

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES  
  
Of the  
  
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

FEBRUARY 10, 2021  
Start: 10:07 A.M.  
Recess: 01:03 P.M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 2)

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: FERNANDO CABRERA  
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH  
RUBEN DIAZ, SR.  
ROBERT F. HOLDEN  
PETER A. KOO  
STEPHEN T. LEVIN  
MARK LEVINE  
CARLOS MENCHACA  
I. DANEEK MILLER  
ANTONIO REYNOSO  
DEBORAH L. ROSE  
COREY JOHNSON, COUNCIL  
SPEAKER  
  
BRAD LANDER

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

PAT FOYE: MTA Chairman and CEO

BOB FORAN: MTA Chief Financial Officer

SARAH FEINBERG: Interim President of NYC  
Transit

ALPHECCA MUTTARDY: Macro-Economist with  
Coalition for National Infrastructure Bank

STANLEY FORCZAK: Coalition for a National  
Infrastructure Bank

JOSE DEJESUS

MARK HENRY: President and Business Agent  
for local 1056, Chair of State Conference  
Board

LISA DAGLIAN: Executive Director of  
Permanent Citizens Advisor Committee to MTA

COLIN WRIGHT

ERIC MCCLURE

LEO ASEN: Volunteer and President AARP New  
York

H.P. SCHROER: WWII Veteran, Director  
YOUMEWE

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

CARLOS CASTELL CROKE: Association of New  
York City Programs at New York League of  
Conservation Voters

TANYA CRUZ

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

4

2 SGT. LUGO: Okay live feed is up. Sgt.  
3 Hope if you could start the PC recording.

4 SGT. HOPE: PC recording rolling.

5 SGT. LUGO: Cloud is rolling.

6 SGT. LEONARDO: Backup is rolling.

7 SGT. LUGO: Thank you. Sgt. Leonardo, you  
8 may take it away with the opening.

9 SGT. LEONARDO: Thank you very much.

10 KEVIN KOTOWSKI: Live streaming is up,  
11 you may begin.

12 SGT. LEONARDO: (Sound is garbled, unable  
13 to hear.)

14 SGT. LUGO: Okay, good morning everyone.  
15 Welcome to today's remote New York City Council  
16 Hearing of the Committee on Transportation. At this  
17 time, would all panelists please turn on your video?  
18 To minimize disruption, please place electronic  
19 devices to vibrate or silent. If you wish to submit  
20 testimony, you may do so at

21 [testimony@council.NYC.gov](mailto:testimony@council.NYC.gov), again, that's

22 [testimony@council.NYC.gov](mailto:testimony@council.NYC.gov). Thank you for your  
23 cooperation. Chair Rodriguez we are ready to begin.

24 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
25 Sgt. Hello and good morning. Thank you all for

joining the Committee on Transportation of a side hearing focusing on the MTA in the era of COVID-19. First, I am going to turn it over to the, to our Committee Counsel and Moderator to go over some procedure items.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair. I am Elliot Glen Counsel to the Transportation Committee of the New York City Council. Before we begin, I just want to remind everyone that you will be on mute until you are called on to testify, at which time you will be unmuted by the host. Please listen for your name to be called. I will periodically announce who the next panelists will be. The first panelists will be from the MTA, Chairman and CEO, Pat Foye, Chief Financial Officer Bob Foran and interim President of New York City Transit, Sarah Feinberg. During the hearing if Council Members would like to ask a question, please use the Zoom Raise Hand Function and the Chair or I will call on you in order. We will be limiting Council Member questions to five minutes. Please also note that for ease of this virtual hearing, we will not be allowing a second round of questioning. Thank you. Um, Chair Rodriguez.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Elliot. I would like now to turn it over to our Council Speaker, Corey Johnson for his opening remarks.

COREY JOHNSON: Um, good morning and thank you all for being here today and I want to thank you Chair Rodriguez for holding this hearing. Um, before I get to my remarks, I want to say that I think we have been joined by Council Members Koo, Lander, Cabrera, Holden, Menchaca, Council Member Diaz and I apologize, um, Council Member Rose as well. Um, good morning. Thank you all for being here. I want to start off by recognizing the MTA workers who have kept this City moving under unimaginable circumstances, never one letting the system fully shut down but it does not come without a cost. We have lost 136 transit workers due to COVID-19, 136. I want to take a moment of silence for all of them and their dedication to our City. (Silence). Thank you. I am glad to see that we have a great line-up today from the MTA, um, Pat Foye, Sarah Feinberg and Bob Foran (clearing throat). Pat, I know your schedule um, must be crazy these days, I know you've been working with the unions, the agency Presidents

(coughs), er, excuse me and the Board and um, getting money from the Federal Government. Um, you have done some incredible work under some of the most difficult circumstances in the history of the agency. I do of course have some policy disagreements with the MTA and we will get to those, but I, I want to start off by saying thank you, thank you to your team, thank you to all the workers at the MTA who have done so much during these difficult times. We appreciate all of the work that has been done and I think it is really a testament to the commitment, your commitment to public service, um, that you all have stuck this out in your positions during this pandemic, having stability and institutional knowledge during a crisis is really invaluable. I think it has made a real difference for riders and with MTA employees and I know these jobs aren't easy, even in the best of times, so, we owe everyone at the MTA who has stuck through this a debt of gratitude. The last time the MTA was here for an oversight hearing, we talked about the new Capital Plan, how expansive, um, how an expansive 24/7 subway system is to the drive, to the is, u- the driver of our economy. How it is critical to New York status as the greatest City in the world

and how if it fails, so does New York. I know we are in the midst of an enormous crisis; hopefully the worst any of us will ever experience at every level of Government we have had to make difficult, painful choices, so I can understand why service was limited back in March but a lot has changed since then. We know much more about how the virus is transmitted. We've lifted many of the lockdown restrictions that we had in the spring. We've vaccinated hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers but as the rest of the City is moving forward and starting our recovery, we want to make sure that the MTA is doing the same. I, I, - um, I want to make sure that we are not compounding the inequities that made this pandemic so devastating to New York City, proposing fare hikes and service cuts, keeping the subway system closed overnight. Those are not solutions to our problems. They will make it harder for us to recover and if the City doesn't bounce back, the MTAs finances will only get worse. We need to be able to show residents and businesses and tourists that we are back. We need the tax dollars that come from having a fully functioning economy. The survival of the MTA depends on it. So, I am a little frustrated that our recovery



has been hobbled a bit by us wanting to get the MTA up and running in a full-force way. We are asking businesses to stay in New York. To keep their doors open but we are forcing many of our most vulnerable workers to spend hours a day finding alternative transportation. We have 24 hour vaccination sites in New York City but we do not have 24 hour subway service. For the noble purpose that someone says, um, some are saying I'm forcing the homeless out into the cold night after night. I think you all know my preference is eventually to have the City take the subway system back, to have the City run the subway and busses again. I know that it is a much taller order now with our current financial picture, but the fact that we as a City are at odds, um, with an agency that serves millions of New Yorkers everyday on such an important policy matter and is a key tool to our recovery. I don't know how we can continue down the same road. Of course, once again, the City is going to be asked to open up its-, open up our wallet as we should be wanting to make sure that we have meaningful ability to influence the way the MTA operates, its plan and its budget. I want to be optimistic about New York's future. I am optimistic.

I want to believe that we will bounce back from this and be better than ever and I believe we will but we need to make sure that the MTA is a meaningful partner in this. We are in for some dark days ahead and we want to make sure that are partnered together to get it done. So, again I want to thank you all for being here. I want to thank all the workers at the MTA for the job they have done during these difficult days. I want to thank you Pat and Sarah and Bob for, I know a really, really difficult year under tremendously difficult circumstances and I appreciate you being here this morning to talk about the MTA and its recovery during this time of COVID. I have some questions of congestion pricing of a 24/7 service, about homeless New Yorkers and about the capital plan that I will get in to later but with that I want to turn it back over to Chair Rodriguez for his opening statement. Thank you again for being here today.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Speaker for your support. The Committee that I have an honor to serve under your leadership and for all the contributions that you make in our City. Good morning everyone. Today, the Committee on

Transportation convenes remotely to hold these very important at this time hearing on the MTA. Before we begin, I would like to extend my thanks and appreciation as the Speaker said to all of the MTA employees that kept our transit system running during one of the worst pandemics that our City and our Nation and the World has ever experienced. To the families of the MTA employees who lost their battle again COVID-19, I extend my sincere condolences. The sacrifice will never be forgotten. I would like to welcome Quemuel Arroyo, I know that he would play an important role as an MTA Chief Accessibility Officer together with the Chair of the MTA, Bob Foran. I know they will work hard together with all of us to make our, all train stations in New York City accessible. Prior to the COVID-19 pandemic, average New York City Transit weekday ridership reached more than \$7 million and it was one of the few public transportation system in the world that runs 24 hours a day on every day of the year. Stay at home orders of COVID two state area led to a stiff ridership decline of as much as 19% at one point on the New York City Transit system, the Long Island Railroad and the Metro North Railroad. Recent information

from the MTA show that the ridership is still down across the transit systems. A recent report project, that project that MTA ridership may not reach 80% of its pre-pandemic levels again at least until the year 2024. The impact that the COVID-19 pandemic has had on the operations of the MTA has been harsh and alarming. The COVID-19 pandemic also led the MTA to shut down overnight subway service in the City between 1 a.m. and 5 a.m. and based on their argument to clean and disinfect trains, equipment and station. The shutdown impacted predominantly low income, immigrant workers who did not have the luxury of working from home. They didn't have the luxury to go and re-locate or they have somebody as some people. It is my hope that during today's hearing the MTA will give us an update as to when overnight subway service will be fully restored in the City. Same as yet, they have not given us a time for restoration. To say that a train would continue being shut down until we are dealing with the pandemic is unacceptable. The COVID-19 pandemic and ensuring decline ridership also had a major impact on the MTAs budget. Even with the Federal Aid that they received last year, the MTA faced significant budget deficits.

Without further support from the State and Federal Government, the MTA may be forced to further increase payer cuts to service or apps. This scenario is unacceptable and time for our State and Federal officials to provide more financial relief so that our public transit system can continue to efficiently serve the transit rider in our City, in our State and as everyone knows this large public transportation is important to the economy of the whole nation but everyone knows that many of the riders are working class, immigrants, New Yorkers, visitors, that Federal Government must act quickly to improve congestion pricing, a crucial source of revenue for the capital plan. Today, I also would like to hear what MTA is doing to increase safety in our subway system, particularly during COVID-19 pandemic as there has been a recent increase in incidents against transit riders and workers. We also hope that the MTA is able to disclose some details in the current status regarding the Council's Zoning for Transit Accessibility Proposal. Finally, I would like to hear how the MTA is working with all the City agencies to serve our homeless population and how transitioning from using the NYPD to utilizing social

workers in the subway can insure our most vulnerable New Yorkers are receiving the support they need. Being poor is not a crime. It is a social and societal problem and we cannot criminalize the homeless at a time when many New Yorkers are going through another crisis. You ask, pertinent to your report, that one of the ways the MTA tried to solve the homeless crisis in our City was by removing benches from subway station platforms. It was completely unacceptable that MTA removed the benches from the train stations. I hope and I know that with the leadership those benches should be restored and we should have a clear explanation why that happened. Over 1 million New Yorkers who have disability and other physical challenges, need these spots to be able to rest, so they are not important only for the homeless population, they are important to 1 million New Yorkers with physical challenges and many others who are visitors in our City. The MTA had to work at outside City agencies to connect homeless individuals with safe housing rather than kicking them out of our subways and leaving them outside in the freezing cold. I hope the authority will address these in the morning today. Before we hear from the MTA, I would

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

15

2 now have our moderator and committee counsel  
3 recognize members that are in attendance with us  
4 today and to administer the oath to the officials  
5 that are here to testify.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL, ELLIOT GLEN: Thank  
7 you Chair, I will now call on the following panelists  
8 to testify Pat Foye, Bob Foran and Sarah Feinberg. I  
9 will now read the affirmation and then I will call on  
10 each of you to confirm your response aloud for the  
11 record. Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm  
12 to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but  
13 the truth in your testimony before this Committee and  
14 to respond honestly to Council Member questions?  
15 Chairman Foye?

16 PAT FOYE: Yes.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL, ELLIOT GLEN: Mr.  
18 Foran.

19 BOB FORAN: Yes.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL, ELLIOT GLEN:  
21 President Feinberg.

22 SARAH FEINBERG: Yes.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL, ELLIOT GLEN: Thank  
24 you, you may begin your testimony when ready.

