CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME USES

-----X

December 15, 2009 Start: 11:43 am Recess: 12:45 pm

Council Chambers

HELD AT:

City Hall

BEFORE:

JESSICA LAPPIN Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Annabel Palma Charles Barron Rosie Mendez Leroy G. Comrie, Jr. Daniel R. Garodnick Elizabeth Crowley John C. Liu Maria del Carmen Arroyo 1

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Randal Fong First Assistant Commissioner of Real Estate Services NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services

Joseph Valentino Director of Property Sales NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services

Gregory Shaw Attorney for Real Estate NYC School Construction Authority

Elan Abneri Director Architectural Engineering NYC School Construction Authority

Dara Adams Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 3 MARITIME USES
2	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Good morning,
3	welcome to the Land Use Subcommittee on Landmarks,
4	Public Siting, and Maritime Uses, I am Jessica
5	Lappin, the Chair.
6	We're joined today by Council
7	Member Annabel Palma of the Bronx, who wins the
8	most punctual award, Council Member Charles
9	Barron, Council Member Rosie Mendez, and Council
10	Member Leroy Comrie. We're also joined by Council
11	Member Dan Garodnick.
12	We have two items on the agenda
13	today, we're going to doone is a school and one
14	is a land swap, we're going to start with that.
15	I'm going to ask DCAS to come up and testify,
16	Randal Fong and Joseph Valentino. It is item
17	number 1287, the 250 Baltic Street exchange in
18	Brooklyn. It's in both Council Member Dilan and
19	Council Member de Blasio's district.
20	And before I ask these gentlemen to
21	introduce themselves for the record and begin and
22	formally open the hearing, I wanted to make sure
23	everybody is here, that you know we are meeting
24	again Thursday morning in the Subcommittee before
25	the Land Use Committee, we're meeting at 9:30is

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 4 MARITIME USES
2	that correct, Gail? Nine-thirty in the morning.
3	There is only one item on the agenda. If we meet
4	promptly at 9:30, we can get through the agenda
5	quickly and then we can have the full Land Use
6	Committee at 10.
7	And I want to note we've been
8	joined by Councilwoman Elizabeth Crowley.
9	There will be a vote on Thursday
10	morning, so please be here.
11	With that, I'd like to open the
12	hearing and ask these gentlemen to begin.
13	[Pause]
14	RANDAL FONG: Is it on?
15	MALE VOICE 1: It's on, it's on.
16	RANDAL FONG: Okay. Good morning,
17	Chair Lappin and Members of the Landmarks, Public
18	Siting and Maritime Uses Subcommittee. I am
19	Randal Fong, First Assistant Commissioner of Real
20	Estate Services at the Department of Citywide
21	Administrative Services, DCAS. I am joined by my
22	colleague Joseph Valentino, Director of Property
23	Sales.
24	On behalf of Commissioner Martha K.
25	Hirst, I would like to thank you for the

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 5 MARITIME USES
2	opportunity to discuss this real estate
3	transaction for the proposed exchange of city-
4	owned property located at 250 Baltic Street, Block
5	312, Lot 24, in the Borough of Brooklyn, for
б	state-owned property located at 338 Forbell
7	Street, Block 4258, Lots 34 and 36, also located
8	in Brooklyn.
9	This Forbell/Baltic exchange is
10	pursuant to the New York State General Municipal
11	Law, Section 72-h, which pertains to the sale,
12	lease, and transfer to municipal corporations of
13	certain public lands. This exchange will grant
14	the State of New York ownership of 250 Baltic
15	Street, now known as the Baltic Street Advocacy,
16	Employment, Housing, Inc., which has been occupied
17	as a mental health clinic for over 30 years.
18	Brooklyn Community Board number 6 will remain in
19	the office space that they have occupied at this
20	location for about 30 years as well.
21	Upon conveyance, the City will
22	enter into a 10-year lease with the state to
23	retain the office space for Brooklyn Community
24	Board number 6 with four 10-year renewal options.
25	Pursuant to this lease, the City will pay a fee

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 6 MARITIME USES
2	equivalent to the operating expenses related to
3	the space. The City of New York will acquire 338
4	Forbell Street, also known as the Forbell Shelter,
5	for continued use as a Department of Homeless
6	Services transitional facility for homeless men,
7	as it has been for nearly 20 years. This facility
8	is operated by Samaritan Village, Inc., under a
9	contract with the New York City Department of
10	Homeless Services.
11	This action is intended to promote
12	the continued use and future control of each
13	property by the current occupants and streamlined
14	facilities management and operations at these
15	locations. The exchange will minimize any
16	disruption of services or relocation of offices
17	and will allow each owner to make capital
18	improvements to their respective properties.
19	There is no monetary consideration for this real
20	estate transaction since both properties are
21	determined to be equivalent in value.
22	New York State General Municipal
23	Law, Section 72-h provides that this exchange is
24	subject to the disapproval by the New York City
25	Council within 30 days following receipt of

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 7 MARITIME USES
2	mayoral approval of the transaction. A mayoral
3	public hearing on this matter was held on November
4	10th, 2009, and mayoral authorization was obtained
5	on November 12th, 2009.
6	Thank you again for this
7	opportunity to testify about the Baltic/Forbell
8	exchange and we urge the Council to support this
9	transaction. We are pleased to answer any
10	questions that you may have.
11	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: It certainly
12	seems to make sense, I just have a couple of brief
13	questions. Right now, theI just want to
14	understand, the Mental Health Clinic and the
15	homeless shelter are both operated by the city or
16	is one operated by the state?
17	RANDAL FONG: One is operated by
18	the state, the mental health clinic is operated by
19	the state, and the shelter is operated by the City
20	of New York, Department of Homeless Services.
21	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Do either
22	entities pay rent?
23	RANDAL FONG: There are leases, but
24	they don't actually pay rent right now.
25	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: But the

