This is why I'm 17 18 introducing a resolution with the Speaker and the 19 Chair and many other council members, ah, supporting 20 the NYCHA Utility Accountability Act. The bill would prorate rent reductions whenever utility service 21 22 It would, ah, allow for compensation cash 23 relief, ah, at the tune of millions of dollars to our 24 thousands of residents that are impacted every day, 25 across the year, every year. Ah, that's it for me.

2 Thank you, Chair. I'm looking forward to the rest of

3 the conversation today.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so much, Council Member. We've also just been joined by Council Member Van Bramer. And I'll turn it back over to Committee Counsel.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Thank you,

Chair. My name is Audrey Sun. I'm counsel to the

City Council's Committee on Public Housing. Before

we begin, I want to remind everyone that you will be

on mute until you are called on to testify. When it

is your turn to speak I will call your name and you

will be prompted to unmute. We will now hear from an

opening panel of members of the public, ah, including

NYCHA residents, followed by council member

questions. In order to hear from everyone, the clock

will be set to two minutes. First we will hear from

Diana Blackwell, followed by Beverly Macfarlane.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time begins.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Blackwell, I believe you're still muted.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ms. Blackwell, you need to accept the unmute request. I'm going to send one to you now. I'm going to send it to you one more

2 time. When you get the request, just accept it and
3 unmute. No?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: All right, Ms.

Blackwell, while we try to resolve this issue we'll

move to the next members of the public, ah, Beverly

Macfarlane, and then we'll return to you. Thanks so

much for your patience.

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: Yes, good morning, everyone.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

thank you for having me, um, and I'm glad that these, um, bills are up for to be passed, because it's very important. Um, we are living in conditions where, um, they, that NYCHA have imposed this AWS service that these buildings are not [inaudible] but have not implemented staffing so our buildings and our garbage have not been cleaned. The rodents are coming into people homes and in the buildings. Um, this is a constant thing with, um, sitting with NYCHA, ah, management, leadership, and it's still, it's continuing to happening. Ah, you know, this is preventive, this should have been preventive maintenance during the whole course of, ah, during

2	this whole pandemic. This has not been, it either
3	has been no cleaning of our buildings or, um, you
4	know, it's just, it's a shame that HUD is given NYCHA
5	all this money and they have not been utilizing the
6	money on our residents' services. And these are
7	quality of life issues here. Um, and unfortunately
8	they have not been doing what was utilized. We can't
9	call 311, like you said. Um, we have to call, ah,
10	the 718 number. The 718 ticketing is they close a
11	ticket, open a ticket, close a ticket, and it's just
12	been a very, um, stressful for our residents and,
13	and, and this is a quality of life issue. So I urge
14	you all to pass these bills and not give NYCHA any
15	more, um, authorization in terms of, you know, you
16	know, they trying to pass us off as to these resident
17	management companies and private developers under the
18	Blueprint for Change Doors, which we as resident
19	leaders are against. So this is another opportunity
20	for them to see that they're not, ah

UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired.

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: Thank you.

24

21

22

23

25

## COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

2		COMMITTEE COUNSEL:	Thank you.	We will
3	now return	to Diana Blackwell,	followed by	Margaret
4	Massac.			

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin 6 now.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Blackwell, did you receive a prompt to unmute? OK. While we continue to work to resolve this issue we'll move to Margaret Massac.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin now.

MARGARET MASSAC: Um, good morning,
everybody. Ah, thank you for this meeting. But what
I would like to see is accountability for NYCHA, not
just in the form of tenants getting paid and because
we don't know if they're gonna use that against us,
ah, to say well they don't have enough money to do
whatever, is that there's some kind of, um,
discipline for the NYCHA, um, staff, for not doing
what they supposed to do, because from all the way we
have the monitor and people are still doing
[inaudible]. This makes no sense. I don't
understand why some people are not getting fired,
some people are not getting suspended for not doing

2	their job, because they cannot be above the law. If
3	they messing up with tenants and not keeping their
4	promises they need to be held accountable and, um, I
5	appreciate all the work that the council people are
6	doing, but I would like to please, and then also now
7	they have because of COVID when you put in a ticket
8	they don't put no appointment time in, and they still
9	come, if you're still gonna come why can't you point
10	an appointment to say you're gonna come a certain
11	day? Ah, because now they don't work with you with
12	appointments, so we almost worse than we were before
13	because we don't know when these people are coming,
14	especially for people that work. We can't take every
15	day off because we think they may come. So it's
16	like, um, they need to know that there's consequences
17	coming their way. And I would like to see a bill
18	with that because no job should be above the law,
19	where they can do what they want to do and just clock
20	in, go home, and make all that money mistreating
21	people and not doing their job. Thank you very much.
22	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thanks so much. Ah,
23	Diana Blackwell, we'll return to you one more time

and if it doesn't work we'll move to testimony from

25 the administration and then return to you.

24

23

24

25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK. At this time we'll move into testimony from the administration. Ah, reminder to council members to please use the Zoom hand raise function if you would like to ask any questions. Ah, I will call on council members in turn in the order that they used the, ah, raise hand function. Um, after we hear from NYCHA we will hear testimony from the remaining members of the public. I will now administer the oath to the administration, which is represented by Brian Honan, Al Ferguson, Vlada Kenniff, Josephine Bartlett, and Andrew Korbul. After I say the oath please wait for me to call your name and respond one by one. Please raise your right Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this committee and to respond honestly to council member questions? Brian Honan?

BRIAN HONAN: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Al Ferguson?

AL FERGUSON: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Vlada Kenniff?

VLADA KENNIFF: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Josephine Bartlett?

JOSEPHINE BARTLETT: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Andrew Korbul?

UNIDENTIFIED: Audrey, ah, Andrew, ah,
Andrew is here for support. He won't be taking
questions. I'm not sure if he needs to be. Ah, I
mean, it's up to the council rules, but he won't be
speaking today. He's just, he's here for support.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, understood.

Thank you. You may begin when ready.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Chair Alicka
Ampry-Samuel, members of the Committee on Public
Housing, other distinguished members of the City
Council, NYCHA residents, and members of the public,
good morning. I am Al Ferguson, NYCHA's vice
president of waste management and pest control. I am
pleased to be joined by Vlada Kenniff, vice president
of energy and sustainability, Brian Honan, vice
president of intergovernmental relations, and
Josephine Bartlett, deputy director of the pest
control department. I'd like to note that I have
over 32 years of experience with the New York City
Department of Sanitation. I started as a sanitation
worker and rose through the ranks, ultimately
finishing my career as the three-star chief of

25

2 Citywide Collection, Recycling, and Containerization. Thank you for the opportunity to discuss the progress 3 NYCHA is making in the critical areas of waste 4 5 management and pest control, ensuring that our buildings and grounds are clean and as pest-free as 6 7 possible is a top priority at the authority. We know our residents are directly impacted by these issues 8 and we are working hard to ensure that NYCHA's waste 9 10 management and pest control methods are comprehensive, modern, and adaptive as the industries 11 evolve. We have made significant changes to our 12 approaches in these areas. We continue to implement 13 14 new strategies and have long-term projects on the 15 horizon that will further improve residents' quality 16 of life. Over the past years, over the past few years we have created a dedicated waste management 17 18 department that focuses on preventing and combatting 19 pest issues, developed IT enhancements that 20 facilitate our work, and trained staff on the 21 integrated pest management. NYCHA is budgeted for 22 131 exterminators, of which we currently have 109 23 exterminators on staff. This includes the 22 new 24 exterminators that we hired as part of the

neighborhood Rat Reduction Initiative. We are

25

2 working on hiring additional exterminators. York City Department of Citywide Administrative 3 Services is in a process of certifying the new 4 exterminator civil service list. Our pest control 5 department is also in the process of onboarding 6 7 additional exterminators by hiring residents via the NYCHA Resident Training Academy. Under the 8 leadership of Chair Russ and in accordance with the 9 10 2019 HUD agreement, we are transforming our, our, our organization to provide improved critical services to 11 our residents and we are investing in a significant 12 amount of funding and human capital to ensure 13 14 results, successful results. The federal monitor, 15 Bart Schwartz, approved, excuse me, approved our 16 paste, our pest and waste management action plan in January of this year. The action plan is our map of 17 18 ensuring that our practices meet our goals of more 19 effective waste management and pest control. It is 20 our commitment to the use of integrated pest management at the authority and the creation of 21 22 developments specific waste management plans for 23 every NYCHA property. This is accomplished by 24 targeted investments and capital upgrades, and a

willingness to reenvision our approaches to pest and

25

2 waste management. A key focus, a key focus of the action plan involves improving the way NYCHA 3 4 collects, stores, and removes waste to meet our goal to remove or store all waste in sealed, rodent-5 resistant containers once every 24 hours. This is so 6 7 important because better waste management means fewer pests as we're eliminating their habitats and sources 8 of food. Today I'll describe some of the waste 9 infrastructure upgrades and programmatic improvements 10 that will enable us to achieve our waste management 11 and pest control goals. NYCHA's current waste 12 infrastructure, which is responsible for managing 13 14 over 200,000 tons of waste every year, is outdated. 15 Since NYCHA's developments were built the amount of 16 waste generated by Americans has tripled. same time, NYCHA's infrastructure hasn't received the 17 18 investments it's needed to keep up with that increase. 19 In fact, more than 80% of our waste assets are past their life cycle and need immediate 20 replacement. The federal monitor approved NYCHA's 21 22 city capital action plan last month, which unlocks 23 over 563 million dollars in funding to help the 24 authority fully upgrade and modernize its waste

infrastructure. Nearly 9 million dollars, ah, in

2 state, city, and federal funds will be added to the 3 city capital action plan. A total investment of 47 4 million dollars toward Mayor de Blasio's Neighborhood Rat Reduction Program has enabled us to accomplish 6 the following: Install larger trash chutes that can 7 accommodate a standard 13-gallon tall kitchen garbage bag on the first level of 15 developments, which 8 helps residents dispose of trash properly. Next, 9 install new interior trash compactors at 38 10 developments, exterior compactors at 16 developments, 11 and 10 bulk crushers and 20 cardboard compacting 12 baling machines, all of which enable us to manage 13 14 waste more effectively and efficiently. Next, we 15 installed over 5000 of, ah, 8000 door sweeps that 16 prevent pests from getting into our buildings, and installed 14 out of 50 rat slabs that eliminate 17 18 places for rodents to live, eat, and breed by 19 replacing the original dirt basement floors with 20 concrete. With this total funding of more than 619 million dollars we'll be able to replace aging waste, 21 22 recycling, and bulk waste equipment at 324 sites 23 across 197 developments. Better waste management 24 means fewer pests and fewer pests leads, ah, lead to 25 an increase in the overall quality of life for our

2	residents. In conjunction with the increased funding
3	for infrastructure, we are making programmatic and
4	design improvements. For instance, at the beginning
5	of the pandemic we instituted a Clean to the Ground
6	Initiative to keep waste yards trash- and litter-
7	free, an especially challenging task considering that
8	stay-at-home mandates resulted in a significant
9	increase in the amount of household waste that was
10	generated at our developments. We worked with our
11	close agency partner, the New York City Department of
12	Sanitation, to obtain a sizable increase in the
13	number of DSNY-funded bulk container dump tickets.
14	This increase represents the removal of nearly 12,000
15	additional tons of bulk waste from NYCHA developments
16	last year. We've worked with the carting vendors who
17	currently service most of our bulk containers to
18	ensure that they increase capacity so that they could
19	increase the frequency of bulk waste removal at our
20	developments. To demonstrate the benefits of
21	increased waste collection frequency at a small group
22	of developments we purchased two six-yard rear-loader
23	compacting garbage trucks that can each hold
24	approximately three tons of household refuse per
25	load. These trucks are equipped with the latest in

25

2 Vision Zero safety divine, designs, including 360degree cameras for enhanced driver awareness, and 3 have the latest in hybrid, ah, that's both diesel and 4 electric technology. NYCHA has also worked with our 5 6 sanitation department partners to develop a recycling 7 reset pilot program to improve recycling rates at 12 sites - Baruch, Baruch Addition, Bushwick, Highland, 8 Butler, Marcy, Morris One and Two, Reis One and Two, 9 10 Webster, and Morrisania. The results are tangible and sustainable. Several sites, such as Baruch and 11 Reis Houses are recycling at record-high rates. 12 the pilot began in early 2020 Baruch Houses reported 13 14 six bags of recyclable material for their weekly 15 In November 2020 they reported 253 bags of pickup. 16 recyclables. Reis Houses reported 384 bags during 17 that same period. The waste management department is 18 finalizing the individual waste management action 19 plans for each of our developments. We have gathered 20 development-specific data via both virtual and in-21 person site visits over the past year. By cataloging 22 and mapping our current waste assets and reviewing 23 various critical aspects of waste management 24 operations and development-specific challenges with

