

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

January 29, 2020
Start: 10:17 a.m.
Recess: 1:37 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Ydanis Rodriguez
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ydanis Rodriguez
Fernando Cabrera
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Deborah L. Rose

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Liza Martinez
Families for Safe Streets

Islin Dehansen
Families for Safe Streets

Melody Bryan
Families for Safe Streets

Amy Kahn
Families for Safe Streets

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner
New York City Department of
Transportation

Julia Kite-Laidlaw
Director of Strategic Initiatives in
Policy Division
New York City Department of
Transportation

William Morris
Chief of Transportation Bureau
New York Police Department

Michael Clark
Managing Attorney
Legislative Affairs Unit

Rebecca Zack
Associate Commissioner
Intergovernmental Affairs
DOT

Keith Kerman
Deputy Commissioner
DCAS

Noah Genel
Commissioner
Business Integrity Commission

Captain Eric Werby
NYPD

Mark O'Connor
Deputy Director
Transportation Alternatives

Eric McClure
Executive Director
StreetsPAC

Zach Miller
Testifying on behalf of Kendra Hems
President of the Trucking Association of
New York

Holish Vaud

Katherine Willis
Co-chair
Brooklyn Activist Committee for
Transportation Alternatives

Richard Robbins

Scarlet Nunez

@

STEVEN SIDOWSKI: This is a microphone check. Today's date is January 29, 2020, on the Committee on Transportation, recorded by Steven Sidowski.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [audio starts in mid sentence] from a law enforcement perspective. Good morning and welcome to today's hearing of the council's Committee on Transportation. I'm Ydanis Rodriguez, the chair of the committee. Today we [inaudible] an oversight hearing on improving safety, improving the streets and vehicle safety. This year unfortunately we started seeing nine pedestrians killed, without counting any numbers beside those that we have if there's anyone that we [inaudible] in the last couple of days or couple of hours. Unfortunately this is where we are. We can be conducting this hearing and there's a crash going on and, and that's, you know, what we are dealing with in the city. But again, at least nine pedestrians being killed, was killed, being killed at the beginning of this year. Many of them were killed by large multi-ton vehicles. The largest vehicles can pose a larger danger compared to average-size cars going at similar speeds. Many times trucks fail to

1 have adequate technology and safety measures, like
2 [inaudible] which can save lives. For this reason we
3 are here today because we believe that the number of
4 vehicle crashes occurring in the city must be treated
5 as an emergency. And today I'm asking, I'm calling
6 the City of New York to declare the deaths of
7 pedestrians and cyclists we have seen in recent year
8 as an emergency, and we should be asking for any
9 additional resources. We should be asking for any
10 additional resources, that means from the state, from
11 the federal [inaudible] city we have no doubt we have
12 great leadership at DOT. We have great leadership
13 and commitment from the NYPD and, and for other
14 agency, DCAS, but this cannot, you know, this cannot
15 continue happening under our watch. When we interact
16 with Families for Safe Streets we don't know who, who
17 is gonna be the new member and that member, that
18 family can be my family, the family can be any us of
19 here, anyone recording before, behind the camera or
20 writing the story, or anyone who is elected private
21 or public. So I feel that, again, we will hear, we
22 know that we have make a lot of progress, but I think
23 that we need to declare this situation as a situation
24 of emergency. Over the past couple of months there

1 have been a series of crashes that have taken
2 precious human life from many of our family. Towards
3 the end of December 2019 we heard that six
4 pedestrians who were struck and killed in a matter of
5 three days. That particular day, one of those days
6 was crazy. And I know it was a tough day for
7 everyone. I remember listening the news about the
8 mother in Queens taking her 10-year-old to school. I
9 went there with Council Member Moya visiting the
10 site. As we were there someone showed me the text
11 from my staff saying that there was another killed as
12 we were talking there in Brooklyn, and I thought it
13 was a sad day, two people being killed. That's what
14 I shared with someone. And suddenly we heard that
15 another person was also killed, eh, eh, some by
16 trucks, involving a big vehicle, three of them, all
17 those three that day. So then we have started off
18 this year with four pedestrians getting killed during
19 the first week of 2020, including again, as I said,
20 the 10-year-old. In mid January we learned that
21 three pedestrians had been killed in separate crashes
22 within a span of 48 hours. Something needs to be
23 done and I mean more than what we have done. We have
24 done a lot of thing as a result of all of us working
25

together, as a result of what TA Families for Safe Streets advocate, City Hall, the council has been doing it, private sector. But we need to do more. We need to think outside the box and that's what I would like to, you know, hear from whoever come and testify. I'm not into the data, all the good things that we're doing. I'm into thinking about, trying to listen what more are we ready to do to deal with this emergency. And that's why I said that this is an emergency and should be as, as such. Due to all this vehicle crashes, eh, we recently convened a round table at City Hall with various trucks industry, stakeholders, and city agencies to discuss what else can be done to address this safety crisis. It became apparent to me that we aren't doing enough and we must push all the stakeholders to increase safety measures. It is unacceptable that trucks operating in our city and across our nation do not have advanced safety features, like sensors that can warn drivers if there is someone on the side or back of their vehicles. And this [inaudible] that the majority of the private sanitation trucks operating in our city still do not have the side guard that needs to be installed on all the trucks, so far we

1 have by 2024. I am calling today for that date to be
2 expedited and all the trucks should be working to
3 install the side guard by 2022. And hopefully they
4 make it top priority. That's a few thousand dollars.
5 OK, that's not much. We're not talking about
6 \$20,000, \$15,000. It's a few grand that they have to
7 spend. If anyone wants to be part of the solution we
8 should be aiming to have all trucks with the side
9 guard by the end of this year. That's how much
10 aggressive we should be, starting with the trucks on
11 the DCAS and then going on the private sector. 2020
12 should be the year to have all vehicles of side guard
13 installed. I have been advocating to make this
14 sooner. This is not the first time that bring this
15 to the table. I hope that cost is not preventing
16 them from installing the potentially life-saving
17 features. Many other country mandate that vehicle
18 manufacturers install side guard before they go onto
19 the street. That's the rule, that's the law in
20 Europe. By their own law, all trucks, all
21 manufacturers that not only sell trucks in Europe,
22 but also they sell trucks here in the United States,
23 they don't have to install the sensors in those
24 vehicle because the federal law doesn't mandate for
25

1 them to do it. We must also be supporting the
2 bipartisan federal legislation led by Senator
3 Gillibrand and Marcos Rubios, that is calling, it's
4 called a Stop on the Right Act, which would pressure
5 vehicle manufacturers to install on the right guard
6 on trucks. We must also ensure that the pedestrians
7 walking light are not, as not [inaudible] to go as
8 the same time the cars can make turns. We have, we
9 have many, we've been doing that, I know that we will
10 hear from our commissioner. We know that there are
11 many intersections that they already are the light
12 and are organizing that way. Yes, they are
13 [inaudible] in Riverdale close to the 2600
14 Netherland. That's like six intersections there and
15 I'm pretty sure that this is something that DOT been
16 able to reorganize the light, for, separate the time
17 for pedestrians and, and drivers. We also know that
18 there's many other intersections that's that how the
19 timing is separated. So when I pass by there there's
20 like 15 seconds that is all for pedestrians. We can
21 call in the dancing bar, we can call in other turn,
22 but the idea is to separate the time from pedestrians
23 and drivers. Just think about with drivers coming
24 here, when they turn, make a right, a park, we should
25

not give the light for the driver to make a right and for pedestrians too close. If we continue expanding what the DOT is doing in some intersection, that they're separating the light, I'm pretty sure that we will see a big reduction also or crashes become more crashes happen in intersections. We need to ensure, we need to ensure pedestrians are protected at all intersections. Despite all our effort through Vision Zero initiatives, pedestrians and cyclists are still very much in danger. We need to come up with concrete solutions to reduce the number of fatalities occurring our city street. It is my hope that during today's hearing we will continue the dialogue that began during the round table section a couple of weeks ago. And I would like to thank City Hall, DOT, and DCAS for putting the players together and also the private sector, and I think it was a productive conversation. We need to address how those private sector that own the trucks, eh, eh, they do more than what they doing right now. Before I ask the committee counsel to administer the oath, I would like to recognize my colleagues here, Council Member Cabrera, Council Member Diaz who are here with us today. Eh, so I would like first to ask the Families

for Safe Streets to come and be the first one sharing their experience and then we will call the administration.

LIZA MARTINEZ: OK. Hello everyone.

Thank you all for being here and thank you for allowing me and the other members Families for Safe Streets to speak first today. It is so important that everyone in this room and beyond here what I have to say. And you know the torture, pain, and heartache this epidemic of traffic crashes are causing. My name is Lisa Martinez and on September 27, 2019, my dear sweet beautiful healthy mother, Ada Martz, became the 177th New Yorker to be killed in a traffic crash in 2019. She was the 26th cyclist killed last year. Ada was an amazing devoted mother to three of us, a proud grandmother to seven kids, a loving wife, a dear, dear friend to too many to count. She was our family matriarch and our family was so secure with her, and she was a connector and brought everyone together. She loved to spend time on the boardwalk near my parents' home in the Rockaways and she danced and she danced and she loved to dance, and she was the love of my father's life, and the two of them had a marriage that was the envy

and admiration of all who knew them. My mother was 66 years old and she had a vibrancy of someone 26. She brought life and positivity to everyone around her and she was a community leader and force, and she was two steps away from completing the American dream, and she moved to New York, when she moved here from Puerto Rico together with my dad and started a family business and a hardware store in Bedford Stuyvesant, Brooklyn for 38 years and put me and my siblings through college. They were all getting ready to retire and spend more time in the sunshine of Puerto Rico and basking in all that they have accomplished. But on the evening of September 27, after she and my father biked to Rockaway Pier to enjoy the sunset, only 10 blocks from their home, she was struck by an ambulette that weighs 10,000 pounds and she was stolen from us that day. We are all lost without my mother. My mom was a healthy woman who took care of her body and she had many years more to go. But she was stolen from us that night and we feel like she was murdered by a weapon and by a dangerous road, by our public servants who have let my family down and whoever is responsible for making sure our systems work and, ah, how can our city be so

unsafe? I would not let my mother's name go down in vain and everything she did was from a place of love and understanding and that's why I'm here today. We should not have to live in the most beautiful city and fear for our lives each day. There should be a way for us to safely coexist, cars, people, children, getting to work, getting to school. People say the best part of New York City is the people. And my mother was one of the best. Shouldn't the main responsibility of our mayor and our public servants is to be keep our people alive. Please, I plead with you to protect us and I don't understand what could possibly be more important than keeping us safe. I am sure you would want to protect your mother, your family, and sadly no one was able to protect mine and that is why I'm here today. Our mother and grandmother is gone. And she's not here to help me through life's challenges. She's not here to play with my children, and a piece of our father has died as well because his heartache is immeasurable. Biking alongside here, can you imagine how distraught he has been to not be able to save the life of his, the love of his life? For all of our lives we watched how much he loved her and now watching his

sadness is unbearable, and there is nothing we can do to make him feel better. How can our city be letting this happen? How can our city afford to lose a loving person who loved bagels with cream cheese and getting the coffee every single morning and picking up garbage off the streets and helping others and making a bowl of soup and her famous sofrito. My mother, Ada Martinez, inspired me and gave me the courage to be here today. But I am here today for all of you and all your family that you never have to stand here to speak about your mother or spouse or child or friend because this is a nightmare that I live with forever and I beg you and I'm telling you I beg you because I humbly be here to beg you 'cause I know we don't always beg for things in life, but I am because I'm humble and I have no ego and I have agenda besides helping to save lives today. So please be a leader and take action now. I urge you to implement without delay the known measures it will keep New Yorkers safe, New York City's trucks and large vehicles, like the ambulettes that killed my mother should not be able to speed down our streets and New York City should be a leader in car and truck safety standards. There are so many solutions, like

speed governors that others will talk about. Everyone deserves that. My mother would do it for anyone here in this room, for your family, for your cousin, and for your friend. Thank you. And today, this is just from me, today I, I, I asked to have strength to come here today to do my work and I just ask you to do your job in, in bringing this together, please. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Your mother, you know that she's gotta be in a place there now helping us to continue making justice, so we're sorry for what [break in continuity of audio]

ISLIN DEHANSEN: Good morning. My name is Islin Dehansen and I'm a member of Families for Safe Streets. My life has been forever altered because of a preventable crash. I share my story now in detail so you can begin to understand the impact this crash has had on me. And I know I look fine and I know that I sound pretty fine. But I don't really sound as I used to. My speech is different. I'm one of thousands of people severely injured in New York City every year. Ah, many are killed, and no one should suffer the life-altering injuries I have. No one should be killed. This is urgent and we have an

1 epidemic on our hands. I knew it before I was hit
2 and now there's no question. I knew the streets were
3 wild. Shortly before 4:00 p.m. on May 23, 2018, on a
4 beautiful peaceful spring day as I crossed East 82nd
5 Street between First and Second Avenue there was
6 nobody there that I could see. Ah, a reckless driver
7 backing up quickly to snag a spot crashed straight
8 into me. I went unconscious. As I was told by one
9 of my witnesses, because I have no memory of this
10 crash, the center of the car's bumper forcibly struck
11 my left side, lacerated my elbow, hitting my fibula.
12 My head smacked against the pavement as I fell to the
13 ground. Bleeding from my head and nauseated, I was
14 taken to Columbia New York Presbyterian Hospital by
15 ambulance. The hemorrhaging was staunch and a
16 skull laceration stapled. After x-rays and CT scans
17 I was moved to the ICU, where I remained overnight.
18 I was discharged late the next day with contusions.
19 I was diagnosed with a concussion and traumatic, is
20 there something, my, my attention span is short and
21 when I see everybody talking I don't know if I'm
22 doing anything wrong. You're here? OK. Um, I was
23 diagnosed with a concussion and traumatic
24 subarachnoid hemorrhage. I was later diagnosed with
25

a fractured fibula and loss of range of motion in my neck. One month later on June 22 after spending considerable time locating a neurologist who took No-Fault medical insurance, which was a feat, I was examined by a neurologist at New York Langone, who said I had functional deficits caused by the concussion and they were considerable. Among the myriad of issues he noted the following: Dizziness, imbalance, nausea, lack of focus, partial loss of short-term memory, binocular vision defects, and a week later after a brain MRI I was diagnosed with a subdural hematoma, aphasia, a pronounced stammer subsequently developed. The neurologist assured me that my distressing short-term memory issues would resolve with treatment. He referred me to outpatient assessments and subsequent treatments at Rusk Concussion Center. The treatments included vision therapy, vestibular therapy, physical therapy, and eventually speech and cognitive therapy. However, two months later, ah, it takes times to get into the system at Rusk, so two months later, just as I was, ah had begun vestibular therapy I fell. I got dizzy in my street and fell and fractured both arms and my metatarsal. I was in absolute pain. I was taken to,

ah, to NYU Emergency Room and spent 10 hours there and left with a huge boot CAM and two splints on my arms. Then I had to find a doctor who took No-Fault again to care for, ah, my arms and legs. Not only could I not walk, but I also couldn't think, I couldn't plan, I could barely look at my emails. I could not hold a piece of paper. Calls went unanswered. I was in a fog with pain permeating my being. Stammering made it difficult for me to speak. Finally after my bones were healed enough for me to return to Rusk I did. I diligently performed my exercises seven days a week. After months of treatment I was cautioned that my brain might not ever return to baseline. A series of external factors may have intruded. I was stunned, yet I had not reason to doubt the prognosis. My aphasia, although somewhat remedied, continued to haunt me. This gregarious human had been transformed into a quiet what I call violet. My work, my work in film, I work in film, requires a great deal of writing. I'm on my own. Ah, I'm known in my field for being highly knowledgeable, well-connected, quick on my feet, my opinion is valued, clients hire me for these assets. However, today my processing speed is slow.

