CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

June 16, 2021

Start: 11:08 a.m. Recess: 11:34 a.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing (Virtual Room 1)

B E F O R E: Rafael Salamanca Jr.

CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne Adams

Diana Ayala

Inez Barron

Joseph Borelli

Selvena Brooks-Powers

Ruben Diaz, Sr.

Oswald Feliz

Vanessa Gibson

Barry Grodenchik

Peter Koo

Stephen Levin

I Daneek Miller

Francisco Moya

Kevin Riley

Antonio Reynoso

Carlina Rivera

Mark Treyger

Jumaane Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: PC recording started.

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Cloud begun.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Back up is rolling.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Good morning and welcome to the Committee on Land Use. At this time, would all panelists please turn on your videos? I repeat, all panelists please turn on your videos. Thank you. To minimize disruption, please place all electronic devices to vibrate or silent mode. Land use testimony@council.NYC.gov. I repeat. Land use testimony@council.nyc.gov. Chair Salamanca, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you,
sergeant-at-arms. Good morning. I am Council member
Rafael Salamanca, Chair of the Committee on Land Use.
I would like to thank our subcommittee Chairs Moya
and Riley for their work on the subcommittees. I am
joined remotely today by Council members Adams,
Ayala, Barron, Borelli, Senior Diaz, Feliz,
Grodenchik, Koo, Levin, Chair Moya, Reynoso, Chair
Riley, and Public Advocate Williams. We have also
been joined by Council member Brooks-Powers. Today,
we will vote on applications referred out from both
of our subcommittees, but before I begin, I would

2.2

2 like to recognize the committee counsel to review the 3 remote meeting procedures.

Salamanca. I am Julie Lubin, counsel to the committee. Council members who would like to ask questions or make remarks should use the zoom raise hand function. The raise hand button should appear at the bottom of the panel. I will announce council members who have questions or remarks in the order that they raise to their hands. Chair Salamanca will then recognize members to speak. We ask that you please be patient if any technical difficulties arise today. Chair Salamanca will now continue with today's agenda items.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, counsel.

From the zoning subcommittee, we will vote to approve prey considered LUs 806 and 807 for the St. Joseph's 1949 Bathgate Avenue rezoning related to property in Council member Feliz's district in the Bronx. The proposal seeks a zoning map and zoning text amendment, including changing and R6A district to and R7D district and the establishment of a mandatory inclusionary housing area, mapping option one and option two to facilitate that development of an 11-

project at 55 percent.

1

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 story residential building. The building will contain approximately 130 units of supportive housing 3 and 157 units will be for residents earning 40 to 70 percent of the AMI with an average AMI for the 5

We will also vote to approve LU 792, the 16th Street zoning special permit relating to property in Council member Treyger's district in Brooklyn. The proposal seeks a special permit for commercial use within the special Coney Island mixed use district to facilitate the development of a twostory commercial warehouse building at 2706 West 16th Street.

We will vote to approve with modifications LU 709 and 791 for the 909 Castle Hill Avenue rezoning relating to property in Council member Ruben Diaz Senior's district in the Bronx. The proposal seeks a zoning map and zoning text amendment, including changing the R3-2 district to an R6B district with the portion of C1-3 overlay in the establishment of a mandatory inclusionary housing area mapping option one and option two to facilitate the development of a five story mixed use building including approximately 35 dwelling units, nine of

2.2

which would be permanently affordable, as well as a commercial and communities space. Community facility space. Our modifications will be to strike MIH option two while retaining option one.

We will also vote to approve prey considered LU 797 for the Crab Shanty 361 City Island Avenue rezoning related to property in Council member Mark Gjonaj's district in the Bronx. The proposal seeks a zoning map amendment to establish a C1-2 commercial overlay district within an existing R3A district which would bring the Crap Shanty restaurant and its long-standing commercial use into conformance with zoning.

