CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

October 13, 2020 Start: 1:09 p.m. Recess: 3:33 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing

B E F O R E: Robert Cornegy CHAIRPERSON

Daniel Dromm CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Margaret S. Chin

Carlina Rivera Helen Rosenthal

Bill Perkins

Mark Gjonaj

Fernando Cabrera

Ritchie J. Torres

Farah N. Louis

Keith Powers

Diana Ayala

Vanessa L. Gibson

Francisco Moya

Barry Grodenchik

Rory I. Lancman

Jimmy Van Bramer Adrienne E. Adams Karen Koslowitz Laurie A. Cumbo Alicka Ampry-Samuel Steven Matteo

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Joseph Fucito, Sheriff City of New York

Annette Hill, Register City of New York

Jill Mariana, Senior Investigative Counsel Manhattan District Attorney Office

Joseph Sant, Deputy General Counsel Center for New York Neighborhoods

Beth Finkel, State Director AARP

Jenny Eisenberg, Senior Staff Attorney in the Foreclosure Prevention Project Brooklyn Legal Services

Lucy Block, Research and Policy Associate ANHD

Rose Marie Cantanno, Associate Director of Consumer Protection Unit New York Legal Assistance Group

Alexa Sloan
Coalition for Community Advancement

Jennifer Levy, Attorney Legal Aid Society Erobos Abzu Lamastu, New York City Resident

Paula Segal, Senior Staff Attorney Take Root Justice

Avi Gross, New York City Resident

Richard Flateau, New York City Resident

Randall Cobb, New York City Resident

Jessica Franco, New York City Resident

Hannah Anousheh, Staff Coordinator East New York Community Land Trust

Debra Ack

East New York Community Land Trust

Andrea Grenville

East New York Community Land Trust

Albert Scott

East New York Community Land Trust

Sarah Hack, New York City Resident

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH  COMMITTEE ON FINANCE  6
2	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good afternoon. At this
3	time, will Sergeants please start their recordings.
4	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The back up is on.
5	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you.
6	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: PC recording is running.
7	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. And at this
8	time, will Sergeant Bradley please start his opening
9	statement?
10	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Okay. Good afternoon
11	and welcome to today's New York City Council hearing
12	of the Committee on Housing and Buildings joint with
13	the Committee of Finance. At this time, will all
14	panelists please turn on their videos? To minimize
15	disruption, please place electronic devices on
16	vibrate or on silent mode. If you wish to submit a
17	testimony, you may do so at
18	testimony@Council.NYC.gov. Again, that is
19	testimony@Council.NYC,.gov. Thank you for your
20	cooperation and we may begin.
21	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Let's gavel in
22	here.
23	[gavel]
24	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Good afternoon.
25	I'm Council member Robert Cornegy, Chair of the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE Committee on Housing and buildings. I want to thank Chair Dromm from the Committee on Finance and other committee members for joining this hearing titled Oversight, examining the city's deed theft and deed fraud crisis. Deed theft and deed fraud are nearing crisis level inn neighborhoods like Bedford-Stuyvesant and Crown Heights, both of which fall in my district. Deed theft can take different forms. fake deed can be created, a homeowner's signature forged, and a faked deed with the forged signature can be recorded. The forger can then borrow against the property, sell it, or even go so far as to evict the rightful owner. In some cases where a property has been left vacant by the owner, the property can be transferred without the owner's knowledge. Another type of deed theft occurs when a scammer convinces a homeowner to sign their property owner over, for example, in the context of a foreclosure rescue scam. A scammer will reach out to a homeowner facing foreclosure, offering to rescue them in exchange for their signature on documents. homeowner doesn't realize that, but by signing these documents, they are signing away their own homes. October 2019 article in the New York Times

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE highlighted these deed theft and deed fraud crisis and told stories of people who were victims of deed theft and deed fraud. One woman, Bordis Baez [sp?], was tricked into selling her family's home worth 1.2 million for 120,000. These purchasers were later arrested intending to flip her home and resell it. In another situation, a homeowner facing foreclosure was convinced to sign an agreement he believed was a preliminary sales agreement, but which, in fact, led to the unwitting sale of his home. With the COVID-19 pandemic and the resulting mass unemployment, many more homeowners will end up vulnerable to deed theft and deed fraud. Today, the committees will hear from the Department of finance and the Department of Housing preservation and Development to learn about the city's efforts to prevent deed theft and deed fraud. We will also be hearing three resolutions The first resolution, 1427, calls that I sponsor. upon the New York State legislature to pass and lack of undertow side legislation that reforms New York State notary laws. Faulty notarization can be found in nearly every complaint of deed theft and deed fraud. Unwitting notaries have played a role in deed theft by notarizing documents without the signatory

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE being present or by notarizing documents presented by an imposter claiming to represent the homeowner. resolution would require background checks, fingerprinting, and training courses for notaries. The resolution would also require notaries to file official bonds to pay for the damages, should they commit any wrongdoings. Resolution 1429 calls upon the New York State legislature to pass and the governor designed legislation that would place more stringent standards on Corporation names that mimic or otherwise resemble government agencies. theft perpetrators will use names that sound like they belong to a government agency, lulling homeowners into a sense of trust and leading them to sign documents that unwittingly cause them to ultimately lose their homes. Finally, resolution 1430 will call upon the New York State legislator to pass the governor designed a bill that would designate all of Brooklyn as a cease-and-desist zone. As a result of this designation, homeowners in Brooklyn could place their names on a list that would bar them from harassment by speculators. I would like to thank my colleagues from the housing and buildings and finance committees present today. I

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

```
COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
1
                                                       10
    COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
2
    see Francisco Moya, Alika Samuel, Margaret Chin,
3
    Danny Dromm, of course. I mentioned before. Helen
4
    Rosenthal, Adrian Adams. Am I missing anybody?
    Farah Louis. I see somebody waving, but I can't see
5
    who that is. My buddy Fernando Cabrera from the
6
7
    Bronx. Am I missing anyone? That is all I can see
    from my screen. I apologize if I missed someone.
8
         I see Karen Koslowitz waving the vehemently in
    the background. Hey, Karen. Rory Lancman is also
10
11
    present. And, with fact, I would like to thank all
    the advocates and New Yorkers who shared their
12
13
    experiences with me and my colleagues as we worked to
14
    develop these measures. Your insights have been and
15
    will continue to be invaluable as we work to stop
    deed theft and deed fraud. We will now hear from the
16
17
    infamous or famous committee Chair-- depending on
18
    who you ask. Chair of finance, my colleague and
19
    friend, Danny Dromm.
20
                CHAIRPERSON DROMM:
                                      I hope that that
21
    infamous is because I'm causing trouble.
2.2
                CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY:
                                      Absolutely, Danny.
2.3
                CHAIRPERSON DROMM:
                                      All right.
                                                   Thank
    you. Thank you, Chair Cornegy. I am Daniel Dromm
24
```

and I am the Chair of the Finance Committee. We have

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 11 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE just been reminded of the human devastation that deed theft and deed fraud is causing, especially in central and eastern Brooklyn and in southern Queens. Decades of rising property values, the foreclosure crisis, and now the desperation caused by COVID-19, together, are making homeowners they are especially vulnerable. Back in February 2016, under then Chair Jalissa Farraris Copeland, the Committee on Finance convened an oversight hearing to better understand the cities deed theft and deed fraud crisis with a special emphasis on the efforts by the administration to combat the problem. At that hearing, we learned of the efforts by the city register to identify document fraud and by the city sheriff to investigate it and about the Department of Finance's notice of recorded document program to inform homeowners wherever there are filings against the property. also learned of the state legislative proposal supported by the registrar and Sheriff that would enhance their abilities to combat the underlying problems and to help victims. Since then, the Council has taken action, including codifying the Notice Recorded Document Program and expanding it by making it an opt out program, rather than one that

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 12 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 required registration by the homeowner. Today, we are hearing legislation I have sponsored, Intro 3 4 number 1919 that will additionally require the Department of Finance to include in its recorded document notifications, information on actions the 6 7 interested party can take if such person suspects 8 that a fraudulent document recording has occurred, and including information about who to contact for assistance, to file for complaint, or to report an 10 11 alleged criminal violation. We also require the 12 Department of Finance to give quarterly reports about 13 the utilization of this program, as well as, on referrals to the sheriff regarding suspected deed 14 15 fraud. From this deed fraud referral data, we have 16 plenty of evidence that deed fraud continues today 17 concerningly high levels. Accordingly, deed fraud 18 rightfully continues to attract much attention. December 2018, and investigator grand jury convened 19 20 by Manhattan district Attorney Cyrus Vance released a 21 report of its own that made recommendations for legal 2.2 In March 2019, the state legislature 2.3 convened its own joint hearing at Brooklyn Borough Hall to examine the crisis facing homeowners in 24

Brooklyn and throughout New York City, including the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 13 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE problem of deed theft. After a troubling report on deed theft in Brooklyn, published by the New York Times last October, Governor Andrew Cuomo directed the state Department of financial Services on Tuesday to look into the many instant sales of deed theft and deed fraud affecting communities of color. Finally, the Attorney General Leticia James has been focused on combating deed fraud and deed theft. January, she launched the protect our homes initiative to protect homeowners from the left upper community education and outreach and enforcement and by going door-to-door in Bedford Stuyvesant to inform homeowners of various scams, along with dozens of other elected officials. I look forward to learning more from the administration to update us on their To help us monitor how effective they have efforts. been and to hear recommendations for further improvements that can be made to protect the innocent homeowner from deed fraud. Before turning the mic back to Chair Cornegy, I would like to thank the staff of the finance division for the preparation of this hearing, especially in my senior counsel,

Rebecca Chiasson, assistant counsel Noah Brick, and

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2 | finance analyst Sarah Gasalum, and Luke Zangerly.

Thank you very much. Chair Cornegy.

2.2

2.3

much, Danny. Before we move forward with the hearing, I have been enjoying door we have been joined by Minority Leader Steve Matteo, Vanessa Gibson, Keith Powers, and Carlina Rivera. I want to apologize for anyone who I missed. It was just an omission based on my screen size and nothing more. I think that we are going to move forward and have Genan take over this part of the hearing.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Before I speak,

Council member Adams would like to make an opening.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I'm sorry, Council member Adams. Council member Adams, I think you are muted.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay. Thank you.

Thank you so much. Good afternoon. I want to thank first Chairs Cornegy and Chair Dromm for allowing me to deliver remarks regarding my bill. Intro 1913 which would require reporting on complaints received and investigations regarding recorded document fraud. Right now, and New Yorkers are suffering from the financial impacts of COVID-19. They are struggling

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 15 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE with food insecurity, loss of income, and many are afraid that they will lose what they have worked their whole lives for, their homes. Homeownership is part of the American dream, but in times of financial uncertainty like many New Yorkers sales right now, homeowners can become targets for deed fraud. Seemingly well-intentioned people may approach homeowners with contracts claiming to offer repair grants or other much-needed services, but, often times, homeowners do not realize that they have been the target of the deed fraud scheme. With so much outrage, it can be difficult to differentiate for the real offers from the fraudulent ones. By the time the homeowner realizes what is happened, it may be too late as the home may have already been sold or mortgaged, literally, right from underneath their feet. Unfortunately, state law prevents us from doing more rigorous checks before deed is recorded. Until there is a shift in the state law, the city Council must demand updates from the office of the share of on their outcomes and strategies of their investigations. I also must draw the correlation of deed fraud with its evil fraternal twin, the Giuliana-esque tax lien sale. I look forward to

