1		TEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND	1
2	B CITY COUNCIL	USINESS LICENSING	1
3	CITY OF NEW YOR	K	
4		X	
5	TRANSCRIPT OF T	HE MINUTES	
6	Of th	le	
7	COMMITTEE ON CO AND BUSINESS LI		
8		X	
9		T 20 2021	
10		January 28, 2021 Start: 11:10 a.m.	
11		Recess: 11:36 a.m.	
12	HELD AT:	REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)	
13	BEFORE:		
14		Chairperson	
15	COUNCIL MEMBE		
16		Justin L. Brannan Margaret S. Chin	
17		Ben Kallos Peter A. Koo	
18		Karen Koslowitz Brad S. Lander	
19		Carlos Menchaca Kalman Yeger	
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 2
2	SERGEANT BRADLEY: Computer recording is on.
3	SERGEANT SADOWSKY: Thank you.
4	SERGEANT HOPE: Cloud recording started.
5	SERGEANT SADOWSKY: Thank you.
6	SERGEANT PEREZ: Backup is rolling.
7	SERGEANT SADOWSKY: Thank you and Sergeant
8	Bradley.
9	SERGEANT BRADLEY: Okay, good morning and welcome
10	to today's New York City Council Vote on the
11	Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing.
12	Please, all Council Members please turn on your
13	videos. Thank you for your cooperation, we are ready
14	to begin Chair.
15	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Good morning everyone. This
16	is meeting is called to order [GAVEL]. Good morning,
17	my name is Diana Ayala and I am the Chair of the
18	Committee on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing.
19	I am joined today by my colleagues on the Committee,
20	Council Members Chin, Koslowitz, Koo, Yeger,
21	Menchaca, Brannan, Lander and Kallos.
22	Today, we will be voting on a historic piece of
23	legislation. Introduction Bill Number 1116-B
24	sponsored by Council Member Chin. This legislation
25	will finally expand the number of street vendor

1

2 permits and establish a much needed independent 3 street vendor enforcement unit. The City's street 4 vendors are a vital part of New York's history. They 5 not only enhance the vibrancy of public spaces and 6 increase the sense of community; they have always 7 added to the diversity of the city's retail and food 8 landscape.

9 And they consistently contribute to the city's economy. Although data is hard to come by to assess 10 11 the enormity of this classic New York Industry, a 2012 study quoted that the direct effort effect of 12 13 street vendors was estimated to produce more than 16,000 jobs \$78.5 million in wages and \$82 million to 14 15 the economy. Unfortunately like many industries, 16 street vending has been hit hard by COVID-19. The 17 reduced foot traffic due to lockdown mandates, work 18 from home orders and reduced tourism, means that 19 street vendors have lost 80-90 percent of their usual 20 sales over the course of the pandemic.

21 Unlike other small businesses and workers who are 22 eligible to access government assistance and 23 unemployment, the majority of the city street vendors 24 have not qualified for benefits under these programs. 25 Despite a risk of its important contributions to the

4

2 city, street vending in New York is historically 3 contentious. As the most densely populated city in 4 the country, public space in New York is a rare and valuable commodity and there are competing demands on 5 this precious resource pedestrians, delivery workers, 6 7 sidewalk cafés, newsstands, grocery stands, fire 8 hydrants, bus stops and all of the other growing 9 street furniture and traffic in our city are just some of the different elements vying for space on our 10 11 sidewalk. Therefore, it is important that when recognizing the value of street vendors and doing 12 13 what we can to ensure discipline ability, we also 14 balance their needs against a host of other issues 15 involved. This is why I am pleased that we are 16 bringing Intro. 1116-B to a vote today. 17 The city's complex regulation of street vending 18 has made enforcement inconsistent and contributed to

19 the tension between street vendors and brick and 20 morter businesses. Changes to our enforcement of 21 vending laws are necessary and the cap on permits to 22 legal events in this city has caused the illegal 23 market in permits to flourish.

24

1

COMMITTEE	ON	CONSUMER	AFFAIRS	AND
BUSIN	JESS	G LICENSIN	NG	

1

Intro. 1116-B aims to stop pitting small 2 3 businesses against each other. It forces us to recognize the small vendors are in fact our smallest 4 5 small businesses. By establishing both a comprehensive enforcement unit as well as a street 6 7 vendor advisory board, the city will fairly balance the midst of competing interests particularly when it 8 9 comes to using the wrath of regulations. The city street vendors deserve the recognition that they too 10 11 are legitimate small business owners and operators. 12 Only after the new enforcement unit has been in place for at least nine months will the bill release 13 14 new permits. 400 each year for the next 10 years. 15 Importantly, these new permits will prioritize

16 current vendors that have been working on a cart and 17 who have been on the wait list for an apartment. 18 They will also limit the number of folks who can vend 19 in Manhattan as opposed to the outer borough.

