CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

---------- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

---------- X

NOVEMBER 24, 2020
Start: 11:09 AM
Recess: 12:56 PM

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 2)

B E F O R E: CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES

COUNCIL MEMBERS: STEPHEN T. LEVIN
CARLOS MENCHACA
ERIC A. ULRICH
KALMAN YEGER

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Susanne Des Roches, Deputy Director for Infrastructure and Energy
Mayor’s Office of Resiliency &Sustainability

Ann Fay Efema, (sic) NYC Economic Development Corporation

Ken Bowles, Ever Soft Energy Sunrise Wind

Julie Bovey, Director, External Affairs, Equinor Wind US Ken Bowes, Vice President, Offshore Wind

Summer Sandoval, Energy Democracy Coordinator Uprose

Justin Wood and I’m the Director of Organizing and Research at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Shea O’Riley, Organizer for Sierra Club’s Beyond Cold Climate

Karen Imas, Vice President of Programs, Waterfront Alliance

Leonard Bradford, Nuclear Physicist and I’m a Professor Emeritus of Urban Studies, Queens College Member of New York Energy and Climate Advocates

Linda Newquin

Katherine Scopic,

(technical)

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and welcome to the today's remote New York City Council hearing of the Committee on Environmental Protection. At this time would Council staff please turn on their video. Please place electronic devices on vibrate or silent. If you wish to submit testimony, you may do so at Testimony@Council.nyc.gov. That is Testimony.nyc.gov. Thank you. We are ready to begin. (pause) Chairman, we are ready to start. Chairman, we're ready to start.

CHAIR: CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, great. I just wasn't who starts. It's kind of like a dance trying to figure out who is supposed to go first. Alright, good morning everyone and all folks. I am CHAIR Constantinides, Chair of the Environmental Protection Committee, and today's hearing is on NYSERDA's Offshore Wind Energy Proposal to develop 9,000 megawatts of wind energy by 2035. In July, NYSERDA'S second offshore wind procurement was announced seeking an additional 2,400 megawatts of generating capacity at a complementary multi-port of

infrastructure investment that will bring New York's total commitment to more than 400 million public and private funds to port infrastructure in the past year. The largest infrastructure commitment to offshore wind in the nation. There are currently three offshore wind projects under active development statewide with a combined total of 1,826 megawatts. The Empire Wind Project has capacity of 816 megawatts, and is being developed by Equinor Wind U.S. LLC. The site is approximately miles from Jones Beach State Park and at its closest point, and expected to begin commercial operations in 2024. The project will connect to the Granite at the Gowanus Substation in Brooklyn. The Sunrise Wind Project has capacity of 8880 megawatts, and is developed by Sunrise Wind, LLC. The project is more than 30 miles east of off the east coast of Long Island at its closest point, and is expected to bring commercial operation around 2024 as well. The project will connect to the bridge at the Holbrook Substation in Central Long Island and. The Empire and Sunrise projects are expected to power more than one million New York homes. Finally, in the South Port Offshore wind farm, which has capacity of 130

megawatts has located five miles east of Montauk. It is expected to provide enough renewable energy for 70,000 homes and offset 300,000 tons of carbon emissions annually. New York City's current means of energy production are generally high emission intensity. It is estimated that each megawatt hour of energy produced by offshore wind will void 800 kilograms of carbon emissions. Using these figures a 2,400 megawatt wind farm to potentially avoid 7,280,000 metric tons of CO2 annually. The equivalent of removing 1.6 million cars. That's a big number from the road. NYSERDA's estimates are slightly more conservative at 5 million short tons of CO2 annually, the equivalent of moving just a million cars from the road annually from the road. Offshore wind technology is not discharged to be waste water, reduced to be solid waste while creating electricity. Wind based generation also does not produce significant air emissions or greenhouse gases. As these technologies do not create any air significant pollution while generating electricity there will be substantial environmental benefits resulting from employing wind technologies in New York City where air quality has

a huge impact on respiratory and cardio pulmonary disease. As recently codified by the Climate leadership and Community Protection Act, New York State is supporting development of 9,000 megawatts of offshore wind by 2035. This will provide enough energy to power six million homes. While some environmentalists see the jacks that large scale offshore projects could help transition the city and the region renewable energy resources, I will just point out the potentially negative impact associated with the construction of infrastructure on the Continental Shelf. Some potentially adverse impacts include disturbing sediment in the water column, increasing trendy and likely another free suspending sediment down the loops potentially affecting a storm of certain fish species and temporary increase in folks' driveways (sic) followed with an increase in boat (sic) traffic in the area. U.S. offshore wind resources are abundant today, a technical potential of 2015 8 gigawatts of offshore wind resource capacity are accessible in U.S. waters using existing technology. This is the equivalent of the energy output of 1,700 terawatt hours per year, enough to provide nearly double the total electric

generation to U.S. in 2015. NYSERDA, um, NYSERDA's proposed offshore wind proposal could also promote the mine and economic impact of $3.2 billion statewide and the support base of 1,600 jobs that are sorely needed during this time of severe economic crisis. These economic benefits do not include the indirect cost avoided to societies like illnesses and or death. To achieve these benefits, we'll need to make changes. The future for energy use in America is renewable energy including wind power. There is simply no way to achieve our aims of good environmental quality and abundant energy for our life style with continual fossil fuel usage. Before I begin I want to thank our committee staff, our committee counsel for hosting the hearing today, Samara Swanston, our policy analyst Nadia Johnston and Beach Tova, our Financial Analyst Jonathan Seltzer, my Legislative Director and Counsel Nicholas Lozowski for all their hard work. I also want to give thanks to my outgoing, um, he left on Monday our Communications Director Telles Collins. He's gone onto new pastures, but I wish him well and thank you for the service to our office and to our committee and I want to wish everyone a very safe,

very socially distant Thanksgiving as we continue to battle COVID-19. COVID-19 is very real. We need to stay safe so I am using this opportunity to get on my soap box as this hearing to just say: Everyone, please stay safe this holiday. With that, I will pass it back to our great Committee Counsel Samara Swanston to swear in our beginning witnesses.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you. Before I swear in the witnesses, I'm going to go over the hearing procedures. I'm Samara Swanston Counsel to the Committee. I want to remind you that you'll be on mute until you're called on to testify when you'll be unmuted by the host. I'll be calling on panelists to testify. Listen for your name to be called. I will be periodic, periodically announcing who the next panelist will be We will begin with testimony from the Administration which will be followed by testimony from members of the public. During the hearing, if Council Members would like to ask a question, please use the Zoom Raise Hand function. The Council Member we'll call on you in the order that you used it. During the hearing if Council Members would like to ask a question, again using the Zoom Raise Hand function. This morning we will be

limiting the wind producers to ten minutes, and others to three minutes for their testimony. (coughs) And now I would like to turn to the oath and I would deliver the oath, and I will call on each member of the Administration to record your answers. So, is everyone here?

SUZANNE: Good morning.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Good morning. Okay Suzanne, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth before this committee and to be respond honestly to the Councill Member questions?

SUZANNE: Yes.

SAMARA SWANSTON: And Anthony, do you...

ANTHONY: Yes.

SAMARA SWANSTON: ...do you affirm (laughs) you're already saying yes?

ANTHONY: Yes.

SAMARA SWANSTON: (laughs) Okay. That's responding honestly, and finally Nancy Esema Assistant Vice President for Smart Cities and Sustainable...Smart and Sustainable Cities, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing

but the truth today and to answer, and to respond honestly to the Councill Member questions?

NANCY ESEMA: Yes.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you. You may begin when ready.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Before everyone gives their testimony, I just want to quickly acknowledge that we're joined by both Council Member Yeger and Council Member Menchaca and on the committees from Brooklyn. Thank you.

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Great. Good morning. My name is Susanne Des Roches, and I am the Deputy Director for Infrastructure and Energy at the Mayor's Office of Resiliency and the Mayor's Office of Sustainability. I am joined here today by Anthony Fiore, Deputy Commissioner at the Department of Citywide Administrative Services and Chief Energy Managing Officer and Ensay Ethema (sp?), Assistant Vice President of the New York City Economic Development Corporation. I want to thank Chairperson Constantinides and members of the Committee for this opportunity to testify on behalf of the de Blasio Administration on the current state of offshore wind. As part of our Green New Deal, Mayor de Blasio

committed New York City to 100% clean electricity by 2040 and carbon neutrality by 2050. This requires a shift to renewable energy from many sources from rooftop to solar to utility scale renewables to energy storage. At the same time, we are committed to an energy transition that will increase resilience to climate change while maintaining energy affordability for all New Yorkers. Offshore wind has an important role to play in decarbonization of New York City's electric grid. Through the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act, or CLPPA, the state committed to procuring at least 9 gigawatts of offshore wind by 2035. We understand that we need a significant share of that resource, and potentially more to decarbonize our city's electric grid electric grid. When we model our future grid we need to take into consideration space restraints, resource diversity, reliability and affordability. One pathway we have modeled that achieved, achieved a 70 percent clean grid by 2030 includes one gigawatt of solar on our buildings, three gigawatts of offshore wind and one gigawatt of tigrow (sp?) connecting through new transmission combined with 500 megawatts of storage located in the city. This modeling underscores that

