CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

----- X

October 15, 2020 Start: 10:38 a.m. Recess: 11:48 a.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson

Speaker

Karen Koslowitz Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Karen Koslowitz

Adrienne E. Adams Rory I. Lancman Deborah L. Rose Margaret S. Chin Ritchie J. Torres

Mark Treyger Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Stanley Richards

Jose Aragio

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, I will.

Council Member Debbie Rose, Council Member Ritchie

sentenced to one year or less of jail time. By law,

right hand to be sworn in?

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: It's OK, they call me The Kos, it's OK.

STANLEY RICHARDS: I remember that at

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

AND ELECTIONS

but the truth?

the, ah, street naming for Adelaide, and other distinguished committee members. I am honored to be nominated, ah, for this important and critically, ah, valuable, ah, position on the Board of Correction. In 1986,34 years ago, I sat in a dorm on Riker's Island in the AMKC, starting another cycle of jail in prison. My life at that time was filled with anger, hopelessness, and confusion, fueled by the desire to only survive. I accepted that narrative and believed that my life would be a never-ending cycle of incarceration, release, and reincarceration. In 1988, almost two years in detention on Riker's

4

2 Island, my time on Riker's ended and my four-and-ahalf to nine year prison term began. Shortly after 3 entering prison I found education and the beginning of a life I never thought was possible. I attended a 5 6 GED class, passed and earned my GED. I then enrolled 7 in Madaya College and found myself energized with the pursuit of knowledge and education. I soon graduated 8 with my degree, magna cum laude, and started to 9 believe that life could be different. I understood 10 that my life was guided by my decisions and I had the 11 12 power to achieve the outcome I wanted as opposed to living my life as the wind blows. Through education 13 14 I believe, for the first time in my life that I was 15 smart, intelligent, a good person, and able to set 16 and achieve goals. It was at that time I believe prison was in my past and not in my future. 17 18 Education in prison gave me the foundation to launch a new life and make amends for the hurt and 19 20 devastation I leveled on my community in Sound View In 1991 New York State Department of 21 2.2 Corrections released me to the community. Like 23 thousands of men and women and young adults released from jail and prison I applied to many jobs. Many 24 25 people who interviewed me told me to get more

9 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES 1 AND ELECTIONS 2 experience. But no one was willing to give me the opportunity. That was true until I applied at the 3 Fortune Society and met Joanne Page, president and 4 In 1991 Fortune Society hired me as a 5 6 counselor. My job was to engage people returning 7 home from prison and support them as they transitioned back into the community. I was able to 8 give someone a hand, pay it forward, and provide a 9 different vision and narrative of what life after 10 prison could be, with hope, hard work, determination, 11 12 and opportunity. Since 1991 I have been able to work on multiple levels in the not-for-profit field, 13 14 specifically, Fortune Society and Hunter College 15 Center on Age, Drugs, and Community Health. I have 16 had the opportunity to impact the criminal justice system on multiple levels, including individual, 17 18 community, and systemic levels. Joanne Page offered me the opportunity to work on management level within 19 20 Fortune - supervisor, manager, director, senior director, now executive. I also had the privilege to 21 2.2 work with Dr. Nicholas Freudenberg, distinguished 23 professor of health at the CUNY Graduate Center. Over the last 19 years I have had the absolute 24 pleasure of engaging with and serving thousands of

25

2 men and women and young adults who walk through the doors of Fortune, hoping for something better, but 3 not sure if better is real and possible. The last 34 4 years of my life lays the foundation of my work and 5 my commitment to criminal justice reform, 6 7 table for this committee to have the confidence to know that I will serve as your voice, your eyes, and 8 advocate on the Board of Correction. While we have 9 experienced amazing reductions and reforms in our 10 criminal justice system, locally, thanks to many on 11 12 this call, we have so much more to do to ensure equity, fairness, and justice in our system. We have 13 14 about 4300 people detained in New York City jails 15 right now. We have a commitment from New York City Council to close Riker's Island and I thank you for 16 17 that commitment. A commitment from Mayor de Blasio 18 to end solitary confinement, and we're working on that right now. And a commitment from the City 19 20 Council to ensure people impacted by the criminal justice system have the resources and supports needed 21 2.2 to end the cycle of incarceration by addressing 23 homelessness, mental illness, substance abuse, and 24 hopelessness. Imagine what we can do as a system if

our corrections department revise their primary

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES 1 AND ELECTIONS 2 mission and vision statement and the Board of Corrections was not seen as an adversary, but rather 3 4 as a partner and a resource to improve the conditions of confinement. We could move towards a more humane 5 6 and integrated system of corrections that seeks to 7 support the growth and development and reintegration of people in custody. I am looking forward to 8 continuing to work to ensure we hold these words that 9 guide our approach to criminal justice - fairness, 10 accountability, redemption, hope, and opportunity. 11 12 Again, I want to thank Speaker Johnson and Chairwoman Kos and the other distinguished committee members 13 here today. And I'll close with this. As I walked 14 15 on my journey I have always thought that my journey 16 was controlled by me. But I have come to learn that my journey has always been controlled by my higher 17 18 power. I have been blessed with an amazing wife of 30 years, four amazing children, and nine amazing 19 20 grandchildren. And my work every single day is to work to ensure that my grandchildren my great-21 2.2 grandchildren eventually will come to know this city,

