

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
EDUCATION AND COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 1

2 CITY COUNCIL
3 CITY OF NEW YORK

4 ----- X

5 TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

6 Of the

7 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH
8 THE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION AND
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

9 ----- X

10 May 12, 2020
Start: 10:07 a.m.
Recess: 4:23 p.m.

11
12 HELD AT: Remote Hearing

13 B E F O R E: Daniel Dromm,
14 Chairperson of the Committee on
Finance

15 Mark Treyger,
16 Chairperson of the Committee on
Education

17 Ydanis Rodriguez,
18 Chairperson of the Committee on
Transportation

19 COUNCIL MEMBERS:

20 Adrienne E. Adams
21 Farah N. Louis
Joseph C. Borelli
22 Jimmy Van Bramer
Barry Grodenchik
23 Ben Kallos
Brad Lander
24 Justin Brannan
Steven Matteo
25 Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Keith Powers
Inez Barron

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONT.) :

3 Vanessa Gibson
4 Mark Levine
5 Helen Rosenthal
6 Francisco Moya
7 Kalman Yeger
8 Rafael Salamanca Jr.
9 Rory I. Lancman
10 Mark Gjonaj
11 Deborah Rose
12 Karen Koslowitz
13 Diana Ayala
14 Ydanis Rodriguez
15 Laurie A. Cumbo
16 Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
17 Stephen Levin
18 Daneek Miller
19 Carlos Menchaca
20 Peter Koo
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S

Richard Carranza
New York City Schools Chancellor

Ursulina Ramirez
Chief Operating Officer for the New York City
Department of Education

Lindsey Oates
Chief Financial Officer for the Department of
Education

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner for the Department of Transportation

Elisabeth Franklin
Associate Commissioner for Budget and Capital

Rebecca Zack
Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental and
Community Affairs

Sarah Feinberg
Interim President of New York City Transit

Janno Lieber
MTA Chief Development Officer and President of
MTA Construction and Development

David Keller
Acting Director of Management and Budget for the
MTA

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Hold on Sergeant Dautaj, hold
3 on . We're waiting for the live link. Go ahead
4 Sergeant.

5 SERGEANT DAUTAJ: Turn your video devices to
6 vibrate. Please mute your microphones on Zoom.
7 Please ensure that you have named yourself correctly
8 in Zoom or you may be either renamed by the Zoom host
9 or removed from the hearing. We will begin the
10 meeting of the Committee on Finance.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are we now live?

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes, sir.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
14 I'm going to use my trustee MSQI debate league gavel
15 to gavel us in. [GAVEL]

16 And with that, I'd like to say good morning and
17 welcome to the City Council's second day of hearings
18 on the Mayor's Executive Budget for Fiscal 2021.

19 My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair the Finance
20 Committee. We are joined by the Committee on
21 Education Chaired by my colleague Council Member Mark
22 Treyger and the Public Advocate Jumaane Williams.

23 I now want to introduce my colleagues who have
24 joined us and they are Council Members Adams, Louis,
25 Borelli, Van Bramer, Grodenchik, Kallos, Lander,

1
2 Brannan, Minority Leader Matteo, Ampry-Samuel,
3 Powers, Council Members Barron, Gibson, Levine, and
4 Rosenthal and I know that others will be joining us
5 shortly.

6 I'm now going to turn it over to our Committee
7 Counsel to go over some procedural items.

8 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Thank you. My name is
9 Stephanie Ruiz and I am Counsel to the New York City
10 Council's Committee on Finance.

11 Before we begin, I want to remind everyone that
12 you will be on mute until you are recognized to
13 speak. At which time, you will be unmuted by the
14 Zoom host. During the hearing, if Council Members
15 would like to ask a question, please use the Zoom
16 raise hand function and you will be called on in
17 order. We will be limiting Council Member questions
18 to five minutes including answers. After you are
19 acknowledged, please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to
20 tell you that your time has begun. The Sergeant at
21 Arms will also indicate when your time is expired.

22 Please also note that for ease of this virtual
23 hearing, we will not be allowing second round of
24 questioning. Thank you, I will now turn it back to
25 Chair Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. The COVID-19 pandemic has changed our daily reality in many respects and our city students have not been spared from these disruptions. In response to the spread of the virus, New York City public schools were closed and students and staff transitioned to remote teaching and learning from home.

I for one could not be more proud of our city's teachers. I also want to thank our Chancellor for making this transition so smooth. In a matter of days, they pivoted to a completely new teaching platform and they showed up for their students. In doing so, they provided their kids with consistency in a time of uncertainty and support when so many young people were stressed and anxious.

So, to all the teachers and school support staff, we thank you and please know that the Council is working hard to ensure that you have the resources you need in this budget.

DOE's Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget totals \$27.5 billion. As economic projections become increasingly dire and DOE's budget cuts reach a total of \$851.6 million in Fiscal 2021, the DOE will operate with a

1.7 percent less funding than anticipated in Fiscal
2021 Preliminary plan.

Yet the plan we are presented is incomplete.
There are several areas of spending in DOE's Fiscal
2021 Executive Budget that are underestimated and
underfunded such as charter cases and charter school
tuition payments. Leaving the city further exposed
to a number of budget risks.

Meanwhile the executive plan does not reflect all
projected spending related to the pandemic or make
baseline adjustments to account for the need for
changed services related to COVID-19. Similarly, on
the capital side, the budget does not align with the
capital plan approved by the panel for educational
policy.

We all know that in this fiscal situation,
difficult decisions and budget cuts need to be made
at the DOE but many of the Mayor's proposed cuts to
the DOE's budget will directly impact the day to day
functioning of schools. I believe that we must avoid
making those cuts to school budgets and that we
should look elsewhere to reduce funding.

I started out by thanking our teachers but there
are so many other school staff that need to be

1
2 praised for their work during this pandemic including
3 the cafeteria staff who are distributing food every
4 day, the custodial staff who continue to ensure the
5 buildings remain clean and in working order and to
6 our principals and assistant principals who are
7 leading by example.

8 And I just want to quote one thing from Lannie
9 Hanson's article this morning in Gotham Gazette.
10 We've lost 74 Department of Education employees
11 during this pandemic, 30 of them were teachers and 28
12 of them were paraprofessionals. The DOE has been on
13 the frontline of this pandemic working hard for our
14 city and I would like to thank you for all of the
15 work that you have done to get us through this
16 current crisis.

17 With that, I'd like to say that COVID-19 has
18 already had a brutal impact on the public school
19 system and we must ensure that our schools have the
20 resources they need, so that this pandemic does not
21 have lifelong consequences for a generation of
22 children.

23 Now, I'm going to turn it over to Council Member
24 and Chair Treyger for his opening. Chair Treyger?

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Chair Dromm and good morning. I am Council Member Mark Treyger, Chair of the Education Committee. I'd like to welcome everyone who is joining us remotely today to the Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget hearing on the DOE budget, Co-Chaired by my great colleague, Chair of our Finance Committee Daniel Dromm. This is the Education Committee's first remote hearing and I want to begin by thanking the Finance Division Staff including Chelsea Baytemur, Masis Sarkissian, Dohini Sompura, Regina Ryan for their hard work in preparing for this hearing. I also want to thank the Sergeant at Arms and the IT division for all of their work in making these hearings possible.

Before we go right into the DOE budget, I want to take a moment as well as you know as my colleague did, and thank and acknowledge every educator, food support staffer, custodian, cleaner, the team, the Chancellors team, the entire office for their incredible work for these past couple of months to help our children in our school communities cope with this crisis.

I also want to extend my heartfelt apologies and thoughts with all of our school community family

1
2 members who have lost loved ones who have been great,
3 greatly impacted by this crisis.

4 While we are aware that the city is in the middle
5 of a crisis that continues to gravely impact our
6 budget, as a former educator and longtime fierce
7 advocate for increases to fair student funding, I am
8 very troubled by the disproportionate impact on
9 school budgets and FSF that the Mayor's PEG would
10 introduce.

11 I am going to be very clear about what my north
12 star is and will be throughout this budget process.
13 Those closest to the struggle must be farthest from
14 the pain. This budget will determine if the trauma
15 our students are experiencing right now will be
16 temporary or generational. They will never get back
17 the lost instruction. They will not get back the
18 school community members that they've lost.

19 This has turned their world upside down and it is
20 up to us in government and leaders to make sure that
21 we protect them and protect their future.

22 We know and we have identified several
23 alternative savings within the city's budget and
24 DOE's budget from areas that do not affect the vital
25 COVID related support and work that our educators,

1
2 school staff, custodians, social workers, counselors
3 are performing.

4 While also not impacting you know, the overall
5 budget. It is imperative that during this time of
6 need, we continue to invest in our children who are
7 in fact our future. I fear that cuts of this
8 magnitude will force our most vulnerable schools to
9 make programmatic cuts in areas that our children
10 need most. DOE's Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget totals
11 \$27.4 billion. This is \$462.9 million less than the
12 budget identified in the prelim plan, a result of
13 \$851.6 million cuts to DOE's Fiscal 2021 budget.

14 A shortfall in state funding compared to what the
15 city expected in a pre-COVID world, required the DOE
16 to backfill \$381.5 million in spending. The
17 remaining \$470.1 million in cuts are from the
18 Administration's program to eliminate the gap or
19 known as a PEG. In the interest of time, we have
20 asked the Chancellor also to limit his remarks, so I
21 will also follow suit. In addition to the Finance
22 staff I mentioned earlier, I'd like to thank the
23 Education Committee Staff Malcom Butehorn, Jeanette
24 Well[SP?], Kalima Johnson and also thank my staff,
25

1
2 Anna Scaife, Vanessa Ogle, and I will turn the
3 hearing back to Chair Dromm.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and we
5 will now hear from our Public Advocate Jumaane
6 Williams.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JUMAANE WILLIAMS: Thank you very
8 much for giving me the opportunity as mentioned. My
9 name is Jumaane Williams, Public Advocate for the
10 City of New York. I'd like to thank the Committee's
11 on Education and Finance. Thank Chair Dromm and
12 Chair Treyger who are being leading on this issue for
13 this executive hearing as well as the Chancellor for
14 being here today. I lend my voices to those who are
15 praising all of our hero's and the school system for
16 helping us get where we are. We still have a lot
17 more work to do of course.

18 The rapid spread of COVID-19 in the subsequent
19 statewide shelter in place or pause order rather, has
20 caused a massive destruction to our local economy.
21 Of course, we all understand the need to consider
22 budget cuts. It does more harm than good for the
23 city to continue to significantly invest in law
24 enforcement yet reducing funding for youth programs,
25 education and vital services to particular low

1
2 moderate income communities and communities of more
3 color. Ultimately, what this means is the criminal
4 justice response instead of an innovative solution
5 that we know works.

6 It is our duty as elected officials to ensure
7 that cuts are equitably distributed, especially at a
8 time when it is clear that some of our most
9 modernized communities unexpectedly and desperately
10 impacted by the coronavirus. Specifically, by
11 decision made local.

12 I'm saddened by what happens to be a shortchange
13 to our city's young people through cuts to education
14 and other youth services. While a reduction the
15 operational cost is understandable. The more than
16 \$400 million in cuts to the Department of Education
17 and the \$166 million to cuts in CUNY will make it
18 more difficult for our youth to get educational and
19 workforce development they need to plan future
20 careers.

21 Last week, the IBO reported that our city stands
22 to lose at least \$2.3 billion in education funding,
23 should the state's decision of 20 to 30 percent
24 across the board cuts occur.

1
2 If the city truly wants to end the tale of two
3 cities, the Administration must reject these cuts and
4 look elsewhere in the budget for opportunities to
5 weather the storm. It is very much nonsensical to
6 reduce funding for DOE when the very nature of
7 learning has drastically changed. Schools in New
8 York have implemented distance learning which is
9 necessary. It is our responsibility to eliminate the
10 digital divide and ensure all students have access to
11 the technology they need to continue their education.

12 I have concerns about DOE's current capacity to
13 meet the needs of students with disabilities, special
14 needs, and our ESL learners. I'm also deeply
15 troubled to hear about reports of ACS investigations
16 into families who have had difficulty obtaining or
17 utilizing remote learning devices.

18 The transition to distant learning has created a
19 great deal of challenges for our students, their
20 families, and teachers. We need to equitably fund
21 the strategies to address these problems. Our
22 investments in young people need to extend far beyond
23 the school. We know that jobs are a key factor in
24 keeping young people engaged in our communities, the
25 city's summer youth employment program has proven to

1
2 be a valid opportunity for our youth. As previously
3 proposed, SYEP should not be dismantled, it should be
4 instead adapted to make youth where they are in the
5 current crisis.

6 The city should use a stipend payment and allow
7 for remote work in skills training, filling essential
8 roles where the city needs it the most. All New York
9 City youth should have access to summer jobs
10 regardless of citizenship status and my bill Intro.
11 1670 would ensure they do so.

12 SYEP is young and eager, workforce deserves an
13 opportunity to build their own foundation. Like all
14 of us, students and educators are experiencing a
15 great deal of trauma. I am concerned about their
16 mental wellbeing during this time. Identifying real
17 time support for mental wellness and trauma informed
18 school practices for both students and staff is a
19 challenge.

20 The Administration must, however, prioritize
21 extended professional development school staff and
22 supports for mental wellness grieving coronavirus
23 devastation during this time as well as those who
24 have lost loved ones and a student or school staff
25

1
2 who have passed in their respective schools across
3 New York City.

4 I know the city is facing economic crisis,
5 difficult decisions will be made. We cannot place
6 this on the back of our vulnerable childrens their
7 families or their teachers. I'm eager to hear from
8 the Administration today on how their commitment to
9 serve New York's youth align with this budget, thank
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Mr.
12 Public Advocate. I'd like to say that we've also
13 been joined by Council Members Moya, Yeger, Salamanca
14 and Lancman. I'm just checking to see if any other,
15 okay, that's it. Before we begin with testimony from
16 the Administration, I'd like to remind the public
17 that the Finance Committee and the Subcommittee on
18 Capital Budget will be holding a remote hearing for
19 public testimony on the Executive Budget on May 21st
20 at 11:30 a.m.

21 Now, I'm seeing some tweets in regard to being
22 disappointed about the public not participating in
23 this hearing but that's the way that it's always been
24 and for the Executive Budget hearings and we take
25 public testimony at the end of the Executive Budget

1
2 hearings. And in many cases, that testimony given
3 particularly by parents and others has made a
4 significant difference in our budget negotiations.

5 So, if you would like to testify at that hearing,
6 please register at www.council.nyc.gov/testify. Let
7 me say it again, www.council.nyc.gov/testify and the
8 information about how to access the Zoom meeting will
9 be emailed to you.

10 You may testify at that hearing via web or via
11 telephone. You may also submit written testimony
12 through the registration website or by emailing
13 financetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that's
14 financetestimony@council.nyc.gov, and also I believe
15 that the Chancellor's testimony today is available on
16 livestream, if I'm not mistaking, let me just double
17 check on that. Excuse me. Yes, the Chancellor's
18 testimony is available on the Council's website
19 excuse me, through Legistar.

20 I will now call on the members of the Department
21 of Education to testify. We will hear testimony from
22 Chancellor Richie Carranza. Chancellor Carranza is
23 joined by Lindsey Oates, the Chief Financial Officer
24 and Ursulina Ramirez, the Chief Operating Officer.

1
2 Will the Committee Counsel please administer the
3 affirmation.

4 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Thank you. I will now
5 administer the affirmation one time and you will be
6 called on individually to so affirm at the end.

7 Do you affirm that your testimony will be
8 truthful and to the best of your knowledge,
9 information, and belief? Chancellor Carranza?

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: I do.

11 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Ms. Oates?

12 LINDSEY OATES: I do.

13 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Ms. Ramirez?

14 URSULINA RAMIREZ: I do.

15 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Thank you. Chancellor,
16 you may begin when ready.

17 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you. So, Good morning
18 Chair Dromm, Chair Treyger, Public Advocate Williams
19 and all of the members of the Finance and Education
20 Committee's here today. I am Richard Carranza and I
21 have the privilege of serving as New York City
22 Schools Chancellor. Joining this morning is Ursulina
23 Ramirez, Chief Operating Officer for the New York
24 City Department of Education and Lindsey Oates, Chief
25 Financial Officer for the Department of Education.

1
2 I want to thank you for the opportunity to
3 testify on Mayor de Blasio's Fiscal Year 2021
4 Executive Budget as it relates to the DOE and I hope
5 that you and your families are all safe and healthy.

6 I would also like to take this moment to thank
7 and applaud all of our teachers and principals, food
8 service workers, our custodians, our school safety
9 agents, our crossing guards. Everyone working in the
10 REC centers that are making it possible for our first
11 responders and essential workers to continue to serve
12 our city. Thank you for your service. Thank you.

13 We are almost two months into a pandemic that has
14 had catastrophic impacts on our city, including the
15 closing of our school buildings from March 16th until
16 the end of this school year. This has been a painful
17 time and we are devastated by the lives lost through
18 this crisis. At the Department of Education, we have
19 lost more than 70 of our colleagues. Our communities
20 will never be the same without them and we owe a debt
21 of gratitude to all the staff on the front line, as
22 well as our first responders and all the essential
23 workers across the city.

24 Having seen firsthand the incredible resilience
25 and commitment of DOE staff, our students, and our

1
2 families, as well as New Yorkers in general, I know
3 that we will get through this together.

4 I would also like to express my gratitude to
5 Speaker Johnson, as well as Chairs Dromm and Treyger
6 and the entire City Council for all you have done and
7 continue to do on behalf of New York City schools and
8 especially our historically marginalized students.

9 You remain fierce advocates for equity in our school
10 communities, and we are grateful to have you working
11 with the Department of Education on how to best
12 provide for all the students of New York City during
13 this time. Your insights and support have been
14 crucial in the midst of this crisis.

15 As you know, the pandemic has also had a
16 devastating effect on the city's fiscal condition.

17 As a result of the near complete shutdown of the
18 New York City economy, the New York City Office of
19 Management and Budget is projecting a city tax
20 revenue declines of \$7.4 billion against prior
21 expectations across Fiscal Year 2020 and Fiscal Year
22 2021. Furthermore, the State's Enacted Budget left a
23 nearly \$400 million shortfall in funding that we were
24 owed for our schools, which the city had to backfill.

1
2 This is troubling financial background in which
3 the Mayor has announced painful cuts to city agencies
4 in our school system. The DOE's Fiscal 2021
5 Executive Budget of approximately \$34.2 billion
6 includes \$27.5 billion in operating funds and another
7 \$6.7 billion in education related pension and debt
8 service funds.

9 Our funding is a combination of city, state, and
10 federal dollars, with the city tax levy dollars
11 making up the largest share, 57 percent and the state
12 dollars 36 percent and federal dollars 6 percent.
13 The Executive Budget includes \$111 million in
14 reductions in saving from the current year operations
15 for the Department of Education and \$471 million in
16 reductions and savings for Fiscal Year 2021.

17 The federal response has not matched the economic
18 impact of this pandemic. The federal CARES Act
19 providing funding to state governments to distribute,
20 New York switched out that funding for their own,
21 using it to backfill a \$700 million hole year over
22 year reduction in State Aid. In addition to state
23 budget allows the Governor to make mid-year cuts as
24 the pandemic progresses, with the potential to cause
25 budget gaps for us in Fiscal 2021. We expect the

1
2 state to announce further large cuts to our budget as
3 soon as this week.

4 This economic reality requires the city to make
5 hard decisions, including painful education cuts.
6 These cuts are of a shocking magnitude.

7 We first began in our center budget, slashing
8 programs including some of our hallmark Equity and
9 Excellence programs. Programs such as College Access
10 for All and Civics for All. Other centrally
11 administered areas for reductions in Fiscal Year 2021
12 include professional development spending reductions,
13 hiring freeze savings, and delaying the expansion of
14 3-K programs, amongst others.

15 But the degree of reduction necessary meant DOE
16 could not take these cuts purely out of
17 administrative budgets and budget cuts to our schools
18 now include \$100 million in reduction to the Fair
19 Student Funding formula and a \$40 million reduction
20 to other funding streams. As an educator, as a
21 lifelong educator, I cannot overstate how troubling
22 this is and I want to be very clear that school based
23 cuts are absolutely the last resort and we are doing
24 everything we can to avoid or minimize the pain for
25

1
2 our school communities. Minimize the pain for
3 student learning and educators who serve them.

4 We are working internally and with our city
5 partners to come up with an equitable methodology
6 that minimizes the impact to our most vulnerable
7 communities. But as a former teacher and principal,
8 very few things break my heart more than having to go
9 through this exercise of trying to save resources for
10 our schools.

11 Let me be very clear, under these circumstances
12 and without additional direct support from the
13 federal government, we simply cannot afford to
14 maintain school budgets and programs at Fiscal Year
15 2020 levels. We need federal intervention.

16 You will hear me detail the incredible work of
17 our staff and families, none of which will be
18 possible without adequate funding going forward.

19 This City Council has consistently been partners
20 in advocating for academic funding and more resources
21 for our schools and our communities and I know you
22 will continue your advocacy to our congressional
23 delegation for additional direct aid to localities in
24 future relief bills.

1
2 Within days of this crisis beginning, we
3 engineered the complete transformation of our
4 educational system, closing school buildings and
5 bringing learning and teaching for 1.1 million
6 students online. This shift to remote teaching and
7 learning poses all kinds of challenges and can't
8 possibly equal the richness of classroom experiences.
9 But it was the best option to sustain our connections
10 with our students. Several weeks in, I can honestly
11 say that I am in awe of what our staff, our families,
12 what our communities and our students have done to
13 make this new reality work much better than anyone
14 could have anticipated.

15 During a crisis like this, it can become easy to
16 lose sight of our broader goals for New York City's
17 schools and children. But from the beginning of my
18 tenure, Equity and Excellence for All has been my
19 focus. This Administration has made historic
20 investments in education initiatives as part of our
21 Equity and Excellence for All agenda to improve
22 outcomes for our students. We have and will continue
23 to use the same lens throughout this crisis and
24 beyond, even as we adapt to the radically changing

1
2 landscape, we will keep our most vulnerable students
3 in mind.

4 I'll begin by diving further into remote learning
5 services and supports for our 1.1 million students.

6 This transition demanded that we figure out a way
7 to bridge the digital divide as quickly as possible.
8 We are the only major school system with a
9 substantial effort to provide remote learning devices
10 to our students. And as I speak to my colleagues,
11 heads of large urban systems across the country,
12 there is no one that comes close to what we have done
13 in New York City.

14 Immediately, we began distributing approximately
15 175,000 existing school based devices to students in
16 need, while collaborating with partners to bring
17 hundreds of thousands of internet enabled iPads to
18 students who previously lack the means to access
19 remote learning.

20 Distribution of centrally purchased devices began
21 with our most vulnerable students: 13,000 students
22 living in shelters, followed by students in temporary
23 housing and foster care, high school students,
24 multilingual learners, students with disabilities.
25 This has been critical in allowing us to provide

1 related service for students with IEP's through
2 teletherapy where appropriate.
3

4 To date, we have distributed more than 280,000
5 internet enabled devices across the city to ensure
6 our students have access to remote learning. This
7 was a hugely heavy lift, but absolutely necessary and
8 would have been impossible without the Council's
9 longstanding and continuous investment in technology
10 for our schools.

11 Our Regional Enrichment Centers or RECs, educate
12 and provide safe spaces to the children of first
13 responders and other essential workers. To date, we
14 have over 8,800 students that have been given
15 placement across 57 REC sites across our city in
16 addition to a range of childcare sites for children
17 ages zero to five.

18 We will be operating these spaces for as long as
19 necessary, so that essential workers have the
20 childcare that they need, so that they can continue
21 to serve our city and our residents.

22 In addition, the RECs, schools are being used at
23 yet another unprecedented way. We have opened nearly
24 450 Meal Hubs across the city that are safely
25 providing three meals a day to anyone that needs

1
2 them, both children and adults. Our numbers continue
3 to increase and to date, we have served over 10
4 million meals and now exceed 500,000 meals that are
5 being served on a daily basis.

6 These sites provide Halal and Kosher meals to
7 those who need them including expanded Halal meals
8 during Ramadan.

9 This has been a huge accomplishment and I can't
10 tell you how proud I am of everyone on our team for
11 ensuring that New Yorkers remain nourished during
12 this destabilizing pandemic.

13 We know that remote learning during this time
14 remains an immense challenge given the stress and
15 trauma facing our students, our families, and our
16 educators. We also know that healthier students are
17 better learners. So, we have focused on ensuring
18 that our students receive access to supports needed
19 to promote their health, wellness, and engagement.

20 And I want to acknowledge that the City Council
21 and especially Chair Treyger, have been key partners
22 in our ongoing work to address the needs of the whole
23 child. Your commitment to ensuring that students
24 have access to social and emotional supports has been
25

1
2 essential to their wellbeing during such unsettling
3 times.

4 Through our Wellness DOE program, schools are
5 conducting universal wellness checks, especially for
6 our most vulnerable student populations and working
7 to identify less engaged students, making sure that
8 they are properly supported. We have created
9 resources to promote SEL learning through remote
10 learning and we have provided direct clinical
11 supports to students since the day remote learning
12 began.

13 We are of course eager, like everyone else to
14 reopen our schools and return to classroom in person
15 learning. However, we recognize the gravity of this
16 situation and the need to center this decision on the
17 health and safety of our students, families, staff,
18 and city.

19 This is going to be a process and a gradual one.
20 We will not reopen a day before public health experts
21 say it's safe. We are looking at different options
22 for how to resume in person instruction and our goal
23 and focus is on returning to buildings in September.

24 Even with all the work we have done to make
25 remote learning as successful as it can be, we know

1
2 that there will be a new level of work required for
3 us, from ensuring buildings that are safe, to
4 rethinking health protocols, to addressing learning
5 loss, providing heightened social emotional supports
6 and all of the trauma informed supports that we know
7 are necessary. We will continue to keep you updated
8 and solicit your feedback as alternatives are
9 evaluated and hope to provide as much clarity as soon
10 as we can allow for maximum planning and
11 understanding.

12 In conclusion, I hope that this paints a useful
13 picture of how critical public education is in these
14 unprecedented times. Our city, our state and our
15 nation's health and economy have been ravaged by this
16 crisis. Our resolve and resilience are being tested
17 daily. Hard choices that we could not anticipate nor
18 wanted to make are foisted upon us on a daily basis.
19 But that is exactly why we cannot abandon our
20 investment in this work and why now, more than ever,
21 it's critical to the future of our students,
22 families, neighborhoods, and our city.

23 The Department of Education is all in, doing
24 everything we can to equitably navigate these
25 challenges. My commitment is that supporting our

1
2 students, families, and educators will always be
3 front and center, no matter what. We need you, the
4 City Council's continued feedback, advocacy, and
5 wholehearted dedication to our 1.1 million students.

6 I want to thank you for your time and myself and
7 my colleagues will be happy to answer any questions
8 that you may have.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Mr.
10 Chancellor and let me jump right into one of our
11 biggest issues which is the issue of state aid. The
12 Governor, and you may have mentioned somewhat of this
13 in your testimony, but the Governor recently
14 announced that there is a potential for an additional
15 \$8.2 billion cuts in the budget to localities if no
16 additional federal revenue is granted to the state.

17 One of the areas that will be impacted will be
18 school aid. Currently, New York City makes up 41
19 percent of the states total school aid allocation.

20 So, if this cut does come through it's likely
21 that New York City could lose \$2.1 billion in school
22 aid. Would it be possible to absorb this cost
23 without layoffs or massive disruption to contracting
24 with nonprofit providers?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Mr. Chair, any additional cuts
3 as I mentioned and let give you the context. As I
4 mentioned the Federal Cares Act, which was supposed
5 to be stimulus money that directly supported schools
6 was used by the state to cover a budget hole at the
7 state. And then we were subsequently cut that
8 funding in our state allocation.

9 Any additional allocations will be devastating to
10 the Department of Education and the students and
11 staff in New York City. We are hitting the bone,
12 there is no fat to cut, there is no meat to cut, we
13 are at the bone.

14 In my tenure over two years here at Department of
15 Education, we have taken over \$600 billion in cuts,
16 which have all been essentially cut and this
17 additional cuts this year is the first time that
18 schools are feeling a segment of pain around these
19 kinds of cuts.

20 To add more cuts from the state to our budget,
21 will devastate our school system and it's why I've
22 been advocating and partnering with all of the City
23 Council members to advocate at the federal level for
24 federal stimulus which will not allow supplementation
25

1
2 of that funding elsewhere. It will be devastating to
3 us. In every facet of what we do -

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, if these cuts
5 happen, will school budgets continue to be the target
6 if the Governor implements these cuts?

7 RICHARD CARRANZA: We are absolutely looking at
8 keeping the cuts as far away from schools as
9 possible. We are decimating; we have decimated
10 central budgets. We have frozen hiring. We have
11 reduced professional development. We are cutting
12 everywhere we can cut centrally but we are at the
13 bone, and that's why for the first time, schools are
14 feeling some of the sting of these cuts.

15 It breaks my heart as an educator that any school
16 would receive or feel any kind of a cut. That's
17 where the rubber meets the road.

18 Unfortunately, this is evidence of the fact that
19 these cuts are so deep. They are now starting to
20 affect our schools. So, we need that stimulus
21 funding and we need to protect our schools and our
22 classrooms as much as possible.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, what is the plan
24 if we do see these cuts? Have you given thought to
25 that?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: We are working on multiple
3 scenarios and we are working very closely with OMB
4 around planning for what, how, and what we would do
5 to absorb these cuts. One of the many reasons I am
6 so proud to be Chancellor in New York City is, the
7 structure that [INAUDIBLE 35:18] in New York City.
8 There our most vulnerable students and our vulnerable
9 community and my greatest fear is that the cuts will
10 chip away. In fact, it won't chip away, it will hack
11 away. The very infrastructure that we created defer
12 our most vulnerable student of communities.

13 With your permission sir, I have my Chief
14 Financial Officer Lindsey Oates on board. She can
15 talk a little bit more about what the planning is for
16 these kinds of cuts. Lindsey?

17 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you sir. I just want to
18 make sure everyone can hear me. Okay, great. So,
19 yes, I mean I agree with both the Chancellor and
20 Chair Dromm's assessment of the state cuts.
21 Obviously, we want to see what the actual numbers are
22 and we expect as the Chancellor testified here,
23 hopefully later this week.

24 To put into context, these additional state cuts
25 on top of existing cuts are somewhere around 10

1
2 percent of the Department of Education's budget. I
3 mean, these are huge, huge numbers and we are doing
4 everything we absolutely can to spare direct school
5 budgets.

6 You know, entire budget DOE supports schools.
7 Our school food workers, our you know, our
8 maintenance, our facilities, our custodians, all of
9 our budget supports REC schools. And so, whatever
10 these cuts end up looking like will be an impact. We
11 are working as closely as we can with our city
12 partners to access how to do this in an equitable way
13 to try to ensure that the students retain the
14 supports that they need during this crisis and to
15 certainly prioritize all of the resources on direct
16 response efforts as long as this crisis is ongoing.
17 Those are our top priorities right now but there is a
18 lot of hard work ahead of us.

19 And we appreciate, as the Chancellor said, all of
20 your advocacy at the federal level really secure
21 direct financial aid we need direct from the federal
22 government to New York City. We need that direct aid
23 to really help maintain our school system right now.
24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Have you been in contact with
3 the federal government on this or how are you
4 advocating for that aid?

5 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, Chairman Dromm, I have
6 personally spoken with both of our senators. I've
7 also spoken with our congressional delegation. In
8 addition, New York City Department of Education is
9 part of the consortium of the largest urban school
10 systems in America, the Council of the Great City
11 School. I have signed a letter with my colleagues
12 across the country to congress requesting aid and
13 stimulus dollars and we continue to engage at the
14 federal level almost on a weekly basis.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chancellor. Remote
16 technology: the DOE purchased 300,000 iPads to
17 implement remote learning. The current estimated
18 cost for these devices as I think it is about \$159
19 million in capital expenses and \$72 million in city
20 tax levy dollars.

21 We knew that the DOE had to purchase these
22 devices for about a month before the release of the
23 Executive Budget, yet none of these costs were
24 reflected in the Executive plan. Can you explain why
25 they were not included in the Executive plan?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Mr. Chairman, I'm
3 going to ask our Chief Financial Officer to give you
4 details on that. Linsey Oates.

5 LINDSEY OATES: Sir, so as you noted Chair, a
6 significant portion of the cost of the devices was
7 funded through capital appropriation and we want to
8 thank Comptroller Stringer for his quick action with
9 our Mayor to ensure the Emergency Appropriation
10 letter was signed to support that.

11 And so, I think you will see that some expenses
12 are hitting our budget related to this. Our expense
13 budget, but most of this is in the capital budget
14 right now and a lot of the expenses occurred you
15 know, before the Exec Budget was released on April
16 16th and are continuing through the month to month of
17 April.

18 So, you will see those expenses start to hit as
19 we move forward. That's the main reason why it
20 wasn't reflected in the Executive Budget as it's in
21 the capital. It's primarily funded by a capital
22 appropriation.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I recall that because for
24 years we are advocating for -

25 LINDSEY OATES: Yes.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The purchase of iPads with
3 capital dollars. So, I'm glad to hear that it has
4 finally happened.

5 LINDSEY OATES: It came at the right time sir.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, yeah, yeah and I know
7 that that's been an important issue for the Committee
8 as well, even after I was Finance Chair and Chair
9 Treyger took over, so, okay.

10 Let me talk a little bit about one shots. In the
11 Fiscal 2020 Budget, the City Council negotiated for
12 over \$11.9 million in funding to be added to programs
13 such as community schools, sustainability, urban
14 advantage, the LGBTQ inclusive curriculum and
15 diversity and integration initiatives. Actually, one
16 of the things that I'm most curious about is that
17 whether or not these programs and particularly
18 culturally responsive sustainable education as well
19 as implicit bias training will continue to be
20 implemented despite the budget cuts to the
21 professional development budget.

