

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION
JOINTLY WITH THE SUBCOMMITTEE
ON CAPITAL BUDGET

----- X

March 9, 2020
Start: 10:14 A.M.
Recess: 3:08 P.M.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Ydanis Rodriguez
Chairperson
Committee on Transportation

Vanessa L. Gibson
Chairperson, Subcommittee on
Capital Budget

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ydanis Rodriguez
Fernando Cabrera
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Deborah L. Rose

Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Steven Matteo
Helen Rosenthal

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lisa Daglian
Executive Director
Permanent Citizens' Advisory Committee to
the MTA

Danny Pearlstein
Policy and Communications Director
Riders' Alliance

DOT Commissioner

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner
Department of Transportation

Elizabeth Franklin
Associate Commissioner for Budget and
Capital Program Management
Department of Transportation

Rebecca Zack
Assistant Commissioner for
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs
Department of Transportation

Aloysee Heredia Jarmoszuk
Commissioner
New York City Taxi and Limousine
Commission

Vincent Chin
Assistant Commissioner for Finance and
Operations

STEVEN SIDOWSKI: This is a microphone check. Today's date is March 9, 2020, on the Committee on Transportation, recorded by Steven Sidowski.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning, everyone. First of all, we know that the City of New York, the city is dealing with this emergency of the coronavirus. And we know that as everyone is doing their part, the MTA is doing their part, too. We understand that they can say that because of all the work that they have to do they need another day to come and testify to the preliminary budget. But for them to refuse to come and participate in a preliminary budget then that's unacceptable. And the reason why those chairs are empty is because the MTA, even though they were called in time, called [inaudible] on time, they had refused to come, not just today's hearing, as I say it, we would understand if they will say that they cannot come on Monday because they are preparing at the level of urgency, emergency that we have in the State of New York, then we will definitely accommodate it, as we have done in the past. We have called, in my six years that I have chairing this Committee on

Transportation hearing what the MTA has asked if they could come another day and we hold the preliminary budget hearing with the DOT and TLC and we accommodated for the MTA to come. So what we got from the MTA is that it's not that we cannot come on Monday, we're busy, we're dealing with an emergency. All of us here would say we understand it. But what they say is we will not come and testify the preliminary budget. And for me it's not a good signal that we get from then after Andy Byford left the MTA, because I don't want to go back as those years before Andy Byford. With the two prior persons in charge of New York City Transit immediately after they took position they approached our office in the first few days, we had a meeting with them, with a new person in charge. I think that there were some messaging and phone call on Friday, yet because they wanted to get the green light of not coming to testify, and again I get it, I understand it. I have two daughters. I know that we need to be there for all New Yorkers to put a plan in place, and if they will say we could not come that day, let's see how things follow up, but they should know that that they should not be a saint to come to a hearing. When you

look at the 54 billion capital plan most of those money are not secure. Ten billion of those money is based on debt. Congestion price is at risk. So here you have a huge amount of money and they asking, they even counting with a three, with a billion dollars for the extension of the Second Avenue subway because that guy in D.C. sent a message in Twitter, not because they have a letter, and they had not secured the three billion dollars in New York City. So most of those 55 billion dollar for capital for this January 20 to 24 are not secure. They also testify in the previous hearing hear that by this time they would give the council the list of the first project, they would do in 60 day they say. Those 60 day already pass. We have not received the list of the most of the first projects that they would do as part of this capital. So with that we support the men and women of the MTA for the work that they do it. We know that, you know, we have a big responsibility and we are not competing with the public opinion on should they be here or no. If they cannot be here because they have emergency meeting because they're planning we support it. But they should not have a green light to say we would not testify in the

preliminary budget hearing. So with that we're taking a pause. So I will give opportunity for Council Member Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I want to echo our sentiments. I think it's shameful that they're not here today. In the 10 years that I've been a Council Member this is the first time I have ever, ah, witnessed the MTA refusing to show up after, ah, they are requesting funds, and I will say that not a penny, ah, should be approved from this council until they show up. We have some serious questions of regarding, important questions regarding, ah, funding that they are requesting and I think it's inconceivable. I know they're using the excuse of the coronavirus, but even more they should be here to let us know what their plan should be. And I believe that ah, ah, such a huge, huge enterprise that they have that they cannot, ah, have the capital people be here and be able to still at the same time deal with the corona and if they don't have a plan by now, by this morning, it just tells me how inept their approach is. They should have that already done, ah, weeks ago when they already knew, ah, and we were already

1 warned that the coronavirus, ah, it was imminent,
2 that will come to New York City. They should already
3 have been prepared. They should already had a plan
4 and they should have had a plan to share with the
5 rest, with the rest of us. So with that I'll turn it
6 back to the chair, and Mr. Chair, again, ah, let me
7 accentuate, ah, we should not consider, ah, giving a
8 penny from the council until they come and show up.
9 This is the very reason why we have these hearings,
10 ah, so we could, ah, have proper oversight. Thank
11 you so much.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
14 Diaz.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Mr.
16 Chairman. Last week I came here to hearing of the
17 Aging Committee, ah, the preliminary budget hearing
18 for the Aging Committee, and I asked the, the, the
19 commissioner how much money, what resources, she was
20 asking, soliciting to fight the, the coronavirus in
21 senior citizen centers, seniors, school have been
22 cleaned but center has to be cleaned. She cannot
23 respond. She was not ready to tell us what is the,
24 what, what the department is doing to protect senior
25 citizen. But the mayor talks about how concerned

1 they are. Now today we have the MTA in the
2 preliminary budget hearing, this is the opportunity
3 for them to request resources from us, to request to
4 help, to request funding to fight the coronavirus
5 within the MTA. But they decided not to come. That
6 mean that they sending a message. We're gonna talk
7 over there about how concerned we are. But we, but
8 we are really not concerned because this is the
9 hearing where people, each department comes to tell
10 us what they need to fight or continue doing the work
11 they supposed to be doing. But when they decide not
12 to come they sending a message, and the message they
13 sending today is we don't care. Whatever we said out
14 there is hypocrisy. We are not concerned and we
15 don't care, well, we don't need any resources to
16 fight the coronavirus. I am very disappointed to
17 come all the way from the Bronx to sit here and then
18 to be disappointed by seeing they don't came and
19 talk. Mr. Chairman, thank you for this opportunity.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Eh,
22 we usually get the public to testify after we hear
23 from DOT, the, eh, MTA, DOT, and TLC, but if any of
24 the members of the public have something on the MTA
25 you are welcome to come, and you can please say your

1 name. And, and before that Council Member Miller has
2 something to say about it, so I would like to
3 acknowledge the Council Member who is here. You
4 heard from Council Member Cabrera, Diaz, eh, Holden,
5 and Miller. Council Member Miller?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
8 Chair. To my colleagues, thank you all for being
9 here. I think that we were all anticipating the
10 much-anticipated budget conversation with the MTA
11 considering this critical moment in our city's
12 history around public transportation. Um, I think
13 that it is just appalling that they are not here
14 today to discuss and talk about, um, their capital
15 plan, and I know in my district we have a, a bus
16 depot that is behind schedule, a major capital
17 project. We have a number of issues. But certainly
18 we wanted to be able to speak about the bus redesign
19 network that has impacted the Bronx, Brooklyn, and
20 will certainly impact the entire city. We want to
21 talk about this farce which is known as First Mile,
22 Last Mile, the privatization of the MTA and, and
23 public transportation system. There is much to talk
24 about and I'm sure that Mr. Chair at a further moment
25 will have them in here and we'll be able to have this

1 conversation and folks will be held accountable. Um,
2 as a, as a public authority they have a
3 responsibility to provide a service and it is our
4 responsibility to make sure that they are properly
5 providing that service. So I look forward to Mr.
6 Chair bringing them in so that we could appropriately
7 ask the questions that are relevant to the services
8 that our citizens deserve. Thank you, Mr. Chair, for
9 allowing me a moment.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. And,
12 again, on record if anyone is putting a few lines or
13 whatever we're saying if the MTA will say that they
14 cannot come we will understand it. We know all the
15 work that they have to do. Our issue is when they
16 say that they can answer any question by phone, by
17 test, by email, question that we can have in the
18 preliminary and that they just prefer to come to the
19 [inaudible] in May. And this is happening at a time
20 where the Chairman of MTA came here and we asked a
21 question, when can we have the list of the first
22 capital project. And he said in 60 days. Sixty days
23 already passed last week. They have not provided the
24 list. And, as I said, the capital, 55 capital
25 billion dollars are not 100% secure. Congestion

price, you heard what happened at the federal level. You also know that there is 10 billion dollar on bond, on debt. They is counting with additional billions of dollars for the Second Avenue expansion, not because there's a letter that they have received but yet because that guy sent a Twitter. And the City of New York has not secured the 3 billion dollars from this end. So those are like a real concern and again, as I said, different from Byford and the previous person in charge of New York City Transit that they just can accessible, ready from day one, the new person having on board, they have been, they have been on board without any effort to connect with the council, OK. Council Member Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.

Ah, this shows a total disrespect for this council and this body by the MTA. This is consistent with this agency's operations. Um, again, it's a slap in the face of this council and the people of the City of New York that they decided not to show. However, my experience, experiences in only two years of the council, um, the MTA was supposed to do a workshop for my district after they announced that they were, ah, coming up with this bus redesign. It's, it's a,

1 it's a total farce. They didn't even do a workshop
2 last month. I had to cancel the, the meeting halfway
3 through because nothing was getting done, because the
4 MTA was ill-prepared, like they are, they're ill
5 prepared to even get a report today or to even answer
6 questions. I had a ton of questions, like, um,
7 Council Member Miller, um, to ask them today and
8 unfortunately we, we were facing empty seats. Ah,
9 it's outrageous. This agency needs a turnaround and
10 I agree with the speaker of the City Council that,
11 um, we should take control, the City of New York
12 should take control of our subways and, and MTA.
13 Thank you, Chair, and it's still, it really is
14 outrageous that we're facing four empty chairs this
15 morning.
16

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. And
18 by the way, a few weeks ago we also asked them to
19 come and testify on the bus redesigning plan, which
20 [inaudible] will be voting in April. This is before
21 the coronavirus situation and they had refused to
22 accept invitation to come and testify on the bus
23 redesigning hearing that we wanted and we have a day
24 secure here for the end of March. So if [pause]
25

LISA DAGLIAN: Good afternoon, well, good morning. My name is Lisa Daglian and I'm the executive director of the Permanent Citizens' Advisory Committee to the MTA. Ah, I echo your concern...

UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

LISA DAGLIAN: I, I can, or I...

UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

LISA DAGLIAN: OK, great, thank you. Um, well, I started already. We were created by the state legislature in 1981, ah, and were the MTA's in-house rider advocacy organization. We echo your concerns about, um, the empty seats that were before you, and thank you for this opportunity to testify. Um, I'm speaking today on behalf of the New York City Transit Riders' Council, who represents New York City subway and bus riders. Ah, our organization also represents riders on the Long Island Railroad and Metro North, looking at, at the system as a regional approach. Last year, as you noted, ah, we, we sought desperately needed funding sources for the MTA's capital budget and through legislation that was passed and the efforts of many in this room, ah, that funding has been secured.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If you, if you
don't mind let's [inaudible].

LISA DAGLIAN: OK.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]

LISA DAGLIAN: OK, and obviously I
understand that you will probably want to, um,
reiterate some of your comments. [pause]

LISA DAGLIAN: OK, thank you very much.

Ah, good afternoon, well, good morning. My name is
Lisa Daglian and I'm the executive director of the
Permanent Citizens' Advisory Committee to the MTA,
known as PCAC. We were created by the state
legislature in 1981 and are the MTA's in-house rider
advocacy organization, representing nearly nine
million daily riders in the subways and buses, Long
Island Railroad, and Metro North. Today I'm here to
speak on behalf of the New York City Transit Riders'
Council. We appreciate your allowing us to weigh in
and echo your concerns and disappointment that the
MTA was unable to testify today. Last year we sought
desperately needed, dedicated, and recurring funding
sources for the MTA's FY20-24 capital program and
people in this room were very instrumental in
helping, ah, assist in the legislation to bring in

congestion prices. Despite the very unfortunate fact that New York City Transit President Andy Byford won't be at the MTA to see his Fast Forward vision become a reality, ensuring its implementation is vital to the city's and the region's economy. So the good news is that the legislative structure is now in place and we also eagerly await the detailed list of projects, as you've referenced earlier. The bad news is that there is, also as you referenced, a hold-up at the federal level, potentially delaying the MTA's plan, or the congestion pricing plan January 2021 start. And even if the approvals come in tomorrow the reality is that the MTA won't [inaudible] hold revenues until mid '21 to 2022, after the start of the capital program, which has already begun. It's vital that the MTA has adequate money to start its capital projects. And despite the fact that they are not here to ask you for the funding, I'm going to ask you to please consider putting in the 3 billion dollars for, for the city before, at the earliest possible point before the congestion, the other congestion pricing funding comes in, as a benefit to all of the riders who not just live in New York City but who travel here and for the economy of the region

as a whole. The lack of a dedicated and recurring operating revenue also is of great concern.

Ridership is growing and subway and bus service must be increased to meet the new demands it will bring.

As Councilman Referenced, the MTA, and Holden, the MTA is redesigning its entire bus network and, and that's a good thing. Some of the routes haven't

changed in a hundred years and are in serious needs of a refresh. At the same time, it's critical that

the redesigns come with increased and enhanced

service to meet growing demand in the outer boroughs especially and in subway deserts, such as Co-op City,

Cambria Heights, and Mill Basis, as, as well as the other districts that you all represent here. They

simply cannot be cost-neutral reorganizations of the networks. Ideally, the redesign should help form the

glue of a truly regional system of better buses,

commercial rail, and subways that will benefit all riders, particularly in advance of congestion

pricing, and that's going to take money. In the face of the significant operating room deficit we on

behalf of riders are asking the city to add funding to increase bus service as a key component of

redesign. How much? As much as you can find to meet

the constituents you serve. We're asking the same of the state. A very successful addition to the more affordable transit and subway [inaudible] has been the Atlantic Ticket, originally the Freedom Ticket, and the New York City Transit Riders' Council takes great pride and pleasure in having worked with you, ah, to lay the groundwork for this pilot program.

And we'll soon be coming out for the set of recommendations for Freedom Ticket phase 2.

Complicating the situation is the new outer boroughs transportation account discount program funded with more than 50 million dollars a year for-hire vehicle fees as part of congestion pricing. While it would bring in some great data, it has the potential to muddy the waters as discussions get under way with the railroads in the coming months. Rest assured that we are committed to working with you on behalf of riders to move needle on this, but again it's gonna take money. As with our original freedom ticket recommendations, we'll be asking the city to contribute. We appreciate your considering our comments on behalf of riders asking for additional funding and attention for these really important

projects. I'm happy to answer any questions you may have. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I do have a few questions and I know my colleagues they also have questions, and from the riders' advocate perspective, citizenship voice, how do you feel is the MTA doing on bringing the transparency that they need when it comes to the first capital project and share that information not only with the council but with you as a representative of citizens and riders.

LISA DAGLIAN: So the MTA put out sort of a presentation on their list of projects that they like to see. But, as you noted, it is not the detailed list of projects and the order in which they'll be promoted. Ah, it doesn't show the funding sources. We are working with the MTA on a revised and improved dashboard to enhance transparency. It is not the MTA's strong suit, but it's certainly something that we're going to continue, um, to call for as increased transparency, also for naming the members of the traffic mobility working group and holding public meetings so that we can see the conversations that are happening around congestion pricing and the cost to enter and exit.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, and thank you, Director, for your partnership and your leadership over the years.

LISA DAGLIAN: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And, and I'm actually excited about the expansion of Atlantic and, and just a plethora of work that you are doing that folks in, in the transportation, community are doing around public transportation and, and which makes the absence of the MTA more important than ever today, considering, um, all that, that is before them. And so, um, one of the things you talked about and you touched on was certainly the congested pricing dollars or the lack thereof, the fact that they're being held up, and also, um, where they're being direct. In terms of the, ah, the, the private cars, um, do you feel that that's the best use of those dollars for the outer boroughs?

LISA DAGLIAN: Since we don't [clears throat], pardon me, since we don't actually have a list of what all of the different, um, congestion pricing, outer borough funds are gonna be used for,

1
2 sort of hard to say, um, if it's a best use. That's,
3 again, an issue of transparency. It will be really
4 helpful for, ah, the MTA to release a list of where
5 the outer borough funds are gonna go. In terms of
6 congestion pricing funds that are coming in to the
7 dedicated lock box, it's something that we and our
8 fellow advocates worked really hard to secure and I
9 think that I would be remiss if I didn't talk about
10 what a great coalition of partnership in the advocacy
11 has come around the issues of buses, of congestion
12 pricing, um, and Freedom/Atlantic Ticket. So it's a
13 really great three-way, four-way, five-way, um,
14 partnership with the elected officials at the local
15 and state levels as well. So, um, obviously we need
16 the federal level to jump on board and become
17 partners in this as well. Do you have any idea, ah,
18 where this program derived?

19 LISA DAGLIAN: The outer borough transit
20 funds?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Ah, no.

22 LISA DAGLIAN: Oh, I'm sorry.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: The, the,
24 specifically the First Mile, Last Mile use of the,
25 the private cars.

LISA DAGLIAN: Ah, so from the, from the list I've seen of projects that are included in the Outer Borough Transit Fund, ah, it called for a pilot of two to four First Mile, Last Mile projects. I was as surprised as anybody to see the RFP that went out call for the use of, um, for-hire vehicles. It's ironic that funds for outer, from the for-hire vehicle surcharge could potentially be used to pay for-hire vehicles, ah, for first and last mile. That money should go to buses and improving service from our perspective.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I, I think that we all agree that that was kind of the intentions that we, enhanced what we had, including potentially, ah, subsidizing, ah, the commuter rail service that, that exists in, ah, with Metro North and Long Island Railroad throughout the City of New York. So thank you again for your support and partnership.

LISA DAGLIAN: Thank you for your support and partnership.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And before calling [inaudible] from the Riders Alliance, you know, one thing that I also, as you know, want to say is to put on record is that, as you say that it is

important for us to advocate for the City of New York to, to confirm the determination their determination to allocate the 3 billion dollars on capital, you remember that when, when the governor said that he was allocating like 400 million dollars and he was asking the city to also share that investment, there was a position across in the other side of this building and meanwhile the speaker and the colleagues here who led the fight to say we need to do our part and the end, you know, the mayor and the council we worked together and we allocated a huge amount of money. So the city has never been refusing on doing their part, even at this moment with the 3 billion dollars that is counted in the 54 billion by the city has not sealed that amount of money, the questions the city has been asking are legitimate one, which is about how the MTA also will increase transparency, to which project, and even the farther they are not, even though [inaudible] came here and he said to us that in 60 days after the capital, eh, eh, the 2024 capital plan will start, which is, which was at the beginning of January, that we would have that list with detail. And for them not to send the list to us, for me my concern is, is that because there is

doubt of those 54 billion dollars because the congestion price, the commitment from the guy in D.C., the three billion from the city, the debt that the MTA got into in order to balance this 54. So I, I think, you know, the city has been [inaudible] and we will advocate for the city to do the right thing by investing the three billion dollar. But the MTA also, my concerned, I don't go to go backward to what the MTA was before Byford. Because it was not a good taste that we had and there was something that happened under his leadership. You know, he built trust. He went to the community. He connected with all of us. And he was not shy on listening, shy on listening, you know, frustration from riders so again I want to separate, my concern, as I say before, is about if the MTA could not come today, which they expressed last Friday and we were trying persuade and to convincing for them to come, and this is because of the coronavirus, and they need to emergency planning, we were supporter. What we don't support is that they have said that they prefer just to come to testify in the [inaudible] and refusing to come and testify on the preliminary. That we invite them to come to a hearing, that we have a date secure

1
2 already on both the bus redesigning plan and they had
3 refused also to come. So those are the concerns that
4 we want to share also with the public.

5 LISA DAGLIAN: And we appreciate those
6 concerns, sorry, just one, the, um, three billion
7 dollar, um, question has also been tied by the MTA to
8 the accessibility projects, um, and moving those
9 forward, um, and we, we would be concerned about any
10 holdup on the accountability projects. I think that
11 they should be moving ahead as quickly as possible to
12 not just be in compliance but to do the right thing
13 for riders.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I believe
15 that making all station acceptable is a matter of
16 human rights and definitely we will be working with
17 you and the rest of the, of the stakeholders to be
18 sure that we do our part of it.

19 LISA DAGLIAN: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
21 Holden.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you for
23 your testimony. Um, I agree with the use on, on the
24 bus redesign and it's, you know, over a hundred years
25 old and it should be looked at. However, um, without

1 really serious input from the ridership, ah, they
2 came up with a draft, at least in Queens, they came
3 up with this draft proposal that on the surface it
4 looks like they cut service. Now, um, that is
5 strange, when we're trying to get people, we're
6 trying to reduce congestion, traffic congestion,
7 we're trying to get, um, we have more people, um,
8 riding the subways and on buses. You would think
9 they would try to increase service, but, um, when we
10 questioned Andy Byford at the time he said, um, we,
11 we claim it's, and they claim, it's kind of revenue
12 neutral, where you would think they would have to
13 pour some more money into it to increase ridership,
14 increase service, and create new routes. They didn't
15 do that. In fact, they eliminated routes. The
16 eliminated bus service to most of my district, if you
17 look at, to Juniper Valley Park, which draws a
18 thousand people during the, ah, each day during the
19 summer months especially. They eliminated any bus
20 service from Juniper Valley Park, and as a result
21 eliminated, um, and, and isolated thousands of
22 people. Now we don't have essentially in most of my
23 district, we don't have great subways. In fact, we
24 don't have that many subways. So I have to take a

1 bus to the subway, which is at least a mile and a
2 half away from my house. My wife has to take the
3 express bus and pay for the privilege of a longer
4 commute. However, they're cutting, and I asked for
5 increased bus service and increased, um, ah, express
6 bus service and they're cutting express buses. Now,
7 um, so that's why the, it's curious with the MTA
8 having to answer a lot of questions today decided not
9 to show up and, again, what I said earlier, it's
10 consistent with how the MTA operates. They
11 consistently, um, ah, puzzle New Yorkers as to how
12 they operate. Ah, like, like the chair said, there's
13 lack of a transparency definitely across the board in
14 the MTA, and then they come up with this bus redesign
15 that unites the entire City Council Queens delegation
16 against it. I mean, that's curious 'cause we've
17 never been united on every issue in Queens, at least
18 in the council. However, we saw that with their
19 initial bus plan. So there's a lack of input. Now
20 we're not getting input today, ah, and like I said
21 before this is a kick in the head to the City
22 Council. It shows a complete disrespect for this
23 body and for New Yorkers. So, but, again, Chair, I
24 want to just mention that to do a bus redesign for
25

1 the entire borough of Queens, which is underserved
2 now with bus service and to cut service is
3 outrageous, and that's why I, you know, I was looking
4 forward to this hearing to, to ask questions, to try
5 to get more for the redesign and to get more service.
6 Instead, we're getting less, at least on the surface.
7 I'm not sure they can handle this, um, and, ah, I
8 think we kind of need, um, you know, a takeover, like
9 I said before, of the MTA. The city should run the
10 MTA. And I'd like to hear your opinion on that.