be a city invested in their future with education and

a path towards college and economic stability, and

not a path toward Riker's Island, a jail, and

23

24

2.2

detention. And I have been blessed to walk this

journey with an amazing woman, my wife, Satari, who

together we're gonna work to make sure that our

grandchildren and our great-grandchildren see the

city for what it truly can be. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. I'm going to start. We will now open the floor up to the committee for any questions or comments concerning the candidate. I can't see, is the Speaker on?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, Council Member Koslowitz. It appears not.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: OK. Then I have a couple of question. Do you believe that DOC and Correctional Health Services have adequately responded to the COVID-19 pandemic?

STANLEY RICHARDS: So I think there are, there are two answers, ah, to that question. The first short answer is, um, I think they did an amazing job in responding. But I think the response was slow. It wasn't coordinated, and it didn't lay out a blueprint for how Correctional Health Services and the Department of Correction will work together moving forward, both in terms of the pandemic we're in right now and in anticipation for a second wave.

21

2.2

23

24

25

So I look at where we were at when we had, I think around 5900 people incarcerated at the time of the pandemic. And we called on the city and the mayor to move swiftly to release those who could be released safely and to get them into services and get them into support, and the mayor did that, which reduced our population, which was the right thing to do. Correctional Health moved swiftly to try to identify and set up protocols for ensuring the continued safety of those who had to be detained there. And I think we had a couple of months where we had no positive, ah, results stemming from, ah, someone being incarcerated. They set up a way for people to come in and be quarantined and tested, ah, so that it doesn't spread to the general population. But what they haven't done is articulate what is the plan to manage a second wave. We know they took steps, but what's the plan? And it's not articulated on their website. It wasn't articulated in the hearing that was just held by Health and Criminal Justice. think they're missing a huge opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. As a member of the Board of Correction you voted in favor of rules to limit the use of punitive segregation.

change the culture in DOC facilities?

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

But there is still so much more to be done. What do you think are the concrete steps BOC can take to

STANLEY RICHARDS: Oh, I, I am really, ah, excited about what we're gonna be proposing. right now, ah, we are closing out a work group to end punitive seq. We have about 90, ah, 90-some-odd people in, ah, punitive seq. It is a tool the department uses. And what we're gonna be proposing, ah, is what all the experts call for, right? model will, will eliminate extreme isolation. model will include a pathway back into general population, so a person can earn their way back into general population. The reasons for movement out of general population will be very defined, so everybody will know what they are. And then the goal would be to work with people to understand the underlying issues that, that perpetuated the behavior that harmed somebody and called for the removal from general population. So to work on those underlying, ah, issues so that when the person ends up back in general population they're able to live without harming. So we are wrapping up that work. We are preparing a memo now, ah, to the board and the board

3

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

1314

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: We have not met, but your story is so compelling. Congratulations to you on your story, on your many successes, on your triumphs, ah, and for being with us today. Ah, what a great story, great story.

STANLEY RICHARDS: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Um, I just have, um, maybe one question, maybe two. Um, my, my, my mother is a retired, um, captain from Correction. Correction is very near and dear to my heart. I know several of my colleagues have heard me say this a million times. Um, my son-in-law, my son-in-law is an officer. Um, I have a very good friend of mine who is actually very high in, in the, in DOC, and I'm very concerned about, ah, COVID, ah, amongst everyone there. Um, I'm, I'm not quite sure that I'm convinced that, um, CHS and DOC have appropriately handled the situation in the past. I hear that my son-in-law may possibly have COVID for a second time, um, at, at this moment, um, and, ah, the person that I mentioned, the other person I'm very close to, got COVID very early on, um, ah, you know, around, ah, April or so and had to be rushed to the hospital. Thank God she is fine now. But I'm not very sure

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

that I'm convinced that there's a handle on the situation, that there's a handle on the spread, that there is even that, and I hate to put it that way, but I will, that, ah, prioritization of concern, um, for the pandemic within the system over at Riker's, within the walls, um, of Riker's, and, ah, I'm very, very concerned. We mentioned a second wave, but I don't think we ever got out of the first wave. So, ah, before we can even speak about a second wave I think that we have to get a handle on the first wave that continues. So I, I think I just need to hear from you again, um, in the way that you just articulated it, ah, so well, just a little bit more of your thought on how you will be instrumental to making people like me more comfortable with the situation there, um, and, and the concern that we have with regard to not just those that are, that are detained, but also our loved ones who are working within those four walls as well.