1 So, for example, it took me three times longer to
2 write this testimony than it would have prior to the
3 crash. It could take me days to mentally access
4 information that previously took me seconds. I
5 continued to relearn what was basic, such as grammar,
6 math, street signs, and the location of Trader Joe's
7 on 14th Street. I ask myself every day if I will
8 ever fully retrieve my brain. Will I remember
9 yesterday? Will my broken brain be fixed? And to
10 make matters worse getting treatment was particularly
11 challenging given the limited number of neurological
12 medical providers available through No-Fault
13 insurance. I found one affiliated with a hospital
14 and receiving care compensation has been another
15 challenge. Our system is broken. These are
16 challenges many people cannot take on and don't. I
17 did. They give up. I don't want them to. And so to
18 conclude, ah, no one should ever give up, because of
19 obstacles such as these that have been placed in
20 their paths. No one's life should forever be changed
21 or ended because of traffic crashes. No one, vision,
22 sorry, Vision Zero is in crisis. The mayor and
23 council need to act now and give this epidemic the
24 urgency it requires. We need to be designing our
25

streets for people, fund and expedite the master plan, put in daylighting and intersections to make it safe for pedestrians to cross the street. Adopt speed governors, and so much more, as you know. Others share the details on these solutions, but I am here to urge you to take these actions now, please. And, very finally, knowing nearly achieved Vision Zero this year, but they vowed to double down to prevent the suffering of people like me. They did not give up, but are fighting harder. Please, fight harder. Thank you.

MELODY BRYAN: Hi, my name is Melody Bryant. Thank you for the opportunity to give my testimony today. I'm a lifelong New Yorker, bike rider, member of Families for Safe Streets, and a videographer trying to make a difference in traffic deaths. As someone whose father was killed in a car crash when I was seven my mission has been to tell the stories of some of our Families for Safe Streets members whose activism and heroism in the face of unspeakable tragedy have made such a difference in saving lives. But this year I haven't been able to get a single story out because I found myself racing from vigil to vigil to show up for and mourn victims

of traffic violence. It feels like Vision Zero is on life support. Cyclist Robin Heitman was killed around the corner from me. I found out about it through texts from friends checking that I was OK. I raced to the site, grabbing my Families for Safe Streets T-shirt, a bouquet of memorial flowers, and zip ties to put them up. I found Robin's roommate and good friend sobbing in each other's arms in shock and disbelief with Robin's bike still on the street. Robin, 20 years old, was a gifted cyclist who had just been accepted into a program to mentor troubled kids. Her name was whispered, their name was whispered as a potential Olympic competitor. They were killed by a box truck driver who claimed he didn't, he didn't know he'd hit them. But Robin's wasn't the only vigil I attended. I also went to the vigil for Chaim Joseph on Eighth Avenue, killed by an oil truck, and Long Island City for Robert Spencer, whose favorite motto, I learned, was safety first. Messenger Aurelia Lawrence in Brooklyn, artist Deborah Freeland in Bushwick, yoga instructor M. Somolowitz in Sunset Park, and recently beloved pediatrician Daniel Kamerman on the 96th transverse, and this was just a quarter of the cyclists killed

last year. Most were hit, as you know, by trucks, and most, like my friend, Jamie Johnson, killed in Washington Heights in the '80s, had no bike infrastructure at all to protect them. When I look at what is happening in Madrid or Barcelona or Paris or Amsterdam or Stockholm or Copenhagen or Oslo, which this year actually achieved the goal of zero death from traffic violence, I'm embarrassed for New York. Our street fatalities are at a 20-year high. The climate crisis is bearing down on our coastal city. Why are we not in panic mode? The time is now to take Vision Zero seriously. We need strong fleet safety measures, implementation of speed governors in the city fleet, dash cams for enforcement, requiring the same companies from, from, ah, the same from companies that do business with the city, and we need smaller trucks. I don't wanna see one more 53-foot truck in New York and I see them all the time. To do this and to address our dangerous and inequitable streets true commitment to Vision Zero requires funding above and beyond what has been allocated for the green wave. And the mayor and the DOT must be held accountable for swift implementation. We're also asking you, the City Council, to step up and

1
2 fund the street's master plan quickly so it can be
3 ready to go on day one. This year, as you know,
4 there have already been nine fatalities on our
5 streets, and while I was waiting to come in here two
6 more pedestrians were hit in Soho by an out-of-
7 control taxi. If we don't want to continue this
8 trend we have to do better. Let's make Vision Zero a
9 real vision for New York. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Being joined also
11 by Council Member Koo. We are gonna be calling the
12 administration up, but do you have any questions for
13 them, or for, just one question.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: First of all,
15 let me just say that, ah, you know, I hear your
16 heart, your heart-wrenching and compelling, ah,
17 testimony. Um, I'm sure it shook everybody in this
18 room. Ah, what I wanted to know is, and now we're
19 gonna hear the administration and ironically this
20 afternoon we're having a 1 o'clock hearing I would
21 love to see, ah, those, ah, who are interested
22 talking about dash cams that you mentioned, ah, in
23 sanitation trucks. I, I'm carrying that bill, ah,
24 and I need your help. I need your help, ah, to
25 advocate, ah, for that bill, ah, because it keeps

everybody honest. But my, I, I work in concrete steps so please help me understand what are the action steps that you are asking us to do in order that we could turn it into or legislation? So one is the dash cam. Ah, what are the other steps?

AMY KAHN: Hi, my name is Amy Kahn. I'm one of the founders of Families for Safe Streets. And I just want to share that it breaks my heart that I spend my weeks welcoming into our ranks more and more members. We bring more people every time to share their heartache. Um, the council has made many steps forward. We're grateful that you passed, you know, the Master Plan bill. It shouldn't be starting in 2022, but if it is then it needs to hit the ground running. The number one thing you can do is to design our streets for safety, through the master plan, and enhancements to it of street safety, like the council member has mentioned, daylighting, Barns Dance, you know, the intersection so you can only either walk or turn, but not the two at the same times. Those are the most important things you can do to save lives, to prevent these crashes. In addition, as, as the council member, ah, the chair mentioned this morning, um, a huge number of the

1 deaths on our streets are because our vehicles are
2 too big for a pedestrian-dense city like New York and
3 we need to be reducing the number of trucks on our
4 streets and those that are there, um, have to have
5 every safety measure. So we should be having
6 transplantation hubs for, for delivery, curbside
7 management to make it safer to, for, for deliveries
8 and encourage alternative ways of doing smaller
9 fleet, smaller delivery things, even cargo bikes and
10 things like that, because trucks are killing people.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So what, what
14 about, if I may, what about, ah, what about, ah, and
15 I don't know where we are with the technology when it
16 comes to trucks but, you know, regular cars they have
17 these sensors that automatically when they sense that
18 there is a person who is too close automatically
19 makes the stop, ah, especially when you're talking
20 about the blind spots. Ah, is, is to your knowledge
21 is there technology regarding that 'cause I know, I
22 know you, you look into all these remedies.

23 AMY KAHN: You reminded me, I left out
24 one big one when you asked what you can do next, so
25 in addition to funding the master plan, redesigning

our streets for safety, the other is technology and, and I will, I will share a different technology, which is speed governors. Europe is mandating by speed governors by 2022 in every single vehicle in the entire European Union. Here in New York we should be taking that same stand and you can do that today by mandating it in all city fleet vehicles and vehicles under contract with the city, all of the private carters that are so dangerous, all of the for-hire vehicles. Speeding is the number one cause of traffic fatalities. That's why New York lowered its speed limit. We have the speed camera program. And the third step will be to, to prevent the cars that we can from speeding and, and just on that a lot of people have questions about ambulettes or ambulances or polices. In an emergency it has a manual override. The technology exists and it will certainly be perfected if it's going to be in every single European country. Um, we need to be using it here to every capacity that we can.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you for all you do and, ah, thank you for your leadership, um, and Mr. Chair, I'm looking forward working with you to making these things happen.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I just want to express my shock, my sorrow, my sadness to hear Ms. Linda, Ms. Martinez, Ms. Linda Hansen, and Melody Bryan expressing their pain and the way, for the way in which they lost their loved one. Mr. Chair, when I was a state senator in 2013 my lawyer, my legislature advisor, Mr. Christopher Lin, who used to be, ah, [inaudible] transportation commissioner. He lost his nephew, ah, in the corner of 113th Street and Third Avenue, right in front of the public school where a truck turning in the corner, Chris lost his, his nephew. Gray was the commissioner before that with, with Mr. Rudy Giuliani. He came up idea of putting rails into the rear tires. [inaudible] we introduced a bill to do that. But a bunch of lawyer came and they said that was illegal because you cannot do that because when truck going for state to state if [inaudible] laws and you put something here it would not be accepted in all the state and my colleagues, the State Senate, they didn't move ahead with that pole. Today and day after day we keep hearing here in the City of New York try it. Ah, news and family like the ladies that came, that are

before us today, ah, expressing their sorrows and their loss, and I think that is time, the time is, it's overdue for us to do something about it, ah, so I'm not really...

AMY KAHN: If New York mandated things the country will follow. We are a leader, this is my home, I love this city, and we are the ones who transform other places. We can and we must require side guards and security cameras, and I don't know the detail on that, but somebody else here probably will and will answer it for you, and I just want to express my gratitude for the, to the chair for letting us share our stories first for the administration officials to hear this, to remind them every day this is why they need to act with urgency. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. And, and it is the law, we passed a law in the city, ah, introduced by us, signed by the mayor, implemented by DCAS and DOT as the commissioner being the leading one coordinating it with other agency that all city fleet must have side guard, while we are trying to do it to expedite it, and I know that we will hear from the administration now. I know that they are in

that, in that plan, to see how we can expedite the law. As we know, it's call for all the trucks to have the side guard by 2024. We also heard in the round table that the private sector is also, they know that they need to rush on this, so, and we will have members of the trucking association coming out to testify so I feel that this conversation is happening now where everyone understands the urgency, the emergency that we have when it comes to continue implementing and exploring all the thing that we can do. We have a bill, ah, and again and we will address with city, with the administration when they testify now that also will mandate any private sector that they do business with the city to install side guards or so. With that, thank you, and you know we will continue working together, and we will never forget your ma, as we have never forget any single person, you know, that unfortunately I say that when I was at 116 and First Avenue with a mother who lost a 3-year-old you would think about that this is last moment we have to be there. We have family losing the little one or the senior citizen. But then a few weeks, two, three weeks after then we had to go to Queens where the other mom also lost a 10-year-old.

So thank you for the way you have, you know, you've been working for justice. Gracias. Thank you. So now I'm going to be calling the administration to please come.

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. And now I ask the committee counsel to administer the affirmation and invite the administration to begin their testimony. Thank you, Commissioner, especially Commissioner Polly Trottenberg. We know that in many hearing not only you heard the testimony from the family, ah, when, you know, when they testified first, as I did it right now, but many occasion when we got hearing we, you always spend quality time to listening to their story and being connected with them. Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and to respond honestly to council member questions?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Um, good morning, Chairman Rodriguez, members of the Transportation Committee. I'm Polly

Trottenberg, commissioner of the New York City Department of Transportation. With me today is Julia Kite-Laidlaw, director of strategic initiatives in our policy division, who serves as DOT's lead on Vision Zero. We also have Rebecca Zack, assistant commissioner for intergovernmental and community affairs. I'm glad to be here with our colleagues from NYPD on behalf of the de Blasio administration to testify on enhancing street and vehicle safety. We're also joined by commissioner and chair of the Business Integrity Commission, Noah Genel, and DCAS deputy commissioner, Keith Kerman. As we enter our seventh year of Vision Zero, it's useful to take stock of the progress the city has made and the challenges we still face. And I want to thank everyone who testified today here from Families for Safe Streets. Obviously, we grieve for all they have suffered, and, and they help bring a human face to the challenges we do face. But I also want to talk about the places where the city has made some progress and then where we want to go in the coming years. In New York we saw five straight years of declining fatalities on our roadways and that really dramatically bucked what was a national trend of

1 rising fatalities. And under the de Blasio
2 administration the past six years of the de Blasio
3 administration have been six of the seven safest
4 years on the streets of New York. Overall, roadway
5 fatalities are down 26% compared to 2013, the year
6 before Vision Zero started, and 19% compared to the
7 pre-Vision Zero five-year average. I recognize that
8 even as those numbers are indicating things are going
9 they're still too high, of course. Ah, and, and last
10 year where tragically we did see in, in some of the
11 Families for Safe Streets, witnesses talked about it,
12 a really tragic rise in roadway fatalities. It was
13 nonetheless still the, the second-safest year ever on
14 New York's roadways. And significantly safer either
15 than it was a few years ago. And it was interesting.
16 We, we had different things happen through the city
17 last year. The Bronx actually saw the safest year
18 that it had had on its roadways with 27 fatalities,
19 compared to 38 the previous year. Staten Island had
20 its second-safest year, down from what had been the
21 most safest year last year, with seven fatalities.
22 But, sadly, we know fatalities did rise in 2019,
23 driven particularly by a dramatic spike in Brooklyn
24 cyclist deaths, up from two in 2018 to 17 in 2019.

