

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

May 5, 2021
Start: 11:33 a.m.
Recess: 2:11 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 1

B E F O R E: Ydanis Rodriguez
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ydanis Rodriguez
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Fernando Cabrera
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Robert F. Holden
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Deborah L. Rose
Carlina Rivera

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Hank Gutman
Commissioner
Department of Transportation

Eric Beaton
Deputy Commissioner for Transportation
Planning and Management
Department of Transportation

Rebecca Zack
Assistant Commissioner for
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs
Department of Transportation

Melanie La Rocca
Commissioner
Department of Buildings

Gale Brewer

Jose Holguin-Veras

Marco Conner DiAquoi

Matt Bauer

Kendra Hems

Ryan Monell

Axel Carrion

Richard Lipsky

Charles Yu

Jeffrey Friedman

Thomas Ferrugia

Regina Fojas

Glen Bolofsky

Jessica Baker

Laura Rothrock

Luis Lopez

Edward Funches

Jeffrey Williams

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: PC recording has
3 commenced.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Cloud recording good.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Backup is rolling.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you, and good
9 morning, and welcome to today's remote New York City
10 Council hearing of the Committee on Transportation.
11 At this time would all council members and council
12 staff please turn on their video. To minimize
13 disruption, please place electronic devices on
14 vibrate or silent mode. If you wish to submit
15 testimony you may do so at testimony@council.nyc.gov.
16 Once again, that is testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank
17 you. We are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you to all
19 the sergeants, sergeants and technicians, who have
20 been working so hard to be sure again that all New
21 Yorkers have the opportunity to follow the hearing,
22 eh, of the council. Thank you all for joining our
23 hearing today on the council's package of bills to
24 support smart, safe, and sustainable deliveries in
25

1
2 the city. First, I'm going to turn it over to our
3 committee counsel to go over some procedures items.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I'm
5 Elliot Lin, council to the Transportation Committee
6 of the New York City Council. Before we begin, I
7 wanted to remind everyone that you will be on mute
8 until you are called on to testify, when you will be
9 unmuted by the host. Please listen for your name to
10 be called. I will periodically announce who the Next
11 panelists will be. The first panelist will be from
12 the administration, from the Department of
13 Transportation, ah, Commissioner Hank Gutman, Deputy
14 Commissioner for Transportation Planning and
15 Management Eric Beaton, and Assistant Commissioner
16 for Intergovernmental and Community Affairs Rebecca
17 Zack. And from the Department of Buildings
18 Commissioner Melanie La Rocca. Ah, during the
19 hearing, if council members would like to ask a
20 question please use the Zoom raise hand function and
21 I will call on you in order. Unless otherwise
22 indicated by the chair, we will be limiting council
23 member questions to five minutes, including answers.
24 Before I turn it back over to the chair, I would like
25 to acknowledge that we've been joined by Council

1
2 Members D. Diaz, Powers, Koo, Rose, Holden, Rivera,
3 Reynoso, Levine, Brooks-Powers, and Cabrera. Ah,
4 Chair?

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
6 Elliot. I'm proud to be working with, with Speaker
7 Corey Johnson, who of course is [inaudible], Council
8 Member Rivera, Powers, and Reynoso to introduce the
9 bills we are considering today. Since becoming chair
10 of this committee I have been a proponent of
11 transportation policies that reduce congestions on
12 our street and prioritize the safety of pedestrians
13 and cyclists. And in that priority I've been working
14 very close not only with Speaker Johnson, my
15 colleague administration, but also with the public
16 advocate, borough president Gale Brewer, Ruben Diaz,
17 Jr., and of course Brooklyn borough president Eric
18 Adams. The COVID-19 pandemic has shown us that we
19 must take the steps to make a public space work for
20 everyone, especially with increase in the number of
21 trucks and vans making deliveries to our homes and
22 business. Many of these vehicles double park while
23 making deliveries, causing traffic congestion and
24 creating potentially dangerous situations for
25 cyclists and pedestrians. The status quo is simple

1 unacceptable. Now is the time for us to be
2 proactive. One of the bills on today's agenda, which
3 I have a sponsor with Speaker Corey Johnson, Intro
4 number 2282, is a bill that would require DOT to
5 redesign our city's truck route network to include
6 safety, increase visibility, and reduce traffic
7 congestion and emissions. The bill would also
8 require DOT to consult with community stakeholders
9 when redesigning the city's truck route network. The
10 bill will require DOT to implement daylighting at
11 each intersection, [inaudible] intersection
12 adjustments to the truck route network and review and
13 replace truck route signals where necessary. This is
14 just one example of the kinds of things we need to be
15 doing to improve our street and I'm proud to have
16 sponsored this bill. Lastly, I would also like to
17 highlight the importance of improving our streets so
18 that they are more efficient, sustainable, and safe
19 for all, especially for pedestrians and cyclists.
20 During the unveiling of the [inaudible] last week we
21 heard the mayor reaffirm his commitment to bring more
22 initiatives like this to all underserved communities.
23 I would also continue work alongside Mayor de Blasio
24 and Speaker Corey Johnson, Brooklyn Borough President
25

1
2 Eric Adams, my colleagues, and especially Riders
3 Alliance to ensure we meet our 30 bus lane miles by
4 the end of this year before the new administration.
5 Before we call on the administration I would like to
6 give the bill's sponsor an opportunity to make a few
7 comments on their bills. First, Council Member
8 Rivera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Good morning,
10 everyone.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I want to thank
13 Chair Rodriguez for holding this hearing on these
14 bills today, which includes my legislation, Intro
15 2281, which would require large commercial buildings
16 to develop delivery and servicing plans to reduce the
17 impact deliveries have on our streets, our neighbors,
18 and our environment. An estimated 1.8 million
19 packages are delivered across the five boroughs each
20 day. The surge in online shopping and deliveries
21 brought on by the COVID-19 pandemic has only made it
22 clearer that the way we handle freight and shipping
23 in most American cities just isn't working for our
24 21st century economy. With my legislation, large
25 commercial buildings in New York City would be

1 required to both submit detailed plans for onsite
2 load and delivery management to the Department of
3 Buildings and directly survey tenants to identify
4 mitigation strategies. Building owners would be
5 offered technical support [inaudible] creation of an
6 office of sustainable delivery systems within DOB.
7 This bill aims to reduce congestion on streets and
8 sidewalks, distribute delivery times more
9 effectively, and has the potential to consolidate
10 shipments, thereby helping our city run more
11 sustainability and efficiently. We look forward to
12 working collaboratively with all of the stakeholders
13 involved, especially our workers, who put exhaustive
14 time into making sure we do the best we can with the
15 current system in place. I hope all of my colleagues
16 will support this legislation and I want to thank all
17 of my colleagues who have bills in the package,
18 Council Members Rodriguez, Reynoso, and of course
19 Speaker Johnson, and I want to thank you, Mr. Chair,
20 for the time.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
23 Council Member Rivera. And now let's hear from
24 Council Member Powers.

1 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you, Chair
2
3 Rodriguez, and good morning, everyone. I am City
4 Council Member Keith Powers. Thank you for giving me
5 an opportunity to speak a few words today about two
6 bills of mine that are on the agenda here today. Um,
7 the first one, ah, Intro 811, which would establish
8 pedestrian flow zones in Times Square, and Intro
9 2277, which would reform commercial loading zones as
10 part of the council's effort to support smart, safe,
11 and sustainable deliveries in New York City. The
12 first one, Intro 811, is about improving the
13 pedestrian experience in Times Square, in Times
14 Square, including guidelines for activity zone and
15 pedestrian zone interaction, and ones that address
16 street closures and signage, allowing the Department
17 of Transportation to set up rules [inaudible] public
18 safety concerns and setting up a working group to
19 coordinate on these issues. This legislation is an
20 update to existing regulations which is necessary to
21 ensure the original intent of those regulations is
22 honored and to codify ambiguities in the original
23 bill about how commercial activity can take place.
24 These pedestrian flow zones will create expectations
25 and guard rails for places transactions can take, can

1 take place, making people feel safer and improving
2 pedestrian flow, and it's well timed with
3 [inaudible]. The second bill, Intro 2277,
4 [inaudible] reforms to loading zones to make the
5 delivery processes more efficient and minimize
6 negative impacts on other users [inaudible] and
7 sidewalk. This legislation requires that all
8 commercial loading zones are controlled by a mini
9 meter, which will ensure delivery trucks are paying
10 their fair share for using street space. It will
11 extend the number of hours that commercial vehicles
12 can park in loading zones from three to eight hours
13 to reduce unnecessary idling that often happens when
14 a driver's time is up but they still have deliveries
15 to make. And to ensure [inaudible] zones are kept
16 open for commercial vehicles, this legislation will
17 prohibit [inaudible] parking in commercial loading
18 zones [inaudible] south of and including 60th Street
19 in Manhattan, obviously my district, and it would
20 require construction permit applicants to maintain
21 loading zone access or create temporary loading zone,
22 loading zones by construction stage of a block in
23 existing loading zones. It's time for our city's
24 commercial delivery infrastructure to catch up to our
25

1
2 21st century needs, and I'm proud to sponsor this
3 bill to address an issue that has long been a source
4 of frustration for New Yorkers, and I look forward to
5 hearing feedback today on that legislation. Thank
6 you to Chair Rodriguez and everyone for your support
7 and participation today.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
9 Council Member. Now let's hear from Council Member
10 Reynoso.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
12 Reynoso?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you. Ah,
14 thank you Chair. I just want to, um, thank God
15 [inaudible] together my two bills, the two bills that
16 I am sponsoring and looking to hear from the
17 administration to speak to two, ah, important issues.
18 One is the introduction of package rooms in any new
19 construction, um, and any major construction or
20 development that happens, um, in new buildings and
21 again in new construction to older buildings. Ah,
22 the package rooms will prevent theft, um, allow for
23 deliveries to happen in a meaningful way, and also
24 given the time and how we are now receiving most of,
25 ah, um, our purchases through mail, ah, making sure

1 that our, that the city is prepared, um, ah, to, to
2 handle that effectively. Ah, also asking for 25% of
3 all street space or street parking be dedicated to
4 loading zones so we can prevent the double parking,
5 um, the double parking that is dangerous for
6 pedestrians, cyclists, and, ah, vehicle drivers
7 alike. Um, but also, ah, allowing for us to give
8 space to, ah, ah, companies and businesses that are
9 doing work for thousands of people as opposed to just
10 one singular vehicle that may be parked, ah, that,
11 ah, you know, awards an opportunity only for that
12 individual. So, I mean, I'm excited to hear from the
13 Department of Transportation. I do want to say that
14 we are in, you know, the beginning stages of
15 development of this legislation. I'm very excited to
16 be able to come to a place where we can, ah, finally
17 start speaking to, ah, the freights and delivery, um,
18 legislation that we set forth. Thank you.

19
20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
21 Council Members. Eh, before our...

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, ah, I think
23 Council Member Holden also wants to give an opening
24 on his bill.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Council
3 Member Holden, please. And I'm sorry, Council
4 Member, that I didn't call you before.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: That's all right.
6 Ah, thank you, Chair Rodriguez. Ah, as far as the
7 bill, ah, before the pandemic I visited a local
8 firehouse on Myrtle Avenue in my district. Ah, it's
9 called the Myrtle Turtles. Interesting name for a
10 fire company. But I had lunch with them to hear
11 their concerns, and obviously there were many. But
12 one thing that stood out was their idea for stencils
13 in the street that would help locate fire hydrants.
14 Ah, illegal parking has become a real huge problem in
15 the city, especially in my district, and, um, you
16 know, people are parking directly in front of the
17 hydrants and, and our firefighters are telling
18 they're having trouble locating them, the hydrants,
19 so in the event of a fire time is of the essence.
20 Seconds wasted trying to locate fire hydrants or
21 struggling to hook them up, ah, because someone is
22 parked illegally, it could lead to lives lost. Um,
23 so while we need our local precincts to address the
24 scourge of illegal fire hydrant parking, my bill,
25 Intro 1819, would be beneficial in helping our

1
2 firefighters locate a hydrant, um, you know, it's a
3 common sense solution to a serious problem. Ah,
4 again, what it is essentially is a stencil in the
5 street. It could be in the middle of the street, it
6 could be a certain color, um, of, of a hydrant, just
7 so the firefighters, um, could locate it. Ah, I want
8 to thank Chair Rodriguez and Speaker Corey Johnson
9 for allowing this bill to be heard, and I'm asking
10 all my colleagues to sign on. Thank you. Thank you,
11 Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank
13 you, eh, Council Members. Eh, before [inaudible] but
14 let's say it in Spanish that [speaking in Spanish].
15 Today's bills, package of bills, besides addressing
16 those particular items that we heard from the
17 different Council Member from a specific area for the
18 truck will delivering the good but also Council
19 Member Holden also bill for the first time, eh, we
20 will establish a fair system where the driver that we
21 know that this is, eh, that they have to keep when
22 they park their vehicle closely [inaudible] so, eh,
23 this is a great opportunity, this is not only about
24 addressing delivery, this is not only about, you
25 know, putting a clear area where drivers should not

1
2 be allowed to park close to the fire hydrant, but
3 this is also about Vision Zero where many of those
4 trucks aren't driving to some residential area, but
5 many of those trucks are, eh, responding to order
6 that we consumers make through Amazon and other, eh,
7 we need to come up with a system where we should have
8 centralized, eh, in different area where those trucks
9 should be bringing [inaudible]. So this also, eh,
10 improve, ah, a resolution to which should be related
11 to visibility that unfortunately those truck create
12 [inaudible]. So this is also about Vision Zero.
13 With that, eh, I will now have our moderator and
14 committee counsel call on the administration to
15 testify and administer the oath.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.
17 Ah, we have also been joined by Council Member
18 Miller. Um, I'll now call on the following panelists
19 to testify. Commissioner Gutman, ah, Commissioner La
20 Rocca, ah, Deputy Commissioner Beaton, and Assistant
21 Commissioner Zack. I will read the affirmation and
22 then call on each individual to confirm their
23 response aloud for the record. Please raise your
24 right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
25 whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this

1
2 committee and to respond honestly to council member
3 questions? Commissioner Gutman?

4 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: I do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Commissioner La
6 Rocca?

7 COMMISSIONER LA ROCCA: Yes.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, Deputy
9 Commissioner Beaton?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant
12 Commissioner Zack?

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: Yes.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. You may
15 begin your testimony when ready.

16 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Thank you. Thank
17 you very much. Can you, can you hear me OK? OK.