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 16 today's hearing and I asked my colleagues to support 2 my bill, Intro 1913 and really to support all of our 3 4 legislation presented today to protect homeowners across the city of New York. Thank you, Chairs. 5 6 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you so much, 7 Council member Adams. I just want to say that we also-- in the room is also Mark Gjonaj is been here 8 9 from the beginning and Keith Powers, if I didn't mention Keith. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Council member Perkins. 12 13 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Danny. 14 Genan? 15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Hello. Thank you. 16 I am Genan Zilkha, counsel to the committees housing 17 and buildings at the New York City Council. Before 18 we begin, I want to remind everyone that we will be on mute until you are called on to testify, at which 19 20 point, you will be on muted by the host. I will be 21 calling on panelists to testify. Please listen for 2.2 your name to be called as I will periodically 2.3 announce who the next panelist will be. We will first hear testimony from the administration and then 24

testimony from the New York County District

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 17 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE Attorney's Office followed by testimony from members 2 3 of the public. Today, Sheriff Joseph Fucito of the 4 New York City Department of Finance will be testifying, city registrar Annette Hill, and the New 5 York City Department of Housing Preservation and 6 7 Development associate Commissioner of preservation Kim Darga will be available for questions and 8 I will now administer the oaths. Members answers. of the administration, please raise your right hands. 10 11 Do you affirm the tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this committee and 12 13 respond honestly to Council member questions? 14 UNIDENTIFIED: I affirm. 15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Is that everybody? 16 Thank you. You may begin when ready. 17 SHERIFF FUCITO: Good afternoon, Chair 18 Dromm, Chair Cornegy, and members of the finance and housing and buildings committees. I am Sheriff Joe 19 20 Fucito and I am joined today by city register Annette 21 Hill. I hope all of you are staying healthy and safe 2.2 during this time in the city. My testimony today 2.3 will quickly review the history of the Sheriff's office deed fraud investigations, describe our 24

current efforts in this area, and advised New Yorkers

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 18 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE on how to protect themselves from deed fraud. I will also discuss our public outreach efforts, as well as proposed legislation to update and strengthen deed crime laws. So, now, for a little history. Since 2014, the Department of Finance and city registrar and Sheriff's office have taken many proactive steps to reduce deed fraud and investigate crimes related to deed fraud. Our investigations in the past six years have resulted in the arrests of 49 suspects tied to fraudulent property transactions. The total value of these properties was in excess of 48,926,000 In addition, the Sheriff's office provided dollars. testimony and evidence to the New York County grand jury report concerning deed fraud in New York City issued in December 2018. The city register is required by state law to perform the ministerial act of recording a deed as long as it is in recordable form meaning that it is certified by a public notary, it has the sellers signature, and the buyers signature, under certain circumstances, and it includes all other required legal documents. is not much room for us to negotiate the law. have trained city register staff to better detect documents that may be forged or fraudulent and put in

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 19 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE place a number of safeguards, including the involvement of the Sheriff's office in the review process. After an internal review of our recording process, we discovered that quick claim deeds are the type most often used by perpetrators of deed fraud. The staff now pays particular attention to these submissions and when there is a discrepancy identified that appears to indicate possible fraud, it is referred to the Sheriff's office for review. Examples of other types of recordings that would trigger an additional review are those with a sale price far below market value, multiple transfers between LLCs and a short period of time, and transfers by people or entities suspected of committing or known to have committed deed fraud in the past. These safeguards have been in effect since July 2014 when we increase our focus on deed fraud. In addition, as part of the review process, city register staff verified the notary information on the New York State Attorney General's official website and discrepancies are sent to the Sheriff for closer review. We also automatically inform property owners by mail when a deed is filed against their property.

The quicker someone catches fraudulent activity, the

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

20 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE quicker the problem can be addressed. To talk a little bit about the present landscape and challenges. As indicated in the New York County Dist. Atty. grand jury report, deed fraud is an onerous crime to investigate and more hurdles we face, the longer it takes to successfully complete an investigation. This year's bail reform has accelerated the disclosure process and now requires much more evidentiary documentation to be ready before trial. This is not impossible to accomplish, but it extends investigative time frames considerably. In addition, this fear, that Sheriff's office has been more involved in the enforcement of many criminal and health processes resulting from cash bail reform and last COVID-19 pandemic. should surprise no one that COVID-19 has presented additional challenges to deed fraud investigations. Grand jury is warned not in panel four months, leaving information gathering by the grand jury process stuck in neutral. Many law, real estate, and title company offices were closed in response to the pandemic. Interviews with potential witnesses and suspects required significant acrobatics and virtual interviews prevent numerous challenges to

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 21 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE However, please note that these hurdles investigate. have only slowed, but not stopped our progress. an illustration of our work in spite of these challenges, the Sheriff's office concluded a recent deed fraud investigation prosecuted by the Manhattan district attorney into an attorney who committed deed fraud against the estate of a Tuskegee airmen. the defendant pleaded quilty to all 11 counts of the indictment on January 13th, 2020, the judge promised the defendant not to exceed six months split on all class D and E felony use and probation on the class C felony provided the defendant comply with certain conditions. On October 7th of this year, the judge, influenced in part by COVID-19, sentenced to the defendant to five years of probation all 11 counts and ordered the defendant to complete 200 hours of community service by February 2021. To make restitution of 25,000 dollars to the victim's estate, sign a judgment for the remainder of the 67,122 dollars stolen from the estate, and judgments for the full amount stolen from the New York State Department of Labor in the amount of 10,220 dollars and, from the defendant's sister, 31,577 dollars. The court

also signed a stipulated order avoiding the deed to

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 22 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE The defendant provided an affidavit the property. withdrawing and/or not pursuing, notices of appeal, and the two civil cases involving the property. While this case was successfully prosecuted, we should be mindful that, during the COVID-19 process, and jail will not be a viable deterrent for nonviolent crime. This is not to criticize the court or its determination, but to highlight that we want to reduce circumstances of people in jail during the age of COVID-19. How New Yorkers can protect themselves from deed fraud? The best use of my public testimony is to educate people on how to prevent deed fraud. Here are some important measures the public can take to protect themselves. Review your property records and you will leave for activity. This information is available on our website through the automated city register information system commonly referred to as ACRIS where you can view property records. The address is www.NYC.gov/ACRIS. A C R I S. Register for notice of recorded deed program. Once you register, you will be notified text or email when there is any activity on your property. It is free and you can register online at www.nyc.gov/finance. Search deed

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 23 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE fraud and choose the first result. Protect your property from deed fraud. Check with the Department of finance safe use receiving property tax and water bills or if any of your utility bills suddenly increase. You can contact us by calling 311 or creating an account at www.nyc.gov/dofaccount. you own a property in New York City that is not occupied, we recommend that you check it often to make sure it is not illegally occupied. If you are going away for a long period of time, ask someone you trust to check on your house regularly while you are gone. Have them collect your mail so it does not pile up, as this suggests to criminals that the house is unoccupied. If you are going away for a long period of time, be careful of people or organizations that offer you cash to help you with home modifications or foreclosure preventions. Never turn over a year deed or transfer of ownership of your home to a mortgage assistance company. Do not sign any property related documents that you do not understand. We encourage people to first consult with a trusted attorney before signing papers. not hire a lawyer referred to you by someone whom I have a vested interest in the property, such as a

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 24 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE realtor. From our investigations, perpetrators of deed fraud operate like a gang. They have their own attorneys, mortgage bankers, notaries, title companies, and real estate brokers. Use a title company that you have vetted for real estate transactions and make sure your title insurance has deed fraud protection. If you suspect deed fraud, act quickly. Do not be embarrassed or wait to get help. The more time that passes, the more difficult it may be to regain the legal title because of how quickly the property can be transferred, perhaps multiple times. File a complaint with the New York City Sheriff's office. You can call us at 718-707-2100. It's important that we open a criminal investigation as soon as possible. You can also email the Sheriff at taxcop@finance.NYC.gov. Hire an attorney to help you regain legal title to your property and check to see if your title insurance company covers deed fraud. This could help cover the cost associated with hiring an attorney. If you cannot afford one, contact the New York State Attorney General's office. The Attorney General's office works with partners to provide free assistance to homeowners throughout the state. Their website is

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

```
COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
                                                  25
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
www.AGSCAM--
              AGSCAM--
                        help-- H E L P-- dot com.
I'm going to talk a little bit about our public
outreach and education. The Department of Finance
outreach unit has been informing attendees about deed
fraud and how to prevent it since early 2016.
work has reached over 100,000 taxpayers at over 1500
events. During the outreach sessions, we give
presentations which include a section on deed fraud
and what people can do to protect their properties.
The outreach team has distributed tens of thousands
of our deed fraud guides which is available at
www.nyc.gov/finance. F I N A N C E.
languages. The outreach unit attends deed fraud
educational forums hosted by elected officials and
community leaders. One example that we consider the
ideal model was a town hall promoted as Don't Lose
Your Home to Scammers hosted by Council member
Cornegy and the outreach team in the Sheriff's
office. This event was cosponsored by the Brooklyn
Bar Association, the center for New York City
neighborhoods, and Brooklyn neighborhood services.
The outreach also conducts train the trainer
sections, hundreds of them over the past few years
during which they educate elected officials and
```

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 26 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE community-based organizations on the topic. This is an ongoing effort and we encourage members interested to contact us to schedule a session. Now, I am going to talk a little bit about proposed deed fraud legislation. Department of finance, in consultation with the New York County District Attorney's office has prepared proposed state legislation to address the problem of deed fraud. The bill is consistent with and implements major recommendations of the New York County District Attorney's office 2013 grand jury report. One of the recommendations for the bell is increasing the penalty for the forging of the deed, mortgage, or a similar instrument by making persons for any of the instruments guilty of the crime of forgery in the first degree, a class C felony with a maximum sentence of up to 15 years of incarceration. The bill also dedicates the crime of filing a false instrument in the first degree to the filing of a false real property instrument or the attempted filing of such instrument. It also makes the crime of filing a false instrument in the first degree a class D felony with a maximum sentence of up to seven years' incarceration. The filing or attempted filing of false instruments other than real

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 27 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE property instruments would be a class a felony with a 2 maximum sentence of four years of incarceration under 3 4 a revised filing of filing a false instrument in the second degree. The current crime of filing a false instrument in the second degree, a misdemeanor, would 6 7 become a crime of filing a false instrument in the third degree. These increased penalties will act as 8 a greater deterrent to deed fraud without being unduly harsh. The bill also creates a new group of 10 11 crimes involving notarization because the deed fraud 12 problem is inevitably enhanced by the lack or 13 downright deceitful actions of duly commissioned Notary Public's and commissioners of deeds, as well 14 15 as the deceitful actions of other persons who falsely purport to be duly commissioned Notary Public's and 16 17 commissioners of deeds. The first of these two 18 proposed crimes in their group notarization of a 19 false or real property instrument in the first-degree 20 and second-degree address false, fraudulent, or improper notarizations of real property instruments. 21 A first-degree crime is a class E felony. A second 2.2 2.3 agreed crime is a misdemeanor. The next group of proposed crime, impersonation of a Notary Public or 24

Commissioner of deeds on real property instrument

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 28 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE deals with persons who falsely purport to be a Notary Public or Commissioner of deeds and notarizing a real property instrument and is a class E felony. group's other two crimes are tampering with a notarization or real property instrument or the notarization Journal in the first-degree and seconddegree. These crimes will address situations in which a person alters or destroys a notarized real property instrument or a notarized Journal or similar record that a Notary Public or Commissioner of deed may be required to maintain. The first-degree crime is a class E felony. The second agreed crime is a misdemeanor. Finally, in addition to the above amendments to the penal law, the bill also amendments the executive law to authorize the city in any county outside New York City, too, by local law, imposes a journal and/or similar report of record keeping requirements of a notary public's and Commissioner of deeds respected notarization of a real property instrument. We hope this bill will become law so we and our partners can better investigate and prosecute I hope that our testimony today has deed fraud.

given you some useful overview of where we stand in

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

2 regards to deed fraud. Thank you for your time and I
3 will now take questions.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now open for questions from Chair Cornegy and Chair Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Sheriff, thank you so much. It's always— I feel like it's always good to see you, but when I see you, you know, we are dealing with a very serious issue. So, don't take that personal. But thank you for the work that your office continues to do.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Chairman, you are on mute.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: On deed theft and deed fraud. I apologize. I would be remiss, though, before I go into questioning, if I didn't point out the great work that we have been able to accomplish in partnership with the current attorney general and the prior attorney general. When there was mortgage foreclosure crisis and the restitution that the banks were required to pay, a great deal of that money was used to combat deed theft and deed fraud and nonprofits around the city received that money and now we don't have that as a resource when we need it most. So, that is really unfortunate. And with a

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

30

2 | budget deficit, it's very difficult to allocate the

3 | appropriate resources to the nonprofits to help with

4 | the mitigation of deed theft and deed fraud. So, we

5 | find ourselves in a double crisis. I just wanted to

6 point that out. Some of the questions that I have

7 began with-- Hold on one second. So, as it relates

8 to victims of deed theft, what are the common

9 problems that owners who think they have been victims

10 of deed fraud phase in trying to quiet title?

SHERIFF FUCITO: One of the biggest problems that we see with the victims of deed fraud is, although we can bring a criminal prosecution, gaining their title back becomes another hurdle in itself and that is significant. That is why we stay very early in the process you should be represented by an attorney with any type of property transfer because we often times see people sign away their property on their own. And under those conditions, it's very hard to prove criminal intent. It can be done in very extreme circumstances, but, as you know, the vast majority of complaints we receive are this type of fraud where they took advantage of the person's lack of knowledge of real estate, they used that to their advantage, and then they had a

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 financial gain over the victim. Then recovering the

3 property after such a transfer is very, very

4 difficult. So, I would say that the strongest thing

5 | that any person could do is, when they are involved

6 in any type of transaction, have good counsel

7 available to them.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, also I wanted to-- from your perspective, is there a particular demographic that is more vulnerable to deed theft and deed fraud? And I don't mean that in ethnicities solely. I mean it in socioeconomic status?. I mean and also in age.

