CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK

----- Х

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- Х

September 24, 2020 Start: 1:05 p.m. Recess: 2:24 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing

B E F O R E: Antonio Reynoso CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Margaret S. Chin Andrew Cohen Fernando Cabrera Costa Constantinides Justin Brannan Chaim M. Deutsch

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ed Grayson, Acting Commissioner Department of Sanitation

Gregory Anderson, Assistant Commissioner of Policy and External Affairs Department of Sanitation

Paul Visconti, Chief of Cleaning Department of Sanitation

Kathy Nizzari Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board

Eric Goldstein Natural Resources Defense Council

Sabrina Rezzy, Director of Communications and Legislation for Assembly Member Rodneyse Bischotte

Debora Rivas The Bushwick Initiative

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 3
2	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Okay. Good afternoon.
3	At this time, will Sergeants please start the
4	recordings? Good afternoon, everyone, and welcome to
5	today's remote New York City Council hearing of the
6	Committee on Sanitation. At this time, would all
7	panelists please turn on the video? To minimize
8	disruption, please place electronic devices to
9	vibrate or silent. If you wish to submit any
10	testimony, you may do so at
11	<pre>testimony@Council.NYC.gov. Again, that is</pre>
12	Council.NYC.gov. Thank you for your cooperation. We
13	are ready to begin.
14	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council member
15	Reynoso, are you ready to being the hearing?
16	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes. I don't have
17	a gap, so I will be using some tools that I had here.
18	[gavel]
19	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you for
20	joining our virtual hearing today on street and
21	sidewalk cleanliness in New York City. First, I
22	would like to acknowledge my colleagues that have
23	joined us. I see Council member Brannan, Council
24	member Chin, Council member Cabrera, Council member
25	Cohen that have currently joined us. Thank you. I

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 4
2	want to give a reminder that there is a significant
3	delay, about two minutes, when loading the live
4	broadcasting and when I'm muting and muting for about
5	10 seconds, so we want to just make sure that we give
6	an opportunity for panelists to speak with time. And
7	I think I'm going to now get this over to the
8	moderator, Nicole Abene.
9	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I'm
10	Nicole Abene, committee counsel to the Committee on
11	Sanitation and Solid Waste Management at the New York
12	City Council. Before we begin, I want to remind
13	everyone that you will be on mute until you are
14	called to testify when you will be un-muted by the
15	host. I will be calling on panelists to testify.
16	Please listen for your name to be called. I will be
17	periodically announcing the next panelists will be.
18	We will begin with testimony from the administration
19	followed by the public testimony. The first three
20	panelists for the public testimony portion will be
21	Kathy Nizzari, followed by Jeffrey Le Françoise,
22	followed by Eric Goldstein. I will call you when it
23	is your turn to speak. During the hearing, if
24	Council members would like to ask a question, please
25	use the zoom raise hand function and I will call you

1COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT
52in the order that you have raised your hand. We will3be limiting Council member questions to five minutes.4Thank you. Chair, if you would like to give your5opening statement.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 6 Yes. Good 7 afternoon. I am Council member Antonio Reynoso and I am the chair of the Committee on Solid Waste in 8 9 Sanitation. Welcome to this hearing on street sidewalk cleanliness in New York City. As I am sure 10 11 you are all aware, the Department of Sanitation 12 budget was reduced dramatically in the budget for 13 fiscal year 2021. There is about 24.5 million glass 14 in the SRI budget to keep our streets and sidewalks 15 clean then there was in fiscal year 2020. Alternate 16 side parking was suspended for most of the summer and 17 is now in effect, but with the reductions. Streets 18 are being cleaned and little baskets are being 19 emptied less frequently. New Yorkers are reporting 20 overflowing litter baskets, garbage on the streets 21 and sidewalks, and an increase in rat sightings. The 2.2 Department of Sanitation to be funded to do the work 23 that we all rely on them to do. These cuts are making it difficult for DSNY to keep our streets and 24 25 sidewalks clean. There was just an announcement that

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 6 some funding is being reallocated to reinstate some 2 3 of the services that have been reduced. I'm 4 interested to understand where this money came from and how it will be distributed throughout the city. 5 Litter baskets are not only being filled with litter, 6 7 but, in some cases, they are being filled with bags 8 of household or business garbage. This is illegal 9 and is adding to the garbage on our streets. We made businesses and households to dispose of garbage 10 11 properly and keep litter baskets for their intended 12 The cuts made the DSNY were too extreme and we use. 13 are seeing the consequences of this throughout the city. New Yorkers deserve clean streets and 14 15 sidewalks and, I, as an advocate for restoring 16 funding, I want to also ask individuals to be mindful 17 of where they are placing their trash. Please do your part to keep our streets litter and rat free and 18 19 dispose of business and residential garbage properly, 20 not in litter baskets. I look forward to hearing 21 DSNY's testimony on how we can do a better job 2.2 keeping our streets clean. I'm also interested in 23 where the reallocated funding will be able to increase litter basket pick up. I want to be sure 24 that this money is being distributed equitably that 25

1COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT
72there is a plan to keep all of our streets garbage3free. Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I will now call on members of the administration to testify. Acting 5 Commissioner Ed Grayson, Assistant Commission for 6 7 policy and external affairs Gregory Anderson, and chief of cleaning Paul Visconti. I will now deliver 8 9 the oath to the administration then I will call on each of you individually to record your answers. 10 11 Speak loudly and clearly when you answer. Do you 12 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this committee and to 13 14 respond honestly to Council member questions? Acting 15 Commissioner Ed Grayson? 16 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: I do. 17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant 18 Commissioner for policy and external affairs Gregory 19 Anderson? 20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER GREGORY: I do. 21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief of cleaning Paul Visconti? 2.2 23 PAUL VISCONTI: I do. 24 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 8
2	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can you respond
3	again? Your video didn't pop up. Chief of cleaning
4	Paul Visconti?
5	PAUL VISCONTI: I do. Can you hear me?
6	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. That was
7	good. Thank you. And you may begin when you are
8	ready.
9	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank
10	you. Good morning. Good afternoon, rather. Good
11	afternoon, Chair Reynoso and members of the city
12	Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste
13	Management. I am Edward Grayson and acting
14	Commissioner of the New York City Department of
15	Sanitation. With me here today was just sworn in as
16	Gregory Anderson, our Assistant Commissioner for
17	policy and external affairs and Paul Visconti, chief
18	of cleaning operations. Thank you for the
19	opportunity this afternoon to discuss sidewalk and
20	street cleanliness in New York City. Before I begin,
21	I would like to think Commissioner Catherine Garcia
22	for her 6 1/2 years of service and leadership to the
23	department. Under her leadership, the department has
24	accomplished many things, creating the nation's
25	largest curbside composting program, working with

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 9 this Council to pass landmark ways to equity and 2 3 commercial wastes on laws, implementing new state of 4 the art technologies to modernize operations, and making New York City cleaner than at any time in 5 history. And for all of us here, we wish her all the 6 7 best in her future endeavors. In addition, I would 8 also like to recognize our first deputy commissioner 9 Stephen Kostis who recently announced his retirement for October 1st this year. Commissioner Kostis has 10 11 been steadfast in his commitment to the department 12 for over the last 34 years and I'm thankful to him 13 for his leadership, censorship, and, most importantly, friendship over the course of my entire 14 15 career. While I was appointed acting Commissioner 16 less than a week ago, I have, for the last 21 years, 17 a variety of roles in the department. Including the 18 director of Bureau cleaning and collection for the 19 last three years, the operations chief during the 20 2016 Jonas blizzard, the largest snowstorm in city's 21 history, and I am proud to dedicate my career to this department. 2.2 I am honored to have been named to the 23 acting Commissioner by Mayor DeBlasio and I look forward to working with all of you to continue to 24 25 keep New York City safe and clean. New York City has