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 8 MARITIME USES
2	Community Board pays rent?
3	RANDAL FONG: The Community Board
4	does not pay rent, they're in a city-owned
5	building currently.
6	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: But they will
7	pay rent.
8	RANDAL FONG: They will be paying
9	maintenance costs, but not rent, it'll just be for
10	their proportionate share of the operating costs
11	for their space.
12	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Do they pay
13	that now?
14	RANDAL FONG: They don't pay that
15	now, they are part of the establishment of that
16	building and the state is operating that building,
17	but because it will be a private building in the
18	future, the city will pay its proportionate share,
19	it's
20	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: How is that
21	going to impact the Community Board's budget?
22	RANDAL FONG: The OMB has approved
23	the payment of those operating costs so it should
24	not be a budget issue for the Community Board.
25	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Okay. Do any

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 9 MARITIME USES
2	of my colleagues have questions? Council Member
3	Barron.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And Council
5	Member Dilan is supportive of the Forbell
6	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: [Interposing]
7	He is.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:exchange?
9	Oh, 'cause that's in the very close to my area.
10	There'll be no impactI know you're saying the
11	value of the property is equivalent
12	RANDAL FONG: Yes.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:so
14	there's no financial burden on this, but there'll
15	be no change of services with the state? The
16	state will be taking over Forbell now.
17	RANDAL FONG: Yeah, the state owns
18	the Forbell property, the city will now own it
19	after this swap.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: After the
21	swap
22	RANDAL FONG: Yes.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:the city
24	will own
25	RANDAL FONG: Yes, this

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 10 MARITIME USES
2	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:the
3	Forbell.
4	RANDAL FONG:exactly, the city
5	will own the property, as well as operate the
6	Forbell property.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So you will
8	own and operate it.
9	RANDAL FONG: Correct.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And
11	there'll be no changes?
12	RANDAL FONG: The operation of the
13	facility is up to the Department of Homeless
14	Services and it'syou know, we are doing this as
15	a real estate transaction, I presume there will be
16	no changes, they will continue the operation as
17	they have right now.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You know, I
19	always get suspect when these happen too neat and
20	look like everything is fine, you know, there's
21	got to be something somewhere. Is there any
22	opposition anywhere from anyone?
23	RANDAL FONG: I have not heard of
24	any opposition.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Haven't

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 11 MARITIME USES
heard of any? If everything is so equal and the
same, why are you making the swap?
RANDAL FONG: The
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
[Interposing] If everything's going to be fine
with Forbell, everything's going to be fine,
nothing's going to change there, no rent's going
to change, everybody's going to be fine, what's
the purpose of this swap?
RANDAL FONG: The main purpose is
that the properties are owned by one entity and
operated by another entity, so what we are trying
to do is ensure that the
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
[Interposing] Swap, so the one's that are
operating it
RANDAL FONG:the ownership and
the operation
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Will be the
same.
RANDAL FONG: Exactly, Council
Member.
Member. COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's the

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 12 MARITIME USES
2	RANDAL FONG: Yes.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.
4	Thank you.
5	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Seeing no
6	other questions and nobody else signed up to
7	testify, the hearing on this item is closed.
8	Thank you, gentlemen.
9	RANDAL FONG: Thank you.
10	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: I'm going to
11	ask for the Counsel to call for a vote on this
12	item. I recommend a favorable vote.
13	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Christian
14	Hylton, Counsel to the Committee. Chair Lappin?
15	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Aye.
16	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member
17	Barron.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.
19	MALE VOICE: Go for it
20	[background noise]
21	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member
22	Comrie.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.
24	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member
25	Palma.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 13 1 MARITIME USES 2 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member 3 4 Mendez. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member б 7 Crowley. COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye. 8 9 CHRISTIAN HYLTON: By a vote of six 10 in the affirmative, none in the negative, no 11 abstentions, LU 1287 is approved and referred to 12 the full Land Use Committee. 13 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: We'll keep this vote open until the end of this meeting. 14 15 Okay, we're going to move on to the 16 other item which is on the agenda today which is 17 in Council Member Garodnick's district and it's 18 lovely that he has joined us this morning. It is-19 20 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: It is 21 lovely. 22 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: It is lovely, 23 I am being sincere. 24 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I just like 25 your word, I don't--

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 14 MARITIME USES
2	[Crosstalk]
3	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: P.S./I.S. 281-
4	M, which is in Manhattan's Community Board number
5	6. I'm going to ask first the School Construction
6	Authority, Mr. Gregory Shaw, Elan Abneri, and
7	James Elberfeld [phonetic] to open the hearing.
8	[Pause]
9	GREGORY SHAW: Good morning,
10	Chairperson Lappin and Council Members, thanks so
11	much for having us today. My name is Gregory
12	Shaw, I am principal attorney for Real Estate for
13	the New York City School Construction Authority,
14	and to my immediate left is Elan Abneri who is
15	Director for Real Estate for the School
16	Construction Authority
17	[Off mic]
18	GREGORY SHAW: Oh, excuse me.
19	Architectural Engineering, sorry, and also we have
20	Jay Elberfeld who is the design manager for this
21	particular project that we're proposing to the
22	Council today.
23	The New York City School
24	Construction Authority has undertaken the site
25	selection process for the proposed 612-seat

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 15 MARITIME USES
2	primary and intermediate facility located on the
3	east side of First Avenue between East 35th Street
4	and East 36th Street in the east side of Manhattan
5	in tax Block 967, Lot 1, now to be Lot 2. The
6	proposed school is also located in Community
7	School District number 2 and Manhattan Community
8	Board number 6. The notice of filing for the site
9	plan was published in the New York Post and City
10	Record on September 30th, 2009. Manhattan
11	Community Board number 6 was also notified of the
12	site plan on September 30th and was asked to hold
13	a public hearing on the proposed site plan.
14	The Community Board held a public
15	hearing on the site plan, the City Planning
16	Commission was also notified of the plan on
17	September 30th and it recommended in favor of the
18	proposed site.
19	The proposed site is located on a
20	vacant lot and that is part of a privately-owned
21	development. The school site is approximately
22	23,581 square feet, a portion of an approximately
23	68,000 square foot parcel of vacant land that is
24	currently owned by 616 First Realty Company, LLC.
25	The developer purchased the property from Con