25

PAT FOYE: Um, Speaker Johnson and Chair Rodriguez, good morning. Um, thank you for inviting us today. Um, I am Pat Foye, MTA Chairman and CEO. I am joined by my colleagues, Bob Foran, Chief Financial Officer in the MTA and Sarah Feinberg, Interim President of New York City Transit. Um, before I begin I would like to thank Speaker Johnson and Chair Rodriguez both for the invitation and for their advocacy on behalf of the MTA. I also want to thank Speaker Johnson personally for his introduction to the newly confirmed Secretary of Transportation. And Chair Rodriguez your regular appearances at our board meetings and repeated calls for Federal Funding are much appreciated. Since we last appeared before the Council in May of 2020 at the height of the pandemic, much has changed. The COVID-19 virus has wreaked havoc on our agency, on both our personal and financial level. Its impact on our budget surpasses that of even the Great Depression and the all too real human cost has been steep. To date, we have tragically lost more than 140 of our colleagues. We will never forget their service and dedication and the heroism that every transit worker at subways, busses, power transit, Staten Island Rail, Long



Island Railroad, Metro North and bridges and tunnels has in carrying New York City and the region throughout the pandemic. Despite these immense challenges, the hard working and heroic MTA work forces kept the City moving for essential workers and first responders during the height of the crisis and now during the recovery. All the while our agencies have continued to show improvements of on time performance and other metrics with 88.6% of subway trains operating on time last year. The highest on-time performance in recent history. On buses, the average extra time customers sat about decreased by 46 seconds on a 12-month average basis and the equivalent metric measuring on-time performance increased by 5 percentage point, so over 77%. This progress was greatly helped by the City's installation of over 16 new miles of bus lanes and bus routes, we are proud of the success and hope to see New York City Department of Transportation implement the rest of the 60 miles of bus lanes that Sarah Feinberg requested for the past summer. I have spoken with Commissioner Hank Gutman who I have known for a long time and we all look forward to working with him and his team on this and other matters. For

our part, we are doing everything we can to maintain and expand of these improvements and performances while prioritizing safety of our customers and employees at every turn. Throughout this once in a hundred year crisis, the MTA has been an industry leader in pandemic protocols. Working in watch step with top Federal, State and Local authorities would back our response and protect customers and our dedicated employees. That starts with our Universal Mask Mandate launched back in April and our unparallel around the clock disinfecting program which 70, over 75% of riders surveyed said they strongly approve in a recent customer survey. Complimenting these efforts are innovative new pilots and studies in fields ranging from air filtration systems to understanding the fluid dynamics of aerosols. We then powered riders by providing real time capacity tracking on busses and its uni-rails to help promote social distancing. PPE (Personal Protective Equipment) vending machines have been installed at select stations along with mask dispensaries on buses and hand sanitizer pumps system wide and we created the regional mask force, distributing more than 6 million masks to customers who need them. Many of

you and your colleagues have joined us for mask enforced events and we greatly appreciate your support, especially Speaker Johnson, Chair Rodriguez, Council Member Miller and Council Member Levine. When it comes to managing the spread of COVID-19 among our workforce we were the first transit agency in the nation to stand up for our own on-site testing program and now we are looking to expand it with coronavirus vaccines but like the rest of the nation the MTA is severely limited by the strained levels of available vaccines. We want to get as many of our workers inoculated as possible, especially our women and men on the front lines; however, availability of supplies from the Federal Government must improve first. The efforts of our heroic workers demand nothing less. In the meantime, safety remains our number one priority as we continue taking action to protect the health and well-being of our customers and workforce. We are also focused on ensuring security of our system. Most concerningly in recent weeks we have seen a string of high-profile attacks on customers and members our workforce. This is appalling and unacceptable. The MTA is already proposing to strengthen state laws protecting

employees against spitting and other incidents and assaults but what we really need is additional robust support from our partners at the NYPD, and additional mental health resources from the City of New York.

We have been in close contact with the New Transit Bureau Chief, Kathleen O'Reilly and are encouraged by her commitment to address these issues and increase police presence across the system. The bottom line is we need customers to feel safe throughout the system so that they will return as the City re-opens.

The MTAs finances will not be able to recover without, before COVIDs fair revenue generated fully \$6 billion for our operations. Our ridership declines over the past 11 months are well documented.

Today, we are serving roughly 30% of our pre-COVID customer base on the subways and approximately 50% on buses. Never in the MTAs history, including the great depression have had had we ever experienced such a sustained drop in ridership and subsequent fair revenue on which we depend. With no option for operating relief from the City and State which are also struggling financially we have had to rely on the Federal Government to stay afloat. The MTA received roughly \$8 billion in emergency aid last

year between the CARES Act in March and the latest COVID Relief Bill passed in December. Additionally, we were in December able to borrow another \$2.9 billion through the Federal Reserve's Municipal Equities Facility. These funds have been a critical lifeline for the MTA and will help us get through 2021 while avoiding severe budget driving cuts to service and thousands of lay-offs. We are grateful to Senate Majority Leader Schumer, Speaker Pelosi and the Bi-Partisan New York Delegation for their hard work and support, but to be clear, we are not out of the woods yet. We are still forecasting substantial out year deficits through 2024. At our Board Meeting later this month, we will consider total policy proposals after deciding in January to delay a scheduled delay on fare increases. We recognize that so many of our customers are suffering financially as a result of the pandemic and we do not want to exacerbate the economic impact of this crisis, especially for essential workers, low income residents and communities of color that rely on us. Without question it's the right thing to do but those actions will have an impact on our worry extremely fragile budget. Internally we have undertaken our

own expensive cost cutting measures. We are projected to save an additional \$601 million in 2021 through significant reductions in overtime, major cuts in the use of consultants and other non-personnel expense productions. It is a fraction of what is needed to address a lingering impact for the pandemic. Simply put we will need a billion more in additional federal relief to get us through the next few years. Thankfully, there was reason to be optimistic on that front. Recent report indicate that Senator Schumer expects that the next COVID Relief Package will include at least \$30 billion for mass transit nationals with a significant earmarked for the MTA. We are looking forward to continuing to work with him, Speaker Pelosi, Newly Confirmed Transportation Secretary Buttigieg and the Biden Administration to protect the MTA. We have long-said that this is a national crisis that requires a national solution. Beyond covering operating costs, Federal support and health fund transformative and necessary Capital projects that will strengthen our system for decades to come like those outlined in our historic 2020 to 2024 Capital Program. The installation of modern signaling on six subway lines,

70 new ADA accessible stations, eastside access, Penn Station access and second avenue subway phase II but the Capital Plan has been largely put on hold as a result of the pandemic and the result international crisis. The Biden Administration, the Transit Friendly Biden Administration can help us recovery by accelerating the central business district tolling program which was needlessly and cynically delayed by the prior administration. The Central Business District Tolling program will help her leverage \$15 billion for our five year capital plan. In additional, Governor Cuomo followed through on the state's commitment by including a \$3 billion capital contribution to our Capital Plan in this year's State Budget Repulsion. We hope and expect that the City of New York will definitively confirm its \$3 million share. These commitments together represent from the State and City represent approximately 12% of the 2020 to 2024 Capital Program and will fund key projects and others I mentioned a moment ago. We are eager to pursue these critical projects for our City customers as soon as possible. One thing we know is that when we will get past this global public health crisis and it is important that when we do our system

is not in a state of disrepair. It's why it is so important that the City serve as our partner and meet its commitment toward the Capital Plan. Over the last year MTA construction and development has proven that it can advance key projects with the new funding constraints, thanks in a large part to the leadership of Janno Lieber. In 2020, we accelerated \$2 billion in capital work and leverage and took advantage of low ridership to work efficiently at delivering improvements for our customers. To name a few examples, we opened a stunning new entrance at Penn Station for subway and Long Island Railroad customers which for the first time in decades gave Penn a physical identity. We completed the rollout of the Omni Fare Payment System on subways and buses by the end of 2020, installed new elevators at 11 stations system wide, finished the L-train project on time and on budget and implemented positive train control on both commuter railroads by the Federal deadline. Additionally, we look forward to the Council's support and partnership on the soon-to-be rolled out Zoning for Transit Accessibility Proposal. This citywide zoning text amendment would provide an avenue for more private funding of ADA improvements,



freeing up capital funding that could be allocated to additional accessibility projects, improving accessibility across the system at every borough is a top priority. Last week we announcing the hiring of Quemuel Arroyo as the MTAs first ever all agency Chief Accessibility Officer. I know you were all familiar with Q. He served in a similar capacity for the New York City Department of Transportation. He knows the City and is respected for his work on behalf of those with disabilities. We are really excited to welcome Q aboard. We want to build on the successes on outlead- or outlined here as much as possible to bring a system into the 21<sup>st</sup> Century. As you all know, a robust MTA is the great equalizer in New York and the Shotoni arm New York City needs to lead his economic recovery and frankly that of the nation. We are eager to work with you and our partners at every level of government to make this happen. We are happy to take your questions. Thank you.

CHAIR YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Speaker, do you have questions?

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes, um, thank you Chair, thank you Pat for your testimony. I, I

want to start by talking about overnight service. I touched on this briefly during my opening but I really, hammer home the real human impact that this is causing. You know that this is a 24/7 city slowed down during the pandemic but we didn't stop. Our hospitals didn't close from 1 a.m. to 5 a.m., um, we didn't wait to stock grocery store shelves, first responders are always on call, essential workers need to be there no matter what and I think it is clear that line-share of this work is being done by communities of color. Not only are they dealing with the threat of COVID every day but we are in many instances keeping them away from their families longer when the system shuts down. I think we are making it harder than it needs to be. So, I want to see if you agree with any of that and if you have overnight progress as an out-size impact on communities of color.

PAT FOYE: So Speaker, I, I think our um, I think we are in much lock step on this issue and let me explain the si-. Throughout the pandemic from the first day we've been driven by minimizing public health risk to our customers and our employees. That has been, is and will continue to be

job 1. The advice that still, um, pertains from the FTA and the CDC and I will read a brief quote, um, from the EPA, it issued frankly a couple of days ago this week is that significant disinfecting of transit properties across the country first is, is recommended by the FTA and the CDC to protect the public health of customers and employees. That continues to be the case. We, we take that direction serious. The reason for the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. closure which we began on May 6 with great reluctance and look forward to the day we return New York City to 24 hour subway service was driven by public health concerns and continues to be driven by public health concerns. Before I note what our customers think, I, I do want to read the advice that we got from the EPA literally Speaker, a couple of days ago. Dr. Shawn Ryan who is director US EPAs Homeland Security Program says surfaces are still recognized as a root for exposure to the virus. There in addition to social distances and wearing of mask or face covering to reduce exposure to aerosolized virus. Current CDC and EPA guidance suggest frequent handwashing as well as cleaning and disinfecting surfaces that are frequently touched by many people. That guidance is

echoed by the CDC and the FTA and frankly their counterparts across the world. High-touch surfaces on subway stations and in subway cars require multiple disinfecting during the day and the only way that we are able to accomplish that is by the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. closure because it is far more efficient to do these disinfecting regimen when there aren't customers on subway platforms and subway stations and to be able to continue to tell our customers that we are doing everything that we can to minimize health risks. I will also note that in a survey, um, that the MTA did of its customers, um, in English and all the titled six languages, over 75% of our customers strongly agree that the stations are dramatically cleaner than they were before May 6 and that they've never seen subway stations and subway cars as clean as they are.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you Pat for reading the guidance, um, from the EPA and from the CDC. I, I do think that it is pretty clear at this point that the primary focus on transmission is on aerosol transmission not surface transmission, though again we want to make sure that we are careful. I, just want to, um, ask you that even if we need to

maintain some enhanced cleaning protocols, we shouldn't, you know need to close the system and leave riders stranded. Other cities like Chicago have managed to clean their transit systems without sacrificing service, so have you, have you talked to other major transit systems across the country like the transit system in Chicago to see how they've managed, um, to continue to clean without sacrificing service?

PAT FOYE: Um, we have Speaker. Um, we've also talked to T, TLF, um, which closed its night to underground service same thing, with respect to NTR and Hong Kong, um, Toronto Transit um Tradition as well. CTA is running a, a couple, actually two of its eight lines, the others are closed, um, overnight, closing is the case that MBTA, Washington, Philadelphia, San Francisco and others across the system. Um, we take the FTC and the CDCs guidance um, we take it quite seriously. Um, we are doing multiple disinfecting a day of subway stations, subway cars, same with respect with Metro North and Long Island Railroad and we are going to continue that. I think that I doing this business, I think you are quite right speaker that aerosols have been

identified as the primary source but the guidance from public health officials in the United States and across the world continue to be that surface or transmission to series that has to be addressed. Our customers frankly demand it.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Do you think that um, if we continue to, um keep saying that these cleanings are essential it is eventually going to be harder to convince people that it is safe to come back to the trains when you stop these enhanced, um cleanings?

PAT FOYE: So speaker, with all due respect, I think it is quite untrue, I think the existence of the cleaning and the 76% of our customers that strongly agree that the disinfecting has made the subway cars and the stations cleaner than they've ever been. I, I don't know what the disinfecting regimen, because no one knows. I don't know what the disinfecting regimen is going to be required in 2022, or '23 or '24. Here's what I'm certain about speaker that no system in the United States or around the world will be cleaning at the level it was doing in 2019 in perfect good faith in accordance with the regulations. So stepped up

disinfecting and the latest advances in terms of filters and dealing with aerosols and dealing with surface, um, transmission of our customers and customers across the country and the world will be seeing that. We are not going back to 2019.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, um, I want to just again continue on this, you know we are, the #1 priority of the City and State should be and I think is getting a many New Yorkers vaccinated as quickly as possible. You talked about the MTA of course is making, trying to ensure that its employees, especially the ones that are on the frontline are getting those inoculations. That's the only way that we are going to get out of this crisis. Once we have a decent supply line, um, we are not going to hit our goals unless we are vaccinating 24 hours a day and we can set up all the 24 hour sites that we want but if they only serve people who live close enough to work or who can afford to take a car, it's going to be hard for us to make the progress that we need fast enough and if we don't get New Yorkers vaccinated, you know it's this vicious cycle of not being able to fully reopen and our economy back on track, so with that being said, do you have a

target date for when you want the MTA to bring  
overnight service back?

PAT FOYE: Sure, um, speaker, let me  
address the vaccination issue. Obviously, Federal  
supply and distribution continues to be an issue.  
Um, I'm happy to report that we have arranged  
vaccinations for over 6,000 of our employees, our  
employees are smart and savvy and frankly if there  
was additional doses available that number would be  
much higher. Um, at this point we've also given  
diagnostic tests ruled out 32,000 of our employees.  
Speaker, with respect to when, I think the answer to  
that continues to be when the Governor declares the  
pandemic over and lifts the stay of emergency, um, we  
will probably move to return um the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m.,  
um, service and we look forward to, to, to, to, to  
that day coming as early as possible.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And what metrics  
or milestones will be used to determine that? It is  
just the emergency being over or are there other  
metrics and milestones like infection rate,  
hospitalization rate? You know say it comes down  
when um, vaccinations go up significantly and we are  
below 3%, do ours? You know whatever the number is,



what are the metrics and milestones that we use besides when the pandemic is over for us to be able to safely re-open?

PAT FOYE: So, so speaker, um, I, I know what I know and I know the many things that I don't know and I'm not going to express it with you on that, I'm going to leave that to the Federal CDC, to the Governor, to Dr. Zucker of the State Health Department but we've, we've been clear from the beginning, we close for 1 a.m. to 5 a.m., with great reluctance. We are aware acutely of the inconvenience that it causes for many of our customers, essential workers, first responders, women and men in communities of color, but, but, but that decision will be made at the State and Federal level and not by the MTA.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I think it would be helpful if there were some public verifiable metrics and milestones for returning to overnight subway service, just for the public to understand how we make these decisions.

PAT FOYE: Well, I, I can't, Speaker, I suggest that the clarity of the Governor declaring the pandemic over and lifting the State of Emergency

which will be happy days, um, and look forward, I can envision crowds in Times Squares and other parts, of Barclay's arena and other parts around the City celebrating that, um, but I think that's going to be, the Governor's declaration of lifting the, the State of Emergency I think will be, will be quite clear at that point.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And one of my concerns is that the longer that we wait, the less likely that it is that we will ever get the service back. Have there been discussions, any discussions about permanently ending overnight service?

