

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

January 21, 2010

Start: 2:17 pm

Recess: 3:30 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E: JOEL RIVERA  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Charles Barron  
Gale A. Brewer  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret Chin  
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.  
Elizabeth Crowley  
Inez E. Dickens  
Erik Martin Dilan  
Daniel Dromm  
Mathieu Eugene  
Simcha Felder  
Julissa Ferreras

## A P P E A R A N C E S

## COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Lewis A. Fidler  
Helen D. Foster  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
James F. Gennaro  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Sara M. Gonzalez  
Daniel J. Halloran  
Vincent Ignizio  
Robert Jackson  
Letitia James  
Peter Koo  
G. Oliver Koppell  
Karen Koslowitz  
Brad Lander  
Jessica S. Lappin  
Stephen Levin  
Melissa Mark-Viverito  
Darlene Mealy  
Rosie Mendez  
Michael C. Nelson  
James S. Oddo  
Christine C. Quinn  
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.  
Diana Reyna  
Ydanis Rodriguez  
Deborah Rose  
James Sanders, Jr.  
Larry B. Seabrook  
Eric Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.  
James G. Van Bramer  
Mark Weprin  
Thomas White, Jr.  
Jumaane D. Williams

1

2

SPEAKER QUINN: Ceremonial today.

3

And if I could ask--everyone is welcome, but if I

4

could ask in particular the members of the Bronx

5

delegation to come up because we have a very

6

important--could we get a little quiet?

7

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down,

8

please. Keep it down, please, keep it down.

9

[Off mic]

10

SPEAKER QUINN: And Council Member

11

Arroyo has a presentation to make to the South

12

Bronx Campus High School Varsity football team, so

13

if we could ask the members of the football team

14

who are here to come up and join us as well. Just

15

step up a little--

16

[Off mic]

17

SPEAKER QUINN: And as they're

18

making their way up, if we could just get a little

19

quiet for the football team.

20

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,

21

please, keep it down.

22

SPEAKER QUINN: Great. Come on up,

23

folks. And let me turn the microphone over to

24

Council Member Arroyo.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you,

1

2 Madam Speaker. Come on gentlemen, we want to show  
3 you off, we're so proud of you.

4

5 My colleagues, I'd like you to  
6 congratulate--come on, back here, guys. You're  
7 all taller than us so it's okay for you to stand  
8 behind us.

8

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Yeah, let's move up  
10 a little more--

10

[Crosstalk]

11

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Let's move  
13 up.

13

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Make two lines  
15 maybe or...

15

[Off mic]

16

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: My  
18 colleagues, I introduce you to the South Bronx  
19 High School Campus Varsity football team, a team  
20 that won the Cup Bowl in November of last year and  
21 we wanted to bring them here to say to them how  
22 proud we are of them. In particular, in the Bronx  
23 delegation, I know that we've been anticipating  
24 your coming to visit with us here.

24

25 The South Bronx High School Campus  
has been in existence since about 2003 and it's

1

2 composed of three schools: The South Bronx Village  
3 Prep, New Explorers, and the Urban Assembly School  
4 for Careers in Sports.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: And their  
7 principals together with Lou, the Athletic  
8 Director, and their Head Coach, Jose Cosme, have  
9 woven a fabric in that school community that  
10 continually graduates above 75% of their student  
11 body in four years, not a small feat, especially  
12 with all of the things that are happening with the  
13 high school drop-out rates in our city.

14 They went the season undefeated,  
15 although, Jose, when he took the coach here, he's  
16 also the Dean and maybe this has something to do  
17 with it, his first season as Head Coach, they lost  
18 seven games in a row only won two, right? That  
19 season. They've been playing together as a school  
20 community for about six years, in six years they  
21 go undefeated and in November win the Bowl Cup,  
22 oh, the Cup Bowl in Brooklyn. What school did you  
23 beat?

24 MALE VOICE: Automotive, Automotive  
25 High School.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Automotive  
3 High School, I don't know what member represents.  
4 It was an incredible, it was an incredible game  
5 and it went down to the last few seconds, but  
6 congratulations to all of you, we are so proud of  
7 you and look forward to incredible things from you  
8 as you enter the world of adulthood and  
9 responsibility. Enjoy your high school years,  
10 they're going to be the best things you remember  
11 because, as an adult, a lot of things are going to  
12 come your way, but you have, with your coach and  
13 Lou and your principals, developed some incredible  
14 skills on how to succeed. This is only one of the  
15 things that's ahead of you. Congratulations and  
16 thank you for making us so proud.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: And if we could ask  
18 the clerk to read the proclamation, but we hope  
19 your guys good fortune and a lot of you are  
20 wearing green, means that you're going to extend  
21 your good fortune to the Jets this weekend and  
22 beyond too, so we're going to see this as a good  
23 luck charm. Everybody's a Jets fan this week.

24 All right, if the clerk could read  
25 the proclamation and then we'll hear from the team

1

2 and the coaches.

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,  
4 please.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council, City of  
6 New York Proclamation:

7 WHEREAS, the Council of the City of  
8 New York is proud to honor the 2008-2009 South  
9 Bronx Campus High School Varsity football team for  
10 their outstanding commitment to the pursuit of  
11 excellence, for their exceptional performance in  
12 sportsmanship, for fostering great school pride  
13 and team spirit, and for winning the 2009 Cup  
14 Division New York City Public School Championship;  
15 and

16 WHEREAS, the South Bronx Campus  
17 High School Varsity football team is comprised of  
18 very talented players from all three Bronx, South  
19 Bronx Campus schools, which include: The Urban  
20 Assembly School for Career in Sports, the New  
21 Explorers High School, and the Mott Haven Village  
22 Preparatory School. And,

23 WHEREAS, after going nine to one  
24 during the 2008-'09 season, the South--excuse me--  
25 the South Bronx Varsity football team returned

1  
2 determined to win a championship and manage the  
3 perfect 12 to 0 record in the 2009-2010 varsity  
4 season in only its sixth year as a varsity  
5 football team. On November 22nd, 2009, the South  
6 Bronx Varsity football team achieved its goal by  
7 defeating Automotive High School 15 to 14 with a  
8 come-from-behind victory and winning the 2009 PSAL  
9 New York City Football Championship Cup Division.

10 NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT KNOWN that  
11 the Council of the City of New York is proud to  
12 honor the '08/'09 South Bronx Campus High School  
13 Varsity football team and congratulates them on  
14 winning the Cup Division, New York City Public  
15 School Championship.

16 Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for the  
17 entire Council; Maria del Carmen Arroyo, Council  
18 Member 17th District, the Bronx; and all the  
19 Members of the Bronx Delegation.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Yeah [off mic].