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 16 MARITIME USES
2	Edison and has obtained Land Use approvals to
3	permit development of the parcels with a mixed use
4	residential, commercial, retail with a community
5	facility, namely the school, and various open
6	spaces. The SA would purchase the property from
7	the developer and build the new 612-seat public
8	primary/intermediate facility.
9	Because the lot for the proposed
10	school is relatively small for the size of the
11	program, the design provides for the following:
12	The five foot setback from the sidewalk of First
13	Avenue and 35th Street, we're proposing to
14	cantilever [phonetic] the building from the second
15	floor upwards over the five foot setback, and what
16	I'm going to mention to you now will be further
17	described in the presentation by our designers.
18	The SA proposes to cantilever this
19	school building over the setback from the second
20	floor upwards on First Avenue and from the third
21	floor on 35th Street. The ramp for handicap
22	access and the fence restricting entrance to the
23	school and the playground will be located along a
24	portion of the 35th Street within the five foot
25	setback. The school building will be

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 17 MARITIME USES
2	approximately 85excuse me, 89 feet high with a
3	mechanical penthouse on the roof, and the retail
4	component originally considered as part of
5	development along First Avenue will be deleted to
6	accommodate the school.
7	The SCA has considered all comments
8	received on the proposed site plan and affirms the
9	site plan pursuant to section 1731 of the Public
10	Authorities Law. In accordance with section 1732
11	of the Public Authorities Law, the SCA submitted
12	the proposed plan to the Mayor and Council on
13	December 10th, 2009.
14	We look forward to your
15	Subcommittee's favorable consideration of the
16	proposed site plan. At this particular point, I
17	would like to have Elan Abneri describe in a
18	little more detail some of the items that I have
19	mentioned in my testimony.
20	ELAN ABNERI: Good morning. The
21	site is bounded by 35th Street and 36th Street
22	between First Avenue and the FDR Drive. The
23	school is located in this corner, there's a
24	proposed tower over here which will be abutting
25	the school and a proposed tower here which would

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 18 MARITIME USES
2	have a 40-foot setback. This area is where a
3	proposed playground at-grade, and there's also
4	another proposed playground which would be on the
5	roof at the sixth floor.
6	This rendering
7	[Off mic]
8	ELAN ABNERI: No [off mic]this
9	rendering shows the various elements of the
10	school. We have the entry over here, we have a
11	handicapped ramp also leading into that entry. As
12	Mr. Shaw explained, we have an overhang here and
13	an overhang here, we needed these two overhangs to
14	allow us to fit the entire program into the site.
15	Most of the mechanical equipment will be in a
16	penthouse at the top, we have a rooftop playground
17	which is located here, the students will access it
18	off a corridor on the sixth floor. The at-grade
19	playground is around this corner.
20	MALE VOICE 1: Let's go to the next
21	site [off mic].
22	[Pause]
23	ELAN ABNERI: This is a plan of the
24	first floor with the entry again of your handicap
25	entry, your stairs to enter in, there's a gate

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 19 MARITIME USES
2	here and around this area; there's also a gate to
3	the playground, this area is an open playground
4	area, there's an early childhood playground here.
5	The main entry, we have a lobby, your elevators,
6	administrative office, lunch room, library,
7	library has a prominent face on the First Avenue
8	side.
9	At this point, if there's any
10	questions, I'd be happy to answer them.
11	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Are there
12	windows on the north side of the building?
13	ELAN ABNERI: On the north side, we
14	are facing the tower or proposed towers, so we're
15	not planning any windows there.
16	GREGORY SHAW: But in fact none of
17	the program, no classrooms are on that side,
18	there's utility areas and also there's some other-
19	-the gymnasium is on that side as well.
20	MALE VOICE 1: Yeah.
21	GREGORY SHAW: So in terms of light
22	and airI mean in terms of light, we positioned
23	the design calls for the areas, the critical items
24	that don't require light on that side of the
25	building.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 20 MARITIME USES
2	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Is that
3	because these would be lot line windows or why did
4	you make this decision?
5	GREGORY SHAW: Because the towers
6	going toif the developer goes forward with the
7	towers, they will be abutting the building at that
8	point, they'll be right next to each other.
9	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Okay. I have
10	a lot of questions, but you asked specifically if
11	we had questions related to the design, is that
12	what your question was or are you justoh, are
13	you finished with your presentation?
14	ELAN ABNERI: We're finished.
15	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Okay, great.
16	So we're going to open it up to questions, I have
17	a few and then I'm going to turn it over to
18	Council Member Garodnick and then other members of
19	the committee.
20	You know, sort of I want to start
21	by saying we're facing massive overcrowding in
22	District 2, particularly in this part of District
23	2 and 116, which is nearby, is beyond
24	overcapacity, so there is a desperate need in this
25	area for a new school. And, generally speaking, I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 21 MARITIME USES
2	think excitement is not the right word, people
3	want this to open, they want it to open yesterday
4	and they need it to open yesterday, so I want to
5	start kind of with that being the overall
6	discussion and certainly people want this school
7	to be built. But there has been a lot of
8	discussion at the Community Board, which you were
9	nice enoughyou didn't have to go to the
10	Community Board and we appreciate that you did and
11	I think it shows that you are willing to engage in
12	discussion and dialogue with the community, we're
13	going to need some of that
14	GREGORY SHAW: Sure.
15	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN:going
16	forward. But I appreciate that you did that, even
17	though you didn't have to, but as you did, I think
18	this is a complicated site where you have other
19	construction, as you mentioned, these towers that
20	are going to be built. So what I wanted to ask
21	more generally is how this construction of this
22	school is going to fit into the construction at
23	the overall site. Once this is builtand we want
24	it to be built, we don't want to wait for the
25	other construction, but once it is and it's open

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 22 MARITIME USES
2	and you have children running around in the play
3	yard and in the building, how do those children
4	stay safe when there is massive construction
5	happening right there, abutting the building?
6	GREGORY SHAW: That's a good
7	question. Only working in, you know, concert with
8	the Building Department and all I can tell you is
9	a school that's in Manhattan, any school that's in
10	Manhattan is subject to that kind of development
11	where there could be a large structure next to it
12	or built next to it. We're cognizant of that,
13	we've had discussions with the developer regarding
14	that, but other than that, at this particular
15	point, there's nothing we can do until the
16	construction, or until he starts to move forward.
17	All I can tell you is currently the developer is
18	experiencing some financial difficulty. Whether
19	those towers ever go up or not
20	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Right.
21	GREGORY SHAW:we're not even
22	sure.
23	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And that's why
24	we don't want to wait, or that would be my view, I
25	don't think we should wait because who knows if or