STANLEY RICHARDS: Absolutely. Thank you for that, for that question, Councilwoman. And, and you're absolutely right. The role of the board, and we've been playing this role throughout this

25 pandemic, has been to hold the department and CHS

1 AND ELECTIONS 2 accountable. In every one of our monthly meetings we have COVID-19 on our agenda and we are asking the 3 4 department, just as the City Council has been asking 5 the department, for a comprehensive plan about how 6 they're going to handle COVID. And what we have been 7 saying to them is that we ought to be focusing on the officers and all of the civilians who come into the 8 facility, because the reality of it is, is that we 9 need to ensure that they're OK because they are 10 connected and they are the ones who's connected to 11 12 the outside that could potentially bring the, the virus on the inside. So we ought to be have a robust 13 14 testing program for the officers. We ought to be 15 having a robust isolation and, and support program 16 for the officers. I've heard from the officers, and 17 this is where I hear different from the officers than 18 I hear from the commissioner. Officers say they don't have adequate PPE equipment and what I hear 19 20 from the commissioner is that every officer has PPE equipment. What we've seen from Genetech, which is 21 2.2 the tool we use to be a monitor, we've seen 23 inconsistent usage of the PPE, particularly face 24 masks, of officers. We've seen them with their face

mask under their chin or face mask not on. And, and

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES 1 AND ELECTIONS 2 what, what we need to do is to be able to hold the department accountable to ensure that the officers 3 are the ones who are really being tested and being 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20

21

2.2

23

24

25

cared for because they pose more of a risk to people on the inside than anybody else because they're going in and out of the facilitate. And, and you're right. We have not gotten a response from the department to say here's our robust plan. What they've done is they've, they said they've offered testing to the officers, any officer can get tested. But they should have a much more robust program. It shouldn't be if you, if you want to get tested. If you're working in the facility, where you're, where you're working next to, ah, detained people or other civilians, they should have some kind of testing protocol to ensure that people are not, um, ah, transmitting the virus. They ought to make sure that PPE mandatory, no question about it, you got to wear your mask. And I think the commissioner last week put out a tele order, ah, saying that if officers are found not to wear their mask they will be, um, held accountable. So I think she's taking a, a stronger stance on that. But we ought to be doing that, and that should be laid out in a plan that's presented to

1

4

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2 the City Council, that is presented to the Board of Corrections, and what we're gonna do is we're gonna 3 hold them accountable. We're gonna make sure it's in 5 the public domain at our hearings, ah, and we're gonna be holding Department of Corrections and CHS 6

accountable for, for ensuring the safety of everyone.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much, ah, for that answer. Um, it, it, really, if we had more, ah, like-minded, thoughtful folks like you, um, present and accounted for, um, actually being able to lay this out, um, people that have come from, ah, where you have come from, like stories, like yours, I think that we would be in much better shape, and I think that a lot of what you just relayed, um, is endemic not just with DOC, but also at NYPD is also, also which we have seen, um, and the nonadherence to the protocols. So I thank you again for your testimony and, ah, wish you much success.

> STANLEY RICHARDS: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: All right. Next up we have Council Member Powers, and if any other council members wish to ask questions of Mr. Richards please use the raise hand function in Zoom.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Hi, there. Nice 3 to see everybody. Thank you for your testimony and

4 nice to see you. We, we speak often in our, in our

5 respective roles. But, um, wanted to ask you, just

6 on the solitary punitive segregation rule-making, do

7 you have a sense of what the timing might be, what,

8 both from the, you're on the task force and the

9 board, so where, ah, what that timing might be, or

10 | looking like when it comes to putting out new rule-

11 making?

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

November.

STANLEY RICHARDS: Yes. So I am trying to close out the work group, ah, work. We're finalizing a memo. I'm hoping to do that by the end of this week. Hoping to get, um, the recommendations to Chair Austin, ah, and the mayor at City Hall by, ah, next week. Ah, the board is working on a timeline to be able to get, ah, to review the recommendations, to incorporate those recommendations into the rule package and get that to Law, ah, for certification, ah, sometime early in, ah, ah, November. Ah, and then giving the public an opportunity to review it, as we made that commitment, and then, ah, signing off on it in, sometime in

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

1516

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: OK, so you'll hold a public hearing on that with, ah, I think

usually it's like 10 days, or 10 days of...

STANLEY RICHARDS: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: ...published? OK.

Thank you for the. Um, I'll, I'll, only, I, I, a number of colleagues asked my questions already, including, ah, Council Member Adams on PPE and COVID preparation and Council Member Koslowitz, Chair Koslowitz, with regard to the other issues around punitive segregation. But I'll just add that, you know, ah, I'll add support for, ah, Stanley Richards, which is that during my time as the chair of the committee, ah, both as his role in the Fortune Society, but also on the task force on punitive segregation and as a board member has been, um, we've gone to Riker's Island together, we've taken tours of the facilities together and he's been a helpful voice and I think good appointee for this, ah, for this body to have because I think he takes his job seriously. I think he's thoughtful and he's not onetrack-minded. He really tries to see the various, ah, issues from the different stakeholders here. I think he is worth our, um, continuing to be our

COMN	MITTEE	ON	RULES,	PRIVILEGES
AND ELECTIONS				

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

nominee on the board. So I just want to add my voice of support for him and, ah, I will be planning to vote on him, ah, in support of his nomination.