in order for the city to clean its grid we need all available resources. There is no silver bullet, and we need to move quickly to ensure they are delivered into New York City. Offshore wind has unique features that make it one attractive resource for our city. First, because of our coastal location, offshore winds can directly connect utility scale renewable energy into our grid. Second, the city lacks available space for citing renewables. Because offshore wind is not competing for land space within the five boroughs, we can use any available land space for storage and solar. Third, offshore wind has a capacity factor of approximately 50% meaning that installations of producing power on average 50% of the time. This means it can provide power for more hours of the day than other intermittent renewable resources. When paired with substantial amounts of local energy storage and hydropower, offshore wind can be saved and used when the wind isn't blowing or on our peakiest demand days. Reducing our reliance on in-city fossil units and avoiding their associated negative health impacts. In addition, there are exciting economic development benefits that can be unlocked if New York City can

become an offshore wind hub. The supply chain in this industry will create jobs in New York City in staging, assembly, and operations in maintenance. Additionally, there will be workforce and business development opportunities created in a range of maritime fields as well as in research and development to advance innovation in this burgeoning industry. As port facilities are critical to supporting various components of the offshore wind supply chain, this industry presents an opportunity for investment in maritime assets across the city such as the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal or SBMT. SBMT is currently competing in an open procurement for state funding to supports upgrades that would enable it to be used by the offshore wind industry including for staging and installation of components as well as wind farm operations and maintenance. Estimates project that up to 350 to 500 direct jobs will be created by the current proposed investments at SBMT including anywhere from 60 to 100 well paying jobs in operations and maintenance. Unlocking this amount of offshore wind in the next decade will require an all hands-on-deck effort. At the federal level the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management or BOEM,

can unlock additional lease space as needed to meet our goal. The state will play a central role to plan, implement and finance installation particularly through its electric rate payer funder solicitations and regulatory authority over the utility. Developers will need to navigate the relatively new environment for citing and constructing their projects while driving down costs to consumers. Con Edison and the New York Independent System operator will need to prepare their infrastructure to be able to receive this large influx of new intermittent power. The City has and will continue to be a strong advocate for New York City residents in all regulatory proceedings at the state and federal level. From sitting on BOEM's Intergovernmental Renewable Energy Task Force to advocating for the state's creations of financial instruments that support renewables, to participating in the offshore wind procurement processes and planning for relevant transmission and distribution upgrades. Through the work of EDC, we are playing a driving role in unlocking the local economic development benefits of these projects. Finally, as more projects enter further stages of development, we are preparing to be involved in

facilitating local siting of necessary infrastructure. In conclusion, achieving our climate goals will require unlocking a variety of clean energy resources and offshore wind has a critical role to play. Moreover, as we continue our economic recovery from COVID-19 we are excited about the catalytic role offshore wind can play in creating jobs and sparking economic development. We appreciate the opportunity to testify at this hearing and look forward to further opportunities to collaborate in this new renewable energy space. Thank you for your time and we will be happy to answer any questions.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Okay. Susanne, thank you for your testimony. So, I guess the first question I have is how do we sort of envision New York City's role in sort of expanding this space? Right, you've talked about it in your testimony there needs to be even more offshore wind that would be the majority of it. How are we working with the states? How are we, you know, lobbying with the governor? Like how are we working? What levers are we pushing here to make sure that we're getting the share of

renewable energy in particular wind energy that we need for the city to move forward?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Thank you, Chair. So, the thing is in regular conversations with NYSERDA regarding their full Off Shore Wind Program, and we have regular communications about planning and we have submitted official proposals into the Policy Transmission needs basically showing that we needs basically showing that we need transmission of offshore wind in, um, in a large quantity as well as update renewables and hydro power in order to get our grid to be cleaner. We also have regular conversations with Con Edison about the upgrades that will be needed, and then, and EDC and also the Navy Yard have been involved in NYSERDA economic development solicitation, and I'm sure EDC will provide more information on that process as we build this unit.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: How are we sort of looking at...Well, do we have any idea what NYSERDA's criteria is to give to whom?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: So, that's a great question. Again, the is a lot of modeling that is going on at the state level right now. So, NYSERDA

held and all-day conference yesterday on the needs for how we're going to move, you know, transmit the power and pull from offshore wind as well as around the state, and I think there, there is a general understanding that the only way to get New York City's air to be clean is a large influx of offshore wind both to New York City and to Long Island as well as bringing resources from Upstate and into the grid. So, you know, I... Well, we used every opportunity through, you know, Public Service Commission proceedings as well as stakeholder involvement at the NYSO (sic) you know to push for a large bulk power into New York City to be cleaned. Again, I think that the studies are all aligning to show that that, that that is what needs to happen in order for the state to meet the CLPPA goal.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Is the state thinking about trade-offs? Like if they give us one transmission line for hydro power that means we don't get a transmission line for wind power of our...? Is this a zero sum game where if we get one we don't get the other? I think that's part of my concern here.

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Sure and, of course, I can't speak for the state, but what I can say is

that again going back to what was released yesterday as well as what has been shown through studies at the NYSO, again, there's this recognition that in order to get to 100% clean electricity (sic) by 2040, we're going to need a lot of new transmission both from off shore wind and from hydro power and, and renewable sources upstate.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: But how do we look at it as far as, you know, the cost of the installation and how that's going to translate to energy that goes to the consumers?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Sure. So, the first solicitations that you were talking about earlier the Sunrise and Empire Wind, those came out at about $83 in megawatt hours. So, the cost is more than traditional power. However, the state has been looking at providing a system of OREC. So Offshore winds, renewable energy credits, and socializing that cost across the state. So, what I don't have it on bill figures because it's too early to say that, we are pleased that any additional costs for offshore wind will be a statewide socialization of that cost. We also expect that as the offshore wind and, you know, you saw some of the figures you quoted about

how much offshore wind can be built on the Eastern Seaboard. Those costs are going to come down as they have in Europe. That tech, this technology is not nascent. You know, it is utilized widely in other places and so we expect as future bids come into the NYSERDA solicitations, they'll start to drop, and there will be less of the need to subsidize and socialize that processing.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Great. I just want to quickly just say here that we're joined by Council Member Eric Ulrich of Queens as well for today's committee hearing. Um, so, jobs and a job's transition. As we are sort of creating these, you know opportunities for installation, um, what happens with...? How do we sort of make sure that New York City runs and has access to these jobs, the training for these jobs? You know these are...presumably I'm guessing a good labor, and a good, you know, middle class labor jobs right? Union jobs. Like how do we make sure that we are training a workforce to get theses jobs and that New York City is not going to be left out?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: So, I'm going to turn this over to my colleague from EDC and Fay Efema. (sic) I Think she's on mute.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Well, that's pretty much been today.

ANNA FAY EFEMA: Thank you for that question, Chair. So, we do expect to expect to see jobs in installation and maintenance, installation and staging, operations and maintenance in project development, and so you're right that definitely especially the installing and staging jobs and the operations and maintenance jobs. Those are going to be trade jobs when technicians, electricians, plumbers, mariners, and we are committed to ensuring that New York City residents can access those jobs. Our strategy at EDC is to leverage our court assets to ensure that New York City can become a help for the industry, and to also leverage those assets to ensure that we are secure in various investments. We call it ecosystem investments around workforce development, growing and scaling the pipeline of New Yorkers who can enter those jobs.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: So, are we...how are we still planning out that as a, you know, was a long-term goal?

ANNA FAY EFEMA: (sic) Right, so we are, um, as Susanne mentioned, we are currently in some negotiations that allow us from going into a lot of debt there, but we are working on creating various programming, thinking about pre-apprenticeship programs, programs with DOE K to 12 programs that would be able to address various parts of that pipeline to be able to ensure that no matter where we are, where New Yorkers are in that task they can fit their jobs in the industry. So, we're developing programmatic ideas right now.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Okay. Um, I guess I'm...I'm...I have a couple of other questions? Where so we sort of expect this to be plugged in? Like where, where are the utilities that I'm a proponent of public power, and a little still uncomfortable with giving this to a private generator. Today a private distributor, but that looks the path that's being chosen, but the gets, you know, has to be distributer. Where is this plugging in? How is this going to work? I know you said you had had some

conversations with them thus far. Well, how is this going to work, you know, with what's up? What recordings are they going to make? Are they going to make them? Like how is this all going to come together?