18 Ah, good morning, Chair Rodriguez and members of the
19 Transportation Committee. I'm Hank Gutman. I'm the
20 commissioner of the New York City Department of
21 Transportation. With me today are Eric Beaton, our
22 deputy commissioner for transportation planning and
23 management, and Rebecca Zack, assistant commissioner
24 for intergovernmental and community affairs. It's an
25 honor to be testifying today along with, ah,

1 Commissioner La Rocca from the Department of
2 Buildings, and I want to thank you for the
3 opportunity to testify on behalf of Mayor Bill de
4 Blasio on the administration's freight vision and
5 this package of freight and delivery bills, as well
6 as Intro 1811, sponsored by Council Member Powers,
7 which would create a pedestrian safety zone in the
8 theater district of Manhattan, and Intro 1819,
9 sponsored by Council Member Holden regarding fire
10 hydrant street markings. As will be evident in the
11 next few minutes, ah, the administration views this
12 as an incredibly important issue for the future of
13 our city. In recent decades New York City has
14 experienced record growth in terms of population,
15 jobs, and commerce. Our complex freight network with
16 trucks currently delivering 90% of our goods, has
17 played a critical role in this growth. The combined
18 effects of the growth of e-commerce and the impact of
19 the pandemic have dramatically increased freight
20 volumes, not only between businesses, as in the past,
21 but to our residences as well. The New York
22 Metropolitan Transportation Council, or NYMTC,
23 projects that by 2045 our city will move 68% more
24 freight on an already constrained transportation
25

1 network. More and larger trucks are emphatically no
2 the answer. Let me repeat. More and larger trucks
3 are not the answer. We need to bring about a
4 transformative shift in the way freight moves through
5 our city to reduce our dependence upon large trucks
6 to deliver our freight, particularly in what's
7 referred as the last mile, which in New York City, as
8 we know, may actually be the last five or 10 miles.
9 Just as the administration is reimagining how people
10 move through our city by expanding bike and bus and
11 e-mobility options to reduce our dependence on the
12 privately owned automobile, so too we must reimagine
13 how goods move as well. Creating safe, attractive,
14 and environmentally friendly alternatives to the
15 large trucks that pollute our air, stress our aging
16 roads and bridges, and harm the quality of life in
17 our residential neighborhoods. The plans we make
18 today will help determine the future of our city. We
19 can and must find alternative ways to move goods that
20 reduce the negative environmental, traffic,
21 infrastructure, and safety effects on our city and
22 its neighborhoods, particularly on low-income
23 communities and communities of color. New and
24 creative solutions are needed, along with the renewed
25

1 use of some old solutions, such as the waterways that
2 were our original highways, around which our city was
3 built. They are why we are in this particular
4 location. We should leverage our access to water and
5 rail and find more ways to bring goods into the city
6 through our ports and terminals, following the lead
7 of global cities such as Paris and Rotterdam, and US
8 cities like LA and Long Beach, Boston, Chicago,
9 Charleston, Savannah, Norfolk, and Oakland. If they
10 can do it, we can. But despite a shift towards
11 maritime and rail transportation, trucks and other
12 commercial vehicles, including cargo bikes, will
13 still be needed to make the last mile deliveries. As
14 long as trucks travel our streets and through our
15 communities we need to reduce their size and weight,
16 shorten their trips, ensure that they are not
17 violating the rules related to truck size and
18 dedicated truck routes, convert them to clean fuel
19 vehicles, and make them safer. To reduce our
20 reliance on diesel trucks we need to shift to
21 alternative modes of moving goods using the hub and
22 spoke of distribution centers, where deliveries are
23 handled by electric cargo bikes and smaller,
24 environmentally friendly vehicles, especially in our
25

1 most dense urban centers. The private sector is
2 already moving in this direction on their own because
3 it makes business sense. The city can and must help
4 facilitate and accelerate this trend. And we also
5 needed targeted enforcement to foster a culture of
6 compliance to protect both our infrastructure and our
7 neighborhoods. To enforce overweight, over-
8 dimensional, and off-route vehicles that damage our
9 streets and bridges and harm our communities we must
10 explore and expand automated forms of enforcement and
11 revise our antiquated permitting system and fees.
12 Legislation sponsored by Senator Kavanaugh and
13 Assembly Member Simon would authorize a program to
14 use automated enforcement to protect the BQE where
15 weigh-in motion sensors have determined that some
16 trucks traveling on the structure weigh as much as
17 170,000 pounds, more than double the federal legal
18 limits. And let me put this in context. When that
19 structure was built the largest trucks that it was
20 built to accommodate weighed 70,000 pounds. Today
21 the federal legal limit is 80,000 pounds. And when
22 we installed some WIM sensors, weigh-in motion
23 sensors, we discovered that there are trucks on that
24 road over 100,000 pounds heavier than it was designed
25

1
2 ever to accommodate, and this is not unique to the
3 BQE. This is a citywide problem. This is not only
4 a, or, as I said, this is not the only highway on
5 which weight and size limits are ignored, and many of
6 our streets in residential neighborhoods are also
7 plagued by oversize trucks that don't legally belong
8 there. Over the past several years the DOT has
9 engaged with industry stakeholders and government
10 partners as it developed its smart truck management
11 plan, which lays the groundwork for policies that
12 will accelerate the adoption of zero emissions, urban
13 freight technologies, and innovations that improve
14 the sustainability and resilience of the last mile
15 delivery network. We also identify opportunities and
16 strategies to build on the freight initiatives found
17 in the OneNYC plan, the DOT's own strategic plan, the
18 EDC's Freight NYC plan, and New York State's freight
19 transportation plan. I'm pleased to say that the DOT
20 received funding in the April plan to support this
21 critical work and for that we are grateful. And
22 fortunately, the DOT is also undertaking a number of
23 these initiatives with our partners in and out of
24 government to transform the way freight moves through
25 our city. First, the agency continues to designate

1
2 parking spaces for loading or unloading commercial
3 vehicles. Launched in 2019, our neighborhood loading
4 zone program responds to the shift to residential
5 deliveries and helps to reduce double parking to keep
6 bus and bike lanes clear by providing space for
7 active loading or unloading of personal, for hire, or
8 commercial vehicles. With 111 neighborhood loading
9 zones citywide already, ah, 49 of which the DOT added
10 during the pandemic, our first year evaluation of the
11 program has demonstrates its success. In the first
12 year, overall double parking on corridors within
13 these zones decreased by a range of between 10% and
14 70%, and corridors with the highest zone use average
15 600 vehicles per space each month, for about 26
16 minutes at a given time. We also found that zone
17 effectiveness and utilization is dependent on the
18 length of the zone, the placement along a block,
19 parking enforcement, and the local demand
20 characteristics, all of which will inform our
21 strategy as we expand the program citywide. In
22 addition, all street improvement programs, projects,
23 rather, in metered areas undergo a thorough curb
24 evaluation that often includes the installation of
25 additional commercial parking spaces. Finally, the

1 agency adds commercial spaces based on requests from
2 businesses, many of which are in non-metered areas.
3
4 Second, through our commercial cargo bike pilot
5 program the DOT incentivizes adoption of sustainable
6 and efficient freight delivery by making designated
7 loading and unloading space available for cargo bikes
8 in the pilot can load and unload wherever commercial
9 vehicles can and are exempt from any muni meter
10 payment. In addition, the DOT installed two cargo
11 bike corrals to date for businesses that need on-
12 street space to facilitate their operations, with
13 more such spaces planned for 2021. Companies
14 participating in the program share cargo bike trip
15 GPS data with us. Based on an analysis of this data
16 the number of cargo bike deliveries increased by 109%
17 between May of 2020 and January of 2021. In January
18 of 2021 alone there were over 45,000 cargo bike
19 deliveries. And there were no traffic crashes, ah,
20 involving those bikes that have been recorded since
21 the start of the pilot. Based on this success, the
22 DOT plans to promulgate rules to make the program
23 permanent and larger. Now state law enacted last
24 year restricts e-bike, e-bike width to three feet.
25 Unfortunately, that prohibits the use of many of the

1 off-the-shelf cargo bike models, making the adoption
2 and expansion of our program difficult for those who
3 want to use it. As called for in the council's
4 resolution, the administration supports the passage
5 of Senator Ramos and Assembly Member Jackson's bill
6 to increase those width limitations to allow cargo
7 bike designs that are more efficient, ergonomic, and
8 most importantly more readily available in the
9 marketplace. This will allow our program to continue
10 growing and make it easier for companies to leverage
11 sustainable micro mobility for the last mile
12 delivery. Third, the city also supports off-hour
13 deliveries through the DOT's off-hour deliveries
14 program, which Mayor de Blasio launched in April 2019
15 as part of a comprehensive program to reduce
16 congestion, improve bus transit speeds, and decrease
17 the opportunity for conflicts with pedestrians and
18 cyclists. The program encourages goods delivery
19 during off-peak hours of 7:00 p.m. to 6:00 a.m. to
20 decrease congestion and truck emissions, with the
21 goal of reaching 1500 business locations by the end
22 of 2021, specifically in midtown Manhattan, lower
23 Manhattan, downtown Brooklyn, Flushing, and Jamaica,
24 where there are high pedestrian volumes and limited
25

1 curb space. With participation at over 900 business
2 locations citywide we continue to expand the program
3 despite the pandemic-related challenges those
4 businesses have faced. And the mayor has instructed
5 us to look for ways to dramatically expand and
6 increase this program. Fourth, the city's truck
7 route network, which was established in the 1970s and
8 most recently revised in 2015 and 2018, requires
9 updating to reflect the changes in residential and
10 commercial land use patterns, the transportation
11 networks and the delivery patterns from e-commerce.
12 The administration supports changes to add
13 [inaudible] to, from, and within industrial business
14 zones, and to fill in gaps, adding new designations
15 where needed, and remove certain routes as well. Um,
16 the success of the network will depend upon trucks
17 adhering to the designated routes. Fifth, the New
18 York City Clean Truck Program, which builds on the
19 successful Hunt's Point Clean Truck Program, which
20 replaced over 500 South Bronx trucks and required
21 safety elements, such as side guards. In June 2020
22 DOT announced the expansion of the New York City
23 Clean Truck Program, a rebate incentive program to
24 accelerate the deployment of cleaner trucks in
25

1 industrial business zones located near environmental
2 justice communities that have historically been
3 subject to a disproportionate amount of diesel
4 exhaust emissions. The program will invest 9.8
5 million dollars to replace older, dirtier diesel-
6 powered trucks with advanced transportation
7 technologies and alternative fuels trucks, including
8 electric trucks. Again, we want to expand and
9 increase this program. Sixth, emerging curb
10 management technologies are allowing us to better
11 manage and regulate the curb, the city's transition
12 to plate-based technologies such as mobile payment
13 and the upcoming launch of pay by plate and virtual
14 permitting offer tools to keep pace with the changing
15 needs of our streets. And finally, the coming
16 implementation of the Central Business District
17 Tolling Program, the nation's first congestion
18 pricing program, represents a transformational
19 opportunity to increase freight efficiency. DOT is
20 working closely with the MTA, which is responsible
21 for implementing and operating the system and will
22 participate in evaluating the system with the
23 objectives that I've mentioned in mine. Now, turning
24 to the bills before the committee today.
25

1 Introduction 2279, by Council Member Reynoso, on
2 installing more commercial loading zones. The
3 administration strongly supports the expansion of
4 commercial loading zones to help mitigate the
5 challenges of accessing curb space in the city's
6 high-densities areas. We are actively expanding
7 these zones and often install new zones together with
8 other changes as part of our ongoing and larger
9 street improvement projects. We're always looking
10 for places to do more, but we don't believe that
11 implementing more loading zones according to blanket
12 formulas is the right approach, and in some instances
13 it could be counterproductive. Ah, our team analyzed
14 the geographic parameters in the bill and found that
15 this would cover large areas across the Bronx,
16 Brooklyn, Manhattan, and Queens, where there is
17 currently little or no commercial loading. Complying
18 with the bill as drafted would require substantial
19 repurposing of existing private passenger vehicle
20 parking in many of these neighborhoods. While this
21 can be helpful in the right location, ah, the DOT has
22 been actively adding loading zones in both
23 residential and commercial age, ah, areas. This
24 specific 25% requirement may require new zones in
25

1 areas where they're not actually needed and miss
2 areas where they are. So while we agree strongly
3 with the objective of the legislation, ah, we don't
4 believe it will accomplish that objective,
5 efficiently, at least, as currently drafted. So what
6 we would welcome is a dialogue with the council and
7 with the council member about goals for implementing
8 more loading zones across different areas of the
9 city. We agree with the objective, we just have some
10 questions about the details of implementation. Ah,
11 Introduction 2277, ah, introduced by Council Member
12 Powers, which contains several provisions on the
13 management of commercial loading zones. Again, while
14 we strongly support the goal of enhancing the
15 management and performance of these zones, the
16 administration would like to work with the council on
17 revising the bill to achieve this goal. Ah, the bill
18 would require all loading zones to have muni meters.
19 Um, requiring the installation of this costly
20 hardware on, on the relevant streets could have the
21 unintended consequence of slowing the deployment of
22 loading zones or even preventing them entirely when
23 the budget is constrained. Rather than require a
24 specific means of capturing payments and managing
25

1 time, we would suggest that the department have the
2 flexibility to use either such meters or a mobile
3 payment system or reservation system, or a
4 combination of these in managing loading zones.
5 Again, the technology is moving and we're trying to
6 move with it, so being tied to the meters might end
7 up being counterproductive and that's our concern.
8 The bill would also extend the hours a commercial
9 vehicle can park, if parking is metered from three
10 hours to eight hours. Similarly, we would suggest
11 that the department have the flexibility to use
12 shorter and longer durations depending on the leads,
13 the needs of the local land uses, rather than being
14 locked into an eight-hour standard, as different
15 communities we've found have different needs. The
16 bill also includes a requirement for DOT to include
17 stipulations to require alternative loading zones
18 when use of the street for a construction project
19 obstructs a loading zone. Ah, there are thousands of
20 such permits each year. Ah, while designating
21 alternative temporary loading zones during
22 construction may be necessary in some case, ah, it
23 can be very challenging and labor-intensive. Ah, we
24 also contend with high residential density, competing
25

1 and evolving land uses throughout the city's central
2 business district, and overall limitations to
3 sidewalk space. So, again, we, we, we agree with the
4 concept but having it automatic in every instance
5 where there's a construction permit we think could in
6 some instances be counterproductive, particularly as
7 we face the ever-increasing demand, ah, for our
8 sidewalk and street space. Ah, so, again, this is,
9 this is an example where we'd like to work with the
10 council and with the council member, ah, to suggest
11 some proposed modifications of the legislation. On
12 Intro 2282, sponsored by the chair, which would
13 require a truck route redesign, as I discussed
14 earlier the administration supports making revisions
15 on our truck routes, um, ah, and we are in the
16 process of doing it and we'll have something to say
17 shortly. Ah, I should note, though, that there are a
18 few responses to the legislation as drafted. The
19 bill would mandate initial and final reports on
20 proposed changes with public comment requirements.
21 Our current process for making changes to the truck
22 route network, however, already has its own hearing
23 and public comment process as required by the City
24 Administrative Procedure Act, known as CAPA. So
25

1 while we value public input, we should ensure that
2 the legislation doesn't create a duplicative process
3 to the one that we're already going to be following.
4 Ah, the bill would also, so, again, this is something
5 we would be happy to discuss, ah, with the chair and,
6 and with the council. Ah, the bill would also
7 require DOT to implement daylighting at each
8 intersection adjacent to the truck route network.
9 Ah, daylighting is an important tool in our toolbox,
10 ah, and we favor using it in the situations where it
11 can make a difference, ah, because safety is our top
12 priority. Um, but we would respectfully suggest that
13 this isn't a one-size-fits-all solution. Ah, we
14 found it incredibly valuable in some places, but in
15 others not really valuable or necessary. Ah, so we
16 would hope that the legislation could be revised to
17 provide the DOT discretion to determine where its use
18 actually would, would further the goal that we all
19 share of safety. Introduction 2253, by the speaker,
20 micro distribution centers are the future. I think I
21 tried to make that clear in my testimony. And this
22 administration strongly supports encouraging their
23 adoption. When paired with environmentally friendly
24 vehicles these hubs have the potential to increase
25