And we grieve dearly for all that we lost last year, and I know we're, we're joined here by Families for Safe Streets, who feel it most acutely. As we always say, these are, these are not numbers and statistics. These are friends, our family, our coworkers, our neighborhoods, and, and they are the people that drive our work. So in 2020 my agency is ready and eager to do even more to make our streets safer. We're gonna work closely with our sister agencies and the leadership of NYPD's new transportation chief, William Morris. We're starting our focus this year on Brooklyn, building 10 of the city's 30 protected bike lanes there. And this morning I joined advocates and other colleagues to announce that DOT will build new protected bike lanes this year along Flatbush Avenue, Fort Hamilton Parkway, Franklin Street, Remsen Avenue, Meeker Street, Navy Street, and [Mist] Street. And you, well, we don't have the map, but we may get you all the map, you can see how those are filling in some very crucial gaps in the city's overall Green Wave Plan to create a comprehensive bike network throughout all five boroughs. And while we're discussing the work ahead in Brooklyn, I want to just to look back on what has

1 been one of DOT's most successful recent safety
2 projects. I think it's an important example for us
3 all to think about, a project we did in Gerritsen
4 Beach. Gerritsen Avenue had long been known as a
5 speedway and had seen a fatality each year from 2014
6 through 2016. And 2016 was the year that Sean Ryan,
7 a 16-year-old cyclist, was tragically struck and
8 killed by a motorist that was going over 80 miles an
9 hour. In 2017 DOT brought our full safety toolkit to
10 the street, including new traffic signals, crossing,
11 pedestrian refuge islands, and protected bike lanes.
12 We worked with the local community, who wanted a
13 safer neighborhood, but they were certainly concerned
14 about the project, which was gonna bring big changes
15 to a very quiet residential corner of the city. And
16 that was our challenge. Gerritsen Avenue has the
17 same fatality rate as the wide, busy Grand Concourse
18 in the Bronx. We are pleased to report that since we
19 began our safety work in 2017 the street has not seen
20 a single traffic death and crashes are down more than
21 50%, with only a single serious injury in that time.
22 And we appreciate Speaker Johnson actually gave us
23 some recognition on social media for our work. That
24 was a very challenging project but, but we are very
25

gratified that we're seeing such dramatic safety benefits. Also in Brooklyn, just to highlight, last week we lowered the speed limit on Third Avenue, one of the streets that accounted for the highest share of 2019 fatalities, as well as along Hamilton Avenue. And we're grateful to the mayor for including an additional 98 million in his preliminary budget to fully fund additional improvements on our Fourth Avenue Great Streets capital project, building out pedestrian and protected bike improvements along the corridor. While I'm focusing today on Brooklyn bike infrastructure, of course DOT will be busy with bike lanes through the rest of the city and we will have more to announce in the coming months. I'm often asked why we face, oh, here, here are the posters. Thanks, Matt. I'm often asked why we faced setbacks this year on Vision Zero after five years of progress in seeing fatalities decline. We believe that some of what we're seeing in New York and across the country is attributable to the increased share of SUVs and light trucks on the roads. This year we released new data showing that the share of deadly crashes involving light trucks rose from 40% between 2013 and 2017 to 46% since the start of 2018. We're

1 seeing a real boom in people purchasing larger
2 vehicles, particularly when the economy is good and
3 gas prices are low. People tend to buy larger
4 vehicles. We've also seen that the most deadly
5 crashes last year happened in intersections,
6 something that's been a big focus for you, Mr.
7 Chairman. Over the last four years DOT has installed
8 left turn calming treatments at over 400
9 intersections, and of course we've added aggressively
10 more bike lanes, new pedestrian space, enhanced
11 signal timings, including over 150 separate street
12 improvement projects last year, the bulk of which
13 include one or more intersections. We know that the
14 safest turns at intersections happen at no more than
15 5 miles an hour, which we know you want to make the
16 mandated speed limit. For our part, we've already
17 worked hard to communicate slower turns to drivers as
18 part of our recent Vision Zero marketing with our
19 Turn Slowly campaign. And I know, um, well, she was
20 here, Amy Cohen mentioned the, the issue of
21 daylighting. We are certainly looking into that.
22 Just, it's been interesting in looking at some of the
23 data on that, actually the data has proved to be a
24 little mixed, because on the one hand when you remove
25

cars at the intersections it gives greater visibility. On the other hand, unfortunately, it often encourages cars to take the turn faster than they would otherwise. So we're still looking at whether that, where that might be a good treatment. But just the safety data on that has, has not proved that it, it works equally well at all intersections. As far as individual streets are concerned, we've, we've seen great progress on some of our deadliest stretches. I think all of you know at one time Queens Boulevard was known as the Boulevard of Death, with double-digit fatality levels year after year, including over 20 in two separate years in the 1990s and eight as recently as 2013. Under Vision Zero Queens Boulevard has seen a dramatic drop in crashes and for the first time in memory had zero fatalities two years in a row. And I'm happy to say all around the city we've largely eliminated streets where you see double-digit and consistently high annual death totals. But we do nonetheless sometimes see spikes in roads, typically major arteries, throughout the city that are sometimes hard to predict. For example, Hylan Boulevard saw two fatalities each year from 2011 to 2014 and then tragically eight in 2015.

1 In the wake of that terrible year, DOT made street
2 engineering changes and conducted a high-profile
3 education program. And NYPD stepped up local
4 enforcement. Hylan then saw four fatalities again,
5 still four too many, the following year, then no more
6 than one in each of the succeeding years. In 2017
7 Northern Boulevard in Queens, which had averaged a
8 little over two fatalities per year for seven years,
9 saw that number jump to seven. We saw that total go
10 down to four in 2018 and one last year. And, as I
11 mentioned earlier, Third Ave in Brooklyn, which never
12 saw more than two annual fatalities in each of the
13 nine preceding years and none at all in 2016 or 2017,
14 followed with two in 2018 and then tragically six
15 last year. We'd already been targeting our work on
16 these challenging corridors and we'll continue to do
17 more. As part of data-driven work on Vision Zero, we
18 focus not just on a single spike in fatalities or a
19 single year, but try to go deeper, committing to
20 long-term strategies. We've increased our output of
21 street improvement projects by nearly 250% above pre-
22 Vision Zero levels, protected bike lanes by over
23 200%, leading pedestrian interval installations by
24 nearly 6000%, corridor retimings by over 800% and
25

speed reducers by nearly double. DOT is also ramping up to the largest Speed Camera program in North America and one of the largest in its kind in the world at an extremely ambitious pace, with 750 school zones outfitted with cameras by this summer. And in the coming weeks we'll be laying out a comprehensive plan for managing freight, a topic much under discussion today, on our streets that will enhance safety, sustainability, and livability for our neighborhoods. And as the council knows, we have even more ambitious targets ahead under the Green Wave Plan, the Better Buses plan, and the Master Plan, legislation that the mayor signed into law in November, and thanks to the council and Speaker Johnson for their leadership there. We now have six years of data under our belt and experience with what can be accomplished through aggressive street engineering changes, enforcement, and education. And of course we look forward to working with all of you as we bring new safety projects to your districts in the years to come. As we've said around Vision Zero and as last year sadly proved progress will not always be linear, but the incredible team at DOT will continue to relentlessly focus on provide strategies

and new approaches towards roadway safety. I know I want to express my gratitude for all their remarkable work over the last six years. We're also looking to new areas where we can broaden Vision Zero's reach. For example, we'll be assisting the Sanitation Department in implementing the Commercial Waste Reform Bill passed last year, thanks to the leadership of Council Member Reynoso. Private sanitation vehicles killed a staggering nine people last year, and all look forward to seeing that reckless industry improve its safety records on our streets and for its own workers as well. And the de Blasio administration strongly agrees with you, Chairman Rodriguez, we need to use New York City's bully pulpit to encourage safer vehicle designs and make more proven safety equipment standard on trucks and other vehicles. The city should require what we are able to do at the local level and advocate at the state level where possible. But there's no question that to make the greatest impact we will need federal leadership as well. DCAS has been a leader in this area, as has my colleague, New York City's chief fleet officer, Keith Kerman. Under New York City's Safe Fleet Transition Plan, developed alongside

experts at U.S. DOT's Volpe Center, DCAS is purchasing vehicles with improved safety features, including automatic breaking, backup cameras, driver alerts, improved driver visibility, heated mirrors, and other technologies that monitor speeding and reckless driving. DCAS also leads the country in installing side guards in city vehicles. The administration looks forward to working with the council on bills to expand the use of truck side guards and require concrete spillage equipment, and we welcome a conversation about what other designs and equipment we should pursue as the safety standard for New York City, New York State, and the nation. Seat belts are among the greatest safety successes of the last century and DOT and the mayor commend the state legislature for acting to require their use by rear-seat adult passengers for in-hire vehicles. We also strongly encourage the council to act on legislation with amendments in light of state action that would require rear seat belts be used in all vehicles within New York City. And finally we strongly support District Attorney Cy Vance's proposed Vehicular Violence Accountability Act, which would create new penalties for injuring or killing

1
2 somebody while committing a moving violation and
3 added penalties for committing multiple violations at
4 once, harming multiple people, or with a history of
5 DWI. As we look ahead we remain grateful for the
6 council's partnership and leadership in all our work
7 on every element of Vision Zero. Thank you for the
8 opportunity to testify, and we're happy to answer any
9 questions you have after hearing from my colleagues.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Other agency that
11 will just answer question, will they read their?

12 CHIEF MORRIS: Morning, Chair Rodriguez
13 and members of the council. I'm William Morris, chief
14 of the New York City Police Department's
15 Transportation Bureau. In addition to my colleagues
16 from the Department of Transportation, I'm joined
17 here by Captain Eric Werby, and I also have available
18 to me Mike Clark, the managing attorney of the NYPD's
19 Legislative Affairs Unit. On behalf of Police
20 Commissioner Dermot Shea I wish to thank the council
21 for the opportunity to speak about the department's
22 efforts to ensure the safety of pedestrians,
23 cyclists, and drivers on New York City's crowded
24 streets. As the chief of transportation I'm
25 responsible for ensuring the safety of all New

1 Yorkers as they travel within New York City. This is
2 a topic that is deeply personal to me. Each fatality
3 on our streets is one fatality too many. Each family
4 that must grieve for their loved one is one family
5 too many. And I think the testimony from, ah, the
6 folks earlier kind of makes that very, very real.
7 You know, this department is committed to keeping our
8 streets safe for all those who wish to share them,
9 especially those who are the most vulnerable,
10 pedestrians and cyclists. Last year the city record
11 the second-fewest traffic fatalities since we began
12 tracking traffic deaths in 1910, topped only by the
13 previous year, 2018. Prior to this administration we
14 routinely saw more than 300 people lose their lives
15 on our streets each year. But because of the vision
16 of this administration and the combined efforts and
17 collaboration between DOT and NYPD we have reduced
18 the numbers lost annually by approximately 100.
19 Unfortunately, we saw a rise in cyclist fatalities
20 last year. As a result, we redoubled our efforts in
21 every conceivable manner to fight it head on, and so
22 far in 2020 we have not had a single cyclist die on
23 our streets. We're always analyzing what works and
24 what is less effective, and we take these lessons
25

into future enforcement initiatives to further hone their effectiveness. The standards and goals for safety have evolved for the better and we will not rest until the day when Vision Zero is not just a vision but a reality. Commissioner Trottenberg has already spoken eloquently about the various creative initiatives that DOT is spearheading. So I would like to highlight the NYPD's vital role on the enforcement side. We're continuing to target enforcement on the seven most dangerous moving violations, the moving violations which are the drivers of collisions on our streets. Appropriately, we refer to these as Vision Zero Violations, and we wrote nearly 200,000 more summonses for these categories of violations last year than we did in 2013. Just to give you an example of the numbers, 682,480 versus 485,178. So those are some very impressive numbers. We also saw a 50% increase in summonses last year over 2018 for failure to yield to a pedestrian or a cyclist, 81,609 versus 54,482. We have continued to prioritize blocked bike and bus lanes leading to an almost 35% increase in summonses for parking in bus lanes last year over 2018. And a 15.8% increase for parking in bike lanes. As for

trucks and other large commercial vehicles, last year we issued 34,593 moving violation summonses and 2,671,825 parking summonses. In recent years truck collisions have been responsible for a disproportionate number of pedestrian and cyclist fatalities, 43 of the 220 deaths last year. While trucks represent approximately 10% of the traffic on our streets, they were involved in approximately 20% of traffic fatalities last year. Our truck environment has always been robust, but as part of our overall strategy to reduce truck-involved collisions, the department has designed a plan to address what we have found to be the main driver of these collisions - dangerous driving behavior by truck operators. This year the NYPD will continue its focus on truck safety through targeted safety initiatives. The most important of these are our Vision Zero high-visibility corridor enforcement initiatives. We have identified corridors in each patrol borough, most of which are along truck routes, that are particularly prone to pedestrian and cyclist collision. During each two-week initiative we deploy increased resources in these corridors in a highly visible manner to deter unsafe driving, and we're

1 constantly reassessing the data we get to ensure that
2 the corridors which have the most need receive these
3 resources. Last year along these corridors we saw a
4 32% decrease in overall collisions and a 48% decrease
5 involving collisions involving pedestrians. We also
6 conduct monthly week-long safe passage initiatives,
7 which involve personnel from every precinct along
8 with members of the Transportation Bureau, focusing
9 enforcements specifically on drivers committing
10 hazardous driving violations, with particular
11 attention being paid to large trucks. While
12 addressing unsafe driving remains our highest
13 priority, it is important to mention the work being
14 done by the Motor Carrier Safety Unit, and they focus
15 on equipment and dimension violations, as well as
16 mechanical defects that directly impact a truck's
17 ability to operate safely. These units also conduct
18 joint overnight safety initiatives with the Business
19 Integrity Commission and focus on private sanitation
20 trucks during the hours when they operate. We also
21 target areas with particularly high incidents of
22 collisions with outreach campaigns and our
23 collaboration with DOT is integral to these efforts.
24 This includes our work with the DOT's Freight
25

Mobility Unit, maintains a dialogue with the trucking industry to address safety concerns, continued joint outreach to the truckers themselves, the efforts of DOT's outreach unit along the high-visibility corridors I spoke of, and the everyday work done by the NYPD and the DOT to promote safe driving, biking, and pedestrian traffic. We aim to effect change in every step of the progress together. Lastly, I'd like to take a moment to speak about an issue that's received a lot of coverage last week when it was included in the governor's budget proposal, the NYPD's Manhattan Tow Pound at Pier 76. The governor's budget would have the NYPD off of the pier by the end of the year, an unrealistic deadline. It's impossible for me to understate how important the use of this location is to maintaining a functioning towing capacity in Manhattan. Leaving Pier 76 without a functioning alternative will essentially cease all towing operations. The solution cannot be just to tow cars to the outer boroughs. Every hour that one of our tow trucks spends on the road traveling to and from a distant pound is an hour that a car blocks a fire hydrant, a bike lane, or a bus lane. Every space taken in the

Brooklyn, Queens, and Bronx Tow Pound for cars towed from Manhattan is one more car that cannot be removed in those outer boroughs. Last year we towed 50,000 vehicles of all kinds to Pier 76. There simply is no other viable surface-level alternative location in Manhattan that can handle that volume of vehicles. Even if a suitable location could be found, the procurement and construction process would take far longer than the one year proposed in the governor's budget. To that end, the NYPD has commissioned a study through the Department of Design and Construction to review and identify new and novel ways of decreasing the footprint of the program, including customized, multi-tier parking garages as well as a vertical automatic parking structure. It's all in an effort to go up rather than out. We have been working diligently to get off of Pier 76 and the conclusion of this study, which is due at the end of February, will provide a road map for the department to bring our tow operations into the 21st century. The study will provide a variety of options that could be tailored to any site that may become available. The department is committed to finding an alternative to our use of Pier 76. And we must all

work together to find a realistic alternative. Everybody, regardless of their methods of transportation, owes a duty to each other to share our streets as safely as possible. And we're committed to helping ensure the responsible use of our streets. Thank you for the opportunity to speak about these critical issues, and I look forward to answering any questions you may have. I'd also like to add thank you very much for your warm remarks. I look forward to working with the chair again in my new capacity as the chief of transportation, and I also look forward to working with all the council members regarding issues in their particular councilmatic districts. It's been my experience prior to this, I was the chief of Manhattan South, the chief of Manhattan North, I've run three precincts over almost seven years, and my experience has always been that local solutions are usually the best solutions. So I look forward to working with each one of you to accomplish to that. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chief.