From our landmarks subcommittee, we will vote to approve application number 20215029 SCM, submitted pursuant to section 1732 of the New York School Construction Authority. This application is for a proposed site selection of property located at 3761 Temp avenue in the borough of Brooklyn for a new, approximately 860 seat primary and intermediate school. This school would replace a lease space north of site currently occupied by PS 18 and PSIS 278. The site is in a district represented by Council member Rodriguez. We will also vote to

approve LU 803 and 804, the Bedside Central and North
NIHOP cluster UDAP and Article 11. This application
submitted by HPD and requests approval of the
designation of an urban development action area and
urban development action area project for such area
and a disposition of city owned property in an
exemption from real property taxation pursuant to
article 11 of the Private Housing Finance Law. Both
items are related to for vacant city owned property
is located at 187 and 187 R, Chancy Street, 772
Myrtle Avenue, 890 Myrtle Avenue, and 1119 I'm
sorry. At 119-125 Barnett Avenue in Bed Stuy,
neighborhood of Brooklyn represented by Council
member Cornegy. These action would facilitate the
construction of approximately 45 affordable
homeownership cooperative units distributed across
the four sites. The sale prices will be affordable
for households with incomes between 80 and 130
percent of the area median income.

We will also vote to approve LU 805, the 72-H transfer of block 3930, lot 50. This application was submitted by the Department of the Citywide Administrative Services on behalf of the Mayor's Office of Resiliency pursuant to section 72-H

2.2

of the General Municipal Law for the transfer of city owned property known as block 3930, lot 50 in the borough of Staten Island to the United States of America acting by and through the National Parks Service. The proposed transfer will require that the entire property being used as an enhanced swamp and public access path in furtherance of the environmental mitigation [inaudible 00:06:34] South Shore Staten Island Coastal Storm risk management project being undertaken by the federal government. The property is located in the district represented by Council member Matteo.

We will also vote to approve five applications to facilitate the Melrose Open Door project in my district in the Bronx. These application submitted by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development will facilitate the construction of 12 new residential buildings in Bronx community board districts one, two, and three and that between them will contain approximately 70 affordable cooperative home ownership units. Previously, units were plan to be affordable to households earning incomes between 80 and 130 percent of AMI. Now the proposal has been modified to be

2.2

affordable to households earning between 63 and 82 percent of the AMI. The project will be developed by MANY under HPD's Open Door Affordable Homeownership program. The property included in the projects are vacant or will be demolished for new construction.

LUS 801 is a ULURP application for the designation of an Urban Development Action area.

Approval of the Urban Development Action Area project and disquisition of the city owned property located at 667 [inaudible 00:07:47] Avenue, 675 Eagle Avenue, 672 Saint Anne's Avenue, A40 Tinton Avenue, and A42 Tinton Avenue in the Bronx. Community Board one.

This action will facilitate the construction of approximately four buildings with approximately 28 cooperative units.

LUS 800 is an application for amendment to the Mott Haven Urban Renewal Air Plan to exempt two sites in Community District one, 675 Eagle Avenue and 672 Saint Anne's Avenue for the floor area ratio, open space ratio, and parking requirements for the Urban Renewal Plan.

LUs 799 is an application requesting a waiver of the area designation requirements of Section 693 of the General Municipal Law. Waiver of

cooperative units.

2.2

the requirements of Charter Section 197 C and 197 D and approval of the project as an Urban Development Action Area project of property located at 1048 Faile Street in the Bronx. Community Board two. This action will facilitate the construction of a new building with approximately four affordable

LU 802 is an application for the designation of an Urban Development Action Area approval of an Urban Development Action project for such area and approval of the disposition of the city owned property located at 881 Brook Avenue, 901 Eagle Avenue, 959 Holmes Street, 1298 Hope Avenue and 1013 Hope Street in Bronx Community District three. This action will facilitate the construction of approximately five buildings containing approximately 32 cooperative units.

LU 798 is an application submitted pursuant to Article 11 of the Private Housing Finance Blog requesting approval of an exemption for real property taxation for all the properties in the project areas.

And also, today, we will also vote to approve proposed Introduction number 1572 B, a local

2 law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York in relation to requiring a citywide 3 4 equitable development data tool and racial equity 5 report on housing an opportunity, sponsored by Public 6 Advocate and myself. I would like to thank all my 7 colleagues who have joined as co-sponsors. This bill was first introduced on May 29th, 2019 Stated 8 Meeting. It was subsequently amended as proposed 9 Intro 1572 A. The Land Use Committee held a hearing 10 on the amended bill on January 11th, 2021. Since 11 12 then, the bill has been further amended as the 13 version we have before us today. Across the nation, 14 there is a renewed movement and energy from local 15 governments and organizations of all types of 16 establish new tools to help address racial equity. 17 Intro 1572 B potential to be a nationwide model for 18 how cities can build the goal of racial equity into their land use and housing policy making process. 19 will try to summarize the key points of the bill as 20 briefly as possible. The proposed bill would require 21 2.2 applications for certain land use actions to provide 23 the City Planning Commission and the public with a report on racial equity in connection with their 24 25 These are new racial equity reports on the