PAT FOYE: No, and in short no.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, we will eventually at some point get 24 hour service back?

PAT FOYE: The answer is absolutely and we are looking forward to doing that as soon as possible.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, I have a lot more questions but I am not going to get to them all, um, because there are a lot of Council Members that have questions so I want to um, just try to be quick on that. I have a bunch of questions on homelessness, I am not going to go in to all of them

but I want to say, you know, there was the issue last week or over the weekend related to the Tweet from New York City transit and I think Chair Rodriquez, um, mentioned this in his opening statement related to benches being removed to "prevent homeless people from sleeping on them." I just want to see, what, what happened there and if that was why benches were being removed?

PAT FOYE: Well, the, the, short answer to that question i-, i-, is no, that's not why the benches were removed but I'll, I'll ask Sarah Feinberg to, to speak of what was done in that, um, station.

SARAH FEINBERG: Thanks Pat and thank you, um, Mr. Speaker. In the, I see you are referring to the 23<sup>rd</sup> Street Station on the F-line.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

SARAH FEINBERG: We did remove some benches there, um, and have sense replaced two of the benches there. Um, we, u removed the benches and cleaned and sanitized them and then put new ones in, um, and I'm happy to go in to that more if you need to.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yeah, I just want to make sure that we are not, you know homelessness is of course, um, a very serious problem in the City. I know Pat you mentioned in your opening statement about needing greater coordination support from the City as it relates to mental health providers and social workers, to partner with the MTA to get people that the help, to get people the help that they need. We know this is a complex issue. We know that we have a record number of homeless people in New York City and the vast majority of homeless people are not even people that you are seeing on the trains or on the street, its families or children that are in homeless shelters across New York City. The people that you are seeing out there that are chronically homeless are some of the folks that are really suffering the most and I don't want to generalize but I will say you know, a good number of them have untreated mental health issues and they need the help that, that they need to get through that. Many of them have substance um, use issues, and they need help there as well and we want to make sure that they get that but I want to make sure that we are not being cruel in any way in creating policies that put

people out in the cold, um, during these difficult times with a record number of people in the shelter system that, um, we are not doing things that are kicking people out in these hard days and hard months, um, just for the purpose of not having homeless people on the subways and so I just wanted to see if you could talk a little bit about that because we do not want to be punitive, um, toward homeless individuals who are really, really struggling right now. We want to be compassionate towards them to make sure that they get the help that they need and I think there are of course, many, many advocates and elected officials who are worried that some of these actions that are being taken are being taken for punitive reasons, and I don't mean punitive to, um, you know to try to hurt homeless people, I mean since there aren't these holistic solutions in place, instead of doing the hard work involved, it is easier just to sort of shut the trains down or, or kick people off and get the on the streets and we know that this compounds the problem for many homeless, struggling New Yorkers.

SARAH FEINBERG: So, Speaker Johnson, you're, I cannot tell you, you are preaching to the

choir. Before I even became President of New York City Transit this was something that I was relentless about when I was sitting on the Board. I have called on the City. I have begged for help from the City to give us more, to send more mental health assistance to many of the folks who are in our system. We have begged the City to use to allow us to use the 3-1-1 system so the people in our system can all 3-1-1 and report an issue that they are seeing someone who needs mental health intervention, someone who needs a substance abuse intervention, someone who seems to be a danger to themselves or others. I have asked certainly for more people t-, you know more resources to come in to our system. Right now the City doesn't let substance abuse or mental health specialists come in to our system and help people. We are ground zero for folks who are having a mental health crisis and frankly we are not necessarily ground zero for a homelessness crisis. We don't ask people there, you know, their housing situation when we are dealing with you an emotional disturbed person or someone who is in the middle of a crisis. We are just dealing with the moment that we are in and trying to solve for that and so, there is, I can tell you no policy

that is punitive towards those who are experiencing homelessness or frankly even those who are experiencing a mental health crisis. If there is anything that we've done over the last year it's just beg for more help and so I see this as a place where we can work closely with you and some of your colleagues, you know, there absolutely needs to be more resources thrown at mental health. We are absolutely happy to partner. We have to be a system that focuses on moving people. Even in the heights of this pandemic we were moving essential workers day and night. You know, we are moving 3 million people a day now, which is more than any, you know public transit agency in the country. And our focus has to be delivering those folks safely and efficiently to where they are going. That is all we can do at this point. You know, it is already a big task so when we, when the, when, when social services fall to us as well, it is just too much for one agency to handle and, you know so I would love to be able to do it all but we can't but we would love to work with you s-, an-, and your colleagues so that we can help make a dent here, but you know we have begged for help and we, we continue to need it.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And then lastly, I want to, um, I'm sure there are a lot of questions on 24/7 service and homelessness that members will get to. Um, Pat, you mentioned it in your opening. I was happy to try to do my best to connect you with Secretary um, Buttigieg about um, the MTAs needs, um, and especially on congestion pricing which the hope is to eventually be able to get \$15 billion in funds related to the MTA capital program, um, related to the revenue that could come in on congestion pricing, um, you know I sent the letter a couple of weeks ago to Secretary Buttigieg asking that given that Former Secretary Chou and the Trump Administration, I think very, um, um, wrongly denied us the ability to move forward on this. Do you have any updates on where are? I know you haven't connected with the new Secretary yet but given the good conversations that you've been having with the Biden folks leading in to him taking office with the New York Congressional Delegation, um, the money that Senator Schumer, Majority Leader Schumer got, the \$8 billion dollars in the two different um, plans last year for the MTA. The hope for an additional \$8 billion to get us where we need to be to cover the out years for the MTA and



given how important the congestion pricing revenue is for the capital plan, could you just give us some updates on where you think things stand and iteratively um, what you need to happen over the next few months to feel some greater security about moving forward on that to help the MTA in its planning to come out of this recovery.

PAT FOYE: Um, first speaker, thank you for the introduction and thanks for the letter of support to, um, the now Secretary, I think he was Secretary-Designee when you sent that letter. Um, that's support's incredibly helpful. Look, following the cynical years of the Trump Administration in which Central Business District Tolling which is a huge invent-, environmental positive point, it produces congestion, um, in the Central Business District throughout the entire City, improves air quality, um and funds mass transit and it was held up on the report pre-test of, they didn't know what environmental, um, road for us to go down. There's, there's much reason for us to be optimistic, obviously with the election of a pro-transit President of the United States and with Senator Schumer's ascension to the Senate Majority, uh, role.

I would also be, um, deficient if I didn't mention that the role of Commissioner, of former UDS, the New York City DOT Commissioner, her new role at the United States Department of Transportation I think is an incredibly important step. I think there is a reason to be optimistic. We have extensive discussions with the uh, with the transition team and, and are ready at the um, you know with the convenience of the Secretary and his team, um, to go down in Washington, brief them on the Central Business Tolling and get it moving as quickly as possible and you are quite that Central Business District Tolling accounts for fully 30% of the funding in the New Capital Plan, so it is a critical funding source.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And what's the timing on when you'd want some forward progress on it from this new Federal Administration, the new leadership at USDOT?

PAT FOYE: So, Speaker, the answer to that question is 18 months ago.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, as quickly as possible.

PAT FOYE: The answer is, the answer is as soon as possible. There is no reason why the Trump Administration could not have, could not have given us the direction that we, um, that we seek and um, we are looking forward to, um, you know expeditious consideration of the issues by the new team.

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, thank you all, I, I have more questions but I can't get them to. Thank you Chair Rodriguez, thank you for being here today.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Speaker. And Chairman thank you for your role, thank you for your letters and silence when they are voting. I know its big challenges. Also it's a great opportunity for the City of New York to have the leadership to run the largest transportation system, again in the whole nation and one of the larger ones in the whole world so we do appreciate your dedication to serve in transportation in previous role and the role that you have right now. Um, Bob, can you, in my belief I think that the crisis, the financial crisis of the MTA is even worse than what have been told. Can you describe what is the current financial crisis that is affecting the

agency, because it should be a responsibility for all of us who bring the support and as you describe new changes in this City having Schumer as a majority, having Polly again in DC, having the speaker in great relationship with the Chairman of the Secretary of Transportation. That's a lot that we have in place by all of us including the New York City Congressional Delegation to advocate to hear from everyone who is following the MTA. Can you describe me more details the current financial crisis of the MTA?

BOB FORAN: Certainly.

PAT FOYE: So, so Chairman, let, let me start and then I'm going to turn it over to, to Bob Foran our CFO, um and let me begin by saying this, I do want to thank you, your colleagues, and the members of the New York Congressional Delegation for your steadfast support, um, for the Cares Bill in the spring and the COVID Relief that was passed in the lame-duck session. Um, simply before turning over to Bob, our revenue sources are primarily two-fold. Um, we get roughly half of our revenue from our customers, which is um, fares and tolls. Um, fare revenue is about \$6 billion, um, and we get a similar

50% of our revenue from a package of subsidies payable to the MTA, put in place by the State Legislature over a period of decades. The, the unfortunate reality and this is a shocking fact, is that the decline in ridership and our fare revenue during the pandemic is orders of magnitude worse than it was during the Great Depression. And it, it, and the pandemic has had a similar significant negative impact on the other half of our revenue, um, that from a dedicated package of, of subsidies put in place over a period of years, um, and decades. And just to give you one fact and then I will turn it over to Bob. At the worse days of the depression, um, which started with the October 1929 stock market crash to 1933 which was the bottom of subway ridership, subway ridership was down 13% to 14%. In the worst days of the pandemic, subway ridership was down 95% and even today is down 70%. I am not going to go through all of the comparable data for all of the agencies because it, it varies from agency to agency but obviously, given our reliance on fare revenue, that has exacted a huge financial toll on the agency. With that, I will ask Bob to provide specifics.

BOB FORAN: And, thank you very much. We commissioned McKenzie to go and look at a study to see what the impact of the pandemic would be both on a ridership and therefore fare and toll revenue and also in terms of the taxes and subsidies that we receive. Um, the projection over a two-year period was that the losses were roughly mid-point about \$12 billion. So, if you realize that our budget is around \$17 billion a year, to lose \$12 billion over two years is just horrendous. We had done significant cost-cutting to try to solve it on our part. The State Legislature has given us the ability to use the lock-box monies which was to be dedicated for the Capital Program for last year and this year to kind of help meet the need. Um, but it's just not enough. The answer to our problem is continued federal support. The federal government is the only party available to provide the significant resources that we need. The State and the City are facing their own situations as you know and so the only party that has the ability to provide the resources we need is the State. We have received \$4 billion this past year, we've got the promise of \$4 billion that was given in December. We expect to see that money shortly but we

need at least another \$8 billion to get us through 2024 even continuing to do cost-cutting measures, tightening the belt, trying to save money wherever we can. But no, this is a dire financial situation on an operating budget and what it's doing, it's constraining us very tightly on what we can do for the Capital Program and we need the Capital Program to maintain a state of good repair and modernize the system in terms of signals, modernize the system in terms of ADA support. Things like that that our customers need and demand. So, until we get right again in terms of our operating budget and that will require additional support from the Federal Government, we are not going to be able to support the Capital Program in a level that we need to. So, we are seeing constraints on the Operating Budget and on the Capital Budget.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, er, thank you. I want to say a few words in Spanish before asking the new question. (Speaking foreign language). Uh, my next question is on, on how much it will be needed if the services will be restored again from 1 to 5 in the morning? How much more will the MTA have to spend to restore those services?

BOB FORAN: Um, I will respond. I know exactly what the level is, but the service that was discontinued, um, was not done as a cost-cutting measure. In fact, we are now running additional bus service and we are still running the trains to keep the workers able to move back and forth but it wasn't done as a cost-saving measure. So.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: What, what, what, what Bob what can be the estimate? On my question about advocating and the nature to restore it and I know the importance and I've been with the MTA, also should be asked. What is the estimate on how much every day it costs to bring the train back from 1 to 5 in the morning?

BOB FORAN: Again, I don't have that number.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: What is the estimate? As a person who runs the finance what can be?

BOB FORAN: I, I.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Well what?

BOB FORAN: Mr. Chairman I don't have that number, but again, we are continuing to run trains to keep our workers moving back and forth.



2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I  
3 understand that but you can send that number to us  
4 right?

5 BOB FORAN: We can, we can see what we  
6 can provide for you, yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: As the  
8 person who runs the finance, there is not a number  
9 that you can send to us, on how much you think on how  
10 much it costs the MTA to run it from 1 to 5?

11 BOB FORAN: I just don't have that num-,  
12 I don't have the information here. We can provide you  
13 with information, I just don't have that information  
14 with me.

15 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay,  
16 that's all I would like to know that this is  
17 information that I have and you can send it to us.

18 PAY FOYE: Chairman, we, we will do  
19 that.

20 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay,  
21 thank you Chair. And, and of course as you know this  
22 is about all of us playing different roles. I will be  
23 the first one advocating you know to get all, all the  
24 resources that you guys need in order to run in the  
25 difficulties you are going through. It, how much,

how is this financial crisis is affecting the Capital Plan in 2024 especially in two areas. Our plan that you guys put it together a great plan, so expedite and to upgrade the signal system that you know before and this will be elected, 40-year plan, you had a plan in one week based on what you had before the COVID-19. So, how is this physical crisis affecting, um, scheduling um, to start to continue Capital Plan, especially on upgrading the signal system and now that you have and I plan for you to bring a que operator in board on overseeing everything to make the station accessible, also to make those pieces upgrading the signal system and making the station accessible.

PAT FOYE: So, um, Chairman, let, let, let me start, um, in the Capital Plan that was approved by the Board and the CPRB in Albany, \$51.5 billion excluding bridges and tunnels. Um, the, that Capital Plan is largely on hold and I'll just give you one example of a consequence in that. In 2020, Janno Lieber and his team had planned to award about \$13.5 billion. As a result of the pandemic and the fact that the Capital Plan, the new Capital Plan was largely put on hold, about \$5.4 billion was awarded.