1 efficiency and decrease negative effects on the
2 environment and local communities by reducing traffic
3 and delivery vehicle dwell time in high-demand, high-
4 density areas with limited curb space. Many have
5 already begun popping up throughout the city. But we
6 want to ensure that companies both big and small have
7 access to this type of facility. We look forward to
8 working with the council and discussing possibilities
9 for a pilot program and how best the city can promote
10 micro distribution, including by partnering with and
11 catalyzing the public sector, which, as I mentioned,
12 is already moving in this direction. And as I
13 mentioned earlier, amending state legislation to
14 allow wider cargo bike models is crucial to
15 supporting private sector adoption. Introduction
16 2281, sponsored by Council Member Rivera, which would
17 require the DOT to create an office, the DOB, rather,
18 to create an office of sustainable delivery systems
19 and require large commercial buildings to implement
20 delivery and servicing plans. Servicing, service
21 and, again, we, we agree completely with the
22 objective of the legislation. Service and delivery
23 plans are a promising practice to enhance
24 sustainability and reduce congestion. Ah, and we
25

1 welcome conversations with the council member and
2 with the council about how the city can best
3 encourage these plans, building on the city's
4 experience with large buildings through the carbon
5 challenge. I defer to our, our sister agencies about
6 implementation challenges for the bill, ah, and in
7 particular to our colleagues at the Department of
8 Buildings. But as to the objective, we are, we are
9 entirely with you. Introduction 1811, sponsored by
10 Council Member Powers, which would geographically
11 expand designated activity zones, or DAZs, and
12 pedestrian flow zones the DOT implemented and
13 maintains in Times Square. We're proud of the work
14 that we've already done along with our partner
15 agencies and stakeholders to craft innovative
16 response to pedestrian congestion in this one-of-a-
17 kind location. However, the DAZs and flow zones we
18 implemented are possible because of the amount of
19 pedestrian plaza space at this specific site. We
20 believe that expanding the approach to general
21 sidewalks outside of this unique location, as the
22 bill calls for on several additional blocks, presents
23 some feasibility challenges. Ah, in addition our
24 colleagues in the administration have some other
25

1 concerns, which, again, we look forward to discussing
2 with the council. Um, we're, we're happy to engage
3 in that dialogue. Finally, ah, Intro 1819, which
4 would require the DOT to mark the location of each
5 fire hydrant using a symbol painted in the middle of
6 the street directly across from the hydrant. Ah, we
7 defer to our colleagues at the FDNY on the emergency
8 response benefits of the proposal. Ah, I would point
9 out that for DOT installing and maintaining such
10 markings would require very significant resources,
11 ah, but if our, if our fire department colleagues
12 believe that this would make a meaningful difference
13 and we can find the resources to get it done,
14 obviously we are all in favor of its safety
15 objectives. Finally, in conclusion, I would like to
16 thank the council for the opportunity to testify
17 today. The challenge before us is great. We must
18 meet the projected increased freight activity over
19 the next several decades while working towards a
20 safer, more responsible, sustainable, efficient
21 freight system that grows the economy, supports
22 freight-related jobs, delivers the goods that
23 residents and businesses need, and deliveries
24 environmental justice as well. Today I've
25

1 highlighted just some of the aspects of our agency's
2 vision and a few promises, strategies we plan to
3 pursue. We look forward to working with the council
4 on these strategies and further discussing these
5 pieces of legislation. We welcome your questions
6 after you hear from our colleagues at DOB. And,
7 again, let me emphasize we look forward to working
8 with the council to achieve what I believe are our
9 common objectives in this field. Thank you.

11 COMMISSIONER LA ROCCA: Good morning,
12 Chair Rodriguez and members of the Committee on
13 Transportation. I'm Melanie La Rocca, commissioner
14 of the New York City Department of Buildings. I'm
15 pleased to be here to discuss two of the bills before
16 the committee regarding making deliveries more
17 sustainable. The department is hard at work at
18 implementing the historic Climate Mobilization Act,
19 which regulates greenhouse gas emissions from large
20 buildings greater than 25,000 gross square feet
21 starting in 2024. Last year these large buildings
22 were also required to start posting energy grades at
23 their buildings, which ensures that owners are held
24 accountable for their performance and make their
25 energy transparency, ah, energy efficiencies, pardon

1 me, transparent to the public. We are very much
2 aligned with the City Council on the issue of
3 reducing carbon emissions and it is clear that large
4 buildings have a critical role to play. Intro 2281
5 creates an office of sustainable delivery system,
6 which is tasked with making deliveries to and from
7 buildings greater than 500,000 gross square feet more
8 sustainable. One of the primary responsibilities of
9 this new office would be to provide guidance to
10 owners on the development of delivery and service
11 plans and to oversee the implementation of such
12 plans. While the department is certainly committed
13 to sustainability we do not have any expertise in
14 making deliveries more efficient and sustainable,
15 particularly where regulating vehicle movement is
16 involved. However, like our colleagues at the
17 Department of Transportation, we are certainly
18 committed to working with the City Council to further
19 our shared sustainability goals, and we look forward
20 to discussing this bill further to determine if there
21 are any areas where the department can contribute our
22 expertise. Intro 2280 requires secure package
23 storage areas in certain new and existing residential
24 buildings. We understand the need for efficient
25

1
2 package management and are aware that certain
3 buildings have already started to include space for
4 package storage in their designs. As such, the
5 department supports this bill as it relates to new
6 buildings and looks forward to working with the City
7 Council to address key details, including how much
8 space for package storage should be provided within a
9 building. With respect to existing buildings, this
10 proposal merits further discussion with existing
11 property owners to fully understand the challenges
12 that may present, ah, for them and to ensure that
13 there are no unintended consequences, including
14 requiring significant alterations to an existing
15 building where minor construction work is being
16 performed elsewhere in the building. Thank you again
17 for the opportunity to testify before you and I would
18 welcome any questions you may have.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So I think that,
20 eh, for the administration we already have both
21 commissioners, two great individuals that I have the
22 honor to be working with, the Department of
23 Transportation and Department of Buildings. Is
24 nobody else from the administration? Since it looked
25 like there is none so may start this section though

1
2 getting to the question, I have a few questions and
3 then I know my colleagues has other questions. Eh,
4 Commissioner Hank, can you elaborate a little bit
5 more on which are the programs that assist today
6 regarding the distribution of good throughout the
7 city and including things such as increased
8 condition, lack of [inaudible] for effective
9 distribution [inaudible] others.

10 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Sure. Ah, thank
11 you, thank you, Chair Rodriguez and it's, it's good
12 to see you. Good to see you again.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]. And
14 thank you for being in Washington Heights, too.

15 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Oh, that was, that
16 was, that was a great event. I was very happy and
17 honored to be there.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: So, so, the
20 challenge, the challenge is, is helping facilitate
21 the transition, the transformation, from reliance on
22 large diesel trucks that deliver goods within the
23 city itself to instead using smaller, environmentally
24 friendly vehicles that don't cause the same
25 congestion, that don't cause the same pollution, that

1 can more easily use the limited space at the curb.
2 Um, I mean, that is the huge, that are, that are
3 environmentally friendly, you know, electric,
4 electric if possible, um, these are, these are all
5 the challenges we face, and the fact that freight
6 needs and demands of the city have grown so
7 dramatically in recent years and, and show every
8 indication of continuing to grow and that the places
9 being delivered to are no longer just commercial
10 establishments or industrial sites, but it's now
11 everybody's home. Um, all of this has created an
12 enormous stress on the system and so we need to have
13 a multimodal approach to dealing with that,
14 everything from making better use of rail and our
15 waterways to, to helping facilitate the transition
16 from large trucks to small environmentally vehicles,
17 environmentally friendly vehicles, including those
18 cargo bikes, so we've outlined a series of steps that
19 we've taken. Many of them began as pilots in the
20 last year or two, um, all of them, ah, have shown
21 successful results so far and so what we're trying to
22 do is come up with the strategies to provide both
23 incentives for people to do more of them,
24 disincentives to continuing in the old ways, ah, so
25

1 that all of us can make that transition together
2 because it's, it's increasingly clear that this is
3 essential for the future of, of the city and how, how
4 goods move, how things move. It's not just, so far
5 we've been focusing mainly how people move. We have
6 to apply the same degree of attention and effort to
7 how goods move because both are essential to our
8 future. And, again, I, in, in preparing for today's
9 testimony I was thrilled to see that the objective
10 of, of all the legislation that's proposed and under
11 discussion today is all moving in the same direction
12 that we are. I mean, there's some differences on the
13 details and sometimes the devil's in the details, but
14 all of us are trying to effectively bring about that
15 kind of transition and that I think is, is a great
16 sign of hope for progress.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I agree with you,
19 and I think that even though I should say that there
20 was this in the detail that I shared that, eh, even
21 with some detail that we need to look at it, there's
22 no many devils. I think that overall I think we
23 agree with most of the things. It's about the
24 execution and the plan that we need to follow 'cause
25 I think that they, you know, are responsible, you

1 know, regarding the role that we play [inaudible] and
2 the role that people play in the future. I think
3 this is all about how to address issue related to
4 sustainability or to [inaudible] about a new culture
5 that we have to build around the street. The street
6 doesn't belong to the truck, car owner. It should
7 belong to everyone and when we had 8.6 million New
8 Yorkers only 1.4 million individuals they have
9 vehicle. It mean that more than 7 million New
10 Yorkers, eh, the majority of the city, rely on public
11 transportation, I think that [inaudible] related to
12 the demand and also, eh, eh, we have created in our
13 city, even though people say we don't want Amazon in
14 Queens, but because of the comfort most people, even
15 those who work organizing against it, they gave most
16 of the [inaudible] to Amazon.

18 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So I feel that,
20 eh, and, again, eh, all my support to anyone who
21 dedicate to organize, so I think that we all play a
22 different role. But who, who is, is DOT the agency
23 leading the coordination and conversation around this
24 particular issue? Um, of course, I will assume that
25 as employee and other agency also interact from DCAS,

1
2 eh, that, you know, neither trucking or the city, a
3 city vehicle, eh, to like, I will assume that the,
4 eh, EDC, SBA, because so important also, you know,
5 how do we get those big corporation to deliver at
6 certain hours? How do we create those incentive? At
7 the end of the day it's about the dollars. Eh, eh,
8 from their point of view. For a point of view who
9 may be more responsible, eh, and, and to know that it
10 is a resident of our city than one who are our
11 priority when, with a new policy. So assuming that
12 DOT rightly is the one that coordinate, that
13 bringing, eh, with other agency have any conversation
14 also been happening made by DOT around bringing
15 economic incentive to those private centers that make
16 some changes on operation and how to organize the new
17 way to deliver good to consumers?

18 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Yeah, ah, um, I'm,
19 I'm glad you asked that question, Chair Rodriguez,
20 because, um, yes, we are, ah, we, we are in the
21 process of organizing exactly that kind of
22 interagency, ah, task force group. It doesn't have a
23 formal name yet. But, but one of the challenges has
24 been that there are various agencies in the city that
25 have some responsibility to the issues that touch on

1
2 this problem and since much of it falls within the
3 jurisdiction of the DOT, one thing that we've been
4 working on is finding our counterparts at EDC, which
5 you mentioned, DCAS, etcetera, ah, the Sustainability
6 Office, ah, and we have engaged all of them in
7 dialogue on this and we are working to make sure that
8 our various plans and approaches work together
9 seamlessly, that it's not a bunch of agencies acting
10 independently and without coordination or concern for
11 what each other is doing. I mean, it's one city,
12 it's one city administration. Ah, we all have an
13 obligation as you point out, a duty, you know, it's
14 an honor to be able to serve the people of the City
15 of New York and one thing that we are working very
16 hard on is making sure that all of these agencies act
17 in a coordinated fashion. For example, EDC, ah,
18 developed a couple of years ago a, a freight plan,
19 which is very innovative, making use of rail and the,
20 and the waterways, etcetera, and they've been busy
21 pursuing it. So one thing we've been working on with
22 the EDC is making sure that what they're doing
23 coordinates with what we're doing. I mean, we, we
24 seem to have more responsibility to the last mile.
25 They've got more responsibility for how goods get

1 here in the first place and get from here, since we
2 also produce things in New York. Um, so getting
3 those two things put together, ah, and then the Port
4 Authority is also an important partner, and EDC had
5 been working with Port Authority on some of the
6 broader issues. So what we're trying to do is get
7 everybody working together on a single consolidated
8 approach, ah, so the support and assistance of the
9 council on that is obviously welcome. But, but
10 you've asked exactly the same questions, ah, that
11 we're focusing on, so thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I, I think
14 that this is [inaudible] the city because I heard
15 both Brooklyn borough president Eric Adams as also
16 addressing the, the [inaudible] now all the agencies
17 should be connecting and improving the coordination
18 and following some model that is happening in Boston.
19 So I don't know if this is something also that you
20 got from DOT by looking at it, but when I look at and
21 listen to others and say how we need to coordinate
22 and have one platform for everyone, from the
23 residents of those community, eh, to those who use
24 the trucks company and regress [inaudible] so this
25 business owner they, everyone should know how we are

1
2 moving, any details or any application or any
3 [inaudible] or any, eh, [inaudible] going on. And,
4 and in that and is there one of, more, I don't know
5 if you have any answer yes, but for me it's also, eh,
6 eh, a common question is that I feel that I do as you
7 know in my bill we want to create a center, to
8 centralize the area where all those, eh, the FedEx,
9 the UPS, other one, Amazon, they create, create a
10 area where they bring all those good there. From
11 there they deliver it to the consumers by using
12 bicycle, using other mode of transportation,
13 something that I'm proud to see DOT working in
14 [inaudible] as in the past. But I also feel that it
15 is important to connect that process with local small
16 businesses. Eh, I think that we need to encourage
17 and the other tools that we have to negotiate and,
18 and with those big corporation is, you know, a
19 incentive. But I think that what we have seen is a
20 mom and pop store being closing every day because
21 they cannot compete with a type Amazon or other one.
22 So at some point, as you will be working with those,
23 especially EDC, what incentive can be put in place
24 for those large corporation also work with the small,
25 eh, clothing store in a local community, with a

1 restaurant, with, with a motor service company, so
2 that they also become a satellite. I think that at
3 this point also consumers we need to step out a
4 little bit for our comfort expecting that everything
5 must be going to our apartment, eh, as we demand for
6 everything going to our apartment it mean that we are
7 demanding for more trucks and therefore we are also
8 contributing to climate change. So I bring everyone,
9 you know, on board, making everyone to do more, eh,
10 be more responsible. Eh, I just hope again that you
11 will put together [inaudible] together with City Hall
12 that [inaudible] forward that also still has related
13 to making those, working with those big corporation
14 so that they work with the mom and pop store that
15 also can be closing because they cannot afford the
16 competition how they can also involve, included in
17 that process on the new New York City where everyone
18 should be able to make a living, will return to the
19 big corporation, eh, good and supporting the mom and
20 pop small business to survive, to create also the
21 job, and at the same time the consumers to give what
22 they want but understanding that they cannot continue
23 with the comfortable of everything has to be in front
24 of my door. So do you see any possibility on, on
25

1
2 creating a new aspect but also, you know, the big
3 corporation, the UPS, the Amazon, FedEx, also can be
4 working, eh, with some small mom and pop store and
5 instead of delivering directly to the apartment and
6 consumers bring some of those good to those local
7 small store and everyone being able to make a little
8 profit.