22 So, these programs were not included in the 2021
23 Budget. So, can you point to any performance issues
24 that would support their exclusion? Why were they
25 not included?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Chairman Dromm, I'll share
3 some thoughts and then I'm going to ask our Chief
4 Financial Officer if she would like to elaborate in a
5 little more detail.

6 All of the initiatives that you have mentioned
7 are not one off initiatives. We have integrated them
8 in the very fabric of what teaching and learning is
9 in New York City schools. So, implicit bias training
10 is not something we just do, it's part of how we look
11 at the work that we do.

12 So, we've built capacity to continue to have
13 those kinds of sessions in house and culturally
14 response to education is not a thing. It is a
15 strategy; it is in pedagogy to what we do to the
16 curriculum of who our students are. 82 percent of
17 students of those 2.1 million students in New York
18 City public schools, are Black, Hispanic, Latino and
19 Asian.

20 So, we feel very strongly that what students
21 read, what students study, the historical figures
22 within the context of the timeframe should be
23 reflective of all of our students. That is what
24 culturally response sustain education is. So, as
25 long as we're learning and teaching in the city,

1
2 we'll be learning within a culturally responsive and
3 sustaining framework. That goes to cities with
4 LGBTQ, where our students need to see themselves
5 reflected in historical figures and historical
6 timeframes.

7 So, you are not seeing that as a specific item
8 in the budget because that has been included in the
9 very fabric of what we do in terms of teaching and
10 learning. Lindsay, did you want to add anything?

11 LINDSEY OATES: I agree with you sir. It's
12 braided into a lot of different actions across the
13 Department between the Chief Academic Officers
14 Department, as well as Deputy Chancellor LaShawn
15 Robinson's area. It's blended within a lot of
16 different initiatives and we use a variety of
17 different fund sources also to fund this really
18 important work.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It just concerns me because
20 these are signature programs. I think of this
21 Chancellor's tenure and something that I have also
22 been fighting as an educator for, for many years and
23 I certainly would not like to see any of these
24 programs pushed to the side because I think that they
25 are you know, extremely important in terms of the

1
2 direction that the school system is heading and as I
3 said before, these are stuff that we have not had
4 before so I don't want to lose them moving forward.

5 So, I think there was \$1 million for LGBT
6 inclusive curriculum. Can you commit to working with
7 us to keep that \$1 million in the budget?

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes sir, we will continue to
9 work with you in the matter that we've worked with
10 you. We think it's important, we think it's vital
11 for all of our students to be supported and
12 represented. So, we look forward to continuing
13 working with you.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, what about
15 restorative justice programs? What are you thinking
16 around that? I think we put \$1.3 million in the
17 Fiscal 2020 Budget, but it was not included in Fiscal
18 2021. You know, that also is extremely important and
19 it requires a whole school effort. So, are we going
20 to continue with restorative justice training and
21 practices?

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Mr. Chairman, similarly to
23 my response around culturally responsive education,
24 implicit bias training, our equity initiatives,
25 restorative practices are part of the fabric of how

1
2 we interact with those students. So, we see that now
3 as the way we work with students. The way, "we do
4 business." It's not a punitive approach, but it's a
5 restorative approach in working with students.

6 So, that will continue to be in effect. We will
7 not cut that. In fact, we've integrated it even
8 more. We've also changed our policies; we've altered
9 our Chancellors regulations to reflect a restorative
10 approach. As you know, we also have a new memorandum
11 of understanding with NYPD which further memorializes
12 this approach that is restorative. It's almost
13 neighborhood policing in schools. It's about
14 relationships, it's about developing the capacity to
15 understand what behaviors are appropriate and not
16 appropriate and then, to be responsible for those
17 behaviors. So, it is in the fabric of what we do and
18 that will not go away.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. That requires me
20 to ask then, are there any plans to reduce school
21 safety agent funding? That has been a point of
22 contention for the Council for a number of years in
23 terms of the fact that we have more school safety
24 agents than we do Guidance Counselors or Social
25

1
2 Workers. Is there any plan to reduce the school
3 safety agents in the schools?

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Mr. Chair, in this budget
5 environment, what I have said to everyone is that
6 everything is on the table. Everything is on the
7 table but I will say to you that having served as a
8 Superintendent in a number of different school
9 systems across the country, school safety is never an
10 issue until it's an issue. And I can tell you
11 visiting our REC sites, I can tell you right now
12 visiting our schools sites, with our school safety
13 agents on duty protecting our sites but also
14 protecting our REC centers and providing a valuable
15 services for us. But we continue to look at what
16 that looks like within the context of the budget,
17 within the context of the pandemic response. And as
18 we get clearer direction from our health
19 professionals and we start thinking about what will
20 in person learning look like, the questions of safety
21 agents as well as every other position in the
22 Department of Education is being actually looked at
23 in terms of how is the new reality going to look like
24 when students come back to in person learning.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Let me just ask a
3 couple of more questions and then I will turn it over
4 to Chair Treyger.

5 Significant changes have occurred in the DOE's
6 Executive Budget and Commitment Plan, Capital Plan,
7 dues to a freeze on nonessential capital work across
8 the state and the Executive Plan shows a \$500 million
9 cut for school capital projects in Fiscal 2020 and
10 \$388 million cut in Fiscal 2021.

11 So, what is the Department's plan for revising
12 the amendment to the five year capital plan to align
13 it with the current budget and to reflect the
14 adjusted schedules as a result of the pause?

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Mr. Chair, I will give
16 some preliminary remarks and then I'll ask our Chief
17 Financial Officer to weigh in as well. But obviously
18 the economic, I call it the economic pandemic that is
19 associated with COVID-19 has changed the landscape
20 for all of us, including our Capital Budget.

21 So, as we are trying to model what future
22 learning is going to look like and what that
23 environment will look like, we thought it was only
24 prudent to pause on the capital plan and capital
25 budget and reevaluate what that's going to look like

1
2 and that's why we did not bring it to the panel for
3 educational policy because we're actually taking a
4 good look at what will this look like. And let me
5 give you an example. Whatever the recommendations
6 are from our public health experts, we know that in
7 September, we will probably have to be doing social
8 distancing and in the very compact environment that
9 are the schools in New York City, what is that going
10 to look like?

11 So, do we need to do additional partitions? Do
12 we need to do install certain things? What will that
13 look like to be able to meet health guidelines? We
14 don't know yet. So, as we get more information, we
15 thought it was only prudent that we pause, so that we
16 can evaluate what that looks like and then build that
17 into our capital plan.

18 I'd like to ask Lindsey if she can add some more
19 detail to your specific question about what is the
20 planning process for the revised plan.

21 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you sir. So, I believe the
22 SCA met with some Council Staff yesterday, President
23 Grillo and folks from DOE to talk through sort of the
24 specific future of the goals there. I think there is
25 a lot to learn from community engagement. We heard

1
2 specifically from a lot of students at our panel
3 meeting who spoke very eloquently about their
4 concerns for the capital budget and I think as the
5 Chancellor said as well, we have a whole new world in
6 front of us and I think there is a lot to learn from
7 engagement and I suspect the SCA during their capital
8 hearing that you mentioned at the top, they will be
9 able to speak more to the specifics and the next
10 steps along those lines.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. I'm going to move
12 on and if I have any other questions, we'll get back
13 to you on them but I want to move to Chair Treyger.
14 But before I do that, I want to say we've been joined
15 by Council Member Gjonaj, Rose, Koslowitz, Ayala and
16 Rodriguez and also by Majority Leader Cumbo and
17 Council Member Cornegy.

18 So, thank you very much and I'm going to turn it
19 over to Chair Treyger.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Chair Dromm and
21 just a quick note before I go right into my
22 questions. I want to say that, the Mayor said
23 recently on television during one of his briefings,
24 that next school year will have to be the greatest
25 school year ever to make up for all the loss that our

1
2 children have experienced and are still experiencing
3 and the proposed budget that he has advanced will
4 devastate the next school year. And so, as it
5 stands, this is not a budget that's acceptable to
6 this Committee and we're going to have to fight tooth
7 and nail both at the city, state, and federal level
8 to make sure that we put more money into our schools.

9 The Exec Budget identifies a \$100 million cut to
10 fair student funding. The most flexible form of
11 funding available to schools and an additional \$40
12 million cut to school allocation memos. While we are
13 still waiting guidance from DOE in how it proposes to
14 implement these cuts, we know what these cuts will
15 mean to our students in schools.

16 It means larger class sizes, fewer enrichment
17 opportunities, and fewer social emotional supports as
18 teachers, social workers, and guidance counselors.
19 It means trusted relationships will be broken as
20 staff or excess when students have already
21 experienced so much loss. It means cuts to programs
22 like art, music, sports, after school activities and
23 academic enrichment programs.

24 How do you propose to implement these cuts and as
25 I ask that question, I just want to note, I and the

1
2 super majority of my colleagues have clearly
3 articulated our guiding principle for evaluating this
4 budget proposal. Our students have lost so much that
5 they can never get back. We cannot impose more pain
6 and loss on them by cutting direct services unless we
7 have turned over every other stone to find other
8 areas to cut.

9 What alternative cuts did you and your
10 Administration pursue before turning to school
11 budgets? And as we are both former educators Mr.
12 Chancellor, we both know what impact these cuts will
13 have on day to day lives of our city students. In
14 concrete terms, how would a child feel, directly feel
15 the impact of a similar cut to the school support
16 organizations or the borough offices which accounts
17 for about \$300 million in the DOE's budget? I
18 appreciate your answer.

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, a whole lot of questions
20 in there. So, if I forget one part, please remind me
21 Mr. Chair. So, thank you for the question. I will
22 say I am still an educator; I'm still educating and
23 working in a school system. But I will tell you as a
24 teacher, I faced cuts my entire career as a teacher.
25 As a principal having to lead two different school

1
2 systems. Two schools in two different systems, I had
3 to experience budget cuts. They always impacted my
4 students, my teachers, my community in devastating
5 ways.

6 There is a saying that says, we can't just throw
7 money at education, I wish just once in my 30 plus
8 years as an educator, somebody would have just thrown
9 money at education. We've never had money just
10 thrown at us. So, any cut is devastating to a school
11 community and I feel it deeply as I know you do as
12 well as a former educator.

13 I will tell you that, this budget is devastating
14 to us in the Department of Education. I've said that
15 FSF should be sacrasing. Unfortunately, with this
16 economic pandemic that we're facing, there are hard
17 choices that need to be made that have to be made at
18 this time and why it is so important and I think the
19 Mayor has been very clear on this point, that we need
20 federal stimulus money that comes directly to cities
21 to offset the economic impact that this virus has
22 had.

23 The FSF cut is never a good thing but it's less
24 than 1 percent off of the \$10 billion base in our
25 schools. This is not something that we are happy

1
2 about. We have cuts truly, as I have mentioned, over
3 \$6 million, \$600 million in my two years as
4 Chancellor. We have been taking PEG's and keeping
5 them away from schools. What will students feel, I
6 think you've been very eloquent that students are
7 going to feel perhaps bitter class. They are going
8 to feel the reduction in services and reduction in
9 enrichment activities.

10 I think that our communities are going to feel,
11 they are going to feel the impact of this nature, but
12 to your other question about how would they feel the
13 impact in borough offices. You know, New York City
14 is a large system and I'm stating the obvious. New
15 York City is a large system. So, it is impossible
16 for anyone to think that everything that happens to
17 support teachers and the administrators in schools,
18 only happens in the school.

19 Teachers teach and students learn and guidance
20 counselors guide and social workers intervene and
21 support but they need supports as well and that's
22 what happens in the borough office. And even during
23 this time of remote learning, we had supports to
24 teachers that are navigating remote learning in a
25 very different way. They are being supported. They

1
2 are being given coaching. They are being supported
3 in learning how to use the virtual websites and how
4 to develop their Zoom capabilities and their
5 Microsoft teams capabilities. Teachers need support.

6 It's not just a teacher and a blackboard in a
7 classroom. That's what happens at the borough
8 offices. They are critically important to supporting
9 our schools and what happens in the schools.

10 Add to that, the support to students with
11 disabilities and the support that comes to them. Add
12 that to our multilingual learner students. Add that
13 to our parent engagement specialists that are
14 engaging with our parent communities at this moment.
15 There are no good choices in this budget. There are
16 no good choices and I am pained by this budget, as I
17 know you are as well. However, these are the
18 difficult situations that we're in given the economic
19 impact that this pandemic is having.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Mr. Chancellor, I
21 appreciate the answer, I would just quickly follow up
22 by saying that what are the systems and structures
23 going to be worth if you have fewer teachers to
24 teach, fewer counselors to guide, fewer social
25 workers to intervene? That has the most detrimental

1
2 impact on the students day to day life in the school
3 setting, which they need even more social workers now
4 more than ever.

5 If there are fewer direct service providers in
6 our schools, but there is no change in headcount at
7 the central offices, there are fewer people to guide,
8 isn't that correct?

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: Sir, Chairman Treyger, we have
10 not announced any layoffs. We have not announced any
11 reductions in school based staff. Conversely, we
12 have cut personnel centrally and I guess, I want to
13 remind everyone that's listening, that when you talk
14 about central personnel, you are also talking about
15 custodial workers. They are centrally funded. You
16 are talking about food service, student nutrition
17 workers, they are centrally funded. Schools don't
18 pay for that out of their budgets. You are talking
19 about support systems with students with
20 disabilities. You are talking about 4410's, you are
21 talking about early childhood.

22 So, central budgets, it's not a group of people
23 at tweed and that constitutes the entire central
24 budget. The essential are always out in the school
25 community and I think our Chief Financial Officer

1
2 could even add a little more color to what that
3 means. Lindsey, could you please also add some
4 detail to that?

5 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you sir. Good morning
6 Chair Treyger, nice to talk with you again. Though I
7 think it's important to just note that pro-offices
8 that you are discussing, I think as we discussed last
9 Friday when we spoke, are part of the central cuts
10 that exist in our budget right now. They will feel
11 the pain. They absolutely will. They will feel the
12 pain of the professional development cuts in our
13 budget. They will feel the pain of the hiring freeze
14 cuts in our budget. They will feel the pain of the
15 you know, supply cuts and the all sorts of
16 nonessential things that are being cut from our
17 budget. They are absolutely going to be
18 participating in those cuts. No one is being held
19 harmless unfortunately. The cuts are just too large,
20 though please note that I guess, just to remind you
21 that they are part of these cuts. And so, as the
22 Chancellor said, there are critical supports for
23 these schools. As you all know, huge school system
24 needs a lot of individualized support from school to
25

1
2 school. The BCO's absolutely provide that along with
3 the Superintendent's offices of course.

4 I just want to remind that they are part of cuts,
5 they will be cut, they will continue to feel pain
6 along with all of our central office team.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, my next question is
8 going to further specify what I mean by some of the
9 central areas that I feel you know, deserve some more
10 scrutiny.

11 In Fiscal Year 2020, the Council fought tooth and
12 nail to ensure that the budget allocated, it included
13 \$29.7 million in baseline funding to hire 269 new
14 social workers, 100 bridging the gap social workers,
15 85 school based crisis response clinicians and 84
16 direct school based social workers.

17 The Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget identifies \$8
18 million in Fiscal 2021 savings related to a re-
19 estimate of 25 of these positions which were never
20 filled. Why has the Department failed to hire all of
21 the 269 social worker physicians? We negotiated at
22 the end of the last Fiscal cycle and what support was
23 provided to schools at the borough office in central
24 levels to hire for these school based positions?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, I will start and then I
3 will ask either our Chief Operating Officer Ursulina
4 Ramirez or our Chief Financial Officer Lindsey Oates
5 to also add some color to this.

6 So, our most recent report to the Council shows
7 that schools, all schools do have access to a
8 guidance counselor or a social worker. In addition,
9 we actively work to fill those positions. We hired
10 68 of the 85 school resource clinicians. We hired 79
11 of the 84 high needs positions and 97 of the 100
12 budgeted. So, we show there was about 25 that were
13 not hired. Virtually, all of the bridging the gap
14 workers are in place. So, we think that we've worked
15 as hard as we can given the supply of these positions
16 and people that are qualified to take these positions
17 and absolutely more work to do to get to 100 percent.
18 However, again, candidates, the pool and who is
19 available all factored into how we were able to fill
20 these positions.

21 Lindsey, Ursulina, did you want to add anything?

22 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Thank you Chancellor. Thank
23 you Chair Treyger for your question. So, as the
24 Chancellor mentioned, we have made significant
25 progress in the hires for these positions and

1
2 obviously we were not expecting things to get this
3 drastic in terms of COVID-19 earlier this – I’m
4 sorry, I’m getting a big feedback back on my phone.
5 I apologize, one second. Sorry about that.

6 So, we’ve made significant gains in hiring social
7 workers earlier this school year and Chair Treyger,
8 as you know, I am a Social Worker myself, I totally
9 understand the need for social workers in our school
10 system. It’s a huge priority for the system and for
11 the Chancellor himself. We did support schools in
12 those hiring and when you talk about the borough
13 support centers, that is what they were doing. They
14 were supporting schools to make those critical hires.

15 And so, I totally understand your concern around
16 some of the gaps or the hires that were filled but
17 that being said, we did hire multiple candidates.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And is there a freeze?
19 Just so we’re clear because there has been some
20 confusion with OMB and others. Is there a freeze on
21 school based pedagogical staff?

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: Chair Treyger, yes. We are in
23 this Fiscal environment; we have frozen most
24 positions. Obviously, we are a large entity that
25 skill has to serve our students in community. So,

1
2 critical positions that need to be filled are being
3 filled but it's on a case by case as needed basis.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And when was that decision
5 made? Because OMB recently testified that there was
6 no freeze at the school based level and now, we're
7 hearing that there is.

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Ursulina, Lindsey?

9 LINDSEY OATES: So, Ursulina, do you want to go?

10 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yes. So, just, at the end of
11 the school year roughly around this time every year,
12 we've put a freeze on hires just to be clear. And
13 that is really to make sure that we're taking a hard
14 look at schools budgets and it's so late in the
15 school year, we want to just make sure that things
16 are settled for the following school year.

17 With that being said, for next Fiscal Year and
18 next school year, of course, we are considering
19 hiring freezes and based on the budgets that we're
20 seeing right now, we're going to probably have to do
21 a hiring freeze for all teaching staff. And
22 obviously, if federal resources come our way, that's
23 excellent and we can figure out a way to lift that
24 freeze but as of right now, we are expecting a hiring
25 freeze for next school year.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, before I move onto the
3 next question, I just want to make clear, principals
4 have already been told, prepare for horrific budgets
5 next year. If any teacher, anyone has notified them
6 that they plan to retire, those positions will be
7 very difficult to fill.

8 And also, the Mayor made a commitment to for
9 example, the renewal schools, that 100 percent of the
10 FSF would always be preserved and now, they are
11 facing a cut. So, any of those new social workers,
12 any of those new counselors, because we have a
13 seniority system, those relationships will now be cut
14 and that is what many of our school communities are
15 facing.

16 I want to move to transportation. Most bus
17 contract operators are eligible to continue to
18 receive 85 percent of their contract amount for days
19 since schools transitioned to remote learning.
20 However, the tens of millions of dollars from this 15
21 percent savings do not appear in the financial plan.

22 Beyond this, because the contract extensions were
23 pulled from the panel for education policy, there is
24 considerable ambiguity on what the DOE's plans are
25 for school busing. Why haven't we seen savings for

1
2 these contracts reflected in the financial plan or
3 for the contracts which does not require payment
4 during closure and has the DOE arrived at a figure
5 that they could share now with how much savings, what
6 will be made? How much in city tax levy portion of
7 the savings?

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Chairman Treyger.
9 I'm going to ask our Chief Operations Officer
10 Ursulina Ramirez to answer. I did want to just
11 respond very quickly to your last comment.

12 One of the things I learned early on as a leader
13 is that during the time of crisis, I led Houston
14 through Hurricane Harvey and it was the plain
15 speaking unvarnished truth to our leaders in the
16 field that I heard they appreciated the most, as we
17 were able to navigate that horrific event.

18 So, I am speaking very candidly with principles.
19 I am not sugar coating a thing. I would be less
20 ingenuine if I told them, things will work out. We
21 are facing the most horrific budget this school
22 system has ever seen. And it is not just New York
23 City, it's not just New York State, it's not just the
24 United States, this is a global economic pandemic as
25 well.

1
2 So, I appreciate and I'm not trying to scare
3 anybody but I want to be very clear with everyone,
4 that this budget is horrific. And revenue is down,
5 there are cuts that will undoubtedly if the economic
6 situation doesn't change, will happen and it pains me
7 as an educator because I couldn't agree with you more
8 Mr. Chairman that these kind of cuts are not helpful.
9 They are not good for students. They are not good
10 for school communities but we also have to be
11 optimistic but realistic.

12 So, if any principles are communicating that we
13 are scaring them, we're not scaring them. You need
14 to have information to be able to make decisions.
15 So, I'm going to ask our Chief Operating Officer if
16 she can answer the transportation bus question.

17 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Thank you Chancellor and thank
18 you Chair Treyger for that question. As we've
19 discussed in some of our weekly calls, we have
20 stopped making payments to the bus companies as of
21 right now and we are considering all of our options
22 when it comes to busing.

23 As you note, a lot of our contracts do have a
24 provision within them that requires an 85 percent
25 payment for snow days and as I've mentioned to you,

1
2 we're taking a look at that provision and taking a
3 look at all of our contracts. Just a reminder, we
4 have roughly 10,500 routes that we run and we're
5 trying to make sure that when school is ready to open
6 that we are able to provide services for all of our
7 students. But you know, as mentioned, we're in a
8 really tough financial situation and trying to assess
9 what we can do right now while we are not in school
10 and while we are not in session.

11 So, thank you so much for that question.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And can the DOE provide for
13 the record, what is the estimated number that can be
14 recouped in savings with the 15 percent call back
15 provisions for the remainder of this school year?

16 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, for between April and June
17 payments and just a reminder it is that a recoupment,
18 we'll be paying at 85 percent rate. It's roughly
19 around \$74 million between that 85 percent and 100
20 percent of payment.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: \$74 million that can be an
22 added lift and boost to schools during this Fiscal
23 crisis. I think that's important to have for the
24 record and what is the plan as many of the bus
25 drivers are still in limbo with regards to their

1
2 health benefits? What is the plan that DOE plans to
3 undertake to find these savings while at the same
4 time, ensuring that bus drivers can maintain their
5 health benefits?

6 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Thank you so much for that
7 question. I think that this is something that
8 weights on our team heavily. It is trying to both
9 find financial solutions right now while ensuring
10 that we can provide adequate services in September
11 while also caring for our bus drivers in knowing that
12 this is a really tough time for them.

13 So, we're in conversations with bus companies
14 right now and hopefully we'll be getting back to you
15 soon on what our proposal is for the fall and how
16 that impacts our workers. So, we'll be back to you
17 soon on that.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And I just want to make it
19 clear for the record that I think there is a path
20 forward to protect health benefits for the drivers
21 and to find these areas like the \$74 million that you
22 talked about, which could be even more to redirect
23 directly into school budgets to stabilize the system
24 because the system is interdependent. We need the
25 drivers to make sure that we transport our most

1
2 vulnerable kids. But if we don't have services in
3 schools, what are they transporting them to?

4 So, the system is very interdependent. I think
5 the drivers will understand that and schools will
6 understand that. And that's something the Council
7 feels very strongly on.

8 I want to move to – there has been Charter school
9 rent and then I'll turn it over to colleagues for
10 questions.

11 The Executive Plan contains around \$2.4 billion
12 in Charter school expenses. One of the largest areas
13 of spending in the DOE's budget. Spending on Charter
14 school leases increased by \$45.5 million due to
15 changes in the Executive Budget. What is the cause
16 or increase lease cost towards the end of the school
17 year, especially during COVID? Why weren't these
18 costs known in the Prelim Budget and also, just to be
19 clear, DOE's share of payment for Charter school
20 lease is tied to 30 percent of the Charter tuition
21 rate for each student.

22 Success academy Charter School Hudson Yards,
23 which has 306 students, has a bimonthly payment of
24 \$238,131 according to information the Council has
25 provided by DOE. Can you tell us how much DOE pay

1
2 for its share of the bimonthly leases and this is
3 space that success academy owns which we're being
4 told we have to pay for rent on a property they own
5 at Hudson Yards.

6 I'd appreciate your answer.

7 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Mr. Chair, I'm going
8 to ask our Chief Financial Officer Lindsey to address
9 your question.

10 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you Chair Treyger for the
11 question. A couple things. First, I want to say you
12 know, as we discussed last week, we're legally
13 required to continue to pay for our Charter expenses
14 during this crisis, that includes leases. You
15 mentioned the Hudson Yard example when we spoke last
16 Friday and we're looking into that. If what you are
17 saying is true, that's concerning. We're certainly
18 going to share with you what we find. Hopefully, I
19 will have more information for you later this week.

20 In terms of busing, one thing I just want to
21 state clearly for the record, is the \$74 million that
22 Ursulina mentioned a few moments ago, is savings in
23 Fiscal Year 2020 only between April and June. We
24 want our school system to be up and running as much
25 as possible in the fall and as much as our health

1 officials will let us to be and we need busing to be
2 running as an important part of our school system.
3 That funding is not necessarily going to be available
4 in Fiscal Year 2021 to support anything other than
5 busing next year.
6

7 There are some unique opportunities for savings
8 this Fiscal Year because we've cancelled nonessential
9 activities because we've closed schools but I really
10 just think it's important to note that those are one
11 time only. We need those resources to run our fully
12 functioning school system in the upcoming school
13 year.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I hear you and that's
15 going to be part of our discussions and negotiations
16 but these are the types of areas that we have
17 identified some of the school bus contract areas and
18 also, and I think this is an area of just agreement
19 but you know, some of the continued use of some
20 thrive consultants within our school system that some
21 of them are not licensed social workers and last
22 year, we had to fight like hell to reprioritize some
23 of that money towards licensed social workers. So
24 that fight will continue this year as well because
25

1
2 again, we must prioritize direct services to our
3 kids.

4 And with that, I'm going to turn back to Chair
5 Dromm and to our Sergeant for additional members
6 questions.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Chair
8 Treyger. We have also been joined by Council
9 Member's Levin and Miller and I'm going to turn it
10 over to our Counsel to call on the first Council
11 Member for questions.

12 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: If any Council Members
13 have questions for the Administration, please use the
14 Zoom raise hand function. You will be called on in
15 the order in which your hand is raised.

16 Council Members, please keep your questions to
17 five minutes, including answers. Please wait for the
18 Sergeant at Arms to tell you when your time begins.
19 The Sergeant will then let you know when your time is
20 up. We will now hear from Council Members Adams
21 followed by Council Member Van Bramer and Kallos.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Good morning. Chancellor,
24 it's good to see you. Good morning to your team as
25 well. This has been an extremely difficult time, so

1
2 I certainly do salute all of our educators who have
3 been out there on the frontlines. I have REC centers
4 who in my district, the work has been very, very
5 tough. It's been very tough to start up and it's been
6 tough to keep it going also. So, I commend all of
7 our educators, your whole team for enduring through
8 this most unprecedented time.

9 I just have a couple of questions regarding
10 remote learning and I had to go off and do a story
11 time reading for the public library a minute ago, so
12 that's why full disclosure. I was off screen because
13 I'm using on screen the whole time, so I hope I
14 didn't miss this. I hope I'm not being redundant, if
15 I am please let me know and forgive me.

16 We know that students have, they've missed a lot
17 in this remote learning atmosphere. How is the DOE
18 ensuring; I've heard the percentages over the past
19 few weeks but how are you really, really ensuring
20 that the percentages of students who are actually
21 getting the learning are actually learning? I'd like
22 to hear a little bit more closely if you can and just
23 let us know, how those percentages are arrived and
24 how can you assure parents that their children are
25

1
2 really getting the education as closely remotely as
3 possible during this time?

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member Adams
5 and it's good to see you. I continue to wish health
6 and safety for you and your family.

7 So, what I said to the organization since day one
8 of our pivot into remote learning, is that we cannot
9 shoehorn the standard traditional in person learning
10 environment into a remote learning environment, that
11 just doesn't work. so, it's required us to be
12 flexible. It's required us to be innovative and it's
13 also required us to be very patient.

14 So, because of that, as many of our Council
15 Members have mentioned, I have tremendous faith and
16 trust in our teachers. So, what we've done is we've
17 issued guidance where we're asking teachers to be
18 sure to check in on students on a weekly basis. For
19 students that have not checked in, because remember
20 the digital divide as such. Not every student had a
21 device, but even in those cases, where teachers
22 weren't able to check in on a student, we had staff
23 that has been following up with students that haven't
24 been checking in.

1
2 And the check in can be many different ways. We
3 had the technology to track student engagement by
4 when they log in, how much time they spend in a given
5 lessen, in a given classroom. We can also gauge by
6 submission of work that they have been assigned, but
7 I will tell you that I've had the opportunity to be a
8 guest on a number of in person synchronous classrooms
9 where teachers are with a full screen, have all of
10 their students and they are doing lessons with their
11 students.

12 I just give a lot of credit to our teachers for
13 really keeping a pulse on what's happening with
14 students. With that being said, and as imperfect as
15 it is, we are gauging engagement and currently, we're
16 at 86 percent of our students, which is really
17 incredible, are engaging with their teachers on a
18 regular basis and we take attendance once a day and
19 we're logging that attendance.

20 With that being said, it is also more important
21 than ever that as we're identifying where those gaps
22 are, because we know there are going to be gaps in
23 learning, teachers are starting to document student
24 learning needs and as part of our grading policy that
25 we rolled out two weeks ago, the improvers

1
2 classification and the incomplete classification are
3 the markers that teachers will use to identify
4 students that need more time to master the content
5 that they haven't mastered yet.

6 That is going to be important because we also are
7 working through the formative assessment of our
8 students, so that we have real time data as we
9 transition into the summer and then more forward
10 looking as we transition into the fall, knowing
11 exactly where the learning gaps are for each one of
12 our students.

13 So, it's all connected and it's in many ways,
14 very different and novel because we've never done
15 this before. But we're trying to be -

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 RICHARD CARRANZA: as efficient as we can.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you Chancellor, I
19 wanted to, thank you for your response. I wanted to
20 get into a little bit more also about social workers
21 and therapists in schools and I really hope that my
22 colleagues will dove into this a lot more than I was
23 able to. I know we're not going to get a second
24 round here, second bite of this apple but I thank
25

1
2 you. Thank you Chair Dromm, I didn't thank you and
3 Chair Treyger as well.

4 So, I look forward to hearing more responses
5 through more questioning of my colleagues. Thank you
6 so much.

7 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Council
9 Member Adams. Let's call the next Council Member
10 please.

11 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now here from
12 Council Member Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you. Good to
14 see you Chancellor.

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you sir.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: You mentioned earlier
17 in your testimony a little bit about the potential
18 protective devices that might need to be installed
19 for example, in schools when they reopen and it was
20 right along the lines of the line of questioning that
21 I had. Obviously, September, God willing we're
22 reopening and it seems like a long time away but it
23 isn't as you know from a planning and budgetary
24 perspective. So, one of the things that's been most
25 embarrassing about this countries response has been

1
2 our lack of testing, lack of PPE's, the lack of
3 supplies. So, are you now already planning and what
4 does your planning look like around for example,
5 having masks for all of the staff and of course,
6 we're all concerned about this Kawasaki syndrome,
7 masks for the children even. Extra cleaning as I
8 think you know, my stepfather was a janitor at IS10
9 in Astoria Queens, so I am very proud to have been
10 raised by a school cleaner and janitor. These are
11 indispensable people in our public school system and
12 there is going to be extra cleaning needed and extra
13 protection for those people who are doing that
14 cleaning.

15 Temperature checks, are we going to have those
16 devices? Are we going to be doing things like that
17 on a daily basis? So, some thoughts on the planning
18 that you are already doing around all of those issues
19 and also the budgetary implications for those issues.

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member Van
21 Bramer and congratulations on officiating that
22 wedding in the backyard. That was a ray of sunshine,
23 so thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.
25

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, we are absolutely 100
3 percent in scenario planning and modeling different
4 scenarios very much along the questions that you are
5 asking. One of the insidious parts of this COVID-19
6 virus is that it seems to be, we seem to be learning
7 more every day. When we initially took on closing
8 the schools in March, what we knew in March was very
9 different from what we now know in May in terms of
10 this virus. The Kawasaki disease for example, we
11 have 53 children in New York City that are now
12 suffering from that complication.

13 So, trying to plan for all of those scenarios is
14 really routed in what the medical experts are telling
15 us, but two of your questions, we are absolutely,
16 we've stocked piled cleaning supplies. Obviously,
17 we're not using all of our buildings but I can tell
18 you the REC centers that I've visited, they are
19 consistently and constantly cleaning everything.
20 They are not waiting for one time of day. Somebody
21 is literally going around with a spray bottle and a
22 rag and spraying and cleaning the whole time.

23 I think that is going to become part of the new
24 normal. The guidance around social distancing, what
25 will that look like? Are the guidance that the CDC

1
2 put out around school lunches. You know, students
3 should eat in their classroom and not go to a school
4 lunchroom. That was the original guidance.

5 We're taking all of this information as part of
6 our scenario planning and looking at what will that
7 look like in an in person learning environment. The
8 other thing that I have to be honest about is that
9 what we don't know yet is what I really worry about.
10 Given the manifestation of this virus, what we don't
11 know, we don't know yet and we're trying to be very
12 nimble while working with consultants that are
13 helping us think through this. That have a global
14 view of whats happened with the manifestation of this
15 virus. But I can tell you, school safety, safety
16 supplies, cleaning supplies, protective gear for
17 student staff and all people are all a top priority
18 into consideration of opening in September.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Great, that's good to
20 hear. I wanted to also just talk very briefly in the
21 last 45 seconds about arts and education which I know
22 you believe in and feel very strongly and we know
23 that when children have arts and culture as part of
24 their education, the results are always better for
25 them.

