

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND  
WATERFRONTS, JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC  
DEVELOPMENT

----- X

April 23, 2021  
Start: 11:07 a.m.  
Recess: 12:50 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 2

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan  
Chairperson, Committee on  
Resiliency and Waterfronts

Paul Vallone  
Chairperson, Committee on Economic  
Development

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Justin L. Brannan  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
James F. Gennaro  
Deborah L. Rose  
Eric A. Ulrich

Paul Vallone  
Inez D. Barron  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Mark Gjonaj

Peter A. Koo  
Brad S. Lander  
Farah N. Louis  
Keith Powers

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jainey Bavishi  
Director  
Mayor's Office of Climate Resiliency

Julie Stein  
Senior Vice President for Asset  
Management  
Economic Development Corporation

Andrew Gan  
Senior Vice President for Transportation  
Economic Development Corporation

Elijah Hutchinson  
Vice President for Neighborhood  
Strategies  
Economic Development Corporation

Prince Flanigan  
Assistant Vice President for Design and  
Construction  
Economic Development Corporation

Jennifer Montalvo  
Vice President, Government and Community  
Relations  
Economic Development Corporation

Noam Baharav

Andrew Rella

Sarah Dougherty

Michael Dulong

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 4  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to PC has  
4 started.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to the cloud  
6 all set.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Backup is rolling.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Sergeant Sadowsky, you  
9 may begin with your opening statement.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS SADOWSKY: Thank you,  
11 and good morning, and welcome to today's remote New  
12 York City Council hearing of the Committee on  
13 Resiliency and Waterfronts jointly with Economic  
14 Development. At this time would all council members  
15 and council staff please turn on their video. To  
16 minimize disruption please place electronic devices  
17 on vibrate or silent moderate. If you wish to submit  
18 testimony you may do so at [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).  
19 Once again, that is [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Thank  
20 you. We are ready to begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Ah, good morning,  
22 everyone. I am Chair Justin Brannan, ah, chair of  
23 the community organizer, and I'd like to thank you  
24 for joining us today for our virtual hearing, ah, a  
25 joint hearing with Council Member Vallone and the  
Committee on Economic Development. Ah, before I read

3 my opening statement I want to acknowledge, ah, some  
4 of my colleagues who have joined us so far. Ah,  
5 Council Members Koo, Powers, Louis, rose, and Gjonaj.  
6 Ah, and I will acknowledge others as they join in  
7 this morning. Um, thank you all for being here this  
8 morning. Um, today's hearing is on port safety and  
9 resiliency in the five boroughs, which is something  
10 that is very, very important to all of us out here,  
11 especially outside Manhattan in the so-called outer  
12 boroughs. Ah, as you all know, yesterday we  
13 celebrated Earth Day, um, and today we continue to  
14 demonstrate our commit to protecting our environment  
15 by discussing resiliency measures planned and ones  
16 that must be implemented to address climate change.  
17 As a city surrounded by water and with 520 miles of  
18 coastline our ports and low-lying neighborhoods are  
19 particularly vulnerable to the impacts of sea level  
20 rise, storm surge, and high tide, and sunny day  
21 flooding. Superstorm Sandy cost this city nearly 20  
22 billion dollars, and if we do nothing future extreme  
23 weather events could cost the city 90 billion dollars  
24 in damages by 2050. That's less than 30 years from  
25 now. Building resilience is an ongoing process. It  
is therefore imperative that we continue to protect

3 our ports, our marine terminals, and our food  
4 distribution centers, as well as our residents and  
5 our property. In January Governor Cuomo announced  
6 plans to develop two new offshore wind farms off the  
7 coast of Long Island to transform the South Brooklyn  
8 Marine Terminal in Sunset Park into a large-scale  
9 offshore wind, staging, and assembling facility. The  
10 terminal will become one of the largest dedicated  
11 offshore wind farm facilities in the country,  
12 bringing much-needed green infrastructure jobs right  
13 here to Brooklyn, investing in the Sunset Park  
14 community, and helping us move one step closer to our  
15 renewable energy goals. I look forward to hearing  
16 from the Economic Development Corporation this  
17 morning about this important project and working with  
18 the administration to help ensure its succeed. The  
19 Hunt's Point Food Distribution Center in the South  
20 Bronx is a vital food hub, distributing over two  
21 billion pounds of food throughout the city annually.  
22 It's also located on a low-lying peninsula that is  
23 vulnerable to storm surge and power outages. Because  
24 Superstorm Sandy hit the city at low tide the food  
25 distribution center at Hunt's Point was spared. But  
because of Hunt's Point's vulnerabilities the city

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 7  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 convened a working group in 2015 to come up with ways  
4 to ensure that this critical food distribution hub  
5 would be protected against future coastal threats.

6 The working group recommended that the city should  
7 focus on both coastal protection measures and

8 elevating and protecting the mechanical systems and  
9 installing backup power, ah, generation. Building

10 equipment has been hardened, but no coastal

11 protection measures have been put in place on Hunt's

12 Point. So I look forward to hearing from EDC and the

13 Mayor's Office of Climate Resiliency today on what

14 coastal protection measures are planned and what else

15 is necessary to ensure that such a vital part of our

16 city's food supply and the Hunt's Point neighborhood

17 itself is both protected and resilient. East Harlem

18 is also a low-lying neighborhood, highly suspicious

19 to flooding from storm surge and sea level rise, as

20 well as extreme heat. In 2017 the city hired

21 consultants to study how best to protect East Harlem

22 from the future effects of climate change. The study

23 found the cost of inaction in the face of climate

24 change over the next 50 years would be approximately

25 3.2 billion dollars. As a result, in December 2019

the Mayor's Office of Climate Resiliency and the

3 Parks Department released a vision plan that  
4 highlighted the need to better manage storm water,  
5 develop and renovate open spaces to be more  
6 resilient, create cool streets, and public spaces to  
7 reduce the urban heat island effect, as well as  
8 elevating waterfront edges to reduce neighborhood  
9 flood risk. The study and vision plan serve as a  
10 framework for developing a stronger, safer, and more  
11 resilient East Harlem. Since the vision plan was  
12 released more than a year ago, we want to hear what  
13 steps the city has taken to make East Harlem more  
14 resilient. As part of the East Side Coastal  
15 Resiliency Plan an integrated flood protection system  
16 will be constructed from Montgomery Street to East  
17 25th Street in Manhattan. Coastal protection and  
18 resiliency measures are critical to protect the  
19 surrounding neighborhoods from coastal storm surge  
20 events and the resultant devastation by what was  
21 caused by Superstorm Sandy. This project must be  
22 done with transparency and we must ensure that  
23 residents continue to have access to green space,  
24 parks, and playgrounds throughout the construction  
25 process. The city must also ensure that it openly  
communicates with residents about the status of the

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 9  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 Staten Island Sea Wall, a 5.3 mile long sea wall  
4 between Fort Wadsworth and Oakwood Beach on the east  
5 shore of Staten Island. This sea wall, originally  
6 expected to be completed in 2021, now likely will not  
7 be completed until 2026 because of continuous  
8 construction delays. Staten Island cannot afford to  
9 be without coastal storm protection when the next  
10 storm hits. The committees today will hear proposed  
11 Intro 1679-A, sponsored by my colleague, Chair  
12 Vallone, who will speak more about this bill in a  
13 moment, which would require the city to study all  
14 shoreline protection structures and incorporate the  
15 living shorelines and nature-based features where  
16 feasible. We look forward today to hearing from the  
17 Mayor's Office of Climate Resiliency and the Economic  
18 Development Corporation in today's hearing. Before  
19 we begin, I want to thank my committee staff,  
20 Committee Counsel Jessica Steinberg Alvin, senior  
21 policy analyst Patrick Mulvahill, senior finance  
22 analyst Jonathan Seltzer, my chief of staff, Chris  
23 McWright, my deputy chief, Calos Santos Suoso, as  
24 well as all the staff for the Economic Development  
25 Committee for all their hard work behind the scenes  
in putting this hearing together. Ah, I will now

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 10  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 turn it over to my colleague, ah, Chair Vallone, for  
4 his opening remarks.

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Good morning,  
6 everyone, and thank you, Chair Brannan. Today is a  
7 good day. We have a lot of happy people today. Ah,  
8 when we're talking about reviewing the entire city  
9 shorelines and how we can protect and preserve them  
10 the day after Earth Day, that's a good day. So, good  
11 morning everyone. Ah, I am Paul Vallone, chair to  
12 the Committee on Economic Development, and we just  
13 heard from my good friend and [inaudible] chair,  
14 Chair Justin Brannan, for the Resiliency and  
15 Waterfronts Committee for our joint hearing today. I  
16 believe it's our first one, so it's another part of a  
17 good day. Today's hearing will take a broad look at  
18 our city's ports and shoreline and how we are  
19 prepared for the impact of climate change. As Chair  
20 Brannan just mentioned, the city's 520 miles of  
21 waterfront are particularly vulnerable to sea level  
22 rise and storm surge. At the same time we are  
23 utilizing our waterfront areas for important needs,  
24 like maritime freight distribution, transportation,  
25 housing, public parks, and more. We must balance  
this need to make use of our shoreline for vital

3 activities, with the need to ensure our shoreline and  
4 the structures on it are resilient enough to  
5 withstand the effects of climate change. During this  
6 hearing we'll be looking how the administration,  
7 particularly EDC and the Mayor's Office of Climate  
8 Resiliency, are working on that balance. We'll take  
9 a look at ongoing resiliency projects, such as the  
10 East Side Coastal Resiliency Project, the Staten  
11 Island Sea Wall, the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal,  
12 offshore wind projects, and others. This hearing  
13 will also provide an opportunity to revisit oversight  
14 topics we have covered in the past and look how the  
15 admin is addressing resiliency in those areas. For  
16 example, in 2018 the EDC held a hearing on Freight  
17 NYC, EDC's 100 million dollar initiative to modernize  
18 the city's freight network and shift a significant  
19 portion of freight movement from trucking to maritime  
20 and light rail distribution. We want to take a look  
21 at how Freight NYC and long-term resiliency issues  
22 are progressing. The committee has also held an  
23 oversight hearing on the Hunt's Point Food  
24 Distribution Center in the Bronx, a key vital hub in  
25 the city's food distribution network. Due to its  
location, Hunt's Point also faces the risk of

3 flooding and power outages from storms and future  
4 planning must take these risks into account. And  
5 last, but certainly not least, we will hear a piece  
6 of legislation sponsored by myself that will help the  
7 city take a comprehensive look at the protective  
8 structures of its shoreline and evaluate what needs  
9 to be maintained or improved. This bill, proposed  
10 Introduction 1679-A, will require the mayor to  
11 designate an agency to conduct this study of the  
12 shoreline and all shoreline protective structures in  
13 New York City. The agency would then prepare  
14 recommendations for maintaining shoreline protection  
15 structures that are function, for replacing those  
16 structures that are deteriorating, and for adding  
17 shoreline protection structures where they do not  
18 exist. The recommendations will include using living  
19 shoreline techniques or environmentally responsible  
20 alternatives to traditional concrete material where  
21 feasible, and the report will be submitted to the  
22 mayor and the council and be publicly available  
23 online. For example, in my district we are  
24 surrounded by water on three sides out here in  
25 northeast Queens, all the way from City Field out to  
Long Island. It is a very large, ah, district that

3 has shoreline all the way from College Point,  
4 Whitestone, Little Neck, and others. But we don't  
5 have a clear picture of what shoreline structures are  
6 there and the state they are in, and in no way to  
7 access the waterfront in my areas. And there are  
8 many groups in College Point, like the Coastal  
9 Preservation Network, that have been, that were, came  
10 into existence just for that purpose. So my time as  
11 council member and chair of EDC is almost up,  
12 unfortunately. But I want to make sure that the next  
13 committee chair and the next admin have a  
14 comprehensive understanding of the state of shoreline  
15 protection structures across this city. I hope this  
16 study can provide this basic knowledge that can help  
17 the next committee and admin manage the shoreline in  
18 many years to come. A lot of work has gone into  
19 legislation this size and I'm look forward to  
20 discussing this bill with representatives from EDC  
21 and MLCR as well as the wide range of advocates who  
22 are, ah, been cheering and here today. Before I turn  
23 it over, I just want to take a moment to thank the  
24 committee staff, legislative counsel Chris Tory,  
25 Jessica Steinberg Alvin, policy analyst Emily  
Forgione, and Patrick Mulhill, and finance analyst

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 14  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 Alia Ali, who has been by our side from day one, for  
4 all their hard work in putting its together. With  
5 that I'll turn it back over to [inaudible].

