CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

November 30, 2020 Start: 1:01 P.M. Recess: 2:46 P.M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera

Andrew Cohen

Chaim M. Deutsch Ruben Diaz, Sr. Robert F. Holden Peter A. Koo

Stephen T. Levin

Mark Levine

Carlos Menchaca Daneek Miller

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Leo Hayward, Deputy Commissioner for Sidewalk Inspection Management or SIM, New York City Department of Transportation

Sean Quinn, Assistant Commissioner of Street Improvement Programs, Department of Transportation

Rebecca Zack, Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and Community Affairs Department of Transportation

Eman Rimawi, New York Lawyers for the Public Interest and double amputee with Lupus

Kathleen Collins

Jean Ryan

2.2

(TECHNICAL)

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Good afternoon everyone and welcome to today's remote hearing New York City Council hearing on the Committee of Transportation. At this time would all panelists please turn on their video for verification. Once again, we ask for all panelists to please turn on their video for verification. To minimize disruption we ask that everyone please place electron devices on silent or vibrate. If you wish to submit testimony you may do so at testimony at council.nyc.gov. Again, that is testimony at council.nyc.go-o-v. Thank you for your cooperation. Chair Rodriguez we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Sergeant.

Thank you all for joining our, for joining our base hearing today on accessibility of the streets.

First, I'm going to turn it over to our Committee

Counsel to go over some procedure items. Thank you,

Elliott.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Thank you. I'm

Elliott Lynn Counsel to this Transportation

Committee at the New York City Council. Before you begin I want to remind everyone that you will be on

2	mute until you are called on to testify at which
3	point you will be unmuted by the host. Please listen
4	for your name to be called. I will be periodically
5	announcing who the next panelist will be. The first
6	panelist will be from the Department of
7	Transportation, Deputy Commissioner for Sidewalks
8	and Inspection Management Leon Hayward Assistant
9	Commissioner for Street Improvement Programs Sean
10	Quinn and Assistant Commissioner for
11	Intergovernmental and Community Affairs Rebecca
12	Zack. During the hearing if Council members would
13	like to ask a question please use the Zoom Raise
14	Hand function and the Chair or I will call on you in
15	order. We will be limiting Council Member questions
16	to five minutes. Please also note that freeze of the
17	special hearing we will not be allowing a second
18	round of questioning. Thank you. Before I turn the
19	hearing back over to the Chair, I'd like to
20	acknowledge that we have been joined by Council
21	Members Diaz, Holden, Koo and Rose. (bell) Chair
22	Rodriguez.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. First of all, I would like to hope that everyone had a great Thanksgiving. I know that this is, this

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

holiday was completely different from the previous one, but I know it was it was good because we did what we had to do to celebrate our Thanksgiving keeping the distance and limiting the numbers of family members that we got together with. So, hopefully everyone were able to contribute to deal with this epidemic, but still can bring a second wave to our city, and we as New Yorkers have to be ready to work together and fight against this epidemic and come out stronger than before. Good afternoon everyone. Today the Committee on Transportation convenes remotely to call the hearing on the following of this side topic as the civility as disability of the streets. As we know, in the past month our lives have dramatically changed. The pandemic has changed the way in which we interact in our streets. Notably, the city is reimaging public space and how the public interacts with this space including innovative and creative ways to expanding new sidewalk and outside space has been increasingly seen. As this space are being reconstructed, and utilized in a different manner, it is important to remember to ensure that that accessibility of this street is maintained for all New Yorkers and

2 visitors particularly for those New Yorkers or 3 visitors that are living with physical challenges. In New York City there are more than 920,000 New 4 Yorkers who self-identifies as individuals with disability or individuals with physical challenges, 6 7 and it is estimated that there are about six million annual visitors to the city who also have to deal 8 with physical challenges. To ensure that this individual living with physical challenges have the 10 11 same rights and ability to leave as those without 12 disabilities and the Mayor's Office for People With Disabilities was established in 1973. The office 13 14 makes sure that all city initiatives, programs and 15 policies are adequately addressing the need of those 16 individuals who contribute the same as those 17 available not to deal with physical challenges. 18 Today, we are here and ready to listen from DOT its 19 goal, which goal is supervised for safe, efficient 20 and environmentally responsible movement of people and good in New York City. Although DOT's main goal 21 2.2 is to ensure safely, safety for all, DOT also 2.3 implements problems to help make New York City's streets more accessible. DOT has taken specific 24 measures to ensure that individuals with low 25

visions, hearing, connective disabilities or limited
mobility are able to access our streets. All DOT's
policies comply with applicable laws of which
include but not limited to the Americans
Disabilities Act and the Rehabilitation Act. To
ensure compliance and inclusion of all individuals
with physical challenges DOT has committed to making
all streets accessible by implementing pedestrian
runs to get all in our streets and sidewalks, ensure
those who are blind or low vision are aware of the
location of bike lanes throughout the city, create
the campaign called the Cyclist Campaign, which

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sir, I'm sorry, but you have to think we're having some technical issues in the background. So, if we could just apologize for one moment. Thank you.

looks for streets, awareness of

 $\label{eq:chairperson} \mbox{CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ?} \quad \mbox{It is my background} \\ \mbox{or anybody else.}$

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, no, I think we're having some issues with live streaming of the hearing.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

2.2

2.3

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: So, just give us a minute 3 to figure that out in the background. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I'll do that. (pause) Can you hear me there?

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Yes, sir. We're just waiting on the stream to be corrected. Just give us a couple of moments.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Chairperson Rodriguez, I'm going to remute you. As soon as we're ready to begin, I'll come back on the line.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. (pause) Okay, first I am sorry for the technical issues and as I...I was saying, DOT has committed to making all the streets accessible by implementing pedestrian routes to get end of streets and sidewalks, ensure those, ensure those who are mind and low vision aware of the location that that makes throughout the city, create a campaign called the Cycle as Campaign, which looks like there's awareness of vulnerable road users especially low vision or blind pedestrians throughout the city. There's implemented accessibility measures within DOT's pedestrian process covers, which looks to create more public

2

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

office space by utilizing under-utilized street space and convert them into process where New Yorkers can sit, rest, socialize and enjoy public life. The DOT ensures pedestrian signals have accessibility features to protect pedestrians who are blind of who have low vision by assisting them in crossing the street with short recorder messages and sounds ensuring pedestrians intervals are accessible to all pedestrians providing visual signals for pedestrians to walk and cars to go implementing safer streets for seniors and major pedestrian safety initiatives for older New Yorkers, and implementing Citibanks and a program that installs branches throughout the city that make streets more comfortable for transit drivers and pedestrians especially for those who are older and disabled. During today's hearing I would also like to hear more of how the DOT is working with the MTA to ensure that all train stations are accessible. Again, this is something that is important for all New Yorkers and especially around this time where we hear the reality of the MTA dealing with financial crisis, it is important that we hear from DOT how does the agency continue conversation with the MTA?

2.2

2.3

It is my goal to ensure that all stations become accessible by 2030. We cannot forget about the older New Yorkers and more than 5 million visitors with physical challenges who also deserve our support. At today's hearing we hope to hear testimony from the MOC, the MOC and DOT regarding how they are expanding in two ways as accessibility related programs, initiatives and policies throughout our city. We want to look at how the city is managing its streets and ensuring that they have all the safety criteria and ensuring accessibility. I will now ask our moderator and committee counsel to call on the Administration to testify and to administer the oath.

that, I would like to acknowledge that we have also been joined by Council Members Cohen, Levine,

Deutsch, Menchaca, Cabrera and Miller. I will now call on the following Members of the Administration to testify: Leon Hayward, Sean Quinn, and Rebecca Zach. I will now read the affirmation, and then I will call on each individual to confirm their response on the record. Please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2	truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
3	before this committee and to respond honestly to
4	Council Member questions? Deputy Commissioner
5	Hayward?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HAYWARD. I DO. 6

LEGAL COUNSEL: Assistant Commissioner Quin.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER QUINN: I do. (bell)

LEGAL COUNSEL: Assistant Commissioner Zach.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACH: I do.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you. You may begin your testimony when you're ready.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And before they begin I would like to express our thank you to the former Commissioner and places like the first hearing that we had former Commissioner Paul Sandoval and I know that the whole team that was, who are here today they were representing the agency well, but we will always miss our great DOT Commissioner and as we express to her we hope the best luck for her on whatever plans she has, she has for the future. She came with the stream at the national level, and I know that as we will be making at the city level, I know, I hope that she will help

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 us at some level if she would decide to go to D.C.
3 Thank you.