I just said before we started the hearing that you and I have a always a good working relationship again. Never forget when I, that when the Occupy

1 Wall Street [inaudible] and we did a big march from
2 Inwood to here and I remember when he was doing the
3 transition from north to south and there was a
4 [inaudible] and both of us we were smiling. You
5 know, he was doing the job, I doing my job. So when
6 I was arrested in [inaudible] Park that was a photo
7 that the *Time* magazine they put it council member
8 arrested, but they put a photo, you know, the police
9 officer and the council member smiling. The day
10 after they removed that photo and they changed that
11 photo for another where there was another action with
12 police officer as being, as being aggressive
13 relationship between, you know, police officers and,
14 and council members. So I know that, you know, you
15 had a big heart and we're looking to continue working
16 with you. It's a big, you know, you have done it
17 before, but this is like, I know that stuff, for both
18 of us that played these role, you know, and, and from
19 Transportation, DCAS, you guy enforcement, council
20 member, so looking to continue working with you. Ah,
21 look, the challenges that I see from my end, ah, and
22 of course I'm going to be asking few question. I
23 know that council member also that have question.
24 But the level of frustration is so high and, and

1 [inaudible] but most important for the 8.6 million
2 New Yorkers who walk every day in our street, that
3 still are able to identify, you know, potential
4 solution to intersections that there danger. When I
5 went to Queens that day when the 10-years-old boy he
6 was killed in that crash, you heard a story after the
7 story about, and even if you're seeing someone today,
8 there are drivers who turn north and south or south
9 and north in that area. First of all, it's not safe
10 for no one. They turn fast and pedestrian has the
11 right to cross. So for me it's like one of the
12 things is about intersections and we, a lot of things
13 have been done. But what is the plan that we have
14 for 2020 to tackling at high level the redesigning of
15 intersections. And, and for me one of my question is
16 what is the turn of, is it a split, ah, split phase
17 signals? What is term that DOT use when separated
18 time for pedestrians and drivers? Is that, is that
19 the right term? Is that what you call it?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's, that's
22 one of the right terms, Mr. Chairman. There are sort
23 of a bunch of different ways we can do signal timing,
24 what's called a split phase or a leading pedestrian
25 interval, or something that you mentioned and I think

Amy Cohen mentioned as well, something that's known as the Barns Dance and, you know, one of the things I'm proud of is in the past six years we have redesigned hundreds and hundreds of intersections, and when I came in we had been sort of very reluctant to use the tool that you're talking about, which is signal timing. We were only doing a few intersections a year. We're now doing hundreds and hundreds of them. I would just say this. Not surprisingly, I think there's not always a one-size-fits-all. I know something you've been interested in with this Barns Dances, and we have tried them in different parts of the city. We actually think, the data shows us, they work best in places where the intersections are very unusual. You all have them in your districts, unless you're right in the middle of grid, where three, four, five, six streets all spill in together. The streets are at a strange angle and people are uncertain about how to cross. That's often a good place to hold pedestrians and then hold cars. We found when we installed them in regular grid locations, unfortunately what happens and I've, I've talked to colleagues in other cities, this is common there, too. People don't wait. Pedestrians

1 won't just stand, vehicles won't just sit. So you
2 have to really target the solution to the details of
3 the intersection. We have, as you know, now done
4 thousands of leading pedestrian intervals and that
5 has seemed to bring tremendous safety benefits and
6 it's very easy to do, which is to give pedestrians a
7 10-, 15-second head start so they're out into the
8 intersection and visible before the vehicles can
9 move. And there are places where we hold the
10 vehicles completely, but we do have a challenge and
11 I'm sure PD can speak to this, too, with compliance,
12 which is the vehicles don't all stop and the
13 pedestrians don't all stop and in...

14
15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: A question...

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...some places
17 where we put in a Barns Dance unfortunately the crash
18 statistics [inaudible].

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner, but
20 we need to, I gotta say that and, and I know that I
21 asked that question before, let's look at the data.
22 Let's look at those data, and, again, I know that
23 different intersection have different challenges.
24 But that particular one, when we separate the time
25 for drivers to turn and pedestrians to cross I'm

1 pretty sure, I can give you one typical example,
2 Dykeman and Broadway. Dykeman and Broadway was an
3 intersection that coming south downtown drivers
4 before had the right to make a turn, those coming
5 from Riverdale to avoid the tolls they cross the
6 225th Bridge, they came to Dykeman, and Dykeman then
7 make a right to take the Hudson River Drive. Before
8 that intersection used to be the drivers had the
9 right to turn and pedestrians to cross from north to
10 south. Number of crashes. And I can tell you, I was
11 elected in 2009. I spent four years trying to
12 persuade the previous administration to please just
13 put an arrow for drivers who had the green light to
14 turn, but pedestrians to have the red so they would
15 not cross. Four years, Commissioner. The data you
16 can check with the 34, but based on the story that
17 you heard over and over it's not the same. And what
18 I got as excuses in not to do it from the engineer
19 from the DOT, to '09 to '13 was about, well, but if
20 we get the time, if we take away the time for drivers
21 then we will have more traffic or driver coming from
22 [inaudible] to Broadway. It was most of the time had
23 been the drivers' time. And for me it's about I
24 don't care, let's stop all the drivers. You know,

1 for me this, this is the way how I see. I don't
2 care, and I know that is an engineer, they have to do
3 the data. But if we have to make, and I'm pretty
4 sure, Commissioner, if you look at any of those
5 intersection that has been redesigned on separating
6 the time and other things, the data speak by itself.
7 Crashes been reduced big time. While we need to is
8 to be sure that we expedite redesigning intersection,
9 being pedestrian and cyclist centered. If we don't
10 do that there's going to be another unfortunate news
11 tomorrow. Or as we talk right now. So for me it's
12 about like, you know, what percentage of the crashes
13 happen in intersections. If it's the same number
14 that we are [inaudible] more than 75%. I don't know
15 if that's a different number.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Ah, I'll grab
18 the latest number. And, and I will just, I will just
19 say, again, not one size fits all, and we were glad,
20 obviously, when we came in to fix that intersection.
21 But I, I can actually think of one in Council Member
22 Deutsch's district where we had put in a Barns Dance
23 and unfortunately we saw the crash numbers went up,
24 and we adjusted it to an LPI and it started to, and,
25 and I'm not saying that we do it, the reason we don't

do it in every place is 'cause of traffic, 'cause we, you know, per se, we don't want to slow cars down.

But we have seen sometimes when cars get too slowed down they will sometimes get off a main road and

start to hit a side street and then we get concerns

there. So there is traffic engineering that goes

into it. It's not anything we want to, you know, of

course we want to use whatever is the best tool to

maximize the safety, not only of that intersection

but potentially other intersections that are going to

be impacted. So, look, we agree with you. We want

to continue to pick up that pace. As I say, we have

done in the past 60 years now thousands of

intersections and, you know, we're continuing to grow

our team of traffic engineers to keep up that pace

and, believe me, my traffic engineers, their first

priority is safety, it's not traffic flow. But you

have to look at, as you readjust signal timings, what

happens to traffic. If, if you divert it to other

streets and create an unsafe condition there, then

that's not a good solution. So, again, we'll

continue to do our street redesigning. Obviously, we

rely on all of you to bring us places where you think

we didn't get it right or where we can build

improvements on it, and we will put Barns Dances in in places where they work. But, again, for us the data shows they work in some places, they don't work in other.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, so what percentage of crashes last year, if you have the number, in 2019, happened in intersection, Commissioner?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So when you, I just have my, this is from last year's, this, no, this is 2016 to 2018. Um, 61% intersections, 34% mid block, 6% highway. And it was, if you looked, um, that's, that's for total. If you look pedestrians, 57, pedestrian fatalities 57% intersection, 33% mid block, 10% highway.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Do you think that we should have a law that establish the speed limit for driver to make turn?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Um, I mean, we certainly support the idea of, and it's always been part of our messaging, and we have a whole campaign about turning safely, I always tell people they should go no, no faster than five miles an hour in a turn. I think on sort of what, how you would handle

1 that legally and how you would enforce I'd have to
2 turn to, to Chief Morris on that one.

3 CHIEF MORRIS: So I would just like to
4 back to the earlier question a little bit, and I just
5 want to kind of inform the council kind of what, what
6 goes on in, in the NYPD regarding this. Um, on a
7 regular basis, you know, it's not just the
8 Transportation Bureau that takes a look at traffic
9 issues. There's something in the NYPD called
10 TrafficStat. And we do that on a regular basis. And
11 basically we'll call in each patrol borough in their
12 turn, there's eight of them, and we'll talk to them
13 about traffic issues in their particular precinct.
14 So from the patrol borough aspect it'll be chaired by
15 the executive officer from that patrol borough, I'll
16 run the meeting. There'll also be a member of the
17 chief of patrols staff there, and basically I'll give
18 like an overview, I ask the borough for an overview,
19 and then I talk to the individual precincts that are
20 experiencing challenges. So you mentioned the thing
21 before, Chair, about that, the truck that made the
22 turn. We had a presentation from the 110 regarding
23 that, ah, that area there where the truck made the,
24 and it was an excellent presentation by the, ah,

precinct executive officer. He understood it. He recognized some of the issues and one of the, ah, participants at TrafficStat meetings, there's two participants you should know about. One is that there's always a representative of DOT there, usually, ah, at the borough level, and where we have a particular intersection or particular area that looks problematic we will, I'll address the representative DOT right there and say to him or her, could you take a look at this, any engineering that we could look at? We kind of look at it from a, ah, a three-part look. We look at education, we look at enforcement, that's the role of the NYPD, and then we look at engineering, and partnering with DOT we take a look at the, where we think there may be engineering. So I just wanted to let the council know that that process does go on at each, at each one of these locations. So where there are, remember I spoke before about local issues? Where there are local issues we're getting them from the precincts based upon what they see, what their analysis is, and it's proven to be effective, so. And, and to echo what the Commissioner said before, I welcome any reports, any observations that any members of the

council or the public have regarding a problematic area in their particular local.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Ah, do we, I heard, so to start to be the same page with this, do you guys support that City Hall and the speaker make that a priority to go to Albany to pass a law to put the, the signal closer intersection, establishing that the speed limit to turn is five mile per hour? [pause]

MICHAEL CLARK: Um, so I, we'd have to look at, um, um, sorry, Michael Clark, managing attorney for the Legislative Affairs Unit. Ah, any proposal we'd have to look at to make sure it is, um, it's written very precisely so our enforcement agents would be able to enforce it in the street, um, to exactly when you have to slow down, when you have to speed up, ah, when you can speed up. So, you know, we're open to working with the council on...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Listen, listen, people are fed up, people are tired, and this is not about too many and I get, you know, you need to do your job from the legislative perspective, but we have spent years led by Transportation Alternatives, Families for Safe Streets yet to persuade, you know,

1 Albany to work with us. And to review the speed
2 limit to 25 miles per hour. So the question is
3 about, you know, we know that there's another big
4 animal, you know, from the legislative year everyone
5 going to Albany, we don't have control to establish a
6 five mile per hour, that's what we've been told. We
7 tried to through put the language. But my things
8 right now is all those crashes that happen,
9 especially the end of December, those that happen in
10 January from the law enforcement perspective, you
11 know, if a driver turn at 10 mile per hour, 10 or 15,
12 like there's, you don't have to, even though at that
13 moment there's no any crash, you don't have, there's
14 no signal, there's no educational from the, ah, DO
15 Vision Zero educational part that say the speed limit
16 to turn is five mile per hour. So what I'm asking is
17 with the, in the, the concept. Do you support that
18 the City of New York should ask Albany to establish
19 the speed limit to turn as five mile per hour?
20

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, I
22 would, again, I would say, I agree with the concept
23 and we have done a lot of education and messaging on
24 this. I, I think it is for PD to talk about the
25 practicalities of enforcing. But conceptually, I

1 will say this for the record, everyone in New York
2 City should take turns no faster than five miles an
3 hour, perhaps even slower. You are correct, Mr.
4 Chairman, that's where we see the majority of the
5 collisions, the injuries, the fatalities. Those are
6 the places obviously where cars, trucks, pedestrians,
7 cyclists all meet, and if everyone were just driving
8 at a really safe speed we have so many fewer
9 tragedies on our hands.

11 MICHAEL CLARK: Yeah, I mean, I think,
12 you know, [inaudible] would agree that taking it slow
13 on turns is what should be done. Um, in terms of
14 having Albany give us more control of our streets I
15 think everyone would agree with that, that we should
16 have more control on what the speed limits should be.
17 Um, and, again, I wasn't saying that we're opposed to
18 it, just whatever happens needs to be written in a
19 way that our officers can enforce it on the ground.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. So the
21 message for us is about let's explore, let's have
22 conversation, let's see how we can make it a priority
23 as we go to Albany to make five mile per hour the
24 speed limit for anyone to turn at any intersections.
25 That's where more crashes are happening, and I feel

1 all drivers, they need to take all the precaution
2 when they turn. We know that. We know that DOT's
3 putting a calming device. You know that we do its
4 own, you know, check on some intersection that are
5 danger but I feel that as we establish the 25 mile
6 per hour in the city I think that also if we can, I
7 don't pretend that we will resolve the problem here
8 and right now, we would have conversation, but I
9 think in concept to ask City Hall and the office here
10 go to Albany and let's try to make five mile per hour
11 the speed limit for anyone to turn in the City of New
12 York. And my last question, and before I pass it to
13 my colleague, is the jaywalking is, as you know, it's
14 a big issue. Most of the tickets they been giving to
15 black and Latino is a racial profile that from my
16 end, our end, we can have all the explanation about
17 it's about safety, you take, you know, intersections
18 and you look at where, you know, enforcement has to
19 take place, but from my end, our end, it's about
20 shouldn't police officer that go in, to go in
21 [inaudible] ticketing pedestrians being displayed to
22 use their time to give ticket to drivers who are
23 breaking the law?