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Chair  
7 Vallone. Um, it's great to be chairing this  
8 important hearing with you today and hearing these  
9 important bills. Thank you for all your work, ah, on  
10 this committee. I also want to acknowledge, ah,  
11 Councilman Cornegy, who has joined us. And with that  
12 I want to turn it over to our moderator at the, ah,  
13 Executive Deputy Commissioner counsel, Kris Sartori,  
14 to go over some, ah, procedural items.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair  
16 Brannan. I'm Kris Sartori, counsel to the Committee  
17 on Economic Development, and I will be moderating  
18 this hearing. Before we begin, I'd like to remind  
19 every that you will be on mute until you are called  
20 on to testify, at which point you'll be unmuted by  
21 the host. During the hearing I'll be calling on  
22 panelists to testify, so please listen for your name  
23 to be called as I will periodically be announcing who  
24 the next panelists will be. We will first be hearing  
25 testimony from the administration, followed by  
testimony from members of the public. During the

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 15  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 hearing if council members would like to ask a  
4 question of the administration or of a specific  
5 panelist, please use the Zoom hand raise function and  
6 I will call on you in order. We will be limiting  
7 council member questions to five minutes, which  
8 includes the time it takes to answer those questions.

9 For members of the public we will be limiting  
10 speaking time to three minutes in order to  
11 accommodate those who wish to speak today. Once you  
12 are called on to testify, please begin by stating  
13 your name and the organization you represent, if any.

14 I will now call on representatives of the  
15 administration to testify. Appearing today for the  
16 Mayor's Office of Climate Resiliency will be Director  
17 Jainey Bavishi. Appearing for the New York City  
18 Economic Development Corporation will be Julie Stein,  
19 senior vice president for asset management, Andrew  
20 Gan, senior vice president for transportation, Elijah  
21 Hutchinson, vice president for neighborhood  
22 strategies, Prince Flanigan, assistant vice president  
23 for design and construction, and Jennifer Montalvo,  
24 vice president, government and community relations.

25 At this time I'll administration the affirmation to  
each representative of the administration. I will

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 16  
WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

2 call on each of you individually for a response. So  
3 at this time please raise your right hands. Do you  
4 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and  
5 nothing but the truth before this committee and to  
6 respond honestly to council member questions?

7 Director Bavishi?

8 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Yes, I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Senior  
10 Vice President Stein?

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yes, I do.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Street  
13 Vendor Project Gan?

14 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT GAN: I do.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Vice  
16 President Hutchinson?

17 VICE PRESIDENT HUTCHINSON: Yes, I do.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Assistant  
19 Vice President Flanigan?

20 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Yes,  
21 I do.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Vice  
23 President Montalvo?

24 VICE PRESIDENT MONTALVO: I do.  
25

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. At this  
4 time I'd like to invite Senior Vice President Julie  
5 Stein to present her testimony.

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Hi, good  
7 morning, everyone. Good morning, members of the  
8 council. Thank you for the opportunity to discuss  
9 port safety and resiliency in all five boroughs. My  
10 name is Julie Stein, senior vice president for asset  
11 management, and I'm joined by my colleagues from EDC  
12 as well as from, as well as Jaaney Bavishi, director  
13 of the Mayor's Office on Recovery and Climate  
14 Resiliency. Today I will be provide an overview of  
15 the importance of our ports and waterfronts in New  
16 York City and the regional economy, and the essential  
17 functions that radiate from them. In this testimony  
18 we will highlight some of EDC's projects, as  
19 identified by the council. I will also put this in  
20 the context of creating a sustainable and resilient  
21 future in the face of climate change, more frequent  
22 powerful storms, and sea level rise. Let's look at  
23 why this topic is so important to New York City and  
24 why we are so focused on it. As we sit here we are  
25 in a city made up primarily of islands and  
peninsulas. In fact, all told, New York City has 520

3 miles of waterfront, a mix of public and private  
4 land, developed and undeveloped, industrial uses and  
5 open space, as well as other uses. Approximately  
6 one-third of the waterfront is privately owned.  
7 Water is what's made this city great. It's water  
8 that brought the first trading ships, which seeded  
9 the growth of the maritime industry and opened New  
10 York to become a global center of commerce. It's  
11 water that allowed to distribute food from farms  
12 upstate and across the country. And it's water that  
13 beckons us to take advantage of opportunities and  
14 green energy. In short, water is both our past and  
15 our future. The flip side of all of this - our  
16 waterfronts are vulnerable. They are subject to  
17 increased storm activity and the damage and loss of  
18 life it can bring. During Sandy in 2012 people died,  
19 homes were destroyed, subways shut down, and power  
20 outages darkened the city. We now know that by 2050  
21 the city could experience 30% more extreme  
22 precipitation [inaudible] on top of that there looms  
23 the spectre of sea level rise. Because of this, it  
24 is impossible to separate economic development from  
25 our focus on coastal resiliency, sustainable energy,  
and alternatives in transportation. The city

2 established the New York City Panel on Climate  
3 Change, which takes the International Panel of  
4 Climate Changes Projections and localizes them to New  
5 York City, providing the latest and peer-reviewed  
6 climate data at the local level. With that research  
7 in hand, we at EDC are mapping our greatest  
8 vulnerabilities and taking bold and significant  
9 action to address them. The city's investing 20  
10 billion dollars in recovery and resiliency projects  
11 across the five boroughs, making it one of the most  
12 ambitious urban infrastructure programs in the United  
13 States. Strong ports also key to our planning. They  
14 strengthen the city's resiliency in the face of  
15 emergencies and transportation disruptions. In order  
16 to lower carbon emissions we are turning to  
17 multimodal freight transport by maritime and route.  
18 With that, let's look at some of these major  
19 initiatives and how we support them. Through Freight  
20 MIC EDC is helping New York City overhaul our aging  
21 freight distribution systems through strategic  
22 investments to modernize our maritime in real assets,  
23 build new distribution facilities, and create  
24 thousands of well-paying jobs. As the city  
25 population grows and consumers demand near-instant

3 deliveries, local freight volume will increase an  
4 estimated 68% by 2045 and with trucks currently  
5 moving nearly 90% of freight trackable [inaudible].  
6 The Freight NYC plan leverages these key strategic,  
7 sorry, these key strategies to support modal shift  
8 and reduce the share of freight moving by truck. We  
9 are updating port infrastructure at the South  
10 Brooklyn Marine Terminal to support offshore wind  
11 facilities and other project cargo. We are making  
12 access improvements to the city's largest container  
13 port at Staten Island's Howland Hook. In addition,  
14 we are forming partnerships with maritime firms and  
15 shipping companies to have more, to move more freight  
16 by water and increasing rail freight to take pressure  
17 off our roadways. Crucially, we are doing this with  
18 a view to decarbonize the supply chain by using zero  
19 emissions vehicles and reducing truck miles traveled  
20 wherever possible. To give you examples, I would  
21 like to tell you how Freight NYC is investing in two  
22 freight hubs. The South Brooklyn Marine Terminal, or  
23 SBMT, and Hunt's Point. SBMT in Sunset Park is  
24 undergoing a rebirth. The city initially invested  
25 over 115 million dollars to reactivate SBMT as a  
major shipping hub to spur further development. SBMT

3 is now our most prominent investment to support  
4 offshore wind production and we will invest another  
5 57 million dollars in offshore wind specific port  
6 improvements. Within the next few years SBMT will  
7 support the production of 3.3 gigawatts of clean  
8 energy. This is in no small part thanks to the  
9 advocacy of Council Member Menchaca, who has  
10 continually pushed for a strong maritime industrial  
11 use of the site. With our partners, Sustainable SBMT  
12 and Equinor US, coupled with the support of federal  
13 and state governments and local leaders, SBMT will  
14 establish New York City as a wind industry hub,  
15 strengthen the local green economy, and create a  
16 national model to support offshore wind activity. We  
17 project over 1200 jobs associated with the project,  
18 while ensuring the local community in South Brooklyn  
19 has a direct pipeline to these opportunities through  
20 the creation of a 5 million dollar fund to train  
21 workers in the skills they need to succeed in these  
22 jobs. Another major hub of freight activity is the  
23 Hunt's Point peninsula in the Bronx. Because Hunt's  
24 Point is key to the local and regional food supply  
25 chain, EDC and the city are working with the local  
community to address vulnerabilities to disruption

3 from future storms and other environmental threats.

4 Hunt's Point is home to 12,000 residents, 18,000

5 workers, and the food distribution center, which is

6 the largest such center in the nation. The food

7 distribution, or FDC, feeds the tristate area with an

8 estimated 4.5 billion pounds of food distributed

9 every year, about half of which feeds consumers in

10 New York City. 12% of all food distributed to New

11 York City comes from the FDC. Using funding from

12 HUD, we partnered with the community to launch the

13 Hunt's Point's resiliency process. Through it, we

14 found that different parts of Hunt's Point faced

15 varying risks. The industrial area, sited in a low-

16 lying flood plain, is vulnerable to storm surge,

17 flooding, power outage, and extreme heat. However,

18 residential area, the residential neighborhood is at

19 a higher elevation, subject to blackouts and heat

20 issues, but not flooding. The study prioritized an

21 energy resiliency project, including a micro grid,

22 solar power energy storage, and backup systems for

23 residents, schools, and the food distribution center

24 businesses. In addition, we are working with the FDC

25 tenants to develop specialized emergency operational

response plans, and in the long term we are

3 committing, committed to working our FDC tenants on  
4 modernization plans to address coastal flooding risk.

5 Each waterfront has its unique challenges. The

6 historic heart of New York's waterfront is lower

7 Manhattan, another area that faces significant risk

8 simply by its location. One of the largest central

9 business districts in the country and one of the

10 world's densest concentration of jobs, it's

11 surrounded by water on three sides. This means if

12 sea level rises to as much as six feet, which is what

13 conservative models project, the neighborhood could

14 be uninhabitable by 2100. As I mentioned, Hurricane

15 Sandy forced the city to recognize its vulnerability.

16 That is why the city is investing roughly 500 million

17 dollars in permanent infrastructure plans to

18 safeguard lower Manhattan's coastal areas and provide

19 interim flood protection. The Lower Manhattan

20 Coastal Resiliency Project involves four tailored

21 initiatives to protect close to 70% of the coastline.