SHERIFF FUCITO: Absolutely. Absolutely. We see, on a continual basis, the elderly are particularly vulnerable to deed fraud. The immigrant community, because of the language barrier that are sometimes presented. Obviously, people who are suffering from— in an economic crisis are more vulnerable to being asked to participate in things that they think are going to relieve them of their debt, but, in fact, relieves them of their property. So, you have touched on each of the points and the overwhelming number of cases that we deal with have those factors involved. The Tuskegee airmen case

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 32 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE that we were dealing with case is a perfect example. 2 Elderly gentlemen and then, later on, it was not all 3 4 only the gentleman, but his estate. Those are the factors that we see over and over again. elderly, the vulnerable, the immigrant community. 6 7 The people who are suffering an economic crisis. 8 Those are the targets of deed fraud. 9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Also, I see Annette shaking her head. You can feel free to jump in at 10 11 any time if you want to expound on what the sheriff 12 has said and if you have anything, please feel free. 13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chair Cornegy, maybe just to ask the Sheriff if he has any 14 15 statistics on those demographics? 16 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Oh, I'm sorry. 17 Danny--Chair Dromm--18 SHERIFF FUCITO: We don't keep official statistics, but I review every deed fraud case and 19 20 that is the factor that I see in each one of these. That we see the elderly, we see some -- When we look 21 2.2 at the interview notes, we see the same factors 2.3 involved. There are people, obviously, in very expensive properties that are also subject to deed 24

fraud, but the average complaint that comes in has

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

33

those factors. The elderly, the émigré, the person

that was approached because they are an economic

crisis. Those are the overwhelming—particularly

Brooklyn, as well. Brooklyn, it has the overwhelming

number of deed fraud cases and those are the factors

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, in Queens, is that similar?

we see particularly in Brooklyn.

2.2

2.3

SHERIFF FUCITO: We see southern Queens, as well, but, obviously, Brooklyn, as far as the number of complaints that come in, Brooklyn is in the lead.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: The one thing,

Sheriff, I didn't-- I may have missed you mentioning
in terms of tools in a toolbox to be preventive, is
the use of the ACRIS system and the ability to check
any movement on your deed or any movement on those
kinds of things through checking the ACRIS system
regularly. In the past, we've all suggested you
included that people check the ACRIS system to see if
there is any movement as often as possible to secure
or to be preventive in any one laying claim to their
deed or changing their deed or anything like that.

Absolutely. You should SHERIFF FUCITO: check on your own. Finance does have a process that we will send notification if there is anything recorded against your property. And that is a very important component to our investigation. Some of our investigations that we are getting in the beginning of this year were triggered by those types of notifications and that we also have the relief factor. Some people get a notice, they don't know what's going on and then they understand that they took a second mortgage and that's what's being recorded or something that did involve their property that they were aware of, they've noticed that it's affected their real property. So, in some cases, it puts people IVs to know that, yes. This was recorded. In other cases, it is an alert factor for us to start an investigation.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, I just want to be clear on what you are saying. The system, as it stands now, when there is any movement, there will be an alert sent and--

SHERIFF FUCITO: Yes.

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: the homeowner will 3 be able to verify whether that is something that they 4 wanted or something that is fraudulent.

SHERIFF FUCITO: They receive a letter that outlines that there was a recording against their property. And if they are unaware of it or they are uncertain, that they could contact the Sheriff's office and it gives our phone number in our email address for them to contact us.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Is there a specific action that triggers that ignore any action on the deed?

SHERIFF FUCITO: I believe it is any recording against the property. So, if somebody files something against your property— it could even be like a mechanics lien or something like that where it is recorded. Any recording on your property results in this triggering mechanism.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, I'm just going to ask one more question and then I will go to my cochair and the rest of the members. But what tools does the city have in place to respond after an illegal real estate conveyance is already occurred?

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

36

I think you already mentioned how difficult it is to reverse that. [inaudible 00:37:54]

SHERIFF FUCITO: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Like it's so easy-it's almost easier to do something fraudulent than it
is to reverse it.

Absolutely correct. SHERIFF FUCITO: the Sheriff's response -- the primary response of the Sheriff is to investigate and see if we can develop a criminal case to bring for prosecution. That is the bulk of what we can do. There are some efforts that we have taken in other directions. when we have an investigation, if we have seen that the parties were going to move for an eviction and we have strong evidence that the eviction was unlawful because the transfer was unlawful, we have made appearances at housing court to see if the people testifying would perjure themselves under oath and arrest them for that. And what we discovered was, when we appeared at housing court, the individuals would withdraw their housing court eviction process. So, we have taken small steps, but we-- it's hard to kind of step into that realm because we can only do this in a very limited circumstance with active

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 37 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE criminal investigations when we have strong evidence 2 that the property was stolen. After the fact, but if 3 you hire a civil attorney, a civil attorney can get a 4 court order converting the property back to you and the court can order the sheriff to convey the 6 7 property back to you by deed, but it requires a court 8 order. The sheriff can't do it on his own. So, you really don't have a lot of options and the city 9 doesn't have a lot of options. As you said, once the 10 11 property has been transferred and once those mechanisms are in place, it is very hard to undo. 12 13 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: You know, I think it is incredibly gutsy that people would steal your 14 15 property and then affixed to you on top of it. SHERIFF FUCITO: 16 Yes. 17 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Do you know what 18 the percentage of that type of conveyance is in 19 relation to all of the other deed theft? 20 SHERIFF FUCITO: It is small compared to the ones that we have investigated, but when we have 21 2.2 spotted it, we have stepped into it and we've gotten 2.3 involved with the eviction process when we have

strong evidence that this was going to happen.

other thing that we noticed in these investigations

24

was that the perpetrators would have different sets of attorneys. They would have one set of attorneys in housing court, one set of attorneys for Supreme Court, one set of attorneys everywhere else. So, each attorney could deny knowledge of everything else. They were only hired for this very limited window. Remember, there are a lot of legitimate attorneys there that could be hired and not realize that they are acting on behalf of somebody who is involved in deed fraud. So, we noticed that that was

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, my last question for this round as I've gotten three texts already about the question of is very particular demographic that is perpetrating these crimes? We asked the demographic of who is the victim. Is there a particular demographic or can you narrow it down to a particular segment of society that is largely responsible for these conveyances?

a trend where they used different councils to perform

different types of functions.

SHERIFF FUCITO: I couldn't say. You of all variety of individuals that are involved. The perpetrators are much more diverse than the victims.

2.2

2.3

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And--

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I'm sorry. And also Barry Grodenchik has been with us from the start. Hey, Barry.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Oh, okay. Good.

Sheriff, are you seeing any uptick in deed fraud

complaints or suspicious deed filings as a result of

the COVID-19 crisis?

SHERIFF FUCITO: Actually, we see a lower amount compared to the other years. We have seen lower amounts, but, from the review of the evidence-and, again, these are the early phases. We see more truer criminal activity. We often get complaints, as I said earlier. We get many complaints where people feel they have been defrauded. And I would categorize that, for lack of a better word, there are things that are sleazy, but legal and then there are things that are truly criminal. We see a lot of sleazy activity. A lot of it. This year, we use the smaller volume complaints, but we are seeing what we believe is more evidence of criminal activity, as you indicated, because of the things that are happening with COVID-19. I think people think we are not watching. So, this is why it is so important for

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 41
grand juries in the court system to get back running
because it means that we can start moving our

4 | investigations forward.

2.2

2.3

At past finance hearings, the Council is heard from advocates that properties that are noticed for the lien sale are often targeted by fraudsters posing as distressed property consultants. While we recognize the benefits of widely publicizing the lien sale list, is there anything that the administration can do to protect these homeowners?

question because, obviously, as you know, the lien sale is part of a ministerial process. But any tool, no matter how helpful it is can always be used for evil. A hammer is a great tool except when you hit somebody in the head with it. Then it's not a great tool. The problem with the lien sale, the problem with ACRIS-- all this information is there to be helpful to people, but it can also be exploited and that is one of the great difficulties that we are facing. Good tools being used for bad reasons. It is very hard to find an answer to it because information is important. And I think a fund that

2 has anything to say, we'll let her jump in. I don't

3 know if she does.

2.2

2.3

ANNETTE HILL: You said exactly what I was thinking. Thanks, Joe.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's good to see you, too, Ms. Hill. And maybe you could even help us with the next question. Based on our understanding, because of state law restrictions, the city register has very little discretion about whether to record a document related to the property even if there is a suspicion of fraud. Can you walk us through the process of how a deed is recorded with the city register? What are some of the most common indicators during the registration process the fraud may be occurring and what do you do if you suspect that there is fraud?

ANNETTE HILL: Sure. Good afternoon.

Well, like you said, I have very little room for rejecting a deed, however, the staff is trained to look for certain things. Like I said, we do-- the sheriff reported we check the notary information. If we find there is something an accurate with the notary information, that is something that triggers us to send it to the sheriff for additional review.

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 43 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE We also look to see -- we have flags in the ACRIS 2 3 system that alerts the staff of certain types of 4 inconsistencies. If the property is below market 5 value and is being transferred and it is below the market value, that is the trigger. We also look to 6 see if there is a property that has LLC and it has 7 8 been transferred a few times. That is something that triggers that something is going on. We also will look to see if there is a quitclaim deed. 10 11 usually triggers that something is going on. So, any 12 kind of inconsistency we find, we will bring in the sheriff to take a second review and will not record 13 it at this point. Working with the sheriff has 14 15 helped us to not put something on record that could actually have someone lose their property. So, it is 16 17 been a very good relationship and taking the sheriff 18 and the part of the review process. 19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you just walk 20 me through the process of how--21 ANNETTE HILL: Sure. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: it's recorded? 2.3 ANNETTE HILL: Yes. Okay. So, we could get a recording over the counter in person. 24

They could also mail it. We also get recordings

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 44 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 80 percent -- almost 80 percent of electronically. the documents we get comes in through the electronic means. So, very few people are now walking in. When it comes in initially, there is a quick review just to make sure it has the initial requirements such as tax forms and has all the requirements. A cover page. And then it goes through to the examiner. examiner's exam Annette to make sure it meets the legal requirements as they have made their payment, if there is a buyer and a seller, it's notarized, and so forth. That is the general process. And if everything meets the requirements, then it gets accepted if there is a payment, for recording. CHAIRPERSON DROMM: If someone suspects fraud, what do they do? How do they go about that? ANNETTE HILL: If someone suspects-if we get someone calling in or they are asking when they come into the office, the first thing we will tell them things, number one, they should get an attorney. And, number two, we send them to our sheriff's department. We well pull all record of their property and we will show them the last recording that will give them that evidence.

can also pull at themselves, but we will give them

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2.2

all that information and directed them to the sheriff

so the sheriff can work with them to see if there is

any criminality involved.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And, sheriff, what investigative tools do you have or what do you used to investigate suspected cases of deed fraud?

SHERIFF FUCITO: Is everything that we have. That's the easiest way to put it. Besides the interview process, besides all of our programs and information. We have used our license plate reader technology. We use the video system that we have at the Department of Finance. We use a lot of other types of mechanisms, including GPS tracking warrants. If we have actually gotten to the point where we want to track someone, we have gotten permission from the district attorney to obtain a warrant, and we track individuals involved in deed fraud. So, we use any tool that is available for any of our criminal investigations are available for deed fraud.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Thanks.

ANNETTE HILL: I just wanted to add one another thing that we do jail. If the sheriff has opened the case with the district attorney and there is evidence, we will put a stop on ACRIS to prevent

1

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

46

2 any additional recordings against the property. But

3 it has to come from the sheriff saying that he has a

4 | very strong case. So, if it's just the-- that will

5 stop them from taking a mortgage out. If they come

6 to try to record something, they will have to contact

7 us and then they are referred to the sheriff. So,

that is another tool we use within finance to try to

9 stop further action against the homeowner.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okav. Thanks. And you had mentioned LLCs which have historically been afforded privacy and secrecy about their owners and, for this reason, have often been used to perpetrate deed theft and fraud. In September 19, state law changes forced new disclosure when an LLC is involved in the deed transfer of one to four family homes. Now, the name and address of all owners must be attached to the real property transfer tax form or the RPTT form. Do you review the RPTT tax returns as part of your anti-fraud review and, if so, do you believe this state law change has been beneficial for your investigations?