LEO HAYWARD: Okay. Good afternoon Chair Rodriguez and members of the Transportation Committees. I am Leo Hayward, Deputy Commissioner for Sidewalk Inspection Management or SIM at the New York City Department of Transportation and I am joined by Sean Quinn, Assistant Commissioner of Street improvement Programs, and Rebecca Zack, Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and Community Affairs. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on behalf of Commissioner Trottenberg on street accessibility. Under Mayor de Blasio's leadership, DOT and this administration are committed to creating a more accessible city for all New Yorkers. One of DOT's core focuses is maintaining and enhancing our pedestrian infrastructure free of defects and accessible to all. Last year SIM performed over 22,500 inspections and reconstructed over 2.1 million square feet of defective sidewalks citywide. Now, turning to pedestrian ramps. Pedestrian ramps provide access on and off over 12,700 miles of sidewalks at approximately 185,000 street corners, mid-block

crossings, and medians and are essential to all 2 3 pedestrians, people with disabilities and older adults. Currently, DOT upgrades pedestrian ramps 4 5 primarily by following the Agency Resurfacing Operation. In addition, pedestrian ramps are 6 7 addressed when responding 311 complaints, sidewalk improvement programs and sidewalk repairs. But 8 recently you may have seen more about in-house crews and DDC managed contractors around as we take on the 10 11 task of assessing and upgrading every pedestrian ramp throughout the city. DOT has added a team of 12 hundreds of permanent and seasonal employees 13 14 including planners, engineers, in-house construction 15 crews and inspectors and in partnership with our sister agency DDC is awarding billions of dollars in 16 17 contracts. In October of last year DOT completed a 18 citywide survey using innovative technology to 19 collect data on pedestrian ramp elements. We 20 contracted a technology company who surveyed a total of 217,778 ramps using high definition street level 21 imagery and new software to extract each ramp's 2.2 2.3 measurements. We also trained other agencies, developers, and utility companies on ADA 24 requirements for the pedestrian ramps included in 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

their projects. Finally, we have a dedicated outreach team for community engagement and are collecting and tracking data through a comprehensive asset management system. This long-term undertaking presents tremendous challenges at great scale. must design and construct around numerous righ-ofway infrastructure including utility lines, text facings, hydrants, street lights, trees, elevators and below ground transit structures, vaults under the sidewalks, the same type material in landmarked historic districts and now sidewalks among others and to make it even more challenging, the city streetscape is ever changing with private developers, utilities, and other agencies working on our streets and sidewalks every day. administration believes in providing safe and accessible means of travel to all New Yorkers and is proud to be dedicating very robust resources to that goal under the Mayor's leadership. Since July 2017, we have installed 1,185 missing ramps, and upgraded 21,000 existing ramps. The public has seen the most recent survey data, assessment and construction progress at www.nyc head ramps.info. Now, Assistant Commissioner Quinn will discuss our work to create

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

new pedestrian enhancements, our engagement with the disability community for project design, use of the curb and finally how involving street use in the

face of the COVID 19 impacts accessibility.

SEAN OUINN: Thank you Leo. Good afternoon. I am Sean Quinn, Assistant Commissioner for Street Improvement Programs. Thank you for the opportunity to testify. Pedestrian enhancements are a major focus for DOT and Vision Zero efforts. With any agency the pedestrian unit works with other operational and planning units to implement new and expanded pedestrian facilities and to create new pedestrian connections. One recent example is that the complex intersection Bronx Park East and Bronxville Avenue where we installed 12,500 square feet of sidewalk to create new pedestrian connections where there was only once a parking field. Another is at the historic intersection of York Street and Pearl Street in Brooklyn where we installed new crossings of smooth accessible pavers in the cobblestone street as well as an expanded sidewalk to create an improved intersection layout, ensured they are more direct crossings. In addition to the safety enhancements our Plaza Program has

2	turned underused, underused road beds into vibrant
3	and accessible pedestrian spaces with 65 locations
4	currently open to the public. Making these upgrades
5	and all of our projects accessible, safe and
6	successful cannot be done without input and guidance
7	from accessibility experts. DOT works closely with
8	the disability community and advocates to understand
9	issues that people with disabilities face while
10	navigating city streets. We host workshops, run
11	online surveys and speak directly to experts in the
12	field to best design ideas and test new treatments,
13	materials and technologies. To give and example,
14	DOT's Mobility Management Team co-organizes mobility
15	clinics and evaluation of events with community
16	partners in which people with disabilities learn new
17	travel skills while DOT tests and surveys
18	participants about potential street treatments. In
19	the face of the many challenges posed by COVID-19,
20	DOT continues to partner with community
21	organizations to engage the public through virtual
22	and teleconference platforms. During the summer we
23	have an informational outreach session with high
24	school students who are blind or have no vision.
25	Help via Zoon, the virtual session enables an

engaging conversation with students who learned 2 3 about the physical design approaches DOT applies to enhance travel for people with vision disabilities, 4 5 and to engage other adults with disabilities DOT held a conference via phone to learn about the 6 7 mobility challenges older adults are experiencing du to the pandemic, and to share information about our 8 accessibility work. DOT also produces the Mobility 10 Management Resource Guide, which includes 11 information about our street improvement projects, 12 transit services and other DOT initiatives to 13 enhance mobility and accessibility, and last week 14 DOT was pleased to welcome Edmund Asiedu to backfill 15 our Accessibility Coordinator position. This 16 critical advisor to the Commissioner is the agency's 17 representative for Accessibility Initiatives, and 18 lead ADA Policy and Compliance internally and 19 externally. Another core part of the agency's 20 mission is to balance many different uses for our streets while maintaining access for all 21 particularly on busy commercial corridors we manage 2.2 2.3 curb use to facilitate loading and unloading of goods and passengers, access to transit and 24 temporary parking for shoppers and visitors among 25

other uses while all while maintaining emergency 2 3 access. As an important part of this mission our 4 Parking Permit Unit administers approximately 27,000 5 parking permits for people with disabilities. These permits provide motorists with a documented 6 disability, create a flexibility by allowing parking in metered zones free as charge as well as the use 8 of no parking areas, authorized parking only areas and truck loading areas. Now I'll speak about DOT's 10 11 work under...now I will speak about DOT's work under Mayor de Blasio's leadership to transform our 12 streets in the face of COVID-19, and to promote safe 13 14 recreation, sustainable transportation and support 15 the city's beloved restaurant and retail industries. 16 First, as Commissioner Trottenberg recently 17 testified in detail, this administration has 18 implemented over 83 miles of open streets citywide, 19 citywide nearly 50% of which are in zip codes with 20 the highest rates of COVID in the city, mostly communities of color, and nearly 60% of which are in 21 census tracks that are low to moderate income. 2.2 2.3 it comes to accessibility, DOT understands that a significant concern for some people with 24 disabilities rely on vehicles, its continued local 25