2 housing an opportunity that would include a statement describing how the proposed project relates to the 3 city's goal and strategies for affirmatively 4 furthering fair housing and promoting equitable 5 access to opportunity. Moreover, these racial equity 6 7 reports would be required to draw data for a local study area from a newly created equitable development 8 data tool established by the Department of Housing 9 10 Preservation and Development and city planning for citywide, borough wide, and where, statistically, 11 12 reliable data is available. Neighborhood and 13 community district level data. The equitable 14 development data tool will provide data on six 15 categories: demographics, economic security, 16 neighborhood quality of life, and access to 17 opportunity. Housing security and affordability, 18 housing production, and a displacement risk index comprised of indicators of population vulnerability, 19 20 housing conditions. The bill would require data to be disaggregated by race and ethnicity and include a 21 2.2 20 year look back for trends wherever available. 23 Additionally, for covered applications in connection with residential projects, the bill would require 24 25 such reports to state the expected rents for market

rate and affordable units and the corresponding
incomes needed to afford to them without incurring
how cost burdens. The reports will also provide the
race, ethnicity for such households. Together, the
equitable development data tool and racial equity
reports will help the public, city agencies, and
elected officials better understand and combat racial
disparities in the land use policies. This bill will
deliver greatly expanded information on displacement
risks in our communities and help ensure that we
consider the racial equity implications of new
development. As New Yorkers continue to push for
fair housing and racial equity, developing tools to
achieve these goals in the context of the land use
approval processes of the utmost importance and this
bill is a significant step in that direction. I
strongly recommend my colleagues to support this
groundbreaking legislation. Public Advocate Jumaane
Williams has been pushing for the adoption of this
legislation since he originally introduced it and is
here today to provide some remarks. Public Advocate
Williams?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much, Chair Salamanca. As mentioned, my name is

2 Jumaane Williams. I'm the Public Advocate for the city of New York. I want to thank you, Chair 3 Salamanca and the members of the Committee on Land 4 Use for holding this very important committee vote 5 6 Thank you, again, for your support on this 7 piece of legislation from day one and helping shepherd through to where it is today. Thank you 8 very much for your support as the Chair. 9 It has been remarkable important to getting where we are today. 10 For many years, land rezoning has been seen as a tool 11 12 for commercial progression in our city, however, the way land rezoning has been executed in New York has 13 14 often widely been seen to be one of the main 15 contributing factors that have led to or exacerbated 16 rising rents, gentrification, displacement, and 17 exclusion. The pattern continues because rezoning 18 applications are approved very often without having all of the necessary information including data on 19 20 the individuals who already reside in the project's This bill, Introduction 1572 B, cosponsored by 21 2.2 Chair Salamanca, will address this issue in two ways. 23 The first will be the creation of an equitable development data tool which the Department of Housing 24 Preservation and Development and the Department of 25

2 City Planning will be required to create in collaboration with other agencies. This tool will 3 include, but is not limited to, demographic 4 conditions, household economic security, neighborhood 5 quality of life and access to opportunity, housing 6 7 security, affordability and quality, housing production, and a displacement risk index. A 8 displacement risk index will consist of signs of 9 population vulnerability, housing conditions, and 10 neighborhood change such as race and Hispanic origin, 11 12 income, English language proficiency, number of 13 renter occupied housing units, number of rent-14 stabilized housing units, number of income restricted 15 housing units, number of households experiencing rent 16 burden, trends in housing and prices in rents, and the number of housing units with three or more 17 18 maintenance deficiencies. This tool, which will be updated annually and available for public use will be 19 20 used by applicants as part of now mandated racial equity reports for certain rezoning applications. 21 2.2 The provision on racial equity reports is the second 23 component of this bill that makes it instrumental in helping to address the problems of housing insecurity 24 The intention of Intro 1572 B is not to 25 in our city.