22 We are examining how to extend the sea port and

23 financial district shoreline into the East River to

24 act as flood barrier. In the neighborhoods between

25 the Manhattan and Brooklyn Bridges we are designing a

system of flood barriers. We also have plans to

3 elevate the wharf and esplanade along the Battery to  
4 strengthen the shoreline there, and we are  
5 coordinating with the Battery Park City Authority on  
6 the reconstruction of its waterfront esplanade. To  
7 support many of these freight and resiliency  
8 initiatives the city, EDC relies on our waterfront  
9 rehabilitation program. We want to thank Council  
10 Member Vallone for introducing Intro 1679, a local  
11 law related to evaluating shoreline structures around  
12 New York City. We believe this process is vital and  
13 that is why EDC has led a waterfront rehabilitation  
14 program for more than two decades. This program is  
15 supported by two key components - waterfront  
16 inspections and waterfront capital construction. EDC  
17 inspects city-owned waterfront infrastructure and  
18 provides repair recommendations annually. In  
19 addition, EDC works with a wide range of city  
20 agencies to identify the critical infrastructure that  
21 needs to be addressed. That means 40 to 50 sites per  
22 year and a 3 million dollar annual inspection budget.  
23 The key deliverables from a typical inspection are a  
24 report that details recommended repairs and cost  
25 estimates for implementing renovations. These  
deliverables are used to support capital construction

3 planning by the city. Over the course of fiscal  
4 years 2018 and 2019 EDC performed 80 inspections that  
5 identified approximately 900 million dollars in  
6 recommended repairs across 150 different waterfront  
7 infrastructure systems under the jurisdiction of  
8 agencies. Of that 150 systems, approximately 45%  
9 needed repairs within one to five years. The capital  
10 construction component of the program is responsible  
11 for developing the five- to 10-year capital plans for  
12 waterfront infrastructure under EDC's jurisdiction.  
13 The most recent capital plan identified 250 million  
14 dollars in rehabilitation needs for EDC assets. The  
15 waterfront facilities management, sorry, the  
16 Waterfront Facilities Maintenance Management System  
17 is available to help in decision-making. This tool  
18 can be found on EDC's website. It has mapped the  
19 entire 520 miles of New York City waterfront and  
20 incorporates geospatial data and computer modeling to  
21 create detailed maps and other important waterfront  
22 data compiled from EDC inspection updates. This  
23 allows EDC, city agencies, engineers, maritime  
24 contractors, construction professionals, community  
25 stakeholders, and others to make efficient, better-  
informed decisions when prioritizing waterfront

3 assets or acting in emergencies. It also encourages  
4 greater, it also encourages greater interagency  
5 alignment. Thank you so much for the opportunity to  
6 be here today. We're happy to take your questions.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, and I'll  
8 now turn it over to Chair Brannan and Chair Vallone  
9 for questions.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Kris.  
11 Ah, I wanted to acknowledge as well my colleague,  
12 Council Member Lander, who has joined us.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Just in case, ah,  
14 Justin, if you didn't mention it, we also have from  
15 the EDC Committee, ah, Council Members Louis, Gjonaj,  
16 and Powers who joined, ah, from what I can see.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Um, I want to just  
18 jump in, jump into something I heard, um, right off  
19 the bat. Your testimony stated the city is investing  
20 20 billion dollars in, ah, recovery and resiliency  
21 projects. Um, could you tell us what these projects  
22 will be and, and really, almost equally as important,  
23 how dependent they'll be on state and federal  
24 funding?  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 27  
WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Sure. Um,  
3 I'd like to invite, ah, Jainey Bavishi, ah, speak to  
4 that question about the citywide approach.

5 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Ah, thank you, Chair  
6 Brannan, for that question. Um, happy Earth Week.  
7 Um, ah, so, yeah, the 20 billion dollars that Julie  
8 mentioned, um, are, are the, um, 20 billion dollars  
9 we have, um, been working to invest in resiliency and  
10 recovery projects across the city, um, since  
11 Hurricane Sandy. Um, about 50 million of that is  
12 federal funding. It's all allocated. So, um, we are  
13 not, ah, counting on new federal funding, um, when  
14 we, when we cite that number, um, and most of the  
15 remaining 5 billion is city investment. There's a  
16 little bit of state funding in the mix but, um, ah,  
17 but not much, um, in the, in the grand scheme of  
18 things. Um, ah, I want to be clear that this is, um,  
19 I, I would say this is a down payment on resiliency  
20 investments across the city. Um, we, there's much  
21 more work to do beyond the 20 billion dollar  
22 portfolio of projects we are advancing now and, um,  
23 we, ah, are going to have to continue to be creative  
24 about how we finance that. I think there is, um,  
25 there's a promising, um, ah, ah, there's promising

2 progress on the horizon. Um, you know, the state  
3 passed the, ah, New York Bond Act, or otherwise known  
4 as the Mother Nature Bond Act, um, in, in the  
5 legislative session, um, this year that will go to  
6 ballots, um, in the fall, um, and can provide some  
7 much-needed money for proactive resiliency action,  
8 and I think the, um, ah, Biden administration's  
9 American Jobs Plan is also promising. There's a 50  
10 billion dollar allocation in there, um, for resilient  
11 infrastructure, so we'll see how Congress takes that  
12 up.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. So you said  
14 it's 15 billion in federal funding, right? Is that  
15 right?

16 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, yes. Sorry, I was  
17 muted. Um, yes, approximately 50 million in, in  
18 federal recovery dollars after Sandy.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. Can you give  
20 us a breakdown of the resiliency-related projects in  
21 MOR's portfolio, um, or, or projects that MOR  
22 oversees? Could you give us a breakdown by borough?

23 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, I'm sorry, Chair  
24 Brannan, I do not have that in front of me right now.

2 I'm happy to follow up with your, with your team  
3 about that.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, we, um, we  
5 requested in the hearings in October and November,  
6 um, the breakdown of the projected cost of each  
7 resiliency-related project, the agency funding for  
8 each project, and how much has been spent on each  
9 project so far. Do you have that?

10 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, there are a lot of  
11 projects. There are literally hundreds of projects  
12 in the, in the, um, mix, in the 20 billion dollar  
13 portfolio. So, no, I do not have that, um, at my  
14 fingertips now. But, um, again, we're happy to  
15 follow up.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. Um, the, ah,  
17 the Block Grant Disaster Relief money that the city  
18 was awarded for, ah, coastal resiliency projects, I  
19 know it's got to be spent by September 2022, ah, or  
20 the city, ah, risks losing that funding. So we've  
21 got about a year and a half to that deadline. Um,  
22 which projects have been prioritized to receive that  
23 funding?

24 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, so just a, a, um,  
25 bit of a, ah, correction there. Um, so Congress

3 actual acted to extend the deadline for the city BGDR  
4 [inaudible], um, ah, to New York City to September  
5 2023. Um, so, ah, we do have a little extra time to  
6 spend that money. Um, ah, in terms of which projects  
7 are prioritized, um, all of the projects that are  
8 funded with the city BGDR, um, dollars are priorities  
9 for us because we want to make sure that we spend  
10 that money in time.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So that, I mean,  
12 they can't all be a priority. There has to be some  
13 sort of triaging happening, I assume.

14 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: No, all of projects  
15 that are funded with DR dollars are priorities. Um,  
16 we absolutely want to make sure that they move  
17 forward and they, ah, and the money is spent in time.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Um, OK. Ah, Hunt's  
19 Point, 2019, ah, EDC committed to flood proofing, ah,  
20 flood proofing or hardening the most vulnerable  
21 buildings, ah, in the food [inaudible] center there.  
22 Um, there are a lot of people that claim that  
23 building hardening is really the bare minimum that  
24 EDC could do to protect, ah, Hunt's Point against  
25 flooding and that there should be more investment in  
coastal resiliency there. Is EDC studying, ah,

3 additional coastal protection measures at Hunt's  
4 Point other than installing the backup power?

5 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yeah, thank  
6 you for the question. So as, as we know that energy  
7 continuity is the most pressing concern today for  
8 protecting our food supply center and based on, ah,  
9 current coastal risks that we think that a, a  
10 tailored approach to the at-risk buildings is the  
11 most appropriate and cost-effective response, not  
12 widespread coastal protection. Um, what we've been  
13 doing in the very short term is that, ah, the, the  
14 two, the facility that's most at risk, that is  
15 critical to our food supply, is the Hunt's Point, ah,  
16 the, the meat market up in Hunt's Point and those  
17 have HESCO bags to deal with, um, the short-term risk  
18 around flooding. The other, the other building  
19 that's in the flood plain is, is Krasdale, um, and  
20 they don't, they don't provide any perishable goods  
21 so, um, they're part of a longer-term strategy. We  
22 have applied for the FEMA Building Resilient  
23 Infrastructure and Communities Program, called BRIC,  
24 um, in order to effectuate additional building-level  
25 upgrades and we're also committed to working with our  
tenants on longer-term modernization plans that will

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 32  
WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

2 incorporate resiliency measures, ah, that address  
3 long-term, ah, coastal flooding. As you know, ah,  
4 buildings that are built to modern building code, um,  
5 are, are resilient from coastal flooding, um, and so  
6 part of our investment more generally in  
7 modernization of, of the food distribution center  
8 will address some of the coastal flooding risks.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Um, could you speak  
10 more specifically to, to other investments that are  
11 gonna be made to protect Hunt's Point?

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Certainly.  
13 So, as, as you may be aware there was announced, I  
14 believe in 2015, um, a 150 million dollar investment  
15 in, um, in Hunt's Point, ah, upgrades and those are  
16 on a property by property basis. The, they're each  
17 in, um, you know, different states, depending on, um,  
18 the property. But, um, there are ongoing projects,  
19 ah, you know, to, think about modernization of the  
20 facilities more generally. For example, we just  
21 announced the groundbreaking a few weeks ago of the  
22 Grow NYC, um, ah, facility up there, which will be  
23 built to modern building code and will be resilient  
24 to coastal flooding.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But that's new  
3 construction, right? It's not for...

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Correct,  
5 correct. But I, sorry, I think, ah, as, as we  
6 continue to modernize the food distribution center  
7 with modern facilities we will continue, we will  
8 continue to, ah, to promote, ah, coastal flood  
9 protection through, through those construction  
10 projects, in addition to the FEMA grants that we're  
11 applying for, for hardening existing facilities.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. Um, I want to,  
13 I want to move through this so I can hand it over to  
14 my cochair. Ah, Staten Island Sea Wall, originally  
15 expected to be completed this year. Because of  
16 construction delays and disagreements between the  
17 city and state about who's responsible for removing  
18 hazardous waste materials that were discovered  
19 underneath the path, ah, we're being told  
20 construction is not expected to be complete by 2026.  
21 Um, what is the city's position as we stand today on  
22 who's responsible for removing these hazardous waste  
23 material?

24

25

3 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: I'll ask  
4 the Mayor's Office of Resiliency to take this  
5 question.

6 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, thanks for the  
7 question, Chair Brannan. So, um, ah, the, the  
8 hazardous waste is, um, affecting one component of  
9 the project, um, in the northern area of the project  
10 and, um, we had always had an understanding with the  
11 Army Corps of Engineers, um, that the city would pay  
12 for the removal of the, the hazardous waste. Um,  
13 but, um, our understanding was that the Army Corps  
14 would actually perform the work because of their deep  
15 expertise, um, in, in doing this kind of, ah,  
16 remediation work. Um, just last fall, um, only  
17 months before we were supposed to go out to bid, um,  
18 the Army Corps said that they would not be able to  
19 perform that remediation work due to liability  
20 concerns. Um, the city, the state, and both, um, New  
21 York senators, Senator Schumer and Senator  
22 Gillibrand, agree that the Army Corps should do the  
23 work because, um, there are just too many efficient,  
24 inefficiencies and technical challenges of having two  
25 different entities do the remediation work and then,  
um, dig the trench for the, the [inaudible] flood

3 wall. Um, so we have, um, ah, altogether, um, the,  
4 ah, both senators, the state, and the city have  
5 appealed to the Army Corps to, ah, grant a policy  
6 waiver so that the Army Corps could go ahead and  
7 perform the work. The city is absolutely committed  
8 to paying for, um, for the remediation. I will,  
9 though, say that, um, the other parts of the project  
10 are moving forward, parts of the project that are not  
11 impacted by the, the hazardous waste remediation, um,  
12 and the Army Corps expects that they will break  
13 ground later this year.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So is construction  
15 of the sea wall happening right now as we speak?

16 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, there's not  
17 construction happening right now. Um, there is, ah,  
18 design, um, and, ah, and technical analysis  
19 happening. So the Army Corps, like I said, expects  
20 to break ground on other components of the project  
21 later this year.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Ah, then that's  
23 concerning, because we thought it was gonna be  
24 finished this year and now we're saying we haven't  
25 even put shovels in the ground?

3 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, so, you know, I, I  
4 think this, this project has a long history. Our  
5 most recent expectation was that we would break  
6 ground early in 2021. Um, that timeline has been  
7 pushed back because of this, ah, conflict around, um,  
8 ah, who will perform the hazardous waste removal.  
9 Um, again...

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So I'm, I'm sorry,  
11 is my information, I mean, I thought we were  
12 expecting for it to be completed in 2021. You're  
13 saying we expect them to put shovels in the ground in  
14 2021.

15 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Like I said, this  
16 project has a long history and the, and the most  
17 recent timeline, um, was that we would put shovels in  
18 the ground in early 2021. Um, ah, and, and we are  
19 expecting that, um, like I said, the Army Corps is  
20 expecting that we will put shovels in the ground in  
21 2021. But that, that timeline has been delayed  
22 because it will be other components of the project  
23 that will move forward first, not the areas that are  
24 affected by the hazardous waste removal.

