CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES of the COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING ----- Х March 13, 2020 Start: 1:25 p.m. Recess: 4:23 p.m. HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall B E F O R E: Alicka Ampry-Samuel Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicka Ampry-Samuel Diana Ayala Laurie A. Cumbo Ruben Diaz, Sr. Vanessa Gibson Mark Gjonaj Carlos Menchaca Donovan J. Richards Rafael Salamanca, Jr. Ritchie J. Torres Mark Treyger Jimmy Van Bramer Carlina Rivera Peter Koo Bill Perkins

1

World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road – Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470 www.WorldWideDictation.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Greg Russ Chair and CEO New York City Housing Authority

Vito Mustacuiolo Vice President of Finance Team New York City Housing Authority

Annika Lescott New York City Housing Authority

Steve Lovci Executive Vice President for Capital New York City Housing Authority

Joey Koch Chief of Staff New York City Housing Authority

1

2

3 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Good afternoon, 4 ladies and gentlemen. Welcome to the City Council 5 Chambers. I am Council Member Vanessa Gibson and I 6 am proud to serve as the chair of Subcommittee on 7 Capital and I am filling in its afternoon for our 8 distinguished chair of Public Housing, Chair Alicka 9 Ampry-Samuel, who unfortunately could not join us 10 this afternoon due to a family matter. I ask all of 11 us to keep her and her family in your prayers and I 12 am proud to step in and fill her shoes and chair 13 today's budget hearing on the mayor's preliminary 14 budget of the Committee on Public Housing. So I 15 thank you all for being here. Today's hearing this afternoon is on the city's fiscal 2021 preliminary 16 17 budget hearing and NYCHA's five-year operating and 18 capital plans for 2020 to 2024. I thank my 19 colleagues who are here. I will recognize the 20 members of the committee and council members who are 21 here. We have Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer, 2.2 Council Member Ruben Diaz, Sr., Council Member 23 Carlina Rivera, and Council Member Diana Ayala, who 24 have joined us and others will be joining us 25 throughout the afternoon. The New York City Housing

Authority has operated the largest public housing 2 3 program in the nation for over 75 years, providing 4 affordable housing to nearly 400,000 low- and moderate-income New York City residents and families 5 and serving nearly 200,000 additional New Yorkers 6 7 through its Section 8 program. While NYCHA continues 8 to be a precious and critical resource in an 9 increasingly unaffordable city, long-standing disinvestment and federal underfunding of public 10 11 housing coupled with organizational mismanagement has resulted in the deterioration of public housing. 12 For 13 years many tenants and families have reported health 14 and safety issues in their homes, ranging from lack 15 of heat, hot water, unresolved mold issues, pest infestation, lead-based paint hazards, elevator 16 17 outages, leaky roofs, and that's just to name a few 18 of many of our long-standing issues. Recently, 19 though, these health and safety issues have come to a 20 head and the federal government stepped in through an 21 administrative agreement that was signed last 2.2 January, which requires NYCHA to remediate living 23 conditions at developments citywide by specific deadlines. In total, the city is providing 2.2 24 billion dollars from fiscal 2019 to fiscal 2028 for 25

2 critical repairs to meet the terms of the agreement, 3 and last February a federal monitor was appointed to 4 oversee these improvements and reform efforts at While city funding is a critical resource for 5 NYCHA. NYCHA, it is a drop in the bucket compared to NYCHA's 6 7 overall capital need of 32 billion dollars, which can potentially increase to as much as 68 billion dollars 8 9 by 2028. NYCHA, to its credit, is not solely relying on its government partners to rescue it from 10 11 financial insolvency. The authority has implemented 12 NYCHA 2.0, a comprehensive 10-year plan to renovate 13 and preserve NYCHA developments and resolve 24 14 billion dollars in capital needs across its 15 portfolio. While NYCHA 2.0 is a big and bold plan, 16 it still leaves about 9 billion dollars unfunded 17 capital needs across its portfolio and does not 18 access for the fact that NYCHA's capital need could 19 as much as double by the end of the 10-year plan. In 20 addition, major components of the success of the 21 NYCHA 2.0 plan heavily rely on funding resources available at the federal level which the Trump 2.2 23 administration has proposed severe reductions to or either complete zeroing out in the budget. At 24 today's hearing this afternoon it is our hope to 25

understand and get a clearer understanding of how the 2 3 NYCHA 2.0 plan will roll out, how NYCHA will improve 4 the fiscal conditions of its buildings under the provision of a federal monitor, and how all of this 5 translates to improved services for residents and 6 7 families. After the New York City Housing Authority 8 we will hear from members of the public. I'd like to 9 remind everyone, anyone who is here today that is interested in testifying to please fill out our 10 11 witness slip with the Sergeant at Arms to your right 12 so that we can add you onto our list. I'd also like 13 to thank and recognize the staff of the Committee on 14 Public Housing for all of their work, our principle 15 financial analyst, Sarah Gastulum, our unit head, 16 Cheema Obichare. I certainly want to thank the 17 finance division led by our director, Latonya 18 McKinney, and our deputy directors, Nathan Toll, Paul 19 Simone, Regina Pareda Ryan, and certainly want to 20 acknowledge again our chair of public housing, Alicka 21 Ampry-Samuel and her staff. And I want to thank our chair for all of her work and her efforts and 2.2 23 certainly while she may not be here physically, she's always here in spirit, and I've talked to her and 24 certainly will be asking a series of questions from 25

our chair to the New York City Housing Authority. 2 3 And with that, as I close I just want to again 4 emphasize that in light of everything that is going on across the country and certainly here in the state 5 and right here in the City of New York around the 6 7 coronavirus this City Council is working very closely with the administration and all of our healthcare 8 9 partners and stakeholders to make sure that we take every precaution possible to protect every New Yorker 10 11 and their family. There's a lot of information out there and we want to make sure that the information 12 13 shared by all is, number one, factual and accurate, 14 and so through a series of social media and other 15 communications, press releases, press conferences, 16 City Council members, our speaker, the mayor and his 17 team are doing everything possible to share as much 18 information as possible. I think every day when we 19 wake up it seems more alarming. There are more 20 confirmed cases. But as the government and as the 21 city we will do our best to remain calm and make sure 2.2 that we follow every guideline need to follow so that 23 we protect every New Yorker and their family. So I thank you for being here today and want to just 24 recognize that we have our general manager here from 25

the New York City Housing Authority. We have Gregory 2 3 Russ, our chair of the New York City Housing Authority. We have our CFO, Annika Lescott is here 4 5 with us. We have our chief compliance officer of NYCHA, Dan Greene. We have our general manager, Vito 6 7 Mustacuiolo, as well as our executive vice president 8 of capital projects, Steve Lovci. So thank you all 9 for being here and with that, before you begin, we will have our committee counsel swear you in, and we 10 11 look forward to today's hearing. Thank you for joining us, and thank you, colleagues, for being 12 13 here. And I'd also like to acknowledge we have joined with us Council Member Peter Koo as well. 14 15 Thank you. COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can you raise your 16 17 right hand, please? Do you affirm to tell the truth, 18 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your 19 testimony before this committee and to respond 20 honestly to Council Member questions? You may begin. 21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you. You may 2.2 begin.

CHAIR RUSS: Good afternoon, ah, Chair
Gibson, members of the committee, other distinguished
members of City Council, residents, members of the

2 public, um, good afternoon. My name is Gregg Russ. 3 I'm NYCHA's chair and CEO. And as we heard in the 4 introductions, I'm joined by the general manager, Vito Mustacuiolo, vice president of our finance team, 5 Annika Lescott, and Steve Lovci, our executive vice 6 7 president for capital. Thank you for this 8 opportunity to present the authority's adopted 9 budget, which was approved by NYCHA's board on December 18, 2019. Before I get into the details on 10 11 the budget and our recent progress, I would like to 12 update the committee on how the authority is 13 addressing the coronavirus in relation to residents, 14 staff, and our properties. We are working in concert 15 with the health department, NYC Emergency Management, 16 and other city agencies to providers New Yorkers, 17 including our residents and staff, with consistent real-time information about the virus. We are 18 19 informing residents of best practices for staying 20 healthy and stopping the spread of germs through 21 direct outreach in multiple languages, notifications 2.2 at our developments, and digital communications, ah, 23 in a very extensive way. We created an internal task force that is planning our response to coronavirus, 24 decimating specific guidance to staff. For instance, 25

we have directed staff to focus their daily cleaning 2 3 on the high traffic areas, such as building entrance 4 doors, elevator controls, mailboxes, and trash We've engaged a federally government-5 chutes. approved vendor to conduct deep cleanings and apply 6 additional product protections that prevent germs 7 8 from spreading. These treatments started on 9 Wednesday at the senior-only buildings and we're bringing in additional vendors for daily cleanings, 10 11 looking to expand into the rest of the portfolio. We 12 are also participating in the regular interagency 13 planning meetings, updating our agency-wide 14 continuity of operation plans, maintaining an 15 inventory of personnel protective equipment for 16 staff. We will continue to keep resident staff and 17 our partners, including the council members, up to 18 date in the weeks ahead. So the groundwork for 19 transformation moving the authority forward, NYCHA is 20 at this time and place, ah, at a moment where its 21 future is going to be defined. In this moment we are working with the monitor, Bart Schwartz and his team, 2.2 23 to develop action plans in critical areas, to improve resident quality of life in accordance with the HUD 24 agreement. This is the framework for building a new 25

NYCHA for tomorrow while benefitting our hundreds of 2 3 thousands of residents today. This work of 4 transformation involves developing an organizational plan to improve how the agency operates and that will 5 be released this summer. It is a collaborative 6 effort and we've already begun to engage our 7 partners, including the monitor, council members, 8 9 advocates, residents, staff, and other stakeholders. There is no way but transforming into a new, stronger 10 11 NYCHA that delivers better services for residents and that involves a lot of hard work. However, while the 12 13 HUD agreement, including the organizational 14 transformation requires massive expenditures, it does 15 not come with additional federal funding for NYCHA. 16 We rely on the support of our city and state 17 government partners to help us address the 18 shortfalls, along with the programs outlined in our 19 long-term real estate plan. NYCHA's budget is a 20 reflection of our priorities in this time of 21 transformation. It acknowledges that we must invest in our buildings while we achieve appropriate 2.2 23 staffing levels. As you've heard, central office staffing has been reduced in recent years, largely 24 25 through attrition. To better serve residents, we are

moving resources from the central office to the front 2 3 line, consolidating our central offices in the 4 process. We are hiring 632 new staff to work at our 5 developments and on our compliance efforts, increasing last year's total budget head count from 6 7 10,707 to 11,349 this year. At the same time we're 8 planning major capital improvements across the 9 portfolio. Our total head count has gone down by 2100 staff in the past 16 years and it has impacted 10 11 NYCHA's ability to provide residents the level of 12 service they deserve. We estimate it would cost 13 about 220 million annually to restore those 2100 14 employees. But when we rehabilitate our buildings through programs like PACT we reduce the maintenance 15 16 needs and we can make more efficient use of the staff 17 that we do have. In addition to moving resources to 18 the developments and investing in our buildings, our 19 focus is on managing at the property level and 20 managing better to improve residents' quality of life 21 and to make good use of our limited funds. Our 2.2 budget outlook - we'd like to thank our congressional 23 delegation for advocating on behalf of public housing, for their role in securing a billion dollars 24 in federal operating funding, 552 million in capital 25

funding for 2019. This money has allowed us to carry 2 3 out our work that's vital for our residents and for 4 the future of public housing in New York City. 5 Thanks to their advocacy we received more capital and operating funds than we expected when we adopted the 6 7 budget last year. We applied some of this money 8 towards the operating expenses required by the 9 agreement, investments that will benefit residents today and tomorrow. We must continue fighting for 10 11 the funding for our buildings and our residents. The 12 president has again proposed significant funding cuts 13 for public housing authorities nationwide in his 2021 14 budget. Our operating budget is 3.84 billion in 15 revenue and 3.75 billion in operating expenses as 16 projected. We anticipate a modest 91 million surplus in 2020, which will help us mitigate deficits in the 17 18 out years beginning in 2022. NYCHA receives two-19 thirds of its operating revenues from federal 20 sources. This year we expect to receive 984 million 21 in federal operating subsidy, which amounts to 2.2 approximately \$6000 per apartment annually. The 2020 23 budget assumes what's called a proration factor at 95% of the operating subsidy, about 50 million 24 dollars less than what NYCHA is eligible for. 25 We

also expect to receive 262 million in city operating 2 3 funds and we thank you and the mayor for these. We 4 expect to collect about a billion dollars in rent 5 from our residents, which is a bit more than the operating subsidy from the federal government. 6 We 7 expect to receive 1.3 billion for Section 8 vouchers 8 and the associated administrative fees this year. 9 Our Section 8 program is well managed, despite the fact that we are underfunded by HUD's formula. 10 NYCHA 11 currently receives 99.5% of our previous year expenses and a Section 8 administrative fee that is 12 prorated to 79%. This funding supports about 84% of 13 14 the 120,000 vouchers that NYCHA is eligible for. The 15 3.75 billion in operating expenses includes 1.1 billion in Section 8 payments to landlords, 1.4 16 billion in salaries and fringe benefits, 377 million 17 18 in contracts, 269 million in OTPS, supplies, 19 vehicles, and equipment, for example. As you are 20 aware, a significant portion of our expenses are uncontrollable, such as utilities and employee 21 2.2 benefits. Our capital budget comprises federal 23 funding from HUD, FEMA funding for Sandy recovery and resiliency efforts, city funding, and state funding. 24 We received an initial allocation of 582 million in 25

federal capital funds this year. Our 2020 budget 2 3 allocates capital funding for building envelopes, 4 building systems, including heating plant and elevator replacements, and interior renovations. 5 Over the next five years we plan to replace 310 6 7 boilers and 281 elevators. Since 2018 we've replaced 8 77 boilers. While the federal capital funding we 9 receive is far from enough to meet the tens of billions of dollars worth of capital needs across the 10 11 portfolio and has actually declined by about 1.2 12 billion since 2001, we are using the money we do 13 receive wisely and efficiently. We expend roughly 67 14 million dollars per month on capital projects and 15 more than a billion dollars of construction work is 16 currently under way across the authority. Last year 17 we obligated the prior year's capital funding in 15 18 months ahead of HUD's 24-month obligation deadline, 19 and we expended the last three capital grants within 20 an average of 17 months ahead of HUD's 48-month 21 expenditure deadline. To facilitate the investment 2.2 of city capital dollars we're going to create some 23 new positions devoted to the management of these projects and we'll have more on that later in our 24 testimony. As of the end of 2019 we awarded 2.98 25

billion in Sandy recovery projects, almost 92% of our 2 3 FEMA money, and have completed 1.74 billion dollars 4 worth of work, providing residents with new roofs, 5 electrical systems, boilers, back-up power, and flood This resulted in the hiring of 440 NYCHA 6 protection. 7 residents as part of this process. In 2020 over 700 8 million is scheduled to be spent on these efforts. 9 HUD's energy performance contracting program is enabling us to replace boilers and modernize heating 10 11 systems with assistance from energy service companies 12 without spending capital dollars up front. The 13 improvements are funded by the cost savings from our 14 reduced energy consumption. Four EPCs are currently 15 investing over 271 million at 70 developments and we 16 are on track to exceed our total investment goal of 17 300 million by the end of the year, several years 18 ahead of schedule. Mayor de Blasio has committed an 19 unprecedented level of resources to the authority, 20 all in a total of 6.4 billion, including 1.3 billion 21 to repair nearly a thousand roofs, 200 million to 2.2 replace boilers and upgraded heating systems. То 23 date we have replaced 177 roofs, benefitting more than 28,000 residents, and helping to prevent leaks 24 25 that can cause mold. I would like again to thank our

2 elected official partners at all levels of government 3 for advocating for increased funding for the public 4 housing's urgent capital needs. The HUD agreement the HUD agreement with a monitorship, whatever term 5 you want to apply, is our roadmap for progress for 6 7 improving the delivery of services to our residents. 8 It requires firm deadlines and goals, both immediate 9 and several years out, which, as I mentioned, involves significant expenditures for which there is 10 11 no dedicated or additional federal funding. To date 12 we have spent approximately 200 million on staff and 13 93 million on vendors to fulfill our obligations 14 under the agreement. For instance, we have spent 14 15 million hiring 153 staff for our Healthy Homes 16 department, which manages efforts on lead, mold, and 17 pests. We created three new departments that are 18 essential to carrying out the agreements' actions 19 plans, compliance, environmental health and safety, 20 and quality assurance, budgeting 18 million to hire 96 additional staff for this critical work. And we 21 2.2 anticipate substantial expenses over the next several 23 years to address all the major areas of the agreement. We expect that it will cost over 2.2 24 25 billion to fully abate lead-based paint across the

NYCHA portfolio. We are currently spending about 101 2 3 million to complete XRF tests in over 134,000 4 We estimate that it would cost roughly apartments. 230 million annually to achieve compliance with 5 interim controls in the area of lead and lead 6 7 remediation. The city is providing NYCHA with at 8 least 2.2 billion in capital funding over the next 10 9 This is part of the HUD agreement. We are vears. discussing with the monitor our plans to use these 10 11 funds to address lead, mold, heating, elevators, and 12 pests through comprehensive modernizations as well as 13 component replacement. We're working on a plan for 14 use of 100 million in fiscal year 2020, state capital 15 funds, also to address the areas outlined in the 16 agreement. We will update the council once that plan 17 has been approved by the state. In November the 18 monitor approved our plan to invest 450 million in 19 state funding to replace 108 boilers at 25 20 developments and 148 elevators at 10 developments, 21 benefitting more than 79,000 residents and reducing 2.2 maintenance demands at those buildings. As we 23 discussed in January, the monitor approved our heating action plan and through operational 24 improvements we've increased staffing and made 25

strategic investments and further reduced the time it 2 3 takes to restore heat outages by 22%, from nine hours 4 last season to seven hours this season. We've brought down the number of heat outages by 23%, from 5 935 last season to 720 so far this season. 6 Ιn 7 addition, the number of residents impact, impacted 8 has dropped by 21%. On January 30 the monitor 9 approved our action plan to improve elevator service for residents. The plan outlines how we will replace 10 11 281 elevators by 2024, reduce the frequency and 12 duration of elevator outages, and improve our 13 communication and outreach to residents, especially 14 seniors and people with mobility, ah, disabilities in 15 the event there is an outage. We are in the process 16 of submitting our lead action plan to the monitor for 17 We created a lead compliance insurance review. 18 program to oversee lead projects and records and have 19 trained over 3000 staff to become EPA-certified 20 renovators. As of March 9, 2020, we continue to 21 conduct our XRF tests in approximately 38,615 2.2 apartments to date. Of those, 17,500 apartments had 23 positive results, 14,754 were negative, and the remainder of the results are forthcoming. Based on 24 initial results, many of these units that tested 25