access for parking and promoting and unloading 2 3 passengers in taxis, for-hire vehicles, Access-a-4 ride and private cars. This is one of several important reasons that our open street programming gains local access, but we are also keenly aware of 6 7 the program's operational challenges including the need to maintain appropriate set-ups and are mindful 8 of this issue as we plan for the program's future. Building on our Open Streets Program, DOT in 10 11 partnership with the Council and restaurant industry established the Open Restaurants Program. This has 12 been one of our most far reaching and successful 13 14 COVID related industry, and we think the largest 15 such program in the world. To date over 10,700 16 restaurants have applied to participate in the 17 program, supporting an estimated 90,000 jobs for a 18 diverse group of employees. New Yorkers have 19 embraced the program in neighborhoods throughout the 20 city, in Motthaven in the Bronx, Washington Heights in Manhattan and Jackson Heights in Queens, Sunset 21 Park in Brooklyn, Thompkinsville in Staten Island, 2.2 2.3 and dozens more. And now, and now through the Open Storefronts Program, which the Mayor announced on 24 October 28, retail establishments can use sidewalk 25

space in front of their business as well provided 2 3 that they maintain a clear path of travel for pedestrians. In the face of COVID 19 we deployed and 4 expanded the Open Restaurant Program quickly by allowing restaurant self-certification and then 6 7 relying on New York City employees to inspect each location and require modifications where we 8 discovered issues. While we understand there were 10 challenges with this approach, we worked diligently 11 with business owners to ensure ADA compliance 12 requiring streets to either be flush with the curb 13 or provide a temporary ramps, and ensuring 14 compliance paths of travel, table height and 15 clearance requirements. Note Pad has created 16 helpful fact sheets on the accessibility requirements for both open restaurants and open 17 18 store fronts including detailed diagrams and 19 instructions, which are available on their website. 20 As the Mayor announced, and the Council codified in Local Law 114 of 2020 sponsored by Council Member 21 Reynoso, work is underway to design and, to design a 2.2 2.3 legal and operational structure for a permanent open restaurants program with the goal of having it in 24 place before the end of next year. Now, as we turn 25

to making the popular program, which was created 2 3 under emergency mayoral executive order to a permanent part of our city we look forward to 4 discussing with the Council the longer term operational, fiscal and legal issues to be resolved, 6 7 and of the importance to ensure that steps and guidelines under the permanent program meet ADA 8 standards while maintaining appropriate clear paths for all pedestrians. Finally, in developing a 10 11 permanent program we must remember that DOT's Core 12 mission remains moving people and goods through the city safely, efficiently and in an environmentally 13 14 sustainable manner that...in an environmentally 15 sustainable manner that is accessible to all. 16 Therefore, the future program must also prioritize 17 bike lanes, bus lanes, pedestrian space, loading, 18 unloading as well as parking for people with 19 disabilities among other competing uses while leaving room for future innovation. In conclusion, 20 as you said the city streets continues to evolve, 21 DOT is committed to creating a more accessible city 2.2 2.3 for all. In the midst of these challenging times we thank the Council for your ongoing partnership and 24 look forward to continuing this critical work. Thank 25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

1

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

you for the opportunity to testify and we now welcome any questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I have a few questions, and then my colleagues they also have the questions. Since we are doing after the pandemic, you know, we've been able to work with the, with the Open City Restaurant Program. It is something that we share at the concept, but also, I will understand that you guys will be every day thinking about challenges. At the time we have programs we should continue with the program that we need to address, things that are related to improvements. How does DOT work with a business to ensures that sidewalk and the streets around those establishments are participating and then remains, are participating and remain accessible to pedestrians especially for people living with physical challenges?

SEAN QUINN: So, our inspectors they go out and while they are inspecting the businesses and the restaurants they talk with the managers and owners and we provide them with advice on how to make sure that their facility as well as well as the rest of the sidewalk is accessible. We answer all their

2.2

2.3

questions, and we do our best to provide them with guidelines so that they can adhere to those requirements.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you see any challenges in the near future that can be, where we can get some pushback from some business owner when it comes to responsibility when they have to make those areas, seating areas accessible or do you see a level, can you describe a general level of cooperation from our local business community especially restaurant owners?

SEAN QUINN: Yeah, we do have a general understanding of compliance. When we go out, you know, we have, we have not had a lot of resistance and people have been very eager to have guidance from us when we've gone out, and they wanted to get it right. Even if, you know, they call us and ask us to come back a second or third time, we've been able to do that. So, the important part is that they reach out to us, and we do get the impression that they want to adhere to the guidelines. They want to be doing all the right things, and they work toward doing that.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thanks and what...how can you describe our streets right now when it comes to area where we have intersections where we have not been able to put some pedestrian island or to advise that you know make, force the drivers to slow down, but instead we still have many intersections where drivers are turning in more than 20 or 25 miles per hour. Have you been, do you have a team of people? Are you doing assessment or challenges that we have in some intersections where there are still drivers there turning in high speed limit?

the, our Left Turn Traffic Calming Program
throughout the city. We do many do many
intersections a year. We tackle that where we've
seen specifically crashes related to turning
vehicles. So, we continue to target those
intersections with calming engineering, and with
even in the past year as we're announcing our Green
Wave Plan, we've modified some of our designs for
bike lane intersections to also ensure that vehicles
are turning slowly. We continued to roll out that
program over the coming years. We do as you know see

2.2

2.3

the turning vehicles in the intersection as critical to address Vision Zero and we continue to do that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When you look at other cities in our country and I know you're just looking at and are comparing the other places, but just here in our country. Which other state that you just feel, the you can compare that they are doing this better thing that we are doing here or in which area do you think that the city, our neat city of New York can say we are a role model, and where do you still sea area that we have to improve to be the city with the best, the most friendly one for individuals with physical challenges?

SEAN QUINN: Thank you for that question.

I know here in New York we are at the forefront of a lot of different initiatives from one of the largest open streets programs from the installation of larger numbers of protective bike lanes. The work we do with our technology and signal infrastructure for accessibility, the accessibility to the disability community. So, we're always looking at other cities and ways that we can improve on how we operate, but we do feel that we, we have sort of a head start and we're doing a lot of great work when it comes to

2.2

2.3

changing the city and turning into a place for all street users.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Do you feel comfortable to say that we're proud to know that allowing the DOT to use the Vision Zero really silent, the silent program so that we follow all the design and align with our goal of Vision Zero that we are making progress in there or you feel that because of the COVID-19 they have been so, you know, slowed down on that load that we work together, you know to be sure that any work to be done or any intersections, redesign an intersection will be part of our Vision Zero goal?

SEAN QUINN: So, just to clarify, are you speaking of the checklist?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

SEAN QUINN: Okay. Yeah, so we, even though we did have a slow start to this, our project season because of our challenges around COVID-19, in the summer we were able to pick back up on our implementation of projects throughout the city. We ensure, we always try to ensure that all of our projects have the best and best number of elements to provide safety for all street users. We have been

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

updating the checklists online as per the law where you can refer back to each project to see how we did. Every checklist, every project that requires a checklist will have that checklist listed along with the project, and you can, anyone can reference to see how we're doing with including all the safety elements in our projects.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and my last question in this round and then we're going to be calling our colleagues to also ask questions, is about our sidewalks. As you know, we've been having conversations. I have a bill that we drafted, and that also to work together with you guys that will make DOT the leading agency to address anything related to sidewalks, and, and our goal is something similar to what's happening in Vision Zero. Like right everyone knows that if we had to culminate anything on Vision Zero it's our DOT as it is in this case Commissioner Polly Trottenberg as the leading one and coordinating anything they want it to be, and with DOC and then or any agency that play any role related to Vision Zero. When it comes to sidewalks, there's some red tapes that we have with that because lacking goals is in our favor. There is

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

no business that get involved. A lot of other things is involved every department or building. experience in this here is not the lack of your will from you guys and other guys about we as a city have not established. We see the city agency that sure coordinated the other one, and I don't know if we continue repeating and have an example of cases of Nicholas Avenue, 180 and other places here that, you know, there's a limited space of population to walk, but it's not that the DOT would not like to, you know, be sure that if we observer the public advise about a lot of things involve the final building, other things involve most of an affair, how do you feel for DOT to be the agency that should be leading the coordination of anything related to make sidewalks accessible to everyone, especially to individuals with physical challenges?

