Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and

International Intergroup Relations

Brenda McKinney, *Legislative* *Counsel*

Cristy Dwyer, *Legislative* *Policy Analyst*

Aliya Ali, *Principal Financial Analyst*



The Council of the City of New York

COMMITTEE REPORT OF THE HUMAN SERVICES DIVISION

Jeffrey Baker, *Legislative Director*

Andrea Vazquez, *Deputy Director for Human Services*

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES

AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

Hon. Jimmy Van Bramer, *Chair*

December 15, 2020

**Oversight:** **The Impact of COVID-19 on Art and**

**Cultural Educational Programming in New York City**

**INTRODUCTION**

On Tuesday, December 15, 2020, the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations, chaired by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer, will conduct an oversight hearing on “The Impact of COVID-19 on Art and Cultural Educational Programming in New York City.” Witnesses invited to testify include representatives of the Department of Cultural Affairs (DCLA), advocacy groups, various art and cultural organizations and foundations and other interested stakeholders.

**BACKGROUND**

*COVID-19 and Limitations on Cultural Institutions: Closures and Cancellations*

On March 12, 2020, in response to COVID-19, New York State (NYS) Governor Andrew Cuomo barred gatherings of more than 500 people and placed restrictions on other gatherings,[[1]](#footnote-1) prompting New York City’s (NYC) cultural institutions—including the Metropolitan Museum of Art (The Met), the Museum of Modern Art (MoMA), the Whitney Museum of American Art, the Guggenheim, the Metropolitan Opera, Carnegie Hall and the NY Philharmonic—to shut their doors, postpone all programming and cancel all shows.[[2]](#footnote-2) In a press conference the same day, NYC Mayor Bill de Blasio stressed the importance of the restrictions, which he conveyed as “difficult but necessary.”[[3]](#footnote-3) On March 20, 2020, Governor Cuomo announced an executive order creating "New York State on PAUSE" restrictions,[[4]](#footnote-4) resulting in a de-facto shelter in place order.[[5]](#footnote-5) While artists, cultural organizations and institutions, cultural groups and galleries began exploring creative ways to keep people engaged with art, culture and commerce while observing safety precautions,[[6]](#footnote-6) data shows that the art and cultural community, in particular, was disproportionately and negatively impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic, as compared with other sectors.[[7]](#footnote-7)

Prior to the pandemic, the cultural sector was one of the largest industries in NYC,[[8]](#footnote-8) employing nearly 400,000 workers, paying them $31 billion in wages and generating $110 billion in economic activity.[[9]](#footnote-9) Last year, the theater industry in NYC alone grossed $1.8 billion and drew 14.8 million patrons,[[10]](#footnote-10) while the dance sector contributed over $300 million to the City's economy.[[11]](#footnote-11) In NYS, the cultural sector contributes more than $120 billion to the economy annually.[[12]](#footnote-12) However, when cultural institutions closed their doors in March 2020, the City’s artists, actors, musicians, stagehands and freelancers suddenly found themselves unemployed and severed from their communities and livelihoods.[[13]](#footnote-13) Over the next few months, the museum sector alone lost almost 34 percent of its jobs due to closures.[[14]](#footnote-14) On March 19th, the Metropolitan Opera laid off all of its union employees[[15]](#footnote-15) and on March 31st, The Met announced it would look to its $3.6 billion endowment to cover costs and maintain employees, something the museum had not previously done, even during World Wars, 9/11 or in the aftermath of Hurricane Sandy.[[16]](#footnote-16) By early April, the Queens Museum had laid off 30 employees, the Whitney Museum of Art had laid off 20 percent of its staff and other institutions expressed they may have to lay off a significant number of employees – in some cases up to 68 percent.[[17]](#footnote-17)

Research conducted for DCLA in July indicates that during the first months of the pandemic, 95 percent of art and cultural institutions in NYC canceled programs, 88 percent modified delivery of their programs, and 11 percent of these institutions were rendered unable to provide products or services to their communities by May.[[18]](#footnote-18) The performing arts industry in particular shed 70 percent of its jobs due to closures,[[19]](#footnote-19) and a survey by the National Independent Venue Association estimated that 90 percent of independent venues would be forced to close forever if they did not receive government aid.[[20]](#footnote-20) In fact, **data suggests that the art and cultural sector in NYC has been the second hardest hit industry with regard to job loss, after restaurants**.[[21]](#footnote-21)