20 Port supervisory licenses, these new permits will 21 require a licensee to be present at the cart at all 22 times. After the rollout of new permits, all permits 23 will work in this way. The goal is that a permit 24 holder, the vender you know and you see regularly at 25 your favorite coffee, my favorite coffee lady, will n

6

2 not only be work that cart but will have ownership of 3 that cart.

With the package of this bill, the committee is
aiming to effectively address both the lack of
opportunity to folks and provide affordable good food
options but also bridge the gaps in enforcement and
the proliferation of the illegal market that thrives
because of decades old cap.

As stated, street vending is an important enterprise for vendors, consumers and the city's economic prosperity. The sidewalks need to accommodate a range of needs and enforcement needs to be functional. Intro. 1116-B will help mitigate these problems while balancing the competing needs of an interest of all New Yorkers.

I am happy that as Chair of the Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, I can finally bring this much needed reform to a vote. With that, I encourage my colleagues to vote in the affirmative but I will now pass it over to Council Member Chin, who is the prime sponsor of the bill for remarks.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair Ayala. You24 said it beautifully and explained it so well about

25

7

2 the bill. I am just so excited that we finally got 3 to this point after so many years. And the people 4 who have been waiting are the hard working vendors. Most of them are immigrants, women, they just want to 5 be able to start a small business, make a living, 6 7 support their families and we have to support them 8 because as our Chair said, they are part of economy. 9 They are part of New York City's history and our landscape. 10

11 So, it's about time and the legislation will 12 address a lot of the issues that people have been 13 complaining about with the enforcement unit and a 14 vendor advisory committee forward that will bring 15 together all the agencies, city agencies that are 16 involved in the vending and the business community 17 and the vender community and they will be able to 18 work together to you know look at all of the issues 19 and make recommendations to the city to improve the 20 system.

21 So, it's about time we pass this bill and I 22 wanted to thank you know, all of the advocates, the 23 Street Vendor Project and all of the community 24 organizations that have been so supportive and all

25

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 8
2	the staff that has worked on this for so many years
3	and I really urge my colleagues to support this bill
4	because it is the right thing to do. Thank you.
5	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. I will now pass
6	it over to the Clerk for a call to the vote.
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk
8	roll call vote Committee on Consumer Affairs and
9	Business Licensing Proposed Introduction 1116-B.
10	Chair Ayala?
11	JEFF BAKER: I am sorry, Billy, can you hold the
12	vote for one second?
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Sure, sure.
14	JEFF BAKER: Council Member Yeger had his hand
15	raised and he would like to be recognized to speak.
16	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I am sorry about that.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you Madam Chair.
18	Good morning. Hi, thank you very much Madam Chair.
19	Thank you my colleagues. I just want to speak
20	briefly before we vote. Obviously we know how the
21	vote is going to turn out but I would like to say the
22	following on the record.
23	There is no doubt in my mind that the topic of
24	vendor licenses has long begged to be visited by this
25	

9

2 Council. The first hearing on this bill was held in 3 April of 2019, more than a year and a half ago and over a year before the beginning of the pandemic and 4 the resulting economic turmoil. That economic 5 turmoil has to be sure effected vendors, as my 6 colleagues have said but I think it is also important 7 to note how the economic turmoil has effected brick 8 9 and morter businesses.

Countless retail stores eateries have permanently 10 11 shuttered in our city to the point where I am not 12 even certain there is a present accurate count of how 13 many have closed, how many jobs have permanently 14 disappeared but we have all seen the shuttered 15 storefronts in our neighborhoods. None of this is to 16 say that the vendor license topic has been properly 17 handled by the city. There has never been a real crackdown on absentee license holders who take effect 18 19 of vendors. As my colleagues have noted publicly and 20 throughout this process. There has never been a real 21 crackdown on license vendors who set up shop right outside of the door of a taxpaying establishment. 2.2 23 These are real issues that need to be addressed and in some ways, this bill will address that. 24

1

2 In my view, the enforcement aspect of the bill 3 should take affect first to ensure that it is 4 actually done. It is done fairly and it is done 5 right. And I think that should happen before we legislate the issuance of new licenses. At the very 6 7 least, I do believe this Council should have held a new hearing to hear from the effected taxpayers 8 9 before moving forward with this legislation.