12 LISA DAGLIAN: Well, first the bus
13 redesign, and Danny is really, um, a major of the Bus
14 Turnaround Coalition, so I know he's going to have a
15 lot more to say about that. Ah, I live in Queens and
16 I've been to more than half a dozen, close to a dozen
17 of both the workshops and the meetings, and I hear
18 the same thing, ah, no matter where I go, whether
19 it's in Corona or whether it's in Queens Village.
20 People want more service, not less, and they all
21 express concerns about the routes that have been
22 redesigned. And I think that the MTA hears that, and
23 I believe that they're looking, they've certainly at
24 least doubled the number of, ah, workshops and
25 hearings that they're going to be holding, including

1 in your district. I, I think they get it. But I
2 don't know that that's what that's going to translate
3 into. So that's something that we're, you know,
4 calling, continuing to call for, um, and there's a
5 really active advocacy group that's working very hard
6 towards that, um, issue specifically. With regard
7 to, ah, a takeover of New York City Transit, um, you
8 know, we were very interested to, when Speaker
9 Johnson made his presentation last year and I think
10 that there are a lot of question and concerns that
11 arise from funding, um, that would need to be worked
12 through and the devil is in a lot of those details.
13 Um, but certainly increasing the amount until and if
14 that does happen, increasing the amount of input and
15 listening to the concerns of the, of the members
16 representing your constituents, it's really critical.
17 So on one hand I'm heartened that they're holding
18 more hearings, um, but we'll see what, you know, what
19 comes out of that. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry, eh,
22 because we also planning for the DOT to come at 11.
23 So we, let's hear your opening statement. If you
24 want to add anything of what, you know, [inaudible].
25

DANNY PEARLSTEIN: Right. Um, so my name is Danny Pearlstein. I'm the policy and communications director at the Riders' Alliance. We are a New York grassroots organization of subway and bus riders, and we're here today to talk primarily about buses because of the major role that the city already plays in the provision of bus service to more than two million New Yorkers every single day. Um, you know, I think in the context of this progressive era in city and state government it's important to recognize who is on the bus, who those two million bus riders are, that it is primarily low-income New Yorkers of color who rely on the bus. It's a majority immigrant population, significant elderly population, and a large number of parents, especially single parents with children who are reliant on the bus. So when we want to provide bus service, you know, to that population we should think of the bus as an engine of opportunity. And too often it hasn't been providing that opportunity. You know, the bus is slow and unreliable. It's mired in very heavy traffic. And people unfortunately have to plan their lives around the bus rather than the bus working around their lives. Um, and, you know, for that reason, as

1 Lisa was explaining, we became part of the bus turn-
2 around coalition in 2016 to advocate with our
3 colleagues for a full transformation of bus service
4 and we work with folks like Transit Center, Tristate
5 Transportation Campaign, and the Straphangers
6 Campaign to make bus service much, much better. And,
7 you know, we've gotten historic commitments over the
8 last few years from the city and from the MTA. You
9 know, the MTA is committed to doing these redesigns,
10 which are now ongoing. The city committed to its
11 Better Buses Action Plan, and what I think we need to
12 focus on here today more than anything else is that
13 last year in his State of the City Address the mayor
14 promised 25% faster buses by the end of this year, by
15 the end of 2020, through the use of street design
16 changes and that is primarily bus lanes. We are very
17 strong advocates of bus lanes. We believe that there
18 should be bus lanes in every crowded neighborhood
19 where there is heavy reliance on the bus, so that bus
20 lanes should be normal citywide. They should operate
21 much of the day. You know, when they are, you know,
22 absolutely critical to moving large numbers of
23 people. You know, last year there was a tremendous
24 success that reverberated around the world in the
25

14th Street bus way. But there was actually a lesser-known and equally important success in Council Member Holden's district on the Q58 along Fresh Pond Road that's delivered far better bus service for the 20,000 or 30,000 people who use the Q58 every single day. And so, you know, this is something that can happen all over the city and it can happen very fast, right? It just takes a little bit of paint and a little bit of political will. So in this hearing we're interested in hearing more from the DOT and in [inaudible] commissioner about how the city is committing to keeping that 25% faster buses go by the end of this year, how this will be the summer of red paint, you know, when, when the DOT will paint the town red and put bus riders first. That's what we're looking to hear from them. You know, another critically important thing is bus shelters, right? Bus riders are increasingly stranded out in the cold, in the heat, in the rain, as we have more and more extreme weather events associated with climate change. We want more bus shelters. Right now there is a minority of bus stops that actually have shelters. We want to see that flipped. We think there should be a majority. We think that every bus

stop should have a bus shelter and I think a preliminary ask is that there be 1500 additional shelters in each borough, for a total of 7500 bus shelters, you know, in, in the near future and we'd like to see you push the DOT to make that commitment and work with the vendor to see those bus shelters through. And the final point is one that Lisa also made about the bus redesigns and that Council Member Holden made so eloquently as well. Which is that for these redesigns to be truly successful, for them to be as robust in reinventing bus service and bringing more people to the bus and in putting bus riders first. The redesign should have an investment and that should be an investment from the city, in terms in Queens and the MTA bus, but primarily in investment we believe from the state, because New York City Transit is an agency of the state. It depends on the state for its resources and the state should make that contribution. So we believe there should be more frequent bus service in the bus redesigns and that's crucial. The other element I think in the redesigns that is very important is that equity should be a focus, and this is equity from places that are far from the subway and equity from

places where people are low income and especially transit-dependent. And we think that the MTA's plans should focus on making the redesigns an opportunity to make the city a more equitable place. That's what we're asking them to do. We support the bus redesign program. We asked for the bus redesigns to happen. But now we need to see equity and frequency be the pillars of those bus redesigns. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Lisa and Danny. And, first of all, eh, you know, you've been doing a, you've been the voice together with many stakeholders on behalf of the riders and advocating for the one million New Yorkers of people with physical challenges, and I know that we will get there. And I want to send a message clear to the MTA, which is we know that they are working 24/7 to take care of the riders, to be sure that they're safe in this tough moments, but also we want to be clear that all the stations are clean and I said a few days ago we want to give top priority to stations in underserved communities. As you heard the governor saying that those community who are more vulnerable are those that, you know, live, we have the vulnerable New Yorkers that have more [inaudible] to

1 get into the coronavirus so we want to be sure that
2 we pay attention to those stations and as the DOT
3 will come I also will be, you know, asking the DOT
4 Commissioner on how are they coordinating with the
5 MTA to have the entry of the stations also cleaned.
6 When it come to the [inaudible] I had the same, you
7 know, as we will continue conversation with any,
8 hopefully they will come to hearing before the end of
9 March, that the [inaudible] in underserved community.
10 That should not be seen as, you know, the opportunity
11 for the advertising company to now say and let's
12 continue just putting more [inaudible] in areas in
13 the Fifth Avenue, Park Avenue, because, you know,
14 that's where they [inaudible] they higher numbers of,
15 you know, riders and pedestrians and therefore it
16 will make more, it will make money. But I think that
17 if we want to really address it that need to have
18 multiple [inaudible] I want the first, second, third,
19 the first hundred of those, eh, eh, a thousand
20 [inaudible] to be in the underserved community.
21 That's where we need it the most. So with that we
22 end it here and, and now we will get the DOT
23 commissioner to be ready to come to the table in the
24 next five minutes.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LISA DAGLIAN: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
gracias.

DANIEL PEARLSTEIN: Thank you so much.

LISA DAGLIAN: May I ask when the of the
bus redesign hearing that you're looking at is?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's set for
March 19. The MTA has said that they, they are not,
they have refused to come, and we want to be sure
that they understand it, that the plan that they
voting in April, next money, should also give the
opportunity for the council and the public to hear
their presentation here, too. Thank you. In five
minutes, we will take a break for five minutes and
then we will get the DOT commissioner. [pause]
[gavel] Good morning. Good morning, everyone. Eh,
we're following the hearing that we started at 10,
where unfortunately the MTA decide that they were not
coming. And as I said before the reason why they
were not coming today was because they had to work in
the preparation for the coronavirus and they will ask
for them to come another day. Definitely the
committee, the council, the public, will say yes, but
what we refuse to take as the answer from the MTA is

1 to say that they will not come and testify during the
2 preliminary budget, that they only will come and
3 testify during the executive budget and for the MTA
4 also to refuse to accept to come and testify in the
5 bus redesigning hearing that we have schedule for
6 March 19 before the coronavirus. So I don't want to
7 go backward on the MTA especially after we had a good
8 experience with working together with the previous
9 New York City Transit Andy Byford and we hope again
10 that the MTA reconsider their decision and
11 accommodate with us for them to come and testify in
12 another day before the end of the preliminary budget
13 section. They asking for the city to, eh, to secure
14 the 3 billion dollars, congestion prices on risk, 10
15 billion dollars of the 54 capital plan is on
16 [inaudible] so there's a lot that the MTA should be
17 addressing with us and the New York City make a huge
18 contribution to the MTA for they only to come when
19 they need the money. Good morning and welcome to the
20 City Council's Transportation Committee's hearing on
21 the fiscal 2021 preliminary budget and the fiscal
22 2020 preliminary mayor's management report. My name
23 is Ydanis Rodriguez and I have the privilege of
24 chairing this committee, and also here together with
25

the chair of the capital plan of the City Council, Council Member Vanessa Gibson, who also will take the floor. Today we are here to begin the fiscal 2021 budget process, a process that we hope will lead to the adoption of a budget that is progressive, responsible, and fair for all New Yorkers, a budget that should give priority to invest in underserved communities. A budget we also hope will effectively meet the city's need while adapting to an increasingly changing environment. We know that these day are tough day for the City of New York. Everyone is doing their part and together we will come out from this difference situation and stronger than before. In the last few days both Governor Cuomo and Mayor de Blasio have declared a state of emergency for New York giving the risk associated with the commuting in the city during the epidemic it is paramount that the city agency do their best to ensure the protections of commuters and riders. The MTA has stated that they are cleaning the areas that are commonly touched by riders for all the stations. They should also include all adjustments, adjacent areas in and around the stations. We need to be sure that all the hand rails, doors, and MTA machines are

properly sanitized and clean. They should add more men and women power in each station dedicated to clean. That's not happening right now. The person that we have at 168 and 145th A and D train is a one-person shift of eight hours. And that number should be increased if we want to have enough men and women power dedicated to clean those stations. DOT needs to make sure that all the streets are kept clean and free of any garbage, especially in underserved communities and, most importantly also, as close to the entry of all stations. Within those communities we see the highest levels of asthma, diabetes, obesity, and many other conditions which impact lower income and make them more propense to the virus. It is important that during this time all city agency are doing their part. We have also heard accounts of drivers getting sick with the coronavirus. I will be working closely with the TLC from [inaudible] we will hear later on. This is the time where we need to come together as a city and make sure everyone is taken into account and that all New York City communities receive the same resources and even more resources in some community who have lack those services and deal with more issue related to asthma,

obesity, diabetes, and other, eh, health issues.

Today we will hear testimony from the Department of Transportation. The DOT preliminary expense budget for fiscal 2021 is approximately 1.5 billion. In addition, 1.9 billion is budgeted in fiscal 2021 for the department's computer program. We look forward to the commissioner updating this committee and subcommittee on the department's effort to maintain and improve the city's roadway infrastructure, improve pedestrian safety, and implementation with the transportation master plan and Commissioner, as you know, intersections are a top priority.

Additionally, we hope the department will discuss its four-year capital plan, particularly in terms of its goals and priorities for the next four years, the scope and progression of work on the East River bridges, the reconstruction of the pedestrian ramps, and roadways citywide, the future of the BQE, cantilever, and the effect of the city's new 14th Street subway. Finally, the city has recently seen a tragic increase in bicyclists' fatalities. In fact, in the first four months of fiscal 2020 bicyclist fatalities have increased a big percent, percentage.

We look forward how those, how DOT plans on

addressing this unacceptable increase. Following DOT we will hear from the Taxi and Limousine Commission. TLC proposed fiscal 2021 expense budget total 54 million. The committee hopes to hear later from them on its outlook for yellow medallion values and its thoughts on the council taxi medallion task force report finding. The committee also look forward to hearing about wheelchair accessibility for yellow medallion taxis, green taxis, and for, and for-hire vehicles. Finally, TLC issued its first for-hire vehicle base license to open in 2011. App-based companies have dramatically increased in popularity. The committee is interested in hearing later on about changing trends in the taxicab industry, including the growth of high volume for-hire vehicles and TLC outlook on the future of these driving industry and its impact on medallion taxi. Now before we hear from the DOT commissioner, let's pass to the chair of the Subcommittee on Capital, Council Member Vanessa Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez. Good morning, everyone. Welcome to the City Council. I am New York City Council Member Vanessa Gibson and I am proud to chair the

Subcommittee on Capital Budget here at the council.

Thank you to our chair, Council Member Rodriguez, for

cochairing this important hearing with me and our

colleagues, and certainly we want to thank the New

York City Department of Transportation, our

Commissioner, Polly Trottenberg, and all of the DOT

staff. We thank you for being here and many of our

advocates who are here as well. The Department of

Transportation's fiscal 2021 preliminary capital

budget includes 7.6 billion dollars in fiscal 2021

through fiscal 2024. This represents approximately

14% of the city's total 56.1 billion dollar capital

budget and is in addition to the 4.4 billion dollars

in available appropriations remaining for fiscal

2020. Its planned commitments set forth in the

commitment plan total 10.8 billion dollars between

fiscal 2020 and 2024. The single largest capital

project budget line and also the source of the

greatest budget uncertainty, which many of us

acknowledge, is the Brooklyn Queens Expressway

Atlantic to Sands Project, including the cantilever.

Due to delays and redesigns of the cantilever project

of its previous planned commitment of 1.6 billion

dollars the department is now committing to spend

only half between fiscal 2022 and fiscal 2024 to make near-term repairs and is shifting the rest of the spending beyond the term of the commit plan.

Meanwhile, last money the New York City Council, we released a report that was written under the guidance of a leading engineering and design firm to really look at alternative operations to repair the cantilever. The council's report identified two viable options at a cost of between 5 billion and 11 billion dollars over the next 10 years, either a capped rebuilt highway or a tunnel bypass with a small surface boulevard. I am eager today to learn from DOT how the administration plans to proceed.

I'm sure you read the report and certainly what DOT's thoughts are on the report that was released. The department is justifiably proud of the many measures it has taken to improve safety here in our city, including street redesign with protected bike lanes, pedestrian islands, speed reducers, speed bumps, and other traffic-calming measures to slow traffic down, such as are now being deployed in the Bronx, in my district, along the Grand Concourse Redesign Project. However, we are not seeing as much progress towards the city's ambitious Vision Zero goal of zero

1 traffic-related fatalities by 2024. In fact, the
2 first four months of fiscal 2020 citywide traffic
3 fatalities increased 5.5% from 73 to 77 as compared
4 with the year before, including unfortunately a 300%
5 increase in bicyclist fatalities. I want to learn
6 more about what the department thinks are some of the
7 factors behind what is happening across the city,
8 these horrific trends that we're seeing with
9 pedestrians and bicyclists, and unfortunately
10 children who are injured and/or killed, um, it's
11 heart-breaking, um, and whenever it happens
12 throughout this city, ah, we all feel guilty and we
13 all have a responsibility. That could be our child
14 crossing the street, going to school with their
15 parent, and certainly my heartfelt condolences to
16 every family member in this city that mourns the loss
17 of their child. And I know DOT has been extremely
18 aggressive in going into many of these communities to
19 look at what we are, are doing and what we could do
20 better. But certainly we are going to always be
21 preventative and do work before there's ever a crash
22 or ever a fatality. So I want to acknowledge you,
23 DOT, for what you have been doing and what you are
24 doing and certainly how we can improve safety overall
25

for cyclists, pedestrians, and every New Yorker. Um, I'd also like to take a moment to recognize and thank the hardworking finance division for all of their work in preparing for today's hearing. I want to thank our director, Latonia McKinney, our deputy directors, Nathan Toll, Paul Simone, Regina Pareda-Ryan, our senior finance analyst, John Basil, our unit head, Cheema Obichair, our senior counsel, Rebecca Chasen, and our assistant counsel, Noah Brick. And I also want to recognize the members of the Subcommittee on Capital, our minority leader, Steven Matteo, Council Member Barry Grodenchik, and our chair, who acknowledged the other members here. And with that, thank you Chair Rodriguez. We look forward to having a conversation today as well as our ongoing work through this budget process. Thank you so much. I'll turn it back over to our chair, Chair Rodriguez.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chair Gibson, and before we hear from DOT, let's also recognize the other council member who are here, Council Member, eh, eh, Deutsch, Grodenchik, Matteo, and Cohen. And now we will hear from the DOT, led by

DOT Commissioner, Polly Trottenberg. [inaudible]
sorry, I thought I had.

UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I did already.
[gavel] Eh, eh, so now we will hear from the DOT
Commissioner Polly Trottenberg, the members of her
team, and before I will call the on committee counsel
to swear in the witnesses.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please raise your
right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
testimony before this committee, and to respond
honestly to council member questions?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You may begin.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thank you.
Good morning, Chairman Rodriguez, Chairwoman Gibson,
and members of the Transportation Committee. I'm
Polly Trottenberg, commissioner of the New York City
Department of Transportation. With me today are
Elizabeth Franklin, associate commissioner for budget
and capital program management, and Rebecca Zack,
assistant commissioner for intergovernmental and
community affairs. We're pleased to be here on
behalf of Mayor Bill de Blasio to testify on DOT's

fiscal year 2021 preliminary expense budget and capital plan. This budget will support DOT in its mission to provide for the safe, efficient, equitable and environmentally sustainable movement of people and goods in New York City. Over the past six years with the leadership and robust resources the mayor and the council have provided we've worked, we've worked hard to serve New Yorkers all over our city. I'm very proud of the men and women at DOT and I want to express my gratitude for all their remarkable work. For fiscal year 21 the mayor proposes a 1 billion dollar operating budget, which will allow us to run, maintain, and manage our signal street lights, parking, signage, markings, roadway surfaces, sidewalks, bridges, and ferries, as well as research and plan for the city's transportation network with a focus on safety while balancing the needs of all users. In our 10.8 billion dollar proposed capital plan for fiscal year 20 to 24 we continue this administration's historic investment in bridge and street reconstruction and support resurfacing, the largest pedestrian ramp program in the country, new street light signals, and our ferry fleet. You can see an overview of our entire budget in my written

testimony. To discuss a few topics, I would like to begin with Vision Zero. Two weeks ago we saw two terrible crashes that killed young people, a stark reminder of the urgency of our Vision Zero work, and we've seen other tragic crashes, unfortunately, since then. With the resources this budget would provide, DOT stands ready to do even more to make our streets safer, working with our sister agencies. As the mayor has said, with each year Vision Zero deepens and grows. But I do want to take a moment to address one message we heard after the twin tragedies in East New York that DOT is somehow delivering fewer street safety enhancements to low-income neighborhoods and communities of color. I want to make emphatically clear that this is not true. Under Vision Zero's data-driven approach we focus our work on the locations with the greatest safety needs, not just the communities with the loudest voices or the most privileged. In practice, as our pedestrian safety action plans behind me illustrate, we've prioritized many of the city's lowest-income areas, and our focus on the areas, these areas, is having real results. Reductions in death and serious injuries in our priority locations outpaced the citywide gains in

safety under Vision Zero. Moreover, we analyzed the number of street improvement projects implemented in New York City's highest poverty and highest non-white neighborhoods based on census tract demographics and you can see from the charts and my testimony we found that these neighborhoods not only received a proportional share of projects, but also realized some of the largest drops in pedestrian fatalities. But we know we have much more to do, and some of DOT's specific safety work within East New York is particularly worth noting. In 2017 we declared Brooklyn's community board as one of our bicycle priority districts, as it is an area where we see comparatively high cycling deaths and injuries, suggesting high ridership, but where cycling infrastructure is more limited. Last fall we joined activities and community leaders to cut the ribbon on the de Blasio administration's 100 mile of protected bike lanes along Fountain Avenue, at the edge of the new Shirley Chisholm State Park. You can see this before and after pictures of Fountain Avenue along with a couple of other recent examples of our work. And this past Friday DOT leaders joined Chancellor Richard Carranza at a community forum with local

1 leaders, Council Member Barron and Assembly Member
2 Barron, and participated in a very productive
3 dialogue about what else DOE, DOT, NYPD, and local
4 elected officials can do together to make our streets
5 safer. In the area of the two East New York crashes
6 in particular, DOT had installed a number of safety
7 projects in recent years, including school slow
8 zones, left turn calming, and a pedestrian head
9 start, what we call an LPI, as well as nearby speed
10 cameras. Even with all these interventions the
11 NYPD's two separate arrests on failure to yield
12 charges show that reckless driving can override a lot
13 of good design and safety work. As with all fatal
14 crashes, DOT will continue to evaluate the design of
15 the streets and the circumstances of these crashes in
16 order to enhance safety. But I will certainly echo
17 the, Chairwoman Gibson's remarks. We do grieve
18 especially hard for these two children and all the
19 children killed on our roadways. As we enter the
20 seventh year of our work and after the tough weeks
21 like we saw last money, we should together take stock
22 of the progress the city has made and the challenges
23 we still face with Vision Zero. We'll take some
24 action quickly and decisively, but other factors
25

1 impacting road safety can be complex, involving land
2 use, interstate commerce, and federal regulation. I
3 say this not to avoid responsibility or pass it on to
4 other agencies or jurisdictions but rather to provide
5 the context into the immense and complex challenges
6 we face. I can speak for DOT staff when I say we
7 have no shortage of will, care, or imagination. And
8 even with recent setbacks we do need to remember that
9 fatalities declined for five straight years and New
10 York City's streets have seen six of their seven
11 safest years under the de Blasio administration.
12 Overall, fatalities are down 26% compared to 2013,
13 the year before Vision Zero started, and ped
14 fatalities are down 33%. And while last year roadway
15 fatalities tragically rose for the first time since
16 Vision Zero began in 2014, it was still New York
17 City's second-safest year ever. In 2019 the Bronx
18 saw its safest year in recorded history, with 29
19 fatalities borough wide compared to 38 last year.
20 Its previous record low was 32 in 2007. Staten
21 Island also had encouraging results. After its
22 safest year ever in 2018 with seven fatalities, it
23 saw its second-safest year in 2019 with eight
24 fatalities. But sadly fatalities did increase in
25

2019, driven by a dramatic spike in Brooklyn cyclist deaths, up from two in 2018 to 17 in 2019. This figure includes five e-cyclists fatalities, which NYPD would have previously reported as motorcycle fatalities, and began recategorizing this past year. And of course, as I always say, these are more than just numbers. They're our family, our friends, our coworkers, our neighbors, and our fellow New Yorkers, and we mourn each and every death. In response, as you may recall, the mayor announced the Green Wave Plan in August 2019 and DOT is hard at work implementing this ambitious series of new initiatives. To support the Green Wave the November plan included funding for 48 new positions, ramping up to 61 positions in fiscal year 24 and our hiring is underway. In January we announced that we will be building 10 of the 30 miles of protected bike lanes we've committed to this year in Brooklyn, along Flatbush Ave, Fort Hamilton Parkway, Franklin Street, Remsen Ave, Meeker Street, Navy Street, and Smith Street. And we're grateful to the mayor for proposing in his preliminary budget to add 98 million to fully fund additional improvements on our Fourth Avenue Great Streets capital project, building out

pedestrian and bike improvements along the corridor.

Two weeks ago we released a Green Wave progress report and announced that we will install 10 new miles of protected bike lanes in Manhattan this year, the borough's largest single-year increase ever.