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 10 been the epicenter of the COVID-19 outbreak. 2 In this 3 country and on a scale of nearly unimaginable earlier 4 this year. I am extremely proud of the men and women of the Department who work hard to deliver essential 5 sanitation services daily in all five boroughs. 6 7 Throughout this crisis, our employees have shown 8 incredible commitment and dedication. Coming to work every day despite fear and anxiety, despite the 9 terrible disease taking a devastating toll on our 10 11 workforce. This global health pandemic has dramatically upended all of our lives and the 12 13 economic fallout is unprecedented. Unfortunately, the FY 21 budget reflects that reality. As with all 14 15 other agencies, this department has had to make some very difficult choices and cuts to programs that are 16 17 important to many New Yorkers and, unless the city 18 receives relief in the form of support from the federal government or long-term borrowing authority 19 at the state level, additional cuts loom on the 20 21 horizon that could be truly devastating to our core 2.2 services. The budget cuts this year include major 23 reductions in DSNY's cleaning resources. These include a 63 percent reduction in litter basket 24 collection trucks compared to last fiscal year, a 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 11 reduction from 736 trucks to just 272 trucks weekly. 2 3 This includes the elimination of all Sunday and 4 holiday litter basket service. A 30 percent reduction in baseline funded weekday litter basket 5 service. Elimination of the supplemental litter 6 7 basket collection that was part of the neighborhood 8 rodent reduction and Clean NYC programs, as well as 9 the nonrenewal of the 8.6 million in funding for supplemental basket service added at the budget 10 11 adoption of FY 20. So, in addition to the budget 12 included -- in addition, that budget also included a 13 30 percent reduction in headcount for the lot cleaning unit, elimination of highway on and off ramp 14 cleaning services, elimination of the dedicated 15 16 syringe litter -- syringe collection team. Together, 17 these cuts have had a real impact on the street and 18 sidewalk cleanliness in New York City. As more and 19 more New Yorkers have taken to our streets to play, 20 dine, learn, and unwind, the amount of litter and 21 waste has increased, particularly in parts of the 2.2 outer boroughs that were hardest hit by COVID-19. As 23 I sit before you today, I recognize this reality. Our streets and sidewalks are not as clean as you 24 25 become used to, particularly compared to the record

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 12 service levels and cleanliness we have experienced 2 3 over the last several years. I assure you that, 4 despite these budget cuts, we are committed to maximizing the value of these limited resources we 5 have to improve the quality of life in our 6 7 communities. This crisis has also given us an 8 opportunity to test new approaches to street 9 cleaning. In conjunction with the city's stay all mortars, the city suspended alternate side parking 10 11 regulations for a total of 17 weeks. In large part, 12 the city streets remain clean during the height of 13 the pandemic, despite the suspension. In June, Mayor 14 DeBlasio announced a new pilot for alternate side 15 parking where most residential streets would be swept 16 only once per week to alleviate the impact of ASP on 17 New York City drivers. While many neighborhoods 18 already had once per week sweeping, particularly in 19 the less dense neighborhoods. In other areas, 20 streets have been swept twice or three times per week. We continue to evaluate this pilot with the 21 goal of balancing street cleanliness and convenience. 2.2 23 Sweeping schedules in needed areas, though, have not changed. There is good news. Last week, the Mayor 24 25 announced several issues focused on improving

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 13 cleanliness and reducing letter in our neighborhoods. 2 3 This announcement included a partial restoration of litter basket service, restoring 65 litter basket 4 trucks per week with a focus on the neighborhoods 5 hardest hit by the COVID-19 pandemic, as well as a 6 7 few other areas across the city that will see 8 increased pedestrian traffic as employees return to 9 the workforce. Through the Economic Development Corporation, Clean NYC initiative, the city will 10 11 provide funding to the Dole funds to provide 12 supplemental cleaning services in neighborhoods and 13 parks across the city through the end of the calendar The supplemental cleaning will support the 14 year. 15 efforts by DSNY and the Department of Parks and Recreation, as well as business improvement districts 16 17 and other community partners. The Dole fund provides 18 employment, career and training, and social services 19 to homeless and formerly incarcerated individuals. 20 Lastly, the City will expand efforts to partner with 21 community-based organizations, elected officials, and 2.2 the private sector to sponsor community cleanups and 23 mobilize volunteers to collect litter on streets and parks. The city will provide tools and logistics 24 25 support to those groups who host cleanups. We have

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 14 also received nearly 1.9 million in funds from the 2 3 New York City Council members through NYC cleanup 4 initiatives. These funds will enable DSNY to restore additional services and supplement our budgeted 5 services. Now, more than ever, we rely on the 6 7 cooperation and support of our fellow New Yorkers to 8 help us keep New York City clean. We need all New 9 Yorkers to do their part. Don't litter. Use the baskets properly and clean up after yourselves and 10 11 your pets. But even more, we encourage residents, 12 community organizations, business owners, and others, 13 to help clean our city. Already, dozens of local and state elected officials have hosted community cleanup 14 15 events in our parks, plazas, neighborhoods. We 16 encourage groups of volunteers to do the same and we 17 provide tools and resources to any groups interested 18 in doing such. I think the Counsel for their past, 19 present, and future support as the Department continues to provide essential services during this 20 unprecedented crisis. And now my team and I will be 21 2.2 happy to respond to any questions. Thank you. 23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Sorry. We're going to be hearing some feedback from my son 24 25 in the background often, I guess, at this point.

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 15
2	Yeah. So, I want to just thank you, Commissioner,
3	for your words. Your kind words related to
4	Commissioner Kathy Garcia. This is the first hearing
5	that we are going to have without her and it is a sad
6	day. She has been absolutely amazing. Working
7	together with her we have been able to accomplish a
8	lot, but I'm looking forward to your 10 year, as
9	well. We also have been working together and have a
10	relationship and I know how much you care about the
11	city and how much you care about the Department of
12	Sanitation. A lot of people don't know your
13	background, but I know that garbage has been in your
14	life for a long time, Commissioner. So, if you could
15	just speak I actually would like to take some
16	time, if you could just speak to a little bit of that
17	background in your history so the folks on this
18	committee that are meeting new from the first time
19	can get to know you.
20	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: So, my
21	pleasure. So, I am the son of a retired sanitation
22	worker and my mother also worked for the department
23	many years ago when they started the recycling
24	program. She was one of the first outreach
25	coordinators who tried to get the people of the city

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 16 to get on board back in the late 80s. My father 2 3 worked the truck and he retired as a supervisor in 4 Brooklyn North and, after both of them had long been past their prime here, I joined the department 5 through the regular civil service channels and I 6 started my career in Queens Community board three, 7 8 the garage there. I remember quite well doing the 9 basket truck every midnight on Roosevelt Avenue and throughout East Elmhurst in Jackson Heights. 10 11 Additionally, I have a little bit of synergy also 12 with the Chair because I grew up in Ridgewood and I--13 where I went to junior high is right in his district, so very familiar with the day-to-day. I love the 14 15 department. Have been doing this for over two decades and I am not agnostic to what everybody is 16 17 seeing out there and my team here, particularly Chief 18 Visconti, dedicate ourselves every single day to 19 cleaning the city and we are glad to have this 20 hearing and try to bring some clarity into what is 21 going on because we're all in this together. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Ι 23 appreciate that. Thank you so much, Commissioner. So, my first question is going to be about the cuts 24 that were made so that the city understands or the 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 17
2	folks that are watching understand exactly what was
3	cut. It's 24.5 million that was directly reduced
4	services that keep our streets and sidewalks clean.
5	And I want to go through them and, if you could just
6	let me know what these mean in real terms. Because
7	we are seeing them as cuts, but what does that mean
8	on a day-to-day operation? I will give one example
9	is the basket service unwrap mitigation zones. There
10	was 718,000 cut. So, what does that mean in, ghosts,
11	and operations? What is that reduction look like?
12	What does it look like?
13	ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: So, in
14	conjunction with the initiative to add additional
14 15	conjunction with the initiative to add additional service, both refuse removal and litter basket
15	service, both refuse removal and litter basket
15 16	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the
15 16 17	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were
15 16 17 18	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were running additional service to try to eliminate food
15 16 17 18 19	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were running additional service to try to eliminate food source and keep the place extra clean. That funding
15 16 17 18 19 20	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were running additional service to try to eliminate food source and keep the place extra clean. That funding is gone, so those tracts no longer run. Now
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were running additional service to try to eliminate food source and keep the place extra clean. That funding is gone, so those tracts no longer run. Now CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were running additional service to try to eliminate food source and keep the place extra clean. That funding is gone, so those tracts no longer run. Now CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: those areas
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	service, both refuse removal and litter basket service trucks in the areas hardest hit with the Mayors rat and rodent mitigation program, we were running additional service to try to eliminate food source and keep the place extra clean. That funding is gone, so those tracts no longer run. Now CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: those areas still get regular service. Just the additional