So, with that, I honor very much the incredible 10 11 work, the incredible amount of work, truly incredible 12 that's been done by the sponsors, by members of this 13 body, by staff, by the affected folks who have an 14 interest in this bill in crafting his legislation and 15 getting it to the right place. But for these and 16 many other reasons, I can't support today's bill and 17 I really do thank you Madam Chair for giving me the 18 opportunity to speak. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. Any other members 20 have their hand up?

JEFF BAKER: No, we may proceed. CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay, we may proceed. COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay, William Martin Committee Clerk roll call vote Committee on Consumer Affairs Introduction 1116-B Chair Ayala?

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 11
2	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I vote aye.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?
4	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Kallos?
6	COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo? You are muted Council
8	Member Koo.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Chair Ayala, may I
10	explain my vote?
11	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Yes, you may.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. So, street
13	vending has long been an issue in my community in
14	Flushing. It got so bad that I had to pass a law to
15	completely restrict vending in congested areas. Over
16	the last year, those areas have still been
17	overwhelmed by vending, but it has literally been
18	ignored by every city agencies tasked with regulating
19	them.
20	The Mayor's Office, NYPD, Consumer Affairs, DOT,
21	no one wants anything to do with street vending
22	enforcement. We even had agencies weeks arrange
23	after we got complaints but many agencies just didn't
24	even bother showing up. It is obvious that there is
25	

12

2 simply no appetite by the Mayor to direct any city 3 agency to enforce street vending.

It doesn't matter that business people complain or that people get sick from eating the food, or the smoke goes in windows or there is litter on the streets. If there is no directive from the Mayor, then nothing gets done. I am sympathetic to street vendors. I think they deserve a place in our city.

But they need to be regulated and enforced, just like everyone else. That hasn't happened in years. Because of this, I will be voting yes today. The reason is that this is the only concerted effort to create a dedicated enforcement agency whose sole job is to enforce vending.

16 I am also pleased to see that the agency will be 17 created first. The agency will be created first 18 before lifting the cap and they will be authorized to 19 enforce a license and licensed vending. It is time 20 to stop passing the buck. Our regulatory agencies 21 has been too long standing around in a circle with 2.2 every body pointing their finger at someone else. 23 The bill isn't perfect but it is a good first step and I truly hope you will put us on a path to work 24

25

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 13
2	finally reaching some equilibrium among both street
3	vendors and brick and morter businesses.
4	Finally, I want to use this opportunity to say
5	that we need to be fair to our small businesses. I
6	have a bill, Intro. 1145 that will examine stores
7	from item pricing requirements. Provided they have
8	scanners accessible to customers.
9	During the pandemic, this will help reduce their
10	already significant burdens and I encourage my
11	colleagues to sign, support the bill but for today, I
12	will vote yes on 1116-B. Thank you.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you Council Member.
14	Koslowitz?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be excused to
16	explain my vote? For years we worked on vendors. In
17	the 90's, I worked on vendors so much that it was a
18	horrible, horrible situation. This bill is the
19	closest to a bill that's really going to help the
20	individual person. Give them something that they can
21	count on. Having their own cart, their own
22	merchandise and no Black markets.
23	I have to say, I have heard many times that
24	vendors hurt restaurants. That is absolutely not
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 14
2	true. You are not going to go — if you want to go to
3	a restaurant, you are not going to stop off at a
4	vendor, you are going to go to the restaurants. So,
5	I don't see how they can hurt restaurants.
6	So, Margaret, congratulations. This is a great
7	step forward and hopefully, the people that have
8	these carts have a good life and a prosperous life
9	like other business people. So, with that, I gladly
10	vote aye.
11	COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?
12	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request permission to
13	explain my vote?
14	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Permission granted.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you so much Chair
16	and congratulations especially to Council Member Chin
17	and to you as well. This is such a thoughtful
18	conversation and a good process.
19	Obviously, a situation where we have got various
20	stakeholders that we care about all of whom see
21	themselves pitted against each other is the most
22	difficult time of all. Of course New Yorkers love
23	and want to support street vendors and see in them.
24	So many of our immigrant stories of our families
25	coming here to get a chance, we see how hard that

2 work is. We know those folks can't apply for PPP you 3 know, and we want immigrants to have a chance to 4 survive and thrive.