STANLEY RICHARDS: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Koslowitz, there are no other council members who wish to speak.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: OK, thank you. Um, now, ah, thank you, Mr. Richards. We will now move to the Board of Elections. The Board of Elections consists of 10 commissioners, two from each of the city's five counties. Each commissioner serves a term of four years or until a successor is appointed. Commissioners shall be registered voters in the county for which they are appointed, and registered as a member of the political party for which they are nominated. New York City Election Law, Section 3-204, Subsection 1, states that at least 30 days before the first day of January of any year in which a commissioner of elections is to be appointed the chairman or secretary of the appropriate party, county committee, shall file a certificate of party recommendation with the clerk of the appropriate local legislative body. New York Election Law, Section 3-204, Subsection 4, states

1

25

2 that commissioners of election shall be appointed by the county legislative body or in the City of New 3 4 York by the City Council. It is for this reason that the Rules Committee is considering this nomination 5 today. The Queens County Board of Elections 6 7 submitted a valid certificate of party recommendation on October 1, 2020. This was more than 30 days 8 before the first day of January of the year in which 9 the commissioners are appointed. If the council as a 10 whole does not act within 30 days of receiving a 11 12 valid certificate of recommendation the applicable political party conference within the council becomes 13 14 empowered to approve the recommendation on its own. 15 For example, a Democratic vacancy would be filled by 16 a vote of the Democratic Party's conference and a Republican vacancy would be filled by a vote of the 17 18 Republican Party's conference. Finally, New York Election Law, Section 3-204, Subsection 4, states 19 20 that if a party fails to file the certificate within the time prescribed by this section, the members of 21 2.2 the legislative body who are members of such party 23 may appointment any eligible person to such office. However, in this case the Queens Democratic Party 24

filed a timely certificate of recommendation.

1

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 board and its commissioners are responsible for maintenance and administration of voting records and 3 elections. The board also exercises quasi-judicial 4 5 powers by conducting hearings to validate nominating petitions of candidates for nomination to elected 6 7 office. The board is required to make an annual report of its affairs and proceedings to the council. 8 Commissioners receive a \$300 per diem for each day's 9 10 attendance at meetings of the board or any of its committees, with the maximum of \$30,000 per year. 11 12 Welcome, Mr. Aragio, and will you please your right

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning. Do you swear to the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

JOSE ARAGIO: I do.

hand to be sworn in?

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Do you wish to make a statement?

JOSE ARAGIO: Yes, thank you. Good
afternoon, everyone. Um, I'd like to take this
opportunity to thank the members of the committee for
taking time to consider my nomination for
reappointment as the Queens County Democratic
commissioner for the Board of Elections for the

1 AND ELECTIONS 2 upcoming term. It has been a pleasure to have been the Democratic commissioner for Queens County since 3 4 I've been appointed to the board's transition 5 from [inaudible] to the election equipment that we 6 have to date. This equipment has improved the voting 7 process for the citizens of New York. During my time with the board I've been part of a change within the 8 agency, which has improved the availability of a 9 citizen to exercise one of the most important 10 fundamental rights, the right to vote. I believe 11 12 voting provides an opportunity for a person to express their beliefs, concerns, and ultimately 13 14 change their future for their choice of elected. 15 the course of my tenure as the Queens County 16 Democratic commissioner I have through my roles in 17 the Ballot Committee and the Public Outreach 18 Committee advocated [inaudible] that have improved the voting process and information to the voter. 19 20 addition, the board's implementation of early voting again has served as an overall effort to inform and 21 2.2 provide the voter with an opportunity to exercise 23 their right to vote. While this is just a small 24 example of changes that have been instituted since my

original appointment there are countless changes

1

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 which have effectively the voting process an easier

3 and successful process. I believe that with the

4 present atmosphere and the courage of the citizens

5 the possibility of changing the way to vote, the way

6 voting is conducted is just beginning. I will have

7 and always have advocated for a process that

8 guarantees confidence in the voting process and in

9 the election results, and I hope to be a part of that

10 mission for the next four years. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. Now we're going to go the floor. We're gonna open the floor of the committee for any questions or comments concerning the candidate, starting, the Speaker, is the Speaker here?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: No, he's not here yet.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: OK. Um, then I have a few questions. What steps do you think the Board of Elections should take to ensure the efficient and accurate certification of this November's general election with a large increase in absentee ballots from prior years?

JOSE ARAGIO: Ah, I think the board has begin, has begun taking the process of implementing

certification process.

presented by the executive management in other

counties as to how we, we actually expedite the, ah,

25

24

2.2

the commissioner?