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 23 MARITIME USES
2	when these towers ever get built and we need the
3	school, so I think it's prudent to move forward,
4	but it's going to be very complicated if and when
5	that happens.
6	Access to the public space on the
7	playground, how would that happen during
8	construction on the site?
9	GREGORY SHAW: If you're talking
10	about the playground area, which is not part of
11	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: [Interposing]
12	Not the one on the roof, but the other one that
13	you pointed out.
14	GREGORY SHAW: That would obviously
15	be a concern for us as to what the contractor or
16	what the developer could do to assure that the
17	kids would not be exposed to this kind of
18	construction. I guess there's ways that could be
19	accomplished, that would all have to be discussed
20	with him at the time that he got his permits to do
21	this. Obviously, we have excellent relationships
22	with the Building Department, so we would
23	certainly be weighing in on that issue.
24	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: I mean we did
25	have a similar situation last year at 67th and

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 24 MARITIME USES
2	First at P.S. 183 when the Laurel was going up
3	next door, we had some problems with the
4	children's play yard being right next to that
5	construction. So I appreciate when you say this
6	happens in Manhattan, it does, even with buildings
7	that are going up near existing schools, but we
8	did have to alter the developer's schedule, have
9	him do work during the summer, for example, when
10	the children were not in school, we did have to
11	have a stop work order issued for that site at
12	different points. So it is complicated, and it
13	can be very dangerous so it's going to have to be
14	taken incredibly seriously, and if the developer,
15	whoever that person is, isn't cooperating, then we
16	have to issue stop work orders on that site until
17	he's forced to cooperate.
18	Is there any plan to have this
19	school, particularly when the site is dormant or
20	before there are otherbefore there's other
21	construction in the area be brought into the
22	community, made into a community asset to some
23	extent, having the gymnasium, or is there an
24	auditorium in this building?
25	ELAN ABNERI: The building has a

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 25 MARITIME USES
2	full gymnasium, it also has what we're calling a
3	gymatorium. It will function as both a secondary
4	gym and an auditorium space, there will be movable
5	seats, there would be a stage, and the advantage
6	is it gives more play space for the children, in
7	addition to serving the auditorium function.
8	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And if they
9	have to play inside, perhaps when there's
10	construction happening, they would have that
11	possibility of doing it?
12	ELAN ABNERI: There again, there
13	are two gym spaces that they can play indoors.
14	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And there's
15	room on the roof for them to play outdoors.
16	ELAN ABNERI: Yes, the outdoor
17	though is adjacent to one of the proposed towers.
18	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: So that would
19	potentially be off limits during construction,
20	potentially.
21	ELAN ABNERI: Potentially.
22	GREGORY SHAW: For periods of it,
23	yes.
24	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Right.
25	GREGORY SHAW: Absolutely.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 26 MARITIME USES
2	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: So are there
3	thoughts about opening up some of these spaces to
4	the community? Obviously not in school hours.
5	ELAN ABNERI: Yeah, well it has
6	been the Department of Education's policy to allow
7	community groups to make uses of schools, you
8	know, after hours, so that's generally been the
9	case and especially so when you have a new
10	facility which has actually more to offer, so,
11	yes.
12	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And I assume
13	it goes without saying that there will be science
14	labs, art rooms?
15	ELAN ABNERI: Yes.
16	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Cafeteria.
17	ELAN ABNERI: Science, there's
18	about 24 regular classrooms, an art room, music
19	room, there'll be science for the younger grades,
20	as well as science for the older grades, a lab and
21	demo space.
22	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: When do you
23	anticipate this school would open if all went
24	according to plan?
25	GREGORY SHAW: If all goes

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 27 MARITIME USES
2	according to plan, we're looking at 2013,
3	September [off mic].
4	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: I'm going to
5	turn it over to Council Member Garodnick.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank
7	you, Chair Lappin. I think you hit the points
8	right on the money because everybody has
9	anticipated that this would be the site of a
10	school, in fact it was a precondition for our
11	rezoning the area which included the entire East
12	River Realty Corporation proposal which goes from
13	35th Street up to 41st Street. In fact, we
14	reoriented the school from where it was initially,
15	which was in the depths of that site on the FDR
16	Drive to First Avenue. So I think Council Member
17	Lappin is absolutely correct that this is not only
18	important, but essential for the East Side to deal
19	with our overcrowding issues.
20	But let's talk a little bit about
21	the mechanics of where we are and where we're
22	going from here. First question is, I assume the
23	Community Board saw these renderings when you went
24	to them, is that right?
25	GREGORY SHAW: When we meet the

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 28 MARITIME USES
2	first meeting, Mr. Abneri and myself were at that
3	first meeting with the Youth and Education
4	Committee and we did provide them with a
5	schematics of design, we had some boards, not
6	exactly the same boards that we're showing you
7	here, but we went into some great detail of where
8	the school was going to be located and the
9	interior design for the school, yes.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
11	So you have more up-to-date information than you
12	did even when you were at the Community Board.
13	GREGORY SHAW: Slightly so, yes.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
15	And the action that the School Construction
16	Authority is asking the Council to take today is
17	an approval on the siting, not an approval on the
18	specific design of this building, is that correct?
19	GREGORY SHAW: Well we are
20	presenting to you information regarding what we
21	believe the design will be going forward and some
22	of the constraints that we faced given the
23	location of the school and the overall
24	requirements for the development.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 29 MARITIME USES
2	understand, let me just be clear on my question,
3	which is that if we were to approve what we're
4	looking at right now and you decide that, instead
5	of putting windows on the first floor over there,
6	cantilever it over 35th Street and decided to make
7	that a non-windowed area, you have the ability to
8	do that, is that right?
9	GREGORY SHAW: That's correct
10	[Crosstalk]
11	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:
12	[Interposing] And if you decided to move the
13	auditorium, the gymatorium, you know, a few feet
14	in a different direction or decided to eliminate
15	it in favor of additional classroom space or
16	science labs, you could do that even after our
17	approval, is that right?
18	GREGORY SHAW: Oh, absolutely
19	[Crosstalk]
20	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
21	So
22	GREGORY SHAW:yes.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:what
24	we're doing here today is approving a siting and
25	not necessarily the details of this design, is