NYCHA staff. We effectively created short, medium,

25

2 and long term action plans to improve waste management at each site. Some of the solutions 3 4 include providing additional bulk tickets each month 5 as well as shepherding the procurement process for 6 faster compactor replacement. We are also finalizing 7 a newly created scorecard cleanliness rating system with the assistance of the federal monitor. This 8 will provide an objective rating regarding the 9 cleanliness of critical areas in both the interior 10 and exterior of all of our developments and will 11 allow us to highlight areas that need attention help 12 redirect resources on a development level. 13 14 the authority released the NYCHA 2.0 Waste Management 15 Plan, a comprehensive set of strategies for 16 delivering state-of-the-art infrastructure and providing residents with convenient locations for 17 18 disposing recyclables and food waste, all to greatly 19 reduce pests and make our developments cleaner. Τо 20 advance the waste management plan, this year we released requests for proposals for the redesign of 21 22 seven waste yards, and for a new pneumatic waste 23 collection system at Polo Grounds Towers, all to start construction in 2022. By 2028 we will have a 24

completely overhauled, sorry, by 2028 we will have

25

2 completely overhauled the waste yards at 194 3 developments. These redesigns will replacing aging waste infrastructure with the new years that will 4 5 have an increased footprint, have more operational functionality, increase additional much-needed 6 7 recycling infrastructure, and have more reliable compactors, making waste handling more efficient, 8 thereby improving the quality of life of our 9 10 residents. The new waste yards will be more aesthetically pleasing than past designs and will 11 incorporate past resident feedback. The pneumatic 12 waste collection system at Polo Grounds will 13 14 transport waste from each building underground to a 15 centralized facility, where it will be compacted in a 16 sealed pest-resistant container. This new system will reduce the amount of labor used to transport 17 18 waste and will minimize exposure to pests. 19 summer we are launching a mattress recycling program 20 at 25 developments to containerize, remove, and recycle unsightly mattresses while providing job 21 22 opportunities for NYCHA residents. It will 23 ultimately be scaled up to 100 or so developments. 24 Over the past year we piloted two dedicated exterior

cardboard compactors at Marcy and Morris One Houses.

2 This resulted in recycling of more than 116 tons of cardboard. We are evaluating the use of in-sink food 3 4 disposals at select sites to reduce organic waste from household waste streams, eliminate food waste 5 food sources from pests, and divert organic materials 6 from landfills. Our farms at NYCHA sites are also 7 helping to achieve these goals. Since 2016 our led 8 partner, Green City Forest, has collected over 21,000 9 pounds, or 10-1/2 tons, of compostable food scraps 10 from NYCHA residents. One Green City Forest alone 11 and former NYCHA resident, Domingo Morales, is 12 working to expanding composting at NYCHA developments 13 14 through an initiative he started called Compost 15 In 2020 Compost Power organized composting at Power. 16 five NYCHA developments that can now process at least 50 tons of organic waste per year. Compost Power 17 18 provides NYCHA residents with the opportunity to 19 reduce waste from landfills while creating more eco-20 friendly drops. Our waste management efforts are being carried out in partnership through outreach and 21 22 education programs led by NYCHA, residents, and other 23 stakeholders. For example, NYCHA is developing a campaign for a clean NYCHA to better communicate with 24 25 and engage residents on proper waste management and

2 recycling programs. The campaign is rolling out at 3 five developments this summer. It will apply the tools of public awareness and behavior change to 4 5 define and promote a positive waste culture at NYCHA. 6 It will feature highly visible signage and other 7 visual prompts developed in close collaboration with and input from residents, community-based 8 organizations, and other advocates. Mayor de 9 Blasio's City Clean-Up Corps Initiative has granted 10 us 7 million dollars in funding to hire 1000 seasonal 11 workers who will keep our grounds clean and well 12 maintained. This include waste handling and 13 14 assisting with our pest control work. An integral 15 cornerstone of our new approach to pest control was 16 the agency-wide roll-out of the industry gold 17 standard - integrated pest management. IPM focuses 18 on sustainable and long-term solutions that target 19 the underlying cause causes of pest infestations. 20 Exterminators perform a thorough inspection, looking forward and removing sources of food and water, as 21 22 well as any points of entry. They perform exclusion 23 work such as caulking and installation of escutcheon plates while minimize the use of pesticides. We 24 25 incorporated IPM protocols into our IT systems and

25

we desperately need for critical capital investments

\_ (

and we will continue to engage our residents to make sure that their needs and priorities are incorporated into the work we're doing to improve pest and waste management practices. Thank you. We are happy to answer any questions you may have.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Wooh, thank you. Thank you, Mr. Ferguson, um, and welcome aboard.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I, I, I have to say that I am, um, pleased to hear you have such an extensive background and experience and working history, previous working history at Department of Sanitation. And, um, it seems as though just from your testimony that you have a lot of work ahead, but you've been implementing a lot of work, um, utilizing your expertise and experiences. So I do appreciate that. Um, so let's just get right into it. With, I represent 27 NYCHA developments just within my own council district, and my constituent services, constituent complaints, clearly, um, have a lot to do with pest control and waste management. Um, but as we focus on our health and as we focus on our environment and sustainability

and just seeing what happened during 2020 with the pandemic, we have to make sure that we are being strategic in the work that we're doing, um, proving information to the residents and really being, um, focused on health and safety and just an overall clean environment. Um, and so with that I want to just begin with a lot of background questions. How many pest complaints did NYCHA have in 2019, 2020, and right now in 2021 for each pest type, and that is

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you,

Chair, for that question. Ah, I'm gonna refer you to

my deputy director of pest control, ah, Josephine

Bartlett.

rats, mice, cockroaches, and bed bugs.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Thank you,

Chair, for the question. So in 2019 there were 3434

verified rat complaints, and 85,341 mice, bedbugs,

and roaches. In 2020 it was 4741, ah, verified rats

and 46,492 of the other three public health pest

types. And so far this year we have 1204 verified

rat complaints and, um, 15,600 so far this year in

the other pest types.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And right now to date are you able to tell us how many open

complaints, like how many, um, complaints that are open right now that you're actively working on for

4 today?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: So as of yesterday when I pulled the numbers we have 4417 extermination work orders open. And this is corrected maintenance work orders, and these are the work orders that come in through the CCC, um, that we will have created it our. It's not preventative maintenance work orders that we also do.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, and can you explain the difference between, so going back to the, the, my first question how many pest complaints did NYCHA have in 2019, 2020, and 2021, and then you gave me a number for 2021. So can you explain the difference between the pest complaints for 2021, what number was that?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Ah, we've got 1204 verified complaints, ah, in rats, and 15,600 for the other three pest types so far this year.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, so the 4417 extermination correction, ah, work orders that you're working on, can you explain what that number

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 is out of the 15,000? Just trying to get some 3 clarity.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: absolutely. So, um, we have inspection work orders, corrective maintenance work orders, and preventative maintenance work orders. The corrective maintenance work orders are what is called in through the CCC, but it's also what, um, our staff when they're on the grounds, if they see a, um, rat burrow that they need to, um, address right then they'll a make a corrective maintenance work order and, um, treat that right then. So that might have been, that was captured when I ran the numbers yesterday. Ah, preventative maintenance work orders, at the beginning of each month we have, um, a p.m. work order that's created for every single building an exterminator goes and does a check of the basement and the grounds. And this is part of our new philosophy and integrated pest management, really inspecting, getting to the root cause, not, trying to get ahead of, um, infestations, not just waiting for, um, it to be told to us. Um, and then there's also inspection work orders that are mostly tied to, um, special initiatives that you heard with the HUD

## COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

2	deliverabl	les, the	target	ed rel	ief pr	rogram,	um,	clean
3	building i	initiativ	re, um,	such	of tha	at natur	ce.	

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. How, how much garbage did NYCHA collect in tons in 2019, 2020, and in 2021?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you for the question. Ah, in, ah, we do not have that information. Ah, that information is maintained by the New York City Department of Sanitation. Ah, and I, I would like, I'd refer you to them for that answer.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [laughs] OK.

So I'm not gonna refer to them. I would like to get that number.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um, especially since you were there for 50 years and then now you're over at NYCHA [laughs].

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK.

 $\label{thm:chairperson ampry-samuel:} And so, and I \\$  say that, you know, just seriously.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So I when I set the stage about where we are today. I just want

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Absolutely, absolutely. Ah, that, I, I will, I'll make the appropriate contacts to get, ah, as much information as we can, but I just want to let you know that, you know, we should be able to, you know, Sanitation should be able to get, ah, containerized information

22

23

24

25

_	
2	because that's recorded at the dumps. Ah, we should
3	be able to get bulk information from them because
4	that's also recorded at the times. Uh, but the only,
5	ah, information that we probably cannot get is for
6	curbside collection material, which represents about
7	half of our developments, ah, because that material
8	is comingled with, ah, the other residential garbage.
9	Ah, of the neighborhood surrounding the developments.
10	It's all on the same route. When they pick up NYCHA
11	they pick up all the, the different, ah, buildings in
12	the neighborhood as well. So they wouldn't be able
13	to pinpoint the tonnage. You know, they can only
14	make guesses or estimates probably on that. But
15	we'll, well continue that conversation. I'll set
16	that up and, ah, you know, I, I look forward to it.
17	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, cool. But
18	just so you know, whenever there's, there's a, a
19	issue with Sanitation or a question, you know, we're
20	gonna look at you like you should know, call
21	somebody.
22	VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes.
23	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Um, all
24	right. Um, what is the common pest complaint that

NYCHA receives? The most common.

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

1718

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you for your question, Chair. Ah, I'm gonna refer you to Josephine Bartlett.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Hi, Chair. Thank you for the question. It's roaches.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. And what is the, what, is there a common complaint even, and I hate to even dive into this part of it, where you, like, you really get into the weeds, but just to understand it. Um, what is the common complaint even within the, the roaches themselves? Because I know that they could be roach infestation where there's roaches everywhere, and then it can also be where, um, you know, you're removing the cabinets, which is something that, you know, they did a story with [inaudible] in my development there, you know, roaches in the cabinets and when you remove them they're just everywhere. Is it when there's, you know, a renovation happening, you know, maintenance work? Can you just?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: So mostly it's low-level roaches that we, um, see and, you know, the resident sees them underneath the sink and in the cabinets. But what I can tell you as part of

integrated pest management, this new approach about
getting to the root causes and sealing up cracks and
holes that these roaches are coming through is that
updated, um, work that exterminators now have to do
is caulking in the cabinets, so like sealing around
all the little cracks in the cabinets so they're not
like getting through. We're also looking for holes,
um, around pipes, um, and stuffing them with, um,
steel wool mesh, um, so that they can't get through
there. Ah, we using the HEPA vacuum, which, um, you
know, can vacuum up their, ah, we call it frazz.
It's the roach poop and wings and skins and things
like that. And it is a way that we can get required
of that, which keeps the roaches coming back, um, and
so we get required of that, and then we use gel, um,
evactly where we see it so more targeted

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. How long does it take NYCHA to resolve a roach infestation, bedbug infestation, rat infestation, or mice infestation? So can you now just go over like the timing with your timeline, or how you resolve these issues when someone calls it in, or if they don't call it in?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Absolutely.

So I'll just keep going with this question. Um, for, um, by the time the, the work order is created till the first time our exterminator goes for rats it's an average of 3.3 days as of last month and, um, all the other three pest types it's an average 4.47 days as of last month. That is not, um, like the completion of the work order when it's, um, a more complicated work order where we're doing, um, leaks, cabinet repair, all of that. It jumps up to bedbugs is 36 days because we have to do follow-ups, it's not just one treatment, unfortunately. 24 days for mice, 15 for rats, um, and 44 for roaches. That's when, and this comes into play [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I heard the number 24. What, [inaudible] again? I wasn't...

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: That is...

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...sure if that 24 hours or 24 days.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Days, it's days. That is not from, to our first look at the situation, though. For, ah, mice, which is the 24 days, um, it is 4.47 days. So from when that first call is made till when our exterminator gets in.