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 18 2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And these rat 3 mitigation zones were in and around like NYCHA 4 developments in those areas that I remember the rat mitigation zones prioritizing NYCHA developments. 5 Are you familiar with that or--6 7 ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: Yes. So, I'll let Commissioner Anderson speak on some additional 8 9 Nuance stuff with that, but primarily, those additional services were in Manhattan and up in the 10 11 Bronx. And, yes, they are around the areas most 12 impacted where the reports of rat burrows. The 13 Department of Health, they monitor that and they 14 receive those health complaints. So, working in 15 conjunction with that team, the places that have the highest amount -- and there are a few Nuance things 16 17 that I will let Commissioner Anderson weigh in on, as well. 18 19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Assistant 20 Commissioner? 21 ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: Yeah. He's 2.2 muted. 23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah. There's going to be a slight delay. 24 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 19
2	ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: There we
3	go. So, as the Commissioner mentioned, we have the
4	neighborhood rat reduction initiative which the Mayor
5	announced back in 2017. The Department of Sanitation
6	has been a very close partner with the Department of
7	Health, the Department of Parks, Schools, etc. Also
8	NYCHA as you mentioned, Chair. And that was focused
9	in three rat mitigation zones. One in the lower East
10	side and Chinatown and East Village in Manhattan, one
11	in the Bronx, along with grand Concourse, and one in
12	Brooklyn, Bushwick and Bed-Stuy. And so those zones
13	were receiving supplemental litter basket collection
14	service. Some of them had extra household collection
15	service, as well as intensive efforts by the Health
16	Department and others to inspect for rat activity,
17	perform rat elimination activities as necessary, and
18	really just try to cut down on the food and housing
19	that the rats need to survive.
20	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And that funding
21	was the 718,000 dollar cut, was that the entire
22	program was cut or a part of the program?
23	ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So, the
24	sanitation portions of that program were reduced.
25	So, the supplemental litter basket service, the
l	

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 20
2	supplemental refuse collection service were both
3	eliminated. The Health Department portion of the
4	program which has the intensive inspection is still
5	ongoing. We still have our monthly task force
6	meetings with the Health Department and others where
7	we really dive into the data. Unfortunately, we just
8	don't have the supplemental collection. So, as the
9	Commissioner mentioned, we are still providing
10	service in those neighborhoods. Still keeping a very
11	close eye on them, just have lower service levels
12	than we did previously.
13	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And then we had a
14	fourth day of collection service in rat mitigation
15	zones, so, when combined, it's more closer to 2.2
16	million in cuts related to rat mitigation zones. The
17	fourth day of collection service, is that just like
18	picking up one extra day of basket pick up in these
19	areas?
20	ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: That's exactly
21	that.
22	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Then we have
23	week day, Sunday, and holidays service and I have
24	here that it says enforcement. In that was almost 10
25	million dollars. 9.45 million. What exactly what

 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 21
 are the effects of that cut? I have week day,
 Sunday, and holiday's service.

4 ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: Oh, yes. So, in essence, we have reduced our baseline weekday and 5 holidays services on basket trucks. So, we were 6 running the baseline level service, as well as Sunday 7 8 and holiday's service to make sure that there were 9 not-- there wasn't a single day that we didn't get out there to the main commercial hubs and now we are 10 11 not running. We took a baseline hit on the six day a 12 week trucks, the Monday through Saturday regular 13 operation and then the supplemental Sunday and 14 holiday cleaning trucks that would go out every 15 Sunday, every holiday. They were also eliminated. 16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The highway ramp 17 So, we're getting some complaints. cleaning. I**'**11 18 just speak to North Brooklyn. Underneath the BQE, 19 for example. Would highway ramp cleaning affect that 20 in any way, shape, or form? And, if not, what 21 exactly are we talking about when we see the highway 2.2 ramp cleaning being caught by 864,000 dollars? 23 ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: So, highway

24 ramps are predominantly a DOT thing and we are not 25 doing a pass the buck here. We were supplementing

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 22 the regular highway ramp sweeping schedule that DOT 2 3 has by going up. We worked with them. We built 4 routes. Chief Visconti seen they built specific 5 dedicated broom rounds to not get the big, bulky debris that could sometimes be on the main bed of the 6 7 highway, but the litter that builds up on the on and 8 off ramps that, you know, frequently get trapped it 9 become an eyesore. So, we had a routine schedule that we were working with them to supplement their 10 11 efforts to keep the highway clean and that is what So, it wasn't so much stuff underneath the 12 that is. 13 ramps. This was more the ramp shoulders to make sure 14 that that litter that accumulates, the windblown 15 litter and stuff. And also we would be out there 16 with our cruise and we would also take some of the 17 bulk that was on that route and one of our lead 18 vehicles when we were out there. But it was 19 supplemental to what DOT was doing. 20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And then the next 21 two are the ones that I think people are seeing a lot 2.2 of, which is lot cleaning. Can you just explain the 23 timeline and exactly how much longer it takes because of the almost 2 million dollar cuts to lock cleaning? 24 We are seeing a lot of illegal dumping now in these 25

1COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT
232lots and a long time or long time for response from3the Department of Sanitation. Can you just go into4what that 1.9 million does and how it affects the lot5cleaning?

ACTING COMMISSION GRAYSON: I going 6 7 absolutely let Chief Visconti weigh in. They were 8 directly for him, that team. That is one of the legs 9 of his unit. But before I turn the mic over, I just want to say that, yes, lot cleaning, in addition to 10 11 cleaning the vacant lots, both private and city-12 owned, but it's a very administrative have a process 13 in order to get, sometimes, permission and writs and consent orders because some of it is -- especially on 14 15 private property. They're also the go to unit for 16 the specialty cleanings that pop up that can't be 17 mitigated by the day-to-day district personnel 18 because all the men and women assigned there have specialized training. They know how to use specific 19 pieces of equipment to do bulk debris removal in 20 21 hard-to-reach places, so to speak. So, the reduction 2.2 of those resources is definitely a hit and, most 23 recently, our biggest asset in the storm respond to the ICA event where the trees-- where we are on the 24 25 tree debris task force, we were using lot cleaning to

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 24
2	do all that. Those men and women have specialized
3	training. So, we took a 30 percent reduction in not
4	with definitely leads to service delays, but I will
5	let chief Visconti related with some more granular
6	info. Go ahead, Chief.
7	CHIEF VISCONTI: Okay. Can you folks
8	hear me?
9	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes.
10	CHIEF VISCONTI: Good afternoon. So,
11	yes. As the commissioners said, we took a reduction
12	in lot cleaning to the tune of about a third of the
13	workers there. It is a citywide unit, so no
14	particular borough got affected more than another.
15	It's a citywide unit. It just happened recently
16	within the last couple of weeks, so I can't answer
17	your question as far as how much longer is it taking.
18	I don't have that because it's pretty new, however,
19	there is a lot of obstacles that go into it as far as
20	a dirty lot. When someone sees a dirty lot,
21	naturally, the first glance is not, you know, all the
22	nuances that go into it. Like is that private? Is
23	it city? City lots we can get to relatively quickly.
24	I mean, immediately. Private lots are a different
25	story, as some of you may or may not know. It

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 25 depends on whether it is fenced or locked, whether it 2 3 is accessible or not accessible. We need to do a 4 ownership search. We petition the owner-- Actually, 5 we petition the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to notify the owner that there is a condition 6 7 on his or her law and we give a prescribed time frame 8 of a couple of weeks for them to correct that. Ιf 9 they do not correct it, we do a follow-up. If they do not correct and the lot is accessible, we move in 10 11 to clean the lot. So, that whole process takes a 12 couple weeks. That is pre-cuts. It has nothing to 13 do with the cuts. That is a couple of week's process right there. If we go back to that private lot and 14 15 it is inaccessible, we can't just go into that lot. If there's no access, then we have to petition the 16 17 judge to let us get into that lot and that is not 18 something that is quickly or easily done. It's like 19 asking someone to go into your home, basically, when 20 they grant that kind of an access warrant. So, for 21 that, that can take months and we have to show an 2.2 egregious condition, rat droppings, if we're in West 23 Nile virus time a year, so on and so forth. So, even without the cuts, some of these lots take a long, 24 25 long time to get to. And through no fault of our

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 26
2	own, it's just their legalities. But we're still
3	I mean, for fiscal year 21, we have already clean
4	north of 270 lots and another hundred non-lot
5	cleanings. Those are the ones you mentioned briefly
6	about underneath the highway. Anything that is not a
7	lot that is kind of heavy-duty, uncut streets,
8	[inaudible 00:27:35] areas, things of that nature,
9	brush that is growing, we address those. Address
10	hundred so far just this fiscal year alone.
11	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Chief.
12	I have a lot of questions that I want to ask, but I
13	want to allow for my colleagues to get some time
14	because I can stay on after. So, I am going to take
15	a pause on my questions, but I do want to say to the
16	DSNY, I am deeply grateful for the work that you guys
17	are doing every single day. You are asking to do
18	just as much with less and I just don't see how that
19	math adds up, so I understand that things are going
20	to get more difficult, but I think later on I'll be
21	asking about this increase in funding by the Mayor
22	for basket pickup and how that affects the work that
23	we're doing and whether or not it will start daily
24	and with the more apparent garbage that we are seeing
25	every single day. But, again, I want to allow for my