Those lanes include Sixth Ave in midtown, Central Park, finishing Central Park West, Fifth Ave in

Harlem, St. Nicholas Ave, a Green Wave connection on the Lower East Side, several new connections to the

Queensborough Bridge, and key connections in lower Manhattan, including Broadway, Whitehall, West

Broadway, Varick, Church, and Sixth Ave. And we're

in the process of finalizing additional crosstown

routes in midtown. Together many of these new lands

along with others we'll be working on in the Bronx,

Queens, and Staten Island will fill major gaps and

make key connections in our cycling network. They

bring us closer to reaching our 2030 vision for an

interconnected, protected citywide network of bike

lines, connecting all New Yorkers where they live to

every major destination. And the de Blasio

administration, in partnership with the council, has

invested over one billion in these efforts since 2014

and has budgeted 3 billion more for fiscal year 20

through 29. Guided by data about the locations most in need of safety enhancement, DOT has tripled our output of street improvement projects and protected bike lanes compared to pre Vision Zero, to create over a hundred miles of protected bike lanes, which now represent about one out of every five protected bike lane miles being created across the entire US. We've increased LPI installations by nearly 6000%, corridor retimings by over 800%, and speed reducers by nearly double. And as the council knows, the master plan legislation that the mayor signed into law in November, thanks to the leadership of Speaker Corey Johnson and you, Chairman Rodriguez, requires DOT to develop even more ambitious street design targets. We've begun the process of creating DOT's dedicated master plan unit to spearhead our efforts. In the preliminary budget the mayor proposes 1.75 million for Master Plan early action costs. We will use this funding to bring on a consultant overseen by our new Master Plan unit for outreach, traffic counts, and data collection. I know the pace of street engineering changes, receives a lot of attention, and rightly so. However, with everything we have accomplished under six years of Vision Zero

and many years of data and experience in hand we are continuing to work on additional ways that we, together with our Vision Zero partners, can go further and deeper. And I'll mention just a few. First, of course, DOT is installing the largest Speed Camera network in the world, as, as far as we know, at a pace of three new cameras every single work day. In fact, during 2020 alone we will install more speed cameras on New York City streets, 720 in total, than we have installed in the previous six years combined. And we just recently celebrated the signing of a law to create a new driver accountability program, with the mayor, Council Member Brad Lander, Chairman Rodriguez, New York City [inaudible], and a remarkable group of advocates. Over the next 12 months we'll be working to stand up this new program, a first of its kind, to hold the drivers who incur the greatest number of red light and Speed Camera tickets accountable for their reckless behavior. Under the program, drivers will be required to take a restorative, justice-oriented, safe driving course and if they fail to complete the course the sheriff will be authorized to impound their cars until they do. In the coming months we will be promulgating

rules identifying a provider for the required course and working with the sheriff, Department of Finance, and OATH to set up procedures for running the program. Starting this fall we will be adding a warning to all our speed and red light camera notices that if vehicle owners incur five or more red light or 15 or more Speed Camera violations they may be subject to the program. We hope these warnings will themselves be a form of deterrents. And many people may not realize this but since our Speed Camera expansion started in July every Speed Camera violation also includes photos and testimonials from five families from Families for Safe Streets who have lost loved ones to crashes, and an example is included in my testimony. Unfortunately, we know that our driver accountability program will only catch a small percentage of drivers, so we are continuing to think about how we can do even more. At the state level we support the Vehicular Violence Act, which [inaudible] penalties against reckless drivers involved in fatal crashes. We'll also work closely with our state elected leaders to encourage state DMV to focus on driver behaviors through enhancements to testing, driver training, and

licensing. An amazing fact - in New York State cars must be inspected every year, but drivers must only pass a driver's test once in their entire lives.

We'll also be working closely with DSNY as they transform the city's commercial waste system, thanks to landmark legislation passed last fall. This bill was the product of years of activism, study, and the leadership of the mayor, the City Council,

particularly Council Member Antonio Reynoso, and my fellow commissioner, Katherine, Katherine Garcia.

Drivers of private sanitation vehicles were responsible for the deaths of nine people in 2019.

We expect commercial waste zones will lead to fewer vehicle miles traveled, fewer emissions, and, most importantly for Vision Zero, safer streets. The city is also advocating strongly at the state level for the ability to pilot automated truck enforcement, with a particular emphasis on the urgent need to get overweight trucks off the BQE. In the coming weeks will lay out a comprehensive plan for managing freight on our streets that will enhance safety, sustainability, and livability for our neighborhoods.

We've also announced a partnership with DCAS, the MTA, [inaudible], TLC, and the New York City Vision

Zero task force to host a professional fleet operator training on March 13, the details of which you can see in a flyer attached to my testimony. Of course, we look forward to working with all of you as we bring new safety projects to your districts in the years to come. As we have said around Vision Zero, and as last year sadly showed, progress will not always be linear, but the amazing team at DOT will continue to focus relentlessly on proven strategies and new approaches to roadway safety. When it comes to mobility, we're continuing to prioritize the most efficient modes, maximize the most efficient use of our curb, and make our streets accessible for all New Yorkers. On buses, the exciting results of our 14th Street Transit and Truck Priority pilot have been well publicized. This past year we also largely met our goals for our Better Buses Action Plan across the board. We implemented over 10 miles of bus lanes, improved over five miles of existing lanes, and implemented a segment of protected bus lane on Archer Avenue in Queens, and other street design projects that benefitted over 700,000 bus riders. We implemented transit signal priority on four quarters, covering 322 intersections, as well as four Q jump

1 signal installations on Broadway and Queens. We have
2 ambitious plans for the year ahead with projects all
3 over the city that you can see on the map in my
4 testimony, with a particular emphasis on the Bronx
5 and Queens, where we will work, ah, where we will
6 implement transit priority to complement New York
7 City Transit bus network redesigns. As many of you
8 are aware, the city and the MTA were successful up in
9 Albany in securing reauthorization of bus lane camera
10 enforcement authority, removing all time of day and
11 route restrictions. Since then, we've partnered with
12 New York City transit to process the notices of
13 violations from their dramatically expanded use of
14 bus mounted cameras, and I want to thank acting
15 senior vice president of New York City Bus and
16 president of MTA Bus, ah, Crag Cipriano and the whole
17 New York City Transit bus team for their great
18 leadership and partnership. And last year DOT added
19 camera enforcement to ten new bus quarters and NYPD
20 has stood up seven new tow truck teams and issued
21 over 350,000 bus lanes and bus stop violations.
22 When it comes to bike share, City Bike phase three
23 expansion is underway, funded by a five-year, 100
24 million dollar capital investment from Lyft that will
25

double the geographic reach of the program and triple its number of bikes to 40,000. This year we are expanding City Bike to the northern tip of Manhattan and into the Bronx for the first time, while also adding new stations and docks to the busiest areas in the core of the city to support the demands of a much larger system. We know the governor and the legislature are currently negotiating on e-bike and e-scooter legislation. Should Albany act, the administration looks forward to working with the City Council to create the best legal, regulatory, and operational framework for these devices on our city streets. When it comes to managing our curb, the uses and needs for the space evolve and demand continues to grow. We're developing a more flexible dynamic and responsive approach, through new policies and regulations, more proactive planning, and harnessing new and emerging technologies. For context, we handle a lot of a parking activity with over 400,000 daily transactions at nearly 14,000 meters citywide and in just two short years Park NYC, our mobile payment platform, has grown to nearly a quarter of all transactions with around 100,000 daily transactions. Cities across the US have increasingly

adopted integrated parking management systems that move away from cash and paper to more digital systems built around license plates. The first step for New York City, which we expect to start this summer and fully implement over 18 months, is pay by play.

Associating your payment or your permit with your license plate means motorists no longer need to walk to the meter and then return to their car to display their payment, and enforcement officers will no longer need to check for a receipt in the window of cars. When it comes to accessibility you may have seen more of our crews out around the city as we take on the task of making every pedestrian ramp in the city fully ADA compliant. Through cutting edge technology to map and analyze the condition of every ramp and a whole new unit at DOT with in-house construction crews, as well as DDC-managed contracts. And with the additional 57 million that was added to our budget in September we will install accessible pedestrian signals at over 300 locations annually for the next three years, as agreed to by the administration and the council. Moving to the vital work of maintaining transportation and infrastructure on which New Yorkers rely, last year we committed 1.2

1 billion worth of Bridge Street and ferry capital
2 projects. I'm proud to say that with improved
3 planning and scoping this was our fifth consecutive
4 year of achieving capital commitments of over a
5 billion dollars. To help deliver our massive capital
6 program, DOT is very glad now to have broad authority
7 to use design, build, procurement thanks to the
8 legislation passed last year and signed by the
9 governor. With the limited authority the city had
10 previously received to implement, design, build on
11 the BQE, borough-based jails, and NYCHA projects, DOT
12 has already been working with partner city agencies
13 under City Hall's oversight, the comptroller's
14 office, and the Design Build Institute of America to
15 prepare to utilize design build. With our new
16 broader authority we expect to advance a number of
17 projects in our program through design build in the
18 next few years, including the Staten Island Ferry
19 Terminal Resiliency Project. You can see some of the
20 examples of current and upcoming DOT capital projects
21 in my testimony. Finally, we heard in the mayor's
22 budget address that the city faces tough choices as
23 the result of state budget gaps, including sizeable
24 Medicaid deficits. While making vital investments
25

1 that I've discussed, this budget also includes
2 savings in a combination of the November and January
3 plans of 20 million in fiscal year 20 and 17 million
4 in fiscal year 21. We were able to accomplish these
5 savings through initiatives that reduced our city-
6 funded cost and recognized increased revenues,
7 without impacting important public services. In
8 conclusion, I want to thank the council for its
9 continued partnership and leadership. As I start my
10 seventh year as commissioner, I'm proud of all that
11 we have accomplished together and excited about the
12 work to come. I am happy to answer your questions.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
15 Commissioner. I have a few question and I know that
16 my colleagues, they also have others, but I know that
17 when you started at the beginning you say that
18 something related to that the city, and I just ask
19 because it's not in the testimony, that [inaudible]
20 related to does the city invest the same resources in
21 underserved communities? I think that you said
22 something about it. Can you elaborate a little bit?

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Um, yes. I
24 think you, you saw some of the charts and I also, I
25 know many of the members were taking a look at these

charts. This is the methodology, I, I think a lot of you are familiar with. Um, we just updated it last year, where we look at all the corridors, intersections in major areas of the city and the data we look as is, you know, on our roadways where we see crashes that result in fatalities or serious injuries, and that's, it's really the data that guides us, and, and you can see from these maps, obviously where you see the red lines and dots, ah, those are our prior corridors and our prior intersections, and those larger orange areas are sort of larger areas of focus. And, you know, one of the statistics we discovered, and this isn't only true in New York, I think it's true in cities all around the country, about 8% or 9% of our roadways and intersections, ah, in most places are responsible for 50% of the fatalities and serious injuries. And I know all of you looking at this map can see intuitively the areas where, you know, we, we know we see a lot crashes. They often tend to be places where you have a lot of major arteries that are, you know, flanked by residential areas but are carrying, you know, six, eight, 10, 12 lanes of traffic and so, you know, a lot of those corridors and intersections

1
2 are all over the city, but you can see a lot of them
3 coincide in many cases with lower-income communities,
4 communities of color, and if you see the, the green
5 and blue focus on those maps, those are what we call
6 our bicycle priority districts, which as I spoke
7 about in my testimony, are sort of not the most inner
8 ring of the city, the next ring out, where we are
9 seeing cycling is really increasing, and increase
10 amongst all kinds of communities, and we want to
11 catch up and put more of that infrastructure in,
12 'cause that's where we're often seeing tragically
13 cyclist fatalities and injuries.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK.

15 Commissioner, how, how do you, I mean, the
16 department, determine in which area, in which
17 intersection a, a stop sign should be replaced by
18 signal system?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, again, as
20 you can see from the map, I mean, we are guided first
21 and foremost at looking at the data of where we see
22 crashes, where we see fatalities, where we see
23 injuries. And I, I think, as the council members
24 here know we, we also, we are both trying to be
25 proactive and look at areas that we think we want to

put in signals and stop signs, but we also obviously take requests not only from council members, but we take them from the public. Um, as I think a lot you know, we used the engineering tests that are put forward at the federal level, it's called the warrant system, where our traffic engineers look at a number of factors. What are the volunteers in both directions? What do the crash statistics look like? You know, and that's how we make that determination. I know that can be very frustrating sometimes for council members, even sometimes frustrating for the mayor. Um, we are always trying to refine that system and work with you all to, you know, figure out when is the best time to take a look at the volunteers and analyze those intersections. We also, as you know, Mr. Chairman, we have a lot of tools in our tool kits in addition to traffic signals and stop signs. We look at pedestrians crossing speed humps, traffics, you know, ah, traffic signal retiming, Speed Cameras, so there are a bunch of things we try and do working together with obviously you all and, and community boards and, and members of the public.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I just feel that we should and, and, and we know that, you know,

1 you, you solving the department, your team is always
2 accessible and listening to the need, to [inaudible]
3 so community boards and, and, and advocate. But I
4 feel that the City of New York should determine to
5 get rid of stop sign unless it is in an area that,
6 you know, because of many study and research has been
7 proven that there is pedestrian and cyclist and other
8 risk. I think that, and I, and I have seen, and I
9 know that we have make a lot of progress, you know,
10 because of the work with the community board and I'm
11 not saying that [inaudible] community boards and
12 other transportation advocate group we have seen more
13 area where we used to have a stop sign. Now instead
14 of the stop sign with have the light signal there.
15 And I think that there's no, there's not a need for
16 us to wait, and, and my recommendation is nobody
17 about these area has these numbers of crashes and
18 therefore we should change it. I think as a policy
19 in general I think that 20, 25 years ago if you look,
20 let's say, at Inwood in this area, like Post Avenue,
21 204, Academy, there used to be a stop sign and now
22 there's not a stop sign anymore, there's the signal
23 light there. And I think that that's something that
24 should be happening across the border. I have seen
25

1 now, I have seen many other area and as the chairman
2 of transportation committee as you know we've been
3 some walking the trains and walking around. I have
4 seen Morris Avenue and Walton Avenue. Still there's
5 intersection there that students are close by, and
6 what you have seen is a stop sign and I just to put
7 the recommendation beside listening to the community
8 board, the elected official, I think that the
9 termination the data are driven on [inaudible]
10 changes their replace the stop sign, surveys about
11 how many cars, vehicle, pass through that area, how
12 many pedestrians go through that area. And I think
13 again like even though we can say we cannot have any
14 crash in this area but the time of a stop sign in
15 intersection I think should be something of the past.
16 I think that in order to improve safety and have a
17 more vision plan for the future they should be
18 replaced by signal, by light, eh, across the New York
19 City.
20

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, I'm just
22 double checking the number. I think I just want to
23 be clear. The, the city is now, I think, I'm gonna
24 double check the number. I think we are, just so
25 everyone knows, installing, putting in about 150 new,

150 new signals every year. We are already just, just for people's information, sort of far and away the most signalized city in the world proportionally speaking and I just, just, it's, it's sort of a counterintuitive, um, concept, but just one thing from the traffic engineering point of view, the traffic engineers, part of why we have these [inaudible] and I know they can be frustrating and, and often a lot of disagreement about it, and it's, it's a very difficult area. But one thing that they worry about writ large in a system is good compliance, and if you've ever been in a place where you've seen a signal or a light that feels counterintuitive and that there's rarely any traffic there it can produce a tendency for people to blow through it. And so that is just writ large in the system, always the thing that they are balancing. I, I think there are always ways we can do it better, and the mayor certainly, if, if you heard his State of the City, has encouraged us to do even more, so, so I can assure you we will be and obviously taking, you know, taking requests from members, but just I think the thing we're balancing writ large in the whole system is, and, and all cities are, are

1
2 grappling with this, but few cities are signalized
3 already to the extent that New York is, making sure
4 that people are going to comply and, you know, it is
5 interesting actually the just, I've mentioned this
6 before, the trend now in some European countries, I,
7 I was in Amsterdam and I saw this is, they're
8 actually starting to take signals out on the theory
9 that they want cars and cyclists and pedestrians when
10 they get to an intersection, they want everybody to
11 slow down and have to navigate it. I'm not saying
12 that's the solution for New York. I'm just saying
13 sort of the most cutting-edge traffic engineering is
14 always, I think, pondering this question about how to
15 create the safest system. It's, it's, you know, it's
16 complicated to get it right but, again, please, we
17 will continue to continue take everybody's request
18 and the mayor has certainly tasked us to lean in and
19 do all that we can on front.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I, I just feel
21 that everything in New York City is about the
22 direction that is given from the top. And I think
23 that this is our time, even to leave direction and
24 policy in place to accomplish as many of them as
25 possible before January 22, and to leave other policy

1 in place for whoever it's gonna be, the new leaders I
2 the city. Because engineer they will always justify.
3 It's about what direction they get. And as I said,
4 2009 I got elected. I left [inaudible] community
5 board, community board were demanding to say we need
6 to redesign Diamond and Broadway. And I did a walk
7 with the great deputy commissioner, you know, of
8 Manhattan at that time, Margaret [inaudible], you
9 know, it was not what he, what she saw, but it was
10 about what direction we're given from the top. And
11 at that time it was about we can now build an island
12 in Manhattan as we did it to expand the space for
13 pedestrians. We cannot put an arrow, the one that
14 that we have right now, so that we separated time
15 from pedestrian to cyclist because it would take some
16 few seconds from drivers that they come from
17 [inaudible] to Broadway. However, what we have seen
18 is by the changes that has been done under this
19 administration. Crashes are reducing big time there.
20 So for me I'm not in the business, I say drivers of
21 being one of those 1.4 million New Yorkers that own
22 cars on how engineering is giving an advisory about
23 if we, our new tools, you know, to reduce the speed
24 or take more time for drivers, will have some impact

1 in the street. For me this is about we have a
2 epidemic on crashes and I know that it break our
3 heart every day. We know that when we through that
4 116 and First Avenue back in December when the, the
5 lady, the child, she was killed by the drivers making
6 a left turn and then we have a week or 48 hours
7 having three crashes and people dying in January, and
8 repeating the same number like three weeks ago. You
9 know, I feel that we need to declare intersections in
10 a state of emergency so that we can get more
11 resources. I believe that this budget even though
12 we've been doing big investment to the DOT to have
13 everything that you need, but for now or [inaudible]
14 later we need to do more. We need to work 24/7.
15 Because when we have those number that more than 60%
16 of the crashes happen in intersections I don't want
17 to see one intersection, what we have is a stop sign,
18 and then to go and talk to the parents and say we
19 were waiting because no one, you know, came to us.
20 So that's my years advice on let's continue, let's
21 [inaudible] let's be more ambition, not only
22 executing what we have today, but to leaving the
23 policy in place for whoever is going to be the new
24 leaders in the City of New York. You know, now do
25

1 you feel we are right now when it come to the
2 resources that we have to redesign intersections and
3 please let's think outside the box. Because, you
4 know, if, if we just say we doing good job, you know,
5 we have the resources, then for me it's bat we have
6 seen an increase of cyclists being killed. You know,
7 Vision Zero is something that we continue having as a
8 goal. But every week there's one person dying in the
9 street.
10

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, I, I
12 will say honestly, Mr. Chairman, I think the city has
13 allocated extraordinary resources. I just was down
14 visiting with my counterparts in Philadelphia. They
15 are trying to do Vision Zero on a shoestring. I
16 mean, I think that, you know, we're a city, I think
17 we're a city about eight times their size and we're
18 probably spending 3000% more resources than they are.
19 There's always more we can do. I, you know, you
20 know, I do particularly want to emphasize this in my
21 testimony. While we're doing all this ambitious
22 street work there is also a [inaudible] one thing
23 we've seen in a lot of these crashes in a lot of
24 crashes, a lot of driver behavior. The one up on
25 116th Street, we had done work at that intersection.

1 That driver took that turn way too fast and they were
2 in an enormous Ford truck in which the visibility,
3 the, the hood of the truck is you can't see below
4 five feet. So, I mean, there are other pieces to
5 this puzzle. Driver behavior, you know, obviously we
6 are, we are looking forward to implementing Council
7 Member Lander's bill. And I think in spending more
8 time up in Albany and thinking through more of the
9 pieces making sure that drivers on the road in New
10 York are doing what they need to do. Um, I think we
11 have tremendous resources. Look, I, you know,
12 obviously we can always do with more, but between the
13 Green Wave and the Master Plan, better buses, our,
14 our pedestrian ramp program, and our Speed Camera
15 program, I mean, we are an agency with, with
16 tremendous resources and, and, you know, a lot of
17 exciting work ahead of us.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] and
20 of course when you mentioned compared to Europe, you
21 know, like it's not the same thing to see the
22 cultural cyclists in Amsterdam and other places in
23 Europe that's we also, you know, compare ourself, you
24 know, it's like the SBS, BRT, when we have things
25 that, places like in Mexico and Colombia, they have

1 done being a more ambition, working a more ambition
2 plan, so I think that, and also in, they are in
3 Europe, eh, as you know, the, the law mandate that
4 any trucks they have to come with the sensors. So
5 here at the federal level we had the legislation, a
6 bipartisan legislation led by Senator Gillibrand and
7 [inaudible] Marco Rubio, do you think that the City
8 of New York, you know, should work with the
9 congressional delegation and Senator Schumer to
10 support that legislation that will mandate for all
11 truck company in the United States to come with the
12 sensors. They are same trucks, similar company.
13 They, they put the trucks on the streets in Europe,
14 but the law in Europe mandate that they have to come
15 with the sensors. Here the same company can be
16 selling the same trucks in the United States but they
17 are not mandated. So do you feel that they, that we
18 as a city should push big time on the bipartisan law?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: No,
21 absolutely, I mean, we, we are certainly as a
22 country, ah, far behind the Europeans in terms of
23 both truck and vehicle safety. They, they have been
24 much more aggressive in regulating their automotive
25 industry, um, than we have, and, and we are also part

of a coalition of localities that is talking, I mentioned in my testimony, my written testimony, to NHTSA, the National Highway and Traffic Safety Administration, NHTSA has traditionally focused on car design in terms of making the, the car safer for the occupants within the car, and a lot of tremendous advances, seat belts and air bags and a lot of things that have made vehicles safer. We're part of a growing number of cities that are pushing NHTSA to do more to focus on making those cars safe for the vulnerable street users, for, for pedestrians and cyclists in particular, and there are a bunch of ways they can do that again. I mentioned that truck for that terrible fatality up in 116th Street. You shouldn't have a truck where you can't see children, short people, things that are below five feet. There are ways you can improve the visibility on those types of vehicles, a bunch of design things you can do, also in terms of center and gravity and, and braking capacity. So we very much want to be part of all efforts, ah, to work with our leadership down in Washington and up in Albany to continue to see what we can do on driver behavior, driver training, and vehicle design.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you think that the city should get behind supporting the bill, ah, bipartisan?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, I haven't, it sounds like a [inaudible] but I haven't seen it personally, but it, it certainly sounds like the kind of thing we would support.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We'll take a look at it.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, and what the, what the law would say we do it that all trucks in the street, they will have sensor, so that the drivers will be able to see the images of pedestrians and cyclists if they are nearby, especially intersection. So I have other question, but I know my colleagues have, many of them they have a question to ask. Now let's start it with Cochair and Council Member Gibson.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, Chair, and good afternoon, Commissioner. Thank you for being here. Thank you for your very detailed testimony as well that outlines a lot of the work we're doing around safety overall and the city, our

ongoing work with Vision Zero, and you mentioned in your testimony, and I certainly want to highlight it, because I represent Bronx County, um, major thoroughfares like the Grand Concourse and Boston Road and Third Avenue. Ah, we've been working very closely with the Bronx office, led by Navardo Lopez, as well as the local community boards, ah, with a number of citywide efforts like Vision Zero, like the expansion of City Bike, um, but I guess what I want to focus on, and you mentioned it, where there's always room to improve and make sure that we expedite the process. The frustration that many of us feel and my colleagues will allude to it as well, um, is at a local community level. Um, as I mentioned, we always want to be very preventative, um, but when get, we the council members get requests and inquiries about speed reducers, about flashing yellow school signs and school crossings, and markings on the pavement, um, we have to go through the process of it being analyzed, looking at data, ah, of looking at, you know, just NYPD data if there have been crashes. And it's frustrating because sometimes it's anywhere from six to eight weeks before we can hear a response from the Department of Transportation, and

on many of our requests they are approved, but there are instances where based on the data that DOT engineers are looking at the requests are denied.