Moreover, the data not only suggests artists largely bore the brunt of staffing cuts,[[22]](#footnote-22) but that arts education organizations alone, many of which employ artists, reported up to 78 percent of artist staffing cuts, some of the highest pandemic-induced cuts,[[23]](#footnote-23) as well as income losses of about 18 percent.[[24]](#footnote-24) This economic landscape and these cuts in particular have also especially affected art educators who often already work under uncertain labor conditions, as many are hired on a part-time or freelance basis,[[25]](#footnote-25) and without benefits.[[26]](#footnote-26)

*Ongoing Concerns and Remote Education Offerings*

While NYS has lifted restrictions on some art and cultural organizations, allowing them to re-open from August 24, 2020,[[27]](#footnote-27) capacity limits and other restrictions have left many art and culture organizations in the same situation they were in last spring.[[28]](#footnote-28) As a result, many of these institutions have continued to explore new ways to interact with audiences,[[29]](#footnote-29) as people are learning and creating art in new ways, and across multiple platforms.[[30]](#footnote-30) Shifting to a remote setting also presents new challenges, as organizations adopt new pedagogical methods and adjust to new technologies,[[31]](#footnote-31) some of which have resulted in a loss of revenue and productivity for a number of organizations.[[32]](#footnote-32) To offer examples of how several organizations have adjusted their strategies:

* Prior to the pandemic, **Flushing Town Hall**[[33]](#footnote-33) offered programs in music, theater, dance and spoken word, along with family and education programs, senior programs, exhibitions, and free community events, and employed a diverse roster of teaching artists.[[34]](#footnote-34) The organization paid its teaching artists who could not come in for two weeks in the beginning of the pandemic,[[35]](#footnote-35) and has now shifted to remote offerings, such as online weekly educational offerings for kids and adults in Global Arts, Virtual Jazz Jams, as well as live virtual assemblies and a Zoom Artist "Hang."[[36]](#footnote-36)
* Prior to the pandemic, two thirds of the **Brooklyn Conservatory of Music**’s[[37]](#footnote-37) budget came from on-site music lessons and music therapy offered at its Park Slope home, and one third from off-site music education programs that it presented at schools, senior centers and other community sites around the city.[[38]](#footnote-38) The effect of COVID-19 on education programming has resulted in a pivot to online learning, with remote private, group and ensemble lessons being offered online on an extensive daily, weekly and monthly basis.[[39]](#footnote-39)
* Prior to the outbreak of the pandemic, the **Jamaica Center for Arts and Learning** (JCAL),[[40]](#footnote-40) a multidisciplinary arts center based in Jamaica, received revenue from rental, registration, tuition, box office, program services, and corporation supports,[[41]](#footnote-41) and stated, “the biggest impact [was] on paying our teaching artists since there [are] no classes, and no contract services now to schools and senior centers.”[[42]](#footnote-42) The organization has also gone virtual. In fact from December 17-20, 2020, JCAL is offering "a four-day multicultural arts festival featuring cultural presentations, panel discussions and workshops, highlighting immigrant, Indigenous, and Native American artists representing diverse communities of Southeast Queens."[[43]](#footnote-43) The organization also features online pop up classes from teaching professionals.[[44]](#footnote-44)
* Finally, the **CANVAS Institute for Arts, Culture and Civic Engagement**,[[45]](#footnote-45) a multidisciplinary arts and culture space on Staten Island’s North Shore, has also faced challenges and highlighted that the inequities faced by Black- and minority-owned art spaces like CANVAS will only be exacerbated during the coming months. “The bigger organizations are going to figure out [how to access emergency funding] much faster,” he says. “They’re going to get the bulk of the money and most of the sympathy.”[[46]](#footnote-46)

In the late spring of 2020, several NYC-based cultural organizations and advocates partnered to launch the “Summer in the City” program,[[47]](#footnote-47) to provide free remote access to art and cultural educational programming.[[48]](#footnote-48) The program ran from July 6th to August 28th[[49]](#footnote-49) and involved a number of cultural institutions providing 500 art and cultural program hours per week and 40,000 hours of cultural programming over eight weeks,[[50]](#footnote-50) all from over 40 organizations as diverse as The Museum of the City of New York, Queens Botanical Garden, The Time In Children’s Art Initiative and the Universal Hip Hop Museum.[[51]](#footnote-51)