2 impede construction. It is not to impede development, but rather to disclose substantial 3 information to equip policymakers and elected 4 officials like ourselves and residents to better 5 6 discern how a proposed project might impacted their 7 community during a rezoning proposal. More than two years to the day when this bill was introduced to the 8 city Council. Were very proud to see how far this 9 legislation has come. With the help of housing 10 advocates, especially the racial impact study 11 12 coalition and [inaudible 00:16:36] who first told me 13 and introduce the idea to me, we have a creative bill 14 that will further housing equality for New Yorkers. 15 I am also proud to say that my office released a 16 legislative report this morning explaining the need 17 for racial equity report to be a part of a land 18 rezoning process. For anyone who is still uncertain as to why our city needs to ensure that race and 19 20 ethnicity are examined during the land use application process, I recommend reading this report. 21 2.2 This morning, I would like to join the Chair in 23 urging every member of the Committee on Land Use to vote yes. Passing Intro 1572 B will solidify our 24 efforts as elected officials to make more informed 25

land use [inaudible UU:1/:14] which protects people
of more color from displacement and guarantees that
the economic development communities considers
everyone who is already there. As well as thanking,
Chair Salamanca, I'd like to thank Speaker Johnson.
I would also thank from my staff Casey Addison,
director of legislation policy who did the lion's
share of the awesome work that got us here. The
Senior Glover, Deputy Public advocate for housing.
Anika Michelle, policy and legislative associate.
Veronica Avis, chief Deputy Public Advocate for
policy. Nick Smith, first Deputy Public Advocate for
all the hard work in moving this legislation forward.
I would also like to thank the Council land use team
Roger Mann, George Sarcusan [sp?], Julie Lubin,
Bryant Paul, Caitlin Greer, and Jason Goldman. You
do a great job in helping navigate this. Thank you
so much and, again, on the project, I [inaudible
00:18:06] yes.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Public

Advocate Jumaane Williams, and I know that you

mentioned them, but I need to just give them a

shoutout and thank them because they were helpful in

helping me understand this and getting it to the

- 2 finish line, as well. I have to give a big shoutout
- 3 to Rob Salano from CUFFH, Churches United for Fair
- 4 Housing, for helping us get this to the finish line.
- 5 With that, members of the committee and members
- 6 representing affected districts who have questions or
- 7 | remarks about today's items should use the raise hand
- 8 button now. Counsel, can you recognize any members
- 9 | with their hands up?
- 10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council member
- 11 [inaudible 00:18:44] has his hand up.
- 12 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: So, I see Council
- 13 member Feliz.
- 14 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Yeah. Thank you so
- 15 | much. I wanted to say a few words about the Saint
- 16 Joseph's project. So, today I'll be voting yes on
- 17 | the project. However, I am my community have
- 18 | question and also concerns about the project. The
- 19 | application will help facilitate the construction of
- 20 | housing units including affordable housing units that
- 21 | are desperately needed in our borough and also in the
- 22 | city of New York. The application will also help
- 23 | facilitate the construction of 60 units for
- 24 | individuals with serious mental health complications
- 25 and the project will be built in a community that has

a lot of needs. Individuals with mental health
complications who aren't receiving the resources that
they need. So, before the Stated Meeting tomorrow,
looking forward to meeting with the applicant's and
continue the conversation about how this project,
which I think is a good one, can be used to serve
the housing and the services that it offers can be
used to the help the individuals who are already in
this community and aren't receiving the housing and
also the services that they need and deserve. So, I
am in support of the project, but, again, before I
think it's a good project, but before the Stated
tomorrow, I look forward to continuing the
conversation about how this project and the resources
that it offers can better serve the local community
that the project will be built on.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Council member Feliz. Are there any other members that wish to speak?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I see no other hands.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Okay. Seeing none,
I will now call for a vote in accordance with the
recommendations of the subcommittees and the local

Reynoso?

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to 3 explain my vote?

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, Chair Salamanca. I just want to congratulate Chair Salamanca and Public Advocate Jumaane Williams for this great piece of legislation on progress that was able to be made in their time here in the Council. I also want to shout out the people that were doing the work on the ground. Churches United for Fair Housing who have been asking to just get a better understanding of demographics and data related to these rezonings in a more meaningful way so that we can make it, you know, objective and data-driven informed decision related to the rezoning instead of just assuming -- using assumptions to plan our city. So, get, just wanted to thank Chair Salamanca and Public Advocate Jumaane Williams and Churches United for Fair Housing for the great work that they did. probably vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Council member Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you. I want to join my colleagues and congratulating Public

committee.

25

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 25
2	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you. I would
3	like to thank the members of the public, my
4	colleagues, counsel, and sergeant-at-arms on land use
5	staff for attending today's hearing. This meeting is
6	hereby adjourned. Thank you.
7	[gavel]
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date	June	20,	2021