ANN FAY EFEMA: Sure, um, so our understanding is that Empire Wind is looking at the Gowanus Substation, and as locations interconnect. Again, at yesterday's conference kind of the same presented their initial ideas around and space for where these interconnections would happen, mainly at, um, and I'm not sure whether or not they kind of did testify today so, um, so, um, you can get more details from them, but mostly they in the presentation yesterday, were looking at some of the coastal, um, substations. Train station level substations in Brooklyn and Queens and in Manhattan. So, you know again these are very early studies, and so, you know, this is a process that's ongoing at the state as part of their PSC mandated grid study, the utilities were required to submit their initial ideas and presented those yesterday. We expect to state's remainder of the study to come out in the coming weeks, and then that will be open for a comment

process and back to my, you know, earlier statements in my testimony, you know, the city will certainly weigh in and provide feedback on those both, where those connection points are and costs when they are available in those studies.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: So, I guess the last question before I turn it over to my colleagues, you know, we have this Local Law 97 that, you know, we're encouraging buildings to make retrofits. We want those investments. We want buildings to think about things like licitation, you know, how do we sort of envision when energy as an opportunity for us to, you know, rent it? What percentage of our grid do we sort of envision with energy playing? How do we sort of see this an opportunity to spur Local Law 97 and say like it's in our grids. You should go for licitation, right? Like how do we sort of think about this in the larger context of decarbonizing our grid and spurring this. That it. That's all that's going to make the green jobs. So, what's our process around? Because this is going to come online right around the same time that the first grouping of building need to get done, right? So,

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: That's right.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: So, this whole city writes a logistic right?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: I'd say, so, um, the Advisory Board that Local Law 97 convened as part of what was in the Local Law has a group that's working on what they call a mission co-efficient. So, that means, you know, what is the next of the grid, you know by what date? So, certainly actual wind as I mentioned even in the city's own modeling plays a role to change that co-efficient to be a cleaner. You know, today we get a lot of our power from fossil fuel and as we start to see these installations come online, that co-efficient will get better and better and as you said, you know, building owners can expect a better and better co-efficient over time. The important caveat, though is that in Local Law 97 we fixed, in 230, we fixed the co-efficient to a pre-Indian point closure because we knew these resources, these pita (sic) resources would take some time to come into the New York City grid and, therefore, we didn't want building owners to be penalized for the closure of Indian Point. So, until 2030, they have the coefficient, um, that was established in the law and then this advisory board will be looking to model

what that co-efficient should be like past 2030, which will, and that will be cleaner as all these sources come in.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Okay. So, I'm...so yes, I will now ask if any of my colleagues have any questions. After that I will come back for a few more and then we'll wrap up legislation. So, now is...do any of my colleagues have any questions?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: I do not see anybody's hand up at the present time.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Okay. I, um, so yes. I guess I'll ask a couple more questions and then I'll let you guys off the hook and we'll move onto the next grouping. Um, why do we look at the battery storage? What role does battery storage play in the wind generation, and is this part of the build-outs that we're thinking about around the Gowanus and the different parts of the city where we are going to plug in?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: That's a great question and its battery storage will play a critical component to both what we see there. You know our solar strategy as well as actual wind. So, both of those resources are intermittent, and so we need both

storage and other clean basic resources to be able to provide power when either the wind has been blowing or the sun is not shining, and the city has been working hard to make our permitting process more transparent to the storage developers. So, we've issued both FDNY and DOB guidance, which we think will move that industry faster, and also Con Edison is currently in an open procurement for utility scale storage up to 300 megawatts. So, while right now we have about 20 megawatts of storage throughout the city, we do anticipate that that will ramp up over the coming few years.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: And how close are we? I know we've done a bill around battery storage, you know, back in the time before COVID. It feels like a lifetime ago. But we did, we did do a bill around battery storage, and we're getting it right? Like we're, we're going to make it easier for everyone to access, right?

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Absolutely. We are working towards procuring our long-term energy plan, which is also another bill that we have merged the battery storage in. So, we can be looking holistically at how does the city and what levers

does the city have in order to, you know, make our clean energy future a reality. That study is in its procurement process. You know there have, as you might imagine there have been some delays due to COVID pause, but, you know, we're moving as aggressively as we can to watch that study which will lay out, you know, a vision for this bulk storage throughout the city as we need it to balance these intermittent resources.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: And who is going to be responsible for building the, you know, constructing and maintaining it to connecting power lines? What role would the city have with that and get the jobs where you can assess you. I'm must curious about that as well.

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Right. So, um, you know, the city at this time will not be responsible for maintaining transition level power lines. That is a combination of the transmission owners throughout the state. So, the builder and the owner tend, you know, can be the same or can be the utility depending on where you are throughout the state. Um, so the, the main piece of this is though is that we need to ensure that this transmission gets built and gets

built quickly. Um, there are, there is a process through the NYCO, a competitive process. There's also, you know NYSERDA is also in procurements, which will, which include transmissions. So, you know, the bottom line here is that, um, the transmission, we need all of that transmission both from upstate and downstate and from the actual wind and, you know, we need to utilize these state processes as quickly as possible in order to realize that power and it come into the city.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Alright. Well, I'm excited about getting as much wind energy as we possibly can into New York City, and I'm definitely excited about the green jobs and the good union job that it will create, and I'm looking forward over the next 13 months because that's about how much time I have as a Council Member to continue these conversations with you to ensure that we're on the right track for 2024.

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Great. Thank you so much.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony today and Samara if you can

bring on the next witnesses. Thank you very much to the Administration.

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: Take care. Thank you.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Susanne, have a great holiday.

SUSANNE DES ROCHES: You, too. Stay safe.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: You as well.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you. We'll now turn to the public testimony. I would like to remind everyone that unlike our typical Council hearings, we will be calling people one by one to testify. Council Members who have a question for a particular panelist should use the Raise Hand Function in Zoom. The panelists once your name is called a member of our staff will unmute you and the Sergeant-of-Arms will give you the go-ahead to begin upon setting the timer. Please wait for the Sergeant to announce that you may begin before delivering your testimony. Again, for the winds energy producers their testimony will be limited to ten minutes. I would now like to welcome Julia Bowie who is representing Empire Wind

to testify followed by Ken Bowles who is representing Ever Soft Energy Sunrise Wind.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

JULIA BOVEY: Thank you very much for the opportunity to discuss with you Equinor's plans for developing offshore wind to serve New York, and take care of wind in New York City with renewable energy. My name is Julie Bovey. I'm the Director of External Affairs at Equinor Wind US. Our responsibilities include making sure that all plans in New York are developed in collaboration with New Yorkers, and that we respond to and incorporate stakeholder feedback and to design, engineer and build our offshore wind projects for New York. I submitted four pages of written testimony, but I will hit just the highlights in my, in my oral testimony, and keep my eye on the clock here. So, just a little bit about me. I first moved to New York City in the 1980s to attend college here, and I've now raised two sons who call themselves New Yorkers. I love to think that I've been here long enough to act like a New Yorker, but also understand and appreciate the city and its people as outsider who has learned the hard way. This experience plus a long career in renewable

energy is great preparation for someone helping to build the first offshore wind project in New York City. You know, as they say if you can make it there you can make it anywhere, but we also know that sometimes the opposite can be true, and you know just because you can make it other places doesn't necessarily mean you can make it here, and what, what is sort of make or brake on that? How do you make it in New York? Well, I think we can all agree that if by working together with the folks that have worked many years certainly before I've been work in this town, a society that offshore wind energy had to be a big part of the energy mix here in order to meet offshore climate goals, to put New Yorkers to work. What I know is that I have a community here as a result of hard work by hundreds of New Yorkers who have advocated for offshore wind. We know that good policy in New York created an attractive market and that's what brough developers like F-1 here. While working with the people and organizations who put these market shaping policies in place, and we know that's the key to our success. And just a little bit about Equinor. By way of background, Equinor built its first offshore wind project in 2009. Since then

we've built an offshore wind farm in the UK and that's where we're currently constructing the world's largest offshore wind farm, and also build offshore wind farms in other parts of there, and we're currently developing offshore wind in Asia and in South America. In 2026 Equinor expects to increase our global installs to pass the renewable energy on 10-X and that's an annual growth rate of more 30%, and just this fall Equinor announce our goal to become a net zero energy company by 2050. I also want to make one more note, recent news about Equinor. We entered into a strategic partnership with BP. They will become a 50% non-operating partner in Empire Wind and Beca (sp?) Wind. I'm not sure this action is expected to clear going next year. So, on the Empire Wind, the Chair gave a little bit of detail about the project and it is about 15 miles south of Jones Beach. The project won that lease area in the Federal Wind Auction at the end of 2016. We got to work at that point on engineering studies and research. As a result of that work we bid in and won an 800 megawatt project in that first New York State procurement. I know that the chair is interested in the interconnection plans for the project. Our plan

is to interconnect Empire Wind into a substation that is part of the water substation but it's actually in Sunset Park, Brooklyn. It's a good place to interconnect wind because there is room on the grid there, and it's also very, um, very close to the water line as possible. At the same time we're developing a second project for New York called Empire Wind 2. We've entered that proposal into the current NYSERDA Offshore Wind Procurement that's mentioned and we're waiting work from New York State as a result of that procurement, and we have a second federal offshore wind lease area about 60 miles off of Montauk. We've had that Beacon Wind and we've also entered a project from Beacon Wind into the current New York Stat Offshore Wind Procurement and for Beacon Wind we proposed interconnecting the power into the New York electric grid in Western Queens, and actually in the Chair's district, and this is an ideal location for injection of offshore wind energy because Western Queens was once home to four major power plants and electricity for much of New York City. So, the wires are already in place to distribute power from that part of Western Queens. So, again, that proposal has been submitted to the