Thank you,

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Has NYCHA implemented its planned enhanced routing "pest-

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you for the question, ah, Chair. Ah, I'm gonna refer again

Chair. Can you clarify on the enhanced routing? CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So I was actually under the impression that there was the new planned strategy for when you receive a complaint and just the timeline coming in from the action plan itself and, um, and, and that's why I wanted the clarity [inaudible] four days because I remember reading something, um, that mentioned, um, like if there's a, a rat infestation it would be a 24-hour

> DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...[inaudible] and address the issue within were hours. And so just what you mentioned, the timeline just seemed a little different from what I was, what I actually read.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Yeah, absolutely. Um, so we get into jargon and we call it

our priority matrix and this is part of our new standard procedure that we just created, and you're absolutely right. Um, rats in the interior apartments are a priority 7 that we must respond within seven days. Um, and as of this month we are, um, hitting that deliverable most of time. Why you saw a different number than what I say because there's, um, rats on the grounds, too. Um, rats on the grounds have a priority level 4, which is, um, within seven days, but we are doing rats as of last month within 3.3 days. Um, so we are hitting our deliverable, um, for that. But, um, the priority matrix, that's what, so it's, um, priority 7, within 24 hours, um, for interior, and priority 4, within

seven days on that exterior for rats.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So when someone, just, just as an example, um, received a call on Monday from a resident who had rats coming in, she had one rat that she saw in her apartment and, um, she called it in, she called us. So what would be the process of someone coming in? So she makes the call. I have a rat that came into, I just saw a rat in my kitchen. What happens then? With the priority, just explain just a snapshot of the

3

4

\_

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

process, of getting rid of that rat in that building, in that apartment, and just the timeline of it.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Yeah, absolutely. So rat inside of an apartment, when we get that we, our goal and what we're hitting is within 24 hours. So we would get it from the CCC. They tell them right then we'll be there. Um, if we have someone assigned to that development right then they, um, part of our new standard procedure is even if they have other work orders, ah, assigned to them, which they will, ah, with a rat inside with the siding they, they stop their usually scheduled work. They call their supervisor. They say, you know, there's a rat inside an apartment. This is [inaudible] so we go to that work order right then. If it's, ah, after hours our, um, emergency services teams [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. And so if it's not a rat, let's say they see, um, on a sticky pad they captured on a sticky three mice.

What would, and they call and the say, you know, I have, um, mice in my apartment. What happens with the, with that?

apartment is, um, we're doing, um, within the initial an average of 4.47 days. That's our response time for mice. So the, we would get the CCC call, um, the planning unit would get the, um, work order ticket. They would, um, reach out to the resident if we have the phone number on, um, in our records or, um, and if we can get a hold of them regardless we schedule it and the letter goes to the management office. That letter goes under their door, um, from the caretaker staff saying we're coming at such and such date and then hopefully on that date. Um, if the tenant is not home on the day that we are there, um, we go a second time on a different day.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. What types of pesticides does NYCHA use at the developments?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you for your question, Chair. I'm gonna defer you again to, ah, Josie Bartlett.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, and, and while I'm asking that question, does the pesticides have any side effects? Um, does NYCHA provide any warning when they treat an area with the pesticides,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

13

12

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

and, um, and can you, and does NYCHA determine which infestation complaints warrant the use of, you know, particular pesticides? So can you just kind of take us through the steps of the usage of pesticides, what they are, side effects, things of that nature.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Absolutely.

Thank you for the question. Um, all of the pesticides that we use are on our new pest control, um, website. Um, we're using things like [inaudible] and Vendetta Gel, First Strikes Off Bait, which is, um, for rats, Final Pellets for direct burrow baiting, um, Sterifab for bed bugs. I mean, pesticides are a chemical so yes, but what we do do is there is Department of Environmental Conservation regulations which we, um, follow. Um, exterminators like to say the label, and not to say, but this is how it goes. Um, the label is the law. You have to follow what the label says when you're, um, treating. It gives you exactly the amount that is appropriate, so, um, like First Strike on the grounds you can put, um, in the bait stations, um, 15 to 30 feet. Um, you can't do it less than that. So we follow, um, the DEC regulations. And I can say as part of our new approach of integrated pest management, which is all

2	about being more environmental and healthier for
3	residents that we really only, we use when it is
4	needed. So that's why we're using the HEPA vacuum or
5	roaches, so it stops the roaches from coming back.
6	And then we use gel it specific areas where, um, we
7	see the infestation. We're really reducing the
8	amount of spray that we use for roaches, which as I
9	said was our biggest pest type. Um, spray, you know,
10	goes elsewhere. Gel really sits where the
11	infestation is. So that's how we're minimizing when
12	the pesticides go. We also have, um, a burrow
13	collapsing team that works at our highest, um, rat
14	infestation developments and their job is to go
15	around and collapse rat burrows. And this is a
16	nontoxic way of getting rid of rats, so it collapses
17	their home. They have to spend their time rebuilding
18	their homes out of needing, so this reduces, um, the
19	amount of rats. It also lets our exterminators know
20	which burrows are active and which are not active, so
21	we don't have to use pesticides in, um, the rat
22	burrows that are inactive. So we're using less
23	pesticides overall.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And you're tracking that? Like how are you tracking that? How

24

25

tracking that?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

1516

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

are you tracking pesticides, well, versus, you know, other, um, technology or strategies to make that determination, you know, as to this is not effective and we need to now do a pesticide. How are you

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Yeah, so every work order, um, the exterminator has shows exactly how much, um, pesticides they use, what type of pesticide, and, um, what component of the apartment that they put it on. So did they put in the cabinet, did they put it on a baseboard, um, the exterior, did they do like bait along the foundation? So we can track how much, what it was, um, and where it was. And we're also tracking, um, and this is a new thing that we did within the last, ah, year and a half as part of integrated pest management. Also on the work tickets we track, um, what other work we're doing. Um, are we sealing up holes? Are we caulking around cabinets? Are we using the HEPA vacuum? Did, um, the resident receive our, um, best tips about to keep your home pest-free flyer that we're giving to every resident when the exterminator comes into your house because, ah, really integrated pest management is us working together and sometimes it's simple as, you

## COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1	COMMITTEE ON TODETC HOOSING
2	know, putting your dog food, um, bowl away overnight.
3	Um, so it's things like that you don't really think
4	about, but it helps out our extermination team a lot
5	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. I just
6	have, um, one more question for now, because I know
7	that we have some very long days, um, in the council
8	and my colleague, Council Member Ayala, has her hand
9	raised. Um, so I'll stop after this question and
10	then go to Council Member Ayala. Are NYCHA rat
11	complaints recorded with DOHMH Rat Information
12	Portal?
13	VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you for
14	your question, ah, Chair. Ah, I'm gonna refer you to
15	Josephine Bartlett.
16	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ooh, Josephine
17	[laughs].
18	VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: [laughs]
19	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you need a
20	water break, Josephine? [laughs]
21	VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: [laughs]
22	DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: I got it,
23	thank you. Um, yeah, so we do work with our
24	Department of Health partners there, um, for

Neighborhood Rat Reduction Developments, which is

104, ah, developments.

-	1
_	l

2

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12 13

14

16

15

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [inaudible]

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

will be coming. CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK.

boroughs mo. It wasn't monthly during the pandemic

because their inspectors were pulled in other

directions, but for the most part we get monthly

counts and that we have, um, access to that map in

real time, and we're currently working with our, um,

numbers on a quarterly basis, um, publicly. So that

monitor, the federal monitor, to, um, release our

gonna stop there and then go back to my question.

They, um, count the rat

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We'll now turn it over to other council members to ask any questions, again, in the order that they've used the Zoom raise hand function. Ah, council members, we please ask that you keep your questions to five minutes in the interest of time. The Sergeant at Arms will keep a timer and let you know when your time is up. Um, first we'll begin with Council Member Ayala, and again a reminder to other members if you'd like to ask a question to please use the Zoom raise hand function.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Is it possible for you to come back around to me because I'm on, ah,

Land Use as well and I'm expected to vote in a second. Sorry about that.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Sorry about that [laughs].

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sure, lots of, ah, lots of multi-taskers on the council.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [laughs]

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, are there any other council members at this time who have questions? It looks like no other members have their hand raised, hands, ah, OK, we have a hand from Council Member Riley.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Good morning, good morning. I'm also on Land Use right now, but I do want to ask a very quick question. I'm sorry if it's garbled speech. NYCHA development, is it weekly, is it monthly, how frequently is garbage picked up?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Garbage is picked up, ah, between two and four times a week, you know, depending on the neighborhood. The low- and medium-density areas are picked up twice a week and the high-density areas are picked up three times a

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

week. Recycling at those locations are picked up
once a week.

COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Vice President Ferguson. Um, and just a request because, um, I was walking through, um, Eagle Houses, which I believe is the second-largest NYCHA development in the city, um, and there was abundance of garbage, um, in front of a lot of the buildings. And what we do see is, ah, when people usually see abundance of garbage they keep putting more garbage there. And I did hear a lot of, um, amazing plans, um, that NYCHA is doing now and [inaudible] together to come because, um, we really want the individuals that live in the NYCHA developments to [inaudible] community, but when it looks like garbage and garbage is just overflowing. Thank you, NYCHA, for your hard work. Hopefully we can work together in the [inaudible]. Um, thank you.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK, um, thank you.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Ah, thank you,
Council Member. And, Council Member, we'll make sure
that we have folks look at it, both on the bulk side,
um, and the regular trash, too, as well. Um, and

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING SI
2	we'd, you know, also [inaudible] summer is here, ah,
3	we would, you know, look, ah, to use the time, ah,
4	that things slow down a little bit, if that's ever a
5	thing. But we can walk the grounds with you, too,
6	and you can point some of these issues out with
7	[inaudible] love to do that as well.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Brian,
9	I really will appreciate that. We, we always had a
10	great relationship working together, so I really
11	would appreciate that. Thank you. Um, that's,
12	that's it. I'll yield my time. Thank you, Chair.
13	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
14	Council Member Riley. Audrey, that's it?
15	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yeah, I think that's
16	it for Council Member questions at that time.
17	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Moving
18	along, um, to the pest waste management plan. How
19	has COVID-19 impacted NYCHA's ability to comply with
20	the goals set in the pest and waste management plan?
21	VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you. Ah,
22	thank you, Chair, for that question. Ah, I'll handle

the waste side, ah, first. And then I'll handle over 23 the pest side to, ah, Josie Bartlett again. Um, so 24 as far as the waste, ah, the waste management plans, 25

2	ah, we, ah, we were able to accomplish a lot, ah,
3	with, you know, during the pandemic. Ah, we
4	initiated a Clean to the Ground initiative, where,
5	ah, we actually, ah, we instructed developments to,
6	ah, make sure that all the grounds and the waste
7	yards were absolutely clear of material. From my
8	sanitation experience I know that, ah, and, and very
9	much like Council Member Riley indicated that
10	Edenwald, garbage begets garbage, that, you know, you
11	need to have an absolutely clean facility, ah, clean
12	development. Ah, it's not only a quality of life
13	issue but, ah, you know, it, it, it causes, ah, other
14	types of problems as well. So, ah, we were able to,
15	during the pandemic we were able to, ah, better
16	enhance, ah, you know, some of our waste-related
17	infrastructure, you know, making upgrades, installing
18	in-sync foods, ah, food waste disposals, ah,
19	cardboard balers, bulk crushers, ah, enlarging the
20	ground floor trash chute. Ah, I'm not sure if you
21	are familiar with the, you know, the trash chutes in
22	the buildings are, ah, you know, are relatively small
23	on each of the floors and, ah, one of our big
24	initiatives I think that will help out tremendously

is by putting the, ah, enlarged hopper door on the

2	ground floor. So, ah, because most people have the,
3	they use the tall kitchen garbage bag, which is abou
4	a 13-gallon bag, and that will fit in these, ah,
5	enlarged trash doors in the lobbies. Ah, we also
6	were able to create and hire staff in the waste
7	management department. Um, ah, I mentioned about the
8	bulk tickets that we're able, additional bulk ticket.
9	we were able to get from Sanitation. Um, we, ah,
LO	actually, when I started, ah, Sanitation was giving
L1	NYCHA 800 bulk tickets per month and that number has
L2	grown to 1250 and, ah, even, and some months that we
L3	actually requested more I think our, our peak number
L 4	was, ah, 1450, ah, bulk loads removed from our
L5	developments in one month. So, ah, you know, we've
L 6	been able to get rid of a lot of material, ah, and,
L7	ah, you know, the, the bottom line with waste
L8	management is you have to get rid of it as soon as
L 9	it's created. And, ah, you know, because it's just
20	gonna, ah, create a host of problems that could be
21	eliminated. Um, and now I'll give you, ah, Josie
22	Bartlett for the pest control side.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just for, um, [inaudible] purposes, um, can you just explain bulk tickets?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes, yes. I'm sorry, I, ah, I apologize that it was, ah, ah, that bulk tickets are tickets that are given to the Housing Authority from the New York City Department of Sanitation, where we use our, our private vendors to, ah, pull the boxes of, the 30-yard containers, you know, the big containers of bulk, ah, but Sanitation pays for the, ah, disposal of that. Sanitation originally was giving us 800 and we are, ah, you know, we're upwards of 1250. That is the new quota that they're giving us every month, and I would say in the last couple months during tax season and, ah, with the stimulus money there has been a lot of extra bulk at the developments. So, ah, basically these developments have grown from 1250 number, you know, for the month and it's, ah, I've requested an additional 200 tickets, which Sanitation, by the way, has been a super, super agency partner, ah, in accommodating and being very responsive, quick turnaround. I don't think I made the request at, at 1:30 in the afternoon and I had a response by like 1:37. And they, they immediately said come pick it up tomorrow morning and we got an additional 200 tickets. And what does that mean to us? Ah, I'm

1	
2	9
3	С
4	k
5	t
6	k
7	p
8	t
9	p
10	t
11	n
12	W
13	6
14	p
15	þ
16	D

glad you asked that question. Ah, that each bulk container holds about 2.2 tons of material. know, that's the average amount of bulk that's in there. Ah, and again, all of this material, ah, you know, we, we find it on old, on many visits at NYCHA properties that, ah, people get new furniture or new things and they're, they're not always sure where to out it, so they just put it outside. They put it in the front, they put it in the back, they put it over near the waste disposal, you know, where we have our waste yards. So, ah, you know, we, we have a lot of education to do and that's also part of the action plan going forward, ah, that, ah, we need to create a petter process, a better system at our developments. Did I answer your question on the bulk tickets? that clear?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes, that was clear. You know, sometimes you hear tickets you, you might think, um, you know, like something. Like you received a ticket and had to pay for.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible] I just wanted just clarification on it.