25 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. Um, I want to  
acknowledge, ah, Council Member Barron who's joined

2 us. Um, moving to the East Harlem Resiliency  
3 Project, um, 2019 MOR and Parks Department released a  
4 vision plan, as I mentioned in my opening. Um, the  
5 city found the potential cost of not doing anything  
6 over the next 50 years would be, ah, 3.2 billion.  
7 And a recent article I saw in *The City*, ah, MOR  
8 stated that the vision plan, ah, offered valuable  
9 insight into current and future risks of, ah, East  
10 Harlem. Um, can you describe the risk that this  
11 neighborhood faces if we do nothing?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Brannan, if I  
13 could just interrupt for one quick second. If I  
14 could ask all the EDC panelists as well as Director  
15 Bavishi to please stay unmuted for the duration of  
16 the Q&A, it's just there are some technical issues  
17 that will make it easier for everyone. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thanks, Kris.

19 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Sure, um, yeah. Thank  
20 you for the question. Um, ah, so East Harlem is a  
21 community that, um, is, ah, vulnerable to, to storm  
22 surge as well as, um, ah, sea level rise and the  
23 impacts of intense precipitation. Um, the vision  
24 plan for Resilient East Harlem is publicly available  
25

3 and the Parks Department, um, released it, ah, to the  
4 public in December of 2019.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And, and has the  
6 city effectuated any of those plans' recommendations?

7 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, yeah, so there  
8 have been a couple of things that, um, have been in,  
9 in the works and have been moving forward. Um, you  
10 know, we, um, my, my office has been clear that we're  
11 committed to continuing our engagement with East  
12 Harlem, um, because we know that, um, the risk of  
13 surge, extreme precipitation, and heat will only grow  
14 worse. Um, in particular, um, ah, the Mayor's Office  
15 of Climate Resiliency successfully applied for a FEMA  
16 grant to study a water square concept project that  
17 would be designed to address the risks of extreme  
18 precipitation. Um, NYCHA and [inaudible] started  
19 work on the study. Um, they started work on the  
20 study last fall and it will be completed by the end  
21 of the year. Ah, we're also working closely with  
22 Parks as they implement the Harlem River Esplanade  
23 Project and, and future esplanade projects, as well  
24 as, ah, Pier 107 to [inaudible] incorporated and  
25 community engagement [inaudible] in, ah, all of these  
projects. Um, and we're continuing to explore grant

3 opportunities at both the federal and state level to  
4 look for new opportunities to further reduce risk in  
5 the neighborhood.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK, that all sounds  
7 great. But is anything actual being done yet in East  
8 Harlem?

9 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, the, the projects  
10 that I had mentioned are moving forward, um, and, ah,  
11 you know, it's important to get design of these  
12 projects right to ensure resiliency is incorporated,  
13 um, and that's what we're working on, engaging, um,  
14 the community in that process.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But nothing's  
16 actually physically tangibly been done yet?

17 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, I think of design  
18 moving forward as something that is being done. But  
19 no, there's no construction underway, if that's what  
20 you mean.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So what's the  
22 timeline for when the people of East Harlem will  
23 actual see something get done?

24 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, you know, the  
25 Parks Department is leading on, um, the esplanade  
projects and, um, I am happy to have them follow up

3 with your office to, um, ah, to provide those  
4 details.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah. Um, yeah,  
6 I'm just hearing a lot of planning and designing, and  
7 I understand, I'm not naïve, I understand that all  
8 has to happen. But I haven't heard of any, any doing  
9 yet, anything that the average person walking down  
10 the street can actually see things changing. I  
11 haven't heard in any of these projects this yet,  
12 which is very concerning. And I haven't heard anyone  
13 blaming COVID for it, either. So I don't know, ah,  
14 what we're doing here. Um, the last thing, and then  
15 I want, I want to hand it over to, ah, my, my  
16 colleague, Council Member Vallone. The East Side  
17 Coastal Resiliency Project, construction for this  
18 project is expected to continue through 2025. Ah,  
19 what flood protections are currently in place while  
20 the construction is, is ongoing?

21 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, you know, we  
22 evaluated, um, the, ah, East Side Coastal Resiliency,  
23 the, the neighborhood that's protected by the East  
24 Side Coastal Resiliency Project, um, as a candidate  
25 for interim flood protection measures. But for many  
reasons that are very particular to that site, um,

3 it, it didn't make sense to install interim flood  
4 protection measures in, in that particular  
5 neighborhood. Um, essentially the interim flood  
6 protection measures would have only, um, protected  
7 the park and would not have, um, ah, effectively  
8 protected the community behind the park, which is  
9 really what we're concerned about. Um, so we are  
10 working to, ah, move the East Side Coastal Resiliency  
11 Project as quickly as possible and, um, we expect  
12 that flood protection will be in place by the 2023  
13 hurricane season.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So the, the flood  
15 protection, you mean the permanent flood protection  
16 or the flood protection to protect the area as the  
17 project is, is ongoing?

18 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: The permanent flood  
19 protection will be in place by, by 2023 hurricane  
20 season.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And what green  
22 space will be provided for the community while the  
23 resiliency measures are constructed and, and the park  
24 is rebuilt?

25 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, you know, we heard  
the community's concerns about access to the park and

2 so that, therefore we've implemented a phased  
3 construction approach that allows for the community  
4 to access a part of the park at all times during  
5 construction.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So what, so at no  
7 time will the entire park be closed?

8 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, no, there will be  
9 a part of the park that's open at all points in  
10 construction.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Now what's the plan  
12 for the Lower East Side Ecology Center?

13 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, I apologize, Chair  
14 Brannan, I don't have, um, that information in front  
15 of me right now. I will follow up with your office  
16 about that.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. We have a lot  
18 of follow-ups here. I hope we're taking notes. Um,  
19 how many trees are being removed for the, the East  
20 Side Resiliency Project?

21 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, we will have to  
22 put this on the list of follow-ups. The Parks  
23 Department is really the best, um, to, ah, best  
24 representative of the city to, ah, answer that  
25 question.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And I guess you  
3 don't know, if you don't know how many we're  
4 removing, you don't know how many are being replanted  
5 and replaced?

6 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: That's a question for  
7 the Parks Department.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. And as of  
9 right now is the East Side plan on time and within  
10 budget?

11 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Ah, yes, that's right.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. All right, I  
13 want to hand it over to, ah, Council Member Vallone.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you, Chair  
16 Brannan, and good morning, everyone. Um, Julie,  
17 thank you for your testimony and the EDC team and the  
18 Mayor's Office. Thank you for the information here.  
19 Um, it really does kind of flow into what Chair  
20 Brannan was doing on a, on an overview of all these  
21 projects and, um, I, I, like always, you're used to  
22 me by now. I always start with your testimony and,  
23 and the information that you've given us as my  
24 starting point. So I, I was brought immediately to  
25 page 5, where you give a pretty decent summary of

3 inspection and what's happening. And I think that is  
4 what is led to the bill in the first place, 'cause  
5 some of this is council members are aware of, aren't  
6 aware of. So why, why don't we start there? You  
7 state that, um, there's over 500 miles of shorefront,  
8 and over one-third of that is privately owned. So we  
9 have two-thirds of shoreline that, that the city's  
10 responsible for. And then you state that EDC  
11 inspects city-owned waterfront infrastructure and  
12 provides repair recommendations annually. Is that  
13 done every year? Is that something that's, that's  
14 done, I know we do the five- and 10-year project,  
15 when was the last time EDC inspected the entire  
16 waterfront?

16 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Um, thank  
17 you so much for the question. I'm gonna turn the mic  
18 over to, ah, my colleague, Prince Flanigan, who runs  
19 the, the program for EDC, to give you details of that  
20 work that his team has been doing.

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Good.

22 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Sure,  
23 ah, thanks for the question. Ah, to answer the  
24 specific question, um, yes, the program is currently  
25 active. Um, as of right now we're in the process of

3 inspecting different sites, the jurisdiction of  
4 different agencies, um, across the five boroughs.  
5 Um, I think an important distinction to make, um, is  
6 that, ah, EDC performs the inspections, um, then we  
7 sort of hand off the capital planning to these other  
8 agencies to develop their own capital plans for their  
9 respective assets.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well [inaudible]  
11 there's a lot of, not so much confusion, but there's  
12 a lot of interaction with the inter-agencies that  
13 you're working with. So could you kind of maybe give  
14 us a summary of that, so, so how many, or what are  
15 the top three city agencies that you're working with  
16 in this process? So, but EDC is doing the inspection  
17 and then that inspection process is handed off to the  
18 applicable city agencies?

19 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:  
20 Correct, and the, the major, we work with a wide  
21 variety of agencies, but I would say the major  
22 agencies that we, ah, work with are Parks Department,  
23 ah, DOT, DEP, and, ah, FDNY. But, um, we, we reach  
24 out to, you know, the, the different facilities and  
25 managers for each agency and at the beginning of the  
fiscal year we come up with, um, the scope of

3 inspections and we, we implement them across the  
4 [inaudible].

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So how do you get,  
6 or how do you determine, um, the work at that point?  
7 Is there a review or the accountability from those  
8 agencies back to you once the inspection is done?  
9 How do you know if it's been budgeted for, started,  
10 or completed, which was what Chair Brannan was  
11 talking about on some projects?

12 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

13 Right, so for the most part, um, EDC, ah, ah, or as  
14 my team the, um, are responsible for our own capital  
15 planning process for our own, um, ah, ah, waterfront  
16 assets. We primarily leave it to the other agencies  
17 to, ah, one, make the case to OMB to receive funding  
18 for the respective assets, and then to prioritize,  
19 um, which assets they're choosing to [inaudible].

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I, I think we just  
21 came up with another good bill, if you [inaudible]  
22 background, which is requiring other sister agencies  
23 to give you an annual update on these resiliency  
24 projects that are within their capital, within their,  
25 even though you're identifying them, it's, it's, it's  
not so much that it's, it's concerning that there are

3 city agencies out there who [inaudible] that  
4 information that are responsible for budgeting and  
5 getting it done. So you, but you also just said,  
6 though, that EDC does have its own capital projects  
7 for its own property. Why don't we talk about that?  
8 So how many, how many identifiable EDC projects are  
9 waterfront related at this point?

10 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: I, I  
11 don't have the specific number of, of assets, but I  
12 can tell you that the totality of the, um, capital  
13 repairs that are needed across the different assets  
14 are about 250 million that Julie mentioned over, ah,  
15 approximately a five-year period.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I mean, I, I,  
17 again, I'm, I'm always a stickler for testimony. So  
18 you guys have stated here that over the course of  
19 fiscal years 2018 and 2019 EDC has performed 80  
20 inspections and have identified 900 million dollars  
21 in recommended repairs across 150 different  
22 waterfront infrastructure systems, under the  
23 jurisdiction, of the 150 systems approximately 45%  
24 need repairs. Now this goes back to a three-year-old  
25 study already, so we're already three years old in  
this particular three to four, and we've only

2 budgeted 250 of the needed 900. So we're already  
3 short, my math stinks, but 700 million...

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: I should, I  
5 think I should...

6 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Yeah, jump in  
7 when...

8 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: I think I  
9 should clarify the testimony and, um, I'll let, I'll  
10 let Prince chime in if I get this wrong. But the 900  
11 million was across the, the program we had done for  
12 all city agencies. The 250 million dollars was for  
13 the EDC waterfront assets that require  
14 rehabilitation. And that was comprehensive for what  
15 was identified as a [inaudible] from the previous  
16 years' programs.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [inaudible] was  
18 that, was that 900 million then, of the 250 that EDC  
19 picked up, did the other 700 million still get picked  
20 up by the other agencies to be prioritized, or is it  
21 still out there waiting to be done?

22 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: I  
23 think for the most part the respective agencies are  
24 still working through that process. I don't have  
25 specifics on, ah, the level of projects for each

3 agency. But I, I know that, um, they're actively  
4 working to prioritize, um, ah, what's important for,  
5 for their operational, operations.

6 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I mean, this  
7 is where, see, we want, we want to team up, it's,  
8 it's budget season, right? So these are the things  
9 that those of us who are passionate about shoreline  
10 preservation, especially for myself and my district,  
11 and members that are present, ah, just about  
12 everybody these days. This is what we'd want to  
13 prioritize in budgets going forward, and when we have  
14 federal funding coming down and state and our own  
15 budgets, ah, being aware of the projects that still  
16 need to be funded, of the critical nature of the  
17 projects that you outlined today, those are some  
18 critical projects that the city needs. But then  
19 there are other projects and each one of the council  
20 members have had shoreline districts, like myself and  
21 most of the Queens members, who, who are still  
22 waiting for those not major to your projects to be  
23 tackled and knowing where that budgetary process is,  
24 knowing where the study is, is what's leading to the  
25 bill today and I'm glad, ah, I mean, I'll just ask

3 you. It looks like in your testimony you're  
4 supporting the bill. Am I correct on that?