_ _

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Um, have you seen an increase in voter participation since you've been

JOSE ARAGIO: Absolutely, we have. We've seen a large amount of voter participation, um, especially now with social media, um, the people are really actually advocating with change in the present climate of what's going on in a political environment has attributed and contributed to that, ah, and is very appreciated. I mean, we had, when I first started there was, it was, I think it was a 20% voter turnout and the numbers have increasingly gone up more and more as each election passes.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: What policies would you suggest to better professionalize poll workers?

JOSE ARAGIO: Um, I, we have within the board had communications with the appropriate agency heads to try to, um, take advantage of municipal workers. Um, I think the use of municipal workers, professionalized municipal workers, as poll workers would really assist on Election Day, um, and allow us to implement other things that are already present in the election [inaudible] which shifts [inaudible]

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

2 nature, of that nature. Our biggest problem is actually retaining and employing over 30,000 poll 3 workers on Election Day and now for early voting. 4 5 Um, unfortunately we try to train these, ah, these 6 individuals and sometimes they don't show up for the 7 election site, which creates problems in staffing. believe the, the use of municipal workers would 8 assist us in having a set group of individuals who 9

are willing to work on Election Day that we can be, that can be counted on.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. was a massive vendor error for absentee ballots sent to voters in Kings County. The vendor was selected on a no-bid contract. Do you think the contracted selection process should be strengthened to avoid mistakes like this in the future?

JOSE ARAGIO: Ah, I absolutely do believe that the contracts, um, system should be changed and modernized to allow for such errors not to occur. Um, I had indicated, um, to the other commissioners that I would not be opposed to holding this particular vendor, ah, really accountable for the mistake that he did, other than him paying for the,

2.2

the, the remailing of the ballots. Um, provided that
we have other vendors to, ah, to do those services.

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. Ah,
Counsel, I'll turn over to you. Are any hands raised
for questions?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. Council Member Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much, and welcome, um, Mr. Aragio. Very nice to see you this morning, and thank you for your service to BOE. Ah, we know, ah, how everyone loves that job so well, so we thank you so much for your commitment [laughs]...

JOSE ARAGIO: [laughs]

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: ...to want to continue. Um, my question really revolves around education and training, um, with, with BOE. So I was curious, ah, just to dig a little bit more into your response when it comes to legislative reforms, particularly around ranked-choice voting, um, and to know your thoughts. Ah, per your response to the initial question was that, um, you believe that the Board of Elections, ah, will meet the requirements, um, with regard to the implementation of ranked-

2.2

voting population.

choice voting, and then it says as we've done with all of our prior obligations with respect to the implementation of changes in the law, i.e. early voting. Early voting is my favorite thing to do in life, by the way. I just want to put that out there. Um, but with regard, again, to, ah, to RCV, um, it's noted that the BOE actually missed the chartermandated June 1, 2020, planning deadline for ranked-choice voting, so, um, so that was, their commitment was not met. So I need some assurance that there will be better education going, ah, going forward, ah, and that there will be adherence, um, to training and education when it comes to ranked-choice voting, which promises to be, ah, very perplexing to the

JOSE ARAGIO: I, I appreciate that question and I, I agree with your sentiment, um, that ranked-choice voting is the next step in the frontier of the Board of Elections. Um, there is a commitment from my end to make sure that our staff is actually trained, um, with respect to the programs and the, the process for ranked-choice voting. It's my understanding that the executive management and the appropriate management teams have requested an

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

extension of time to move those, that deadline that you referred to. And, in fact, it was, um, met after the extension. It's also my understanding that executive management is actually having current discussions and I believe there's a meeting set for this week, if not today definitely tomorrow, with the State Board of Elections regarding ranked-choice voting and the implementation thereof. Our board has taken pride in taking poll worker training to the next level and employee training to the next level, with specifically with poll workers who have actually started online training course for Election Day and other procedures that we need, and we hope to implement that as well with ranked-choice voting as we become more familiarized with the program and exactly what's gonna happen to us. But I do fully expect that we'll be implementing it coming up in 2021.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: OK. Thank you very much, um, for the explanation. I appreciate that. I don't have any further questions. Thank you.

JOSE ARAGIO: Thank you.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Counsel, is there anyone else?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. Council Member Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Hi, how are you?

JOSE ARAGIO: Good morning, how are you?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Um, you can see how good I am on Zoom. I forgot to unmute. Um, ah, I want to thank you, you know, for your service to, um, the Board of Elections, especially during, you know, some very trying times. You know, my concern, um, beside ranked voting, um, is the fact that, um, we've seen, um, when there is an increase in volume that, ah, the Board of Elections, um, often experiences, you know, difficulties and, um, the volume, ah, promises to be, you know, much higher than we've seen in previous elections. And, um, I, I just want to understand, you know, it seems like when we introduce new equipment into, um, the, the process that, um, we experience glitches and errors and, um, and things that I feel could have been avoided had we, um, added these, you know, the equipment or whatever in a, in a more timely manner. What safeguards have, have been put in place to ensure that, um, the increase, ah,

2.2

[inaudible].

machines that you, you brought in to count the, um, the, the increase in ballots, you know, what assurances do we have that we're not gonna have some sort of fiasco, um, like we saw in, you know, a previous election? Um, what safeguards are there, ah, especially when we introduce new equipment and things into the process, you know, pretty late

UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED: Is it the computer or is the link?