24

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes. actually, it, it seems a little, the system seems a little primitive, because it's actual a physical ticket that they give us for the dumping of the load, but that's, it just happens to be that's, that's the way it is right now and, ah, we, we, it has a control number on it and, ah, you know, they have to dump the load within three hours, ah, from leaving the development, ah, to go into the actual dump itself. So, ah, you know, the, there's a lot of, ah, you know, there's a lot of red tape in there. But, ah, I, I will tell you, bar none, that since, ah, since I've been communicating with Sanitation that they have been nothing but responsive and any development that has requested additional bulk tickets I have granted them, because they, they definitely need it.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That's good to, so, so it's excellent to know that there's been, ah, you know, like a, a double fee, tickets are being issued, and it is very helpful. But then for the, the crazy part is, it's an actual physical ticket, right? That's just so crazy to me.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes.

24

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Like a ticket 3 in this age of technology we would have, you know.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: I am trying to work with Sanitation because that, that is, um, that is a, I'm not sure if it's like a DOI issue, ah, that, but it was something that was created, ah, quite a while ago and, yeah, clearly, ah, and it's just something that we actually even have to get when they, they take the actual ticket and they stamp it at the development as well.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [laughs]

with the development name and a, a time punch to start the clock for the three-hour window that they're allowed to dump the load and, you know, that's, you know, and in, in some cases it was a logistical nightmare, to have somebody come in, you know, the machine wasn't working to do the punch and things like that so I'm definitely, ah, you know, I'm definitely looking to change that. I am a fully automated person. I, I like everything, and that was one of my signatures at Sanitation, was to automate everything because I am not into pencil and paper

1	COMMITTEE ON FUBLIC HOUSING 50
2	because automation leads to better accountability all
3	across the board.
4	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you for
5	that. I know Brian is kind of squirming in his chair
6	right now, Brian Honan, 'cause he's like oh my
7	goodness.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [laughs]

Because that would be like a whole of the, how a request is related to [inaudible] it reminded me of [inaudible] and signing into...

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I'm getting flashbacks [inaudible] yes [laughs].

 $\label{eq:chairperson} \mbox{CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL:} \quad \mbox{OK, I'm gonna}$  move this along.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: I can jump in about some of the, ah, pest, ah, things that we've done as part of the, um, HUD deliverables. So on the pest side we, ah, implemented the prioritization matrix, that's what we spoke about earlier with the different priorities based on pest types. We've created a flag for units with self-reported health conditions, so, um, we know if a resident is pest sensitive, if they've let us know, and then we

1	(
2	
3	(
4	į
5	-
6	7
7	-
8	,
9	ŗ
10	1
11	ä
12	1
13	
14	ċ
15	(
16	
17	7

respond to that pest complaint, ah, quicker than otherwise. We've created a new standard procedure all around integrated pest management so it updates the roles and responsibilities of staff members and what they now have to do. Exterminators aren't just treating. They're doing the caulking and have the vacuum, the [inaudible] ceiling. Um, we did the Targeted Relief Initiative. This is part of the HUD agreement where, um, there is a certain timeframe and, um, any apartment that had one or two or more, um, pest infestations we went in, we did the full integrated pest management, and we also, if there was an infestation we did the adjacent units, so up, down, side to side.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, I just wanted to remind you of the, the question itself. So what I was asking has COVID-19 impacted NYCHA's ability to comply with the goals that were set in the plan?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: OK.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Cause I just wanted to, you know, you know, get a sense of, of, like the impact of COVID-19...

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Absolutely.

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

itself.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...[inaudible]

able to do a lot of things that, um, weren't in-unit work, but things such as the Targeted Relief program took us longer because we weren't able to get into apartments. But we did finish it at the end of last year and, um, the NYCHA Pest Infestation Indexing, which is another HUD deliverable that requires us to get into apartments, that was, um, a shorter program than we would have otherwise done, um, if it wasn't COVID. But we were able to do a lot of IT fixes and standard procedures and trainings, um, instead.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you have like a percentage or any kind of numbers at all related to, um, the number of apartments that you may not have been able to enter because of COVID or, you know, um, and my next question is, um, are you experiencing a backlog of work orders due to staffing and maintenance adjustments in response to COVID-19?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: So during COVID, um, there was a backlog of work orders that built over those months, um, to 7694. Um, but as soon as we could start getting back into the

1
Т

apartments we worked on a plan to hit that backlog and we've got into those tickets now. Um, however, now, also people were not calling in as the same rate during the like heavy COVID 19 because they didn't want people inside their apartment actually. So now we're seeing people call and as I, ah, testified earlier we currently have a little over 4000 work orders right now, um, that we are getting to.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How much funding has been allocated to NYCHA to address the goals set forth in the pest and waste management plan? Um, and can you disaggregate between the expense and the capital spending?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you,

Chair. Ah, I am going to refer you to Vlada Kenniff,

vice president of energy and sustainability.

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you,

Chair, for that question. I'm going to focus on the

capital side of your question. Um, as we've

discussed yesterday I came to NYCHA to focus on waste

management and we wrote the comprehensive waste

management plan specifically to advocate for

recapitalization of NYCHA's waste management assets.

We recognize that many of the waste management assets

of both compaction and containerization, the interior compactors, the exterior compactors, many of them are the end of their useful lives and we've been successfully able to advocate for 563 million dollars for, ah, capital investments in, ah, NYCHA's infrastructure through the City Capital Action Plan. We are very proud and very, ah, happy to start working on this. Procurements are in motion for a lot of this work already. Ah, NYCHA has been focused, ah, on the neighborhood rat reduction work up until now. Ah, that's been, ah, approximately 47 million dollars, both in city and federal funding, um, and there's another 9 million dollars that's, ah, invested in capital infrastructure outside of the neighborhood rat reduction areas. Did I answer your question? And I think the expense side of the, ah, the question we may have to get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. I'm gonna just, just in case I missed something I'm actually just gonna read the question so that you can answer it and be able, just, now this is for the record so that, um, we can just have like just a clear question and clear answer. What is total amount NYCHA has

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

committed to pest and waste management to date? And can you disaggregate this by project type?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Ah, to date we have 619 million dollars in total committed in capital funds. Um, I described the 563 million dollars, the part of the City Capital Action Plan, and that could be broken down further in the City Action Plan, um, by project type, and, ah, the 47 million dollars of neighborhood rat reduction funding, ah, that is another part of funding that's been focused on things like hopper doors, interior compactors, exterior compactors, some bulk crushers, some rat slabs, um, and we can give you those precise numbers separately. And there's another 9 million dollars that is, ah, outside of the, um, neighborhood rat reduction work that we can also disaggregate.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Um, I'm gonna stop there because I see that Council Member Ayala is back and I want to make sure that she's able to jump in because you may have to leave again.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I actually have a few questions. But, ironically enough, when I was waiting somebody just text me, ah, from Morris Avenue, 414, if somebody can deal with an

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

issue over there. Apparently the door broke and now the residents cannot access the building. They can't come in and out because it's locked. So I would appreciate it if somebody could look into that.

UNIDENTIFIED: I'll, I'll get on that, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. Um, you know, I have a, I have to bring this up and I, you know, I apologize because I'm one of those, ah, people very much so that, you know, I don't like to shoot the messenger. Um, because I understand there's a lot of complexity that happens. You know, NYCHA is a huge agency and there's a lot that's happening and, you know, we could be here for days talking about this. However, I will and I have been bringing up and I will continue to bring it up at every single hearing until it has been rectified, because my buildings are horribly, horribly, I mean, ah, dirty, beyond dirty. They're filthy. And, you know, we have been meeting and having conversations about this for some time, um, there are a lot of reasons why, and I get, you know, um, that there has to be some responsibility also on the end of, you know, ah, residents, right? Residents shouldn't be

2 throwing garbage out of their window. But then what 3 is NYCHA doing to address that? Um, every single 4 building in my district, and most specifically, I 5 don't know why, the ones in the south Bronx, East 6 Harlem buildings have problems. But the ones in the 7 south Bronx are so dirty that I want to cry every time I go into those buildings. Um, on the inside of 8 the buildings, you know, you can tell they haven't 9 10 been properly cleaned and maintained for a long time, to the point that, again, and I've mentioned this 11 before, you have humungous like spider webs on top of 12 people's doors. Um, outside the garbage buildup is 13 14 really just, you know, I, I, I'm speechless every 15 time I'm there. I really literally want to cry when 16 I'm there because it's that bad. Um, and that obviously is contributing a humungous, you know, ah, 17 18 rat population problem that is beyond controllable at 19 this point. Um, I was at Mitchell Houses right before the pandemic and I'll tell you that there a 20 rat hanging out in front of the building on Alexander 21 22 Avenue, just sitting on, he was just sitting on the 23 front, on the front of the, the stoop, you know, the 24 door was open, and eating an orange peel, because 25 there was garbage everywhere. I, I couldn't believe

2 I actually have video of, you know, of these I have pictures if you'd like to see 3 encounters. 4 them. Um, I have been meeting with the staff, ah, 5 and we are trying to address this. But every single time that we meet it's like we're coming up with a 6 7 plan, we're thinking of a plan, we're gonna implement a plan. And I would love to know today when can I 8 expect to see relief for my buildings, because the 9 conditions that the residents that I represent are 10 living under, um, are really just beyond anything 11 that is, you know, that can be explained away and, 12 um, and I'm horrified for them. So I would love to 13 14 know what the timeline is. Like when are people 15 gonna go in there and start, you know, ensuring that 16 the buildings are clean, not only on the inside but 17 the outside. You know, we're holding these 18 contractors to task and, you know, and ensuring that 19 they're cleaning behind the scaffolding and behind 20 the netting, um, because a lot of that is contributing to the, the pest issues. Um, and then 21 22 you have all of these scaffoldings. Rats are 23 climbing into the scaffold and I'm getting reports of 24 like rats literally going into people's windows. 25 horrible, just horrible. In East Harlem it's Taft

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	Housing and I know that [inaudible], you know, some
3	time ago, you know, we had instances where we had
4	raccoons climbing. You know, I don't know if
5	raccoons are part of your pest management, you know,
6	strategy, but they have been, we have them, right?
7	We have them at some of our developments as well, um,
8	and all of the garbage attracts them, right? And
9	then the scaffolding doesn't, doesn't help. Um, so I
10	know that there's a, there's a lot here. But I, I'm
11	really just, you know, I'm hoping to create some sort
12	of a partnership and to get some clarity, um, on when
13	exactly are we gonna start to address these issues.
14	Like is there a timeline?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um, thank you, um, thank you, Council Member. I'm, I'm gonna turn to, um, Al and, um, and, and Josie, who both oversee both these areas. But the one thing I did want to start out with, the common theme that you hear all the time, because we meet regularly with the tenant leaders and staff, ah, locally in your districts, both in the Bronx and in East Harlem, is staff will tell us we're really trying, but we're short-handed. And, and, and I feel for the them and they're right. Um, so as part of, ah, the federal money that came in

1 2 through COVID, um, we are going to be able to hire an 3 additional 1072, ah, workers, um, as many residents 4 as possible, ah, for, ah, a six-month stint, um, to 5 make sure that they concentrate on the grounds, um, 6 and, um, and then our permanent NYCHA staff can then 7 concentrate inside the buildings, um, as well. 8 this, we can get you a breakdown of, of that 1072 of the number that we assign to your district. Um, in 9 fact we'll get the committee, you know, where they're 10 gonna be broken down, ah, as well for each of the 11 committee members. Um, but we believe that, you 12 13 know, this will, um, greatly, um, it's much-needed 14 relief for the staff who's on, on hand right now. 15 Um, and it, it will certainly help. Um, but, in 16 addition it's, um, a strategy is needed, a strategy 17 is in place, ah, through the action plans that were 18 recently approved by the monitor. Both Al and, ah, 19 Josie can talk a little bit more about, about those, 20 but, ah, I, you know, I've seen all the pictures that 21 you sent. Um, we, um, most [inaudible] in, in real 22 time, um, and, ah, but it's been going on for too 23 long. You're 100% right. Um, Al, if you can add, ah, add more to that, um, and, ah, Josie as well. 24

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Sure. Ah, ah,
thank you, Council Member, for bringing that, you
know, that issue to our attention. Ah, the concerns
that you have are, are shared by the pest waste, pest
and waste management departments. Um, the, ah, you
know, the, the short answer, ah, I know you have a
lot of concerns, are that, you know, one of the, ah,
which I mentioned in my testimony, one of the, ah,
reasons for creating a scorecard cleanliness system,
ah, cleanliness rating system, is so that we can
measure both the interior and exterior conditions of
our developments throughout the city. OK, we, we
have worked with the federal monitor in developing
this. This is an objective rating system, ah, that
will give it, it'll be on the scale of 1 through 5,
ah, you know, 1 being, ah, dirty, 5 being the
cleanest. Ah, there are composite scores for each of
the areas. It'll be elevators, lobbies, walkways,
waste yards, ah, etcetera. Ah, and it

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I'm sorry, Al, and I don't want to interrupt you, but I...