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 30 MARITIME USES
2	that correct?
3	GREGORY SHAW: That's correct.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
5	And the reason I ask that question of course is
6	becauseand I want to talk to you about this a
7	little moreis that we want to make sure that you
8	are fully engaged with the community on the
9	subject of the details of the program and the
10	details of the design going forward, and nothing
11	that we do here in the Council is intended to
12	preclude that continued discussion, in fact, we
13	would like to insist upon it and you have, I
14	believe, agreed to do that, but we willif you
15	want to comment on that now, but we can come back
16	to that in a moment.
17	GREGORY SHAW: Yes, I'd like to
18	yes, we certainly agree to continue dialogue with
19	the Community Board number 6 regarding the design
20	as it goes forward. As a matter of fact, we have
21	in the past when Community Boards have asked for
22	continued input with respect to a design going
23	forward, we have given them an opportunity when
24	they've asked.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 31 MARITIME USES
2	[Crosstalk]
3	GREGORY SHAW: And so we are
4	certainly willing to do so and we will appoint a
5	point person as a point of contact to bring the
б	appropriate representatives before the Community
7	Board so that you will have an opportunity to have
8	some dialogue and some input.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Good
10	GREGORY SHAW: Yes.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:and
12	they will ask and we will certainly ask. In your
13	proposal, in your letters to both Mayor Bloomberg
14	and Speaker Quinn dated December 10, you note that
15	under the proposed project, the SCA would acquire
16	the privately-owned property and would construct a
17	new approximately 612-seat primary and
18	intermediate school serving students of District
19	2. Question one here is, have you acquired this
20	site?
21	GREGORY SHAW: No, we have not, we
22	could not because a precondition to acquiring a
23	site is approval of the site plan by the Mayor and
24	the Council, so if we are fortunate enough to have
25	your approval today, then we could go forward. We

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 32 MARITIME USES
2	are in contract with the developer to purchase
3	this particular property, but that contract is
4	subject to Mayor and Council approval of the site
5	plan.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
7	And is that the last obstacle that would stand
8	between you and the City's ability to perform on
9	the contract?
10	GREGORY SHAW: Yeah, yes, at this
11	particular point, that is the only condition right
12	now. The developer had some other conditions that
13	he had to comply with and he apparently has in
14	terms of subdividing the property and a few other
15	things and so this is the last condition.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Just
17	from the City's perspective, this is it.
18	GREGORY SHAW: That's right
19	[Crosstalk]
20	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
21	And the number of seats in the school that you
22	noted in your application here, you noted that it
23	was 612, now that number has moved around somewhat
24	during the course of our discussion over the last
25	two, three years. It at one point was a 708, I

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 33 MARITIME USES
2	think I remember it being, perhaps, I'm not
3	positive about this, a 640. The question that I
4	have for you today is, is this a floor or is this
5	a ceiling?
6	GREGORY SHAW: Well I'm going to
7	let Mr. Abneri answer that question in terms of
8	design.
9	ELAN ABNERI: From a practical
10	standpoint, I think we're at the maximum number of
11	seats we want to put in. As it is, we have six
12	stories and any more than that we think would be a
13	burden for the children to have to go up and down
14	the stairs, you know, all day long from class to
15	class, so we try not to go more than six stories
16	and that's where we're at now.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
18	And so that means that that is the max, you
19	believe that 612 is the max.
20	ELAN ABNERI: Yeah. It's actually
21	aroundit's a little more than that, but it's
22	around 612.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.
24	Council Member Lappin raised the issues about the
25	surrounding site future development, I think

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 34 MARITIME USES
2	everybody agrees that it is simply undesirable to
3	have a school followed by residential
4	construction, even on one side abutting the school
5	and a one side separated by a mere 40 feet.
6	During the interim period, however, before any
7	future residential development might take place
8	and for the benefit of my colleagues, this site
9	today is a gravel pit which collects water and
10	does nothing today, it's just emptyand
11	presumably most of that site will remain a gravel
12	empty pit, even after 2013 if no residential
13	construction has taken place, is that correct?
14	GREGORY SHAW: Yes, if the
15	developmentit's his property, so if he doesn't
16	develop it, we have no ability to
17	[Crosstalk]
18	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:
19	[Interposing] How will you segregate off the
20	school and its property from the gravel, wet pit
21	that it is today to ensure that students don't
22	find their way there or that members of the public
23	don't find their way there? Today, it's chained
24	off, it's got a fence, as you know, but once you
25	start opening the door here, how will you protect

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 35 MARITIME USES
2	or segregate off the school?
3	GREGORY SHAW: I'll let Mr. Abneri,
4	who's an engineer, answer that question.
5	ELAN ABNERI: The site would have
6	to remain fenced off where there's no development.
7	We'll be building a retaining wall around the
8	perimeter of our property which will protect that
9	property when any future development is done and
10	our property would be chained off so there is no
11	way that people could easily wander off.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. I
13	think that's going to be an important design
14	parameter, something that we will continue to have
15	as a conversation with the local Council Members
16	and the community.
17	Let me reiterate here that the
18	composition of this site is a point of concern and
19	this is beyond the jurisdiction of the School
20	Construction Authority, however, but we have
21	raised alarms about this with the Department of
22	City Planning, the City's Economic Development
23	Corporation, and the School Construction Authority
24	because this is an entire city block which is
25	being developed in an order that nobody really

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 36 MARITIME USES
2	expected. In fact, there were restrictions
3	written into the restrictive declaration when we
4	did the rezoning which would disallow too much
5	development before the school happened and those
6	were the rules that were put in at the time, not
7	what will happen if the school is coming in first,
8	nobody expected that to happen. So I do want to
9	say on the record that we do believe the
10	Department of City Planning should be working to
11	get a complete site plan from the developer and
12	working to do this in a way that makes sense for
13	the city, makes sense for the developer, and makes
14	sense for the school.
15	Let's talk about those future
16	conversations, however, that you were going to be
17	having with the community. First of all, did I
18	hear you correctly say that the School
19	Construction Authority is going to assign a point
20	person to discuss issues with the Community Board,
21	either in any task force or ongoing communications
22	that they wish to have?
23	GREGORY SHAW: That's correct,
24	Council Member.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Will the