SEAN QUINN: So, I know that we...I hear what you're saying with the variety of different agencies that are involved in issues related to the sidewalks so we're definitely interested in hearing more on this bill and have those conversations going forward.

24

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1 2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you. 3 Now, let's move to the Council if they have questions. Elliott, I'm going to put it back to you. 4 So, the other thing always controlling the order of the categories. You have to raise your hand to ask 6 7 questions. Thank you Chair. We will now 8 ELLIOTT LYNN: 9 call on Council Members in the order that they have

used the Zoom Raise Hand function. Council Members, please keep your questions to five minutes. The Sergeant-at-Arms will keep a timer and will let you know when your time is up. We'll start first with Council Member Rose who will be followed by Council Member Cohen. Council Member Rose.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The time starts now. (pause)

> ELLIOTT LYNN: Um, you can...(pause) COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Can you hear me now? ELLIOTT LYNN: Yes, we can.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Oh, thank you. I'm sorry. I was having trouble unmuting. Thank you, Chair, and Deputy Commissioner, the Safe Streets for Seniors Program is a pedestrian safety initiative for older New Yorkers in which DOT evaluates

2.2

2.3

pedestrian conditions in targeted senior pedestrian focused areas, and they make safety improvements.

Could you tell me how many senior pedestrian focused areas are on Staten Island and where they're located and what criteria was used to evaluate pedestrian safety and accessibility, and what specific litigation measures have been implemented as a result of this program? Thank you.

ELLIOTT LYNN: okay. So, I'm actually going to pass that onto Sean. He has more information on that one.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. thank you.

SEAN QUINN: Thank you Council Member for the question and I don't have the exact number of locations senior pedestrian focused areas on Staten Island. I can absolutely get that back to you. I know these areas have been determined and they are in all five boroughs. They have been determined by looking at our Senior Safety, Injury and Fatality date as well as senior population to focus our attention and efforts on street safety projects in those areas. The typical project... I'm just looking to see if I have the answer here. Okay. The typical projects range from changing signal timing

2.2

2.3

to allow for a longer crossing time for seniors who may have a...may require a little bit longer to cross the street, and then a lot of the other things that you've seen DOT do or cross a city pedestrian refuge island so seniors can... People who need a longer time they can wait in the middle of the street while they're crossing, short in crossings, more direct crossings. So, a lot of work with our signal timing and geometry changes to aid those seniors who are walking and getting around their neighborhoods.

also targeted where senior centers are? I understand that there are some neighborhoods that are targeted, but like there are clearly identified senior centers where these measures should be applied. Is that also a part of the criteria in determining where they, where these districts are, these areas are?

SEAN QUINN: Yeah, and so just to go back to your earlier question, we have two areas within Staten Island. Then you go up Highland Boulevard area and South Beach. You can find the maps of what was included in those areas on our website under pedestrians and safe streets for seniors. I do know

2	that population is a Senior population is a
3	factor in determining these areas, which would also
4	indicate that there are senior centers within those
5	zones. I don't know if we're looking specifically at
6	senior centers when determining where the zones are.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: What, what type of
8	volume would trigger a location being considered a,
9	you know applicable for this initiative?
LO	SEAN QUINN: That, again I also don't have
11	the exact answer for that, but that's something that
L2	we can look into and I can get you all the
L3	requirements for how neighborhoods are chosen for
L 4	the program.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Alright, thank
L 6	you.
L7	SEAN QUINN: Yes.
L8	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.
L 9	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council
20	Member.
21	SEAN QUINN: Thank you Council Member Rose.
22	Next is we will hear from Council Member Cohen who
23	will be followed by Council Member Holden. Council
	n

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The time starts now.

Member Cohen.

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very much. 2 3 Thank you Chair. Really, I think I have sort of the same question I had when Commissioner Trottenberg 4 testified last time, which, you know, I wish her all the success in the world. I'm not sure that we're 6 7 articulating, you know, a sort of macro vision for what the streets are going to look like and that 8 we're using them in a way that makes the most sense for the most New Yorkers, and even the fact that, 10 11 you know, we're responding to the COVID crisis like 12 at this stage of the game it is so reactionary 13 really I think it's disappointing. I think that the 14 allegation of, you know, of valuable street 15 resources I'm just not sure that we're really 16 articulating a vision for these resources in a way 17 that works for us now, and that's certainly going to 18 work for us in the future. You know, and we're 19 introducing more and more users to the street, you 20 know, electric scooters and all these various electric individual mobility devices. Like things 21 are changing rapidly, and I feel like you know the 2.2 2.3 streets, you know we don't have...we have a finite number of streets, but how we use them I just, again 24 I'm not convinced that we're articulating a vision 25

2.2

2.3

for how this is, you know, sustainable. Having all of these, the vast amount of streets that's devoted to residential parking. I've talked to the Commissioner about residential parking permits and there seems to be a low level of enthusiasm for that, but I mean that's a lot of space that's allocated to parking cars many of which may not even be registered to people who live in the city. Can you talk a little bit about the agency's just, you know, long-term vision and how you think that we could better allocate, you know limited street resources?

SEAN QUINN: Sure. So, I think there's a couple of different answers to that question. Namely as it comes to Open Streets and Open Restaurants programs and our Open Street Restaurant Programs, we did learn a lot of how to design the city streets. I think we were able to by launching those programs help other people in the city re-envision how New York City streets can be used. We definitely learned a lot of lessons with that program, but the program is also built off of a lot of work that the agency already did. So, we're going to take the work that we've been doing, the work that we did over the

2.2

2.3

summer and fall the lessons that we've learned and develop longer term future programs to build out of this and take all the lessons that we learned especially when it comes to how we can make sure those streets accommodate people with disabilities and intro count as we develop those programs. I think there has been some visions laid out in our Green Wave Plan as well as the Better Buses Plan to show how and where we intend on transforming some of those streets and how we hope to layer in these pedestrian elements and these pedestrian streets into those planning processes.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I appreciate your time.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

SEAN QUINN: Thank you Council Member. Next, we will hear from Council Member Holden who will be followed by Council Member Miller. Council Member Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes, so thank you, thank you everyone and thank you Chair for this hearing. I think it's very important to talk about just basic needs of some communities that are not getting the improvements that we heard today. For

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

instance, I have for three years waited for speed bumps on W Sixth Street in Woodhaven. I've also had a crosswalk, many crosswalks in my community that are really anyone walking would take their lives in their hands because of for instance Jamaica Avenue and Woodhaven Boulevard, which is not really my district. It's a little out of my district, but it's like walking on the moon, and I've, I've approached DOT many times about fixing that. Not touched. even see heavily traveled streets not only in my district, but throughout the city that are rippled. You have this ripple on the roadbed that's not fixed. Walking, normal walking people with disabilities can't walk on those kind of ripples and that's no fixed, and then we see people walking around precincts where police vehicles their own personal vehicles parked on the sidewalk blocking crosswalks, doing everything, parking everywhere and how can we even fix that? How can we prevent them from doing that other than just enforcement? Can we do improvements on these corners especially around precincts that will stop them from parking except the police and they're not going to enforce their own laws obviously. We're not, we're not seeing the

enforcement around precincts especially some of mine
where the police vehicles are parked everywhere
blocking crosswalks. So, forget about You know, I
think we have to get back to some kind of the basics
of clearing our crosswalks, prevent people from
crossing on the sidewalks, but I'd like to address
these things, and I'm not getting from Queens DOT.
I'm not getting the answers. I'm getting a very,
very slow response, and I don't want to get a COVID,
This is pretty basic to COVID. You know, I'm hearing
that. I heard at this hearing that COVID slowed
things up. Yeah, we understand that, but we weren't
getting service before the COVID for the last three
years. So, I would just like the DOT and the
officials here try to address some of these. What is
the procedure on damage cross-walks? I'm talking
about the road bed, the ripple that I mentioned.
What is the procedure on that? Does that get like
sort of putting it on the back burner here.