JOSE ARAGIO: To answer your question, I believe the equipment that we've putting in, Clear Ballot has actually, was put in after the June election, so we had enough time to work out some of the issues that may come across with that, with that equipment. However, it's my understanding that all equipment that the board, um, owns or purchases is certified, ah, or, or has to be certified by an appropriate agency and I believe in this case it would be the state board. The board puts out a contract for the requirements and then based on that equipment that we receive it should have already been certified, and I believe by the state board, ah, to

2.2

make sure that the equipment is, ah, is gonna serve its purpose. Um, unfortunately, like most things, when you, when you, when you purchase it you start realizing what the issues are. But I believe with appropriate staffing and having technicians who are familiar with the equipment, and also our contracts do include that, ah, a service contract, ah, with the vendor to troubleshoot programs that we may have with the equipment as it's happening.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Well, um, I, I'm hoping that, you know, we, we don't experience any of, of those issues. Um, I'm, I'm hoping that, you know, the troubleshooting has taken place prior to, you know, the, the election. Um, I also, I'm concerned about ranked-choice voting, um, as is my colleague, ah, Adrienne Adams, and, and the education of the public and, and when is that going to happen? It's quite a complex situation and it's often, it's one that's difficult for those of who are a bit conversant with, you know, with the process. So, um, ah, is there a timeline for when this, um, information is going to get out to the public? And, and, um, how are we going to, you know, sort of educate them on, on this process?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

JOSE ARAGIO: Ah, we, as a board of 10 commissioners, we haven't been briefed yet by executive management with respect to the, the public outreach portion of the ranked-choice voting. however, I do expect, as we have done in the past with the VS200s and any new equipment that comes out, we, we hold public meetings when we try to inform the public as much as possible. We do have, um, our website, which actually provides as much information as possible, um, and we're actually starting to implement the use of videos to explain things to people. I, I was just on the website this morning and I saw a whole bunch of different [inaudible] regarding the absentee ballot, tracking your ballot, the, the board is taking more of a position where we're trying to inform the public as much as possible, do as many [inaudible] as possible. we've accepted and, and encompassed the use of social media and I believe that that will probably be part of our messaging, um, messaging, ah, protocol, and we do have a public outreach committee that, that, that responsibility falls upon them to make recommendations to us, the rest of the commissioners, as to how we should proceed with that, and I, I do

2.2

believe that's part of their agenda as I heard, ah, some [inaudible] with respect to wanting to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Um, what's the, the advent of COVID and, and the need to social distance, that has created some, um, challenges for the Board of Elections in terms of space. Um, are we, are we prepared to handle the volume of people that we, um, anticipate coming out to vote and, and still being able to maintain, you know, the social distancing requirements?

JOSE ARAGIO: Yes. Right now in the City of New York we have a, we're gonna have over 1200, ah, poll sites. We have over 88 early voting sites. We're hoping that people will available themselves of using the early voting sites for those, that period of time and allow for social distancing. In addition, the high volume of absentee requests will also assist with that. Um, and, and we've taken the appropriate measures within the poll site as we actually conducted an election in March, which was canceled, and we did a June primary and we, ah, we were able to allow and, and allow our poll workers to work safely and also protect the public. Um, so I, I do believe we have implemented those things. We've

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

expediting the line process.

2.2

seen what worked and what hasn't worked, and we're actually changing that to, to try to make these better. And also I just, as a side note, the board is also, um, publicizing the use for the website and in our meetings the use of the Fast Pass and also the card that was sent in a mailer to allow for more contactless voting, um, and we're encouraging these things as much as possible, and also in the hopes of

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Hopefully you just remind people to actually open that because traditionally people just kind of disregard it. Um, I, I think there should be some special attention paid to remind people to actually go in there, because there's, you know, the Fast Pass is, you know, a part of that mailer. Um, and my last question is, you know, um, about, what are we doing to ensure the public about the integrity of the safety of the absentee, um, ballots and, um, the integrity of the, the absentee ballots?

JOSE ARAGIO: Well, the canvassing procedure is actually open to elected officials or candidates, and open to the public and the press.

Ah, we also have poll watchers that appear and

CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

through four remaining quickly, as Chair Koslowitz

AND ELECTIONS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

runs a tight ship. Ah, so the first, ah, do you support using technology to improve access to voting? In particular, I authored Local Law 65 of 2016 to provide an absentee ballot tracker, which took four years to implement, and Local Law 238 of 2017 for online voter registration, which has not been implemented. Why haven't my laws been implemented timely or at all, and will you commit to do so?