And so what I want to understand, certainly for the outer boroughs, where a borough like the Bronx we are filled with hills, we have a lot of narrow streets that are two-way streets, so you know that will mean double-parked vehicles, but you still have lots of pedestrians and children that are traveling. So is there a way that we can work, um, with DOT to expedite a lot of these requests? We don't want to say to our constituents I'm sorry, not enough injuries, or not enough people have been hit before we can get a speed reducer in this area. Um, the other part of this conversation is the interagency coordination that DOT has with Department of Ed, School Construction Authority, and there are things that we need to make sure we have in place. As one example, during the summertime we know about three K sites that are opening in the fall. We know about new schools that are opening both district and charter schools and private schools. So why can we not work together before the schools open to make sure that we have the markings, ah, the speed reducer

1 if needed, and certainly, um, Brad Lander and I and
2 many others have been talking about it. We have to
3 work with NYPD to get more school crossing guards.
4 School crossing guards, we have too many vacancies
5 and this is a part of the conversation that we need
6 to make sure is at the table. So can you help us
7 understand what we can do better as an agency to
8 expedite a lot of the requests that we get about
9 safety improvements in our districts?
10

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: So, look, I
12 think the, the challenge my agency is facing, and
13 I've testified about it to this council before, is we
14 have seen in all areas speed humps, signal requests,
15 sort of all our major safety work that, and look, in,
16 in some ways we're glad in the Vision Zero era that
17 has raised a lot of awareness and, and brought a lot
18 of good insights and requests to us. But it's also
19 meant certainly it's, it's, it's now a, you know, it
20 can oftentimes be a challenge for my agency to keep
21 up with the volume of incoming we get. Unlike most
22 other cities that I know, any citizen can request a
23 signal or a stop sign or a speed hump and the agency
24 will do that work. So that means we're getting
25 thousands and thousands of requests every year. We

1 certainly always try and work with council members
2 and community boards, you know, key leaders in the
3 community, when we hear of priority sites. But it's
4 just we have a tremendous amount of incoming now. If
5 there are very key places that any of you, you know,
6 want to make sure that we're getting to as quickly as
7 possible, I know you work with our borough
8 commissioners on that, and, you know, we're happy to
9 continue that. But we are getting, you know, from
10 all five boroughs from every neighborhood a
11 tremendous volume of requests now, and it, you know,
12 definitely is now taking a little time for my agency
13 to keep on top of it all.

15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, I understand.

16 And I'm glad that you provided, ah, the charts and
17 the graphs that really show the improvement projects
18 by neighborhood poverty and, you know, and I say that
19 representing a neighborhood, ah, and a district of
20 high poverty where many of constituents don't feel
21 that their issues are being addressed, um, simply
22 because, and, you know, it's no fault of DOT, but,
23 you know, let's be honest, there are certain areas of
24 the city that get a little bit more attention and the
25 media also covers it as well, and many of my

1 constituents are working full time. They can't
2 necessarily come down here for rallies and
3 demonstrations and be a part of advocacy groups, and
4 it doesn't mean that they don't care. It doesn't
5 mean that it's not a priority, it just means that
6 they just simply may not have the time to invest,
7 which is a lot of time. And I always say any, any of
8 us in this city can easily become a victim. There
9 is, there is no, you know, barrier here where you
10 live in a certain area or neighborhood and you can
11 easily become that next victim. And so I think a lot
12 of the approach that we all take as advocates and
13 working in this administration is that it can be us
14 and we take it very personal. I take it very
15 personal. I worry about, you know, my family walking
16 the streets, my mom taking my niece to school. I
17 worry about them all the time and I pray that God
18 forbid anything happens someone will help them so
19 that they're OK. And we all want that. And so I
20 don't want anyone to be at this hearing and watch
21 this hearing and think that communities that face
22 higher poverty are not prioritizing safety in this
23 city. They may not be at that press conference but
24 they care and they want their neighborhoods to have
25

all the safety measures just as other neighborhoods have as well. So I'm grateful for this graph because when I get inquiries from my district I can say that there has been a lot of priority given to places like the Bronx and other parts of the city. So I want to thank you for sharing that.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thanks, and if, if I may respond, and just again, to say in the testimony, Chairwoman Gibson, I mean, we are, look, last year was a tough year in Brooklyn, but in the Bronx it was the safest year on our roadways that we ever saw. Um, it was 28 fatalities, still way more than we want, but, but, you know, we're actually seeing dramatic improvements in, in safety in the Bronx and we're pleased with that. And I, I do want to very much talk about the point you make, about making sure that we're reaching out and connecting with communities of color and, and low-income communities and, and it's certainly true we, we sometimes joke about the fact that when we do press conferences if we, if we do them here in Manhattan we're likely to get a lot of reports. As we move further out into the city it may be harder to get the kind of media attention we want. But, you know, you

1 mentioned Navardo Lopez, my, my Bronx borough
2 commissioner. I mean, I think our borough
3 commissioners do everything they can to be on the
4 ground, to work with your offices. We've created the
5 DOT Street Ambassador Program, which I know a lot of
6 you are familiar with, a group of people, they speak
7 multiple languages, and when we're talking about
8 doing our projects, it's not only about community
9 boards, because we recognize often working people are
10 not going to be able to give up a night to come to a
11 community board. But we send our street ambassadors
12 all over the city to talk to people as they're on the
13 street, to talk to them on the bus, to catch them
14 where they are in their languages to make sure we're
15 getting their input. Listen, this is an area where
16 we know we can always do better and, you know, we
17 welcome from all of you, you know, any sort of
18 partnership and guidance. Call on us if there are
19 places we need to be, you know, and people we need to
20 be connecting with, obviously we always want to be
21 doing more on that score, but I'm proud of my team.
22 I think they've, they've, they've done a good job and
23 in the Bronx we at least were very heartened that we
24 had a, a year where we saw fatalities [inaudible].
25

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right, OK. I have a question about the pedestrian ramp program. Ah, we've been installing pedestrian ramps at street corners, ah, to become compliant with the Americans with Disabilities Act and there was also a recent, a court settlement as well, um, and DOT agreed and committed to installing at a minimum 800 corners where ramps are missing and upgrade over 12,000 ramps in all five boroughs. Can you give us an update on the states of the pedestrian ramp program and are we on pace to install the minimum 800 corners where ramps are missing and upgrade the 12,000 ramps?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah, I'm, I'm, I'm happy to say that we are doing, ah, we, we are on pace since, since fiscal year 18 we've 954 corners and we've upgraded 14,263, ah, and we're projecting for fiscal year 21 that we'll upgrade 10,303 corners. And just to step a back on, on the settlement, just to contextualize it, this is the largest pedestrian ramp settlement and program in the country in the country right now. I think no other city is looking to be, you know, make the kinds of investments that we are going to be making. It is, it is no small undertaking to make fully ADA

1 compliant what we estimate to be well over 300,000
2 corners in the city, and as a lot of you know on any
3 given day a lot of our streets and sidewalks, there's
4 things going on, they're being cut into by utilities
5 or private building owners. Trucks are turning over
6 them, so to, to commit to fully upgrading and
7 installing pedestrian ramps in every corner of the
8 city is a big undertaking and we're grateful for the
9 resources, ah, that the council has shared with us,
10 and, and we're on target. This is something we're
11 committed to doing. We're hiring up a lot of in-
12 house crews, and also working with DDC, 'cause some
13 of this work will be done by private contractors.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. Would you be
16 able to provide the council with a breakdown by
17 borough of all of the work that's being done?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I, I, I
19 have it here, um, we can, if you want we can provide
20 it to the, to the council.

21 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. And also
22 we, um, understand in terms of the bollards
23 installation, the city announced it would spend about
24 50 million dollars to secure high-risk public spaces
25 from attacks by, ah, vehicles, including the

1 installation of about 1500 metal bollards. Um, last
2 April DOT reported that you anticipated all the
3 bollards would be installed by the fall of 2019. Can
4 you give us an update on that? Has that been
5 completed? And if so, ah, what remains outstanding?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I, I
8 think, um, I'm not sure where it was reported that we
9 said all 1500 would be done by the fall of 2019. I
10 think we had committed that we would get the work
11 done in 2019 in Times Square, which was a, a pretty,
12 you know, one just thing that, that I think many
13 council members are aware of, bollard installation in
14 New York City can often be pretty complicated because
15 you want to put bollards so that they can stop a
16 truck, which means that you want to sink them pretty
17 deep into the ground so that they're very stable.
18 And one of the challenges, the areas we want to
19 install them, like Times Square, ah, are often places
20 where there is a lot of infrastructure under the
21 ground, water, sewer, utilities, subways, so these
22 projects, you know, for better or for worse
23 unfortunately turn out to be somewhat complicated and
24 expensive. I have in my notes here I think we've
25 gotten about half of the 1500 done, and I think we'll

look to get the rest done I think, um, in the coming year.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, and that also include areas like, as an example, in the Bronx, in and around the civic area, 161st Street by Yankee Stadium. We also have bollards over there as well. So in addition to the prevention of vehicles that may jump the sidewalk, it's also in high-traffic areas as well, correct?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Right, and, and just to be clear, the way we, the city determines where to install bollards, that is work that is done with the NYPD Counterterrorism Unit, which obviously has the most, you know, sort of up-to-date and detailed information about where they're seeing potential threats around the city and, you know, where it makes the most sense to install that type of security infrastructure.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK. I have a question about the interagency coordination as it relates to a lot of the capital projects. You mentioned DDC. I also want to, ah, recognize there's a lot of work being done by New York State DOT, um, and I cite the Alexander Hamilton Bridge, there's a

200 million dollar project, ah, of the Major Deegan Expressway. We're adding a new entryway to alleviate traffic going into Jersey through the GW Bridge. There's a lot that's happening. Um, but on the ground, the residents don't necessarily understand all of the agencies that are involved. They usually call us and then we call you. So I want to understand how you work with all of the outside agencies, particularly utility companies, ah, Con Edison and others, when there's a lot of infrastructure work being done. We see signs, sometimes the signs are not put up in an appropriate amount of time. There's just a lot happening and DOT issues all of these permits to do nighttime work, weekend work. So what does that look like on the ground as it relates to the council members and/or community boards being involved as well as notified?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So a lot of questions imbedded in there. Let me, I'll start with the state DOT piece of it and then, and then...

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ... and try to get to the other questions. Um, and it is certainly true not only is the city doing a lot of building,

the private sector doing a lot of building, utilities doing a lot of work on our city streets. New York State DOT, as you point out, ah, Council Member Gibson, is doing a lot of big projects around the city, too. We definitely meet very regardless with our state DOT counterparts. Um, we were actually, a group of us were just up in Albany a couple weeks ago, meeting with my counterpart, ah, Commissioner Dominguez and her team. Our bridge, ah, all the sort of, all the different agency, bridge experts actually have a regular coordination meeting, and then of course we are certainly talking to all, our sister agencies and the utilities in our permitting process. I will admit, though, it is a lot to manage and a lot of communication is needed. Um, as you know, we also talk regularly to community boards and try and keep them updated on projects, as well as council offices. If there are places where you think better communication needs to happen, better coordination, please come and let us know. You know, as you correctly point out, it's a balancing act with our permitting process. We want to try and balance both not, for example, giving up too many lanes of traffic or making it too, you know, too much of an impact on

our roadways during busy times during the day, but not impacting communities too much at night with construction work. So we often work very closely with your offices and community boards to find that sweet spot.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, great. And my final question, as I turn it back over to our chair and other colleagues that have questions. In my opening I talked about the BQE and the cantilever project, um, the release by the outside, ah, engineering firm, the announcements that have been made by the mayor, a lot of meetings. Um, there's been a shifting of about 747.9 million dollars in capital into the outer years for the project. So I wanted to ask specifically is the current commitment of 806.2 million for the BQE work between FY20 and 24 sufficient to make repairs now to the cantilever and what do you envision, um, we should be doing to address this moving forward? I know it's a long, long term project, but I do know there are short-term fixes and goals that we should have now for this project that will have a real impact on not just Brooklyn and Queens, but really the entire City of New York.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So you're, you're correct and, and I'm sure you aware, we actually had a hearing on this a couple weeks ago where the, the panel that the, the council, ah, put together, um, you know, representing people from Arep, the engineering firm, talked about their proposals. We had Carlos Acera, who chaired the mayor's, ah, experts panel talk about their findings and, and then we, DOT, talked about what we're doing. Just, I think, to reassure you on the budget score, the, the capital plan as envisioned will certainly give us in, in the next few years the resources we need to do the kind of shorter-term and, and potentially 10-year fixes in different spots of the BQE. I, I think what, what you saw in the budget was a recognition that the, you know, a major capital project in the multi-billion dollar area that we have not yet come together politically on what the best approach is gonna be. The, the city has committed again in the short term to rigorous monitoring of the structure and short-term repairs, putting a design and then a procurement together to hit key parts where we see serious deterioration and giving them a fix that we think will last about 10 years. We are

going to be up in Albany this session talking about potentially automated enforcement of truck weights to help reduce the number of overweight trucks on the structure and therefore help reduce, you know, slow the deterioration. But I think one thing that also came out of the hearing and, and I know that Arep, the, the panel that the council put together and our own expert panel talked about perhaps a new governance model that would also involve state partners, because I think the consensus seems to be that the city does not on itself have the authorities and the jurisdiction to put together the kind of plan that will be satisfactory, not only to the immediate impacted community, but to other communities along the corridor. As, as you point out, this roadway has an impact really in a lot of ways on all five boroughs of the city.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Thank you, Commissioner. I'll turn it back over to our chair. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner, with the, before I start calling the other colleague and, um, on the question, on the, on the [inaudible], first of all on the

1 pedestrian bollards, eh, I hope again that, you know,
2 if you're thinking share with us on assessment, on
3 what is the city right now, on how many pedestrian
4 bollards are being installed, eh, you know, more
5 details, eh, that, eh, I heard what, you know, as you
6 explained right now, where are we. But I think that
7 that's important. As you know, that plan come out as
8 a, I can say as a compromise for a bill that we have,
9 that we have more than 35 council members that
10 [inaudible] the bill will call for the City of New
11 York to do assessment and stop pedestrian bollards in
12 front of cultural, religion, and, and intersection
13 with high volumes of, of pedestrians, so definitely
14 the only tools that we have right now to stop a
15 vehicle to be used as weapon of mass destruction is,
16 is the bollard. And definitely when you go to 42nd
17 and Sixth Avenue and you get like more than 50
18 bollards in front of Bank of America, you know, it is
19 as important in the other side of the sidewalk at
20 42nd through Sixth Avenue for pedestrians as it is in
21 the sidewalk close to Bank of America. The only
22 difference is that they have some value in that area.
23 So I do feel that the theaters ah, along 42nd Street
24 where, you know, these heavily used for not only New
25

1
2 Yorkers but a lot of visitors, those are area that
3 definitely I would like to personally, ah, you know,
4 being engaged in this issue to see more action
5 installing the bollards there. How are we, if you
6 want to share now, where we, we come with a plan of
7 installing the bollards in across the theaters and
8 42nd Street?

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, again,
10 I think we've installed, we've installed about half
11 of that first set of the 1500 bollards, you know, we
12 are continue to talk to NYPD and City Hall about what
13 the, the future sites might be, and, you know, again,
14 I think I would just emphasize, you know, installing
15 bollards is a costly process, 'cause you have to go
16 deep underground and, you know, I think it'll just be
17 something the administration and NYPD
18 Counterterrorism and the council will continue
19 talking about. You know, how many places around the
20 city do we want to sort of put the time and resources
21 into installing bollards. I think that's going to be
22 an ongoing dialogue.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well, I, I just
24 think that we need, we need to get more information,
25 because, again, we did not move, continuing pushing

on the bill, that we had more than 35 council member because we thought it was important to move and doing through conversation with City Hall and you guys. So I feel that there's no value of money that, you know, can replace the value of life and as we know, like, you know, especially now with are all focusing, as we should be, with the coronavirus, but, you know, being a targets of terrorist attack we always continue, you know, three months ago it was attacked throughout all over the world against, you know, eh, eh, institution in the Jewish community, Muslim community, so today we have those theater, let's say, what are we waiting, even with all those challenges? We already know. It's 'cause the counterterrorism, the NYPD, they need to get involved. We have to, we had challenges on the ground. Everything is true. But we did agree to have a aggressive plan on installing bollards which is the only tools that we have right now to stop a vehicle. So we have all those theaters at 42nd Street, like from bus terminal at 42nd and Ninth Avenue, whatever, to Seventh Avenue. Why are we waiting to install pedestrian bollards in those, to protect those theaters?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, again, Time, 42nd Street is done. We're continuing, I think, to work through the list. Again, that is prioritizing...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You mean 42nd and Times Square?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Not, not a....

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, there's theaters on a number of, of midtown streets. Not just there's 42nd, 44th, I mean, a bunch of those streets have theaters. And, again, just, I will have to definite to NYPD Counterterrorism on this. They sort of have the list that they're prioritizing where they see there are the greatest potential threats.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Eh, so the only thing, yes on recommendation bus shelters, you know, eh, I, as we passed the bill in the past, I think, I am still waiting for City Bike to present the, the number that some point we were having some conversation and working with them. But now with the Lyft also they also, they should know that City Bike, that we passed the bill at the council where it mandate, in this case Lyft, as the new owner of City

1 Bike to give a financial report to the council. So
2 we [inaudible] again. They had not presented that
3 financial report. I'd also hoped that the JC, what
4 is the former name?
5

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: JC Decoe.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: JC Decobe. I
8 know that I posed a bill that also is a language, we
9 have not moved it yet, to also ask and JC Decobe also
10 to give a financial report to the council on, on, how
11 they doing it. So I do, I have some concern about if
12 all the interests are putting a lot of bus shelters,
13 [inaudible] is all around data driven by marketing,
14 advertising, or just thinking about, you know, where
15 we need it the most. And I would like just to
16 encourage as you will have conversation with them,
17 and working with them, the top priorities for bus
18 shelters should bid in Washington Height, should bid
19 in the South Bronx, should be in those poor
20 neighborhood where people have to be waiting 40
21 minutes to wait for the bus. It should not be Fifth
22 Avenue. It should not be Park Avenue. If they're
23 thinking about advertising then you will be driven by
24 locating those bus shelters in those area. If
25 they're thinking about area where we have

1 transportation desert that people just rely on buses,
2 then the top priority should be underserved
3 community.
4

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: So I think,
6 as, as you're probably aware, Mr. Chairman, the city
7 ah, entered, before, before my time, entered into a
8 concession agreement with, um, first Amoosa, then,
9 then JC Decoe, and, and I think in a lot of ways for
10 many years it served the city well. They, ah, have
11 given us pretty high-quality bus shelters and, you
12 know, they were committed to build and maintain in
13 perpetuity a certain number and we hit that number,
14 and there's certainly been desire. Believe me, DOT
15 deeply shares the desire to see more bus shelters
16 throughout other parts of the city. But we've been
17 trying to work that through the concession agreement
18 and I think we're hopefully close to a deal that will
19 work to get bus shelters in other parts of the city.
20 I mean, we have considered the model of would the
21 city want to take this over and do it ourselves and,
22 and I think the question so far has been I'm not sure
23 we would do as good a job as the current
24 concessionaire, but I certainly hear your frustration
25 about the fact that we haven't broken the log jam on

installing that next generation of bus shelters around the city and, and we really want to do that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just feel that I know that my colleague here, Council Member Vanessa Gibson, we will agree, I will say, that where we need bus shelters is in my case at 180 First, where we have four buses, that they go from 180 First and St. Nicholas Avenue. There's no one bus shelters there. We need bus shelters at 17 Engine Run. We need bus shelters in, in underserved community where people waiting, but we don't have the MTA personal as they haven't ordered more middle class and upper class community sending, calling for buses, to have more buses. Where people [inaudible] heard from the conductor that the bus last stop will be this intersection, and people have to be waiting there for now. So I'm happy to continue working with you, but knowing that they are all about and, you know, I believe in the, in the open market society. I believe they provide good services. It's not the best during the snowstorm. They still come back with the same excuses, that they clean the snow for, you know, at one point a few hours after we had to be calling you, Sanitation, for to send a team and clean

those area. But when it come to a specifically related to the bus shelters I would like to see how we can engage in that conversation and look at underserved community as the first area where we should be starting the new phases of bringing bus shelters.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I would be happy to follow up with you on that, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We could certainly use your help on it, I think.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Council Member Koo, followed by Council Member Cohen and Diaz. And now we putting the clock on three minutes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair Rodriguez. And thank you, Commissioner and DOT, so always one of my favorite agencies, and you have good staff, and the Queens staff are doing a good job. So, ah, I want to talk about something local. It's [inaudible] my district, 39th Avenue, is in serious need for repaving. DOT has patched up the streets to the point where there is not longer is effective. A couple years ago DOT told me that due to

1 construction, ah, a block away, we will not pave,
2 repave the street. Ah, however, if we are constantly
3 waiting a period of no construction in Flushing, my
4 streets will never be repaved, you know. So what is
5 the DOT's process for assessing street conditions and
6 when does it go from patching up a pothole to
7 requiring repaving of the entire street? Ah, I have
8 some photos, but it's hard to show, it's right in
9 front of the Sheraton Hotel, on 39 Avenue, of the
10 streets that are really broken up and it looks very
11 terrible, especially in front of a Sheraton Hotel.
12 It makes Flushing look like we are in a third world
13 or fourth world country, you know, huh.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: So, obviously,
16 Council Member, we'll, we'll take a look at that
17 particular street. I, I suspect what may be
18 happening here, and this is a challenge we, we face
19 around the streets. We do, we do annual inspections
20 of all the streets for conditions, and obviously we
21 get a lot of good intel from 311 complaints and, and
22 from all of your offices and the community boards.
23 One challenge we face is when a street is scheduled
24 for a capital project, and, and I don't know if
25 that's the case here. We typically don't do a

1 resurfacing because we're resurfacing to be capitally
2 eligible in our budget system. The work needs to
3 last for five years. What does happen sometimes and
4 it can be a huge source of frustration, I get this,
5 is, you know, potentially we thought a project was
6 gonna start in a given year and then for whatever
7 reason, if it's a DDC project it may be delayed year
8 after year. We've, we've tried to particularly now
9 look at those on case-by-case basis and make a
10 judgment. That, that may be the case here and we'll
11 certainly look at that. But I do know sometimes that
12 can be just a bit of a Catch-22 that streets
13 sometimes get stuck in as we're waiting for a large
14 capital project to happen. We'll take a look into
15 that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So I hope you'll
18 look into it. My, my second thing is for the fiscal,
19 ah, 2020 budget, ah, using [inaudible] savings of
20 \$810,000 due to under-spending in the roadway
21 markings, ah, budget. Ah, I have a bill, Intro 106,
22 which will require repainting pavement markings
23 within a certain frame after a street repaving. This
24 was because streets were [inaudible], need repaving
25 in my district, but the lines didn't come until

several months later. There were also instances where pavement markings were faded or disappeared, which causes [inaudible], ah, to drive outside the lanes. So there is a clear need for more attention paid to roadway markings throughout New York City. So how did DOT determine this \$810,000 saving while they allow things that need to be done.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: So I'm gonna, I'll talk about that, sort of that little tag basically and then Elizabeth Franklin can talk about the program writ large. Because writ large we are, we are very much growing our markings program. But it also true, and I've, I've testified in front of this body on several occasions about some of the challenges we face and I've talked to my sister cities. We all face the same challenges. There are not that many firms out there that are qualified and ready to do high-quality markings work I New York City. It tends to be a very concentrated industry, ah, that often during a season can run out of capacity. We've had, you may have seen in the news, unfortunately, ah, a markings company that we were very excited to, to work with, an M/WBE firm out of Boston that was going to be doing a lot of our work,

1 and there was a tragedy there. The owner of the
2 company had a party that employees came to. The, the
3 upshot of that party that one of the employees killed
4 someone on a roadway, there was a drug overdose, so
5 that, that unfortunately was a firm that we had to
6 take out of our rotation. So we have certainly faced
7 contracting challenges on that front. I'm happy to
8 say as, as part of our Green Wave Plan, and I'll let
9 Elizabeth talk about it, we're now going to move more
10 of that striping work in house...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Oh, good, good.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ... which I
14 think will mean that it will be higher quality and
15 more consistency.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So you are
17 considering doing the work in house?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We'll, we'll
19 still always need outside contractors, but I think,
20 you know, one thing we've concluded is more in-house
21 work will be better for us, and Elizabeth can give
22 some of those number. Maybe she can give some, maybe
23 she'll dig them up.