1
2 So, I just want to stress the importance of that
3 and also ask you about how DOE is going to use
4 virtual cultural programming to make sure that when
5 in person programs aren't possible, that children are
6 still being able to experience the arts particular
7 public school students who are in so many cases, not
8 having them available.

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you sir. So,
10 absolutely.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: I consider the arts not to be
13 an addendum to the core curriculum, it's part of the
14 core curriculum and even in this remote learning
15 environment, we have dedicated arts programming right
16 now that is being done remotely for our students.
17 That will continue and we have not made any cuts to
18 arts programming even in the face of this budgetary
19 pandemic. But we are dedicated to continue to have
20 the arts be a vital part of what our students
21 experience.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Next Council
24 Member.

1
2 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
3 Council Member Kallos, followed by Council Member
4 Grodenchik.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to Chair's
7 Dromm and Treyger for your leadership and Chancellor
8 Carranza, DOE teachers and staff for adapting to the
9 pandemic and to more than 60 that lost their lives.
10 Today I am concerned for those cuts that will only
11 drive costs, like skipping an oil change only to
12 replace a more costly engine. A number of questions
13 and only five minutes, so please, if you can spend no
14 more than 30 seconds answering each question. As one
15 of two parents, both of whom are working more than
16 full time, we feel the stress of balancing work with
17 childcare. We won't be able to return to normal
18 without access to childcare. Wouldn't you agree that
19 scaling back the role on a 3K for all to school
20 districts in Manhattan throughout the city will
21 reduce access for families to employment and put
22 children who have fallen behind because of the
23 pandemic even further behind?

24 RICHARD CARRANZA: We are in a global pandemic
25 and an economic pandemic. I am always willing to

1
2 listen to your ideas. These are hard cuts for
3 everyone and unfortunately, they are reaching even
4 the most fundamental programs that we believe in like
5 3K. We're not cutting 3K, we're just not expanding.
6 We're pausing on the expansion.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Mayor de Blasio is
8 proposing cuts SYEP and you are proposing cuts to
9 SONYC after school. What will children do between 3
10 pm and 6 pm while parents are working or traveling
11 home?

12 Again, this is about access to economic
13 opportunity and getting people back to work.

14 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so again, we're working
15 with our city partner and some of those programs are
16 in different agencies around developing alternatives.
17 We are also engaging the philanthropic community and
18 seeing if they can be of assistance during this time
19 of need for the children of New York City.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I appreciate that, we're
21 doing the quick back and forth and respecting the
22 time. I would just say that this my tax dollars, our
23 tax dollars and we should be paying for the programs
24 versus turning to philanthropy. I welcome the
25 philanthropy but we should pay for it. DOE does a

1
2 multibillion dollar contracts budget, I'm the
3 Contracts Chair. Both our Finance Chair and
4 Education Chair brought up a number of the different
5 contacts. Is there an opportunity to first cut all
6 of our contracts, multiple billions of dollars, I
7 know we're looking for hundreds of billions of
8 dollars but could we stop spending externally before
9 we start cutting internally?

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: Sir, so, I think it's
11 important to note that contracts are not bad in it of
12 themselves. That you have to have contract with
13 services to serve students in some regards. So,
14 without specificity of what contract and what it's
15 serving and what that impact would be on students,
16 it's kind of hard to answer your question. I'd like
17 to ask my Chief Financial Officer if she could also
18 expand a little bit on that. Lindsey.

19 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you sir. Thank you Council
20 Member Kallos, so just as a reminder, some of the
21 things that we do spend our contract budget on
22 include our community schools program, nursing,
23 custodial supplies, nursing supplies, food,
24 transportation, you know, related services for our
25 students. Those are all things I think that are

1
2 critical to running our school system. IT obviously
3 is a big area that we spend money on as you are well
4 aware but that is supporting our critical response
5 right now. Remote learning is critically supported
6 by all of that. We are looking at reducing
7 contractual spend. That's part of the existing
8 Executive Budget. We are always looking at more but
9 there are critical services that are provided by our
10 contractors.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Would you be open to
12 sharing the contracts that you are considering
13 cancelling or not moving forward with in order to
14 save money as well as the contracts that are under
15 consideration but you chose not to move forward with,
16 so that we can work with you to evaluate?

17 LINDSEY OATES: We can absolutely get back to you
18 with more information.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Perfect, and let's just
20 jump into the technology. So, I guess, big question
21 right off the top. Chancellor Carranza, will schools
22 open in September? Yes, no, or planning for the best
23 but ready for the worst?

24 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, none of us have a
25 crystal ball, so we don't know how this virus is

1
2 going to continue to metastasize out in the
3 community. We are shooting for a September opening.
4 That is our goal, that's what we're preparing for but
5 we're also preparing for any other eventually.
6 Again, we're going to be guided in those decision by
7 what the medical professionals tell us and what's
8 safe and secure for students, staff, and community
9 members.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you and so, I'm
11 going to do my best to finish in 30 seconds. But
12 just diving into the technology Chair Dromm got into
13 the DOE's \$231 million spent on 300,000 iPads at a
14 cost of \$770 each which is almost twice retail.
15 We're now on the hook for \$36 million a year just for
16 the internet and this isn't fast internet, this isn't
17 broadband and none of these devices have keyboards.
18 Do you believe that having kids on slower speeds
19 without keyboards is equitable and would DOE consider
20 -

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Saving a quarter of
23 billion dollars by distributing a \$100 or a \$200
24 laptops and working with Spectrum or Altice to deploy
25 free broadband to all students, giving every student

1
2 a laptop and using the free service during the
3 pandemic and the essentials which I negotiated with
4 the Attorney General James to continue at \$14.99 a
5 month and a huge cost savings over the emergency
6 procurement.

7 Thank you.

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you. So, Council Member
9 Kallos, so I disagree with the premise of your
10 question very respectfully. When we transition and
11 pivoted to remote learning, there was an immense
12 digital divide. We did not have the time for a
13 yearlong procurement process. We had to work with
14 entities that could provide us the devices in real
15 time and we found people that would provide us with
16 those devices.

17 I mentioned earlier we delivered over 280,000
18 devices to children that didn't those devices. Now,
19 those devices are equipped with, those iPads are
20 equipped with internet capability, so there's a chip
21 that's installed that gives them internet capability.
22 They have a hard case and we also purchased insurance
23 for each one of those devices. We think that's
24 important from an equity perspective because we did
25 not want any student or any family to not ask for a

1
2 device on the fear that if something happened to that
3 device that they would somehow be held responsible
4 for that device.

5 Again, in real time, addressing this crisis, I am
6 proud of the work that this organization has done to
7 get devices into the hands of our students, in our
8 most vulnerable students. But as always, and again,
9 I really appreciate your thoughts because we want to
10 continue to improve how we're serving our students
11 and what that looks like. So, happy to partner with
12 you on additional partnerships and what this looks
13 like as we continue to move into the next chapter of
14 this school year.

15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Next
17 Council Member please.

18 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
19 Council Member Grodenchik followed by Council Member
20 Brannan.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Oh, I am sorry. Good
24 morning Chairs, can you here me? Yes, I hope. Good
25 morning Chancellor, good morning Ms. Ramirez and Ms.

1
2 Oates. I do want to at the start of my remarks,
3 associate myself with Chair Treyger. Having lived
4 through more than one budget retrenchment as a
5 student and as an adult in New York City, I am very,
6 very concerned about the fact that when we cut the
7 budget, it's usually the people that actually provide
8 the services in schools. That being teachers and
9 para's and social workers and guidance counselors and
10 food service workers who end up getting cut. Not so
11 much the bureaucracy. So, I think that really
12 Chancellor, we need to know what the plan is going
13 forward considering a worst case scenario. It was
14 mentioned before by you that the governor is
15 threatening billions of dollars more in cut. Last
16 week we heard from the OMB Director Ms. Hartzog and
17 it seems to me that the city's plan is to hope for
18 more money from the feds but that really isn't much
19 of a plan because it may not come and we need to know
20 and we need to know exactly what your plans are. I
21 know it's not easy but we do need to know what they
22 are, so that we as a Council and the residents of
23 this city, 8.6 million of them with over a million
24 children in public schools can have a chance to look
25 at that plan and hopefully make it better. Usually

1
2 the more eyes on something the better it is, that
3 doesn't always work.

4 So, my first question, we heard about Fair
5 Student Funding being cut and I'd like to know from
6 you exactly sir, will it go below 100 percent in the
7 schools where it is currently above 100 percent. Not
8 that I have too many of those schools in my district.

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so I'm going to ask - I
10 share your concern Council Member. Again, budget
11 cuts are never helpful and you know -

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I know you share my
13 concern, but I'm not going to get seven minutes like
14 Kallos got, so can I hear about fair student funding?

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: Well, you are going to hear my
16 response.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay, thank you.

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: I don't sell widgets; I don't
19 produce revenue generating product. So, we are
20 dependent on what the state and the city provides us
21 to run our schools.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Agreed.

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, to give you a detailed
24 plan without knowing the finality of what that
25

1
2 financial plan looks like is impossible. We're
3 preparing for all potential eventualities.

4 I'm going to ask our Chief Financial Officer
5 Lindsey Oates to specifically address your question.

6 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you sir. Thank you,
7 Council Member. There are multiple ways that we can
8 implement this cut across the Fair Student Funding
9 formula. We're exploring all of them. It may
10 include schools over 100 percent but we're looking at
11 other options. We're looking at how best to you
12 know, minimize the pain, and have this be inequitable
13 but those are conversations that are going on between
14 our office and our city partners and I think there
15 will be more to come soon on that topic.

16 I agree with the Chancellor, that these large
17 cuts coming at this time of year makes it
18 particularly hard for us to think about the upcoming
19 school year but we're doing the best we can under
20 these really trying times.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay, I want to thank
22 you for those remarks. I do want to say that with
23 regard to the school safety officers in my schools, I
24 can't vogue for all the schools although, I have 35

1
2 schools in my district and I visit them all the time
3 and I miss that right now.

4 I want to say that they are outstanding
5 professionals. They are mostly women and mostly
6 women of color and if you want to get into one of my
7 schools with trying to get passed them without
8 talking to them, good luck to you because it's not
9 going to happen. They are consummate professionals
10 each and every one of them.

11 I know most of them on a first name basis and
12 even then, I still have to provide them with an
13 identification card. They take nothing for granted.

14 I do want to thank you all for your work. I know
15 it's not easy. I am concerned also; we did have a
16 very good discussion yesterday with Deputy Chancellor
17 Wallack about screening for middle school and the
18 screens and those in place. I do want to associate
19 myself with the remarks made by my Senator, my state
20 Senator John Liu. I don't think that this is a time
21 to make great changes. I understand that some
22 changes may be necessary. I have great middle
23 schools; I have great high schools. I do worry of
24 course that to get to the Stuyvesant's of the world,
25 any Stuyvesant graduates here, nothing, no ill will

1
2 intended. From Eastern Queens, it would be easier in
3 some cases to go the Suffolk County as opposed to
4 Manhattan.

5 So, I hope that you will tread lightly and that
6 whatever plans that you have, you will cast this wide
7 and that it is possible in reaching out to our CEC's,
8 our PTA's and really all of us that are involved in
9 the education of our children and again -

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Time expired, what
12 about - no, I'm only kidding. Thank you, thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Next Council Member please.

14 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now here from
15 Council Member Brannan followed by Council Member
16 Lander and Council Member Gibson.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you Chairs. Thank
19 you, Chancellor. I think all of my colleagues are
20 pretty eyes wide open when it comes to the dire
21 fiscal reality that we're in and I echo what every
22 body is saying and certainly with all parents and
23 teachers are telling me directly that safeguarding
24 funds for the day to day functioning of schools and
25 school communities must be number one. With all do

1
2 respect to my former colleagues at Tweed, I think we
3 should take a good look at the amount of employees we
4 have, the central office administrators. I think
5 there is something like \$6 billion that we're
6 spending just on central office staff. Again, with
7 all due respect to my former colleagues at Tweed, I'm
8 sure we could find some savings there.

9 As Chair Treyger mentioned, the Mayor does like
10 to say how next year needs to be the most
11 extraordinary school year in history. We all agree
12 with that. I think we have to make sure that in
13 order to have the most extraordinary school year in
14 history, that we're safeguarding funds and making
15 sure that teachers have all the tools that they need
16 for students to catch up with in September.

17 One thing I'm hearing that I would love to get
18 you to clarify, hearing a lot of concerns from
19 parents about the emergency grading policy that was
20 put into place for the emergency. A lot of rumors
21 out there. A lot of theories out there. Would you
22 be willing to clarify that this is just an emergency
23 grading policy and not a trial balloon for anything
24 else?

1

2

RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member.

3

Absolutely, this is a response to the COVID-19

4

pandemic and our transition to remote learning.

5

Everyone I think understands that this is not the

6

normal way that school has been conducted. So, you

7

can't have the normal rating system, especially with

8

the digital divide and getting devices to students

9

and not everybody had them at once.

10

So, this is a response to this pandemic. It is

11

not a change in policy.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay, I appreciate that.

13

Thank you very much Chancellor.

14

RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you sir.

15

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, our next Council

16

Member please.

17

COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from

18

Council Member Lander followed by Council Member

19

Gibson and Council Member Barron.

20

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Chancellor and Ursulina

22

and your team, thank you so much for being here. You

23

know, we appreciate what an extraordinarily difficult

24

time this is and you know, I remain grateful as a

25

public school parent to see what's going on in my

1
2 daughters classrooms and in seeing the extraordinary
3 work that so many of our teachers are doing.

4 I want to you know associate myself with some of
5 my remarks of my colleagues and I'll just add, you
6 know, I've been making very clear that if can't
7 afford to hire new teachers, then I don't think we
8 can afford to hire new police officers either. And
9 I'd like to see some of the couple of hundred million
10 dollars that we currently have allocated for that
11 brought back into the Department of Education to
12 abate some of these devastating cuts and I also want
13 just want to continue to push to say I think there is
14 more we can find from the borough support offices and
15 from some other places within the DOE hierarchy to
16 help restore some of these devastating cuts to
17 schools.

18 A couple of questions for you. You spoke with
19 Chair Dromm at the beginning about the work on social
20 and emotional learning programs and restorative
21 practice programs. Last year, you and the Mayor's
22 Office really pledged, developed a great plan to do
23 more to work on and improve school climate and
24 obviously right now, those programs provide just
25 transformative tools to students to help them process

1
2 and cope with pandemic related trauma. I was glad to
3 hear you say that those programs are being
4 maintained.

5 Can you just help us kind of find them in the
6 budget? I know our allies and young people worked
7 hard to preserve those and just we want to see them
8 in the budget, be able to see their not being cut and
9 make sure we know how they are going to continue.
10 So, can you kind of help point them out?

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member. I'm
12 going to ask our Chief Financial Officer to address
13 that question please.

14 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you Council Member Lander.
15 So, I just want to clarify for the record, the
16 previous comment from Council Member Brannan. The \$6
17 billion reference to the central budget is just
18 inaccurate. That's a number pulled off of the state
19 report. That includes an entirely wider net than
20 just our central budget. Our central budget is
21 around \$615 million in the upcoming fiscal year. The
22 current \$6 billion number includes things like leases
23 and safety and community schools and contracted
24 related services and things that really are central
25 supports to schools and not Tweed verdantly.

1
2 So, I do take your point on you know, looking
3 elsewhere outside of school budgets. It is something
4 that we have a strong track record of having done and
5 we've cut our central office quite a bit over the
6 last several years and we will continue to do so.
7 There are significant cuts to central offices in this
8 Executive Budget.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I want to give Council Member
10 Lander a little additional time since your answer was
11 more directly toward Council Member Brannan.

12 So, let's give him a couple minutes back on the
13 clock please.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much Chair
15 Dromm and I wonder CFO if you could just answer that
16 question about where in the budget, we see the
17 restorative practice in social and emotional learning
18 programs so we can feel reassured that they are being
19 preserved in this budget.

20 LINDSEY OATES: Sure, so there are a variety of
21 funding sources that are used for that and we're
22 facing huge cuts. We are prioritizing services to
23 our students and you can see, you know you can see
24 the list of the itemized cuts that were published and
25 you can see the social, emotional learning and

1
2 restorative justices were not included in that rather
3 itemized list.

4 You know, I think from my part, we have to
5 unfortunately look at all areas but we do have some
6 title 4 funding that is rural funding that provides
7 some support to those programs and we, as the
8 Chancellor said, are going to continue to try to
9 ensure as much as possible these really successful
10 important programs prioritized by our Chancellor
11 continue and yourself and many others of this body
12 continue to support.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I appreciate that and
14 maybe let me just ask if you guys will follow up and
15 you know, it's obviously not, having not seen them on
16 the cuts list is helpful. Being able to kind of see
17 them in the budget is also helpful.

18 So, if you can help us really identify and
19 understand where those are and I guess also note, if
20 you are thinking about continuing any of those into
21 the summer as remote summer school gets stood up, you
22 know, how were going to – they were important before
23 and they are extra important amidst the trauma that
24 the pandemic is providing.

1
2 And then, my other question Chancellor is for you
3 and you know, it might be the sort of the different
4 point of view then Council Member Grodenchik
5 outlined, but I would like to ask you to talk a
6 little bit through the question of how you are
7 thinking about admissions for next year. You know, I
8 do think a crisis like this really can help us focus
9 on what we think is most important and sometimes make
10 us question things that we've been doing along the
11 way, a long time for a certain way. And as you know,
12 we move to middle school admissions especially for
13 next year, but high school admissions as well, we're
14 going to be doing it, all doing it in the shadow of
15 this very difficult semester where we've had to
16 realize that like, in a lot of cases the kind of
17 tradition grading rubrics we have used aren't
18 actually what matter most to helping students show up
19 and grow and learn and thrive and that's a useful way
20 of thinking about what's important and how we'll do
21 middle school admissions, especially in high school
22 admissions as well next year. It's important to get
23 feedback on that and ask people their perspectives
24 and try to design something that makes sense for next
25 year but also that we can learn from.

1
2 And I just want to ask you to kind of share with
3 us your thinking and how we're going to move forward
4 from here.

5 RICHARD CARRANZA: Well, thank you, yes, so, we
6 have already started a public engagement process
7 where we're actually getting and gathering feedback
8 on what the admissions will look like. If you
9 remember when we transitioned to remote learning, the
10 first thing that we had to do is have guidance on a
11 new attendance policy because we're not in face to
12 face contact with students anymore. We did that.
13 The next thing that was important -

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: The next thing that was
16 important is that as we knew that we were going to
17 finish this academic year in remote learning, we
18 needed a grading policy. We took feedback, we
19 listened to lots of different voices and we came out
20 with a grading policy.

21 Throughout all of those iterations, I've been
22 very consistent in saying that we will not hold
23 against students anything that is beyond their
24 control. And a pandemic is beyond their control.

1
2 So, we're not going to use the attendance, we're
3 not going to use the grades because we all understand
4 that the grades aren't the grades that students would
5 have gotten the first half of this school year. So,
6 as we're doing the work of crafting what the
7 admissions policy will look like in light of the
8 seriously disrupted year this year, we're going to
9 take a lot of feedback but we're going to be very
10 conscious of making sure that that's not – it's not
11 inadvertently hurting students for things that are
12 beyond their control. But I'm really excited to hear
13 what the community has to say and what their ideas
14 are. I will tell you, just like the grading policy ,
15 it's probably not going to please everybody but we
16 want to have something that is going to make sense as
17 a response to the pandemic and the interrupted school
18 year but we're not out looking to create policy in
19 the face of a crisis. That's not what we're looking
20 to do. We just want to be fair and equitable to all
21 students given the trauma that they've gone through
22 this year.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
24 We're going to go to our next Council Members
25 question.

1
2 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now here from
3 Council Member Gibson followed by Council Member
4 Barron and Council Member Moya.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you. Good
6 afternoon Chancellor and the DOE team. Thank you to
7 Chair Dromm and Chair Treyger and all of my
8 colleagues on the call and certainly many New Yorkers
9 who are watching.

10 I echo the sentiments of all of my colleagues and
11 mainly you know understanding the harsh impact that
12 COVID has had on the City of New York. Certainly, on
13 my borough Chancellor of the Bronx and school
14 district 9 which I know you know a lot about and you
15 know, the decision we make over the next few weeks
16 are going to have a real impact. I think we have to
17 ensure that this budget is reflective of our values
18 of breaking down the school to prison pipeline and
19 making sure that we focus on social workers and
20 guidance counselors. The social emotional learning,
21 the trauma informed care and the holistic and wrap
22 around services that our children and their families
23 need.

24 Our children and families have been traumatized.
25 Many of us are traumatized right. Because we've

1
2 never dealt with anything like COVID before, so I am
3 reminded of the importance of education, of
4 academics, of making sure that our students have
5 everything they need and I know that this process has
6 not been easy, so certainly, I thank you and all of
7 the educators and principals and teachers, the
8 cafeteria workers and custodians, the crossing
9 guards. Everyone who really has been going above and
10 beyond. Sacrificing themselves to really help.

11 So, I had a couple of questions and I apologize
12 if you already asked but today's current role and the
13 responsibilities of our school based health center
14 providers, our school nurses, our social workers, and
15 our guidance counselors. I want to understand what
16 guidelines we're giving them for the summer, for
17 summer learning in terms of teleconferences and
18 telecall. How are we checking up with families and
19 their day to day needs as we prepare for hot summer?
20 My second question is the coordination with DYCD on
21 summer learning and youth programs. You know that we
22 are fighting like heck to get summer youth employment
23 and summer camp for kids, but what is the work that
24 DOE is doing with that?

1
2 I am very concerned like many others about FSF.
3 We fought hard for that Fair Student Funding bridging
4 the gap, social workers and I definitely want to
5 understand how we move forward with that.

6 I also want to add my voice to Chair Treyger and
7 others who spoke of about our school bus drivers,
8 many are not working. We want to protect their
9 benefits. Many of our essential workers including
10 bus drivers and patrons, as you know Chancellor, are
11 people of color and women and women of color. And
12 so, these are the frontline, some of the lowest paid
13 workers and we have to do everything possible to
14 protect them.

15 So, if you could just give us an understanding of
16 where we are with a lot of our social support staff,
17 the summer learning, the interagency coordination
18 with DYCD and how we move forward and assure New
19 Yorkers that we are going to prioritize students
20 needs and not more policing in our schools.

21 Thank you.

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member. So,
23 our guidance counselors and our social workers are
24 hard at work right now. One of the things that I
25 like to remind the community, I don't have to remind

1
2 you but the community is that school was never out.
3 We just pivoted to a new learning and teaching model.
4 So, we've been in school these past few weeks. Our
5 guidance counselors, our social workers are being
6 employed in supporting our students that are in
7 crisis but they've also [INAUDIBLE 1:55:31] housing
8 and they are out there finding kids and working with
9 students in trauma.

10 The plans for summer learning are in development
11 right now. We'll have more to share in terms of
12 details very, very soon. Again, we all understand
13 that we're going to be guided by the medical
14 professionals as what we can and can't do and that
15 only pertains to things like, can we be in person or
16 can we have blended environments? Those are the
17 types of logistical but very important operational
18 questions that we're working our way through. We
19 have multiple scenarios and we'll share that with you
20 very, very soon.

21 The other question about interagency
22 collaboration and coordination, we are absolutely
23 working in an integrated way with our sister agencies
24 and what we're really trying to do at the direction
25 of the Mayor, is to make sure that we are adding

1
2 value to each work stream. So, in other words, we
3 always try to coordinate but this summer in
4 particular, we want to be able to really break down
5 any silos that exist and how do we use a little
6 funding from there, a little funding from here, and
7 how do we create that support system for our students
8 particularly over several months and then how do we
9 address the summer learning needs of our students
10 that have [INAUDIBLE 1:57:00]. All of that is
11 working very, very, I would say very strategically
12 but we're going to have more details to share in the
13 very, very near future.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, great and then as
15 my time runs out, I just want to urge you to continue
16 to work with a lot of our stakeholders. Sometimes I
17 find it troubling and during COVID, where we have
18 agencies that are making decisions and then the
19 Council Members are told after. We have to have a
20 system that's more engaging because the school
21 providers and the CBO's on the ground are working
22 with our children every day all day and there is a
23 continuity of services and particularly in
24 communities of color, low income and immigrant
25 communities, there's a relationship that's already

1
2 been established and understand that when we talk
3 about the impact that COVID has had on children, it's
4 also their families as well, everyone has been
5 touched. So, when talk about being traumatized, it's
6 real for us. Particularly in the Black and Brown
7 neighborhoods when we're dealing so much death and
8 pain and frustration. The remote learning in itself
9 was a challenge just to address that.

10 So, I definitely think we have a lot of work to
11 do and please don't forget about my school bus
12 drivers. They are emailing me consistently
13 Chancellor. I'm sending those emails to you and your
14 team, so that we know how hard that you know, they
15 are working and how we need to continue to work
16 together.

17 So, I thank you Chancellor. Thank you Ursulina
18 and everyone on the call and I look forward to the
19 next few weeks. It's not going to be easy but
20 certainly we have to recognize that this budget
21 should not reflect harsh education cuts that are
22 going to have a negative impact on our school
23 districts, our teachers, their budgets and overall,
24 our children and their families.

1
2 Thank you Chair Dromm, thank you Chair Treyger
3 for your relentless advocacy and your leadership and
4 we have a lot of work to do. Thank you so much
5 everyone.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Our next Council
7 Member please.

8 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now here from
9 Council Member Barron followed by Council Member Moya
10 and Council Member Rodriguez.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Push up
13 another two minutes, so that I can get my extra time
14 as well. I want to thank Chair Dromm and Treyger and
15 Chancellor Carranza and his staff for being there. I
16 also want to say that I extend my condolences to all
17 of the Department of Education, victims of the novel
18 coronavirus and I want to thank all of the DOE staff
19 for the work that they are doing in this very
20 difficult trying time. As you know, I was a member
21 of the Department of Education in various capacities
22 for 36 years.

23 Chancellor, your theme for our system is equity
24 and excellence and that's a goal towards which we are
25 working and I just want to be sure that as a part of

1
2 the pedagogical approach, that teachers are going to
3 make sure that it's incorporated so that we can see a
4 reflection of the culturally responsive education,
5 restorative justice and the social emotion learning.

6 Now, I've got a lot of questions, if you could do
7 that quickly for me, I can get to my other questions.
8 Thank you.

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: That absolutely continues to
10 be one of the cornerstones of our approach. So,
11 everything we are doing instructionally,
12 pedagogically, curricular-wise, and materials-wise is
13 based in culturally responsive in sustaining
14 education.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Good and as we talk about
16 making sure that our staff has the tools that they
17 need, I have been forced into the world of Zoom at a
18 rate that has been astronomical. What are we doing
19 to make sure that those who staff members who have
20 not been technologically at the top of this peak are
21 now getting the support that they need to be able to
22 be competent in reaching our children?

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, Ma'am. So, the supports
24 are coming from our borough offices. So, the
25 specialists are our art team, our academic response

1
2 teams. That's the work that they are doing. They
3 are identifying working with principles to identify
4 teachers and staff members that need additional
5 support and then they get the coaching. So, we're
6 going to continue to do that because we think it's
7 really important to build a capacity to continuing
8 this remote learning.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. The phrase,
10 we're all in this together, applies that there is
11 some equality for all of us and that is not the case.
12 We know that we have been in a system of systemic
13 racism since Black and Brown people have been here.
14 We've gotten less than anybody out there and we've
15 gotten the least in our communities. And
16 historically, that underfunding has been in Black and
17 Brown communities and it was highlighted by the CFD
18 case, for which we still have still not gotten the
19 monies that we are entitled to.

20 So, as we talk about the Fair Student Funding,
21 will every district get the same percentage for the
22 students that they have in their districts?

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, my understanding and we're
24 working through that implementation of that PEG right

1
2 now. So, I'm going to ask our Chief Financial
3 Officer to answer that question for you.

4 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you Council Member for the
5 question. Here, here, I am the CFE case and not
6 getting that funding. Absolutely, thank you for
7 bringing that up. We are, as the Chancellor said and
8 I have testified previously, looking at how to
9 equitably distribute this cut with our city partners
10 and there will be more to come in the future.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, I hope to hear that
12 everyone will get the same percentage. Yes, it's
13 going to mean that some people who have gotten more
14 than 100 percent will now have to come down and share
15 that burden.

16 And Chancellor, I'm very much interested in how
17 we're going to meet; you talk about focusing on the
18 highest needs student population and certainly,
19 that's special needs students. What are we doing to
20 accommodate them? Students that perhaps have three
21 adults giving them individual attention. What are
22 doing now during this process?

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, this has been one of our
24 biggest priorities Council Member Barron. So, we've
25 prioritized everyone of the students and their

1
2 families has had an IEP meeting where we've revised
3 IEP's to fit this remote learning. We are providing
4 daily interaction with students at Synchronous. We
5 also are providing teletherapy to some of our
6 students. We are also working with our partner
7 agencies and partner organizations to provide
8 whatever supports students need.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I have two
10 more quick questions again.

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: Good.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I've always believed that
13 education should be a continuum from 3K through post-
14 secondary education for at least the first three
15 years of college.

16 So, if there was a program, the linked program
17 where the DOE was working in collaboration with the
18 higher education CUNY system to provide assistance to
19 children, to move them in and given them remediation
20 during that first transition into college, are we
21 going to be able to see that program and since my
22 time is running out, in cases where students will be
23 returning to school in September hopefully. How are
24 we going to institute social distancing in a
25 classroom that has overcrowded numbers registered?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so two good questions.
3 I'll do the last one first and then answer the
4 repeating question.

5 So, that is at the crucks of what we're doing in
6 our scenario planning right now. I referenced it
7 earlier in my testimony when working with experts
8 that are helping to guide us on what that looks like.
9 I will tell you the short answer is, it's very
10 difficult in schools period, but in New York City
11 particularly, because of our buildings are set up and
12 the age of our buildings, etc. So, it's a number of
13 things. I'm not saying this is going to happen but
14 I'll give you just a taste of what it could look
15 like.

16 Do we then bring all students back at the same
17 time or do we have a phased approach? Do you have
18 one school, do you then implement a cohort model? In
19 other words, three groups of students. Group one
20 goes to school on one day, groups two and three
21 participate in remote learning. The next day, group
22 one stays back with group three and then group two
23 goes to school and then the third day, group three
24 goes one and two are home doing remote learning. Is
25 that something that we could do? Could there be

1
2 shifts? So, there's a am and a pm shift. All of
3 those are being explored and all of them have real
4 serious benefits and serious, serious downsides.

5 But we're trying to be prepared in all of the
6 models that we're putting forward based on what the
7 medical advice would eventually look like.

8 In terms of the supports, we are continuing to
9 have college access for all programming. Of which
10 the program you mentioned fits into and we are
11 desperately trying not to touch that at all.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank you,
13 Mr. Chancellor and this is an opportunity for us to
14 get to that equality that we want to talk about. The
15 equity that we want to talk about. Thank you to the
16 Chairs Dromm and Treyger and to all of the people who
17 worked to put this together. Thank you so much to
18 those technical people.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Council
20 Member. We'll now go to our next Council Member for
21 questions.

22 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
23 Council Member Moya followed by Council Member
24 Rodriguez and Council Member Louis.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Great, thank you so much.
3 Thank you to Chair Dromm and thank you to Chair
4 Treyger. Chancellor, good to talk to you today.

5 You know, I just want to go with some of the
6 questions that Council Member Barron was talking
7 about because I've been talking to a lot of the
8 parents in school district 24 and 30 where I
9 represent and share with the Council Member Dromm.
10 You know, we are probably the hardest hit district in
11 the entire city due to this COVID-19. There are
12 concerns that have been coming up that a lot of the
13 material that is being self-taught. They feel that
14 there is very little support for some of the most
15 needy students and those are the students with
16 learning disabilities and ELL learners. And even
17 with the related services that are being provided, we
18 know that it's not the same thing as being in the
19 classroom.

20 And so, is there a plan in place to compensate
21 for the lost time and the possible regression for
22 some students that may be experiencing this and if
23 the remote learning does goes beyond the summer, what
24 steps are being taken to support students with
25 learning disabilities, ELL and especially the parents

1
2 who don't have the command of the language to really
3 teach their kids? Is there something in place, I
4 know that you started talking a little bit about the
5 students with disabilities but if you can get into
6 that a little bit more and also for ELL learners,
7 that would be great.

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member. So,
9 we are very much aware of the challenges with remote
10 learning particularly on the impact its had on
11 parents. Because parents have been thrust into the
12 role of being not only the bread winner but like,
13 teacher. So, we understand that. We have done a
14 number of things. We put out a survey on remote
15 learning, which we got incredible feedback on. We
16 learned a lot from what people told us. Students and
17 parents told us where some of the gaps and some of
18 the challenges. So, we are implementing some
19 solutions, some alternatives based on that
20 information. We have also put out very specific
21 resources and guidance on our teach hub, which is
22 where teachers can log in for resources and curate
23 virtual material specifically targeted to
24 differentiating instruction for student with
25 disabilities but also for working with students that

1
2 are multilingual learners, ELL students. So,
3 teachers have resources. Principals have access to
4 those resources as well.

5 In addition, we have our borough specialists that
6 are pushing in and they are pushing in at the request
7 of principals and teachers to provide additional
8 support in helping to develop intervention plans for
9 students that are multilingual learners. And then
10 our special education department has been all hands
11 on deck in terms of providing more and more resources
12 to meet the needs of students with disabilities. It
13 is part, it is central to our planning for summer.
14 Students with disabilities and multilingual learners.
15 We consider them to be in this environment some of
16 our most educationally fragile children.

17 So, we are planning with them in mind about how
18 we're going to enrich their learning, build in time
19 for, I don't call it remediation I call it enrichment
20 and trying to really serve their needs given the
21 experience that they have had this summer.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Great, thank you
23 Chancellor. I just want to thank Alison Avilla[SP?]
24 who is the PTA President from IS-227 in my district
25

1
2 that really brought this to my attention. So, thank
3 you very much. Thank you Chairs.

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you sir.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, we'll now go to
6 our next Council Member.