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 27 colleagues to have some questions. So, I'm going to 2 3 go ahead and turn it over to Nicole again. 4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I will now call on Council members in the order they have used the zoom 5 raise and function. Council members, please keep 6 7 your questions to five minutes. The Sergeant-at-arms locate the timer and they will let you know when your 8 9 time is up. So, first we will hear from Council member Cohen, followed by Council member Brannan, 10 11 followed by Council member Chin. SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts--12 Time 13 starts now. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very 15 much, Chair. It is good to see you. It's good to 16 see my colleagues. I want to congratulate the acting 17 Commissioner. Congratulations. I also want to and 18 knowledge that I was a big fan of Commissioner 19 Garcia, as well. And I also want to say that, you 20 know, this budget was, obviously, the most difficult budget we have had to tackle in my time in office and 21 I would tell you that I don't think I fully 2.2 23 understood the impact or the scope of the cuts on sanitation. I think it really would have given me 24 pause because I don't think that the mission of DSNY 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 28 is tenable with the funds that we provided and the 2 3 thing that makes me believe that is, in my entire time in office up until, you know, the last few 4 months, I, literally, almost never got complaints 5 Like peoples trash got picked up. 6 about DSNY. The 7 city baskets got picked up. You know, people 8 complained sometimes that they got tickets for 9 alternate side, but they didn't complain that they didn't come. And it was really one agency that just 10 11 did not require a lot of attention from my office and that is not been the case in the last few months. 12 13 So, I think it is, obviously, directly correlated to the budget cuts. My first question, maybe, is-- But 14 15 alternate side. In Community Board eight where they, 16 basically, had one alternate side on one day of the 17 week on each street, they got no cut in alternate 18 side parking. In CB seven, which is, you know, is greater density, has been determined based on past 19 studies that it needs more alternate side, they got a 20 21 50 percent cut. So, I don't understand how that 2.2 makes any sense. I think it is unfair and it is just 23 led to, you know, significantly dirtier streets in CB seven, so I am concerned about that and, you know, I 24 25 just think that that is, from a management

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 29
2	perspective, and planning and asset allocation, I
3	just don't think that that is equitable or fair and
4	it really puts a burden on the people in CB seven.
5	You know, highway ramps, I have the major Dagan, the
6	Henry Hudson Parkway, in the Bronx River and I have
7	multiple exits. And I use the major Dagan ramp a lot
8	and it is filthy. I was wondering if you could talk
9	about staffing levels based on the cuts. When we cut
10	service, what is happening to the people who used to
11	do those services? And I do have one more question
12	about Sunday's service. I gave discretionary money,
13	it's not a huge amount. It's about 50,000 dollars
14	for Sunday service. What is going to happen with
15	that money? So those are really the two.
16	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Well,
17	thank you for your question and for your support.
18	And, yes, we truly appreciate your support to put out
19	additional funds and provide additional funding for
20	service. So, what happened to the people was, in our
21	budget, we had planned attrition to get to lower
22	heads. So, for right now, despite the threat of
23	either, you know, personnel actions that we have all
24	read about with the budget and potentials, the
25	Department of Sanitation has not had to lay anybody

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 30 However, we had an attrition plan to get down 2 off. 3 to a specific headcount because of these service 4 cuts. The sad reality is a lot of the cleaning that was being done, because it wasn't baselined and 5 because it wasn't six days away, was sometimes based 6 7 upon a formulaic overtime model. So, when we cut the 8 funding, we didn't lose the heads immediately, but we 9 lost the service because we're not running the over time trucks are were not adding on Saturday 10 11 mechanical brooms that we normally would run for the 12 highway. So, that is why, right now, it's not a 13 complete where you cut the people. Right now, we are planned on entering this coming winter with a lower 14 15 headcount amount just because of the attrition plan, aqnostic of anything else that comes down the pipe. 16 17 So, that is where we are on the heads. And as far as 18 what is going to happen as we get any additional 19 resources from Council members or any other funding source, we are going to work with those providers to 20 21 find out where the best use is in, to that end, I 2.2 will let Chief Visconti way again. His team and his 23 whole staff as part of the team that works with all of the members of the Council and various other units 24 25 to make sure that we are getting the right message

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 31 across, especially when you're committing your funds 2 3 and where you need it. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: But we don't have the capacity to do Sunday basket pickup at this point 5 in time? 6 7 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ιt depends. And I will at the Chief weight. You can, 8 9 but there's caveats. That's all. COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Chief, I've got 10 Johnson Avenue and 235th Street. I mean, every 11 12 Monday morning my email basket is filled with photos of that can--13 14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: We're waiting for 16 Chief to be un-muted. 17 CHIEF VISCONTI: Yes. Thank you. I was 18 waiting to be un-muted. Council member Cohen, first 19 of all, thank you for your continued partnership. Ι 20 know you like that Sunday basket truck each year. 21 You service at each and every year. We've been 2.2 waiting for your email, by the way. We are ready to 23 go with that Sunday service. Yes. So, the city cleaning initiative money is separate from the cuts 24 and, by all means, if you want that Sunday service 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 32 and you want to contribute again this year to us, 2 3 will reach out to the community affairs like you 4 normally do through channels and--COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: It's in there. 5 6 CHIEF VISCONTI: Nick or Henry. Whoever 7 you want to deal with and, by all means, we will get that route going as soon as you would like. 8 9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Okay. I appreciate that. Thank you thank you, Chair. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Do you have 12 any-- anything else you would like to ask, Council 13 member Cohen? Anything else last-minute you wanted to ask? 14 15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I covered all of 16 the things -- all my notes. 17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Thank you, 18 Council member. I appreciate it. 19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will hear from--20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Just really quick. 21 2.2 Sorry, Nicole. I just want to acknowledge the fact 23 that we have been joined by Council member Costa Constantinides. It's really, really good to see you, 24 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 33 2 Costa. Nice of you to be on. Thank you. Go ahead, 3 Nicole. 4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Now, we'll hear 5 from Council member Brannan followed by Council member Chin. Council member Brannan? 6 7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now. COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: 8 Thank you. 9 Thank you, Chair. Thank you so much. Acting Commissioner, welcome aboard. It is great to meet 10 11 you. I've heard only great things about you from a 12 lot of folks I grew up with who are on the job right 13 now. So, people are texting me right now telling me how great you are. So, a lot of guys I went to high 14 15 school with her on the job. So, that means a lot to me. And certainly we miss Kathy, but I think you'll 16 do a great job. Yeah. I mean, some of my colleagues 17 18 have mentioned- I don't think you needed to be in Oracle to know that the budget cuts to sanitation 19 were going to be felt and seen immediately and they 20 21 sure were. Because of budget constraints, you know, 2.2 I had to take most of the funds that are 23 discretionary, the sort of extra discretionary funding that we get that I would normally give to a 24 25 duel fund or wildcat to do sort of detailing, we had

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 34
2	to take that money and give it back to sanitation
3	just to sort of get the baseline of what we used to
4	have back in the Gilded Age before COVID. I mean, I
5	think I know sort of anecdotally what the challenges
6	are with budget cuts, but certainly with the MLP that
7	we had which is important for illegal dumping and
8	that kind of stuff, what are kind of some of the
9	immediate challenges that you are seeing with the
10	budget cuts in addition to, you know, the overflowing
11	corner garbage cans? Are there other areas that we
12	are not thinking about that we are seeing an impact
13	on?
14	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON:
15	Absolutely. And thank you for your support. You
16	are always a good partner to us and I know how much
17	you care about the city and the cleanliness,
18	particularly. And, yes. It's not just the litter
19	baskets where we've seen it. Where out there every
20	day and we would love to do more. In addition the
21	letter basket reduction, we had also a reduction in.
22	We had a solid partnership with the GTP program where
23	we were getting manual street cleaners out there
24	every week and, because of the COVID crisis, that is

25 suspended for a while. I won't say it is gone

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 35 forever, but that is a noticeable impact. Not having 2 3 those manual resources to get into some of the fence 4 lines and some of the drop off and dump out areas. 5 Additionally, you know, sadly, it is also true that we are seeing an uptick in illegal dumping. 6 The 7 exact root cause of that, I mean, and fairness, the root cause of any illegal dumping, depending on what 8 9 it is, is an interesting myriad. There is no right answer as to why someone would put half a load of 10 11 concrete on an abandoned street or something. But we 12 have seen an uptick in that. That is been a 13 challenge for us. We are using our enforcement personnel to try to stake out those high event areas 14 15 and we're doing the best we can with that, but that 16 is a challenge to keep on top of and keep clean. You 17 know, just circling back to the corner litter 18 baskets, on the other side of it, too, is that some 19 of it is also COVID-related meaning we are imploring everyone to use the frequencies service. So, the 20 21 department comes either two or three times a week for 2.2 you for regular pickup for your household refuse, 23 depending on what neighborhood you live in. However, we are also cognizant that, sadly, some of the people 24 25 who live in the apartments or houses, may be because