	25
1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 37 MARITIME USES
2	School Construction Authority come back to the
3	Community Board and discuss the design and look
4	for improvements, get the Community Board more
5	information and a schematic design and agree to
6	work with them on their concerns and to find
7	solutions by possibly refining the design to meet
8	concerns that the Community Board has laid out?
9	GREGORY SHAW: Absolutely, Council.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Will you
11	open a constructive and meaningful dialogue with
12	the Community Board that allows them to make
13	constructive criticisms and suggest alternatives
14	that are thoroughly reviewed and considered?
15	GREGORY SHAW: Absolutely, we've
16	met with them twice and we're more than willing to
17	meet with them again.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And will
19	you do all of the foregoing requests as to the
20	local Council Members which includes me, Council
21	Member Mendez, Council Member Lappin, as well as
22	any of the state or federal officials?
23	GREGORY SHAW: Absolutely,
24	whatever, whatever you
25	[Crosstalk]

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 38 MARITIME USES
2	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:
3	[Interposing] Terrific, well thank you for that,
4	and what we would like to ask is that you
5	memorialize that in a letter to us before
6	Thursday's vote. And I will say for myself that,
7	again, this site has been viewed as a critical
8	part of the East Side's school overcrowding
9	problem and ways to deal with it and we approved
10	our rezoning contingent on the existence of a
11	school on this site, so I have no question in my
12	mind that it is absolutely an appropriate site and
13	that's the question that is presently before us.
14	And so I will be supporting the application,
15	contingent on the receipt of the letter about your
16	ongoing communication with the Community Board and
17	elected. So thank you very much, Chair Lappin.
18	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you very
19	much, Council Member Garodnick, I look forward to
20	reviewing the letter, if you could get that to
21	Council Member Garodnick tomorrow so he has a
22	chance to run that by the Community Board, that
23	would be helpful so that we can meet and vote
24	promptly on Thursday morning, that would
25	appreciated.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 39 MARITIME USES
2	GREGORY SHAW: No problem.
3	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: I wanted to
4	give Council Members Liu and Crowley the
5	opportunity to vote before we move on to other
6	questions.
7	MALE VOICE 2: Arroyo.
8	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: I'm sorry,
9	Arroyo.
10	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member
11	Liu.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: I vote yes.
13	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Council Member
14	Arroyo.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.
16	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Vote now stands
17	eight in the affirmative, none in the negative, no
18	abstentions.
19	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Council Member
20	Barron.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I just
22	wanted to caution, one, my Council Members,
23	there's something I'm working on, some legislation
24	I'm working on to see what we can do as a Council
25	to have more authority over the design and the

2 programming.

3	All that he just said to you, Dan,
4	that, yes, we'll do this, yes and do that, if they
5	want to radically change that, they can have
6	conversations with you until you turn purple, and
7	if they decide to do that, they have the power and
8	the authority to do that. I've had an instance in
9	a school in my district where it's supposed to be
10	K to 8, we had conversations, the planning board
11	didn't want it changed, I didn't want it changed,
12	nobody wanted it changed, but the Department of
13	Education decided they wanted to put a high school
14	transfer school in the building instead of the
15	elementary school, so now we have a middle school
16	and a transfer school. They said we'll only leave
17	it there for a year and then revert back. We have
18	absolutely no power no matter how nice he said
19	yesand he's a very nice guy, I like him very
20	muchbut it's irrelevant what he just said to you
21	today, totally irrelevant because if the
22	Department of Education wants to radically alter
23	this, they have the legal authority to do it. So
24	I think in the letter, if they can put a little
25	more muscle in the letter and say that, even

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 41 MARITIME USES
2	though we have the legal authority to change the
3	design and the programming without the City
4	Council, we will not exercise that authority
5	without coming forth to the City Council. It'll
6	be interesting, I don't know ifI don't think we
7	can hold them legally bound to a letter because
8	it's not a contract, but a stronger letter than I
9	will talk to you and I will sit down and have
10	conversations with you. Until we can work on some
11	legislation to hold them legally binding to come
12	back to usif in fact that could happen, I'm
13	exploring that. At least the letter should be
14	stronger, acknowledging that they have the legal
15	authority to change the design, they have the
16	legal authority to change the program, but we will
17	not exercise it out of good faith, because the
18	Council was nice enough to approve the site, we
19	will not exercise our legal power over you without
20	coming back to you and looking and dealing with
21	these changes. I think thatwould you do a
22	letter like that?
23	GREGORY SHAW: Well the only
24	problem with that, Council Member, is in fact
25	Council Member Garodnick wants us to consult with

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 42 MARITIME USES
2	the Community Board as the design goes forward, so
3	it's an evolving process, so what we're talking
4	about today, may in fact be somewhat changed in
5	consideration of what the Community Board has
6	requested.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I didn't
8	say not change it, I didn't say you couldn't
9	change it, I said that you will not exercise your
10	legal authority to change it without consultyou
11	can say the Community Board
12	MALE VOICE 3: Finalize it, or
13	finalize it.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:or to
15	finalize it without the Community Board, without
16	the consent of the Council. So it doesn't
17	preclude from doing all that you just mentioned,
18	you can go ahead and talk to the Community Board,
19	you can even make changes, but this letter will
20	say that you will not exercise your legal
21	authority without the approval to do that, without
22	the approval of the Council and the Community
23	Board and anybody else that the local
24	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: [Interposing]
25	Okay.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 43 MARITIME USES
2	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:Council
3	Members
4	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you,
5	Council Member Barron for that, and that's duly
6	noted.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What am
8	[Off mic]
9	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:duly
10	noted, I know you noted it.
11	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Well we'll
12	take a look at the draft and what they sent us
13	and
14	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I just want
15	to see whatI just wanted to see if he would be
16	willing to do that.
17	GREGORY SHAW: I can't answer that
18	rightin that fashion, Council Member Barron,
19	other than to say that the issue that you had
20	raised previously which it was a change in the use
21	of the school from an elementary school to a high
22	school is different than what you're asking now.
23	When you're talking about interior design, one of
24	the things that Council Member Garodnick had
25	mentioned in his initial comments or questions