1

And of course, we also love our brick and morter 5 small businesses and we see what's happening during 6 7 the pandemic and how hard it was before and we want 8 them to survive and thrive and it is not easy to 9 balance those interests but - and I will say, I wish we had gotten there long ago. If we had had the 10 11 courage collectively to move through this process 12 earlier, even though it was hard. In the last term there was an effort earlier and this term there was 13 14 an effort, Margaret, you have been part of those and 15 so many others on this call have. Street Vendor 16 Project and organized street vendors have kept 17 pushing us but because it is difficult, we didn't get 18 it done and as a result, now we have to do it when it 19 is even harder.

But the right answer - so I wish we had done it earlier and then we wouldn't be doing it in a pandemic when small businesses who are brick and morter have also had such a hard time and of course therefore feel more put upon, not especially by street vendors but by the pandemic.

2 So, I wish we had done it earlier. But this 3 process is a good one. We should not continue to 4 punish low-income immigrants who are street vendors 5 because the pandemic has also made it harder for 6 brick and morter small businesses.

1

7 So, there will be no perfect bill here but this 8 is a very good one. It really gets this issue right. 9 Balancing all the interests. Props to everybody who worked on it. To the Speaker and his team to Council 10 11 Member Chin and her team to Street Vendor Project and 12 their allies and to the Chambers and the Small 13 Business folks who show up to advocate for the folks 14 they care about even if at the end of the day they 15 don't support the bill.

16 It does bare saying that we have not done enough 17 for our small businesses and of course, we have much more to do. So, let's consider Council Member Koo's 18 19 bill about item pricing. I have got a bill coming 20 about mandatory PPE provision. In Albany, they have got rent relief bills and small business recovery 21 lease bills and back at this Council, we can consider 2.2 23 commercial rent stabilization. There are so many more ways that we need to show up for our small 24 businesses and I feel deeply committed to do so. 25 But

1

for today, I celebrate this good step forward for our street vendors who work so hard and deserve an opportunity. Should not be shunted into the Black market and should have a real opportunity to have survive and thrive.

7 Just one last small thing, I do think it is also worth noting that the open restaurant and open retail 8 9 programs that we have passed during this pandemic and are fighting hard to make sure remain permanent, do 10 11 create an opportunity for brick and morter small 12 businesses who want to, to apply for free to get to 13 use the sidewalk and street space in front of their 14 businesses. That is not a cure all and many other 15 things in this bill are critical to make sure that 16 there is good enforcement and protocols.

17 But I do just want to note that there is that 18 opportunity for brick and morter small businesses to 19 use the spaces in front of their stores in the 20 pandemic and let's keep that going past the pandemic 21 so that they have the opportunity as well. Thank you so much and I proudly vote aye. 2.2 23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca? COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to explain 24 25 my vote?

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 18
2	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Permission granted.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I want to
4	say thank you to Speaker Johnson and his team,
5	Council Member Chin and our new Chair of the
6	Committee, welcome Council Member and Chair Ayala.
7	The incredible work that we have been doing with the
8	vendor project has been long term and the small
9	businesses that we have spoken to, the union
10	representatives that we have spoken to. All of the
11	advocates on all of the sides have shared their
12	concerns and those who have worked with us, helped us
13	all get to this historic point and I am proud to be a
14	co-prime sponsor for this bill. A bill that is like
15	Council Member Lander said, long overdue.
16	It has been almost half a century since the
17	Council has taken any positive action on the city's
18	current street vendor permit and enforcement system
19	and throughout that time, we have seen a rampant
20	underground market grow. Exploitation of our
21	immigrant workers grow and an over policing and
22	discrimination of vendors and outdated regulations
23	that have created disorderly and frustration in our
24	commercial corridors.

1

2 And that's what we are getting in response to 3 this bill, Chambers of Commerce are saying what they are saying and there is a lot of beliefs but those 4 are all myths. What we know is that street vendors 5 actually create a more positive impact to our 6 7 commercial corridors and with this Intro. 1116-B, we have the opportunity to modernize sorely outdated 8 9 regulations that will serve both street vendors and brick and morter businesses. 10

Our bill creates the office of Street Vendor Enforcement. A new dedicated unit within the city government to justly and firmly enforce the new laws. Once this enforcement unit is up and running for nine months, the permit cap will slowly be rolled back and 400 new, brand new, food vending permits will be issued annually for the next ten years.