SHERIFF FUCITO: For the sheriff side, yes. Whenever we get a referral that there is something related to deed fraud, we look at the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 47 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 entire package. The reason that we look at the entire package, as the district attorney grand jury 3 4 report indicated, deed fraud is onerous to investigate. We may not be able to prove the theft, but we can prove that they lied on certain documents. 6 7 So, the RPP tax return, any of the other documents 8 that are notarized. We may be able to charge someone with forms of perjury or filing false instruments, even if we can't necessarily prove a deed fraud 10 11 component. So, yes. That is an important part in 12 knowing who the principles behind the LLC are. 13 takes a significant amount of time off the investigation if we know who they are. 14 15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, are there any 16 tax privacy issues that prevent you from looking at 17 RPTT returns during your investigations? 18 SHERIFF FUCITO: Not on that return. There is no confidentiality on that. We can't look 19 20 at regular tax returns and use that information. 21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. We've heard 2.2 that the comprehensive notary road for him could be 2.3 very helpful to help stop deed fraud. Some states have moved faster than New York to update their 24

notary laws, including California, which has required

48

2 | notary journals since 1973 and, more recently,

3 Virginia and North Carolina. Some states have felt

4 such urgency about these issues that they have

5 changed notary law by executive order, including

6 Massachusetts and Rhode Island. Have you had

7 conversations with state representatives about moving

8 some things forward in this regard?

1

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SHERIFF FUCITO: Yes. We have been advocating. We were advocating over the last several years some changes in the notary laws, but when we did the grand jury report with the DA, we felt that we should join forces and push as a joint in unison saying these are the changes that we should be looking for as far as a notary, as far as making sure there are more increased crimes for notaries that are involved in this, keeping better records. Particularly for real property transfers. And if necessary -- I mean, part of the issue, to be honest, is many parts of the state are not interested in this legislation, however, we are trying to convince people that, if the rest of the state isn't interested, New York City is interested. major problem for New York City and these are things that we would love to see in New York City to help

2 reduce deed fraud. Having the notary be more 3 responsible in the process.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, would you blame that lack of interest as the reason for it languishing in New York state legislature?

SHERIFF FUCITO: I think that, upstate, the issue of deed fraud is not as prevalent and there are other issues involving how much intrusiveness the government shall have been a person's life. So, I think those issues tend to slow it down in the other parts of the state where, as here in New York City, we see this on a regular basis and we think it has a lot of value to help reduce deed fraud.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I'm just going to ask a few more questions and then we will turn into other Council members. But, in fiscal 21, the adopted budget headcount for the office of the sheriff was 268 positions with the actual headcount of 236. Is it your office subject to the hiring freeze?

SHERIFF FUCITO: While, at this point in time, we have openings, but we have not been able to hire. We have been trying to work with OMB to move forward in the hiring process, but we have to be

2.2

2.3

realistic. The budget in the city right now is difficult to predict and I am sure there are many other city agencies like myself that have very valuable programs, but we are kind of in a waiting mode.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, at this point, do you think you are going ahead your headcount?

Your budgeted headcount this year?

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. And how many staff members are assigned to work on deed fraud?

And do you know other titles? What their titles are?

SHERIFF FUCITO: Yes. Yes. So, we have to titles. We have— Actually, three titles are involved in deed fraud. The deputy sheriff title, the criminal investigator title, and the auditor title. Each one of them does a certain component piece of it. We have, approximately seven investigators and, I believe, six deputy sheriffs and three auditors doing most of the deed fraud investigation, but that doesn't mean that those are the only people devoted to deed fraud. For example,

if there is going to be an execution of the search

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 51 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 warrant, we may bring in more deputy sheriffs to 3 conduct the search warrant. In the county office is 4 where people walk in to, let's say, the registrar's office and they have a deed fraud, Annette's team 5 will actually bring them over to the Sheriff's 6 7 office. In the sheriffs in those counties, even though they are not primarily assigned to deed fraud, 8 will take the basic investigation. So, it is a hands-on approach. Most of the Sheriff's office 10 11 operates that way. I think I've explained above for. 12 We are a small agency and small-- unlike NYPD which 13 has a very specific people assigned for 20 years to 14 do the same task, we are generalists. Deputy 15 sheriffs every day could be investigating deed fraud, they could be serving an order of protection, they 16 17 could be transporting a prisoner, making interest. 18 So, every day has a combination of different duties that are assigned to them. 19 So, do you feel 20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 21 that that is sufficient to handle all that number of 2.2 deed fraud cases that you are getting? 2.3 SHERIFF FUCITO: It's difficult because--It is difficult to balance because every assignment 24

the sheriff has is important. Deed fraud is a very

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 52 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 important program. It is important to me personally, but so is our order of protection project. So does 3 our apprehension of the people who are going through 4 emotional distress pursuant to the mental hygiene law. Each of these are very, very important. I 6 7 can't say that one is more important than the other. I am saying all of them are important and, with that 8 9 in mind, we tried to balance it out. CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Sheriff. 10 11 SHERIFF FUCITO: Oh. And by the way, we 12 also are-- because we believe in many other reforms 13 going on, we are also the agency now doing electronic monitoring for the city. The pretrial electronic 14 15 monitoring for New York City. If you are arrested 16 and you went to jail, that is a new option that is 17 available. 18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good. Thank you very much, Sheriff. And thank you, Ms. Hill, as 19 well. I appreciate it. 20 21 ANNETTE HILL: You're welcome. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And we'll go back 23 to Chair Cornegy. I appreciate it very much. you. We've also been joined by Council member 24

25

Torres.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you. Genan,

I don't know if you're keeping the stack on numbers
that would like to ask guestions.

call on Council members to ask questions in the order they have used the zoom raise hand function. Council members, please keep your questions to three minutes, including responses. There is a second round of questioning where Council member questions will be limited to two minutes. The Sergeant-at-arms will keep a timer to let you know when your time is up. First, we will be hearing from Council member Gjonaj and then Council member Rosenthal.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you, Chairs

Cornegy and Dromm. Sheriff, thank you so much for

that explanation of what challenges you have. The

water all of the safety nets and measures that you

have in place seem to be after-the-fact. After the

legal instruments have been signed, after they have

been submitted, and after they have been recorded

that you could, perhaps, pick up on whether it be a

missing form or all of the proper fees. None of that

stops the transaction from occurring. In my question

2 to you and to Ms. Hill and his wouldn't it be easier

3 for any legal instrument requiring that deed transfer

4 or only an oral mortgage that is placed on the

property, require attorneys to sign off on that

6 | transaction?

2.2

2.3

SHERIFF FUCITO: It's possible. I defer to the city register because it sounds similar to another type of filing system that is in place in other jurisdictions. It's possible but, as you know, the last case that we prosecuted, the person that we prosecuted was the attorney involved in the transfer. So, we do find that, in the deed fraud industry, attorneys, notaries, real estate agents are all part of it. So, having an attorney necessarily sign off on it will not guarantee any preventative measure that there will be deed fraud.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you.

SHERIFF FUCITO: But all let Annette speak to other types of filing protections that exist in the country.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Before you answer,

Ms. Hill-- because you need to attorneys. An

attorney representing the buyer and the attorney

representing the seller. And, at that point, both

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE attorneys have a responsibility to make sure th

2.2

2.3

individuals.

attorneys have a responsibility to make sure that their respective clients, as well as the other client, is of sound mind, is doing this of their own well and in accordance and putting that burden of responsibility on the attorneys to make sure that they also get title insurance, which is another component here. So, again, I'm just offering a thought and I'm not understanding why this is so complicated when I think we have options that are going to be easy to prevent any fraud. It may be a bit expensive, but attorney is in title insurance would go a long way to preventing these frauds,

whether they be the attorney or unscrupulous

Sorry, Ms. Hill.

ANNETTE HILL: I have to agree with you that, yes. Having an attorney does help it, but often the people who come to this in a party of deed fraud, sometimes it is the same attorney representing both parties and that is because they haven't gotten their own attorney. The other thing is state law for recording requires the notary to validate who is in front of them. Again, often times, we see the notary. We have had many cases where we are referred to the sheriff where the notary was part of the

fraud. So, yes, I do agree that, you know, having something upfront would be better, but the nature of the way the recordings are, the people who are there to protect often our at times, involved in the fraud.

after, whether it be the notary or the attorney and holding them criminally responsible would go a long way to prevent the fraud from occurring originally.

ANNETTE HILL: Yes.

Should be looking at this from a different angle.

Holding those, like attorneys, that are licensed, they are supposed to be acting in the best interest of their client and the notaries responsible for any action that is led to a fraud and, if they are participating in the fraud, hold them accountable for not doing their due diligence to confirm that the transaction is legal, it is proper, that both buyer and seller are represented and requiring no deed transfer should ever occur without an attorney.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Mark. I would agree that— I guess the caveat there is that, without an attorney on both sides.

2.2

\_ ¬

- that would create a checks and balance for an attorney that has ill intentions. And I'm not aware of-- Chair, you know, we have credit protections on her credit cards. We don't have a mechanism in place that protects and deed transfers or liens or mortgages taken out against properties. Maybe this is another avenue that we should be pursuing where we allow these independent credit agencies not to allow a transfer or a lien to be placed on a property until they have confirmed it.

changes only something the sheriff can recommend.

It's beyond our cannon to actually make any change.

The legislative body has to do this. As far as the attorney is, it sounds very sounds to have two viable attorney is present, but I'm sure there will be people who object that they want to purchase a sale property without an attorney being present or they can't afford one. I know it is foolish to move forward without proper representation, but the issue is that forcing representation may not be viable.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: The legal document, you should be required to have an attorney that

sort of follow up on what Council member Gjonaj was

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE talking about. You mentioned that you automatically

59

1

2

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

3 inform property owners by mail when a deed is filed 4 against the property. If someone were to open up their mail, read that, and realize that, hey, I 5 didn't-- who the hell is, you know, filing against 6

7 my property, what would be their next steps and is

8 that enough to stop the sale from going through?

SHERIFF FUCITO: It is not enough to stop the sale from going through because we would have to investigate it. An example would be like if the bank is foreclosing. Let's say it is a legitimate mortgage that the bank is foreclosing and then they file some type of notice with the register or, you know, your landscaper file some type of lien against you because you didn't pay a bill. Those things could trigger a notice that could be sent to someone. It is just a filing that Larry is been some type of filing against your property. It's the only way to alert you that something was filed with the registrar.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Pray. This says specifically when a deed is filed.

SHERIFF FUCITO: But, it is other types of filings that will trigger something, as well.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah. But I'm 3 talking about a deed.

SHERIFF FUCITO: Right. Once we get the complaint, the person calls up, we get the complaint. We have to start looking at it. His many complaints we get -- we get complaints from individuals that say they were the victim of deed fraud and it turns out they were the person that perpetrated the deed fraud. So, we do want to look at every complaint and understand what is going on. Look at the history of the property. It doesn't happen instantaneously. And then, once we see that there is no connection between the person that filed this and the person who is claiming this, that starts building the case. then that leads us to interviews that can lead us to that we feel so strongly about it, the quicker we will move on it. If it is something that we have somewhat of a cloudy piece of evidence, we need to build more evidence and that is what takes a lot of Building that evidence.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Got it. So, the city itself bring the lawsuit. Like the person who lost their deed doesn't even have to bring the

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 61 lawsuit because the city is going to file a lawsuit 2 3 about the fraud. 4 SHERIFF FUCITO: No. No. the city doesn't bring any civil action against the party in 5 these matters. What the sheriff does is look for 6 7 criminal activity and look to see if the transfer of 8 the property, if any component of this transfer was criminal activity and then--COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: 10 11 SHERIFF FUCITO: we start-- we look at 12 it and say, okay, this is a crime. That's a crime. 13 We add up the crimes. We try to get evidence. We speak to the district attorney. The DA kind of 14 15 agrees, yeah, sheriff. I see what you are---SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired. 16 17 SHERIFF FUCITO: and then we move forward. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, okay. So, 20 then the DAs-- Sorry, Chairs. If I could just 21 finish this real quick. Then it is the DA who 2.2 pursues the case. So, again, I'm sort of getting 2.3 that but not the homeowner-- I mean, the homeowner would be a party, obviously-- the old homeowner--24

Someone is really shaking their head no. I'm

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 62 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE just trying to look out for somebody who gets a piece of paper in the mail that says a deed has been filed against your property. You no longer own it. And then somebody calls Department of Finance. What the heck? And then you investigate and, let's say, month later-- I'm making it up. Your finding is totally criminal. Completely criminal activity. This is fraudulent. So, then you give it to the DA to prosecute but then-- Paul is trying to write something. Going to try to pin her. But, anyway--Way. No. Put it back. Put it back. I was just looking at it. The owner must also file a civil action. Okay. So, the owner also has to do it at the same time that the DA may be prosecuting criminally.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SHERIFF FUCITO: So, without getting too expensive, there is a criminal approach and there is a civil approach.

mentioned that. That's okay. Got it. And just it happened to a constituent of mine and, you know, it is such a drawn out— it was a three year horrible process and one of those that we use clearly fraudulent and that happened before the law went into

```
COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
1
                                                       63
    COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
    effect where now TOS sends out that letter. So, she
2
3
    didn't even find out about it. But, anyway. Okay.
4
    Thank you so much, Chairs. I appreciate your help.
                CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY:
                                      Thanks, Helen.
6
                COMMITTEE COUNSEL:
                                      Next, we will hear
7
    questions from Council member Miller followed by
    Council member Adams.
8
                SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.
                CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Council member
10
11
    Miller? You're on mute, brother. Can we go to
    Adrienne and then go back to-- Genan?
12
13
                COMMITTEE COUNSEL:
                                      Sure. Now we'll
    hear questions from Council member Adams.
14
15
                CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Well, come back,
16
    Daneek, as soon as you connect.
17
                SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.
18
                COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay. Thank you.
19
    I will be brief. Sheriff, thank you so much for your
    testimony today. It is been such an education
20
21
    hearing from you today, so thank you so much. My
2.2
    question is very brief. It has to do with the
2.3
    proposed deed fraud legislation that has been
    proposed to the state which I found to be
24
```

fascinating. The line in your testimony is the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 64 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE Department of Finance, in consultation with the New 2 3 York City County district attorney office has 4 prepared proposed state legislation to address the problem of deed fraud. It hasn't actually been 5 6 proposed to the state? If so, who is been carrying 7 the legislation and what exactly is the status of the bill? 8 9 SHERIFF FUCITO: We have to get bill numbers and have been introduced, but this is one of 10 11 the primary bills that the Department of Finance is

the primary bills that the Department of Finance is looking to advocate for in the upcoming legislative session. It is a very important issue to us. As soon as we have that information, we will certainly share it with the Council.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much, sheriff. I found it to be very, very interesting. So, thank you again for your testimony today.