2 positive had only one or two apartment components 3 where lead is present, such as baseboards or 4 windowsills or walls. The monitor approved our mold 5 action plan just this Wednesday. We finished rolling out our Mold Busters program citywide in September 6 7 and have provided all applicable staff with hands-on 8 training on the updated mold inspections and 9 remediation protocols, including the new tools we are using to effectively and efficiently combat mold. 10 То 11 tackle pests and wastes we've adopted an integrative 12 pest management approach authority-wide, training 800 13 staff on these protocols. To date we've provided 14 targeted relief to more than 3500 apartments with 15 recurring pest complaints and have completed more 16 than 1200 inspections across the city as part of our 17 work to identify infestation hot spots. We are 18 establishing a new waste management department, 19 installing new trash compactors and other waste 20 disposal infrastructure and are working with the 21 sanitation department to improve bulk waste pickup. 2.2 The monitor approved our action plan for ensuring the 23 integrity of HUD inspections, known as FAS inspections, in October. We've trained more than 900 24 staff on FAS and HUD's uniform physical condition 25

standards, making staff aware of the consistent daily 2 3 maintenance that is needed to improve the conditions 4 of our properties year round. We are now validating FAS work orders through our compliance department and 5 these efforts also involve our other newly created 6 departments, Quality Assurance and Environmental 7 8 Health and Safety. The Permanent Affordability 9 Commitment Together, PACT, the majority of NYCHA's buildings are over half a century old and their 10 11 massive capital needs, tens of billions of dollars 12 and rising, is the single greatest issue impacting 13 the authority's future. Addressing this is an absolutely imperative, but it can't be done with 14 15 business as usual. Through our PACT preservation 16 initiative, a key and innovative part of NYCHA 2.0, 17 we're bringing substantial renovations and repairs to 18 at least 62,000 apartments by 2028, significantly 19 improving the quality of life for residents. We are 20 on track to achieve this goal. By this spring, 21 nearly 21,000 apartments will be somewhere in the 2.2 conversion pipeline. To date we have converted 23 nearly 7800 apartments across 30 developments to more stable Section 8 funding streams through PACT, 24 addressing 1.1 billion in hard costs for the capital 25

2 needs of these properties. Last month we closed our 3 seventh PACT transaction, which will bring more than 4 370 million in major repairs and renovations to 2625 apartments throughout Brooklyn, home to over 6300 New 5 Yorkers. Last month we also selected five 6 7 development teams that will work with us to preserve 8 over 5900 apartments in Brooklyn and Manhattan, 9 benefitting more than 11,000 residents. We will soon release a request for expression of interest to 10 11 convert and renovate an additional 5400 apartments. 12 We are using every tool and resource at our disposal 13 to improve the quality of life for our residents. A 14 key focus of our work and catalyst for change is 15 fulfilling the obligations of the HUD agreement in 16 collaboration with the monitor. As noted, the 17 federal government is not providing additional 18 funding to meet these substantial obligations and so 19 we must continue advocating for the funding the 20 public housing residents deserve. Our partnerships 21 with stakeholders, including the council members, is 2.2 vital to accomplishing all that we must accomplish 23 and we thank you for your support. At this critical moment as we strive to invest in the authority and 24 ensure that it can serve New Yorkers for another 85 25

2 years, we look forward to keeping you updated on our 3 progress. Thank you. We are happy to answer 4 questions that you have.

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you very much. Thank you, Chair Russ, and thank you to you and your 6 7 team for being here. Um, we have a lot of work to 8 We've done a lot of work together, and I think, do. 9 you know, this City Council under this administration has worked very closely with Housing as it relates to 10 11 making sure that there's funding from the city. Ah, 12 we work with our partners in Albany to get initially 100 million dollars that was allocated to NYCHA 13 14 through the Manhattan district attorney and recently 15 in 2019 another 100 million, as well as the 450 16 million that the governor recently signed off on. So 17 there's been a lot of money flowing. Um, this City 18 Council continues to be very concerned, as we should, 19 about the federal dollars and the federal impact, and 20 this budget that the president has proposed now, um, 21 it looks like there will be a potential 15% cut, um, 2.2 in federal funding based on the projections that 23 Um, about 60% of your operating budget we've seen. for 2020 is supported by federal dollars. Um, but 24 because there is uncertainty at the federal level, 25

2	um, we at the council want to understand what the
3	impact would be, um, while the budget process is
4	under way. Are we having conversations with our
5	partners at HUD, um, and are we developing some sort
6	of a plan in the event that that cut does go through.
7	Um, so could you get us, give us an understanding of
8	what's happening, your conversations, and how we move
9	forward at the federal level?
10	CHAIR RUSS: Sure, thank you very much,
11	ah, for asking. This is really just an incredibly
12	important issue. So, um, we have been advocating,
13	ah, each budget year on our own and with other
14	housing authorities around the country for, ah,
15	realistic budgets from the administration, and to
16	date we have not received any. And, ah, we have been
17	very fortunate that these budgets have, ah, been
18	delivered to Congress and our delegation, ah, with
19	support, ah, from us here at home and the House has
20	been able to craft budgets that have been blunted,
21	ah, most of the, ah, ah, cuts that the, the
22	president's budget proposes.
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm.
24	CHAIR RUSS: Let me start with capital,
25	ah, if you're asking about impact.
l	

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm.

3 CHAIR RUSS: Um, we do not believe that 4 the final budget that the government adopts will zero 5 out the capital program. But in fact that's what was That's 582 million dollars this year, 6 proposed. 7 which would completely, um, spin us in the wrong direction in terms of the investment that we have to 8 9 We have, ah, a significant amount of capital make. money in the pipeline and we are actively working to 10 11 obligate and expend those funds. But the kinds of 12 cuts that the president proposed would be draconian, 13 not only for us in New York City, but for virtually all the other housing authorities that rely on that 14 15 capital budget. We have also, um, ah, advocated and 16 begun to look at, ah, impacts in our operating 17 budgets. We believe that ah, these decreases, ah, 18 are also significant. They touch our ability to do 19 day-to-day maintenance. But we also believe that, 20 um, we have, ah, some reserves and additional funds 21 that in the event these cuts even came close to being 2.2 implemented we would be able to operate at some 23 period of time, ah, and transition if we had to, ah, if these became cuts that we had to actually deal 24 with. 25 My own view is that we're going to get a

2	different budget out of the Congress than what the
3	president has submitted, just like we have in the
4	past two rounds of budget years. Um, but I won't,
5	um, these are significant cuts again that the
6	president and the administration have proposed and
7	they're unconscionable. I mean, our national need in
8	public housing is around 70 billion dollars in
9	capital backlog. New York is approximately half of
10	that number, a little bit more. To propose in this
11	time period, ah, complete zeroing out is just
12	irresponsible. Um, I wanted to ask, um, ah, my CFO
13	if she had any additional comments on the president's
14	budget.
15	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, before you do,
16	can you just give me the amount on operating? You
17	said 582 million in capital. What is the potential,
18	ah, cut on operating dollars?
19	CHAIR RUSS: Ah
20	UNIDENTIFIED: The potential
21	CHAIR RUSS: Go ahead.
22	UNIDENTIFIED:difference would be a
23	10% cut to NYCHA day-to-day operations.
24	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And how much is
25	that?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 28 1 UNIDENTIFIED: In dollar terms? 2 3 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. 4 UNIDENTIFIED: It would be about 50, 5 we'll get back to you. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. But it would be 6 7 10% of your overall operating budget? 8 CHAIR RUSS: Correct. Did you 9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. OK. 10 want to add anything else? UNIDENTIFIED: I'm the CFO. 11 12 UNIDENTIFIED: Um, I just wanted to 13 clarify it would be 500... 14 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Can you put the mic 15 closer to you? 16 UNIDENTIFIED: 582 million dollars lost in 17 capital funds, a 10% loss in the federal operating 18 funding, so 10% of the 1 billion dollars that we're 19 [inaudible]. 20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, I understand. 21 UNIDENTIFIED: Not the total budget. 2.2 CHAIR RUSS: Right. 23 UNIDENTIFIED: Um, in addition, the Section 8 program has a 5 billion dollar national 24 25

2 decrease and so for NYCHA specifically it could be 3 approximately 6300 vouchers lost.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. That's a lot. 5 I wanted to ask specifically about the state capital Um, I know we've worked closely with 6 funds to NYCHA. 7 Albany to try to not only get the money in the 8 adopted budgets, but make sure that the month is 9 actually given to us so we could draw down on it. Um, the 2016 state-enacted budget, the state provided 10 11 the first major capital investment to NYCHA, ah, about 100 million dollars, which funded a lot of 12 13 smaller capital projects, security upgrades and 14 enhancements, as well as improves to grounds. Um, 15 these funds require that NYCHA work with DASNY, the dormitory authority, to develop a spending plan which 16 17 would be subject to approval by DHCR. Um, to date I 18 wanted to understand where are we on those security 19 enhancement projects, um, as well as some of the 20 other installation projects. How much have we spent of that 100 million dollars to date and what remains 21 outstanding from this initial allocation from 2016? 2.2 23 CHAIR RUSS: Thank you very much for the

question. We are in the process of spending that month. I'm going to ask, um, our EVP for capital,

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 30
2	Steve, to give you the details on where we are with
3	the 100 million that went through the DASNY process.
4	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm.
5	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Thank you
6	very much. Thank you for that question. Um, just
7	one clarification. The, that 100 million was managed
8	and constructed by DASNY.
9	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: By DASNY, right.
10	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Ah,
11	NYCHA capital projects division, or operations, did
12	not, um, manage any of those funds that came in.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right, so DASNY did
14	the work.
15	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Ah, and
16	managed it.
17	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And managed it, OK.
18	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Yep.
19	The funds never came through NYCHA.
20	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
21	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Um,
22	they've completed about 139 projects of the 217
23	originally planned projects. Um, 17 of those are in
24	progress. Ah, nine of those have not started.
25	There's 52 projects that they are reallocating or
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 31
2	have been canceled. Um, and those were broken into
3	three distinct, ah, items. Those are the security
4	projects, the appliances, ah, which were the
5	refrigerators and gas ranges, and in those quality of
6	life projects which were the community centers,
7	landscaping, and playgrounds.
8	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Security cameras,
9	what about key fob and intercom system, was that
10	included?
11	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Yeah,
12	those were part of the security projects which were
13	CCTV, the layered access control, as you just
14	mentioned, some control doors as well as lighting
15	improvements.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
17	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: About 78
18	of those projects are completed. Um, the other 20
19	have been canceled or reallocated by DASNY and the
20	state legislators.
21	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Appliances for
22	new tenants or existing tenants? Do we know?
23	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: I
24	believe it was a mix.
25	
l	

2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Mixture. And the 3 last category described, you said quality of life. 4 That includes community centers, playground, 5 exterior, lot, recreation at some of the 6 developments?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Correct. 8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. OK. Um, and 9 the reason I ask is because in the past some of my colleagues have developments where NYCHA has done 10 11 capital work versus the DASNY capital work and there 12 is a difference in the quality of work that's been 13 done. So this allocation, as you mentioned, was done solely by DASNY. What role did NYCHA have in this? 14 15 Did we, ah, make recommendations, did we oversee? 16 What was the role we played in working with DASNY and 17 DHCR?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Um-hmm. 19 So, um, we worked with DASNY a lot on the lessons 20 learned that we had. Um, also engagement with the 21 residents, engagement with the development staff. We 2.2 were brought up to speed on their schedules in terms 23 of when they were gonna start construction, and we gave them lessons learned on working with the city on 24 constructions projects within the city. 25

2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, and how many
3	projects are remaining, outstanding? You said 17 are
4	in progress, 52 were repurposed, reallocated, and
5	what's remaining to complete?
6	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: So of
7	those 217, the 139 have been completed. So you've
8	got 17 projects that are in progress, nine roughly
9	that have not started yet
10	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: [inaudible]
11	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: and
12	52 that are being repurposed or canceled.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, got it. And
14	since I'm the state, um, I also want to talk about
15	the 2018 enacted budget included 200 million for
16	capital work at NYCHA and the following year, 2019,
17	we had an additional 250 million dollars for critical
18	repairs. Um, however, I think we all understand that
19	that total, 450 million dollars, was not made
20	available to NYCHA until a few months ago. Um, the
21	agreement between NYCHA and DASNY on a grant
22	disbursement agreement in connection with this 450
23	million dollars has been completed. So I wanted to
24	understand the 450 million dollars we council members
25	were notified of which developments included any of

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 34
2	this capital work, specifically boiler replacements
3	and elevator replacements. So I wanted to understand
4	where we are on timing? How many projects have we
5	started, um, and what remains left to be done? And I
6	know this is recent. I'm very clear, we just got
7	this 450 million dollars. I'm very clear on that.
8	CHAIR RUSS: No, thank you very much. Go
9	ahead, Steven. We can, we can run down your list.
10	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: You know
11	that I'm very passionate of our capital projects
12	division, so
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: As is I.
14	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: I, thank
15	you very much for asking for asking that question.
16	Um, the 450 is a reimbursement program and you're
17	absolutely correct, we've now, ah, the monitor has
18	agreed to the GDA action plan, um, which allows us to
19	move forward with those funds. We are doing two
20	different things in the elevator pipeline we are
21	currently in design on those elevators.
22	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
23	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: This is
24	going to be a design, bid, build program and, ah,
25	we're in the design stage at this point in time. We
l	I

2	are on schedule for those elevator programs. The,
3	the heating plan program is actually part of, ah,
4	what the state allowed us to do, which is design and
5	build. We are in the first stage. We will be in the
6	second stage very soon, um, basically within the,
7	within the month on a design build program for the
8	heating pipeline that's associated to the phase one
9	of those heating pipe, ah, heating plants.
10	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. So for the 450
11	million dollars we do have design build authority
12	approved by the state, and who made the determination
13	on which developments would receive the boiler and
14	elevator replacements?
15	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: So those
16	were part of the original allocations with the state
17	legislators and then those are all, ah, online and
18	published in the GDA action plan.
19	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Got it. OK.
20	And we have the list of developments, um, and that's
21	been made available to the council members. Um, I
22	have one question before I turn it over to my
23	colleagues and then I'll circle back. Chair, you
24	alluded in your opening the difference between
25	spending federal capital dollars versus city capital
l	

2 dollars. Um, I got excited when you talked about 3 bringing on a member of the team to focus solely on 4 spending city capital dollars. And I bring that up because the city capital commitment rate for NYCHA 5 has been hovering around 25% for quite a few years. 6 7 Um, it's actually about 30% over the past five years. Um, in 2019 NYCHA committed about 25% of the 1.2 8 9 billion that was allocated in the city's 2019 executive commitment plan. Um, in fiscal 2019 the 10 11 average citywide commit rate across city agencies is 12 Um, so can you explain again why NYCHA does not 70%. 13 spend city capital dollars and what are our plans to 14 draw down on city dollars faster in a more 15 expeditious way and who is this new staff person that 16 we're bringing on and what will their role and 17 responsibility be?

18 CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, Steve and I have 19 talked quite a bit about this because, um, we really 20 feel that we need to make an organizational change as 21 part of, ah, the answer to, to your question. Um, 2.2 and there's two things that will happen 23 organizationally. One is that, um, Steve is establishing a position in his department and that 24 person would be a liaison on the City Council, ah, 25

2 projects that we have, ah, currently and in future. 3 The other thing we've agreed to do, ah, is create a 4 small projects team. So there would be additional support inside of capital for making sure that these 5 funds are, um, expended more timely and, ah, with 6 7 better scheduling and focus. One reason that you see some of the numbers, ah, that you, that you've quoted 8 9 is that, um, the federal government has a process where they will give you a budget, ah, in a 10 11 particular year, give you that month, and they have 12 a, a firm, ah, process where they give you 24 months 13 to obligate those funds, and when they use the term obligate they mean 24 months to design, consider, ah, 14 15 procurement, and sign a contract. Then they give you another 24 months to expend, ah, under the contract 16 17 and complete the hard cost work. And that's a very 18 different process on the federal side than what we go 19 through on the city. And I wanted to ask Steve if he 20 could explain a little bit how the city process is 21 different from that and, um, why that often shows us, 2.2 um, as we do the design part of this with the kind of 23 balances that you're referencing.