9 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Sure. Well, I, I
10 think that the hope, the hope is that as part of our
11 recovery, which we are, which we are in the early
12 days of, but we're hoping is going to proceed, ah,
13 you know, quickly and, and completely that, that
14 people will want to get out to the stores more and
15 will, will, after having everything come to them for
16 the past year might feel a hunger to get out and
17 return to those patterns, but, you know, even those
18 stores rely on delivery for their inventory,
19 etcetera. They get the goods that they sell. So, so
20 yes, that's clearly an important part of the chain.
21 The other thing which I think you touched on, ah,
22 Chair Rodriguez, which is part of what we're trying
23 to accomplish, is, is to make sure that, that this
24 business model, this delivery model, isn't just
25 available to the big guys. I mean, they have adopted

1 it on their own because they figured out it works.
2 Um, so they did that pilot program for us in a sense.
3 What we're, what we're working on coming up with is
4 models that would allow us to create, ah, the same
5 opportunities for smaller delivery folks, for the
6 people who, you know, who are more local, etcetera.
7 So I think that that address is part of what you were
8 asking about. Um, and that's where I think there can
9 be a real role for, for city government in terms of
10 helping up, helping set up, you know, Amazon or, or,
11 or UPS may create a massive facility in which to do
12 this stuff, but creating smaller places where local
13 entities can perform the same kind of efficiency,
14 enjoy the same efficiencies, um, and perform the same
15 kind of transition is something that is definitely on
16 our list of items we're pursuing, so.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. I have just
19 one more question and then I'll, I'm gonna be calling
20 my colleague. Eh, eh, what, what does the city, eh,
21 what does the city currently are doing in regard to
22 ensuring that there is enough vehicle charging
23 infrastructure without, without the city?

24 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Ah, that, that is
25 another item on our to-do list. Um, we've got a

1
2 pilot program now, ah, for electric, electric vehicle
3 charging and it is on the list of projects that we're
4 looking to accelerate. Ah, um, there, there are, ah,
5 ah, electric chargers being put in city garages now
6 as we speak. We are exploring opportunities to
7 expand that program and I don't have anything to
8 announce today but that is something we're actively
9 working on.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
11 Commissioner. And now let's, let's go now to the
12 colleagues who have question and bring it back to
13 Elliot so [inaudible]. Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.
15 Ah, first we have been joined by Council Members
16 Menchaca and Levin. Um, we'll now call on council
17 members for questions in the order they used the Zoom
18 raise hand function. Ah, council members please keep
19 your questions to five minutes. The sergeant will
20 keep a timer and let you know when your time is up.
21 Um, Council Member Holden will be first and Council
22 Member Holden will be followed by Council Member
23 Miller. Council Member Holden?

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.
25

1 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank
2 you, Chair, and thank you, Commissioner Gutman. Um,
3 regarding the truck deliveries that you spoke about
4 and how freight moves through the city, um, we have
5 53-foot trailers are kind of the norm now and I was
6 always told they're illegal to operate on New York
7 City streets, ah, because, um, and then yet everyone
8 seems to be looking the other way regarding this. So
9 when you have a 53-foot trailer, those are the
10 extended trailers, ah, and then you have an extended
11 cab that the driver is in, many times they sleep in,
12 in part of it, now you're looking at a vehicle that's
13 well over 70 feet opening in New York, on New York
14 City's narrow streets. So, um, so especially,
15 especially dangerous, um, you know, they're
16 especially dangerous on turns. And you mentioned in
17 your, in your testimony that many of the trucks are
18 overweight and are, and are damaging our
19 infrastructure. I addressed this with the police
20 department some years ago as to why they're operating
21 on New York City streets. They can only, they need a
22 special permit, as I understand it. Maybe you can
23 enlighten me. But they need a special permit to
24 operate, even drive through our city, much less get
25

1
2 off and then make deliveries. So as a result you
3 have these 53-foot trailers, extended cabs. When
4 they go on their loading base they're blocking half
5 the street and they're sticking out. These loading
6 bays weren't designed for these extended cabs.
7 Neither were our street corners. So drivers are also
8 telling me that, and they said this a number of times
9 to me, that they're not even trained to operate these
10 53-foot trailers in New York City, or anywhere, yet
11 the companies are making them do it, and
12 unfortunately, so they need, they need special
13 training to operate it, they don't have it, yet the
14 companies are, to make more profits, are making the
15 drivers do this. So we have this big problem in New
16 York City, because I've had it on my street corner
17 where I live, in a residential, these trucks are
18 spilling off the expressway sometimes because they're
19 lost, I don't know how they should be lost with GPS
20 now, but they are, and they wind up on narrow
21 streets. I've had a don't walk sign, walk/don't walk
22 sign, electronic sign, that's been knocked down
23 probably two dozen times within the last five years
24 because the trucks can't make this turn and, and they
25 get into a bottleneck and they cause havoc. So,

1
2 first of all, why are we allowing 53-foot trailers if
3 they're illegal in New York City, and why are we, and
4 if I ask the police department why they can't enforce
5 it they said we don't have the resources. That means
6 staffing. So what can be done to address this, ah,
7 Commissioner? I mean, that's first things first
8 here, you know, because what we have now is illegal.

9 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: I, I couldn't, I
10 couldn't agree more, Council Member. Ah, ah, my
11 introduction to this issue was when I served on the
12 mayor's BQE committee. And we looked at, at that
13 stretch of highway, the cantilever, and the fact that
14 illegally heavy trucks and illegally large trucks
15 were driving on that road and were contributing
16 significantly to its, to its demise, and it's well
17 why can't we enforce the law, and, ah, I also share
18 your concern about the enforcing the law on the city
19 streets themselves, because whatever damage oversize
20 and overweight trucks do to our infrastructure, on,
21 on highways and bridges, ah, they also destroy
22 quality of life, as you say, in our neighborhoods
23 when they get stuck trying to round a corner. Um,
24 you, the only thing you left out was pedestrians on
25 the sidewalk, when they end up going up on the

1 sidewalk as they try to make the turn. Um, so, ah, I
2 think what we need, so I, I would desperately like to
3 enhance our enforcement capabilities in all those
4 regards. Um, apart from getting more police
5 resources devoted to this, um, the, the other options
6 I think involve electronic enforcement. We have the
7 technology with these WIM sensors to figure out the
8 overweight and oversize issues. There are other
9 technologies available, just as we use cameras to
10 enforce speed and red light, there are, cameras could
11 be used to find the off-route trucks and all of this
12 requires, ah, the consent of Albany, so this will
13 require more legislation. We're waiting for the
14 first piece to pass now in terms of the WIM sensors
15 that we've installed on some fragile pieces of
16 infrastructure. But I think it's a problem, it's a
17 problem citywide. I mean, the other issue is getting
18 industry to pay attention.
19

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Um, sorry. But I,
22 I agree with you and whatever you can come up, you
23 know, we, we are in favor of making the enforcement
24 real.
25

1 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Ah, Chair, if I
2
3 may, just one, one follow-up to that quickly. Um,
4 the police, um, if you talk to the, just to the
5 precinct, I would say 90% of the officers I spoke to
6 don't even know about this law. So we need to
7 educate NYPD because, like you mentioned, pedestrians
8 are at risk when these cars, these trucks are turning
9 the way they're turning. But the city is losing
10 millions of dollars a year on the infrastructure and
11 our streets, and the fact that I'm telling you as
12 I've been working on this for 20 years and I keep
13 getting the same answer. I think it's, it's, they're
14 putting profits over people's lives, the industry is,
15 but I, I, I think the city is not doing their job,
16 ah, and the city could do their job, but I, I think
17 they want to look the other way because it's an
18 economic thing. But New York City streets were not
19 designed for these massive 75-foot trucks making
20 turns and it endangers everyone, like pedestrians and
21 certainly people have been killed by this. So we
22 need to get tough with this, and if we're gonna have
23 a law then we need to enforce it. So what good is
24 having laws if you can't, if you won't enforce them.
25 We can. But now, it used to be a few trucks here and

1 there. They have a 53-foot marker on the truck.
2 Some are erasing that now and that's a violation.
3 They have to have a stencil 53 foot on the side of
4 the trailer. They don't. That's number one. And
5 the fact that they're driving them, we should, we
6 should crack down. And I would ask the mayor, and,
7 again, if, if DOT is serious they'll put out an
8 advisory and a crackdown and not just say, yeah, we'd
9 like to do it but, you know, we don't see how we can
10 do it. We, we can force the NYPD to do it. Thank
11 you. Thank you, Chair.

12
13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council
14 Member Holden. Um, next we will hear from Council
15 Member Miller, who will be followed by Council Member
16 Menchaca. Council Member Miller.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. Thank
19 you, Mr. Chair, for, once again, your leadership on
20 this issue. Ah, Commissioner Gutman, thank you for,
21 for the tour. It was robust and it was
22 comprehensive, ah, and, ah, I, I, I guess that you
23 witnessed the, the burdens that, that the
24 constituency endure on a daily basis, being in a, in
25 a, not just a transportation desert, but in a, living

1
2 in a community or in the city where, where old
3 transportation patterns and design are, are pretty
4 antiquated. And, you know, what do we do about that.
5 Um, and, and I will say that, ah, that it went a long
6 way and I am often apprehensive, ah, about the
7 motives, motives and motivations of, of DOT, and, ah,
8 the lack of investment and transportation deserts,
9 lack of adjustment in, in communities of color that
10 oftentimes the, the investment is punitive, as in red
11 light cameras and, and, and, ah, speed cameras and
12 not real infrastructure investment and so I'm glad
13 that we had the tour, we had a robust conversation
14 about your vision and, and what can be done to
15 address this and that we have a real advocate there.
16 Um, those, which, which leads me to 2279. Ah, as you
17 see in the downtown area we have a lot of development
18 occurring, ah, simultaneously down in there. Um, ah,
19 in the area that is the, ah, busiest bus
20 transportation hub in, in the city and nearly in
21 America and, and, ah, but we have landed a number of,
22 ah, large developments there, ah, which require, ah,
23 loading docks and, um, not sure how that is going to
24 happen, even if it's just simple curb cuts, ah, and,
25 um, so clearly we're going to have to address that

1
2 program in the very near future. Ah, the concern is
3 the, the kind of, ah, ah, discretion that DOT has in,
4 ah, deciding, ah, that they're gonna take 25 foot of
5 curb space and allot it to, ah, ah, ah, these, ah,
6 buildings for, ah, for deliveries, ah, large
7 deliveries outside of the normal, ah, ah, truck
8 delivery access and, and parking. Ah, so, if, if, if
9 you could kind of, ah, calm my anxieties, ah, about,
10 ah, DOT and its discretion and, ah, and, and the fact
11 that when these projects occur that there will be
12 public discourse and community engagement, ah, around
13 that and, and in particular community boards would be
14 involved, ah, before any such implementation that
15 would occur.

16 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Sure. Ah, the,
17 the, first of all let me say, let me thank you for,
18 for hosting us in your district, ah, I guess it was
19 last Friday?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah.

21 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Ah, ah, I very much
22 enjoyed the opportunity to see the street sweep and
23 discussing, ah, personally and to, to have a first-
24 hand, ah, understanding of the issues you've been
25 raising with the agency, and I, too, thought it was

1 very productive and, and certainly very informative.
2 Um, ah, as to the, as to the commercial loading
3 zones, again, this is, this is an issue, ah, this is
4 an issue where, where our, our objective is to work
5 closely with, with the community, with your office,
6 ah, ah, and, and to make sure that we're doing what
7 makes sense. Um, this is, you know, in areas where
8 we have the ability to, to do it. But, but we, and
9 recognizing the competing use of the curb. I mean,
10 we were out there looking at buses, right?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah.

13 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: So, so how you, and
14 this is something we discussed, I guess, the other
15 day. You've got, the streets aren't getting any
16 bigger but we're, we're dedicating portions of them,
17 the bus use portions of them, to bikes, etcetera,
18 etcetera, and the commercial loading space has to fit
19 in there, too. So, so we're happy to work with you.
20 And, again, this is an example of an area where,
21 where the need for commercial loading space is sort
22 of obvious and, and, you know, if we didn't notice it
23 you would certainly bring it, you and your staff
24 would certainly bring it to our attention. Um, um,
25 which, which we thought probably works better than

1
2 the more formulaic automatic based on census,
3 etcetera, approach that is in the legislation. But,
4 um, ah, certainly we're, we're looking for areas like
5 that where we can make a difference. As to the
6 process, and...

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: ...[inaudible] I'm
9 sorry, OK, I was gonna turn it to, ah, the Assistant
10 Commissioner, but, again, you know how to reach us.
11 We can, we can have that conversation offline.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You can take time to
13 finish that.

14 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: OK, I was, I was
15 gonna toss it to Assistant Commissioner Zack on the
16 question of who's involved in the decision-making
17 process beyond the informal availability of our
18 office to talk to your office and the borough
19 commissioner to talk with your office [inaudible].

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, because,
21 and we see it's pretty unique and it's happening now,
22 so, um, we think any work that's gonna get done is
23 gonna precede the implementation of this legislation
24 here. So how, how do we make sure that we get that
25 right?

2 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Right, I mean,
3 Rebecca?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: Yeah, I,
5 I'll circle back with the team here and talk to the
6 Queens office and Eric and some of his staff and, and
7 put together the, the right folks to talk to you.
8 Happy to follow up. I'll reach out to Ali, too.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: OK, thank you.

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: You're
11 welcome.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: There's multiple
13 locations that that is happening right now.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: Understood.

15 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Yep.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council
19 Member. Next we will hear from Council Member
20 Menchaca. Council Member Menchaca.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. Ah,
23 Commissioner, I don't think we've, we've spoken yet,
24 and so congratulations on...

25 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Thank you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...your
3 appointment, and, ah, looking forward to working with
4 you [inaudible] Deputy Commissioner Zack and, and,
5 ah, Commissioner La Rocca, too, over at, ah, DOT are,
6 are very, ah, briefed on what I'm about to ask, and
7 really I want, I want to bring this conversation into
8 focus in Red Hook. Red Hook, which has five last
9 mile delivery distribution centers on their way, ah,
10 totalling 3 million square feet of engaged work in
11 this, ah, and we've been talking about for the last
12 hour and some, and it's causing real fear, and we've
13 been talking about this for two years, and so we're,
14 we're kind of, we're not where you are. I think
15 you're still trying to understand it. We're, we're
16 done with that in Red Hook. We have some ideas and
17 we're, we're faced with this, the, the, the issue
18 that happens in city government that basically
19 because there's 15 different agencies that have to
20 look at something nothing happens, and so we're,
21 we're really, we're kind of done with that grace.
22 What the community has done with us at the city level
23 with that grace period of get your shit together and
24 they're pissed, and so what I would like to talk to
25 you about is either getting physically to Red Hook to

1 understand what's happening on the ground, one, two,
2 work with the agencies, and we're talking about EDC
3 'cause EDC has a lot of managed property of top of
4 Port Authority, um, with a lot of, ah, capital
5 improvements coming to the ferries and home port,
6 too. There's a lot of infrastructure that's gonna
7 get, ah, in lot of ways impacted by all these last
8 mile delivery, not, not including the schools and in
9 the neighborhoods. So, like you know the issue, I, I
10 have been listening to you. You got the issue, what
11 we are faced with is the inaction of the city is
12 gonna cause the fears to come to fruition and we're
13 gonna be in a bad place because people are gonna die
14 on the streets of New York in Red Hook, Red Hook, by
15 truck and the pollution's gonna be real and we're
16 just not moving fast enough. So I'm here just to
17 sound the alarm in a very public way to you. I'm
18 very frustrated with the fact that just the agencies
19 are not moving in any real way, or, or talking to
20 each other, and, and so here we are. And, and so
21 this is more of a comment and I'd love to work with
22 you but at this point I, I just haven't seen any real
23 movement on, and just a lot of talking. And so, um,
24 I'll invite you to come to Red Hook to check it out.
25

1
2 But, um, we have some real ideas on how to think
3 about traffic flow. Um, we also have some ideas to
4 curb the actual construction of more last mile
5 delivery. I think we have a reached a
6 oversaturation, which brings in City Planning. Ah,
7 and if City Planning isn't talking to EDC isn't
8 talking to DOT isn't talking to DOB then, then the
9 market, and, and I heard you say this earlier, I
10 think this is a really big point, that, that this is
11 just how goods are gonna happen, this is how goods
12 are gonna move. That's a market force. The city has
13 a responsibility to its community to shape the market
14 forces and the market forces are [inaudible] right
15 now, and if all those last mile delivery, ah, centers
16 are in full throttle we're not gonna be to move
17 anything. Ah, and I think that the last mile
18 delivery folks are beginning to understand that, too.
19 But that's where leadership comes, and I just haven't
20 seen that. Um, so, will you come to Red Hook?