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 36 of COVID fears, they are getting rid of material. 2 3 They don't want to hold it an extra day. You know, 4 you never know how people are reacting to just 5 getting rid of waste or what have you in the world. So, we have seen some anecdotally they are. I can't 6 7 scientifically prove it, but we have seen some 8 behavior change. And, in some cases, because of more 9 and more people telecommuting or being at home or the stay-at-home order, we have certain areas of the city 10 11 where tonnage was up on all of our residential 12 household collections. So, maybe, there was an 13 increase at the curb which then, coupled with our 14 outage -- so, in the beginning, think of the way the 15 optics of cleanliness. It's a cumulative effect. 16 So, whether or not it's directly cleaner directly 17 dirty, just if you have this -- you know, it's that 18 reticulated in your sensor in your brain where you can see something every day and then you are looking 19 20 for it. And that's not saying that it's not dirty. It's dirtier. The streets are dirtier. 21 It is. But 2.2 the truth of the matter is we've come through this 23 long six-month process where we had no mechanical brooms running. And some days, the collection 24 service is delayed because of staff outage or just us 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 37
2	not being able to man it. At some point, during the
3	height of the pandemic, the department had a 20
4	percent outage on field effective workforce. In
5	these men and women came in every day with fear. You
6	know, they braved it through. They are real heroes
7	throughout the city. One day, when we are all in a
8	much better place on COVID we can look back and
9	highlighted all the various people who did just some
10	amazing
11	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.
12	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON:
13	Sanitation will be in there. But those are some
14	of the challenges, Councilman. It's not just the
14 15	of the challenges, Councilman. It's not just the litter baskets. We're having challenges in just
15	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just
15 16	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front.
15 16 17	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front. COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah. I
15 16 17 18	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front. COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah. I appreciate it. Yeah. My time is up. We just had an
15 16 17 18 19	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front. COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah. I appreciate it. Yeah. My time is up. We just had an electronic waste recycling event last weekend then
15 16 17 18 19 20	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front. COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah. I appreciate it. Yeah. My time is up. We just had an electronic waste recycling event last weekend then the turnout was insane and, I mean, that is a
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	<pre>litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front.</pre>
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	litter baskets. We're having challenges in just about every front. COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah. I appreciate it. Yeah. My time is up. We just had an electronic waste recycling event last weekend then the turnout was insane and, I mean, that is a testament to how much people appreciate it when we were able to do that for DSNY, certainly something I

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 38
2	hazardous to waste removal sites. I guess that have
3	been there still close, apparently. So
4	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Yes.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: So, you know,
6	doing what we can to get by in a make sure that folks
7	are, obviously, keeping your workers safe and not
8	throwing stuff out but they are not allowed to throw
9	out. But I appreciate the work you guys are doing in
10	a safe neighborhood is a safe and clean
11	neighborhood is the foundation for everything else.
12	So, nothing but respect for you guys and I look
13	forward to working with you.
14	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Same
15	here. Thank you.
16	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council
17	member Brannan. And I just want to follow up on a
18	couple of things. Are we looking to maintain ASP or
19	the alternate side parking as is and for how long?
20	Has there been a discussion to bring it back to what
21	it was originally? I just want to know what the
22	internal discussions regarding alternate side of the
23	street parking is in the administration.
24	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Oh,
25	absolutely. So, everybody knows were working for a

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 39 pilot right now where we are only coming on the last 2 3 posted sign. So, as I stated earlier, one time a 4 week areas are still getting the one time a week that 5 they normally had and then, in areas that had ASP for multiple days, it's the last posted day on the sign. 6 7 This is to alleviate the need to leave the house, to 8 give some relief on both convenience and just public 9 safety and we really are reevaluating with the administration, the best way to do street cleaning in 10 11 the modern city. And there are certain areas of the 12 city where the sweeping schedule was, perhaps, 13 insufficient. We get requests all the time for more sweeping and we have other areas of the city that are 14 15 saying, you know, our area is relatively clean. 16 Maybe we could do something that provides more 17 opportunity to park or more opportunity to do 18 [inaudible 00:43:01] to do business and maybe we need 19 less sweeping. At that point, taking into all of 20 that and then, on the backend of the COVID pandemic 21 and train open back up and keep residents safe and 2.2 healthy, we are into this new pilot program. We are 23 working towards something that is with all stakeholders, nothing is coming out yet, but our 24 intent is to keep working towards that. Someone who 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 40
2	has been involved at some of the policy level at City
3	Hall and other stakeholders is our Assistant
4	Commissioner Greg Anderson. I'm going to let him
5	weigh in on any of the nuances stuff, but we are
6	continuing working and what you are seeing now is not
7	where we will be. It's just the current program.
8	ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.
9	And I would echo what Commissioner Grayson said. We
10	are continuing to evaluate the pilot. I think what
11	we saw during the height of COVID was that the
12	streets actually stayed really clean when people were
13	staying in their homes. As people, you know, came
14	out and started using the streets more, using public
15	space more, using outdoor dining, hopefully starting
16	next week, learning, you know, I think we have seen
17	more litter and we want to find the right balance of
18	how frequently we have to clean the streets and how
19	frequently people have to, you know, have to go
20	through the inconvenience of moving their car. You
21	know, it is something I think we are going to have to
22	keep working through over the next few months, but
23	right now the once a week pilot is extended
24	indefinitely. We're continuing to evaluate it. I
25	think we want to see what happens in the winter and

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 41
2	how that changes things. But we are working at other
3	factors, as well, to try to really think through what
4	are other cities doing. Look to best practices to
5	see how can we get that current access and really
6	clean the streets, but also do so in a way that, you
7	know, doesn't make someone double parked the car for
8	90 minutes or sit in their car for 90 minutes or, you
9	know, circle the block 10 times trying to find a
10	parking space on Monday night. So, that is what
11	we're trying to achieve.
12	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. I just want
13	to let you know that I've never seen so many people
14	ask for more cleaning or to bring back ASP the way it
15	was originally than before. So, I'm surprised that
16	folks are advocating for that and I do want to say,
17	because it's happening once a week in some areas like
18	in Williamsburg, I just want to make sure you guys
19	the enforcement needs to be stronger. Many cars are
20	staying parked and, if an area doesn't get cleaned,
21	we have to wait one more week before it gets cleaned
22	again. And just the timeline there, the amount of
23	dirt that piles up in two weeks worth of trash, a lot
24	of cleaning, I think it's a big problem. So, I just
25	want to make sure that you know that enforcement

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 42
2	should be happening very aggressively, more
3	aggressive than ever, because it's only one day we
4	are asking this time and we need people to help us
5	help the city and they are not doing that right now.
6	So, just to advocate for more enforcement on that one
7	day, Commissioner. Okay. Nicole? Sorry. Thank
8	you.
9	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thanks. Next we
10	will hear from Council member Chin.
11	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair,
13	and welcome, Commissioner. Looking forward to
14	working with you. I have a couple of questions.
15	Regarding like one of the rat mitigation zones is in
16	my district in Chinatown in the lower East side and
17	it was doing quite well. I mean, I think Assistant
18	Commissioner Anderson worked with us and we worked
19	with the Department of Health and the good thing
20	about it was that we got a lot of big belly trashcan
21	in the communities and I think that really was a
22	significant improvement, even though we had some
23	sabotage going on in the beginning where people were
24	doing illegal dumping. Instead of saying, you know,
25	with bricks and all kinds of weird stuff. So, one of

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 43 the questions is that I wanted to ask was what about 2 3 looking at some of the problematic areas in terms of 4 having, you know, big belly at the street corner and seeing if there is a way to do partnership with local 5 merchants? I mean, fortunately, in my district, I 6 7 have quite a number of business improvement districts, so they are responsible with [inaudible 8 9 00:47:43] the garbage and putting it on the side. And, with the budget cut, I mean, those garbage still 10 11 pile up. So, that is one question. The other 12 question is maybe Assistant Commissioner can answer. 13 The whole plastic bag, you know, band that we pushed on the education effort. So I wanted to see is there 14 15 was like any data on reduction of the plastic bag 16 ways the Sanitation Department sees because there was 17 so much effort that went in it and I remember in my 18 office we are still giving out those orange recyclable bags and people really like it a lot. 19 In 20 my last question is that, because of the pandemic, so 21 many people work from home and I see, you know, all 2.2 these deliveries. All these boxes from Amazon and 23 whatever. So, my question is around the recycling program. Like, I mean, how do we make sure that 24 25 these apartment buildings, you know, that they've got