SHERIFF FUCITO: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Just to piggyback off of Council member Adams, how can we, as a counsel, be supportive of that legislation on the state level?

SHERIFF FUCITO: Your normal legislative process would be what would be needed. You know,

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 65 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE dialogue with the state legislature to express that deed fraud is a crime that -- it affects other jurisdictions, but it primarily affects New York City, like everything else, because of the volume of people we have, but the nature of the number of realty transactions. So, it is an important local crime. It's important for us, it impacts our citizens, and I think we have express to that to the legislative body that how important it is for our residents at the ground level. These are people's homes, so this is something that we really kind of have to impress upon them. We were hoping that the weight, and the district attorney office supporting the legislation would be very helpful. And I also wanted to shout out to ADA Jill Mariani. She is on this call. She is been instrumental in prosecuting deed fraud cases in New York County. She is a fantastic partner and I can't speak enough and praise her enough for that type of work and dedication she has brought to deed fraud. You really have an advocate in the DAs office with Jill Mariani. just wanted to bring that up.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: And I agree. It seems, though, that there may be some actual civil

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 66
2	rights issues here, too. Because between Bedford
3	Stuyvesant to enemies New York, Southeast Queens,
4	those are primary areas which have been that assault
5	on African-American and people of color
6	homeownership. So, you know, Daneek Miller well,
7	both the cochairs of the Black and Latino and Asian
8	caucus are on this call and they probably could speak
9	to us pursuing that, as well.
10	SHERIFF FUCITO: I would believe that
11	your legislative persuasion would be helpful with the
12	assembly and the Senate.
13	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Council member
14	Miller, have you gotten your audio together?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I think I am wait
16	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Yes, sir.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: waiting to be
18	unmuted. Am I unmuted?
19	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You're unmuted,
20	Council member.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you so
22	very much.
23	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Just for the
24	record, it wasn't me muting me.

working there together. So, that's me.

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

1213

14

15 16

17

18

1920

21

22

23

24

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

the [inaudible 01:12:57] of the phone and my desktop

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: No. I have just

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Cochairs, thank you

for this important topic. Something, obviously, we've been talking about probably for the last five Sheriff, also something we been working on. A couple of things. You indicated that this was something that was not yet seen as being prevalent in the South is Queens community. And based on not necessarily this data, but some of the complaints and what I've seen in my district, as well as Council member Adams and Richards, the opposite. Anytime you have homeownership typically has the Chair mentioned-Cornegy-- seniors and folks of color, they seem to be low hanging fruit in this area. Have you seen kind of a mobile-- If you don't see it in Southeast Queens and claims now, do you-- or over the past five years, is there any indication that there is kind of a concerted mobile network operating within the five boroughs at any time that is engaged in this type of activity?

25 SHERIFF FUCITO: Well--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Individuals.

1

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SHERIFF FUCITO: I don't know if my testimony was clear. I was indicating that Brooklyn just seems to have the highest amount of fraud. doesn't mean that the other jurisdictions do not. Queens County has a significant amount of deed fraud [inaudible 01:14:30], as well. As far as networks, yes. Will you say that deed fraud operates in networks. We have observed networks. We have networks under investigation where we have groups of people that are involved in different component parts of the deed fraud. You have realtors, you have attorneys, you have notaries, and you have other people that are looking at moving property. That network of people are involved in much of the deed fraud and it is a network. And it takes a long time to gather the information in the evidence on the network. But, yes. You are correct. operate as a network and need to operate throughout the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: We talk about fraudulent deed in terms of transfer of property.

What happens in the case where there has just been a name added to the deed without the consent? Would

you say that that is the same process because someone
then notarized the fact that they witness to this
person agreeing to this person being added to the

5 property, as well?

2.2

2.3

SHERIFF FUCITO: I would have to look at each case individually. The name being added to a deed doesn't necessarily mean it was deed fraud.

There could be a lawful reason for that transferred to occur. But we would have to look at a complaint that a name appeared on the deed inspiring—

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

SHERIFF FUCITO: type of interest, we would investigate it.

was referring to was someone without someone's consent. And then, finally, Ms. Hill indicated that there is the process by which people come in to make a complaint and then that they are often referred to the sheriff. Does this have to be very specifically the owner of the property? The primary deed holder or can it be a spouse, child, neighbor, or someone who was concerned about these nefarious behaviors that are going on, particularly the seniors that are

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 70 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE being preyed upon? Do the [inaudible 01:16:52] have 2 3 to make a complaint themselves? 4 Okay. Yeah. I'll ANNETTE HILL: 5 Yes. It doesn't necessarily have to pay the answer. owner, but the owner will have to get involved--6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Right. ANNETTE HILL: eventually. But we do 8 9 have, especially for the elderly-- sometimes it is a son, daughter, it could be a sibling, it could be a 10 11 spouse that could come in. So, we will-- it's 12 public information what's about recording. 13 will give the information and pull the information up with someone comes in, but we well tell them that the 14 15 owner of the property needs to be involved if the 16 case has to go forward with the sheriff. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you so 18 Thank you, cochairs for this important 19 hearing. 20 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Daneek. 21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear 2.2 testimony from Jill Mariani, senior investigative 2.3 counsel on the Rackets Bureau at the New York [inaudible 01:17:47] of the district attorney's 24

office. Thank you. You may begin when ready.

2 JILL MARIANI: Am I unmuted? Can you

3 hear me?

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Yes.

JILL MARIANI: Okay. Thank you, Chairs Dromm and Cornegy Jr and members of the committee on finance and housing and buildings. Thank you for this opportunity to speak on behalf of the Manhattan District Attorney Office. My name is Jill Mariani and I serve as senior investigative counsel in the Rackets Bureau. I also added a member of the New York State Attorney Generals task force. few greater threats then being displayed from one's home and, shockingly, this can happen through property deed theft or deed fraud as we know it with the stroke of a pen or click of a mouse. Deed from on is not only harrowing from the victim, but it also affects the integrity of our real estate ownership system and real estate taxes that are a substantial source of the New York City revenues, as you are aware. Notary publics are the gate keeper. They have [inaudible 01:18:58] and thwarting the activity is far better than later prosecuting the activity. Now, this crime happens when fraudsters discover prized parcels by either scouring of the two areas

1 72 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 for recently disease donors or canvassing 3 neighborhoods for unoccupied or dilapidated 4 residences or merely looking at public deed property owned by older people. Now, the fraudsters then get 5 control of the property through a variety of criminal 6 7 means, including forging the owner's signature on the deed or tricking the owner to sign the property over 8 or masquerading as a legal distributer transferring 9 the property to one of many different types of 10 11 entities like a limited liability company, a series 12 of shell companies, or a totally fictitious person. 13 The fraudsters are then able to use the property as collateral for mortgages and loans make renovations, 14 15 extract cash for personal benefit. And they may even sell the property to a bonafide purchaser. 16 17 notary public is the gatekeeper poised to avert this 18 most dastardly fraud and that's where many of my comments focus on the resolution of 1427. 19 document associated with a real estate transaction 20 requires a notarization. This required the notary 21 2.2 public to positively identify the signer of the 2.3 document by obtaining proper identification from that

person. Now, virtually, every fraudulent transfer

involves a faulty notarization. Either by a willing

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 73 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE or unwitting Notary Public. Now, brazen perpetrators even affix a fake notary public signature themselves by stealing and using a valid notary public stamp. Or they may lift valid notary commission information from public documents and photoshop them onto new documents. Or using the information about a public notary that is contained in the public filings and get phony public real-- I'm sorry. Notary public real stamps from [inaudible 01:21:10]. And those vendors are not required to verify the commission of the notary public. As you've heard in your County Grand Jury [inaudible 01:21:22] of Manhattan District Attorney Cyrus R. Vance Junior responded to a wave of deed fraud by issuing a first of its kind Grand Jury report in December of 2018 setting forth simple recommendations to combat this problem. One of the recommendations focused on deed fraud-- I'm sorry. Focused on a notary public relationship in the deed fraud. Among some of the things that are recommended which are in Resolution 1427 include requiring all notary public applicants to be fingerprinted as part of a background check and to file an official bond which would establish that the applicant's true identity and [inaudible 01:22:05] applicant ever been

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 74 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE convicted of any [inaudible 01:22:09]. It will also provide victims some measure of recovery for damages in cases of misconduct. The specific recommendations also included an increase in the level of education required to pay, and maintain their notary public appointment and, importantly, to institute new procedures that the Notary Public should follow an exercise to the official act, including keeping a chronological and contemporaneous Journal of all no tutorial acts, have you have heard the Sheriff talk about. Now, to attack this problem, as you've heard the sheriff mentioned, the Manhattan district attorney's office has joined with-- the Sheriff's office as drafted bill language to amend penal law article 170 and 175 involving false property instruments and drafted language that suggests adding a notarial offenses article to the penal law. that would address, with one of the Council members mentioned about holding notary publics accountable, specifically, for impersonating or doing their role in this crime. That would do a lot to prevent what is happening. Since 2018, the Manhattan District Attorney has had a dedicated attorney focusing on issues of real estate, housing, and deed scams.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 75 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE that person can be notified through the district 2 3 attorney's financial fraud hotline at 212-335-9000. 4 In closing, I would like to say that the Notary Public stands in a pivotal position to thwart real 5 estate conveyance fraud and to assist in bringing 6 7 scammers to justice. With Notary Public day being celebrated on November 7 in the United States, it is 8 9 appropriate time to call for legislative review. Notary Public must be viewed as the gatekeeper. 10 11 Thank you for this opportunity. 12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now take 13 questions from Chair Cornegy and Chair Dromm. 14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I believe that the 15 Sheriff and Ms. Hill will be leaving us at this 16 point, if I am not mistaken, so I do want to thank 17 them for their coming in for providing us with 18 answers and giving their testimony. So, thank you 19 I think we're going to go to the public very much. 20 Unless Chair Cornegy has something--21 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: No. No. Thank 2.2 you, Cochair. Yes. 2.3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes. Okay. COMMITTEE COUNSEL: 24 Before that, we would like to open up questions to Council members in

testimony. Okay. We will now turn the testimony from members of the public. I would like to remind everyone that, unlike an hour in person Counsel earrings, we will be calling individuals one by one to testify. Once your name is called, a member of our staff will unmute you and the Sergeant-at-arms will set the timer and announce that you may begin. Testimony will be limited to two minutes. I would now like to call Joseph Sant at the Center for New York City Neighborhoods who will be followed by Beth Finkel of AARP and Jenny Eisenberg of Brooklyn Legal

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

Services. Mr. Sant, you may begin.