24 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER FRANKLIN: I, I, I
25 don't have the exact...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: All right,
we'll, we'll dig up those numbers for you.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER FRANKLIN: But it
was part of, part of what we were funded for with the
Green Wave last November was, um, bringing in some
in-house crews so that we can take some, give some
relief to our contractors. Um, we're looking, we're
looking to hire those people up now, looking for
space to put them.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: OK, thank you. I
have no questions, but I'll forward to you so you can
send to the agency so they can get back to us, yeah,
OK.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
Cohen, followed by Council Member Diaz.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Ah, thank you,
Chair. Ah, how are you, Commissioner? Good to see
you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Good, thank
you.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Ah, could you just
talk a little bit about the, the capital budget and
the [inaudible] 10.8 billion dollars by borough? How
that breaks out by borough?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well, that's a good, I might have to have Elizabeth compile that and come back to you on it.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I, I wanted just, you know, to, to continue on sort of the provincial, ah, I know that you have visited Mosholu Parkway...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: ...several times and I do appreciate that. But I gotta tell you that I was a little irked when I was in the preliminary briefing and I saw 100 million dollars for Fourth Avenue and I'm trying to get a, you know, a picture of Mosholu Parkway. I found that very, very frustrating. Ah, the challenges in getting east-west in the Bronx are really significant. Ah, Mosholu Parkway is, is a major corridor and there are places where it's eight lanes and there are places where it's two lanes, and it is, it's just a mess. And, ah, you know, while it is, it's pretty, I have, you know, but it doesn't function and I think it's dangerous. I think that it is very, very fast. It's a high-density portion of my district and I appreciate, you know, that it was the safest year in terms of death in the Bronx. I'm, I'm wondering if,

ah, does the data show that also for injuries, or is it?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Ah, I'll, I'll double check the, the injury data. And, and obviously, Council Member, you and I have, have been on Mosholu and, and look, we certainly don't disagree. That is a street that, that could, you know, it was designed in another time and is, is not as pedestrian and cycle and community friendly as it needs to be. I think, as I said at the time, the challenge we face and obviously this, this will be part of our ongoing negotiations with the council. There are a lot of corridors in New York City that are ripe for reconstruction. Reconstructing a corridor, as you all know, in this city it tends to be a massive undertaking, often hundreds and hundreds of millions of dollars and we have, you know, so far in our Great Streets program, it's true, we focused on those corridors, Atlantic Avenue, Fourth Ave, um, Queens Boulevard, ah, and the Grand Concourse on places where we have over the years seen tremendous numbers of fatalities. But, but I, I take your point. That is not to say there aren't other worthy candidates, um, to look at those kinds of

1
2 reconstructions and obviously that's a, to some
3 design, a larger dialogue that would involve our
4 budget office, but we are keenly aware of your
5 interest there.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: OK. I would
7 appreciate the [inaudible], I don't know if, if you
8 have that today but that would be great. And I'll
9 just, there are a few issues that I'm sure that
10 you're aware of, but, the, the curb to curb after the
11 utility work, um, I, I don't know if utilities
12 literally sit around waiting until like, oh, it's 18
13 months, I can tear up the street without having to do
14 curb to curb. Ah, but there seems to a lack of
15 coordination in terms of where there can be
16 substantial work and then we get a repair that is.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Let, let us
18 sit down and talk to you about that, 'cause that,
19 that is an issue we have brought to the utilities and
20 I will say, at least I will give them some credit,
21 National Grid, which I think had been not doing a
22 good job on this front. When we brought it to their
23 attention and teams really sit down and, and talked
24 about, they've started to be more careful and
25 thoughtful about that work. I'm sure there is more

we can do and if there are hot spots let us come take a look.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Ah, that would be great. And, again, I, I am interested in the capital [inaudible]. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Diaz, followed by Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, thank you Mr. Chairman. Ah, when we talk about changing stop sign and traffic light it is important for [inaudible] for anyone to know that stop sign and traffic lights must be approved using a federal warning system. You cannot do otherwise because the federal highway system require that the warning system measures traffic density and speed. The system cannot be changed or we lose all federal funds. Is that right?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, I, that's a common belief and I just, I think, again, the federal warrant system is, is pretty obscure, but I'll, I'll do my best to explain it. The, the tests that are laid out by the federal government are engineering tests and I would say my traffic engineers and most traffic engineers around the

1 country adhere to them. We adhere to them 'cause we,
2 we think they make sense. The balance the immediate
3 need for safety designs at intersections, with, as I
4 said earlier, a system in which you get good
5 compliance. Cities can deviate from them if they
6 choose to, but generally most cities deviate from
7 them very little because they, they represent the
8 best engineer consensus and they also represent, you
9 know, a legal defense, and I think fairly for a lot
10 of cities, too, they represent a consistent way of
11 looking at things so a DOT is not doing favors or
12 not, you know, treating communities differently, and
13 so that's the approach we've taken.

14
15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: OK. I'm going to
16 ask you two questions, but before I ask the question
17 I would like to tell you that the Bronx commissioner,
18 Mr. Navardo Lopez, in my district is doing a
19 fantastic job. I don't [inaudible] but I want you
20 to...

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm, I'm so
22 glad to hear that, thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: ...I want to let
24 you know that, that he has been, he has been
25 wonderful. Now talking about budget. This is a

1 budget hearing and DOT actually makes money from
2 parking meters. Can you tell me how much money a
3 week do you make and are you allowed to keep it? And
4 if not, where does the money go?

5
6 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I will, I'll
7 let, I'll let Elizabeth grab the budget numbers. We
8 do not, it's often a perception that DOT we keep
9 parking revenue or Speed Camera revenue. We, we keep
10 none of that revenue. New York City has had a, a
11 pretty, you know, strong practice of taking all
12 revenue sources and putting them in the general
13 funds, and I actually think, it, it's proved a good
14 practice in the case of our agency 'cause I think it,
15 hopefully is reassuring that we're not trying to
16 unfairly go after people with parking tickets or, or
17 Speed Camera tickets. My agency does not keep that
18 revenue. It goes into the city general fund, where
19 it's used for whatever the...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: And, and you don't
21 know how much money you make in parking a week?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: All right,
23 yeah, parking, yes, I've got parking revenue, ah,
24 meters for last year was 254 million.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: 254 million?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Why don't you grab the, grab the camera revenue, too?

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Wow, that's a lot of money. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Cameras, and just, um...

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: That's a lot of money.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It is a lot of money, although remember the New York City budget that I think you all currently are deliberating on is 95 billion dollars, so, relatively speaking.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, miss. And, and, let us continue. Council Member Miller, followed by Council Member Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Good now, good afternoon, ah Commissioner, you and your team. So in the interest of time I want to ask question and hopefully we can get some of these answered. And I don't want to be, sound like I'm being redundant, but I don't want to do new things. Ah, so, ah, when you were here January 29, ah, safety, vehicle safety oversight in Transportation Committee, ah, we asked the question,

ah, that spoke to truck traffic in the greater Jamaica area, specifically around Liberty Avenue, waste transfer station, JFK, and so forth, and the response was that there was a, a study that was going to, a comprehensive plan that would be put out shortly. Um, do you have that study as of yet, and I did speak to our local folks there and we're looking to work with them on that.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Not yet, Council Member. I very much hope in the coming weeks and obviously, ah, I think with, with coronavirus there's been a lot going on at, at City Hall. But we hope it, very soon that we'll, we'll get that study.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: OK, so, and then, I just want to rerun the speed racer. Speed Cameras, have we kind of, and, and I absolutely supported it, I thought it was imperative for our major throughways to be able to kind of control and slow down traffic. But we are literally seeing them residential streets, um, in my district and, and I don't understand why. The community doesn't understand why, and you came to the town hall hearing and they think that it is, it is, ah, motivated by reasons of, of race or something of that nature there. And then, ah, certainly I see

1 in her that we continue our subsidies of the ferries,
2 um, and so if can talk about that. And then finally,
3 um, you talk about in your testimony, ah, safety, ah,
4 particularly the protected bike lanes and, and, and
5 just Vision Zero safety throughout the city there,
6 but you also very specifically mentioned underserved
7 communities that, that we're going in. The last time
8 you were here we talked about very specifically the
9 Fountain Avenue, ah, ah, bike lane there and, and my
10 question was whether or not that there was community
11 input, and, and because I was engaged with folks in
12 the community, community board, tenant associations,
13 whatever, and they remain up in arms of, of, of that
14 particular section of, of that, ah, bike lane there,
15 and so as we move forward I would hope that we have
16 better community engagement, um, as we move forward
17 with these projects 'cause I, I do believe that
18 communities, whether they're communities of color,
19 underserved communities, whatever, um, know what's in
20 the best interest of their community and have good
21 ideas about how do we, how to remain safe in, in
22 those communities, and with that being said I kind of
23 leave on, on this note, that I, and you and I have
24 had really a constructive conversation, um, over the
25

1 past five years on diversity and, and, and your
2 particular agency there and what that means in terms
3 of reflecting the needs and the values of the
4 communities, as well as what it means to a budget of
5 this size when it comes to M/WBEs. Visually, I don't
6 see it. And I'm sure you're, you're doing better and
7 you, you can articulate that but, um, just by
8 appearance it appears that we have, um, folks going
9 into communities from outside the community making
10 decisions, um, on what's best for those communities,
11 and, and I'm sure you will tell me that that is not
12 the case and I'm looking forward to hearing it.
13 Thank you.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: All right,
16 well, I'll, I hope I will remember all the things
17 you've just asked me. You may have to refresh my
18 memory. I'll, I'll start with Fountain Avenue. And,
19 and I, I want to just run through some of the
20 outreach we did do, and, and I want to talk a little
21 bit, because, I mean, obviously, as I mentioned in my
22 testimony, we had, um, two children tragically killed
23 in East New York and the first thing that folks said
24 is DOT isn't do enough in our community, and then on
25 the other hand sometimes when we do things in

community of colors people don't like it. They, they, they don't want, they feel like it's, you know, not the projects they're looking [inaudible]...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: With all due respect, I was...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, so we're always...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...there and, and, and a big part of that, and, and those weren't cyclists, right.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, let me...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Those two children weren't cyclists.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, but I, I'm...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And there's certainly something that we could do, very specific, and that's what I meant when I said when you talk to folk about how do you keep people safe and at the same time not disrupt commerce, economy, and everything else in the community is a conversation that is worthy of, of having with community.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, so, let me, I think we are trying to have that conversation, and, I mean, look, if you want to speak about the particularly, since, I mean, even now we're talking about East New York, although I recognize you're the council member from Queens, um, I think, you know, it is well known that my Brooklyn team is, is a very diverse team, my Queens team, too. Um, and just to talk a little bit about what we do and found out. I mean, one challenge we, we have in all our projects, this is well known, I think, to all of you sitting here, um, you know, unfortunately I rarely have a project in which everyone in a neighborhood loves it. Um, you know, these projects can often be very controversial and, you know, this body, you passed, um, I just checked my number here, 39 in favor of the Master Plan. The Master Plan is going to take the work we're doing and increase it exponentially and that is now a mandate we have from the City Council. So, you know, that is going to be a challenge for us all to work through and, and I, you know, I know not all of you voted for the Master Plan, but I, I think when I look at the language of the Master Plan it is calling on DOT to build out 50 miles of protected

bike lanes, um, a year throughout the city. Let me just talk a little bit about, which we did do in Fountain Avenue, and not to say that there isn't room for us...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And just as a matter of point of clarity, born and raised right there, right there...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, no, understood, understood.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...in that project, that housing project right there.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, no, I recognize the...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So we do have a relationship and continue to have a relationship with that community there and I just don't know that it manifests itself in this plan and whether or not people were engage. Um, in fact, from my research, again, ah, ah, community board, tenants association, even the school, um, which is right in front and considering the disruption, ah, when, when the school bus stops or if a delivery is being made, it just wasn't well thought out.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, so let me just, I'll talk for a minute just about the sort of the outreach work we did do, and obviously we're always looking [inaudible]. And, look, Council Member, I know that that's the neighborhood you're originally from. I was just trying to say it as I was speaking about my Brooklyn office recognizing obviously you, you now represent communities in Queens. So just the backdrop on that plan, and we, we try and do this with every plan and we don't, obviously, always reach every person in every neighborhood. It's always an ongoing challenge for us. But there, back in March of 2017 we did talk to the full CD5 community board. We did a public event later that year at the Cypress Hills Library. Um, it was an event actually requested by CB5. We did an event in June, um, at Fourth Avenue at Wharton Street. We did another presentation later that money to the CB5 Transportation Committee. We went back basically a year later to the Transportation Committee. So I, I fully recognize, you, you don't catch everyone at all these events and, you know, we'll always look for ways to do better. But I, I do also have to say I think the Master Plan, and I, I

1 testified about this on this bill. It is going to be
2 a challenge for us to implement, you know, 50 miles
3 of protected bike lanes every single years and make
4 sure we're doing all the outreach that's required.
5 It is certainly going to require, I think, a lot of
6 help from council members and community boards to get
7 there.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [inaudible]
10 either based on need and so we'd love to see that as
11 well and not again just the appearance that folks are
12 going in knowing what's best for a community. Ferry?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I mean,
14 obviously, the, the, the NYC Ferry is, ah, run by
15 EDC. We, we consult with them and, and I think you
16 all have heard the mayor's you know, I think the
17 mayor is a strong defender of it, thinks that it's
18 been a very successful program. I know the question
19 has come up about, you know, how does it stack up to
20 other transportation investments the city is making
21 and the MTA and buses and so forth. And I think, you
22 know, stacked against it, obviously, as, as you can
23 see in my testimony, the city's investing quite a few
24 billions in those other modes, but, um, you know, I
25 recognize that there's certainly, you know, a

spirited discussion about the level of subsidies for the ferry. I think, ah, for, for your colleagues who represent those communities, they're, they tend to be pretty big boosters of it.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, well, transportation equity and where those resources go to a community that's earning \$150,000, ah, subsidizing industries such as Wall Street and the business community and we have transportation deserts that have illegal dollar vans. We don't think that's equitable or the best use of those city dollars. And finally M/WBES.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: OK, am I answering?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You can answer it, yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: OK. Ah, I'm gonna actually have Elizabeth pull up those numbers. Um, I, I think we are continuing to make progress and certainly the, the changes that the city was able to

1
2 get up in Albany are going to, I think, make a big
3 improvement in those numbers, particularly the
4 ability to increase the dollar amount for micro
5 purchases. Elizabeth will find those numbers. Let
6 us, as soon as she grabs them we'll, all right, why
7 don't you take that?

8 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER FRANKLIN: Ah, in
9 fiscal year 19 for micro purchases, under \$20,000, we
10 had a goal of 45% and we achieved over that goal,
11 60%. Um, for small purchases we, between \$20,000 and
12 \$100,000 we also exceeded our goal of 50%, up to 52%,
13 and, um, but unfortunately for our formal contracts
14 we had a goal of 23% and we were only able to commit
15 10%. No, 13%.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. And,
17 and of course like I add to what the council member
18 said, first of all with the WMB like, you know,
19 there's a lot of work that has to be done. You know,
20 like those numbers, also I always say, my belief, I
21 always say that the fight for to address how the
22 public, private sector can do better on providing
23 more opportunity for women and minority. It will
24 make, it will incentivize a lot of people to be
25 [inaudible] movements. I think that there is a lot

1 of question about, you know, how we are getting, how
2 are those opportunity for women and minority
3 translated into, you know, real faces of people who
4 live in the underserved communities, so a lot of,
5 yeah, so, I, I think that a lot had to do also who
6 make decisions for those project and how, you know, I
7 gotta say that in the past there were, there were
8 even a lot of corruption going on. No necessary and
9 particular entity, but it's about how people were
10 able to make, you know, the women and minority
11 cooperation, having a family, having a friend, having
12 whoever, you know, and, and when you look to the
13 community and you do it [inaudible] minority, women
14 and minority and each council member you can count
15 who are those people who live in our communities. So
16 I think that, you know, there's a lot of red tape
17 that we still has to address, who make decision, is
18 it only, is there opportunity how we make those
19 numbers, but it's about how we as a city has to
20 address, because if we justify and I'm not talking
21 about the numbers that we say report, you know, we've
22 been able to get this percentage or contract for the
23 women and minority who are those individuals. Where
24 do they live? Do they live in those underserved
25

community? Because we lacking many of those faces from our communities.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: We would, Mr. Chairman, I think we would certainly take you up on it, as you, you sort of reference it red tape. I mean, I, I have said this before in front of this committee, New York City has, as far as I know, the most complicated and difficult procurement process in the country, and that is particularly hard on small firms. We are a hard city to do business with. The number of rules and hoops that you have to jump through. We have often a complicated process, frankly, in getting the comptroller also to register these contracts and then the whole change order and payment system. So I think there is, you know, there's certainly things all the agencies can do better and I think, you know, under [inaudible] Doris obviously who's leading our efforts here in this city we've, we've tried to do a lot to be better and to now create a mentoring program to help bring these smaller firms along. But I think there's a lot we could do to reform our own procurement process that would make it a lot easier for M/WBEs to get into the city contracting business.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, and I hope that that happen, you know, under our watch, under our time. But being honest with you, the way how I also see that it benefit particular sector, it's not that we had those structure in place, not knowing how to change it, but is, it worked for some people, from some sector. And it doesn't work for the black, for Latino, and for women. Eh, and, and the last thing before calling on my colleague that I want to bring to the table is about the, we do support it and support the transportation master plan. Where we are lacking is also to have more New Yorkers who live in underserved area the opportunity to go to work in a short distance. As you know, City Bike was created thinking about those who live here, from Battery Plaza to 59th Street. Probably they didn't, they were the last one who needed City Bike. They already had the train system, one of the best. But it was thinking about the wealthy New Yorkers, the middle class New Yorkers. So now that under your leadership you'll be able to renegotiate and be able to expand City Bike. You know, getting into the bike should not be, it's not a luxury. It's a right that people should have. And even when you look at the cyclist

1 community in New York City the public and private
2 sector has to do better to connect more diversity, to
3 bring more diversity into that word. And I think
4 that we need to do more educational, we need to do
5 more marketing. People got to see the benefit of
6 getting to the bike. We need to make it more
7 accessible, too, more affordable today. We also need
8 to be more, more good pay job. The 100 million
9 dollars that city provide incentive for people to
10 create good job in the city are not going to the
11 underserved community where sometime you had the
12 opposition, not only for expansion with City Bike but
13 for the BRT and the SBS. So I know I agree with you
14 that there is a lot of work that we have to do. But
15 in order to build the support is not only to say who
16 support more bike lane. It's about how are we
17 communicating, what other investment as we making in
18 those community so that people see the benefit and so
19 should have access to those benefit.

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I certainly
22 agree with you, Mr. Chairman. And, again, in the
23 next few years, I mean, we are excited, as I said in
24 my testimony, we will be building out the City Bike
25 system, we will have 40,000 bikes, we will, we will

1 cover half the city at that point, and obviously we
2 will be reaching into a whole new more diverse set of
3 communities. Not the whole city by any stretch but,
4 you know, all bike share systems usually tend to grow
5 out from the, from the central core and continue to
6 expand outwards. We are, you know, obviously work
7 with Lyft. We're offering, ah, low-income discounts
8 for NYCHA residents, um, \$60 for the year and you can
9 pay that in \$5 a month increments and you can pay in
10 cash, you don't even have to use a credit card. I
11 think we'll continue to look at ways we can explore
12 making sure, ah, that system is accessible to low-
13 income communities. And you're right, Mr. Chairman,
14 part of that is working with local community groups
15 and local neighborhoods. I think the work we did
16 with the Bed-Sty Restoration Corporation in Brooklyn
17 was a partnership we're really proud of that brought
18 a lot of new, ah, lower-income residents into the
19 system. We certainly want to do that now, as we're
20 gonna be, obviously getting to the top of Manhattan
21 and into the Bronx and new communities in Queens and
22 Brooklyn as well.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks. Council
25 Member Holden, Lander, and [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.

Ah, Commissioner, thank you for your testimony and, um, I just have a few questions. And you know I have some frustrations with DOT over the last couple years, and one is, um, I, I see that we're behind in, ah, speed bump, ah, installation from last year, this year. We're, we're almost 40%, ah, down, ah, from this time last year. And I, you know, I've been trying to get speed bumps, ah, installed, especially one street. I started in October of 2017 with a request. The community board approved it in June of 2018 and now two years later they're promising me spring. What's the normal installation process?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Ah, let me, I'll answer both, both questions. And, look, I know you have your frustrations with us and, and I hope you feel like at least that, that our team on the ground is trying to work with you know, I know, um, not always to your satisfaction, but, but we're always there to try and work with you. You know, one challenge we're facing now in the speed bump program is because we have built out so many speed bumps when we resurface roadways we have to rip the speed bumps out and reinstall them. So part of what is slowing

us down now, and look, this is, you know, in general, as, as I sit here with the council and obviously hear the request for more traffic signals, for more speed lights, for more, for more speed humps, for more bollards, for more markings and bike lanes, pedestrian islands, one thing always to bear in mind is we continue to build that infrastructure out we need to have a budget to refresh it and maintain it. And I think certainly with speed humps we're starting to see that challenge now. We've installed so many of them, ah, that when we resurface we have to go back and do those reinstallations. And, look, there is, there is no question, Council Member, we now have a backlog. We are getting so many requests that we are having a hard time keeping up. It sounds like in the case of this one it has taken too long and, and let me, let me take a look. We're, we're trying to do them expeditiously, particularly in areas where we know it's, it's a high priority for a, for a council member or community board. But there's no question, we're getting hundreds of requests now. And...

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, the problem is...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...and also doing extensive resurfacing. So it's becoming a, a big task to, to keep up.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: The problem is we're getting told by the Queens office, in my case, that it'll get done then, you know, a certain, certain period, and it doesn't get done. It gets kicked back another six months, and another six months, and, and then we look like we're not doing our job on, in the council office. So, um, but since, since I requested it, since the community board approved it, ah, again, a lot of cars have been hit and people, ah, jeopardized. But let me just go to other things like that, like markings. You're talking about street markings. Um, you, you make a, I don't know who, um, was contracted out for the Woodhaven Boulevard SBS, but whoever did it made mistakes and it happens. On, in turning lanes, let's say, or in dotted lines. I put in two years ago, I, I told the Queens office. I did a video on it even. And it's still, nobody can go out. I should go out with some black paint and just make over the, the white line, make a turning lane, because several accidents have happened and nobody's doing anything

1 about it, and it's just ignored. Now it's starting
2 to wear away, the whole lines are wearing away. So
3 we're getting to a point of frustration that DOT,
4 even a change, they make a mistake on a turning lane,
5 or they make a mistake on a, ah, on an SBS, it
6 doesn't get corrected. They acknowledge the mistake.
7 No corrections on street markings. Over and over
8 again. And yet people are being jeopardized. I've
9 witnessed so many accidents on the corner of Cooper
10 Avenue and Woodhaven Boulevard because of an SBS
11 marking mistake. DOT won't correct it.

12
13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I can go out.
15 Again, I can go out with some black paint and do it
16 tomorrow.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I'm, I'm
18 looking at the team here. Let me, let me check into
19 that. And, again, I, I think you've heard me be
20 somewhat transparent about the fact that it's no
21 question. We've had, we've had real challenges in my
22 years in this job with markings. It's, it's not
23 intuitive, but one thing I've learned is running a
24 good markings operation for a city this big that's
25 doing so many projects is actually one of the most

challenge elements of what we do. Let, obviously, Council Member, I'll look at the places here...