18 Most importantly, this Intro. establishes a 19 street vendor advisory board that includes 20 representatives from the vendor community. Small 21 businesses in our community and the city agencies. And unlike the current outdated system, the new 2.2 23 legislation will ensure that stakeholders have a voice to address issues as the arise and we know that 24 25 they will arise.

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 20
2	So, whether it is on $5^{ ext{th}}$ Avenue, a hot dog stand
3	or China Town fruit cart or in Sunset Park a taco
4	truck. Street vendors are deeply embedded in the
5	vibrant culture of our city. It is in the fabric of
6	the city. Both in the past, present and in our
7	future. Our street vendors were on the frontlines of
8	the pandemic, feeding our city. They are small
9	business owners. Many of them who were left out of
10	state and federal emergency aid. Street vendors also
11	tell a beautiful American story of those who started
12	out on the streets vending and then owning their own
13	brick and morter storefront or restaurant.
14	Intro. 116-B does not pit street vendors against
15	other small businesses. Our bill is the beginning of
16	an ongoing effort to support all and small
17	businesses, so that they can recover from this
18	devastating economic impact brought about by COVID-19
19	pandemic.
20	And with that, I vote aye so proudly and I just
21	want to say thank you to everyone on this Committee
22	for doing the good work for Margaret Chin and her

for doing the good work for Margaret Chin and her team and for the incredible street vendor power that they have built. Let's keep going. Thank you. I vote aye.

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 21
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Brannan?
3	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: May I have permission to
4	explain my vote.
5	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Permission granted.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you Chair. So, as
7	the husband of a small business owner who had to
8	close her business after ten years because of COVID,
9	I do feel particularly tuned into what our local
10	small businesses are going through right now.
11	I also think that there is a lot of
12	misinformation out there about this bill. Right now,
13	it is basically the Wild West out there for our food
14	carts. For instance, as far as enforcement is
15	concerned, any time I have had an issue with an
16	illegal vendor just popping up, I have had to call in
17	favors to the NYPD or City Hall to actually get
18	action taken.
19	And mainly because there is such a mess of rules
20	and regulations that no one really knows, no one
21	agency knows the rules. Having a dedicated
22	enforcement unit where you have a specially trained
23	agents who can enforce all general food and vending
24	rules is what we have needed for a very long time.
25	

22

And making sure that this new unit is up and running before we you know, release any new permits, it just makes a lot of sense. So, I appreciate that. Making sure that this unit is up and running for almost a year before we consider releasing new permits is important to.

The issue of this idea of these vendor tycoons 8 9 who live down in Florida and are renting out ten different trucks up in Brooklyn, is insane. 10 It is 11 absolutely crazy and its got end and we need to get 12 to a place where if you have the permit, you have to 13 be present with the cart. You can't be leasing it 14 out and paying your workers garbage while you are out 15 of the state and leasing out your carts.

16 So, I hope we will get to a place where all 17 permit holders have to be present at the cart. I 18 think that's really important and I think something 19 that we need to fight towards.

But I think this bill is great. I think there is a lot of misinformation out there about this bill. I understand the sensitivity around the timing of this bill, especially considering that the earliest we would see any change would be the summer of 2022.

25

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 23
2	But I apricate the thrust of the bill and
3	especially for me in my experience is the enforcement
4	of vendors that just pop up. Not just for resident
5	complaints but frankly for other vendors who are
6	following the rules and then when other vendors
7	aren't following the rules and there is no one to
8	really enforce them. So, we have to level that
9	playing field for the folks that are following the
10	rules and doing the right thing.
11	So, with all of that, I vote aye. Thank you.
12	COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Council Member
13	Yeger?
14	COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote no. Thank you.
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: A vote of eight in the
16	affirmative, one in the negative and no abstentions.
17	Proposed Introduction 1116-B has been adopted by the
18	Committee. Thank you.
19	CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. Thank you all for
20	coming in. Again, congratulations Margaret. You are
21	a champion, my hero.
22	With that, we conclude this hearing. Thank you
23	guys, see you later.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Congratulations Margaret.
ļ	

1	COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND BUSINESS LICENSING 24
2	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Peter, I really
3	appreciate your support.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, thank you.
5	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Okay, the live has ended.
6	Thank you all. See you at Stated. [GAVEL]
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____ February 15, 2021