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 44 2 to like compact those boxes? Because I still say 3 when I walk down the street that people don't fold up 4 the boxes. It just creates so much more recyclable 5 garbage. So, there's ways that we can work together to mandate that they've got to do their part because 6 7 it definitely has increased because more people are 8 staying at home. 9 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you, Councilwoman. Yes. I look forward to working 10 11 with you and I will just take your points as quickly 12 as I can. I will defer for the latest on the back 13 legislation and where that is headed to Commissioner Anderson in one second. As to the big bellies, so we 14

15 are always -- we just recently, last year, the 16 department took the Better Bin Campaign and we are 17 always in search for the right litter basket. 18 Always. It's the thing we're going to do. We're always looking, literally, for the best possible way. 19 20 Big bellies, interestingly enough, just a thing the 21 think of. They have more volume when used correctly 2.2 because they have a compaction in there. Interesting 23 thing post-COVID, for the limited number of big bellies -- and, again, don't have scientific 24 25 background. I don't have a real survey that's

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 45 empirical that I could share, but, anecdotally, a lot 2 3 less people are using them because you have to touch 4 it. So, that challenge with something that you have 5 to pull on the handle is that becomes a challenge to implement, especially now. So, moving forward in 6 time-- and that is why a lot of times, I think 7 8 everybody is seen some, sadly, some of those cases of 9 the big bellies where people are using it almost like a stack table and there is the plenty of capacity 10 11 left in that basket and yet they are stacking things 12 on top of the broad top. So, that is an optics 13 thing, however, I am definitely willing to work 14 together to try to find the right solution in a post-15 COVID world. And, again, I'm not blaming the handle. It's just that that is a game changer because big 16 bellies are great. 17 18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, a lot--19 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: 20 [inaudible 00:50:49] 21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: of them you can 2.2 just use your foot. There are a lot--23 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Well 24 yeah. 25 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Just step--

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 46 2 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: They have 3 the foot pedal one. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah. 5 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ιt depends on the model. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: The Mayor demonstrated the foot-- Yeah. 8 9 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: No. No. But, also they have a maintenance thing with them 10 11 with regard to the fact that, sadly, they become an attraction for graffiti and other things that then 12 13 have another component. They are not bad, they're not good. But I'll definitely work with you and talk 14 15 to you and we can discuss the best ways to move forward with something like that and, hopefully, more 16 17 economically favorable times. To the recycling, 18 yeah. I think that we can certainly--19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired. 20 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: outreach. 21 Because I do think that people's behavior did change 2.2 on how they buy. Amazon was on an upswing anyway, 23 but, clearly, in the wake of the pandemic, a lot more people bringing boxes home. So, may be just 24 education coupled with some enforcement where it is 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 47
2	completely egregious. But, education and say, hey,
3	there is a proper way to bundle this so that it is
4	not all over the sidewalk. And this is your
5	recycling day. So, I will gladly work on that,
6	Commissioner Anderson can weigh in on where we are
7	right now with plastic bags and moving forward on
8	that.
9	ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Hi,
10	there. Can you hear me?
11	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes. We can.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes.
13	ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So, we
14	work together for probably six or more years, Council
15	member, on fighting plastic bag waste, so I
16	appreciate your long-standing advocacy there.
17	Unfortunately, the state got sued back in March. Not
18	surprising. The plastics industry is very litigious
19	and they love suing us for every great thing we tried
20	to do. That lawsuit just got resolved a little bit
21	over a month ago and breaking news as of a few days
22	ago, the EC actually announce that they are starting
23	enforcement on October 19th. So, we don't
24	technically yet live in a world where plastic bags or
25	bands, but, less than a month from now, we can

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 48 finally celebrate living in a plastic bag free New 2 3 York City. So, we are talking to TEC about how to 4 amplify their enforcement efforts. I think we 5 definitely want to try to do as much outreach as we can, understanding the limited resources available to 6 7 us to do that outreach. I think we are really 8 optimistic that stores that are giving out paper bags 9 will be charging the paper bag fee which can help to support some of our reusable bag distributions and 10 11 really, you know, try to get as many reusable bags 12 into the hands of New Yorkers because, if you take 13 your reusable bag to the grocery store, you don't have to pay the fee. It is totally free to use and 14 15 much better for the environment. So, that is where we are there. And I want to actually build off of 16 17 what the Commissioners sat on the recycling peas. 18 Interestingly enough, even though, you know, it seems like everyone is ordering from Amazon everything, the 19 20 paper recycling actually hasn't increased that 21 substantially over the past six months. It's been an 2.2 increase of, on average, around three or four percent 23 of a month by month basis. The metal, glass, plastic recycling is skyrocketing. Around a 25 percent 24 increase for most months since the beginning of 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 49
2	COVID, which is really fascinating. I think we can
3	all sort of guess why that might be. But, you know,
4	we're keeping an eye on the recycling and really
5	trying to ensure that New Yorkers are still
6	recycling, especially now that they're spending more
7	time at home.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Thank
9	you, Chair.
10	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Now, we
11	will hear from Council member Costa Constantinides.
12	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay.
14	So, Commissioner, great to see you. Congratulations
15	to Commissioner Anderson. Good to see you, as well.
16	Thank you, Chair, for that warm introduction. I'm
17	glad to be here with everyone here today. So, just
18	very quickly because I have to run to another
19	meeting. Number one, I gave 10,000 dollars through
20	cleanup initiative money for additional letter basket
21	pickups. Are those happening? Will they be
22	happening? I want to ensure that our business
23	corridor are funded because last time I got sent a
24	video with the rats scurrying around garbage in those
25	same corridors which was a little concerning. So, I

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 50 want to make sure that that money is going to be put 2 3 to good use and then, secondly, what is the impact of 4 the alternate side of the street reduction on our 5 waterways? How much more debris is getting sent into our sewer system then causing, you know, CSO debris 6 7 in our waterways? Have we seen an uptick there? And 8 I know the DEP is not on the call, but, you know, I 9 know DSNY, you do the street cleaning, so I want to know the answer to that question, as well. 10 11 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you 12 for your question, Councilman. We appreciate your 13 partnership and we know your dedication to cleaning 14 in your community. In your counsel. Yes. So, 15 sadly, only anecdotally I can tell you we don't have 16 a tonnage report or contamination report from DEP. 17 But, we can all see that if we have more, more things 18 that could be considered floatables or litter that get into the catch basin prior to being swept up, 19 that we would have normally gotten too prior to that 20 happening, clearly, there's more than likely some 21 2.2 more getting in. Whether or not that is making its 23 way past any treatment center, I don't know, but we can certainly follow up. And it's a very good point 24 25 were not agnostic to it. And, as far as your support

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT that goes in, going to let Chief Visconti talk directly to that. Go ahead, Chief.

4 CHIEF VISCONTI: Good afternoon, Council 5 member. Thank you for your contribution. Can you hear me? Okay. Yes. The answer to your question is 6 7 yes. You funded, I believe, basket truck, partial 8 basket truck on Saturdays that went into effect 9 September 5th. So, it is been a couple of Saturdays now. If you are not seeing the result of that, we 10 11 can sidebar on that. My office or yourself with me and I'll take a look at the route and tweak it or we 12 13 could discuss exactly what you have in mind in your area of focus and I'll make sure you're getting the 14 15 service that you're supposed to be getting. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you 17 very much.

18 CHIEF VISCONTI: You're welcome.
19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you,
20 Councilmember Constantinides. I just want to
21 recognize that we've been joined by Council member
22 Chaim Deutsch. Council member Deutsch, if you want,
23 you can ask questions now.
24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 52
2	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I don't think he's
3	going to ask any questions. I'm going to follow up
4	with some questions before we turn it over to the
5	folks who are testifying today. The Mayor announced
6	an initiative to restore a portion of the FY 21
7	sanitation services citywide. Can you walk us
8	through how this will be funded? You know, how we
9	found the money and what the details are? Where is
10	it happening? Where exactly are we sending this
11	extra service? You talked about equity, not
12	equality, which I love to hear. So, I want to know
13	what that means. And then, is this over time or
14	additional uniform sanitation headcount increase? I
15	just want to understand the parameters of the entire
16	increase.
17	ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON:
18	Understood and thank you for your question. Yes.
19	So, no. This is currently not a headcount increase.
20	We are still on our plan, attrition plan. As far as
21	the areas that are impacted. So, 27 specific areas
22	were identified as being hardest hit and we tried to
23	tailor the routes to address those with COVID, that
24	is. Hardest hit with COVID. And coupled with our
25	institutional knowledge of where the overflowing
	I