21 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: So, so, first of
22 all, ah, ah, Council Member, it's, it's a treat to
23 see you, ah, ah, even on Zoom, again, again, and, and
24 I look forward to working with you in, I guess, your
25 ongoing capacity, my new capacity. Um, and I'd be

1
2 delighted to come to Red Hook and, and look around,
3 ah, I mean, see whatever it is you'd like me to see.
4 Ah, um, if it's any comfort, I've already, I've
5 already had conversations with some of your
6 colleagues in government, um, who also are
7 responsible for that jurisdiction about some of these
8 issues and maybe even started introducing me to some
9 of the community groups. So, so we are, again, we're
10 not as, we're not quite as clueless as you may have
11 feared, ah, but we obviously still have a lot to
12 learn. And, and we are most anxious because,
13 precisely because this kind of distribution model,
14 um, is, I think, critical to getting rid of the big
15 trucks, ah, certainly within the city. Ah, you know,
16 we, we would like to encourage it, but we also want
17 it to be responsible. You know, I think some of the
18 projects there are as-of-right, so there's not a
19 whole lot that we have the ability to deal with.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: All of them.

21 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: OK, so we don't
22 have a lot, we can't prevent them. But what...

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

24 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: What I would like
25 to do, and this is something that we're already

1 discussing and I would be delighted to discuss
2 further with you and your staff and to do it on site,
3 is to find ways to make them be good neighbors. Um,
4 if the idea is to eliminate the big trucks, um, on
5 our residential streets, you know, you have to pay
6 attention to how they get to these distribution
7 centers and make sure that, that whatever they're
8 doing, ah, is, is consistent with the quality of life
9 in the residential parts of the district, and that's,
10 that's something where I think we may be able to be
11 of assistance and where we would certainly love to
12 try, because that I think is critically important.
13 Um, so, again, happy, happy to have this dialogue.
14 We should continue with, with less of an audience
15 and, ah, with others involved, including EDC,
16 etcetera. Because I do think there are things we can
17 do to allow the model to go forward, which we don't
18 have the ability to stop and wouldn't want to for the
19 other reasons, but to do it in a way that's, that's
20 not destructive of the quality of life in your
21 district or anybody else's, because that's obviously
22 not the, not the objective. So thank you for the
23 question.
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well, yeah,
3 let's, let's set that up.

4 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Sure.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
6 Commissioner, as soon as possible.

7 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: You got it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And we do
9 believe that there's way to stop them actually and we
10 want to talk to you about those as well. But that's
11 going to require a larger citywide, um, understanding
12 about how we can, ah, really understand saturation in
13 neighborhoods and, um, and allow for everyone to be,
14 ah, productive both as a neighbor, ah, as a resident,
15 and, and a distribution center. And so, um, let's
16 explore those ideas as well. Thank you, Chair, for
17 this extra time, and I look forward to working with
18 you and, and the rest of city, City Hall.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council
22 Member Menchaca. Ah, Chair, I believe Council Member
23 Holden would like to ask a follow-up question if it's
24 OK with you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Council
3 Member [inaudible].

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Ah, yes,
6 Commissioner, I just want to follow up on, um, my
7 legislation about, on 1819, about, um, the stencil of
8 the fire hydrant. Um, I might make some suggestions,
9 ah, because it does seem that DOT wastes manpower or
10 staffing, um, based on the fact that, let's say
11 daylighting, for instance. I have a lot of locations
12 in my district where they put up daylighting, which
13 is good, except they put up two no standing signs,
14 you know, going in each direction, like on the, why
15 would, why would we need a sign on the corner, no
16 standing, going one way and then, um, just a few from
17 is another sign. So you probably have maybe 10 feet
18 in between the signs or 15, whatever it is, and, um,
19 what, what we're seeing. Oh, sorry, my camera's not
20 on. OK, there we go. Um, what we're seeing is a
21 waste of staffing to put multiple signs, unnecessary
22 signs, yet, um, you mentioned that it would require
23 more staffing to put a stencil, just essentially
24 paint and a stencil could be painted within a matter
25 of I'd say minutes, but I'm not sure, you know,

1
2 what's required. Do you think it's that much of a,
3 of a problem to DOT to put the stencil in the middle
4 of a street?

5 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: I think the, ah,
6 I'm told and obviously we will pursue this further,
7 that there is, there is an issue of, ah, contracting
8 capability, the people who do this painting on the
9 street, that there aren't enough of them to do what
10 we're called on, so it's not even DOT personnel,
11 apart from resources, and I think if we're just doing
12 in a few places obviously that wouldn't be an issue,
13 but I was handed a note that there are 110,000, ah,
14 fire hydrants in the City of New York. So, I mean,
15 if, if this is important, if, if our colleagues in
16 the fire department believe that this is an important
17 thing we will obviously look to see if there are ways
18 that it could be done, or done in a phased manner.
19 But it's, you know, again, this is, this is, um,
20 they're telling me it's not as easy as, as it sounds.
21 Um, and, you know, we can, we can look at that. But
22 it's, it's a...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I, I don't think
24 any, Commissioner, I don't think anybody is saying
25 110,000 at once.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Like, you know, right, right away. All I'm saying is it could be phased in, it could be done in the districts that have more of a problem with, um, obviously hydrant parking, where, where you have...

COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: ... a very dense area and there might be a lot of fires in a particular area that has more density, so all I'm saying is this could be phased in over a period of years. But, and, and it would make sense with what Chair Rodriguez also said, it would make sense to extend this to not only the stencil but to painting the 15-foot marker so, um, right now people are guessing. They're guessing what 15 feet away from the hydrant is, ah, on each side, and as a result there's people just sort, tend to do, do less obviously if they can try to fit or five feet or 10 feet and I think we just need to, to just, you know, make it easier for people and also warn people that there's a hydrant there, ah, and at the same time helping the firefighters find, ah, if the

1
2 firefighters are telling me there's a problem,
3 there's a problem then.

4 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Yeah.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Like they're the
6 ones answering it.

7 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Yeah, I mean,
8 Council Member, I certainly understand the concern,
9 and what I can say is we will, we will look at this
10 further and, ah, figure out, figure out if there's an
11 answer. I mean, I, I certainly understand the
12 concern.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: All right, and
14 this is done in other cities, by the way. It's not
15 like, we're not inventing this.

16 COMMISSIONER GUTMAN: Yeah. That's,
17 that's, you know, I realize this isn't, this isn't
18 the most innovative thing we've been talking about
19 today.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, but I do
21 see, but, Commissioner, I do see, and, and again, I
22 know you, you just took over recently, but I do see,
23 ah, DOT tends to over-sign areas, that means like the
24 signage of putting up no standing, they put too many
25 of them up many times where, you know, especially if

1
2 you looking at daylighting, and I've plenty of
3 photographs to show the waste. So we need to maybe
4 reallocate resources with the DOT, if, if we don't
5 have enough street makers then we need people to do
6 that and take them off the sign, ah, ah, detail. But
7 thank you, thank you, Commissioner. Thank you,
8 Chair, for the second round. Sure.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and I
10 definitely would like to be working with you, Council
11 Member. This is important and, as you know, and
12 Commissioner you inherit, you know, the agency and I
13 think this is not about anything more than money for
14 the City of New York. This is about, we, this is a
15 source that we can raise money, can get a ticket,
16 and, and I think again that, eh, and again this is
17 not just on this administration, this is what we as a
18 city have done. We, we collect 1 billion dollars on
19 ticket. And I think that any time when, when we look
20 at wanting to changing what we make it's about OK, we
21 will be losing 5, 10, 20 million dollars. So it
22 doesn't make sense. I want any driver who, who
23 violate a part of the law to get a ticket. But it
24 isn't fair that a driver doesn't know the distance
25 that he or she must maintain. So I think that, you

1 know, this is not about technology. This is about we
2 cannot do it. This is about we cannot buy the paint.
3 It isn't about coming up with a signal. This is
4 about we as a city using those tools to collect
5 money. So, again, eh, again, thing that we were
6 doing for decades, eh, and I feel that this is the
7 time for us to at least with this small, eh, eh,
8 paint or putting the signal there we need to let
9 everyone know drivers should not park, eh, eh, eh,
10 on, on a 15 feet. But he or she should know what is
11 the distance, because right now it's not. So with
12 that I want to thank you, my colleague, and, and
13 again everyone that, you know, have come from the
14 administration, both commissioners, eh, eh, DOT, and
15 I know that all questions went to DOT, but I
16 appreciate all the work that we've done together.
17 We, our DOB commissioner, and with that, with the
18 administration going, now we go to hear from
19 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer and then
20 members of the public.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.
23 Um, if there are no other council members that have
24 questions, ah, we will now turn to the borough
25 president and public testimony. I'd like to remind

1 everyone that unlike our typical council hearings
2 we'll be calling individuals one by one to testify.
3 Ah, each panelist will be given two minutes to speak,
4 unless otherwise instructed by the chair. If your
5 testimony is long than your allotted time you can
6 please summarize and you may submit written testimony
7 for the record by sending it to
8 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Ah...

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before, before we
11 call on Manhattan Borough President and [inaudible]
12 to some colleagues, they had to go other meeting. I
13 want to invite all my colleagues for the [inaudible]
14 that we are having this coming Friday at noon at 166
15 and Broadway. The [inaudible] is gonna be after
16 Carlos Cook, a person that play an important role
17 together with Malcolm X. So not only we're gonna be
18 connecting 166 and Broadway, at Broadway from where
19 we connect after Betty Shabazz and Malcolm X, where
20 Malcolm X was assassinated, but also on that day,
21 this coming Friday at noon at that location at the
22 same time that we're going to be doing the co-naming
23 after Carlos Cook, and we're also gonna be calling
24 for the reopening of the investigation, eh, of the
25 assassination of Malcolm X, eh, so everyone are

1 invited, eh, to come to Washington Heights, get a,
2 get a good [inaudible] so with that let's go now to
3 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer.
4

5 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Thank you very
6 much, Chair Rodriguez, for this and much other, and
7 it's always fun to hang out with you in your
8 community.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

10 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: I am Gale
11 Brewer. I am the Manhattan Borough President, and I
12 just want to congratulate you and DOT for the
13 discussion today about how our city handles delivery
14 of goods and services. And I have just three bills
15 I'm gonna, ah, support. One is Speaker Johnson's
16 Intro 2253, Council Member Reynoso's 2279, and, ah,
17 Council Member's 2281, um, and they're all good
18 bills. And the only suggestion I would have, and I
19 know that you probably feel the same way, that these
20 proposals need to be reviewed by community boards,
21 'cause I know that community boards care about these
22 issues, particularly about how food gets delivered.
23 So, ah, 2253, as you know better than I, would
24 require DOT to pilot 12 micro distribution centers,
25 transferring goods to sustainable modes of last mile

1
2 delivery. Um, and I think these would, ah, function
3 like, ah, cargo bike delivery corrals currently
4 installed in many Whole Foods, like one right near my
5 house, and it aims to make deliveries to residents
6 via bikes rather than trucks, and in our dense city
7 the last mile, if it's done in a space-efficient
8 vehicle, like a bicycle is very commonsense. I
9 support that. It does help reduce, I hope, truck
10 traffic, and that's something that we're all trying
11 to do. I just want to make sure that there is a
12 place, ah, that the cargo bikes can go, um, in front
13 of each center so that there isn't any, ah,
14 congestion sidewalk. 2279 would require DOT to
15 designate commercial loading zones in 25% of certain
16 census tracts. Um, you know that these are proven to
17 ensure that deliveries happen in a timely manner, try
18 to stop double parking, and this bill I think would
19 help avoid these issues. The only suggestion I would
20 have is to amend it so that it prescribes more varied
21 street by street solutions and includes the
22 neighborhood loading zone language, that new DOT
23 language. It has helped double parking be reduced in
24 parts of Manhattan. And finally 2281, it's an office
25 of sustainable delivery systems and would require

1 commercial buildings over 500,000 square feet to
2 produce delivery plans for the Department of
3 Buildings. Large commercial buildings, we know they
4 generate truck traffic and it would require them to
5 plan deliveries in ways that reduce that and make
6 less disruptions to neighbors. Today we talk about
7 delivery consolidation, off-peak deliveries,
8 reservation systems, and with the DOB's newly formed
9 Delivery Systems Unit, which I didn't know about but
10 you do, um, this legislation would enable large
11 buildings to receive their deliveries with less
12 disruption. The only suggestion I would have is I
13 really, instead of that one office to talk about
14 sustainable delivery systems, I'm hoping that that
15 will allow we can do an office of the public realm,
16 which would include the bike lanes, the bus lanes,
17 and things like this, but not a separate office for
18 delivery systems. Thank you very much, ah, and I
19 really appreciate this interactive discussion about
20 how we can delivery of essential goods and services.
21 Thank you very much.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Gale.

23 We have been, you have been the best [inaudible]
24 colleague serving together the council about the best
25

1
2 also borough president who have used your opportunity
3 from your role to share the distribution of resources
4 through equally through the whole, eh, borough of
5 Manhattan and I know that transportation is on your
6 heart, so definitely we will continue working
7 together with you. Thank you.

8 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Thank you very
9 much.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Borough
11 President Brewer. Um, next we will turn to other
12 members of the public. Um, first we will hear from
13 Jose Holguin-Veras. Jose?

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, and can
16 you also explain the time in minutes for everyone,
17 and please if you would say more than that just
18 summarize, like 10 seconds before we give you, eh,
19 eh, let you know that you're getting close, but
20 please keep it just for two minutes.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And if your, please
22 summarize your testimony and if it goes over time you
23 can submit written testimony. Again, the address is
24 testimony@council.nyc.gov.

25 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jose?

JOSE HOLGUIN-VERAS: My name is Jose

Holguin-Veras. I want to thank, ah, Chair Rodriguez and the council members for giving me the opportunity to be here. Eh, as I said, I am the director of the Center of Excellence for a Sustainable Urban Freight System. That is a coalition of the leading freight research [inaudible] in the, in the world. We have a [inaudible] view of [inaudible] management, policy, and planning and among other accomplishments our group was the, the group that they signed the Off-Hour Delivery Project that had been successfully implemented by the New York City Department of Transportation and the City of New York. Basically, I believe that these, ah, package of, ah, initiatives drafted by the City Council are basically important because they basically in a unified way they try to address the obstructions of the use by double-parked trucks, by [inaudible] of time to improve the commercial loading zones, the regulation that tried to foster the sustainable moves by means of fostering micro distribution centers. I'm also requesting the, the New York State Legislature to remove the constraint to cargo bikes. In addition to that, I

1
2 mean, I believe it's important to reduce the both the
3 issue of package theft that has been affecting New
4 Yorkers, because also in doing so that helps increase
5 delivery efficiency by making these, ah, deliveries
6 faster and minimizing the amount of time that trucks
7 will be, will stand at the curb. Eh, as I asked both
8 the commissioner and several council members
9 indicated, I mean, there might be a need to, ah,
10 update the truck route systems also. In addition,
11 and finally, I believe that the initiative of
12 delivery as [inaudible] is very important because it
13 is an example of equal demand management [inaudible]
14 I mean large, eh, developments have the possibility
15 to minimize...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 JOSE HOLGUIN-VERAS: OK. And with that
18 basically I want to thank you for the opportunity to
19 talk.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
21 testimony. Um, next we will hear from, um, let's
22 see. Ah, next we have, um, Marco Conner DiAquoi.
23 Marco?