7 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
8 Council Member Louis followed by Council Member
9 Rosenthal and Council Member Rose.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is starting now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Good afternoon everyone
12 and I just want to thank Chair's Treyger and Dromm
13 for organizing this Zoom and I just want to thank the
14 Chancellor, Chancellor Carranza as well to taking the
15 time to meet with myself and my colleagues last week
16 to address matters regarding the digital divide among
17 Black and Brown communities in Brooklyn.

18 Most of my questions were answered already, so I
19 want to thank my colleagues for raising a lot of the
20 concerns that we're getting from our communities and
21 the school communities.

22 So, I just have some follow up questions
23 regarding some of the questions that were already
24 asked. Regarding the \$5 million in cuts to SONYC and
25 after school programs, Chancellor, you mentioned that

1
2 your team is working on asking the philanthropic
3 community for assistance. I just wanted to know what
4 was the actual ask to philanthropic community.

5 You also answered a question regarding the delays
6 in 3K, I know that East Flatbush and Brownsville were
7 supposed to get some additional 3K programs this
8 year. So, I wanted to know what was the actual
9 definition of delays in the pause?

10 We hear it often but we don't know what that
11 means. We don't know the timeframe of the delay or
12 the pause, so if you could please address that as
13 well. And regarding the digital divide and tech and
14 remote learning, I wanted to know who would be
15 prepared for summer school remotely and for the fall,
16 as we're still trying to figure out what the school
17 year is going to look like. Will we have enough
18 devices for all students by the fall? And those are
19 my three basic questions, so thank you so much.

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you. So, in terms of
21 the philanthropic ask, we've asked philanthropy to
22 help ensure that some of these proposed cuts, if they
23 could cover these cuts during this financial downturn
24 for the city. Again, being optimistic, we are
25 optimistic that once we are past this pandemic, that

1
2 the economy will jump start again but absent that and
3 absent any federal stimulus funding, we don't want
4 students to feel that cut. So, we've specifically
5 asked on a number of programs, different
6 philanthropic potential funders, if they would
7 consider that as part of their portfolio.

8 So, we're in active discussions with them. I
9 will be just very apologetic up front to say that it
10 would probably not be diplomatic for me to mention
11 the names at this point because I don't want them to
12 feel undue pressure, but I will tell you that we're
13 having some very positive conversations.

14 The pause in terms of 3K is really about the
15 current situation that we're in. The Mayor believes
16 strongly in early K and PreK and 3k as I do as well.
17 we have data that shows they have been game changers
18 in terms of the opportunity gap. It pains us to even
19 consider rolling not rolling out the plan that we had
20 but the pause is just that. It's not a cut, we're
21 not cutting programs and we're not going to do away
22 with the commitment that we've made to have these
23 programs roll out into new communities. What it
24 means is that given this particular budgetary
25 environment, we can't roll out this coming year, but

1 we definitely had the goal of next year being able
2 to, or even if things change drastically, as soon as
3 we're financially able to do that, even before next
4 year, to actually fulfill that promise that we made.

5
6 And then in terms of devices, we currently have
7 in the hands of every student and family that has
8 requested a device, we have put a device in their
9 hands. And what we've done is, in our purchasing,
10 we've also allotted for the fact that not everyone is
11 going to fill out a survey. Not everyone is going to
12 make the phone call and let us know that they need a
13 device.

14 So, we have our parent engagement specialists.
15 We have our parent coordinators. We have our
16 principals, our teachers, our social workers, our
17 guidance counselor and as they identify students that
18 perhaps hadn't filled out a survey and let us know
19 they need a device or hadn't called that number, as
20 we're finding folks, we're getting devices into their
21 hands as well.

22 So, we feel very confident at this point, that
23 everyone that has asked for a device, has a device
24 and we have devices in case somebody's device - you
25 know, I personally know the case where a student had

1
2 their device. They had their own computer and it
3 broke. So, that student wasn't part of the original
4 count. They called and said, hey, my computer broke,
5 is there one for me? Absolutely, we got a device to
6 them.

7 So, we're going to continue to keep our eye on
8 that because as we stay in remote learning, that is a
9 huge equity issue.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our next Council
11 Member; thank you Council Member Louis.

12 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
13 Council Member Rosenthal followed by Council Member
14 Rose and Council Member Ayala.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, shit gotta go.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Folks, just a reminder to
18 mute yourselves. Thank you.

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: Hi, Council Member Rosenthal.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: She needs to be unmuted.
21 Okay, Council Member Rosen- op. Thank you, Council
22 Member Rosenthal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great, appreciate it,
24 appreciate all your time Chancellor. You really have
25 the patience of a saint. I want to ask two quick

1
2 questions. First, is given that the state is likely
3 to cut our education budget again within the next two
4 weeks, I am wondering if your financial team is
5 continuing to look through your central office budget
6 with a fine tooth comb looking particularly at the
7 consulting contracts number one.

8 And secondly, an issue that so many people have
9 talked about, if you are looking at the nature of
10 procurement and if there's a way to bring down costs
11 in those areas.

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, Ma'am. Thank you for
13 those two questions. So, we are absolutely
14 continuing to look through all of our budgets and in
15 particular, you know, our consulting budgets, our
16 professional development, we're looking at all of
17 them and I've been very clear with the organization
18 that everything is on the table. There are no sacred
19 paths. We are absolutely looking at everything in
20 the Department of Education.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And has anything
22 jumped out at you as you've started to go down that
23 list, are there specific things that have jumped out
24 that you've said, you know what, we're going to take
25 the cut here and some that were lower hanging fruit?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: There starting to emerge
3 somethings. Everything now is painful but there are
4 things that we've done because New York City has been
5 a progressive school system for a number of years
6 that we are actually looking at, what are the must
7 haves and what are the good haves. You know, the
8 good things to have and the must haves to run a
9 school system. We're definitely in that sphere right
10 now. I think to add a little more detail to your
11 question, I'd like to ask our Chief Financial Officer
12 because she is really in the weeds doing this work
13 right now. If Lindsey could add a little bit more
14 detail to that. Lindsey Oates, could you unmute her
15 please.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: While we're waiting for
17 oh -

18 LINDSEY OATES: Everyone can hear me?

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes.

20 LINDSEY OATES: Great, so Council Member
21 Rosenthal, I know you are a fellow lady of Finance
22 and I appreciate your questions. I want to say that
23 we are really hard at work on the procurement side.
24 Our Senior Executive Director Charlotte
25 Hermangenez[SP?] is working with MOCS, the Law

1
2 Department and many other areas to learn what other
3 city agencies are doing. One of the things that we
4 are looking at and actively negotiating with many of
5 our vendors on SU are voluntary price reductions.

6 So, we started that work with some of our largest
7 vendors. We have vendors who are agreeing to this
8 and that I think is a big step in the right
9 direction. My understanding is that this is work
10 that happened after Hurricane Sandy, which was very
11 successful for the city. The last time we had a
12 major economic downturn in a crisis and so, we're
13 going to continue to do those kinds of things but
14 point well taken and we are absolutely looking for
15 savings there.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, I'm going to
17 move on to a second area but you know, if you could
18 come back to the Council with a list of the savings
19 areas with that level of specificity, I think that
20 would be really helpful and even if you want to
21 categorize it the way that you are talking about it
22 here, the must haves, lucky to have. You know, to
23 sort of categorize it that way so that the Council
24 can see how you are looking at it.

1
2 And then, secondly, you know, and I'm just going
3 to add the way that Lannie Hampson[SP?] and others
4 unearthed the contract that was so completely
5 overpriced was by looking harder at the way the RFP
6 was written. And the way the RFP had been written on
7 that computer consulting contract was really landed
8 it in the hands of a single provider, who then was
9 able to charge as much as they want. Really, for the
10 service once they had the monopoly. So, you know,
11 it's that kind of fine tuning details that I'm hoping
12 to look at.

13 I only have five seconds. Chancellor, if you
14 would consider putting out surveys at the grab and go
15 sites, I'm wondering if you would consider putting
16 out some survey's about whether or not people would
17 be wanting their food via the grab and go meals or
18 via a bag of groceries. I'm wondering if that's
19 something that's possible and secondly, whether or
20 not at the grab and go sites, you would consider
21 putting out information about domestic violence and
22 how people can be seeking help that is available to
23 them if they would just know that it was available.
24 Is that something that you can do without a lot of
25 money?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so we will definitely
3 look into what that looks like and absolutely
4 consider it. I would just share that as of - and I
5 think they are both good ideas, we just have to see
6 how physically operationally we could actually do
7 that.

8 I visited some of those grab and go sites and
9 I'll tell you that as of right now, we have served
10 over 10 million meals since March 16th when we
11 pivoted to remote learning. 10 million meals and
12 we're -

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And what would have
14 been amazing is in every single one of those -

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member, we have to
16 move along.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.
18 We'll follow up later.

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you, yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, the next Council Member
21 please.

22 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
23 Council Member Rose followed by Council Member Ayala
24 and Council Member Rodriguez.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time starts now.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Thank you
3 Chair's Dromm and Treyger and I just want to thank
4 you for your commitment to the young people and
5 education.

6 I want to thank all of colleagues on this at this
7 hearing today for your questions, your support, and
8 your articulation of the importance of SYEP, summer
9 SONYC, COMPASS, and summer camps.

10 Chancellor, I'm sure that you have had an ear
11 full in terms of how important summer programming is
12 for our young people and how committed this Council
13 is to making sure that they are getting services.

14 Another thing, this pandemic has exposed the
15 historic inequities that are suffered by many New
16 York communities of color and it has exacerbated the
17 negative economic realities of our most vulnerable
18 youth. And one of the barriers to remote learning
19 for our oldest students has been the need for them to
20 work to support their families in light of the
21 economic hardship suffered during this pandemic.

22 These students may not earn the credits that they
23 need this term and they will need to participate in
24 summer school, likely through remote learning.
25

1
2 So, has the DOE thought about possible summer
3 options and have you considered a summer program that
4 would include both the remote work base learning
5 component with a stipend and a credit recovery
6 component. So that these students can actually find
7 a way to earn money and get their course credit this
8 summer? And if not, how are you going to engage the
9 older students this summer who really need to work to
10 help their families through this economic crisis and
11 help them get their course credits?

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Council Member Rose, thank
13 you very much for bringing that up. I've been
14 meeting with a number of community based
15 organizations and elected officials and this
16 particular idea has been raised up in the last week
17 and a half. So, my team is actually exploring what
18 that would like and how we could actually bring that
19 to scale within a summer environment. Part of the
20 complications with our planning for summer is that we
21 just don't yet know what medically we will be able to
22 do in the community, whether it's in person or does
23 it need to be remote.

24 So, we're really trying to plan for both
25 eventualities. If it's remote, what does that look

1
2 like. If it's actually, we can do some in person
3 with appropriate social distancing and other
4 precautions, what does that look like and then also,
5 as I mentioned earlier in my testimony, working with
6 some philanthropic opportunities to be able to fund
7 this in this particular time.

8 So, it's a great idea and we're kicking the tires
9 to see what that could look like.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: You know Chancellor, I just
11 want us to remember that many of these same youth are
12 the ones who were already disadvantaged and behind,
13 and so, when we're looking at programming for summer
14 SYEP and to try to make up for the losses of these
15 last three months. We have to include we have to
16 make sure that these support services are in place
17 with these young people and I just want to make sure
18 that we do this equitably.

19 You know, we have a REC center that was only open
20 four days and our essential workers were not able to
21 access the REC center, so that they could continue to
22 go to work because economically they needed to do
23 that and as essential workers.

24 So, when you are looking at resources, I want to
25 implore you that you need to look at it with a

1
2 different eye and making sure that the inequities
3 that we said, the Mayor said was going to be
4 addressed, are truly being addressed. And that the
5 communities that need these services most, are
6 actually in the whole formula and get the resources.

7 So, please, and when you talk to the
8 philanthropies about subsidizing summer youth jobs,
9 please ensure that you impress upon them how
10 important it is because you know how important it is
11 and that DOE and XYEP and DYCD is going to put the
12 monies into these programs.

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, Ma'am. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I have to ask a clarifying
15 question. Mr. Chancellor, you just stated something
16 that's new to me and I'm the Education Chair. Are
17 you telling me that the Department of Education is
18 putting together an SYEP program this summer?

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: No, sir.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Is this correct?

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: No, no. What I said is that
22 we're exploring opportunities to have some kind of a
23 program where students can remotely participate in
24 job experiences and get paid for that. We don't have
25 the funding for it yet. We don't have the

1
2 programming for it yet, but this as a result of the
3 number of conversations that I and my team members
4 have had with a number of folks around the city.

5 So, we're exploring what that could look like.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I just want to clarify
7 that no IEP's have been changed because you can't
8 legally do that without parents at the table. What
9 has possibly changed is what you could provide from
10 the IEP in this remote setting.

11 So, I just want to just state for the record that
12 if there have been certain changes made in terms of
13 IEP's without parents being notified, that's against
14 federal law.

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: Absolutely, it's against
16 federal law and that's not what I said sir. I said
17 that I adapted IEP's in some cases you can do that
18 virtually where parents have agreed to be part of a
19 virtual meeting. Just like we are all on Zoom today,
20 you can do that.

21 So, again, I don't want my comments to be
22 misconstrued. We are following all of the federal
23 laws but we are also working to serve the needs of
24 our students with disabilities.

25 Thank you for allowing me clarify.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, and just note and
3 then I'll turn to my colleagues. That is a student
4 is falling behind because of remote learning right
5 now, I am concerned about how and what changes the
6 folks can make virtually in the summer. We keep
7 hearing about the number of kids who responded to the
8 survey, but thousand of kids also did not respond to
9 the survey. And those are the thousands of kids who
10 are still having difficulties and challenges
11 adapting.

12 So, I'll turn it back over to colleagues, I just
13 wanted to clarify for the record that IEP's cannot be
14 changed without parents and that where accommodations
15 might be happening now, is a different situation.

16 So, thank you and let's move forward. Thank you
17 Chair Dromm.

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Mr. Chair and I want
19 to clarify for the record as well, that IEP's are not
20 being illegally changed. We are following the rules,
21 we are following the law and that we are adapting in
22 full communication with parents. I just want to be
23 very clear that that is what is happening.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our next Council Member
25 please.

1
2 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now here from
3 Council Member Ayala followed by Council Member
4 Rodriguez and Council Member Ampry-Samuel.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Sorry, I usually don't
7 unmute myself. Good afternoon Chair's, good
8 afternoon Chancellor. I am really concerned, I guess
9 my question is really relating to the social,
10 emotional needs of our young people. As a parent,
11 you know, I am at home with the exception of today,
12 I escaped. But I am at home every single day with my
13 children and my children are you know, 14 and 18, so
14 they are a little bit older but you know even in that
15 age group, I'm witnessing you know some of the
16 anxiety and even borderline depression, I would say.
17 And so, I wonder given that we're working remotely
18 and that there is really no - I'm sure that teachers
19 are communicating with parents via phone but there
20 isn't that face to face right, that interaction that
21 we're used to.

22 So, when a child comes to school and there's
23 something a little bit off about maybe you know, the
24 way that they are behaving that it becomes pretty
25 evident to the educator at that moment. In light of

1
2 you know, not having that anymore, I'm just, I'm
3 concerned about our kids and I wonder what is the DOE
4 doing today to ensure that the social, emotional
5 needs of our children are being met and how does that
6 relate to how we are preparing for a fall where we're
7 having children come into a school setting after
8 months and months of being away and really suffering
9 from traumatic, you know, a humungous traumatic
10 experience?

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, so Council Member Ayala,
12 you are absolutely articulating one of our concerns
13 that we're working through. So, we are continue - I
14 testified earlier, we are continuing to have our
15 guidance counselors and our social workers working
16 with students albeit it is remotely but having that
17 interaction. We've also - part of why we've asked
18 our teachers to be checking on students and have a
19 check in with students, especially students, finding
20 students that have not checked in in a while is
21 because we want to be very cognizant of what their
22 needs are as well.

23 In addition, Deputy Chancellor LaShawn Robinson
24 and her team are continuing to provide resources on
25 our teach hub and learn at home site. Resources for

1
2 teachers and parents that are guidance around
3 attending to the social, emotional learning needs of
4 students. Trauma informed practices, trauma informed
5 interventions for our teachers.

6 So, again, what we're trying to do is braid the
7 academic resources with the social, emotional
8 learning trauma informed resources that our teachers
9 have. This is a very difficult time for everybody.
10 I know for a fact as well, that our students are
11 undergoing trauma and our parents are undergoing
12 trauma and what makes it even more pernicious is that
13 at the same time, the people that are teaching, the
14 teachers and the principals are also suffering from
15 trauma as well.

16 So, we're trying to provide as many resources as
17 we can right now, but we're also being very, very
18 clear about how that is going to continue into the
19 summer, into the next school year. Because I can
20 tell you from my experience, leading my community
21 through Hurricane Harvey and Houston, that the
22 effects of trauma are not evident immediately. The
23 effects of trauma start manifesting themselves
24 anywhere from six months to two years after the
25 traumatic event.

1
2 So, we know that this is a long term commitment
3 that we need to make to make sure that our students
4 and our staff and our communities are being well
5 supported.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and we'll now go to
7 our next Council Member.

8 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
9 Council Member Rodriguez, followed by Council Member
10 Ampry-Samuel and Council Member Cornegy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Gracias. [SPEAKING IN
12 SPANISH 2:35:10-2:35:39]. I feel that the
13 coronavirus has showed a face in New York City. A
14 city built based on systematic racist society. It is
15 true that the coronavirus doesn't discriminate. By
16 the parents send the kids to the school, that they
17 can raise \$1 million, the PTA raise \$1 million in
18 school district, they will have to deal with some
19 type of drama. Bystander same thing Chancellor.
20 Those families of the PTA cannot raise \$1. So, what
21 is the plan that DOE has right now to use poverty as
22 we will have to top decision on cutting funding, so
23 that funding will not affect the poorest
24 neighborhood. I mean, the students who live in the
25 poorest and overcrowded neighborhood?

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: [SPEAKING IN SPANISH 2:36:35-
3 2:37:19]. So, Council Member Rodriguez, again, I
4 want to thank you for your question. Your question
5 speaks to the heart of how we're approaching trying
6 to grapple with this budget crisis. We agree that
7 equity is important and we agree that there have
8 been, this crisis has really brought into the
9 sunlight in a much more powerful way, the inequitable
10 experiences of our communities of color. When you
11 just look at the effects medically that this pandemic
12 has had, the disproportionate impact it's had in
13 communities, our African American community, Latino
14 communities, our Asian community. You can see that
15 it's had a disproportionate affect.

16 Earlier in my testimony, I testified about the
17 FSF and the cut that we have to make to FSF. Our
18 Chief Financial Officer talked about really looking
19 at an equitable way of implementing that PEG. That
20 is one of the ways that we're looking at. What are
21 the communities that are most impoverished, what are
22 the communities that are most disproportionately and
23 historically underserved and how do we implement this
24 PEG, not on the backs equally all of those -
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Chancellor, yeah, so I
3 appreciate the answer, but I feel it is important and
4 I know where your heart is but I think it is
5 important that the DOE designate to hear the mental
6 traumas of both children and parents that we know
7 from research can prevent the learning and especially
8 the English language learner. As you know, 42
9 percent of the students, they are Latino and they are
10 close to 40 percent African American.

11 So, among the English language learning, who are
12 those who live in the poorest one and as you know,
13 more than 50 percent, around 50 percent of the 42
14 percent Latino, there are English language learning.

15 So, how can we get the DOE to work – I know where
16 your heart is, but together, the city to look at
17 those families investing additional funding to those
18 families for themselves, for the students and for the
19 mental health that will need a lot of help after this
20 trauma?

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so again, our guiding
22 principle is making sure that we're serving from an
23 equitable perspective all of our students and in
24 particular, our students with disabilities, our
25 multilingual learners, and those communities. So, as

1
2 we are planning for how we are going to address this
3 budget, that is a central fundamental piece of our
4 planning process. More to come -

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: My last question.
6 Sorry, my last question because of the time. Is the
7 quality of food served to the community, the school
8 the same in the middle class as in the poorest
9 neighborhood?

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, sir. To my knowledge,
11 there is no different menus for different parts of
12 the city. It's all the same.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Excuse me, I want to go back
15 to Council Member Ayala because I didn't realize that
16 she was still wanting to question and she has a
17 couple of minutes left. Is Council Member Ayala
18 still here?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, I just had one
20 question, it was around the Census. I'm wondering
21 what and how the DOE was working with parents to
22 ensure they are completing the Census.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, you're not
24 unmuted.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: The time began.

1
2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Can you hear me now?

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Okay, so we continue to put up
5 guidance around the Census to our families. We also
6 asked our parent coordinators to continue to
7 disseminate information about taking the Census. We
8 are working with the city agencies in getting that
9 information out as well.

10 So, we had a very robust plan of parent meetings
11 and PTA meetings and back to school nights, which a
12 big wrench got thrown into those plans with the move
13 to remote learning but we are still working and
14 coordinating with our sister city agencies to get
15 that word out.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and now,
17 we'll go to our next Council Member.

18 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
19 Council Member Ampry Samuel followed by Council
20 Member Cornegy and Council Member Powers.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY SAMUEL: Good afternoon
23 Chancellor and thanks Chair Dromm and Treyger for
24 your leadership. My questions were related to summer
25 programming and addressing them into helping with our

1
2 children, as well as the Census question. So, my
3 colleagues did a great job at addressing those
4 concerns. So, I had one last question and it's about
5 the school safety agents.

6 I know that a few of my colleagues spoke highly
7 about of our school safety agents and everyone knows
8 that my mom is a retired school safety agent. She
9 retired three years ago.

10 I actually have to right now just, you know, just
11 continue to uplift the families of the school safety
12 agents that did pass away during this time. But you
13 mentioned city agencies working in silos in the past
14 and that your goal is to be able to add value and
15 lend your voice in a multiagency discussions.

16 So, with that being said, there have been widely
17 publicized instances of violent social distancing
18 enforcement by NYPD and more recently an announcement
19 that the school safety agents are being deployed to
20 enforce social distancing. And I would say that I
21 prefer to say healthy spacing and not social
22 distancing. Social distancing gets up under my skin
23 because we are social people. So, I prefer to say
24 healthy spacing.

1
2 But in light of this, are you involved at all in
3 conversations around the school safety agents in
4 their role in the months ahead and have you been able
5 to lend your voice with the Mayor's Office, the city
6 administration as well as NYPD or even Teamsters
7 Local 237 where the school safety agents you know,
8 they are members of that particular unit.

9 So, have you been able to be a part of those
10 conversations and lend your voice because they are so
11 you know, important inside the school buildings and
12 to what DOE is doing. And so, I just want to hear
13 your thoughts to find out what's going on with
14 helping conversations.

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, thank you Council
16 Member. Just very quickly on the Census because that
17 was one of your questions. We are also distributing
18 information at all of the meal hubs about the Census
19 as well. So, we're trying to really get the word out
20 there and I forgot to say that on the last question.

21 But the Mayor has charged all of us agency heads
22 since the beginning of the city's response to COVID-
23 19, that we all wear the same uniform. We all work
24 for the people of New York City. So, that means that
25 we are going to support each other and we're going to

1
2 work across the perceived silos that exist in our
3 agencies. We've seen that in a couple of ways. Our
4 school nurses are very hard at work providing
5 services at our REC sites but there are also a number
6 of school nurses that at the height of the community
7 spread, we're actually deployed to hospitals all
8 across the city and we're supporting and augmenting
9 our hospitals in responding to the COVID-19. I will
10 just say to you that there may be members, senior
11 members of my team that have been involved in those
12 conversations around school safety agents but I have
13 personally not been involved in those conversations.

14 School safety agents serve in our schools but
15 they are actually employed by the NYPD. But I
16 haven't personally been involved in those
17 conversations but it would not surprise me only
18 because of the example that I shared with school
19 nurses going out and serving in other areas where the
20 city critically needed them as well.

21 I can tell you that my experiences with school
22 safety agents, is I have been able to go around to
23 these REC centers has been absolutely amazing work
24 that they are doing. They are not only keeping our
25 schools safe, but I have also seen them as well,

1
2 write stuff down and be very, very cognizant of
3 students wearing their masks and if they don't have
4 their face covering, giving them a face covering.

5 So, I would expect that even in an assignment
6 around safe distancing, that they would bring that
7 kind of care to that assignment as well.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY SAMUEL: okay, I just wanted
9 to as I close, to say that it's unfortunate that you
10 are not part of those conversations because your
11 experience in how you see like the work that the
12 school safety agents are doing and also, just your -
13 you know, just being creative on other types of work
14 that the school safety agents can be doing inside the
15 buildings or just around the buildings or working
16 with families can be critical and to not have that
17 voice in those conversations can be detrimental at
18 times because if the Administration is not speaking
19 to the elected officials and they are also not
20 speaking to the heads of agencies about the people
21 that work in those spaces -

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY SAMUEL: We are really
24 missing out and so, I would just encourage you know,
25 just the opportunity to be able to hear what's

1
2 happening and be able to give your own subjectives
3 about the folks that work in your buildings and see
4 how they can be best utilized. Because there are
5 other people that can do what the Administration has
6 planned for school safety agents and not the SSA's
7 themselves.

8 So, thank you so much.

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Next Council
11 Member please.

12 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: We will now hear from
13 Council Member Cornegy followed by Council Member
14 Powers and Council Member Levin.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Times starts now.

16 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Council Member Cornegy
17 are you there?

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Why don't we move on and if
19 he comes back, we'll put him back in the lineup.

20 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: Will do. We will now
21 hear from Council Member Powers followed by Council
22 Member Levin.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you and I'm
25 not seven feet tall, so I can't to a Robert Cornegy

1
2 impression but very nice to see you and I hope
3 everybody is hanging in there and I want to thank
4 everybody, all our teachers, principals, parents,
5 everybody who is working overtime right now to make
6 sure that our kids are getting educated and thanks to
7 everybody who is tuning in even at this late moment.

8 Chancellor, I have two – I mean, I think that
9 most of my questions have been answered but I wanted
10 to ask too that I didn't hear it asked, but I will
11 stand corrected if they were asked.

12 One is just, you know, we're learning a lot of
13 lessons around COVID right now and particularly about
14 how to utilize remote learning in the future. And
15 I'm wondering if that, if you see the supplying
16 anywhere ahead whether it is around summertime, snow
17 days, or other ways that one might utilize remote
18 learning in the future and whether any lessons around
19 that or challenges?

20 And the second is, I was reminded by somebody in
21 my staff yesterday around the fact that as schools
22 are closed, perhaps there would be an opportunity
23 here to do a number of the capital projects
24 construction that is intended or planned for by the
25 DOE and the SCA. But some limitations obviously

1
2 right now from construction. Are schools able and
3 are they going under any construction right now? Is
4 there a plan to do that and do you see this as an
5 opportunity to do some of the infrastructure changes
6 in schools that were intended or anticipated?

7 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member
8 Powers. So, I'll answer the first question on remote
9 learning and then on construction, I'm going to ask
10 our Chief Operating Officer to give you a little more
11 detail on that particular question.

12 So, obviously this is a horrible experience for
13 everyone. This is a very difficult experience. This
14 is a first pandemic in our lifetimes that we've had
15 to experience in this way. But it has provided us
16 with some opportunities that I think we need to seize
17 and continue with. One is, the digital divide and
18 we've been able to, as I've testified today put a
19 device in the hands of every student who said they
20 want a device.

21 Our teachers have been able to build capacity,
22 knowledge on how to use technology in a very
23 different way. In some cases, teachers were already
24 going this in very creative ways but in other cases,
25 they've developed this capacity to teach and have

1
2 additional ways of teaching that we shouldn't lose
3 once we go back to in person instruction.

4 I'm very optimistic that we will continue to
5 develop this capacity and that teachers will be able
6 to use these skills to augment their pedagogy as we
7 go back into face to face learning.

8 I also think that students have become much more
9 independent learners. Not because we want them to
10 only be independent learners but they've had to
11 really adapt that's part of the trauma but it's also
12 part of the capacity that they've built to be able to
13 learn in a different format as well.

14 All of those things, I see being a part of any
15 future schooling that happens in our city. I think
16 it's just an incredible opportunity to add to what
17 students are able to know and do.

18 I'd like to ask Ursulina if she could address the
19 construction question.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And before she does that,
21 I just, why I'm asking is because we also know about
22 like how during the summer time for instance how many
23 students you know, may put the pencils and paper and
24 not be learning over that time and divide in that as
25 well and I wonder if at some point in the future we

1
2 could be seeing even optionally parents be able to
3 you know, tap into digital learning and remote
4 learning as a way to help reduce that.

5 RICHARD CARRANZA: Absolutely.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: But I take Ursulina to
7 take the second question.

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Ursulina?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I think she needs to be
10 unmuted.

11 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Thank you. Thanks for the
12 question Council Member Powers. So, as you are
13 aware, the governor and the Mayor put a pause to all
14 nonessential construction so that pause, a lot of the
15 work done by SEA. Although the SEA just restarted
16 working again on the new school as we are developing.
17 They will add additional capacity for September, so
18 that work has started.

19 In terms of the facilities team, we are doing
20 what we call life and safety work. So, think about
21 that as you know, fire extinguishers, things around
22 those lines but if it's not essential, we're not
23 doing it and they are doing a lot of the maintenance
24 work, painting, waxing, stuff that they would be
25 doing when the school is closed during the summer.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, well you guys
3 perfectly timed your answers because we are at five
4 seconds but thank you to both Chairs for giving me an
5 opportunity and best wishes to everybody.

6 Thanks.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and I
8 believe that we have come to the end of the Council
9 Member questions. I want to take this opportunity to
10 thank you Chancellor. Stephen Levin is still
11 looking, okay, sorry, Stephen Levin. Council Member
12 Levin. Can Council Member Levin – okay, thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you. Thank you very
14 much. Thank you, Chancellor. I apologize if you
15 have already covered this topic in your testimony and
16 responding to other Council Member questions but how
17 exactly are, we tracking students that are not
18 participating in remote learning right now?

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, at the current moment
20 we're having, our guidance is that teachers check in
21 with their students on a regular basis. Most
22 teachers are doing that on a daily basis. We also
23 have the ability to track when students have logged
24 in. Then we know that they are engaging and we have
25

1
2 the ability to also do some tracking on when they've
3 submitted assignments or posted assignments as well.
4 So, those are kind of the three main ways that we're
5 tracking if students are engaged.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And what are we seeing
7 right now in terms of remote learning engagement?
8 So, just like in terms of class time. What is the
9 range? What are identifying as particular
10 challenges? Where is successful, where is it less
11 successful?

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, those are great questions.
13 We currently are tracking about 86 percent of our
14 students are engaging on a daily basis, which is
15 phenomenal. It's not regular attendance like we
16 would take in a face to face situation but one of the
17 things that we've done and I keep referring to
18 guidance is that how that remote learning looks and
19 feels is going to be different from school to school,
20 teacher to teacher. Even within communities it's
21 going to look different.

22 So, the guidance is that teachers are daily, on a
23 daily basis checking in with their student and that
24 they are to the extent possible having synchronous
25 lessons with their students. Which means the

1
2 teachers on the screen, the students are on the
3 screen, and there is an interaction. For a meriod of
4 reasons, that's not always possible but that's the
5 guidance that we've put out there and many teachers
6 are actually doing that.

7 But we are seeing just a variety of different
8 ways. Some teachers have morning sessions with their
9 students. Some teachers have office hours in the
10 afternoon. Any possible way you can think of
11 teachers interacting with students, we're seeing that
12 happen in this remote learning timeframe.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Are you seeing greater
14 success by particular grades? Is some grades that
15 are unbalanced having a better result than others,
16 older kids, younger kids?

17 RICHARD CARRANZA: Just generally speaking, I
18 would say that we are seeing much more active
19 engagement. Not much more but we're seeing more
20 consistent engagement at the high school level,
21 particularly with our high school seniors. We're
22 seeing much more active engagement. Middle schools
23 are very engaged as well. What I'm really excited
24 about is that at the elementary school level,
25 especially the early readers, kindergarten, first

1
2 grade, second grade, we're seeing much more active
3 synchronous teaching with teachers working with their
4 students. At the older grade, we're seeing a little
5 bit more of assignments are posted. Teachers have
6 office hours; students can check in on that.

7 So, it's really a range of different kinds of
8 engagement data.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I mean I really just want
10 to acknowledge all of the parent out there that are
11 participating in this. I have two kids right now
12 that are younger than school age but the prospect of
13 engaging in remote learning with them and doing what
14 I have to do as you know, I'm fortunate to still be
15 working at this job, I think it's, you know to those
16 parents that are doing all of that at the same time,
17 I'm just astounded at their ability to do that and I
18 want to acknowledge that. Because they are now
19 acting as teachers themselves and obviously, to all
20 the teachers that are doing this and taking on this
21 unique challenge at this time that they never
22 anticipated, you know, my hat goes off to them as
23 well.

24 Last question Chancellor, at the grab and go
25 sites where we are doing food out to New Yorkers who

1
2 need it, at the moment I don't believe that menstrual
3 products are a part of that assortment. Is that
4 something that is within the DOE's portfolio or is
5 that somebody else's portfolio?

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: Council Member, so during the
7 in person education experience, those products were
8 available to our students at all our schools. With
9 the transition to remote learning, I'm happy to say
10 that we've heard that feedback. Our team has been
11 working hard on that and absolutely starting next
12 week, those products will be available at grab and go
13 sites.

14 So, we've heard the community and I want to thank
15 the team for working so hard to make it happen.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, thank you so much
17 Chancellor, thank you.