state and that's when I have to win a competitive process and sign a contract before any of those plans can move forward. Now the question: How are we going to make all of this happen? How are we going to build these projects? Well, when I joined Equinor I joined a team that's made up of some of the most experienced technical engineers and scientists from all over the world working on offshore wind, and what was the first question they asked when they came to New York? They asked: What point in New York is most capable of hosting construction of a massive offshore wind energy project for our wind? Talking about a shore with 100 acres of space, with waterside wards that can hold 600,000 tons of honen (sic) that has the areas of deep water right next to keysop. Well as we all know the answer is there isn't a port like that in New York. So, another company may have moved immediately to the option of building their project in another state, but the up and companies recognize that the local investment and local jobs are the main drivers or one of the main drivers of New York's offshoring goal. So, we went out to find a port in New York that could be reconstructed and upgaredef to the assembly of that harbor. So, one of the things

we learned quickly is the section undertaking is so not there that we needed to find a way to build a port not just for us not just for our power wind but to serve all New York offshore wind projects that want to construct here for decades to come, and like all other big shared infrastructure projects, a port like this can't be built with private money alone. It needs public investments. Building an offshore wind supply chain in New York must be a collective effort by developers, commercial suppliers of all sizes, policy makers at every level of government, communities and advocates. Now remember each state on the East Coast that is procured offshore wind is competing to locate the supply chain in their state because they know the just as we do that the first assembly port will be the catalyst for other parts of the supply chain to set up shop nearby. We need more jobs and investments with that, and that brings us to the issue of the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal or about the EMT. We will hear from others today about the potential for SBMT to be the center of the Offshore Wind supply chain in New York and for the region, and there are better people than I to outline the vision, commitment, risk and gumption it's taken

over many years to get SBMT to where it is today, which is the most promising and essential first step to locating an offshore wind supply chain here. I'm surprised to say that when Equinor identified SBMT as the key to our ability to assemble a power wind in New York, we found the only reason SBMT is available today is because of the community has fought for decades to preserve the space for marine industry to once again thrive in Brooklyn, and without the community I mean not only Sunset Park, but also the city that owns the port, the agency EDC that manages it, and the partnership that offers it as well. So, here is the status of SBMT across the line. (sic) Together with the operators and owners, Equinor submitted a proposal to New York State to turn SBMT into a world class offshore wind force capable of staging an assembly the largest most sophisticated offshore wind technology of its kind and becoming the operation and maintenance space for offshore wind projects throughout the region. Now this is a competitive process in New York State. It's allocating up to $200 million in matching funds toward the port improvements that are needed, and competition is stiff. The Equinor SBMT proposal

leverages significant private investments from Equinor and our partners with money already committed by New York City in this request for state investments, and again, SBMT would be the largest dedicated offshore wind port facility in the United States. Currently, and it is the only available industrial waterfront sited in the New York City area capable of doing this job. Equinor is grateful for the support of our work with us on this shared vision and now we await New York States' decision on its current offshore and procurement and power to our state is very important for improvement funds, and we appreciate the committee's interest in offshoring development. Looking forward to working with you and answering your questions.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Julia. I appreciate that and I have just a number of questions. If this project...if SBMT does come fruition and we're able to get all the approvals from the state, when do you believe it will be operational?

JULIA BOVEY: Well, there's a lot that has to happen between then and now, but we believe

that it could be operational mid-2020. So, we say ’24.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: About ’24?

JULIA BOVEY: We have to recognize that, that, you know, the permitting itself is a big undertaking. You know, it’s not something we could all accomplish together, but permitting first then conjunction.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: How do we envision, how many jobs will your project be?

JULIA BOVEY: So, one concern we have and we, and we only like to count our direct jobs, and so lots of comments will tell you about the second order of us and other jobs that we located as a result, but we think three to 500 direct jobs at SBMT. You need jobs.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: How many jobs then? Say that again. I’m sorry. I need that again.

JULIA BOVEY: Okay, three to 500.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Three to 500.

JULIA BOVEY: And then you add to that suppliers, vessel operators, um, and those second order of cadets that will be, um, catalyzed by those thee to 500.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: How many of those jobs will be from New York City residents and from Environmental Justice communities?

JULIA BOVEY: Sure. You know, I think that New York is unique. New York City is a unique position because it owns the port. It can use that leverage to, um, to really set expectations clearly. We know and the potential user of this port gets funded that we will commit to working with DDC and through them Workforce 1 the New York City employment agency...

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: That is qualified.

JULIA BOVEY: ...to make sure that we hire through New York through Workforce One to get, um, to get workers from disadvantaged communities primarily Sunset Park, but also other communities around there and if we're lucky enough to win Beacon Wind, we're interconnecting in Russian Queens then we would focus on those communities as well to get the jobs there.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Well, I am very excited about those projects. Beacon Wind I am very, very interested in. You know that agent. Astoria has provided 55% of the city's power for decades, but it's all been dirty fossil fuel infrastructure, and in our community there is no cost with that, but there's, you know, higher asthma rates. We have our

own version of asthma ally in Western Queens. I would love to replace those fossil fuel plants because we went from having the most dirty power plant in New York State in the funny fact that it closed down to having the next dirties power plant in New York State which was Ravenswood. I'm tired of holding that title. I'd rather have the title of most clean energy. So, if we're able to Beacon Wind, we're able to do renewable Rikers, you know, connecting those together with utilities battery storage could really be a boom for the city and a job creator and really give us an opportunity to create renewable energy in a large way, and replace dirty fossil fuel infrastructure and put it out to pasture. I think that's a vision we all share, right?

JULIA BOVEY: Yes.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: I know you can't talk too much about Beacon Wind, but I can say how much I support it. (laughs)

JULIA BOVEY: Thank you. I appreciate that support.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: I'll let the state know that. So, I'll say nothing. I'm not shy.

JULIA BOVEY: (laughs)

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: One thing just really quickly. What do you see that's like the life cycle of a wind turbine?

JULIA BOVEY: Sure. Well, we, we have— the last I know the machines and the foundation and also the contractor we have that we put a lease there again. So, these are all different things that could limit or stand in the way of the project. We think that, we think the machines will last 25 years. Other wind, wind machines around the world have lasted a lot longer, but what has been the case is that winter is going to become more and more efficient over the years, but that's just like when you buy a laptop computer, you know, a year later they're twice as efficient and so what we do see is lots of developers choose to replace the turbines before what they thought was the end of the use for life because they can generate so much more electricity with new models. We're trying for that by making sure that we install the absolute, um, newest state of the art and most efficient wind turbines and plan to get, you know 25, 30 years out of them. Over 20 we need to extend our federal relief. We also plan to install foundations in a lease area that ideally will be able to hold for that wind turbine we might see in 30 years. Of course, that's hard to imagine, but the

idea is that we'll have foundations that are very robust.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: And what happens with these connections? Right, what would happen to a turbine? Where does it go, how does it moved?

JULIA BOVEY: Uh-hm.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: What is the impact of both the installation and the removal of the ecosystems out in the ocean as well? Like how does this all work?

JULIA BOVEY: Sure, um, installing, installing the turbines means first installing foundations to hold them, and then, um, and then fitting the tower section into the foundation so that it stands up. There's a few different type offshore wind foundations the type that Empire Wind intends to use as much as possible. It's called the gravity based foundation. It has the lowest environmental impact because it avoids pile driving, which it can cause people noise to marine mammals in some cases if it's not something that is controlled properly. So, to the full extent feasible we intend to use these gravity-based foundations and an added bonus for those is that they can be made in New York. So,

that's a huge amount of New York content. Um, the process then once those are installed and released there, and as I said, bringing the, the tower and wind turbine sections, which will be assembled at SBMT up to the lease area where a large vessel will take them off the barges and put them in the foundations. Now, decommissioning 30 years from now more, there are a lot of workstreams happening now with Equinor, but across the industry and so across the board really looking at the potential for recycling the materials that are in those blades. The blades are, um, are a composite of carbonsider composits, and so there does need to be a lot more work on recycling those, but parts of the, of the components that are steel and those are...

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, Carlos.

JULIA BOVEY: He looks like he may be frozen.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, sorry about that. Now, do we see any of my colleagues with their hand up?

JULIA BOVEY: No, none at the present time.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: And Julia, the last question I have is, um, what are your thoughts about working with the surrounding communities for economic development, for...so that you're not just doing this, but that your part of the larger community at all times.

JULIA BOVEY: Sure. Well, I think that the, um, the LPCA sets it and there is plenty of work for that for any companies coming into New York to understand that at least 40% of investments need to be made in disadvantaged communities, and for us those mean, that means long-term relationships. So, it mean, um, opening an office and having that office in Brooklyn. If not near us the SBMT, if we're lucky enough to win the funding there. It means making sure that the community has access to learn about offshore winds, to understand the workforce readiness that's needed, that we are working extra hard to make sure that we're hiring from within the community, and that we're, and that we're spending our dollars in the community. Um, and, you know, again EDC the great partner on that they've been phenomenal, but also the community activists that have worked for years to, to preserve the working waterfront, and

they have also been quite an amazing resource for us to be able to, you know, figure out what's worked in their community in the past and what hasn't according to them. They have often given us the example of Sims Recycling facility as a great example of a company that they will come in and work and be successful on the waterfront in a way that it is in cooperation with the community. So, that's the promo that we want to know.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: And I'm sure that Uprose and Meet you have been in close contact with you, and began these conversations ensuring just transitions and good working jobs right?