21 [Off mic]

22 MALE VOICE: I just want to thank  
23 all the Council Members and everyone here at City  
24 Hall for having us and inviting us down today.  
25 It's a great group of kids and we look forward to

1  
2 trying to maintain and establish our name in the  
3 South Bronx as being a nice place to be and a good  
4 place to be a part of and that very many good  
5 people come out of the South Bronx.

6 SPEAKER QUINN: And a great place  
7 to get an education.

8 MALE VOICE: And a great place to  
9 get an education, absolutely. I agree. And I'd  
10 like to, first of all, guys, it doesn't get any  
11 better than this, soak it in, enjoy it.

12 But I'd like to thank Maria del  
13 Carmen Arroyo, she really supports our school and  
14 that Sunday when they were out there on the field  
15 and we were on the side going nuts, she was down  
16 at the end, she couldn't come down to the 50 yard  
17 line because she had her grandson with her, but  
18 she really supports us in many ways and really it  
19 comes from the heart, I really want to thank her  
20 for all that support.

21 MALE VOICE: I agree, thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you,  
23 Lou. And that sentiment is shared by every member  
24 of the Bronx Delegation. Whenever the discussion  
25 about how we can make our schools better, we know

1  
2 that you guys are there making us all proud with  
3 the work that you're doing, not only on the field,  
4 but in the classroom as well.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you guys very  
6 much. Congratulations. Thank you.

7 [Off mic]

8 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you guys,  
9 congratulations. And I just--

10 [Off mic]

11 SPEAKER QUINN: And if I could  
12 just--shhh, I'm not sure he's still in the  
13 Chamber, but I wanted to recognize a Council alum  
14 who's with us today, Doug Appell [phonetic], who  
15 was a Sergeant-at-Arms for 17 years for the City  
16 Council. Is Doug still here?

17 [Off mic]

18 SPEAKER QUINN: All right. Well  
19 he's down in the lounge, well I shall let him know  
20 we recognized him. Okay, that concludes our  
21 ceremonials, thank you.

22 [Long pause]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and  
24 gentlemen, can I have your attention, please? Can  
25 I have your attention, please? At this time, can

1  
2 you please place all cell phones and pagers to  
3 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees and  
4 lobbyists please leave the main floor of the  
5 Chambers. And as a reminder to our members of the  
6 public seated in the balcony, there will be no  
7 shouting, cheering, or yelling during the course  
8 of the Stated Meeting. Thank you.

9 [Long pause]

10 [Off mic]

11 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Ladies and  
12 gentlemen, please rise for the Pledge of  
13 Allegiance.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

15 MULTIPLE VOICES: I pledge  
16 allegiance to the flag of the United States of  
17 America and to the Republic for which it stands,  
18 one nation, under God, indivisible, with liberty  
19 and justice for all.

20 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: The meeting's  
21 now in order. Roll call--reopening the recessed  
22 meeting of January 6, 2010, to be held today,  
23 January 21st, 2010. The meeting is called to  
24 order. Roll call, please.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Here.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Felder.  
24 [No response]  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Foster.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Here.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Present.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: James.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Here.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:  
13 Here.  
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.  
15 [No response]  
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.  
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Nelson.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.  
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.  
21 [No response]  
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.  
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.

1

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

2

3

[No response]

4

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Present.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Seabrook.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Present,

10

and with permission, Mr. Majority Leader, I'd like

11

to vote aye on all matters on this recessed Stated

12

Meeting.

13

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: So ordered.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: I vote

15

aye.

16

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich. Ulrich.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

18

COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

20

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

22

COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Vann.

25

[No response]

1

2

COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

4

COUNCIL CLERK: White.

5

[No response]

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.

12

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

13

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Here.

14

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

15

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

16

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Quorum is

17

present at this point in time, we're going to

18

adjourn the recessed meeting, meeting is

19

adjourned. We're now going to open the Stated

20

Meeting of January 21st, 2010. Can we have an

21

additional roll call, please.

22

COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.

1  
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.  
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.  
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Present.  
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.  
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.  
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.  
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.  
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.  
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Felder.  
21 [No response]  
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.  
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.

1

2

COUNCIL CLERK: Foster.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Here.

4

COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Present.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.

12

COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN:

14

Remarkably still here.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.

17

COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.

19

COUNCIL CLERK: James.

20

[No response]

21

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Here.

23

COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell. Koppell.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

1

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

2

3

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

5

COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Sorry, I

7

was showing him pictures of my son. Aye.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

12

Here.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

17

COUNCIL CLERK: Nelson.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.

19

COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.

20

[No response]

21

COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.

23

COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

1

[No response]

2

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

4

COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Here.

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Seabrook.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Here.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

12

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

14

COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

16

COUNCIL CLERK: Vann.

17

[No response]

18

COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

20

COUNCIL CLERK: White.

21

[No response]

22

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.

25

1

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.

2

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

3

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Here.

4

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

5

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

6

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Quorum is

7

present. Ladies and gentlemen, please rise for

8

the invocation being delivered today by our

9

colleague, Council Member Larry Seabrook.

10

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: May we

12

bow our heads. God of our weary years, God of our

13

silent tears, God who has brought us far along the

14

way, for we are gathered here today to do the

15

people's business and it is important that we

16

begin to do that, but in our deliberation each and

17

every day as we thank and do good for people, we

18

must never forget the Haitian people and we ask

19

for all of the blessings that can be bestowed upon

20

a people, please allow them to be showered with

21

blessings from this chamber to Port-au-Prince.

22

These and many other blessings we ask in Thy name,

23

Amen.

24

MULTIPLE VOICES: Amen.

25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Adoption of  
3 the minutes, Council Member Comrie?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Motion that  
5 the Minutes of the Stated Meetings of November  
6 16th and November 30th, 2009, be adopted as  
7 printed.

8 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: So ordered.  
9 We've also been joined by Assemblywoman Inez  
10 Barron, who is with us in the audience as well.

11 Messages and Papers from the Mayor?

12 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

13 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Communication  
14 from City, County, and Borough Offices?

15 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

16 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Petitions and  
17 Communications.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

19 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Land Use Call-  
20 Ups?

21 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

22 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Communication  
23 from the Speaker.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Before  
25 I make a--

1  
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down,  
3 please.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: --a statement or  
5 two on the actions we're taking today, I just want  
6 to take a moment to echo the sentiments of Council  
7 Member Seabrook and remind all of us that  
8 obviously all of our thoughts and prayers and  
9 hopes are with the people of Haiti.

10 I also want to thank all of my  
11 colleagues who have been tremendously supportive  
12 and generous as it relates to the City's efforts  
13 to bring relief and support to the people of  
14 Haiti. I want to in particular though single out  
15 two of our colleagues who have been working really  
16 around the clock to help support the Haitian  
17 community here in New York City and support the  
18 people of Haiti: Council Member Dr. Mathieu  
19 Eugene and Council Member Jumaane Williams.