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and I have two
20 more. If Council Member Cornegy is there. Did you
21 want to ask a question Council Member Cornegy? Just
22 give him a minute to be unmuted. Council Member
23 Rivera, are you there? Council Member Rivera, no,
24 Council Member Cornegy?
25

1
2 Okay, thank you very much then. Chancellor, we
3 really appreciate you coming in and spending over
4 three hours with us to answer these questions. We of
5 course will have some follow up questions which we'll
6 forward you by mail and we wish you luck and again,
7 thank you to everyone in the Department of Education
8 for the job that you have done in terms of
9 transitioning from classroom to remote learning. It
10 has been a very difficult time for all of us and to
11 be honest with you, if I'm still a teacher and I had
12 to transition, I'd need heavy duty professional
13 development on how to get on to remote learning
14 because I'm not all that technologically aware.

15 But we thank you very, very much for what you are
16 doing.

17 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chancellor and also
19 to Ms. Oates and to Ms. Ramirez as well. Thank you
20 for being with us.

21 We will now take a break until 1:30 p.m. then we
22 will hear from the Department of Transportation. I
23 ask my colleagues who will be joining us for the
24 transportation portion of the hearing to remain in
25 this Zoom with your microphone muted until we are

1
2 ready to begin and thank you very much. [GAVEL] This
3 portion of the hearing is ended.

4
5 We have previously heard from the Department of
6 Education and we will now hear from the Department of
7 Transportation. We have been joined by several
8 Council Members. They are Council Member Powers,
9 Menchaca, Adams, Lander, Ampry-Samuel, Grodenchik,
10 Miller Rose, Ayala, Cabrera, Brannan, Yeger,
11 Koslowitz, Cumbo, Gjonaj, Levine, Koo, Cornegy,
12 Holden, Levin, Matteo, and Gibson.

13 In the interest of time, I will forego an opening
14 statement but I would like to ask our Committee
15 Counsel to go over some procedural items before
16 turning it over to Chair Rodriguez for his statement.

17 NOAH BRICK: Thank you. My name is Noah Brick
18 and I am Counsel to the New York City Council
19 Committee on Finance. Before we begin, I want to
20 remind everyone that you will be on mute until you
21 are recognized to speak. At which time, you will be
22 unmuted by the Zoom host.

23 During the hearing, if Council Members would like
24 to ask a question, please use the Zoom raise hand
25 function and you will be called on in order. We will

1
2 be limiting Council Member questions to three
3 minutes, including answers. After you are
4 acknowledged, please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to
5 tell you that your time has begun. The Sergeant at
6 Arms will also indicate when your time has expired.

7 Please also note that for ease of this virtual
8 hearing we will not be allowing a second round of
9 questioning.

10 Thank you. I will now turn it over to Council
11 Member Dromm, uh, Council Member Rodriguez for his
12 opening statement.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Good
14 afternoon. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez, Chairman of
15 the Transportation Committee. I want to begin by
16 thanking my colleague, Co-Chair Council Member Daniel
17 Dromm, and the members of the Committee on Finance
18 with the members of the Committee on Transportation
19 holding this budget hearing.

20 First of all, I would like to put out prayer to
21 all those families that they have lost a loved one.
22 As we know, coronavirus doesn't discriminate anyone
23 who can die, but most people that have been dying,
24 they are the poorest New Yorkers. We don't want
25 anyone regardless if they are upper class, middle

1
2 class, or lower class to die but we need to address
3 the reality.

4 It is a combination of coronavirus and poverty
5 that have killed so many people. We want to be sure
6 that we, at this hearing today realize that our
7 investments have to be made related to transportation
8 in order to connect more people who live in
9 underserved community to buses trains, bicycle, and
10 Ferry.

11 Today, we are hear to continue the Fiscal 2021
12 Budget process under completely different
13 circumstances that we found ourselves just two months
14 ago. Since our preliminary budget hearing, nearly
15 20,000 New Yorkers have that due to the novel
16 coronavirus and the lives of all New Yorkers have
17 been completely changed by the virus.

18 Over 20 million people have applied for
19 unemployment in USA. Numbers that haven't been seen
20 since the great depression. We are experiencing a
21 national health crisis. The lives of which we have
22 never seen before.

23 As we all continue to do our part to practice
24 safe social distance, families has been separated,
25 jobs have been lost, and community business has been

1
2 being forced to close. And of course, transportation
3 also has been effected. The dedication and sacrifice
4 for all essential workers. Our trains and buses have
5 continued to run, our livery and for hire vehicles
6 have been able to deliver meals to New Yorkers who
7 cannot leave their home. Our supermarkets and
8 grocery stores remains in stock and our nurses and
9 our doctors have been able to save thousands of
10 lives. Our [inaudible 3:06:13] has been taking the
11 buses and the trains to go and provide these services
12 to our senior citizens.

13 Many parents, they have to serve to work as a
14 teacher assistant even though they have never applied
15 for the job by staying with their family and helping
16 their children.

17 This is what it means to be in New York, to look
18 out for one another and to ensure that we are all
19 doing our part during this pandemic. Without the
20 work our city will never be able to function.

21 However, we must also acknowledge that we have lost
22 many essential workers, including more than 80
23 transit workers. I would like to take a moment of
24 silence to recognize and honor the sacrifice of all
25

1
2 these workers and the many New Yorkers who have
3 fallen to this virus.

4 Through this hearing, we hold a continuation of
5 the budget process, we lead to a reduction in the
6 budget that is progressive, responsible in fear for
7 all New Yorkers especially the immigrant, the Latino,
8 Black and Asian in the poorest neighborhood. Those
9 that have been left behind, those that show one more
10 time that even though Mayor de Blasio wanted to
11 mandate to close the gap between the rich and the
12 poor. Today, more than ever, we are seeing an
13 equality as a face of New York City. We need a
14 budget that will effectively meet under the
15 Departments efforts to maintain and include
16 pedestrian and cycle safety and the city's railway
17 infrastructure during this pandemic.

18 And my brothers and sisters who represent middle
19 and upper class community, as we will have this
20 discussion, let's put all our priorities for anything
21 related to bike lane, to buses, to cyclists in
22 underserved communities. Those dealing with asthma
23 and obesity. Those that they are left behind.

24 I hope to also hear from the DOT's plan on
25 expanding protected bike lane and city bike station

1
2 to all, all, all underserved communities who have
3 always been the last one. Additionally, we hope the
4 Department will disclose its four-year Capital Plan
5 particularly intent of its goal and priority once we
6 recover from this pandemic as well as this cost of
7 proposed budget cut related to COVID-19.

8 Finally, the Mayor has recently committed to
9 opening 40 Meyers Street to pedestrians within a
10 month and 100 miles by end of summer. We look
11 forward to hearing how DOT plans to implement this
12 program and how it will be carried out equitable to
13 all community in need of open space.

14 My brothers and sisters, the opening of a street,
15 should be equal of the percentage of people dying in
16 different [INAUDIBLE 3:09:14] and the percentage of
17 people getting the coronavirus. If we have one
18 [Inaudible 3:09:21] that have one person dying by
19 [inaudible 3:09:24] or they have hundreds of people
20 with the virus compared to 2,000, then the opening of
21 the street should be the priority to the underserved
22 communities.

23 The MTA'S, I'm going to leave it there. Sorry,
24 the MTA 2020 adopted the operating budget back in
25 December prior to the outbreak of the corona virus.

1
2 As a result, they remain balanced. These private
3 [INAUDIBLE 3:09:48] in ridership and fair revenue.

4 Similarly, the authorities nearly adopted 2020-
5 2024 nearly 55 billion Capital program appears fully
6 funded pending federal approval of congestion pricing
7 and city and state contribution.

8 We look forward to having the MTA update the
9 committee on the state of the transit system during
10 this outbreak and its effort to minimize as possible
11 for both its unemployed and the city essential
12 workers.

13 Additionally, we hope to hear about how the MTA
14 will navigate it's future under the possibility of
15 significant funding cuts. Please, the MTA plan of
16 dedicating closing our transit, our train
17 from 1 in the morning to 5 a.m. should be part of the
18 timeframe. We should leave it up – the MTA should
19 explain to us for how long our train will be closed
20 from 1 in the morning to 5 a.m.

21 Finally, we look forward to hearing about the
22 MTA's recent decision on how, that particular
23 decision in how to close subways from 1 a.m. to 5
24 a.m. and how it is treating one of the new most
25 vulnerable population, the homeless.

1
2 I also look forward to hearing from the MTA on
3 how they will be helping those communities that rely
4 on the trains during this time.

5 Many of these New Yorkers do not have the luxury
6 of working from home and this closure will have a
7 significant impact on the community. Before we hear
8 from the MTA, let me take a moment to recognize -
9 well, I will leave it our staff to please call the
10 names, recognize the Council Members who are with us
11 right now. [SPEAKING IN SPANISH 3:11:37-3:12:01].

12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Chair
14 Rodriguez, I just want to make sure that people
15 understand that we're going to be talking to the
16 Department of Transportation now and then the MTA
17 will follow after that. We'll have a separate
18 hearing for that.

19 Today, but after the Department of
20 Transportation. So, I will now call on the member of
21 the Department of Transportation to testify. We will
22 hear testimony from Commissioner Polly Trottenberg.
23 Commissioner Trottenberg is joined by Elisabeth
24 Franklin Associate Commissioner for Budget and
25

Capital and Rebecca Zack, Assistant Commissioner for
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs.

Will the Committee Counsel please administer the
affirmation.

COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Thank you. I will now
administer the affirmation one time and you will be
called on individually to so affirm at the end.

Do you affirm that your testimony will be
truthful to the best of your knowledge, information,
and belief? Commissioner Trottenberg?

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Yes, I do.

COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Ms. Franklin?

ELISABETH FRANKLIN: Yes, I do.

COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Ms. Zack?

REBECCA ZACK: Yes, I do.

COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Thank you. Commissioner
Trottenberg you may begin when ready.

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Thank you. Good afternoon
Chairman Rodriguez and Chairman Dromm, and members of
the Transportation and Finance Committees. We want
to thank you for inviting us to testify on behalf of
Mayor de Blasio on DOT's FY21 Executive Budget and FY
20-24 Capital Plan.

1
2 Today, I am testifying on a far more challenging
3 budget than the one that I presented on March 9th,
4 shortly before the COVID-19 crisis overtook our city.
5 Like much of city government, DOT is now adjusting to
6 a new operational and fiscal reality, requiring us to
7 redesign, postpone or even cancel some programs,
8 while doing everything we can to provide for the
9 safe, efficient, equitable and environmentally
10 sustainable movement of people and goods in New York
11 City.

12 Many of the savings I will outline in this
13 proposed FY21 \$1.1 billion Expense Budget and \$10.3
14 billion five-year Capital Plan simply reflect the
15 reality of reduced service levels, operations, and
16 projects for 2020. And while we are still grappling
17 with the proposed funding reductions in this budget,
18 we know there will likely be more to come in 2021 and
19 beyond.

20 Additionally, with the COVID-19 crisis still upon
21 us, we face an unpredictable and less productive
22 operational environment. We must now perform our
23 work with a relentless focus on the health and safety
24 of our workforce, our contractors, and the public,
25 with social distancing, personal protective equipment

1
2 PPE, temperature taking, and sanitizing regimens for
3 our facilities, vehicles, and tools. We also face an
4 uncertain procurement environment as our contractors
5 and supply chain firms face their own COVID-19
6 impacts.

7 But I am proud to say that during this pandemic,
8 the team at DOT has been resilient, resourceful, and
9 dedicated to keeping our agency operating as safely
10 and productively as possible. And many DOT staff
11 have stepped up to volunteer on other city needs
12 during COVID-19, from food distribution to providing
13 masks for the public. I want to thank them all for
14 their service.

15 I'm first going to just go over the overview of
16 our budget but you can see its in the written
17 testimony, I wont read through the numbers. Both are
18 \$1.1 million Expense Budget and our \$10.3 billion
19 five year Capital Plan.

20 I'd like to turn to the immediate effects of the
21 COVID-19 crisis on our operations. DOT like many
22 sister agencies has felt the impact of the virus
23 directly with employees out sick and tragically some
24 lost forever. We mourn the loss of our colleagues
25 especially those on the front lines of DOT and

1
2 throughout City government and the MTA and are
3 grateful to all the essential workers putting their
4 lives at risk each and every day. And thank you
5 Chairman Rodriguez for kindly noting that.

6 In the face of the crisis, I'm proud to say that
7 DOT has maintained all the agency's critical
8 functions, including emergency infrastructure
9 repairs, operating, and expanding our speed camera
10 program and running the Staten Island Ferry 24/7. We
11 are now starting to resume more field operations
12 including resurfacing, sidewalk and pedestrian ramp
13 work, and pedestrian and bike projects and we are
14 working closely with our union partners to ensure
15 that our field workforce is properly socially
16 distanced, well-equipped, and fully supported.

17 This crisis had dramatically changed our city's
18 streets. Traffic is down significantly, which has
19 led to one bit of good news: a decline in traffic
20 fatalities since mid-March leading to the longest
21 period without a pedestrian fatality, 58 days, since
22 we began tracking by mode in 1983. However,
23 unfortunately, some drivers are taking advantage of
24 our much emptier streets to speed recklessly, and we
25 know we can never let up our vigilance.

1
2 DOT's speed cameras have issued almost double the
3 number of violations compared to before the crisis
4 and NYPD has stepped up targeted speeding
5 enforcement. And we are continuing our pace of
6 installing 60 new speed cameras each month and plan
7 to meet our goal of standing up the largest speed
8 camera in the world.

9 We have continued to grow Citi Bike with a focus
10 on addressing COVID-19 impacts. The system now has
11 14,500 bikes and 900 stations, more than double the
12 size of the system more than double the size of the
13 system at launch in 2013. We recently began expanding
14 into Upper Manhattan and the Bronx, where we are
15 installing 100 new stations, including stations at
16 Lincoln and Harlem Hospitals. We have also partnered
17 with Lyft, Citi and Mastercard to offer free year-
18 long memberships to essential workers on the front
19 lines of COVID-19. We are also answering the call
20 from many of you, including Speaker Johnson and
21 Councilmember Rivera, to open up the city's streets
22 to pedestrians and cyclists. Late last month, the
23 Mayor and Speaker announced we would open 100 miles
24 of streets, including 40 by the end of the month. We
25 are actively working with our sister agencies,

1
2 Council members, Community Boards, BIDs, advocates,
3 and others to achieve this goal and have thus far
4 opened nearly ten miles of city streets, and expect
5 to open many more miles that we have been working
6 with many of you on very, very soon.

7 Lastly, even amidst this crisis, we are working
8 with our contractors and partners at DDC to continue
9 critical construction work on the majority of our
10 capital projects, from transformational streetscape
11 improvements in Downtown Far Rockaway, to a new
12 community plaza space in Soundview, to a full
13 neighborhood reconstruction in Ozone Park, and the
14 next phase of our Grand Concourse project. And we are
15 continuing our critical bridge work as well,
16 including upcoming repairs and resurfacing on the
17 BQE.

18 Now that our agency has grappled with the initial
19 operational challenges of COVID-19, we are beginning
20 to look ahead to innovative approaches to help our
21 city and our economy reopen. We are grateful to the
22 Mayor for creating a Surface Transportation Recovery
23 Council, with representation from our sister agencies
24 and a broad group of experts, including advocates,
25 labor and industry leaders, and other stakeholders.

1
2 We hope to work with this Council on re-thinking
3 our streets and on getting people back to work safely
4 and efficiently, focusing on biking, walking, buses,
5 and ferries. The Council will also focus on how our
6 street network can help bolster businesses and
7 restaurants through public realm and access
8 improvements and support efficient commerce and
9 deliveries.

10 We know how important it is to seize the moment
11 and draw upon our experience during COVID-19, to
12 focus on making our city even more equitable,
13 healthy, safe, and sustainable. And we look forward
14 to the City Council and taking your input and
15 partnership in this shared goal.

16 But this brings me to our fiscal reality and
17 DOT's targeted savings of \$61.5 million in this FY21
18 Expense Budget. I think it is useful to contextualize
19 the impact that dollar amount represents. And you
20 can see in my written testimony's in charge that lay
21 out the numbers.

22 While DOT's operating budget is \$1.1 billion,
23 over 50 percent of that comes from State and Federal
24 grants, from the Capital Budget, or represents
25 revenue generating activities, like parking meter

1
2 operations and automated traffic enforcement, and
3 therefore making cuts to those programs would not
4 generate Expense Budget savings.

5 Of the approximately \$515 million remaining,
6 large portions are relatively fixed costs such as the
7 electric bill for streetlights and signals and leases
8 on DOT facilities or support the inspection and
9 maintenance of the essential infrastructure on which
10 all street users rely.

11 A final factor when looking for savings is to do
12 all we can to avoid layoffs, as the Mayor has
13 pledged. This means looking for savings where we can
14 from newer programs, like Green Wave or Better Buses,
15 which have more unfilled positions that can be cut
16 without laying off existing staff, which is not the
17 case for core DOT operations like roadway repair or
18 bridge maintenance.

19 Nonetheless, should more savings be required in
20 the coming months, we expect we will see further
21 budget cuts that will affect every part of our
22 agency.

23 In the area of Vision Zero, we have identified
24 \$10 million in total savings in FY20 and FY21 with
25 reduced spending on roadway markings due to current

1 contractor capacity limitations, reduced media
2 spending, and a delay in filling positions.
3

4 While we do not take these savings lightly, with
5 a total of \$1 billion spent on Vision Zero thus far
6 and \$3 billion allocated in this budget, our
7 commitment to eliminating traffic fatalities and
8 serious injuries remains steadfast. In our Better
9 Buses initiative, something I know Mr. Chairman you
10 have written about with great concern; we have
11 identified \$2.7 million in FY20 and \$5.7 million in
12 FY21 in total savings from delays in hiring and
13 reduced materials and supplies due to COVID-19.

14 The Administration remains committed to Better
15 Buses and increasing bus speeds, particularly as
16 traffic congestion returns to our city streets. We
17 still expect to invest over \$12 million from our
18 Expense budget into the SBS program in FY21, which
19 will enable significant work towards the goal of
20 speeding up buses as outlined in the Better Buses
21 Action Plan of April 2019.

22 Specifically, DOT still expects to install an
23 average of 7.5 miles of new bus lanes per year and
24 will meet our previous transit signal priority goal
25 of 1,000 intersections by the end of 2020. And we

1
2 still plan to move forward with bus priority projects
3 planned for 2020, including on 149th Street in the
4 Bronx, which serves Lincoln Hospital.

5 And we are open to adding additional projects as
6 resources and community support permit. With the
7 Staten Island Ferry, we identified \$6 million in
8 savings by reducing service and suspending lower
9 level boarding in response to a 90 percent drop in
10 ridership. And we have identified other
11 opportunities for savings throughout the agency,
12 including delaying parking meter upgrades and
13 reducing vacancies.

14 For DOT's Capital Budget, we rolled out \$1
15 billion from FY20-25 period into Fiscal Years 26 to
16 FY29. This is largely comprised of funding for the
17 BQE project, while keeping available for critical
18 near-term work on the structure.

19 Also, in the category of capital spending, DOT is
20 funded for about 600 lane miles of roadway
21 resurfacing, or around half of what we have been able
22 to achieve for five straight years under the de
23 Blasio Administration.

24 During my time as Commissioner, DOT has been
25 fortunate to have so many elected officials,

1
2 advocates, and other stakeholders supporting the
3 agency taking on more projects and initiatives each
4 year. And as DOT's mission has expanded, the agency
5 has grown by over 30 percent in the last six years
6 and added 1,000 new employees. But we now face
7 significant budget cuts, a citywide hiring freeze,
8 and restrictions on outside contracting.

9 And finally, as I touched on earlier, we also
10 face productivity challenges in light of the
11 operational changes necessary to safely resume our
12 work. But I am confident that DOT's creative and
13 resourceful workforce will find every way to make the
14 most of our still robust resources. Even if we are
15 unable to accomplish all that we would like, we will
16 continue to maintain and improve our infrastructure,
17 run the Staten Island Ferry, and implement vital,
18 innovative pedestrian, bike, bus, and safety projects
19 that will support the city's economic recovery and
20 quality of life.

21 In conclusion, I want to thank the Council for
22 its partnership, particularly in the face of these
23 unprecedented times. I am proud of all we have
24 accomplished together thus far. We have worked
25 together in every part of the city, including our

2 lowest income areas and not just those neighborhoods
3 with the loudest voices or the most privilege. I am
4 re-attaching some of the equity analysis of our work
5 that I shared in our Preliminary Budget testimony.

6 We remain eager to continue working together to
7 help our great city through this crisis, and to
8 create an even better New York City for tomorrow.

9 I am happy to take your questions.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
11 Commissioner. I appreciate you coming in and giving
12 your testimony.

13 I'm going to just talk a little bit about the
14 deferred bridge maintenance. Even with the current
15 need to make difficult budget decisions, we must be
16 careful not to repeat the mistakes of past recessions
17 and defer maintenance on critical infrastructure.

18 In the Executive Capital Plan, several
19 infrastructure maintenance projects were reduced
20 including a 27 percent reduction in the planned
21 Manhattan Bridge reconstruction and the \$23.3 million
22 shift into the out years for bridge painting
23 citywide.

24 Even before the pandemic, DOT shifted \$138.5
25 million into the out years with the Queensboro

1 Bridge, oh, excuse me, the Ed Koch Bridge
2 rehabilitations. Can you please detail all
3 maintenance projects that have been cut or deferred
4 from the East River projects, bridge projects and
5 explain why you think this is prudent.
6

7 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'm going to speak generally
8 and then I'm going to have Elisabeth Franklin pull up
9 some of the details and I think one of the general
10 things, we couldn't agree with you more Mr. Chairman.
11 We never want to go back to those days as you
12 recollect, when we had to shut the Williamsburg
13 Bridge down because the city had deferred maintenance
14 and you know, I think the Mayor since that time have
15 pledged to make sure that we always keep our bridges
16 in the state of good repair and I'm grateful to this
17 Mayor and this Council. We have had a lot of
18 resources to do so.

19 Certainly, as we have started to face budget
20 pressures, what we have done is take a hard look at
21 contracts where perhaps the schedule was not aligned
22 with how were actually going to be let the contract
23 and the BQE is certainly one of those examples or I
24 think as a lot of folks know, that project, we're
25

1
2 probably still a couple years away from the major
3 work.

4 So, we've had opportunities to roll some of those
5 projects out with not having a big impact on bridge
6 conditions but I'll let - Elisabeth, wants to speak a
7 little more to the specifics.

8 ELISABETH FRANKLIN: Am I unmuted. No, yeah, I
9 think I'm unmuted.

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: You are unmuted.

11 ELISABETH FRANKLIN: Yeah, the specific projects
12 that you mentioned - are going to match project
13 schedules in this past plan, this April plan. Even
14 the BQE because of the panel and everything else
15 we're rolling out some of the work and getting to
16 work on the most critical parts of it in the next
17 five years and we still have the money for later on.

18 But as to the other bridges you mentioned, I'm
19 going to have to get the specifics on what's
20 happening with each of those contracts.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm just going to just ask as
22 a follow up, with the BQE project, we get design
23 build on that right?

24 ELISABETH FRANKLIN: Yes.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And is there any timeframe in
3 which that needs to be completed in order for us to
4 continue with design build?

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well, you may remember we
6 were granted a few years ago. There were just
7 several particular projects that the legislature
8 granted that authority and then this past year, the
9 city was granted a blanket authority, which is good
10 news. So, that means we have more years for a whole
11 bunch of design build.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right, right, okay, thank you
13 for that clarification. The DOT did not provide
14 performance data on bridge on bridge ratings for
15 Fiscal 19, despite having this information in past
16 MMR's. Last year 57.8 percent of our bridges were
17 listed in "fair" condition.

18 Was this information in the 2020 PMMR and has the
19 percent of our bridges that were in the list, were
20 they rated fair or poor condition as that increased
21 in 2020.

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right, so I'm going to jump
23 in on this one and it is a bit of a complicated
24 question. A few years back, the federal government
25 created a new bridge rating system, which is a much

1
2 more I'd say sort of complicated and multifactored
3 system and New York City DOT and a lot of other you
4 know, bridge owners around the country have been sort
5 of struggling with matching the old system we used
6 with the new one. It's not an easy one to one
7 correlation and so, you know, we are still sort of
8 using our standard bridge evaluation protocols, very
9 continuous inspections that both the city and the
10 state do but we're still trying to make those two
11 methodologies mesh.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you have an idea when
13 that's going to be available or?

14 POLLY TROTTENBERG: I'm looking at Elisabeth on
15 this one. I'm hoping some time by the end of this
16 year we're going to have you know, a system. And
17 again, this is one where we're also working with
18 state, New York State DOT because they are one of the
19 entities that also inspects our bridges.

20 Okay, thank you. To address the increase in
21 cyclists deaths in 2019, the city launched a \$58.4
22 million plan. Green wave bike safety plan to enhance
23 street safety. Due to COVID-19 DOT has proposed a
24 PEG that would reduce funding for protected bike
25

1
2 lanes by \$3 million over 2020 and 2021. A 17 percent
3 reduction over the two years.

4 Given that we're asking New Yorkers to limit
5 nonessential travel on subway and buses and to
6 practice social distancing, is it prudent to make
7 such significant cuts to bike lanes?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: So, just, I think it's
9 probably important to distinguish between the Fiscal
10 Year 2020 cuts and 2021. Because a lot of what's
11 happening in 2020, is really just due to events on
12 the ground, due to COVID-19. I mean, we've all had
13 to pause different parts of our work as have our
14 contractors etc. And I think look, we want to work
15 with the Council on obviously with the shape of some
16 of these cuts are going to look like. We know there
17 is nothing here that any of us are excited to see
18 cut. We're just trying to find that right amount of
19 what we can spend and what we can actually
20 accomplish.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, DOT planned on
22 installing speed cameras in fiscal 2020 and 720 by
23 2021. Funded through \$81 million in capital funding.
24 Is DOT on schedule to install the 300 cameras in both
25 fiscal 2020 and 2021?

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We are, I want to thank my
3 team, because throughout the COVID-19, we have kept
4 on track with our speed camera installations and
5 maybe Elisabeth or Rebecca can dig up the latest
6 numbers and I think you know as I mentioned in the
7 testimony, I'm very glad that we've kept that program
8 expanding because we have seen practically a doubling
9 in the amount of speeding as traffic has gone down on
10 our streets.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Commissioner, can you
12 give us a list of where those speed cameras would be
13 broken down borough by borough and how they are being
14 selected. How are you selecting those locations?

15 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We use a methodology where we
16 - and one thing we're lucky is we get a lot of speed
17 data from city vehicles. We look at places where we
18 see high speeding and high KSI, which is Killed and
19 Seriously Injured. So, we're looking in places where
20 we see those two factors together.

21 And then there are places that are within the
22 quarter mile radius of a school and you know, they
23 are good places to place those cameras and I think
24 the methodology has proved very, very sound.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and one of the things
3 that's been quite popular, especially in my district,
4 are the bikes at Elmhurst Hospital. Any plan to make
5 those sites permanent?

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I think we would really like
7 to. I think one thing that has been terrific is how
8 much cycling has become an important mode of
9 transportation during coronavirus and so important
10 for healthcare workers. So, yes, we've done some
11 work with the other Chairman on this and would love
12 to work with our Council Members on this.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I really would like to
14 have that because we don't have Citi Bike here at
15 all. So, a long time waiting for that.

16 Thank you, Commissioner. I'm going to turn it
17 over to Chair Rodriguez now.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank you
19 Chair Dromm and thank you Commissioner for the great
20 work that you have done and as we know we have had
21 challenges and it's not an easy time for us.

22 Commissioner, what is the plan on cleaning, and
23 this question is MTA but also include DOT, when it
24 comes to some area related to train stations and we
25 had this conversation in the past on how I want the

1
2 MTA to include a plan to clean the stations, not only
3 inside in the train but also the entry of the
4 stations.

5 And it's coming from my understanding and my own
6 experience to say you enter the station let's say 176
7 compared to Broadway on 96 and 72nd. There's a
8 completely lack of cleaning in one side and the other
9 one is one to a whole purification. And when I
10 approach DOT and MTA on how can you also take care of
11 cleaning the entry because people also touch the
12 stairs when they come from the street. There's a
13 sidewalk like three feet away from the entry to the
14 station. So, they just throw them to DOT. They say,
15 that's not on us. That's on the city's
16 responsibility. It is or it's not. Can you look at
17 this and see how the whole plan of cleaning also
18 include if there is something that the DOT or
19 sanitation workers is involved by labor DOT also
20 include an effort to clean the entry of the stations
21 besides cleaning inside?

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I certainly think we can. I
23 think it would be helpful Mr. Chairman to get us
24 particulars about stations where you think this is an
25 issue and obviously -

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Be with me on this.

3 This is about priority. This is about you can take
4 in the station, call in the upper west side, call in
5 on the upper east side, call it the middle class,
6 upper class community. There are more resources.

7 So, I Would like the site that I can give you
8 149th 3rd Avenue that I can give you 176, I would like
9 for the DOT talk to the MTA to do the assessment and
10 the person they have assigned to clean inside, also
11 to look at the cleaning and the entry of the stations
12 up close the five boroughs.

13 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, well, I'll be happy to
14 talk. We're talking to the MTA every day on a
15 variety of topics, so I'm happy to talk to them about
16 this as well and I know you will be hearing from New
17 York City Transit Interim President Sarah Feinberg
18 next and I'll talk to her about it as well.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay but be with me on
20 this. They will say that this is the city. If point
21 blank the MTA is saying that they don't want the
22 responsibility on cleaning the entry. I just want to
23 be sure that if that would be the case -

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, I do have to take a
25 look about whether it is - whether it belongs to the

1
2 city or the MTA and if it's MTA property, what kind
3 of a protocol we would work out there.

4 So, let me speak to them about it.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and my second
6 question is on investments to improve our buses. As
7 you know, [INAUDIBLE 3:35:37] and come and be with me
8 on this too, this is about I take my year that I will
9 have to serving in government or to serving the
10 community, I would dedicate it to address the
11 inequality that we have you know, equity issue that
12 we have in the city. And I have even told the Mayor,
13 he make a lot of progress but I think the coronavirus
14 showed its face in the City of New York. When it
15 came to the poorest and the richest.

16 So, I think that for me, at this moment, like we
17 cannot go to the transportation community and say we
18 will take a pause for the next two years on investing
19 to improving buses. So, I don't want to put you on
20 the spot but I would like to at least be open to
21 explore a way on how we can restore the funding for
22 the Better Buses initiative.

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Certainly, Mr. Chairman and
24 just to be clear, as I said in my testimony, we are
25 still committed to doing a lot of bus lane work. Not

1
2 as much as we originally committed to in 2019 but we
3 are not putting a complete pause on that work but of
4 course, I think our message here is we fully
5 recognize this is going to be a negotiation with the
6 Administration and the City Council and these cuts
7 are painful. Nobody is enjoying finding ourselves
8 here and obviously we want to work with you all and
9 get a set of priorities that everyone can agree on.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But again, this is a
11 moment where we are seeing any other big cause and
12 fight you know, [INAUDIBLE 3:37:04] to the Black
13 Lives Matter to the justice, we have seen a lot of
14 energy of people who are embracing other fight. Not
15 necessarily a fight indirectly, I want to call all
16 the leaders and agency to understand. There's a
17 voice in the underserved community that say, this
18 should be a priority here. For my colleague in
19 government and if you talk about the Better Buses
20 plan, starting addressing priority to the underserved
21 community. Like, those are the ones because they are
22 sick. Last month, obesity, diabetes, plus
23 coronavirus, you know is equal to the so many people
24 dying because of the coronavirus.

1
2 So, I think that when we look about those
3 communities, those are the ones, most of them, that
4 they are dealing with transportation desert. They
5 have to walk 20 blocks from their apartment to a
6 train station, so whatever we can do to address it
7 also looking from a social class perspective, it is
8 important if we want to address what happened during
9 this time of the coronavirus. I said before, it
10 doesn't matter anyone leaving the cycle 10001.
11 Anyone can have it, anyone can die. But the numbers
12 there is high at the poorest neighborhood.

13 So, with the Better Buses, I want everyone to
14 look at the underserved community as they are opening
15 the streets as a top priority. In case we need to
16 cut, we should cut in all the areas that they already
17 have plenty of buses. That they already have plenty
18 good transportation. You know look at it. Look at
19 the upper west side, look at the upper east side,
20 look at the Long Island City. There is a ferry
21 there. Look at the new community going through
22 gentrification, they have better buses than the
23 poorest ones. So, I just want for you to you know,
24 to look at this and see how we can you know keep this
25 conversation going on.

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I just appreciate that Mr.
3 Chairman and obviously, that also will be a
4 discussion with the MTA and it is no secret that they
5 are facing you know, right now pretty devastating
6 budget situation. We'll say that there may be
7 another relief package down in Washington that helps
8 them but obviously, that's going to be something both
9 agencies are going to need work together with the
10 Council on.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and next question
12 Commissioner and I don't know if you have the number
13 in total, if you have it great and if not, if your
14 team can put it together, I would like to see and I
15 have some idea, we have some idea that the City of
16 New York and also the democratic and also the city
17 that we are in state, they lost some funding from the
18 federal government, so do you have any idea to what
19 percentage? How the number went down from the last
20 four years or Obama's Administration - to the last
21 four years Obama in the fiscal year, Donald Trump,
22 when he come to getting to federal funding to our
23 transportation system.

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right, I'll get you those
25 numbers but I will say, interestingly enough Mr.

1
2 Chairman, we have not seen — transportation has
3 actually not been an area where we've seen big cuts
4 during the Trump Administration. That's been
5 traditionally done in Washington, an area of fairly
6 bipartisan support and Congress has mostly kept those
7 programs somewhat held harmless but we'll get you
8 those details.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And do you think that — I
10 mean, question, have the DOT looked at asking good
11 contractors because we have good apple and we have
12 bad apple everywhere. In government, public,
13 private, academic, everywhere and I know that there
14 is a lot of contractors that they are good. They are
15 good ones. There is [INAUDIBLE 3:40:52] we need to
16 make them accountable. We need for them to get the
17 project done on time. We need to work with them to
18 control their prices.