JULIA BOVEY: Absolutely. They, they have been phenomenal, and really have their door open to us from day one and, you know, this is, this is their vision at the end of the day for what they wanted in their community as well. I mean as I said, it's no accident that this space is there ready for the marine industry to resume. It's been protected by the community because that's what they wanted, and we feel lucky to come into a bridge like that.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: So, at this, at this time actually, Council Member Menchaca does have some questions. So, I'll pass it over to him.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. Good morning panel. (pause) Hello. I don't know what's going on in New York here. Okay, Chair, can you hear me?

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Yes. Yes. we can hear you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, I don't know why my video isn't on. It was on earlier. Um, I just want to, um, kind of go back to Julia. Thank you for being here and kind of speaking to... We've spoken before in our community and I just want to reiterate the historical nature of this, of this unprecedented opportunity, that the real driver here has always been the community of Sunset Park, and it's taken the city agencies some time and I'll even say the state some time to get on board, and so I think it's important that we state that for the record here for this committee and for the Council Members that are listening and anyone who's here that it's...it's been the community of Sunset Park an incredible advocacy and the vision to really set SBMT

the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal into motion. There were a couple of moments that were difficult for the community and fights with the city that were kind of oriented another way. I think we fixed that, but I just, I just want to keep coming back to that. There's no way that this would have been possible without Sunset Park thinking about this, advocating, building power and executing, and so I just want to remind everyone of that, and the reason I'm reminding everyone of that is because there are some troubled waters as we move forward to get this stuff going and, and we're going to always go back to the community. A community will lead us in that direction as we, as we really lay out the infrastructure get SBMT up and running and really welcome this new infrastructure. So, thank you. Thank you for being here, and I just needed to say and put that on the record. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Council Member Menchaca for your question and statement. Um, Julia thank you and I look forward to working with you on SBMT and hopefully Beacon as well. so, thank you for your time and I wish you a very happy holiday.

JULIA BOVEY: Thank you very much. On behalf of everyone at Equinor we're so thrilled to be able to talk about this with you.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you so much.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Thank you and now I would like to welcome Ken Bowes to testify followed by Summer Sandoval of Uprose and the Peak Coalition. Is Ken Bowles here? (pause) Okay. We can always come back to Ken Bowes.

MALE SPEAKER: He is in the attendees.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Okay, then we will have some of the...

KEN BOWES: Can you hear me now.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Ken Bowles?

KEN BOWES: Can you hear me now?

FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes, I can hear you.

KEN BOWLES: Great. Thank you. Chairman, thank you members and invited guests. Thank you for the invitation to speak today regarding Sunrise Wind. My name is Ken Bowes. I'm the Vice President of Offshore Wind siting and permitting for other source energy. I'll share a presentation with you today and I'll identify the slides as I go through them. So, I'm going to slide 2, just a little bit

about Sunrise Wind. It's a joint venture of Orsted and Eversource. It's a 50/50 partnership, which means we share the risks and the rewards for the Sunrise Wind Project. We believe we bring unparalleled experience to the New York market. Moving on to slide 3. On the left hand slide you'll see a corporate profile of Orsted on the right hand side of Eversource. First starting with Orsted. Orsted ranks number one in the corporate knight 2020 index of the Global 100 most sustainable companies. They have the most experience in offshore wind industry commissioning their first offshore wind project in 1991. In 2017 into 2018, that first offshore wind farm was decommissioned. I know there's a question about that recently. So, what happened with those decommissioned materials? First of all, we've excavated 15 feet below the seabed floor and removed the foundation. All of the secondary steel, primary steel, copper from the cables and wiring has been recycled. The turbine blades now serve as noise barriers along highways in Denmark. In all, most all of the materials for the project have been recycled for future use and some in novel and unique ways. Orsted also is the owner

and operator of the first offshore wind farm in the U.S. the Block Island Wind Farm, and just recently commissioned the second offshore wind farm for Dominion Energy in Virginia. In total we have 26 wind farms worldwide and more than 1,500 turbines in operation. On the right hand side would have been about Eversource. Eversource has been ranked the number one most just utility by Forbes and Just Capital. We also rank number one in the country in energy efficiency. We're a national leader in transmission. In fact, today we own and operate Southern Enterprise with the state New York. On an hourly basis power flows to and from New York, from New England as the need arise. We also serve more than 4.4 million customers in New England serving them with electric, water and gas services. We understand what it means to be a local provider in more than 500 communities in New England and collectively we think there's a bright future ahead for clean energy. In fact, we've announced the first utility in the country that will be carbon neutral by 2030. Moving onto more details about the Sunrise Project itself. I'm now going to jump over onto slide 6. The wind turbines for Sunrise Wind will be

located 30 miles east of the South Fork off Montauk Point. In general very visible from anyone in the New York area. the electricity generator will be transmitted more than a 100 miles to Smith Point and as the interconnection point or the landfall location, and from there 17 miles through the county, state and town roads in Brookhaven, Brook haven, New York. This point of interconnection was chosen after a careful study of more than 20 substations in New York and a little bit different than other power purchase agreements, we actually will sell our power into the open market on a daily basis and collect all revenues which was mentioned previously, ocean renewable energy credits as the subsidy portion of the project. So, by selecting project with high notal prices that minimizes the rate payer impact based upon the Sunrise mean location. All the project will be buried underground for the offshore as well as the onshore. Moving onto Slide 7, some of the benefits directly. Obviously, no harmful emissions for cleaner air. Reduce the carbon intent of resources and create jobs. In total 800 direct jobs and 1,500 to 2,000 indirect jobs. In fact, we already have more than a

100 employees in the State of New York working on this project. Moving onto Slide 8 this will be offsetting about 230,000 cars per year taking off the road with more than 2.1 metric tons of carbon dioxide off the road. Moving onto Slide 9, some of the economic benefits. Aside from the direct and indirect jobs it will provide, we also will have a host community agreement with the town of Brookhaven. We also have another project component in the town and that's the Port Jefferson Operations and Maintenance facility, which I will speak of in a few slides. Sunrise has committed more than $10 million to seed fund the National Offshore Wind Training Center in Suffolk County, and we have cut raising labor off there and environmental community, and this will serve as a nationwide location to train the next generation of utility and offshore wind workers. Sunrise Wind is also committed to performing secondary steel fabrication in the New York Capital region the Port of Albany. We recently signed a National Offshore Wind Labor Agreement with the building trades. Moving onto Slide 10, which is the Port Jefferson, one of the largest commitments we have made to ew York is at the Port Jefferson

facility. We have committed to having our operations out there for the entire northeast region, which includes 100 permanent jobs including the location of our service operation vessel. We recently announced the first Jones Jack compliant U.S. built service operation vessel. In essence it's a floating hotel where our workers can be serving the wind farms from. We have also made commitments to the Port or Port Jefferson for infrastructure improvements to accommodate the new service operation vessel. Now, I'm going to jump towards the stakeholder outreach, which is actually slide 13. From our team the consistent ongoing stakeholder engagement is a core value and critical help of the development and construction process. For example with the Sunrise Wind project we had our open house last week for the project and in that we indicated we've had more than 100 meetings with local public officials and stakeholder groups. For this now I'm going to go onto Slide 16 just kind of a summary slide. Again, we provide power to more than 500,000 New York homes and clean renewable energy. We provide ongoing jobs at the Operations and Maintenance facility at Port Jefferson, and during

construction 800 direct jobs and almost 2,000 indirect jobs, and we look forward to building and operating the Sunrise Wind Project for the next 20 plus years. Thank you very much.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Well, thank you for your testimony. Also, when do you believe your project will be operational and I'll ask you the same questions I asked the other ones.

KEN BOWLES: So, for the Sunrise 1 project, we're anticipating 2024 into 2025 for full operations.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Now, you talked about several, well you talked 800 jobs. Is that correct number that you're proceeding, you're seeing that you are working with building trades and so on. Is that correct?

KEN BOWLES: 800 direct jobs. Yes that will be working direction on the project.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Now you said you would sign an agreement. You work, you're working with the building trades to make sure they are good union jobs?

KEN BOWLES: That is correct, and we will have a project specifically with an agreement for

the Sunrise Wind Project. As with all of our other projects South Fork Resolution and possibly even Sunrise, too, if we're selected in this next round for NYSERDA.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: And what's been your community engagement? Yea, because we can go back to that as well. Hello. Ken?

KEN BOWLES: Hello.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Ken? Ken, did I lose you?

KEN BOWLES: Hello.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: I don't see him.

(pause)

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Hello. Yes, I think we lost him. Ken, are you still there? Hello. Yeah. I guess Samara I guess we'll go forward. I guess it those are the only other questions I have but I'll ...we'll just go with, put his testimony to the record.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Okay, alright. I will now call on Jack Summer Sandoval of Up Rose and of the Peak Coalition, and then, too, will be followed by Carlos Garcia of Nija Summer.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All in time.