REBECCA ZACK: Are you speaking...I think over... Hi, Council Member. Thanks for all your...I'm not sure if you're done. I can wait until you're done.

2.2

2.3

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, no I'm...I have 3 more, but (laughs)

I felt so

REBECCA ZACK: I'm sorry?

MALE SPEAKER: Yeah. So, Rebecca, I was going to drop in on the road bed issue.

REBECCA ZACK: Okay.

know the Mayor and the Commissioner have increased our ability to resurface our roadways tremendously.

Over the past couple of years we've been having

1,300 and 1,100 miles resurfaced over the years and in deciding where we go to resurface and to fixing those problems that you talked about, we do go to the community. We do go to elected officials, and we do use that to set our schedule at every community Board. So, as

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Is that a question for all?

just... because I'm on the clock here. On that kind of thing I asked for just the milling and they don't really do this or if I could have the crosswalk milled because I wait for years and then to have the

2.2

2.3

whole street milled. Let's say the whole block, and I don't need the crosswalk really because it's dangerous, and I'm not... Do you have a program that when you see dangerous crosswalks because you can't maneuver in them. You can't walk over them even much less a person with disabilities or the ripples that...we're not, we're not seeing that. Do you have that program? I mean maybe Rebecca Zack can answer that. Do you have that?

REBECCA ZACK: I'm not, I'm not...

Maintenance program that addresses a number of different conditions on the roadway. Specifically I'm familiar with what you're talking about and usually the roadways by bus stops we do take those requests and in the off season we have had our maintenance crews go out address those bus locations that have those ripple effects that we talk about. So, we do do it, and I guess, I guess we just need to make sure we get the locations that you're talking about...

REBECCA ZACK: Alright.

SEAN QUINN: ...and we will do our best to try to address those.

2.2

2.3

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Inank you. I just
have one other question but if I may Chair, I just
had a pedestrian a senior who was killed crossing
the street, and this was an hour that just before
dawn when it's hard to see. I understand that.
They're still investigating it. Could you tell me
DOT's role in an investigation? DO you guys work
hand-in-hand with the Police and talk about what
improvements could be made or what happened in that
particular case where a pedestrian was killed or
struck by a motor vehicle? Do you work with the
NYPD after that happens?

investigator of the incident and however we do send a team, a street team out to these locations to assess the safety elements at the location to see if there is anything we can do immediately to improve the condition or over time. So, we make an initial set of recommendations. The Street Team will make an initial set of recommendations for anything they find immediately, and then those, that location there if it's felt to need more work we'll go into our Street Improvement Program list and we'll be informed by some other of the

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

information that NYPD eventually determines to be the... part of the crash.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes, I would like to be involved in that, at least get the results of the investigations of your working with NYPD, and I'd like to know what DOT has in mind because I'm little, you know, I'm very concerned about right now people like Commissioner Trottenberg said in the previous hearing during the COVID we're seeing many more people speeding. I'm not saying that the speeding was a result of this current accident that I had in my district. I'm concerned about throughout the city that we see people speeding, and I'm not sure we're getting the enforcement either, but I think we need to-to--to talk about this as to what we can do. I'm having a difficult time getting speeding addressed in my district throughout the area. I think most people are concerned about this. So, we need, you know, we need to come up with solutions, but anyway, thank you, Chair. Thank you for your indulgence.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you Council Member.

Next we will hear from Council Member Miller.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Council Member Miller. SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The time starts now.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good afternoon. Good afternoon Chair. It is good to see you and my colleagues. I don't even know where to begin. I really don't and I will begin as I begun for the last seven years when we had hearings, which involved the agency the DOT and, and that is whether or not the lack of diversity is a manifestation of the, the lack of equity and services and how they get delivered throughout communities throughout the City of New York. I can agree wholeheartedly, kind of whole heartedly with my colleague Holden that these are things that predate COVID, and I would also submit that what we have seen and we have put forth viable plans whether it was busways, programs and projects to, to combat the illegal and unaccessible and unsafe commuter vans and many more, (chime) and nothing has been done over the past seven years. What happens when we talk about Vision Zero here in Southeast Queens and other communities of color throughout the city we don't get the investment and capital improvement, which includes mediums and

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

other capital investment to keep people safe. We get punitive speed cameras, and they're like cameras, which is fine, but we want more. We also want to be engaged as a community. I'm glad to see you Deputy Commissioner Haywood. That's a face I have not seen for the past seven years. I'm very interested to hear about sidewalks and plans to...Obviously homeowners are deeply impacted. I want to talk about accessibility, and how that's important. So, we have a DOT project that is occurring right now here on Merrick (sic) Boulevard in Southeast Queens. It is not a project that was engaged that the community was engaging in part of this cost or any other form of engagement. They were at Community Board meeting last week and, and they were made well aware that they were being disingenuous at best in saying that. We went to them and we asked them to be able to mitigate the problem that which the community had known about forever. During rush hour and certain times of the day it will take you 20 minutes to go three blocks, and there was a study, a study which that was done by DOT proposed by the Jamaica Now, which was finished some time in April or May. It has yet to

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

be released. I think that it's going to demonstrate what we already know that there are areas of congestion that we have put forth some solutions and nothing has happened. So, I... I look forward to seeing that report sooner than later. My office went to DOT with this problem of congestion, and asked for a meeting to discuss how we mitigate. Part of that was a suggestion of a no standing depending on the-obviously the time of day. The traffic flow everyone goes to the subway in the morning. Everyone comes back in the afternoon. The buses will take 20 minutes to go three miles and then 20 minutes to go three blocks. Everyone knows what this is. DOT came out, met with my office, the precinct and made an announcement that they had already begun on the bus lanes. That we were supposed to be touring to discuss. They also painted the bus lanes everywhere along this twomile corridor except for the locations where the problem began. I have some pictures here where the side from 107 and Merrick, 108 and Merrick and then other places. The commonality amongst these hot spots they are body shops, and on these body shops where those lanes are away they park in the bus

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

They park on the street. We have at least over 100 cars that are parked on the street that never move belonging to these body shops. We have, at this location we have three senior buildings and they cannot walk on the sidewalk because there are cars parked on the sidewalk. Now, DOT was out there with us the 103rd Precinct was out there with us, and we've been having this conversation for more than a year. None of it's been mitigated. Now DOT has moved forward with a plan to put a bus lane not on the curb but taking away one of the driving lanes. Now, we're down to one lane and now when these cars double park and these things happen at these same locations, we were worse off than we were to begin with. That was no community engagement but it was indicative of DOT what they do. They decide that they want to implement a certain program and they're going to fit a square peg into a round hole, and that's just not working. There's been no engagement and it is just consistent with what you're doing. Now, this is the latest project. The busway that we were greatly anticipating on Archer Avenue what we've been working with for nearly ten, two decades when there