And as I mentioned in my opening remarks, we accelerated projects to the tune of about \$2 billion. The um, Cares money was important in dealing with the 2020 deficit, um the deficit financing that we did through the Federal Reserve Bank in 2020, about \$3.4 billion. That was attractive money compared to the market but deficit financing obviously has an impact on our ability to do Capital Projects. If we are able to get the \$8 billion that we've requested the COVID Relief and Stimulus Bill that the Biden Administration is working on and Senator Schumer is working on, um, that would cover our deficits in 2022, '23 and '24. The other unknown share in terms of being able to provide the Capital Plan is, um, as we, we discussed just a couple of minutes ago, 30% of the Capital Plan comes from Central Business District Tolling, we are optimistic as a result of the new Administration being in place and Senator Schumer being in his role. There are other pieces of that, including \$7 billion of Federal Funding that we have assumed that I think there is reason to be optimistic on that, the \$3 billion from the state is in the, is in the Governor's Budget. We hope and expect \$3 billion from the City will be in the, uh, in the City

Budget. If all of these things are in place, we should be able to un-pause the Capital Plan to a substantial degree or if everything falls into place to do the whole \$51.5 billion which is our goal.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And Chairman and I asked you and I take your word when you said that it was a mistake when one of the workers of the MTA stated that the removal of the benches was to avoid homeless to using. So, again I, we all make mistakes and I take that as a mistake and can we expect that no benches will be a, removed and all of them who were removed, um, that station will be back and none of them will be removing other stations?

PAT FOYE: Sar-, Sarah can you speak to the specifics on that station?

SARAH FEINBERG: Yes, sorry, I muted and unmuted and re-muted myself. Um, so, to, to be clear I think someone said that the Tweet was a mistake because it was, didn't have sufficient context and was Tweeted in error. Um, the two of the benches have been, um, replaced, um, but to your point about you know assuming that we won't make any kind of changes to stations going forward I, I'm not

going to, you know, I'm not going to agree to that, obviously we have a massive system to, to maintain and to manage with 472 stations and so, you know, happy to work with you and your team and others on the City Council to let you know how we're, how we're handling various issues and stations, but um, but I can't promise we won't make changes to stations going forward.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Have any other benches been removed in other stations?

SARAH FEINBERG: We have on occasion removed benches from stations, I think going back several years at this point for various reasons, you know because we are changing the layout of the station because it makes sense to remove them and occasionally as a last resort, um, due to some encampment issues and then often, um, replace them. But, um, this is something that we've done on occasion for years.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: In the, in the last, as-, as-, as looking at this particularly period of time, when the benches was removed on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street, were any station got benches removed at the same time that they were removed on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street?

SARAH FEINBERG: I'm not sure I totally follow the question, but I, if you are asking if we removed addit-, removed additional benches that day, then we did not.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: If there were, yeah, if there were other stations, that, that other benches removed during the same time, when those benches were removed of that station?

SARAH FEINBERG: No.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

SARAH FEINBERG: And I just want to reiterate, I would reiterate my call to, um, partner with the City Council on trying to get some additional resources for mental health distress and for, um, for issues that are happening in the City. Again, you know we are a transportation agency and if we could get some assistance on you know being able to use the 3-1-1 system, being able to get mental health, you know intervention into the system, being able to get substance abuse intervention into the system, we would be incredibly grateful for any help.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And, and of course, and the answer is yes, we need to establish a partnership and that is what I said this morning and

when I was at conf-, a press conference with Urias (SP) Elijah, you know each time I respect the leadership of all the Governors and the Mayor. I know that it is more easy to criticize what they are doing than to understand that they work 24/7 and even though we don't agree on everything but they have been playing an important role in this difficult time, and, and however, I believe that the crisis inside the train station is the responsibility of both the City and the State and that is somebody you know I appreciate having the numbers of homeless and that they are getting the support but I feel that still as many as homeless we are not connecting them with the necessary resources that they deserve and I think they should require more for the New York State Department of Health and the New York City Department of Health to work in collaboration so that we can connect them with other services. In, but, I'm fine with you Sarah, you said that as you were answering the speaker you said that, um, you wanted to get more support because you mentioned it is something that the City was not responding or there was something on the 3-1-1 call that, um, when they were made, the City would not allow. Can you explain what that impression is?

SARAH FEINBERG: Yeah, I'm, I'm happy to expand on that. So, right now, if you are, um, anywhere in the City and you dial 3-1-1 to, um to report, um, you know someone who may need a mental health, um, assistance or mental health intervention or substance abuse intervention. 3-1-1 answers the phone and asks you where you are and you give them an address and then they send help to you right away or send help to the person that you've called for right away. If that call happens in the subway system and you call from the subway system and say, you know, I'm at the Bleaker Street Station and, and someone here seems like they could use some real assistance at this moment, 3-1-1 asks you for an address and you say I am at the Bleaker Station and they say, "No, I need a street address." And of course, I'm sure there are people out there who know the street addresses of all the subway stations. I am not one of them and I don't think most people know that and so the 3-1-1 operator says I can't help you, you are just going to have to call the police. And of course, you know, calling the police is, is a good option in certain circumstances if someone's about to harm themselves or others but it is certainly not a good, um, option most of the time.



And, particularly when what we are talking about is someone who is in a mental health crisis who desperately needs intervention and assistance. So, for the last few years, literally for two or three years we've been asking the City to enter into the 3-1-1 system, subway station. It seems like, I'm not a tech expert it seems like an easy fix to me. We've recently, you know gotten some movement from the City that they say they are taking a close look at it and that they hope that they can make some real movement on that in the coming days or weeks or months but that is absolutely something that we desperately need. It means someone in the system can call and register that complaint and help will actually come. So, we don't reach a point where someone who could've, you know, who needed an intervention on the previous 10 or 12 or 15, you know, moment didn't get one and then we have some sort of incident happens in the system and, you know, where someone gets hurts. Um, so, again.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I, I think.

SARAH FEINBERG: Any help that we can get from the City Council would be, um, absolutely appreciated. I believe that this is something that could go a long way toward helping.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I believe that this is something definitely that the City should know, that the City should correct. I feel that, I again I think Sarah we both and maybe even the Governor and I would like to see working closer but I feel that the scenario that you described is unacceptable and I know again, I know that you will get the support from the Speaker, myself and my colleagues on the Council but now I'm calling on City Hall to correct, you know the way that you are describing on the 3-1-1 not responding immediately when the call is made from the station. This is about human rights. This is about connecting people with the help, support that they need and I am more than happy to follow with you after, um, this hearing and the Speaker to see how we get conversation with, with City Hall to see how we can correct it.

SARAH FEINBERG: Thank you, thanks Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, thank you and my last question i-, i-, is about the cost, how much it costs to the MTA to disinfect the, um, station, in March 2020, it was the Chairman's report in the New York Times that the MTA estimated it

would need \$300 million for its disinfecting effort. However, the estimate was made when the subway was being disinfected every 72 hours. As May 6, 2020, subway began disinfecting daily. How much did the MTA spend on disinfecting 2020 and how much is the budget for cleaning efforts in 2021?

BOB FORAN: We spent last...

SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Go ahead Bob sir.

BOB FORAN: Um, last year we spent \$200 million and, about \$250 million to \$260 million on the cleaning. Again, it wasn't a full year. We expect it could be \$350 million thereabout going forward.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you guys. Now, I am turning it back to my colleagues who also may have questions.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. We will now call on Council Members in the order that they have used the Zoom Raise Hand Function. Council Members please keep your questions to five minutes. The Sergeant at Arms will keep a timer and they will let you know when your time is up. Um, Council Member Lander will be first, followed by Council Member Koo. Council Member Lander.

BRAD LANDER: Thank you very much Chair. I'll take off, you can see that I am wearing my MTA Subway Outreach mask and I want to begin by appreciating all the Subway Worker Outreach that I've seen. Kind of acknowledge the remarks of the Speaker and the Chair about the suffering and sacrifice those workers have made. Um, and appreciate the tireless that they and you are doing to save our subways, get federal aid and implement congestion pricing. Um, I also appreciate your mention of the transit zoning bonus which I know not to many people will focus on but we are eager to make that work in the Gowanus Neighborhood Rezoning to provide funding for a new elevator, stairwell and entrance at the Union Street NR Station. Um, there are some questions about how to make that work, um, and I think that is going to require additional input from the MTA, so, I, I am sure that this is true but I just want to make sure that you will sit down with us soon with City Planning and City Hall and my office so we can figure out how to make that work to provide investment for the subway that it so, so much needs.

PAT FOYE: Um, Council Member, a couple of things, one is thank you for wearing that handsome

mask. Second, thank you for joining the mask force, there you go, thank you. Um, and lastly, yes, um, we'd, we'd be happy to sit down with, um, with you and the City on the, um, Transit Accessibility Zoning and with particular with application to Gowanus and other applications around the City. I, I think it's an important, an important change that will benefit the City.

BRAD LANDER: That's great, thank you very much. Um, there is a lot we agree on and a lot we want to do to save the subways but I am going to spend the remainder of my time on 24/7 service and this issue of overnight deep cleaning. Because I have to say I'm, I'm deeply distressed by the answers that you've given today. I'll be honest, I find them highly cynical. I think it is hygiene, it is true that a majority of riders say they like it, that it looks clean. I'm sure if you just honestly ask them, do you like the subways better without homeless folks in them, they would probably say yes, but that would not mean homeless people had better services, or that homelessness was reduced, or that homeless people weren't up on the streets freezing and it wouldn't mean that service was being provided and it wouldn't

mean essential overnight workers had access to 24/7 service they need and it wouldn't mean that people without cars, um, had the ability to get to 24/7 vaccination sites and it wouldn't even mean that, that you were improving public health outcomes. Of course, you know, if you were going to say that we have to do everything we can with no responsibility for any of the other things that I mentioned, then you can justify it in the ways that you have. But the overwhelming preponderance of public health experts who have looked at this question, do not believe that it makes sense to continue closing the subways overnight and spending the amount we're spending on making the subway shiny but not actually making them safer in measureable ways and that they don't provide all those others that are due, so I just want to ask a couple of questions here. That I, I want to make sure I understand. So, the Governor has established a four-tier system for opening and closing tied to a wide range of data points. He is allowing 25% indoor dining to resume in New York City this Friday, despite the fact that the positivity rate remains above the level that he said. But if I understood what your answer was to the speaker, you're not tracking any data, you have no

plan for reopening governed by positivity rates, you are just going to wait until the Governor says the emergency is over and you don't plan to reopen the subways overnight despite the issues of vaccine distribution, um, at all. There's, there's not any data that you are tracking that you are looking at reopening you are simply going to wait for the Governor's order?

PAT FOYE: Well, we're tracking the data of course for the City and the region and, and for the MTA. We're not...

BRAD LANDER: Will the subway be reopening overnight when some of that data indicates it can be safely done or not, yes or no?

PAT FOYE: So, respectfully let, let me finish. You're, you're focusing on the customer survey. The customer survey is one of four or five reasons why this decision is the real one. We, we're in a service delivery business and what our customers think about actions that we take is A) extraordinarily important to us but B) given that ridership is so low and we are all in the business of bringing people back to offices and to restaurants and to Broadway and to Yankee Stadium. What customers think is fundamentally

important. However, this decision is driven by FTA guidance and CDC guidance and the quote that I read from the, um, Director of EPA's Homeland Security Program who, all of whom.

BRAD LANDER: Respectfully, I'm going to take back my time because I only have 20 more seconds. I don't think it is. I don't think it is the real answer. I believe that you are engaged in Hygiene Theater, I think it's a cynical approach. The science would support reopening the subways overnight in a way that was safe and if you helped communicate to riders so that they understood it was safe, it would work. Let's get serious about ending homelessness. Let's get serious about keeping our subways safe and clean. Keep those mask distributors out there but please reopen the subway, establish some data that will make clear how you are going to do it in ways that give riders confidence. Let's restore 24/7 overnight service. Thank you.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member Lander. Um, our next panelist will be Council Member Koo who will be followed by Council Member Reynoso. Council Member Koo.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.



PETER KOO: Thank you, thank you, thank you Chair Rodriguez and Speaker. And I also want to thank Chairman Foye and, and the transit President Ms. Feinberg and Mr. Foran. Um, Chair you mentioned that the bottom line is that you have to make sure that the customers feel safe in the subway or on the busses. So, can you tell us last year or last two year, um, what is the crime rate in the subway station or on the busses? How many people get attacked? How many people get pushed on to the subway, the tracks? Can you give me the, some statistics?

PAT FOYE: Um, so, so, so Council Member, recently as we all read there has been a state of, a state of attacks on customers and employees, employee assaults, employee spitting, etc. Um, we, we can provide the data which comes from the, um, the NYPD. It's posted on our, it's posted on our website. We've invited Chief, um, O'Riley to report to the, to the trans-, to the Board of the MTA on these issues. And, and we are calling out for additional police resources. We are impressed by the initiatives that the new Chief has, um, has put in place and we are also as, um, Sarah Feinberg and I have been talking about. We, we need additional mental health resources from the City of

New York to deal with people who are suffering, um, from mental illness and other issues and are in the subway system. We owe our customers and employees and a safe and secure environment at all times.

PETER KOO: Thank you. You know, um, during my tenure in the City Council, I think about 10 years ago or 9 years ago, I proposed in the public hearing, um, for Transportation that MTA start using pad-foam doors to make sure that passengers don't get pushed on to the tracks or some passengers commit suicide. They jump on the tracks. That was 10 years ago. And then a few years ago, there was a pilot, you, um, proposed. Can you give us a status on the pilot study or have you done anything on that?

PAT FOYE: Um, Sarah, do you want to speak to that?

SARAH FEINBERG: I'm happy to. We did undertake that study, um, and, um, I, we're happy to share. I, I obviously don't have it in front of me, I'm happy to share it with you if that is helpful. Um, I think ultimately the determination was that while those doors are, or while those barriers are possible, um, they are unbelievably expensive. Um, they are not possible in all stations. They would be possible in

some stations, um, but would be an extremely expensive, um, solution to something that is typically viewed as, as a, you know as a problem that happens on occasion and not very often but that would be a very, you know, expensive solution for som-, for dealing with that issue. But look, I thought it was important that we looked at it and appreciate you, you suggesting it and asking for that and we are happy to share, um, details with you.

PETER KOO: Because, you know, in Cities around the world have foam doors have been used, they have used pad-foamed doors for many, many years, 20, 30, 40 years and New York City we should have the resources to do it. No? Not in all stations but in some stations at least. You know.

SARAH FEINBERG: Some, som-.