5 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Ah, we are  
6 supportive of the intent, um, obviously because we're  
7 already deeply engaged in this work and we'd love to  
8 further discuss with council, um, you know, about  
9 management system and, and how, um, we can work with  
10 you to see how we can refine or improve it to better  
11 suit the needs that you're seeking.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Yeah, I, I think  
13 that's, thank you. I think that's pretty much where  
14 it's a matter of doing what you're kind of already  
15 doing, but expanding and getting an annual report on  
16 that. I think we, I think we're gonna have to,  
17 again, it's not just EDC's issue or problem. It is,  
18 it's a city agency working together on this. So I  
19 think we're gonna need a, a companion bill or two  
20 that Chair Brannan and I could work out with so many  
21 other council members to, to now marry in the other  
22 agencies on what is in their portfolio that EDC has  
23 outlined, where they are with that, and what, what  
24 has been funded, what needs to be funded, what is yet  
25 to be targeted, um, on that. Could you give us a  
description of once, and, and I'll use this. If this

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 51  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 900 million, once these repairs are determined, how,  
4 how do you determine which projects to go forward?

5 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

6 Right. That's a good question.

7 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you [laughs].

8 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: It's  
9 based on multiple factors. Um, one factor, for  
10 example, is if a specific asset has a high volume of,  
11 you know, folks going back and forth across maybe a  
12 bulkhead or, or whatever the case may be, um, we  
13 might prioritize based on that, because in those  
14 cases there's, there's an immediate life safety risk  
15 if, if something collapses.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: You have, so just  
17 go with these step by step. Do you have a breakdown  
18 of those high-risk projects that are within the city?

19 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

20 Correct, we do. I don't have the information  
21 offhand, but it's something we have in our, um,  
22 management tool that...

23 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So you can provide  
24 that to us. At least we can see which ones are being  
25 prioritized as a high, not so much risk, but a high  
priority to get to.

3 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

4 Correct.

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: All right. And so  
6 what would be the next level?

7 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Um, I  
8 would say that that's, that's the, that's the major  
9 [inaudible]. I mean, there's, there's different,  
10 obviously there's different tiers of activity, um,  
11 and if, if we want to be very nuanced another, um,  
12 criteria is just the physical level of deterioration  
13 of the asset. For example, if something might be  
14 severely deteriorated with, um, a relatively small  
15 amount of activity we might still rate that as just  
16 as significant as something with a moderate level of  
17 deterioration with a high level of activity, because  
18 the, the impacts are, it, it really comes down to a  
19 life safety risk and we want to make sure that we're  
20 not, um, allowing, um, these assets to deteriorate to  
21 the point where, um, it's hurting anyone.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I mean, does, so  
23 does EDC maintains that, that breakdown of those type  
24 of projects? Is that done on an annual basis, or it  
25 looks the last one was done 2018, 2019, or just that  
was used as example?

3 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

4 Right, 2018 and 2019 was used as an example. Um,  
5 during 2020 the program was paused for a few months  
6 because of COVID. Um, so for the, um, for the most  
7 part we're playing a little bit of catch-up now to,  
8 you know, finish some of the inspections that were  
9 supposed to happen in 2020. Um, then acquire those  
10 inspection reports and work with the agencies to  
11 develop the next round of, um, council repairs.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Can we, can you  
13 provide a list of those requested inspection sites so  
14 that the council members are aware of which areas in  
15 their districts are being inspected for, for  
16 deterioration issues?

17 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Sure.  
18 Are you referring to the current plans?

19 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Yeah. So you're  
20 current. I mean, I think this...

21 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: ...a way for us to  
23 kind of tackle this going forward is to, you're  
24 already doing basically the work. It's a matter of,  
25 of now providing this information annually to, to  
beyond just EDC and the agencies, but now to, to all

3 of us so we can prioritize what needs to be done,  
4 and, and what needs to be prioritized. So with the,  
5 with the projects that are prioritized, are you just  
6 repairing them back to their original state? Part of  
7 the bill we're looking for is, is now trying to take  
8 in this "living shorelines" approach where we can  
9 have a new green resiliency approach to, to projects  
10 that are may be coming or to replace existing cement-  
11 based projects. Um, is any of that done with, with  
12 the repairs now, or is that only for new future  
13 projects?

14 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

15 Right, so for the most part the, kind of the mantra  
16 for the program is, um, ah, repair in kind unless  
17 there's specific circumstances, um, um, that was  
18 discussed with, you know, a specific agency or  
19 internally within EDC. Um, I think that if we were  
20 to, you know, expand the program to address some of  
21 the, ah, needs in the bill we'd have to work through  
22 some of the current constraints of the program, and I  
23 think, ah, we're happy to, happy to do that.

24 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I think that,  
25 that's part of what's in this bill and I think that's  
why there's excitement here. It's, it's a review of

3 the shorelines and how we can use some of these new  
4 learning resiliency, ah, techniques that are being  
5 brought in across the country and the city, because  
6 we, we just don't want to put back, we want to  
7 repair, but there's opportunity for so many untouched  
8 parts of the shoreline. Um, of the two-thirds of the  
9 shoreline that EDC maintains, do you have, ah, do you  
10 have a study of all existing two-thirds planned or is  
11 that just on a repair need basis?

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: So just to  
13 clarify, the two-thirds are publicly owned more  
14 generally, not just in EDC's jurisdiction.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So do you, do you  
16 expect that the entire, what's within your portfolio,  
17 or is it only done on projects that are flagged that,  
18 that need repairs?

19 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Ah,  
20 could you repeat the question? Sorry.

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: When you do the  
22 inspections that are in the report, is it the entire  
23 portfolio of EDC-owned, city-owned land, or is it  
24 just the sites that we, ah, have brought to your  
25 attention and need repair?

3 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

4 Right, so it's, it's typically sites that are in  
5 critical, critical condition and need repairs. We  
6 try to inspect every site on a roughly, a roughly  
7 five-year basis, but it's also...

8 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yeah, also,  
9 there's also another effort I want to highlight,  
10 which is that, that waterfront maintenance management  
11 system also has mapping and visibility on each of the  
12 sites, even if they're not doing a deep dive  
13 inspection. So I don't know if you want to explain  
14 the kind of information that's available for the  
15 sites that aren't getting the annual inspections.

16 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN:

17 Exactly. So, yeah, ah, thanks Julies. It's good to  
18 separate kind of the inspection from the mapping. As  
19 of right now we have the entire, ah, the entirety of  
20 the 520 miles of, um, NYC waterfront mapped. That's  
21 available on the, on the management tool. As for the  
22 inspections, it's, it's, um, something we're still  
23 working, working towards for the entire waterfront.

24 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: So, yeah,  
25 Council Member Vallone, I think that some of the  
information that you're interested in, in terms of

3 understanding the conditions and the materiality of  
4 each of those miles might be available, even if a  
5 deep dive inspection hasn't been completed in the  
6 past few years.

7 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I mean, so  
8 how are we to know then which part, which projects  
9 EDC is going forward with on a capital annual basis.  
10 I mean, other than the ones that Chair Brannan and I  
11 had targeted the major ones for today, do you have a  
12 list of projects that are on EDC's basically to-do  
13 list and are gonna be funded and go ahead with?

14 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: We  
15 do.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So can, can we  
17 share that list? What's, what are we, what's on  
18 target for, for this year and what's on, what's  
19 coming up? So until we, that's what we're trying to  
20 find out. The, giving over that type of information  
21 is, it then allows us to fight with, and fight for  
22 the budget to, to allocate this. Otherwise, it's  
23 just all great things to be done. But if we don't  
24 have the budget for it, it's not gonna get done.

25 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: Yeah,  
like I said...

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 58  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [inaudible] what is  
4 the list that EDC has targeted to be done for, like  
5 you said, on your critical projects?

6 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: It,  
7 it really is a number of sites, so I'm glad to share  
8 that list, um, afterwards. But I, I don't have the  
9 list offhand, um, you know.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And is that done on  
11 an equitable basis borough by borough, or is it just  
12 done by need?

13 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: The,  
14 the principle, um, nature of the program is that we,  
15 you know, the target areas that are in deterioration  
16 and have high levels of activity. So, um, not  
17 necessarily, um, based on a specific borough.  
18 [inaudible] glad to share like specific criteria with  
19 you and others.

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I, you know,  
21 I see, Chair Brannan, we've already been, ah, we have  
22 council members on. I see Council Member Lander and  
23 I see some other council members. I, I think what  
24 maybe we can do at this point is turn off, ah, turn  
25 to the council members maybe for some specific  
questions on either projects in their district that

3 they may have, and then Chair Brannan and I will come  
4 back 'cause I have additional questions about these  
5 larger projects, where we are with them, and how we  
6 are going to, ah, incorporate, um, the work that is  
7 being done, and you've already identified over 900,  
8 [inaudible] 900 million with only 250 million being  
9 targeted with city agencies that we don't know if  
10 that's even being done or not. So that's, ah,  
11 concerning to me coming into a budget season, um,  
12 when we are, that three-year-old estimate that we're  
13 700 behind, we are a COVID pandemic world now and we  
14 are already looking at new resiliency techniques that  
15 are not even in that 900 million. So, ah, we have  
16 got some serious budgeting and, and work to be done  
17 to protect our shorelines. So, Chair Brannan, I'll  
18 turn it back to you to see if there's council members  
19 who had their hands up or the committee counsel. Do  
20 we have any council members at this point who want to  
21 jump in?

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, yes, Chairs.

23 There's, there's, ah, there is a member who has a  
24 question. Um, just quickly before we move on to that  
25 member I will just go through my spiel. We'll call

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 60  
WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

2 on the members to ask their questions in the order  
3 they have used the Zoom raise hand function. Council  
4 members, if you'd like ask a question but have not  
5 yet used the Zoom raise hand function please raise it  
6 now. Ah, council members, please keep your questions  
7 to five minutes. The Sergeant at Arms will keep a  
8 timer and will let you know when your time is up, and  
9 please begin once I've called on you and the sergeant  
10 has announced that you may begin before asking your  
11 questions. At this point we have Council Member  
12 Barron who has a question.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member,  
15 please pause for a second. I think you're on mute.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: OK. Can you hear  
17 me now?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just give us one  
19 second to unmute you, please.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: We can hear you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, yes, Council  
22 Member, you can begin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: OK, good. Thank  
24 you so much. Ah, glad to be able to participate. I  
25 did not hear most of the testimony, so my questions

3 may, ah, already be about areas that you've already  
4 spoken about, ah, so please forgive me. I represent  
5 East New York, which has waterfront at the, ah, the  
6 Jamaica Bay. During Hurricane Sandy water came into  
7 one of those inlets and went to the western side and  
8 flooded into Canarsie. Had it gone to the eastern  
9 side it would have flooded an area where there are,  
10 there's a development that's called The Landings.

11 The people who are at The Landings, which are  
12 condominiums and co-ops, have indicated that their  
13 shoreline is eroding. We are having lots of  
14 challenges to find out in fact where their property  
15 line ends and where Parks Department, which I believe  
16 is the entity that, ah, is responsible for the actual  
17 area that, ah, comes in contact where the water  
18 begins. What would be the most efficient way to  
19 identify precisely where that ends, because it's  
20 elevated at this point where the property line is and  
21 there's a steep drop and the property line, the  
22 owners are saying that their property is being  
23 undermined, and it's obvious when you look at their  
24 porches and back yards that it's being, ah, there is  
25 a depression that's happening. First of all, how are  
we going to determine precisely who is responsible,

3 and certainly we don't want to go to that property  
4 line and say, well, it's not yet there so we don't  
5 have to worry about it. There has to be something  
6 proactive and preventive that Parks Department should  
7 be able to do to make sure that this property, ah, is  
8 not in danger.

9 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, thank you for that  
10 question, Council Member Barron. Um, I, um, ah, am  
11 not familiar with the details of the situation, but I  
12 can say that I know that Parks is, the Parks  
13 Department is working with, ah, the co-op board. In  
14 fact, they were just on a site visit the other day.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, I was  
16 there.