SUMMER SANDOVAL: Did you call me?

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Yes.

SUMMER SANDOVAL: So good afternoon Committee Chair and City Council and thank you for the opportunity to submit testimony today. My name is Summer Sandoval and I am the Energy Democracy Coordinator at UPROSE and today I'm here on behalf and along side with members of the PEAK Coalition. PEAK is a coalition of five groups that includes Uprose, the New York City Environmental Justice Alliance, the Point CDC, New York Lawyers for the Public Interest and Clean Energy Group. We are committed to creating a comprehensive effort to replace New York City's peaker power plants that disproportionately harm and pollute Environmental Justice communities with renewable and energy storage alternatives such as offshore wind to achieve a just transition. In the midst of multiple crises it is crucial for New York City to address the root or inequities in our fossil fuel dependent energy systems. Crises are not exclusive inductees of decisions that place these clusters of polluting infrastructure in communities of color and low-income communities have exacerbated public

health impacts from both Covid-19 as well as climate change causes. Offshore wind development is an opportunity to work with community leadership to create thousands of well paid climate jobs, increase local clean energy resources and help New York meet emission reduction and equity mandates codified by the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. Studies show that the CLCPA will create up to 150,000 jobs over the next ten years. These jobs will be in renewable energy development, energy efficiency, retrofit, construction, manufacturing and support industries. In order to ensure local job creation, New York must invest in the necessary infrastructure to host these jobs. Increasing, increasing in the city renewable energy generation and meeting New York's goal of 9,000 megawatts of offshore wind by 2035 is an integral set to replace all polluting peaker plants. For offshore wind development must be approached in a comprehensive manner with frontline community leadership at the forefront of priorities, decision making and implementation. So, we urge the New York City Council to support our comprehensive model of offshore wind development, and investments in New

York City. Offshore wind developers must be required to work along side communities to create workforce training programs, and resources that ensure new clean energy jobs are accessible, and that long-term benefits are realized by local residents. I would like to thank the New York City Council for holding this hearing today, and for allowing me to testify, and for more information please visit or Coalition website at Peak Coalition.org. Thank you.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: So, I want to thank you for all the great work that you guys do on advocating for our community and every community that has been burned by these fossil fuel plants for generations, but we're back with the power now. I wasn't a Council Member. I was in college when they decided that they were going to place these plants back in the early 2000s with the, you know with the stipulation that it would be open for only three years. It's now 20 years later, and those peaker plants are still in our neighborhoods. In Queens I know they're right next to the Queens Bridge rigtht into one of the Astoria houses. So,

thank you for that with the city to fight back against these peaker plants in EJ communities.

SUMMER SANDOVAL: Thank you, sir.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you, Summer and next we will have Carlos Garcia of NYEJA to testify.

MALE SPEAKER: (inaudible)

CARLOS GARCIA: Good afternoon Chairperson Constantinides and members Levin, Menchaca, Ulrich and Yeger. My name is Carlos Garcia and on behalf of the New York City Environmental Justice Alliance NYC-EJA. We are here to testify in support of the continued development of offshore wind in and around New York City. Founded in 1991, NYC-EJA is a non-profit citywide membership now work linking 11 grassroot organizations from low-income neighborhoods and communities of color in the shovel for Environmental Justice. NYC-EJA has a long history in the fight for development of renewable energy in New York City and throughout the state. From the instrumental law and the passing of the State's Community Leadership and Community Protection Act, CLCPA, to our most recent efforts in providing technical expertise to the

Coalition. NYC-EJA has the ability to prioritize New York's fight for Environmental Justice for the city or (inaudible) (coughs) Looking at the role continued offshore wind development will have in New York's energy sector, its positive community externalities reveal a win-win for New York's fight for environmental in the (inaudible) It is on an electrical grid standpoint and a connection of offshore wind in Sunset Park, and other EJ communities around New York will provide a vital supply of energy to offset the projected increase energy load and that will offset the need for peaker pipelines. A real world example of this is currently under consideration in Brooklyn. Like most of the Environmental Justice community in New York City, Sunset Park is considered a load pocket. A load pocket is an area where there is insufficient transmission capacity to provide 100% of their electricity load. The load you can think of it as how much the area is asking, now much the area is using without relying on generation capacity that is physically located within that area. According to the New York Independent System Operator NYISO, newly released, reliability needs

assessing report released just six days ago the Astoria East Corona 130 KV in Greenwood and Fox Hills 138 KV transition low area, which feeds in and out of Sunset Park are expected to see an energy deficiency of over ten hours totaling 650 megawatt hours on a peak day in 2023, and an energy efficiency of 14 hours totaling 3,571 megawatt hours over a 14-hour period on a peak day 2025 respectively. Simply put, NYISO believes that there is not enough energy to meet the ever increasing demands for energy in South Brooklyn. Combined this with the aggressive loadification (sic) and watching the vehicle part (sic) that New York City has committed to, New York City may face a larger problem than anticipated. While NYJA and our allies have identified this problem and are working on amazing numerous model solutions to this problem, partnerships with NYFA and makes it all alike, the unique buildings that owners are structured in Brooklyn on compound the difficulty of developing in-city renewable energy generation with the (inaudible) This is where offshore wind comprises a very unique and valuable

characteristic. It's ability to interconnect not for the amount of energy...

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: On this side...

CARLOS GARCIA: ...an energy efficient area. We do look forward to continued collaborations with the City, State in any advocates in our fight to start cleaning the environmental justice transition.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you so much. Thank you so much for your testimony today and thank you for all the work that you're doing on behalf of New York City. Please give my best to Eddy.

CARLOS GARCIA: Thank you, Chair and I'm looking forward to working with you more in the future law.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Absolutely. Thank you very much.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you Carlos and now I would like to welcome Justin Wood of New York Lawyers for the Public Interest who will be followed by Frank ACHAIR of ILA Local 1814.

MALE SPEAKER: Starting time.

JUSTIN WOOD: Thank you. Good morning Chairperson Constantinides and members of the Council. My name is Justin Wood and I'm the Director of Organizing and Research at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest. Thanks for the opportunity to testify today. NYLPI and our partners in the Peak Coalition believe the rapid development of offshore wind farms and the corresponding onshore infrastructure should be a top priority for clean energy and job creation in the city. As we've heard, these investments in offshore wind plus local solar and battery storage we can quickly move to decommission the polluting and expensive fossil fuel peak plants, which perversely run on the hottest days when air quality is at its worst. As utility rate payers New Yorkers have paid a staggering $4.5 billion over the past ten years just to keep these inefficient and polluting peaker plants on standby and most of this local money then goes to wealthy out of state corporations and private equity investors who own these plants. These funds would be far better spent building offshore wind, solar and battery infrastructure to ensure a clean and reliable power

supply in every community while targeting green jobs and workforce developments to the communities that need them most. As we've heard, the substations interned by assembly sites needed for offshore wind can be a source of both green energy and desperately needed jobs in low-income communities and communities of color that are experiencing a devasting and multi-faceted crisis this year. These communities have endured some of the highest COVID-19 infection and fatality rates in the nation. They're disproportionately suffering from mass unemployment in the ongoing economic crisis, and they face long-term environmental burdens from air pollution that are now known to increase the severity of COVID-19 and other respiratory illnesses. We also know all too well that these same communities are on the front lines of climate crisis and will continue to face flooding, extreme heat and extreme weather events in New York City. As you will also hear from our partners in the Climate Works for All Coalition, offshore wind can be a powerful source of good, green and living wage jobs in our working waterfront communities, and as we've heard

specifically today the Equinor project in Sunset Park alone could create hundreds of direct jobs plus additional indirect jobs for suppliers and contractors. We really look forward to working with the Council and continuing to work with the Administration, our State legislators and state agencies to ensure that New York State's clean energy transition is rapid and that it brings investments to our city's working waterfront and Environmental Justice communities. Thank you.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you very much. Thank you for your testimony today.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Next we will have, we will have Frank ACHAIR. Is Frank ACHAIR here? Okay. if Frank ACHAIR is not here next we will move onto Carlos Costell from, from the League of Conservation Voters. Carlos.

MALE SPEAKER: Starting time.