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 44 MARITIME USES
2	regarding what I was presenting was thewhat
3	we're presenting today is not going to hold us if
4	we're going to change classrooms around or move
5	things around in the interior of the building
6	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
7	[Interposing] No, I understand the difference
8	between program and design, I'm not confused on
9	that at all. My concernand pardon me, Chair
10	Lappin, if I just explore this a little further
11	and I know the difference between program and
12	design, but your authority to do this without, you
13	know, evenyou don't even have to consult us to
14	do this right now. I just wanted to see if you
15	would be willing'cause this could be setting a
16	precedence of what we do, not just for your area,
17	but for what happens in the future, if the letter
18	could be stronger and saying we will not exercise
19	our legal authority to change the design or the
20	program without consulting the community and the
21	Council Members and getting their approval.
22	GREGORY SHAW: I'm afraid that I
23	have no authority to make that commitment to you,
24	Council Member.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So who

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 45 MARITIME USES
2	does?
3	GREGORY SHAW: First of all, in
4	terms of program, that is coming from the
5	Department of Education
6	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All right,
7	what about design, do you have authority over
8	that?
9	GREGORY SHAW: No, I don't have
10	authority over design, I can't
11	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
12	[Interposing] So you could just give a letter
13	that
14	GREGORY SHAW: [Interposing] Well
15	the letter will be what the Council Member
16	Garodnick has asked for, which is to have a
17	serious
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
19	[Interposing] Of conversations
20	GREGORY SHAW:dialogue
21	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:with no
22	authority.
23	GREGORY SHAW:and with
24	consultation with the community. I'll give you an
25	example, one of the things that the Community

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 46 MARITIME USES
2	Board had expressed interest in or question was
3	why is the entrance on 35th Street. Well that's
4	one of the things we're going to discuss with
5	them, but if you look at the site, it's either
6	going to be on 35th Street or it's going to on
7	First Avenue, and that's an issue of safety, so
8	that's one of the things we would have a dialogue
9	with them.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, you
11	can have a dialogue, but I'm looking atbut if
12	the community decided First Avenue and you decided
13	34th Street, that's it.
14	GREGORY SHAW: Well if you're
15	talking about the safety of children
16	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
17	[Interposing] And, and we
18	[Crosstalk]
19	GREGORY SHAW:if we're talking
20	about safety of children, yes, then
21	[Crosstalk]
22	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
23	[Interposing] Okay, but even in the design, if
24	Daniel wanted the gym on the first floor and so
25	did the Community Board and so did everybody, and

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 47 MARITIME USES
2	you said no, we're going to put it on the sixth
3	floor, the fifth floor, that's what could happen
4	because you have the authority, and I'm just
5	saying that some of that authority needs to be
б	given up because if you don't, then the
7	conversations are nice conversations, but the
8	bottom line, you're going to do what you want to
9	do.
10	GREGORY SHAW: But if you're
11	talking about design criteria, it's not just we're
12	doing what we want to do, you're working within
13	the confines of what the program is and the size
14	of the building, so if
15	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
16	[Interposing] No, I understand all of that, but
17	when the dust clears and you have a difference
18	with the Council Members, when the dust clears,
19	understanding designthe height of the building
20	and all of that, when the dust clears, if there's
21	a conflict and the Council Members don't want that
22	and you do want it, you will exercise your legal
23	authority to do what you want to do in the context
24	of the design, I know if you can't do nothing out
25	of the context of the design of the building, so

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 48 MARITIME USES
2	I'm not talking about that.
3	GREGORY SHAW: We would respond to
4	any request of
5	[Crosstalk]
6	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
7	[Interposing] I know you will, no furthergo
8	ahead, now you can do your thing that you said
9	before.
10	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Okay. I just
11	have one last questiondid you have a question,
12	Leroy? Oh, Rosie has a question.
13	[Off mic]
14	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: You don't have
15	to have a question, Leroy
16	[Crosstalk]
17	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN:but you can
18	if you want to.
19	[Off mic]
20	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: You mentioned
21	the contract of sale, what are we paying for this
22	property?
23	GREGORY SHAW: Thirty-three
24	million, 250.
25	[Pause]

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 49 MARITIME USES
2	[Off mic]
3	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And what do we
4	anticipate the cost of construction to be?
5	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [Off mic]
6	got \$14 billion
7	[Pause]
8	MALE VOICE 4: [Off mic] 60
9	million?
10	MALE VOICE 5: That's chump change.
11	[Pause]
12	GREGORY SHAW: Sixty, seventy
13	million.
14	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Okay. Council
15	Member Mendez.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I'm sorry,
17	
	Chair Lappin, your question was?
18	Chair Lappin, your question was? COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much
18 19	
	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much was the property.
19 20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much was the property. CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: How much is
19 20 21	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much was the property. CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: How much is the price of the property.
19 20 21 22	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much was the property. CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: How much is the price of the property. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Sixty,
19 20 21 22 23	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: How much was the property. CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: How much is the price of the property. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Sixty, seventy million?

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 50 1 MARITIME USES sixty. 2 ELAN ABNERI: No, that's probably--3 I think it's probably, construction will probably 4 5 be around--6 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: [Interposing] 7 I asked, right, price--ELAN ABNERI: --fifty million. 8 9 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: -- of property, 33 million--10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Right. CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: --estimate on 12 13 construction costs, and you said 50 million? Fifty to 60 million. 14 15 GREGORY SHAW: Approximately. 16 [Off mic] 17 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: So what a 18 school costs you say is 100 million bucks. 19 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: In 20 Manhattan. 21 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: In Manhattan. 22 Council Member Mendez. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, 24 Chair Lappin. Council Member Barron had asked a 25 couple of questions, but he also--you said you

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 51 MARITIME USES
2	weren't in charge of construction, is that the
3	School Construction Authority that's got the final
4	approval on construction?
5	GREGORY SHAW: Yes.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Okay. I
7	want to get back to the wet gravel pit 'cause I
8	pass it every day, it's across the street from my
9	district and I, you know, I was taking down some
10	notes so I didn't hear everything, but that area
11	is owned by the developer, but this will be an
12	attractive nuisance. I remember what I did in
13	middle school, which is in the Broadway Triangle
14	and still hasn't been developed, but anyway,
15	another story.
16	[Off mic]
17	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: It's up? I
18	used to, during gym time, cross the street and go
19	into the empty lot and then I'll stop right there.
20	So what is the Department of Education's
21	responsibility then to make this attractive
22	nuisance not so attractive, particularly I think
23	to the older students who are going to be there.
24	GREGORY SHAW: I think we had
25	indicated we'll have a retaining wall and then the