JOSEPH SANT: Thank you. I'm grateful for the opportunity to provide testimony this afternoon. My name is Joseph Sant. I am the Deputy General Counsel at the Center for New York City
Neighborhoods. The center promotes and protects

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 77 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE affordable homeownership in New York so that middle and working-class communities are able to live in strong, thriving communities. We were established in 2008 and we have assisted over 74,000 homeowners. Our funders include the New York City Council, the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development, the New York State office of the Attorney General, and other public and private funders. I want to talk about the connection between the left scams and foreclosures. So, the rise of deed theft in New York City is filled by rapidly increasing home values and also by the fact that tens of thousands of New Yorkers are struggling to avoid foreclosure and the negative effects of our ongoing foreclosure crisis are still felt citywide, but I have seen, particularly, in communities of color which were disproportionately targeted and harmed by predatory lending. Nationally, half of the collective wealth of black families was lost during the great recession because of how much home-equity contributed to their total net worth and because predatory loans targeted these communities and, likewise, the Latino community lost an astounding 67 percent of its total wealth during the housing

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

collapse. So, I mentioned that because today, the

COVID-19 pandemic is pushing another wave of

homeowners into the financial danger. We have 10

percent of New York borrowers who are not current on
their mortgages. That is an increase of over 120

percent compared to this time last year. So, New

York now has one of the highest mortgage delinquency
rates in the nation, according the data available
from black night. The homeowners in trouble right
now do have protections, thanks to the federal Cares

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH

2.2

2.3

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

Act and state banking law, 9X, which allow them to

forbear their mortgage payments. But those mortgage

forbearance periods will--

JOSEPH SANT: expire soon and, when those forbearances expire, we anticipate an increase in mortgage distress and foreclosure activity and, with that, a significant increase in the thieves and mortgage rescue scammers. So, I just wanted to make sure that I highlighted that point that, as we see many more homeowners going into distress, we should see this becoming an even more acute problem. In thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony this afternoon. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

[inaudible 01:28:15]

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now hear from Beth Finkel from AARP followed by Jenny Eisenberg from Building Legal Services and Lucy

BETH FINKEL: Thank you very much.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

BETH FINKEL: I'm Beth Finkel. I'm the state director for AARP and we want to say Chair Cornegy and members of the Committee on Housing and Buildings. AARP has over three quarters of a million members in New York City aged 50+ and, as we have heard before, older people have been targeted, so that is why we are here and speaking about that as and our supporters of this work. And also as this overwhelmingly impacts New Yorkers of color and a lot of work recently and disrupting the disparity that many of you know about and this is really about the heart of that work—

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Beth, can you hold on one second? I hear a ringing in the background.

Does everyone else hear that, as well? If everyone can mute themselves if they are not speaking or if

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2.2

2.3

BETH FINKEL: I do get the [inaudible 01:29:16]. I apologize for that. I don't know how to turn it off. I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Okay. Can we restore her time? I'm so sorry, Sergeant-at-arms.

BETH FINKEL: Thank you, sir.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

preying on people in Brooklyn and in South Queens and these are gentrifying areas and we are very concerned about that. The news headlines have these stories and I know many of you talked about the victims. We have also talked about many number of victims in East Flatbush and Bed Stuy and we are very, very concerned about the 3000 deed theft and claims that have been recorded in the city since 2014. I think we have all identified that this is a crisis. Earlier this year, we were very happily joined by [inaudible 01:30:08] to launch the Homeowners Protection Program which we will continue to be a part of because we know how important that is. We also know that the only way to really help these folks is to make sure that they get

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 81 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE access to [inaudible 1:30:25] the legal services in order to secure the address. We also are working with the New York State Attorney General's office and the Department of Financial Services division of housing [inaudible 01:30:40] agencies. What I really want to just stress is that AARP is very pleased to support the Chairs resolution of 1429 and 1430 which respectively call on the state to enact legislation of adopting more stringent standards around corporations names that mimic those of government agencies and [inaudible 01:31:11] 6775 designating the [inaudible 01:31:15] cease and desist zone, as the sheriff spoke about earlier, providing homeowners with the needs to effectively express their wish not to be solicited by [inaudible 01:31:26]. There is so much work to be done here. I have shortened my testimony for the two minutes.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

BETH FINKEL: AARP is very much committed to this work and always fill free to call on us because we really want to be supported. This is such, such important, essential work. So, thank you for [inaudible 01:31:46].

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Great. Thank you,

3 Beth, for your partnership.

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will hear from Jenny Eisenberg of Brooklyn Legal Services followed by Lucy Bloch of ANHD and Rose Marie Cantanno of NYLAG.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

JENNY EISENBERG: Good afternoon. Can you all hear me okay? My name is Jenny Eisenberg. I am a senior staff attorney in the Foreclosure Prevention Project at Brooklyn Legal Services which is actually a program of Legal Services NYC and my testimony today is on the half of Legal Services NYC which is the nation's largest provider of free legal services to poor people. Since 2009, our foreclosure prevention projects have actually represented thousands of families across Brooklyn, Queens, the Bronx, in Staten Island who are at risk of losing their homes to foreclosure and real estate frauds and scams. We have substantial experience litigating and investigating these kinds of cases. I, myself, have quite a few on my docket active right now and we have a pretty unique insight to lend to the committee and the Council as a whole. So, I did not realize that

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

83

3 to say briefly what our responses to the proposed

we would only have two minutes today and I just want

legislation. I understand that there are three

5 proposed resolutions, to proposed revisions to the

6 city administrative code. The short answer to these

7 proposals is, yes. They are great. They would all

8 | likely add incrementally to-- and the goal of

9 reducing deed theft. The longer answer here,

10 unfortunately, is that deed theft is complex and it

11 | is persistent and there are broader measures that the

12 | Council could actually take to address the problem.

13 | I think many of the speakers of already acknowledged

14 the fact that the people who are most vulnerable to

15 | title scams on their property are people who've

16 already been victimized by redlining, predatory

17 | lending, foreclosure, and outdated fraud. Increased

18 funding for access to the legal services would go a

19 tremendous way--

20

25

1

2

4

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

21 JENNY EISENBERG: towards improving

22 people's ability to address these issues because,

23 | ultimately, as many Council members have indicated,

24 | notifications are great, but then what? Who do you

call? And that is why adequate funding for our

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 84 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE network of not just legal services providers, but on the ground community, you know, grassroots housing counselors is really, incredibly important. I also, if I could just take a very, very brief moment to address something that Council member Adams acknowledged at the beginning of this session and that is the abolition of residential properties inclusion in the annual tax lien sale because, when that lien sale list gets published, we are throwing those property owners to the wolves. And their property addresses are out there for all to see. is something that we have consistently advocated around and there is absolutely no reason why these properties need to continually be included on the lien sale list. Finally, and again-- I understand my time is out, but because we are having so many conversations right now about criminal enforcement, I will say that I came before this committee almost 5 years ago and I testified about litigation that I and my colleagues were handling involving one of the many scam outfits that are operating against our clients and that is Homeowners Assistance Services of New York. I understand that Council member Cornegy was very interested in this case. I know that these

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

85 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE cases have been referenced in the proposed legislation and I will say this. Everyone says it would be great to have a lawyer in these situations. I'm not a lawyer and I'm still handling this case almost 5 years later and the FBI got involved in people went to jail. There was a trial. People testified in the southern district. There are numerous resources that were devoted to that one case making it highly unusual and, you know what? We are still fighting to get title back for these clients. So, when we talk about, yeah, it would be great to have a lawyer. It would be great to have resources, I'm here to tell you that those resources are human beings and we need money and we need more staff and we need more time and we need for local law enforcement to be more interested in investigating and prosecuting these cases. We hear time and time again and we now, I know, that these cases take a lot of time and they take a lot of energy and that is true. But if there too hard for local law enforcement to investigate and prosecute and work up the way that, you know, street crimes get investigated and prosecuted and worked up, then we should prioritize that and devote resources and

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 86 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 training and hiring and move in that direction because all also note, as we are having a national 3 conversation about over policing and reallocating 4 criminal justice resources, let's note that these same communities who have been consistently 6 7 victimized over and over again are also the same communities that are getting aggressively 8 policed for street crime and, yet, I have had clients say that they reached out to local law enforcement 10 11 and were met with not the most receptive audience. 12 And not out of hostility, but because these are 13 resource heavy prosecutions. We understand that, but maybe it is time to shift priority. I really 14 15 appreciate everyone listening and I'm happy to take 16 more questions. My prior testimony was significantly 17 more detailed than this and I will supply that to the 18 committee for reference, as well. 19 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Jenny. 20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. Next, we will be hearing from Lucy Block from ANHD, Rose Marie 21 2.2 Cantanno from NYLAG and then followed by Jennifer

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

24

2.3

[inaudible 01:38:15].

1

25

2 LUCY BLOCK: Okay. Good afternoon. Thank 3 you, Chairs Cornegy and Dromm in the Committees on 4 Housing and Buildings, the Committee on Finance. 5 name is Lucy Block. I am a research and policy associate at ANHD, the Association for Neighborhood 6 7 and Housing Development. We're an umbrella 8 organization of more than 80 members citywide to build community power for housing, economic, and racial justice. Many of our members work in 10 11 communities where low income, black, immigrant, and 12 other homeowners of color, as well as their tenants, 13 are at risk of losing their homes. Thank you to both committees for having this hearing on the very 14 15 important issue of deed theft and deed fraud and the 16 interrelated issues of speculation, harassment, and 17 displacement of small homeowners in New York City. 18 would like to thank the previous speakers for 19 bringing in all of these interrelated issues. 20 talking about how this really needs to be understood 21 and addressed holistically. So, ANHD fully supports 2.2 resolutions 1429 and 1430. We partially support 2.3 resolution 1427 and we support introductions 1913 and 1919 with proposed modifications. I'm going to be 24

talking a little bit about our research on

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 88
2	foreclosures and then my more detailed testimony
3	comments on those individual pieces of legislation
4	are in my written testimony that I have provided.
5	So, the problems that are referred to in the proposed
6	resolutions of aggressive and predatory solicitation
7	to pressure senior zone homeowners to relinquish
8	their homes, many times duplicitously and as well as
9	outright fraud to illegally steal deeds. These
10	issues have been occurring for many years. Our
11	members, Cypress Hills Corporate Development
12	Corporation and the Center for New York City
13	Neighborhoods know this because they have been
14	working on these issues for many years to pass
15	legislation to stop this from happening. Now, more
16	than ever, we are seeing that this is a really
17	critical moment to enact today is increased
18	protections. So, to understand this, I did some
19	research on foreclosure filings in 2020 and examined
20	how many foreclosure filings were happening during
21	the worst months of the pandemic and what is been
22	happening over time. I included some charts and
23	tables in my

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

2.2

2.3

mention that the number of foreclosure filings was below 100 in April and May and below 200 in June and July, but it surpassed 400 in August. The number of filings jumped from 192 to 360 in small homes that are one to three units during those months. So, the number of foreclosure filings are dramatically on the rise in recent months which makes this really, really urgent. We are also seeing scheduled foreclosure auctions beginning to take up again and, as I said, there is more detailed information and data in my testimony and I am happy to answer questions.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next, the we will be hearing from Rose Marie Cantanno from NYLAG followed by Jennifer [inaudible 01:41:09] from Legal Aid and Alexis Sloan from the Coalition of Community Advancement.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

ROSE MARIE CANTANNO: My name is Rose

Marie Cantanno and I'm the associate director of the

Consumer Protection Unit at the New York Legal

Assistance Group where I have had the privilege for

the last 10 years unfortunately, as we have heard

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 90 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE many times on this call, deed theft is a persistent problem in New York City. And, unfortunately, the COVID-19 crisis is only exasperating that situation. Homeowners who are desperate to keep their homes or to sell them to provide financial stability for the family are becoming the perfect target for unscrupulous real estate investors, attorneys, and notaries. It is often said that, in crisis, either the best come out in people, but unfortunately, it often brings out the worst. The opportunity to exploit those in dire straits is growing exponentially. The justifiable fear of the virus is being twisted by these charlatans for profit. For example, realtors are using the fear of individuals and telling them that living in cities is too dangerous. That they need to move out to the suburbs. At the same time, they offered to handle everything for the client, including finding a buyer who doesn't need to come into the house, playing on the fear of having strangers traipsing through their homes during the pandemic. The realtor directs the property to their own investor at a highly discounted price, such robbing people of the equity they have spent their whole lives accumulating. The house is

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 91 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE not advertised in the multiple listing service, nor 2 is the community, as a whole, able to see it, 3 4 therefore, there is no competitive bidding process. In many cases, the difference in price can be hundreds of thousands of dollars. On another level, 6 7 because so many small homeowners are struggling with having tenants that are not paying their rent, these 8 people are coming to their homes and saying, I can get them evicted for you. I can take care of this, 10 11 but I can only do this if I am the legal owner and 12 they have the is homeowners sign their deed over, 13 promising them that, as soon as they get the tenant 14 out, they are going to sign the house back over. 15 Unfortunately, what happens is a few months later, it 16 is the homeowners who find themselves in housing 17 court being evicted. For these and all the other 18 things that have been going on, we appreciate everything that the Council is doing to help protect 19 20 homeowners in New York City. Thank you. 21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next, 2.2 we will be hearing from Jennifer Leavy from Legal Aid 2.3 Society, Alexis Sloan from the Coalition for Community Advancement, and [inaudible 01:43:31] from 24

the [inaudible 01:43:32] Society.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Jennifer? We can't hear you. Do you want us to come back to you? You can change your mic input. So-- Okay. We'll come back to you after the next. Next, will be hearing from Alexa Sloan.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