Additionally, in recent weeks, the NYC Department of Education (DOE) launched a program focused on art education, which could provide additional opportunities for cultural education at nonprofit organizations.[[52]](#footnote-52) According to organizations and media, the impetus behind starting this (yet unnamed) program is to address gaps created by the city’s $15.5 million funding cut to art education services,[[53]](#footnote-53) which equates to a roughly 30 percent cut.[[54]](#footnote-54) The program will be facilitated by DOE’s Office of Arts and Special Projects and provide free and remote arts programming to K through 12th grade students in the City’s 1,800 public schools,[[55]](#footnote-55) while simultaneously providing opportunities for art and cultural organizations to earn revenue, employ teaching artists and engage with the community in meaningful ways again.[[56]](#footnote-56) The program will amount to more than 170 hours of instruction, including videos and resources for both the city’s 75,000 teachers and caregivers.[[57]](#footnote-57) Content is also “gradually being uploaded” to an online portal, also administered by the DOE.[[58]](#footnote-58)

One organization participating in the program, the Dance Education Laboratory at the 92nd Street Y, has stated that the organization is using the opportunity to: (1) highlight dance traditions in NYC, with a focus on “three groups of people who have been marginalized, ignored or completely decimated from American history books,” and (2) to evaluate Native American dance and culture, the evolution of tap dance in New York and “the work of the choreographer H.T. Chen.”[[59]](#footnote-59)

The value of art and cultural education on young people is undisputed.[[60]](#footnote-60) As NYC Mayor Bill de Blasio has acknowledged, “art and cultural education broadens each child, deepens their commitment to education, makes them stronger intellectually and makes them better able to handle the world that we are in today.”[[61]](#footnote-61) Further, while there are numerous examples of how remote art and cultural education might provide access and opportunities for some youth to engage in culture from home in new ways, cultural organizations and advocates have argued that, on the whole, the current situation is limiting youth access to arts and culture.[[62]](#footnote-62) Moreover, there are also challenges and downsides to remote education, such as shorter attention spans, reduced attendance numbers and technology issues.[[63]](#footnote-63) Advocates also argue that the cuts to cultural education staff and arts education budgets limit cultural organizations’ capacity to serve and engage young people while disproportionately impacting students from low income communities,[[64]](#footnote-64) and this is occurring at a time when all youth need arts education more than ever, particularly to help process the ever-changing world around them during a time of pandemic and economic uncertainty.[[65]](#footnote-65)

**CONCLUSION**

At today’s hearing, the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations will hear from DCLA and the cultural community on efforts to support educational programming offered by arts and culture organizations, about the status of current remote and in-person art education opportunities for youth, and about how the art and cultural education landscape is coping with structural programming changes as the pandemic continues. The Committee also seeks to learn about the impact of cuts to cultural funding on educational opportunities at the organization level and to gain insight into how the Council can best support efforts to promote effective art and cultural learning going forward, especially until cultural institutions and organizations are able to resume normal educational programming.