CARLOS COSTELL: Good afternoon. My name is Carlos Costell Coke and I am the Associate from New York City Programs at the New York League of Conservation Voters. NYLCV represents over 30,000 members in New York City and we are committed to advancing the sustainability agenda that will make

our people our neighborhoods and our economy healthier and more resilient. I'd like to thank Chair Constantinides for holding this hearing today and for the opportunity to testify. New York State and New York City in the past few years have made significant commitments to reducing fossil fuel emissions and fighting climate change. The Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act, Climate Mobilization Act and WINYC2050 are all groundbreaking commitments to sustainability and are leading us to in the right direction towards a clean energy economy. In order to achieve these goals we must meet the CLCPA's goal of building 9 megawatts of option wind by 2035. As much as the curriculum and policy needs to advance option wind is happening at the state level but there is still actions that New York City can take to ensure that the transition is a sustainable offshore wind energy is cost-effective, competitive and well executed. First, the city must work with offshore wind developers and utilities to establish an efficient and effective way to connect to the grid. Coordination of setting transmission lines and the connections and infrastructure will be com, will be

a complex process and involves multiple jurisdictions and communities. We will need the city's help to make sure that these transition, transition projects are cited and built efficiently including making sure that we have enough appropriate resilient sites reserved for interconnection. Second, the city will also play an instrumental role in establishing and developing offshore wind industrial ports. Ports such as those proposed at the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal and the Arctic Hill(sic) Terminal. They need significant investments so they can facilitate and be involved in construction and installation projects and associated supply chains. These ports will create jobs as the city recovers from the pandemic providing a much needed boost to our economy. New York City has allocated some investments for port development, but we would like to see even more to help projects grow faster. In addition to developing the port infrastructure necessary for offshore wind the city should also be connecting Environmental Justice communities to job training and placement with offshore wind companies many of whom have shown a long list to do their

part to achieve climate justice. A just transition requires that we make sure that New Yorkers who have been most harmed by reliance on fossil fuels will also benefit from the green economy. Additionally, attention should be given to retaining workers previously employed by fossil fuel grade industries and tapping those for these new green jobs. Third, numerous permits and reviews will be necessary for construction of facilities to support development of the off-shore wind industry. The city must ensure that permitting the facility for offshore wind and associated supply and assembly work in New York is done as quickly as possible while also providing appropriate environmental reviews and community input. We are in the process of shift to clean energy economy, a shift New York must be at the front of, a shift that will rely heavily on offshore wind and in particular in New York City to fight climate change, reduce resilience on polluting power sources and ensure a...

MALE SPEAKER: Time expired.

CARLOS COSTELL: Thank you for the opportunity to testify today.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you so much for this testimony.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you, and next we will have testimony from Shea O'Riley of the, of the, um, Sierra Club.

MALE SPEAKER: Starting time.

SHEA O'RILEY: Good afternoon everybody. My name is Shea O'Riley and I'm an organizer for Sierra Club's Beyond Cold Climate. For four years now I have been organizing with our grassroots members and partners to support responsible offshore wind all the time. That first winter in 2016 we secured a 2400 megawatt target by demonstrating that New Yorkers were ready to fight climate change and creates tens of thousands of good jobs in nurturing an optioned industry. Now, just four years later, we have a state target of 9,000 megawatts by 2035, and we're doing it right. Led by the Labor Movement and frontline partners we have secured responsible contracting standards in New York that are a model for the entire renewable industry. Offshoring developers are required to pay a prevailing wage, to enter into too fit negotiations towards a project labor agreement, and

to abide by strict environmental standards. We'll hear from others today that these developers are working community groups and they do need to maximize benefits for local communities. Our city's energy is the dirtiest in the state with 90% of our power coming from gas and oil and our density needs limited opportunities to meet the high demand. Offshore wind with its high capacity factor and peak coincidence is one of the best solutions for this pipeline. It also provides a rare opportunity to significantly reinvest to realize our city. Unlike medium hydro power offshore investments create local and sustained jobs with the increasing viability of supply chain manufacturing locally as the mystery scales up. It also adds incremental new clean energy to the region. We are at a critical juncture in the fight against climate change. In Astoria and Sunset Park private fossil fuel companies are attempting to extend the life other aging gas plants by promoting theoretical hydrogen conversion would still allow decades of pollution. We need every level of government to be clear that that we will not allow new fossil fuel plants to be built. If you find

yourself in a hole, you don't' think slower, you stop digging. Offshore wind combined with battery swords at these critical places command their fossil fuel plants also be while ensuring the liability and providing community investment. With your support we can secure this local just transition. We are committed to staying offshore in flourishing New York and we're telling this to the leadership. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today and thank you to Council Member Constantinides for your unwavering kind of actions in our city.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Shea. Always good to see you. Thank you for your testimony today.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Next we will hear from Karen Imas of the Waterfront Alliance. Karen.

MALE SPEAKER: Starting time.

KAREN IMAS: Thank you, Chair. My name is Karen Imas, I'm the Vice President of Programs at Waterfront Alliance. We're a non-profit civic organization and coalition of more than 1100 alliance partners ranging from environmental advocates to educational institutions to businesses

and corporations. We are here today to champion support for the growth of the actual wind sector for New York to achieve a major share of the jobs and economic benefits generated by serving its an offshore hub, the city and state must commit to the essential role that our ports or maritime ports play to meet the needs of the offshore wind industry. Despite our region's extraordinary maritime history and capacity to support major renewable energy goals, the current state of our local ports and industrial waterfront infrastructure it's not always well understood. Local maritime infrastructure must be a bigger policy and funding priority for the Council and the Mayor and the State if offshore wind can truly take off and be an economic engine for the region. Given the unique technical requirements for offshore wind component staging, handling, assembly and installation, the industry requires port facilities that can handle heavy and large components while also providing unfeathered and deep water access to the specialized installation vessels needed to install and maintain them. Not to mention air drop restrictions at our local bridges. Many of the

smellow (sic) ports in our region were not designed to accommodate these constraints. However, these challenges can be overcome with the commitment to capital investment in infrastructure, retrofits, dredging and other physical site upgrades. We encourage the City to include capital commitments in future budgets. With these upgrades the 73-acre South Brooklyn Marine Terminal for example provides a tremendous opportunity to become an offshore wind hub and major economic driver for the city. Ultimately the success of offshore wind will require a cooperative approach among owners and operators of various ports and the project developers along with partnership with the city and state. Importantly, design considerations that promote climate adaptation and resiliency of the port and responding to such threats as sea level rise and dynamic flooding events will also be critical in these upgrades. With respect to workforce development opportunities, the city can play an important role in creating pathways of opportunity. While New York City has a highly skilled and well trained workforce, gaps do exist in key skill required for this transition. Offshore

wind rolls are extremely varied given that the life cycle of a wind farm progresses from installation to decommissioning. This requires electricians, engineers, pipe fitters, wind technicians as well as dozens of other occupations not to mention traditional working waterfront occupations such as captains, crews, stevedors and dry dock workers. In fact, 74 different professions are needed to build an offshore wind farm according to the Workforce Development Institute. We will need under graduate and graduate programs that equips students with both hands-on experiences as well as research and development opportunities, and the cultivation of these skill sets begins even earlier through middle and high school. We will need programs for DOE, the CUNY system and SUNY System.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Oh, Ms. Imas

KAREN IMAS:...to help to o train the workforce. Waterfront Alliance looks forward to collaborating with all the various actors and ensuring that we build the 21st Century port infrastructure and port offshore wind success. Thank you.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you so much. Karen, it's always good to see you. thank you for your testimony today.

KAREN IMAS: Thank you so much.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you Karen and next we will have testimony from Professor Robert who is Lynn Bradford the Co-Director of Community Studies of New York. Professor Robert, please.

MALE SPEAKER: Starting time.

PROFESSOR ROBERT: (coughs) I Thank for the opportunity to testify. I'll make it as quickly as I can. My name is Leonard Bradford. I'm a... I was trained as a nuclear physicist and I'm a Professor Emeritus of Urban Studies at Queens College. I'm also a member of New York Energy and Climate Advocates, a group recently formed to examine and critique the state's energy and climate policy. The state hired two consultants to develop plans for how the station responds to it's new climate law, and what they found and reported to the Climate Action Council in the last several months. The largest single source of energy under these plans will be offshore wind, which we're talking about today. The Down State Area where we live will be

almost totally dependent on offshore wind. It's up to 80% according to the results of these two consultants. I don't know if I said this but the source is for everything I'm saying. They are in my printed testimony. There's little open land in that area for solar and wind on the land. So, we're dependent on the offshore wind. Wind is full of contradictions. Sometimes there's too little. The agency NYSO that runs the electric grid for the city found that there will be days and even weeks when there's inadequate energy coming from offshore to provide the sort of, the power we need in the Downstate Region. They did not have a solution to this. They labeled something renewable natural gas, but that doesn't exist and it's kind of rhetorical device. At the other extreme, the wind farms we talked about lie directly in the path of the storms that come through every summer and then we know will get more intense and more frequent as this, as the climate continues to warm. The wind turbines will automatically shut down when those storms come through to protect themselves, but if the storms are strong enough the turbines are rended up to a category 3, and a category 5 storm

the Hurricane Maria hit Puerto Rico two years ago and destroyed the wind farm there. It's conceivable over the next 30 years that we will be hit by such a storm and New York City will be dead for up to a decade. We need reliable back-up and it will exist we have to go, but it's nuclear power, which today provides 30% of the state's electricity, but it appears nowhere in the state's energy plants up to this point. In fact, the only plant in this downstate area nuclear plant is in the process of being shut down by Cuomo Administration, and replaced by gas. It's being burned at Reagan's Florida and every place else in this city and it provided 25% or our electricity for the last 50 years, twice as much even one of the...

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: You need to wrap up.

PROFESSOR ROBERT: Well, I urge the Council to support the expansion of nuclear power if you want to save this city.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you very much for your testimony, Professor.

PROFESSOR ROBERT: Okay.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you very much.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you, and now I would now like to welcome Bonnie Brady Long Island Fishermen.

MALE SPEAKER: Starting plan.