20 [Applause]

21 SPEAKER QUINN: Council Members  
22 Eugene and Williams together probably represent  
23 the largest number of Haitians anywhere in the  
24 world outside of Haiti and both of their offices  
25 have been working literally around the clock to

1  
2 try to help people find out where their families  
3 are, locate their families, help people who know  
4 that they've lost families deal with that  
5 tremendous grief, and also to help people navigate  
6 the immigration system and other issues. I want  
7 to really thank them. I again want to thank all  
8 of my colleagues who have been constantly in  
9 contact and offering so much support to Council  
10 Member Williams and Council Member Eugene and I  
11 just want to call on Council Member Eugene and  
12 Council Member Williams for comments.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you  
14 very much, Madam Speaker. As you know, these are  
15 very trying time for the Haitian people. We in  
16 the Haitian community are dealing with grief and  
17 sorrow as we see our native country, our beloved  
18 Haiti, going through such horrific tragedy.

19 People in the Haitian community  
20 throughout the world are traumatized by the loss  
21 of so many relatives and friends and the [off mic]  
22 destruction of this country, Haiti [off mic] that  
23 they carry deep inside their soul and deep inside  
24 their heart. There is no person of Haitian  
25 descent that is not affected by this devastating

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

tragedy. However, it's brought me comfort to see the commitment and the desire of so many people, including you, my dear colleagues in the City Council, who are working with me to send relief and demonstrate to the survivors that Haiti is not alone in its struggle to recover. From the bottom of my heart on my own behalf and on behalf of all my Haitian brothers and sisters, thank you very much. And I want to [off mic] also the leadership of Speaker Quinn in dealing with this matter.

With hundred of thousand of people in Port-au-Prince left homeless, we must work quickly to ensure that the basic humanity and necessities are met and that some labor of social stability is restored as soon as possible.

With each passing day, people are dying and those who survive are in desperate need of water, food, shelter, and medical care. I applaud the international organization and all the volunteers who are giving of themselves to provide those need to my native land and I urge you to continue working together with me to assist Haiti now and in the future.

Let me also mention that last week

1  
2 Speaker Quinn and the Mayor announced the creation  
3 of a municipal fundraising program to aid in the  
4 Haitian relief effort. The program would allow  
5 all the city employees to donate money from their  
6 paychecks. The money will go to reputable  
7 organization currently on the ground and providing  
8 relief in Haiti. The City [off mic] payroll  
9 deduction program will begin with the City  
10 paycheck issued on February 5th, 2010, and run for  
11 four pay period. There are 300,000 city  
12 employees. If each of us donate only \$1 by  
13 paycheck for the full period for Haiti, we would  
14 raise 1.2 million to help the Haitian in needs.  
15 To participate, all you have to do is log into  
16 nycaps employee self-service and have your  
17 employee I.D. number and password. Administrative  
18 services can help anyone who has questions. I  
19 hope that every City Council member participate in  
20 this program, setting a clear example for our  
21 employees, other city workers, and all New  
22 Yorkers.

23 And, again, from the bottom of my  
24 hear, on my own behalf, and on behalf of all my  
25 brothers and sisters, thank you very much for

1

everything you are doing. Thank you.

2

3

[Applause]

4

[Off mic]

5

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Council

6

Member Eugene, and just before I call on Council

7

Member Williams and then Council Member Cabrera,

8

Dr. Eugene, I just want to thank you again, you

9

have been a tremendous power of example and a

10

tremendous inspiration, not just to all of us, but

11

to all New York and the unbelievably strong and

12

dignified way you have stood up and been a leader

13

in the face of just which is just unthinkable,

14

unthinkable tragedy, so thank you again so very

15

much.

16

Council Member Williams?

17

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah,

18

first I want to give a special thanks and prayers

19

to Council Member Eugene because, although I

20

represent a large Haitian constituency, Council

21

Member Eugene has the added responsibility being

22

from there, his family still being there and

23

having to lead, so I want to give a special thank

24

you and prayers to him.

25

And I want to thank everyone also

1  
2 who has offered support for my community and thank  
3 the Speaker and the Mayor for that program that  
4 the Council Member just spoke about and then also  
5 encourage everyone to please participate. Of  
6 course, as we've been saying, we're asking for  
7 people not to donate supplies at this time unless  
8 you can answer three questions. The first is, how  
9 is it getting from the point of deposit to a plane  
10 or a boat. The second is what plane or boat is  
11 bringing it to Haiti, and the third is once it's  
12 in Haiti, who's going to be able to distribute it  
13 and who is going to get it to the people who need  
14 it. And if those three questions can't be  
15 answered, we're asking you to refrain from  
16 supporting and giving particularly monetary  
17 contributions to those who can deliver on the  
18 services.

19           Also, in keeping with what Mathieu  
20 Eugene was talking about for a very long time and  
21 consolidating efforts, in my district, we launched  
22 a 45th District Haitian relief effort and that's  
23 going to be consolidating everything that's going  
24 on in my district. Also, one, to help provide  
25 disaster relief, and two, to have hopefully a

1  
2 structure in place that can help in the rebuilding  
3 process. So as I said, they're going to be  
4 coordinating, also they'll be fact checking daily  
5 with all the groups, all the congress people, the  
6 U.N., making sure that we have the most up-to-date  
7 information and, of course, working with Council  
8 Member Eugene and the Speaker. So there's a lot  
9 of ghost stories being chased and we want to make  
10 sure that doesn't happen.

11 And I want to thank everyone who  
12 supported and they ask for the temporary  
13 protective status that President Obama did, I  
14 think it was a very, very huge thing, and thank  
15 you everybody who supported that and thank you,  
16 Council Member Eugene, for lastly having the  
17 fortitude to get this body to support that. I  
18 think it was very, very helpful and it was  
19 something that was definitely needed.

20 So I want to say thank you again  
21 for everybody who has supported. Thank you,  
22 Speaker, for putting together that program. Thank  
23 you.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very  
25 much, Council Member Williams, and let me next

1

2 call on Council Member Cabrera, who has actually  
3 just returned from Haiti.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you  
5 so much, Madam Speaker. I had an opportunity to  
6 go to Haiti, the situation there is dire, it's a  
7 catastrophe indeed. Really what we have here  
8 there is doctors trying to do their jobs, but they  
9 don't have medication. I had an opportunity to  
10 take a ton of water [phonetic] supply on Tuesday,  
11 by this morning they already had completely used  
12 all the supplies. With organizations that I'm  
13 working with, we brought about 2,000 I.V. units  
14 this morning and the doctors there at the general  
15 hospital related to us that we're down to the last  
16 I.V. They're doing amputations without  
17 medication, C-sections without medication. I have  
18 a call out to every single Council Member here and  
19 everyone that you have an influence with to really  
20 speak out for these doctors that are working 30  
21 hours straight for the medications that are  
22 sitting right at the airport, isn't that far from  
23 the hospital.