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 53 baskets have been and the field observations that 2 3 So, working together with the come in. 4 administration, we have devised 65 additional basket trucks per week and we can certainly give you all the 5 breakdown of where exactly those areas are. That's 6 7 not a problem. It is not a headcount program. It is 8 an overtime program. And as far as how we are 9 funding it, we are working with OMB and we are moving around existing resources that the agency has to try 10 11 to get that done. And we got it off the ground. So, the key for us is noticeable. We ran our first 12 13 series of these trucks starting this weekend, in the areas that saw the -- clearly, like anything, and 14 15 empty basket is a good basket. So, that worked out. 16 And we are still yet to see for the rest of that 17 initiative with regard to the partnerships with the 18 Dole fund or community cleanups or BID. That is still being worked out. The announcement is like a 19 20 week old. So, we're going to have to see how that 21 cascades, what that actually means in the real time. 2.2 But it seems to be promising. Anytime we can solicit 23 additional help to help us maintain our core job of keeping the streets clean, for anybody who wants--24 for the Dole fund folks who come in and do a great 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 54 job and the Business Improvement Districts, how they 2 3 intend to use any support that comes in through that, 4 we love the BID's. All of the BID's go out and try 5 the best to keep their areas clean and we try to support that effort in every way possible. 6 So, those 7 are hanging moments that I can't really speak to because it is still being formed. For us, the 8 immediate termed benefit is 65 basket trucks a week 9 on an overtime program that doesn't impact our heads. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That's good to 12 If you can please get me the locations of know. 13 where they are or what the routes look like. I want to be able to communicate that to individual Council 14 15 members, especially the ones who are extremely 16 concerned. And I'm glad to hear that they're going 17 to be focused mostly on communities that were most 18 affected by COVID which really does help. I want to pause the questions again and just allow for the 19 20 testimony, the public testimony to me again at this 21 moment. So, thank you again, Commissioner, for 2.2 answering all of our questions and should a Council 23 member join hereafter, we might give them an opportunity to ask questions, as well. 24

25

 1
 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT
 55

 2
 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank

 3
 you.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We will now turn 5 the public testimony. I would like to remind everyone that, unlike our typical Council hearings, 6 7 we will be calling on individuals one by one to 8 testify. Council members who have questions for a 9 particular panelist should use the raise hand function in Zoom and I will call on you after three 10 11 panelists have completed their testimony. For a 12 panelist, once your name is called, member of our 13 staff will unmute you and the Sergeant-at-arms will 14 give you the go-ahead to begin upon setting the 15 timer. You will have three minutes to deliver your 16 testimony. Please wait for the Sergeant to announce 17 that you may begin before delivering your testimony. 18 I would now like to welcome Kathy Nizzari to testify 19 followed by Eric Goldstein. 20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now. 21 KATHY NIZZARI: Good afternoon, Chair

22 Reynoso, Nicole, and members of the Sanitation 23 Committee. I am Kathy Nizzari of the Manhattan Solid 24 Waste Advisory Board or SWAB. We want to first think 25 New York City [inaudible 01:02:31] sanitation workers

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 56 who have kept us safe as we have hunkered down in our 2 3 homes these past six months. The men and women of 4 the Department of Sanitation and also lead the city's massive and complicated hunger relief efforts that 5 have provided food assistance to nearly 1 1/2 million 6 7 city residents during the pandemic. Their valiant 8 work ensure that our health and safety were 9 protected. Next, we want to thank the Mayor's Office for reallocating funds to supplement sanitation's 10 11 efforts to keep streets and parks clean and we also wish to thank Council members for allowing us this 12 13 opportunity to prevent testimony today. SWAB 14 strongly believes that any further reductions in 15 sanitation [inaudible 01:03:11] without cooperations 16 from its citizens and support from other city 17 agencies will compromise the health and safety of all 18 New Yorkers. The reason increase in local rat 19 populations since the compost program has cut is 20 evidence of that. We are grateful that essential 21 food scrap drop-off sites have been restored and are 2.2 hopeful that proper outreach and education will help 23 ameliorate this issue. We ask that Council members and the Mayor's office [inaudible 01:03:39] budget 24 and services for the foreseeable future to allow time 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 57 for the review and improvement of their services to 2 3 efficiently and effectively protect the health and 4 safety of its residents, while meeting the city's zero waste employment goal. In addition, the said 5 continue evaluating long-term solutions that include 6 7 policy changes that will shift the city's waste 8 burden back to producers and consumers through 9 adopting policies like extended producer responsibility and save and [inaudible 01:04:12]. 10 11 All near-term solutions to abridge service gaps may 12 include service swaps. For example, substituting a 13 ways collection service for a recycling collection. We understand the present budget crisis is like no 14 15 other faced by New York City and department citywide 16 of been subject to dramatic cost-saving [inaudible 1:04:33] measures. DSNY's budget was reduced by 106 17 18 million dollars this fiscal year, resulting in the 19 suspension of its landmark organics collection 20 program, reduced street cleaning and litter basket 21 services, and suspension and reduction of other 2.2 important ways reductions. We are still reeling from 23 the loss of these crucial services that help the city progress towards zero waste goals with potentially 24 more cuts to come. While we understand the necessity 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 58
2	of these cuts, any further reduction in DSNY's budget
3	will affect essential services that protect the
4	health and safety of New Yorkers. As the city
5	considers its options, SWAB will be happy to assist
6	Council members and the Mayor's office as they work
7	on strategies to achieve these critical goals. And
8	just on a personal note, I have
9	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.
10	KATHY NIZZARI: I happily have
11	participated in community sweep up to do my part and
12	will continue to do so. Thank you for your time.
13	CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so
14	much, Kathy. Thank you for your testimony and your
15	effort and everything all the SWABs are doing to
16	assist of the Department of Sanitation. So thank you
17	again for your testimony. We really appreciate it.
18	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thanks, Kathy.
19	Next, we will hear from Eric Goldstein followed by
20	Sabrina Rezzy followed by Debora Rivas. Eric?
21	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.
22	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Eric, your muted.
23	You have to accept the unmute.
24	ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Sorry. Eric Goldstein,
25	Natural Resources Defense Council. Good afternoon,

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 59 Chairman Reynoso and members of the committee and, 2 3 welcome to Commissioner Grayson. We wish you and 4 yours have the best in all of your efforts. I am 5 going to summarize my written testimony. New York's streets and sidewalks are a key part of our 6 7 environment. For city dwellers, our streetscapes are what we mean when we say we are going out. For most 8 9 of us, they are the main place that provides our daily interaction with fresh air and open space. 10 11 When these streets are overrun with litter, waste, 12 dog poop and other trash, we feel less joy walking 13 down the street and persistent litter on our streets lowers property values in neighborhood pride. 14 15 Unfortunately, in recent months, the cleanliness of 16 our streets and sidewalks have declined sharply in 17 many areas and we detail some of the facts about that 18 in our testimony. Keeping the streets clean ought to be considered an essential city service. 19 This task 20 should not be viewed as a secondary consideration. The same is true, by the way, for organics collection 21 2.2 and composting. Sending food scraps and yard waste 23 to landfills or incinerators generates additional air pollution and global warming omissions. In the 24 25 short-term, we urge City Hall to reallocate funds,

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 60 perhaps from the snow removal budget, and other 2 3 sources, to litter basket collection. But the budget 4 challenges that City Hall is facing are real and we need more creative strategies to help fund these 5 essential services over the long term. One way of 6 7 accomplishing this is by reforming sanitation collection schedules so as to substitute one trash 8 9 collection with a collection for organics and/or recyclables. This would provide a similar level of 10 11 service at reduced cost. The savings and funds which could amount to tens of millions of dollars a year 12 13 would be reallocated for more frequent street cleaning and to establish citywide universal curbside 14 15 organics collection. This strategy of performing 16 collection schedules is exactly the approach being 17 followed in cities around the nation. For example, 18 in Seattle and Denver, they have adjusted their waste 19 collection schedule so that they now provide once 20 weekly trash collection, once weekly collection of 21 organics in food scraps and yard waste, and every 2.2 other week recycling collection. In New York City, where our residential trash collections are more 23 frequent, adjustments could be made accordingly with 24 different schedules for different neighborhoods, 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 61 depending upon the waste loads. The total number of 2 collections could stay the same, but the collections 3 4 in different categories of waste on different days would create more efficient and more sustainable 5 waste practices in the nation's largest city. So, in 6 7 conclusion, in addition to reallocating funds to address the short-term needs for restoration of 8 9 litter basket collections, we urge the Council to help jumpstart the process of reforming DSNY's trash 10 collection schedule as a mechanism for generating 11 additional funds for both street cleaning and 12 13 curbside organics collection. As a first step, we recommend that the Council advance legislation 14 15 directing DSNY in cooperation with--SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired. 16 17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: in cooperation with its 18 unions and the Mayor's Office of Sustainability to 19 complete a comprehensive study of what other cities 20 have done in terms of root adjustments to save funds 21 and to outline possible options in this area with the Department in the Council to consider down the line. 2.2 23 Thank you for your attention. CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Eric. 24 25 And I just want to say I'm a big fan of changing the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 62 schedule or how frequently we pick up, general 2 3 refuse, let's say for example. Limiting the pickup of general refuse, let's say, to once a week would 4 incentivize or motivate folks to do better with 5 recycling knowing that that would be picked up more 6 7 frequently. If we do that two or three times a week, 8 everyone would make sure that all their recycling is 9 out and just not to have all the general refuse out or in their homes. So, we have been advocating for 10 11 this for quite some time amen you are right. If we do some modification, there could be some cost 12 13 savings while also achieving many of our goals that we have when it comes to recycling. So, it is 14 15 something that I am definitely going to be looking 16 into, Eric, and I appreciate your testimony very 17 much. Thank you. 18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If any Council members have any questions for the previous two 19 20 panelists, can you please use the zoom hand raise 21 function now? Seeing no hands raised, we will move 2.2 on and hear from Sabrina Rezzy next followed by