1. Jesse McKinley and Michael Gold, *Ban on Large Gatherings in N.Y. as Coronavirus Cases Rise Sharply* (Mar. 12, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/12/nyregion/coronavirus-nyc-event-ban.html>; *See* Executive Order 202.31 (May 14, 2020), *available at* <https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/no-20231-continuing-temporary-suspension-and-modification-laws-relating-disaster-emergency> (describing previous orders); Michael Paulson, *Broadway, Symbol of New York Resilience, Shuts Down Amid Virus Threat* (Mar. 12, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/12/theater/coronavirus-broadway-shutdown.html>, [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Robin Pogrebin and Michael Cooper, *New York’s Major Cultural Institutions Close in Response to Coronavirus* (Mar. 12, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/12/arts/design/met-museum-opera-carnegie-hall-close-coronavirus.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Transcript: Mayor de Blasio Holds Media Availability on COVID-19 (Mar. 12, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/137-20/transcript-mayor-de-blasio-holds-media-availability-covid-19> (“That’s really, really painful for the many, many people who work in that field, let alone so many New Yorkers and people all over the country who really look forward to these events, these concerts, these sports events, and it’s really going to be kind of a hole in our lives and it’s painful,” he said. “It’s not something we would ever want to do but it’s something we have to do.”); Michael Paulson, Broadway, Symbol of New York Resilience, Shuts Down Amid Virus Threat (Mar. 12, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/12/theater/coronavirus-broadway-shutdown.html>, [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Governor Cuomo Signs the ‘New York State on PAUSE’ Executive Order (Mar. 20, 2020), *available at* <https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/governor-cuomo-signs-new-york-state-pause-executive-order>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Governor Cuomo Signs the ‘New York State on PAUSE’ Executive Order (Mar. 20, 2020), *available at* <https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/governor-cuomo-signs-new-york-state-pause-executive-order>. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Information shared during the daily “Culture @3” call, hosted by the CIG; *See* Judd Grossman, Michael Straus, Catherine K. B. Lucas and Sarah E. Schuster, *What Legal Rights Do Artists and Galleries Have During a Pandemic?* (May 13, 2020), *available at* <https://www.artnews.com/art-news/news/artists-galleries-legal-rights-coronavirus-1202687028/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dcla/about/pressrelease/PR-2020-04-24-COVID-Survey.page>; <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/DCLA-AFTA-Covid-Impact-Report.pdf>; [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. NYC Comptroller Scott Stringer, *The Creative Economy: Art, Culture and Creativity in New York City* (Oct. 25, 2019), *available at* <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/the-creative-economy/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. NYC Comptroller Scott M. Stringer, *New York by the Numbers: Weekly Economic and Fiscal Outlook* (May 26, 2020), *available at* <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/newsroom/new-york-by-the-numbers-weekly-economic-and-fiscal-outlook-no-2-may-26-2020/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *See* Michael Paulson, *Broadway’s Box Office Keeps Booming. Now Attendance is Surging, Too*. NY Times (May 29, 2019), *available at*<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/05/29/theater/broadway-box-office.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. *See* Dance NYC & New York City Dance Makers and Organizations, *Letter to Mayor Bill de Blasio RE: Advisory Council on Arts, Culture, and Tourism,* DanceNYC (May 13, 2020), *available at* <https://www.dance.nyc/news/2020/05/Letter-to-Mayor-Bill-de-Blasio-Re-Advisory-Council-on-Arts-Culture-and-Tourism/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. *See* National Assembly of Art Organizations, *Creative Economy State Profiles: New York* (n.d.), *available at* <https://nasaa-arts.org/nasaa_research/creative-economy-state-profiles/>; *see also* National Endowment for the Arts, *State-Level Estimates of the Arts’ Economic Value and Employment (2001-2017)* (Mar. 2020), *available at* <https://www.arts.gov/artistic-fields/research-analysis/arts-data-profiles/arts-data-profile-25>. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Information shared during the daily “Culture @3” call, hosted by the CIG. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Anastasia Tsioulcas for NPR, Tweet: <https://twitter.com/anastasiat/status/1240645951309701120?s=21>. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. Sarah Cascone, *In a Surprise Move, the Metropolitan Museum of Art Is Looking to Its $3.6 Billion Endowment to Cover Costs* (Mar. 31, 2020), *available at* <https://news.artnet.com/art-world/met-endowment-paying-staff-1820772>. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Information shared during the daily “Culture @3” call, hosted by the CIG. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. City of New York, *NYC Department of Cultural Affairs Launches Survey Examining Impact of COVID-19 on the City’s Cultural* (Apr. 24, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dcla/about/pressrelease/PR-2020-04-24-COVID-Survey.page>; SMU Data Arts, *COVID-19 Impact on Nonprofit Arts and Culture in New York City* (June 25, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/DCLA-AFTA-Covid-Impact-Report.pdf>; [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. SMU Data Arts, *COVID-19 Impact on Nonprofit Arts and Culture in New York City* (June 25, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/DCLA-AFTA-Covid-Impact-Report.pdf>; *See also* Shant Shahrigian, *‘Arts organizations are back in business’: NYC performances prep for Spring 2021*