PETER KOO: Not fancy ones, you can upgrade. At least some simple mechanical ones, like the one they used at Disneyland. Right? This a barrier so that when people push you, you can hang on to the barriers, that you don't get pushed on to the subway that easy. You know what I mean? When you go to Disneyland there is a barrier, you know, poles, 3 feet,

4 feet high, those are easy to install and you can open them mechanically, no, electrically.

SARAH FEINBERG: I'm not, I have to say I'm not familiar with the ones at Disneyworld but would be interested, to follow up on that. Again, sir, I hear you. We've looked at it and I will just tell you it is a multi-billion dollar. I think it was a \$2 billion solution to put these in just a portion of our stations. I know other, I know other systems, um, have used them and other systems have contemplated them but just, um, I mean I can go into the details with you offline but given the nature of our system, the way our platforms are built, the way our trains come in and how long our trains are, it's, it's slightly complicated, but I'd be happy to walk you through it.

PETER KOO: But the saying where there's a will there's a way. If there's no will, there's no way.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time expired.

SARAH FEINBERG: If the City Council is willing.

PETER KOO: And the MTA, the MTA.

SARAH FEINBERG: I will absolutely take your \$2 billion.

PETER KOO: MTA has spent billions of dollars in building the Oculus around World Trade Center. To me, that is a waste of money. I mean it looks like, we're not, MTA is not in the palm set, in the business of building museums. No.

SARAH FEINBERG: I thin-...

PETER KOO: I, a, potential standards. No. We should put funds in all stations. You wasted billions of dollars on many, many fancy stations.

PAT FOYE: So, Council Member can I, can I make, some, sorry, can I make some points.

PETER KOO: Yeah. Sure, yeah.

PAT FOYE: For better or worse, the Oculus was built by the Port Authority, no MTA funds were involved in that. The, other point I would raise, the systems that have platform doors include Disneyland tend to be new systems, new stations that were built assuming platform doors. That the subways were built by different investor groups, 180, um, years ago. And, and we don't have the uniformity of platform size, platform curves, etc. And there is one reason why Sarah's estimate for part of the system is right, it

would be an extraordinary amount of money but we would be happy to have a conversation with you and share the results of the plan.

PETER KOO: But you have aven-, 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue extension. There is very little, but how come you didn't consider putting platform piers over there? It is fairly new there, 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council Member.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member Koo. Um, our next Council Member we will hear from is Council Member Reynoso. Council Member Reynoso.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

ANTONIO REYNOSO: Thank you Chair. Thank you Speaker, um, for this hearing. I just have a, a couple of, um, questions and some concerns. Um, the fact that you know the CFO of the MTA wouldn't know, um, what the cost would be to allow for overnight service to resume in the MTA is unbelievable. It's unbelievable and if that is true that the CFO cannot give us information as to the cost of, of what the cost would be to restore overnight service, it kind of speaks true to the like the systemic and institutional

problems that we have at the MTA. Um, we should be able to know what it costs us right now to run the MA as is and a projection as to what it would cost, um, should we restore overnight service. What I'm hearing from the Chairman and the CFO is that they, they have no clue what it would cost to re-open overnight service.

PAT FOYE: Let me, if I, so, let me.

BOB FORAN: Let me respond to that. What I was is that we were, we are continuing to run the trains and we are running additional bus service. Okay? So, there is no savings, or there is no additional cost to put the service back. This is not being done to save money. This is being done to make the cleaning more efficient. So, again, that was the statement that I said. That we are not doing this to save money, and it is not saving us money to, to do the service that we are doing. I said we would provide additional information to answer the Chair's questions but this is not a cost-saving measure.

ANTONIO REYNOSO: So, so or in turn, it would, it would not increase the cost of the MTA to open, to have overnight service restored?

2 BOB FORAN: In fact, it would probably save  
3 us money because we wouldn't have to run the additional  
4 enhanced bus service.

5 ANTONIO REYNOSO: So, why, why?

6 BOB FORAN: This is not being done, this  
7 is being done as the Chairman said to make the cleaning  
8 more efficient and to allow us to do it.

9 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Okay, so Bob, I just want  
10 to be clear, when the Chair was asking you the question  
11 of what it would cost to restore the service from 1 to  
12 5 you kept telling him that you didn't have information  
13 or you couldn't present them information. So, I'm  
14 just trying to clarify here, that under, the people  
15 that are on this call might be under the impression  
16 that you didn't answer that question, and what you are  
17 saying it could possible save us money, to um, to have  
18 the system restored from 1 to 5. So, thank you for  
19 that comment.

20 PAT FOYE: So, so, so Council Member we,  
21 we will have the CFOs office look at it and we will  
22 come back as we, as we, as we promised the Speaker and  
23 the Chair and you will share it with, um, anybody on  
24 the Council who wants to see it.



ANTONIO REYNOSO: Thank you. Um, and then the second question that I have is related to the removing of benches. Even though it might seem like an, um, insignificant issue for you and, um, the way, um, the way that Ms. Feinberg kind of talked, answered that was we took them out and we put them back in. They needed to be cleaned. They needed to be changed. The type of seating. Did we replace the benches with the same type of benches? Um, at 23<sup>rd</sup> Street? Are they the same benches that were cleaned out and just restored?

SARAH FEINBERG: Yes, I'm sorry, can you hear me?

ANTONIO REYNOSO: Are you, yeah, I can hear you. Are you sure about that?

SARAH FEINBERG: Yes.

ANTONIO REYNOSO: Because from what I'm, from what I'm hearing and what I'm seeing is that the benches were actually, the leaning benches were u... where you kind of have to lean them against the wall and not the traditional benches where you sit down. So, they were not replaced.

SARAH FEINBERG: Yeah, I mean, you will have to.

2 ANTONIO REYNOSO: So, I want to ask you the  
3 question again.

4 SARAH FEINBERG: Sir, I know what you are  
5 saying, you are seeing something Twitter but excuse me  
6 for stating the obvious, but Twitter is not always  
7 where there's a healthy debate taking place that's  
8 full of context and all.

9 ANTONIO REYNOSO: It's fine Sarah, and  
10 that's why I am asking you the question so you can  
11 clarify. So, can you clarify that the benches were  
12 replaced with the same exact benches on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street?

13 SARAH FEINBERG: Yes.

14 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Thank you for clarifying  
15 that for everybody watching on Twitter that she has  
16 cleared that up and said that the benches on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street  
17 are the exact same benches that were there before,  
18 right? Thank you. Um, and I just want to say, I'm  
19 actually grateful that we have folks here from the  
20 MTA. I haven't seen you in a long time and I'm glad to  
21 see you here. I think it is very important that the  
22 relationship that we have with the City Council be a  
23 strong one because we actually are here in an effort  
24 to ask for more funding from the Federal and State  
25 Government that you can actually do the work that needs

to be done. We know you are operating in a deficit and there is not, there should be no Council Member here that is not fighting tooth and nail to make sure that there is a reasonable amount of funding coming to the, to the MTA. Um, I also know that there are Council Members that fight at a City level with the Mayor to...

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time expired.

ANTONIO REYNOSO: To, um, to put more funding into the MTA as well. That the City does its part in its contribution. So, you know, showing up to these hearings, hearing us out, letting us hear from you, really admits for our relationship and effort. Again, to increasing funding or insure that funding is coming to the MTA or at least you have advocates that are doing that. So, thank you so much for your time.

PAT FOYE: Um, Council Member we appreciate and thank you for that support.

ANTONIO REYNOSO: Thank you. Take care.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Council Member Reynoso. At this time are there any other Council Members that have questions for these panelists? (siren sound). Next, we will hear from Council Member Miller.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

I. DANEK MILLER: Um, thank you. Good morning Chair. Good morning madam President. Um, a number of questions so I guess I'm going to start with my, with my um, let's just talk about the community and these transit budgets and some of the overnight service that had been cut and whether or not it is sufficient to provide the overnight service to those essential workers. While you have acknowledged that there is a, there was an impact on the workforce that requires the overnight service, have you considered even your own workforce and the impact in your own workforce traveling somewhere from like Southeast Queens throughout the system, and, and, again and I don't want to berate you, I know that you said as soon as you get the okay from the governing bodies then we, we're going to be back on-line but there are some unintended consequences to the workforce and to essential workers, additional costs to travel with this new time to travel and so what have you done to mitigate that and to assist those. Um, because when you put out the buses, particularly in Southeast Queens, there is nothing south of Union Turnpike with, with the overnight bus service. Um, so, you know how we are communicating in terms of putting that. So, I

just want to get all the questions out. So, that would be one part and then how efficiently are we using the entire system? Are we using and being able to access the Metro-North, Long Island Railroad, the Commuter Rails in a way that really, um, supports our New York City Transit? Obviously, they are at an all-time low on the commuter rails in terms of their ridership, you know. I would submit that it would support not just their ridership but certainly it would help, um, communities that are traditionally transportation deficits and have access to commuter rails which often times are cost-prohibited. Um, we've been advocates of expansion of Atlantic Ticket. How do we see that playing into the whole, um, COVID, um, scenario in terms of, um accessing ridership, being more efficient with the delivery of services and ensuring that those who are being negatively impacted by the overnight shutdown having access to the system in its entirety? And then, you answer that, and I'll put on my ... you know after ...

PAT FOYE: Um, thanks Councilman. First, we are aware obviously that our employees are A) essential employees and some of them effected by the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. closure. Obviously, many of them are

working during that period. You know, doing disinfecting, station work, um, you know track work, etc. and in many cases their shift will extend beyond the 5 a.m. period and they will be able to take subway or bus or however it is they commuted back. The Atlantic Ticket Pilot continues. Um, and is, it is usable. Customers can use Metro-North and Long Island Railroad. Obviously, there is limited service as you know, um, during that period of time but to the extent that there was service on a particular line or branch that is available to all, all customers including MTA, MTA employees. As, as we gone through this exercise, Council Member, um, we've been acute aware that, um, our customers were affected by this which is why we added as you know significant bus routes in the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. period. That, that continues. With respect to respect to, for instance, vaccinations, the City Field Site will be up and running. Um, depending on the number of doses, it will be 24/7 but we are already stopping the Flushing, I'm sorry, we are already stopping the Port Washington Branch at Willis Point, um, to allow customers, um, from north, south, east and west to get to City Field if they've got vaccination appointments at any time of the day to

make that, to make that, um, commute, um, you know even easier.

I. DANEEK MILLER: Chair, Chair Foye, so if I may, I'm going to put on my labor hat and obviously I was one of those employees for more than 26 years, that, that traveled back and forth, and, and reported to work at 4:15 in the morning and, and, and in these days it would be very difficult to do so. But in the Committee on Civil Service and Labor, we had a hearing about two weeks ago that discussed the, um, the state of COVID on the Municipal Workforce and obviously we had testimony from the TW, ATU and some of the other unions within the MTA and they had a number of, of concerns and I just want to talk about some the things, have you talk about some of the things that really, um, had supported workplace safety and I want to preface it by, by saying Mr. Chair for the extra time that I want to commend the MTA for absolutely being out front and, and supporting working but more importantly the work, the memorializing those employees that was lost, many employees that was lost, supporting the dependent, surviving dependents of, with the benefits and pensions, is, is, is really the how we should be treating people. That being said, as

we move forward, what, I, I'm, I'm receiving calls as many of my colleagues about busses being overcrowded. And, and I know early on, that we addressed that, we moved, um, back the, um occupancy on the bus, but at this present time, you know all the buses, you know often are overcrowded to the point that it is impossible to social distance, um, um, employees obviously are being impacted. There was a testimony of a bus operator in Staten Island that two weeks ago at the hearing had done everything that he could do to keep himself, protect himself, um, from COVID-19 and had contracted COVID and unfortunately taken it home to his family and, and on the date of the hearing, the 10-year-old son who had also contracted COVID, passed away. These are the unintended, most extreme consequences of workers that, front-line workers that go out each and every day and put themselves on the line to make our lives seamless to go back to our families and communities. What are we doing the protect that? Are we implementing? I'm looking at some of the plans, um, how many busses is coming online. But rear door service, is that going to resume? Are we going to be able to receive customers through the rear door and, and, um, if not when what are we doing to



protect workers? And then, finally, um, transportation being the great equalizer. I'm glad that you adopted that, it is something that I've been saying forever, um, and we talking about and we've talked about pay equity in industries here at the Council all the time. Um, could you tell me about the, coming, coming contract, negotiations and what you are doing to see that those are on the line are not being paid less than their counterparts in another area? And I know that's messy, but that's what we do here at the Council. Um, if there are people doing similar jobs, doing the same job, they should be receiving the same pay, particularly during the time of a pandemic, no one should be going out and putting their life on the line and being paid less than anyone else who is doing the same job. And those survivors, who had.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Thank you.

PAT FOYE: Um Chairman, can I respond to the Council Member?

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Of course.

PAT FOYE: Okay, fine, good, so, um Council Member, a lot of questions, um, in that. Let me talk about what we have done to protect our employees,

first. Um, we have from the first days of the pandemic, I think that a national leader has been aggressive and innovative and effective in protecting employees and customers. Um, we distributed 14 million masks to our employees, um, 7 million masks to employees, 17 million pairs of, of gloves to employees and we have sufficient stock piles for as long as the pandemic continues and hopefully that will be a short period of time to continue to provide mass, um, face shields where it is appropriate because of an MTA workers, um, particular work function and sufficient supplies of mass disinfecting gloves and other PPP as long as this horrible, um, pandemic continues. Um, we have vaccinated over 6,000 of our employees in the last call it two and a half to three weeks. Transit workers are classified or categorized in category 1B so right after healthcare workers and the other first responders and we have an additional 12,000 who already signed up in the portal and want vaccinations and the only issue there is supply and distribution from the Federal Government. Um, we intend to stand up our own vaccination centers at MTA, um, facilities and the plans for that are complete. The only thing that is holding back the opening of that is guarantees of

sufficient of supplies to be able to, um, vaccinate employees at bus depots, subway yards, um, Metro North and Long Island Railroad Facilities. I think we've been effective in communicating to the public and our employees the importance of using PPD, wearing masks, etc. We are going to continue, we are going to continue to do that. I also ought to mention that we have provided diagnostic testing to over 32,000 of our employees. Um, we are testing at a rate of 1,000 to 2,000 a week at this point. The diagnostic testing is really critical because its allowed us to identify approximately 1,000 asymptomatic employees who they and their family and their colleagues would not have known that they were infected by COVID-19 might have continued to work and increase the infection rate. We were able to identify those 1,000 asymmetric, um, asymptomatic employees. Others who were tested in some cases were returned to the workforce if that was, um, that was appropriate. Um, and we have throughout been following guidance from the CDC, the Federal Transit Administration to the extent it related to transit, obviously the State Department of Health. The regimens that we have put in place applied to subways, buses, power transits, Staten Island Railroad,

bridges, tunnels, Metro North, railroad. We've treated every agency with the same degree of urgency and commitment. With respect to labor contracts, um, Council Member and I, I think you will appreciate this answer, I'm not going to talk about the status of contracts or negotiations or discussions in public. It would be inappropriate for me to do that. I understand the importance to you as a member of the City Council and as a former union member of the MTA but I, I can't speak in any detail beyond that.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, thank you Chair. And I have a few more questions before we get into, before we hear today from members of the public and after I ask those questions and you leave Chair, it would be important that you also leave some members of your team to hear their testimony. One of the first one that will be speaking is going to be members of a great national project that they are aiming to create the natural infrastructural bank and they've been having conversation with, with members of the Biden-Harris team with the idea that some members of a national institution also reporting that initially. And I feel that at a time where everyone knows that the only way or how we can bring back our

economy is by investing in our infrastructure. It is important also that, you know, we hear those you know ideas and again I hope and I know that you usually do, some members of your team will continue listening when you get to the public so that you can get those testimony. But before.