19 Have DOT looked to start any conversation with
20 contracting by asking them or suggesting them to cut
21 the prices of projects by at least 10 percent and
22 that conversation has not happened. Do you see any
23 possibility that having conversation with
24 contractors, that they have projects from this budget
25 and the possibility that we also plan for the miss

1
2 for the budget, the 2021 budget, that we get
3 contractors to cut the prices by 10 percent on DOT
4 and across the agency so that we can get some savings
5 there and be able to invest this money in other
6 projects on transportation and across other agencies
7 in the city?

8 POLLY TROTENBERG: That's a good questions Mr.
9 Chairman and one that you may recall the MTA's did
10 their own experiment on where they sort of went to
11 their contractors, not who were doing heavy
12 construction projects, but they were doing different
13 consulting projects and asked them all to take a 10
14 percent cut.

15 I would say that the firms that were the hardest
16 hit by that we MWBE firms. They had the least
17 ability to absorb that kind of a margin, so, if this
18 is something we want to look at, we have to be very
19 careful because I think it hits the minority
20 contracting community the hardest of all. I do think
21 though that clearly, the city should take a fresh
22 look at all its financial commitments and see if
23 there are places we can get some savings, absolutely
24 and I think you know, some bids may come in lower now
25 because the contractors are more anxious for work.

1
2 But some contractors have also struggled as we have
3 at the city level with a lot of new expenses.

4 New cleaning protocols, new equipment, new
5 vehicles needed. So, I think the market is still
6 sorting itself out. I would just want to make sure
7 anything we did, did not you know, unduly harm the
8 DWBE community.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, so for the purpose
10 of time, I have a question but I will stop here, so
11 that our colleagues also get a chance to continue
12 asking questions.

13 Thank you Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you so much Chair
15 Rodriguez. And now, let's go to our Council Member
16 questions.

17 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: If any Council Members have
18 questions for DOT, please raise the Zoom raise hand
19 function and you will be called upon in the order in
20 which you have raised your hand.

21 Council Members, please keep your questions to
22 three minutes, including answers. Please wait for
23 the Sergeant at Arms to tell you when your time
24 begins. The Sergeant will then let you know when
25 your time is up.

We will hear please from Council Member Powers followed by Council Members Menchaca and Adams.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time begins now.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you. Nice to see you Commissioner. Thanks, I've been talking to your team on a few items, I want to say thank you to all the folks at DOT.

A couple quick questions here. The first being, one of the ideas that other city's have had and I've been talking about in trying to see if the city can put together a game plan. Is as we're doing a reopening some time in the future about ways to - to me it seems like bars, restaurants are going to be the last one's to be able to reopen and likely with capacity reduction. So, I think you had mentioned this but one of the things I'd like to see and perhaps my district can serve as a template or pilot for this, is to look at maybe expanded space in the streets, curbside, sidewalks, to help those businesses be able to do outdoor serving. Do the capacity reduction inside to be able to take better advantage of space on the outside and to help those businesses out as they are going to have a slow phase in and reopening and I would be curious to hear if

1
2 the DOT is – where you are on that and also, if you
3 would be willing to work with me and I know some
4 other colleagues who are interested in this, maybe to
5 have a call or a meeting, a virtual meeting about
6 this with stakeholders to talk about the various
7 different hurdles, challenges and likelihood that we
8 can do something like that.

9 I'll start there and then I have two short
10 questions.

11 POLLY TROTTENBERG: We are absolutely thinking
12 about it and I'm happy to say sister agency are as
13 well, particularly small business services and Indel
14 Castillo[SP] whose part of her bailiwick at MOME is
15 looking at larger restaurants, city planning and we
16 all recognize and there was a story about it
17 happening Vilnius with Lithuania of turning over a
18 part of the streets and sidewalks, so restaurants can
19 space out and do social distancing.

20 There is sort of an interagency group that's
21 looking at sort how you would management and some of
22 the permitting issues and we've been also talking to
23 the Restaurant Association.

24 I agree your district might be a great place to
25 start to test this out and I'm happy to have a team

1
2 of folks that can act with you on it. It would be, I
3 think a wonderful way to help restaurants start to
4 generate some business again and bring some socially
5 distance life back to our streets.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you and I think
7 we'd have to talk to SLA and other stakeholders to if
8 we're talking about service. But I would be glad,
9 I'll look forward to their call.

10 Second and last here is just in terms of the open
11 space in general beyond just a serving but one is
12 Rockefeller Center 49th and 50th, we've talked about a
13 lot. They've been looking to also be part of the
14 open streets program wanted to hear feedback on their
15 ability or that ability in my district to be able to
16 use those cross you know, sort of through streets
17 that go adjacent to the plaza. And second, around
18 Grand Central lots of open space, lots of
19 opportunities there. If you could just talk to us
20 about any plans around that might be in the works
21 around Grand Central.

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well, as you know and I want
23 to thank you know many of your colleagues and
24 community boards and bids have been coming to us with
25 a lot of ideas on open streets and you know, I think

1
2 we've tried to evolve a model where we're being very
3 light touch and obviously not having NYPD stand at
4 every corner.

5 Those obviously are some iconic locations that
6 you are talking about but are happy to put them on
7 the list and talk to you about them. Again, we're
8 trying to lean in and open up as many streets as we
9 can while dealing also with any place that has a bus
10 routes or emergency vehicle routes, just trying to
11 make sure you know, they don't impede anything that's
12 important in terms of COVID-19 workforce or emergency
13 vehicles.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you. If you
15 can have somebody follow up on the open street stuff,
16 that would be great and thank you to Chair Dromm and
17 Chair Rodriguez for the time.

18 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we'll go to our next
20 Council Member please.

21 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: And we have questions from
22 Council Member Menchaca followed by Council Member
23 Adams.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you everyone and
3 thank you to the Chairs for this hearing and thank
4 you Commissioner.

5 So, my first question is really something that we
6 had talked about before in terms of really working
7 with local neighborhood infrastructure to be a kind
8 of component of the safe streets and open streets.

9 So, I wanted to see if there was any change. I
10 know that the NYPD last time really talked about
11 officers being a part of that and I'm hoping that
12 we're going to hear something different from you in
13 terms of really shepherding a kind of community
14 driven safety plan one. Two, Citi Bike expansion I'm
15 sure has been impacted and I think a lot of folks in
16 Sunset Park who are essential workers might want to
17 engage in that program in using Citi Bike. And so,
18 what are the expansion possibilities in terms of kind
19 of COVID related neighborhood, essential worker
20 populations like Sunset Park? And then the final
21 question is, those essential workers, many of them
22 are immigrants and non-English speakers. And I'm
23 thinking about our work during Vision Zero and how we
24 really focused on hearings that were multilingual and
25 sometimes non-English and how are bringing that

1
2 population into helping shape the, what is becoming a
3 very kind of clear like hate. Council Members, you
4 decide what streets to close and rather making it
5 more participatory in process and design.

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right, and just to be clear,
7 it isn't a hey Council Member, you decide. We
8 actually have had our borough commissioners offices
9 reaching out to Council Members, to community boards,
10 to local neighborhood associations and certainly
11 trying to do it in multiple languages. I'm sure
12 there are ways we can do better and I think we would
13 love to the extent that any of you want to, happy for
14 you to help facilitate groups we should talk to. We
15 do want this to be a you know, this is the way the
16 model - sort of a top down, PD manding all the
17 barricades. We are looking for a community driven
18 model, but we recognize some communities, more people
19 may be able to bring some resources to the table.
20 Some not, but certainly where there is an interest,
21 we're ready from the city's point of view to step in
22 and help and bring resources as needed.

23 So, if there are streets, neighborhoods, areas,
24 you know, in any of the districts you all represent,
25 let us know. You know, in Brooklyn ferries on the

1
2 ground ferrying all those requests through. And I'm
3 sure, in your district, I can think of a lot of
4 places where we could really successfully open up
5 some streets.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Wonderful. Citi Bike?

7 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yeah, City Bike.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And then the open
9 streets community infrastructure.

10 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yeah, I mean, Citi Bike, we
11 are you know, trying to work on the expansion best we
12 can. You know, while the coronavirus is on and
13 making sure again, I mean one challenge I think we're
14 starting to work our way through, is making sure we
15 can reach out to communities. When people come home,
16 when community boards are you know, not all of them
17 totally up and running or they are sort of having
18 Zoom meetings which you know, not everybody is
19 technology enabled. But we also certainly see you
20 know, what a huge boom Citi Bike has been during
21 coronavirus for healthcare workers.

22 So, I'd love to sit down with you in a socially
23 distance way and talk about what else we can do down
24 in your district for sure. You know, I want to thank
25 also, you know, Lyft and Citi and Mastercard for

1
2 stepping up and offering you know, year long free
3 memberships to all essential workers, healthcare
4 workers, frontline city workers, people working in
5 food pantries.

6 So, certainly for those of you who have it in
7 your district, make sure you know those folks can get
8 free yearlong memberships.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And then activating the
10 kind of community infrastructure for open space
11 rather than the police?

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, again, I mean I think
13 if you look at the, I happen to live near one of the
14 open streets, PD is really, they are coming in the
15 morning to put in the barricades, coming by a little
16 bit during the day to monitor it as our DOT staff and
17 park staff but mainly, it's just sort of open and the
18 community is keeping an eye on it. It's very light
19 touch for PD and that's the only way we're going to
20 get to 100 miles. We're obviously not going to do
21 that with a PD heavy model.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
23 We need to move onto the next Council Member please.

24
25

1
2 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we have questions please
3 from Council Member Adams followed by Council Members
4 Lander and Cabrera.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you so much. Thank
7 you Chairs Dromm and Chairs Rodriguez for this
8 important hearing. Hello Commissioner, it is always
9 good to see you. Thank you for your partnership over
10 the years.

11 Commissioner, you know, over the years that I've
12 been elected, it's just been a couple but you know
13 that I represent areas of Southeast Queens and for a
14 very long time our sectors were not really given
15 priority by DOT.

16 So, when I came in, I kind of boosted that
17 priority to the top of the list to try to get
18 repaving done and a lot of other things done. Four
19 way stop signs and just a lot of things that paid
20 attention more to the safety you know, of our
21 pedestrians and our commuters.

22 So, we know that DOT has a limited time frame
23 where the roads can be repaved now. To what extent
24 and again, I'm being selfish about this, as I'm sure
25 my colleagues get selfish about their work in their

1
2 districts. To what extent has street repaving been
3 delayed as a result of COVID-19?

4 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Not selfish to care about
5 your district for sure and is has been a great
6 partnership with you, we appreciate it.

7 You know, we took a pause on our major
8 resurfacing you know, basically for a little over a
9 month while we retool that whole operation to make it
10 safe. To make sure that the work that crew has had
11 all the masks and cleaning supplies and equipment
12 that they needed. That we had adequate vehicles, we
13 retooled the schedules, how people mustered at that
14 facilities. We did everything we could.

15 We have now got our resurfacing program up and
16 running again. Our lane mile target for this year is
17 1,100 miles. I don't think both due to the pause and
18 due to the sort of all the new protective measures
19 we're taking that we're going to quite get there but
20 we're going to try to get as far as we can.

21 You know, I'm happy to say folks are happy to be
22 back at work. Now, just as I highlighted in my
23 testimony. I do want to make sure Council Members
24 are aware for my five year capital plan. This coming
25

1
2 year, I'm only budgeted now for around 600 roughly
3 speaking lane miles.

4 So, that will represent a big decrease in
5 resurfacing in the coming year after this one.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay, thank you very much.
7 I'm just going to jump here really quick because I
8 see the clock goes very fast.

9 We know that litter and dumping has been a big,
10 big problem for a very long time. Our parkways and
11 expressways continue to experience just a horrible
12 amount of litter right now. So, what role is the DOT
13 playing in the cleanup of our parkways and
14 expressways in the era of COVID-19?

15 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: I mean, we have arterial
16 maintenance crews which do clean up and again, as I
17 said we had to do some pausing while we retooled our
18 operations to make them safe. Our folks are back out
19 there again and Council Member, if there are places
20 where you are particularly seeing a garbage
21 accumulation, let us know. Let Nicole Garcia know
22 and we will send crews out to do a cleanup.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Van Wyck Express Way, just
25 saying.

1

2

POLLY TROTTENBERG: Van Wyck, okay, dully noted.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you.

4

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we'll go to our next

5

Council Member, thank you.

6

COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we please have Council

7

Member Lander followed by Council Member Cabrera and

8

Council Member Rose.

9

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your clock

10

starts now.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Commissioner to

12

you and your team for all your hard work. It was

13

good to see you out in the first hours of open

14

streets on Prospect Park West and I know you guys are

15

working hard to make that work and spread it as the

16

Chair cares rightly so much about all around the

17

city. I also really appreciate that vigorous street

18

rethinking you spoke about, what Paris has done in

19

accelerating bus and bike lanes, Corona Peace Day as

20

they are calling them is truly impressive and it's

21

amazing right now during the reduced traffic to see

22

how fast, on time and effective our buses can be and

23

I really hope we can build on that with more

24

protected bus lanes both during the emergency and

25

beyond. And I also really like the idea you were

1
2 discussing with Council Member Powers as cities have
3 done from Atlanta to Wuhan and opening up our streets
4 to restaurants, to serve outdoors in this crisis and
5 I'd like to raise both of my Zoom hands for my
6 district to be able to participate in that as well.

7 Moving on to the budget, it was not so long ago
8 when we stood together in the rotunda as the Mayor
9 signed the dangerous vehicle abatement program to
10 help address the risks and harm caused by the city's
11 most reckless and recidivist drivers and we might
12 have hoped that the COVID-19 crisis would make us all
13 treat human life as more precious but sadly, the
14 opposite seems to be true when it comes to speeding
15 and recidivist reckless driving.

16 Before the crisis, the number of drivers who had
17 15 or more speed camera violations in a single month
18 was usually zero and sometimes one, two, three, maybe
19 five. In March it was 18, in April it was 180
20 according to research compiled by Brian Howl[SP?].
21 In just the three months since February, nearly 700
22 vehicles have received 15 or more speeding tickets.
23 It's a 3,000 percent increase from the same period
24 last year and like you, I'm so grateful that with
25

1
2 more people inside, no one has been killed. But with
3 that kind of increase, it's just a matter of time.

4 So, even in this pandemic, we really need that
5 dangerous vehicle abatement program. Funding was not
6 included in the Preliminary Budget because we had
7 only just reached agreement on the program and when I
8 asked you about it at the Preliminary Budget hearing
9 before this awful crisis, you indicated that the plan
10 was to include it in the Executive Budget.

11 Unfortunately, the Executive Budget includes no new
12 needs. So, that means there's no funding in the
13 budget right now to implement this program, is that
14 correct?

15 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: That's correct.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I just want to make
17 sure I have the number right here. I think I got it
18 wrong in a conversation with Streets Blog earlier.
19 What we need for FY21 for this program is \$1.6
20 million, is that right?

21 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Yeah, Streets Blog, I don't
22 know where that number came from.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: It came from me, so I
24 gave them the wrong number.

25 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Okay, there you go.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So, that's about one
3 tenth of one percent of the DOT budget and I don't
4 want you to have to cut another \$1.6 million from
5 anything because you've already made the painful cuts
6 we're talking about today but since the Mayor
7 committed to this program at the signing ceremony and
8 since it remains important and since we continue to
9 see recidivists reckless driving, I really hope City
10 Hall -

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Can find the \$1.6 million
13 we need to save lives and get this program started as
14 we agreed on and I know you want to do as well.

15 POLLY TROTTENBERG: I mean, I will just say
16 Council Member, you know, no doubt it certainly is
17 painful. We all stood together celebrating your
18 great accomplishment in getting this program passed
19 and I think we look forward to discussions about when
20 we can resume this one. Obviously, you know, it's
21 not only a budgetary matter, we have a hiring freeze.
22 We have more or less sort of a pause on contracts.

23 So, there's several elements we need to work
24 through if we're going to stand up a new program but
25

1
2 obviously, we know we'll be talking to you about
3 this.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Next
6 Council Member please.

7 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we have questions please
8 from Council Member Cabrera followed by Council
9 Members Rose and Reynoso.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your clock
11 starts now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much. I
13 first want to thank the Chairs for getting to us
14 colleagues quickly. I want to acknowledge that,
15 thank you so much. It means a lot.

16 Also, Commissioner, I want to thank you for the
17 work yourself and the Bronx Commissioner in the
18 borough that you did in my district this last year.
19 I know when we have the issue of corona, you know, it
20 tends to cloud over the work that was done this last
21 year.

22 So, I want to personally thank you. You being
23 here in my district and we felt a difference in our
24 streets. So, I want to thank you, personally thank
25 you for that. I wanted to ask you three quick

1
2 questions. One is related to E-bikes, as you know,
3 the state gave us a green light on looking for if you
4 could give us some leadership and just implement some
5 policy, so we don't have to legislate it through in
6 the Council.

7 Second, and as you know, the advocates have been
8 asking for this and in light of the fact of what I
9 heard Chair Dromm mention with the Citi Bike, I
10 couldn't think of a better timing that we could have
11 to have the E-bikes for our healthcare workers and
12 other essential workers.

13 And second question is related to jobs. How much
14 margin do you see that we have right now if we don't
15 get the federal help that we're so hoping. At what
16 point do you let go? Do you find yourself forced to
17 call for layoffs and also, equities, I hear about
18 streets, perhaps being closed for restaurants, models
19 that we see in other countries and pilot programs. I
20 will hope that communities of colors will be included
21 in that. I know everything usually is focused in
22 Manhattan and what I don't want to see is, our people
23 living for the Bronx, going over there while
24 restaurants over here keep hurting and so, if we can
25 work on that. And last question, which I haven't

1
2 heard anyone talk about this. You know, summer is
3 coming, they are going to have 90 degree days, 95
4 degree days, 100 degree days, you know, we're already
5 getting the tense global warming. How do
6 construction workers in streets, they will use face
7 masks. I mean, it is right now, it's so hot. Is
8 there technology they could use, I don't know, have
9 you guys talked about that? I would appreciate your
10 input in all these four questions.

11 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Alright, let me make sure I
12 get them all. I think first on the e-bikes and the
13 e-scooters, we do need to work with the Council. We
14 need to work together to have them officially
15 legalized. We stand ready to work with you all as
16 soon as possible. I certainly think as many of you
17 have said over the years, you know, the delivery
18 workers on their e-bikes have become real hero's and
19 I think the city is very grateful and want to work
20 with you all as quickly as you can to work out a
21 protocol on those.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you.

23 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Refresh my brain, on the
24 restaurant question, absolutely, I hear you. You
25 know, obviously we're hearing from a lot of the

1
2 Manhattan bids but you know, we were also working
3 with the Third Ave bid in the Bronx on an open street
4 and we certainly want to make anything we would do
5 with restaurants available in a bunch of different
6 neighborhoods.

7 We're thinking that through and obviously hearing
8 interest from all of you about commercial areas in
9 your districts would be helpful. And I apologize,
10 the other two questions were -

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Related to the jobs, how
12 much margin do we have right now before we layoff in
13 mass for the summer.

14 POLLY TROTTENBERG: So, in jobs and again, I
15 think this is part of why you know, this budget
16 discussion is a difficult one. You know, when I look
17 at an agency like mine, where we have exciting new
18 programs that we were looking at, like the reckless
19 driver program of Council Member Lander. Part of the
20 reason we're not funding that is because where
21 programs that involve hiring new people are on a
22 pause.

23 So, we're trying to sort of preserve the city
24 workforce we have with a hiring freeze and I think it
25 is the Mayor's plan and OMB's plan to try and

1
2 maintain that. That we have no layoffs, but I think
3 also, you've heard the Mayor say that the fiscal
4 picture is uncertain. We're hoping from federal help
5 but certainly from the point of view of DOT, we're
6 looking to do everything we can to avoid layoffs, to
7 take care of our own workforce. But that does force
8 some of those difficult choices about do you hold off
9 then, delay for some period of time new programs and
10 new hiring.

11 In terms of the masks, you were right, they are
12 hot and you know, as I said, we certainly took a
13 pause in our roadway, in our sidewalk work and a
14 number of our outside contractors to figure out the
15 new protocols. To make sure that our employees are
16 safe, that they can socially distance, that they have
17 the right equipment. That vehicles and tools and
18 everything are being sanitized as they need be.
19 That's a question we're going to grapple with. It's
20 a general question that construction workers deal
21 with during heat conditions. Often times they work
22 reduced shifts, they will get out of the sun in the
23 middle of the day. So, I presume we'll probably even
24 have to do more of that.

1
2 There are a lot of different mask technologies
3 out there and maybe there are some good ones. The
4 ones that I have seen though, the particularly the
5 high quality ones, they do tend to be – they tend to
6 make you warm for sure.

7 So, that's another thing we'll have to think
8 about with our workers. Thank you for pointing it
9 out.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much. I
12 just want to remind Council Members, we do have the
13 MTA coming in at 3:00 p.m., so if we could keep our
14 questions short, that would be very helpful. Thank
15 you, next Council Member please.

16 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Questions please from
17 Council Member Rose followed by Council Members
18 Reynoso and Gjonaj.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Rose, your
20 clock starts now.

21 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: We are having some
22 difficulty with muting the Council Member.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Can you hear me now?

24 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: We can, can you restart the
25 clock.

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yes, your clock starts now.

3 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you. Hi,
5 Commissioner and thank you Chair's Dromm and
6 Rodriguez. The Department will use state funding of
7 \$1.5 million in Fiscal 2020 and \$6 million in Fiscal
8 2021 in the out years in place of city funds for
9 costs associated with the Staten Island Ferry. By
10 eliminating the lower level boarding at the Staten
11 Island St. George Ferry terminal, DOT anticipates
12 saving \$909,000, \$100,000 in Fiscal Year 2021 only.
13 Why is it that there is a savings program in place if
14 additional state funding of \$6 million was added and
15 will be used in Fiscal Year 2021? And will DOT amend
16 the current lower level boarding to include senior
17 and persons with disabilities and are you going to
18 remove the lower level boarding plan?

19 POLLY TROTTENBERG: I've got the questions and
20 look, certainly as you know Council Member, we've had
21 a lot of challenges with the Staten Island Ferry. We
22 saw ridership plummet by around 90 percent and we
23 started having a lot of challenges with our
24 workforce. A lot of folks testing positive being out
25 sick and quarantining and so, you know, we thought it

1
2 was prudent to as you know, reduce service
3 frequencies and that has enabled us to regularly
4 clean and sterilize the boats. Important both for
5 our workforce and for the passengers. Now, everybody
6 has all the proper PPE's. Masks, we're also giving
7 masks away at both terminals and just to preserve the
8 workforce, we saw for example that low level
9 boarding, we were getting very, very low numbers.
10 They are always open for people with disabilities and
11 people with bikes. There is a separate entrance that
12 they use but the bigger lower level boarding, we were
13 seeing you know, on some of the runs, we were
14 literally just getting a handful of folks.

15 So, as we see ridership numbers start to rise
16 again, we will take a look at those but for now, we
17 were serving very few people and -

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: The question was that
19 state, the state apparently put funds in for the
20 Staten Island Ferry, so why did that necessitate a
21 cut and I want to get you to say this also, are you
22 going to commit to reinstating full ferry service
23 every 30 minutes after the pause for 24/7 after the
24 pause?

25

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right, so we're grateful that
3 the state gave us that money. We're using it for the
4 ferry but you know, the city overall is facing you
5 know a billions and billions of dollars of revenue
6 losses. By the end of the year an extra -

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: \$3.5 billion in coronavirus
9 costs, so again, since the ridership had plummeted so
10 dramatically with the ferry, it's one of the ways the
11 city is you know, looking to reduce some of its
12 expenditures. We have said, as you know to your
13 colleagues you know as ridership starts to go off, as
14 we have better workforce availability and we are sure
15 we have all the protective equipment, we will start
16 to rekindle the service again.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: For the record, I wanted
18 that.

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'm sorry.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I wanted to put you on the
21 record. I wanted to get you on the record saying
22 that.

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well, you know, I want to be
24 a little cautious in that I can't totally predict the
25 trajectory but and I think as we have said, as we get

1
2 back to you know normal levels of ridership, we will
3 continue with normal levels of service with one
4 caveat. The sanitizing of the boats and making sure
5 they are safe for passengers and for the crew is a
6 new factor here that we're going to have to work in
7 with all of our operations.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our next Council
10 Member.

11 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we have questions from
12 Council Member Reynoso followed by Council Members
13 Gjonaj and Miller.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your time
15 starts now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you. Hello
17 Commissioner, I hope you are doing well and I hope
18 that everyone in the Department of Transportation is
19 doing well.

20 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just wanted to, I
22 wanted to focus on businesses and really focus on
23 street closures in an attempt to expand their space
24 in order to allow for the reopening to when it
25

1 happens to be helpful and productive to these
2 business owners.

3
4 I'm also going to plug Grant Street, from Drig
5 all the way up to the waterfront. I've actually had
6 three businesses come to me looking to know if they
7 could put chairs out in the streets. I said, you
8 can't take chairs down the streets by yourself, you
9 have to let DOT do it, but just really good this
10 time. It seems like a lot of people are biking, they
11 are. A lot of people are biking just by the way, I
12 just want to say there's a shop that is like a 400
13 percent increase in sales of bikes since the
14 coronavirus.

15 So, a lot of those people are doing this more.
16 It is a time where there are less cars in the road to
17 really take advantage about putting bike lanes down,
18 closing those streets, adding plans in these cases.
19 Shutting streets for pedestrians and for businesses.
20 So, I just wanted to ask, I know you said you got a
21 team together. When can we expect something, some
22 form of study or conversation coming from the Mayor
23 that speaks to the advantage of our supposedly less
24 frequented streets?

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well, I would certainly say
3 based on what I am hearing from all of you today you
4 know as I mentioned, the Mayor has started up a
5 surface transportation council. I clearly want to
6 put this high on the agenda and work with you all
7 because it appears there is a big interest in it.

8 You know, I want to be careful now, some of the
9 streets that are being referenced I think you
10 mentioned Grant Street. I think that's a bus route
11 and a truck route, so obviously we'll have to work
12 through some of those details but I think I'm hearing
13 loud and clear from many of you this is something you
14 are hearing from local businesses and I think could
15 go a great way towards making our streets you know
16 safer and more inviting in helping some of these
17 restaurants and stores start to open up and see some
18 business again.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Any other questions -

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: One more quick one.
21 It's just I want to exercise that Grant Street north
22 of Drig is not a bus route actually south is. So, I
23 just want to make sure that that's noted.

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, north of Drig.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just really want to
3 highlight and put a top priority businesses streets.
4 Thank you, Commissioner.

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I would just say again all
6 our Borough Commissioners are taking incoming from
7 everybody on all the streets they would like us to
8 look at and we're trying to be quick and nimble in
9 that. So, you know, I look forward to taking a look.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Let me get my
11 pitch in for the restaurants and streets as well.
12 So, if you are taking notes, please consider Jackson
13 Heights Elmhurst. Alright, we will go to our next
14 Council Member.

15 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Council Member Gjonaj
16 followed by Council Members Miller and Koslowitz.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your clock
18 starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. I want to
20 thank the Chairs and thank the Commissioner. I just
21 want to echo and I will pick up on this also, the
22 entire borough of the Bronx, sidewalk café's rather
23 than just a district commissioner. The restaurants
24 need it, it will add a little activity to what is now
25

1
2 desolate. I want to pick up an echo on some of the
3 comments about trash.

4 We've discussed this in prior hearings as well,
5 when it comes to the MTA and DOT and the
6 responsibilities between sanitation, the MTA is only
7 responsible for two feet from the building structure.
8 The rest of the sidewalk falls into no mans land.
9 And we go back and forth on this often. Sanitation
10 says it's DOT, DOT turns around and says it's MTA and
11 this seems like Ground Hogs Day all over again, which
12 now Segway's right into the parkways. Last year, we
13 had quite a few conversations about parkland, who is
14 responsible for maintenance, who is going to do the
15 work. It falls into that not my responsibility
16 category similar to the train stations. I'm hopeful
17 that we can avoid a replay of last year where the
18 grass grew to a point of four plus feet high.

19 It is not what we like to see. I am hopeful that
20 you will be working this out with the other
21 Commissioners whether it be Parks Commissioner or
22 Sanitation. Ahead of the scheduled precut season and
23 I think I'll wrap it up with that.

24 So, Commissioner, if you can give me a commitment
25 to working on the grass. The cleanup of the trash,

1
2 I'm echoing open up the open up the entire borough of
3 the Bronx, where permitted while understanding we
4 have ADA compliance on sidewalks, we need wheelchairs
5 to get by and the other requirements and where we
6 have tree pits that's obviously going to be another
7 problem.

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We'll make sure we try and
9 get ahead of the grass issue we had last year and I
10 think we did finally work it out. We'll get on top
11 of that and look, again, I'm glad to hear from all of
12 you how much interest there is in opening the streets
13 up to restaurants and businesses and really want to
14 take that back to the Mayor and my sister agencies
15 and get to work on how we can start to make that
16 happen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And I want to correct you
18 on something that you said earlier about where you
19 are putting cameras in and where road dieting is
20 going in.

21 You said you rely on incidents, the report that
22 was issued. I'll bring up Moss Park again, it was
23 delisted from the high priority but yet it was
24 included into road dieting. So, when you refer to
25 avenues where there are high incidents or number of

1
2 crashes or fatalities, that has been the case. It's
3 arbitrary on where you install or where you do rode
4 dieting or where you implement other traffic
5 measures.

6 And I rather you -

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Hold true to decide where
9 you are going to implement them.

10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. We'll go to
12 our next Council Member.

13 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we hear please from
14 Council Member Miller followed by Council Members
15 Koslowitz and Levin.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time starts now, Council
17 Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good afternoon everyone.
19 Chair Dromm and Chair Rodriguez. Commissioner, it's
20 good to see you again. I'm glad everybody is healthy
21 and safe. I have a couple questions, first on the
22 Better Bus network that we listed, that we all have
23 been working on.

24 In lieu of the proposed cuts, do we have the
25 capacity to implement the transit signal and priority

1
2 that we had anticipated, as well as some of the work
3 that we've started in major hubs such as Archer
4 Avenue and other places throughout the city. You
5 know, we had the plastic bollards and that didn't
6 work and they came out and we have other plans.

7 Are we going to have the ability to see these bus
8 networks be – see them to full fruition in the work
9 that we had started? So, hopefully we can do that.
10 And then, I want to talk about some of the signage
11 and the shop work that has been late to say the
12 least. We have a complete area where the signs are
13 almost damaged, you don't know where you are and
14 signs that go down. It takes years for them to be
15 replaced and so, we're very much concerned about
16 whether or not the cuts that we see are going to
17 impact the work that we behind on.

18 And then finally, Council Member Adams introduced
19 last legislation, last she had co-sponsored that
20 would examine the need for one way streets in areas
21 that have high density now that didn't endure the
22 type of density years back and so, I think the
23 initial response was that the legislation was not
24 necessary because the borough Commissioners head
25 capacity [INAUDIBLE 4:18:59].

1
2 So, over the past two years we have done one
3 street, a total of two blocks and we have two cars
4 can no longer drive down these streets. They need to
5 be one ways and we're hoping that we can see that
6 work continue to be done.

7 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Alright Council Member, let
8 me try and answer your questions. First of all, I'm
9 happy to say, we are keeping pace with transit signal
10 priority. We're going to hit our target this year.
11 That work, I think we're going to be able to continue
12 to do at the same pace. We've actually - I want to
13 compliment our traffic office team; they've continued
14 over the past few years to find ways to do that at a
15 more and more affordable price and have really gotten
16 good at doing it. So, we'll keep up with that.

17 I know unfortunately the Archer Avenue pilot did
18 not work so well, but Archer Avenue is still very
19 high on our list. Something we're going to be
20 talking to the MTA about. I mean, we recognize we
21 have to continue to figure out some ways to make that
22 route work better. We'll come back at you with some
23 ideas there.

24 On signage, are you saying you are seeing places
25 where signs are falling down and not being replaced?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yes, some have actually been taken down and we have asked to put them back and they are kind of, where you have the daylighting on the corners and people want to park on the corners, so they've actually removed the signs. And so, we've asked that they be put back up and there is a number of locations that haven't gone up for nearly two years.

And then some are just faded, totally faded.

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Let me take a look at that. And on the one way streets, I think, if I remember the bill and I'm not sure I completely - it was sort of requiring us to look at them every - it just seems like it was perhaps a lot of work to get it what is clearly sort of a targeted problem in some neighborhoods and I think our process has been that the Community Board has to sign off on the one way streets and I think that's sort of I think what's holding things up perhaps in Southeastern Queens and maybe we need to meet with Council Member Adams just brainstorm a bid about how to deal with that log jam.

[INAUDIBLE 4:21:05] street conversions.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thanks. We have to
3 move on. Thank you. Our next Council Member please.

4 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we please have Council
5 Member Koslowitz followed by Council Members Levin
6 and Cohen.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member, your clock
8 starts now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Okay, thank you. It's
10 good seeing you. I'm wondering you may have spoken
11 about this before, I had to leave for a little while.
12 The construction on Queens Boulevard bike lanes,
13 where is that at?

14 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Well, that's a good question
15 Council Member. At the moment, there were some
16 things we were trying to wrap up with that project
17 before coronavirus hit. Some work with a design firm
18 and our state and federal overseers. Coronavirus has
19 kind of put that on a bit of a pause. So, at the
20 moment, I don't have a totally clear answer about
21 when we're going to move forward with that project.
22 So, that's one we're going to have to come back to
23 all. It's hit a few snags related to COVID-19.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Okay and one more.
25 The fences along Queens Boulevard up until now have

2 been replaced rapidly. Will budget cuts prevent that
3 from happening when a car goes into it and takes it
4 down?

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, I mean, that is not
6 something where we want to see any reductions in
7 terms of replacements.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Okay, thank you and
9 thank you for everything that you do.

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Council
12 Member and we're going to go to our next one. We
13 have three more after this.

14 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we please hear from
15 Council Member Levin followed by Council Members
16 Cohen and Richards.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Levin, your
18 clock starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, hi Commissioner.
20 So, I just wanted to – one quick point following up
21 on what Council Member Lander spoke about, the need
22 for the increased accountability on repeat speeders.