24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, well, I will 25 also say, and I understand the federal government

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 38 1 gives you a timeline to obligate funds. If the city 2 3 does not, but that does not mean that we have to 4 allow capital projects to languish and not get 5 started. CHAIR RUSS: No, oh, no, I'm not 6 7 suggesting that. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I don't want to 8 9 suggest that the city starts to put a timeframe on spending city dollars, but something has to be done. 10 11 In the past few fiscal years from 2015 to 2019 NYCHA has been under that 30% capital commitment rate, 12 13 whereas most agencies are closer to 70. So I need to 14 understand what we're doing to improve our commit rate but without a timeframe that should not be a 15 16 reason why city dollars are not spent in a timely fashion. That's not acceptable. 17 18 CHAIR RUSS: No, I... 19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Not for council 20 members that give money to NYCHA every year and we 21 expect our projects to move forward. I just want to make that clear. 2.2 23 CHAIR RUSS: No, I understand, and we have the same expectation, which is why we're making 24 25 the changes that I mentioned earlier, because we

2 definitely feel that, ah, we'd like to line up more 3 closely to the expectation you have for that 4 spending. So, ah, I only call that out because it's a contrast in how the funds are, ah, looked at from, 5 ah, city versus federal. But that does not mean 6 7 we're in any way less committed to getting to the 8 place that you just described, which is more timely 9 and guicker expenditures and, um, that's one of the reasons we're going to do the small projects team. 10 11 We want folks who are devoted to managing these and 12 getting these out the door. But I, I did want to 13 Steve to add, ah, one thing that related to the 14 design period. Like any project we deal with, even 15 the, the smaller ones, ah, that we might have, ah, 16 often through the generosity of a City Council 17 member, ah, we're obligated to do the design, we're 18 obligated to do the planning. There's also, ah, likely a resident engagement piece. We're obligated 19 20 to go to bid, and we're obligated to secure bids that 21 we feel are responsible and reasonable, and then 2.2 we're obligated to do the, the actual construction 23 So in that process, though, um, I wanted Steve work. to kind of just point out how we differ a little a 24

39

2 bit in terms of what we're spending, how the rates 3 show up.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Thank 5 you very much, Greq. So, um, what Greq is explaining in terms of the federal versus the city is the 6 concept of how a project gets constructed. Let's 7 8 say, for example, I have a \$500,000 project. In the 9 federal pipeline I know that the first year is gonna be design. So only 10% of the dollars associated 10 11 with that \$500,000 project are gonna be allocated 12 that first year. And then when we get into the 13 second year we go into construction. And so maybe 14 \$250,000 as we put some more funds up front to get 15 the construction started. And then the remainder of 16 that following year as you close out that project, 17 \$200,000. The difference what Greg was mentioning is 18 in the city program, particularly for NYCHA and maybe 19 not some of the other agencies is that the entire 20 \$500,000 comes into our, our access right up front. 21 So what you, what the numbers say is three years of 2.2 funding is in that single year. So it would actually 23 be not prudent for us to have a higher percentage because that would mean that we spent out three years 24 of funding in one year. We really should be only 25

2 funding 10% of that that first year. We're actually working with OMB and they, we have approved this, 3 4 we're right sizing our portfolio to match how 5 construction happens and how it works with other agencies. So what we will do is we've shown them our 6 7 entire portfolio, all of the schedules, and the first 8 year funding you're only gonna see about 10%, which 9 would have been those design fees. And then the following year you're gonna see the construction fees 10 11 flow into that. It helps the city in terms of right 12 size management. But it will also illustrate that 13 the numbers are better. Um, we were informed that 14 potentially our numbers are, are better than all of 15 the other agencies, or at least comparable to the 16 other agencies if we were to right size those funds. 17 Um, I do want to just give you one more piece is that 18 we have a lot of great wins, ah, with the city. Most 19 of the projects that we're doing, the major 20 initiatives that we're doing, um, are ahead of 21 schedule, um, and not only have they been ahead of 2.2 schedule, we've been working with OMB that they've 23 actually given us more money so we could move them forward. It was mentioned earlier the mayor's 24 roofing, ah, initiative. That was originally 10 25

It was about 100 million each year. 2 years. We've 3 been, we've been doing so well on that program that 4 we've actually moved up to about 200 million each year and we've moved it down to eight years. 5 So we're saving a number of years in the process because 6 7 of the roofing program that's going up. The mayor's heating initiative, we cut back on some procurement 8 9 We, we looked at every single day that we time. could cut out of a schedule, every single day that we 10 11 could cut out of a, ah, a design time where we went from 12 months from design to nine months to design, 12 13 and we're actually on schedule for all of the heating plans that were part of the mayor's heating 14 15 initiative, that was about, ah, nine contracts, 11 16 developments. So in terms of our spend we're 17 actually spending and succeeding really well on those 18 major programs, and I think by right sizing our 19 portfolio you're gonna see the percentages coming out 20 of the, the reports that capital at the New York City 21 Housing Authority is, is actually comparable to all the other agencies or better. 2.2 23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. I thank you for

clarifying. I guess I only wish that we started this process much earlier in terms of working...

2 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 3 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...with OMB on right 4 sizing. Many of us have been here for seven and 10 years and we're still talking about how we can draw 5 down faster on city dollars. So that, it would have 6 7 made sense, but I understand we're here to do work. 8 And we need to make sure that whoever this person is 9 that starts, I'm assuming they're going to be starting sometime soon? 10 11 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 12 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And then also 13 the other part of this conversation, even with design 14 build, we need to work with OMB on vacancies that we 15 identify in the capital division, designers and 16 architects, and if there is a vacancy we need 17 associated with HP, I'm sorry, with OMB to make sure 18 that we can do better recruitment and bring on staff. 19 The challenges that we sometimes understand with many of our agencies is we don't have sufficient staff in 20 21 the capital division. So if there are vacancies we need to fill them. With all of this capital work 2.2 23 that's happening, federal and city dollars, we don't want vacancies in the capital unit, even bringing on 24

a new staffer. So I would expect that to be

21

2.2

23

24

25

2 prioritized and you all working with OMB, um, through 3 this budget process.

4 CHAIR RUSS: Council Member, we, ah, we wholeheartedly agree. We really want to, um, there's 5 a number, there will be a number of other things that 6 7 we'll be bringing to Council in the near term, 8 including better information on the overall capital 9 spend from all sources, ah, the small projects team that we mentioned is about managing those smaller, 10 11 ah, capital programs and, ah, we believe that, ah, 12 working with OMB on how we count the funding and then 13 working our own, ah, with our own crew to get the 14 funding out the door, we are gonna make a turn and 15 can show a change. So, um, ah, these things will be 16 coming into place in the near term and as we get this 17 formed up we will let Council know, ah, when we're, 18 we've shifted to the new form of operation. 19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, I appreciate 20 I'm going to get to my colleagues that have that.

questions as well. I want to acknowledge the

first, ah, Council Member Ruben Diaz, Sr., for

presence of Council Member Mark Gjonaj and Council

Member Bill Perkins, and we will begin council member

questions, ah, with our first colleague that was here

45 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 questions, followed by Council Member Carlina Rivera. 2 3 Thank you, colleagues. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madame Chair Lady. Good morning, ladies and, um, good 5 afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. Mr. Craig Russ? 6 7 CHAIR RUSS: Yes, sir. 8 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] that 9 there's an organization in New York State called NYPIRG, the New York Public Interest Research Group. 10 11 They have had a great success all across the state in 12 reducing fuel costs through group buying. In your 13 statement you said that your utility costs are uncontrollable. My question, have you ever met with 14 15 NYPIRG to enroll in their fuel buying group? 16 CHAIR RUSS: Um, I'm not aware that we 17 have, but we'd certainly be willing to. And I just 18 want to be clear that that term on the uncontrolled 19 costs refers to certain fixed costs in the budget 20 like salaries and benefits that we have to pay, ah, 21 every year. So we'd be glad to get the information 2.2 for the group and I'd be happy to sit with them and 23 see if they can offer us, ah, some opportunities. 24

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 46
2	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Ah, um, could you,
3	can you, so you haven't enrolled or approached NYPIRG
4	to help you reduce fuel costs?
5	CHAIR RUSS: Well, we, we have not as
6	yet. I mean, we, we'd be willing to talk
7	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So I suggest that
8	you should do something right now because if we
9	are
10	CHAIR RUSS: [inaudible] but we're
11	always, we're always looking to do that. Yes.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: OK, so, please do
13	that, because they, they, they are good helping
14	CHAIR RUSS: Sure. And, and I would say
15	we are, ah, working with other groups on our
16	utilities. The energy performance contracts that I
17	mentioned in the testimony, that's a way to reduce
18	utility costs. We have some additional ideas that
19	we're gonna be running out this year and, ah, we're
20	very interested and would be glad to talk with them
21	about their ideas on how we might make an impact.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Can you, can you
23	tell me how many senior centers are located in NYCHA
24	buildings?
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 47
2	CHAIR RUSS: I'm going to ask if, um, the
3	general manager can respond to that question. Senior
4	centers.
5	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sir, I, um,
6	don't have the exact number of centers, um, and we
7	will get that in a few minutes.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: What was that
9	again?
10	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I said we
11	will look for the number of
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: You don't know?
13	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO:senior
14	centers.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: You don't know how
16	many senior centers are located [inaudible]?
17	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I'm sorry,
18	I said just give us a minute, we're looking up that
19	information now.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: That's something
21	you should know, that's [inaudible].
22	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We have,
23	sir, we have 97 senior centers located at NYCHA
24	properties.
25	
I	

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 48 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I just want to know 3 how many senior centers... 4 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: 97, sir. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: OK. So are you implementing any specific measure to protect those 6 7 seniors attending centers in NYCHA? Or are you just 8 leaving that to other city agencies? 9 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sir, if you're speaking specifically about the current issue 10 11 that we're dealing with... 12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I'm, I'm talking 13 about if you have implemented... GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So we have 14 15 a very close... 16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: ...any specific 17 measure to protect seniors that are located in NYCHA 18 building or you leaving that to other city agencies 19 to deal with? 20 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: No sir. 21 We, we have a very close working relationship with 2.2 our city partners, um, primarily with the Department 23 for the Aging. Um, we also have a close relationship with a number of providers and not-for-profit groups. 24 25

49 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 So there's a joint effort in dealing with our 2 3 seniors, um, and their safety and well-being. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So, so you're taking care of the senior in NYCHA buildings? You 5 are taking care of seniors center there? 6 7 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We are doing our absolute to address all of the issues and 8 9 concerns that our seniors are raising, yes. COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Because I, I have 10 11 not heard you or any, even the mayor saying for 12 specific for senior centers in, located in NYCHA 13 building we're doing this, this, and that. I haven't heard that. 14 15 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sir, I 16 believe that, that we did address that in the chair's 17 testimony, that we did call out some the efforts at 18 our senior developments. Ah, with respect to the 19 current... 20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I tell you what I heard. Maybe a... 21 2.2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: OK. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Maybe it's not true, but this is what, I heard that you are telling 24 staff and cutting hours to protect staff from, from 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 50
2	the coronavirus that you are cutting staff
3	[inaudible].
4	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: No, sir,
5	that is not
6	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Cutting hours of
7	work.
8	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO:correct,
9	no, in fact it's just the opposite.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Are you
11	implementing staff to help, ah, decontamination of
12	the senior center located in NYCHA?
13	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sir, we
14	have, um, and the chair mentioned it in his
15	testimony, excuse me, we have 71 buildings where
16	seniors reside. These are senior buildings only,
17	right, and we have started an, an intensive cleaning
18	program. We started this week. By the end of
19	today
20	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So how many, so how
21	many centers
22	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sir
23	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] I'm,
24	I'm concentrating myself in NYCHA, in senior center
25	located in NYCHA. How many senior centers located in

51 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 NYCHA as of today you have a specific [inaudible] 2 3 crew to be decontaminate and clean the, those 4 centers? 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So, sir, I, I want to just kind of differentiate. We have 97 6 7 senior centers in our buildings. The efforts to 8 provide additional cleaning services at those centers 9 are being provided through the Department for the Aging and efforts undertaken by the city. We have 71 10 11 buildings, residential buildings, that are senior 12 buildings only, where we have started an intensive 13 cleaning program where we have brought in outside 14 contractors to supplement the staff. COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: 15 So you don't know, 16 so you don't know how many centers, specific center, 17 you have already cleaned. 18 CHAIR RUSS: But those centers are being 19 cleaned by another [inaudible]. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Are decontaminated. 21 [inaudible] school, are you doing it with 2.2 [inaudible], are you doing with [inaudible], how many 23 center already, oh, we sent a crew there to decontaminate. How many? 24 25

2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: All the 3 centers and buildings are being cleaned daily. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] the 5 answer is no. CHAIR RUSS: The answer is that DFTA and 6 7 the providers in the building are taking on the cleaning that you're, you're discussing. They, they 8 9 are, they are working in the senior centers to do exactly what you described. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: They are working... 11 12 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: ... in the senior 13 center? Could you tell me where, which ones? 14 15 CHAIR RUSS: I, I do not have that 16 information. But I'd be glad to check with DFTA and 17 get back to you and give it to you. It will be, it 18 will be all of them that they have a presence in. 19 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: All 97. 20 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, so we could give you, 21 we can check with DFTA and get that information... 2.2 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So none of, none of 23 us [inaudible] City Council member could go to our district and tell our senior, ah, centers, ah, we, 24 the city are taking care of this center and this 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 53
2	center, yeah, and the senior that come to this center
3	[inaudible] so we, none of us could do that because
4	you don't know how many center have you cleaned up.
5	CHAIR RUSS: No, I, I would, I would say
6	that we have another agency that's working in the
7	center to do the kind of things that you're
8	discussing.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: That's what I asked
10	before. You are leaving that to other city agencies.
11	So now you're gonna leave that
12	CHAIR RUSS: And if
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: for other city
14	agencies.
15	CHAIR RUSS: And if you, if you would
16	like us to get the information on how that cleaning
17	is being conducted and the progress they've made we'd
18	be glad to provide that to you.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: All right.
20	Changing the subject, I have one other question. How
21	are you addressing the underfunded HUD formula used
22	currently. Has, has the law department been helpful
23	with [inaudible], ah, pressure on the equal
24	protection?
25	

54 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 CHAIR RUSS: I'm sorry, could you, 3 could... 4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] how are you addressing, addressing the underfunded HUD 5 formula used currently? Is the law department 6 7 helping you or not? 8 CHAIR RUSS: In, in what you're 9 describing... COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: The [inaudible] 10 11 formula, I mean, the formula that HUD is using is 12 underfunded. 13 CHAIR RUSS: No, that's true, but what I 14 wanted to respond to was, ah, your question about the 15 law department. The way that the federal government, 16 ah, provides the funds to us is there is a formula, 17 for example, on how to calculate the total 18 eligibility for operating subsidy for any housing 19 authority, including NYCHA. Typically what's 20 happened is either the administration or Congress 21 proposes a number that is a percentage of that 2.2 formula, and in, ah, past years it's been higher than 23 we could have expected, around 97%, 98%, um, of, of that. In other years it's been, we've had some 24 25 significant drops. But we're not able to act legally

2	through that because Congress is appropriating what
3	think they can afford to appropriate. Um, it's not a
4	question of us being able to go back to HUD and say,
5	um, we want you to change the formula or fund the
6	full amount. Congress has that discretion to fund
7	that formula at whatever level they feel they need to
8	fund it at. It's not something we could, um, attack
9	or sue on.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: But there's
11	something called equal protection.
12	CHAIR RUSS: Yes, sir, there is. And,
13	um, but in terms of appropriations at the federal
14	level they really do, ah, they really do have the
15	final say on how much money they can put into the
16	program.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: All right, last
18	question. We all know about the lead, the lead, um,
19	poisoning, the lead problem that we're having. Ah,
20	what, what independent resource, resources you use to
21	watch the lead compliance unit, yeah, I mean, you
22	have, you have a unit to, to, to do the, with the
23	lead compliance and now who's watching that unit?
24	CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, I'm going to start
25	and then ask the general manager if he wants to add
l	

2	anything. So in terms of the work that follows, ah,
3	so that we're either remediating or abating lead in
4	the unit, that work can be checked by our compliance
5	department. Ah, it can also be checked by the
6	Environmental Health and Safety and if we wanted to
7	Quality Assurance as well. Those three departments
8	that I mentioned in the testimony create something
9	that NYCHA's not had before, and that is the ability
10	to go out, validate that work has been done, that
11	it's been done properly, and that any kind of work
12	ticket associated with that has been appropriately
13	closed. Um, so those departments are checking on
14	that kind of work. And I don't know if, Vito, you
15	wanted to add anything?
16	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure. Sir,
17	if I could just add one other piece, um, to the
18	oversight? Currently we have 15 contracts for XRF
19	testing. We also have two additional contracts just
20	for QA. So these are vendors that do not have
21	contracts, um, with us for the testing. But they're
22	going out there and doing quality assurance testing
23	as well.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So, so you, you're
25	not trusting what they're telling you. You are

57 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 verifying what they tell, ah, what they tell you, 3 'cause they have a unit, they [inaudible] report you 4 are not trusting that. You have somebody else to check that report. 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We have 6 7 multiple ways of, of... 8 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I'm glad to hear 9 that. GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: ...quality 10 11 controls, yes. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I'm glad to hear 13 that. Thank you. Thank you [inaudible]. 14 CHAIR RUSS: Thank you. 15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, Council 16 Member. And just expanding a little bit on what the 17 council member was talking about as it relates to the 18 97 senior centers that are in NYCHA developments but 19 are managed by DFTA and contracted out to local 20 community-based organizations, while NYCHA no longer 21 manages these centers it's really incumbent upon you 2.2 to make sure that the senior centers are protected. 23 So I know you, Chair, you, you expressed the interagency coordination with OEM and the mayor's 24 25 office, but what are we specifically doing with the

2 Department for the Aging to ensure that the CBOs on 3 the ground have the supplies, the equipment, the 4 materials, the staffing that they need to completely clean, fumigate, and make sure that senior centers 5 are clean? Is there anything we're doing 6 7 differently? And then I would also say the same question goes for DYCD. Our community centers in 8 9 NYCHA are also contracted out to local CBOs. So are we having those conversations? What does that look 10 11 like? And even though NYCHA no longer manages, this 12 is your property and so we expect to make sure that 13 there remains a level of oversight. So can you 14 clarify that so we all understand what exactly is 15 being done? 16 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure, so if I can with, um, respect to the senior centers. Um,

17 18 so we are part of a multiagency task force, um, and 19 the other agencies that are on the task force, um, 20 include the, um, Department for the Aging as well as 21 Department of Health. We do daily calls with them, and there have been a number of initiatives, um, that 2.2 23 so there, we, um, the PEU, which is the unit that goes out and do the door knocks, have been canvassing 24 all the centers. Um, they're mobilizing plans, um, 25

2 to serve senior citizens, to increase Meals on Wheels if it's necessary. So there is a daily check-in that 3 4 we are part of, um, and very focused on senior centers. We've also done very specific, um, outreach 5 to seniors in four different languages. In fact we 6 7 just pushed out another robocall today, um, that is 8 again just reminding seniors, um, about how they can 9 properly protect themselves, um, against exposure to the germs. So those are just some of, I mean, we can 10 11 kind of outline for you in more detail the efforts 12 that are being made and focused on seniors. 13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Out of the agencies you describe, between NYCHA, DFTA, and DOHMH 14 15 do you know yourself are any of the agencies physical 16 going to visit centers? Robocalls I appreciate, 17 phone calls I appreciate, emails I appreciate, but we 18 also appreciate on the ground visits. Are we going 19 physically into these centers? 20 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Yes, yes. 21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 2.2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: There are 23 staff that are canvassing each of the centers. 24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, OK. Now what 25 about DYCD?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 60 1 2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We'll have 3 to get back to you... 4 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: ... on DYCD. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And now the 6 7 other question I have, since we mentioned and are 8 talking about seniors who sometimes have, um, more of 9 a vulnerability in terms of compromising immune systems, the 71 senior buildings that may or may not 10 11 have a senior center on the development, those are the stand-alone centers, sorry, stand-alone buildings 12 13 that we have, what are we doing there, because 14 they're really, there's no staff, um, sometimes no 15 super that lives in the building, what are we doing to monitor those seniors as well, because they really 16 17 are out there by themselves. They have no one to 18 monitor them. Um, are we visiting those buildings in 19 particular? 20 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure, so we 21 have increased our presence at those developments. 2.2 We've posted, um, signage in each of the buildings, 23 not just the senior buildings, but every building within our portfolio, and, again, specific for the 71 24 25 senior buildings. We started a cleaning and

protective measure initiatives. By the end of today 2 3 we will have addressed approximately 50 of the 71 4 senior buildings with the first phase, which is of a thorough cleaning of touch points. So that would 5 include the building entrance door, mail boxes, 6 elevator controls, um, the hopper door handles. As I 7 8 said, this is a very, um, aggressive effort. The 9 second phase of this is the contractor will be coming back out to apply a solution that is a combination of 10 11 a deep cleaning agent, um, as well as a protective coating. So it's kind of like a Scotch guarding of 12 13 sorts. This protective coating actually will kill 14 germs before it makes contact with the surface. The 15 recommendation was to do a reapplication every 90 16 days, right. We are at the senior buildings doing a 17 reapplication of that solution every 30 days. 18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 19 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: But we 20 already have contracts in place, right, and the 21 initiative has already begun. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: This includes doors, 23 windows, walls, common areas? 24