BONNIE BRADY: Can you all hear me?

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Yes.

BONNIE BRADY: Great. Council Member Constantinides, thank you so much for asking me to speak to your group today. It's very important. I'm Bonnie Brady. I'm from the Long Island Commercial Commercial Fishing Association. I represent commercial fisherman throughout Long Island through a multitude of gear, like gear groups, and I would love to have about 30 minutes honestly to talk to you about the issues that related to offshore wind as it involves the ocean environment and the ocean ecosystems. I don't mean to be the wet blanket on today's hearing. However, there is no silver bullet and there is no free lunch, and unfortunately, a lot of the information that you have heard to date does not actively explain offshore wind whether the difference between main play and capacity, whether the difference between what is necessary for pile driving and jet piling and jet trenching the ocean

floor, using the ocean floor with electromagnetic frequency and laying thousands and thousands of miles of transmission cables upon it. I have unfortunately about three pages of notes, but it looks like I've got a minute today. So, there is no way I will be able to get that involved. So, I have some pictures that I ran around to get for you and I don't know if you can see this. Can you all see that?

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Yes.

BONNIE BRADY: That's the assessment. Yes. great. These are sediment clues I've seen from space by Nassa of the Tanent Wind Farm area, one of the very first wind farms done by Dong Energy known there as Oyster. This is radar interference in that same wind farm because the magnets in the railroad's minerals inside the turbines create the road magnetic field which affects radar for most fishermen. The problem that the commercial fishermen have with the plan as it stands for the wind energy area is they forgot to remove traditional and historic fishing grounds. This map shows the wind energy areas listed in black and also the ones that in Rhode Island and

Massachusetts, and the orange you see here is actually where fishermen fish. Those are... Oh, I'm sorry. I can send all of this information to you, by the way. These are traditional and historic fishing grounds, and the Block Island informed project for locally for those that offer Montauk, the five wind turbines that are on the radar here five ghost turbines here. There are huge problems with offshore wind. First of all, not removal of traditional historic fishing grounds because frankly you cannot eat energy. You can, however destroy your food security and in the time of COVID I think we've all learned how important it is to have access to high quality protein. Gosh, there's so much to say and I'm not going to be able to fit it all in. However, I can tell you that when I heard about the wind farms, the output decreases by 4.5% per year for the first ten years. Name plate is about what 100 megawatts. The actual capacity for offshore wind is 38% of that. You need gas 24/7 for backup. There is no way to create backup...

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: We follow.

BONNIE BRADY: to create the ability for the amount of wind that's necessary, and there are many

economic...I mean, excuse me, ecological issues that I would love to talk to your committee at further length in any format whatsoever. Thank you so much for your time.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you so much for your testimony and pleas email me all that information. I think you have my email.

BONNIE BRADY: Thank you very much.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you. We have two witnesses left, Linda Newquin and Catherine Scopic who will be the last witness. So, Linda Newquin, could you please testify now. She's with the law now.

LINDA NEWQUIN: Hi, can you hear me?

SAMARA SWANSTON: Yes.

LINDA NEWQUIN: Okay, great. Thank you so much for the opportunity to provide testimony on the two partner projects known as the new way on this new policy and research enters that align, day lines for 34. When the city has a pandemic all lines can be local community groups working on the front lines of both economic and environments of justice through the coalition kind of what's for

all ten visions, for all the country for all of the groups, our climate and community platform provides a road map on how the city can navigate those crises in their path. Now more than ever, it integral that the city prioritize its community led projects with education and good local union jobs in fact in black community, black and brown communities and the investment in the new brown energies. Black and Brown energy. Economic recovery in the age of COVID 19 and climate change we cannot afford for climate adaptation and economic growth be addressed in silos. Economic injustice, environmental racism and public health dispartities will worsen as the climate crisis progresses in the midst of the COVID 19 pandemic. New York City must prioritize and invest in renewable energy efforts in the Environmental Justice communities most impacted by climate change, the COVID 19 pandemic and racial violence. Investment in infrastructure to low income communities is not a popular idea, but it's also a proven economic stimulus that will put our city back on track towards a robust recovery. Strong community organizing is smart policy reach has already hired what the research

was planning to do, and I think we've heard it a lot from these great community organizations thus far this morning. Offshore wind is the necessary part of the local implementation of the CLCPR. New York City passes to waterways and ports make it as prime destination for offshore wind development. Investing in Sunset Park's Industrial Waterfront cannot only take the right kind of jobs, though it will impact frontline communities, would also address climate mitigation, adaptation and recovery. Port at plays would help Sunset Park and industrial waterfront in creating tens of thousands good local career union jobs and help us see the increase in its local and regional supply chain. At the end of the day good climate policy is good labor policy. The plan we're going to stop with many inventions before would create hundreds of jobs, hundreds of jobs every year and initial staging and an onwards of management and then indirectly an additional 60 to 100 jobs in contracting me. You know, our city is looking for a way out of this crisis and New York has the opportunity to lead the way especially in investing in infrastructure that directly impacts their

income Environmental Justice back in 1988. We cannot return to the piece of it as we work. We must move forward economic impacts out and we must move to a solution that centers New York in this community solution. Thank you for your time and letting me to testify today, and for me to fill out my testimony. Thank you much.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: So, thank you so much for your testimony today. We really appreciate it. Thank you so much for all of the work that you do.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you and now we'll have Katherine Scopic who's our final witness.

KATHERINE SCOPIC: Okay. Thank you Chair Constantinides, Samara Swanston, Nick, all the Council Members and all those great people and everyone who has made this hearing possible. As Samara said, my name is Katherine Scopic. I'm speaking as a citizen and I'm also Chair of Sierra Club New York City Group and work with the Climate Crisis policy. Yes. we need offshore wind. We all know we are in a climate crisis and these megawatts are huge and you have heard all morning all of the positive aspects to the EJ communities, to labor that can benefit, and can only benefit us. I have

carefully followed the bone studies and it's so expensive thorough studies on all of the marine life in our oceans that will and could be affected down to the migration of the Atlantic, the Atlantic whales, the Atlantic gray whales. So, I am 100% behind these projects. We are geographically abreast to have the, be on the Continental Shelf, and to have a proven exuberant generous wind energy come in constantly. The wind flows very strongly. Although this is a city issue that we're addressing today, as one who has been studying climate crisis policy on all levels I would like to report to you that in the House Select Committee on the Climate Crisis Report on page 59, we read: Develop a national offshore wind transmission plan. As you all know we now have three transmission plans in the United States from the East Coast to the Rockies, from the Rockies to the West Coast and Texas. Sod, the Federal Government is looking to install transmission lines along the coast, which would enable us to transfer the lot, the energy from the offshore wind. Provide...on page 138, Provide grants to expedite port electrification, reduce emissions from port operations and upgrade,

and upgrade points for offshore wind development. Page 140: Make energy efficient offshore wind servicing vessels eligible for federal loan grants and there's more. I've just read a few of those. So the federal list is looking down the road. These are plans, tentative plans in the works from the federal level to supply grants in financing to enable offshore wind. And in all due respect to the Mayor I would just like to say that the mega dams the hydro, the chippie would be extremely destructive not only to the indigenous people in Canada but to the Hudson River and I would just like to implore him to please stop negotiating on this issue and let us use the renewable...

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Time expired.

KATHERINE SCOPIC: ...that is truly renewable. Thank you everyone. Yay, offshore wind.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Katherine. Always good to see you. Please stay safe.

KATHERINE SCOPIC: You, too. Thank you.

SAMARA SWANSTON: Thank you, Katherine and at this time I'd like to ask if there's anyone who has registered to testify, to testify but whose name I have not called? Is there anyone who

registered to testify who has not been called? Okay, seeing none I will turn it over to Chair Constantinides for any closing remarks.

CHAIR CONSTANTINIDES: I just want to make sure I thank everyone who took the time to testify today on this important issue. I want to again thank our staff, our staff attorney Samara Swanston for hosting the hearing today, our staff, our Policy Analyst both Nadia Johnston and Micky Chawa (sp?) our Financial Analyst John Seltzer, my staff Arthur Luzowski, all the great sergeants at arms that helped make this staff, the hearing run so well, all the tech folks who don't get named who do all the great work behind the scenes. I appreciate you and thank you, and I also want to make sure two things: One, I wish everyone a happy, safe, socially distant Thanksgiving. I've had COVID. It is serious, and we need to stay safe this Thanksgiving. There was a lot more of me in March when you last saw me. I lot 30 pounds. I'm still struggling to get the weight back on. So, I implore everyone please, please let's stay safe this Thanksgiving holiday and not travel and stay socially distant, and I hope that we all get

together once it's safe, and then secondly I want to pass condolences onto the family on to the family of our former Mayor David Dinkins. He was a giant in city government. He was someone who planted so many of the seeds that have come to fruition today that never got the credit for it. So, I really want to thank Mayor Dinkins for his service to the city and wish him the best and peace for his family. There might be those condolences. So, with that, again thank you to everyone who testified today and with my imaginary gavel I will gavel this hearing of the Environmental Protection Committee close. (gavel) (laughter)

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.

Date December 4, 2020