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

25

MARCO CONNER DIAQUOI: Yes, thank you.

My name is Marco Conner DiAquoio. I am deputy director of transportation alternatives. I want to thank council speaker Corey Johnson, Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez, and today's bill sponsors for leading this critically needed set of bills. Ah, the way that we currently use our street space is highly inequitable and it is harmful to every goal that this city has set around public health, our environmental and sustainability goals, reducing carbon emissions, and reaching Vision Zero. And the trucks, the way that we're using trucks, ah, in package deliveries are lethal to New Yorkers and disproportionately account for the more than 1000 pedestrians and cyclists killed in just the past eight years. But right now we're using our limited street space in the most harmful way. 75% of our street space today is dedicated to moving or storing cars, with the rest of us pushed to the margins of the streets. On average, cars sit parked and unused 95% of the time. This is a terribly inefficient use of highly limited public space that comes at the expense of reliable and sustainable and equitable transportation and deliveries. And today's package of bills will

1
2 directly address this. This is a city where everyone
3 either walks or rolls. We are a city where more than
4 80% of commuters commute by means other than a car
5 and where a majority of households do not own a car.
6 These are the realities, but the 75% street space
7 allocation to cars does not reflect that. We need to
8 reduce our reliance on large trucks and for the
9 trucks that must continue to we must set up much
10 smarter and equitable systems. Um, just very
11 briefly, um, we, ah, daylighting in Intro 2282 are
12 great. Um, daylighting saves lives, especially when
13 combined with turn restrictions. We also recommend
14 that the daylighting be required for 20 to 25 feet
15 from each...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 MARCO CONNER DIAQUOI: ...[inaudible] as
18 recommended by, by NACTO, um, and, ah, we strongly
19 support this package of bills today. Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Marco.
21 Um, if you have no questions for these panelists, ah,
22 next we will hear from Matt Bauer. Matt?

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 MATT BAUER: Hi, good afternoon, ah,
25 Council Member, Chair Rodriguez and members of the,

1
2 ah, Transportation Committee. Um, my name is Matt
3 Bauer. I'm the president of the Madison Avenue BID
4 that I'm here representing the New York City BID
5 Association, ah, which represents 76 business
6 improvement districts throughout, ah, New York City.
7 Um, ah, we very much appreciate you hosting this
8 hearing and we recognize the importance of moving
9 goods throughout our commercial corridors for the
10 health and vibrancy of our, of our city. Um, ah, we
11 commend the efforts to address last mile, ah,
12 efforts, and we think that Intro 2253 is a very
13 interesting idea. I just want to caution the city
14 and, and being directly engaged in a private sector
15 effort and, um, just also that any of these, ah,
16 facilities not impact, ah, retailers and other
17 restaurants that are on the block. Um, ah, we are,
18 ah, we recognize the importance of loading zones in
19 our, in our commercial districts. However, Intro
20 2279's, ah, blanket requirement that 25% of these,
21 ah, of our zone, of a block basis turn into loading
22 zones would be very difficult. Ah, that usually
23 represents a quarter of the stores and stores don't
24 want to necessarily be in a loading zone where
25 there's so many competing uses of our curb, ah, from,

1
2 ah, bike racks to fire hydrants to customer parking
3 to open restaurants [inaudible] take a more nuanced
4 approach, ah, and holistic approach needs to be, ah,
5 required for, for the siting of these. Ah, we are
6 concerned about Intro 2277's, ah, requirement to
7 extended, ah, the parking time, ah, to eight hours in
8 loading zones, in loading zone. It would, everything
9 [inaudible] into transfer depots, ah, that we're
10 very, very, ah, would not be, would not create
11 turnover of traffic. And finally Intro 2281, we
12 recognize the importance of buildings doing this, but
13 we have congestion pricing coming on right now and
14 with the...

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 MATT BAUER: ...city's existing off-hours
17 program there could be a lot more to do. So thank
18 you, um, very much for having me speak.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
20 testimony. Um, if you have no questions for this
21 panelist, next we will hear from Kendra Hems.
22 Kendra?

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 KENDRA HEMS: Hi, good afternoon. Ah,
25 thank you, Chair Rodriguez and members of the

1 committee. I'm Kendra Hems, president of the
2 Trucking Association of New York. Um, I just want
3 to, ah, thank the council for their support of
4 improving, ah, the efficiency of freight movement in
5 the city. To be brief, regarding 2253, the pilot
6 program for micro distribution centers across the
7 city, we support this initiative. We've actually
8 been working with some private industry on this.
9 However, we would encourage that all locations have
10 charging infrastructure versus just the minimum of
11 three. It doesn't support, um, sustainable modes of
12 transportation if we don't build out the
13 infrastructure to allow them to charge. Um, Intros
14 2277 and 79, we appreciate the intent to expand
15 loading zones across the city. We are a bit
16 concerned that the, ah, proposed parking rates set a
17 minimum rate but not a maximum. As our drivers are
18 doing everything they can to deliver these essential
19 goods, we want to ensure that they can do so and not
20 be charged exorbitant rates in the process. Um,
21 related specific to 2279, um, the provision that 25%
22 of the curb allocation be for loading zones. We
23 would like to see that be evaluated annually to
24 ensure that that does not [inaudible] overtime.

1 We're supportive of 2280 and 2281 regarding how goods
2 are delivered to large residential and commercial
3 vehicles. However, we do caution that there is no
4 one size fits all solution to this issue. Ah, the
5 trucking industry is incredibly diverse, as are their
6 needs, and so we need to ensure that there is some
7 flexibility built in, ah, to this legislation. And
8 then finally on Intro 2282, we're happy to see that
9 the legislation calls for the replacement and
10 enhancement of trucker signage. We believe this is
11 critical in eliminating confusion for drivers that
12 are unfamiliar with the truck route network.
13 However, we have been working with the city DOT for
14 several years as they update the current truck route
15 network and we want to ensure that the legislation
16 would not conflict with the work that they are
17 already doing. In, ah, respect of time, I just want
18 to thank you once again for your time today. We look
19 forward to continuing conversation on this
20 legislation. We appreciate the intentions, the
21 importance of the efficiency of freight delivery.
22 However, we do we feel that there are some areas of
23 the legislation that could be improved.
24

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

KENDRA HEMS: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony. Ah, I believe Council Member Holden has a question for this panelist.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes. Ah, thank you. Ah, Ms. Hems, could you, could you answer, did you hear my, um, my concerns about the 53-foot trailers being used in New York City? Do you know why your members are using them?

KENDRA HEMS: I, I did hear that and I appreciate the question. Um, part of the challenge, and certainly not, um, condoning the use of, um, equipment that's illegal, part of the challenge is the industry standard across the country are 53-foot trailers. And in fact it's very difficult for the industry to obtain a 45-foot trailer, which is what would be required to stay within the legal combination length limit within the city. Um, so I don't think it's necessarily a willful violation of the law. I think it's more about, um, the fact that many of these companies are from out of state and outside of New York City 53-foot trailers are in fact legal. Um, and I did want to comment, too, because I also heard, ah, your comment related to the training,

1
2 um, and I do take issue with that. Our drivers are,
3 um, trained to drive combination vehicles, whether
4 it's a 48, 45-foot trailer, 48-foot trailer, 53-foot
5 trailer. They do have the training necessary, um, to
6 drive that length of vehicle.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Well, I, I didn't
8 make that up, by the way. A driver actually said
9 that to me. And if it's, if, if your members are
10 using, and now it's really the norm, it's not the
11 exception, ah, the 48-footers or 45, whatever the
12 smaller vehicles, you have to understand, New York
13 City has tighter streets than many other cities.
14 We're an older city. Um, if there's a law
15 prohibiting them, then your members should abide by
16 it and not, and not say, well, it's done in other
17 parts of the country. Well, you know what? That's
18 endangering everyone. So if your members are
19 willfully skirting the law by using 50-foot footers
20 and then saying you're, they're all trained, um, ah,
21 I didn't make that up, drivers actually told me that.
22 So we need, we need an investigation as to why you
23 couldn't use smaller trucks in New York City because,
24 um, if, if it's, ah, if it's, ah, money, it's the
25 economy, you're also destroying New York City streets

1
2 and endangering everyone, pedestrians. My, my, my
3 vehicle was, that was parked legally on the corner
4 was taken out by a tractor trailer that just kept on
5 going and wiped my car out. And this is happening
6 every day in New York City. So if the industry is
7 going to, um, really not listen to the law, then I
8 got a big problem with that. And the industry should
9 get itself together before asking, yeah, before we
10 want to work together, the industry is flying in the
11 face of the law by saying we're using 53-footers and
12 the heck with you guys in New York City. That's what
13 they're saying.

14 KENDRA HEMS: Well, and Council Member,
15 with all due respect, I mean, we're speaking in
16 generalizations here. I don't think to paint the,
17 the industry with a broad brush that they're
18 willfully violating the law is, is fair. There are
19 many companies that in fact do follow the law and do
20 take the extra expense to order the shorter trailers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I'm sure there
22 are but [inaudible].

23 KENDRA HEMS: I think part of the
24 challenge is making the out-of-state carriers that
25

1
2 come into New York City are unfamiliar with the
3 restriction.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I'm sure there
5 are, but I'll show you photographs of extended cabs
6 blocking streets. They have extended cabs and
7 extended trailers, and that, don't tell me that
8 everyone is trained to drive those things, either.
9 Those things are massive 70, 75-five footers and they
10 can't maneuver New York City streets without going up
11 on the sidewalk, endangering everyone, taking out
12 cars and pedestrians, and, and bicyclists and so
13 forth. So let's, let's get, let's get a, um, you
14 know, a solution to this and not just for decades now
15 ignoring the law, and that's what the industry is
16 doing. And this was told to me by the drivers, OK?

17 KENDRA HEMS: I understand that. But we
18 have millions of drivers across the country. So,
19 again, it is the generalization based on
20 conversations with a specific driver.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I'm talking about
22 New York City. I'm talking about New York City here,
23 not the rest of the country. Thank you. Thank you,
24 chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You're welcome.

And I, I think that the most is, I think that the Trucking Association, you know, overall provide services responding to the demand of the consumers. I ask you that you as a leader [inaudible] our institution at the moment we just need to take the message back there and say now this is case is going on the city so that you can address it. I feel that, you know, we always should be expecting that it's no, there's a small percentage are involved in that practice. But as you know [inaudible] corrected and, and, and I think that, and it's not just, I think the technology is there, [inaudible] trucks, eh, or I know you guys mean that private company want members of the institution the technology is there for them to know where the trucks are. So I feel that, you know, [inaudible] urgency, let's be sure there's no one of those trucks that are affiliated with institution that are involved in the practice, because it affect the image of the whole institution that [inaudible] provide important service without those truck delivering the food to the city, eh, we would not be able, people would having to get their package in their apartment. So, you know, let's be

1
2 sure, eh, again, take it back to those members and
3 let's be sure that there's not just some member. No
4 one should be involved in that practice. Thank you.

5 KENDRA HEMS: I agree 100%, Chairman.
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, our next panelist
9 will be Ryan Monell. Ryan?

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 RYAN MONELL: Well, thank you, ah, Chair
12 Rodriguez and members of the committee. I'm Ryan
13 Monell with the Real Estate Board of New York. I
14 appreciate the opportunity to testify today. Ah, you
15 know, very much in support in regards to what we're
16 hearing today, about finding opportunities to
17 alleviate truck traffic in our city, ah, to make our
18 streets more safe and to make our streetscapes work
19 better for, for all New Yorkers. Um, we have a few
20 concerns with a number of the bills that were, were
21 introduced today, particularly, ah, Intro 2281 and
22 Intro 2280. Ah, Intro 2281, um, as you, ah, I'm
23 sure, ah, have seen, ah, we've put together
24 requirements, ah, for buildings that are now going to
25 defined as large traffic generators. Ah,

1
2 unfortunately, um, we feel very strongly that the,
3 the impetus is put on the wrong, ah, individuals, ah,
4 in this proposal, ah, and as a result, um, you know,
5 we [inaudible] for many folks, including building
6 service workers, ah, building managers, and property
7 owners who are trying to do the best for their
8 tenants. Ah, requiring them to essentially, ah, put
9 together, ah, recommendations on freight delivery
10 that ultimately is the responsibility for those who,
11 ah, are making the deliveries just doesn't make a
12 whole lot of sense. And so we're very concerned in
13 regards to, ah, how to implement this proposal.
14 Secondly, and, ah, I think, ah, Commissioner La
15 Rocca, ah, voiced similar concerns in regards to
16 Intro, ah, 2280, which would require package rooms in
17 essential all new construction as well as, ah, after
18 gut renovations. Ah, I think we have to look in
19 regards to specificity around, ah, what is being
20 required and where it could not potentially work in
21 certain circumstances. So, ah, looking forward to
22 working more with the council on this as well. Ah,
23 we have, ah, submitted testimony to the record, um,
24 with further suggestions. And thanks again, ah, to
25 the chair.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 94
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
3 testimony. Are there any questions for this
4 panelist? OK, seeing none, our next panel will be
5 Axel Carrion. Axel?

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 ALEX CARRION: UPS thanks Speaker Johnson
8 and Chair Rodriguez for holding this important
9 hearing on the recently proposed smart, safe, and
10 sustainable delivery field package and for the
11 opportunity to provide feedback. We would also like
12 to thank Council Member Reynoso, Powers, and Rivera
13 for their leadership on this legislation. UPS has
14 long envisioned alternatives for a more sustainable
15 streetscape and we're delighted to see that the
16 council has taken a huge first step to address the
17 continued shortage and lack of curbside space
18 available for commercial deliveries. UPS strongly
19 supports Intro 2277, which would support efficiency
20 by extended the number of hours that commercial
21 vehicles can park in loading zones from three to
22 eight hours. Increasing the time allowed at the curb
23 will decrease congestion and instances of double
24 parking by eliminating the needs of vehicles to
25 unnecessarily reenter the roadway every three hours

1 to find new parking. Commercial zone parking
2 enforcement would further complement these efforts.
3 Similarly, Intro 2279's proposal requires DOT to
4 designate at least 25% of curbside space to loading
5 zones in both densely populated neighborhoods and
6 neighborhoods with commercial and manufacturing uses
7 would ensure that there is additional commercial
8 parking to help offset the exponentially growing
9 volume of deliveries in New York City. We believe
10 this would not only make deliveries more efficient,
11 but also create safer streets for drivers, bikers,
12 and pedestrians alike. UPS is also strongly in
13 support of Intro 2253, which would require DOT to
14 establish a pilot program of at least 12 micro
15 distribution centers. With Intro 2253, New York has
16 an opportunity to lead the way on zero emission
17 alternatives to last mile distribution and
18 preparation of cargo bike deployment in other metro
19 areas, like Seattle and Portland, UPS is excited to
20 expand on the great success realized in Europe in the
21 areas of truck dwell time and double parking amongst
22 other challenges associated with limited curbside
23 space. That is why UPS strongly supports Resolution
24

2 1610, calling on the state to amend existing e-bike
3 regulations...

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 ALEX CARRION: ...[inaudible] cargo bike
6 models to operate in New York City. We commend
7 Senator Jessica Ramos for her leadership on this
8 issue in Albany and look forward to working with her,
9 the council, and DOT to pass this legislation. Thank
10 you very much.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
12 testimony. Are there any council members that have
13 questions for this panelist? OK, seeing none, our
14 next panelist will be Richard Lipsky. Richard?

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 RICHARD LIPSKY: Can you hear me?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we can hear you.