61

1	
2	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So, again,
3	we're focused on the lobbies. We're touching on the
4	high traffic
5	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, well, no, I'm in
6	the lobby. The walls in the lobby, the doors.
7	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Again, most
8	people do not touch the walls, so it's the doors,
9	it's the handles, the push plates, right, it's the
10	elevator controls, the mailboxes, the hopper doors.
11	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
12	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: But this is
13	not a cleaning of every surface in the lobby,
14	because, again, we've worked with a number of
15	agencies, both at the, um, the city and federal level
16	and we've looked at CDC guidances and Department of
17	Health and Mental Hygiene guidance, um, and we've
18	talked to a number of people in the industry, and the
19	recommendation is not to do a thorough cleaning of
20	the entire lobby but certain touch points.
21	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Who's making this
22	recommendation?
\sim	CENEDAL MANACED MILEDACULOLO. Co thoma

23 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So there,24 there are a group of, um, agencies, including the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 63 1 2 Department of Health, we've talked to experts in the 3 industry. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And when will 4 you get to all 71? You said you're at 50 now? 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: By the end 6 7 of today we will have completed the first phase, which is a cleaning of ... 8 9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: ... 10 11 approximately 50 of the 71. The contractor is working through the weekend as well. 12 13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, good. Are we 14 using any different types of solution and materials 15 that are in terms of quality, quality materials to 16 clean and completely desensitize, are we using 17 anything different than what we normally have done? 18 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, we, the contractor 19 that we described is using, um, a bleach type wipe, 20 ah, on the surfaces. Ah, we have observed the 21 contractor's crew going out to look at it. They're 2.2 wiping them down, ah, with that material first and, 23 um, kind of sanitizing that way. So this is a, ah, difference than, um, some of the other products that 24 25

64 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 we've been using. This is actually, ah, a 3 disinfectant-based product. 4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: And I would say, too, that the chemical, the solution that 6 7 they're using, it's not a chemical, a solution that 8 they're using for the protection of these surfaces is 9 kind of cutting edge, right. It's not a standard off the shelf solution, right. So it's, it's eco-10 11 friendly, um, and... 12 CHAIR RUSS: It's a biofilm. 13 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Biofilm. 14 CHAIR RUSS: And, um, it's, it's designed 15 to, um, if any, ah, bacteria or virus comes to rest it's actually designed to, ah, inhibit or, inhibit 16 17 them. 18 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Right. 19 CHAIR RUSS: And it, um, does it, does it 20 through a biological, ah, approach. 21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 2.2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So I was 23 out at three of our centers, ah, senior buildings, on Wednesday, um, watching the first phase of the 24 25 cleaning.

2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, understand.
3 Thank you. Ah, let me get to Council Member Carlina
4 Rivera, followed by Council Member Peter Koo. Thank
5 you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so much 6 7 for being here, and thank you, Madam Chair. You 8 know, we, I know your work [inaudible] frustration. 9 All of us are very, very, um, anxious. And so I just want you to know that we're asking you a lot of these 10 11 question and, and some of them are kind of the same, 12 but it's because NYCHA historically has kind of let 13 us down. So we're asking you these questions because even in the testimony, right in the beginning it says 14 15 we created an internal task force that is planning 16 our response, that is planning our response. It's 17 here. So we just want to make sure that whatever it 18 is that you need that we are able to advocate for 19 you, because with seniors at such a high risk and, 20 and no supplies seemingly to be found anywhere, we 21 want to make sure your connection with the mayor and 2.2 the governor, potentially, could at least give you 23 the supplies that you need. But those aren't my question. Those are not my questions. It, it is, it 24 is just very frustrating and we want to make sure 25

2 that as we look at public systems, I always say that, 3 you know, a part of our public systems and, and 4 general infrastructure, NYCHA should always be 5 considered. So the same care and attention and funding that we give to our hospitals and our 6 transit, people don't talk about public housing in 7 8 the same way. And so, I mean, I, I think we should 9 fully fund public housing, um, but that's my personal So let me ask you a couple questions about 10 stance. 11 the actual budget. So you mentioned that two-thirds 12 of NYCHA's operating budget is from the federal 13 government and the city contributes 262 million per But what's the state's contribution to NYCHA's 14 year. 15 expense budget? 16 CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, right now I believe 17 the state's is all capital, and, ah, there, there 18 isn't an operating baseline coming from, all the 19 state money has been capital. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: OK. You have 32 21 billion in capital needs and the number is expected to double within 10 years, and while I think that all 2.2 23 levels of government, state, federal, and city, should be contributing, we know that operational 24 funding for ongoing maintenance and repairs is 25

essential for avoiding large, large capital backlogs like the one we're experiencing right now. So do you have an estimate for repairs and maintenance needs this year, and how much expense funding would be needed to cover this?

7 CHAIR RUSS: So I would, ah, think, now 8 you're making me think about, so I would 9 differentiate inside the operating budgets, and I'll ask the CFO and the GM if they want to weigh in. 10 11 Inside the operating budgets there are funds for the 12 crews, the repairs, the day-to-day maintenance. At 13 NYCHA day-to-day maintenance could be something very 14 simple, like, oh, gee, we have to go adjust a door 15 closer or something like that. But because of the 16 condition of the buildings those repairs can become 17 extensive and complex, especially the ones with the mold and the leaks. So I would say that the budgets 18 19 reflect the ability to get, um, ah, our crews into 20 the properties to, to make those essential repairs. 21 But at some point I would also say that we're, we're 2.2 in the position where we need in addition to the 23 daily day-to-day expense, we are going to need a very large infusion of capital, ah, across the entire 24 25 portfolio. Um, when you look at the, um, RAD and

PACT conversions, those alone have raised 1.1 billion in hard costs. Those are actual repair costs. That number has to repeat many times across the portfolio, and I wanted to ask the CFO if she could give you a breakdown on where the money is going so you can get a sense of what we're spending, ah, to your first point on the day-to-day operations.

9 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT: Um, so in terms of the uses of funding, we have an expense 10 11 budget that is 3.75 billion dollars. 1.4 billion of 12 that is for personnel services. So that includes 13 salary and expenses for the 11,339 employees at the 14 authority. The lion's share of those employees are 15 at the front line, so they're in the operations space. So that accounts for already 38% of our 16 17 In addition we have 377 million in budget. 18 contracts, so that's 10%. So that's vendors to help 19 us to supplement the work being done at the 20 properties. That also includes some staff 21 augmentation, so to hire temporary staff to help out 2.2 in key target areas where we need additional support. 23 In addition, we have 269 million, so another 7% in other services. So this accounts for supplies, 24 25 equipment, and all the other materials that we need

2	to support the front lines. The remaining balance is
3	554 million in utilities. So that's at 15% of cost
4	that Greg alluded to before. So that accounts for
5	heating, electricity, oil, gas, everything that our
6	173 some odd thousand units need to continue to run.
7	And the remaining balance, that 1.1 billion, that's
8	Section 8 payments to landlords. So, as mentioned,
9	we get the Section 8 funding from HUD and most of it
10	goes out to the landlords and NYCHA keeps a small
11	portion for the administration which is allowed by
12	the federal government.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: OK, I want to ask
14	about NYCHA 2.0. That's a pretty ambitious, ah, goal
15	for raising capital funds, yet only raises enough to
16	cover 75% of the capital needs. Do you have a real
17	estate analysis that shows how realistic the
18	valuation of the NYCHA 2.0 is?
19	CHAIR RUSS: So, um, let me start by
20	saying that, ah, in terms of the, um, RAD and PACT
21	deals that we're actually on, ah, target. Ah, by the
22	end of the year we hope to have over 20,000 units in
23	the pipeline. And those closings, the ones that we
24	just experienced and the ones that we've had, ah,
25	historically, are producing, ah, significant, ah,
I	I

11

2 capital funds for hard costs. Um, for example, um, 3 the Brooklyn, um, mega bundle is going to produce, 4 ah, approximately 371 million dollars in hard costs from, from that deal. 5

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: But does it 6 7 change, I mean, does it change the 75/25 factor? Ι mean, is it financially sound to kind of offload the 8 9 majority of your assets to only 75% of your needs, and do you have plans for raising the remaining 25%? 10

CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, at, at the property 12 level these projects are penciling out and are 13 meeting the need. And if you look across all the 14 different options that come with 2.0, um, the numbers 15 that you're referencing were based on the assumptions 16 that we'd have a blend of approaches, which includes, 17 ah, RAD, which includes build to preserve and 18 transfer to preserve. And, um, we've targeted 19 62,000-plus units for those. We think that, um, 20 that's still a good number. But I would say to you 21 that we are also working on developing, ah, a set of capital plans for the other 110,000 units. 2.2 Um, I 23 hope in the next near term we would be able to begin to present ideas that would show a capital plan goal 24 and ambition for the entire portfolio. So that is 25

2 coming, ah, and would supplement and actually 3 compliment what we're doing with, ah, 2.0.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: OK, and this is my last question, Madam Chair. The CR office 5 received an increase in complaints about sanitary 6 7 conditions on developments and general cleanliness and maintenance concerns, and our office was told 8 9 that NYCHA had cut development maintenance positions and changed the cleaning schedules, which was the 10 11 cause of these complaints. NYCHA is adding 632 12 positions this fiscal year. How many of these 13 positions will be directly in developments to address 14 the understaffing problems, and I know there's the 15 added factor of increased cleaning.

16 CHAIR RUSS: Sure. Ah, almost all those 17 positions are intended to go to front line. Um, so 18 we want to, we recognize that we are thin there, 19 properties and skilled trades both, and I didn't know 20 if the general manager wanted to add anything on the 21 scheduling.

GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure, so I think what you're referencing is what we refer to as AWS, the alternative work schedule, um, which is a new schedule that we rolled out, um, last March for

72 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 That was the first title that we 2 caretakers. 3 negotiated, the contract language went. And I admit 4 that it's been a rocky rollout. Um, some 5 developments have embraced the concept of AWS. Um, other developments are still struggling with the 6 7 concept of it. I think we need to keep in mind that the work schedule had not changed for over 50 years. 8 9 This is a new concept for the majority of our staff. Ah, we have trained over 450 supervisors, um, with 10 11 respect to AWS. We're doing time and motion studies. 12 Then we're bringing on a consultant to help us deal 13 with the developments that are still struggling with 14 the concept of AWS. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So I just want to 16 thank you. I, I know that it's maybe the first 17 change in 50 years, but, I mean, that's, it's still 18 our obligation. So I just ... 19 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I'm sorry, 20 to add... 21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yeah. 2.2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We've, 23 we've gone from an 8 to 4:30 five day a week work schedule to a seven-day work schedule from 6:00 a.m. 24

to 7 p.m., and in fact through AWS we were able to

2 add an additional 210 caretakers, of which 70% of 3 those were residents.

4 So I just want to COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: 5 echo, um, the Madam Chair's, ah, comments on creating a new position devoted to the management of the 6 capital projects. Because I don't even know how many 7 8 employees are dedicated to this now, but our concern 9 has always been over the pipeline and how much we allocate in like a senior building elevator. Like 10 how is that not a priority? Why does it take so 11 12 long? I know she asked you all of these questions. 13 I just want to reiterate that sometimes I think it's 14 not so much as creating a new position, but looking 15 at what exists and what's not working. And then the 16 last thing I'll say is in terms of FEMA, I have a lot 17 of FEMA work going on my, on our campuses. It's kind of a mess. It's getting a little bit better. 18 But I 19 just hope that you'll go over the budget. I, I've 20 asked for an audit of the FEMA work and I just want 21 to be responsive to, and be fiscally responsible 2.2 that, you know, this is 2.9 billion, there's 1.7 23 billion dollars of work that has been already completed according to your testimony, and I just 24 don't know if we're gonna go over budget and what 25

74 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 that means for the quality of life of my residents. 3 And I know we took you on a tour, ah, Mr. Chair, 4 along with the ... 5 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: ... the local 6 7 electeds, including Congresswoman Nidia Velasquez, 8 and, and I just really want to emphasize just please 9 stay on top of some of this work and make sure it's done expeditiously and on time and on budget. 10 11 CHAIR RUSS: No, I, I appreciate your 12 comments very much because having been there at the 13 site with you and going to some of the other sites, 14 this is an enormous construction job and comes with 15 all the issues and disruption. Ah, I known Steven 16 and Capital are committed to, um, really stepping up 17 to make sure we can address some of the complaints, 18 which in some ways when we were there that day were 19 just tangential to the work. Like I want the light 20 moved or, and we want to be more responsive to that 21 and we're committed to doing that. So thank you. 2.2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: And 23 Councilwoman, if I may, so the earlier statement or comment that you made, um, with reference to the task 24 force and our preparations, I think it's important to 25

2	note that we have been at the table, um, from the
3	very beginning. Ah, so we, I have personally been on
4	all the interagency, um, meetings, um, with the
5	mayor's office and all the, ah, city agencies. Um,
6	we are constantly being asked what our needs are, um,
7	where we are with respect to our planning, and, um,
8	the planning is developing. Um, as we receive more
9	information and learn more about how we can better
10	address the issues at our developments and better
11	protect our residents and our staff, we're pushing
12	out notifications, we're educating, um, our residents
13	and staff. We're changing our plan, um, as more
14	information comes in.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you. Thank
16	you so much, Madam Chair.
17	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you so much,
18	Council Member, and just to add a little bit on. Ah,
19	the Council Member talked a lot about NYCHA 2.0 and
20	in your testimony you talked about the conversion of
21	7800 apartments across 30 developments, um, the 1.1
22	billion dollars in hand and hard costs for the
23	capital needs of the properties. You talked about
24	closing on the seventh PACT transaction. So even
25	

76 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 with all that we described, all that's in the queue, 3 um, there's still that 8.9 billion dollar gap. 4 CHAIR RUSS: That's correct. 5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, now, is there a timeframe in which we should expect that there will 6 7 be a plan released? Like should we be looking to get 8 this by the executive budget? Is this something that 9 we will see in the immediacy or is this more of a long-term plan to address that? 10 11 CHAIR RUSS: No, it's, ah, something we 12 hope to, ah, have out in the very near term, ah... 13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. CHAIR RUSS: ... in the next, um, ah, 30 to 14 15 60 days, and begin to actually circulate the ideas, ah, and, um, present them to the community at large. 16 17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. 18 CHAIR RUSS: So it's coming in the near 19 term. 20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. Ah, next 21 we'll have Council Member Peter Koo, followed by 2.2 Council Member Diana Ayala. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chairlady. And thank you, um, Chairman Russ and your 24 Ah, I'm Council Member Peter Koo, Flushing 25 team.

2 [inaudible]. I will focus my questions on the Bland 3 House in Flushing, Queens. Last year, ah, the, the 4 chair of the Committee on Housing, on public housing, 5 Ampry-Samuel and I, walked from Bland House to visit the management's office during the posted hours. 6 The 7 door was locked. We reported this to NYCHA. NYCHA 8 promised that they would ensure that the office would 9 be open during posted hours. Now I'm being told that the four developments have been combined to one 10 11 management office and receiving complaints from 12 residents. The four developments are Bland House, 13 Leavitt 34th, 125-0122 Avenue, and [inaudible] 14 Gardens. When did the consolidations of [inaudible] 15 management office occur? Did you know that? 16 CHAIR RUSS: I'm... 17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: The, the four 18 developments, they have only management office. 19 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, we have to, yeah. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: When did it happen? 21 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So, sir, 2.2 I'm sorry, but we will have to check into this 23 information and get back to you, but this is the first that we at the table are hearing this. 24 25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Oh.

78 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So we do 3 need to find out. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Because our, our office wasn't notified. 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: OK, sir, 6 7 when was this? 8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And, ah, the 9 residents because many of them are senior citizens. CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. 10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Because it's hard for them to walk a mile to make a complaint. 12 13 CHAIR RUSS: So, first off, the offices 14 should be open on the hours we say they should be 15 open, and I would like to follow that up based on the 16 feedback you're giving us right now. And secondly, 17 um, I would commit to, ah, if, if you would like 18 coming and either meeting with you or walking the 19 site so we can see what you see and we can take 20 appropriate steps to make sure that, ah, we're 21 addressing the problems that you're, you're 2.2 communicating to us. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So my second question is on the scaffolding. The, the Bland House 24 is currently surrounded by scaffolding which is 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 79
2	blocking the security cameras the day I found it.
3	Ah, the residents have been reporting to me that they
4	feel unsafe. So, ah, what existing project currently
5	requires scaffolding, and when can the residents
6	expect the scaffolding to be removed, because it has
7	been up there for a long time and they, they didn't
8	see them do anything.
9	CHAIR RUSS: Um, thank you for that. I'm
10	going to ask Steven to, to talk to you a little bit
11	about the scaffolding.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah. And then if
13	the scaffolding has to stay can NYCHA provide
14	temporary cameras, because it's blocking the original
15	cameras that we put up there.
16	CHAIR RUSS: And to the camera question,
17	yes, we would be interested in seeing those locations
18	and making sure they're in the right spot.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Um-hmm.
20	CHAIR RUSS: If you have some that you
21	can, that you know or the residents have pointed out,
22	we'd be glad to work and see if we can that part of
23	it addressed.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: OK.
25	

T	
2	CHAIR RUSS: And I'm going to ask Steven
3	to talk about the scaffolding at that, at the
4	location.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah. So my, my
6	last question is on capital projects. For fiscal
7	year 2017 I put in funding for a security gate
8	similar to the one at International House in Jamaica.
9	And also for grounds beautifications. Five years
10	later I have heard nothing on the project. So I want
11	to find out the status.
12	CHAIR RUSS: OK.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah. And also
14	fiscal 2020 I funded new lighting on the development
15	on Bland House, and only two out of the five
16	buildings have seen an update on the, the new
17	lighting. Ah, we can we expect the remaining three
18	buildings to get updated?
19	CHAIR RUSS: OK.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: On Bland House,
21	yeah.
22	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.
23	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Yup, so,
24	um, currently the 2020 allocation funding here for
25	the \$300,000 for lighting upgrades and that is, is

2	being, it's in construction and it's in, in that
3	phase. The Local Law 11 work, that's the emergency
4	shedding work. Um, at this point in time the funding
5	year for the work, the façade work associated to that
6	is 2023. Um, and that is when the shed, or the work
7	associated to those sheds will start.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Hmm, because, ah,
9	the reason I want to make a complaint now is because
10	normally I wouldn't be because I'm not a committee
11	member. But we [inaudible] this, these three
12	questions, ah, to NYCHA for many months. We didn't
13	get any answer, and finally my staff, ah, emailed to
14	the, to the, ah, respondent, to the boss of the place
15	and we still didn't get an answer. She just said
16	we'll get back to you, so, so I want you to improve,
17	ah, communications of, from council members because
18	we feel [inaudible], we send you an email and you
19	never replied to us.
20	CHAIR RUSS: No, that, that doesn't work
21	for me and it doesn't work for you.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah.
23	CHAIR RUSS: And, ah, um, if you feel
24	that you've got an issue with our response
25	

82 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So I have to come 3 here, right, to make a complaint. 4 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. No, I, you're, no, you're letting me know, I appreciate it. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah. 6 7 CHAIR RUSS: And I, I would commit to you 8 that, ah, we have a group, ah, that is interested in 9 getting your email and getting your questioned answered. And if it comes to us or to Brian or 10 11 through the GM, however, ah, we're gonna commit to 12 get back to you with more information. And we'd be 13 glad to, um, spend a little time at the site with 14 you, if you'd like to. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes. 16 CHAIR RUSS: I'd like to, ah, ah, to 17 offer that, number one. Number two, we, ah, would 18 like to get those camera locations pointed out to us 19 so we could move them and then we can, ah, spend a little more time talking about the work that's gonna 20 21 be done on the façade that requires us to put the 2.2 sheds there. So let's see if we could work something 23 out. COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: OK. 24 25

83 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 CHAIR RUSS: I'd, I'd be happy to do 3 that. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, so, thank you, thank you for your leadership, yeah. 5 CHAIR RUSS: Thank you. Thank you for 6 7 bringing this to our attention. 8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, Council 9 Now we have Council Member Diana Ayala, Member. followed by Council Member Mark Gjonaj. 10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you, Madam 12 Chair. Um, I want to piggyback off of what, ah, 13 Council Member Koo was asking regarding the 14 scaffolding because it's, it's something that really, 15 um, I don't understand, um, there seems to be an 16 uptick in the number of developments that are now 17 surrounded by scaffolding, but there was never any 18 real clear, um, explanation as to why there was a 19 need to put up so much scaffolding so quickly and at 20 so many developments at the same time. You know, so 21 we could only conclude that there was an issue maybe 2.2 with brickwork that had been done before and maybe 23 some sort of failed inspection. It would have been nice to have a little bit of clarity on that. I 24

25

4

2 think some of the resident leaders would, um, would 3 express the same.