CHIEF MORRIS: So I took a, a look at the jaywalking summonses. I think there were about 363 or something written for the year. They're concentrated in two particular areas, the Bronx and Brooklyn. Um, they are not, as according to my preliminary review, written by members of the Transportation Bureau. I have been briefed by my staff that, ah, the chair of the Public Safety Committee has met with the police commissioner regarding this particular issue and that the review is continuing at that level.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. So we do realize that there is a big concern and especially from members of the Black and Latino National Caucus and members of the [inaudible] in general, ah, one thing is about the breakdown, who's been getting most of those summons, those tickets, but my thing, putting that reality aside, my [inaudible] question to you is shouldn't those officer who do enforcements use their time instead of ticketing jaywalking to drivers who are breaking the law?

CHIEF MORRIS: I don't know enough about the particular analysis of these summonses. That's why I said, Chair, I'll communicate your concerns to

the police commissioner that this happened. But I know that's he already, I've been briefed that he is undertaking a review of the matter already.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK, thank you. So let's go, our colleague, Council Member Cabrera. Cabrera, Cabrera is not here. Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Ah, thank you Chair. Good afternoon, everyone. And, firstly, I want to congratulate Chief, ah, Chief Morris on your position, um, so, congratulations. Um, so this question is for, is for, um, DOT Commissioner in regards to, ah, protected bike lanes. I was looking and listening to your testimony on the building of protected bike lanes in Brooklyn. Um, why was Emmons Avenue left out of your testimony? And, um, yeah, let's get that first.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We, we did not, ah, announce Emmons Avenue today. That is still on the list we're working on. So it wasn't included in my announcement today.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So what is your plan? Because I'm, I'm, really want to have a conversation on this and try to get it done if feasible 'cause I'm a, um, I think protected bike

lanes are the way to go and not shared bike lanes with cars on the streets. So what, when do you believe the conversation will start to begin?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well, I think we've had a bunch with you and, and some of your state colleagues and, you know, happy to continue those. Again, I think it's a project we want to get going on soon.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I don't, I don't know what conversation you had with my state colleagues. I'm talking about what conversations are we gonna have with your city, with the city councilman in that district?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Happy, happy to, happy to sit down whenever you'd like.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So what's your plan? What is the plan on the Emmons Avenue protected bike lanes?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: As I say, we didn't announce it today. Hope to announce it in the near future. And, again, we're still kind of working through some of the details.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Is that going, is that gonna get...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So happy to sit down with you all if you...

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Will it be, get, will it get done this year or it's something that?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I hope to get it done this year, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: OK. Why was it pushed it back?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Hmm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Why was it pushed back, because we had an initial...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I think, as you're sort of raising, I think there's still a few sort of doing issues we're working through and, you know, again, I think we're sort of gonna do another round of outreach and discussion. I think we're close, but still a few things to work out.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: OK. Um, now when you have conversations in regards to changing the way our street design is, do you have conversations with FDNY?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Ah, yes, and in, actually in fact, um, it's, it's a good question. I just had the opportunity the sit down yesterday

1 with, ah, Commissioner Nigro and some of his top
2 staff because I think one of the messages we've now
3 had with FDNY is, um, between the Green Wave and the
4 Master Plan the city is changing the rate at which it
5 is going to be doing Vision Zero projects and
6 protected bike lane projects essentially
7 exponentially, and FDNY has a big role to play. They
8 review all our projects. We have a whole protocol
9 with them and I think, you know, we talked about sort
10 of the resource needs they're gonna have and how
11 perhaps we can get them involved sooner in discussing
12 the operational details of these projects, because
13 even at our current pace I think FDNY, it's a lot for
14 them to keep up with, what is envisioned under Green
15 Wave and Master Plan is even doubling and more than
16 what we're doing now and obviously FDNY needs to be
17 able to keep up with [inaudible] doing. We often
18 have PD matters to discussion as well as how
19 Sanitation is gonna sweep and remove snow. So
20 there's a lot of roles for, for sister agencies as we
21 step into the, the Master Plan era.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So on every
24 project, ah, that DOT designs do you get a stamp of
25 approval from FDNY on every single project?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And is that something that you could provide to the, um, elected officials within that district?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: OK. Um, Avenue O and Coney Island Avenue. Are you familiar with that intersection?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Um-hmm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Do you believe it's a disaster?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think it's something we can do some work on. I'm happy to talk to you about that.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And we met there about four years ago, four-and-half years ago. So I want to get something done on that intersection, Avenue O and Coney, to make it safe for all. You did put in, ah, pedestrian islands.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Um-hmm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: But that corner is a real disaster and we need to take care of that right away. So if we could have another site visit there and if we could come up with some type of

design, um, as you agree that is, that intersection...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Let's, let's do a site visit on that and, and talk Emmons as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I'm, I'd love to have a conversation, 'cause we have another two years left, ah, in this council. So I want to get it done...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...and make sure that my district is, ah, one hundred percent safe. And, ah, next, in Kings Highway, ah, I, I, forgot my, my bullhorn at home. But, anyway, um, Kings Highway and Nostrand, I'm still waiting for an answer since you, you, ah, you redesigned that intersection, we had, just to mention, a few going south on Nostrand Avenue towards Kings Highway. We spoke about having a turning lane 'cause right now it's extremely dangerous when, ah, cars do turn from the regular lane, and secondly the truck loading and unloading, you told me you can't have red signs to actually let, um, um, motorists know that that is only intended for, for trucks loading and unloading. Kings Highway is also a complete disaster with trucks double parking and triple parking, yes, triple

1 parking. You could down four, five blocks and just,
2 you have to drive in the opposite lane. So this
3 needs to get done, too.

4
5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I'm gonna,
6 I think I'm gonna have Rebecca speak about it. But I
7 also think, I wanna perhaps turn to PD a bit on the,
8 the double and triple parking on Kings Highway 'cause
9 I think...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, but the
11 enforcement, yeah, I appreciate.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: There's sort
13 of an enforcement [inaudible], too, but I don't know,
14 I mean, we...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, but,
16 Commissioner, I have, I just have a two minute, three
17 minute time limit. But I understand enforcement
18 thing, [inaudible] and enforcement here, whatever, I
19 understand the enforcement thing. But we need to get
20 it before it gets to an enforcement thing to be
21 proactive rather than reactive. So it shouldn't
22 really get to the point that the NYPD needs to come
23 and issue double parking summonses. So we need to
24 make it very clear for trucks that, and vehicles,
25 that this is designated for truck loading and

1 unloading. I work very hard with your office to make
2 sure we have nine, um, nine dedicated spots, but it's
3 a complete disaster. Again, um, to me this hearing,
4 these hearings are a waste of time 'cause I haven't
5 accomplished anything. I don't see anyone else
6 accomplishing at these hearings. But I'm just, I'm
7 just speaking out for my entertainment purposes only.
8 I'd love to get this done, and you understand, your
9 agency knows very well we have major issues and I
10 want to make sure that these areas are protected, OK?
11 I gave up my car. I sacrificed my life to make sure
12 people are safe and to make sure our environment is
13 protected and I take the train as much as I can and
14 now I did my job and I expect your [inaudible] to do
15 their job. Thank you very much. [pause]

17 REBECCA ZACK: Yeah, I [inaudible] tell
18 the truth.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Identify yourself, please.

20 REBECCA ZACK: Um, Rebecca Zack, I'm
21 assistant commissioner for intergovernmental affairs
22 at DOT. Council Member, it's nice to see you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Rebecca, you are
24 the best.

25 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: I'm sorry?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: You are the best.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: I, I appreciate you say that at every hearing and I love everyone hearing that. I think we've supplied a lot of answers in terms of the signage. If you want to sit down and, and the loading zones and, ah, the left turn bay, I know we've supplied answers.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No, I'm still...

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: I know they're not satisfactory...

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No, no, since the last hearing I haven't heard one thing. No. No.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: I'll call you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: Thank you.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good afternoon.

Is it afternoon or close to afternoon? Good afternoon. Is that all the [inaudible]? It's just a little, and we'll get the phone call? OK good. I'm not gonna go there anyway. I'm not gonna, yeah,

1
2 yeah, but that's different. So I am, I want to just
3 try to remain consistent on, on what we've, what has
4 been our consistent concern, um, in terms of
5 implementation of Vision Zero over the years and, and
6 that, and based on what Chief was saying that a lot
7 of focus continues to be Manhattan centers, and I
8 will say that there has been a lot of involvement in
9 the outer boroughs in terms of intersection,
10 infrastructure, and so forth, um, not necessarily
11 always agreeing that that is, um, reaching the target
12 audience or, or, ah, providing, ah, the necessary,
13 ah, resources where they need to be located. Um, so
14 you mentioned the, ah, the, ah, the, ah, the
15 corridors with the, ah, heaviest truck traffic and
16 the, ah, where the most accidents occurred, and I see
17 from the testimony, um, your testimony, it was, it
18 was, um, identified by borough. Could, could we talk
19 about that and, ah, could we identify it by borough
20 and speak specifically about truck traffic, um, and,
21 and, ah, in the greater Jamaica area considering we
22 have a very high density of waste transfer, the, the
23 two airports, and a lot of truck transfer, what has
24 been done to mitigate that? Um, and then I want to
25 talk about, um, summonses as a tool for Vision Zero,

1 Vision Zero summonses very specifically, um,
2 obviously that's from an NYPD perspective and
3 Commissioner, ah, ah, DOT, um, as you continue with
4 your campaigns, and I will say that over the past few
5 months they have been aggressive and shared
6 responsibility of the road, but I came up with kind
7 of walking, ah, cross at the green and not in
8 between. And, and, and I think that, um, just
9 hearing it and hearing it, ah, it made a difference,
10 and so I'm not seeing that shared responsibility now.
11 What can we do differently? And then finally can we
12 talk about real agency coordination? Obviously we
13 have one of our major bus lanes and, and, and, ah,
14 business, ah, corridors, ah, in Jamaica Avenue,
15 Archer Avenue, southeast Queens, and it is inundated
16 on a daily basis with, um, commuter vans and other
17 vehicles that should not be there. If you're gonna
18 talk about summonses that are being issued and
19 accidents that have been occurred what are we doing
20 to mitigate that? I know we came in with some
21 infrastructure, ah, that did not necessarily work
22 with, with, where are we with that and what's the
23 update? Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I, I think, I'll take a quick crack on the truck issue and some of the education, and then I think PD can talk about the enforcement and, look, you're certainly correct, Council Member, you have a district, obviously, proximal to Kennedy Airport, large commercial areas, a lot of truck traffic, and as I mentioned in my testimony and when we reflect upon, you know, the rise in fatalities that we saw last year there's no question trucks are a huge factor and I think we heard some eloquent testimony from Families for Safe Streets on that as well about oversized trucks, overweight trucks, trucks going off route, which has been an issue very much in your district that we've talked about and, and worked with PD on. We will be putting out in the, in the coming weeks a more comprehensive plan on trucks and some of the new approaches the city wants to take. I think there's also some very key things we need to do at the state level. The city, we would really benefit from automated enforcement, where we could get at trucks that are 'cause, you know, PD will talk about enforcement, but they're not gonna be everywhere all the time, and I think that's another key enforcement

1 tool we need. Um, I'm gonna get, just in a minute
2 I'm gonna get you the list of what the, the truck
3 priority routes are in your district. But, but not
4 doubt, trucks is an ongoing challenge. And, again,
5 we're gonna be rolling out some, you know, I think,
6 some new proposals and new ideas on how to better
7 manage truck traffic and I think you all know the
8 rising challenge. The city is growing, commerce is
9 growing. You know, the *New York Times* ran a story
10 last year that said New Yorkers now get 1.5 million
11 packages a day. And, you know, for the first time
12 we're seeing in the city that more packages are
13 coming to residential neighborhoods than to
14 commercial neighborhoods, and that's a whole new set
15 of challenges for us, and we're trying to carve out
16 some space within residential areas for truck loading
17 zones. That's, that's proved popular in some areas,
18 not so popular in others. So more work to do there.
19 But we're gonna have a big report coming out soon.
20 I, I think we also very much agree with you on the
21 messaging. You know, we have throughout the course
22 of Vision Zero and, and the chairman has been a big
23 supporter and helped us with not only funding, but
24 also helping to make sure that we're coming up with
25

1 campaigns that are culturally resonate, that are
2 multilingual, you know, we have put out a bunch that
3 do emphasize the roll everybody has on the streets
4 with a special emphasis, of course, on drivers, and
5 we had one this year that was very hard-hitting in
6 which, you know, that was, the call that was done in
7 different languages that was called Was It Worth It.
8 And I think it really gets particularly at another
9 thing we saw last year, I think a real spike in some
10 very reckless driver behavior, I mean, one of the
11 Families for Safe Streets witnesses, you know, told a
12 heartbreaking story about how she was hit by a
13 vehicle backing up really quickly to get a parking
14 space. You know, and, and the, you know, the
15 campaign really speaks to it. And I, I hear this in,
16 in my travels as commissioner, people saying, oh,
17 someone jumped out, or people aren't paying
18 attention, and I always have the same answer, which
19 is if you're behind the wheel what does that matter?
20 Drive at a safe speed, take that turn slowly, don't
21 back up down a street. You don't know who's gonna
22 jump out. Could be a child, who knows? I mean, the,
23 streets of New York are unpredictable. You know, our
24 message to people behind the wheel is you have the
25

ultimate responsibility. If you go at a slow, safe speed and the worst happens and there's a collision everyone will walk away. So we're, we're gonna continue to focus on those messages. But, you know, again, we welcome, I think particularly from council members from all different parts of the city and, you know, we appreciate the chairman's leadership, ideas on how we can make those campaigns more resonate. We do a lot of focus groups and, and studies. But we also know we need to keep refreshing those messages and making sure we're hitting all parts of the city.

[pause]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [audio starts in mid sentence] that, that when in the bus lanes that protected the bus lanes and they were [inaudible] plastic and they would remove immediately.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, yes, we...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is there something else...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, we...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...in the toolbox that we're...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, I mean, we had, we had committed, right, we did it in your district, we did it on, on Archer to try and do what we called a protected bus lane. I think, the, the challenge that we face with protected bus lanes is some desire for permeability for emergency vehicles. So, yeah, we used plastic delineators and, you know, often we find in the city when we put those up eventually they get run over. I think in, in your district they just got yanked out.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Um-hmm.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Ah, my, my bus planners were sitting down with our New York City Transit counterparts and thinking again about what are some better infrastructure solutions there. We recognize that experiment didn't, didn't play out as we had hoped. But we're not giving up, we're going back to the drawing board.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: OK, well count us in on that one, and then, and then finally coordination with NYPD on, on those corridors.