24 And the stigma that has been  
25 portrayed that the idea, the violence, that it's

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

dangerous, I have to tell you that people treated us very nice, they wanted to help, they're willing to work, why not hire the people that are there to transport the equipment. And so I'm asking for everyone here to please, please, this is what the doctors are telling me, please, for the love of this people, to get the medication to the doctor, they're asking for tetanus shots, they have not received one tetanus shot for the patients. They're really in need and I have to really commend some of the doctors that I met from Brooklyn, Queens, and the Bronx that are working around the clock and they need to be sponsored, they're asking to be sponsor for \$1,500, they can stay there for an extra week.

So we're doing our best, but if you could collectively work together, it would truly be a blessing to these people.

Thank you so much, Madam Speaker.

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much, Council Member.

Today we will be voting on one action out of the Rules Committee, a slate of new leadership positions for the Council for both the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

majority and the minority, a slate of new Committee Chairs, and new Committee memberships. I believe this is a list of individuals in the different capacities that we have assigned them to who will do a important and tremendously forward moving job for this Council to help the City of New York and through the Council's different oversight, budget, policy, and legislative functions, help the City of New York move through this tough recession, and I would urge all of my colleagues to ratify the slate of Committee Chairs and Committee members and leadership positions that are before you today.

And that concludes Communications from the Speaker.

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you very much. Discussion of General Orders. Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: First, if you will, Mr. Chair, before you start my time, I would like to say to Mathieu Eugene, Rev. Sharpton and I are going to charter a plane and there's about 30 or 40 doctors that are willing to go down with us, we're in touch with [off mic] John so we

1  
2 will, Jumaane, have someone on the ground that can  
3 get those doctors and that medication to the right  
4 places. So we're just working on the right time  
5 to do that and we're solidly behind you and your  
6 support and we support you 1000%.

7           Unfortunately, all politics is  
8 local and I just rise today to appeal to my  
9 colleagues once again in not allowing the Speaker  
10 to remove me from Chair of the Higher Education  
11 Committee. This to me is an abuse of power, it's  
12 very divisive, she tried to get some of the blacks  
13 to take the chair, but they refused it, and thank  
14 you for that. And when she couldn't get the  
15 blacks to do it, she got a Latino to do it, which  
16 is very, very divisive. Fortunately for us, our  
17 roots and unity with the black and Latino  
18 community will not be divided based upon the  
19 opportunism of one Latino in this body.

20           And I say that if you want to  
21 remove me, remove me because I'm an ineffective  
22 leader and you can't do that. I held 80 hearings,  
23 and one of those hearings we had a textbook  
24 hearing, the Barnes & Noble showed up and now  
25 they're going to have a rental, a textbook rental

1  
2 program for CUNY students where they'll get a 42%  
3 discount on the textbooks. I've gotten \$56  
4 million or more for the Peter Vallone Scholarship  
5 I might add over the years, hundreds of millions  
6 of dollars for capital money and black male  
7 initiative, I've gotten programs for immigration  
8 and [off mic] Dominican studies and Puerto Rican  
9 studies. I've been an excellent Chair, nobody can  
10 question that.

11 And if it's because of what  
12 happened at the Charter meeting, the last meeting  
13 where people got upset, well, Council Member  
14 Christine Quinn, the Speaker was on Channel 11  
15 saying that it was a fine meeting, she was excited  
16 about it, it was an exercise in democracy, so it  
17 can't possibly be that.

18 Is it because of what happened at  
19 Fiterman Hall when a racist, Jeffrey Wiesenfeld,  
20 interrupted me after I fought for eight years to  
21 get Fiterman Hall the money to rebuild it, and  
22 this racist who called--

23 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: [Interposing]  
24 Council Member--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --black

1

2 people savages and called Hasidic Jews thieves?

3 This racist threatened to come here on December

4 14th--

5 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member

6 Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --with some

8 whites from Queens and they were assured by the

9 Speaker that they don't need to come because she

10 is going to do what they want her to do, which was

11 to remove me from my position as chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member

13 Barron, you have to wrap up.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So the

15 Speaker is backing up a racist, instead of asking

16 him to be removed from the Board of Trustees,

17 she's removing me on his behalf from Chair and

18 this body. Well, Christine, I'm going to be the

19 Chair anyhow.

20 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: [Interposing]

21 Council Member Barron, can you wrap up, please?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Whether you

23 like it or not, I'm going to buy my own gavel and

24 bring it to the meeting because I will always

25 Chair CUNY students--

1

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

2

3

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Silence,

4

silence in the balcony, please.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --I will

6

always fight for their rights. Instead of you

7

removing me, a very effective leader, at the time

8

that the Governor's cutting money from CUNY--

9

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member

10

Barron, I'm going to have to ask you--

11

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and

12

cutting money--

13

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: --wrap up,

14

please.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --from TAP,

16

you needed to support me.

17

MALE VOICE: Point of order--

18

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You never

19

even called me in--

20

MALE VOICE: --the two minute rule

21

has expired.

22

[Off mic]

23

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Okay. At this

24

point in time, we're going to have to move on with

25

the meeting. Is there anybody else for Discussion

1

2 of General Orders?

3 [Off mic]

4 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Okay, so let's  
5 move on.6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --no matter  
7 what--8 MALE VOICE: Let the man speak, let  
9 the man speak.

10 [Off mic]

11 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Silence in the  
12 balcony, we're going to have to move on with the  
13 meeting for today. Seeing no others for  
14 discussion, we're going to move on to the Report  
15 of Special Committees.

16 [Off mic]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --whether  
18 you like it or not. I'm going to--

19 [Off mic]

20 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
21 Barron, if you could please wrap up.22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm going  
23 to speak up--

24 [Crosstalk]

25 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: We're moving

1

2

on to the Report of Special Committees.

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and so is  
my colleagues--

5

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6

7

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Reports of  
Standing Committees?

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --with the  
Speaker and vote no on this--

10

[Crosstalk]

11

12

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the  
Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections, Reso  
1--

14

[Applause]

15

16

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Quiet in the  
balcony. Silence in the balcony. Continue.

17

18

19

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the  
Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections, Reso  
1, making certain amendments to Rule 7.00A of the  
Rules of the Council.

21

22

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
Orders.

23

24

COUNCIL CLERK: M7, Chairperson and  
members of the Committees of the Council.

25

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General

1

2 Orders.

3

4

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: General Order  
calendar.

5

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution  
appointing various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

7

8

9

10

11

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
Orders, and I'd now like to ask for a roll call on  
all of the items that have been coupled on the  
General Order calendar, please, Mr. Majority  
Leader.

12

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: So ordered.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

16

17

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be  
excused to--

18

[Pause]

19

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Yes, you may.