CHAIR RUSS: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: However, we get like, you know, so, one, I would like to know what's 6 7 happening with this, why scaffolding was put up, but wondering if there has been any conversation at NYCHA 8 9 or between NYCHA and the DOB regarding the, ah, the potential, ah, implications to public safety that the 10 11 scaffolding coupled with the new netting and the chain link fence, ah, you know, put some developments 12 13 at risk of.

14 CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, I'm gonna answer, 15 ah, one part of the, the, ah, your question in terms of, ah, getting information on why the scaffolding is 16 17 We have, ah, two ideas that we're going to there. 18 be, I think, running out soon. One would be that 19 we're gonna use construction signage on the 20 scaffolding to talk about hey, here's the date it 21 went in, here's why it went in, and we're gonna post 2.2 that in, um, more than one language, and additionally 23 we're also looking to, and this one is, I would classify this as more of a demonstration. We want to 24 put, just like when you're walking down the street 25

2 and you, you go to the subway, you see the screens 3 there that give you information on the trains or, we 4 want to put those, try those in the lobbies, so that if you come in, um, you're at the elevator, you could 5 get updates on what's going on in the building that 6 day. You could updates on long-term projects like 7 8 the scaffolding, so that the communication about why 9 it's there and for how long is, is better. Um, I want Steven to talk a little bit about the issues 10 11 that we have when the scaffolding goes up and, and 12 understand that. And I would only preface his 13 comments by saying when we have facade work, um, 14 it's, some of the most expensive work that we can 15 undertake and, ah, also some of the hardest to do 16 logistically, but, um, if you could just kind of get 17 to some of the questions the Council Member had. 18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Yep, um, 19 I'll be, I'll be brief. The, the sidewalk sheds that 20 go up, the emergency shedding that goes up, that is 21 legislated. Um, every five years there is a facade 2.2 review, where a report is, ah, implemented into the 23 Department of Buildings system. If there is an unsafe condition within that facade then within 24 24 25 hours we are required to put up sidewalk sheds to

2 protect the residents and the neighborhood from that 3 particular element. Um, this doesn't give us a lot 4 of time and we are working with the developments to, to inform them as much time in advance, and then when 5 we put those sidewalk sheds up that day we walk over 6 7 to the development office to make sure that the 8 cameras are, um, we look through the screens to make 9 sure which ones of the cameras are blocked and which ones aren't to, to make changes to those cameras. 10 11 We're putting up a lot of sidewalk sheds, as you 12 mentioned. Um, that's part of the legislation and we 13 recognize that there are every once in a while 14 cameras that we're just not gonna hit. Um, 15 definitely when they get brought to our attention we 16 immediately go and out and make those changes, so 17 that way the cameras are there. Um, but then it 18 comes the piece of the funding of the actual work 19 that's associated to that wall. It is a difficult 20 portfolio for us. It's a big portfolio, and those 21 funds are not capital eligible. They're not bond 2.2 money and so we have to look at other funding sources 23 to do the work on Local Law 11 work. So that's either taking some of the federal dollars away from, 24 ah, the big federal capital projects that we're doing 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 87
2	or the community development block grant money, which
3	is what we usually use that, ah, some of those funds
4	for.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: So in other words
6	the scaffolding has the potential to be there for a
7	couple of more years before we identified funding.
8	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Yes.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I get that. But I
10	have a couple of concerns, and quite honestly I'm
11	annoyed because Millbrook, for instance, has
12	scaffolding again and they just did their brickwork
13	three years, four years ago, so it should still be
14	under warranty, and I, I don't understand like what,
15	what happened, um, and I get that you only get 24
16	hours to put up the scaffolding, but the scaffolding,
17	in all fairness, has been up at those developments
18	for months and they still to this day do not know why
19	the scaffolding went up. So at some point, even
20	after the fact, it would have been nice to know,
21	because I've asked several times as well about, you
22	know, why the scaffolding. So, again, I, this is
23	what I'm sharing with my resident leaders is that I
24	can only conclude that upon inspection there was some
25	sort of deficiency that was identified, um, that the
I	

2 rest of us just don't know about. Um, I, I get that, 3 I get that we have, you know, horrible contractors 4 that are doing work at NYCHA that we're dependent on. 5 I'm, ah, excited about that. I do not applaud that. I think that we do the city and NYCHA the service 6 7 because we're spending month two and three times over 8 for the same work. However, on the public safety, 9 there's nothing I can do to change that immediately. I'm gonna, I'm gonna accept that. However, regarding 10 11 the public safety of the residents there is a lot 12 that we can do and it's not just a matter of 13 positioning and repositioning the cameras, which was 14 an issue, but it's also an issue that the chain link 15 fences are required to have mesh, which five, six 16 years ago was not a requirement and that poses, ah, a 17 safety issue, um, risk to the residents because 18 sometimes you can't see. I will admit that in the 19 last few years we have changed the, the type of mesh. 20 So I remember walking into Carver and it was like 21 walking, you know, into a maze. It was black mesh, 2.2 you couldn't see out, you couldn't see in, we had an 23 abundance of robberies that were occurring, you know, during that time. They changed to a more transparent 24 It's still not the best. I have the most 25 one.

2 public housing of any member in this body and I have 3 a serious gun violence issue. Last summer I had 4 almost 30 shootings at my public housing developments. So right I'm terrified for what is to 5 come this summer if now we're adding an additional 6 issue that could potentially put people's lives at 7 8 So, you know, I get that, that we're required, risk. 9 we're mandated by law to do certain things, but it doesn't preclude us from being able to try to think 10 11 outside of the box and figuring out how do we then 12 ensure the public safety of these tenants because we 13 recognize that these specific developments are having 14 That is, that is, ah, that's something that issues. 15 I really want a response to. And two, the 16 scaffolding is also allowing for a significant 17 accumulation of garbage at the public housing 18 developments and I, my understanding is that the 19 contractors are supposed to clean on the opposite 20 side of the, of the fencing and then NYCHA staff can 21 only clean on the outside. I'm not sure. But if you 2.2 look at the developments the, the fencing goes all 23 the way to the bottom. So even if the staff attempted they couldn't even reach the garbage 24 because the fence goes all the way to the floor. 25 So

2 there's no where, there's no place to even put a 3 broom in. Ah, but the large accumulation of garbage 4 obviously is a problem when we're talking about, you know, the large, ah, rodent infestation that we're 5 also seeing. So, so there are a lot of things that, 6 7 yes, a monetary, ah, restrictions. However, there 8 are other ways that we could be helpful. And two of 9 those things on the top list of priorities this summer for me are obviously the, the scaffolding and 10 11 the public safety, um, issues that that poses for, 12 for my constituencies. And also the amount of 13 garbage accumulation that has been allowed to, um, to 14 occur since the time that the scaffolding went up. 15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Um, 16 thank you. I think I, I have about five pieces 17 here... 18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes. 19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: And I'll 20 try to respond to each of those. Um, you're 21 absolutely right where it's a five-year cycle with 2.2 the Local Law 11. So if you get a report and then 23 the report goes in and you have an unsafe condition, immediately in 24 hours you get the sidewalk sheds 24 going up. If we identify funding for that particular 25

2 element, so remember Local Law 11 is only that 3 element that was an unsafe condition, the contractor 4 goes in and takes care of those elements. That following year you get the sidewalk sides go down and 5 then you're in that five-year cycle again. 6 The five-7 year cycle does not start when the work ends. The 8 five-year cycle is from the original five-year cycle. 9 So immediately we have to put in the next report and if, let's say for example that brick was taken care 10 11 of, that section of the wall was taken care of, but if there's now same deterioration in that wall based 12 13 on, on rain, snow, sleet, all of those issues, then all of a sudden now you have sidewalk sheds that go 14 15 up for that section of the wall. And so it's a cycle and we are working with, um, our contractors to look 16 17 at the building facades a little bit more 18 holistically. That does cost more month, but we're, 19 we're analyzing that to make sure that at the end of 20 the day we're not putting up sidewalk sheds and then 21 doing the work that's associated to that specific report and then having to put sidewalk sheds up again 2.2 23 in two years because, or a year, because a different report goes in that identifies a different section of 24 25 that façade that has the errors. Um, we do have a

lot of contractors. Um, Greq mentioned the amount of 2 3 spend that we're going through and the amount of, ah, 4 contracts that we have out there. We monitor those 5 contractors. We have quality safety and We have assistant project managers 6 construction. 7 that are, and project managers that are going out to 8 the field regularly, announced and unannounced, and, 9 ah, when we find that we have a bad actor we, we move immediately to make sure that we can remedy that. 10 Ι 11 quarantee, based on the percentages of contractors 12 that we out, have out there that we're gonna have 13 some bad actors every once in a while. It's part of 14 the industry. But it's very, very important for us 15 to make sure that we identify them and then take 16 action immediately to make sure that either they are 17 not doing work for the City of New York or us again, 18 but also that the work that we're putting in here is 19 gonna last us. You know, if we put in a roof and 20 it's got a 30-year warranty I want that roof to last 21 30 years, period, because that's what they're paid 2.2 for. That's what the contract is. And so we do have 23 that staff. Um, in terms of working on the, the sidewalk sheds and the development, um, Greg 24 mentioned the piece with the sign. Um, we've had 25

25

2 some great conversations with council members. Ι 3 actually thank you very much for hosting me at your 4 offices to talk to you a little bit about some of the projects that are happening in your developments, um, 5 and I, and I would say to any of the council members 6 7 our offices are, our door is open all the time to go 8 over these items. But we're going to look at the 9 electronic signage, but immediately what we are doing, and we have the pilot done, the poster is 10 11 done, it's being corrected in the Department of 12 Communications and the [inaudible] would like to see 13 it. But it will be a poster that will be put up in each of the development offices that identifies the 14 15 work that is happening at the development as well as the date of completion. We recognize that not all 16 17 the residents can go to the tenant resident meetings, 18 um, and we want to make sure that there's enough 19 information out there so everyone can see what's 20 going on, because there is a lot of work that's 21 happening in all of these developments. 2.2 CHAIR RUSS: Council Member, I, ah, have 23 been thinking about your committees on security and I wanted to offer, um, we'd be glad to, ah, if we can, 24

sit with and get NYPD and before summer, ah, spend

some time thinking about the places where the 2 3 criminal activity, ah, touches our properties and 4 there's a few, there are things that NYCHA could do differently and are thinking and planning for the, 5 ah, change of season, and do that in a collaborative 6 7 way with, ah, with NYPD where, ah, we're getting some 8 of their advice and feedback for anything that we 9 might be able to do. So, um, we'd be very, be very glad to spend time at the office and, um, work with 10 11 you to see if there are some things that we could be 12 very tangible and very targeted in terms of what we 13 might try, ah, both to support NYPD, but also to 14 support the safety issue, or get to the safety issue. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I, I would 16 appreciate that. And in regards to the contractors 17 and the garbage?

18 CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, they are supposed 19 to, ah, do that cleaning. Ah, Steve and I have 20 talked about this. I said I'm, ah, not interested in 21 paying someone who's not doing the entire job. So, 2.2 ah, if we, we, I have instructed staff if we can to 23 withhold payments and will, ah, because this repeats. Ah, it's not the first time we've heard it, and also 24 to Steve's earlier point, ah, we're going to evaluate 25

that contractor in a way that folks know that the job was not, was not done. I will say, though, that, um, if we have that situation we're willing to, um, ah, get the vendor out there to do the cleaning, ah, when we're, when we've advised that it's lagging, and, ah, I don't know, Vito, if you wanted to add anything to that.

9 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure. So I, I just want to be clear that there are certain 10 11 situations where the contractor is responsible for 12 the cleaning and maintenance behind the fence and the 13 sidewalk shed, um, if there's a construction site, an 14 active construction site. But if the fencing and the 15 sidewalk sheds are put up because of Local Law 11 to 16 address the immediately hazardous concerns. The 17 contractor currently is not responsible for that. 18 We're looking to address that, and we're also working with our partners, um, with the teamsters. 19 Because 20 to send our staff into those areas require a certain OSHA certification that not all of our staff 21 2.2 currently have. So these are issues that, that, 23 honestly the next step of it, too, is we need to do a better job of, one, communicating, and two, educating 24 our residents when the sidewalk sheds are erected. 25

So I think there's a multipronged approach, and I 2 3 would add to what the chair said about the meeting 4 with NYPD. Um, the Department of Buildings, at least in the last two years since I've been at NYCHA, they 5 have been extremely helpful, um, especially in 6 respect to this area. When we, I first got there we 7 had sidewalk sheds. We had miles and miles of 8 9 sidewalk sheds where it wasn't necessary. And Capital and DOB sat down and came up with a plan that 10 11 addresses the safety concerns of not having sidewalk 12 sheds and having sidewalk sheds. And I think that's 13 still, that's a work in progress. So I would invite 14 the Department of Buildings to join us, because, 15 again, they've been really helpful in dealing with 16 these issues. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No, I would really 18 appreciate that because I think that you're more 19 susceptible to becoming a victim of crime than you 20 are... 21 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 2.2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ... to getting hit 23 by a brick, you know... CHAIR RUSS: Right. 24 25

96

97 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ... in public 3 housing and I... CHAIR RUSS: And, ah, I think that's a 4 5 very cogent assessment. GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sort of a 6 7 [inaudible] of safety. 8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I want to make 9 sure people don't get in the head by either. CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, I know. 10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: But I, ah, I just 12 want to make sure that people aren't, you know, and I 13 want to reiterate that, you know, for the most part, you know, 99% of the people that live in public 14 15 housing are wonderful people, but we continue to see, 16 you know, these issues arise year in and year out, 17 and last year was just a really bad year for us in 18 the 8th District and I want to make sure that my 19 residents, you know, feel safe when they're coming in 20 out of their homes because, you know, the rest of us 21 get to go home and, you know, we, we don't have to 2.2 live with that day-to-day, um, you know, uncertainty 23 of what, what's to come and, you know, I'm a baby of, of, ah, public housing. I grew up in [inaudible] in 24 the '80s when, you know, it was not, you know, it, it 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 98
2	was not, it was not a fun time. You know, we saw
3	many of our friends and family, um, succumb to, to
4	gun violence and so we want to make sure that people
5	just feels safe. Um, I just, I had a very quick
6	question, I'm sorry, Madam Chair, just about
7	regarding the, um, I'm sorry, Mark, real quick,
8	regarding the, the electronic, ah, temperature
9	monitoring. I know that there's a, there's a plan
10	to, ah, to get to 44 developments before the end of
11	this year, is that correct?
12	CHAIR RUSS: Ah
13	UNIDENTIFIED: That's correct.
14	CHAIR RUSS: I think, yes, thank you.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: So, just, you
16	know, want to put out there that we've been getting
17	a lot of complaints from the developments that do
18	have it regarding shortage of staff. I'm not sure if
19	that's something that, um, that NYCHA is, is aware of
20	or looking at regarding the amount of time that it
21	takes the staff that's supposed to be monitoring the
22	new systems to get from one development to the other.
23	This is the, the heating system, right?
24	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: You're
25	talking about the heating system [inaudible]?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I'm talking about 3 the heating system, yeah. 4 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Yeah, we have added a, a significant number of staff to our 5 heating department, ah, this heat season. And I 6 7 think what folks might be talking about is that there 8 are temperature triggers... 9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes. GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: ...where the 10 11 system will shut off, right, but we not have seen any 12 situation where these devices have been installed 13 where it's dropped below what the minimum setting is, 14 and our minimum setting is significantly higher than 15 what the local law requires. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I know 17 Jefferson... 18 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: The 19 great... 20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, Jefferson 21 Houses has been a problem, um, all winter and, um, 2.2 they have expressed some concerns about the amount of 23 time that it takes, um, the heating staff that monitors the new system to get to the development, 24 um, and feeling like they're, yeah. 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 100 1 2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Yeah, and 3 I... 4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: So, um... 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Our response time has been much better, um, this year 6 7 than even last year, and last year was a significant 8 improvement over even the prior year. Um, we... 9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: We'd 10 love to take you our... 11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: OK. 12 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, we could over the 13 development time, though. EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: 14 Yeah, 15 but also I would love to take you... 16 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. 17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: ...our 18 center of, at LIC, to show you how we have staff that 19 monitor our systems 24/7. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: And what is, what 21 is the total cost savings to NYCHA, um, when you're 2.2 done? What do you anticipate NYCHA will save once 23 you transition the entire 44 developments? 24 25

2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: I don't 3 know that we have that readily available, but we 4 could certainly get back to you with, ah... CHAIR RUSS: We can, yeah, we can. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: OK. 6 7 CHAIR RUSS: And, um, let's, ah, work 8 with, ah, Brian's office and set up a time so that we 9 can actually start some of the security planning ... COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes. 10 CHAIR RUSS: ... that we've talked about. 11 12 And our contribution, I think, can be thinking about, 13 ah, lighting, cameras, any kind of dead spots where 14 people might hang out, that kind of thing, and what 15 could we do, ah, ahead of the summer to maybe turn that knob down a little bit. 16 17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I would appreciate 18 it. Thank you. 19 CHAIR RUSS: Thank you. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you, Madam 21 Chair. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, Council 23 Member. Now we'll have Council Member Bill Perkins. COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very 24 I just want to commend you for the role that 25 much.