JOSE ARAGIO: Ah, I, I will commit to do Um, I, I do believe that those, those requests or, or changes in the law will ultimately benefit and have benefitted, as evidenced in the June primary and in this primary, ah, to avail the voters an opportunity to actually exercise their right to vote. Um, ah, the, the reason for the delay for the online voter registration was a partisan issue that ran all the way up from the state board where the Board of Commissioners, the city Board of Commissioners, could not get a legal, an opinion, ah, for or against a, a technical issue whether or not a signature, needed a wet signature requirement or a signature was sufficient in the form captured by the electronic process. Ah, I believe that the executive order signed by the governor, ah, in this last, ah,

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

2.2

election took that out of the equation and then allowed us to implement, ah, the absentee ballot tracking and ballot requests, and as indicated earlier we have over 730,000, ah, absentee ballot requests and we're in the process of, of getting those out to the public as soon as possible, and we're over 90% compliance with respect to that. I'm all for, ah, online registration in, in as many places as possible, and, ah, the board accepting that and mandating that through our process as long as we're able to provide verification for the information of the voter, I'm a hundred percent for that.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: The Board of Elections is widely criticized for its patronage.

I've authored Introduction 1248 of 2016, which would mandate [inaudible] jobs so that anyone can apply.

Regardless if I'm able to pass this legislation, would you commit to posting all jobs at the Queens Board of Elections?

JOSE ARAGIO: Ah, the jobs at the Board of Elections as, as the council members are aware, are created through the New York State Constitution. Ah, it, the jobs have, the Board of Elections has to

44 1 AND ELECTIONS 2 have an equal representation of all Democratic and Republican, ah, members in order to assure a fair 3 process. Um, I have instituted as a Democratic 4 5 commissioner within my, within my borough, um, the 6 availability to hire as many qualified people as 7 possible. We look at different avenues to obtain those candidates, from, ah, nominations from the 8 party organization through the internet, through, ah, 9 newspaper, ah, requests or, or advertisements for 10 technical positions, from poll workers, from existing 11 12 workers. So I, I believe that I have instituted and the board will institute, ah, if, if a majority of 13 14 the commissioners so desire, ah, I have included a 15 robust, ah, avenue of, of obtaining qualified 16 candidates for positions with the Board of Elections. Um, I don't presently, the board actually does have 17 18 on their website a job vacancy and we do list our technical positions. Um, I'm, I'm not for at this 19 20 moment, um, putting the jobs on the city website. Um, as I stated before, I believe the state board is 21 2.2 run by the Constitution and, um, I don't believe that 23 we should be advertising our jobs on the state, excuse me, on the city website. However, I, I'm for 24

putting our jobs on the board's website and ensuring

7

8

a fair process in the hiring and, ah, standardized,

ah, qualifications for all employees and a

standardized review of that application. The

determination of whether or not someone is qualified

6 should not be ad hoc based on different counties.

Um, in addition to alleviate the, the question of nepotism, um, I have instructed in Queens County my

9 chief and the appropriate manager to actually do the

10 | interviews of the resumes and of the potential

11 candidates and then make a recommendation to me and

12 my Republican counterpart for that person's job. And

13 | I have on occasion, ah, they have on occasion not

14 recommended, irregardless of where they came from,

and I've actually not hired, ah, county, ah,

16 candidates, ah, for that purpose. And also, in

17 addition, I also had vacancies, a limited amount of

18 vacancies in the general office and whenever I have,

19 ah, submitted a request for someone to be, ah,

20 interviewed I then allow the appropriate manager in

21 that general office to make that interview and make a

22 recommendation to myself. Ah, so I rely heavily on,

23 oh, absolutely, on the recommendation of my chief

24 and/or managers on the hiring process.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you, and you touched on it in your previous answer, but the Department of Investigations found incidents of nepotism at the Board of Elections, including a violation [inaudible] conflicts of interest board through you yourself. Can you share what happened and whether you paid the fine and would you commit to following and enforcing the [inaudible] nepotism?

JOSE ARAGIO: Absolutely. I, I am one hundred percent for enforcing the rules. Um, in, in 2012, as I was getting close to my reappointment, I was informed by, ah, Mr. Davis, Chuck Davis, ah, whether I not I had received a waiver for hiring, ah, you know, Rajo, my spouse, as a temporary employee. Um, upon notification that I needed a waiver, I immediately fired her since I did not have the waiver. Um, and again, this came up as part of the reappointment process. Um, subsequently some time after, I think it was a year or two afterwards, I, I actually, ah, entered into a disposition with the Campaign Finance Board. I paid the fine and I readily admit that I was unfortunately, I, I made a mistake, um, and I was, unfortunately the mistake was relied on based on information given to me by the