18 RICHARD LIPSKY: OK. Um, I represent,
19 thank you for the opportunity, I represent, ah,
20 Mercedes Supermarkets, Morton Williams Supermarkets,
21 and I'm testifying in response to, ah, Councilman
22 Powers' Intro 2277, which, ah, restricts, ah, times,
23 ah, ah, of commercial loading zones to eight hours,
24 now extends this time to eight hours. And, ah, we
25 had a discussion with, ah, staff yesterday in

1
2 Councilman Powers' office. I think, um, we're in
3 agreement, ah, with, um, ah, Commissioner Gutman that
4 the bill needs to be tweaked in terms of, um,
5 specific areas, especially in front of supermarkets.
6 Precisely because, ah, we've experienced real
7 difficulties with Amazon trucks parking all day long
8 in front of supermarkets and, ah, preventing our
9 deliveries. We usually get between, ah, 40 and 50
10 deliveries a day and if we don't have access to the
11 space in front of our stores then our delivery trucks
12 are thwarted, ah, usually getting ticketed, ah, for
13 delivering to the store, um, you know, they are
14 supposed to have access. So, ah, we would like to
15 see some tweaks to the bill and we think, ah,
16 hopefully that the sponsor is amenable to restrict in
17 front of supermarkets so that there is expeditious
18 loading and unloading that will allow, ah, those
19 deliveries, ah, to occur. So, um, we're in support
20 of restricting the parking and we think there's a
21 need to do it in a more, um, targeted direction and,
22 ah, the importance of supermarkets, um, should be
23 reinforced by the city. The e-commerce is taking a
24 big bite out of them. They shouldn't be allowed to,
25 ah, prop up all day in front of markets and we are

1 hopeful that the entire council would take a look at
2 the bill and...

3
4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 RICHARD LIPSKY: ...and amend for
6 supplements. Thank you.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
8 testimony. Do any council members have questions for
9 this panelist? OK. Ah, seeing none, our next
10 panelist will be Charles Yu. Charles?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

12 CHARLES YU: Good afternoon, Chair
13 Rodriguez and, um, members of the Committee on
14 Transportation, and thank you for this opportunity to
15 address you today. My name is Charles Yu and I'm the
16 senior director of [inaudible] Assistance of the Long
17 Island City Partnership, the local development
18 corporation for LIC. We also manage the LIC Business
19 Improvement District and the Industrial Business
20 zone. Through our BID, ah, we want to echo
21 [inaudible] sentiments earlier in his testimony on
22 behalf of the BID Association. Ah, we also wanted to
23 share our perspective in our industrial business
24 service provider hat, where we work one on one with
25 industrial businesses throughout western Queens.

1 Transportation and freight mobility are very
2 important issues for our area. Many of our
3 businesses rely on commercial vehicles and get daily
4 operations to deliver essential products, services to
5 their customers in Manhattan and beyond. We commend
6 the City Council for highlighting the need, ah, to
7 accommodate essential delivery activity and to
8 proactively alleviate the growing conflicts on our
9 congested street. We welcome the opportunity to work
10 with you, DOT, our businesses, and other affected
11 community stakeholders on crafting a holistic
12 approach to these pressing issues. While we believe
13 the package of bills is much needed, ah, is a much-
14 needed call to action, we also cautious, caution that
15 these are complicated issues and this is a difficult
16 moment when the booths for permanent open dining and
17 congestion pricing management [inaudible] are being
18 developed and will also have a direct effect on the
19 use of curb space and traffic lanes. Further, at
20 this time when we are still experiencing massive
21 disruptions due to COVID-19 in this difficult time,
22 it is a difficult time to properly gauge the
23 [inaudible] and traffic patterns making an
24 appropriate long-term solution elusive. Ah, we also
25

1
2 fear the unintended consequences of some of these
3 proposals, especially when applied so broadly. Ah,
4 for example, the extension of commercial loading
5 zones to no less than 25% of available curb space
6 could introduce frictions with restaurants offering
7 outdoor dining on certain streets and may not
8 actually line up with the needs of those making
9 deliveries, and site selection and implementation of
10 the micro distribution centers could increase the
11 cost of delivery and does not make sense for all
12 types of deliveries.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

14 CHARLES YU: Thank you, and, um, look
15 forward to the opportunity to working with the
16 council, DOT, and businesses, um, and other community
17 stakeholders, ah, to find a long-term solution.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
20 testimony. Are there any questions for this
21 panelist? OK, seeing none, our next panelist will be
22 Jeffrey Friedman. Jeffrey?

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 JEFFREY FRIEDMAN: Yes, ah, thank you
25 very much. Um, my name is Jeffrey Friedman. I want

1
2 to say thank you to the chair, um, as well as the
3 commissioner and also the borough president, because
4 a lot of times the success of these projects
5 ultimately are about the neighborhood. My name is,
6 ah, Jeffrey Friedman. I'm the CEO of Building
7 Intelligence and providers of ST3, the cloud to
8 mobile solutions for security and logistics. Many of
9 you have worked with our team for specific large
10 projects in the city. Ah, many of the people in the
11 Department of Transportation over the last 15 years
12 have created amazing solutions that solve many of the
13 big programs from many of the big complexes and the
14 construction sites. Our Safety X certified delivery
15 scheduling program has been adopted by many forward-
16 thinking facilities, not only to make this city
17 better, construction projects better, to lower
18 traffic and create value, a valuable amenity. As
19 important as it is to solve congestion issues,
20 knowing when vehicles and drivers are meant to arrive
21 as a matter of security and safety are also
22 important. Leveraging investments in security to
23 create efficient operations has resulted in a better
24 city. A lot of the things that you are trying to
25 pass we're, we're all for. Um, the, the bill sort of

1 celebrates the success of the past that's already
2 been established at One Bryant Park, at World Trade
3 Center, at Hudson Yards, at Time Warner Center, at
4 One Vanderbilt, and many other facilities around the
5 city. Delivery scheduling programs have worked, have
6 lowered congestion, and created a much safer city.
7 Um, it's reduced pollution, optimized operations,
8 support a better-working city, a smart city. This is
9 really what a smart city is about. A smart city is
10 about building owners and operators working together
11 in a public-private partnership to enable, um, just a
12 better-working city. It's not only from the, ah,
13 government, but it's also the government and the
14 private sector working together. These forward-
15 thinking owners and operators have put their wheels
16 in motion to support efficient operations and a safer
17 city. The city needs more buildings to coordinate
18 delivery and operations to support a safer city. The
19 premise of these systems is allow tenants and vendors
20 to coordinate and consolidate deliveries to reduce
21 traffic and pollution. Many of you know that some of
22 the vehicles that...

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 JEFFREY FRIEDMAN: ...[inaudible] are half
3 empty. Anyway, we just really wanted to applaud the
4 effort by all the council people, the chairman, the
5 commissioner, and the effort to make, put some of
6 these things into law and many of the, ah, great
7 building owners of New York City have already done.
8 Appreciate your time and effort. Thank you, guys.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
10 testimony. Do any council members have questions for
11 this panelist? OK, ah, seeing none, our next
12 panelist will be Thomas Ferrugia. Thomas?

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 THOMAS FERRUGIA: Hi. Um, I am Tom
15 Ferrugia. I'm director of governmental affairs with
16 the Broadway League. Ah, I have already submitted a
17 long form testimony, so I will just go through this
18 very quickly. Ah, the Broadway League is the
19 commercial, is a trade association for the National
20 Theatrical Broadway Industry. We have over 400
21 members who maintain offices in New York City. And
22 I'd like to thank the council for allowing me to
23 speak. I'd also like to thank Speaker Johnson and
24 Council Member Powers for sponsoring, ah, Intro, ah,
25 what is it now exactly, ah, 1811. Um, specifically,

1 um, I want to preface my remarks by saying that, um,
2 in 2019 Broadway sold 14.8 million tickets. Ah,
3 approximately 46% of those admissions were domestic
4 tourists. An additional 19% were foreign tourists.
5 And approximately 59% of all visitors reported that
6 attending a Broadway show was a principle reason for
7 their visit to New York City. Ah, we provided almost
8 100,000 full-time equivalent jobs and welcomed
9 approximately 40,000 theater-goers per day.
10 Combined, Broadway theater had an economic impact of
11 20 billion dollars on the United States and generated
12 about 675 million dollars in tax revenue for the
13 city. And as we all know, ah, our theaters have been
14 shuttered since March 12, 2020, and New York City is
15 losing an estimated 1.225 billion dollars in economic
16 activity every month that our theaters remain dark.
17 The league has always endorsed legislation and that
18 improving the flow of pedestrian vehicular traffic,
19 encouraging visitors and resident access and
20 enhancing the overall quality of life in Times
21 Square. We believe this oversight is more important
22 than ever as we work with legislators and health
23 officials to raise our curtains and rebuild audience
24 confidence in public gatherings. The promise of a
25

1
2 safe and orderly environment is vital to visitors
3 returning to Times Square. Ah, with respect to 1811,
4 it's important that the council act to regulate what
5 has remained a leading contributor to an unsafe,
6 chaotic, and disorganized environment in Times
7 Square.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 THOMAS FERRUGIA: Ah, thank you very much
10 for this opportunity and, again, we support, I
11 support this legislation completely and we think it
12 will go a long way in ensuring, um, an improved
13 experience in Times Square for our visitors and for
14 our residents. Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
16 testimony. Are there any questions for this
17 panelist? OK, our next panel will be David Cohen.
18 David?

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do we have David?
21 OK, we can circle back to see if we get David. OK,
22 our next panel will be Regina Fojas. Regina?

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 REGINA FOJAS: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez
25 and members of the committee for the opportunity to

1 speak today. My name is Regina Fojas and I'm the
2 senior vice president of Times Square Alliance. The
3 alliance strongly supports Intro 1811 and thanks its
4 sponsors, Council Member Powers and Speaker Johnson,
5 for their ongoing leadership in public space
6 management. In 2009 the city created the Broadway
7 pedestrian plazas to manage increased congestion on
8 our sidewalks. Tourists and New Yorkers alike could
9 navigate Times Square safely and have a place to sit,
10 relax, and enjoy public space. Before COVID the
11 plazas welcomed over 400,000 people a day. In 2016
12 the council passed Local Law 53 to preserve mobility
13 on the plazas and maintain individuals' right to
14 engage in commercial activity within designated
15 activity zones. However, the city's interpretation
16 of the rule has left passersby open to unwanted
17 bullying and harassment outside of the zones. In
18 2019, well after the bill passed, 60% of those who
19 work and live in Times Square reported the unpleasant
20 interaction with a costumed character and a quarter
21 of them reported being touched without consent, the
22 impact of which is even more serious post pandemic.
23 Pre-COVID when I walked our district I was stopped at
24 least 45 times by costumed characters [inaudible] to
25

1
2 investigate sellers and people pretending to be
3 monks. If we want New York City to be a post-
4 recovery destination we must address these conditions
5 before workers and visitors return to our plazas en
6 masse. Intro 1811 does this by building upon Local
7 Law 53 and also establishes a committee composed of
8 costumed characters so it gives them a voice in a
9 forum to address issues before enforcement is
10 necessary. I think it's a very important component
11 of the bill. A time to recovery is vital to New York
12 City's recovery. If, if visitors feel safe in Times
13 Square, the busiest crossroads of the world, they
14 will feel safe across the city. Adopting Intro 1811
15 puts us further along the path to recovery and lets
16 the world know that New York City...

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

18 REGINA FOJAS: ...is a safe and exciting
19 place to return to. Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
21 testimony. Are there any questions for this
22 panelist? OK, seeing none, our next panelist will be
23 Glen Bolofsky. Glenn?

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.
25

1
2 GLEN BOLOFSKY: Thank you so much. Good
3 morning.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before, before we
5 move to the next panel I want to, eh, eh, eh, bring
6 to the Center for Alliance, of course always happy to
7 be working with you guys and, but, eh, I know that
8 because of COVID a lot of conversation that we were
9 having, eh, you know, before we were hit with the
10 pandemic we were not able to follow up, but as a
11 person that led the law that addressed the business
12 custom there and, and separate the area where they
13 could be, eh, I just want to be sure that as we
14 continue our conversation on this bill that we
15 continue those pieces that we were discussing before
16 COVID, which is about, eh, we also talk when we pass
17 a law that the Time Square Alliance would be working
18 with the whole, eh, theater community in Times Square
19 with the, with the Disney community there, to be sure
20 that their resources are not only, you know,
21 investing in the Times Square area because anyone
22 would like to be in Times Square area. Eh, the
23 question is part [inaudible] plaza, like how can the
24 Times Square plaza adopt, you do not know the sister
25 plaza in this case in the uptown Manhattan area and

1
2 the Bronx or Brooklyn, eh, that we can say, eh, some
3 of those theater in Times Square they should not only
4 say we can go one day a year and do the performance
5 in Times Square, but let's bring it to the
6 underserved community, too. So, again, I think that
7 we were having positive conversation and I can say
8 that, you know, we learned from lack of [inaudible]
9 when we pass a bill years ago and I know that the
10 experience there was to correct where places we not
11 work that we were not following [inaudible] it comes
12 to, eh, looking for Times Square to work with the
13 partners and members of those board to be sure that
14 they would not only, eh, bring the, the entertaining
15 and culture to the Times Square but also to adopt a
16 plaza in the underserved community. So, again, I
17 just want to let you know that I would also be
18 continue looking at, you know, how we, eh, will
19 following of those amendment understanding how
20 important it is, you know, to expand on the bill that
21 we passed, but at the same time we need to be sure
22 that the workers there, they are also trained. All
23 the workers that this [inaudible] they are
24 immigrants. They are, many of them undocumented who
25 they also pay the taxes. So, eh, eh, a bad

1 [inaudible] cannot describe the general behavior of
2 everyone who worked there. So I know that again we
3 had only good, positive, eh, conversation with you
4 guys, but more than, you know, the worse about
5 implementations in order to reassure that all those
6 millions of tourists, hopefully they will come back,
7 all those corporation that they will return for the
8 investment. They also need to understand it, that
9 the reason why lost most of the people that could be
10 black, Latino, Asian, and the poorest one is because
11 they are not the one who went to the Times Square
12 area. They are not the one who made the money. So
13 go and, and, and enjoy a good play there. So, you
14 know, I think that this [inaudible] that we got to
15 [inaudible] from COVID. And one of those is more
16 than ever to look at the most wealthy one that they
17 are getting ready, that they are the one who are
18 getting billions of dollars in PPE and other federal
19 support, also to understand that, you know, New York
20 City had to learn from George Floyd. New York City
21 had to, to learn from, from the coronavirus. It's
22 like anyone can die but once delivery die, when a
23 well known person die, we make it to the front page.
24 Hundreds and thousands of people die, black, Latino,
25

1 and Asian, the poorest one, and they just numbers.
2 So be sure that we close the gap on access to
3 cultural, [inaudible] to be sure that it's not in the
4 theater, the black and Latino and Asian who play the
5 role more on the cable but being [inaudible] those
6 institutions are for me very important as we also
7 work with you guy to work on things that is important
8 for those who make, you know, all the [inaudible]
9 that work with you. So I'm more than happy to work,
10 but I just want to let you know that I will be
11 looking at those agreement that have been made.

12
13 REGINA FOJA: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez,
14 and we're happy to continue those conversations with
15 you and your office.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, ah, now we'll go
18 to Glen Bolofsky. Glen?