9

2	you have created for residents to be a part of taking
3	care of the homes where they live. I think that's
4	very, very valuable for them to have that kind of,
5	ah, partnership, ownership, and in fact it seems to
6	me that there's not just talking about just the adult
7	residents, but just as important and maybe even more
8	importantly

CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: ...the youth. 11 And so I wanted to get a sense of how much of this 12 youth involvement are we having in this very 13 important, ah, project that they're inviting the 14 tenants, and hopefully I'm saying the youth to be a 15 part of.

16 CHAIR RUSS: So we run, ah, a number of 17 partnership programs that are focused on, ah, youth 18 at the property and I would say this. We are open 19 and are, ah, pursuing, um, almost any opportunity to 20 engage youth in, um, anything from summer employment, internships, ah, working, ah, with us in ways that 21 are appropriate given the age of the person. 2.2 We are 23 looking to expand, ah, our relationship with Youth Build, which is the, ah, group that works on, um, 24 25 getting, ah, youth into the construction trades. We

2 met with them, ah, um, I can't remember if it was 3 earlier this year or towards the end of last year 4 about, ah, we have a good partnership with them now. 5 We wanted to open more sites and more recruitment. And we're also interested if, um, ah, either any of 6 7 the resident leadership or, ah, Council has ideas on 8 how we can, ah, strengthen that. Because I agree 9 with you. I think if we can give, ah, kids in those age brackets a chance to, to do something, see 10 11 something different. You never know when that's 12 gonna...

UNIDENTIFIED: Sure.

13

14 CHAIR RUSS: ... open up somebody to a path 15 that they might not have thought about it. And I do 16 think that, um, ah, we'd be glad to talk, ah, ah, 17 with our, our resident engagement group and see if 18 there are specific things you might have in mind. 19 But we're always thinking about this, because we 20 feel, ah, that it's really important to have a chance 21 for them to, ah, contribute and, and step up.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very 23 much for, for that answer. I, I just hope that you 24 feel comfortable, you know, reaching out to us to 25 make sure that we are engaged with you...

2

CHAIR RUSS: Sure.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: ...in this effort 4 and, especially again, ah, when it comes, our young 5 people, they are out there...

CHAIR RUSS: Could, can I add something, 6 7 can I add something else, ah, Councilman. Um, we're 8 gonna be engaged in these large-scale capital 9 investments, whether we do it through the Rental Assistance Demonstration, um, and putting particular 10 11 emphasis on making sure that when we do that kind of 12 property that our, ah, RAD partner is also reaching 13 out and engaging folks at the site level. And the 14 second thing I would say is as we go down this road 15 together we're gonna have to raise a lot of capital to reinvest in NYCHA. And there's gonna be a lot of 16 17 opportunities if we're successful in raising the 18 capital to do things that directly impact our 19 families. And I'm not just talking about the new 20 kitchen or bath we hope to put in. Um, the way we 21 see it we've got three investments to make. We have 2.2 to invest in the building, we have to invest in 23 changing NYCHA's culture, and we have to invest in the families. And if we're successful in some of the 24 capital funding things that we're hoping to do in the 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 105
2	next couple of years the ability to multiply that
3	into a social impact is increased and we're, we're up
4	for taking that on.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very
6	much for that, ah, response. And, again, ah, include
7	us any way you feel we can be useful.
8	CHAIR RUSS: Surely.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I appreciate the
10	initiatives that you're taking and, and want to make
11	sure that you get as much support as possible from
12	CHAIR RUSS: Thank you.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS:at least from
14	my office and I'm sure my colleagues probably feel
15	the same way. Thank you.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, Council
17	Member. OK, I just have, ah, several more questions
18	in a, a different, ah, areas that I wanted to ask all
19	of you today. Um, so I wanted to specifically ask
20	about the NYCHA-operated, senior, ah, club transfer.
21	Many of those 14 senior centers in last year's budget
22	were transferred over to DFTA. Um, and as part of
23	our budget, um, seven NYCHA-managed senior centers
24	were transferred to DFTA and then in the fiscal 2020
25	adopted budget DFTA was provided funding for one year
I	

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING

2	only to manage an additional five NYCHA senior
3	centers. The remaining two centers previously
4	managed by NYCHA were closed and as of June 2019
5	NYCHA no longer directly manages any of its senior
6	centers. So my first question is while many of them
7	were baselined in the fiscal 2020 budget, which we're
8	grateful for, um, is there a long-term strategy to
9	secure funding for five senior centers that are only
10	funded through this fiscal year?
11	CHAIR RUSS: I, um, oh, thank you.
12	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: It's at the top of
13	your
14	CHAIR RUSS: Yes, we are. I'm sorry.
15	We, we are working, um, I apologize. We are working
16	with OMB to think about how to get the money into
17	these centers, so we don't want to represent that
18	they're kind of dangling out there and, um, we want
19	to address the needs at those centers and making sure
20	that we, ah, we can do that while we're addressing
21	our larger capital needs. So it's, it's on our
22	radar, yes.
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Well, I wanted
24	to be at the top of your list.
25	CHAIR RUSS: Yes.
I	

2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And I also speak for
3	myself and the largest champion we have for our
4	seniors, and that is Council Member Margaret Chin.
5	CHAIR RUSS: All right.
6	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: If she were here she
7	would want you to put it at the top of your list.
8	Ah, we also closed two centers. Ah, we closed Taft
9	in Council Member Perkins's district and Baisely Park
10	in Council Member Adams's districts. Um, is that is
11	existing space currently open for residents to use
12	and is there a plan to reopen those centers and if
13	not what will we do with that vacant space?
14	CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, Taft, ah, we hope,
15	um, it was reopened, yes, it is open. We reopened it
16	with some, ah, discretionary funding we had in
17	January and the provider now is the Stanley Isaacs
18	Neighborhood Center.
19	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
20	CHAIR RUSS: Um, the Baisley Park is not
21	open for resident use. It is on, there are
22	renovations occurring, though, at that site.
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, so the minimal
24	funding that you used to reopen Taft, does that cover
25	you through the end of this fiscal year?
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 108
2	CHAIR RUSS: That I do not know.
3	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
4	CHAIR RUSS: And I could, have to get to
5	get back to you on.
6	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great.
7	CHAIR RUSS: OK.
8	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, we definitely
9	want to continue to talk about that.
10	CHAIR RUSS: No, I, I think what I'd like
11	to do is, um, ah, we have, ah, because of the
12	arrangements we have with the senior centers I want
13	to be sure we understand where the partner agencies
14	are and what we're committing to in terms of, ah,
15	either renovations or continued operation there.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And what was
17	the process by which, um, we transitioned the
18	existing NYCHA staff at those particular senior
19	centers where they folded into NYCHA in general
20	staff, do you know where they went? Um, because we
21	did have a conversation about trying to see if any of
22	those NYCHA staff could be hired and picked up by the
23	ultimate CBO on the ground, um
24	CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, there were
25	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Do you know?

2 CHAIR RUSS: Ah, yes. There were 18 3 staff assigned to those centers and they were 4 afforded the opportunity to select positions with family partnership and community development 5 departments, ah, with CEP. CEP worked with local 371 6 7 to ensure that that transition occurred and, ah, the 8 staff have, um, transitioned over to the new 9 positions. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. 10 And, um, 11 in terms of the operations, while I know that DFTA oversees the senior centers, administers the 12 13 contracts with those particular CBOs, um, in last year's budget we put in several million dollars for 14 15 capital work, renovations that needed to be done. 16 Um, as one example I have two of these 14 and one of 17 them needed a significant amount of capital work, the 18 other not so much. Um, many of these centers were 19 very small in terms of operations, no full food meal 20 program. Um, is there some sort of a Memorandum of 21 Understanding that exists today that outlines the 2.2 responsibility of each agency, whether it's NYCHA, 23 DYCD for centers, or DFTA, or the not-for-profit providers? 24

109

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 110
2	CHAIR RUSS: So we are actually in the
3	process of drafting that, and
4	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: We're just drafting
5	that now?
6	CHAIR RUSS: Yes.
7	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Oh my goodness.
8	CHAIR RUSS: It's a
9	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: We are late.
10	CHAIR RUSS: We are. And, ah, ah, I'm
11	not, to be candid, I'm not comfortable, ah, with that
12	one because I think when you commit to writing with
13	each other you define the responsibilities of the
14	parties. And, ah, this is something where, ah, as
15	we've done this transition I think we have to step up
16	and get the, the Memorandum of Understanding
17	completed.
18	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. So what I'd
19	like to see, and if it's OK
20	CHAIR RUSS: Sure.
21	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON:City Council, ah,
22	we will work with the 14. I mean, we can work with
23	those particular council members.
24	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.
25	
l	

2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I can tell you with
3	my two there is still outstanding capital work that
4	needs to be addressed and it has not always been a
5	productive conversation with DFTA in terms of
6	additional money that is needed to bring these
7	centers up to full capacity. Um, and so I want to
8	have that conversation now because if there's
9	additional money that
10	CHAIR RUSS: Sure.
11	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON:is needed we need
12	to make sure that's reflected in the budget.
13	CHAIR RUSS: No, and I, I think part of
14	the thing that we're talking about here is
15	structuring ourselves in a different way with the
16	Memorandum of Understanding so it's clear who's doing
17	what, who's contributing what, and then, ah, to your
18	point figuring out what that, what that capital, ah,
19	would look like and where that's coming from.
20	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Do you have a
21	timeframe of when you think that would be?
22	CHAIR RUSS: Um, I don't and I, but I
23	want to go back and talk to the parties, and I could
24	get you, ah, an answer when we're thinking about
25	certainly circulating a draft and being able to meet.

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 112
2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
3	CHAIR RUSS: OK?
4	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And the reason I ask
5	that question also is one of the underlying factors
6	that we have to consider with the operations of these
7	senior centers today there are ongoing inspections
8	that are happening
9	CHAIR RUSS: Right.
10	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON:and there are
11	agencies that are visiting these centers and some of
12	them are being given fines that someone has to pay.
13	Right?
14	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.
15	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And so the quicker
16	we get an MOU where we delineate who's responsible
17	for what the quicker we can really address a lot of
18	those outstanding issues.
19	CHAIR RUSS: No, and we very much agree
20	with you and, ah
21	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, 'cause they'll
22	call us, Chair. They call us.
23	CHAIR RUSS: Yes, OK. And let them know
24	that we're, we're coming to kind of help straighten
25	this out. We're not gonna let it sit.

2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. Um, I
3	wanted to ask about community centers, another
4	favorite topic of mine. Um, earlier this year in
5	February the mayor outlined his State of the City
6	address, in which he announced plans to reopen five
7	community centers at certain NYCHA developments. It
8	wasn't outlined exactly where they were. Ah, do you
9	know where those centers are located, and will these
10	newly constructed centers, um, or will existing
11	centers undergo renovations?
12	CHAIR RUSS: So
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So two questions,
14	brand-new centers
15	CHAIR RUSS: Sure.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: and/or existing?
17	CHAIR RUSS: So, um, ah, they were
18	identified. We are currently, ah, this is currently
19	vacant spaces at NYCHA developments and we are
20	working to notify the tenant associations before we
21	make the list public and as soon as we do we will,
22	and so this is previously unoccupied spaces and there
23	will need to be renovations before that we can make
24	them operational. So I hope to have the names soon,
25	and then we hope to also be able to give a sense of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 114 1 what work is going to be required to make them 2 3 operational. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 4 So two questions from that. The funding for the capital 5 work that's necessary, will that be reflected by the 6 7 executive budget, and number two, will this be a new RFP to determine which not-for-profit will run these 8 9 community centers? 10 CHAIR RUSS: I, I cannot answer that. 11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, all right. 12 CHAIR RUSS: I don't know at the moment. 13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: To be determined. 14 CHAIR RUSS: But, no, we could, we can 15 make sure that we get that answer to you. But I 16 don't know at the moment. 17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. OK, to be 18 determined. Ah, wanted to ask about the Elevator 19 Action Plan. I think the general manager knows like 20 next to community centers and senior centers I am 21 always talking about elevators. Super important. 2.2 Um, in January the NYCHA monitor approved a 23 corrective action and response plan outlining our steps to reduce elevator outages and no-service 24 25 conditions at 3200 elevators that were owned by

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 115
2	NYCHA. The elevator service and repair department
3	manages the elevator operations and consists of 473
4	full-time staff. So my first question is do we have
5	any vacancies in the elevator service and repair
6	department and if so how many and do we have plans to
7	fill those vacancies?
8	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.
9	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So I am
10	going to give my seat up to Joey Koch.
11	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
12	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: And ask her
13	to please
14	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: The elevator
15	champion, now chief of staff. [cross-talk] But
16	always prioritizing elevators.
17	CHAIR RUSS: And we always say that Joey
18	is more up than down, so. [laughter]
19	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes, yes, agreed.
20	CHAIR RUSS: Sorry, I couldn't resist.
21	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: Hi, good afternoon.
22	I'm Joey Koch, ah, chief of staff at NYCHA. But,
23	yes, I, I am a champion of all things heat and
24	elevators
25	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes.
I	

2	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH:for, for NYCHA.
3	Um, so we actually hired about 20 additional elevator
4	teams. Um, they are either all hired or in the
5	process of being hired. There was a list called.
6	Um, and so we're in the process of bringing all of
7	those on board.
8	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And the
9	agreement requires NYCHA to replace or address at
10	least 425 elevators by 2024. Are we on track to meet
11	that obligation?
12	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: We are currently on
13	track to meet that obligation.
14	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, and this is a
15	full replacement?
16	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: These are full
17	modernizations
18	CHAIR RUSS: Right, right.
19	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH:full, full
20	replacements.
21	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. I'm excited.
22	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: Ah, me too.
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I mean, 2024 is a
24	little ways off.
25	
1	

4

5

2 CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: It's a long way. 3 It's a long way.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I'm still excited. CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: I know.

6 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And have you, has 7 the authority decided yet of that 425 elevators which 8 developments will receive the highest priority based 9 on outages, malfunctions, etcetera, do we have that 10 list already?

11 CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: Yes, so those have been identified and it has been based on the PNA, the 12 13 physical needs assessment, and outage, historical 14 outage history. That is always subject to change as 15 issues arise that may require an elevator to be in 16 worse shape than it was when we originally made the 17 list. So it's potentially up for revisions, but they have been identified. 18

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And according 20 to the, ah, physical needs assessment, ah, about 1.5 21 billion is required to repair and replace elevators 22 across the portfolio. Um, how much funding have we 23 already dedicated to implementing the provisions, um, 24 outlined in the elevator action plan? Do we have 1.5 25 billion? Are we close?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 118 1 CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: Yeah. 2 3 CHAIR RUSS: No, they're, we don't have the 1.5, we have a portion of the state funding. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. CHAIR RUSS: Ah, and we probably have 6 7 some, ah, capital. 8 CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: We do. 9 CHAIR RUSS: I don't what that number is, 10 though, Steve... CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So a combination of, 11 12 you're talking about the... CHAIR RUSS: Federal. 13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...450 million from 14 15 the state? 16 CHAIR RUSS: Right. 17 CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: State. CHAIR RUSS: That, a portion of that 18 19 funding is going to elevators. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Plus what we're 20 21 putting in. EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: 100 2.2 23 million. CHAIR RUSS: 100 million is elevators. 24 25 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

2 CHAIR RUSS: Thank you. Um, and then do 3 we have federal capital for elevators? 4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Um, we 5 have both, ah, the action plan funds as well as federal dollars and some city dollars are going into 6 7 elevators. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, so what's the 8 9 total total of what we have between federal dollars, the action plan, money from the administration, plus 10 11 the 100 million you already described? Is there a 12 total? EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Yeah, 13 there is a total dollar amount. 14 15 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We're gonna 16 have to get back to you with the actual [inaudible] 17 all the pots. 18 CHAIR RUSS: Let, let us, yeah I don't 19 want to add, I don't want to add wrong. 20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, no, no, I 21 understand. 22 CHAIR RUSS: OK, but we can get... 23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I wasn't a math major either. 24 25

1

2 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. No, that was my, I 3 struggled.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I just want to again, and the reason is say that, I mean, Vito, you 5 know how, we all know how important elevators are. I 6 7 do nothing but talk about elevators and windows all 8 day. Um, and as close as we can get to the 1.5, ah, 9 billion, and I think it recognizes that in the physical needs assessment, you know, elevators are a 10 11 critical part. Just like roof and boiler are, I'm 12 not saying that they're not, but elevators, we have 13 an expectation when we get in we need to get to our 14 location. And I remind you, Chair, I have a senior 15 center in my district that is on the 20th floor of a building that's 24 stories, and I'm reminded of the 16 17 staff and everyone else in this particular building 18 and we're currently, we have 2 million dollars for 19 that building, thankfully, and we're going through 20 design. So I would love to see that in other places, 21 particularly since some of these developments may not 2.2 have a lot of outages, but it still means that there 23 is a priority to replace that elevator.

24 CHAIR RUSS: No, thank you, ah, because 25 we agree and, ah, with the capital money that we have

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 121
2	and the capital money we hope to raise, ah, we do
З	want to get to the entire portfolio. We don't want
4	to miss anyone.
5	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. So one more
6	question, Ms. Koch. The 20 new staff, is that added
7	on to 473? That's in addition? Yes?
8	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: I, we added an
9	additional 20 teams, so it's 40 people. Off the top
10	of my head I don't, ah, remember, but I think it is.
11	CHAIR RUSS: It is.
12	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, it is, OK.
13	CHAIR RUSS: The CFO has confirmed.
14	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: Yes.
15	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, got it.
16	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: And I want
17	to thank you for your contribution to the
18	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Absolutely.
19	CHAIR RUSS: Yes.
20	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And I hope in my
21	last two years I can give more. I make no promises,
22	though. I have to get to a lot of other parts of my
23	NYCHAs.
24	CHAIR RUSS: Well, if you do we're gonna
25	spend better than we have, so.