20

21

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Turn the  
mic on. [Off mic]

22

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: It's on.

23

Press the button.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I did.

25

Before I was rudely interrupted, as I was saying,

1

2 Christine, I'm going to still be a spokesperson  
3 for CUNY, there's nothing you could do to stop me  
4 from doing that. It is shameful that you abused  
5 your power like that, but more shameful is that  
6 this body is going to allow her to do that. And  
7 let me tell you something, they're coming for me  
8 in the morning, but they're going to come for you  
9 in the afternoon.

10 FEMALE VOICE: That's right, that's  
11 right.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And once  
13 you allow, once you allow--

14 [Applause]

15 [Off mic]

16 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Quiet in the  
17 balcony.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --once you  
19 allow something like this to happen to one of us  
20 because you're not the one speaking up right now,  
21 you're setting a dangerous, bad precedence. The  
22 press told me that she said she's doing this  
23 because I was divisive. Nobody divided this  
24 Council more than Christine Quinn on the Sonny  
25 Carson vote when she got 24 whites to vote for her

1  
2 against naming a street after somebody, that never  
3 happened in the City Council. There's nothing  
4 more divisive than what Christine Quinn has done  
5 in this body. And now to try to manipulate the  
6 Latino community against the black community  
7 because she couldn't find a black person to take  
8 my place is even more divisive. So she is the  
9 last person that can talk to anybody about being  
10 divisive.

11 You now have a Speaker who's going  
12 to continue to be the Deputy Mayor and the only  
13 reason why she voted against him, she wanted to  
14 assure her seat as Speaker, she will continue to  
15 turn this city over to the land grabbers, to the  
16 rich, to the elite, and watch at budget time, see  
17 what happens to black and Latino communities. The  
18 only reason why the Mayor even mentioned black and  
19 Latinos in the State of the Union address is  
20 because you are the new majority now and they want  
21 to placate you and have you thinking that they're  
22 going to support you and it's because we raised  
23 it. Christine, I will always be a speaker for  
24 CUNY, you cannot stop me from doing that.

25 [Applause]

1

2

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Silence in the  
balcony. Continue with the vote.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And I vote  
no.

5

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes, yes.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yes.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes.

12

COUNCIL CLERK: Comrie.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Yes.

14

COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Yes.

16

COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Yes.

18

COUNCIL CLERK: Dilan.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Yes.

20

COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yes.

22

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Yes.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Yes.

1

COUNCIL CLERK: Fidler.

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: What

4

happened to Felder? Yes.

5

COUNCIL CLERK: Foster.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Yes.

7

COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

9

COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

11

COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Gonzalez.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Yes.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Halloran.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Yes..

17

COUNCIL CLERK: Ignizio.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.

19

COUNCIL CLERK: Jackson.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Vote aye.

21

COUNCIL CLERK: James.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Yes.

23

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes.

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Koppell.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Yes.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Yes.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Yes.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Lappin.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote yes.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Mark-Viverito.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [Off mic].  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Nelson.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Yes.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Palma.  
20 [No response]  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Recchia.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yes.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Reyna.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Yes.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yes.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Sanders.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Yes.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Seabrook.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Yes.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Vann.  
18 [No response]  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Weprin.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Yes.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: White.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Aye.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be  
25 excused to explain my vote?

1

2

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: This was sort of difficult for me and I happen to think that on this issue, and I am a CUNY [off mic] and this [off mic] leader, I think the Council Member had been a good champion on our issues. At the same time, there are 50 other Council Members. I'm also happy that people that I perceive to be progressive have been moved into leadership positions and particularly freshmen have giving a chance to be moved into leadership positions. So I vote yes.

14

COUNCIL CLERK: Oddo.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

16

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

17

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Vote aye.

18

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

19

SPEAKER QUINN: Yes.

20

[Long pause]

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: All items on today's General Order calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative with one in the negative and zero abstentions. Introduction and Reading of the Bills?

1

2 SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are  
3 referred to committees as indicated.

2

3

4

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Now we go to  
5 General Discussions. Seeing no one--

5

6

FEMALE VOICE: [Off mic] Brewer.

7

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Oh, Council  
8 Member Brewer.

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just want  
10 to mention I know that Council Member Dickens also  
11 knew John Bess and yesterday we had a memorial  
12 service for him, he was a leader in the community,  
13 not just in Harlem, but he was probably the best  
14 person I've ever seen who could work with young  
15 people. He died at a young age in terms of my  
16 outlook on things and yesterday at Abyssinian, the  
17 entire church was filled with people who've known  
18 him for the last 40 years. And so I know that  
19 Inez Dickens and others wrote a letter thanking  
20 him for all the work that he did, thanking his  
21 friends and the young people whom he guided and  
22 counseled, many of them spoke. So I just want to  
23 remind people that there are people like that out  
24 there, as we all know, but he will certainly be  
25 missed. Thank you, John Bess.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you very  
3 much. Council Member Lew Fidler.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Thank you,  
5 Mr. Majority Leader. I see that we've been  
6 rejoined for the last time by our colleague,  
7 Council Member Simcha Felder, and I wanted to be--  
8 he is here, right?

9 MALE VOICE: He's here.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Yeah, okay.

11 [Off mic]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I want to  
13 say publicly what I will say to him again and  
14 again in private, that he will be missed  
15 tremendously in this body by all of us.

16 [Applause]

17 [Off mic]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Thank you  
19 very much, thank you very much, sit down, please.

20 [Laughter]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Well it was  
22 my understanding that now that you're Deputy  
23 Comptroller, we are going to rise when you come  
24 into the room and call you Mr. Deputy Comptroller  
25 so--

1

[Background noise]

2

[Off mic]

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: And the Speaker tells me that like it or not, we're going to have you back for a ceremonial, where I trust, you'll be properly roasted.

5

6

7

8

And I do want to say in all seriousness that it has been more than an honor and a privilege to serve with you, Simcha. Outside of your always good humor, I will say that in the eight years that we've served together, you've never said anything to me that you didn't mean and you never made a promise that you didn't do your darndest to keep, and I think those are great words to leave this body with. And I hope that John Liu makes the serious mistake of sending you back here to testify on behalf of the Comptroller's office, and we look forward to working with you in whatever capacity, and you are loved and will be missed.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member James.