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: That's OK.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: When, when does, when do you guys plan to implement this, ah,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

scorecard system, and what is different about the scorecard system, because I'm assuming that now there's still a shared responsibility, right? People are expected to, to, ah, to perform. Um, but it doesn't seem like there's anyone that's like supervising now. Like it doesn't seem like anybody's like going out there and saying, OK, like we have a problem at this specific development, like, right, this garbage has been building up for quite some time, so it's pretty evident that no one's gotten to it in, you know, in a while. Like if that's not happening now how am I supposed to feel comfortable with the fact that we're implementing a scorecard system? Do we have enough staff to oversee that? VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Well, that's, thank you, Council Member [inaudible]. Ah, the, basically, ah, why we, you know, having a scorecard system, ah, as you, you may have heard, I, I came

system, ah, as you, you may have heard, I, I came from the Department of Sanitation, which, ah, you're familiar with, ah, the scorecard for street cleanliness and sidewalk cleanliness, that it's, now this is going to be, I would say, ah, an enhanced, ah, scorecard, something that will actually get down to granular detail so we can focus not only what the

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 problems are, but where in the developments

3 themselves the problems lie, and then we would use

4 them as a way of determining what resources we have,

5 what people, what equipment, you know, what we have

6 at the property level, and then we have to determine

if that is a sufficient amount of people.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I get it. I get it. But, again, this all sounds like a glob, it's gonna take, a, a few months to implement.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: It's we're rolling it out, we're actually rolling it, it's, it's kind of in its infancy. We've been testing it at different locations. We've rated different developments. And we've seen where, ah, you know, where we have, ah, some issues and concerns, and we've also seen positive results. You know, we've seen, ah, and this is a way, ah, I think, ah, by investing time in this, I know, ah, I, I just want to assure you by us investing our time in this that what we're establishing is something that is, ah, not only short-term, but it's a long-term measure of your developments, so that you will get a rating and we'll supply it to you when it's all, you know, at your, you know, full transparency, this is what your

2 development was rated and the goal is to rate it 3 4 5 6 7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

every month. And not your development, but in the individual areas that we're talking about. Um, and, look, I understand. I, as far as immediate relief goes I'm more than glad for my, myself and my staff to meet with you or members, ah, of your staff at specific locations. Ah, and we can discuss the issues, ah, and, and you know, and come up with the plans. I mean, we already have some preliminary plans, but I would definitely like to include you and your staff and, you know, I, I really, I, I, I hear your frustration. I share it and, and I, I, I assure you that you have my...

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [inaudible], you know, we will be out there this entire summer making sure that, you know, we're, you know, like I'm, ah, if we have to, if we have to start facilitating cleanup, you know, ah, events at the different NYCHAs then that's what it will be. But, you know, we're gonna keep hammering away at this until there is relief, because it's just really [inaudible] at this point and it's been years and, you know, like years, years, um, you know, I, I'm a very reasonable person, like I can work with you. I understand when things

25

2 are happening. Like I'm, you're not gonna find a more reasonable person in the world. However, within 3 4 limits, within limits. You know, when you keep, when 5 you, when I keep coming to hearings and I keep 6 hearing well, we're about to implement this and we're 7 doing, we're in the process of doing that, and then it's like Jesus Christ, this is another year. 8 another six months that you're telling me, and in the 9 10 interim people have to walk through, you know, they have to try to run through the rats in the front of 11 the buildings. You know, they have to hope that one 12 of them doesn't climb into their, you know, apartment 13 14 window in the interim. Um, and I, I just, you know, 15 I'm not, you know, we don't even know, and I'm sorry, 16 Madam Chair, thank you, you're always so generous, um, with, you know, allowing me the time. Um, but, 17 18 you know, it, when you are doing [inaudible], ah, 19 pest management at the developments, like the 20 resident leaders are not even informed. Like there's not even a communication, there's not even a 21 22 communication were done that says hey, you know what, 23 um, you know, we, you know, let's have a 24 conversation. We understand that this development,

you know, has a severe, you know, ah, rat infestation

25

coming to NYCHA and where?

2 This is what we're doing. Well, you don't know, you know why, because when the residents come 3 to the resident leaders, the resident leaders have no 4 5 information to give. And then the resident leaders 6 come to the council member and the council member has 7 no information to give, because nobody is communicating with me, nobody's communicating with 8 Um, that would be, you know, I, I would, I 9 10 would suggest that that be, you know, part of the strategy is, you know, ah, really improving the lines 11 of communication, maybe posting the buildings when 12 13 you're doing, um, pest management that advised, you 14 know, residents, hey, these, these are the days when 15 the exterminator is gonna be, you know, um, outside 16 of, of the development so that at least people know and they see. Um, because, you know, when people 17 18 know they understand. They may not like it. But at 19 least they have information, tangible information. 20 Um, and just my final question really is around the, 21 ah, the city cleanup corps jobs. Are those jobs, are 22 those the same jobs that, ah, Brian referenced or is 23 this a different set of, of, of employment 24 opportunities and how many of those, ah, would be

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um, Council

Member, yes. Those, those jobs are, are the same.

So out of the, um, 10,000 jobs that the city will be

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: And they start when, do you know?

creating, ah, 1072 will be at NYCHA.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We are currently interviewing, but we hope to have this ramped up by the summer, you know, which is coming soon. You know, within the next few weeks.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: OK. Is there a plan for what happens after, because you said this is six months?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Six months, yeah.

I mean, it's largely dependent on federal funds and how far they can stretch, but the this is, you know, ah, we'll, we'll deal with it, you know, at the end of this. But, um, it would be great if we can, you know, keep this going as long as possible. It's certainly needed. The one...

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I'm, sorry, Brian, because I, just because it's a part of the, it's part of the same question. What prevents NYCHA from hiring people in the first place? Don't you get, you

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 know, isn't, isn't there like a budget for

3 development that, you know, I'm, I'm assuming that if

4 you have funding for six, seven caretakers, whatever

5 | that, whatever that is, right?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: And sure, like

what, what's preventing you from hiring up?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Um, the question always comes back to the same, it's funding, funding, funding, right? So when I first started at NYCHA years ago we had 15,000, um, workers. We're down to south of 11,000. Um, and that just shows you the level of operating funds that we have been cut over the years, um, and, um, and you don't experience cuts like that without seeing the effects. And the effects that you see in your district, the effects that you see in Council Member, ah, Alicka Samuel's district, um, you know, places where you have a large concentration of public housing, of course those are the places where you feel it the most. Um, and so when I go to developments, staff don't, they don't say to me I wish I had more money, I wish I had more vacation time. They say I wish I had more colleagues who could help me, you know, clean the buildings.

And they're right. Um, it is something that as part of our transformation plan we're looking to do a more localized style of, of management. Um, we're looking to, ah, make sure that, ah, managers, too, are equipped to make decisions at their developments so it's not, you know, only folks at 90 Church and 250 Broadway who are making these decisions, who in some cases have never been to some of the developments where they're making the decisions. So, um, we agree with you.

[inaudible] myself I, would volunteer myself and I'm sure that, ah, Chair Samuels would, ah, would join me in helping create some sort of advisory group with NYCHA so that we can help, you know, implement a lot of these, ah, action items, because I think that the turnaround is really what is bothersome here, is the, you know, the constant reinventing and strategy after strategy that just take way too long to implement and then observe whether or not they're, they're, they work or they don't work, and, um, so I'm, you know, I'm, listen, I'm, I'm happy to helpful where I can. I will come back again, you know, to the next hearing

and hopefully we have better news, um, but I appreciate the time. Um, thank you, Madam Chair.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
Council Member Ayala. And just a quick follow-up.
Out of the 1072 positions does NYCHA already have
that funding in, do you already have the funding?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yes, it's, it's, ah, part of, ah, 7, 7 million dollars in federal funds that came from the COVID relief. Um, so it is, it's in place, yeah, for now.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It is not something that if you don't use by a particular time, like a certain time, it...

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, no. But, no, it, it won't go away, but, ah, but, ah, we plan to use it as fast as we can, because we need, the summer is the time when you see more garbage, when you, 'cause more people are outside, they're more active, um, and, you know, we need the relief here as fast as possible. So when the funding is in place we just have to now get the, you know, the bodies, you know, into developments so they can start, you know, working.

2	CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And I see
3	that we have been joined by Council Member Vanessa
4	Gibson as well. And I want to remind, um, the public
5	and NYCHA residents that after the Q&A we will return
6	to the residents first, um, to speak again. Do you
7	have a upcoming caretaker onboarding process

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I don't know. Um, but we can look into that.

happening this week or next week at all?

'cause I've been hearing, um, a few people told me just in passing that they're starting, um, some like training class and they have to go to 90 Church [inaudible].

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We do regularly hire caretakers. There's a lot of, ah, there's a lot of turnaround in caretaker position. Um, it is very, very tough work, um, and so we regularly hire, ah, caretakers. But, um, I can see if there's something special and get back to you, get back to by, before the end of the day.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, thanks.

How many staffers does NYCHA have that work on pest

2 a

and waste conditions, and how many of these staffers are at the local developments?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank...

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council Member, ah, go ahead.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: I got it.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, good.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: I got it. Ah, thank you, thank you again, Madam Chair, for that question. Um, the, the total number is 4619 staffers. Ah, there are 140 people, ah, in the pest control department, ah, 25 in the waste management department, and 4454 caretakers. OK, and the caretakers, obviously, are the, the development level and, and for the exterminators, ah, that pest control has, ah, has 22 people and 87 people are allocated to the borough shops, you know, for the exterminators.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Got it. What trainings, what training does NYCHA staff receive to address pest and waste conditions at NYCHA? How long is the training and how much does the training cost?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK, like, ah, thank you for the question, Madam Chair. Ah, I'm gonna refer you to, ah, Josephine Bartlett.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: [inaudible] thank you for the question. Um, all of our exterminators have done integrated pest management, um, trainings. They, ah, the full one was a full day. Um, and this was year, this has been yearly, and we've been doing, um, many trainings like to use the HEPA vacuum, um, caulking, kind of like specific IPM trainings that are, ah, a few hours. Um, those are done in shop by our technical advisor, who has decades of, um, pest control experience. So it's part of salary, so no additional cost there. We are also, as part of integrated pest management, we're really putting emphasis on the like pest issues are not just a extermination problem. We're working with caretakers to let us know when there's infestations near compactor rooms or if little holes need to be, um, plugged, we're saying that the caretakers need to, to do that. If they can't they need to report it to their supervisor. So we are doing, um, new, um, part of the four-day training that, um, caretakers There is an IPM, um, component. We also have trained more than 700, um, people, um, on IPM, um, which was through our partners at Stop Pests, which is a HUD-funded, um, program which is free of cost.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And how many vendors does NYCHA have working on the pest and waste management plan, and how many of these vendors are employing NYCHA residents? You can also talk about the roles of the vendors within the plan.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK. Ah, thank
you, Madam Chair, for that question. Ah, I will, ah,
I'll cover the, the waste side. Ah, the vendors that
we have, ah, as I discussed before, the private
carters for bulk removal at the developments, ah, as
well as there are vendors for compactor repairs, ah,
you know, and, and as you have seen by the age of the
equipment there are a lot of them. Ah, we also have
a mattress recycling program, ah, that is on the
horizon...