PAT FOYE: Chairman, just briefly, as with respect to every City Council Member, when the three of us leave, we will have colleagues watching the entire, the entire hearing and all of the, um, all of those that testify.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, thank you, which is that what usually happens. So, I know that you have a great team, the governmental relation, and, and I just want to be sure but I wanted to highlight that one of those who will be testifying is going to be the leaders of that big idea, to create a national infrastructure bank. My two question is, is about, it's not a question. And I have been joining your team with the distribution of masks to the riders, we have done in the last couple of weeks. We were at the 149 and 42 train in Grand Yonkers. Yesterday I joined also that group in front of the 4 and B train in Jerome Avenue and again someone else had a case,

more president, that is who also had joined effort with the MTA to make, put a plan together to reopen our services 24/7 but I also understand that you know a lot had to do with the decision at the state level and I feel that, you know, yes, we want to be difference and be open from leading, leading, leaving the science to make decision on how you know we operate and how we can control the Coronavirus in the stations, so I also see that part of the argument but in the same time we also need to be sure that the federal resources are here, they stay on the standard and working with the Governor and the Mayor that we can be able to provide all the support that you need to reopen the train stations as soon as possible. And question, again, going back to that piece, because in the first part, we all agree. We are partnered to get advocate funding at a national level, but the thing were, we have to be going to the back and forth, you don't have to see everything, you know agree on everything. You have your way of explaining. I understand your argument but from our ends, keep pushing you guys to reopen our train at midnight as soon as possible is coming from the argument that I said at the beginning. You know people who use those trains aren't people

like myself when I come in to wash dishes and leaving my job at 5 in the morning. So based on a lot of those immigrants, working class, that they are work in deli, they work in supermarket, they are working in pharmacy and they are the ones who maintained our city during the time when a lot of people, you know needed it most. So, why is it that thing? Have you explored and talked to your team about, of course, I would like for the train to be reopened as soon as possible, as yesterday, but we know that, you know I hear your explanation but can you explain why it is closing for five hours, from 1 to 5. Have you explored to scale the plan away that you can say close from 3 to 5, 2 hours to clean the station? And how the closure is making the cleaning more efficient?

PAT FOYE: Yeah, so, Chairman let me address those questions and thank you for both of them. The four hour closure from 1 to 5 a.m., we looked at many other options. Um, shorter period of time, longer period of time, a different period of time, four, four hours we believe is the minimal period that gives us the maximum efficient. And the reason why it's more efficient, I think any subway rider will understand. Um, in crowded or half-crowded subway car or a crowded

or half-crowded subway platform can't be disinfected in the period of time that it can be. If, if the customers are not there. It's just a reality. It's also frankly safer for customers and for the employees doing the work. Um, but I and Sarah and others have been for instance in the terminal end of ride stations and watched the cleaning. The cleaning is the disinfecting is orders of magnitude more efficient when there aren't customers on the car or on the platform. And that calculus led us to the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. four hour closure. And we did look at other options which didn't give us that level of productivity and efficiency to be able to clean, to clean the cars multiple times, and disinfect the cars multiple times a day.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Can you explain what happened during those four hours, um, of cleaning those trains in the stations and you know what is going on during those four hours, um, when it comes to procedure of cleaning those stations and the train that could not happen during the daytime?

PAT FOYE: Yeah, yeah, Chairman what, what happens is the, um, the MTA forces go through the cars with unbelievable speed and efficiency. And they are



cleaning all the sub..., the surfaces on seats, on poles, um, vertical poles, horizontal poles, doors, all high-touch areas are being disinfected. The floors are also just being cleaned and you can imagine how difficult that, that frankly, impossible it would be to do that work if you had 20 or 50 or 100 people on a subway car or hundreds of people on a subway platform. It's just not going not get done.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I'm going to tell us a little bit about the safety of our stations? Can you let us know I know it's a big concern for all of us? We want to be sure that everybody is doing everything you can, everything in your power to address safety, a number of people especially men and women inside the station. Can you explain to us how many stations in our train systems have cameras and what percentage of that that cameras are working?

PAT FOYE: So, um, Chairman I, I don't have that at my fingers, far more of a majority of the stations have cameras. The cameras are routinely checked. Some of them for instance, transmit to the transit, the NYPD Transit Bureau Response Office in, in Brooklyn and is reviewed on a, on a real-time basis

by the NYPD Transit Bureau. On, on that issue, frankly from a policing point of view and the mental health resource point of view, we, we need your help and the help of your colleagues on the City Council, um, to have additional policing and additional mental health resources because clearly there are some small number of people who do have mental health issues, need help, um, need counseling, need services, inpatient, outpatient and that's not a task that the MTA can perform or is, um, is regulated or quick to handle. We implore your help and assistance and that of your colleagues on those issues.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And more than happy to help as much as we can. I feel as I say that I think that this should be something that every, joint effort between the City and the State. I know that there is a number of help provided, healthcare providers in our communities that they also get funded by the New York State Department of Health and sometimes they've been waiting for more to be dispersing, to get the dispensing of the services that are providing at your, that definitely, you know we need to declare an epidemic when it came to the reality of the numbers of New Yorkers or people that may come

from other states and immediately they are in our street and they need mental health services in order to you know deal with the challenges in their life. So, I agree with you, we should definitely as I said before a call, and that's my call today of City Hall that on the 3-1-1 and not responding immediately to a train station where someone needs help is something that is unacceptable and I hope they correct as we are speaking right now and when it comes to allocating for more resources from the City and the State it is just something that definitely has. We have to join forces with you guys, you can count on us. My other question is about, and again it is about how, you explained the closure of the train from 1 to 5 something that you have heard in the institution from the riders and how they feel. In many polls that have been done, a survey has also allowed us to sustain that most New Yorkers support the MTA to have the train closure from 1 to 5 in order to disinfect the station. Can you explain to us what is the mechanism that you used to get the people feedback? If it is surveys and poll who has done it? You know, so we can, you know share that information?

PAT FOYE: Um, so, actually Chairman. So, we regularly survey our customers and let me tell you what the results of that is with respect to the 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. closure and the, um, and the disinfecting. About three of every four customers, actually slightly higher, 76% strongly agree that cleaning and disinfecting efforts make them feel safe when using transit. And obviously Chairman, we all want people to return to the subways. To return to Midtown, Manhattan, to return to all five boroughs. Nearly three in four customers tell us that trains are cleaning since the May 6 implementation of the late night system closure, um, comparing to only 4% who say to the contrary. So, in both of those, and those surveys were done in all of the title XI languages, including, including English and Spanish and others. So, overwhelmingly, overwhelming support from our customers. It may not be reflected in Twitter, but the real life customers, the real life constituents, Chairman that you have, each of your colleagues has, wants a safe and secure environment on, on the subways. They are horrified by the events that they've read about in the newspapers and the reports by the police of slashing and people being pushed onto the tracks

by, by people who were suffering presumably from mental illness and they support the approach we are taking and I believe Chairman that it is that level of confidence in the disinfecting of the stations, the platforms, the Long Island Railroad, Metro North, buses, power transit that is going to play a big role in New Yorkers and out of towners returning to New York City and returning to the, to the mass transit system.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I agree with you that the safety of the systems on all aspects including people knowing that it is safe. The station, the buses and the trains is important and I can tell you someone that has been using the train, also been put in the social media encouraging people to continue riding the busses and the trains. One thing that I know that we can agree is that we have to help the riders, because based on my experience I can say that bus minority or riders using the train and buses, they are wearing the masks. It is a rare occasion where we don't see you know some riding the bus and the train that they are not using the mask. The great effort that has been put in place, all the stakeholder, public, private, the whole institution on board, so I

do believe that it is definitely mask safe. And cleaning the train, the busses is important. Of course, as I say that you know reopening as soon as possible but recognizing that great job that you are doing and I know that if tomorrow there is a call from the Governor who say that we need to put a plan in place to reopen 24/7, I know that you are the man and woman power to say we can do it. So, I know that you are in the position leading this big institution and \$1 trillion budget institution but a lot has to do with what the State decides or thinks that we should do and that's why I also ask you continue to do the best we can but I am also asking the Governor to please work with us so that we can reopen the train station as soon as possible. You know, now vaccines will be provided to all the five boroughs, 24/7, a lot of those people they don't have a car and a lot of those people they work until 1 in the morning, 2 in the morning, so for me, more than putting this fuss. I just want to make a case as we are ready to work hard in 21, should be the year that we are back on our feet as a City in the Northeast, we definitely should be trying to work together to put in the resources that you need. Including the man and the woman power to clean the

resources and everything so that the station is safe from COVID and that's my, you know approach in my, in my argument with this case.

PAT FOYE: So, Chairman I think we agree on much. Two point that I want to make. One is that we are eagerly looking forward to the day that, um, that we return 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. service. We are looking to the day when most people or everybody is vaccinated and we have crowding on the Lexington Avenue Line and that is going to be a happy day. The other thing that I want to say and this is important, you had a total experience about your rides on the subways buses where you see almost universal mask compliance, that's, that's also my antidotal experience but more importantly the data suggests that. The regular surveys that we do of mask compliance on subways, buses, Metro North and Long Island Railroad all indicates that it is above 95% and all the public health officials agree that the single most important thing that any of us can do individually is to wear our masks. It protects the wearer, it protects fellow commuters and it protects our employees, and I'm gratified chairman that your antidotal experience is

the same as mine and it is more importantly backed up by the data, so thank you for that.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Chairman how many, and recorded also the members of the ATU and TW also are in our hearing today and they are representing men and women that keep the train running. How many workers died because of COVID so far?

PAT FOYE: Well, sadly 142.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you and my last question with this and then I'm calling my Council Member Levin who has joined us. He also has a few questions. Who, are you using private contractor to clean the stations or are you doing with an inside MTA employee?

PAT FOYE: Chairman it is primarily done by MTA forces but there is a, there are some private contractors that are doing the work.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay and with that one I will be following up with your team. One area, that I feel we can do better which is the opportunity for more women and minority, especially for those in our City to also be part of those who get the opportunity to do part-time with the women and



minority. As you know, MTA is a big institution and it is more easy to blame the leadership to blame people in government but the private sector they are making billions of dollars every day after we sold all the larger institution, transportation institution that we have here and one of the things that everyone knows is that when we build those trains, we know many are going for structure, you know benefit the economy on many states in the south and the Midwest. So, I feel also that at some point we also, I would like to look at the micromanagement when in terms of, when we look at women and minority and that we are making the numbers. What percentage of those are New York City residents? Who are participating and taking advantage of the big opportunity on women and minority and I am more than happy again to follow with your team. I am more focusing and concerned on how to work with you, how to connect in those sectors that they are, so that person that you have in charge to oversee the women and minority so that we can continue expanding those opportunities.

PAT FOYE: So, Chairman, briefly, we are unbelievably proud of what we've done in the MWBE and DBE space and let me just. A couple of facts. One is

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

98

2 COVID, COVID, as you know Governor Cuomo's goal is 30%  
3 MWBE, DBE. On COVID spending, um, we have 32% of the  
4 COVID spending has been purchased from New York State  
5 MWBEs and DBEs. So that's in a period from, um, March  
6 to the end of, um, the end of 2020. Um, about 77,  
7 nearly \$80 million. On general MWBE spending in 2020,  
8 the MTA spend \$772 million, almost \$800 million that's  
9 over 27% of our New York State Funded projects, as you  
10 know Chairman. Different rules apply to federally  
11 funded, um, projects and the MTA, I am proud to say is  
12 itself responsible for fully 25% of all MWBE payments  
13 statewide. I'd be happy to follow up with you but we  
14 are incredibly proud of the COVID spending and just  
15 the spending and this effort as I'm sure you know, led  
16 by Michael Gardener, um, who has done a fantastic job  
17 on these issues.

18 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. And,  
19 I'm more than happy to follow with you. As you know  
20 everything is local and, and I can tell you that I  
21 don't know one person in my District that I represent  
22 that, that, and I can say that I have a good, I  
23 organizer, so I connect largely to my small business  
24 community, so I don't know one person that they can  
25 say, we had opportunity to be part of Women and

Minority led by the MTA. I know that is the experience of many of my 51 colleagues at the Council and I also believe that doesn't happen on the MTA. That happened on consumption in many areas. A lot of people who are outside, a lot can be from Los Angeles, that they are doing well, even though in this field and I just want to see how we look at the City, how we can still look at more opportunity to connect more Women and Minority, especially the underserved community to have opportunity to be part of the great economy that, you know, MTA represents.

PAT FOYE: So, so Chairman to that issue Michael Gardener and his team regularly run job fairs. The job fairs obviously um, at this time are, are virtual and given the spending, the \$772 million that was spent on New York State funded projects, 27% of the, um, spending. It undoubtedly has to positive affect constituents in your, um, in your district. I will ask Michael to do some follow up on that.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. And again, I, I had a great conversation with your team and this is something that we do every, that we can follow. So, I do appreciate but I do want to you know highlight and this is something that, I should say,

you know, when we look at the State level, this is like the state institution. You know sometimes there are other sectors, you know, outside New York City that they are doing much better. It could be because they know how to gain information, because they know how to sit and worry, because they have a network. So, I believe that this is one of those areas that I hope you also leave your fingerprint to look at underserved community that they also have a large number of women and minority and how they can also be part of that, on that opportunity.