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I, too, want to give my regards to my seatmate. During tense

1

2 moments in this City Council, it was always  
3 Council Member Simcha Felder who provided us with  
4 some levity. His timing was impeccable, a true  
5 comedian. So--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Wonderful.  
7 Do you have anything else nice to say--

8 [Crosstalk]

9 [Laughter]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Yes, you  
11 were my seatmate and my confidant, but most  
12 importantly you are my friend and I'm going to  
13 miss you and so I wish you the best.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I also  
16 wanted to say that on January 18th I've been  
17 working with Senator Gillibrand and we've been  
18 working with the Department of State and today  
19 they announced a humanitarian policy allowing  
20 orphan children from Haiti to enter the United  
21 States. So despite all the despair, despite all  
22 of the death, despite all of the destruction,  
23 there is a ray of hope and these are these  
24 children will now be allowed to enter these United  
25 States to be adopted. We will continue to work

1  
2 with Senator Gillibrand to bring more children.  
3 At last count, there were at least 500,000  
4 children ready for adoption in Haiti and we will  
5 open up our arms to these babies. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
7 Nelson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Thank you.  
9 Gee, Simcha, you were uncharacteristically quiet,  
10 I didn't even know you were here for the first  
11 time. So we are going to miss you, we're going to  
12 miss the non-quietness that you bring to this  
13 ceremony every time we meet.

14 But on a serious note, I just want  
15 to just remind my colleagues again that there are  
16 United States Navy Seals being court-martialed for  
17 ridiculous reasons and I suggest you go protest  
18 against this.

19 And, also, I still protest the  
20 terrorist trials taking place in New York City as  
21 being outrageous and strategically idiotic.

22 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
23 Vacca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I want to  
25 rise to salute and to wish well my fellow Council

1

2 Member Simcha Felder. When I came to the Council  
3 four years ago, Simcha went out of his way to  
4 befriend me and I do want you to know that today  
5 we're appointing new committees and new committee  
6 chairs and one consideration I had was where I was  
7 going to sit and I wanted to sit here because  
8 Simcha and I have developed that type of  
9 friendship. So I wish him well, and I thank him  
10 for all he's brought to the Chamber, but I thank  
11 him most of all for all he means to so many of us.  
12 Thank you, Councilman Felder.

13 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
14 Jackson.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you,  
16 Majority Leader. Simcha, let me just say this,  
17 that you have been a brother of mine in this City  
18 Council members' Chambers for the going on our  
19 ninth year since we've been here. And I remember  
20 going back way in the campaign that we were  
21 together, along with some others, and more  
22 recently in the past four years as the Chair of  
23 the Education Committee and as a member of the  
24 Committee, you have always been there through  
25 thick and thin sitting through all of the hearings

1  
2 and even in the member's lounge when we were there  
3 before our meetings, you eating your breakfast and  
4 me eating mine, you were always willing to share.  
5 And you always asked about, you know, you and I  
6 would talk and I would ask you how's the family,  
7 and you would respond in kind, asking how our  
8 families were doing. And I say to you that any  
9 time that you were absent or going to be absent  
10 from a committee meeting, you would always call up  
11 and apologize for not being there because you had  
12 a commitment, and that wasn't often, it was very  
13 rare.

14 So I say to you, you've been an  
15 ideal brother and colleague in the City Council  
16 and we will always miss you.

17 [Applause]

18 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you.  
19 Council Member Recchia.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Simcha,  
21 today's your last day and last Stated Council, but  
22 I have to tell you as a colleague being right next  
23 to you, having our districts and working together,  
24 you and I, our friendship has grown together. But  
25 you're an outstanding person, but more important,

1  
2 you and I have something in common that a lot of  
3 people don't, is that when we first started out  
4 campaigning, our wives were pregnant and we both  
5 had a child during our first campaign and we  
6 always talk about that, that's one of--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: [Off mic]  
8 my personal life.

9 [Laughter]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I just  
11 want to thank you for all you have to done for me  
12 and for my district and I wish you the best of  
13 luck.

14 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
15 Gonzalez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: I just  
17 wanted to inform my colleagues today about the  
18 efforts of Puerto Rico in respect to Haiti. On  
19 Friday I received a call from the Secretary of  
20 State, Kenneth McClintock, and he informed me that  
21 he was being briefed. I know there's been a lot  
22 of information and our Spanish newspaper said [off  
23 mic] and so on and so forth, but it is important  
24 that people understand that we are present, that  
25 all the local airports in Puerto Rico are being

1

2 utilized for this effort to Haiti.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I also would like to thank the Speaker especially for all the concern and effort that she has involved herself with, but also our borough president from Brooklyn Marty Markowitz. And we were briefed by Senator Gillibrand and I have to say that everyone has jumped in. It is a humanitarian effort, it's an effort that the entire world has to be responsible for, but I want to say today that Puerto Rico is present and that every airport in Puerto Rico is being utilized for the efforts to assist Haiti today. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you very much. Council Member Vallone, followed by Oddo, followed by Comrie.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Council Member Nelson, I couldn't agree more about the Seals or the trial, but today I also agree wholeheartedly with Council Member James regarding Simcha Felder.

Much more than just a comedian, though, I mean one of the best comedians we've had the pleasure to be around, but he used that sense of humor to get things done for his district and

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

for the people of the entire city. Perhaps, Simcha, no one will miss you more than myself because oftentimes you and I were the only two Democratic votes on a certain side of any issue, and I don't know what I'm going to do without you. But I have never met a funnier, a more effective, or a more ethical elected official or person than Simcha Felder and I'm proud to call you my friend in the past and in the future.

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you very much. Council Member Oddo.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: I would just prefer that if they clap all at once at the end because the applause is getting less and less.

[Laughter]

CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Minority Leader Oddo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Earlier in the year, Gotham Gazette asked me for some predictions and I predicted that I will be consistently funnier than Simcha Felder this year and I scared him right out of the Council.

Some of the new members may be wondering, if you don't know Simcha, was this guy

1  
2 this good and he truly was, and Peter is right, we  
3 all know about the levity. What I love about  
4 Simcha frankly is it's easy to be friends in good  
5 times, but Simcha, the beauty of Simcha frankly  
6 was when you were having a tough time in your  
7 life, whether it was personally, conflicted about  
8 what you want to do with the rest of your life,  
9 whether it was your parents, your mom or your dad,  
10 you know, not feeling well, that's the Simcha  
11 Felder that I will miss terribly. When our former  
12 colleague Andy Lanse's [phonetic] mom was dying of  
13 cancer, no one was a better friend than Simcha.

14 And the beauty of my experience  
15 this last 20 years in the City Council has been I  
16 would never probably never come in contact with  
17 Simcha and he has educated me so much. And he's  
18 the only person who could come to my parent's  
19 house and scold my mother that she had too many  
20 pictures of her only grandchild on the wall and  
21 not enough of me. And he is universally loved in  
22 my house. And I wish him well and I make the  
23 commitment to you, my friend, that our friendship  
24 doesn't end today. Thank you and God bless.

25 [Applause]

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
3 Comrie.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I'm going  
5 to pile on to the Simcha friendship parade.  
6 Simcha, you've been a true gentleman and a friend  
7 to many of us through thick and thin and I want to  
8 thank you for your support of me and always  
9 encouraging me to focus on what's important--and  
10 that's the delivery of services for our district.  
11 Simcha, everything else has been said, I truly  
12 want to make sure that our friendship stays  
13 consistent and constant because you've been that  
14 kind of adviser to me.