17 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Wonderful. So I know  
18 that there are discussions ongoing. Again, I'm, you  
19 know, we would have to have someone from the Parks  
20 Department answer your question more specifically.  
21 But, um, but I know that they are, they are engaged  
22 with the, with the board and working on this with  
23 them.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right. So what  
25 is your interaction, ah, and relationship? What's  
the coordination? Who has the responsibility? Is it

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 63  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 specifically Parks or do you have some part to play  
4 in this as well?

5 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, at, at this time  
6 Parks Department is taking the lead.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And will they  
8 report to you, and will their plans be, who reviews  
9 whatever Parks Department comes up with as their, ah,  
10 solution to this problem? Who says yes, this is the  
11 right thing, yes, this is as far as we need to go?  
12 Who does that?

13 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: Um, again, Council  
14 Member, I'm, I'm not, um, familiar with the specifics  
15 of the situation. The Parks Department definitely  
16 does not report to me. We will coordinate with the  
17 Mayor's Office of Climate Resiliency as needed. Um,  
18 but they, they report to the Deputy Mayor, um, of  
19 Housing and Economic Development [inaudible]. I, I,  
20 I don't know enough about the specifics to answer  
21 your question more specifically.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: OK, great. Thank  
23 you so much. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council  
25 Member. Ah, at this point there are no other council  
member questions, so we can, ah, turn back, ah, we

3 can turn back to the chairs for more questions if  
4 they have any. Ah, Chair Brannan, Chair Vallone?

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Chair Vallone, do  
6 you have anything?

7 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I think, I  
8 think you can hear from the council members'  
9 questions, that where we started off with when EDC  
10 does determine that repairs are required and then  
11 hands that off to an agency to actually do the work,  
12 budget the work, prioritize the work, and get it  
13 done. Um, ah, I, I think pretty adamantly that that  
14 has to be a, a, pretty much a secondary [inaudible],  
15 um, to get that information because I don't, I don't  
16 really think it's acceptable that an agency can go  
17 off and determine after it's been already found that  
18 the work needs to be done and now it's being handled  
19 by Parks or someone else who has that particular  
20 property, and more for the [inaudible] Parks, um, and  
21 then what they're doing there and how they're going  
22 to be [inaudible]. Ah, ah, I, I would like maybe  
23 some conversation about there are clearly districts  
24 that are waterfront districts to the city. There are  
25 council members that have, ah, no shoreline. There  
are council members that are surrounded by shoreline.

3 Um, for the, for the boroughs and the shoreline  
4 projects that you are targeting, is there a list of  
5 definable shoreline projects by borough that we could  
6 go over that have been determined that are about to  
7 go forward or going forward?

8 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: I, and I'll  
9 let Prince, ah, clarify if this is incorrect, but,  
10 ah, certainly we could sort the list of projects, um,  
11 you know, by boroughs so that you could see. I also  
12 just want to make sure that we're, you know, sort of  
13 disaggregating two sets of things that we're working  
14 one. One are some of the resiliency projects we were  
15 speaking about earlier, but also the general  
16 inspection program, which is about, you know, the  
17 general state of good repair.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, yeah, and I  
19 can certainly see that those are things that we might  
20 be able to. Because the other part of this that we  
21 haven't discussed and, and something that Chair  
22 Brannan and I [inaudible] the patrons hearings, you  
23 know, if there are any now present or future zoning,  
24 rezoning, or development projects, um, there has been  
25 a, a 100% cry to make sure that any project that  
touches waterfronts automatically must preserve the

3 shoreline for community access. And, and that's  
4 something that's [inaudible] topic, but it's also  
5 something that, um, we haven't discussed as untouched  
6 city-owned land that still can be developed. Do we  
7 have, ah, an estimate or a breakdown on remaining  
8 city land that's in our portfolio that is, ah, yet to  
9 be developed?

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Um, I, I  
11 don't have that in front of me as it relates to our  
12 properties, although the properties that EDC manages,  
13 um, and that's in our portfolio typically are active  
14 properties. But to your point about creating  
15 additional community access, it certainly is one of  
16 our priorities when we are redeveloping. For  
17 example, our waterfront properties in the Sunset Park  
18 district, we've been working closely with Council  
19 Member Menchaca on this to make sure that whenever  
20 we've making investments we're also create, um, you  
21 know, beautiful, ah, publicly accessible open space.  
22 So, for example, we operated, ah, a new waterfront  
23 space at the Brooklyn Army Terminal in 2018. Ah,  
24 Council Member Brannan may be familiar with it, ah,  
25 as well as our new plans, um, at Bush Terminal will  
also have significant increments to public waterfront

3 access. So it's certainly front of mind for us. Um,  
4 I would also refer to, you know, City Planning's work  
5 on the waterfront revitalization program, as well as  
6 all the work that they're doing, um, you know, around  
7 the comprehensive waterfront plan. Um, you know,  
8 they are, they are what I would say our experts, ah,  
9 in, in the sort of the soft shoreline question, um,  
10 as, as well as some of the, the question you're  
11 having about how it impacts future, ah, you know,  
12 property development and rezoning.

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: But Julie, with  
14 those success stories with those types of projects,  
15 is that something that's just negotiated, or is that  
16 something that's mandated and required that, that  
17 must be done?

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: It's  
19 something that we have, I mean, so obviously where  
20 then is new development on the waterfront there are  
21 certain requirements when it comes to, um, getting  
22 your DOB approvals as it relates to zoning. So  
23 certain properties have requirements, ah, when  
24 they're being developed. There's also certain  
25 improvements that we're making because we hear from  
the community that they're important, um, even when

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 68  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 we're not doing necessarily redevelopment, but we're  
4 just investing in certain properties. We are making  
5 sure that we are both compliant, um, with whatever  
6 the zoning is for the, the waterfront zoning for the  
7 area when it applies as well as, um, you know, other  
8 ways we want to be good neighbors at our public  
9 assets.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, that's been  
11 something we've been toying with for years, is making  
12 that a requirement that all shoreline access must be  
13 preserved for community, ah, access, whether it's the  
14 parkland, the [inaudible] shoreline resiliency  
15 programs. Um, through these individual projects it's  
16 been negotiated. But I still think that may be  
17 something we look into.

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yeah, and  
19 you, I, I imagine you're familiar with the waterfront  
20 zoning requirements, but, you know, that, those often  
21 apply, ah, not in all cases, but it often applies,  
22 um, when we're reinvesting, ah, you know, either  
23 publicly or privately.

24 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So, I mean, Justin  
25 and I, you, you talked about the Sunset Park, and  
that's basically the success story. But there are a

3 couple of, ah, projects that Chair Brannan mentioned  
4 quickly. But I, I don't know if we, we got the  
5 answer. Is the Hunt's Point still in a development  
6 phase or are we beyond it?

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: So our  
8 Hunt's Point properties, um, for the most part are,  
9 are properties that have been built out and have been  
10 built out since the '60s or '70s. There are certain,  
11 um, individual properties, like I just mentioned the,  
12 the Grow NYC project, ah, that will be in  
13 construction, um, but for the most part we have long-  
14 term leases with tenants along the waterfront, um,  
15 you know, and, and [inaudible] improvements that  
16 we're talking about are in connection with the  
17 existing tenants on the lot.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: No, um, I'm  
19 [inaudible] talking about the, the, the tenants that  
20 are negotiating leases or the land that needs to be  
21 post Sandy looked at, not the, the 50 years in the  
22 past. I'm talking the, the projects with the ongoing  
23 leased tenant [inaudible]. Are we beyond development  
24 phase for the resiliency projects there, 'cause we  
25 had a separate hearing about that, and there were  
lots of things to be negotiated between each lease

3 and tenant, and a lot of that had to deal with the  
4 recovery and the resiliency of the land that, that  
5 Hunt's Point is on.

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: So I think  
7 I highlighted earlier the specific projects that  
8 we're moving forward with in the short term,  
9 primarily around, um, the, you know, the HESCO bags  
10 that are at, at the meat market to protect that, um,  
11 immediate risk, and then we're also applying for that  
12 FEMA grant that will have building level  
13 improvements. Um, but, you know, we, for the most  
14 part the opportunities with each of the tenants, ah,  
15 as I'm sure they said in the last hearing, are locked  
16 into individual leases that have quite a bit of term  
17 left on them, um, and so as we negotiate new  
18 development projects we're looking with an eye  
19 towards building hardening and coastal resiliency,  
20 um, which apply differently depending on the  
21 location, um, of each of those buildings.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, a lot of that  
23 with the food distribution center had to do with  
24 power and the generation of new power, existing power  
25 and, and...

2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: That's  
3 right.

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: ...[inaudible]. Has  
5 there been any decision on that on, ah, the backup  
6 power generation?

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: So there's  
8 a couple of different components of the project, um,  
9 which are in various stages of implementation. For  
10 example, the Hunt's Point, um, meat market has a  
11 generator project, um, that Council Member Salamanca  
12 has been a strong proponent of. Um, those, ah,  
13 generators just need, are just awaiting EPA  
14 inspection before they can be finalized and  
15 connected. But those are basically in place pending  
16 that regulatory, ah, approval, the, um, the EPA  
17 approval inspection, I suppose. Um, we are in design  
18 on some of the other projects as it relates to the  
19 [inaudible] generation facility and the other solar  
20 that's components of the, the long-term plan.

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So can you, can you  
22 provide, I guess, an update on that timeline for us?  
23 [inaudible] 'cause that's something we've been  
24 working on.

3 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yep. So  
4 we're still looking towards the, um, the CDBG, um,  
5 ah, timeline that Jaaney had referenced earlier.

6 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: All right. And the  
7 last thing I'll, I'll kind of wrap up is just maybe  
8 what, I mean, we always talk about the tools in the  
9 EDC toolkit. Ah, part of the bill that we're, we're  
10 hopefully gonna be passing soon, and Intro 1679 is  
11 the use of living shorelines and natural-based  
12 resources. What, could you give us an example of  
13 some of what EDC is doing now with some of the  
14 shoreline projects that are starting to implement  
15 some of these alternative living resources that we  
16 can use as the identical first, identifiable first,  
17 ah, batch of living resources that we can use, and  
18 what are some of the goals that maybe we can look  
19 forward to in the future?

20 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yeah, so  
21 let me take a first pass at that and then I'll hand  
22 it over to Prince. Many of the properties that we  
23 are working on, um, are obviously active projects,  
24 right, so we have a waterfront infrastructure like  
25 many of our ports. So all of the investments that  
we've been making, for example, at SBMT, are for

3 active port use, ah, so always trying to balance,  
4 obviously, active bulkhead use. Um, we do have a  
5 project at [inaudible] Cove, um, which, ah, is an  
6 example of that, ah, planting wetlands, and we also  
7 have the work that we're doing, um, ah, sorry,  
8 planting wetlands and also doing clean-up, um, and  
9 obviously you're familiar with some of the work that  
10 we're doing, um, in, in Staten Island, ah, for the,  
11 the wetlands, um, project at Sawmill Creek. Um, we,  
12 you know, I also want to sort of strongly reference  
13 the work that our, our partners at City Planning have  
14 been doing on this topic more generally. They have,  
15 um, quite a bit of expertise on living shorelines and  
16 the recommendations as it relates to, um,  
17 implementing them across the city. Um, and then I'll  
18 also just reference, ah, the work that we did at Bush  
19 Terminal Piers Park in 2014 to implement, um, the,  
20 the natural landscaping there, which had been a  
21 previous dumping ground. Ah, I don't know, Prince,  
22 if there's anything else you want to mention in terms  
23 of the work that your team is doing.

24 ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT FLANIGAN: No,  
25 I, I think that's pretty comprehensive, Julie. The  
only thing I would add is that, um, ah, many of those

3 projects are a direct result of some of the work that  
4 one, that stems from the management tool and also  
5 from the, ah, our engineering that goes to different  
6 sites and perform the actual inspection to determine,  
7 you know, what can and what cannot happen at a site.