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: A what? What did you just say?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: A mattress recycling program.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, OK [laughs].

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, continue.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK. Ah, and so, ah, and that will also be run by a vendor that actually has, will be, ah, be employing NYCHA residents. That was for the mattress recycling program. And that's the one that I mentioned in my testimony that was 25 locations and we plan to expand it to 100 or so down the road.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And is that [inaudible] on the, um, the, is that online for the public to see for residents to be able to know what's happening and...

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: It will...

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...is there information process or sessions with [inaudible]?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Ah, I, I know that will be. Ah, I can, ah, Vlada, can...

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: We do...

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yeah, that's

OK.

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Sorry. Ah, thank you for the question, Madam Chair. And we do work with resident engagement. We have also, to complete the question, ah, we have, ah, vendors for cardboard baler installations, interior compactor

2	1
3	ć
4	7
5	1
6	k
7	
Q	-

replacements, enlarge hopper doors, and other waste and recycling initiatives. Um, there are seven vendors so far. Ah, I understand they've hired 32 NYCHA residents in total. Um, we do publish the, I believe some or most of these initiatives that I've listed on our energy sustainability page. Um, there is a GIS map that shows, ah, some of the improvement work that's happening.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is there a vendor performance tracked to assure the quality of services that they have been doing?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Absolutely.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And is there a way for residents to be able to interact, and I'm thinking along the lines of when you had the private vendors that were cleaning the buildings during the COVID-19 process there was a way for the residents to be able to, to, um, file complaints or, you know, let you know how the vendors were operating, what they were doing, what they were not doing in their individual developments. Is there a way for the residents to be able to file a complaint or, you

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

know, know who the vendors are and what's happening with them?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, so what worked really well with the vendors during COVID was, um, we had a really open relationship with the compliance department and I think it was the first time people, ah, understood what the compliance department, you know, did and the value of it. that exists for any, ah, any vendor of, of NYCHA. So if you, um, have somebody, you know, come to your apartment who's a vendor who is supposed to do some work, you can go to either the compliance department or the quality assurance department and say the vendor came, um, they, um, didn't do, do the work properly, or they didn't treat me respectfully, or, you know, they did have the work and never came back. All those complaints can go to the compliance department or the, um, quality assurance department and they, they will then be charged to make sure that [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And when I asked if there was a, a, a tracking system for the quality of services [inaudible] said yes, but, I

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

mean, I [inaudible] how, like how is it tracked, how
is the performance tracked?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: The performance is tracked. Our, ah, project managers evaluate the work and they, ah, ah, use our E-Builder system to, ah, make sure that all the work is completed on time and on schedule. And, um, we have field inspection staff that goes out and checks on the work that is happening.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And I know we've been talking a lot about the compactors and their life cycles, but now I just want ask specific questions about the life cycles of, of the compactors. According to the pest and waste management plan, NYCHA conducted a 2018 infrastructure assessment of 274 developments. 255 had interior compactors and 108 had exterior compactors are at the, 255 had interior compactors and 108 had exterior compactors at the end of their useful, at the end or past their useful life. old is NYCHA's oldest compactor and what is the performance of this compactor?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you for that question, Madam Chair. I'll take it. Ah, the

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

1

performance is completely dependent on the use and the maintenance. We actually have two compactors that are 28-1/2 years old and functioning well. Um, they're located at the Bedford Stuyvesant Rehab on Lower East Side, ah, 2. Ah, so we wouldn't look to replace these compactors if they're maintained and functioning well. Um, we have another exterior compactor that is over 25 years old and it's located

11

12

13

10

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What is the average age of an interior compactor and the average

at Carlton Manor.

age of a exterior compactor?

14

that question. The average age of an interior compactor is approximately 18 years. And an average

life of an exterior compactor?

1617

15

age of exterior compactor is approximately 14 years.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: The manufacturer

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you for

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What is the

recommended useful life for an exterior, interior

useful life of an interior compactor and the useful

compactor is 10 to 15 years. And, ah, the

manufacturer's recommended useful life for an

exterior compactor is seven to 10 years.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, um, can you explain, so just looking at those, the, the useful life question, and then going back to the oldest compactor and the performance of that compactor, can you explain that number of 30 years and 25 years compared to what is, um, suggested for the useful life and, and then comparing that number 10 to 15 years?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Yeah, um, the manufacturer generally projects that a compactor will fail within those timeframes. Um, but apparently in those particular developments the staff have been taking care of those compactors and they've lasted much longer than the useful life. Ah, it does happen. Ah, but, ah, in, across the portfolio, as you've heard in Mr. Ferguson's testimony, 80% of our equipment is at the end of its useful life and may not be functioning properly.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Has NYCHA found that buildings with the upgraded compactor infrastructure showing a reduction in pest-related complaints?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you for that question, Chair. I'll pass it on to Mr. Ferguson to answer this question.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you for your question, Madam Chair. Um, I, I don't know, you know, we don't track it that way. We don't track that information. Ah, but, ah, that, that's, I think that's a great idea. You know, that, you know, going forward, ah, that that's definitely something that we should be looking into.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. All right [inaudible]. According to, so, I didn't want to go into details, like dive into that, but I just, you said you don't, you don't track that. So the question was how, has NYCHA found that buildings with upgraded compactor infrastructure, do they show a reduction in pest-related complaints. So we're talking about compactors, right, and the, the, how, how old the compactors are and, um, you know, and I, and I understand the development being able to, you know, maintain that particular compactor. But if you had upgrades to it, you know, we try to see that the, the, clearly the correlation and linkage between the, the, the age of the compactor and pest complaints.

2

3

So I would think that there would be some kind of tracking of that.

4

5

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: I, I, ah, I agree, I agree. It's logical. You know, it's illogical that's there's, there's...

7

6

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK.

8

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: ...definitely would be, no, I, I just, um, that, ah, you know,

10

9

we're, we're trying to establish, ah, all of the, the

11

metrics. Ah, for example, in preparation for this,

12

ah, for this hearing that, ah, I was able to, ah, get

13

the, you know, the number of interior compactors are

14

2975, ah, exterior compactors you have 36, um, and

15

then, you know, also, ah, you know, piece of trivia

16

information is that in Williamsburg they have the

17

largest number of interior compactors. Ah, they have

18

136 of them, you know, for the interior compactors.

19

Ah, and then on, as far as exterior compactors,

20

Throgs Neck has six. That is the largest number of

21

exterior compactors that we have. Ah, and, ah, to,

22

to clearly answer your question, I'm sorry, I just, ah, to, ah, go, you know, one step further, I just,

2324

you know, I was looking to answer your question and,

25

and, and I, now I can embellish or, or, or go a

little bit further, ah, but it, it's definitely a valid concern, ah, that, ah, I'm not sure if you're aware or, or the numbers, or I may have mentioned, ah, that about half of NYCHA locations, NYCHA developments, are curb, have curbside collection.

And, ah, the balance have, ah, exterior compactors.

So, ah, you know, there, there should also be a relationship of, you know, a seal, having a sealed compactor, OK, and that's part of the HUD agreement

insertion, is that the material either has to be in a

sealed compactor or picked up once every 24 hours.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: [inaudible] I, I think the, the, going back to the question you asked, I think the, the data match, um, looking at, um, developments that have had upgraded, upgrades in the infrastructure and, ah, pest complaints could be done very quickly. It's something that we could, we can do and, and share with you. It'd be really an interesting exercise and, ah, a different way of looking at things too. It also would certainly help us when we make the case for investment, um, to go to council members such as yourself and say when you invest in compactors you see X results. So, um...

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I got it.

can come back to you with that shortly.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: start off with the Sanitation currently provides, ah,

I'11, I'11

OK.

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: ... I think that's, I think that's, I think that's helpful. Ah, so we

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. I'm just thinking, you know, as you're, as you're strategizing and putting your plans in place, that may just be, it would just be helpful. Um, and I know that Council Member Riley had, um, you know, spoke to and had questions around the, the collection of trash and you was just speaking on that, um, how. So, according to the pest and waste management plan, NYCHA asked Sanitation on November 2019 to increase the curbside collection to seven days a week. Sanitation was unwilling to provide these services because of costs. And so would this increase in curbside collection lead to an increase in head count at NYCHA and/or Sanitation? And what is the associated personnel will, um, the OTPS cost and personnel services costs, um, if there was this increase in the collection to seven days? And if you can just go back over what service does Sanitation currently provide to NYCHA.

2	for, ah, the curbside locations, right? We, we have
3	the, the curbside, the bucket, we have curbside, and
4	then we have containerized. Ah, the curbside
5	locations get anywhere from two- to four-time service
6	a week. Ah, it's, the majority of them are either
7	two or three times. Most of our developments, I will
8	tell you are getting three-time service and that
9	means they're getting service either on Monday,
10	Wednesday, Friday, or Tuesday, Thursday, Saturday,
11	OK, at the curbside locations. Now at the
12	containerized locations they get as much service as
13	they need, that, ah, if they have, ah, we have
14	certain containers that are serviced every other day,
15	that get, you know, multiple service. So some
16	people, some containers actually even get service
17	four times a week or five times a week. So as
18	needed, ah, we have two types of service when it
19	comes to containerization. There's scheduled service
20	and there's call-in service. There's either, because
21	the, the high generation rates that we have at our
22	locations that they'll pick up on Monday, Wednesday,
23	Friday, or Tuesdays and Fridays. They'll pick all
24	the compactors. Ah, so that's a scheduled or a call-
25	in could be at certain locations that do not generate

more...

as much, that they wait for the, ah, the compactors

to be filled. There's a red light that goes on, on

the power unit that powers up the compactor, and when

that light goes on it says it's at 80% capacity and

you basically have another day or to of room left in

that compactor so they call it in. That's called

call-in service. Does that make sense, did I?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK, so we have scheduled service, call-in service, and then curbside service. Um, ah, as far as, you know, Sanitation, ah, providing, you know, the additional service, it would be to the curbside locations, because, I believe, that the containerized locations, ah, need upgraded, need upgraded containers in most locations. You know, obviously based on the useful life and, and the current age of the containers, ah, that we definitely, we definitely need to, you know, keep improving, which we have it in the plan to get our new, ah, compactors. So we're gonna go back to the curbside location, ah, which we generally get either two- or three-time service and recycling is picked up once a week at those locations as well. So the

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [inaudible] requested the seven days a week for the curbside collection...

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...um, and, and Sanitation, you know, was not able to do that. Have you come up with what that would cost at all and, and, um, have conversation with the administration on increasing funding to be able to do seven days a week curbside collection?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Ah, no, no I did not. Ah, the Department of Sanitation, ah, I'm just gonna tell you from my experience about the challenges that, you know, they're, it, it, you know, how they develop the cost plan, ah, will be, you know, whether or not the trucks could go, ah, across district boundaries. You know, the sanitation districts are coterminous with the community boards.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um-hmm.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: So, ah, you know, they'll, they'll be a lot of, ah, ah, you know, various options, ah, that, ah, and, and factors that would be considered in their cost. Ah, but the, the lion's share of the cost would be on the New York

O

City Department of Sanitation's side. I do not know what that cost is. Ah, but, ah, the other, the other component is us, which I did not, ah, I honestly did not, ah, you know, I didn't calculate how much more effort. Ah, however, ah, what we're, I, I want to put out there, I had mentioned in my testimony that we purchased two compactor trucks.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I was just about to say that [laughs].

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: In your testimony you mentioned [inaudible].