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: All right, let, let me just say, 'cause my time is up, but let me, just one question I want to get in. I have, and I put in, again, two years ago for a street reconstruction. I know it takes a long time. But I have, and the ones that I've requested, I have no sidewalks, no curbs, no catch basins. Ah, these are streets that never had it. So several streets in my district, you know, if they do get reconstructed they're, um, they, they're streets that have that. So what's the, who's making these priorities that what should be, ah, reconstructed? I have areas that the sidewalk ends and people have to walk in the street. And Queens, I'm not like the, you know, on the edge of, of the world here. I'm in a very busy area with hundreds of thousands of people living there, so when people have to walk in the street, I have a guy that's, that he put a, ah, cyclone fence up and every time it snows, luckily it hasn't snowed this year, but every time it snows the street plows plow the, ah, the snow into his fence and damage his fence because there's no curbs, there's no sidewalks.

1 And this is, and I'm, I'm told now, two years later,
2 ah, I keep, he keeps calling my office and I'm told
3 not in the foreseeable future. Meaning he's never
4 gonna get this, ah, in, in my lifetime possibly. But
5 this is frustrating, when I have several streets,
6 73rd Place is one, which is, people have been killed
7 there because there's no sidewalks, are all one side,
8 and it's a, it's a raceway. And I asked for a
9 traffic study. Nothing happens. So whatever we're
10 asking for in the budget, let's make sure we put, ask
11 for enough to cover street markings, to cover, ah,
12 reconstruction, that at least we have a priority
13 that's not somewhere in the ivory tower that somebody
14 is saying this is not a priority, this is a priority.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: If, if I can,
17 let me, let me distinguish between street
18 reconstructions and, and sort of the other things
19 you've mentioned, resurfacing, markings, and places
20 where perhaps we can do temporary sidewalks, and more
21 temporary. Those are things I think that remember
22 are sort of in the more affordable end of what the
23 city does. Major street reconstructions are projects
24 that can often cost tens and hundreds of millions of
25 dollars, particularly if you need to install sewer

1 infrastructure. Oftentimes what we discover, and I
2 don't know if it's the case with the street you're
3 referencing, in places where we don't have that
4 infrastructure property owners have built into the
5 city right-of-way and in order to build out the
6 street you, you may need to do some taking. So, so
7 those projects can be very complicated. The city,
8 you know, only budgets for a certain number of them
9 every year. Those decisions are made very much at
10 the level of City Hall, OMB, and the council. So,
11 you know, the DOT commissioner does not solely get to
12 pick where the street does, does major street
13 reconstruction work. So, so that is certainly, I
14 think at the highest levels of the budget
15 negotiation, a discussion of priorities. Those
16 projects, again, do tend to be, you get into the
17 hundreds of millions of them and so they're, they're
18 quite costly.

19
20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
22 Lander, followed by Council Member Levine.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Chair,
24 and thanks, Commissioner, to you and your team. I
25 appreciate the attention to the, ah, ah, Dangerous

1 Vehicle Abatement Program and your testimony and all
2 the work you and your team, ah, have done on it and
3 are going to do on it. Um, ah, two questions, um,
4 and one is about that program, so you speak to it in
5 the, in the testimony. Um, in the preliminary budget
6 since we had not yet reached agreement and passed the
7 program it is not in the preliminary budget. Um, we,
8 I assume, cannot do it with like moving some
9 resources around. So I, I guess I want to hear a
10 little bit about the process for identifying it as a
11 new need, making sure it gets in the executive budget
12 with new resources that the mayor assigns and not
13 trying to find it by, you guys are doing all these
14 other very important things you have to keep doing.
15 So, um, what can we look for to make sure it's in the
16 executive budget as a, as a new need that doesn't
17 take from other things?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, I, I
20 appreciate the question and, again, Council Member
21 Lander, thank you for your leadership on that
22 legislation. We will need resources to do that. I
23 know we have a big budget, but as you correctly point
24 out we have a lot of things that people are expecting
25 from us. I think we want to work closely with you

1 and the council. You say there was a bit of a timing
2 mismatch here, but, but certainly we're gonna have
3 staff and obviously be working with whoever is the
4 provider of the education, also obviously working on
5 the adjudicatory side with DOF and OATH and we will
6 need resources to make sure we run the, the, I think
7 the high quality and impactful program that I know
8 you envision.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: OK, now, I'll be
11 working with the chair, my colleague, so that, you
12 know, we can get that into our, ah, response to the
13 preliminary budget, just so we make sure it happens
14 with new resources and, and doesn't try to come
15 internally.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: All right, and
18 then my second question for you is about an area
19 where, um, I think it's the first I've ever had a
20 budget proposal for something that saves money and
21 saves lives, and we already have some good examples
22 on, um, so, ah, Streetsblog and, you know, Gersh
23 Kuntzman, who is, is here, who sometimes is a big
24 praiser of our and your efforts and sometimes, ah, a
25 holder accountable ransom stories in the fall about

1 payouts from city agencies for traffic crashes where
2 city employees hit New Yorkers and we wind up on
3 average paying 85 million dollars a year, ah, over
4 the last five years in traffic crashes. And one
5 really encouraging thing from that story is that the
6 New York City Department of Transportation, ah, has
7 actually over the last five years as part of its
8 Vision Zero really significantly reduced the number
9 of payouts, and that means people whose lives are
10 saved and injuries are avoided and the city saves
11 millions of dollars. But the other top four
12 agencies, FDNY, Sanitation, Parks, and NYPD, you
13 know, have, do, do not, have not had reductions in
14 their crashes and payouts that come anywhere close to
15 what DOT has achieved. So that's a place where we
16 could save millions of dollars, keep people alive,
17 um, and have Vision Zero results. So I just wonder
18 if you could a) tell us a little bit about what DOT
19 has done to achieve that succeed, and then help us
20 think about what we can do to get your sister
21 agencies to follow it.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I appreciate
23 the question and, and you and, and Council Member
24 Dromm contacting us about it. And, look, we are
25

1 proud of the fact that we have seen a real reduction
2 in crashes involving DOT [inaudible] more work to do
3 for sure. We, we are not resting on our laurels. I
4 mean, all the agencies you are referencing have big
5 footprints on the city streets and a lot of people
6 driving. I think because we were one of the main
7 Vision Zero agencies, at least very early in my
8 tenure, we, we made a real focus of saying we need
9 DOT employees to be model drivers, and we have sent a
10 lot of messages to our employees about that. We do a
11 lot of wonderful trainings with them. And, and I
12 want to really praise, ah, our sister agency, DCAS.
13 The installation of telematics in all the city
14 vehicles, I think is starting to be and will continue
15 to be transformational. You get in real time
16 notifications about in a city vehicle when you are
17 speeding, when you are engaging in excessive
18 breaking. I mean, it is tremendous amounts of
19 information. By the way, we go through it and look
20 through our employees to see, you know, which
21 employees need a, a refresher or a stern reminder
22 about if we're seeing speeding violations or unsafe
23 behavior. So it is a tremendous tool for keeping the
24 city fleets accountable. Now, not all agencies are
25

1 yet signed up for the telematics. I don't, I don't
2 think NYPD is, but I think for the other sister
3 agencies that is going to be transformational. I in
4 particular spend a lot of time talking to Sanitation,
5 and I know you are aware there was tragically last
6 year an incident involving a fatality with a
7 sanitation truck, and I talked to Commissioner Garcia
8 about it and, you know, we're brainstorming together
9 always about better training for employees and for
10 Sanitation perhaps what the next generation of trucks
11 that will have better designs, better visibility,
12 some of the things the Chairman was talking about at
13 the outset of the hearing. The particular truck in
14 question, um, that one in Queens, it was not a truck
15 with good visibility and, and probably not the ideal
16 model. So, so, you know, amongst our sister agencies
17 we do constantly talk and continue to brainstorm.
18 Um, you know, I do think, too, something we've done
19 with the TLC and I'll thank Families for Safe Streets
20 for this. As you know, they put together a very
21 powerful video. We show it to our employees, too.
22 To me, it's, it's one of the biggest pieces of
23 culture change is when people see, you know, as I
24 like to say it, people sort of think of speeding
25

typically as kind of a victimless crime, ah, and when they see that the impact it can potentially have in devastating a, a family and a community that, that can be a real eye-opener.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So we're going to be following up with the commissioners of those other agencies as well. I just haven't seen a situation like this where one agency really did, you know, achieve that very steep reduction, um, so we need to figure whether it's the same kind of leadership using the data that you get and then following up with those commissioners and other leaders so we can achieve those reductions as well, and obviously saving lives is most important, but we're [inaudible] budget and a way of saving money when we need to is, is a strong value as well, so, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Council Member Levine, followed by Council Member Levin, and the cochair is here, she will have some question, and from there we will be ready to move and ask question and have the TLC as the next panel.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Hello, Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Hi, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I wanted to ask a follow-up on a point that, ah, the chair raised on bus shelters, particularly low-income neighborhoods or outlying parts of the city, northern Manhattan, where there are many stops that don't yet have shelters, and I know you've discussed this some when I've asked the agency in the past. I've been told that the, the current contract with the, I guess it's JC Decoe or the provider, ah, didn't allow for additional installations. I may have that wrong, but I understand you may be in a new place vis-à-vis the provider and I wonder what the status of that is.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, I mean, the, the original concession contract required, um, it was first Amoosa, then JC Decoe to upgrade all the existing bus stops in the city. And, again, I, I think the, the agreement as written, they've, they've done a good job. I know the Chairman wishes they would do better on snow removal. But in general the, the shelters have been high quality and well maintained and part of the agreement of the contract is that they maintain those shelters in, in

perpetuity, which again is no small thing, ah, you know, as my agency's inventory of infrastructure that we have to maintain keeps growing. We certainly recognize, and we share it, a deep desire to expand the number of bus shelters around the city. From the point of view of the contract, um, JC Decoe is not gonna do that unless there's some kind of a revenue stream for them 'cause, you know, they, they do make their money in this contract and they pay the city quite a lot of revenue as well. They make their money off advertising and, you know, so they have told us in the current advertising environment that the places that are the most lucrative, for better or for worse, are sort of key high-end shopping corridors, particularly in Manhattan. And, and it's, it's not just the nature of the stores. It's also are there a bunch of bus shelters, you know, in a row that can sort of provide, I guess, strong advertising benefits. So we have been in a, in a long negotiation with JC Decoe about, you know, if they could get some more advertising revenue could we get more bus shelters and of course our priority would be in underserved and low-income neighborhoods. We've not quite completely nailed that deal down. It is,

it is complicated, but we are keen to do so. I think maybe the question the council has is should the city be investing resources on top of that. It, it doesn't fit into the current contractual framework, but I think it's certainly something we [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: But how much revenue is this contract sending back to the general fund currently?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Ah, it's a, it's a billion dollars over.

ELIZABETH FRANKLIN: It's 55, 56 million per year.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It's, OK, but I think the total was a billion, Elizabeth is saying 55 million a year.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And, and, and by the way, both companies, both companies who have had the contract both say that they've lost money on it, which I think is probably true.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: OK, but we could plow some of that 50, 55 million a year back into additional shelters in outlying neighborhoods, for example.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, again, I, I think that is certainly a discussion for the council and, and the administration to have.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Or, or alternative, alternatively, we could allow for additional shelters in high-traffic, more upper-income areas and require as...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, I...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...as a compensating measure multiple shelters uptown and in the outer boroughs.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I, I think that's the, that's the deal we'd like to strike, because not only do we want to build the shelters. In the perfect world JC Decoe would also continue to maintain them. So I think finding the contours of that deal has, has taken a while, but I hope that we're close. You know, happy to talk with you further about it. We, believe me, we certainly share the desire to see a lot more bus shelters in neighborhoods all over the city [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Is, is there a clock ticking on that contract negotiation?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Um, it...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: That would mean it can't drag on too long?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I mean, I don't know that there is a clock ticking. I think that perhaps has been part of the challenge.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right, OK. Well, if we can help the clock tick a little bit we'd love...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Happy, happy to talk...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...we'd love to solve this.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: ...happy to talk about that one, yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: OK. Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Council Member. Council Member Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very much, Chair. Ah, hi, Commissioner. Um, I just want to ask about, um, ah, some of the bike lane infrastructure, um, particularly in the district I represent, um, two, um, two of them in particular. One is the West Street, ah, bike lane in Green Point.

1 That's a protected lane, but, or it's a, it's a
2 raised lane, um, but we continue to have this problem
3 of vehicles parked in the middle of the bike lane.
4 Um, and it, it's, ah, it's increasing, ah, hampering
5 the, the usefulness of the bike lane. Um, and it's
6 something, I think you were out there recently.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It's a, it's an
10 ongoing problem. If we can have some type of
11 protected, um, you know, protective measures, whether
12 it's some kind of, the, the plastic bollards or
13 anything of those sort.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: All right.
15 For sure let us, maybe Rebecca will follow up with
16 you and we'll have our bike folks go out there and
17 take a look.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK. Um, and
19 secondly Schermerhorn Street, which we've spoken
20 about a number of times. Ah, it's more complex than
21 just a DOT is, but the bike lane there is, is
22 effectively useless because of a number of issues.
23 One is construction, so, um, ah, there's a lot of
24 development happening on Schermerhorn Street on, um,
25 on the north side of the street and so you get, um,

1 ah, a lot of, ah, a lot of the, um, the sidewalk
2 sheds or cranes or what-have-you, um, taking up, um,
3 space that goes into the bike lane and, and, um, is
4 forcing people out into the street. Um, in addition
5 to that you have, um, ah, the NYPD Transit, ah, that
6 is there at the Hoyt-Schermerhorn Station. Um,
7 they're using, um, ah, because their car, they don't
8 have enough parking spots they're, they're parking in
9 the bike lane, um, and I know we've talked about this
10 before. I'm, I'm eager to find a solution on this,
11 um, and my feeling is if it means sitting down with
12 Chief Delatorre at, at NYPD and, and, um, and the,
13 ah, transportation chief and going over how many
14 spots do they really seriously need. I'm more than
15 happy to remove those spots from public parking to
16 give them what they need so long as they actually
17 abide by that and don't park in the bike lane
18 anymore. And then working with the Department of
19 Buildings to figure out what we can be doing, um, to,
20 to clear out that bike lane, um, because it's, it's
21 just not safe and frankly I get killed on Twitter
22 about it and, um, ah, in addition to that I know
23 there's, the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership has put
24 forward some, um, ideas around kind of a more
25

comprehensive look at downtown Brooklyn, um, in terms of, um, bike and transfer infrastructure.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, um, as someone who, who bikes around that part of Brooklyn herself you are right. Schermerhorn is not what it should be. It is, it is not a good street for cyclists right now and I'm sorry about that. And I think what you've just recommended is a fantastic idea. Ah, Chief Delatorre, Chief Morris, someone from DOB and, and DOT to see collectively how do we rationalize this street. And, as you say, you know, recognize for our sister agencies what their parking needs are. I mean, look, one challenge in downtown Brooklyn is there is a lot going on, no question. Huge new construction and a huge demand at the curb. But I would love to be part of such a convening, um, so [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK. That would be great, that would be great, if we could do that as quickly as possible, um, 'cause I know that, um, residents in downtown Brooklyn are, are eager to see something.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and I, and, ah, Regina Meyer did send me her comprehensive look for downtown Brooklyn.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think there are a lot of exciting ideas in there.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Would love to engage on it for sure. I think it's got a lot of...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Great.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...creative things in there.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah 'cause, you know, with, I, I feel some level of urgency. I've got about 20 months left here, so, um, that's one thing I'd love to get that done actually, ah, in terms of planning before, before I'm out the door.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, good, let's, let's follow up.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Great, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Councilwoman, do you have a question?

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Um, just one final question. Commissioner, I just had one question, um,

to expand a little bit on what you talked about. In your testimony you were talking about the state legislature and how we are increasing, um, Speed Cameras in school zones. Um, March of 2019 the state approved the renewal and the expansion of the Speed Camera program, which has been operating in our city since 2014 and as a result, ah, DOT worked on installing about 300 Speed Cameras, I believe, and in fiscal 2020 and 724 2021 funded through 81 million dollars in capital funding. So I wanted to ask about the installation of the 300 cameras in fiscal 2020, and I know, you know, the camera selection is a process that's done with DOT based on data, but what we have been seeing recently, um, with the increase in robberies that have been happening across the city, and particularly we've had some assaults on buses. So some of my constituents have been reaching out to me about getting funding for cameras to be installed on buses. While I know that's not DOT, but I bring it up because a lot of people don't make the distinction between the cameras that are installed on buses to look at traffic in the bus lane, right, to keep traffic and the buses flowing. So they believe that maybe some of those cameras which are on the

1 front of the bus and looks, you know, in that
2 direction, if we would be able to provide any more
3 security for, ah, commuters that are on the bus. And
4 I say that because a couple of my constituents have
5 had, you know, children being victims of assaults on
6 buses. It's been very alarming, um, and I so I just
7 didn't know the process so I wanted to understand
8 what that would look like and how your agency would
9 be involved.
10

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I mean, that
12 would obviously, if, if you're bus only that would go
13 through the MTA and I know, you know, typically
14 cameras that are installed, obviously it's something
15 they would need to work through with their unionized
16 work force, um, you know, happy to, to sort of bring
17 it to them and, and see their thoughts on it.

18 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: But they would work
19 with you, right, in terms of input? I mean, I can't
20 see them doing it on their own. If there was a
21 process wouldn't, ah, MTA work with DOT on...

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: They probably
23 would work with DOT and then also probably NYPD.

24 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right, OK.
25

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, if the cameras are particularly not for catching cars in the bus lane but for catching, you know, malefactors on the buses...

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Right.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: As you correctly put it, they'd be facing in the other direction and I'm sure NYPD would want to...

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And, and MTA has their own police force now, as, as we know, recently scheduled to grow, so, um.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yeah, Um-hmm.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Presume they, they would have their own views on that as well.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, and what about the installation of the, the cameras?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So the, the, the 300 that were pledged under basically the council legislation that was passed in the sort of interim period between when our state authorization expired and when we got it reauthorized we did install and activate all of those, ah, by the end of 2019, and, and now, as I said in my testimony, we are, um,

installing, based on our new state legislation at an extraordinary aggressive pace, um, approximately three per day, and we will be to all of the 720 school zones, um, by the summertime and then continue to add more cameras in, in speeding corridors after that.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, and as you do that are you also keeping pace with new schools, new construction, SCAs, ah, capital plan, new schools that are opening in September, would they also be considered as we expand the camera installation?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: We are. I, I would say, you know, in my time in this job we have, I think it is fair to say coordination between DOT and SCA has been a challenge. I mean, their mandate is to get schools in as quickly as possible, and I think I've had a very good relationship with Commissioner Grillo and we have really tried. We have a whole school safety team which is now much more a part of the planning process as new schools are being sited and designed, and very much trying to make sure that we have the proper safety measures in place. I, I wouldn't say it's a perfect process. There's always room for improvement. But I think

1 the, the two agencies have, have come a long way in
2 their coordination. If there are particular schools
3 where you think we're falling short, obviously please
4 let us know and we'll see what we can do.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, I'm sorry, I
7 just have one final question, because it's a topic
8 that I always speak about, and Council Member
9 Rodriguez and I from northern Manhattan, Washington
10 Heights, Inwood, and the West Bronx, we represent
11 over 50% of the step streets in the city of New York.
12 And I always say no one outside of northern Manhattan
13 and the Bronx really understands the purpose and the
14 use of step streets. We use them a lot. Um, some of
15 them have been going through major gut renovations.
16 Some have had minor renovations and other cosmetic
17 work. But as I learned from the Bronx DOT office,
18 ah, biannually we do an assessment of all of the, um,
19 step streets we have across New York City to
20 determine the structure, the viability, etcetera,
21 etcetera. And then we make a decision based on those
22 that are in the most need in terms of our
23 prioritization. Um, I represent the Joker Steps in
24 the Bronx, right.
25

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I, I was about to say, step streets are more known now than [inaudible] global phenomenon.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: We got a lot of attention on step streets. I think we got free Whoppers from Burger King, I mean, lots of attention for the residents on Shakespeare, but also we were able to go in and do some graffiti removal and do some cosmetic work because they're in structurally good condition, but they just don't look as good as we want them to. So I have other step streets that are in process, mainly DDC, but I guess my question for you is, um, what, what funding do we have dedicated? Is there a fund or something within capital dedicated to step streets, and how often are we constantly looking at renovation, you know, changing them, as well as cosmetic work, too.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'll, I'll see if we can dig you up the capital number.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I'll, I'll admit, I think, I know it's long been an area of focus for you and I think you know our in-house...

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Even outside of the movies.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [laughs] But even before the Joker made...

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: Yes. [laughs]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...made that particular step street famous, um, you know, we have, we have our own in-house sidewalk crews that have been trying to do more repairs. I think you know the, the step streets, the, the jurisdiction, and the repairs can be complicated. But, um, you know, perhaps in this budget, particularly it is true in some funny way that the movie really did put a bit of a focus on them and the needs there, and let us talk to you about if there's more we can figure out how to it. I know now your district is world-famous, and, and I was glad, at least we go to out and clean them up and get rid of the graffiti, so as everyone goes with Instagram pictures, um, they look their best.

CHAIRPERSON GIBSON: OK, so I'd love to talk to you more about the capital on step streets. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, eh, eh, Chair Gibson. And, and Commissioner, there's a

1 numbers of question, I'm going to be asking a few and
2 then we will follow, eh, in writing with the others,
3 and of course with the JC Decoe, you know, a lot of,
4 eh, I say a few things to be followed in conversation
5 with them. Eh, eh, with the City Bike expansion and
6 as you know the last thing we heard was about that
7 the City Bike expansion to the South Bronx and
8 northern Manhattan would be happening in the spring.
9 Eh, hopefully you guy can talk to Lyft and figure out
10 to see by any chance what is there any possibility
11 since the plan was for the expansion to happen in the
12 spring. Eh, can that expansion be part of the car-
13 free day that will happen on April 19, and thank you,
14 you know, for your team for the great job that they
15 doing. We will also follow with your team to see how
16 with the, what opportunity are there for the RFP for
17 the local groups in the uptown area that they will
18 participate and also if there is any interest, other,
19 other, eh, colleague in, in the Bronx, eh, Brooklyn,
20 Queens, Staten Island also to be part of the car-free
21 day. It's not closing the street. It's opening the
22 street to celebrate, OK? Eh, on, and we celebrating
23 that day, so thank you for that part. When, when it
24 comes to the coronavirus, first of all, we heard the
25

1 news that the chair of the Port Authority, Rick
2 Cotton, tested positive and that he is going to be
3 working from his home. Eh, I feel that as, you know,
4 as been saying in the press conference with the mayor
5 and the, and the, eh, health commissioner and this is
6 a model time when we will continue seeing, eh, more
7 cases, so it's not a big surprise, but are we ready
8 and of course it's not 100% ready, but how do you
9 feel, eh, you know, are you, in this case at the
10 agency coordinating with the MTA and how ready are we
11 to have leadership of agency in case that anyone,
12 commissioner, elective, you know, tested positive to
13 be working from home. What will that mean, and I
14 know that we cannot predict that moment in that
15 happen.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'll, I'll,
18 it's a, obviously a great question, Mr. Chairman.
19 I'll, I'll talk a bit about my own agency, our
20 coordination with some of our sister agencies, and
21 what I know about the city's efforts. I'm obviously
22 not the health commissioner and I want to be careful
23 I, I don't overstep. She, she and obviously the
24 State Commissioner Zucker are the, the main sources
25 of guidance for New Yorkers. But I would say on the

1 transportation front, and I know you and I have
2 talked about this. I, I'm in communication with Pat
3 Foye of the MTA and, you know, they have instituted
4 their sort of rigorous disinfecting protocols. We
5 are doing the same in the Staten Island Ferry and we
6 are posting in all our facilities and handing out
7 flyers at the ferry, reminding New Yorkers about, I
8 think, all the sort of prophylactic measures we know
9 people should take, washing their hands and coughing
10 into their sleeves. And I think one message I know
11 the mayor made very clear yesterday, if you are sick,
12 ah, you know, the city is asking you to stay home
13 until you, you see if it recovers, and, and, you
14 know, one thing I know also to just remind people of,
15 and I'm, we're very sorry to hear about Rick Cotton.
16 I wish him a speedy recovery. Um, you know, many
17 people who, who do get the coronavirus do, do
18 recover, um, after the, the period of, of
19 convalescence and quarantine. So, ah, I have also,
20 in terms of our facilities, been in contact with
21 Laura Fox, who is the general manager for City Bike
22 and talked through the disinfecting protocols we're
23 gonna have there. They're going to be increasing
24 their cleaning. They're gonna have more to say about
25

1 it. And luckily one thing for us with City Bike
2 right now is a lot of the bikes pass through valet
3 stations in a given day. So that's going to be
4 particularly a good place where they will have staff
5 on hand to make sure that the, the bikes are being
6 sanitized. So on the transportation front we're
7 working closely. I think, as you heard from the
8 mayor and the health commissioner yesterday, ah, you
9 know, the city is, you know, very engaged in trying
10 to get ahead of, of, of the coronavirus, working
11 closely with the state. But events are, are still
12 unfolding. I, I think, ah, you know, my
13 understanding is the mayor and the health
14 commissioner will be updating New Yorkers every
15 single day and providing new information as they have
16 it and yesterday I know they put out a whole new set
17 of, ah, guidelines and talking points for folks.