CHIEF MORRIS: So, Council Member, if I may, you mentioned before about commitment to the outer boroughs as opposed to Manhattan centric. Let

me just begin with the big view. Taking a look at [inaudible] for some summons enforcement numbers regarding trucks. Um, as a whole in 2019, this is the entire city, about 35,000, ah, moving violations issued to trucks, ah, about 2.5, 2.6 million parking summonses were issued to trucks. Taking a look at the specific issue, you asked about Parsons and Archer and, you know, having walked that foot post more than few years ago, I know that area kind of well. Um, there were two, there were two, it was either one or two operations there as part of the Vision Zero initiative. We spoke before about corridor enforcement. We look at corridors. We work collaboratively with DOT to identify the corridors, and we did identify a corridor out there on Hillside Avenue back in July and August, and just in terms of taking a look at the collisions during the period, the resources that I have here reflect that during our enforcement period the collisions there went down 54%. And, um, I take a look at the, ah, collision breakdown in all of the 103 and the 107 there. My resources reflect that they went down about 12.8% during that period, too. And one of the numbers that I think is worth bringing to your attention here is

we spoke before about the motor carrier safety units. There's actually three of them within the transportation bureau and, um, although their enforcement is not specific to the Queens area, you know, who knows where these trucks are going to wind up at the time of the enforcement? But I think it's worth noting that, um, let's see, I'm trying to do some quick math here. About 34,000 criminal court summonses were issued to trucks who were in violation of the various regulations there. That's separate from the moving violations. So those trucks, you know, even maybe if they were stopped in Manhattan they're probably winding up in Queens and all over the city. So I think you, you know, the council would want to know about that level of enforcement that goes on also.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK, thank you.

And before I call my college, Council Member Menchaca, one thing, definite one for us to have a walk some places where we have more trucks, ah, activities, you know, can be in the Bronx, can be in Queens, but this is something that, you know, hopefully we can coordinate something. And, and here I would like to, you know, take this moment also to

1 acknowledge some students who are here. [speaking in
2 Spanish] I want for them to stand up, all the
3 students and the teachers back there, ah, [speaking
4 in Spanish] I wanted to acknowledge them. They will
5 be testifying later on about how, and as you can,
6 first of all that's my darling school where I used to
7 teach for 13 years before being elected to office,
8 being a cofounder, Luperon High School, and most of
9 them they are new coming student from Latin America.
10 So they won the state competition [inaudible] on
11 innovation and they, they made [applause], they are,
12 they are going competing, there's one or three of
13 your school that they are being competing nationwide.
14 But important is that their project is about a smart
15 helmet. So they are creating a helmet that will be
16 with all the technology that provide long distance
17 information to the cyclist on how they close to
18 vehicles and of course like this is a Siri product,
19 ah, when it comes, so definitely would like, you
20 know, I told them that, they will come later on, but
21 I wanted to take the opportunity because at some
22 point they will testify when, when the leaders of the
23 agency are not here. But they, you know, for me they
24 are the hope that we have, that as we are addressing
25

1
2 immediate challenges we also have our present and
3 future leaders also thinking about innovation and
4 hopefully we can connect it with DOT, DCAS, and
5 other. What we need to see are how also they are
6 preparing to do the national competition that also we
7 look to see in different way how it can be helpful
8 today. So, mucho gracias [speaking in Spanish].
9 Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] [laughter]

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [laughs] And the
12 school is where the prison [territory] used to be.
13 That's what's, that's where the school is located.
14 Thank you. Council Member Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
16 Chairs, ah, Chair, and, ah, to the students who are
17 here today. Looking forward to hearing your
18 testimony later. And my question, I'll start with
19 NYPD and, ah, Chief Morris. Fifty-three trucks in
20 the City of New York. Where are they legal to drive?

21 CHIEF MORRIS: On truck routes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Do you have, is
23 there a map that you guys have?

24 CHIEF MORRIS: Yes.
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And do any of those include neighborhoods, ah, residential neighborhoods?

CHIEF MORRIS: It's my understanding that they're confined to truck routes unless they're making a local delivery.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So 53-foot trucks could go...

CHIEF MORRIS: Unless I'm wrong about that. Maybe the legislative counsel?

MICHAEL CLARK: That's my understanding, too.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That's your understanding too?

MICHAEL CLARK: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well, I think that there's, there's a, there's a misunderstanding about where 53-foot trucks are going in and out of neighborhoods and I think this is part of the enforcement issue that we're seeing in neighborhoods that I represent in Red Hook and Sunset Park. There's, and then I'm...

UNIDENTIFIED: In Brooklyn?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: In Brooklyn, yeah, southwest Brooklyn.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yeah, we're just trying to [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, southwest Brooklyn and Sunset Park, Red Hook. And we, I want to hand, I'm gonna, I'm going to walk over to DOT in the next set of questions, but I think what, what I hear most about folks are the increased number of trucks that they're seeing that they think are, are not legal to drive down their block. If they get stuck and/or they present really dangerous conditions for pedestrians and cyclists, and there's a large conversation around enforcement that the NYPD and the precincts are saying they just don't have enough, ah, people power to be able to enforce that issue. And so there's an enforcement issue and I'm just trying to figure out how, how we change that. And maybe there's an answer now, but I'm just letting you know that I'd like to work with you in thinking about what, what that enforcement need might because the next, the real next question is where, where we're seeing a lot of and you're hearing from some of the questions and the council members are asking the, the

1 enforcement of bikes and pedestrians, ah, is being
2 felt, e-bikes, for example, is a problem and, ah, the
3 problem, the problem is that there's enforcement,
4 over-enforcement of e-bikes when we should be
5 focusing on the things that are actually killing our,
6 our neighbors. And so is there anything that's
7 preventing you from stopping all enforcement on e-
8 bikes, especially as we get closer to an issue, um,
9 that can get resolved in the state?

11 CHIEF MORRIS: Sure, so if, if I could
12 just address the truck issue first. You know, I've
13 already in my short tenure here worked with a few
14 local electeds regarding particular truck issues in
15 their specific areas. So I'd welcome the opportunity
16 to coordinate the resources with you. I can't speak
17 to what the precincts are telling you about staffing.
18 But I know that in other districts we have worked
19 with the local precincts to augment their resources.
20 We have access to the heavy-duty towing vehicles that
21 we could utilize to, that they'll make an impact
22 there. So I'd welcome that opportunity.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great.

24 CHIEF MORRIS: The, the other thing, I'd
25 just like to say about e-bikes. The chair before

1 what are we doing differently in 2020, where are we
2 going? What we're going to do with, ah, the, ah, the
3 throttle e-bikes in 2020 is we're gonna focus on the
4 VTL violations regarding them and not on the mere
5 possessory situations. So I just would like to give
6 you a little number, ah, a couple numbers. I just
7 spoke before about the TrafficStat forum, how, ah,
8 I've been putting that word out to all of the local
9 patrol boroughs and they in turn, the precincts are
10 there also to get the word out about it. You know,
11 if we take a look at the summonses that permitted the
12 seizure of the e-bikes in 2019 they were down about
13 15%. Um, if we also look at the summonses that were
14 issued at the same time for VTL violations, and that
15 is the dangerous or reckless operation of the
16 particular e-bike, they were up 27%. So the issue
17 that we're putting out there is as we go into 2020
18 it's focus on the dangerous/reckless behavior that's
19 involved, not just the mere possession of the e-bike.
20 I think that's a good balance between, ah, the needs
21 of people trying to make a living and the needs of
22 the community to be safe as they walk. And I think
23 the numbers reflect this, that, um, in 2020, just the
24 early part, you know, our e-bike-specific enforcement
25

is down 80%. So the numbers are reflecting the implementation of that new strategy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. And if I could just ask one question of DOT to really expand on the testimony that was focused on Third Avenue and the changes there that are happening, it's, kind of dive a little bit deeper here on Third Avenue. I think Third Avenue presents one of these really precarious streets that we've been on because of many deaths that have happened, ah, over the last year, years, and there's a lot of changes happening on the waterfront side, from Third Avenue to the water, ah, Industry City, if you've heard about it, wants to expand and the rezoning and 20,000 jobs, that's 20,000 people crossing that very dangerous avenue, and can you talk a little bit, just in my last question to you, really about what we can do. I know you and I have sat in my district office and I asked very particular kind of, almost like a czar, for southwest Brooklyn to sit with us and make decisions with us, and I feel like there's no, we're always responding to issues and I think we can really step forward with a larger planning process and just

1 give us an opportunity about how that's changing
2 hopefully in 2020.

3 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, and
4 look, certainly we have followed obviously all that's
5 happening with Industry City and your involvement
6 there, and we recognize, I mean, look, for us, as I
7 mentioned in my testimony, I mean, Third Avenue, it's
8 a very unusual street. There were years when we had
9 no fatalities and years when we had almost none, and
10 then, you know, this past year we saw this huge spike
11 and, you know, we've been looking hard and talking to
12 you and others about what's going on there, and
13 you're right, it is a street that was changing from
14 what was really in a lot of ways very industrial, you
15 know, basically a service road for the highway. And
16 now, you know, look, School Construction Authority is
17 putting schools there. I have my own opinions about
18 whether that's a wise thing to do but it's happening,
19 all this development is happening. There's pizza
20 parlors and restaurants and residences coming in.
21 So, and it's happening fast, no doubt about it. You
22 know, I think we are, I think we do have some folks
23 in the Brooklyn borough commissioner's office that
24 have been focusing on that area as well as from
25

1 Traffic Planning management. I would actually love
2 to get City Planning into the discussion too, and
3 maybe even EDC, 'cause I think you are right, there's
4 a pretty comprehensive set of challenges now coming
5 to that Sunset Park area. So we should follow up on
6 that. Um, and that is, you know, I think what's
7 happened on that street, it is having a lot of rapid
8 changes and particularly, you know, I will just admit
9 the School Construction Authority has their mandate
10 to build schools everywhere they can, but from where
11 DOT sits they're putting in some places which are
12 very, very difficult, which I don't know would have
13 been the top of my list as a place to have a lot of
14 kids crossing the street. We're gonna work with
15 closely, obviously, to do everything we can on the
16 ground, but, you know, the rapid changes for Third
17 Ave sitting under a big highway are certainly,
18 certainly quite a few.

19
20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

21 Councilman.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
23 much, Chair. Thank you, commissioners and, ah,
24 Chief. Thank you for being here and for answering
25 our questions and for your testimony. My first

question is, and I'm sorry if, if, ah, my colleagues have already asked this, but obviously the increase from 2018 to 2019 in cyclist fatalities, um, ah, was dramatic and tragic. Why did that happen? Do we know why that happened? It's more than a statistical aberration.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Right, well, I mean, it sort of depends on how you look, I mean, particularly, as you know, the spike in cyclist fatalities happened in Brooklyn, and we saw from one year we went from in 2018 we had two cyclist fatalities in Brooklyn, last year we had 17. So I can talk about some of the reasons and factors, but I'm not going to be able to completely explain the big jump in those numbers. And I testified on some of those things before you got here. I mean, in particular we're seeing, this is I think a phenomenon in Brooklyn, we're seeing it certainly in Council Member Menchaca's district and Council Member Reynoso's district, areas that were previously more industrial, a lot of truck activity, a lot of heavy industry that are now becoming more residential, we're getting schools, we're getting retail, it's putting more pedestrians and more cyclists on the

street, and that's unfortunately one place where I think we're seeing a lot of collisions. We're, we're seeing...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: But, sorry to interrupt, but that's not a one-year thing. I mean, I've...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well, I mean, I don't...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I've lived in Brooklyn for 15 years...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: All right, but there's, there's...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...and it's been a gradual thing.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Right, I think there's nothing that's happened in Brooklyn that I can say from one year to another can completely explain going from two cyclist fatalities to 17. And, you know, one thing you'll see in my testimony, I talk about there's different corridors in the city where we'll see a period where there will be very few fatalities and suddenly a big spike. Third Avenue is one of them. A few years ago Hylan Boulevard, Northern Boulevard in Queens, and sometimes then,

1 we'll obviously always do work there and we're
2 usually often doing work before that spike happens,
3 and then we'll see that spike go down. So I'm
4 talking about, you know, some of the potential
5 factors I'm seeing but I can't say...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I would say
9 this overall, something I did mention in my
10 testimony, and obviously what happened in Brooklyn
11 this year is so heartbreaking and that's why this
12 morning we came out and announced we're gonna do a
13 third of the protected bike lanes miles in Brooklyn
14 this year. You know, it's interesting, just poring
15 over some of the statistics, looking at Third Ave and
16 other streets and trying to analyze what happened
17 this year and sort of putting it in the bigger
18 context there were, there was a time in the city when
19 there were streets that had double-digit fatalities
20 in New York, Queens Boulevard being one of them. You
21 know, for the most part, knock on wood, we're past
22 those days. But we are not past seeing unfortunately
23 big spikes. And that calls on all of us, on DOT, on
24 PD, to continue to drive down on where the data sends
25 us, and I think one of the things we're seeing in the

1 data this year, it doesn't explain everything, but
2 we're seeing trucks are a big factor, and that's what
3 I was just saying, we're gonna be rolling out a big
4 truck plan. PD is looking at their enforcement
5 strategies. We've heard from the audience today and
6 probably my colleague, Keith Kerman, should talk a
7 bit about some of the things the city is doing with
8 our fleet and particularly, um, potentially our
9 contractors.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah, but since I
12 have a limited amount of time that does take me to my
13 next question. So, speaking of trucks, I've been
14 asking just in my district for a reconsideration of
15 Franklin Street as a truck route in Green Point, and
16 it leads to a bigger question, which is we have not,
17 um, reevaluated our truck routes in a very long time
18 and so a place like Franklin Street, that is, um,
19 kind of gone in the opposite direction, no, no, it's
20 gone in the direction that you talked about, which is
21 it's gotten, you know, the working waterfront in
22 Green Point has been replaced by condos, um, and
23 there's just a larger population in that neighborhood
24 now. And that's just a street, I mean, there was a
25 young man that was killed there last year on a

bicycle by a private sanitation truck and, ah, I've asked for it numerous times, written letters, so we don't have to talk specifically about Franklin Street, but are we gonna reevaluate what our truck routes actually are and where they need to be? Um, and, ah, with an eye towards, with safety being the paramount consideration instead of, ah, I think convenience for, for certain industries, which I think was the driving factor probably for when the truck routes were developed. I don't even know actually when they were developed, but.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So let me give you an answer to all those, and I will talk about Franklin Street. And I just want to say actually, because we were talking about one other thing to account for sort of the large jump in fatalities. I do want to just note, drove one methodological thing which changed, it changed for the better but it did have an effect on the number of PD which had previously been characterizing e-bike fatalities as motorcycle fatalities. This year they changed that designation, I think rightly. We all want to have e-bike riders characterized as bikes, but that did mean that five fatalities that in previous years would

1 have been counted as motorcycles in 2019 were counted
2 as cyclists. So just sort of when people say why did
3 that number jump so high, that is just...