2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes, yes, we will,
3	we will. Um, I wanted to ask about the homeless set-
4	asides in public housing. Um, I believe we started
5	in 2017, we started to dedicate 1500 units per year
6	from homeless families that were referred by DHS.
7	Um, do you know how many formerly homeless families
8	we've placed in NYCHA under this set-aside policy to
9	date and how many we intend to place in 2020? Are we
10	aware?
11	CHAIR RUSS: Yes, we are. And, ah, I've
12	got to get the general manager to, he has the data.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And is that a
14	set number? Are we
15	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We have
16	committed
17	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON:firm with 1500?
18	CHAIR RUSS: Well, we've committed to
19	certain amounts each year on the homeless set-aside.
20	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
21	CHAIR RUSS: But I, but if you've got an
22	update that would be great, on where we are this
23	year.
24	
25	
ļ	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 123
2	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So we've
3	been tracking, um, our production units, um, on a
4	daily basis.
5	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
6	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So we are
7	on target to deliver approximately 2000 for this
8	year. We are using a combination of both in-house
9	staff as well as contracted staff.
10	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. How many, have
11	we done 1500 from 2017 each year? Did we meet that
12	target? Do you know? Because you said 2000 this
13	year, but that's just for 2020.
14	CHAIR RUSS: Right, right.
15	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Correct?
16	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Last year
17	we completed approximately 1700.
18	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, OK. And how
19	much subsidy does NYCHA receive from the city to
20	place these formerly homeless families?
21	CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: We received 28
22	million.
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: That, that's the
24	amount to date, or is that annual?
25	

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 124 1 2 CHIEF OF STAFF KOCH: Amount to date to 3 expedite apartment prep. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And as far as 4 5 placing formerly homeless families in any of these units, what happens in situations where the unit 6 7 needs work? Are we responsible or does DHS cover the cost of that? 8 9 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So you said after the occupancy? 10 11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes, for a formerly homeless family to occupy a NYCHA apartment. 12 13 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: We make the 14 repairs. 15 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. 16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, we make the 17 repairs, OK, got it. Um, I wanted to ask, you talked 18 a lot about energy efficiency and sustainability at 19 NYCHA, and I want to bring up another topic that I 20 consistently talk about and that's windows. Ah, 21 NYSERDA, the state agency dedicated to energy, 2.2 research, and development, um, used to have 23 weatherization programs and so does, ah, Homes and Community Renewal, DHCR. Do we have any existing 24 weatherization programs and how would we be able to 25

provide replacement of windows to many of our NYCHAs? 2 3 I think about a few of mine, like Clermont 4 Consolidated, that are low rises. They have poor heating, but the reason why their heat is poor is 5 because the windows are in poor condition. So no 6 7 matter how much heat we provide, even if it's at its 8 maximum, poor insulation means that you can't feel 9 the heat anyway. And I mentioned this to the monitor, Mr. Schwartz, when he was here at our last 10 11 hearing, because I think it's important to invest 12 further in weatherization programs where we can 13 replace many windows that need to be replaced.

14 So, um, we do have currently CHAIR RUSS: 15 the energy performance contracts I mentioned. But I 16 want to say that we're interested in a more, ah, 17 ambitious approach. The boiler work that we're doing 18 with the state funds, for example, ah, we're, we're 19 not going to replace those boilers in kind. We're 20 gonna try to bring more efficient and different 21 systems. And, ah, when we start making those kinds of investments we'd like to circle back to the 2.2 23 partners that you mentioned and see if there's any way we could pick up, ah, additional funding for 24 things like windows and other weatherization. 25 Um,

1 COMMITTEE ON PUB	LIC HOUSING
--------------------	-------------

2	these are expensive items in terms of replacing
3	windows at the scale we're talking about. But we'd
4	be game to talk to folks because if we can change
5	both the boiler and the, ah, outside, the, ah, the
6	wall and the window, ah, that would lead to even more
7	efficiency and, and really give us a leg up on, ah,
8	ah, trying to save energy.

9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So right now do we 10 have any money in our capital designated to window 11 replacement? And I understand the logic of what 12 you're saying. Are we looking at opportunities at any state grants? Um, it's really frustrating, 13 Chair. I am asked as a council member to fund window 14 15 replacements at my developments. And I'm not NYCHA. 16 I don't have that kind of money.

17 CHAIR RUSS: Right. 18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And I shouldn't have 19 to replace windows at my NYCHAS. But I should expect 20 that whatever revenue stream we can identify, is 21 there anything today that we have dedicated to window 22 replacements?

CHAIR RUSS: We, we have 10 million
dollars in weatherization. I can't tell you...
CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

126

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 127 1 2 CHAIR RUSS: ... that that is, ah, 3 exclusively for windows. But I could get back to you 4 and tell you what that money is for. 5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. What other examples would it be used for besides windows 6 7 [inaudible]? CHAIR RUSS: It could be used for various 8 9 sealing... CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 10 11 CHAIR RUSS: ... sealants or, ah, you know, 12 cutting drafts or... CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Window. 13 14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: Um, I'm 15 gonna step in here. 16 CHAIR RUSS: Go ahead, please. 17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: So we do 18 have weatherization programs and we are working with 19 the state, um, at this point in time. We have 20 \$415,000 in weatherization programs, ah, in 21 construction, and those are things for, ah, refrigerators, Energy Star, windows are included into 2.2 23 that, lighting, and ventilation. We're also thinking about comprehensive modernization on some of our 24 portfolio, and when we talk about comprehensive 25

modernization we are thinking about the whole 2 3 building envelope and so we are thinking about windows associated to that. 4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And what are the 5 guidelines and metrics that you use with the existing 6 7 weatherization programs that you're talking about to 8 determine which developments get priority? So are 9 these developments that are not in queue to get a brand-new boiler? Um, is it based on 311 calls? 10 11 it based on the property managers, the resident 12 associations? Like how are we determining which

13 developments that we could start with for the 14 existing weatherization money?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: So it 16 has a lot to do with the grant itself. Um, but most 17 of the weatherization programs happen in the 18 scattered sites. The...

19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Scattered sites, OK. 20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT LOVCI: The 21 smaller, ah, buildings that might not get a full 2.2 boiler replacement, they may not be able to, they may 23 not be having a, a part of a large roofing program. Um, they're smaller developments of one- to four-24 family homes, um, maybe 45,000 residents. 25 That,

1

128

Is

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 129
2	those are type of developments in which the
3	weatherization program is focused on.
4	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. So I
5	would love to talk further about that as we expand on
6	the weatherization program because in addition to
7	scatter site I would also say some of the
8	consolidated buildings and developments where there
9	are low rises, um, they have fire escapes, they have
10	no elevators, they're just walk-ups. Um, but
11	generally speaking, many of them are probably old and
12	in need of, of some attention. So I just want to put
13	that on your radar. OK.
14	CHAIR RUSS: And I would say that we are
15	seeing examples at some of the, ah, I mean, ah, at
16	some of the RAD conversions where they're doing, ah,
17	both the windows and the exterior cladding.
18	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm.
19	CHAIR RUSS: And, um, that's something
20	that we will look at, where we can. It's a, it's a
21	big lift, though, in terms of cost and it's a big,
22	both for the window and the cladding, but, um, to
23	your point the places where they're doing it are the
24	low-rise buildings
25	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right.

CHAIR RUSS: And it looks, actually looks
very attractive and also has the advantage of really
just changing the energy profile for that building
completely.
CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right. No, some of
the developments I'm thinking about that I would hope
can be considered for weatherization are not in the
RAD program.
CHAIR RUSS: Sure.
CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, so they have no,
again, there's no opportunity that would bring them a
replacement of windows.
CHAIR RUSS: And we, when we talk about
our capital need over the next few months we'll talk
about what we're, we hope and what our ambition is
for raising capital for the, the non-RAD pipeline.
CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Um, since we
are now beginning the 2020 census, in light of
everything going on, that's something that's not
stopping. Residents of NYCHA have had a reluctance
to participate and be counted because of the fear
that the information will be shared with government,
with HUD, with landlord, ah, with other agencies like
law enforcement. Um, has NYCHA adopted any policies

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 131
2	or any communication on the ground with your property
3	managers, your, the CCOP or any of the leaders to
4	resonate that that is not the case and emphasize the
5	importance of participating in the census?
6	CHAIR RUSS: So we are collaborating
7	with, ah, New York City Census 2020 office.
8	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, Julie Menin's
9	office?
10	CHAIR RUSS: Um
11	UNIDENTIFIED: Yes.
12	CHAIR RUSS: Yes.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yeah.
14	CHAIR RUSS: And, ah, ah, our, a couple
15	things, we're going to do a direct mail notice
16	explaining the census and emphasizing, ah, the
17	protections that you have when you respond. We want
18	to send this notice to all 171,000 households in
19	April with the rent statement. And, um, share that
20	on the rest of our communications platforms. Before
21	we send it out we'll likely sit with the CCOP and,
22	ah, brief them on it as well and, um, also, ah, we
23	will be, ah, conducting outreach or supporting the
24	outreach effort so that we're able to communicate to
25	
I	

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 132 1 residents how important it is to respond, ah, so that 2 3 they can be counted. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 4 And I also want 5 to just be mindful of language access. CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And some of the 8 changes this year with the census where you can 9 conduct it, you can participate online. Um, there's a lot of things that can happen now before the 10 11 enumerators and the physical visits do happen. 12 CHAIR RUSS: Right. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So I think it's 13 14 important to make sure that message resonates that 15 we're not sharing this information, particularly 16 people that may fear that their benefits would be in 17 jeopardy. 18 CHAIR RUSS: Yes, right. 19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: And if they are 20 including residents as of April 1 that may or may not 21 live in their household, that has been the growing 2.2 concern. 23 CHAIR RUSS: We'd be glad to share language with you and, and get your, ah, comments. 24 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 But, ah, we will be working with the 2020 office to 2 3 get to those points.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Ah, I wanted to ask about the alternative working schedule, AWS. 5 Ι used to call it flex op, I think, um, and the 6 recently, um, enacted labor agreement with Teamsters, 7 with Local 237 and how that relates to frontline 8 9 staff, um, evening shifts, weekend shifts. Um, is this in the entire development? Do we have AWS 10 11 today? Um, is it still being phased in, and how do 12 you ensure with an alternative work schedule, work is 13 still being done, garbage is still being picked up, 14 Vito knows, I had a situation this week, and then 15 how does that also impact the weekend blitz 16 initiative that we have?

17 CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, a couple things and 18 then I'm going to turn it over to the, to the general 19 manager. Ah, as we've discussed and mentioned, this 20 is, um, both on a caretaker side and also with the recent arbitration on the maintenance worker side. 21 2.2 It has been rolled out, ah, to all properties at the 23 present time. Um, I want to give Vito a chance to weigh in and just give you a sense of where we are 24 with this and, and what we're working on. 25

2

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

3 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure, so thank you. Um, so as I mentioned earlier, um, AWS 4 5 implementation for caretakers, um, the rollout began last March, um, and all developments now have AWS, 6 7 ah, for caretakers. And we've gone basically from a 8 Monday through Friday 8:000 to 4:30 schedule to a 9 seven-day-a-week operation, um, from 6:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. And, you know, for full transparency we've 10 11 had some bumps. And, again, it's been a pretty big 12 change for a lot of our staff to kind of, um, 13 understand and to implement. So to that end we have 14 done extensive training. We will continue to do 15 training at the developments where they're still 16 struggling with the implementation of AWS, and we're 17 bringing in a consultant to assist with that. So that's with respect to the caretakers. Now, AWS, 18 19 when we negotiated the terms with the Teamsters, um, 20 we were able to hire an additional 210 caretakers as 21 part of the negotiations. Um, and again, 70% of 2.2 those were residents with those new hires. The chair 23 mentioned that we, um, recently received a decision from an impasse arbitrator for AWS for maintenance 24 25 workers. Their schedule will be slightly different,

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 135
2	right, they will not be working seven days a week.
3	Again, we try, we're trying to be respective of, um,
4	our residents and what we've heard from residents is
5	that they would prefer not to have normally scheduled
6	maintenance work on Sundays. So this will be a six-
7	day-a-week schedule and the hours will be from 8:00
8	a.m. to 7:00 p.m. six days a week.
9	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
10	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: And there
11	will be maintenance workers who will be working
12	Sundays to address emergency conditions.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. So Sundays
14	would only be emergencies?
15	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Yes.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: For maintenance
17	workers?
18	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Correct.
19	In addition to which, um, on March 3, um, we signed
20	an MOU with the electricians also for an alternative
21	work schedule, and their work schedule will mirror
22	the same as the maintenance workers. So our intent
23	is to roll AWS out to almost all of the skilled trade
24	titles, right. Not every position would necessitate
25	

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 136 1 an AWS work schedule. But we're aggressively moving 2 3 forward, um, to expand this through other titles. 4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Can... 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: How it will affect weekend blitzes. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm. 8 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: The weekend 9 blitzes have been extremely successful and we believe that they should be continued. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: As long as we notify the development in a sufficient time so that 12 residents can make sure that they're home on 13 14 Saturdays and we let them know that it only applies 15 to a certain amount of work. Um, Saturday blitzes does not, as I understand, it, it doesn't include 16 17 emergency work, it's just basic repairs, correct? Or is it vice versa? 18 19 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So the 20 weekend blitzes are just really for, um, maintenance work orders. 21 2.2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Maintenance work, 23 right. 24 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 137 1 2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Correct, 3 and we do provide three notices to the residents in advance of the, um, AWS work schedule. 4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, no, it's gotten 5 better. 6 7 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Yep. 8 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: It was a bumpy start 9 at the beginning. GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: It was. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I admit that, I 12 acknowledge that. But it's gotten much better. The 13 first and foremost is to let the electeds know, the 14 TA leaders, um, many instances so that we can make 15 sure that people are home. And then also the second 16 part of it to make it successful is the workers have 17 to show up on Saturday. I don't want to hear that 18 residents stayed home and then no one showed up. 19 Like we shouldn't have those types of issues. 20 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I agree 21 with you 100%. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 23 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Um, and the information that I provided with respect to AWS for, 24 um, for the electricians, that is only for the 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 1 electricians that are assigned to developments. 2 We 3 do have electricians that are assigned to special 4 units...

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

5

GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: ...such as 6 7 heating and elevators. They have a different work schedule and we can kind of, if you like we can 8 9 provide you with, um, more details about the work schedules. But they do work, um, seven days a week 10 11 if they're assigned to a unit that supports either heating and/or elevators, and we're currently 12 13 negotiating an AWS schedule for our elevator mechanics as well. 14

15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And how do you 16 ensure with an alternative work schedule that you 17 have a sufficient amount of staff, both maintenance workers and caretakers assigned to large 18 19 developments? So the issue that I have as one example where we've been asking for a deconsolidation 20 21 between Andrew Jackson and Morrisania air rights, 2.2 because we share staff, we share a property manager, 23 and the work load and the volume is heavy. It's not even a large development with respect to population. 24 So it's not as big as Morris or Edenwald or Gun Hill. 25

2	CHAIR RUSS: Right, right.
3	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: You know, large
4	developments in terms of units, but the work, the
5	volume is heavy. So we've been asking for
6	consideration to deconsolidate both so that we do not
7	share staff. Even though we're right across the
8	street from each other, you guys know that we've
9	struggled in the past. We're just maintaining a
10	sufficient amount of staff. So under AWS how do we
11	ensure developments like what I just described,
12	there's enough staff on a rotation where all of the
13	issues can be addressed?
14	CHAIR RUSS: Go ahead, go ahead.
15	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So, so AWS
16	really, um, is to expand work hours.
17	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Say again?
18	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I said AWS
19	really is to expand work hours, and where we can
20	within the existing framework of the budget to
21	increase head count, similar to what we do with
22	caretakers. Um, I think what the Chair mentioned
23	earlier, too, is our focus on hiring up additional
24	frontline field staff, and I think that that those
25	two go hand in hand.
I	I

2 CHAIR RUSS: And I want to say I was, ah, 3 went to, ah, see, ah, Mr. Yowerton last week. We 4 actually had a very productive meeting with his resident council membership. We walked the site 5 together. Ah, we talked about a number of the issues 6 7 as he sees them. So we are working with, with him 8 and with that tenant association and I'm hoping, um, 9 to come back for some ideas with him about, ah, what he sees as some of the issues at that property, um, 10 11 beyond adding the staff. I want to just be clear 12 that when we did the 2020 budget, the one I mentioned 13 in the testimony, we made a conscious effort to shift money into the field and, um, we're gonna continue to 14 15 do that inside the boundaries that the funding, ah, 16 ah, gives us. Ah, we're doing it now as part of the 17 monitorship agreement in the sense that we have to 18 do, ah, a transformation plan. We actually have to 19 reorganize the housing authority. But, um, the kinds 20 of things that we're talking about here, changing the schedule, making sure we have sufficient staff, and 21 2.2 then also meeting with the, the tenant associations, 23 because I know Mr. Yowerton, I'm in touch with him quite a bit, and, um, we have a, we had a good walk 24 and a good conversation about what he sees as our 25

2 shortcomings and, ah, committed to work together to 3 see if we could get that turned around at his site. 4 He has a tough site, ah, but you already know, know 5 that, so, um, but we are working with him in a very 6 direct way.

7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And coupled with the alternative work schedule and making sure we have 8 9 sufficient staff, caretakers, maintenance workers on the ground, um, how are we dealing with the 10 11 outstanding work orders and the backlog? Um, the last time we met in the Bronx we talked about 12 13 developing a better system to make sure that a work 14 order that is actually closed is closed because the 15 work... The work is done. 16 CHAIR RUSS: 17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...has been complete 18 and not just because the worker closed the work 19 Um, and then we talked about reducing, um, order.

20 duplicative work orders because residents were home 21 and no one came, or vice versa, just a combination of 22 many, many different things.

CHAIR RUSS: Right.