ALEXA SLOAN: Hi. Good afternoon. My name is Alexa Sloan. I am an organizer with the Coalition for Community Advancement, progress for East to New York and Cypress Hills. We are movement of local tenants, homeowners, houses of worship, small businesses, and community organizations in Cypress Hills in East New York who organize for real affordable housing, protections for tenants and homeowners, and new and good jobs for the East. comments today are in the effects of the nonregulated real estate industry on small homeownership and affordable rents in East New York and Cypress Hills. I am here with other East New York coalition members to ask city Council for greater protections and for to see the resolution 1430 past. As many here now, East New York is a predominantly black and Latino, a vibrant multiracial class community and, because of a

exclusionary the black and Latino people, small

block associations and engaged in grassroots

homeowners have identified a pool resources to buy

their homes. Homeowners in East New York have formed

1

2

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

community mobilization. The Coalition for Community
Advancement formed in reaction to the East New York
2016 re-zone and, in the last four years, the
coalition is fought the unregulated real estate
industry. In our conversations with homeowners, we
hear stories weekly of activities emerging on the
criminal. Testimonies of harassment, deed theft, and
predation on the elderly and other vulnerable
homeowners. We know--

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

ALEXA SLOAN: We know of countless people who have been contacted on a weekly and daily basis,

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 94 emailed, called, door knocked by aggressive investors looking to purchase their homes and we know that people under duress and provided with misinformation are selling their homes for wildly undervalued prices. Since the 2000 E. New York rezone past, we have been seeking not have traumatic protections, such as the cease and desist rezone for all of East New York. Petitioning for this zone has been a very long process, very laborious, and very opaque. 2016-- so, in the last four years-- the coalition has collected documentation of intense and repeated speculation by collecting flyers in the mail and logs for homeowners to record the calls and texts and visits that homeowners receive from developers, real estate, and investors. But it wasn't until last year with the support of State Sen. Julia [inaudible 1:47:17] did we learn that there was an official survey that homeowners could use. Last summer, we collected 500 surveys. We sent today's surveys to the New York Department of State in 2000-- September 2019. We had to wait seven months until March of this year for a public hearing. At this public hearing, over 40 East New York homeowners testified to the terrible stories of deed theft, harassment,

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 95 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE and repeated predatory speculative activity that have left many residents feeling forced out of their own homes. After March, we waited until July for the New York Department of State to post a proposed zone which was a small area that the community and asked for. There was a public comment period that lasted 60 days, during which, over 500 residents submitted public comments of support for a zone for all of East New York. And now we have to wait. But it shouldn't have been this difficult nor taken this long for homeowners to seek protections. The cease and desist his own is not a radical measure. If people want to sell their homes, they can still sell their homes. As cease and desist zone for all of Brooklyn as needed and is urgent. City Council, Committee and Housing and Committee on Finance, black and Latino, and working-class homeowners needed more protections from predatory equity and from unregulated real estate industry. New Yorkers need a cease and desist The small homes anti-speculation act and the abolishment of the tax lien sale yesterday. We need city Council to act now. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

96

1

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next,

we will be hearing from Jenna from the Legal Aid
Society, [inaudible 01:48:50] .

5 JENNIFER LEVY: Good afternoon. Can you 6 hear me now?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

Okay. Good. JENNIFER LEVY: about that. I am Jennifer Levy. I am an attorney at the Legal Aid Society in Queens in the foreclosure prevention department. The legal aid Society has been at the forefront of advocating for the rights of homeowners in the city, state, and local levels since 2000 through our foreclosure prevention in home equity preservation projects. Since its inception, we have assisted homeowners by challenging abusive lending and real estate practices in state and federal court, defending homeowners in foreclosure actions and, since 2008, advocated for loss mitigation act court mandated settlement conferences. Through our advocacy for homeowners in fighting to save their homes from foreclosure, we have seen countless homeowners fall victim of various kinds of scams and deed theft, seeking to profit from their The foreclosure crisis has had a devastating

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 97 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE impact on low income neighborhoods, communities of color, the elderly. And it is these very same communities that have become targets of deed theft and related scams. Deed theft can take many different forms. We've seen everything from outright recording of fraud dealing deed transfers without the knowledge of the homeowner to tricking homeowners into transferring the deed to their home to a scammer in the belief that they are applying for a loan modification. A more recent form of deed theft includes fraudulent short sales which, in particular, has targeted seniors in foreclosure and those with reverse mortgages. The fact that foreclosures, mortgage, and property information are public and easily accessible online, has made it easy for scammers to identify and target homeowners in financial distress. Homeowners of color, those who do not speak English as their first language, and especially our elderly homeowners are constantly and aggressively approached by mail, phone, and in person solicitations at their homes. Deed theft is not always committed by a large entity, victimizing hundreds of homeowners throughout New York City.

Smaller sized to scammers who use a uniquely named

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

98

LLC for each fraudulent deed transfer makes it even 2 more challenging to detect. They often use the 3

address of the target property is the name of the 4

6

LLC. We often---

1

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

JENNIFER LEVY: see individuals hiding behind LLCs with government or official sounding names. A particularly targeted population are seniors, especially those with the reverse mortgage for which they have no personal liability or a tax lien which is of public record showing that they may be in financial distress. I'm just going to give one case example real quick. A prime example is Ms. D, an elderly homeowner with a reverse mortgage who fell behind in paying her property taxes and therefore was at risk of foreclosure. When she called her reverse mortgage servicer, she was incorrectly told that she would the entire loan balance on her reverse mortgage and her only choice was to sell her home. As a result, she fell victim to a real estate scammer who knocked on her door and made her believe that she was merely signing an agreement to list her house for sale, however, instead, she was tricked into signing a contract of sale to sell her house to an LLC for

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 99 just \$200,000 when her house was worth 500,000. 2 Τo 3 make it worse, that brazen LLC then brought a lawsuit for breach of contract to force the sale. We commend 4 the city Council on their efforts to address this 5 serious issue and we also would like to urge the city 6 7 Council to support an expansion of the cease-anddesist zone beyond Brooklyn to areas such as Queens. 8 Thank you so much. COMMITTEE COUNSEL: 10 Thank you. Next, 11 will be hearing from Erobos Abzu Lamashtu, Paula Segal from Take Root Justice and [inaudible 12 01:52:28]. 13 14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time. 15 EROBOS ABZU LAMASHTU: Hello. All right. Can you hear me? 16 17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We can. Yes. 18 EROBOS ABZU LAMASHTU: All right. 19 signed up just to listen for information basically to 20 [inaudible 01:52:56] property. I'm currently in the 21 Fortune Society program. Thank goodness for that. 2.2 But I didn't sign up for testimony and [inaudible 2.3 01:53:04] in case I do become a property owner one

day. I'm learning about the protections and

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 100 different things. [inaudible 01:53:13] to testify, but I find this very informative.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

EROBOS ABZU LAMASHTU: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we'll be hearing from Paula Segal from Take Root Justice then followed by Avi Gross and then followed by Richard Flateau.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

PAULA SEGAL: Thank you so much. Attorney and Take Root Justice. It's an equitable neighborhoods practice. Thank you so much for the Council, first of all, and the members who are here for helping us launch Take Root Justice and the hardest fiscal year that we have had in a very long time. The Councils support in spinning off from our parent organization in the last year has been So, really, my gratitude to the members invaluable. here today. I am really pleased to be a part of this hearing and it does feel like a follow-up to the hearing we had five years ago. Thank you so much, Sheriff, for the updates and the practices that have been improved in those five years, but I really sad to say that a lot of things have not changed. And I

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 101 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE am going to focus my testimony on what Counsel member 2 3 Adams rightfully pointed out as the shadow stepchild 4 of deed fraud which is the New York City tax lien sale and I am going to urge the members here who have the legislative power to just let the tax lien sale 6 7 die. Let it be a bad memory, a bad Rudy Giuliani dream and let this be the last year that the city 8 publishes a list of homeowners and other property owners in distress that paints a bull's-eye on those 10 11 vulnerable homeowners and gives property speculators 12 a roadmap to who they might be able to fall into 13 stealing their properties and whose properties they might be able to take without may be ever interacting 14 15 with anybody. As I told you about five years ago, in 16 fact, in my practice, I have been encountering the 17 worst of the deed thieves in the Makani Brothers who 18 I think some folks here know. They discovered a property in prospect [inaudible 01:55:29] in Brooklyn 19 on the tax lien sale list in 2003, reported to find 20 21 some heirs of the deceased, a Guyanese emigrant. have gotten in the District Attorney's Office and 2.2 2.3 involved. They declined the case. 2003 was much too long ago. The case is still going. We had to find 24

that heirs, we had to help them find counsel.

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 102
2	city has actually acquired the property and there is
3	\$2.3 million sitting in escrow with the court that
4	should rightly go to this immigrant family whose
5	property this is in that case is still being
6	litigated. In the meantime, we have a new park in
7	prospect. That's really great. I just want to thank
8	Council member Cornegy, particularly, for his
9	resolution, resolution 1429 addressing the names of
10	corporations our friends, the Makani's regularly use.
11	Housing and urban development LLC, HPD LLC, and
12	Queens LLC as their cover in these transactions
13	making it a very compelling trick for the folks that
14	they interact with. So, I have submitted written
15	testimony with a little bit more detail. Thank you
16	so much.
17	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.
18	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Paula.
19	It's actually good to see you.
20	PAULA SEGAL : [inaudible 01:56:52]
21	Thank you.
22	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: next, we will be
23	hearing from Avi Gross followed by Richard Flateau
24	followed by Linda Ford.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Thank you, Chairs Cornegy and AVI GROSS: Dromm, for this opportunity. I am not going to read off a written testimony, but I would like to share with you through my personal grievance which has to do with fraud and affordable housing. I've become aware of thousands -- that's the number. Thousands of affordable deeds which were fraudulently transferred to privileged parties, for lack of a better word, and I'm just going give one example here. We have, on the left side, you can see the city of New York. On the right side Majin Der Bahanot [sp?]. He received the property that is worth-- and affordable property with the market value of about \$700,000 for the attractive price of 1040. And that is one of thousands of examples. Now, Chair Cornegy, when I took this information to the relevant authorities and, again, there are thousands of affordable properties that were transferred for ridiculous sums. The answer I got really concerned me and the answer was, well, maybe there was a lien on the property. Maybe that is why it was sold for such an attractive price. And I hear that from law enforcement, that sort of gave me the impression of this is why it is happening because

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 104

there is no enforcement to begin with. So, if the

perpetrators know that the answer will be, oh, well,

we are not going to look into it. And affordable

property was given for 100th of a price, then isn't

that a great motivation for people to do this and

continue to do this?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

I'm just going to give here AVI GROSS: another example. And as you can see here, on all these deeds, these are all official signatures of chorizo wood and Commissioner. So, my plea deal, Chair Cornegy-- you know, been watching you for a long time. I know you are a person of integrity and I know you care about the public, but the problem here is whoever has access to affordable properties is able to transfer them fraudulently. Then I have thousands of examples. For a fraction of the price. And, unfortunately, these are people that have access to ACRIS and nobody is watching over them. know you are a person of integrity. I know you wouldn't stand for this. The question is how can we get this to stop? Public property is meant for the public, not for privileged parties so fraudulently transferred to themselves for a fraction of the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 price. And, finally, if you want examples of any of

3 the thousands of fraudulent deeds I have uncovered, I

would be more than happy to send them to you. Thank

5 you for your consideration.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, offer you. If you could provide me a correspondence in the chat, somebody from my office will reach out to you in the next 24 hours. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will be hearing from Richard Flateau followed by Linda Ford and Sarah H.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

thank Chairs Dromm and Cornegy, for holding this hearing. I didn't get on in the beginning, so I'm not sure, but I think I might be the only actual victim of property fraud. So, I was a victim of a fraud that the case is actually been tried in the person convicted. They were involved with the ring that stole six properties and I am beneficiary of the ACRIS notification. The way that I was able to get to this quickly and early on was the day after the person signed a fraudulent document, I got notified by ACRIS and I proceeded to make whatever noise I