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 GLEN BOLOFSKY: OK. Ah, first, ah, I
21 want to thank everyone for being here and making
22 themselves available, everybody's schedule is
23 obviously very, very, very, very busy. I think the
24 message today is about unity, how we come together to
25 passing port legislation and so first in terms of

1
2 unity, let me wish those who celebrate a happy Cinco
3 de Mayo. Second, I agree completely with Chairman
4 Rodriguez, and I do so entirely, the street belongs
5 to everyone, pedestrians, bicyclists, delivery
6 vehicles, and not the least disabled motorists. This
7 leads me to speak to Intro both 2277, sponsored by
8 our friend, Keith Powers, and 1141, our honorable
9 Chairman. And we want to thank Speaker Johnson and
10 Chairman Rodriguez for committing to passing 1141 to
11 make parking fines fair for everyone and protecting
12 the disabled motorist. Now, speaking very quickly
13 and briefly to 2277, I'm hopeful and believe we are
14 all here again in unity to make certain that the
15 hard-fought rights of our disabled community are not
16 lost due to a misconstruction of how the proposed law
17 and existing laws work to protect the disabled. Do
18 they work in unison, or is there room for a
19 compelling interpretation that no placards mean
20 exactly that, no placards. I appreciate that the
21 administrative code has an exemption for disability
22 permits, so we seek assurance on the record or an
23 amendment to 2277 that where it says no placards it
24 will exclude a ban on disability permits. This way
25 if ticket agents lean on the no placards language to

1 write us tickets at a later time we can have the
2 record show that 2277 is leaning on existing law that
3 already carves out an exemption for disability
4 permits. Ah, that's the main issues I have. If I
5 have a moment, the other question concerning,
6 concerning 2277, the intent is wonderful. We agree
7 wholeheartedly. The question of eight hours, um,
8 which would be great for certain companies like UPS,
9 FedEx, Amazon, and we respect their needs, and maybe
10 there needs to be some parking for that.

11
12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 GLEN BOLOFSKY: Thank you so much for
14 your valuable time. I appreciate it.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Are there
16 any questions for this panelist? All right, seeing
17 none, our next panelist will be Jessica Baker.
18 Jessica?

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 JESSICA BAKER: Thank you, Chair
21 Rodriguez and members of the committee for allowing
22 me the opportunity to speak today. My name is
23 Jessica Baker Voodor and I'm the vice president of
24 operations for the New 42nd Street. Ah, the New 42nd
25 Street has partnered with the city and state over the

1
2 past 30 years to create and manage a vibrant mix of
3 adaptive reuses for city-owned historic theaters on
4 42nd Street between 7th and 8th Avenue. I'm here
5 today to support the thoughtful policies included in
6 Intro 1811 and we offer our sincere thanks to the
7 bill's sponsors, Council Member Keith Powers and
8 Speaker Corey Johnson, for their leadership and
9 support of the theaters and businesses on 42nd Street
10 during this very difficult pandemic. Um, 42nd Street
11 theaters between 7th and 8th Avenue desperately need
12 this theater district safety zone designation that's
13 created in Intro 1811. Ah, on the east side of
14 single 42nd Street block there are five theaters with
15 a total of more than 5000 live theater seats, ah,
16 that includes the New 42's new Victory Theater, which
17 during normal theater operations presents world-class
18 performances to more than 100,000 New York City
19 schoolchildren, parents, and families, ah, across the
20 five boroughs. Ah, the block is also home to, ah,
21 several other theaters and establishing pedestrian
22 flow zones on the sidewalks of blocks like ours with
23 multiple active theaters is just common sense. Ah,
24 the density of the visitors and theater-goers that
25 our block brings, um, adds to the congestion of the,

1
2 of the commuters between the Times Square subway and
3 Port Authority, and the, ah, very informed and
4 reasonable policy solutions that are included in
5 Intro 1811, um, that regulate, ah, the spillover of
6 commercial activity from the plazas, like the
7 costumed characters and the ticket sellers. Um, ah,
8 these, these conditions create overcrowding
9 conditions that bottleneck our sidewalk traffic and
10 forces pedestrians, and many of whom are children,
11 into the streets. Um, the crowds...

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

13 JESSICA BAKER: Thank you so much. I've
14 submitted a fuller, ah, testimony, but we really
15 appreciate, um, the council's attention to this very
16 critical matter and, ah, thank you for letting me
17 speak today.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
19 testimony. Are there any questions for this
20 panelist? OK, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] I
22 know that it would take [inaudible] in what I say,
23 [inaudible] your partners follow one thing that we
24 have talked about, even though we make the number
25 very well [inaudible] citywide [inaudible] but it

1
2 comes to, you know, and of course I have my daughter,
3 having my two daughters, 14 and 8, and many play
4 there and, and performance so but, you know, making
5 all these things, getting the private sector that who
6 can pay more, eh, and raise the money for the
7 underserved to be able to access to, you know, those
8 [inaudible] very important and, again, eh, I would be
9 talking to the, to the community that [inaudible]. I
10 want to be sure that with that, you know, they also
11 know that this conversation is going on. I want to
12 be able to work with you and my colleague. I also,
13 you know, the whole idea that a job training program
14 should be put in place for those individuals also to
15 have opportunity to get trained to [inaudible] job,
16 you know, the city's coming back. The city's coming
17 stronger. Those people make a lot of money in, in
18 42nd. And they should be able to put a fund. They
19 should be able to train those individual and offer
20 them the opportunity to be relocated. Cannot be only
21 looking at let's change the law so that we can move
22 forward. So I just want to be sure that, you know,
23 as the organizer that I am, more than elected
24 official, I would looking very careful to be sure
25 that from my role at chairing this committee and

1
2 working with my colleague, those piece of agreement
3 are in place, I would like to hear from you more
4 details about how you're gonna be instituting
5 [inaudible] people but the whole coalition, you know,
6 of the private sector in the [inaudible] especially
7 and, and the Disney, who own Times Square.

8 JESSICA BAKER: I a hundred percent agree
9 with you, Chair, and I appreciate your leadership on
10 this issue. Ah, the New 42nd Street has a number of,
11 ah, job development programs and artist development
12 programs that we are working on very much in, in this
13 same initiative. So, ah, I look forward to working
14 with you on these efforts, and thank you so much for
15 your advocacy on that issue, hundred percent
16 supportive.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Ah, OK,
19 our next panelist will be Laura Rothrock. Laura?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 LAURA ROTHROCK: Thank you, Chair
22 Rodriguez, and members of the City Council. My name
23 is Laura Rothrock and I'm testifying today on behalf
24 of Twin American. Twin America provides hop on, hop
25 off, double decker sightseeing bus tours. Before the

1 pandemic our company served over one million
2 customers annually and employed approximately 1000
3 union employees, representing six different unions in
4 New York City. Regarding City Council Intro 1811, we
5 understand that Times Square stakeholders want better
6 pedestrian flow in public plazas. However, the
7 language about the sightseeing buses is duplicative
8 of current city policy and doesn't offer flexibility
9 as our city begins to welcome back tourists. We ask
10 that the bill be amended to delete the following
11 provision. No on site, on street sightseeing bus
12 stops shall be located adjacent to a pedestrian flow
13 zone. The city DOT provides sightseeing bus stop
14 permits that are also reviewed by the local community
15 board. If there's a problem with a sightseeing bus
16 stop we work with DOT, the Times Square Alliance, and
17 the community board to relocate the stop. So to
18 legislate where city sightseeing bus stops can be
19 within Times Square seems like an overreach and
20 unnecessary since there is already a public process
21 in place. Twin America has been working with the
22 City Council, the Time Square Alliance, and other
23 local stakeholders since the plaza program began.
24 We're deeply involved in the discussions around the
25

1 activity zones when they were first implemented in
2 2016 and we want to continue to work with the council
3 and all stakeholders to find, to help find the
4 solutions that make the city safe and welcoming. We
5 also have offered up suggestions dating back to 2016
6 to the administration and City Council about how to
7 better regulate ticket sellers, which we have ticket
8 sellers, um, and we would be happy to revisit those
9 discussions. As you can imagine, the pandemic has
10 devastated our industry and the city's tourism
11 economy. Now that we are over the worst of the
12 pandemic we hope to work with the City Council on
13 ways to invigorate tourism during the long road ahead
14 of us. We ask that you remove the bus stop provision
15 from this bill language, and we would be happy to
16 discuss with you further. Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
19 testimony. Ah, are there any questions for this
20 panelist? OK, our next panelist will be Luis Lopez.
21 Luis?

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 LUIS LOPEZ: Hello, my name is Luis Lopez
24 [inaudible]. I'm sorry. You can hear me?

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

1
2 LUIS LOPEZ: OK. Hello, my name is Luis
3 Lopez. I'm an author and motivational speaker. I am
4 disabled. I am a quadriplegic. I'm paralyzed from
5 my neck down. I have a NYC DOT disability permit. I
6 want to start out by saying I appreciate everything
7 Chairman Rodriguez does to help protect me and the
8 disability community. I simply hope that Intro 2277
9 2021 will not remove my rights to use my NYC DOT
10 permit at parking meters. Can the council please
11 reassure me that my disability permit rights will not
12 be taken away? Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Luis, we take it
14 very, you know, our commitment to working with one
15 million New Yorkers that rely, you know, who have
16 physical challenges is a commitment that we have and
17 so definitely we will be working with, you know, with
18 you and many others, voices of the community that,
19 you know, really can [inaudible] with physical
20 challenges. Sometimes, you know, born with those
21 condition, other time it's about, you know, something
22 happened with us, you know, a crash or things like
23 that happened and at end, and at the end is about if
24 you are so lucky and we live, you know, alone, all of
25 us would be ending, you know, in with condition of

1
2 physical challenges. So when we work and legislate
3 for the community of New York, while one millions,
4 you know, who, who are productive individuals like
5 all the, any, any other one that doesn't have
6 physical challenge, is our responsibility. So there
7 are ways, yes, we will be working with you when it
8 come to the need with you and many other, we, that
9 community that has physical challenges, which is
10 close to one million, and but also we are working to
11 be sure that not only if, if we address things
12 related to, to some, the permit that you have the
13 right to, that's what it's, it's something that New
14 York City has established, but also to make public
15 transportation accessible. Eh, we know that many
16 time if anyone had to take elevator [inaudible] in
17 the old town area and they go to, and they want a
18 train they're gonna to need to go to 231st Street.
19 They had to go to 96th Street in order to take the
20 next, eh, eh, train station with an elevator in order
21 to go back to 231st. So I think that, you know, it's
22 not only things related to the, to the permits, but
23 it's also about a new approach and now we need to
24 invest billions and billions of dollars in
25 infrastructure to make New York City street and

1 transportation accessible to everyone. So, Luis,
2 thank you for everyone that you do. And we are here
3 to stay we stand for you today as somebody that would
4 be standing for us tomorrow. Thank you.

5
6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
7 testimony. Um, our next panelist will be Edward
8 Funches. Edward?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 EDWARD FUNCHES: Hello. My name is
11 Edward Funches. I am also a paraplegic. I want to
12 thank the DOT. I want to thank, ah, Chairman, ah,
13 Rodriguez for always supporting the disability
14 community. I want to thank the, ah, the house
15 speaker. Um, I am also, um, concerned about, um,
16 bill 2277. Um, you know, I drive and I drive
17 downtown and that bill states that it's, it's taking
18 away our, our plaque, that we would be unable to park
19 [inaudible]. So I'm asking, you know, that y'all
20 will assure us that it will not affect us and our
21 driving our, our plaque. Thank you very much
22 Rodriguez, thank you very much for DOT. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and we
24 will be, you know, again, I know that [inaudible] and
25 the rest of Transportation they taking notes of

1
2 everything and, and we will have conversation with
3 again our colleagues and Speaker Johnson to hear for
4 a new concern and identify where how we can work with
5 you.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
7 testimony. Ah, next we will hear from Jeffrey
8 Williams. Jeffrey?

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 JEFFREY WILLIAMS: Good afternoon,
11 everyone. My name is Jeff Williams. I'm also a
12 motivational speaker and an author as well of *My Feet*
13 *are Off the Ground*. I want to thank, um, Mr.
14 Rodriguez and the council here today for giving us
15 the opportunity just to share some of these issues
16 with us and having an understanding of, you know, not
17 only with diversity in inclusion being on the
18 forefront, but I'm also, um, disabled individual who
19 uses a wheelchair and I drive into work every day,
20 and having that plaque has gave me the leverage I
21 need to get to work on time and be productive at my
22 job, and I wouldn't want to lose my job because I'm
23 having trouble trying to, um, get to work on public
24 transportation, which, as you said, is not accessible
25 and I just want to thank you all for considering, you

1
2 know, that this is a need that goes far and beyond
3 just parking. You know, it gives us access to being
4 independent. It gives us access to being productive
5 in society and giving back in society. So I want to
6 thank you all for that reason.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yep, and, and I
8 assure you that the bill does not have any negative
9 impact with the placard, eh, provided that to the New
10 Yorkers with physical challenges, New Yorkers with
11 disability. So this is something, again, this is not
12 included in the bill. Not only will we be sure that
13 we will protect you in this bill, but in any other
14 thing related to make the streets, make
15 transportation accessible again to one millions New
16 Yorkers who every day contributes to the city in
17 different way, who pay the taxes, who work hard, who
18 are productive individual. So we need to be sure
19 that we don't legislate on anything that will have a
20 negative impact in your life. So that, this bill
21 does not include, eh, any removal, any loss of permit
22 for New Yorker with physical challenges.

23 JEFFREY WILLIAMS: Um, I have one other
24 questions, Mr. Rodriguez. What have you, um, would
25 they have something like for their write-in, just to

1
2 lock us in not only for now but in the future as
3 well?

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I don't think,
5 first of all, like when the process work is that,
6 again, the bill does, it's not included. This bill
7 doesn't talk, doesn't have any language with that,
8 and I think that no one in the City of New York, you
9 are a powerful group not only with a million of you,
10 but the voices that you have, the leaders that you
11 have, the [inaudible] rehab every day, and I don't
12 think that any, no leader in New York City will think
13 about bringing anything that has negative impact with
14 a population in New York that contributes so much,
15 eh, as you do. So this is what I can say.

16 JEFFREY WILLIAMS: Thank you so much. I
17 appreciate it.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your
20 testimony. At this time are there any other members
21 of the public, ah, that would like to testify? If
22 you could use the Zoom raise hand function. OK,
23 Chair, seeing none, I'll turn it back over to you.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
25 everyone. Again, this has been a great hearing.

1
2 Hopefully we will work around those bill. Again, the
3 bill that you heard today, those bill that now
4 they're subject to [inaudible]. Ah, we also continue
5 conversation among colleagues, eh, and stakeholders,
6 administration, eh, eh, and again, eh, this is
7 something that we hope that we can work with all
8 sectors here. I want also to take the opportunity,
9 as I said before, to invite any one of you who'd like
10 to join us this coming Friday at noon at 166 and
11 Broadway as we gonna be co-naming a street on the
12 name of a gentleman from the Caribbean, eh, very
13 proud that he was born and raised in DR by a person
14 that dedicate his life promoting the value, our
15 sister from Africa, one of the right hand of Malcolm
16 X, so we're gonna be co-naming that corner of 166 and
17 Broadway after Carlos Cook, but also we're gonna be
18 calling for the reopening of the investigation on the
19 assassination of Malcolm X that also happened there
20 at the, at the Boardroom at 165 and Broadway. With
21 that, everyone is invited. I cannot promise that I
22 can pay you for the mangoo, but there's a good
23 mangoo, rice, beans, and chicken uptown and more than
24 happy that you can come enjoy. With that [gavel],
25 ah, thank you, everyone, thank you to the staff, eh,

1
2 the speaker, the sergeant, everyone who work in the
3 tech, to be sure that all New Yorkers have access to
4 this, today's hearing. And with that this hearing is
5 adjourned.

6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 29, 2021