25

23

24

2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, it's a tall 3 order, but are we making any progress on shifting and 4 really revamping the whole work order system? 5 CHAIR RUSS: So, ah, we have, ah, as part of the reorganization that I mentioned, and I want to 6 7 be clear that, um, sometimes you hear the word 8 reorganization and folks say, oh, this is just moving 9 the boxes around on the paper. We, we're actually compelled by the monitorship agreement to make, ah, 10 11 structural changes. Ah, we're looking at, um, having 12 a crew come in as part of this to go through the work 13 order process with us and to, um, help us amend and 14 revamp along the lines that we discussed when we 15 visited. So that is gonna be part and included in 16 the plan, um, for restructuring which, ah, should be 17 released in draft, we hope, in May and then, ah, 18 would go to the monitor for his review in, ah, June. 19 So it's on the radar. Ah, we're gonna get some help 20 to do it, and we're going to have, ah, specific 21 recommendations on how to get to some of the issues you described. 2.2 So that's in the works. 23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And will that also include some of the specialty, ah, workers as 24 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 143 1 2 well, carpentry, brick laying, electrical, painting, 3 plastering... 4 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...plumbing, welding? 5 CHAIR RUSS: It's gonna look at both... 6 7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. CHAIR RUSS: ... the issues you raised 8 9 about the closed and then it's gonna look at how can we do a better job sequencing work ... 10 11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. 12 CHAIR RUSS: ...and, um, ah, you know, 13 making sure that, um, that that it's a much tighter 14 process than what we have now. 15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Um, can you 16 explain to me what the NYCHA Cares program is about? 17 I see there was 20 million dollars for fiscal 2019 18 and 2020 to support this program? 19 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Sure. So 20 that 20 million dollars was a one-time allocation, 21 um, from the mayor, um, to reduce open skilled trade 2.2 work orders. And we actually, um, spent about 27 23 million. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Million, right? 24 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 144 1 2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Yes, 3 millions, yes. 4 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah. 5 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I have a lot of them [inaudible]. 6 7 CHAIR RUSS: Oh, you got an update? GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: 8 Yeah. Um, 9 so we were able to, um, address, I'll look for the exact numbers, but we were able to address, um, 10 11 approximately 50,000 skilled trade work orders, um, 12 within 14 developments. And when I say 50,000, what we did was we identified developments with a high 13 14 number of open skilled trade work orders and we 15 looked at the aging of those skilled trade work 16 orders. We identified 14 developments. We sent in 17 teams that consisted of, um, multiple skilled trade 18 workers and when they went into those apartments not 19 only were they looking to address the open work 20 orders, they were creating work orders to identify, 21 ah, to address problems that they identified. So 2.2 when they left that apartment, um, all of the work 23 was completed. 24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Is that a program that will continue through this year as well, since? 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 145 1 2 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: No, that 3 was a one-time allocation. We have other programs that replicate the type of work that we did through 4 NYCHA Cares. 5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. So we don't 6 7 need 20 million dollars anymore? GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: Excuse me? 8 9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: We don't need 20 million dollars anymore for New York [laughs]. 10 CHAIR RUSS: I don't know that I would, I 11 12 wouldn't say... CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: NYCHA Cares. 13 GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: I think we 14 need a little bit more than 20. 15 16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Listen, if you don't 17 ask you won't receive. CHAIR RUSS: Ah, don't worry, we intend 18 19 to ask. 20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: That's my 21 philosophy. CHAIR RUSS: We will. 2.2 23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Um, the final 24 two questions, I do want to go back just to the 25 coronavirus, ah, since it's, um, so relevant to now

and all the different systems that we have to 2 3 continuously put in place. Um, in your interagency coordination with DOHMH, with DFTA, with DYCD, with 4 OEM and the administration, um, will we look to 5 identify some sort of an emergency like response 6 7 So, again, not knowing how long this is going plan? to be in effect, how many more new cases we will 8 9 receive that are confirmed. Um, this is a national The president is talking now about declaring 10 crisis. 11 like a national emergency at the federal level, right? Um, and so because we're talking about over 12 13 400,000 residents that live in our developments and 14 their families, and many are vulnerable, seniors, 15 those with disabilities, I've talked to several 16 residents that have children and adults that are confined to their home. They are disabled, they take 17 18 medication every day, and so I'm not worried about 19 their exposure on the outside, but I'm worried about 20 what happens if we have to evacuate or get them out 21 of their home. That's my concern. Um, and so it's almost like emergency disaster preparedness, similar 2.2 23 conversation. Are we working on some sort of an emergency response that we will ultimately develop, 24 um, for our residents and families? 25

2	CHAIR RUSS: I, I would say that our
3	conversations, ah, with the partner agencies and
4	among ourselves has been directed towards, um, ah,
5	planning around, um, what happens if we identify, ah,
6	someone who's positive, what happens if there
7	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yep.
8	CHAIR RUSS:has to be a quarantine.
9	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yep.
10	CHAIR RUSS: And what are the things, and
11	just talking at a high level for a minute, what are
12	the things we have to do to help that family get
13	through that period and how do we work with our
14	partners to make sure that, um, ah, they're not
15	compromised in some way, and how do we continue to
16	provide services in the rest of the building? So we
17	have been discussing this and also discussing it with
18	our partners, ah, in terms of trying to figure out,
19	um, delivering, ah, making sure that folks have
20	access to what they need, especially if they're
21	quarantined, and supporting those efforts with the
22	partner agencies. So, um, there is likely, um, ah,
23	sooner or later we'll have a case, but we think that
24	the conversations we've been having have been pretty
25	

10

2 strong ones and we're gonna have a coordinated 3 response when we do.

4 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. All I 5 ask is that it's really important, and I know it's 6 challenging to get a lot of information out fast to 7 thousands of residents. And thankfully we have 8 systems in place like robocalls and emails, even down 9 to phone calls.

CHAIR RUSS: Right.

11 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Property managers on 12 the ground level should be calling their presidents, Um, and their executive boards at the local 13 right? 14 Um, my only fear is that people are just not level. 15 aware, and I want to make sure that even it's a matter, even in my own building where I live, we've 16 17 posted signs all over public spaces to let people 18 know about precautions and things you can do, seeking 19 medical assistance, calling 311, making sure, you 20 know, basic things. A lot of it is a behavior 21 change. 2.2 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: But it's also about what we expose ourselves to as well and things we can do a little bit differently. Um, and so it's my hope

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 149
2	that over the next few days and weeks, I don't want
3	to say months, um, that we will continue to expedite
4	information in terms of communication, with every
5	channel and every resource we have.
6	CHAIR RUSS: And we have, we have pushed
7	out a lot of information to, ah, in the manner you
8	described and, um, I can't remember the numbers. Do
9	you have the numbers?
10	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So I think
11	in total
12	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.
13	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO:it's
14	approximately 700,000 communications that have gone
15	out to both residents as well as staff. It's a
16	combination of robocalls, emails, we put a pop-up on
17	our My NYCHA app, um, so when you access My NYCHA
18	app, which we have about 90,000 users, um, there's a
19	pop-up and there's a link directly to the Department
20	of Health, um, specifically for coronavirus. Um,
21	there's push notifications, and I believe there are
22	about 6000, um, subscribers for the push
23	notifications. We have put flyers, one-pagers, FAQs
24	up on each of our developments in every building,
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 150
2	every management office. We've put up posters, and
3	all of these efforts are in multiple languages.
4	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
5	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: It's just
6	some of what we're doing, not all of it. Um, in
7	addition to which we have a, for lack of a better
8	word, a war room, um, at 250 Broadway, we're senior
9	management, we meet now twice a day, um, to discuss
10	specifically issues that come up on a daily basis
11	with respect to coronavirus.
12	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And as we
13	continue to have conversations, and I guess this is
14	the same conversation we're having with the
15	Department of Education, um, about a full closure of
16	schools and my fear with many of my children and
17	families who live in temporary housing. Um, schools
18	are lifelines for them, right? They expect to get
19	breakfast and lunch, medical services, and so, and I
20	say the same thing to you, working with DFTA as far
21	as senior centers and DYCD as far as our community
22	centers and cornerstones, where you have seniors and
23	children together.
24	CHAIR RUSS: Right.
25	

2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, should there be
3	a decision that's made where we have to limit some of
4	that access? It's my hope, and we say the same thing
5	to the DOE, if we have to do a full school closure we
6	have to identify a way to get meals to seniors and to
7	make sure that young people have some place to go.
8	That is my fear, is that if we close and limit access
9	seniors and young people have nowhere to go. And
10	obviously we have to always think about their, their
11	and health and safety
12	CHAIR RUSS: Right, right.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON:as primary, um,
14	importance. But also I'm thinking about the gap,
15	right, and the void that's going to be created in
16	terms of services. So, again, just want to keep that
17	on your radar because I don't know what's going to
18	happen in the next days and weeks ahead.
19	CHAIR RUSS: No, thank you. We have
20	been, um, running that scenario out amongst ourselves
21	and with partners. Um, I mean, it would be
22	unprecedented, obviously, but, ah
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Everything.
24	CHAIR RUSS:we're very, we're very
25	cognizant of the services you described and making

2 sure that NYCHA's role is, is to facilitate, um, ah, 3 and help those families if we wind up in a no school 4 or guarantine situation or whatever.

5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Um, my final question is around the mayor's Neighborhood Action 6 7 This was a plan we started a few years ago Plan. 8 where we looked at neighborhood map. There are 15 9 NYCHA developments identified that have the highest, ah, level of violence and we've poured, literally 10 11 poured a lot of resources into these 15. The three 12 in the Bronx are Butler, Castle Hill, and Patterson. 13 And those three developments have gotten cameras, 14 exterior lighting, the community centers have 15 extended hours. We've done a ton of things. When NYPD was here last week we asked the new chief of 16 housing, Chief Barrera, about the idea and the 17 18 possibility of expanding on those 15, simply because 19 we know there are other developments near the 15, 20 across the street, adjacent, next door, that equally 21 have challenges, but they're not as high in crime. 2.2 So what we don't want to say and we've had to say 23 because we prioritize, sorry, your development doesn't have as much crime as Butler or Patterson, so 24 25 that's why they're getting a lot of stuff. So what I

2	want to understand is are we having conversations
3	today with MOCJ, NYPD, and others, DYCD, around the
4	possibility of expanding and if so do you have an
5	idea of what that would look like?
6	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, so we're very
7	interested in aligning our capital work and
8	initiatives with what NYPD, ah, wants to do in those
9	neighborhoods. And, ah, we're also, would very much
10	like to, ah, work with them and have proposed this.
11	I would not suggest that we're in a formal planning
12	stage yet.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
14	CHAIR RUSS: We'd like to over time align
15	our camera systems. Ah, we very much, ah, think that
16	that would be a way for us to, um, give them, ah,
17	access that we, we currently can't unless we take a
18	DVD and run it over there.
19	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I know, that's a big
20	problem now.
21	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, and, ah, both Vito and
22	I have, ah, talked. We've raised it to NYPD and
23	we're looking to do further discussions with them on
24	how we might make that a project.
25	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.
I	

2	CHAIR RUSS: So that's, that's one thing
3	that we've talked about that we're actually
4	interested in, um, making an investment in because we
5	think that benefits them, it benefits us, and it
6	benefits, ah, the community.
7	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm. And also in
8	the same conversation, a lot of frustration we hear
9	from NYPD that most of our NYCHA developments are
10	under a PSA, right? Very few are under the local
11	precinct.
12	CHAIR RUSS: Right.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: When the companies
14	that install the sidewalk sheds and scaffoldings,
15	again, I don't know what their metrics and guidelines
16	are, but I will tell you every camera is covered and
17	every exterior light is covered, too. So another
18	reason, as what Diana Ayala was saying and why people
19	get so upset is because they're surrounded by
20	scaffolding, the whole development is in scaffolding,
21	the cameras are covered, and it is almost an
22	invitation to be a victim of a crime, because you
23	can't see anything, NYPD can't see anything, and then
24	the lights are covered, too. So is there any way
25	that we can have conversations with the companies we

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 155
2	work with to keep that in mind as they install
3	scaffolds? They have to go up. But you don't have
4	to cover the camera.
5	CHAIR RUSS: Go ahead.
6	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: So I was,
7	let me just start and I'll hand it off to Steven.
8	Um, you know, I think what you're talking about were
9	challenges that we were faced with before, and I
10	think the communication between Capital, the Office
11	of Safety and Security, and the developments is much
12	improved. So when sidewalk sheds are required there
13	is a coordinate effort, there is a walk-through of
14	the development to see whether or not cameras and/or
15	lighting needs to be moved in advance of installation
16	of the sidewalk sheds. I'm not going to suggest that
17	there haven't been situations where even through
18	those best efforts, um, that we still have blocked,
19	um, cameras.
20	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm.
21	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: And we do
22	identify those we react very quickly. And we need to
23	do better with respect to that.
24	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes.
25	

2	GENERAL MANAGER MUSTACUIOLO: With
3	respect to the lighting, lighting is required, um,
4	under the sidewalk sheds, um, so, yes, there have
5	been situations where existing lighting might be
6	blocked by the, by the installation of a sidewalk
7	shed, but all of our sheds are required to be up to
8	code, um, which includes sufficient lighting.
9	CHAIR RUSS: OK.
10	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. OK, so I am
11	finished with all of my question, but I like to go
12	down my list and make sure I summarize so that you
13	don't forget anything we've asked in terms of follow-
14	up. So we talked about the state funding, right?
15	CHAIR RUSS: Yes.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: We talked about all
17	the different funding streams that came from the
18	state, and I would love to continue to talk about any
19	updates on the outstanding projects, ah, both with
20	DASNY as well as our money that we're overseeing, the
21	450 million dollars. Um, we've also talked about the
22	city capital commitment rate and how we're going to
23	work with OMB on an organizational change. We have a
24	new staffer coming in and we want to see some right
25	

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 157 1 sizing of the portfolio because the commitment rate 2 3 is obviously there... 4 CHAIR RUSS: Right. CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...but we want to 5 look at some changes, right? In a more timely 6 7 fashion. Exactly, yep. 8 CHAIR RUSS: 9 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes? CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And we are also 11 12 going to be anxiously awaiting the plan on how we are going to address the 8.9 billion dollar gap that's 13 left in the overall 32 billion dollar capital plan 14 15 after NYCHA RAD, NYCHA PACT... 16 CHAIR RUSS: Sure. 17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: ...and some of the 18 other measures, right? 19 CHAIR RUSS: Yep. 20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, we are going to 21 prioritize, because Council Member Chin wants us to, um, our senior centers, the ones that were not 2.2 23 baselined, the five that were only funded through this fiscal year, and then you're going to give us an 24 update about Taft, right? 25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 158 1 2 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 3 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, because we put in a little bit of money in that. And then I don't 4 know if there's a final plan you have for Baisley 5 Park in Queens, but please let us know about that as 6 7 well. CHAIR RUSS: We will. And we'll also 8 9 update you on the MOU that we discussed. 10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes, the MOU. Um, 11 the new community centers, we're going to get some more feedback on that, the under-utilized vacant 12 13 NYCHA, the five, and then any new, new centers that 14 the mayor has proposed in his State of the City, 15 address. CHAIR RUSS: OK. 16 17 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Correct? 18 CHAIR RUSS: Yep. 19 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And do I have 20 any more? You're going to keep us posted on the 21 homeless set-aside. Ah, Vito, you said that we are on pace to set aside 2000 this year in 2020? 2.2 So I 23 just want to make sure that we're still good with that. And the elevator action plan, we're going to 24

do some follow-up to see how we can get to the 1.5

25

billion dollars when we do the numbers and add up all 2 3 the different levels of funding from the state, from 4 the feds, from the action plan, from City Hall, as 5 well as council members. Don't forget my 2 million dollars. And then you're also going to keep us 6 posted around the coronavirus, um, and what we're 7 8 doing with the pandemic and how we are, um, engaging 9 residents and stakeholders on the ground. Any plans that need to be put in place, contingency, to make 10 11 sure that services are still available for young 12 people as well as for the seniors. I definitely want 13 to do that. Um, and then we're also going to be 14 talking about the work order backlog and that plan. 15 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. 16 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right? That we're 17 going to come out with? 18 CHAIR RUSS: Yes. And that will be part 19 of, ah, we're gonna, when we do the restructuring 20 plan... 21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um-hmm. 2.2 CHAIR RUSS: We're looking at, ah, the 23 work order process. We'll be looking at AWS and, ah, we're also looking at, ah, recertifications. 24 25

-	
2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. And then also
3	keep us updated no the 2020 census and your work with
4	Julie Menin and her team. Um, we can be helpful as
5	well.
6	CHAIR RUSS: Sure.
7	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Many of us are doing
8	outreach ourselves. We're going to avail our
9	district offices, some of us, to be a pop-up site
10	with the US Census because we want to make sure that
11	we're doing our part, particularly since New York
12	Public Library announced that the libraries are going
13	to be, ah, closing and they were a partner and they
14	were going to offer services, too.
15	CHAIR RUSS: Ah, OK, sure.
16	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: So, again, that's
17	going to be a limitation. But it doesn't stop us
18	from doing our work well.
19	CHAIR RUSS: Right.
20	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, and then if
21	there's any further update on the caretakers, the
22	maintenance workers, the, ah, work with Local 237,
23	please, please continue to update us on the weekend
24	blitzes so that we're able to let our residents on
25	the ground know about that. And then finally, ah,
	1

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING
-				

2	any ongoing conversations with MOCJ and NYPD about
3	the neighborhood map program. And, once again,
4	please don't forget about my windows and
5	weatherization, um, I'm gonna keep talking about the
6	windows till I leave office because I care so much
7	about windows and a lot of the residents that I know
8	of that are in need are seniors, um, and that's my
9	concern to make sure that weatherization programs,
10	talking to NYSERDA, um, Council Member Diaz talked
11	about NYPIRG.
12	CHAIR RUSS: Yeah.
13	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: NYPIRG is an
14	environmentalist group, so maybe we can work with
15	them on any opportunities. All I say is let's be
16	creative. We can't sit back and wait for the federal
17	government to foot the bill on everything. They will
18	not do that. But that doesn't stop us from being
19	creative and looking at other opportunities and
20	partnerships that we can embark on to bring in the
21	revenue that we need.
22	CHAIR RUSS: Great.
23	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Make sense?
24	CHAIR RUSS: That's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 162 1 2 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Was that an accurate 3 checklist? 4 CHAIR RUSS: I think that's a... 5 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Did I miss anything? CHAIR RUSS: ...very accurate checklist. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I didn't miss 8 anything, right? Did I miss anything? 9 CHAIR RUSS: Yeah, yeah. 10 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, all right. 11 Thank you so much everyone for coming today. 12 Thank you for having us. CHAIR RUSS: 13 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, really 14 appreciate it. We will be in touch as we prepare for 15 the executive budget and whatever happens between now 16 and then, um, thank you for your work, thank you to 17 the general manager, thank you to our senior vice 18 president, our CFO, and thank you to our chair. 19 Thank you. CHAIR RUSS: 20 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you for your 21 partnership. I appreciate it. 2.2 CHAIR RUSS: 23 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: I look forward to working with you. 24 25 CHAIR RUSS: Likewise.

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING	163
2	CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, thank	
3	you.	
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 24, 2020