23 You know, the numbers that he cited are beyond
24 alarming, a 34 increase in repeat speeders and so,
25 you know, if we're going to be looking at increased

1
2 social distancing probably well into the coming
3 fiscal year, we need to make sure that there are
4 resources in place to reduce that, whether it's
5 through the enforcement or you know under the
6 enforcement under the existing law or NYPD
7 enforcement, speed cameras and all the above.
8 Because it's a huge hazard and people should not be
9 getting away with that repeat dangerous behavior.

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean at least they are
11 getting a lot of speeding tickets. Obviously some of
12 them it's not quite teaching them the lesson we would
13 hope and look, as I said to Council Member Lander you
14 know, obviously this will be a discussion with the
15 Council about what is just going to be the timing in
16 this budget climate for standing of new programs. We
17 certainly agree that this one is an important one.
18 We're just dealing with you know, some difficult
19 budget realities at the moment.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, but just I mean,
21 it's directly related to the pandemic itself. You
22 know, the situation is made worse because of the
23 social distancing.

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I will just say, it is a
25 strange phenomenon which is speeding is way off but

1 you know, knock on wood, fatalities are way down.

2 It's a strange combo at the moment and look, I don't

3 want to take it for granted because as more people

4 start to get out in the warm weather, those facts

5 could change. You know, again, we're not lacking in

6 vigilance and we are, just so you know, with all the

7 speed camera data we are getting, we are getting it

8 regularly to PD to show them the corridors where

9 we're seeing the most egregious speeding and they are

10 trying to do targeted enforcement in those areas.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, alright, just let's

12 keep that conversation going because you know, it's

13 just one that will save lives, so I think it's

14 important to gear up on that. Okay, thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.

16 Next Council Member.

17 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we please hear from

18 Council Member Cohen followed by Council Members

19 Richards and Grodenchik.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will start now.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very much. Good

22 to see you Commissioner.

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Hi Council Member.

24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I'm not going to ask you
3 about Mosholu Parkway right now you know, but I am
4 concerned about one particular project that we've
5 been working on and you know, I'm concerned of
6 potential budget impacts. We've been working on
7 trying to come up with some kind of resolution for
8 private streets and I'm curious if you know the
9 status, I've been promised that we were very close to
10 coming up with a proposal but I have not been briefed
11 if there is one yet and now, I'm a little concerned.
12 I would really hate it, like, this is an ongoing
13 problem in my district. It's really one I'd like to
14 solve before I leave and time is starting to tick on
15 me.

16 So, I wonder if you know the status of that and I
17 know it's a citywide problem as well as my district.

18 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Right, and we've heard about
19 in you know, most of all in Staten Island but it is a
20 challenge in at least probably four of the five
21 boroughs, probably a little less though in Manhattan.

22 Look, I think the challenge is for the city to
23 assume ownership of all the private streets is sort
24 of an epically expensive undertaking, billions, and
25 billions of dollars. I think the question we've been

1
2 grappling with and it's probably an even more acute
3 question in these difficult fiscal times is, is there
4 some system for looking at the streets most in need
5 of repair. You know probably in the most underserved
6 neighborhoods and is that a place to start? And I
7 think that's where the conversation was headed. I'll
8 admit I don't know that we achieved resolution and
9 now, we would have to look at that in light of the
10 current budget climate but I think that would be
11 potentially the way to go, which is come up with some
12 kind of you know, an evaluation system of the streets
13 that we're most in need of repairs. You know, in the
14 most, probably disadvantage neighborhoods with the
15 fewest resources and prioritize those to start with.
16 And then maybe that can be a part of this budget
17 negotiation you know, if that's something members
18 have an interest in.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I mean, I have some orphan
20 streets that really you know, they happen to be in
21 more [INAUDIBLE 4:28:07] district, but I don't know
22 that you know, if you can't drive to your home, I
23 don't know what the answer is. You know, the streets
24 apparently belong to long defunct associations and
25 they are really orphans and the conditions are

1
2 abominable. There just has to be a resolution and
3 you know, whether the you know, there is a lot of
4 times where I think as a guiding principle, people in
5 the greatest need but you know, it's not passable. I
6 don't know if it matters unless you happen to be able
7 to afford a tank to drive home.

8 We just need to make sure that people can get to
9 their homes.

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, look it's an enormous
11 challenge. The problem is the scale of it is sort of
12 a multibillion dollar challenge. So, again, you
13 know, I'm happy to continue that dialogue you know,
14 as part of these budget deliberations. It's
15 certainly something we can talk about but it does
16 come with a big price tag.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I'd like to know if we
18 could get a timeline to find the status at least of
19 what your work -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Council Member Cohen, happy
22 to follow up with you on this topic.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Okay, I'll reach out.
24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We are very
3 pressed for time, so I'm going to move onto the next
4 Council Member please.

5 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: May we please hear from
6 Council Member Richards followed by Council Members
7 Grodenchik and Holden. I'm sorry Council Member
8 Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I hope that's not
10 cutting into my time but thank you Commissioner for
11 all your work and you hear trucks in the background
12 of this hearing, that is trucks repaving Francis
13 Lewis, so I want to thank you finally, it's been a
14 long time coming. As a matter of fact, I can't even
15 leave my block because they have blocked off all the
16 blocks, so thank you for the work that you are doing.

17 I wanted to hear a little bit more about Far
18 Rockaway Plaza and I know you mentioned it early, so
19 we don't anticipate any budget cuts there. I also
20 wanted to add, just ask a few things. Of course, I'm
21 supportive of SBS and we try to preserve that as much
22 as possible to move people in buses during this
23 period in a safe manner. And then I wanted to hear
24 about the Bike Share Program, align bike for instance
25 where are we at with that specific program and I also

1
2 of course, have to hopelessly plug South Queens, you
3 know, we heard about these open street programs but
4 quite frankly, we didn't see any streets in Southeast
5 Queens. Are we not worthy enough for open streets?
6 I'm a little troubled by that.

7 So, I'm hoping that your administration is
8 certainly looking at opening up some streets in South
9 Queens somewhere and if you know, I'm sure Council
10 Member Miller and Adams have some recommendations and
11 you would have some recommendations for open spaces
12 for our community.

13 So, that's where I'm at Far Rockaway Plaza.
14 Thank you for paving, Bike Share, of course SBS,
15 let's keep that going and then also, open streets for
16 Southeast Queens.

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Alright, thank you Council
18 Member. As I mentioned, the Far Rockaway project is
19 moving forward. It's on schedule, I think we're
20 starting construction this construction season.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And that's about \$30
22 million right, still? So, we have not cut that.

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, we'll have to check on
24 that number and I think anticipating completion in
25 2022. Would be delighted to work with you and your

1
2 colleagues on open streets. You can reach out to the
3 Borough Commissioners office. We have a survey you
4 can fill out online but obviously we want to get to
5 100 miles and that will hopefully take us into the
6 district that wants us and every neighborhood that's
7 interested in this. We're very excited about that.

8 In terms of bikes and scooters. So, I think as I
9 was saying to your colleagues, we've seen a big
10 explosion and interest in cycling during COVID-19.
11 We're going to as part of the Mayor's, this surface
12 transportation Council that he's put together, take a
13 look at all the ways we can expand cycling. We're
14 going to have Citi Bike be a part of the council and
15 I know you had certainly had an interest in the
16 Rockaways in perhaps being one of the first sites for
17 e-scooters and for that, we you know are you know,
18 working with the Council to sort of take steps that
19 are needed to legalize those here in the state.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you, stay safe.
21 I look forward to following up on those items.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Next
23 Council Member please.

24 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Council Member Grodenchik
25 followed by Council Members Deutsch and Holden.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And that will be it, thank
3 you.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you very much.
6 Good afternoon Commissioner. Just quickly, I know
7 you are concerned about this as the Transportation
8 Commissioner. You know, I represent the eastern rim
9 of Queens along with Paul Vallone and Daneek Miller
10 and Donovan and I am extremely concerned as I know
11 you are that once we start to go back to work and
12 people may be a bit leery of getting on the subway,
13 not that I have any subways in my district, but I am
14 concerned that we are going to have Carmageddon or
15 whatever you want to call it because there's really
16 no easy way to get Eastern Manhattan or Western
17 Queens and I'm sure the same is true of Southern
18 Brooklyn going into downtown Brooklyn.

19 So, my suggestion, my colleague Daneek Miller is
20 a great champion and I've joined him on the Atlantic
21 ticket and Andrew Cohen has also joined us to open up
22 Metro North and the Long Island Railroad in New York
23 City at a much reduced cost. Now, I know that you do
24 not run the MTA, but I know that the Mayor has
25 appointees on the MTA board and we would love to have

1
2 your and the Mayor's support on this issue because it
3 basically costs nothing because very, very few people
4 are riding the trains as it is.

5 It would be a great way, the infrastructure,
6 exists, we are not building subways uphill side
7 avenue. We're not going to build a subway in my
8 lifetime anyway on the Long Island Express Way or
9 even out to Southeast Queens. The money just isn't
10 there.

11 So, I would appreciate that and the other thing
12 that I would like you to think about and I know it's
13 not even in New York City but also again in the MTA's
14 bailiwick and I'll be talking to the governor's
15 people about this, a park and ride at Belmont Park.
16 We have a train station there, they could run trains,
17 they could run a couple of trains at rush hour. I
18 know that thanks greatly to the intersession of Chair
19 Leroy Comrie of the Senate Corporations Committee.

20 We will be getting a full time train station
21 there but this would be something that could be done
22 quickly. The parking is there, it's not like people
23 are going to the racetrack because it's not even
24 open.

1
2 So, it would be a way to do it cheaply and just
3 to put those thoughts in your mind and I will yield
4 my other 50 seconds. Thank you.

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you Council Member. I
6 would say we are certainly focused on the issue of
7 the sort of Carmageddon as you say, the Council, the
8 Mayor has put together, he is going to look at that
9 and his two MTA appointees Bob Lynn and David Jones
10 are on the Council. So, I will certainly make sure I
11 talk to them. I think we totally agree with you,
12 we've all been champions of making city ticket or
13 whatever, freedom ticket, whatever it's called more
14 available to city residents you know, in affordable
15 prices, a very good idea.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I mean just in
17 Adrienne Adam's district at Rochdale Village, you
18 have 6,000 families living there. That's hundreds of
19 people you could take off buses and out of cars right
20 there and get them into Manhattan in a half an hour.

21 Thank you.

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you for the suggestion.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we have our next
24 Council Member please.

1
2 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: We have a final question
3 from Council Member Holden.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Hi Commissioner.

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Hi Council Member.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thanks for your great
8 testimony. Thanks for sitting through this. By the
9 way, the open streets in Forest Park is working well.
10 Thank you very much for that.

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Glad to hear that. Do you
12 want some more?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You would never expect it
14 from me right, but it is working well and people are
15 enjoying it. But anyway, graffiti has exploded in my
16 district. I don't know if you touched upon this
17 because I had to step out for awhile but - and I
18 think it's all over the city now and I know you
19 suspended the program of cleaning it for a while.
20 When do you expect that to get on board again?

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We are restarting that
22 Council Member and if there are places where you are
23 seeing a lot of graffiti, let Nicole Garcia's office
24 know and we will get folks out to do some cleaning.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But I also have some
3 volunteers that are willing to help out if we got the
4 paint. Is that a possibility? Because sometimes you
5 know, it's so over whelming that, we want to get the
6 graffiti off within 24 hours. It's not always
7 possible for the city to do it but we have
8 volunteers. I'd like to match the paint.

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: In some places you would
10 paint over and some places we bring chemicals that
11 actually melt the graffiti away. So, I'm happy to
12 talk to you about that. I don't think we're turning
13 down volunteers if there is a place, they can be
14 useful.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Great thanks, thanks
16 commissioner and a couple other points. I want to
17 just echo, we have a lot of trash on the arterial
18 highways.

19 You know, so, it's bad in normal times but now it
20 is much worse, so I will talk to Commissioner Garcia
21 about that. And is there anyway to expand the Adopt
22 a Highway Program to get more businesses or people
23 involved in that?

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, we have had various
25 times sort of made a push on that campaign and in

1
2 light of actually the budget hardships the city is
3 facing, probably good to do another round and that's
4 something we've actually typically done in
5 conjunction with Council Members and Borough
6 President. So, we can come back to you on that.

7 Great, thanks Commissioner. Thank you Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much Council
9 Member. We do have one more from Council Member
10 Deutsch. We skipped over him and I'm sorry about
11 that. Council Member Deutsch?

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. Hi, good
14 afternoon everyone. So, I have two questions. My
15 first question is regarding speed cameras. So,
16 although I don't condone speeders, you have the speed
17 cameras around the schools throughout the city and
18 the schools have been closed. The question is, are
19 those cameras still in operation and number two, if
20 they are, what is the rationale behind it? And my
21 second question is, is when you continue to do all
22 the essential work for the infrastructure, is that
23 work going to be given to New York City contractors
24 opposed to contractors who are based out of state?
25 Because our businesses have been suffering even

1
2 before COVID and over COVID, they have been suffering
3 tremendously.

4 So, I want to know how many contractors does DOT
5 use that are out of New York City and if you do have,
6 how many if you could consider using New York City
7 contractors?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: So, our contracting as you
9 may know Council Member is done under some of, I
10 think the most complicated procurement rules in the
11 land and for us, it partially depends on where the
12 funding comes from. If the funding is federal, then
13 I'm not able to have a New York preference. If it's
14 state, I'm not necessarily able to have a New York
15 City preference and if it's just local funding, then
16 I have to work through the city's procurement roles
17 and all that. We certainly want to support local
18 firms and I think a lot of our contracts do come from
19 New York City firms and I'm actually going to have my
20 folks, maybe we can check on what that percentage is
21 but I always in the case of my procurements have to
22 follow whatever are the relevant procurement rules. `

23 Which you know, depending on -

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: You do have contractors
25 based out of New York City correct?

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Oh, quite a few, yes, for
3 sure.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, so that's
5 something that we should look into.

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'm happy to get you that
7 percentage. On the speed cameras, the bill that the
8 state passed last year expanding the program, does
9 allow us to run them year round you know, all day
10 long. And I think look, we recognize school is out
11 but I think as you are hearing today in the
12 discussion, speeding has doubled on our roadways.
13 It's been astonishing and anyone I know who has been
14 out and just, I certainly see this in my own
15 neighborhood, cars going at tremendous speeds. And
16 so, we think right now, those cameras are really
17 doing a lot to save lives and we want to keep them
18 on.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Alright, because people
20 are questioning if those cameras are in operation,
21 maybe we should let them know, so this way it will
22 reduce speeding and it doesn't become a gotcha
23 camera.

24
25

1
2 The focus of it and the objection of having those
3 cameras is to reduce speeding and we need to let the
4 public know that those cameras are in operation.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much and
7 now, Chair Rodriguez will close this hearing out and
8 we're going to move right into the MTA portion
9 without a break.

10 So, Chairman Rodriguez, did you want to close us
11 out on this part of the hearing? Is Chairman
12 Rodriguez unmuted?

13 COUNSEL STEPHANIE RUIZ: It appears that we've
14 lost Chair Rodriguez's audio.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so we'll give him an
16 opportunity when he comes back. Because I think we
17 should move on to the MTA at this point.

18 I do want to thank you Commissioner Trottenberg
19 for coming in and for providing testimony and we're
20 most grateful to you. We'll follow up with other
21 questions later on.

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you Mr. Chairman and
23 thank you Chairman Rodriguez.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Absolutely, thank you very
25 much. So, I'm now going to call on the members of

1
2 the New York City Transit to testify. We will now
3 hear testimony from Interim President of the New York
4 City Transit Sarah Feinberg. Op, your back. Yes,
5 okay, yes Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I have a few quick -

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, certainly.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, I don't know what
9 happened [INAUDIBLE 4:42:45] -

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chair Rodriguez, did you want
11 to make a statement?

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I would like to, I have -
13 whatever happened, I was disconnected right now, I
14 did have some final question to the DOT Commissioner.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so, I think she may
16 have left, but what we'll do is we'll follow up with
17 questions. I'm sorry, we didn't hear you responding.

18 Okay, it's hard to hear you. You are breaking
19 up.

20 Commissioner Trottenberg is here, do you want to
21 ask?

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I do, yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, go ahead.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner - can you
25 hear me?

1

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No, we can't Chair.

3

4

POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yeah, you are a little hard to hear.

5

6

7

8

9

10

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, so Commissioner, I do have some final questions and I would like also to call the attention of the MTA should be patient. They did not come to the Preliminary Budget hearing and they should give the time for us to ask the questions we have today.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Commissioner, I have - [INAUDIBLE 4:44:10] electrical bike and electrical scooter, as you say that you are ready to work with us. I personally, as the Chair of the Committee is ready to work with Speaker Johnson, my colleague and advocate. But we also have to figure out some safety concern that also has been brought by some senior citizens and other residents. Are you also looking at, are definitely will be on board [INAUDIBLE 4:44:40] for the electrical bike and electrical scooter be legal but are you also looking at a way to some safety concerns?

23

24

25

POLLY TROTTENBERG: I apologize Mr. Chairman, you are fading in and out a little bit, I didn't quite get the whole question.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: With the DOT, are you
3 looking to some safety matter related to the
4 electrical bike and electrical scooter that should
5 also be addressed as you move forward on conversation
6 with the Speaker, my colleague and also residents,
7 especially the senior citizens as we would like to
8 legalize electrical scooter and electrical bike?

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean, of course Mr.
10 Chairman, this is going to be a conversation with the
11 Council and you know, as you know that the state bill
12 actually did not legalize them in Manhattan, only
13 legalized them potentially in the outer boroughs upon
14 the Council's and the Administrations action. And
15 obviously, I think if we're going to move forward
16 with the scooters, we would do it as a pilot project
17 were we would test it out perhaps in a less dense
18 neighborhood and make sure we did very much figure
19 out the safety protocols and that it was something
20 people felt comfortable with.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Are you open to work from
22 your role with the Administration and the possibility
23 that we give a forgiveness of parking ticket to first
24 responders -

1
2 POLLY TROTTENBERG: I'm sorry Mr. Chairman, you
3 cut out again.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chairman Rodriguez, let's
5 take this up in written questions, we can't hear you.
6 We're having technical difficulties. Can you hear
7 me?

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: One second and I will
9 reenter.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chair Rodriguez, we have MTA
11 here and they are only staying until 4:10. Chair
12 Rodriguez, can you hear me?

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I do. I'm trying to
14 enter through my other phone if that's okay. Can you
15 hear me now?

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Quickly please.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can somebody unmute me.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chair Rodriguez, we're going
19 to have to move on and we'll get back to you and
20 allow follow up questions at a later time because we
21 have only a few minutes left. We are already way
22 over schedule.

23 So, I want to thank you Commissioner for coming
24 in and we'll follow up with questions with you at a
25 later time.

1
2 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yes, we'll take all the
3 questions and provide the Committee with answers.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much.
5 Alright, we're now going to move on to the MTA New
6 York City Transit and I'm going to ask my colleagues
7 who will be joining us for the end portion of the
8 hearing to remain on the Zoom excuse me, and anyway,
9 we have been joined by - now, I'm lost. Okay, by
10 Sarah Feinberg. Ms. Feinberg is joined by David
11 Keller, the Acting Director of Budgets and Janno
12 Lieber the Chief Development Officer.

13 I'm going to ask the Council Committee, the
14 Committee Counsel, excuse me, to please administer
15 the affirmation.

16 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Thank you. Do you affirm
17 that your testimony will be truthful to the best of
18 your knowledge, information, and belief? Ms.
19 Feinberg?

20 SARAH FEINBERG: I do.

21 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Mr. Keller?

22 DAVID KELLER: Yes.

23 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Mr. Lieber? Is Mr. Lieber
24 with us?

25 JANNO LIEBER: I do.

1
2 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Thank you. President
3 Feinberg, you may begin when ready.

4 SARAH FEINBERG: Okay, thank you so much and
5 thanks for holding this hearing. Good afternoon, and
6 thank you for having me, particularly to Speaker
7 Johnson and Chairs Rodriguez and Dromm. My name is
8 Sarah Feinberg, I am Interim President of New York
9 City Transit. I'm joined by Janno Lieber, MTA Chief
10 Development Officer and President of MTA Construction
11 and Development, and David Keller, Acting Director of
12 Management and Budget for the MTA.

13 Like every government agency, organization and
14 industry across the country, the MTA has been hit
15 hard by the COVID-19 pandemic. Developing our
16 response has been my biggest focus since starting as
17 Interim President at New York City Transit. Things
18 are moving quickly, and our incredible workforce has
19 not missed a beat. I am awed daily by their
20 dedication. They are the backbone of every action
21 we've taken, stepping up day after day despite their
22 own fears and anxieties.

23 Last week, we made the historic decision to close
24 the subways overnight from 1 to 5 a.m., which has so
25 far proved successful in shoring up the safety of our

1
2 system. Hundreds of cleaners and staff have been
3 mobilized for this effort to more aggressively clean
4 and disinfect stations, subway cars and buses. We
5 are also working with the city to connect more
6 unsheltered New Yorkers with the critical services
7 they need and deserve during this difficult time.

8 We wouldn't be able to do this work without the
9 partnership of the city and the NYPD. It's crucial
10 that we continue to work together in the long term to
11 protect our brave and heroic workforce, essential
12 customers, and those who will return to the subway in
13 the future. Closing the system overnight was a
14 painstaking decision that we did not take lightly.
15 The subway is part of the fabric of New York City and
16 it is core to our identity as a city.

17 For 115 years, the MTA has operated service 24
18 hours a day with only rare interruptions. But
19 extraordinary times call for extraordinary measures.
20 People who devote their careers to transportation
21 don't relish any moment when they have to close it to
22 the public. And yet, in these strange times, I could
23 not be prouder of the heroic work that was done last
24 week. It was a herculean logistical challenge,

1 brought together on an unbelievable timeframe, and
2 New York City Transit more than rose to the occasion.

3
4 If there is any silver lining to the overnight
5 closure, it's that we're not just cleaning more
6 often, but we're changing the way we clean. We've
7 prioritized testing of innovative solutions like UV,
8 antimicrobials, and electrostatic sprayers that we
9 can continue to use once this crisis passes and we
10 get used to a new normal.

11 This week we began piloting UV technology for use
12 on subway cars and buses. We're looking to see if
13 UV's are more efficient and less expensive than our
14 current efforts. The bottom line for our customers
15 is that things underground will look different than
16 what they're used to. But they can trust that safety
17 is always our guiding principle.

18 I can't emphasize enough just how vital a role
19 the city's support plays in our response. I'm
20 grateful for the commitment we've received from the
21 NYPD to secure stations while our crews execute this
22 vital cleaning program. More than a thousand
23 officers have been patrolling overnight. The bottom
24 line is that the MTA is a transportation agency and
25 our experts use is not in social services.

1

2

3

The subways are not a replacement for the shelter system and this is where we need the city to step up and keep stepping up. Not until the weather breaks or a cold spell is over, but day after day for the long haul.

7

8

Protecting public health and safety is at the core of every action that we have taken. The MTA has been a global leader among transit agencies since day one, acting more quickly than our national and international counterparts, some of whom have only just started to adopt measures we put in place weeks ago.

14

15

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Madam President, may I ask you to summarize because we have very limited time.

16

17

SARAH FEINBERG: Yeah, I actually was trying to do so and skipped large portions which probably made it feel a little disconnected but -

19

20

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, okay, thank you very much I appreciate it. Thank you.

21

22

SARAH FEINBERG: Would you prefer I just take questions?

23

24

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, thank you for that
3 offer. That would be wonderful, thank you very, very
4 much.

5 SARAH FEINBERG: You ask me a broad array of
6 questions and we'll probably hit everything I was
7 going to say.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, I think we'll cover
9 everything is right. Thank you, thank you, that's
10 very kind. I appreciate it. And our first
11 questioner is Council Member and Co-Chair Rodriguez.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: First of all, I'm a
13 little, not a little - I am disappointed. Now with
14 the new President of the New York City Transit. A
15 lot of respect to you and I look to keep working with
16 you but now we have to be dealing with the pressure
17 because we only have 40 minutes, 50 minutes. That's
18 unfair.

19 They didn't come to the Preliminary Budget, now
20 is the time for us, I get it, especially you Chairman
21 of Finance and my colleagues they can be tired, long
22 day but for us to be rushing the time and cutting the
23 time from five to three minutes and now rushing and
24 not to hear specific from the MTA, because they have
25 to step out and go to another meeting, that's

1
2 unacceptable. That New York City can not be only
3 seen as the one that they come for help when they
4 need support from the congestion price. When they
5 need additional capital when they need \$1 million.
6 We should be asking them to have as much time as
7 we're needing. At least from the perspective on how
8 much time we need the MTA.

9 If we from the Council have to cut the time
10 because we have other business to do, I understand
11 it. But for me, this is unacceptable from the MTA as
12 an institution but going straight, you know, I'm very
13 disappointed when it comes to the MTA when we
14 announced at the beginning that they needed to clean
15 this station including the entrance to the station,
16 that the answer that I got was, directly from their
17 communication person, that that's on the DOT
18 jurisdiction.

19 So, now, again, President of the New York City
20 Transit, you know, the whole team, not on a personal
21 level but as an institution, are you committed to
22 also take responsibility to clean the entry way
23 stations, so that a station in an underserved
24 community is as clean as those at Columbus Circle.
25 at 96th and 72nd and Broadway.

1
2 SARAH FEINBERG: So, first of all, can you hear
3 me? So, first of all, thank you for the question.
4 First of all, we've had good conversations before by
5 phone and I'm happy to continue those conversations
6 with you one and one and with your colleagues and
7 also when it's more appropriate when we're beyond the
8 pandemic. Obviously, happy to meet in person as
9 well.

10 I apologize that our time is short today. I
11 think in the future, if there is more notice on the
12 hearing, we might be able to accommodate more folks
13 to meet for longer but I can assure you that every
14 station is being cleaned regardless of what
15 neighborhood it is in. We have flooded the system
16 with more than 2,500 cleaners and they are hitting
17 every station, every car and they are hitting
18 stations twice a day.

19 And so, the suggestion that we are only cleaning
20 some stations is just, it's just false.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The entry of the station
22 in underserved communities, are they, the entry, is
23 that on the DOT responsibility or is that under the
24 MTA responsibility?
25

1
2 SARAH FEINBERG: Well, if you are referring to
3 something that's within the station itself, that's
4 something we're cleaning but if you are referring to
5 something that's outside of the station, we're
6 unlikely to be cleaning that because that would be, I
7 assume city property.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, exactly. So, we can
9 see and please, the coronavirus is put in the face of
10 this city for us to see that the station aren't as
11 clean in all the stations across the neighborhood, go
12 and tell that story to people who live in the Bronx.
13 Go and compare, take picture, and see how the station
14 in underserved communities and then look at Columbus
15 Circle. You are saying that they are cleaned the
16 same.

17 SARAH FEINBERG: Sir, I absolutely believe that
18 they are being cleaned, absolutely. Now, I cannot
19 tell you what is happening outside of the station. I
20 can promise you that just owning every single car and
21 cleaning every single car in our fleet, and every
22 single station twice a day is about all we handle at
23 this point. I can't vogue for what's outside of the
24 station.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and this time, it's
3 not about the things that we can do after the
4 coronavirus, for God sake.

5 SARAH FEINBERG: No, this is something that we'll
6 con-

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: For God sake, they left
8 New York and left the city. They went to the Hudson
9 Valley; they went to the [INAUDIBLE 4:58:20] they had
10 3,000 square feet in their apartments.

11 You know, from where we had the big numbers of
12 people, the larger numbers with the virus and dying?
13 In the poorest neighborhood. They take the train.
14 You know people who have the privilege to work from
15 their house, from their apartments, the undocumented
16 New Yorkers. The working class New Yorkers.

17 So, unless the leadership in our state and the
18 city understand that equity is a big issue and we
19 continue to put a band aid on this crisis. We would
20 not be ready to be prepared for the second wave of
21 this coronavirus.

22 So, first, we need pay attention across the
23 board, not only to the inside of the station but at
24 the entry to the station and then when you look at
25 what things that we can do, I would like to know for

1
2 how long will the train be closed from 1 in the
3 morning to 5 in morning. And I know the answer can
4 be for as long as it takes on the coronavirus but
5 you know, who is waiting to know the timeframe?
6 Those who need to take the trains in the morning.

7 So, do you have a plan on for how long the train
8 will be closed from 1 to 5 am?

9 SARAH FEINBERG: So, what the Governor has said
10 and what I certainly agree with is that we will
11 continue to clean the system and serge the system
12 with cleaners throughout the pandemic. So, the
13 safety of our workforce and the safety of the workers
14 that we're moving and our ridership is our top
15 priority. And so, we're going to continue to clean
16 the system over night through the pandemic and sir, I
17 think I agree with you that the health of our
18 ridership is number one.

19 I disagree with the fact that you are suggesting
20 that the system is clean in some places and not clean
21 in others. If we have issues there, I want to know
22 about them. We are trying to make sure that we are
23 doing everything we can to keep the system as clean
24 and as safe as possible for everyone.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

In terms of the overnight service, we're also making sure that we - for those who are depending on the subway service between 1 and 5 in the morning, we have added an enormous amount of bus service. We've enhanced local service, we've added additional express route, express but service and we're also offering our vehicle for hire program for those whose commutes would be longer than 1 hour and 20 minutes and require 3 or more stops.

And so, I believe from the numbers that I am seeing that we are accommodating folks but if there were folks that were unable to be accommodated, we absolutely want to know about it.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think my last question, I know that my colleagues also have a question. Is about you know, in my conversation and my comment, is about being walking around, driving around to the poorest area in this country. When you look at where do we have transportation deserts, most of them are not in the middle class and not in the upper class. It's in the poorest neighborhood where we have the most issue transportation desert. Where you have the people in other crowded stations, especially at this time, where also the MTA should control the

1
2 physical distance. And this is a challenging one,
3 because I agree with you and the Governor, we were
4 not built to address physical distance, but one thing
5 is clear, all New Yorkers take the trains, but who is
6 dying?

7 SARAH FEINBERG: Look, excuse me, I'm sorry, I
8 didn't mean to interrupt you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, all I'm saying is
10 special attention should be given to the underserved
11 communities. That's where I'm coming from and I
12 think it's not a matter for me to or any Council
13 Member to give any particular station, to give you
14 to. I think that if the city is the one responsible
15 to clean the entry of the station, and our purpose is
16 for the rider to have a welcome entry, I'm not the
17 one that should be given you and sending photos to
18 the institution. The institution should do that
19 assessment.

20 How clean are the stations, are the entry in each
21 station in the City of New York. But again, I just
22 hope that we can take the approach that you know,
23 look at the numbers, look at the people dying and
24 yes, the trains in the station is a vehicle to where
25 the coronavirus spread. But what happens then, that

1
2 most people who get the virus are in the underserved
3 community.

4 It's the same train that go from City Hall to
5 96th Street and keep going up to 96th Street to the
6 Bronx, so why people are dying, those who live in the
7 poorest area? Why does people have the highest
8 numbers of cases with the virus are there. So, I'm
9 going to share with you what I heard from many riders
10 which is about we need to clean not only the entry,
11 we need to clean the end of the station and also, we
12 need to preserve the plan to upgrade our buses. We
13 need you to work with DOT, so that the funding that
14 is probably going to be cut, the program to upgrade
15 the buses in our city should be restored.

16 I know that this is the city's
17 responsibility but the MTA should be engaged in the
18 conversation.

19 Thank you Chair and thank you President.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and just
21 to be fair also, you know, we were running behind on
22 our schedule, we went over at least 20 or 25 minutes.
23 So, I do recognize that as well. We got a late
24 start.

1
2 But anyway, let's go now to our next Council
3 Member to ask questions.

4 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Okay, Chair Dromm. The next
5 question is from, I apologize for a frozen computer.
6 Can we hear please from Council Members Miller,
7 followed by Cabrera and Holden.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, good afternoon
10 Madam President. This is Council Member Miller and
11 thank you for coming out. I do want to reiterate
12 what the Chair said that we missed you for the
13 Preliminary hearing and we did want to talk about
14 some of the very important capital projects and had
15 questions of whether or not they were going to
16 continue to happen. The Jamaica Bus Depot in Jamaica
17 Queens which I represent, which happens to be the
18 oldest Depot in the city, which is operating at about
19 70 percent, 75 percent of capacity, 20 years ago.
20 And so, it is really important but, in the immediacy,
21 we want to talk about your commitment to this
22 overnight plan and what that means. I've had the
23 privilege and pleasure of representing those workers
24 as the president and business agent for those transit
25

1
2 workers, car cleaners and bus maintainers as well who
3 are cleaning.

4 And I've been into the depots downstairs over the
5 past few weeks and while you say there are 2,500
6 people committed to this, there are normally one
7 person serving a very large station, which is
8 inadequate. What does that mean in this day and
9 time? Are you bringing on additional staff and I
10 know that transit workers who are adversely hit with
11 infection from one in any working group. Do you have
12 the capacity to do so? What does that look like and
13 so, we want to talk about the human capital portion
14 of it and then very appreciative of the initiative
15 and the fact that the board has voted to support the
16 benefit package to \$500,000 in the healthcare, super
17 important. But also, how do you provide services to
18 those transportation deserts in the community such as
19 Southeast Queens, which has the highest number of
20 public employees in the City of New York.

21 And south of Union Turnpike, there is no service
22 going. You don't have shuttles operating. We don't
23 have buses operating and even from the Long Island
24 Railroad, you make the station, there is no shuttle
25 if you have the luxury of getting there.

1
2 Have you coordinated with local transportation
3 and let them know in advance that these are your
4 needs. So, how do we address that and the immediacy,
5 how do we protect workers and are we going to
6 continue with those major capital projects that
7 really are important to these transportation deserts.