PAT FOYE: Chairman, I'd be, I'd be happy to follow up with you but given the numbers that, um, you know, I just cited, the MTAs performance is something for us to be proud of. I'd be happy to work with you to, um, get out the word to a greater extent to your district.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Chair. Let me call now on Council Member Levin who has questions and then we will move to the public section.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Levin do we have you? Okay, Chair it looks like we don't have Council Member Levin today.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: (Speaking Spanish). Thank you Chair for your great leadership and we will continue working with you and your team. With that.

PAT FOYE: Chairman thank you for the opportunity. Thanks for the opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

ELLIOT GLEN: Thank you. Um, we will now turn to public testimony. I would like to remind that unlike our typical Council hearings we will be calling individuals one by one to testify. Each panelist will be given two minutes to speak. Please begin once the Sergeant has started the timer. Council members who have questions for a particular panelist, um, should use the Zoom Raise Hand Function and I will call on you after the panelist has completed their testimony. Um. Chair, it looks like we have Council Member Levin now if we still have the MTA.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: You can check if they are they are there and if, um, if they

are of course, and if not then we just need to continue to the public. But I leave it for you to check.

STEPHEN LEVIN: Thank you Chair, sorry about that, I had to step off-screen for a minute.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, Council Member we are checking to see they, if the Chair is still there because, um, before you re-joining they had stepped out.

STEPHEN LEVIN: Okay, um.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Elliot can you check?

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Give me just one minute, Council Member.

STEPHEN LEVIN: Okay.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, it looks like we might have lost Chairman Foye at the time. Um, we can still give it to Council Member Levin for his remarks but we may not be ask the Chairman any questions.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Levin, if you, I do appreciate all the time that they gave to this hearing but I really apologize for you not to be able to ask a question, but if you have anything to say, you have the floor.

STEPHEN LEVIN: Thank you Chair. I mean, I wanted to ask the MTA, um, what scientific studies they are relying on, um, to, um, um to guide their policy on, um, cleaning the stations and the cars every night. I don't know if there's, they came up with that policy in the early days of the pandemic when we knew, um, much less about the nature of the spread of COVID and we know a lot more now and I, I don't know if, if they've, what, what studies they are relying upon and whether the, whether it's necessary at this point or whether other people are getting sick by um, or whether, whether the current, um, actions they are taking are, um, are keeping people from getting sick. Um, so, so I just, I don't know if they've, you know this is now a positive, going on almost a year and what's it based on. And that's, that's one question. Um, I, I would like for them to, um, um, supply us with antidotal, I mean any, any data, not antidotal, we have, we have seen an increase antidotally of, of, of kind of random violent crime and, on the subways of the slashings and, and people being pushed on to the tracks. You see them reported in the newspaper. I would like to see from the MTA, um, um, some type of objective data to show us whether that is, um, whether

that is really an uptick that we are seeing or whether it's and how they would analyze that and, um, and, and the like. And then, um, I would like to know the status of. They announced, um, probably 18 months ago now that they were, um, adding, um, MTA police officers and not NYPD transit officers but MTA police officers to, um, to the subway system. I don't know the status on that. Um, and so those are all, those are all kind of big picture questions that I was, you know I would like to have some answers on. Um, if anybody, I realize that Chair Foye is not, is no longer on the call but if there is anybody from the MTA that can answer those questions that is still on the call, I appreciate it. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: If they are I would let them jump in, but if not Council Member I will have to continue moving into the public section now. Um, by the MTA time to joining the Governmental Relation I will be happy to continue with the public and let the MTA. Again I know that they testify, led by the Chair but if any opportunity the Governmental Relation wants to say anything they are more than happy to do it but we have to continue now going to the call.



ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair. We can also follow up with questions for the MTA following the hearing. Again, we will now turn to public testimony. As I said, each panelist will receive two minutes to speak and please wait to begin until the Sergeant has started the timer. Council Members who have questions for panelists use the Raise Hand Function in Zoom and I will call on you after the panelists has completed their testimony. For panelists once your name is called, a member of the staff will unmute you and the Sergeant will give you the go ahead to begin upon setting the timer. Um, I would now like to welcome the first panelist to testify. That will be Alphecca Muttardy and I apologize for pronunciation of names.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

ALPHECCA MUTTARDY: Thank you very much, um, Mr. Chairman and all the Committee on Transportation for having me. My name is Alphecca Muttardy, I am a macro-economist with the Coalition for the National Infrastructure Bank and I realize that you are here today to meet on the, the MTA and ways that it can enhance its service during this COVID period but I would like to step back and talk about

the overall picture of the finances of the City of New York and in particular financing transportation and introduce you to a Bill in Congress. It's called HR6422 and it calls for the creation of a national infrastructure bank to finance infrastructure all across America and that includes in the wonderful great State of New York and the City of New York. So, what this Bill will do will be to create a.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: You will be able to have five minutes. I will give you that time so instead of two go to five since you also are representing members and since you are speaking on behalf of all of them so, let's, let's use five minutes.

ALPHECCA MUTTARDY: Thank you very much. I appreciate all of that. So, this bank would create a bank, a public bank that will lend for infrastructure across America \$4 trillion dollars to cover everything. I, that is not, thank you, that is not, um, currently financed by, um, the Federal Government or state and local governments all of the financing gap and then in addition to that for roads, bridges, rail, airports, water infrastructure and in addition to that this Bill will also cover a high speed rail,

affordable housing, broadband access to underserved areas and other large mega projects. The beauty of the bank is that it will complete and compliment all of the current needs of the MTA to, um, finance all of the capital projects that have been put on hold that will include for example the second avenue subway and extension of all of the other lines and stations. It will include other infrastructure projects that impact the MTA like the gateway tunnel project that brings commuters in from North and South areas and is currently as a safety danger problem. Um, this financing will create up to 25 million new great paying jobs in the City of New York. It will create up to 1.6 million great paying jobs and will finance all of the projects that are not receiving funding now. Your discussion on MTA has focused a lot on going to the Federal Government to ask for financial resources to bridge you over this COVID gap and I would like to tell the Council Members that I have really looked carefully at the Federal budget and the new administration who has come in with a lot of really strong bold plans for building out rail, for supporting the public transit, for doing all kinds of transportation and other projects but the big problem

will be funding these projects. So what this bank will do, will be to lift the responsibility for financing all of the unmet gap on to the infrastructure bank and take it off of Federal finances and state and local finances. Without this bank, probably you will not be able to get a lot of the projects done that you have on your capital project plan right now. Your plan right now is for \$51 billion as Chairman Foye has said. That does not include a lot of projects that are not funded like gateway and like I think the Second Avenue Subway. So, this, this will bridge you over. In addition, this bank will be doing intercity and community development. It will be building affordable housing. It will be providing you with new infrastructure and projects that you hadn't had before to take care of your homelessness and mental illness problems, another huge segment of your local minority that you haven't really talked about during this hearing or all the folks who lost their jobs during the COVID period who will not be able to find new employment afterwards who are living in homeless shelters or who had long-term rent that is due and they will not be able to pay back and eventually when all the limitations expire, they become homeless

themselves. It will be a whole new group of folks and in addition we really need to get to these transportation deserts that were spoken of. We need to get real projects out to these places that don't have them now, that are not on the current capital plan for transportation. This bank can cover all of those things. However, the bank wasn't passed and enacted by itself without your strong support, so we are asking for you, Council Members to support, um, House Resolution, um, 14322, 1432 pardon me, which has been introduced by, um, Council Member Rodriguez and Lander and others. You have just gotten a letter of introduction about this, um, um, resolution. What it does is memorializes Congress. Your members of Congress to pass, um, 6422 to create a National Infrastructure Bank and by having all this Grass Root support from every single jurisdiction that has huge infrastructure needs, we can get this bank moving forward and to fill out all of the infrastructure needs and build out our country better back, um, best in ways that the current vision envisions with the Biden Administration and Secretary Buttigieg but there are not funds to cover all of these infrastructure needs so we ask for your support to cover, the support and

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

110

2 co-sponsor House Resolution 14322 to support the  
3 National Infrastructure Bank.

4 SGT. MARTINEZ: Time has expired.

5 ALPHECCA MUTTARDY: Thank you very much.

6 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: And, thank  
7 you, and yes on all correction. The Bill, the  
8 resolution that we have in the Council, I want to  
9 mention it, you didn't mention it, which is about  
10 Council Member Robert Cornegy and myself and of course  
11 working with Council Member Brad Lander and others. I  
12 would like to thank Council Member Robert Cornegy for  
13 being the person who also started with this idea and  
14 now to put it in a resolution. Thank you.

15 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

16 Um, do any other Council Members have questions for  
17 this panelist? Okay, seeing none. Next, we will hear  
18 from Stanley Forczak. Stanley.

19 SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

20 STANLEY FORCZAK: Thank, thank you so much.  
21 Good afternoon everyone. I really appreciate the time  
22 that you've given us here today. I am also with the  
23 Coalition for a National Infrastructure Bank. I'm a  
24 retired executive from Amtrak, I spent over 30 years  
25 there and I just would like to embellish a little bit

of what my colleague has said regarding the National Infrastructure Bill Legislation that's in front of Congress. The issue here is very simple and you've heard it from the Chairman and his team from the MTA and that is they have a very aggressive Capital Plan but one of the issues as, as Alphecca just mentioned is there is not a lot of money to be appropriated for transportation and other infrastructure project. The time is now to go through and establish a new National Infrastructure Bank. This would be the fourth National Infrastructure Bank in the history of the United States. It was created first by Alexander Hamilton and there have been three after that. These banks built all of the infrastructure that we have in the country. Right now our infrastructure and you are well aware of it in New York because your subway system is over 120 years old but there are railroads in the west that have road beds that are over 200 years old. So, the issue is our infrastructure is falling apart and the only way to do it is to use a National Infrastructure Bank to get everything done because if we are going to wait or appropriations it's not going to be done. It's not going to be done by a suggestion here for 2024, it might work all the way up into the 40s and 50s of the

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

112

2 century. So I urge you to follow the lead of your  
3 Chairman and sign on to the new resolution that is out  
4 there to support the Legislation that we've got. So,  
5 I think it's time that we really think about these  
6 things and get things done. Last issue, safety issue.

7 SGT. MARTINEZ: Time is expired.

8 STANLEY FORCZAK: I'm sorry. Thank you.

9 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, do  
10 any other Council Members have questions for this  
11 panelist? Okay, seeing none. Our next panelist will  
12 be Jose DeJesus. Jose.

13 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry,  
14 do we have any TW or the ATU.

15 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes we do.

16 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Let's show  
17 that we call them and then we follow.

18 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

19 JOSE DEJESUS: I'm sorry. Can you repeat  
20 the question?

21 SGT. MARTINEZ: You may begin sir.

22 JOSE DEJESUS: My name is Jose DeJesus and  
23 basically I understand the issue is the budget. It is  
24 really hard but I do have, I have a membership, TWA  
25 member... the families on the line **(INAUDIBLE IN PLACES)**.



ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Your sound is a little, is there any way that you can improve the sound a bit.

JOSE DEJESUS: I'm sorry. Is that a little bit better?

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Better.

JOSE DEJESUS: The technology, I'm sorry. I got a bus operator assault this past weekend. It was bad because he had some customer to wear a mask and the thing about it. It was just for the safety of the operator. They do not have the 6 feet distance that they were doing before between the operators and the public and it is just trying to keep safe of the, from the virus. I, again, seeing the numbers are looking high and looking low it would probably, the fact of the matter is, the community that I serve, that I serve is the mandates doesn't work and then you have the bus operator. They don't want no problems, no hassles, and now. There is no way we could guarantee this but make it safe for our operators, the safety for the people driving the bus.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Do any Council Members have questions for this

panelist? Okay, our next panelist will be Mark Henry.  
Mark.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

MARK HENRY: Thank you Chairman Rodriguez for this invitation and good day to your colleagues on the City Council. Um, my name is Mark Henry. I'm the President and Business Agent for local 1056 and also Chair of our State Conference Board. Especially thank you to Speaker Johnson for his acknowledgements today of our transit workers this morning and Chairman Foye and President Feinberg for their acknowledgment of our losses to our members throughout the MTA system. I would be remiss if I didn't say thank you to Senator Chuck Schumer who has delivered to this agency and receiving funding needed to keep the agency going. I always appreciate this opportunity to tell you the plight of our members, we have been doing a lot from day one back in March. We were the individuals who were not able to shelter in place. We were those individuals who had problems getting PPE in the very beginning even though the agency has improved on that. Getting us our PPE and getting us COVID testing has been a great help to our members. The anxiety levels in our workforce and membership have gone through

continue to be great. Um, the vaccine as far as us receiving it, we have a very small window of opportunity has been an anxiety issue for our members to get vaccinated, to be able to work and provide the services that we do for the agency. Homelessness on the buses has been an issue. The anxiety of being laid off which is something that the chairman didn't mention but that was something that has been out there and has a spectator that hangs over the memberships head. Um, we are classified as essential. You know we, we move essential workers throughout the City and unfortunately we are without a contract at this time. TWE has a contract. The ATU not only my local but the other ATU locals that represent and move people throughout the five boroughs all without a contract. As stated earlier, Senator Schumer has delivered funding for this agency but yet we still to this day have been without a contract for almost two years. Our members have put their lives at risk, put their family at risk, deserving of hazard pay if that should be included in this. We are equally deserving. Our dedication and hard work should be recognized and never marginalized. Cuts to bus service which is something that we've seen and starting to notice, having talks

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 116

2 with the agency in regard to that needs to be shelved.  
3 Any time you try to cut any kind of transportation  
4 service in the City, it kills the neighborhood. It  
5 kills the city of New York from progressively moving  
6 back in to a prosperous environment for businesses to  
7 flourish and neighborhoods to flourish. We definitely  
8 see the.

9 SGT. MARTINEZ: Time is expired.

10 MARK HENRY: And we just make sure the, the  
11 overcrowding on busses does not occur. Again, I am  
12 always here as a resource and thank you again for your  
13 time Chairman, um, Rodriguez.

14 CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

15 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.  
16 Do any Council Members have questions for this  
17 panelist? Okay. Seeing none. Our next panelist will  
18 be Lisa Daglian. Lisa.