    (Dec. 8, 2020), *available at* https://www.nydailynews.com/coronavirus/ny-covid-nyc-culture-van-bramer-20201208-wgufmokbbbdanjmlsi4l54kdty-story.html (“From February to October, employment in the arts and entertainment industry dropped 63.8%, according to a recent report from city Comptroller Scott Stringer, citing the state Department of Labor … [a figure which] might be an underestimate”). [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. *See* Afia Earna, *How New York City Might Begin to Revive Its Decimated Tourism Industry*, Gotham Gazette (Sep. 13, 2020), *available at* <https://www.gothamgazette.com/city/9742-how-to-revive-new-york-city-tourism?mc_cid=b644d5807f&mc_eid=46585a506c>. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. NYC Comptroller Scott M. Stringer, *New York by the Numbers: Weekly Economic and Fiscal Outlook* (May 26, 2020), *available at* <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/newsroom/new-york-by-the-numbers-weekly-economic-and-fiscal-outlook-no-2-may-26-2020/> (explaining that “private employers in New York City shed 823,500 jobs in April – one in every five private sector jobs; dine-in restaurants were the hardest hit, dropping by 119,000 jobs – an 85% decline in a single month; and the arts, entertainment and recreation sector saw the largest decline after restaurants, losing 67,200 jobs, or 78%”); *See* Niv Elis, *Arts,* *Struggling to Survive, Face a Longer Road to Recovery*, The Hill (Apr. 11, 2020), *available at* <https://thehill.com/homesnews/coronavirus-report/492301-arts-struggling-to-survive-pandemic-face-a-longer-road-to-recovery>; *see also* David Kaufman, *An Architect in City Hall Plots NYC’s Cultural Recovery,* Architectural Digest (Jul. 30, 2020), *available at* <https://www.architecturaldigest.com/story/gonzalo-casals-nyc-cultural-commissioner>. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. SMU Data Arts, *COVID-19 Impact on Nonprofit Arts and Culture in New York City* (June 25, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/DCLA-AFTA-Covid-Impact-Report.pdf>; Valentina Di Liscia, *Over 15,000 Workers Have Been Laid Off or Furloughed From 810 NYC Cultural Organizations* (Jul. 21, 2020), *available at* <https://hyperallergic.com/577706/covid-19-cultural-survey-smu-dataarts/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. *Id.* (explaining that educational positions often attract artists who need to maintain flexible schedules, but the positions leave them vulnerable and “without benefits, protections, and structure”). [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. SMU Data Arts, *COVID-19 Impact on Nonprofit Arts and Culture in New York City* (June 25, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/DCLA-AFTA-Covid-Impact-Report.pdf>; [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. Sara Aridi, *In Year of Dashed Expectations, Buoying Artists and Educators* (Nov. 11, 2020), *available at* https://www.nytimes.com/2020/11/12/neediest-cases/in-year-of-dashed-expectations-buoying-artists-and-educators.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. *See, e.g.,* Arts for Art staff, Arts for Art Annual Report 2020 (n.d.), *available at* https://www.artsforart.org/annualreport.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. SMU Data Arts, *COVID-19 Impact on Nonprofit Arts and Culture in New York City* (June 25, 2020), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dcla/downloads/pdf/DCLA-AFTA-Covid-Impact-Report.pdf>; [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. Zijia Song, *Pandemic Has Dealt a $550M Blow to the City’s Arts and Culture Orgs, Study Finds* (Jul. 23, 2020) *available at* https://bedfordandbowery.com/2020/07/pandemic-dealt-550m-blow-to-the-citys-arts-and-culture-orgs-study-finds/. [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Flushing Town Hall, Flushing Town Hall at Home (n.d.), *available at* http://www.flushingtownhall.org/. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. Abigail Savitch-Lew, Eli Dvorkin and Laird Gallagher, *Art in the Time of Coronavirus: NYC Small Arts Organizations Fighting for Survival* (Apr. 2020), *available at* https://nycfuture.org/research/art-in-the-time-of-coronavirus. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. Flushing Town Hall, *available at* http://www.flushingtownhall.org/. [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Brooklyn Conservatory of Music, *available at* https://bkcm.org/ [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. Abigail Savitch-Lew, Eli Dvorkin and Laird Gallagher, *Art in the Time of Coronavirus: NYC Small Arts Organizations Fighting for Survival* (Apr. 2020), *available at* https://nycfuture.org/research/art-in-the-time-of-coronavirus. [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Brooklyn Conservatory of Music, *available at* https://bkcm.org/. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Jamaica Center for Arts and Learning, *available at* https://www.jcal.org/. [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Canvas Institute for Arts and Civic Engagement, *available at* http://www.canvasinstitute.org/. [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. Abigail Savitch-Lew, Eli Dvorkin and Laird Gallagher, *Art in the Time of Coronavirus: NYC Small Arts Organizations Fighting for Survival* (Apr. 2020), *available at* https://nycfuture.org/research/art-in-the-time-of-coronavirus. [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. Summer in the City, Summer in the City (n.d.), *available at* https://www.summerinthecity.nyc. [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Summer in the City, *About* (n.d.), *available at* https://www.summerinthecity.nyc/about. [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. Activities were offered in five daily time slots, to access twenty interactive virtual programs. Summer in the City, *About* (n.d.), *available at* https://www.summerinthecity.nyc/about. [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. Summer in the City, *Organizations* (n.d.), *available at* https://www.summerinthecity.nyc/organizations [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. *See* Abigail Savitch-Lew, Eli Dvorkin, and Laird Gallagher, *Art in the Time of Coronavirus: NYC’s Small Arts Organizations Fighting for Survival* Center for an Urban Future (April 2020), *available at* <https://nycfuture.org/research/art-in-the-time-of-coronavirus>. [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. Zijia Song, *Pandemic Has Dealt a $550M Blow to the City’s Arts and Culture Orgs, Study Finds* (Jul. 23, 2020) *available at* <https://bedfordandbowery.com/2020/07/pandemic-dealt-550m-blow-to-the-citys-arts-and-culture-orgs-study-finds/>; Information shared during the daily “Culture @3” call, hosted by the CIG. [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. Additionally, according to the budget, the Department of Cultural Affairs, which commissioned the pandemic impact survey and sponsors nearly 1,300 New York nonprofits, will lose $23 million compared to their record $212 million funding in 2020. Sara Aridi, *In Year of Dashed Expectations, Buoying Artists and Educators* (Nov. 11, 2020), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/11/12/neediest-cases/in-year-of-dashed-expectations-buoying-artists-and-educators.html>; *See also* NYC Department of Education, *Arts* (n.d.), *available at* <https://www.schools.nyc.gov/learning/subjects/arts>; Hakim Bishara, *NYC’s Public Art Education Budget Reduced to 70% of Previous Year* (Jul. 2, 2020), *available at* <https://hyperallergic.com/574726/nyc-2021-budget-arts/> ( “In April, the NYC Arts in Education Roundtable launched a public campaign Arts Are Essential to advocate against the then-proposed budget cuts. The group enlisted a lineup of celebrities for the cause, including actor Alec Baldwin and the original cast of Hamilton. Ultimately, the campaign did not prevent the city from reducing budgets from various arts and culture initiatives, from after-school art programs to cultural programs for immigrants”). [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. Sara Aridi, *In Year of Dashed Expectations, Buoying Artists and Educators* (Nov. 11, 2020), *available at* https://www.nytimes.com/2020/11/12/neediest-cases/in-year-of-dashed-expectations-buoying-artists-and-educators.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. *Id.* (“The initiative is designed to support multiple beneficiaries: the teachers, their students, the nonprofits and other collaborators, like videographers and artists, who were employed to help shape the content”). [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
59. *Id. See* President’s Committee on the Arts and the Humanities, *Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America’s Future through* *Creative Schools* (2011) *available at,* <http://pcah.gov/sites/default/files/PCAH_Reinvesting_4web_0.pdf>; Robert G. Lynch, *The Economic and Fiscal Consequences of Improving Educational Outcomes* (Ja. 2015), *available at* <http://equitablegrowth.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/10153405/0115-ach-gap-report.pdf>; Kalima Rose, Milly Hawk Daniel and Jeremy Liu, *Creating Change through Arts, Culture, and Equitable Development: A Policy and Practice Primer* (2017), *available at* https://www.policylink.org/sites/default/files/report\_arts\_culture\_equitable-development.pdf . [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
60. *See* Robert G. Lynch, *The Economic and Fiscal Consequences of Improving Educational Outcomes* (Ja. 2015), *available at* <http://equitablegrowth.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/10153405/0115-ach-gap-report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
61. NYC Department of Education Info Hub, *Annual Arts in Schools Reports* (n.d.), *available at* https://infohub.nyced.org/reports/academics/annual-arts-in-schools-reports. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
62. Information shared during the daily “Culture @3” call, hosted by the CIG. *See, e.g.,* Adam Krauthamer, *We must prevent a great cultural depression* (Oct. 25, 2020), *available at* https://www.nydailynews.com/opinion/ny-oped-we-must-prevent-a-cultural-great-depression-20201025-hwatatfmt5bsdezgvqzs54zkay-story.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
63. *See, e.g.,* Wallace Editoria Team, *Pandemic Brings Challenges (an Opportunities) for Arts Education* (Sept. 22, 2020), *available at* https://www.wallacefoundation.org/news-and-media/blog/pages/pandemic-brings-challenges-and-opportunities-for-arts-education.aspx. [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
64. *Id.; See, e.g.,* Judith M. Burton, *The Arts and Re-Envisioning COVID-era Schools* (Aug. 2020), *available at* https://www.tc.columbia.edu/articles/2020/august/the-arts-and-re-envisioning-covid-era-schools/. [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
65. *Id.;* Information shared during the daily “Culture @3” call. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)