8 And let me just preface it by saying that I am so
9 glad that you are here today to talk about the most
10 important transportation system in the entire world
11 and it's been left out in the transportation
12 conversation but right now, the closure is very
13 important if you can speak about that, I'd appreciate
14 it.

15 SARAH FEINBERG: Absolutely. So, thank you so
16 much for all those questions and I'll try to run
17 through them as quickly as I can.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 SARAH FEINBERG: And I wanted to start by
20 thanking you sir for I believe you delivered lunch to
21 a bunch of our MTA workers today. So, that was very
22 kind of you, thank you so much for doing that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Absolutely, my pleasure.

24 SARAH FEINBERG: Thank you. So, I'll go through
25 a bunch of your questions quickly. First of all, in

1
2 the capital projects and on the Jamaica Bus Depot,
3 I'll defer to my colleague Janno and if she doesn't
4 have the latest on Jamaica, I will come back to it
5 but I want to leave the Capital program for him. He
6 is best to place the answer that.

7 In terms of worker, of our own workers and worker
8 protection, so first you made one comment about MTA
9 workers being hit harder than any other industry and
10 I just want to – I want to clarify that we have paid
11 an unbelievable price during this pandemic which has
12 been heartbreaking.

13 It is in no way to suggest that the price that
14 we've paid isn't severe because it is but I'm not
15 convinced that our industry has paid in a
16 disproportionate way than others. I mean, I think
17 one of the things you are saying is that the MTA has
18 tried to be incredibly transparent about the way that
19 we're approaching this pandemic, how we are caring
20 for our workers. How we are distributing PPE, what
21 we're doing to clean, and disinfect our system for
22 our workforce and our riders and I think by virtue of
23 being very transparent, we've been sharing
24 information as it comes and we in hopes that people
25 understand both what we're doing and also can learn

1
2 from us and learn both about the pandemic and how
3 transit systems should react to challenges like this.

4 So, look, at the end of the day, I hope that the
5 suffering and loss for the MTA comes to a close very
6 soon but I think that one of the reasons we've gotten
7 so much attention is because we've been so
8 transparent.

9 But in terms of workers protection, I think one
10 of the things that I found to be most stunning about
11 the situation we find ourselves in, is that as a
12 transportation agency, we ultimately made the
13 decision to distribute PPE, including masks to our
14 employees because the CDC and other federal
15 authorities have not stepped out and recommended that
16 action.

17 You know, I am a broken record on this. We are a
18 transportation agency. We are not a social services
19 agency and we're not medical or health experts. And
20 so, if you are looking to the MTA to give you medical
21 advice you are going to the wrong place and you know,
22 in the middle of a pandemic, the fact that the CDC
23 was continuing to stand by its guidance that people
24 should not wear masks.

1
2 You know, weeks ago it felt very out of touch
3 with the reality that we were seeing on the ground.
4 And so, we made the decision to practically start
5 distributing those masks to our workforce and I'm
6 glad we did. I wish we had done it sooner frankly.
7 But I think it's a strange place to be when a
8 transportation agency is making medical calls that
9 the CDC isn't willing to make and look, and look, I
10 think I'm not, you know, probably not the only
11 transit agency leader to feel that way.

12 It was also incredibly frustrating personally and
13 for us to have such difficulty in getting the PPE
14 that we wanted. I mean, we have stockpiled an
15 enormous amount and had a lot of masks on hand and
16 gloves on hand. But it was a huge undertaking by our
17 procurement folks to be able to get the kinds of
18 supplies that we needed because the reality was is
19 that the country did not have them on hand because
20 the federal government hadn't stepped up there.

21 So, it was very frustrating. Look, we will do
22 everything we can to keep our workforce safe and we
23 wake up every day and I think that I've done
24 everything the day before and I try to find new
25 things to do the next day.

1
2 So, we have you know, on the buses side, we have
3 put a buffer zone between the bus operator and the
4 public. We're doing rear door boarding so that the
5 public is not coming into interact with the operator.
6 We are you know, protecting the operator with
7 additional space. We are no longer taking cash in
8 our stations.

9 So, we're trying to do whatever we can to make
10 sure that we can protect our workforce and also keep
11 our riders safe at the same time.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And the overnight
13 service?

14 SARAH FEINBERG: The overnight service will
15 continue through the time of the pandemic. The
16 governor has said that - I'm sorry, go ahead.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I'm sorry, the question
18 was, whether or not there are transportation deserts
19 that we don't have service overnight in Southeast
20 Queens. How do we reevaluate that?

21 SARAH FEINBERG: So, we will certainly - we have
22 tried to hit everything with our bus service. We
23 will absolutely take a look - yeah, we will take a
24 look at those deserts to make sure that your folks
25 have a way to get where they need to go, but at the

1
2 same time, I also want to urge them to go to our
3 website and sign up for the essential connector
4 program, so that we can make sure that if -

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Really bad move.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member, we need to
7 move on.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you.

9 SARAH FEINBERG: We want to make sure that they
10 are getting where they need to go sir.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

12 SARAH FEINBERG: Okay.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, we'll go to our next
14 Council Member please.

15 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Thank you. Can we please
16 have Council Member Cabrera followed by Council
17 Member Holden followed by Council Member Gibson.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'll make it quick. And
20 Chair Dromm, I want to thank you for - I know you
21 could be asking questions right from the beginning
22 and again, you are always a first class Chair and I
23 really commend you for thinking about the rest of us,
24 so I'll follow with your example and I'll be
25 parsimonious with my time.

1
2 Madam President, I have to say I commend you, you
3 literally, this is like the worst time of any
4 president of MTA could conceivably walk into a
5 situation, into a pandemic and then take over the
6 system and I have watched you from afar. I don't
7 know you personally but appreciate your decisiveness.
8 You know, your getting things done and I see the
9 action and appreciate that.

10 My question is regarding the elephant in the
11 room. Which is, I'm concerned about the federal
12 government. What level of discussion are you having
13 directly? Are you having direct talks with the
14 administration at the federal level? What would
15 happen if we don't get help? Right now, we're losing
16 90 percent of all the funding that we normally would
17 get and God knows when we're going to be able to
18 open. I'm very, very worried.

19 And my second question is in regards to, this is
20 a question everybody is asking me. They ask, Council
21 Member, why don't we have more cars? Why are we
22 cramming everybody up in the trains, in the subway?
23 Why can't we just double it up so we can have more
24 space and they are afraid to go in. If you could
25 help me with those two questions, I would really

1
2 appreciate it because this is the questions that
3 people are asking.

4 SARAH FEINBERG: So, in terms of the federal
5 response, look I mean, you may have seen that the
6 house released a bill just a couple of hours ago.
7 We're still reviewing it to see how it could impact
8 us but it certainly seems positive.

9 Look, I don't, and obviously with the help of
10 Senator Schumer, there was a first tranche of federal
11 assistance which has been unbelievably helpful and
12 we're grateful to him for his work.

13 Look, I think you know, New York and MTA are the
14 leading edge of this. I think all other transit
15 agencies are going to be in the same shoes as us
16 soon. You know, not getting additional federal help
17 really isn't an option. You know, this is not you
18 know, we are in a situation where we can't just, you
19 know, we can't go sell more things or raise prices
20 right significantly.

21 And so, this is a situation where the federal
22 government is just going to have to step up. You
23 know, the governor and others have called for a
24 hero's fund. You know, Senator Schumer has -

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 SARAH FEINBERG: Done great work on this.
3 Speaker Pelosi has done great work on this and so, we
4 are in close contact with the hill on a regular basis
5 and I know others at the MTA including Chairman Foye
6 and others are in close touch with both our
7 congressional delegation and members of the
8 administration.

9 So, I just don't see that it could be an option
10 that we don't get additional federal assistance.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And the trains being so
12 packed and a way to increase -

13 SARAH FEINBERG: Yeah, no look, it's a great
14 question. I want to make sure that people
15 understand, it is hard to imagine New York City
16 transit functioning and operating service where
17 everyone can socially distance, right. I mean, even
18 if ridership ticks up in a very small amount, in a
19 very slow way, you know, we are going to end up with
20 moments where cars or trains have more people than is
21 ideal right. Because as construction comes back, as
22 retail comes back, as all the things come back to our
23 economy, that we have to have come back in order for
24 New York to recover from this, that means we're going
25 to have an increase in ridership and even, you know,

1
2 small increases in ridership and we want to go all
3 the way back to where we were before, even small
4 increases in ridership mean that people are going to
5 have to take it upon themselves a little bit to
6 social distance and to get space where they can.

7 The current standard is 6 feet plus a mask. That
8 is not something that I think that we should assume
9 is going to be something that we can maintain going
10 forward as ridership picks up. So, we have been
11 urgently asking medical and healthcare experts,
12 please give us your advice and your best guidance on
13 social distancing. If you can't do six feet and a
14 mask, is it four feet and a mask? Is it two feet and
15 a mask?

16 My sense of it is that it will be the number one
17 priority will be to be vigilant about mask use.
18 Masks will be required. And the second part will be,
19 you know, get as much space as you can between
20 yourself and fellow riders. I think that's where
21 we're going to land and if we can give our riders the
22 tools and the control and as much control as possible
23 over how they are entering the system, interacting
24 with the system, interacting with others, we will
25 have done a good job of giving our riders control

1
2 over their own destiny. So, that's going to be our
3 focus.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much.
5 Thank you Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Council Member
7 Cabrera. Thank you for your kind remarks. Let's go
8 to our next Council Member.

9 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we have Council Member
10 Holden followed by Council Members Gibson and
11 Grodenchik please.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you Chair Dromm and
14 thank you President Feinberg. I appreciate all your
15 comments and testimony and I've been hearing from
16 constituents who are very happy to see the trains
17 this clean. They haven't seen that in their
18 lifetime they are saying.

19 So, what are the additional costs that we're
20 dealing with, with the MTA cleaning the way you are.

21 SARAH FEINBERG: So, it's unclear at this point
22 obviously, as you know, the longer this goes on,
23 obviously the more expensive it's likely to be. But
24 this is just not something that we have flexibility
25 on. I mean, we are increasingly effective and

1
2 efficient every day. We just started this a week
3 ago, less than a week ago and I would say already we
4 have learned you know, where we can be more effective
5 and efficient in cleaning. And so, we're getting
6 better all the time and I think that costs will come
7 down as we get better and more efficient. But this
8 is, you know I think Chairman Foye said about a week
9 ago, this is likely to be a multi-hundred million
10 dollar problem and I agree with that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You know, I was doing
12 some research about a month ago of looking at other
13 subway systems, how they were cleaning and I looked
14 at Moscow and they had the hazmat suits. They had
15 the UV lamps; I think they were about four feet high.
16 They had the foggers. So, did South Korea, they had
17 the hazmat suits, the foggers and UV lamps in
18 February.

19 And when I looked at the MTA, the way we were
20 cleaning, you just had somebody sometimes without a
21 mask, with a rag and knowing the virus, knowing how
22 it spreads. I mean, it was spreading like the flu.
23 Our own Department of Health in early March at a City
24 Council hearing was saying, you don't need masks.
25 When we know how the flu spreads. We know how

1
2 viruses spread. It seemed that misinformation was
3 everywhere. Not only the federal government but our
4 own government and some of the, I just couldn't
5 understand. We still see the TV stations using the
6 footage of MTA cleaners with no masks and then see
7 how many deaths we had in the MTA. It was upsetting,
8 it still is upsetting that we didn't give - it looks
9 like we didn't give our MTA workers the proper
10 equipment.

11 SARAH FEINBERG: Yeah, look, I mean, at this
12 point, I'm shocked if we have anyone out there who is
13 not wearing an N95 or other masks. We have
14 distributed I think more than a million and a half
15 masks and I say to New York City transit employees
16 constantly in my emails and my videos to them, if you
17 start your shift and you do not have the PPE that you
18 need, raise your hand, talk to your supervisor, talk
19 to your manager and if you have to, send me an email.
20 And we will make sure that you have everything that
21 you need before you start your shift.

22 You know, for a while, I got a handful of those
23 emails and in every single case -

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

1
2 SARAH FEINBERG: I think that it turned out that
3 the PPE was you know, in the next room or in the
4 unopened box on the floor.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Does every worker have a
6 hazmat suit? Because that's the problem here I think
7 to.

8 SARAH FEINBERG: I'm not sure I agree with you
9 that it's the problem, certainly our cleaners have
10 access to those suits if they want them. Some of our
11 contractors use them, some of our cleaners use them
12 if they want them but we do have those suits. I'm
13 not sure that the experts we have consulted believe
14 that they are necessary but we certainly have them,
15 both stockpiled and on hand.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Just look at the MTA
17 workers. The whole country of South Korea I think
18 has 250 deaths. Moscow, the same thing is very few
19 deaths compared to New York City.

20 So, I think we have to relook at how we're
21 cleaning even but certainly how we are treating this
22 virus.

23 Thank you Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. I'm
25 sorry.

1
2 SARAH FEINBERG: Can I just, can I say one thing
3 about the cleaning.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Of course.

5 SARAH FEINBERG: I was just going to say that one
6 of the important things that this overnight shutdown
7 affords us is the ability and the space and the time
8 to test some new cleaning solution. So, we are
9 testing UV. We are testing microbials. We are
10 testing new sprayers and new devices that allow us to
11 clean faster and more efficiently. So, that's
12 exactly one of the things that we're doing on the
13 overnights.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Our
16 next Council Member.

17 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we have questions please
18 from Council Member Gibson followed by Council
19 Members Grodenchik and Adams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you. Good
21 afternoon.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Madam President, good
24 afternoon. Thank you Chair Dromm, Chair Rodriguez.
25 Just two very quick questions on the Capital Plan and

1
2 I appreciate all the work that everyone is doing
3 during COVID.

4 Currently, the state funding makes up nearly a
5 quarter of the 2015, 2019 capital program but the
6 state will only contribute \$3 billion or 5.8 percent
7 towards the new plan and that does not include
8 congestion pricing.

9 And we all know congestion pricing will largely
10 impact and be paid for by New York City residents and
11 taxpayers. Is it fair that the proposed capital
12 program has the state and city each contributing \$3
13 billion in funding?

14 SARAH FEINBERG: I'll refer you to my colleague
15 Janno. Janno, do you want to jump in on the capital
16 program?

17 JANNO LIEBER: Sure, Council Member, Janno Lieber
18 here. Good to see you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: You too.

20 JANNO LIEBER: Look, and I hope you are staying
21 safe and your colleagues as well. Listen, the
22 capital plan was adopted by the legislature at the
23 Governor's request. The Capital program review board
24 adopted it at the beginning of 2020 and it was
25

1
2 historic and it did put us in a position to really
3 upgrade the system in a huge way.

4 So, we were moving aggressively to all of a
5 sudden put, you know, put 70 stations in ADA
6 accessible shape for the first time in a single
7 capital program. We had all those projects moving
8 and obviously they had to stop because of the impact
9 of COVID and your colleague asked about the need for
10 federal support. Our ability, the operating budget,
11 back in shape and with it, to be able to continue the
12 capital program really depends on federal support.
13 That's is the you know, an existential issue for all
14 of us and your constituents who are depending on the
15 MTA, not just to operate, for us to continue to make
16 it better.

17 What I can tell you though is that all of the
18 capital program work that was underway, has continued
19 during the COVID crisis and its continued safely. We
20 aggressively implemented a whole group of really
21 aggressive safety programs and the result was keeping
22 workers separate, disinfecting tools, monitoring
23 entry, and exiting. We were able to keep a very low
24 rate of COVID positives in the construction
25 workforce.

1
2 So, if we can get the money back in shape, we are
3 ready to run all the capital projects that everybody
4 is running safely.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, thank you for that.
6 And the capital plan assumes about \$10.4 billion in
7 federal funding, almost 20 percent of the total plan.
8 Do you guys believe that you are going to get this
9 level of funding from the federal government and
10 given the political climate and everything we're
11 dealing with COVID, is it safe to assume that the
12 federal government is going to give us this \$7.5
13 billion for infrastructure projects? Have you guys
14 received any commitments from Washington DC and do
15 you really believe that this is a realistic
16 assumption?

17 JANNO LIEBER: I do think it's realistic and here
18 is why.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

20 JANNO LIEBER: One, Congress really aggressively
21 moved to address the transit program in the CARES
22 Act. We've asked for more money but as you know,
23 we've talked about it but in the first emergency
24 relief program enacted by Congress, there was a
25 significant chunk for transit.

1
2 So, they understand how important it is to
3 continue investing in transit. Two, the numbers that
4 we were assuming, we're basically just depending on
5 what have been given to the MTA in the past. So,
6 that it's not unreasonable to assume that we'll
7 continue to get that same amount of money, especially
8 since congress is obviously pouring money out to try
9 to stave off the effect of the COVID crisis. And
10 three, there is real talk about an infrastructure
11 stimulus bill and I'm sure we will participate. So,
12 I do think it's reasonable.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, thank you so much.
14 Thank you Chairs.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Next Council
16 Member please.

17 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Can we please hear from
18 Council Member Grodenchik followed Council Members
19 Adams and Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you. Thank you
21 very much. Thank you Chair for being here all day.
22 I look forward to spending many more days like this
23 with you. President Feinberg, it is nice to see you.
24 I don't think we've ever met but it is nice to see
25 you. I really don't have much in the way of mass

2 transportation in my district. It's kind of, we do
3 have buses but that's about it.

4 I'm one of two districts in the whole city I
5 believe that doesn't have a single subway station but
6 we manage. I had mentioned to Commissioner
7 Trottenberg before this. Councilman Miller, my dear
8 colleague, and the other half of the Jamaica Avenue
9 caucus. We have been pushing, you know, we have the
10 Atlantic fare and I know that you do not deal with
11 the Long Island Railroad of Metro North but I think
12 we are looking as you know, at a disaster when we
13 reopen the city because it's just going to be
14 impossible. People don't want to get on buses and
15 subways. They are going to get in their cars. I
16 have a district that has over 90 percent car owners
17 per household. And what we would like to do is put
18 some of those people at least on the Long Island
19 Railroad.

20 We have stations throughout Eastern Queens. We
21 have Metro North Stations throughout the Bronx and
22 upper Manhattan. And so, whatever voice you could
23 add to that would be helpful and we do also, while
24 it's not in New York City and just over the border at
25 Belmont Park in Nassau County, we have tremendous

1
2 parking lots at a Long Island Railroad station and
3 due to the intercession of my dear friend and
4 colleague Senator Comrie, we are going to get a
5 railroad station built there but we have one now that
6 basically sits there empty or it has work trains
7 sitting there. We could put thousands of people on
8 the Long Island Railroad and I have to think that
9 those trains are going to be empty also because
10 people are going to be very reluctant to get back on
11 for all the reasons I've explained here.

12 So, no questions but I hope you and your
13 colleagues here will add your voice to that. I will
14 be mentioning it to the Governor if I can find him
15 but or his people but it would be a way to get you
16 know, a percentage of people into Manhattan or into
17 western Queens or into downtown Brooklyn without ever
18 getting on a subway.

19 So, thank you.

20 JANNO LIEBER: Thank you, thank you.

21 SARAH FEINBERG: Understood, absolutely, thank
22 you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our next Council Member
25 please.

1
2 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: May we please hear from
3 Council Member Adams followed by Council Members
4 Lander and Koo.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Adams, your
6 clock starts now.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very much.
8 Thank you, President Feinberg, a pleasure to meet
9 you. We've never met also. I represent District 28,
10 that's the Jamaica South Ozone Park Richmond Hill.
11 So, Council Member Miller and I we're neighboring
12 districts and I just wanted to go a little bit maybe
13 of an update for the Queens bus redesign program.

14 My colleagues and I overwhelmingly disagreed with
15 the plan initially. So, if there are any updates
16 that you could provide us, let us know what's going
17 on. Whether things have actually come to a halt
18 because of COVID-19. Whether it's still on the front
19 burner, when the design for the boroughs will be
20 completed and what the current outreach is right now
21 for our Community Boards, Council Members, and
22 stakeholders. So, where are we right now with the
23 Queens bus redesign?

24 SARAH FEINBERG: Thank you so much for the
25 question. So, all of our redesign work is really on

1
2 pause at the moment but the absolutely remain top
3 priorities. It's a huge effort on our part to right
4 size and make some changes to bus service to make
5 sure that we're meeting people where they are. But
6 all of that is on pause at the moment as you can
7 imagine. You know, early on, it quickly did not make
8 any sense to be having community meetings where we
9 were actually bringing people together to interact
10 with each other and so, we have put everything on
11 pause. We wanted to make sure that everyone
12 understood that you know, the input from the
13 community is vital to all of this and we're not going
14 to move forward without being able to hear from the
15 community.

16 So, that work is on pause for the moment. We do
17 want to get back to it because I think it's important
18 and would love to work with you on it and speak with
19 you, you know, over the phone and in person when
20 we're able to because I would love to hear your
21 thoughts on it. I will say that I know that you
22 know, these redesigns start in a place and people are
23 unhappy and then we make changes and it tends to get
24 better and better and then once the service is up and
25 running, people usually are pretty happy with it but

1
2 we take the input part very seriously and I want to
3 make sure that we are working with you and caring
4 about your concerns.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very much for
6 that. I'm just going to squeeze in one more. I've
7 got a couple of minutes left. I am a commuter or at
8 least I was, e-train end to end every day and the
9 homeless situation is significant, Jamaica station.

10 So, I just want to get your take on this. The
11 MTA are you looking at perhaps deploy social workers
12 in the subway system. We know that our subways are
13 policed very heavily, doesn't seem to do a whole lot
14 outside of you know, antagonizing folks. So, that's
15 the first part and the second part is has the MTA
16 actually trained police officers in dealing with
17 riders mental health issues? And I'll stop there.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

19 SARAH FEINBERG: Thank you, great questions. So
20 first of all, we you know again, we're a
21 transportation agency. We're not a social services
22 agency and so, we believe that the priority is to
23 make sure that we are treating everyone with an
24 enormous amount of respect and grace and kindness.
25 But to be making sure that those who are vulnerable

1
2 and need social services and need medical services
3 and need mental health care aren't turning to us to
4 get it but are being you know, moved to, and sent to
5 the folks who can actually offer it.

6 So, we are working very closely with the NYPD
7 with our own MTA police force with homeless outreach
8 workers for the city, with the BRC and with nurses
9 and medical staff and other outreach workers and
10 social workers to make sure that the folks who need
11 help are getting it and to answer your question about
12 police training, I can only speak to the MTA police
13 but I believe this is the same with the NYPD. We do
14 train people in how they work with those who are
15 struggling with mental illness and you know, it is a
16 very difficult job to be a police officer in the
17 transit system. My hats are off and I'm so grateful
18 to RMTA police and to the NYPD for all the work that
19 they do and this is one of the challenges. These are
20 folks who are vulnerable and who have not gotten the
21 help that they need and you know, being in a transit
22 system and treating it as a factor of shelter is not
23 the right answer for anyone and so, the fact that
24 they have turned there, means they are not being
25 served elsewhere. And so, we are trying our darndest

1
2 to get them into the hands of the folks that can help
3 them.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Great, thank you. Our next
6 Council Member please.

7 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Council Member Lander
8 followed by Council Members Koo and Deutsch.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Lander, your
10 clock starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: President Feinberg, thank
12 you so much for being here. Thanks for stepping up
13 to this job and what's really a daunting and
14 impossible time and I apologize, I got my timing
15 mixed up, so I didn't hear your testimony, so I hope
16 I don't ask questions that are repeated, but I
17 apologize if I did.

18 Janno, also really good to see you. It's not
19 that long ago that we were talking about what we
20 could do Gowanus rezoning to strengthen the transit
21 system. I still want to get that elevator for the
22 Union Street Station, but that's for another day.

23 I really appreciate all you guys are doing, the
24 whole system, you know, your employees, the MTA
25 workers, the members, and you know, the cleaning

1
2 that's been stood up is great. I want to ask about
3 three things that seem to me also really essential
4 for starting to be able to have our subway system
5 carry more workers as people start to move back in
6 including a lot of people who are very hesitant to
7 get back on the subways but we needed them to because
8 we're not a city that can work if people get back in
9 to try to get on cars.

10 So, I guess one, is a question about time
11 scheduled demand management. What's the relationship
12 between the work the Governor and the Mayor are doing
13 to try to work with some you know, businesses and
14 corporations who are larger Manhattan employers to
15 think about every other day scheduling or four day a
16 week scheduling or altered time line scheduling, so
17 we can prevent rush hour from being massively
18 overcrowded on the subways.

19 I guess a related question about the road Sam
20 Schwartz has put out some interesting ideas about
21 your know sort of short term tolling of single
22 driving cars on the east river bridges because we've
23 got to do something to prevent just a flood of cars
24 that start to come in as people start to return to
25 work. And I guess, finally, if people are going to

1
2 practice social distancing underground, it seems to
3 me that we need some like public health corps
4 ambassadors, like a set of people who are not NYPD or
5 transit cops but who aren't just like regular transit
6 workers either.

7 Folks who are trained and get some - you know,
8 have some skill and ability in communicating the need
9 for strap hangers to observe social distancing and
10 like, help us provide in the ways we're going to need
11 to.

12 So, that's a lot but I wonder if you could talk a
13 little about the preparations you are making on those
14 fronts.

15 SARAH FEINBERG: Sure, sure, thanks for the
16 question and nice to talk with you. So, first on the
17 staggering, so on the staggering of hours and of
18 days. So, we have absolutely, first, I think the
19 Governor came out first and urged employers to do
20 this. We absolutely echo it. You know, as the city
21 reopens, as ridership comes back. You know, to the
22 extent that employers can be responsible employers
23 here and have you know, shift hours, so that you got
24 some folks coming in early, some folks coming in
25

1
2 later and then the same on the other end of the rush
3 hour, that would be very helpful.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: We have the tools to like
5 compel also, so we might need to think about
6 something that's a little -

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

8 SARAH FEINBERG: I don't have the tools to compel
9 but you do, so go for it. But I think you know,
10 look, but staggering days of the week would be great
11 as well. We are hearing from businesses that they
12 are planning on doing that, so that's good news.

13 I take your point on tolling but I will just say
14 that's not my wheelhouse and I'll let others weigh in
15 on cars and tolling. In terms of the Public Health
16 Corp, I will tell you that the first thing that
17 strikes you in this role is the scale of the system
18 and 472 stations having public health ambassadors at
19 every single one of them would be a dream come true
20 for me but I think would be extremely hard to scale
21 into find those folks.

22 I can tell you what we are planning though, which
23 is that we will have police, we will have MTA staff.
24 We have platform comptrollers and we've hired some

2 short term contractors to try to help us with this
3 effort.

4 We are not going to be able to be in every
5 station at every moment, at every hour of the day
6 reminding people you know, where they can stand and
7 where they can't stand. This is very much going to
8 be about reminding the ridership of our
9 recommendations of the best recommendations and the
10 best practices for medical and healthcare experts but
11 this is very much going to be a shared
12 responsibility. Riders are going to have to, and I
13 think they will appreciate this. When armed with the
14 best information we have about how they can keep
15 themselves safe and healthy, they will have to take
16 some steps to.

17 So, you know, I can't be on every platform to
18 tell people, you know, that car looks too crowded to
19 me, why don't you, you know, head down a few more.
20 You know, we're going to have to count on folks to
21 make some of those decisions themselves and I am
22 counting on employers across the city to be flexible
23 and helpful and to acknowledge that it's a lot better
24 to have an employee arrive 15 or 20 minutes late
25 because they waited on a less crowded train than to

1
2 show up on time but having packed into a car like a
3 sardine. So, I appreciate your help in echoing that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let's move onto our
6 next Council Member.

7 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Council Member Koo followed
8 by Council Members Deutsch and Levin.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Koo, your clock
10 starts now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. Thank you Chair
12 Dromm and Rodriguez and I want to thank President
13 Feinberg for doing a wonderful job during this
14 pandemic.

15 The things I want to say is that a lot of the
16 subways are clean. Are we doing it permanently like
17 that? Because I go to subways all over other
18 countries, they are all clean and I was wondering how
19 come New York cannot do it?

20 So, now, give us opportunity at night you shut
21 off for a few hours and then you clean the subways.
22 So, and another thing I want to say is, that since we
23 do it on the empty train, we should have robot to do
24 it because a robot doesn't get tired. You know, and
25

1
2 this is where you see it done because the subway is
3 configuring the same.

4 So, if we have a robot to do it, it will save a
5 lot of time and you will avoid the workers infection.
6 That's one thing I want to say and then another thing
7 I want to say is the platform, right. In other
8 countries they have lines on the platform telling you
9 how to line up. But in New York subways, there is no
10 lines. People are all extended all over the
11 platform.

12 So, if you have lines on the platform, then
13 people know oh, this is too many people. I will go
14 to another - I mean, further away from the platform.
15 So, people and then they have navigator during busy
16 hours. They tell you hey, line up here, line up
17 there, you know.

18 So, those are the two points I want to make and
19 then one more point is that since we are short of
20 revenue now, we should increase spaces in the subway,
21 in the platform, in the subway. In Hong Kong and
22 Taiwan there are all kinds of bakeries or convenience
23 stores in the subway system. You can buy coffee; you
24 can shine your shoes.

1
2 So, we should increase that. First, you increase
3 revenue. Second, you have more people there, you
4 will cut down on clients, muggings and robberies,
5 things like that.

6 So, thank you very much for doing a wonderful
7 job. Thank you.

8 SARAH FEINBERG: Thank you so much for the
9 suggestions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much. Now,
12 President Feinberg has to leave in a couple of
13 minutes, so our next question will have to be our
14 last question.

15 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: And that question goes to
16 Council Member Deutsch.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Council Member Deutsch, your
18 time starts now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you so much. Good
20 afternoon, so I have two questions. My first
21 question is, I want to speak about the homeless, the
22 homelessness on the transit system.

23 So, there were reports last week that there were
24 several homeless people who passed away on the
25 transit system and also in the homeless population,

1
2 there were dozens of people that passed away because
3 of COVID. Do we know that – do we have any
4 information if those who passed away on the transit
5 system, if they passed away because of COVID?
6 Because it was reported that it was because of
7 natural causes. That's number one and the second
8 question is, is what was the success rate of the MTA
9 working together with homeless outreach and the NYPD
10 to actually getting the homeless into shelter, those
11 who were sleeping on the transit system?

12 SARAH FEINBERG: So, thank you for the questions.
13 So, let me take it in reverse order. So, first of
14 all, the success rate for having folks actually enter
15 the shelter system, those are not numbers that we're
16 tracking. The NYPD is tracking them and I know even
17 more closely, Commissioner Banks, the City Homeless
18 Outreach is tracking them.

19 I have heard from them on a daily basis that they
20 are very happy with the numbers that they are seeing,
21 so they feel like on a regular basis just as a
22 handful of people offer them services and there is a
23 significant uptick over the last week in the number
24 of people who are taking them up on the offer of
25 services now.

1
2 So, I know they are quite pleased but I'll send
3 you to them for the specific numbers and in terms of
4 the deaths. I mean, unfortunately, we are such a
5 vast system with so many riders that individual
6 riders you know, passing away of natural causes in
7 our system is not a terribly unique thing to happen.
8 When you just have millions of people, the numbers
9 are such that that will occasionally happen. I do
10 not have any reports that those were COVID related.
11 I remember at least one was a heart attack but I
12 don't know what the others were but it has never been
13 flagged for me that those were COVID related.

14 I just wanted to go back to Mr. Koo's remarks for
15 one minute because I thought I was going to have an
16 opportunity to respond to him. I just wanted to
17 thank him for acknowledging how clean the cars are
18 and how clean the trains are and it's such a
19 testament to our cleaners and the folks we've got
20 cleaning the cars right now that you know, really any
21 time of day now at this point that I'm in the system,
22 I am stunned by how clean the cars are and it's just
23 - they have done an unbelievable job and they are
24 doing it by cleaning 24 hours a day, the overnight
25 outage and closure to the riders is so that we can

1
2 really surge the system, but they are cleaning 24
3 hours a day and it shows and it's really a testament
4 to them.

5 So, thank you for all those.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much President
7 Feinberg. I know you have to leave at this time. I
8 do believe that Mr. Keller and Mr. Lieber are staying
9 if I am correct. Are you able to stay or -

10 DAVID KELLER: If you wish, we are able to stay
11 yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We only have a few more
13 Council Member questions and it would be great if you
14 could answer their questions, but I do want to thank
15 you President Feinberg for coming in and for giving
16 us testimony and for foregoing your opening statement
17 which is very much appreciated as well.

18 Thank you.

19 SARAH FEINBERG: You bet. I trust that you will
20 remember that next time and let me go on twice as
21 long.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, very good, thank you.

23 SARAH FEINBERG: I appreciate it, thank you for
24 having me.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and now we'll go to our
3 last few Council Members questions.

4 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Yeah, Chair Dromm, at this
5 time, we have no further questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Oh, very good, alright. Then
7 we'll just go to Council Member Chair Rodriguez for a
8 closing statement.

9 COUNSEL NOAH BRICK: Chair Rodriguez, are you
10 with us? We may have lost Chair Rodriguez.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, well, everybody gets
12 off the hook easy today in that sense but we thank
13 you for coming in and we will follow up with
14 questions a little bit later on with you. Again,
15 thank you so much for coming in.

16 Okay, now, let me just close out. Alright, this
17 concludes today's hearing. Before we close, as a
18 reminder to the public, the Committee and
19 Subcommittee will be holding a remote hearing for
20 public testimony on the Executive Budget on May 21st
21 at 11:30 a.m. If you would like to testify at that
22 hearing, please register at
23 www.council.nyc.gov/testify and information about how
24 to access the Zoom meeting will be emailed to you.

1
2 You may testify at that hearing via web or via
3 telephone.

4 You may also submit written testimony through
5 that registration website or by emailing
6 financetestimony@council.nyc.gov. And just finally,
7 let me say thank you to all of my colleagues for your
8 help and cooperation throughout the day, it's been a
9 long day but I appreciate everything that everybody
10 has done and the questions that you've asked.

11 Again, thank you everybody and with that this
12 hearing is adjourned. [GAVEL]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 1, 2018