15 I also must let folks know that my  
16 district and the Camber Heights, Queens Village  
17 has the second highest density of Haitian  
18 Americans. I have friends that have lost  
19 relatives, I have a cousin through marriage that  
20 has lost ten members of her family. I just want  
21 to echo the efforts and applaud Council Members  
22 Williams and especially for the pain and the  
23 suffering that Dr. Eugene is going through. He  
24 has been in my district to come to meetings to  
25 advise people and the Council people and to hug

1  
2 people. We've been working in the 6th  
3 Congressional District through all Haitian  
4 Americans United for Progress.

5 I just want to remind people that  
6 as, Council Member Williams said, unless you have  
7 a delivery system to get something to Haiti right  
8 now, the best thing you can do is to donate money  
9 into programs and groups that are actually on the  
10 ground, that actually have an ability to deliver  
11 services. Please do not deliver your used clothes  
12 or your old food to any of our offices, please do  
13 not get involved with any groups that all of a  
14 sudden just got created to develop relief efforts,  
15 please make sure that you're dealing with  
16 reputable organizations. And please remember that  
17 the situation in Haiti, there's not going to be a  
18 quick fix--

19 FEMALE VOICE: Right.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: --but a  
21 long term fix, and I'm going to be working with my  
22 colleagues and all in government and all people  
23 that care about a long term fix to repair and  
24 restore the great nation of Haiti. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member

1

2 Ulrich.

3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I just  
5 wanted to add my own little personal take on  
6 Simcha's departure here. Had I known we were  
7 eulogizing him today, I could have brought  
8 something from Leviticus for him, being that  
9 that's his favorite book. By the way people are  
10 talking, I don't know if he's going to work for  
11 the Comptroller's office or if he's going to the  
12 chair.

12

13 So I'll never forget actually being  
14 one of the new kids on the block literally when he  
15 offered my wife to officiate at our wedding, so of  
16 course, the two good Catholics that we were, we  
17 were almost ready to take him up on it, especially  
18 when he offered to do it for half-price.

18

19 So he really is a remarkable man  
20 who will be sorely missed in this body, but I have  
21 a feeling that he's really not going anywhere, and  
22 I just want to add my congratulations and best  
23 wishes. Mazel tov, my friend.

23

24 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
25 Nelson.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Thank you.

1  
2 [Long pause] Oh yeah, thank you, Erik. But do  
3 you remember your first meeting when Betsy  
4 Gotbaum, her staff, they forgot to--we forgot to  
5 mention your name in roll call? Well that's what  
6 happened and Betsy Gotbaum apologized to you and  
7 your reply was, that's okay, don't apologize, I  
8 just want to part of this, and that set the tone  
9 for your humor from that point to this, and,  
10 again, from that point to this and after, you're  
11 going to be missed. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
13 Koppell.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: I could  
15 not allow this session to go by talking about  
16 Simcha without mentioning his participation on the  
17 Mental Health Committee, which I had the privilege  
18 of chairing for the last four years. Simcha was  
19 at every hearing and his devotion and concern over  
20 those who suffer from mental illness or mental  
21 retardation was more than obvious. He's so  
22 dedicated, so concerned. No one I think took the  
23 issues of that committee which are the issues of  
24 some of the least fortunate people in our city,  
25 more seriously than Simcha. He's a great

1  
2 supporter of mine, I couldn't have a more  
3 diligent, committed, or cooperative committee  
4 member. And, Simcha, I know you will be missed  
5 and I hope in your new capacity you'll do  
6 everything you can to direct resources to those  
7 who suffer from mental illness or mental  
8 retardation.

9 Thank you for all your cooperation  
10 and all your work over the last four years.

11 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
12 Sanders.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Let me do  
14 two things, one joyous, one not. Simcha, the  
15 pigeons of this great city will owe a great deal  
16 to you. They were very grateful that you are  
17 moving on. Those in the know, know that he  
18 authored legislation over the pigeons. I believe  
19 it's still in committee, I'm not sure.

20 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: No, we heard  
21 you reintroduced it.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: I'm sure  
23 any moment, I look forward to that. He has  
24 certainly shown himself to be the quickest wit in  
25 the City Council, but he's also shown himself to

1  
2 be one of the most passionate believers. This is  
3 a person who you may argue over what he chooses to  
4 believe in, but when he believes, he is going all  
5 out, and that is what, I would suggest, a sign of  
6 his greatness and certainly it will be missed. I  
7 wish you well, Simcha, I wish you well.

8 On a more serious note, I want to  
9 of course talk of the situation in Haiti and  
10 request that, Madam Speaker, that at the first  
11 possible moment, a delegation from the City  
12 Council go down to Haiti composed of whoever  
13 wishes, but certainly the people most affected,  
14 that we see for ourselves and direct every  
15 possible effort that we can to aid the good  
16 people.

17 Thank you very much.

18 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Council Member  
19 Rodriguez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I  
21 remember in my first day here and voting  
22 abstaining because, as I say, I had not read  
23 whatever it was I was going to be voting for, and  
24 Simcha [off mic] getting to me--first of all, he  
25 took the floor supporting that decision and

1  
2 stating it was the right thing to do. And then  
3 later on coming to me and saying, look, you do the  
4 right thing like. And then being at the funeral  
5 with my father and looking at this guy going over  
6 there and say there's a couple of questions that I  
7 learned not to ask when anyone dies and I know  
8 what you're going through and for me it was very  
9 important. So unfortunately, we were serving  
10 together for those couple of weeks.

11 But I hope that we understand that  
12 what the Mayor said in his State of the City, what  
13 we have say at the City Council and over and over  
14 is something that we have to face. There's two  
15 New Yorkers, there's the New Yorkers of the poor  
16 and the New Yorkers of the rich and we need to  
17 support the New Yorkers of the rich to help us to  
18 close a gap that we have. And the city  
19 comptroller [off mic] important institution from  
20 where, we [off mic] more investment should be done  
21 especially in building affordable housing in poor  
22 communities, such as Washington Heights. Thank  
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you very  
25 much. Council Member Brad Lander.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I was going  
3 to stay off the Simcha bandwagon, but I can't let  
4 this past comment go unnoticed because I happened  
5 to be behind Ydanis and after Simcha said you did  
6 the right thing, he did also follow-up by saying I  
7 will break you. So I just want to say on behalf  
8 of all the freshmen, we're glad you're not going  
9 to be here to break us in and that you're leaving  
10 room for both a new class clown and somebody that  
11 has the devotion that you've shown so far. So  
12 thanks for leaving.

13 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: And now we get  
14 to hear from the man of the hour, someone who's  
15 going to bring humor to numbers, which is a very  
16 tough thing to do, Council Member/Deputy  
17 Comptroller Simcha Felder.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Thank you.