4
5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: That's one reason.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: There was sort
7 of a methodological change [inaudible] result the
8 motorcycle number went down.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: So, and again,
11 I think we're happy that they did it, it was the
12 right thigh to do, but it, I think part of the other
13 reason there was such a shift in the number this
14 year. I mean, I think, I do recall our
15 correspondence on Franklin Avenue. I mean, we, we do
16 sort of continuously look at truck routes. I mean,
17 here is the challenge we face in the city. You know,
18 I cited the statistic, New Yorkers are now getting a
19 million and a half deliveries a day. It's a little
20 bit of a joke, like everybody wants to go to heaven
21 but nobody wants to die, you know, there is an ever-
22 growing demand for home deliveries and, you know, we
23 all want to have vibrant commercial corridors. We
24 want to try and actually route the trucks on the
25 streets that can best accommodate them and I think

one challenge we sort of have with the Franklin Avenue is if you want to reroute trucks what are the alternative routes, and often then there's not any easy, then there's...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: McGuinness Boulevard.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: .., you know, then there's not necessarily another street which sort of...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Franklin Street, sorry, Franklin Street, just to be clear, in Green Point. No, McGuinness, I mean, I've said McGuinness Boulevard is an obvious truck route and it goes to...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, McGuinness is...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: 495 and it goes, you know, it goes, ah, up towards, um, 21st Street and Queens, but, but Franklin Street is, um, you've got a lot of pedestrians. You can't, I mean, bicycling, I bike on Franklin Street going south towards, um, you know, towards Kent Avenue. It is a, it is like it is the first, ah, 10 blocks of my bike commute when I bike and it is, down to here, from Green Point to here, it is by far the most dangerous

10 blocks on my commute, is the first 10 blocks.

More dangerous than East Broadway, which is not a picnic either, so.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, so we are, again, as I mentioned, we're gonna be sort of playing out a more comprehensive truck strategy for the city and, you know, again, happy to sort of keep reevaluating. The truck routes are a very big challenge, because the one thing I don't want to do is take trucks off larger streets and then if they have to go too far out of their way find them winding their way through little local streets, which are even less able to accommodate them.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Understood. I do think that they should just go on McGuinness Boulevard in Green Point. Um..

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Sorry, I just want to ask, how many speeding tickets we gave out last year? Sorry, thank you, Chair. Sorry.

CHIEF MORRIS: 148,000 speeding tickets by the NYPD.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Speeding tickets, and what was that, an increase year over year?

CAPTAIN WERBY: It was actually slightly down from 152,000, the reason being we really focused on the fail to yield to pedestrian and fail to yield to bicyclists at intersection. That was our big increase from 81,000 up from 54,000.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: OK.

CAPTAIN WERBY: So we took some of the speeding teams and put them on those intersection fail to yield to protect the bicyclists.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I would say they are both very important.

CAPTAIN WERBY: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Speeding is an, is a huge, huge problem everywhere you go. When I'm driving a car, by the way, if I go, I go 20 miles an hour in my car. When I go 20 miles an hour invariably somebody behind me not only beeps, goes around me and actually creates a more dangerous situation because I'm going like less than the speed

limit. People start to freak out because they can't go 35 miles an hour on our streets.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: So can I just, I mentioned in the testimony, just to remind you, we are in the midst of the largest Speed Camera installation maybe of any city in the world. So, again, to the extent that PD can't be everywhere all the time, if you have locations that you...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Everywhere, every intersection.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Well, I need more than every, I mean, if there are particular locations that are, again, that in the....

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Franklin Street.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: ...half-mile radius of a school...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Franklin Street, Green Point Avenue.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: ...let us know and, um, again, we have a lot of Speed Cameras now. We're going to be putting them in at the rate of about 70 a month and always looking for good locations.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Great, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I have a few question before calling Council Member Richard on DCAS, eh, what percentage of trucks under your jurisdiction already have side guard and what percentage still have to be installed with side guards?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: OK, thank you very much, Councilman, for your leadership with Vision Zero and partnership with DCAS. So DCAS is working to complement the extraordinary important work of DOT in designing streets and changing how vehicles are designed, and I want to answer the side guards and quickly be responsive to some of the technology issues that the advocates brought up earlier. So on side guards New York City is the largest implementer as a fleet of side guards in North America. Sixty percent of our trucks have side guards now. We are every day installing. We are doing them as retrofits, which takes a little time. We've always planned on beating 2024. If 2022 is the target we'll make it. This year we'll try, um, but we always expected to be above 2024. We're at 60% now. As importantly, we've created that industry. You know, it goes to some of the other technologies

about intelligent speed assist that have been brought up. There were no side guards in North America, period. If you go to Europe every truck has them. They've had them for 20 years. You go to Brazil. Every truck has them. They've had them for decades. You came here, they didn't exist. Thanks to your leadership and the leadership of DOT and Mayor de Blasio through Vision Zero we've not just implemented for the city fleet, but we're creating the industry, working in partnership with the US DOT Volpe Center. DCAS is certifying companies around New York City. We went from one small company in Canada. We now have five installers, five side guard installation companies, so they're two different things, who makes the guard and who installs them. So we're creating this industry and it's a very common-sense fix, as you mentioned. It's less than \$2000 if done correctly. And, of course, we're now working with the Business Integrity Commission to get them installed on commercial waste vehicles as well as advocating across the country. This same thing now has to be done for high-vision trucks. We called for having only high-vision trucks in the city fleet, but to achieve that we need them in the marketplace. If

1 you go to UK high-vision trucks are fairly commonly
2 offered. You come to North America there are far
3 fewer models. We just met with an international
4 manufacturer who sells trucks in London with high-
5 vision cabs, but we can't get that same company, or
6 we're working on getting that same company, I
7 shouldn't say we can't. We're trying to get that
8 same company to sell them here. Same thing with
9 intelligent speed assist. So we are very supportive
10 of implementing intelligent speed assist. We are
11 already the largest implementer of telematics and
12 speed monitoring in the public sector in the world.
13 There are nearly 36,000 city units, including the
14 city's school buses, that have speed tracking today.
15 The next step from speed tracking and speed alerts is
16 to have the car respond directly, not just tell you
17 you're speeding, but stop the car. That's
18 intelligent speed assist. We have to build that
19 industry in North America. So we are working with
20 U.S. DOT Volpe. We're also working with the City of
21 London and the City of Montreal to do that. So we
22 are absolutely committed to having intelligent speed
23 assist be a standard item on our vehicles, but we
24 have to create, just like with side guards, just like

1 with telematics, we have to create that industry and
2 that's what we're gonna do. We're a municipal fleet
3 department but we punch above our weight and we are
4 gonna push as much as possible to change this
5 industry and we get truck manufacturers to change how
6 they build trucks.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. So I will
9 assume that then you support the A list requests that
10 we have. We waiting to continue talking to you guys,
11 City Hall, and see how we can move it, which is the
12 one that will mandate also, eh, any private sector
13 that they do business with the city to install side
14 guard in the trucks.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: So we want
16 to push this as aggressively as we can. I think what
17 we need to work with you on and work with the law
18 department and the Mayor's Office of Contracts on is
19 how that language needs to be structured so that it's
20 enforceable. We you've, you know, through DCAS
21 there's an enormous variety of city contracts. So
22 there are some contracts very specific to truck
23 operations, if you have delivery companies or the
24 waste industry where, or the construction industry
25 potentially, where that could be very eligible.

1
2 There are other contracts the city has that might not
3 have much to do with vehicles. So if you have a
4 contract with a law firm and they happen to have a
5 truck do you not do business with the law firm
6 'cause, you know, so we have to work on what is
7 doable at the legal and contractual level, and I
8 think that's where the effort would be. But
9 certainly we want to see side guards mandated
10 wherever the city has the authority to do so.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. So we will,
12 you know, I was on, the counsel from this committee
13 and central office they will follow with you to see
14 how we can look at the bill, which already have a
15 hearing. Eh, with the sensors inside the trucks, eh,
16 is there technology there, you know, to, not only to
17 wait for the city to buy the new vehicle that come
18 with those technology in vehicle that they will be
19 able to provide the images of pedestrians when the
20 vehicle make any turn?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KERMAN: So we're
22 doing a lot on technology. I mentioned the
23 telematics, which is tracking real time, and I
24 mentioned the side guards. So a couple other things.
25 We already have 3000 trucks, 3000 vehicles, including

1 trucks, with different types of driver alert systems.
2 These driver-alert systems can vary. This is a very
3 emerging part of technology. Some are notifying the
4 driver, kind of beeping them that they're speeding or
5 beeping them that they're going off lanes. More
6 aggressive versions would start to shake the
7 accelerator pedal or shake the steering wheel and
8 kind of alert you. Um, we are also are implementing
9 and testing car cams. Um, we have 400 camera systems
10 that are in deployment now. And we have in
11 partnership with U.S. DOT, we've published this and
12 we're happy to share, a safely transition plan. So
13 we're pushing every type of technology as
14 aggressively as we can. We do of course have to
15 assess technologies. We need to make sure that if we
16 spend city money on a technology it works, and we do
17 have to make sure that it's consistent and compatible
18 and comfortable with how the driver functions. So,
19 you know, a driver alert system can be notifying a
20 driver of what's going. It also could be distracting
21 a driver. You have to balance. Everyone who has a
22 navigation system in a car knows that on one hand
23 navigation is very helpful. It makes sure you know
24 where you're going. On the other hand if you're

1 looking at the navigation system and you're not
2 looking ahead of you that's a problem. So, um, we're
3 balancing this. We are assessing, um, both cam
4 technology, camera technology, and driver alert,
5 especially for trucks, and, you know, we're committed
6 to expanding that but we also need to get it right
7 and make sure that we're installing the technology
8 that's gonna be working with our drivers, um, and
9 safe to do. So we're balancing that, but it's
10 absolutely part of what we're implementing in our
11 safely transition plan, which is a public document.
12 We're happy to send it to the advocates as well to
13 kind of see what we're doing and go through what
14 we're doing.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. And then we
17 will follow with you because we already been have
18 introduced language to also, eh, mandate also the
19 private sector who do business with the city to also
20 to give a report, install it, the technology as we
21 have the side guard also especially with the sensors
22 of any other new technology that will allow drivers
23 to be able to have the alert when pedestrians or
24 cyclists are nearby when they're making a turn.
25 Thank you. Council Member Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. And I want to just pick up quickly back on truck enforcement and I know Commissioner you alluded to pushing some of these trucks into narrow and side streets, ah, and that's something we often seen in southeast Queens. So I just wanted to hear a little bit more about what PD is doing, um, especially right on the outskirts of JFK, ah, and I know this is a big issue also near Laguardia as well as being that we're airport, um, communities. [pause]

CHIEF MORRIS: I have in my records that we spoke earlier about the Vision Zero corridor enforcement and I show in my resources that we have done a corridor enforcement in the vicinity there, that's that 102, 106, 113 area in terms of the JFK, ah, and the records show that we were there in October and it looks like, ah, for that period that we were there for Vision Zero our collisions were down about almost 40%, 39.7%. So I think that this is just another numerical indicator of the success of this corridor enforcement where we identify corridors working in collaboration with DOT and then we have focused enforcement for a fixed period and we see reductions in the collisions there. The operational

1 reality is we can't be everywhere all the time.

2 That's why I rely upon meetings like this when folks

3 say to me, listen, take a look at this, take a look,

4 in addition to a numerical analysis of what's going

5 on. We had a discussion before about, you know,

6 collisions with injuries, where are they occurring.

7 It's not like, my staff tells me it's not like the

8 old days. I mean, now a cluster of two causes us

9 great concern. But years ago it'd be a cluster of

10 double digits. So what we've done instead of just

11 looking at a particular, we look at a corridor now,

12 and we're doing these corridor enforcements. So one

13 of the things I just wanted to bring to your

14 attention, Council Member, was in addition to the

15 local enforcement that goes on at a local location

16 like this corridor that I just pointed out, you know,

17 we have three separate motor carrier safety units

18 that focus on truck traffic, that focus on trucks

19 that are dangerous to begin with. They have

20 violations of equipment regulations, things that make

21 them unsafe. And in addition to all of the VTL

22 violations that we've written trucks in 2019, I just

23 wanted to put on the record that we wrote 34,420

24 criminal court summonses to trucks that were not in

25

1
2 compliance with regulations requiring them to have
3 certain equipment and things. So, I mean, you could
4 see the truck enforcement numbers.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I want to
6 thank the 105 in particular and the 113, who've done
7 a lot more work in towing some of these trucks who
8 are illegally parked in our neighborhood as well, and
9 DOT as well for, um, some of the signage near
10 Springfield Park, which has really been effective as
11 well, but without enforcement, obviously, none of
12 these things would work as well. Um, question for
13 you, Commissioner. Merrick Boulevard, I remember us,
14 I think two years ago, um, doing some enhancements on
15 Merrick Boulevard because it was one of the, um,
16 places that was pointed out in Queens that had some
17 of the highest pedestrian fatalities, I believe, as
18 well back then. Um, and also accidents, um, and
19 victims. So can you just speak to where are we on
20 Merrick Boulevard now?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I think,
22 I'm going to turn to Rebecca on this. I think we
23 have some things planned for this year, but let me
24 make...

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: Give me a second.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, let her, have her, give her a second to dig up some of the details.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I only have one minute, so I'm gonna, while she digs that out I just want to go back to PD as well. Um, and obviously you're aware of the, um, letter that we sent to the police commissioner. I did meet with the police commissioner yesterday to discuss a lot of different issues, um, but I wanted to go through the walking, the jaywalking while black, um, thing, black and brown, ah, summonses that we've seen in the city. What are we doing to address these disparities?

CHIEF MORRIS: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Actually walking while black in New York.

CHIEF MORRIS: The chair, the chair brought up his concerns regarding that. I testified earlier that none of those summonses were written by members of the Transportation Bureau so I can't comment beyond that. But the chair did ask me to communicate to the police commissioner the concern of

1 the Black and Latino Caucus regarding the disparate
2 numbers there. I also testified that I had been
3 briefed by my staff that you had had a private
4 meeting with the police commissioner and that the
5 matter is under review at his level at this time.
6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I just wanted
8 to make sure I got you on record but yes he's been
9 alerted. All right, if you could just go through
10 that quickly and then, um, just one last thing, the
11 Travers Park, ah, issue, where we with that? Ah,
12 that's come a lot, near Northern Boulevard as well.

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: Let me, ah,
14 can I check in with City Hall on Travers? I know
15 it's kind of like at that level. For Merrick, I need
16 to follow up directly with your office. I don't have
17 those details at hand.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: OK, and then
19 the last thing I'll say before my colleague kicks me
20 off, where we at with the DOT opportunity study for
21 the Rockaways as well? Implementation?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: I'll follow
23 up with that as well.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: OK, so those
25 three things, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Second round, and I'll be quick on these, ah, Commissioner, and specifically actually Commissioner Trottenberg, I asked the NYPD earlier about 53-foot trucks and [inaudible] reminded me through a really great nyc.gov document about truck routes and 53-foot trucks. Do you, do you have an answer about the 53-foot trucks and where they're able to go? 'Cause it's a little bit more nuanced than truck routes actually when I saw the data. Can you respond to 53-foot trucks in the City of New York?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, I mean, I think the, the regulation in the city is they are required to stay on a truck route unless they need to go to a local delivery point, and that has definitely been a challenge on the enforcement front because I think in order to prove that they aren't doing that you need to see their bill of lading and I think that's been, I think what you will be hearing from this administration in the coming weeks is both some fresh enforcement strategies, some other things we're gonna be doing on the, on the truck front, and I

1 think also an agenda up in Albany 'cause, again, I
2 think part of the enforcement challenge here is we
3 need an ability to do more automated enforcement and
4 go to some of these hot spots where we know we're
5 seeing a lot of, you know, illegal truck activity and
6 find more ways to get at it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So the, the dot
9 gov, the nyc.gov documents says that they're really
10 limited actually in their interstate routes, that,
11 ah, don't allow them to go on local truck routes at
12 all, ah, or through truck routes and that they're
13 only allowed on I-95, I-695, ah, 295, so essentially
14 they're only allowed on the freeways.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Right.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And we're
17 seeing them, obviously, in our communities.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I think, I
19 think one of the challenges, I think I have this
20 right, is, um, and maybe BIC may know the answer on
21 this, too. That is now sort of the industry standard
22 for trucks. So, um...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And yet that's
24 [not] happening. So I'm loving the idea of automatic
25 enforcement but I, I think unless we somehow, I don't

1 know how, I don't what we do to curb people's
2 obsession and sickness with getting packages the same
3 say. Like I don't know what, unless we do something
4 on that front...