18
19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Did you think
20 that we should have a level of planning, bringing
21 together city DOT, New York DOT, MTA, everyone that
22 have a role to play in transportation so that
23 planning is taking place, you know...

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, yes, I
25 mean, that, that is...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, I'm sorry, Commissioner, and I don't mean about none, I'm not meaning about there's no conversation or not, but I just feel that if, we don't know how far we will go and we want for people to take precaution and not to be panic. And we know that that's the message. And we also know that, you know, eh, it's gonna be the more vulnerable New Yorkers, those who have previous health condition, you know, with asthma, diabetes, and other type of issue, the more [inaudible] to, you know, to get into this virus. But what we also know that there's not a 100% answer of how fast this will go and I think learning from Italy, and I don't want to compare another expert on the health, but for me it's about if by any chance there is a need to say we need to shut it down, some area of the city, you know, at what point, you know, can we say there's a, there's a level, it's like in the Vision Zero, you've been assigned to lead the Vision Zero together with the NYPD and anybody else. I think as the DOT, as the commissioner of DOT, you know, I think that who coordinate with MTA, who coordinated with the DOT, it's not about sharing information because this point I also feel that New Yorkers need to hear and see a

level of planning that bring together the city and the state and I think that transportation is going to be, it is and it will be one of the more critical one if we continue to see expansion of the virus.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, I think, Mr. Chairman, I hope you're seeing that certainly from the city's point of view it is the highest level of our leadership. The mayor, the first deputy mayor, our health commissioner, the head of our emergency management system, you know, we've already created a bunch of interagency working groups. We are looking at a whole variety of contingency plans for difference scenarios in, in case we find ourselves in more dire circumstances. Um, you know, certainly agree, transportation is, is a big piece of that, both as a public safety piece of it, but also making sure that we can keep our economy functioning. So, so we're certainly part of those efforts and obviously we'll keep in close touch with you all on this committee. You'll, you'll have an important role to play.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But do we, do we have one right now a plan that is only on transportation that this is, I don't want to get

into, you know, this is a lot of things happening and things changing very rapidly, so.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, we, I mean, yeah, I mean we are certainly looking at some transportation-specific plans and obviously that does involve us working very closely with the MTA. And then I think broader scenario planning, as you're saying, what we've seen in other countries, what, what would be the best case scenario, what would be potentially a more dire scenario.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, but I, I just feel that we need to push the MTA. And, again, this is not about bringing politics to the scenario, but when I heard, let's say, a station such as, all the station that I know, let's throw one and say 145th A and D train, there's a one person in a shift of eight hours that is in charge of the maintenance and cleaning of the station, and just to have the mobile unit to go at night and cleaning, that's fine. But if we really want to work 24 hours we should add more men and women on the cleaning team of the MTA. And I feel, again, like MTA sometime behave as and it is a governor entity, he's the one appointed most of the member, including the chair. But in this crisis

1
2 I would like to see a more close, day-by-day, seating
3 and planning, led again by city and state DOT and the
4 MTA. So that we don't get just to, you know, share
5 information with them, but who's planning, because my
6 thing is if at some point we can say, you know,
7 people will, we don't know how things will move in
8 the future in certain community. You know, who
9 already has a plan for transportation? So it's more,
10 I want to leave it yes or no as, you know, ideas and
11 concern, and with that how are we doing since that,
12 eh, eh, since Staten Island Ferry is under the DOT.
13 Is there a plan for the Staten Island Ferry?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes. I, I
15 think, as I mentioned, Mr. Chairman, we're looking at
16 the same, ah, cleaning and disinfecting protocols as
17 the MTA. We're completely cleaning and disinfecting
18 our ships every 72 hours and we are constantly
19 cleaning surfaces in the terminals and the ships, and
20 we are, we are looking at the questions of, as you
21 mentioned, I think all city agencies are potentially
22 planning, looking at different staffing scenarios,
23 and all the things that could happen in, in some of
24 the different scenarios, ah, we're all actively
25 engaged in those discussions with Office of Labor

1 Relations and our operations team. So everything, I
2 think, is working pretty aggressively to try and
3 envision any potential scenarios we could see here,
4 but for now we are certainly focused on keeping the
5 terminals and the boats clean and reminding our
6 passengers about what they can do, in terms of
7 washing hands and coughing into their sleeves and so
8 forth to, to minimize potential contacts.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just, I just
11 think also that, and as I mentioned to you before,
12 and I did mention to MTA, too, the cleaning of
13 stations should also include the surrounding area of
14 the stations, and especially, as I said, and I know
15 in many places, like I have one of the first on the
16 one train in the needle exchange program. You know,
17 I have a lot of, a huge population of homeless, eh,
18 eh, individual, that they are in that location. I
19 think to connect and to talk and to provide services
20 to those individuals I feel also when you look at
21 stations, like as I said, the one referred, but I
22 also the colleague she can refer to a station in her
23 district, too, but I think that, you know, you go to
24 Sanitation being spending some time [inaudible] and I
25 got to see the entry of the stations are not the same

1 as 92nd and Broadway, as 96th and Broadway, as
2 Columbus Circle. You compare 149th, Third Avenue,
3 Columbus Circle, and I think that, you know,
4 especially there in uptown we've been getting, we've
5 been fighting against it, a lot of new supporting
6 housing [inaudible] is like a dumping ground. I
7 think that we need to build but I think underserved
8 community been getting the most. So if you thinking
9 about underserved when it comes to the transportation
10 I encourage, you know, that DOT working with the,
11 with the, with MTA because when I brought the
12 question who's cleaning in front of the station like
13 their answer was about well that's a city agency and
14 I just hope, again, I want to put, this is a time of
15 getting solution. I don't want to be as blaming, but
16 it's about I see that there's a need also to focus
17 the cleaning of a station not only inside but in the
18 surrounding area, too.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: So I agree,
21 Mr. Chairman, and as I told you, I had talked to Pat
22 Foye this morning, you know, to sort of go through
23 potential, ah, cleaning protocols. I'm obviously
24 going to circle back with him after this hearing. I,
25 I do know, I think for both agencies, the particular

1 focus has been on surfaces that people might touch
2 'cause that is potentially where someone who has the
3 coronavirus coughs or somehow some kind of, again,
4 I'm not the health commissioner here so I want to be
5 careful that I don't, I think we're still learning a
6 lot exactly about how the, the disease is transmitted
7 and, and how long it might last on surface, on
8 surfaces. But I think, you know, certainly for us
9 that's been a priority in the cleaning protocols is
10 looking at those places that people might, you know,
11 poles and bannisters in areas where, where people are
12 gonna put their hands and then potentially touch
13 their faces and that would be the way the virus is
14 transmitted. But, again, I want to be careful on
15 staying within my area of expertise here.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. And my last
18 one is about not the virus but on going back on the
19 issues, is about how long is the, eh, city towards
20 meeting the mayor goal of a, of the 25% faster buses
21 by the end of the year?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I think, as
23 you, as papers are flying. I think as you saw in our
24 testimony, um, and one thing I'm, I'm proud of and I,
25 I want to compliment my team because in our, in our

1
2 Better Buses Action Plans we laid it out for 2019 and
3 now you can see for 2020 a very detailed list of
4 projects that we were doing - bus lane work, TSP,
5 pedestrian safety improvements and accessibility
6 improvements for bus riders and, you know, the team
7 has really been, I think, working diligent to achieve
8 those goals and I, I think we've racked up some,
9 some, some good accomplishments. For 2020, as you
10 saw, if you looked at the map, we have a particular
11 focus on the Bronx because that is the next big place
12 where the MTA is doing a lot of bus redesign work
13 and, and Queens will follow after that. Um, we are
14 also really, I think, something we, we heard loud and
15 clear, we've really overhauled the way we do TSP,
16 transit signal priority, and we're doing them at a
17 much faster pace and at a much lower cost. So, so
18 it's one of the areas I think the agency has gotten
19 much better in. Um, and I would point to, as I
20 mentioned in my testimony, obviously 14th Street,
21 our, our, our transit and truck priority street, has,
22 has produced some really exciting results, and we've
23 seen dramatic improvements in bus speeds, we've seen
24 an increase in bike ridership in the area, and I'm
25 happy to say, you know, recently just really safety

statistics show the street is also a lot safer.

We're not yet ready to say where, where the next set of those corridors would be, but obviously those are places where we think we can make dramatic gains in, you know, bus speeds improvement. So I think we're on target with a lot of our goals, um, but certainly more work to come.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner. We'll take a two-minute break and we will continue with the TLC commissioner.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Now we will continue our Committee on Transportation preliminary budget section with the Taxi and Limousine Commission, eh, Aloysee Heredia Jarmoszuk, [inaudible] eh, it's an honor to have you here. As I said before, not only because of your professional background but also being a woman and having two daughters and being Dominican the same, I cannot deny my being proud, too. And we have a lot of people, a lot of talent here. So this is about, eh, individual, they can contribute to take our city to the next level. TLC proposed fiscal 2021 expense

1 budget total 54.3 million. The committee hopes to
2 hear from the commission on its outlook for yellow
3 medallion values and its thoughts on the council Taxi
4 Medallion Task Force report finding. The committee
5 also looks forward to hearing about wheelchair
6 accessibility for yellow medallion taxi, green taxi,
7 and for-hire vehicles. Finally, since the TLC, since
8 TLC issued its first for-hire vehicle base licenses
9 to Uber in 2011 base companies have dramatically
10 increased in popularity. The committee is interested
11 in hearing about changing trends in the taxicab
12 industry, including the growth of high-volume for-
13 hire vehicles and TLC outlook on the future of the
14 driving industry and its input. And now I will call
15 on the committee counsel to please swear in the TLC
16 commissioner.
17

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please raise your
19 right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
20 whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
21 testimony before this committee, and to respond
22 honestly to council member questions?

23 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I do.

24 VINCENT CHIN: I do.
25

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: So good afternoon, Chair Rodriguez and members of the Transportation Committee. I am Aloysee Heredia Jarmoszuk, commissioner and chair of the NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission. Thank you for inviting me to attend today's hearing and previous TLC's fiscal year 2021 preliminary budget. With me is Assistant Commissioner for Finance and Operations, Vincent Chin. As I've shared at my confirmation hearing last month, I'm committing to, I'm committing to make, to making sure that TLC delivers solutions that help driver income, expand the number and type of accessible transportation for New Yorkers in wheelchairs, support the struggling medallion industry, and encourage technological improvements for drivers and passengers. Let me start with an overview of TLC's preliminary budget for fiscal year 2021, which is 54.33 million, broken down into 41.8 million in personal services and 12.5 million in other than personal services. The preliminary budget represents a \$356,000 increase from the current modified budget for fiscal year 2020. The difference reflects funding for collective bargaining changes and the restoration of unspent funds from hiring

delays that have been redirected to meet citywide savings targets. For many years we struggled with recruitment and retention of the TLC officers and inspectors, which resulted in a high vacancy rate for the agency, but we have made significant strides to address this. Over the past year we have been hire multiple classes of new cadets; a new class will graduate within the month. And we will begin a new and larger cadet class this spring. These efforts are aligned with one of the recommendations from the Taxi Medallion Task Force to continue hiring enforcement officers to keep pace with the growing size and complexity of the industry we regulate. Currently the TLC's authorized head count is 597, almost what it was in 2014 when the apps began operating and there were half the number of licensed drivers and vehicles. TLC has experienced minimal PS and OTPS growth since that time and head count was reduced due to delays in hiring uniform staff. Now that we are increasing our uniform staff and have taken on several new efforts to address the struggles of drivers during this period of crisis for the industry, we must ensure our budget allows us to deliver on the city's commitments. We appreciate

support from the council and the Office of Management and Budget to ensure TLC has the resources it needs to support drivers, work towards solutions for medallion owners, improve accessibility of all licensed vehicles, and keep drivers, passengers, and the TLC officers safe. On the revenue side, TLC's budget is projected to be 58 million dollars in fiscal year 2021. This is 3.5 million dollars lower than the current modified budget for fiscal year 2020. The difference reflects an expected one-time uptick in revenue from driver license renewals in fiscal year 2020, which will not carry over into fiscal year 2021. Revenue collected from taxicab licenses is also expected to be somewhat lower than prior years after the introduction of important legislation to waive license renewal fees and TLC's subsequent decision to defer collecting these fees. Throughout the fiscal year we will monitor collections of all categories of revenue and work with OMB to make any adjustments as needed. At my confirmation hearing I outlined four key priorities for the TLC - addressing the medallion debt crisis, encouraging innovation and vehicle technology, protecting driver income, and ensuring accessibility.

I also committed to you and to the drivers that I would take several actions to further these and other priorities in the near future. In the past few months I have also had the chance to meet with many of you and since becoming chair I've continued to meet with drivers, base owners, medallion owners, and I have of course met with TLC staff at our facilities in Queens, Staten Island, and Manhattan, with our enforcement teams at both, and with our enforcement teams at both airports. I'd like to update you on these goals and initiatives next. As, as shared at my confirmation hearing, um, my first priority as chair would be working towards a solution for the medallion crisis. TLC and this administration are committed to working with the council, members of the task force, medallion owners, our partners in state and federal government, and other stakeholders to find a solution to the crippling debt faced by many drivers. As you know, the National Credit Union Administration, which held a significant number of New York City medallion loans, recently sold that portfolio to a private investor. Our goal must be to ensure that any entity controlling a large block of medallions behaves in a socially responsible way that

1 respects each owner and does not destabilize the
2 medallion market. Conversations among the
3 administration, the council, and the private sector
4 are ongoing and I am determined to find solutions and
5 resolutions that support medallion owners. We must
6 also continue to push for changes to state and
7 federal law that would protect drivers from the
8 predatory loans that contributed to this crisis. At
9 TLC we continue to implement the changes called for
10 in the broker review ordered by the mayor, including
11 the passage of new broker rules and the creation of a
12 driver assistance center that will provide owners
13 with financial and legal counseling. There are many
14 reasons for the current financial crisis and it is
15 going to take a multipronged approach working
16 alongside all stakeholders, including drivers, to get
17 us through it and to make sure that we don't find
18 ourselves in the situation again in the future. To
19 ensure the continued viability of the industry and of
20 drivers we need to foster innovation in the industry
21 and ensure that TLC's regulations are appropriate for
22 a 21st century market. In my time so far as the TLC
23 chair, we have worked to convene a working group that
24 will study greater innovation in the taxi sector and
25

work to foster greater adoption of e-hail and other technology by drivers, passengers, and fleets. We will also identify what other steps could be taken, either solely by the TLC or in partnership with other city agencies and outside technology experts to introduce new technologies in the industry and encourage their adoption as a way to increase the number of trips taken in yellow cabs. Ensuring that yellow cabs can, can compete in this 21st-century transplantation landscape is essential if we want professional driving to be an economically viable career for New Yorkers. In 2018 the TLC released a report on driver income, which found, among other things, that 85% of app-based drivers were making less than the minimum wage. Following legislation signed by the mayor with the support of the council, TLC's driver payrolls went into effect in February of 2019, adding more money to the pockets of our hard-working drivers, paying their rent, putting food on their table, and supporting their families and local businesses. TLC's payrolls were first in the nation and we continue to evaluate their impact to ensure that we are protecting and supporting drivers. Since 2018, and thanks to our partnership with City

Council, TLC has restricted issuance of new for-hire vehicle licenses with the exception of wheelchair-accessible vehicles and battery electric vehicles. The license pause played a key role in booster driver income and reducing congestion. We've taken these steps to check growth and halt the race to the bottom for driver pay and we will continue to advance the needs of drivers so that they can have a livable wage. The TLC continues to prioritize expansion of wheelchair accessibility for passengers in New York City to make sure passengers using a wheelchair can go anywhere in the city using TLC-licensed vehicles at any time. Through the implementation of TLC's FHV license pause and FHV accessibility rules, more FHV's and WAVs are on the road in New York City than ever before. In addition, the vehicle mandates for yellow and green taxis, TLC's for-hire vehicle accessibility rules established critical service requirements for all car service companies doing business in New York City, and we continue to see the number of wheelchair-accessible for-hire vehicles increase from 200 to over 1600. While we've heard from passengers who use wheelchairs that this is a good start we need to continue this progress and increase the number of

accessible vehicles on the road so that passengers using wheelchairs experience wait times equivalent to all other passengers. While much progress has been made, I am committed to an exhaustive review of TLC's accessibility initiatives that will greatly expand transportation options in New York City. A key part of TLC's mission is to ensure safe, reliable transportation for passengers, but far too long too many potential passengers have not enjoyed the full benefit of that mission. Mayor de Blasio and the council have made it clear through the TLC's Office of Inclusion that the city will not accept the denial of for-hire service to any passenger based on race, religion, or any other illegitimate reason, and we are expanding our commitment to combat and eliminate discriminatory service refusals in New York City. TLC has recently launched a citywide outreach campaign about service refusals, informing the public about their rights to a taxi for a for-hire trip and providing information how to make a complaint through 311 if refused. We brought examples of these ads today, and maybe you've seen some of them around the city, on the subway, or while waiting for a bus. . We're very proud of these ads and we think that

1 they're, they're quite relevant and, and they're
2 resonating with folks. I'm excited about this
3 campaign and we look forward to continuing our
4 outreach efforts in 2020 and beyond. As I mentioned,
5 last month at my confirmation hearing, I would like
6 to work with the council's black, Latino, Latin
7 America, and Asian caucus and all the council members
8 to expand the reach of the Office of Inclusion so
9 that all residents and visitors of New York City know
10 their rights to ride in TLC-licensed vehicles. Thank
11 you again for inviting me to previous with you TLC's
12 preliminary budget and our policy goals for the
13 future, and I'm here to take your questions.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. One
16 of my first questions is related to what, you know,
17 the situation going on, which is related to the
18 coronavirus. So can you explain what is TLC doing
19 right now to address coronavirus since not only
20 drivers but also riders, eh, automatically develop
21 that interaction, they go from point A to point Z?

22 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Sure. So public
23 safety is our, is our top priority and similar to
24 the, the vigilance that the Department of Health and
25 Mental Hygiene has initiated along with, ah, the

1 senior leadership at the administration, the TLC is
2 doing that it can to communicate with directors.
3 We've issued about four or five notices over the last
4 week and a half, um, to provide drivers with guidance
5 on and precautions that they should be taking similar
6 to what you've likely have heard from the press
7 conferences and from the Department of Health and
8 Mental Hygiene and we will continue to over-
9 communicate with drivers in the days ahead so that
10 they are able to work but also take all necessary
11 precautions.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]
14 sorry, thanks. What would be the procedures, you
15 know, like I feel that in the last two weeks, the
16 last two, three weeks we just, you know, in the
17 middle of this health crisis that all we know that is
18 started but we don't how. We will continue progress
19 as, as you know, it is, it was, it had been so
20 unfortunately to hear on those cases, but we, that's
21 not that controlled area, including the chair of the
22 Port Authority, or the New York City Port Authority
23 this morning announced by the governor so what is the
24 procedure in place, let's say that on informing a
25 rider if the city, if the driver over whatever, high-

1 volume company or driver that are associated with the
2 industry find out that he or she tests positive, what
3 is the procedure in place, if there any, if there's
4 not, as we always say, it's open to from suggestion,
5 and, eh, on how riders will be notified, if there's
6 any particular case involving any driver.

8 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: So as I
9 understand it anyone who tests positive, ah, or takes
10 a test that is confirmed positive, it, it's done by a
11 medical professional. Those are, those results are
12 communicated to the Department of Health and Mental
13 Hygiene and they have health detectives that they go
14 out and then survey and take the matters into their
15 own hands and communicate very effectively and
16 quickly with whoever has come into exposure with,
17 with the person who had a positive result. So the
18 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene is the one
19 that manages that. For the TLC, what we do is ensure
20 that we are communicating, ah, very clearly and
21 providing guidance and dispelling any facts from
22 myths to the 200,000 licensees that we have, and we,
23 we're continuing to communicate, ah, on a daily
24 basis. And, and in all of our, um, authorized
25 languages.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. I, again I'm on the list of things to, again, the only thing that we have in place but for now we as the city has to continue looking at things to improve but to put in place if we don't have it and I think that one of my, not concern, but, you know, ideas is of things come into our head as we, I know that we sitting here we're thinking about, OK, if that happened in my neighborhood, if that happened in the agencies, tomorrow of us get positive, you know, everything is now is taking time or whatever we do. So one of my thing is about, you know, how to notify [inaudible] in the week can we put in place that we connected, and I know that through the press conference, through the Department of Health, I know that when there is any new case it's not that people they don't get to know [inaudible] but I think that there's, it's important to continue addressing how to be closer, tighter, when it came to informing whoever got close to any individual that test positive so that's my, you know, one of my concerns about how we can continue thinking about if a driver tests positive and he or she was driving in the area that, you know, a number of passenger rode that car how soon can we,

1 what system do we have in place so that those
2 individual that got into those vehicle are notified
3 and, and provide all the support and help that they
4 need.
5

6 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Sure, ah, so we
7 have an entire team of, of hundreds of people who are
8 working 24 hours a day through the emergency
9 management in partnership with DOHMH to guard exactly
10 against what you're talking about. Um, they're doing
11 an extraordinary job. They've, I personally feel,
12 have done great at instilling calm and giving
13 everybody the facts and as more cases, um, present
14 themselves they are doing everything that is
15 necessary to triangulate whoever the individual has
16 come into contact with. And I think that, um, the,
17 the, what we are seeing and, and the numbers so far,
18 while they're growing, they're growing, um, at a very
19 contained pace and I think that that is a direct
20 result of how wonderful and well the city is managing
21 the issue and I think that they'll continue to
22 communicate exactly, I'm confident that they will
23 continue to communicate exactly as cases present
24 themselves and the health detectives will go on and
25 reach everyone and remind folks, um, that have had

1 direct exposure to, to, to quarantine themselves if
2 they're not feeling good, to stay home, um, to notify
3 a medical professional and, and to manage this in the
4 way that city is advising with all the precautions in
5 place.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And still related
8 to the moment that we're going through with the
9 virus, coronavirus, and putting aside, you know, that
10 you explained, you know, how TLC has like a clear
11 policy on, again, discrimination, but, you know,
12 beside being discriminated for area where passenger
13 need to go and drivers sometimes refusing to take
14 individual to those places but just putting that
15 aside and talking about the barriers. We have seen
16 also Jewish people being discriminated, eh, not just,
17 not just on the TLC side but being discriminated when
18 the basketball team that went to Baltimore to play a
19 game in D.C. and getting there to the hotel, they,
20 the hotel denied, refused to provide them a rooms
21 even though there was not a direction by the
22 Department of Health who said that they were risk of
23 not being any places so we have seen discriminated
24 there, we have seen discriminated in the Asian, the
25 Chinese community, eh, already and, as you know, we

are clear, we, we need to send a clear message that, you know, so they could be the Jewish, could be the Chinese, could be the Asian, tomorrow it could be the Latino, could be anybody else. So what is the message, what is the TLC putting in place to be sure that at the same time that we encourage everyone to take precaution and to help each other what is the agency doing to be sure that not, not a single group is discriminated in our city as we go through this virus situation.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Sure. Um, in addition to communicating with all of our stakeholders around health and safety precautions we have also been communicating very clearly that we have a zero tolerance policy for any discriminatory behavior, including health and this particular, um, crisis that we're experiencing now around the COVID-19 strain of coronavirus. We encourage anyone who is experiencing any level of discrimination, um, to reach out to 311, ah, and we will immediately investigate and, and be in touch. We are tracking this very, very closely. Over the last, ah, two weeks we've been tracking this closely. We've gotten four complaints, um, and we have full investigations

that have launched to look into those four complaints on discrimination around the COVID.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: And we'll continue to do those.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Eh, we also heard that, you know, another issue that, that some high-volume services, as Uber and Lyft have restricted the times when drivers may use the apps. What is the TLC doing to address that, this issue?