2	was administrative allocated money, DOT decided
3	they were going to Jamaica Avenue instead, and when
4	there was community pushback and merchants'
5	pushback and there were no allies to go along with
6	that, that project just went away even though
7	Archer Avenue is the busiest bus corridor in
8	America. Nearly a quarter of a million people take
9	the trains and buses daily and we can't get
10	anything to address that. So, how do we move
11	forward here? How do we move forward when you talk
12	about, we're talking engaging elected and engaging
13	communities, how would? Again, I would submit
14	that that is disingenuous at best. It has not
15	happened. The program that has happened is what
16	DOT has felt necessary or mayoral, but at the end
17	of the day we still have a busy congested
18	commercial and bus corridor on Jamaica Avenue and
19	Archer Avenue. That is, it is we still have
20	illegal and inaccessible commuter vans that block
21	buses and all traffic on Archer Avenue. These are
22	problems that we've been dealing with for the last
23	six years. We've written legislation. No
24	enforcements. We've spoken through hearings. We
25	didn't do the hearing out there. Commissioner

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Trottenberg came out there three or four times. fact, nearly got run over by a commuter van one who jumped the curb. Nothing has happened. So, this all sounds good, but the practical application of it and the impact on mitigating congestion and creating accessibility, and I have see these. You cannot walk out of the building. Near 300 seniors and for two blocks cars are parked on the sidewalk. Derelict cars are parked on the street, and there is no accessibility. Now, the plan was put a bus lane there on the curb to move those cars to get the off the curb. Instead, what do we do, and then the kicker of all kickers is DOT announces last week that we put down the bike bus lane. They also said that they were going to talk with us about signs. And now there are signs going up suggesting cameras, fines, but no times. So now it's a 24/7 bus lane, which makes absolutely no sense. So, they did not talk with us about that. But going back to the problem, which we initiated with them, which was these 7 or 8 body shops that exist and block the streets and block the sidewalkS, everywhere along these two miles stretch has a bus lane except for in front of the body shop because they want to,

they want us they want to have a conversation with 2 3 the owners to figure out how to help them move 4 along. So, the rest of the world is being inconvenienced with this bus lane, but the people who caused the problem who necessitated the need 6 7 for a bus lane they don't have it. In fact, I was told last week that they are no longer painting 8 lines and that they are going to paint lines in 10 front of the body shops in the spring. So, for the 11 next six months they are to continue to be 12 inconvenienced as a community on this main 13 thoroughfare and the people who have created this 14 problem continue to operate just as business as 15 usual. I hop that, listen and I heard all the 16 praise that was being heaped. You know, I just don't share those sentiments in theory, but in 17 18 practical application it never happened in this 19 community and, and as I driver throughout the City there are communities of color that don't get the 20 21 same investment and there is absolutely no enforcement. I remember talking four year ago about 2.2 2.3 Atlantic Avenue. There is a no standing that runs from the Brooklyn Bridge to Queens, and it's been 24 and it's occupied all the time. That trip will take 25

you an nour and a nail leaving City Hall, and, and
nobody does anything about it. So, we're doing all
these studies. I don't know what we're studying,
but the people that's on the ground the people that
need to access these streets and sidewalks are not
being impacted and they are particularly not being
impacted of the outer boroughs. They are
particularly not being impacted in communities of
color and we are not seeing the investment that we
are seeing in other places in the city. We want to
be safe. If Vision Zero is applicable but we want
something other than speed cameras to keep us safe.
We want, we don't want punitive dollar investments
or (chime) or that's going to keep us safe. We are
now seeing speed cameras in the middle of sidewalks
or residential streets in Southeast Queens here
now. No engagement on that. That is pretty
ridiculous. So, I think DOT needs to be a lot more
transparent in their actions and, I know we're a
little late in the game. It needs to be a lot more
diverse, and so that we have ideas that really
reflect the needs and the values of these
communities that we serve.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member I think that you know a lot of specific things that is very important to follow up, and one of the things of promotion I know in the past you have focused your attention on the need to walk that area and there is somewhat what DOT can say, but I can say that let's follow and let's see how we can, you know, put some effort together, and do the walk. So, we don't give up, but let's bring in DOT to put that thing together so that we can do a walk in that area so that we can look at a specific thing that we should do that is the need of your community.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I appreciate that,
but it has to be at senior level because over the
last month they meet every Wednesday with my
office, and nothing has happened, and again, they
went to the Community Board. The community is
totally upset. They have this two miles that they
are the busiest stuff in the community that they
can't use, and the problem people, you know, why
would you put a bus lane in the midst of people
that caused the problem. Just an answer for that.
Where are the answers? We need answers, and the

2.2

2.3

answers I'm not getting at the local level. So, I'm talking to the Deputy Commissioners to see who's accountable? You know what was the plan?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, I know you personally. In my, when I first tried to raise that and we were giving up on DOT. So, but before we hear from them what they are going to say, let's see how you and I can follow up on any way that we can be helpful to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks. Anyone from DOT would like to address?

SEAN QUINN: I can just... I will say one thing and that's specific to the Merrick Boulevard. I'll say I know you've been working with our Queens Office on those conversations, and I think Chair Rodriguez has some advice on how we can move forward on that. Generally, we just as our Commissioner testified at the Preliminary Budget Hearing a little while ago, we have in relation to our projects our citywide safety projects. We analyzed a number of those projects implemented in New York City's highest poverty and highest non-white neighborhoods based on census tract

demographics and we found that these neighbor	ormoods
not only received a proportional share of pr	rojects,
but also some, also realized some of the lar	rgest
drops in pedestrian fatalities. So, while w	we
certainly do have more work to do in terms of	of
reaching all corners of the city, our data of	driven
approach so far has taken us to the neighbor	rhoods
all over the city, and we're really working	to
address bringing down our fatalities and in	juries
everywhere we possibly can.	

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And do you want to share that data? Can you share that data?

SEAN QUINN: Yeah, I believe it's in the, um...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yes?

SEAN QUINN: Sure.

it. I would suspect that it's probably in poor gentrified communities that, that, that are getting these investments. I haven't seen them. I haven't seen them in Southeast Queens. I have not see them at all. I'd love to see those.

SEAN QUINN: Okay.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 54 2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, just share the data, and then we will follow up with your 3 4 plan. Okay? If I have taking something let's say 5 that you got from DOT, then we can work together to organize and work with someone from your team, and 6 7 they commence it and they, and then Council Member 8 Miller and myself will be there, too so that we can 9 work together and see what are the challenges. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And are we not doing 11 the Bus way plan? Is that not happening? I see 12 somebody waving their hand. That was the big 13 announcement by the Administration. Are we not

SEAN QUINN: Can you, Rebecca?

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

doing the Busway?

REBECCA ZACK: Hi, Council Member. In regards to Merrick I know there was five blocks that you had concerns about. So that part has not been done, and you want to put in the engagement on that, which we have committed to. You also wanted Archer to be a busway and we...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What does that mean?

REBECCA ZACK: I'm sorry?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What does that mean that, that I wanted further community

2.2

2.3

engagement, and we committed to that. Because I've been told that that won't be addressed until the spring, which means that we are going to continue to have that problem until next spring.

REBECCA ZACK: You know, I think one of the challenges that we have right now is, you know, the season ran out. The project started when they started, and that... My understanding is that you had very specific concerns with those areas, and my understanding is that you wanted that held for now so we could have more community engagement, which I believe it's in our interest.

absolutely not. That's misinformation. That is the problem area. We went to them and asked them to put a no-standing and they came up with the bus lane, but that is certainly misinformation that would, like no absolutely not. Those people caused the problem. Those people are the reason why 300 seniors cannot even walk on the sidewalk out of their building because they're parking on the street. They're the reason why they can't cross the streets to even get a bus because they're parked in the lane, and they just leave that. (sic) We want

that.

questions for DOT?

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you, Council

Member. Are there any other Council Members with
questions for DOT? Chair, do you have any other

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, two and my question is which other city are doing things related to adverse challenges, important to individuals especially the kind of challenges that we can't look at right now. Did you, are you looking at any other, and again, I'm proud of the work that we have been able to do together and with DOT, with the Speaker with our colleagues and stuff that we hear from others and from colleagues, specific things that have to be addressed and the attention to be giving on some level in the undersevered communities in the whole city of New York is something that, you know, we've been addressing and just hope again that the fact that we have areas to still deal with and challenges, it doesn't take credit for a lot of other things that we have been able to do together. So, with that experience, is there anything that you have seen in other cities that as we have been to be proud of being a role model as they say other places in L.A. or

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

other cities they are doing things that we should
look at it to improve accessibility to our New
Yorkers and visitors for fiscal challenges?