8 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Is there a  
9 requirement on, on the, when we're talking about a, a  
10 project of a shoreline nature, whether it's  
11 preservation or repair, is there a requirement that  
12 alternative resources or living resources or  
13 alternative green approach is taken for that current  
14 project or, or is that just done on a project by  
15 project basis? I mean, a lot of this is, is new  
16 ground and a lot of it is siting new, ah, and a lot  
17 of we're learning has been partners, whether it's our  
18 coastal preservation partners, whether it's our  
19 federal partners, um, they're learning more things  
20 every day on coastal preservation, whether it's the  
21 Billion Oyster Project or, um, using sea grass to  
22 preserve the shorelines, and making sure that DEP is  
23 not dumping directly right onto the preservation  
24 project, where those, ah, sewer lines are going.  
25 There's so much city interagency on what happens on  
any particular project. I, I think we would have a

3 little bit more comfort if we knew that there was a,  
4 a controlling agency to make sure that approvals are  
5 done and that, that the best, or the least impactful  
6 approach is made. Is, does that happen now through  
7 EDC, like if there's a project that's handed off to  
8 another agency be done on a shoreline are they out  
9 there with complete discretion to finish and complete  
10 that project? Or do they have to obtain permission  
11 for what approach they're going to take?

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: So I, I'd  
13 like to just reference the, um, the work that City  
14 Planning done on the Waterfront Revitalization  
15 Program. Those requirements, um, ah, that program  
16 requires that the applicant look at a soft shoreline  
17 when it's not an active maritime edge, um, and again  
18 I'll just reference City Planning as sort of our, um,  
19 experts doing a deep dive on, ah, making guidelines  
20 and specific requirements in this area.

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Does City Planning  
22 then report back to you on an annual or quarterly  
23 basis on what projects that they are then outlining  
24 for you for shore preservation...

25 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Sorry, just  
as a, let me, ah, clarify what I mentioned. The,

3 there are, you know, requirements that are in place  
4 through various, you know, policies and requirements,  
5 whether it's zoning or other guidelines that are  
6 required, um, through the development process, and so  
7 those are the guidelines that EDC or other city, ah,  
8 agencies or other private developers will reference  
9 when they're doing new investment. So it's not on a  
10 case-by-case basis, but rather there are, you know,  
11 there are guidelines and structures in place that,  
12 um, require the applicants still get soft shorelines  
13 sort of when it's on an active maritime edge.

14 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I think to,  
15 to our cochair we just met another bill that we can  
16 put in to work together with on, ah, any projects  
17 that are shoreline-based to be required to record  
18 back and report back as to what shore resiliency  
19 measures are being installed or instilled or approved  
20 or looked activity as tolerated, ah, before the  
21 project goes forward, because it seems to me that  
22 there's, um, on the projects that are the successes  
23 that you're working with are, are clear, but then  
24 there's a lot of projects that are being handed off,  
25 ah, to other agencies to maintain with other

3 requirements and I'm not quite sure if I'm  
4 comfortable with [inaudible].

5 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: Yeah, and I  
6 would also say it's a little beyond my area of  
7 expertise, but it's probably worth looking at what  
8 the reporting requirements already exist, ah, as it  
9 relates to getting certain building permits and other  
10 approvals, because I know that there's quite, um, an  
11 infrastructure in place, ah, in order for different  
12 approvals, ah, before you actually start any of that  
13 work and I, I imagine that some of that is already  
14 being captured, um, through some of those processes.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, thank you for  
16 answering the questions that we've come up with. I  
17 know Chair Brannan has some for himself. I'd like to  
18 turn it back over to my cochair.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Chair.  
20 Um, I wanted to allow, ah, Council Member Barron, I  
21 think she had another question.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, yes. Thank  
23 you, Chair Brannan, and thank you, Chair Vallone.  
24 Um, I do have another question. In 2019 after many  
25 millions of dollars that the city put into the  
Pennsylvania and the Fountain Avenue landfills the

3 state came, ah, sort of late to the game and put on a  
4 lot of the, ah, icing and put in some paths and had a  
5 grand, a grand opening of the Shirley Chisholm State  
6 Park. So my question is for that shoreline of that  
7 area between basically Pennsylvania Avenue and  
8 Fountain Avenue who's responsible for that, and is  
9 there any coordination between the city and the state  
10 for, ah, plans for maintaining that shoreline, that  
11 coastline, and perhaps having other kinds of  
12 community access to the water?

13 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: I'm not  
14 sure that EDC has the answer to that question.  
15 Jainey, I'm not sure if MOR does?

16 DIRECTOR BAVISHI: No, it sounds like a  
17 Parks Department question.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So we don't know  
19 who's responsible? I know I think the state has  
20 leased it from the feds where it's a part of the  
21 Jamaica Bay area, but I wanted to know what's the  
22 city's, ah, role in this, coordination, suggestions,  
23 because, again, the city put in the millions that was  
24 necessary for the state to do the, the cosmetic  
25 topping and have a grand reopening. But I wanted to  
26 know who's responsible now that it's there and what's

3 the coordination between those two levels of  
4 government. So, ah, to the chairs, if we could get  
5 an answer to that I would appreciate it. Thank you.  
6 That was it.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Council  
8 Member. Yeah, um, I wasn't thrilled with the  
9 preparation or the lack of preparation today. Um,  
10 um, it's, it's disappointing, um, and I agree with my  
11 cochair today. I think there's a lot of stuff that's  
12 gonna come out of this hearing as far as reporting  
13 that I think we're gonna need just to, um, have some  
14 accountability and, and some, try to inject a little  
15 urgency here. Um, you know, I think it's, you know,  
16 look, I, I think we all understand that the building  
17 resilience, ah, is a process, it doesn't happen  
18 overnight. Um, but I think urgency here is certainly  
19 critical, um, because time is just not on our side,  
20 um, and we can't wait for these hearings to get this  
21 information, um, and then when we get to the  
22 hearings, ah, when agencies aren't prepared and we're  
23 pulling teeth to get information, um, it's just, it's  
24 disheartening, but it's also just, it's not OK, we  
25 don't have the time and, again, like I said earlier,  
I didn't hear anybody blaming COVID for any of this

3 stuff. So, um, the delay in, in some of these  
4 projects and stuff that we thought, ah, or was going  
5 to be completed by 2021, now that we're hearing we  
6 hoping we get shovels in the ground by 2021, you  
7 know, time is not on our side and protecting our, our  
8 ports and our marine terminals and our food  
9 distribution centers and making sure that we are  
10 communicating with the communities who are on the  
11 front lines of extreme weather, um, they, they can't  
12 wait for these hearings to find out this information.  
13 So we gotta do better there and if it requires us to  
14 put in more reporting bills to keep folks honest and  
15 keep folks accountable then that's what we're gonna  
16 have to do. Um, so I thank you...

16 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: If I can,  
17 if I can...

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure.

19 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT STEIN: [inaudible]  
20 I think in order to get a more complete picture of  
21 many of the questions that you're asking there, are  
22 many other folks working throughout the city on some  
23 of these [inaudible] many of these projects and some  
24 of the questions you've asked are on properties that  
25 are outside of our jurisdiction or outside of MOR's

2 jurisdiction. And so, for example, I'm sure that,  
3 um, Parks or DEP would have a robust answer to  
4 Councilwoman Barron's question, but it just, you  
5 know, they're, they're not here with us, ah, in a  
6 speaking role today. So I, I would invite, um, you  
7 know, more conversation with the, the, the various  
8 agencies. The, the property in New York City is  
9 owned, um, you know, by, by a lot of different  
10 agencies and we're, you know, deep, deeply  
11 knowledgeable about the ones that we're working on,  
12 um, but, you know, want to sort of give credit to  
13 where the other, other agencies are involved.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: OK. Um, OK. I  
15 want to acknowledge also we were joined by Councilman  
16 Ulrich, um, and I think with that, Kris, unless  
17 Councilman Vallone has anything else we can move on  
18 to our next panel.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, Chair, there are  
20 no other questions from council members, so we can  
21 move on to testimony from members of the public at  
22 this point.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Great.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, as I said before,  
25 we'll now turn over to public testimony. I'd like to

3 remind everyone that unlike our typical council  
4 hearings we will be calling on individuals one by one  
5 to testify. As I stated earlier, each panelist will  
6 be given three minutes to speak. Please begin once  
7 the sergeant has started the timer and given you the  
8 cue to begin. Council members who have questions for  
9 a particular panelist should again use the Zoom raise  
10 hand function and I will call on you after the panel,  
11 and, ah, I will then call on you to, ah, ask those  
12 questions. For panelists, once your name is called a  
13 member of our staff will unmute you and the Sergeant  
14 at Arms will give you the go-ahead to being upon  
15 setting the timer. Please wait for the sergeant to  
16 announce that you may begin before delivering your  
17 testimony. And at this point I'd like to call on  
18 Noam Baharav to testify, who will be followed by  
19 Andrew Rella.

20 NOAM BAHARAV: Hello, everybody. Ah, if  
21 it's OK with the council we'd love to flip the order  
22 and have Andrew Rella start and I will follow.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: That, that's fine.  
24 Ah, Mr. Rella, please, ah, begin.

25 ANDREW RELLA: Good afternoon. My name  
is Dr. Andrew Rella and I'm the director of

3 engineering for E-concrete, a coastal engineer  
4 specializing in [inaudible] design, and I'm joined by  
5 Noam Baharav, the concretes director of public policy  
6 and relations. I'm also an adjunct professor at  
7 Stevens Institute of Technology and a local native  
8 New Yorker. Throughout my academic and professional  
9 career I've coauthored [inaudible] Living Shoreline  
10 Engineering Guidelines, the advisory committee member  
11 for Hudson River [inaudible] Project for over 10  
12 years, as well as worked at the DEC since 2013 on  
13 developing solutions to ecological engineering of  
14 concrete pylon encasements. E-concrete, a company  
15 specializing in ecological design of coastal and  
16 marine infrastructure has been operating in New York  
17 City since 2012 with projects at Brooklyn Bridge Park  
18 and Middle Island, Huron Street, Queens, and soon to  
19 be [inaudible] project planned for the southern shore  
20 of Staten Island, New York, my home borough. We've  
21 heard throughout this meeting the importance of our  
22 city's waterfronts and infrastructure, [inaudible]  
23 effort. The importance of developing resilient  
24 structure cannot be overstated. Current  
25 infrastructure needs, sea level rise, and increased  
storm frequency can only be addressed through

3 assessing the structural, ecological, and social  
4 aspects of design. [inaudible] design engineering  
5 [inaudible] living shorelines not only serve to  
6 provide ecosystem services and ecological uplift to  
7 serve to reinforce the structural components of  
8 infrastructure enhancing projects [inaudible]  
9 actually impacting to climate change, expediting,  
10 permitting, and providing on-site mitigations all  
11 returning [inaudible] and saving millions of dollars.  
12 I now hand this over to Noam Baharav to finish the  
13 statement.

14 NOAM BAHARAV: Thank you, Andrew. As my  
15 colleague, Dr. Andrew Rella mentioned, E-concrete's  
16 resilient building roots in New York City run deep.  
17 Members of the committee, Chair Brannan and Chair  
18 Vallone, we thank you for the opportunity to share E-  
19 concrete's testimony in support of this bill. Intro  
20 1679 affords a comprehensive and visionary approach  
21 to sustainable development throughout New York City's  
22 shoreline protection structures. By assessing the  
23 current state of the city's shoreline protection  
24 measures and identifying where potential  
25 infrastructures must be replaced, this bill ensures a  
proactive approach to reducing the impacts of

3 seasonal flooding, erosion, and catastrophic storms.

4 By analyzing if the living shorelines approach would

5 be a feasible replacement to the traditional

6 protections the proposed committee would direct, the

7 proposed bill, my apologies, would directly increase

8 economic stability services, like flood attenuation

9 and shelter for species, while increasing the coastal

10 public access and open space. By determining

11 opportunities for environmental concrete the city is

12 taking an integral step towards meeting the challenge

13 of climate change. This bill would strengthen the

14 city's work to build protected shorelines that can

15 also be carbon sinks, marine habitat, local job

16 creation, and recreational and educational sites.

17 When environmental concrete is encouraged the city

18 gains more natural spaces and hardened infrastructure

19 with co-benefits that traditional concrete

20 protections cannot afford. We thank this committee

21 for hearing our testimony and are grateful for your

22 time and attention towards this hearing process. We

23 look forward to continuing collaborating with the

24 City of New York towards a more resilient future.

25 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Noam.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much.