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 52 MARITIME USES
2	kids will be fenced in, but other than that,
3	there's not too much we can do with someone else's
4	property. We don't have control over it, we can
5	only control the areas that we have. The way the
6	school is designed, it's designed in such a
7	fashion that the kids should not bethey don't
8	enter in that area.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: So it will
10	be a retaining wall.
11	MALE VOICE 1: And fence.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: And fence.
13	ELAN ABNERI: The retaining wall is
14	to make up the difference between the level of the
15	pit now and grade level and the fence will be
16	about 16 feet high in the playground area, so it
17	more than high enough to keep people out or in.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: And the
19	retaining wall goes high enough that the school
20	children won't be able to grab the fence and then
21	jump over, or we don't know yet, we're still
22	ELAN ABNERI: [Interposing] We
23	frequently install a very tight mesh fence, it has
24	very small openings, it difficult to get any kind
25	of foothold. I mean where there's a will, there's

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 53 MARITIME USES
2	a way, you can
3	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Yeah.
4	ELAN ABNERI:scale anything,
5	but
6	MALE VOICE 1: [Interposing] The
7	retaining wall will only come up to grade, the
8	base floor of the playground, from there up will
9	be a 16 foot high fence. The retaining wall is
10	merely to get the hole up to level
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Okay.
12	MALE VOICE 1:with the street.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I see
14	issues, that's all I'm going to say. You know,
15	you can break the fence, I've climbed on those
16	when I was in better shape, put my fingers in
17	those little small things and climbed up.
18	So I certainly look forward to
19	working with my colleague Council Member Garodnick
20	and with the Community Board. This has been a
21	site that they've been looking at for nine years
22	or so when the Con Ed facility was still there, so
23	they've been very involved in this and have a lot
24	of knowledge about this and are very concerned.
25	So I look forward to the continuing conversations

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 54 MARITIME USES
2	about the future plans and look forward to this
3	letter and for us voting for a site coming up on
4	Thursday.
5	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Agreed, and I
6	think it's certainly in the city's best interest
7	for ultimately this entire parcel to be developed
8	and we hope it will be, but we know that these are
9	tough financial times for many in this industry,
10	so who knows what the long term prognosis is.
11	Thank you very much, there is one
12	other person signed up to testify on this item
13	who's representing Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney,
14	Dara Adams, is Dara still here?
15	[Off mic]
16	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Great.
17	[Pause]
18	[Off mic]
19	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, Council
20	Member Arroyo, I don't think you were here when I
21	mentioned we're meeting again Thursday morning
22	both to vote on this and one other item.
23	[Off mic]
24	[Pause]
25	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Go ahead,

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 55 MARITIME USES
2	introduce yourself for the record and begin, Dara.
3	DARA ADAMS: Good afternoon, Chair
4	Lappin, I'm Dara Adams, representing Congresswoman
5	Maloney. Thank you so much for giving me the
6	opportunity to represent her here this afternoon.
7	I offer testimony in support of a
8	new 612-seat primary/intermediary public school
9	facility at 616 First Avenue. Congresswoman's
10	been advocating to site a school on the Con Edison
11	Waterside development since she first learned that
12	Con Edison would be vacating the space in 2000.
13	She's excited that the School Construction
14	Authority is finalizing their purchase of Lot 1
15	and has announced an intended opening of the
16	school in September of 2013.
17	She first testified about the need
18	for a public school in the Waterside development
19	at a public hearing on September 26, 2002, before
20	the Public Service Commission. At the time, she
21	had heard from the community that District 2
22	elementary schools were at 90% capacity and that
23	there was a very real concern that a new
24	development meant to attract thousands of
25	residents to the neighborhood would overburden our

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 56 MARITIME USES
2	already overcrowded schools.
3	At a hearing the following year on
4	the supplemental draft Generic Environmental
5	Impact Statement, the New York City Board of
6	Education projected that P.S. 116, which is
7	located in the heart of the Waterside development
8	area on 33rd Street, would reach 103 capacity by
9	2007 without the new Waterside development. At
10	the time, she testified that these numbers lag
11	behind reality and, sure enough, over the next six
12	years, more than 30 new residential buildings were
13	constructed in the P.S. 116 catchment zone and
14	P.S. 116 reached 113% capacity in 2008.
15	Accordingly, residents in the neighborhood have
16	expressed great excitement about a new school
17	coming on-line to alleviate the overcrowding.
18	I have seen Congressmanrather, I
19	have seen plans for this site change over the past
20	ten years. According to the original plans, some
21	2,000 to 4,000 additional residential units should
22	already have been constructed by 2007, as Council
23	Member Garodnick alluded to. Clearly the
24	development is a little behind schedule. The
25	uncertainty as to when private development will be

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 57 MARITIME USES
2	completed on this site is a cause of concern to
3	residents who worry that the new school will be
4	completed and open for business first, leaving
5	children vulnerable to dangers associated with the
6	construction site, as the Council Members have
7	mentioned.
8	In the past three years, my
9	district has witnessed two catastrophic crane
10	accidents and other serious construction
11	incidents. With that in mind, the Congresswoman
12	strongly encourages the city to take all steps
13	necessary to ensure that development of the site
14	will be as holistic as possible. She will also
15	work with the community and local elected
16	officials to ensure that any opportunity to
17	minimize the impact of construction on the
18	students and area residents will be implemented.
19	Thank you.
20	CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you,
21	Dara. We appreciate the Congresswoman's testimony
22	and her support of this school and her advocacy on
23	behalf of the families in the neighborhood. Thank
24	you.
25	DARA ADAMS: Thank you so much,

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & 58 MARITIME USES
I'll share that with her.
CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: With that,
this hearing is closed and this meeting will be
recessed until Thursday morning at 9:30, and the
vote is now closed.

## CERTIFICATE

I, Tammy Wittman, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature\_\_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_December 21, 2009\_\_\_