23 Debora Rivas.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now.

25

24

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 63 2 SABRINA REZZY: Good afternoon. I am 3 Sabrina Rezzy, the director of communications and 4 legislation for Assembly member Rodneyse Bischotte. Assembly member Bischotte represents the 42nd 5 assembly district which includes Flatbush, Midwood, 6 7 and Ditmas Park. I just want to say thank you to 8 Chair Reynoso and the members of the committee for 9 holding this meeting and, Commissioner Grayson, it is a pleasure to meet you too and we look forward to a 10 11 committed relationship. I just want to speak a little bit about what we have heard from our 12 13 constituents on the trash pickup and that is that our district has experienced an increase in overflowing 14 15 trash bins, litter, and agricultural overgrowth. We have received the largest number of complaints over 16 17 the summer and they were centered on the areas 18 surrounding Brooklyn College. Constituents have also noted that there is a significant lack of trash bins 19 in areas where there is high pedestrian traffic and 20 that, you know, the trash bins that are there are 21 2.2 older and not the rat prove trash cans. One 23 constituent group noted that two days after a community trash pickup, litter was back because there 24 25 are no bins. And you know, I, unfortunately,

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 64 2 experienced this personally over the summer. I was 3 driving and ran over a nail that was heading in, you 4 know, some of the street garbage that has been 5 blowing around on our local streets. So, you know, I'm glad to see that trash pickups are being restored 6 7 by the Mayor with the increase of 65 trucks and I 8 would like to think the Mayor's office for restoring 9 those services. Trash, as we know, breeds rodents and germs and our residents deserve a clean and 10 11 healthy environment and our current public health 12 crisis means that we need to do more than ever before 13 to clean up the streets, sidewalks, and parks. So, I think you, Commissioner, Chair Reynoso, and members 14 15 of the committee. Thank you to Kathy Nizzari and 16 SWAB for all your efforts to clean up our 17 neighborhoods. We are grateful for all of your work 18 to improve the situation. Thanks. 19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, 20 I want to make sure that we can get back to Sabrina. 21 you and the Assembly member on whether or not the 65 2.2 new trucks or the expanded trucks are running through 23 your district. And I believe Assembly member Bischotte's district was one of the hardest hit 24 25 districts during COVID, so I would assume that they

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 65 are the ones that are going to receive the services. 2 3 But, again, I don't have that information readily 4 available to me, but, when they get it to me, I will get it to you and hopefully, you know, we can see an 5 impact, positive impact, on your district. 6 7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. 8 SABRINA REZZY: Thanks. 9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next, we will hear from Debora Rivas. 10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time starts now. 11 I'm Debora Rivas. 12 DEBORA RIVAS: Hi. 13 I'm part of a grassroots community cleanup group called The Bushwick Initiative. I want to thank our 14 15 city councilmember Antonio Reynoso. He is been very 16 gray at supporting our group. And I also want to 17 thank DSNY. They have been really great. We 18 actually hold regular meetings with the DSNY rep and 19 they have been completely supportive of, you know, 20 our street cleaning crusades. Since the budget 21 cutbacks, we have experienced a significant amount of 2.2 trash in the streets. And it's been a challenge for 23 us to maintain the cleanliness of the community because, not only is there a lot of trash in the 24 25 streets, there is trash in the park and, like what

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 66 was said earlier, we will have a community cleanup 2 3 and then about an hour later the trash will be back on the street. So, I do have some recommendations 4 regarding how that could be mitigated. I feel like 5 the city should focus on marketing and implementing a 6 7 campaign, a litter free campaign. I think that will 8 help. I feel like the city can also-- well, now we 9 are seeing the budget, but I think some money should be allocated towards may be a text message system 10 11 reminds building and commercial owners of the pickup 12 schedule or the recycling schedule. I think part of 13 the issue is that a lot of garbage is being put out on days where it is not a pickup day and then what 14 15 happens is a lot of the homeless people dig through 16 the bags and then the bags get scattered. The 17 garbage is scattered all over the street. On the 18 other recommendation could be may be, you know, instead of having the black bags, clear bags put out. 19 Because I think that will help reinforce the 20 recycling. Those are my suggestions. As far as 21 2.2 restaurants, I think part of the reason why we see an 23 abundance of garbage is because we did have outdoor dining and a lot of restaurants for using single use 24 25 dinnerware and plastics which created a larger

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 67 abundance of garbage and that is what you would see 2 3 on top of the litter baskets. It was like overflows 4 of like plastic spoons and plastic containers. Ι 5 know that September 30th we're going to be allowing people to go inside, but I also feel that there 6 7 should be some kind of messaging to those restaurant 8 owners that, you know, they don't have to use single 9 use dinnerware anymore. There is nothing statistically to show that COVID is transmitted 10 11 through, you know, regular plates and spoons. I'm 12 sorry. Bear with me because of outside and I'm in my 13 car because I'm actually working. Any suggestions to improve the city cleaning operations and physical 14 15 challenges -- yeah. I do think that the main thing 16 that we should focus on is just creating an 17 awareness. I think that a lot of the litter problem 18 is people and I think that if we don't emphasize the 19 importance of recycling and keeping things clean, 20 people will continue to adjust their things out--21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired. 2.2 DEBORA RIVAS: on the street. That's 23 it for me. CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 24 Thank you, 25 Debora. And I just want to highlight the work that

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 1 68 Debora is doing in the community is really special. 2 It's about changing culture and making sure people 3 4 understand that littering is a problem and it seems like since the Bushwick Cleanup Initiative, we have 5 They've been out there doing the work 6 done a mural. that the city should be doing regularly. We have 7 seen an increase in foot traffic in and around 8 9 Bushwick. We have also seen the outdoor dining is made it so that, you know, trash is an output to the 10 11 left or right structures and they are compounded in the middle of the block. But the work that the 12 13 Cleanup Bushwick Initiative is second to none and they are really changing minds and culture, which I 14 15 think is the most important thing here. If everyone 16 were just to throw the trash away in their home and 17 keep it in their pocket and not throw it out on the 18 street, it would make a huge difference, but were not there yet. And I'm grateful for the work that Ms. 19 Debora Rivas is doing in our community. So thank 20 you, Debora, for that. I really appreciate it. 21 2.2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If any Council 23 members have questions for the last two panelists, please use the zoom hand raised function now. And, 24 25

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 69 2 if not, there are no more panelists, so Chair, you 3 can wrap up the hearing.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah. So, I want 5 to say again that I want to emphasize that it seems like it is a consensus. We are extremely grateful 6 7 for the work that DSNY is doing. We care deeply 8 about the men and women of the Department. We know 9 that we are asking them to do the same or do more with less, so we recognize the changes -- that we are 10 11 going to see a change in how our trash is picked up, 12 but it doesn't mean that we can walk away from the 13 problem. We need to address it and I am grateful that the Mayor was able to find funding through over 14 15 time or whatever it is, to be able to get 65 more 16 trucks in. I'm hoping that we can have conversation, 17 maybe, and a couple of minds to see what impact that 18 has had on these communities and whether or not we will start seeing something different. But I do want 19 to encourage New York City to do better, as well. 20 Ιf 21 we are all contributing one way or another, and if we 2.2 are able to not litter, it would be a huge impact in 23 a huge difference. Thank you, again, to all the members of DSNY who are here speaking the day, to all 24 my Council members for your questions and I'm looking 25

1	COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 70
2	forward to a lot of follow-ups so that we can see
3	where exactly they used trucks are going to go in the
4	impacts they are going to have. So, again, thank you
5	so much, Commissioner. To the Chief. To the
6	Assistant Commissioner. I really appreciate your
7	time and I think, at this point, we're done with the
8	hearing. Thank you. Take care everyone. Peace and
9	love.
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 30, 2020