4 Our next speaker will be Sarah Dougherty, who will be  
5 followed by Michael Dulong, who is our last  
6 registered speaker.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

8 SARAH DOUGHERTY: Hello, OK, you can hear  
9 me. Um, thank you for having me. I'm Sarah  
10 Dougherty from the Waterfront Alliance. Um, the 525,  
11 the 520 miles of shoreline in New York City are a  
12 magical landscape of maritime recreation, a working  
13 port, and a green ecological wonder. At the same  
14 time the many mixed uses along the shoreline paint a  
15 complicated picture. Public facilities alone include  
16 the Manhattan and Brooklyn cruise terminals, the Red  
17 Hook container terminal, city marinas, FDNY and NYPD  
18 marine facilities, shoreline and beaches, coastal  
19 resiliency structures, waterfront parks, greenways,  
20 and dredging sites. We recommend the City Council's,  
21 we commend the City Council's efforts to draw  
22 attention to port safety and resiliency in today's  
23 hearing. The city, through plans like the NYC  
24 Comprehensive Waterfront Plan, Create NYC, and the  
25 EDC's waterfront management maintenance, ah, system  
that we've discussed a lot today, as well as recent

3 changes in the city's zoning code through the zoning  
4 for coastal flood resiliency have put forth many  
5 proposals for strengthening maritime ports and  
6 coastal resiliency. Key questions to consider from  
7 this point are how these plans integrate or cross  
8 reference one another and what we can do to measure  
9 progress when these recommendations are made or  
10 reforms are instituted. Three things could be  
11 improved - interagency coordination, measuring the  
12 progress and maintenance needs over time, a  
13 commitment from the administration to back a  
14 collective vision for port resiliency and  
15 sustainability across the city. The role of the city  
16 and regions ports are sometimes shrouded in mystery  
17 for the public, for the public and lawmakers. The  
18 port and maritime sector is and can be even greater  
19 in this 21st century economic driver while rising to  
20 meet the critical needs of local environmental  
21 justice communities. We applaud the recent efforts  
22 by the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey to  
23 deploy a more, to deploy more clean vehicles at Red  
24 Hook terminals and we can mend the city's effort to  
25 create a marine terminal at Hunt's Point. But a  
broader vision for maritime ports and the working

3 waterfront in the city is absent. We recently  
4 published recommendations in the Waterfront  
5 Resiliency Platform for the next mayor of New York  
6 City, which include prioritizing first a focus on  
7 five-borough green maritime port vision, i.e.  
8 offshore wind, decarbonization, electrification,  
9 ecological restoration, a thriving five-borough ferry  
10 service, retaining waterfront industrial zones that  
11 foster local career pathways and green and blue jobs,  
12 and moving more goods by water. Turning to Intro  
13 1679, Waterfront Alliance supports the goal of  
14 living, of studying shoreline protection structures  
15 and advancing natural shoreline protections. Living  
16 or nature-based shorelines stabilize the shoreline  
17 and provide habitat restoration, ecosystem services,  
18 wave attenuation, improve water quality, and  
19 facilitate recreational activities like kayaking.  
20 Compared to conventional hardened or [inaudible]  
21 shoreline stabilization methods, living and nature-  
22 based shorelines provide 25, up to 25% more  
23 biodiversity and can reduce tidal energy, filter and  
24 reduce...

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

25 SARAH DOUGHERTY: Um...

3 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: You can finish up,  
4 Sarah, that's fine. You can finish up.

5 SARAH DOUGHERTY: Thank you. Um, I'll  
6 try to make it quick. Um, so we strongly support  
7 living shorelines. Um, Waterfront Alliance through  
8 its Waterfront Edge Design Guidelines rating system  
9 recently verified a cement plant in the South Bronx  
10 for its innovative design at the water's edge, which  
11 restored wetlands and created public access, even  
12 alongside an industrial waterfront site. To that end  
13 we recommend that legislation includes specific  
14 language on first whether the city's existing  
15 shoreline protections align with best practices  
16 outlined in the Waterfront Edge Design Guidelines,  
17 specifically category 3, edge resilience credits and  
18 appendix B, shoreline stabilization and decision-  
19 making, that this legislation incorporate a citywide  
20 rating system, restoring system for waterfront edge  
21 resiliency and ecological aligned with WEDG, and  
22 lastly incentives such as expedited permitting  
23 between DEC, Army Corps, and Department of City  
24 Planning are in place to encourage widespread  
25 adoption of naturalized shorelines. Thanks for the

1 COMMITTEE ON RESILIENCY AND WATERFRONTS JOINTLY 90  
2 WITH COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

3 opportunity to testify today, and apologies for going  
4 over time.

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And, Sarah, thanks  
6 for making it waiting to the end, and we always love  
7 looking forward to your reports, ah, and working with  
8 your alliance. It's so important. And I know Chair  
9 Brannan and I are, are gonna be right on the heels of  
10 some new bills after this, so you may be, you may see  
11 some of your wording right in those bills, so we're  
12 all on the same mission here.

13 SARAH DOUGHERTY: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Our next  
15 and last registered speaker is Michael Dulong.  
16 Please begin.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please once, please  
19 hold on one second. I think we have to just unmute  
20 you.

21 MICHAEL DULONG: Sure. I think you can  
22 hear me now, right?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

24 MICHAEL DULONG: Great point, great  
25 points, Sarah. Good afternoon, Chairman Vallone,  
Chairman Brannan, um, and thank you for the

3 opportunity to testify today. I'm gonna testify in  
4 support of 1679. Um, and thank you for your  
5 leadership in pursuing a, a study of all 520 miles of  
6 New York's shoreline. Um, we believe, I want to talk  
7 about why we believe it's necessary and respectfully  
8 suggest some ways to strengthen the bill. Um, I, in  
9 all of your remarks today it's very clear climate  
10 change is something that is going to grow worse.  
11 We're already seeing sunny day flooding, ah,  
12 especially out in Queens. Ah, we're seeing an  
13 increase in localized flooding, ah, in streets and  
14 homes due to precipitation, increased combined sewer  
15 overflow, and an increased risk of storm surge. Um,  
16 in your remarks today, Council Member Brannan, ah,  
17 you talked about the, the 19 billion dollars that  
18 Sandy cost the city in damages. Ah, 43 New Yorkers  
19 died. Um, 433,000 New Yorkers' homes are in the  
20 flood plain and were affected by Sandy. Ah, so, many  
21 of those are low-income New Yorkers and people of  
22 color, and so clearly something needs to be done to  
23 prevent that from happening again and the problem is  
24 growing worse. The federal study that is happening  
25 now, the Harbors and Tributaries Study, is not going  
to account for all of these problems for all these,

3 for all of sea level rise impacts. It is focused  
4 only on storm surge and does not address blue sky  
5 flooding, or flooding that will occur due to rising  
6 tides. Ah, and so New York City needs its own plan  
7 that will either complement the federal government's  
8 plan, if the federal government ever asks, or will  
9 step in, um, act where the federal government won't.  
10 And so a few ways that we think you could strengthen  
11 the bill. First, ah, resiliency planning is  
12 obviously very complex and the people in communities  
13 know exactly where they are vulnerable. They know  
14 where flooding happens regardless. They know, um,  
15 where the solutions might be and what those solutions  
16 might be, and would be able to push for those. Ah,  
17 so we think there needs to be not just community  
18 participation, but community leadership in devising  
19 these plans, and we hope the bill would set forth a  
20 framework to allow for that. And, as general  
21 community engagement doesn't also, doesn't always  
22 result in equitable participation, um, we think that  
23 there should be a racial equity guideline spelled out  
24 in the bill. Um, now obviously some, a lot of  
25 planning has taken place. EDC talked about it today.  
Ah, southern Manhattan has gotten the, the lopsided

3 majority of that planning and, ah, and some of it is  
4 great planning. We just want this study to, and  
5 resources of this study to go to places where there  
6 hasn't been that type of plan. So I hope that the  
7 efforts that have already been done would not be  
8 duplicated but that they can be incorporated. Um,  
9 and that includes all the studies that EDC is doing  
10 of its...

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

12 MICHAEL DULONG: ...what the city owns.

13 Ah, I just have two more things to say, if that's all  
14 right.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Go ahead, Michael.

16 MICHAEL DULONG: Um, and so of the one-  
17 third of the city that's owned privately, we're  
18 already seeing developers, ah, want to put in their  
19 own piecemeal, um, structures. So I'm speaking  
20 specifically about the Two Trees, the Ring Project in  
21 Williamsburg. Um, we haven't taken a position on  
22 that, but we want, if we're going to build in the  
23 waters we want to build one time, we want to get it  
24 right, and we want to protect the communities, not  
25 just some buildings. So we do need a plan for that  
other third. And the last, of course we appreciate

3 and support the living shorelines or the preference  
4 for living shorelines, um, as the best way to protect  
5 communities, protect ecology. One point, um, that  
6 we're concerned about is that we cannot build  
7 ourselves out of this problem completely, and there  
8 will be some need for strategic retreat. We hope  
9 that the report and the study will be able to  
10 identify those areas, identify where that might be  
11 necessary as a potential solution so that we can have  
12 those on paper and actual begin those conversations.  
13 So thank you very much, ah, and we support the bill  
14 and we appreciate your, ah, your support for the  
15 study.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you, Michael.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you very much.

18 Ah, at this point Mr. Dulong was our last registered  
19 speaker. If we have inadvertently missed anyone who  
20 has registered to testify today and has yet to have  
21 been called, please use the Zoom raise hand function  
22 and you'll be called in the order that your has been  
23 raised. Seeing none, I will turn it over, ah, back  
24 over to Chair Brannan and Chair Vallone to make any  
25 closing remarks and to adjourn the hearing.

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Kris.

4 Um, yeah, I, I, you know, I think this, I think we  
5 learned a lot today. I think we got a lot of ideas  
6 for stuff we need to do to hold folks accountable,  
7 um, and again, um, you know, we shouldn't have to  
8 wait for these hearings to get updates that aren't,  
9 um, as satisfactory as we'd like to hear. Um, I  
10 certainly, um, would hope that the agencies share our  
11 urgency a little bit more. Um, you know, Earth Day  
12 is great, but Earth Day is every day. Um, time is  
13 not on our side here in any of these projects and  
14 thinking really about communities that are on the  
15 front lines of, ah, extreme weather is what keeps us  
16 up at night, um, and I, I do think that some more  
17 reporting would help, ah, as far as accountability is  
18 concerned on some of these updates. I think today  
19 some of the agencies were not nearly as prepared as  
20 they should have been. Unfortunately, that's not new  
21 with some of these hearings, but we don't let that  
22 discourage us. We let that inspire us to do better,  
23 to come up with some legislation to hold these folks  
24 accountable. So, um, but I'll, I'll turn it over to,  
25 ah, to Chair Vallone for some closing remarks. But

3 thank you, ah, Kris, and all the committee, ah, who  
4 worked hard behind the scenes to make this possible.

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: That's right. Kris  
6 and the team, this was a flawless hearing. So thank  
7 you. And like Chair Brannan said, ah, especially for  
8 the advocates who waited to the end, I still see you  
9 there, Michael and Sarah, and some of the folks. Ah,  
10 your, your advice and words are, do hit home and we  
11 do include, you'll see in the bills right after this,  
12 Justin and the team and I are already working  
13 together on that, and that's why these surveys and  
14 data are so important to put into legislation because  
15 if one thing we've learned over the last eight years  
16 together if, if we don't we get answers like today.  
17 So we have to put the bills in and we have to mandate  
18 it, and, ah, I, I see already what my question for  
19 the administration is gonna be next week on the  
20 capital, it's gonna be prioritizing this 700 million  
21 dollars that's already been identified for shorefront  
22 capital repairs that has yet to be done. So if we're  
23 really gonna put a stamp on a green future for New  
24 York City it's got to be in the budget. We can do  
25 all the studies in the world we want, but if we don't  
fund it it's not gonna happen. So, um, I thank

3 everyone for that. I thank everyone for today's  
4 hearing, and I think Justin and I together, um, after  
5 celebrating Earth Day, like you said, every day is  
6 Earth Day, so with that I think we'll bring our  
7 hearing to a close. And on behalf of Chair Brannan  
8 and I, myself, thank you, God bless everyone.

9 [gavel]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 12, 2021