So, we have spoken COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: to both L.A. and still meet about things that they are doing there in regards to ped ramps. I think, I think another piece of as I mentioned in our testimony is that we have our new Accessibility Coordinator who started last week at DOT, and I feel that this is something that he'll be able to tackle or beat on, but we've already been doing it and had those conversations not only internally with the city, but externally with other cities as well. I think his role here will be, you know, greatly appreciated along with the work that we've already been doing with our Mobility Management Team which I also mentioned in the testimony. So, we have new people, and people who have been in the agency for a while thinking about this question and having those conversations with other cities and I think in our conversations with L.A. and Philly so far we've found, in other cities we found that our program is the most aggressive. We're way ahead of these cities and we want to, we want to keep that

2.2

2.3

up and hope that the new Accessibility Coordinator
and the work that we're doing will help us keep
this pace.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. Thank you guys.

SEAN QUINN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

SEAN QUINN: Thank you. If there are no other...Oh, Chair Rodriguez, I think Council Member Holden would like to ask another question, if the answer could be.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Alright. Just ask it.

council Member Holden: Thank you. I just one other, one quick question. In a number of locations throughout my district I've asked for raised crosswalks to be implemented or to be installed as a tool. I'm not seeing...well, I think the day after and especially by a school I have a very hazardous wide street with a curve, and you really can't see the crosswalks when cars and trucks are coming around the curve. So, I asked for a raised crosswalk, which would act also as the speed bumps, and I've seen that implemented very

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

- well in Pureto Rico and many European countries. 2
- 3 I'm not seeing it in New York City
- 4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.
- COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But if you install any related crosswalks..
- 7 REBECCA ZACK: We do.
- COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: 8 You do?
 - REBECCA ZACK: We do and let me...I can get the location of where they are. It's pretty limiting in terms of because of the corners and drainage and making sure that we can still have water and things drain into corners. It's challenging, but we do have them. We don't have
- 15 many because of that, but, um, I pull that and find
- 16 out where they are.
- 17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Because of drainage 18 you could put a little, because of drainage you 19 could put a little pipe at the curb that would get 20 the water through. I mean there is no way to
- 21 engineer that?
- I don't know if we would. 2.2 REBECCA ZACK:
- 2.3 I'm not sure about our ability to install like at
- the curb or what that would mean for Sanitation or 24
- whatever, but you're saying yes we do have them, 25

2.2

2.3

and I'm not sure what the, what the challenges are or if you ever got a response about the specific location that you're asking about. If you were denied, we dan talk about it, but if you never got a response, we can, we can go from there.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Most of the time I'm denied and I would accept when somebody requests a traffic light. We're seeing now a lot of money for traffic lights, which I don't believe many work on residential streets because people speed up at the yellow. I would like traffic calming and I...I'm not getting speed bumps, but I think this city does not implement crosswalks, raised crosswalks enough. I'm seeing that in European countries. I'm seeing it all over the United States even.

REBECCA ZACK: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And we are slow to do that, and drainage? Come on. Other cities have figured it out. I think what we have to do is think outside the box, but also implement raised crosswalks that are more feasible in certain locations. Sometimes they're made out of brick. I've seen it in Puerto Rico out of brick, a beautiful crossing, and it doesn't have to be on a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

corner. Alright, it could be mid-block as long as there's, they put some traffic signal or not, but we need to start making our corners or our crossings safer.

REBECCA ZACK: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and, and again, I feel that, you know, as you are residents or all colleagues here the message is for DOT for you guys that, you know the 51 Council Members should be they meet up here that you should rely on the Council, you know, being that we have to act for our community, and, and again as I can that we do a good job. I feel like we can do much better if we are able to follow with specific things that we have in and for our community, and, of course, they have many local things from developers or the island which I have for either running this section that is going to be because, you know, rather than turning and driving very fast when they make a turn, I would follow you guys, but let's be sure that we continue a residential suggestion on how we can improve each Council Member. So, with that, thank you to the panel, and they're waiting, too.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 REBECCA ZACK: Thank you.

3 SEAN QUINN: Thank you.

LEO HAYWARD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Thank you. We will now turn to public testimony. I'd like to remind everyone that unlike our typical Council hearings we will be calling individuals one by one to testify. Each panelist will be given two minutes to speak. Please begin once the Sergeant has started the timer. Council members who have questions for a particular panelist should use the Raise Hand Function in Zoom, and I will call on you after the panelist has completed their testimony. For panelists, once your name is called, a member or our staff will unmute you and the Sergeant-at-Arms will give you the go-ahead to begin as soon as they set the timer. Please wait until the Sergeant announces that you may begin before delivering your testimony. I would like to first welcome Imaam Rimlowi to testify and I apologize for the pronunciation of your name.

EMAN RIMAWI: That's totally fine. Thank you so much. Hi, my name is Eman Rimawi. Oh, sorry.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.

2 EMAN RIMAWI: Okay, great. My name is Eman 3 Thank you so much for including me. I work 4 for New York Lawyers for the Public Interest in the Disability Justice Program. I am also a double amputee with Lupus, and I just a walker. For almost 6 7 four years I have worked at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest as the Access-A-Ride 8 coordinator and organizer to help people with 10 disabilities. We use New York City's park transit 11 service to obtain, to obtain better service. 12 Through this work and from my own personal experience I have realized the paratransit isn't 13 14 the only access issue for people with disabilities 15 in the city. Accessible streets play an essential 16 role in the lives of all New Yorkers in many ways: 17 Going from the grocery store to using a taxi or 18 even getting to their jobs and yet there is so much 19 inaccessibility in our city. How can New York City 20 be the best city in the world and exclude one of their most disenfranchised communities out there? I 21 can't hide who I am and I won't. If people don't 2.2 2.3 want to associate with me I'm not interested in associating with them. Unfortunately, that doesn't 24 always work especially when we are talking about 25

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

access and the need to request accommodation from the city. Property owners are expected to clear snow and ice off the sidewalks to create a fourfoot wide path for pedestrians including pedestrian walkways curb cuts. Property owners and businesses must also keep sidewalks clean as well as clear of objects that obstructs passage. Failure to comply with local laws governing snow and obstruction removal creates a fine. Packed snow and obstruction removal is especially critical for seniors and individuals with mobility impairments like me. Unfortunately, I have some sidewalks obstructed by trash and snow more times than I can count in all five boroughs including in the very busy areas like Grand Concourse in the Bronx or Downtown Brooklyn. I've had to climb over such barriers, which isn't easy for someone like me or hope that a stranger can help me over as I had to go into the street when I couldn't get past, and when I used the wheel chair, sometimes I had to go all the way back to the other side of the block just to cross at the corner. No one should have to do that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OH, Miss.