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 106 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE could and I notified the sheriff's office and the DA. So, I would like to publicly thank Council member Cornegy for standing with me at a press conference in 2016 which helped to smoke out the perpetrator and bring them to justice. Since the time is so short, I'm just going to focus on a few policy recommendations, policy and legislative recommendations. Just kind of reverse engineering what happened to me. So, first of all, I would like to say that I'm fully in support of resolution 1427, as well as Intro 1913 and 1919. I just have for policy recommendations. First one is that this should be a mandated notification of recorded property documents. I know right now people have to sign up. Second, there should be an enhanced security of notary information. What happened in my case is that notary was actually a fake. Somebody had stolen a notary stamp. So, it has to be more security about that.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

RICHARD FLATEAU: all just go over the last two and I will submit written testimony. There should be increased penalty for fraud involving notaries. And then, enhanced security and integrity

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

of the recording process. So, I well flush those

3 things out in written testimony which I will submit

4 to the committees. Thank you.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Richard, I want to thank you for your testimony and, since you are here in Crown Heights area, you know, if it can happen to you, you know, those seniors and people on and ciliary streets and people who have issues around immigration, we got really, really concerned because if people would be so bold and brazen to attack yourself and your family— and I'm assuming they didn't know your family history, but—

RICHARD FLATEAU: No.

quickly that there were people out here who were doing it to people who weren't willing to come forward. Your willingness to come forward and not be embarrassed—— I've met with people on several occasions who felt embarrassed by some type of fraud over them falling victim and were unwilling to expose their own trauma because of embarrassment or because of this kind of things, so I want to thank you for stepping forward and being an example. You helped us bring more people out into the forefront about the

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 108
2	issues that they were facing because you were willing
3	to put a face on it and a name to it. So, again,
4	thank you. There were many more cases after yours we
5	were able to help litigate because you were able to
6	stand publicly in a press conference and talk about
7	that. So, I know that couldn't have been easy to do
8	and thank you again for doing it.
9	RICHARD FLATEAU: Thank you. Just so
10	people know, I'm a real estate broker. I'm also
11	currently the Chair of Community Board three and I am
12	the former president of a real estate board and
13	someone actually defrauded me. So, thank you very
14	much, Council member Cornegy and Council member Dromm
15	and all the other Council members who are trying to
16	tighten the regulations around property fraud.
17	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Point you will have
18	Sarah H followed by Randall Cobb and Jessica Franco.
19	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.
20	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.
21	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sarah? Are you
22	there? Okay. We can come back to you. Next up, we
23	have Randall Cobb, Jessica Franco, and Hannah
24	Anousheh.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2 RANDALL COBB: Hello. Can everyone

3 hear me?

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We can hear you.

RANDALL COBB: Okay. Great. Good afternoon to everyone my name is Randall Cobb. live in the Bedford Stuyvesant area of Brooklyn. I've been a victim of the stand and more so, in other words, equity theft. I have been going through this battle for going on seven years. I have been harassed, tricked, and just pretty much, lied to all seeking help from saving my home. It has been a very hard and difficult situation where, you know, it is good hearing that these laws are out there, but, in my case, which I have a very clear case of the left, that I'm not getting any help whatsoever. contacted the DA, the AG office, and I am still waiting on them to respond due to my situation. to no avail. No one has reached out to me and in helping me. I need help and I am sure I'm not just speaking only for myself, but for others who have been in this matter. It is just been like a ring around and, yes, these laws are there, but they are not being enforced because why I haven't been helped?

You know, everything is very clear and vivid of what

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I went through, but there is no help and I am just pleading for help.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

110

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will be hearing from Jessica Franco, followed by Hannah Anousheh from East New York Community Land Trust and Debra Ack from East New York Community Land Trust.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

JESSICA FRANCO: My name is Jessica Franco. My husband and I are first generation firsttime homeowners. We purchased our home from an investor added above market value rent of 600,000. The same home. Just recently purchased six months before for 190,000. We have received -- since then, we have received countless letters, flyers, personal visits for offers for our home. Within a five mile radius of our home, we have seen a rotation of 2 to 3 homes being for sale within every block. flipping is causing property value and property taxes to increase linking Cypress Hills, is New York, and brought going completely unaffordable to working families. I have witnessed how my neighbors, especially her seniors, have been heavily harassed. Everything from being followed to a laundry mat, the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 111
supermarket, to the post office, all with the goal of
purchasing their home and flipping it. We need to
criminalize deed fraud. We need to stop home
flipping that is causing displacement of working
families, and we need to pass a cease and desist zone
for all of Brooklyn. We need to be intentional about

protecting and preserving communities and ending

displacements. Thank you.

2.2

2.3

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next, will be hearing from Hannah Anousheh from East New York Community Plan Trust, Debra Ack from East New York Community Land Trust, and Andrea Granville from East New York Community Plan Trust.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

MANNAH ANOUSHEH: Good afternoon, Council members. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. My name is Hannah Anousheh and I am the staff coordinator for the East New York Community Land Trust Initiative, and organization of the is New York and Brownsville residents who are dedicated to fighting displacement and taking community ownership of land. Like several people who spoke before me, want to point out. Speculators use the list of lien sale and legible properties to target people who are

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

112

2 | struggling financially or elderly and have fixed

3 incomes. They prey on people in the lien sale listed

4 and many homeowners are convinced to sell their

5 homes, you know, often for significantly less then

6 | the home's value. The East New York Community Plan

7 Trust and our partners across New York City recognize

8 | the lien sale law as a racist and unjust law

9 characteristic of its creator, Rudy Giuliani. The

10 lien sale law expires at the end of this year. The

11 | last time it was renewed was in 2016. The city

12 Council has a responsibility to let this law sunset

13 | and to work with communities that are most impacted

14 | to create a more just and equitable system for debt

15 | collection. You know, to put it simply, renewing the

16 lien sale law with small reforms is shortsighted and

17 | not acceptable. When we talk about adjust recovery,

18 | about transforming unjust systems in the wake of a

19 crisis to build a more equitable economy, this is

20 what we mean. Thank you for your time.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next,

22 | we will be hearing from Debra Ack from the East New

23 York Community Land Trust followed by Andrea

24  $\parallel$  Granville from East New York Community Plan Trust and

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 Albert Scott also from the East New York Community
3 Plan Trust.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

DEBRA ACK: Good afternoon, all. My name is Debra ack and I am a member of the East New York Community Plan captures Initiative. I also sit on the committee for the education and outreach for that land trust. I am here just to share a part of my experience with homeowners. No. I'm not a homeowner, am a renter, but it affects everyone when the staff's take place. It affects the renters, too, because the renters, unfortunately, we are unaware of what is going on. But recently, I have had the opportunity to call about 30 people who were on this New York City tax lien sale register. I think that this register needs to be abolished along with the tax lien sale. With calling the is 30 residents, they are very fearful because they do not know, first of all, who I am. I have had people accuse me of being a scammer, yell and scream at me. Oh, you are trying to buy my home from me. These people are just unaware of exactly what is out there for them that they have been, obviously, reached by other people who have been trying to buy their home from them or

and your family are well and I am just going to

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 115 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 reiterate what everyone else is saying. We need to abolish the tax lien sale. Not, you know, extended, 3 4 postpone it, because we know that the black and brown communities are the ones that are impacted by it the most. That whole process for the lien sale is 6 7 outdated, it's archaic, and it just needs to be abolished completely. We have people losing their 8 homes sometimes just for hundreds of dollars and it's, you know, disgrace and it is predatory. And I 10 11 think the best thing for the Council members, anyone 12 who has impact, to make this, you know, tax lien sale 13 go away, that is what should be done. It should be abolished because it is preying on those who have no 14 15 voice to speak for themselves and that is why we are 16 all here today speaking for them. So, I ask you, 17 please abolish the tax lien sale. Thank you. 18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. we have Albert Scott from East New York Community 19 Land Trust followed by Linda Ford followed by Sarah 20 21 Η. 2.2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time. 2.3 ALBERT SCOTT: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Albert Scott and I'm with the 24

East New York Community Plan Trust initiative.

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 116 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 just like my peers mentioned earlier, I'm asking New York City Council and definitely this committee to 3 4 champion and abolish the New York City tax lien sale. Apparently, the sale has been weaponized, first for the Wall Street firms to take away land and 6 7 properties within black and brown communities and then now it has been further weaponized where crooks 8 utilize this as leads to target communities of color. By abolishing this tax lien sale, it would be the 10 11 first initial step in addressing this prevalent issue 12 of teen fraud in which it targets communities such as 13 Brownsville and is New York. And I just definitely want to remind this dynamic body, the New York City 14 15 Council, that this was a former mayor Rudolph 16 Giuliani law that perpetuated this and he was 17 definitely not a friend to communities such as 18 Brownsville and East New York. Keep the generational wealth in which communities and individuals have 19 20 worked so hard for and maintaining their properties and remained in communities such as Brownsville and 21 2.2 East New York where everyone had left. Abolish the 2.3 New York City tax lien sale. We need your help to

remain in New York City. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 117 2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next, 3 we will be hearing from Linda Ford followed by Sarah 4 Η. 5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time. COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Linda Ford? 6 Next, 7 will be hearing from Sarah H. 8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time. 9 SARAH HACK: Hello. My name is Sara Lee I am a victim of deed fraud, home theft. 10 11 completely understand to say-- I just want to say first of all, thank you for having me here to other 12 13 committees. I would just like to say that I agree with Mr. Cobb and I have been in this situation for 14 15 maybe two, going on three years now. I have reached 16 out for help. I've been with numerous numbers of 17 attorneys that refused to take my case because they 18 were all involved with the same circle of the situation that is going on. I was notified by the 19 Department of Finance saying that someone was trying 20 21 to put a deed on my home. I contacted them, 2.2 explained everything, and so far, as Mr. Cobb said, I 2.3 reached out to the Attorney General, several council

members and still no help. The only person that I

have received any type of help from was Mr. Cornegy's

24

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 118 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE office. And I appreciate that, Mr. Cornegy. But, as they said, there is not enough that's going on to enforce or to push the issue that is going on right now because people are still suffering and they don't know how to respond to what is going on. I have all of my documents. I have my title, my deed and they are claiming that my house was sold under an auction lien when I didn't owe anything and now they've taken out at least two or three mortgages on my home. took over my water bill and I'm still living on the property. They even send me eviction notices which one lawyer had said to me that it was fake and she took herself off the case which she was a civil suit lawyer and she said she couldn't help me because she was too deep involved with what's going on. So, how can we get help if the majority of these lawyers and legal aid--

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

SARAH HACK: who is supposed to be helping us get through this? How are we supposed to get help as a victim? Thank you for your help and thank you for your time.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Last, will be hearing from Linda Ford.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

2.2

2.3

have to let us unmute you or else we won't be able to hear your testimony. Okay. I'm sorry. We won't be able to hear you. Okay. Well, thank you. This concludes the public testimony for today's hearing. If we have inadvertently forgotten the call on somebody to testify, that person can raise their hand using the zoom function and we will try to hear from you. Okay. We will now turn the hearing over the Chair Cornegy to close the hearing.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Genan.

Thank you, everyone who is testified today and,
although this hearing is coming to an end, the work
necessary to the security and to protect our
homeowners in this city is not ending. This is the
beginning of a continued collaboration between policy
legislation, advocacy, to make sure that we can
protect those very vulnerable homeowners who are
standing right in front of deed that in deed fraud.
I want to say that in communities like mine, this is
a three legged stool between deed theft and deed
fraud, the use of the lien sale listed in the use of
the third-party transfer list conspiring when it is

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH 1 120 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 2 unchecked to displace homeowners. For tenants and there are tenants' rights and protections. 3 to have the same staunch advocacy and policy and 4 legislation around homeownership. 5 In black communities, homeownership has conspired to help us 6 7 build wealth in the transfer wealth, to pay for our children's education's, to pay for the ability to 8 start businesses, and equity is incredibly important. In sum, we don't want to look past that. So, I want 10 11 to thank my partners in city and state government for 12 their work in this. I want to especially say thank 13 you to the cochairs of the Black Latino And Asian caucus. We have taken this up as a mantle. A 14 15 special thank you to Cory Johnson who is our speaker 16 at a very special thank you to our finance chair 17 Danny Dromm for cochairing this hearing and for the 18 emphasis put on for communities of color around the city and state of New York. Thank you. And, with 19 20 that, I would like to--21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Cornegy. 2.2 Chair Dromm would like to make just a short--2.3 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I'm passing it to That was my--- my only [inaudible 02:24:13] 24

reference for today, too, by the way.

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 121
2	CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. They
3	only thing I wanted to say is thank you to you, Chair
4	Cornegy. This was an excellent hearing. Very
5	informative and particularly emotional the year the
6	stories of those who have been directly affected by
7	deed fraud. So, thank you and I look forward to
8	continuing to work on the legislation into passing it
9	as soon as possible and the city Council. Thank you
10	very much, Chair Cornegy.
11	CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you. And,
12	with that, the
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

## $C \ E \ R \ T \ I \ F \ I \ C \ A \ T \ E$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 21, 2020