19 [Applause]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: First of  
21 all, those that did speak about me, I want to  
22 thank you; and those that didn't, I know that the  
23 reason you didn't speak is that you had so much to  
24 say you didn't know when to start, so I appreciate  
25 that as well.

1  
2 Even those that did speak missed a  
3 lot of my good characteristics--

4 [Laughter]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: --but no  
6 one is perfect, even I am not perfect, even I am  
7 not perfect. I just wanted to first of all thank  
8 all of you for the opportunity to serve together  
9 with you, some of you are luckier as Council  
10 Member Lander alluded to, the fact that he won't  
11 have the opportunity to have my being here with  
12 him throughout his tenure, but your district is  
13 close by and I will have the opportunity to break  
14 you when I want to.

15 [Laughter]

16 [Off mic]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: I just  
18 wanted to say that people, you try to think back  
19 on an annual basis whether it's Rush Hashanah, the  
20 New Year, or January, the levity, the celebrating  
21 is good, but the introspection is more important,  
22 and throughout life I think that there are  
23 occasions and certainly very special times where  
24 you have to or should spend time thinking about  
25 the past and what you've done wrong. It's not bad

1  
2 to think about what you've done right, but that's  
3 sometimes much easier. And throughout the time,  
4 there have been times that I've said things or  
5 done things to people that I feel was  
6 inappropriate, so I want to apologize before I  
7 leave. Some of them are not here anymore, but  
8 that's not my fault. [Laughter] So this is a  
9 last opportunity because we believe that repenting  
10 is good when with sins against God you can do  
11 whatever you want and speak to God about how  
12 you're sorry, but against men, it doesn't work and  
13 the only way it works is by actually saying sorry  
14 to the people directly. Having said that, I would  
15 expect apologies from many people in the room as  
16 well. [Laughter]

17 But I do want to say that it really  
18 was a wonderful time in my life working together  
19 with you here and the friendship is something that  
20 should be reinforced, it's something we came into  
21 when we got elected that was really unbelievable.  
22 I looked at the class picture from '02, bear  
23 slight changes in my physical makeup and generally  
24 they're lies slight changes but the atmosphere,  
25 the friendship, the love that existed should

1

2 continue to permeate these walls.

3

4

5

6

7

[Off mic]

8

MALE VOICE: Thank you for that.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And lastly, I just want to say that, had I known that I would be getting this opportunity, maybe I would have voted differently on extending term limits, but I--

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: That was an easy line, I don't know why it took so long. Karen here got it right away. But having said that, I would say is that you never know, September is just around the corner, if I don't like the job, I'm coming back.

But more importantly, I wanted to say it's Samara who's in the room is leaving today and it's wonderful that I'm getting all this attention, Samara asked me in fact to leave my council position and take that job so that no one would talk about her.

But I want to say in addition to all my colleagues, I will never forget you and you certainly won't forget me. And I love you all very much and I wish you and your families good health and happiness and I hope that God gives you

1

2 all what's good for you. Thank you very much.

3 [Applause]

4 MALE VOICE: I accept your apology,  
5 I know it was aimed at me. I knew you were aiming  
6 it [background noise]. I know you were aiming  
7 that apology at me, I felt it in my chest.

8 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Madam Speaker?

9 SPEAKER QUINN: I just wanted to  
10 say a couple of quick things. First, to Council  
11 Member Felder, Simcha, I want to thank you for you  
12 apology--no, I'm only kidding. Simcha, I just  
13 wanted to thank you for all of your support in all  
14 of our work together. From when you and I worked  
15 on issues when I was on the Health Committee, when  
16 I was chair of the Health Committee from your  
17 support when I was running for Speaker, for your  
18 support when I was Speaker, for our fights when I  
19 was Speaker, for making up with me after the  
20 fights when we were Speaker, for accepting my  
21 apologies. But I just want to say, Simcha, you  
22 have been somebody who has been honest with me,  
23 encouraging of me, supportive of me, and there for  
24 me--forget the politics, as somebody I could call  
25 on personally when I needed advice and support,

1  
2 particularly when there were trying things going  
3 on in my personal life or with members of my  
4 family, and for the particular advice you gave me  
5 in one situation which is advice I carry with me  
6 and use in other situations like that. And I just  
7 want to thank you. You have been, as Jimmy might  
8 have said, not someone if they were to sketch out  
9 who would become one of my closest friends here,  
10 you know, we might not have been on each other's  
11 lists, but that is--

12 [Off mic]

13 SPEAKER QUINN: I don't know.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Why?

15 SPEAKER QUINN: We'll leave it for  
16 others to decide.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: You're just  
18 reinforcing those prejudices over and over again.

19 SPEAKER QUINN: But I just want to  
20 thank you so sincerely and on behalf of myself and  
21 particularly my father to whom you have also  
22 always been extraordinarily kind. I just want to  
23 say thank you, I love you, and I wish you and your  
24 family nothing but the best and all the happiness  
25 in the world. We want to have you back for

1  
2 appropriate ceremonies so there can be more  
3 grilling and you get less mic time. But thank you  
4 very much, Simcha, there are many interactions we  
5 have which I will never forget and carry with me  
6 always. So thank you.

7 I also want to, as Simcha said,  
8 mention Samara Daly who has been--

9 [Applause]

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Who there is a  
11 reception for in the red room right after the  
12 Stated, so I encourage everybody to come, but  
13 Samara has been my director of scheduling for four  
14 years, she also worked for Speaker Miller, and at  
15 a different time, for Speaker Vallone, she's very  
16 fond of saying she worked for three different  
17 Speakers. But Samara has been my director of  
18 scheduling since day one. She's on to a new and  
19 exciting challenge working in Brooklyn to make the  
20 Brooklyn Bridge Park an even greater reality,  
21 something else, something that's very close to her  
22 heart, but I just wanted to ask all of you to come  
23 to the reception to help me thank Samara. Samara  
24 is somebody whose entire life's work has been  
25 about the city she loves and she grew up in.

1  
2 She's done nothing professionally that hasn't been  
3 in the interests of our five boroughs. She's  
4 somebody who puts her heart and her soul into  
5 everything she's done. She's someone I know  
6 without whom I would not have gotten through my  
7 first term of Speaker, so I'm a little bit worried  
8 about the second one without her. But I just  
9 wanted to thank her so much, she has been  
10 invaluable, a tireless worker, gives her heart and  
11 soul to everything, and I know she's going to do  
12 great, we may have to penalize the company she  
13 works for though for having taken her, so we'll  
14 get to that later. But, Samara, thank you, thank  
15 you, thank you, thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RIVERA: Thank you.  
17 Thank you very much, ladies and gentlemen. This  
18 meeting is adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Tammy Wittman, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature Tammy Wittman

Date February 3, 2010