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

personnel director at that time that it was, it was fine. Ultimately, the responsibility was mine to do a little bit more due diligence. As a result of that, um, I have encouraged and we have created processes to try to prevent other commissioners or other employees from making the mistake that I made. Ah, we now provide the policy and procedures to not only the, the hired staff but new commissioners now receive that. I never got a policy and procedure quide as I became a commissioner. I make sure that new commissioners now get that so they don't make the same mistake. In addition, when I was the president of the board in 2014 we again reaffirmed our, ah, procedures with respect to anti-corruption and nepotism and we actually post those, our procedures are posted on the website. Um, I also have implemented the use of a questionnaire in the hiring process in Queens County, which has incorporated some of the recommendations by the DOI in their report.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. My last question, I thank the chair for her indulgence, most elections in New York City have few lines, but every four years we have presidential elections and the number one complaint is long lines. And during a

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

pandemic that could be a serious deterrent to voting, what will you do as commissioner to eliminate these long lines? Would you support splitting up so-called super poll sites? Do you have other solutions or proposals?

JOSE ARAGIO: Ah, the issue with the

super poll sites is as, as the board has made abundantly clear, is the availability to have accessible poll sites where we can reduce the number of [inaudible]. Ah, I'm always open to finding as many poll sites that are accessible and ADA compliant to allow that to happen. But the immediate steps that we've taken right now is, um, the use of the Fast Pass, the information card. We've actually hired, ah, the board has a plan to hire line managers who will pull people out of the line and send them to the EDA, the correct EDA table, in order so that they could vote. They will, you know, we've done it with, ah, early voting. We used that as a step to allow us to try to reduce the amount of people coming out on Election Day. The absentee ballots, of course, ah, will also reduce that amount. But we're totally committed to trying to reduce that number and have

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Matteo.

24

1	COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES 50 AND ELECTIONS			
2	MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: I'm voting, ah,			
3	respectfully, no on 255 and 1467, and yes on the			
4	other things.			
5	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: I'm sorry,			
6	Councilman, just one more time? My apologies.			
7	MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Can you hear me,			
8	Billy?			
9	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yes, my			
10	apologies. One more time, I'm sorry.			
11	MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: That's OK. No			
12	on 255, 1467.			
13	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: OK.			
14	MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: And aye on the			
15	other one. Thank you.			
16	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: OK. Thank you.			
17	Lancman.			
18	COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yes.			
19	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rose.			
20	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes. Aye on both.			
21	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Torres.			
22	Treyger. Adams.			
23	COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Congratulations to			
24	Mr. Richards and Mr. Aragio. I vote aye on all.			

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

1	COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES 51 AND ELECTIONS			
2	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN:			
3	SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on both.			
4	UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.			
5	UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.			
6	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: M-255 is adopted			
7	by the committee, 5 in the affirmative, 1 in the			
8	negative, and no abstentions.			
9	UNIDENTIFIED: Billy?			
10	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yes?			
11	UNIDENTIFIED: Um, can we, Council Member			
12	Treyger will be joining us shortly.			
13	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: OK, I can, want			
14	to wait or announce? I can announce the vote now and			
15	call in later, or I can wait, or he's coming in right			
16	now? OK.			
17	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Why don't we hold the			
18	vote open?			
19	CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Where is he,			
20	Treyger? What happened here?			
21	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Mr. Clerk?			
22	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yes?			
23	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We may have Council			
24	Member Torres back.			

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: And Council
3 Member [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member

Torres?

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Hold on.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.

Council Member Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Ah, yes, and I, I appreciate the chair's, ah, and the committee's time. I simultaneously have a call with Dr. Long, ah, with regards to testing strategy in schools, all at the same time. So, so my apologies. I just wanted just to thank the chair, ah, Karen Koslowitz, and, and the entire committee for their, for their work and making sure that folks have an opportunity to, to get the information which they have. I just want to, just before I vote, just to reemphasize again the importance of language access, the importance of interpreters at, at poll sites, including Russian speaking. Ah, this has been an issue that's deeply, deeply personal to me and folks I represent, um, and I, I really just want to underscore that. Ah, and with that I do vote aye,

1	COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES 53 AND ELECTIONS			
2	and I thank the chair again for her leadership and			
3	for her time. Thank you.			
4	COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you. M-			
5	255 with a vote of 7 in the affirmative, 1 in the			
6	negative, and no abstentions, and M-256 with a vote			
7	of 8 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and no			
8	abstentions. Both items have been adopted by the			
9	committee. Thank you.			
10	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you.			
11	CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: This committee is			
12	adjourned.			
13	UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you, everyone.			
14	JOHANNA CASTRO: Thank you, Chair. Um,			
15	the live has ended and we ended this hearing.			
16	UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you very much,			
17	council members.			
18	UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you, congratulations			
19	to both.			
20	CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Yes.			
21	UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.			
22				
23				

	GOMATERED ON DULING		E 4
1	COMMITTEE ON RULES, AND ELECTIONS	PRIVILEGES	54
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date ____October 25, 2020