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Sure. Um, this is something that has been brought to my attention several times, ah, before my confirmation and post-confirmation. We've met with a couple of stakeholders and advocates around this exact issue and what I've initiated in the last week is to do a study, um, to see exactly how drivers are experiencing these lockouts, um, and I believe that that's what we're discussing right now. Ah, I want to be able to pinpoint, um, the exact problem and if the drivers are experiencing loss of wages in comparison to what they have been making consistently, um, since we, um, made changes in February of 2019. So we're going to be studying this

1 very closely over the next couple of weeks and, and
2 I'd be happy to report back on that.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: All right. So
5 you referred also to the head count at, at the
6 agency. Eh, can, can you compare the number, what
7 was the head count before the agency went through the
8 big expansion of, of, or increased the numbers of
9 high-volume, 2014, if you compare 2014, ah, to today,
10 how are we doing? How many drivers did we have with
11 license given by the TLC and what was the head count
12 at that time and what is the numbers of drivers
13 affiliated with TLC today and what is the head count
14 today?

15 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: So as I, um,
16 mentioned in my, um, ah, opening statements, our head
17 count has remained more or less the same over the
18 last couple of years and we're obviously looking to,
19 to grow as, as required or as appropriate. Um, with
20 respect to actual licenses, um, I know that we
21 presently have about 330,000 licensees, um, and I can
22 give you a breakdown of drivers and vehicles if that
23 would be helpful. Um, we'd have to look back on, on
24 past years. I don't have that information right now.
25 But what I do have is that, as I said, we have about

330,000 licensees. Of those we have 196 approximately drivers and approximately 116,000, um, vehicles, and that is the breakdown, um, of the licensees. So we have about 597 employees. That has been constant, ah, at least over the last couple of years and then our licensees are in the, in the 330,000 range with the breakdowns I just provided.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Should TLC be, will TLC be able to expand services and support drivers, medallion owners, livery bases, eh, corporate black car, all sector of the industry if the agency get more resources?

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I don't know that I can answer that, you know, with a level of confidence right now. I think that what we need to do is actually take a comprehensive look to see how we are currently positioned. I mean, I would always be happy to, to take on more resources if they were offered. But I'd, I'd like to actually do a deeper dive to see what it is that we are servicing now and where and ensuring that we're maximizing, um, ourselves to provide service before I, I call on for more.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. I use in my role, now that you know, eh, and I can say I know that many colleague from this end that we feel the same thing that, and this is something that we, I committed to push on the other side. You don't have to answer that question on, on, on looking at the need, at the growing of drivers affiliated with the entity, they need to have more increase of law enforcement, thinking on especially down the main street area, close to hotels, close to luxury building, close to piers, what we have heard many stories about, eh, not yellow taxi, I mean, some drivers who are not the yellow, you know, having some connection with some people in those area and do a lot of street hail. So I feel that, you know, at least from my end and I know that the yellow taxi report included as one thing to we look at it the expansion of the agency so that the agency can have enough men and women at all level to respond to the demand that we have to take the agency to the 20, to the 2020.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I, I, I agree with you 100%.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. And, and, I know Council Member Miller has a question, but a few more, if you don't mind, like one is on the driver assistance center. Eh, I do, I did suggest in the past and I suggesting now that we should look at the drivers assistance center in a more comprehensive centralized services to drivers. And I, I believe that, of course, everything is local, so I will suggest though that being not in Manhattan and, and the, and the riving being invisible border between northern Manhattan, the Bronx, and having all those bases in those area as we also have bases that they were providing the services when, when we are dealing with crack and crimes and other issues. I would like to see that center to not only being in Long Island City, to be able to function with some staff to connecting to provide the services with other agency. But I feel that the, the, the need that we have when we listen to the drivers is for the city under TLC to build like a very broad and comprehensive center where the drivers should be connecting and advise on healthcare and not just the insurance that they can have access to, but can we at some point have conversation about what type can we work, creating a

1 fund with contribution from the drivers and the city
2 and probably the Uber and Lyft, they also can share
3 some of those contribution to connect the, eh, all
4 the drivers with healthcare. The, related to the
5 same, eh, area what I feel that in a center we should
6 also have services related to is also creating a
7 retirement plan for drivers, eh, with the same mode.
8 I think that it's all about probably those other type
9 of thing that we were talking, the, in the for-hire
10 and the livery task force that we hoping to vote in
11 the next Stated Meeting, eh, what we should be
12 looking about, you know, someone, if I will continue
13 driving a livery taxi as I did in '88 and not, and
14 that, and make that my job, at my age I will benefit
15 by having a retirement, eh, eh, benefit. So I think
16 that if we can look at it on again expanding and
17 putting a center, eh, not necessarily in the Long
18 Island City, but outside, eh, of the Long Island
19 City. I know that satellite office that's something
20 that would be important, and if I can, you know, ask
21 you that question will you as the commissioner be
22 open to have that conversation about how to expand
23 the driver center and the possibility to identify, at
24
25

1 least have conversation about building satellite
2 office outside the Long Island City.

3 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I'm absolutely
4 open, um, to having a conversation and to exploring
5 how we would expand and broaden our reach, um, on
6 driver assistance. Absolutely.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. And
8 electrical vehicle, eh, that's, eh, eh, something
9 that I hope again that we can expand at TLC. As far
10 as I know, and correct me if, if I'm wrong, I think
11 that electric vehicle they can have a plaque, right
12 to, eh, they are among those who if a driver can get
13 a, there's no limit for a driver to get a license,
14 but the limit is on the plaque. And I think that
15 electric vehicle provide that opportunity. And, and
16 if that's the case can we look on how we can bring
17 some incentive for electric vehicle? And for
18 [inaudible] that we work with some bases and as we
19 had done in other occasion we can dedicate three or
20 four, five parking spot and bring electrical charge
21 to in front of those bases, eh, so that we can
22 accommodate those area and incentivize and make it
23 more easy for the taxi driver to be able to charge
24 the vehicle close to the bases that they are
25

1 affiliated, and the second part is about explore what
2 other incentive can we bring to drivers who like to
3 purchase a electric vehicle.
4

5 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Sure, we can
6 certainly look into some of the ideas that you just
7 shared. Most of that I would have to do in, in
8 partnership and at the direction of the Department of
9 Transportation. But we from our end can absolutely
10 look at how we would be able to leverage or add
11 incentives for electric vehicles and, as you
12 mentioned, they are, um, excluded from, from the, the
13 cap.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. So my
15 colleague, I have other question, but my colleague
16 also has question. Council Member Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
18 Chair, and good afternoon, it's a pleasure to meet
19 you, ah, Commissioner. Look forward to working with
20 you. So I have a, a couple of questions. Um, I kind
21 of want to focus on what, as, as Council Member
22 Rodriguez says that every is local and, and, and in
23 southeast Queens, um, we have this proliferation of
24 commuter vans. So I, I want to talk about that, but
25 while, while the council member was talking about

1 opportunities for, for the livery community and
2 upward mobility, I wanted to ask you about this, ah,
3 your, your familiarity with this RFP that went out,
4 um, from the MTA with, ah, First Mile, Last Mile, ah,
5 kind of, ah, which is overnight, replacing overnight
6 service from MTA with the app-based vehicles, if you
7 saw that as an opportunity, ah, for, for, some of the
8 industry and, ah, in particular, ah, what would that
9 look like if so, ah, aside from the, the big players
10 such as the Uber and Lyft. Is there actually
11 opportunity for, for these community-based, ah, ah,
12 um, businesses to take advantage of?

14 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: So I have some
15 very preliminary and peripheral, um, knowledge of
16 this program. I met with MTA for the first time last
17 week in my new capacity and we discussed this program
18 a little bit. And as I understand it, there is an
19 opportunity for, there's a RFQ. The RFP has not been
20 issued yet. It's, it's coming. It's imminent. But
21 what they have said is that it will not be exclusive,
22 um, on a borough level or to, um, to one or two. It
23 won't be limited to one or two participants. They
24 are open to working with, and I am, and I am open and
25 committing to ensure that word gets out, that there

1 will be an RFP, that there is a way to participate in
2 the program and, and they're going to be, I think,
3 opening this up to four boroughs, um, and even, even
4 though these companies are big I don't think that one
5 or two companies could, could provide all of the
6 service that is necessary. So we just need to make
7 sure that there is enough communication out, or that
8 there is sufficient communication and that there is
9 actual communication out so that everyone who is
10 interested or could be, can be a participate in this
11 is aware that this is coming down the pike and they
12 should put all their hats in the ring. Um, we have
13 four large boroughs. There are a lot of people that
14 need transportation and I think that if things are
15 done in a balanced way there, there is opportunity
16 for, for all the players.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I, I, in my
19 hat as the chair of, ah, Civil Service and Labor and
20 obviously a, a lifelong civil servant, um, I kind of
21 frown at the thought of privatization and, and, and
22 moving away from these, ah, public services. But we
23 have in this committee here sought ways to increase
24 the, to, to first of all protect the folks within
25 this industry, but also increase the upward mobility

1 for, for, for these drivers and, and with [inaudible]
2 communities as well. So it's certainly an
3 opportunity that I don't, you know, that we should
4 look carefully at as, as we move forward. Um, then I
5 wanted to ask you about your, your current work
6 force, your, your head count, particularly around
7 enforcement, ah, of the agency? What do those
8 numbers look like?

10 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: We have about
11 220 enforcement officers right now. We have a class
12 of 60 or so new cadets that are coming up, and we're
13 looking at bringing in a class of 66 or 69 to 120,
14 depending on, on...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And, and, and how
16 many vehicles citywide are they responsible for
17 overseeing?

18 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I mean, we're
19 the regulator for the entire industry slight we've
20 got quite a, quite a, quite a bit, it's the entire
21 fleet and if we...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah.

23 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: ...look at it
24 that way it's, it's an area of development and an
25 area that we need to grow.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, and, and, because obviously those numbers are woefully insufficient, even though they have grown, but the industry has also grown and, and, and where we were behind we weren't able to, to keep up, and so certainly we want to, as, as Chair Rodriguez said, we want to make sure that we have the tools and resources for, ah, these services to be provided in a way that, um, that keep communities safe, that keep drivers safe, that keep riders safe. Um, and, and so that kind of, ah, segues into my focus on the commuter van industry, which has often been unsafe, unregulated, and inaccessible, um, in, in, in doing so and so over the past few years we passed a number of, of laws, ah, local laws, that address this, and except for the accessibility, obviously, um, but recently, I know this week there was a, ah, a, a accident, a well-publicized accident involving a, ah, commuter van and, ah, where the operator, um, hit a cyclist and attempted to flee, which is not outside the norm, um, and, and, and based on, ah, media reports, ah, it was unauthorized, unregulated, and quite frankly had, had Pennsylvania plates. But the fact of the matter is, is nearly 90% of the industry

1 is unregulated and unlicensed. What can TLC,
2 although we recognize that your authority lies within
3 those that are registered what can you do working
4 collaboratively or what ideas do you have to, to make
5 sure that the vans that are operating are operating
6 safely, ah, and is there something that we can do
7 policy-wise, legislatively, that would give you the
8 teeth that are necessary to, to address the other 90%
9 of the industry?
10

11 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I think, ah,
12 first and foremost, I'm so sorry that we didn't have
13 an opportunity to meet, ah, before today and I'd like
14 to set some time to talk about, um, this particular
15 thing with you more in depth and see how we can
16 collaborate to sort of crack down on this. Um,
17 generally the commuter vans that are providing
18 service and are operating room in a legal manner are,
19 are providing some vital service to people who, who
20 need transportation, who are in transportation
21 deserts and don't generally have access. So I, I
22 don't want to diminish the importance of the commuter
23 vans, but we absolutely have to crack down on illegal
24 vans. This accident that happened this weekend is
25 tragic. It's horrific, um, and we cannot have that,

1 and thank God, um, that there were some Good
2 Samaritans out, um, ah, at the weekend that, that
3 helped, um, ah, the investigation and will, will
4 hopefully bring this particular, justice to this
5 particular situation, which is ongoing so I can't
6 really elaborate on it. Um, but we, we have to very
7 strategically and in a comprehensive manner, um,
8 crack down and, and probably have a real solid
9 enforcement plan that is specific to illegal commuter
10 vans that happens within our legal authority and
11 follows the state regulations. But we, we have to
12 end this.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And, and finally,
15 I, I think had kind of brought together a coalition
16 of folks who had kind of inherently just gone in the
17 other direction, but we thought that these were
18 critical services in these transportation desert that
19 needed to get delivered and, and so you had, um,
20 folks, ah, from, from all over the transportation
21 community, including those, ah, legal service
22 providers, um, um, agencies, ah, unions who, who have
23 gotten involved in, in trying to create a safer
24 industry there and a safer environment. Um, but
25 agencies did not necessarily live up to kind of the

1 plans, and I'll give you an example. We had carved
2 out, we, we had asked some folks to move their
3 locations on their pickups and, and there were some
4 promises that we would want to do some things in
5 terms of signages and, and shelters and, and some
6 other things that, that, ah, made it more conducive,
7 ah, for the passengers, and easier for them to access
8 them and, and there wasn't an agency follow-up, and
9 so myself and others who really convinced these folks
10 that this was going to really enhance the business
11 and, and, and provide a, a safer, more efficient way
12 to access them, it didn't come to fruition because
13 everybody didn't do their part. And so, ah, and
14 partially I would say also that in the past it
15 appeared that agencies, ah, priorities were simply,
16 ah, whether or not these vehicles, um, within the
17 purview of TLC whether or not they, they were legally
18 registered and, and, and insured, and which did not
19 include whether or not they had a legal operator
20 behind the wheel, which is hence the, the passage of,
21 of Local Law 8, ah, which requires for ah, a, ah,
22 city [inaudible] operator, and then, and then
23 secondly, um, it, it appeared that the safe operation
24 was not a priority. So in other words if you had a
25

1 licensed operator and you were legally registered,
2 whether you jumped red lights, speeded, or ran on,
3 operated on bus routes, all the things that you
4 shouldn't be doing didn't matter so long as you had,
5 ah, legal registrations and a legal operator, which
6 gave the appreciate that the city was more, ah,
7 concerned about revenue and taxation than it was
8 about safety. So we're hoping that that is not the
9 case, that we can continue to move forward with the
10 policy that we all put in place and, and we are
11 looking forward, ah, to working with you and, and
12 your new team here and, and whoever is left over as
13 well, um, and, and, and certainly the chair with his
14 leadership and committee and, and, and, um, again,
15 with the, um, RFQs that have gone out certainly we
16 want to be helpful with that as well and as we move
17 forward. So I want to thank you for your, you being
18 here and for your time. Look forward to working with
19 you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Thank you,
22 likewise.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
24 Council Member Holden.
25

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Welcome,
Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Hello.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Sorry, I was at
another meeting. Um, I just want to talk about
safety issues, ah, in, in TLC that, that maybe we
could partner, and, and I know something, some
programs exist and might even exist here in New York
City where, um, your agency works with restaurants
and bars to combat, um, drunk driving or driving
while impaired, um, where we can do, um, a safety
campaign to, to post information within these, ah,
establishments to, to get people to get a medallion
or, um, for-hire vehicle, and whatever you, you feel.
Ah, is that, does that exist in your budget?

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Probably not
exclusively within my budget, but I certainly think
that there are opportunities where we could work with
DOT and NYPD and the TLC jointly, and I obviously
cannot speak for the other agencies. But maybe as a
part of Vision Zero or even, um, ah, a sub sort of
committee or group that could advance what you're
talking about, I think it's a great idea.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, where there's something that's posted in, in the bar that says, and, and it could, you could partner with the owners of the restaurant when they identify somebody they should say we'll call you a vehicle, and somehow the city subsidizes it or the restaurant probably is the best thing to do, but it does promote, um, less drunk driving, ah, 'cause every day we, we hear of an incident. And, um, we have the for-hire vehicles, we have, obviously, an abundance, and possibly use this to save lives. It would be a good program for your, your agency maybe to, to promote. So I'd like to see if that's possible, um, and I, I have some ideas on I could talk to you about which I think would, 'cause we already have some establishments that are doing that. They actually advertise it in their, in their, you know, they put out ads and they put a menu and, and it would, it would be included there. But I, I don't see it around the, um, let's say the restaurant, I don't see it, um, where I think something could be posted by your agency, which would be nice.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: I'm happy to meet...

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: OK.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: ...and talk about it and, and try to explore how we could tackle this.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah. So I, so I think we should have goals on safety, also, um, in, in some of the for-hire vehicles that I've taken it was very difficult in the back seat to find the safety belt, um, you know, you had to go digging sometimes 'cause and, and now we're talking about a state law in, in, in the rear seat so we have to kind of remind the drivers that they could actually remind the passengers buckle up in the back, um, which, um, that again will save lives. So that's, that's what I'm kind of interested in here because, um, some drivers, I mean, most drivers are good. We, we do see some drivers that drive fast and, and over the speed limit. But still, um, I don't know how many. I think we should do a, a survey how many, how many passengers in taxis, um, are actually buckled up in the back seat and that would be some, another safety campaign I think we might want to work on.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: In anticipation of the law that will be passed we are going to, we already started working on ideas of how we're gonna

1 ensure that there are either stickers or labels in
2 all of the cars and part of that should be a public
3 awareness campaign that this new law is coming into
4 passage and not waiting for it, the law to begin.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Correct, no,
6 it's...

7 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Actually jumping
8 on it right away.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It's a good
10 practice, with and without a law.

11 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Yep.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: OK, thank you
13 very much. Thanks. Thanks, Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Eh,
15 Commissioner, how can, how do you think that we can
16 be helpful, and of course this is a conversation. I
17 don't expect you know the answer is gonna be
18 definitely answered, eh, answered right now. But
19 what should we expect when it come to making Uber and
20 TLC more accountable especially under your time
21 leading this agency?

22 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: As, as we've
23 been discussing, one of the things that we're going
24 to do is actually do a top, ah, to bottom review of
25

1 all of our rules and regulations right now to figure,
2 um, what is still relevant, what needs to be
3 contemporized, what needs to be made more stringent
4 and what needs to be retired or what needs to be
5 adapted, um, to the present. So if, if you just give
6 me a little bit of, of time we're gonna begin that
7 review, and obviously we won't be doing that work
8 unilaterally. That is work that we would be doing
9 through the commission, with the agency, and in
10 partnership with you and all of our stakeholders.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] how a
13 lot of services, eh, that could help, the green, the
14 yellow, medallions, the traditional corporate black
15 car, the livery bases, now, you know, with all those
16 services that are being added and we're putting
17 [inaudible] investments, eh, on transportation from
18 the MTA and assuming that, you know, not only through
19 Access-A-Ride, we had the opportunity to connect with
20 services. Those sector but also with the
21 announcement of the RFP I think that even though we
22 can say, you know, this is on the MTA but we as a
23 city also, eh, even with the few members that we have
24 and the partnership that there is there between
25 agencies such as TLC and the MTA, I think this time

1 around what we hear is a lot of frustration for many
2 drivers, which is about here is Uber and Lyft trying
3 to take advantage with whatever is the new RFP that
4 come out. And I think that as I said before in other
5 matter in the open market society we don't control
6 who responds to RFP. But I think that we do control,
7 you know, and how from the beginning we can work with
8 those sector that have been affected the most after
9 the high-volume app company landing and stay in the
10 city. So I just hope again that not only through
11 Access-A-Ride, which is the agreement between New
12 York City and the MTA to provide those services, the
13 service that is around like 400 million dollars, if
14 we can think about how those traditional, eh, livery,
15 corporate, yellow, green, benefit from but also all
16 the RFP that the MTA will put out there as I agree
17 with Council Member Miller, you know, it cannot be
18 that, first of all, I, I welcome, I will work with
19 the TW and I will be on their side when it comes to,
20 eh, their approach, eh, their position, when it comes
21 to MTA now to complement other services in the
22 underserved area bring Uber and Lyft, I think that if
23 any sector will bring to provide the services it
24 should be delivery basis. It should be those sector

1 that they were there in those community. It can be
2 in places in Queens, Brooklyn, Washington Heights,
3 and the Bronx where and I say in other issues like
4 when those community we're dealing with crack and
5 crimes and other people that were living, those
6 livery bases they stay there, and I feel that we also
7 have a obligation to identify where there's any RFP
8 to provide services, of course the first thing that
9 we should do is to increase and improve buses in
10 those area. But if the buses are not the first, the
11 only one and the other service will be added let's go
12 local and let's think about the livery bases, the
13 corporate black car, whoever had been there when they
14 were not a high-volume company. So those are just
15 suggestion for us to look at it. Eh, [speaking in
16 Spanish]. Eh, I'm not going to be getting into the
17 question about, you know, things that I feel we
18 should do in the outer borough area but I hope that
19 as we will have a, the livery base task force we will
20 have the opportunity to identify and be creative on
21 how it can be helpful to them, too.

23 COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: As you know, my,
24 I am completely committed to the well-being and the
25 livelihoods of our drivers. And so anything that we

1 can do to ensure that they have work and, as, as you
2 know well from me, um, I believe that there is a way
3 to stabilize the market, to make sure that everybody
4 is getting the service that they need. We have
5 enough geography in New York City. There's enough
6 demand, and we just have to figure out how to spread
7 the wealth and to do it in an equitable manner. Um,
8 I agree that we need to pay attention and I'm, I
9 can't, I'm very much looking forward to working with
10 the task force that's upcoming to figure out what we
11 can do in the interest of the bases and the livery
12 industry, um, but most importantly we have passengers
13 and riders in New York City that needs to get to
14 places, and we have sufficient drivers, we have cars,
15 and we just need to make sure that everybody is
16 matched properly, um, and that's the work that we
17 have to do in the days ahead and, you know, I, I
18 understand exactly, um, the difficult, um, situation
19 that a lot of the drivers find themselves in as well
20 as, as well as the bases and the small businesses,
21 and, um, and I'm here to do better for them.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] With
24 that I'd like to also thank Bill for, for, as we say,
25 great working, eh, relationship that we established

during the time that he was leading this agency and I think that, you know, no doubt, that at least I can say my six years chairing this committee we have great experience working with the commissioners and with you, too, and, and with the staff that you have onboard. So, you know, we have a big challenge, but I summarize this saying the same thing. We for now and we need to bring more resources to the agency in order for the agency to expand, you know, in all those area that we hope that they will do in 2020. So with that this hearing is adjourned.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Oh, sorry. Thank you, Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER JARMOSZUK: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So I'm sorry, since members of the public testified in the previous one of the MTA so I'm sorry [inaudible].

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION
213

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 11, 2020