24

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

EMAN RIMAWI: No one should have to do that. It is unacceptable, and how is that fair to me? Am I not an equal citizen of the law? Why does that seem like the city...? Why does it seem like the city puts the responsibility of watching out for those, reporting but potentially arguing with property owners or everyday citizens rather than the officials and agencies who are paid to do it? Additionally, fallen trees or branches are a huge problem especially in Queens. You can report trees and branches that have fallen in public property but often times it takes a while to get it removed. Pedestrian ramps and curb cuts are not up to time in any borough. I've gotten, it's gotten better, but it's not as it was or should be. It's as if no one has asked a person with the physical disability if these pedestrian ramps actually work. A few ramps that I absolutely loathe are attached to public libraries. One is from the main library at 42nd and 6th and the other is at Prospect Park. I have not been to them in years because I am afraid that I will fly off and go into the street. I know I am not the only one because I have had these talks with several people who have mobility issues

2.2

2.3

and they have the same complaint. Relatively new concerns since the start of COVID are accessibility issues with outdoor dining. I have seen a number of outdoor dining set-ups that blocked an entire sidewalk in Manhattan, and I've had to go into the street to avoid that. I'm able to do that because I use a walker, and my balance is improving, but people who use wheelchairs have to go, have the worst time to get around those blockages. I've had other people tell me that they have to simply go back around the block and go out the corner because they can't get through, and that's exhausting. We really need to break up this impact.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Yes, summarize and if you can sum up...

EMAN RIMAWI: Yes. I'm almost done.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If you cannot get through this you can save the testimony by Bill (inaudible)

EMAN RIMAWI: That's fine. I'm almost done.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

EMAN RIMAWI: We really need to think about the negative impact blocking sidewalks has on the disability communities, but we are not the only

2.2

2.3

one. What about people with strollers, luggage or packages? The same ways that elevators work for everyone so do accessible sidewalks. Again, thank you for sharing my testimony. It is vitally important for streets and sidewalks to be clear of obstruction particularly for seniors and persons with disabilities because we often have mobility devices that need the space to get through. Please contact me if you have any other questions. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Thank you for your testimony. Do any Council Members have questions for this panelist? Okay, seeing no questions, we will move onto the next panelist. Next, we will have Kathleen Collins. Kathleen.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Kathleen Collins.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The time starts now.

KATHLEEN COLLINS: Good afternoon. My name is Kathleen Collins and I (inaudible) from birth. I am also an attorney who is retired from the job that I had for 30 years. Right now I'm speaking on behalf of Downstate Yorker Doubt where I am a co-coordinator and Downstate New Yorker D.A.P is a

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

grassroots non-hiearchial Community of people with all types of disabilities advocating for the civil rights of people with disabilities including, but not limited to right to move in, no a right to live in and fully participate in the larger community. Due to the timing and communication throughout today, I'm just going to mention the areas that I will be submitting a written, written comments to the, to record it. I just want to highlight the five...right now we have five areas that we are going to speak about in our proposed comments to policies or add to that at this meeting here today. Besides areas that we plan to address on our curb ramps also know as head ramps I've heard here today. The condition of sidewalks and roadways, physical obstacles encountered on the sidewalks and in the roadways, problems with traffic signals including the fact that so many of the traffic signals are not accessible to our sisters and brothers who are hearing impaired, and finally list of traffic designations. We ask that the committee creating an advisory board consisting of New Yorkers with many different types of disabilities that an assist this committee and other City

2.2

2.3

Council committees in their work. So, do...so we do not continually have to bring lawsuits against the city. Further, finally we ask that this committee continue to reach out to New Yorkers with disabilities making a truly great and safe city for all New Yorkers in our wonderful city. So, please reach out to us. Don't be...(inaudible) And also we ask...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Alright.

KATHLEEN COLLINS: ...that D-N-Y adapt a chief back hub. Please reach out to us. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Thank you for your testimony. Were there any questions for this panelist? Oh, okay seeing none...

FEMALE SPEAKER: Oh, I have a quick question. I just have a quick question. Will we be able to access this recording later? I mean it's so rare and then also with our comments, do we just send them to that link that we got in the email that's says you just click on it and you send it to the Transportation Committee?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Yes, you can submit written testimony through that link, and we can

1

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 follow up with you if you continue to need 3 assistance with that.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Okay, great. Thank you so much. When it's, it's only 12 with this so it's as of Wednesday is the deadline.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Which ends.

FEMALE SPEAKER: 72 hours from the date from today is the deadline for any comments. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Okay, next we will hear from Jean Ryan.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, that's our...

JEAN RYAN: Hi. I'm Jean Ryan. I'm President of Disabled in Action of Metropolitan New York. Can you hear me.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think yes.

JEAN RYAN: Okay, thank you. We represent people with all kinds of disabilities, and this is our fiftieth year, 50, and we intend to be around for at least 50 more years. I would like to address five or six things whatever I have time for, and then I will submit written testimony also. One problem is the accessible street crossings for blind people who live all over. They don't just

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

live on certain streets where you have them now. They should be all over the city. Every single light should have safe street crossings for people who are blind, and people become...most people who are blind become blind in later life. So, they're not going to have a whole lot of travel skills for being blind. So, that's why this is really important to a huge number of people in our community. All over the city curb cuts. We want curb cuts and pedestrian ramps at all corners and in good repair we don't want ponding. There are some corners that perpetually have ponding so deep that you just cannot go through it safely with a wheel chair, and then only people who can manage those are people with high boots or really good jumping skills, and I would venture to say that most people who are walking in New York City do not have really good jumping skills. Also, the crosswalks somebody mentioned that before, the period of time that crosswalks are repaired is a really long time, and it shouldn't be because so many cross-walks are really marked up with potholes and just are so bad you could hardly...

JEAN RYAN: Okay, let me just quickly cover
the other ones. E-Scooter regulation. There should
be none on the sidewalks. Regulated speeds on all
E-Scooters, rental or not. No parking scooters near
an intersection or on a sidewalk, and also we want
the DOT to eliminate their rule allowing parking of
head ramps at keyblocking head ramps at key
intersections. This is discriminatory to people
with disabilities and it's very ineffectual since
around 2007 and 2008, and it is totally
discriminatory to us because we cannot to mid-block
crossings, and we need to, and the last two things
I'll mention in my written testimony: Shore road
bus stops in Bayridge, in New York are totally
impossible, and unable to be used by wheelchair
users, and snow removals at intersections is a
perennial problem and a snow plow just keeps
plowing the snow there and leaving it and it
becomes to be a big huge ridge of ice that traps
wheelchair users in our homes. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank you for your leadership and...

JEAN RYAN: Can I just...

COMMITTEE COUNSEL LYNN: Oh, go ahead. Sorry.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry and just thanks Kelly. So, thank you for your leadership and, and also I believe that the leadership that your institution and many other advocates are so important. That's why even the level of the work that has been done in our city to make our intersection accessible is also the result of advocate groups for the intersections and they say this and also many also other results are lawsuit (sic). So, I hope again that working with all the advocates, all the counting, (inaudible) we can begin to make our city a role model for the whole nation. I think that there's a lot of work that we have done, but there's many other that we have to.

FEMALE SPEAKER: And I wonder where are they going to put the snow with all the outdoor restaurants.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: This, this I know.

JEAN RYAN: Well, do you know what I mean?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: (LAUGHING)

JEAN RYAN: You may have to list...Okay, well, I have an idea. Minneapolis melts the snow. I'm from Minnesota originally, Minneapolis melts the snow. There is no place to put a whole lot of

2.2

2.3

snow. We could have melters in every neighborhood that, you know, melt the snow so it just turns to water and goes down into the sewer and you don't have to haul it away or shovel it to the curb because there is not going to be space this year.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And we take your suggestion and we soon follow with you and there a Sanitation, of course and DOT, too. Thank you.

JEAN RYAN: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

testimony. Are there any questions for this panelist? Okay. Before I turn it back over to the Chair, I just wanted to check in if there was anyone else that we missed as far as public testimony? If you could use the Zoom Raise Hand function. Okay, seeing none, Chair, I'll turn it back over to you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes. Thank you members and thank you all the staff of Committee on Transportation. So, the vide to actually get started so they can pour in legislation staff. Also Eric Cordata from Honeybee Communication, and, you know this is, this conversation is important to New

1	COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION	76
2	York and DOT, to the (inaudible) in any case.	This
3	hearing is adjourned. Thank you	
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 11, 2020_____