19 SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

20 LISA DAGLIAN: I'm sorry, I'll be right  
21 there. Let me just get my testimony in front of me.  
22 Okay. Greetings. My name is Lisa Daglian. I am the  
23 Executive Director of the Permanent Citizen's Advisory  
24 Committee to the MTA, (PCAC). Thank you for holding  
25 this hearing today. We'd like to first acknowledge

the transit workers who have kept the system running throughout the pandemic and thank them for their continued service. We also recognize and mourn those whose lives were lost. It was hard to believe that we were thrust into the vast unknown of COVID-19 a year ago. During this time, the MTA kept service running to allow essential workers to get where they needed to go so the rest of us could stay home. They have undertaken initiatives and implemented protocols. Some more successful than others to keep us safe. The MTAs physical resources have been devastated as a result. More Federal funding is critical to emerging from the crisis as is restarted the Capital Program. The City's \$3 billion is sorely needed sooner than later to help kick start it. Congestion Pricing and the money it brings will hopefully pick it up from there. Ridership continues to be low even with the vaccine roll out. In January, we released a white paper entitled, "How the MTA can transition into the new normal, getting riders back on board" which includes our recommendations on measures the MTA should take to increase rider confidence and get them back on transit. It will require money, additional funding is essential to move the needle on these best practices. We've learned a

lot in the past year including how COVID-19 is spread and the best ways to contain it. Accepted theory in May no longer holds true today though. Subways are still closed to night, overnight to regular riders, extensively to clean and disinfect the system. The trains are still running. As science tells us, that is not the most effective way to stop the spread. It is time to restore 24/7 service, tens of thousands are forced to find other ways to get to work or back home or to get vaccines between 1 and 5 a.m. From the start, we've been asking for metrics and milestones to help guide when the system can reopen. We've heard nothing as have you. And while we are big supporters of the bus network it is not a substitute for the subways. If people can go to football games and dine in restaurants and soon attend New York pop-ups events, they can certainly ride the subways overnight. Caring for the homeless means providing lasting shelter and services and the two should be seen as the separate issues they are. We all look forward to restarting the economy and getting on with life. 24/7 subway service is an integral part of what will help us get there. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

2 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you,  
3 Lisa. Do any Council Members have questions for this  
4 panelist? Okay. Seeing none. Next, we will call on  
5 Colin Wright. Colin.

6 SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

7 COLIN WRIGHT: Hi, good morning, I'm Colin  
8 Wright. I'd like to thank Chair Rodriguez and the  
9 Committee on Transportation for the opportunity to  
10 testify today. Um, as New York City continues to  
11 navigate its recovery from this pandemic, it's  
12 critical that City leaders do so with the promise of  
13 equity and justice for those in our City who has been  
14 hardest hit. We can't let these riders continue to  
15 be marginalized by policy that fails to interrogate  
16 harmful and disproportionate impacts. This year, the  
17 City can prioritize those riders. First, we ask for  
18 your continued support in demanding that Governor  
19 Cuomo restores 24 hour service. We appreciated the  
20 letter signed by Council Member Rodriguez and his  
21 colleagues in January which argued that the overnight  
22 subway closure is impeding 24 hour COVID vaccine  
23 distribution and should be ended. Governor Cuomo's  
24 decision closed the subway each night and stranded  
25 over 50,000 of your subway riding constituents by

making it nearly impossible for them to reach their overnight shifts at airports, hospitals, bodegas and construction sites. The vast majority are non-white and 32% are of low incomes according to census data compiled by my organization. The Governor stated reason for the closure to disinfect subway cars during the pandemic is not backed by the latest scientific evidence. In January, the leading Scientific Journal of Nature summed up the science on COVID transmission in an article with the headline, COVID-19 rarely spreads through surfaces so why are we still deep cleaning. The articles specifically called out the MTA's vast expenditure of resources during overnight cleaning as an example of what not to do. Contrary to what we initially thought, the risk of transmitting COVID on transit may be well below particular if riders wear masks. While the MTA attempts to regain confidence of riders with stringent cleaning, it appears that universal mask wearing and proper ventilation is what keeps the virus at bay. Second, we ask individual Council Members to support the Zoning for Transit Accessibility Proposal sponsored by the New York City Council, Department of City Planning, Mayor's Office for People with Disabilities and the



MTA and I am running out of time so I will just say that this policy is supported by organizations representing New Yorkers with disabilities, New Yorkers with children, older New Yorkers. It's a good policy and it will streamline and accelerate progress toward a fully accessible subway system. So, I will just wrap up by saying this is a pivotal time for New York City's future. We really must use this year to put the City in the best possible position to recover from the pandemic, a fair recovery for New York City will require making transit riders a priority. Thank you.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Colin. Do any Council Members have questions for this panelist? Okay. Our next panelist we will hear from is Eric McClure. Eric.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you. Thank you Chair Rodriguez for the opportunity to testify today. Um, like my colleagues and others today I would like to honor those frontline workers with the MTA who have kept New York City moving for the past 11 months and to remember those whose lives were lost to the virus. New York City's Transportation System is the engine

that driven our economy for more than 100 years. It has never been more important than it will be in rebuilding our economy as we recover from COVID-19. As the pandemic gripped New York last spring, subway ridership plummeted by 90% and it remains lower by 70%. Buses which actually ran on time with fewer cars on the streets and no fare collection for a period last year, are just 50% of normal ridership. Yet, automobile traffic is back to nearly pre-pandemic levels. However, recovery is completely unsustainable in an add to the cleaning, greener future that New York can only achieve with robust transit ridership. To get New Yorkers back on transit the MTA must restore 24/7 subway service. There is scant evidence that subways and buses have been a vector for the spread of COVID-19. Nor that foam light transmission is a significant factor but shutting down the subways for overnight cleaning sends the public a message that they are somehow unsafe. Sufficient cleaning can be accomplished while running subways around the clock which is what is happening anyway since trains continue to run without passengers between 1 a.m. and 5 a.m. Yet tens of thousands of New Yorkers overwhelmingly frontline workers, people of color and residents of

lower income communities were severely inconvenienced by the overnight shutdown. Enhanced bus services are a very poor substitute especially when you are trying to get to or from work at 3 in the morning to a COVID vaccination site which are open throughout the night while subways are not. We urge the Council to demand that the MTA immediately publish the metrics and time that it will use to evaluate resumption of 24/7 subway service without any further delay. They have done that for restaurants, gyms, and schools and must do the same for the most essential piece of our transportation network. The city that never sleeps can't recover without a full recovery of our subway system. The subways can't recover without a return to 24/7 service. Thank you.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

Do any Council Members have questions for this panelist? Seeing none. Our next panelist will be Leo Asen. Leo.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

LEO ASEN: Um, good afternoon, Chair Rodriguez and members of the Committee, my name is Leo Asen, I'm a volunteer and President of AARP New York which has 750,000 members of the 50+ community in New

York City. AARP would also like to thank all of the MTA employees for their incredible work and tireless efforts throughout the pandemic and acknowledge the loss of the 142 MTA employees as a result of the COVID Crisis. The MTA is the life boat of New York City and critical for the lives of the 50+ New Yorkers. However, there are issues as, as have been discussed. Many stations are ADA inaccessible and there are transit deserts in many of the outer boroughs. The MTA has made strides to improve these issues but the COVID pandemic has decimated the cap of the budget. AARP calls on the MTA to commit to the following measures to support the mass transit and the 50+ community. Continue avoiding any service cuts to balance the budget, especially bus services. When funds return to the Capital Budget prioritize ADA and station accessibility projects. Continue delaying the biennial fare hikes until the end of the COVID-19 pandemic and ensure that any new technology implemented such as the fair payment systems or journey planning applications is accessible for older adults and people with disabilities. Finally, AARP calls on the City to commit to preserving the full funding for

the fair fares program in the Fiscal Year 2022 Budget.  
Thank you very much for the opportunity to testify.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

Do any Council Members have questions for this  
panelist? Okay. Our next panelist will be H.P.  
Schroer. H.P.

SGT. MARTINEZ: Time begins now.

H.P. SCHROER: Try and unmute, oh. My name  
is H.P. Schroer, a veteran of WWII and Director  
YOUMEWE, a veteran's advocacy organization that  
represents 12,000 veterans attending college in New  
York City. Almost five years ago, the Mayor and the  
City Council and Corey Johnson approved veterans  
attending college in the City were to be able to  
purchase MTA fares at half price. The only  
requirements were they had to be honorable discharge  
and attend colleges in the City. Their income was not  
to be a factor in determining their eligibility.  
Sadly, after five years, less than 500 of the 12,000  
who were able, were able to purchase discounted fares.  
Why? Because of income restrictions imposed by the  
Department of Social Services. I ask Chairman  
Rodriguez if you could look in to this. Mindful of

the MTA financial difficulties there are two pending Bills in the State Legislature which are supported by a majority from both parties which gives the MTA a veterans half-fare discount. Not only do Bills A074 and Bill S1287 do this but the money can only be used for the discount and will not come from the MTA budget. I know Pat and board fights like hell to get money for the budget. Veterans have been the country's first respondents for over 250 years and we continue to fight for you. We ask that you fight for us. While we appreciate the words, "Thank you for your service." It is time for the current board to ask itself is it the right thing to do? And explain to the public why you continue to charge veterans full fare and why you haven't made any effort to ask the Governor to pass the Bills which gives you the money to fund the discount. I thank you.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you H.P., um, do any Council Members have questions for this panelist?

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I am more than happy to be working with you. Let's fight all of this and my team of a, of a committee and see if we can put any language or resolution and Bill.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

127

2 H.P. SCHROER: I thank you very kindly.  
3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Welcome.

5 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Our next  
6 panelist will be Tonya Cruz. Tonya.

7 SGT. MARTINEZ: Tonya, you may begin.

8 ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Go ahead  
9 Tonya. Okay, we can move on to the next panelist and  
10 we can check in again with Tonya. Our next panelist  
11 will be Carlos Castell Croke. Carlos.

12 SGT. MARTINEZ: The clock is ready.

13 CARLOS CASTELL CROKE: Good afternoon. My  
14 name is Carlos Castell Croke and I am the Associate of  
15 New York City Programs at the New York League of  
16 Conservation Voters and why NYLCV represents over  
17 30,000 members in New York City and we are committed  
18 to advancing as sustainability agenda and will make  
19 our people, our neighborhoods and our economy  
20 healthier and more resilient. I would like to thank  
21 Chair Rodriguez, Speaker Johnson and all of the Council  
22 Members here for the opportunity to testify today. New  
23 York City's extensive public transportation system is  
24 a point of pride for New Yorkers. The MTA trains and  
25 buses provide an accessible and affordable way for New

York City residents, tourists and local workers to get around the City without the need for personal automobiles. The MTA is particularly important to working class New Yorkers for a reliable commute to and from work. The service that the MTA provides are also critical in helping to curb pollution and fight climate change by providing cleaner mass transportation alternatives to cars. This hearing correctly focuses on MTA in the area of COVID because we all know that this past year has affected so many aspects of our daily lives including the transportation network. While the suspension of overnight MTA service was implemented to provide a window for proper cleaning, the suspension has also been incredibly difficult on the working class, people of color and especially our essential workers. Our transit system already underserves many of the communities where these New Yorkers reside as transit deserts too often overlap with low income communities of color. Now, recent State Budget Hearing has even revealed that the MTA has not saved any money from the overnight suspensions. Therefore, we believe that keeping the overnight service suspensions in place does more harm than good, especially as we continue to



encourage residents who relied on public transportation for years, not to instead rely on personal vehicles. In order to get more people out of very dangerous and congestion inducing personal vehicles and on to public transportation we need to improve our mass transit system. In 2019, the state authorized congestion pricing in a historic that paved the way for public transit renaissance. If that public transit renaissance and our recovery from the pandemic is conditional on using congestion pricing proceeds and other funding sources to ensure our public transportation functions at a high level efficiency. This is particularly relevant for our bus system, um, just to add before I run out of time is that we really thing that improvements to our bus system, with infrastructure, lane enforcement and signal improvements will really build the trust that we need before congestion pricing comes in to play. Thank you.

ELLIOT GLEN, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Carlos. Do any Council Members have questions for this panelist? Okay. Seeing none. Now I would like to call on anyone that I haven't called on who would like to testify. If you could please use the Zoom

Raise Hand Function. Okay Chair, I think that is the end of the public testimony.

CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you I should thank all the Sergeants and the whole team of the Council for helping us to conduct the remote hearing and also to the great team that we have at the Committee of Transportation and also to my Chief of Staff, Elliot's firm and my director Evelyn Correido (SP), my communication person Tomilita (SP) all of your guys are great. Doing a great job and I appreciate also the members of the public that came here to testify. I want to highlight that as far as I know under the new plan of Biden-Harris, a plan where we have the great leadership of Senator Schumer, the New York City Congress of Delegations including my colleague Council Members for the preparation for the Committee of the Transportation Committee, all of them working together to be sure that we give the financial support and one other thing that I want to highlight is that based on what we know, the MTA came clean through FEMA, all the laws they have also been getting through the reduction of ridership as far as I know and if that would be the case, I definitely would like to bring forth my call for the MTA again, not only to

continue providing the services of improving safety for riders but also to be sure that we restore the services 24/7 as soon as possible and that we continue working on our great ambition plan, especially with the Capital 2024 that with the great signal system and now the new leadership of the chief accessibility, our great New Yorkers, to work to make sure that all train stations will be accessible. I see the Tanya Cruz is here and so let's call her before we close this hearing.

TANYA CRUZ: Thank you Chair. I, um, I apologize for missing it. I was actually on the call with Council Member Miller. Um, what I wanted to do is, we at Community Board 13 and what we were getting from our constituents about the buses in southeast Queens is that there is a derelict on the ridership of wearing masks and the bus drivers are being, you know they are trying to do their best. They are being confronted. They are being threatened and people, the homeless has camped out on our buses. We are starting to see trash. There is so much that is going on in southeast Queens with the homelessness and people not wearing masks so that if there is anything that the

2 Council can do to assist the MTA with this, I  
3 appreciate that.

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
5 so thank you and before closing I want to reelaborate  
6 my thanks to all the colleagues, Speaker Johnson, Vice  
7 President to our President and during the time of the  
8 pandemic they cancelled a lot of time which we did  
9 most of it together distributing masks and allocating  
10 to restore the MTA services 24/7, with that, this  
11 hearing is adjourned.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 31, 2021