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: So there are two six-yard, ah, compacting trucks. So, um, each, you know, a six-yard, ah, the department, so you get a sense. Department of Sanitation has a 25-yard, ah, compactor truck, right, so that's the amount of, it's a volume, the amount of material that it holds. Each sanitation truck holds, can hold between, ah, 10 and 15 tons, on average, OK. So we bought two six-yard trucks. The thought behind buying these trucks were so that they could be at our developments and that they can navigate the developments safely, because, as you know, the behemoths that Sanitation has, the

2 25-yarders, are huge. They have the double wheels in the back and, you know, I, I think there's a certain, 3 4 you know, for, ah, the type, the additional 5 collection, I mean, there is curbside collection, which there's, there's no concern, but if we 6 7 were to pick up garbage within the developments, you know, to make it easier. And, and it goes to 8 your point. Ah, part of my thought process if we 9 were to go with additional service how would we do 10 11 it? Would we just put the material at the curb, or would we, ah, navigate, you know, the interior roads, 12 you know, depending on the size of the developments. 13 So there's a lot of factors that have to be 14 15 considered as well. Ah, but, ah, just even getting 16 back to the request, ah, Sanitation's, ah, you know, initial response was to, ah, for us to, you know, ah, 17 18 start by, you know, recycling more, you know, and 19 instead of just putting everything by the curb, ah, 20 you know, 'cause NYCHA had a history of, of not recycling as much as they could have. Ah, but, you 21 22 know, we're, we're definitely looking to, ah, you 23 know, change that around. Ah, so, ah, again, getting back to the, the additional service, if we, if we run 24 25 into any problems, if we need additional service,

2 Sanitation has been more than accommodating, more than responsive, ah, in getting us anything that we 3 need, ah, you know, in terms of additional service 4 5 and, ah, and, and my feeling is also that as we 6 go location to location developing our individual 7 waste management plans, ah, and, and just to give you another, ah, ah, I'm sorry, I don't want to take up 8 your time, or, or, just, I just want to give you a 9 10 better explanation that, ah, the action plans are living, breathing documents that it's a plan and it's 11 only as good as up to that date that it's made, and 12 13 we're trying to always make it better. You know, 14 look at it, change it, make it better, um, you know, 15 it's something that, ah, must be constantly revised 16 based on, ah, the needs and the changing needs. for example, I'll give you a quick for example, 17 18 Baruch Houses. It has a tremendous amount of Sandy 19 work being performed right now. Ah, so there is a 20 tremendous amount of construction, fences, gates, ah, you know, the, the Local Law 11, like, you know, 21 22 we've mentioned the Local Law 11, ah, sidewalk 23 shedding. Ah, all of that, all of those things change the way we do business, right? The change how 24 25 we have to, it's making it more challenging to clean

1	СО
2	th
3	pl
4	re
5	se
6	th
7	
8	nc
9	ch
10	de
11	in
12	Yc
13	λc
14	an
15	tr
16	
17	\$1
18	
19	An
20	in
21	(1)

23

24

25

the development. You know, when we have to revise plans we have to revise janitorial plans. We have to revise grounds plans. Ah, so, ah, does that make sense? Am, am I, ah, I just, I want to make sure that I'm not...

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It's, it's, no, I get, I get it, I get it. We see a lot of, um, changes in, in development changes and when I say development, development construction, um, cleanup initiatives. There's, there's a lot going on in New York City right now and so, um, I, I, I get what you're saying. I just have a, a quick question to another follow-up. What was the cost of the two trucks?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Ah, they are \$136,000 each.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, all right.

And, um, and I'm just gonna, you mentioned recycling in that and I want to get some of those recycling questions, um...

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...on the record as well. On March 30, 2020, NYCHA issued an RFQ to re-envision its waste yards, which pose

significant health risks to residents, as they are in close proximity to play areas, apartments, and other public spaces. Um, can you identify for the committee the seven developments subject to the NYCHA design bill RFQs for improvement to the exterior yards, um, and also by what criteria were these developments chosen and what's the status of the RFQs for each development, um, and is the construction still on schedule, ah, to be completed by December 2022, um, you know, with so many changes happening with COVID, and if any of the projects, you know, like have broken ground at all. So just the status.

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK. OK, thank you for your question. Ah, I'm going to refer you to Vlada Kenniff, that she has, that's, that's one of her projects and, um, I'm sure she has more information on that.

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you, Al.

Um, the seven developments are Jackson, Marcy, Morris

2, Webster, East 180th Street, St. Monterey Avenue,

Laguardia, 303 Vernon Avenue. Um, the, we are in our

fee stage. We just released the, our fee, um, for

the short-listed teams. Um, we are on schedule with,

ah, these, ah, waste yards. We are very excited

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

about these waste yards. We do think that they will be, um, re-envisioning how we do waste management at our developments. Um, they are no longer replacements in kind. They're looking to do new equipment and recycling storage as a part of the, ah, waste yards. Um, also noise reduction elements are a part of the new design. We are also considering visual screening material for cleanliness and security. And we're focused on the aesthetics and ability to customize each site. Um, so we're very much looking forward to, ah, working with the residents in particular on the designs and placements of the recycling infrastructure as a part of these, ah, new waste yards. The first one, ah, is Marcy, where we are, ah, working very closely with residents. The residents have weighed in on the placements of the tested locations. We've done surveys, um, through resident engagements. done webinars and we are gonna be working with the design teams that are selected, um, to be able to weigh in on additional waste stations.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ah, does NYCHA have recycling centers at all developments.

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: NYCHA does have recycling centers at all developments. Ah, this was rolled out as a part of the 2015-2016, ah, coordination with, in coordination with Department of Sanitation. At the same time NYCHA, ah, and DSNY developed signage and education, training materials for both residents and staff.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And can you just quickly explain some of the recycling centers are indoors and some are outdoors? So you can explain like which ones are outdoor, which ones are indoor, um, if that's possible? Like what's the difference?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: The, the, all the recycling infrastructure that I am aware of, ah, particularly the glass, metal, plastic, paper, cardboard recycling, is outdoors. Um, the, there may be in some places e-waste recycling and [inaudible] recycling that is indoors, but all of the glass, metal, plastic, paper, cardboard, recycling infrastructure is currently outdoors.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And what's the ones that are outdoors? Are the recycling centers

placed in one location per development or are they in multiple locations?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: They are,
there's at least, um, two bins per building. If it's
a single building, if it's more than three buildings,
um, that would get, ah, two, two bins of the, the
green and the, and the blue. And so there is, ah,
centralized infrastructure in, ah, both single
buildings and, ah, campus-style buildings.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And what about senior-only buildings? Where are they located within senior-only buildings?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: They are usually right outside of the building. Those are generally single, ah, ah, single buildings and so those are generally right outside of the, ah, buildings.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is NYCHA tracking diversion rates at developments that now have recycling centers?

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you for that question, Madam Chair. Al, would you like to take this question?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Ah, we, we currently do not track, ah, recycling at these

\_

locations. Ah, the, ah, the amount of anything that's collected in the recyclable containers, ah, are placed in the recycling areas and they're picked up once a week at the developments, and that material is comingled with the, ah, the household recyclables of the, the truck that services the entire neighborhood. So there is no way for us to determine, ah, you know, come up with a weight, which would give you your diversion rate.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Um, do you have any plans at all to set any goals related to how you would be able to collection this information if you feel it's necessary and, um, like even working with the residents on, um, expanding residents, ah, recycling participation?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Yes,

absolutely, absolutely. I'm glad you asked that

question. Ah, that, ah, recycling is, is a high

priority, ah, for the authority. And, um, the

recycling, which I'm trying to break down currently,

ah, how we can determine, ah, which material, you

know, we're picking up, where we can grab the

numbers, ah, for, to come up with a diversion rate.

You know, we could do diversion rate either by weight

1 2 or by volume, because, as you know, landfill, it doesn't know weight, it knows volume. It's space. 3 4 So, ah, basically we want to take all of the 5 initiatives, the mattresses, ah, the cardboard bales. 6 We have these, the new cardboard balers which I 7 mentioned in my testimony, ah, that we're able to make, ah, you know, it's, it's much simpler. 8 basically you just lift open the top, throw your 9 10 cardboard boxes in there at the development, and then they actually have a baling machine that it actually 11 gets, you know, when it reaches the weight limit that 12 13 has the baling machine and that particular piece of 14 equipment reports back. That actually has new 15 technology that has, it's cellular technology that 16 reports back and it lets you know how many bales were 17 made, and we already know what it set it, you know, 18 for weight so that Sanitation could pick it up, ah, 19 without straining themselves. It'll be 40, 50 20 pounds. You could set it to like 100 pounds if you wanted to. But Sanitation said 40 pounds is, is a 21 22 weight that they're OK with. So we know how many 23 bales are created, ah, and it's only at select 24 locations, but it's a start. My goal is to have ah,

e-equipment or i-equipment, you know, however,

25

2 however you want to stay very intelligent equipment that can report back to us when people are using 3 4 things. And part of the baling machine, ah, and, you 5 know, not to bore you to death with this, the little 6 details, ah, but, ah, with the baling machine you can 7 actually see when people are using the baler. knows when the baling machine is actually working. 8 So it helps us to make sure that if we want to know 9 10 if somebody's recycling it'll report back to us saying they use this machine every day, and then 11 another, then another, you know, another development 12 13 may report back that nobody has used this machine in 14 two days, or three days. And then that, these are 15 all flags that come up. And these are great, great 16 management tools, ah, and it's ways of accountability, and it's a way of also determining, 17 18 ah, and develop our new diversion rate. Ah, the 19 mattress, that'll be something else, because 20 mattresses is another, ah, big volume item, that we can figure out how much landfill space, you know, 21 22 part of the diversion rate, right? Diversion rate is 23 the amount of material that we're diverting away from landfills. So we'll be able to tell with the 24

mattresses. Ah, we recycle also, ah, stoves and

I hope I've answered your question.

refrigerators. You know, we have, we're, we're getting numbers on that now, ah, as well as Sanitation does pick up some of them. Ah, so, you know, I want to come up with, ah, good estimates on our front as well as working with our Sanitation partner and providing a, ah, reliable diversion rate.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: You have, you have. You answered that question and you answered the, you know, a, a series of other questions that I had related to clarification around the mattress [laughs].

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: OK

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So thank you for that. Um, I only have a few more questions, um, that I need to just get on the record. The neighborhood rat reduction program began in 2017 with the goal to reduce the rat population by 70% at 110 sites. Has the program met or come close to the goals that were set? How much does the neighborhood rat reduction program cost and, um, has NYCHA successfully installed the 50 rat slabs across nine developments, as stated in the planning, and if not

what were the causes for the delays? So could you just speak to the rat reduction program?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you,

Madam Chair, for that question. I'm gonna defer the,

ah, the pest part of that question to Josephine

Bartlett.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Hi. Um, we are close. Um, we, month to month we are about at 65%. Last month we had a 67%, um, reduction. This month right now we're at 61%. So we are getting close to our 70%. Um, this is, um, the cost of it is, our 22 exterminators that work on this, um, burrow collapsers, which is eight people, our, um, our 72 seasonals, eight caretakers, three SOEs, one program manager. Um, it is 51 full-time staff for NRR. This is \$2,288,954, um, and the seasonal budget to date is \$322,000. Um, for the rat slabs I'll pass it to Vlada.

VICE PRESIDENT KENNIFF: Thank you. Um,

I understand that 14 slabs have been completed. Ah,

there are 36 that are in progress. Ah, COVID has had
an impact on delays in this particular project.

There was a, um, citywide funding freeze for eight

months. This program was capitally funded, um, city

funded. Also, um, rat slabs are, ah, done in compliant spaces so some of that work couldn't be performed during COVID restrictions.

just briefly give us, ah, um, like a quick understanding or just put into context the, the complaints that you've heard around, um, the rats recently, right, and the rat reduction program. Can you explain, um, why we still hear, um, rat complaints, um, and, you know, just kind of explain for the public why and what, and you know we can talk about this, you know, this amazing program, and then on the other hand folks still struggling with rats.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: Absolutely.

Um, unfortunately, we can't get rid of the rats

completely. So we are still seeing these complaints.

Um, we have made, um, a lot of headway. Like Council

Member Ayala speaking about, um, places in Harlem,

like Jefferson in her district had 152 rat burrows

when they entered the program in 2019, and last month

were at 70. Johnson has also seen a very, um, big

decrease from 131 from their baseline to 44. Kings

Tower 184, and last month were down to 18. So as she

said, but also as she said, she said south Bronx is

having, um, a lot of difficulties, and yes, we're having a lot of challenges. Um, Patterson, which is in the neighborhood rat reduction, um, is at the same level as when it came in. It does fluctuate, obviously. Every month is different and we work with our Department of Health, um, partners. They have an inspection team that does these burrow counts. Patterson is at 82 rat burrows and last month they were at 83. Our team has been working really diligently on the gardens. There's a few gardens that were created with partnership with the Knapp program and we've been working with those gardeners to really, um, target areas where we're seeing a lot of rat burrows, um, in these spaces. So our team is there treating the grounds twice a week and is working on that closely. Mitchell, although it's not a neighborhood rat reduction program, we know it has issues and we have, um, a team of exterminators there twice a week treating the grounds and, um, working in the basements as well. So, um, yes, we, you know, there's ups and downs and each, um, development has its challenges, um, but that's part of the integrated pest management to kind of see where the root cause

24

20

21

22

23

2 again is, where we can target and get better results 3 in the future.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, thank you for that. So now I'm just gonna ask a question, a couple of questions about the, um, preconsidered Intros, the bills themself related to the New York City Housing Authority complaints. When NYCHA responds to a resident complaint about pests and does some kind of fix, is it NYCHA's policy to ask the resident whether the pest condition has been addressed before marking the complaint resolved? And does NYCHA have any particular policy involving senior households or households with children?

VICE PRESIDENT FERGUSON: Thank you,

Madam Chair, for that question. Ah, I'm gonna refer
you to Josie Bartlett again.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: So, um, part of our new standard procedure when we go into an apartment if there is a pest infestation, um, on the work order we put corrective action taken, and they must mark the level of infestation that they saw, low, medium, and high, and this is all standardized and has been taught to our exterminators. This triggers a follow-up work order automatically, which

we, has, ah, priority, like what we spoke about with the matrix earlier and our exterminator goes back again on this new work order. Um, if they see, ah, signs of pests again they would do corrective action taken again and another follow up was created until really the issue is resolved. Um, but they can put, yeah?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Like you said the first time, so they make a complaint, and then someone comes out. And you said corrective action was taken and there's a follow-up. I don't really understand that.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: OK.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How do have corrective, corrective action taken if it wasn't, um, resolved?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: So the, a treatment is done on that visit. So they put down pesticides, they do HEPA, they do, ah, HEPA vacuum. Um, they caulk, they seal. You know, it's different for each work order and we track it, we see what is done. But they don't know if that has eliminated the issue until they come back. So if corrective action is marked, so this is a little nitty-gritty, but on

1 2 each work order there's four options you can do. 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

There's preventative. You don't see pests but, um, we put, we did some caulking, we did some gel to be preventative in case in the future. Um, satisfactory means no pests. We don't use pesticides and, um, there's not a follow-up. But when corrective action is marked on this work order, the infestation level has to be marked and automatically a follow-up work order is done and that's just to make sure to see that when they come back again what is the level of infestation again? Is it still medium? Is it low? Has it been, gone away? Like this is the way that we know if what we've done, um, has eradicated the issue.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So whose job is it with, within NYCHA to, to make sure that if a case or complaint is marked resolved that's it's actually resolved?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR BARTLETT: So we have, on the pest side we've got a few levels of, um, Q&A going on. Um, we, all of our five teams of exterminators have one to two supervisors of exterminators which are always doing pop-ups on their staff. They put their labor code on the work orders

and we can from, um, a management side which apartments they've done and what has been done. Um, we also have environmental health and safety which does, um, reviews of the work orders and, um, does reviews in person to see what is being done and that it matches up with what you're seeing on the work order. We have a QA department that is doing the same, and then the pest control department that I am part of, we are looking at these work orders and we have two technical advisors who have decades of experience that go out, shadow staff, and make sure that, um, when they're doing integrated pest management they're doing it to our standards and that the work is being done with what we want.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So because, you know, the conversation is always around accountability and transparency and making sure that agencies are working together, you know, um, if there's a rat infestation and, you know, how is that being tracked with DOHMH and when we're talking about waste management, you know, what, you know, how are you working with Sanitation? Um, can you speak to this bill around, um, being able to call in complaints with 311? Um, do you think it's possible

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 to merge the NYCHA call center with 311? You know,

3 if you just give us your thoughts around the bill

4 | itself?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council Member, um, so, as you know, this is an idea that's been around for a long time, um, at different times NYCHA, you know, has entertained it and had conversations with, with [inaudible]. Um, the, and you've been to our call center in Long Island City, and it's actually a very, it's a very good call center. really is. I think, I, I kind of wish that, um, that, you know, more residents and, and more council members could go there, because, ah, if you see it runs really well. I think people get frustrated, um, because, um, they call the call center, they get a work order number, and yes, it's true, sometimes the work doesn't get done the way, in, in the time that it was supposed to, the quality of the work is not what they wanted, and they, and they think automatically it's the call center that was the problem, when in fact oftentimes the call center did its job. You know, you call there, you, you put in your complaint, they give you the ticket number. problem, I think, a lot of times is and something we

recognize, the problem is, you know, oftentimes with
the, um, making sure that the work gets done and
making sure that it's quality, is, is getting done,
but it's not the call center. Um, NYCHA residents,
um, can call 311, ah, currently and those complaints
do get routed to NYCHA, you know, and would anyway,
you know, would, would no matter what. Um,
just like any other landlord, though, if you lived, I
always compare to [inaudible] because it's a big
apartment complex, or Starrett City, or something
like that. Your first line of defense would be
called the landlord, you know, ah, in that, in that
instance. If the landlord does not do what they're
supposed to do then you can call 311 and, and, and,
ah, and they would, ah, be able to route it to the
proper agency. Um, we believe that we need to get
better in terms of quality assurances with work order
tickets. And I know that this bill is well
intentioned, but I'm not sure it achieves that goal.
CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. And, um,

just, I mean, this is a resolution, but it's a state

bill. But, you know, what do you think your thoughts

around the Utility Accountability Act?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, so I, I, I've, I've had several conversations with the, ah, with Assembly Member Anderson about this bill. We, and we've looked at it very closely. It would cost us about 35 million dollars, um, um, ah, in expense dollars, um, if we were to, ah, to enact the bill, um, as, you know, as written. Um, we, ah, I think that the goal here is to make sure that we have fewer, um, outages and make sure that they last a short, short a period of time. I'm not sure how taking resources away from us does, ah, achieves that goal. Nationally we're having a conversation around infrastructure and I think we all agree that the way to get better services is to invest in our infrastructure and not to be punitive on a municipality or an, an agency, and I think, you know, in some ways while very long outages, especially around gas, are more than frustrating, I, I, I don't even have the words, you know, in my vocabulary to describe what they are, um, are, you know, just unacceptable. Um, I don't, you know, costing, you know, um, I, I, I'm not sure if this is the right way to go. Um, the, the other thing the, the bill does needs to be tightened up and I, and I told the

25

council member.

2 sponsor this, too, and we'd, we'd be happy to work with him on. It does not differentiate between the 3 4 cause of the outage, right? So it could be NYCHA, it 5 could be, for instance, I remember a few years ago we were at Howard Houses, Con Ed, you know, just shut 6 7 down elevator service for everybody. Well, the way the bill is written right now NYCHA then would have 8 to pay residents, you know, for that shutdown in 9 10 service, um, as well. Um, and Council Member Menchaca I know, who, you know, is, you know, pushing 11 this resolution, um, understandably because in Red 12 Hook we've experienced a lot of gas outages. Red 13 14 Hook Houses is 82 years old and the infrastructure is 15 the same age, and if you, if, if you know any who is 16 82 and really didn't take very good care of 17 themselves they're probably not in good shape and Red 18 Hook Houses, um, is also experiencing about 500 19 million dollars in upgrades around Sandy. So as we 20 dig, you know, um, contractors sometimes are, you know, hitting things that they're not supposed to 21 22 but, you know, it does cause outages, um, and, but 23 it's also, there are pipes that are well past their shelf life. Um, we've had conversations with the 24

We've had conversations with Red

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 Hook Initiative, other groups in that area, and say

3 really the best way to go is to look to replace the

4 gas risers rather than, you know, and then, you know,

5 long term we probably wouldn't have, you know, that

6 issue and, ah, and I, I think, I think through

7 investment we can, we'd, we'd be better suited to

8 | achieve the goal here.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, thank you so much for that, Brian. Um, I actually do not have any other questions. Um, but I do hope that just hearing your testimony today we're able to, ah, you know, really work together on pests and waste management. Um, there's been some real take-aways. And I know Council Member Ayala mentioned it, um, you know, [inaudible] together, um, clearly there's some need for some round tables and working directly with the residents related to communication, um, information, um, sharing, um, everything else. um, there's definitely a need for some follow-up. But I do appreciate, um, the conversation. So, again, I have no more questions for, um, NYCHA, but I do know that we have a couple of residents who wanted to, um, speak after the community group, the authority. So I'll turn it back over to...

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: And, and, and
Council Member, could I just add, could I just add
something that came up earlier? Earlier you had
asked about, you know, what's going at 90 Church
around hiring. Um, that is around the cleanup corps,
um, and to date, um, we have hired, um, over, um,
500, ah, 500 people for that, ah, for those positions
and over half of them have been residents. So, ah,
and they started, ah, some of them started the last
week of May. So we're halfway to our goal. We hope,
ah, by July to be fully there, ah, to be 1000 hired.
And, ah, the current numbers are 539 hired, 224 of
them are residents.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Say, what [inaudible] number?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: 539 hired to date. Ah, 224 are residents.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK, OK. And is there, and there is a, a heavy push to inform the residents about this job opportunity?

VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We sent this all to, you know, all, you know, all residents with email addresses. We've been, you know, putting it out there on social and made sure that all the tenant

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

24

leaders, too, do have it. You know, any	council
---	---------

3 members, if you, ah, want to make sure that the

4 residents in your district know about it, you know,

5 please encourage them to apply.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: OK. Thank you

7 so much. Thank you. Audrey?

will now return to testimony from members of the public. Ah, please listen for your name. Once your name is called please accept the prompt to unmute. The Sergeant at Arms will set the timer and announce that you may begin. Your testimony will be set to two minutes. Um, I would now like to welcome Caller One to testify. For the record, could you please state your name, Caller One?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

DIANA BLACKWELL: Well, good afternoon.

19 | Thank you, Chair Ampry-Samuel and committee council

20 members for having me here today. My name is Diana

21 | Blackwell and today I'm speaking as a member of the

22 NYCHA Recycling Committee for the Manhattan South

23 Solid Waste Advisory Board, or the MSSWAB, a

voluntary citizen advisory board dedicated to helping

25 NYC achieve a zero waste goal. As advocates for

25

cardboard and mattresses. However, a more vigorous

2	effort is needed in order to contribute to the city's			
3	reduction goals for waste and greenhouse gas			
4	emissions. According to the NYCHA's 2018 waste			
5	management report they now have a diversion rate of			
6	an increase of 2%. This means a staggering 1900, I'm			
7	sorry, 196,000 tons of NYCHA waste is sent to			
8	landfills or incinerators. This is equivalent to			
9	50,000 tons of gas, ah, GHS emissions every year.			
10	75% of these totals could be reduced with a robust			
11	recycling plan. To further increase NYCHA recycling			
12	rates, NYCHA must make additional plans for			
13	sustainability, increasing residential participation			
14	in recycling. These plans should be implemented and			
15	alongside the infrastructure and institutional			
16	improvements. As NYCHA works hard to revitalize			
17	waste yards and build recycling infrastructures into			
18	new campus waste systems they, they must also work			
19	with the residents to build in recycling programs.			
20	Just like every other New Yorker, NYCHA residents			
21	should know how in their building their recycling			
22	bins will be reliable, to be located, and they should			
23	know which materials go in each bin. Achieving an			

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

24 excellent residential...

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

DIANA BLACKWELL: Thank you. We will applaud NYCHA. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ms. Blackwell, please continue.

DIANA BLACKWELL: OK, thank you. Ah, I'm just gonna repeat. Achieving excellent resident participation takes residents' investment, ongoing education, and hands-on contamination control. bureau should coordinate with these environmental leaders to ensure effective recycling education at each campus and discover which campuses might benefit from the installation of a DSNY program, such as ewaste and textile recycling that are currently available to NYCHA campuses. You know, we do applaud NYCHA for creating a comprehensive plan for the institutional waste management, as rapid improvements continue to occur in NYCHA's waste infrastructure and collections. We ask that you extend these improvements to NYCHA's sustainability and community investment so that we create campuses that are not only cleaner but greener and safer and more empowered. And I thank you very much.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thank you very much. I believe this concludes public testimony.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 However, if we have inadvertently forgotten to call

3 on anyone to testify please use the Zoom raise hand

4 function now and we will try to hear from you.

5 | Seeing no hands, I will turn it back over to Chair

6 Ampry-Samuel to close the hearing.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so I do want to recognize, um, the committee staff. Thank you so much, Audrey, for your assistance during this, um, hearing and for all the prep leading to it, as well as Ricky Challa and Hozay Condey. Um, I also want to, um, just personally thank Ms. Mcfarlane, um, Ms. Blackwell, and Ms. Massac for coming in and testifying today. I always appreciate your voice, um, and your expertise, um, and I would like to do that follow-up, um, Ms. Mcfarlane, um, with Diana Ayala, Council Member Ayala, and Ms. Blackwell I would also like to follow up with you because you mentioned some things around, um, just, just gas and our sustainability, and I do have a gas, um, ban bill that has been introduced in the council and I would love to be able to get your, um, your input. Um, thank you so much, NYCHA, for your testimony today, and I do look forward to the, um, follow-up. So we will receive, um, you know,

1	$\circ$	
$\perp$		0

## COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

clearly a follow-up from the committee and I look forward to those next steps. So with that, um, that will conclude today's, um, hearing with the Public Housing Committee, um, and enjoy, ah, a safe and prosperous day and week [laughs]. [gavel]

## ${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date \_\_\_\_July 21, 2021