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I will,
7 I want to talk a little bit about that. Because it
8 is funny, people complain to me about trucks and then
9 I will say well how many Amazon packages did you get
10 this week?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, they're
12 like, yeah, there's two that just arrived today.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: But, but a
14 couple things we are doing, some of you may know
15 we've started a cargo, a cargo bike pilot to deliver,
16 to do more deliveries by bike instead of by truck.
17 We're also working with the industry. You know, one
18 thing that they have started to do, you know, Amazon
19 and other places are using drug stores, etcetera,
20 places where they will potentially consolidate
21 deliveries and people can walk, you know, in a
22 neighborhood, here's the place you go to pick up your
23 package. So the truck is not coming to every single
24 house. We're looking to do more of that with the
25 industry. They are also trending in that direction.

I think you'll hear more from us on that front 'cause that is a way to keep those trucks, at least hopefully, on major routes and off local streets. And I don't know if BIC wants to?

COMMISSIONER GENEL: Thanks. Yeah, as far as truck routes I mean if they are, they're supposed to be on the truck route unless they're making a delivery or a pickup for, for BIC, um, of the...

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: A 53-foot truck is making a pickup?

COMMISSIONER GENEL: No, well, of garbage. I mean, I was talking about, um, BIC-regulated trucks.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it.

COMMISSIONER GENEL: Um, so, I'm not specifically addressing that. But they're, um, so they're supposed to be on those truck routes and we have been working with the NYPD to help extend our arm of enforcement, um, for trucks. We've been doing overnights with the NYPD regularly, ah, with our investigators and the NYPD to sort of expand, um, the reach of our small, ah, investigative staff.

1
2 MICHAEL CLARK: And I think just a little
3 bit, to be clear, so the DOT rules, ah, there's rules
4 about the 53-foot trailer and then the rules about
5 the total length of the truck, so up to 55 feet of
6 total length of the truck, um, is permitted on truck
7 routes. But you're right, the 53-foot trailers are
8 only permitted in very narrow areas unless they apply
9 for a special permit, um, according to the New York
10 City web site.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Can you, I, I
12 think that got more confusing. Can you just say that
13 again, but?

14 MICHAEL CLARK: Yeah, sorry, yeah, so
15 it's 50-foot, 55-foot total length cab to end of
16 truck.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Are OK?

18 MICHAEL CLARK: Are OK. 53-foot trailer,
19 which you obviously make the total length more than
20 55 feet, is permitted on certain highways unless a
21 special permit is obtained.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: OK.

23 CHIEF MORRIS: If I may, my recollection
24 is the Commissioner and I had a discussion about
25 these trucks unrelated to this hearing today, and the

chair asked before what were we doing differently in 2020 and, ah, you know, I'm New York City born and bred and I relayed a story. I said I never remember all these large trucks when I was younger here. We have kind of said we're gonna work together in 2020 and kind of nail this whole issue down about what's the story.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And thank you for sharing your contact information because I'm going to follow up with you on that.

CHIEF MORRIS: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I think we need the Department of Buildings situation Here to kind of curb some of these last-mile delivery, ah, companies that are coming, for example Red Hook has five last-mile delivery projects on its way, and those are all 53-foot trucks and it's gonna be more trucks than we have space for trucks on the streets in Red Hook.

CHIEF MORRIS: Yeah, I think we have to get more knowledgeable about it and then as we, with knowledge comes the ability to figure out engineering and enforcement [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, it's gonna take a lot more time and effort and focus and I'm willing to do that. Let's do it together.

CHIEF MORRIS: Sure, absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think, as the Chief said, 2020 is gonna be a big year for focusing on trucks and obviously we will need the help of Council and I think our colleagues in Albany as well.

UNIDENTIFIED: Thanks.

UNIDENTIFIED: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But I will say that, you know, what everyone should know is that the level of frustration is too high and, and those two particular weeks when we have all the people who die at the end of December related to truck crashes. When we were there the first week of January with the same type of vehicles involved in those crashes, you know, everyone should know that and I think that, again, in the round table conversation that we have I think that the private sector, the trucking, and that was testified to they also share that they understand the level of crisis and the committee to do more.

1 But what everyone should know is that we definitely
2 need to work harder because when God forgive a new
3 crash happen and someone die we gonna be tough on
4 whoever is involved in that crash. If it's by any
5 chance any company that allow anyone that is driving
6 without a license, if it is anyone that have some
7 [inaudible] with those company [inaudible] public or
8 private, you know, that the drivers they not stopping
9 the stop sign or, you know, drove in a high speed
10 limit when they turn, the message [inaudible] here
11 should be, you know, this is too much and we cannot
12 take anymore. So I personally, you know, have been
13 trying to be fair and compromise and bring different
14 sector together. But I don't like, I would not like
15 to be in the press conference and new big thing
16 happen in the city, but if that happen we would
17 change the tone of pressure when it comes to any new
18 big thing that we will lose as a result of any
19 crashes. So, you know, this is, I know that we have
20 the pressure on but I just want for everyone, public
21 and privates understand that this is out of control.
22 You know, I know, I was born and raised in the
23 Dominican Republic. We have a lot of crashes. And
24 but we should not expect that these things happening

1 here when we have so much technology, so much
2 resources, losing so many beautiful life everyday.
3 And as we know most of them not happening
4 intersections, most of them didn't happen because the
5 driver turned, the pedestrian had the, you know,
6 didn't have the time to pass by, to cross, is
7 basically, you know, a epidemic that we need to, to
8 eradicate. And, and before you go I would like to
9 highlight a couple things. One, I believe everyone
10 agree intersections are top priority. Enforcement is
11 top priority. That someone, you know, as you have,
12 you are new in this role leading, you know, this area
13 from the NYPD. I don't want to be tough on you but
14 I'm tough on those when it comes to the hit and run
15 alert. I had not heard after we pass a law one case,
16 and if you have the numbers share with us, with the
17 hit and run alert being activated in New York City.

19 MICHAEL CLARK: Right, so we get hit and
20 run information out in many avenues. Um, we use
21 Twitter, we use local accounts. I think one of the
22 challenges for hit and run investigations, um, when
23 we have the license plate number is, is not finding
24 the car. Like if we have the license plate number we
25 know which car it is, we can find the car. It's

1 finding the driver who was, making sure the person
2 who was driving the car. Um, there's, you know, we
3 have done it, I'm not sure what the numbers are on
4 how often we've done it, um, but I think there's some
5 concern about oversaturating alerts to people so they
6 become numb to it for a lot of variety of, ah,
7 avenues. So we try to use it when its appropriate
8 and helpful to an investigation, um, and we
9 appreciate the ability to do it when we need it, so
10 that's where we stand on it.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How many time was
13 that used in last year?

14 MICHAEL CLARK: I don't have that number
15 with me, I can get back to you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I would say,
17 I would say based on someone following trucking and
18 being involved with this, very few. So, so let's see
19 how we can look at it since with the tool being, you
20 know, provided at least for, from the, the bill that
21 we passed and see how it can work. The other thing
22 is on the hit and run is that we need to double the
23 numbers of men and women in the collision
24 investigation unit. [inaudible] numbers but what we,
25 the numbers that we've been looking at is that at

1 least in 2018, I don't know it was at the end of
2 2019, 44 hit and run, most of them they are damage
3 related. But 4000 of those end up sending people in
4 critical condition to a hospital and an average of
5 one person dying every week as a result of hit and
6 run. And I feel that the numbers that, of
7 individuals that we have dedicated to hit and run,
8 which I believe is no more than 60, I don't recall
9 [inaudible] 50 something based on the last number of
10 individual dedicated to the investigational squad
11 unit, we also been calling to double that number. As
12 also we feel that as City Hall is and the speaker
13 knows we are getting into negotiating the budget we
14 should double the amount and [inaudible] my colleague
15 from Brooklyn and the other delegation to fight
16 together to double the investments for the in Vision
17 Zero educational, eh, initiative. It is with that
18 funding that we can be able to expect from DOT and
19 other agencies to have more, more resources, to
20 disseminate information, to educate, to do more
21 prevention. So those are things that I hope again
22 that we look at it as we planning for the 20, for the
23 2020. Eh, I also would like to, again, in a non, not
24 a hearing related, but to take the opportunity to
25

1 express my support to the workers of City Bike who
2 are negotiating the contract. I support TW as they
3 fight for those men and women that work in the
4 maintenance and relocating the bike to have a fair
5 contract. And in the same direction and there's
6 something that I have as someone born and raised in
7 the countryside in the Caribbean, when I give my word
8 I honor my word. And when I get a word from anyone
9 that's what I take. When we talk about the expansion
10 of City Bike we talk about expansion to the South
11 Bronx and Washington Heights to happen at the same
12 time. So when I got a phone call yesterday asking me
13 we can put a structure now but we do the expansion
14 one area in the spring and we doing the other one
15 back in the summer and I just using this momentum
16 because even though I push to be clear with whoever
17 made a call the answer was still let's look at it.
18 And my, I was very clear from the beginning, I want
19 the expansion to happen at the same time to the South
20 Bronx, to Washington Heights, because as you know we
21 have left behind underserved community. I know that
22 you pushing Lyft, we push, you know, the City Bike in
23 the past but I, I need to be clear with that part.
24 And, and then thank you for, I know that probably
25

1 this year [inaudible] are more advanced than us and
2 that was a good thing that we did [inaudible] we
3 started putting together Car-Free Day not only on our
4 responsibility, now we decided that make it like
5 yearly. We're working with DOT taking the lead with
6 us. So we're looking to have the meeting on the
7 11th, eh, February 11 at 9 in the morning to bring
8 all the stakeholder to come to, and I know that you
9 are doing, you already been doing a lot of work so I
10 also wanted to say thank you for what you think is
11 doing the car-free day. And, again, those of us that
12 know and we are looking at these [inaudible] 19 basis
13 on if we follow the recommendation for the date and
14 DOT wants to do it like on a Sunday because the
15 anniversary of one of those big events.

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: This year
18 is a pretty exciting year for car-free 'cause we're
19 doing it on the, um, it's the 50th anniversary of
20 Earth Day so we kind of have a lot of momentum to
21 build on this year, which I think is gonna be really
22 exciting.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. So that day
24 is the day you know only closing the street, but it's
25 open in the street and bringing cultural and we're

1
2 having conversation about sustainability and how to
3 make the streets safer in our city. So thank you
4 again for what your team is doing.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZACK: We can push
6 the date out, too. We can push the date out, too, to
7 maximize.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK. Thank you.
9 Sorry, before we close, Council Member Reynoso. I
10 mean, before you go.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you so
12 much for being here. It'll be just some, ah, quick,
13 three quick questions. Ah, or three quick places of
14 questions. The first one is just, um, ah, it seems
15 like there's been an increase in enforcement
16 happening related, in, to vehicles and trucks in the
17 City of New York. I just wanted to ask how many, how
18 many summonses were given, ah, to vehicles, um,
19 versus how many summonses were given to, ah, cyclists
20 or bikes, um, whether or not we have that number?

21 CAPTAIN WERBY: Ah, yes, Council Member.
22 In 2020 we issued about 986,000 total moving
23 violations, that's total. To bicycles, if memory
24 serves me correctly, it was around just north of
25 35,000.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK.

CAPTAIN WERBY: Ah, the moving violations to trucks, we testified a little while ago it was around 34,600.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK.

CAPTAIN WERBY: And that is pretty much the modes of transportation, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: You said 986,000?

CAPTAIN WERBY: Yeah, just, just short of a million total moving violations.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So outside of the...

CAPTAIN WERBY: Not counting parking tickets.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right. So nine hundred and like 20,000 moving violations for vehicles?

CAPTAIN WERBY: Ah, to cars. Bicycle ones, they're technically considered moving violations, 37,000 or so, 35, 37 thousand.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK. And do we know in general how many vehicle trips occur in the City of New York per day on average?

CAPTAIN WERBY: Vehicle trips via a car, like a sedan, a Suburban?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, a car, a car, yeah, 'cause we, we know how many, we got an estimate...

CAPTAIN WERBY: Of the bikes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...about how many bikes...

CAPTAIN WERBY: OK.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...um, are on the streets at a single time. Do we do estimates for how many vehicles are on the streets for a single time?

CAPTAIN WERBY: Let, let us just check that one second.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I know a million vehicles enter the city each day. I don't know whether we have a total count of all vehicle trips in the city. But let us see what data we've got.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: When you say they enter, they enter like the CBD or they enter from New Jersey?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: They enter, they enter from all the crossings into the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: They turn on move, about a million a day.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Right, they, they cross from, they cross from another jurisdiction into New York City. And I would just say, one thing at least we're doing on the DOT side is that there is a whole sort of exciting new world of technology which is I think giving us more accurate ways to do better counts on all this. So let, maybe we'll brief you on sort of the [inaudible].

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, I think, I just want to make sure people, like have an understanding of, ah, of the scale related to vehicles, trucks, cyclists, and then also to speak on enforcement related to that. A lot of people have a misconception that enforcement doesn't happen on one end or happens too much on the other end. And I just want to make sure we've got a perspective through data and information instead of anecdotes. So that's one set. And just very quickly, the next set of question is just, ah, communications. Too often the NYPD or the people on the ground when they're first in and around collisions or deaths, um, make statements that are thereafter in some cases, ah,

1 unfounded. This is a big deal for the cycling and
2 pedestrian community, that they get it right for the
3 families. And it seems like there is either a bias
4 or a misunderstanding of exactly how these things
5 should be happening. Under your leadership, I hope
6 that you can do a better job at having the NYPD hold
7 their tongue until official investigations are over
8 or until we absolutely know what happened. Um, ah,
9 and this happens too often, where somebody says
10 something. Like, for example, somebody said it's not
11 illegal in the City of New York to open a door is
12 what an officer said when a cyclist got hit by a
13 door, or got doored is what it's called, and died
14 after they got hit by a truck thereafter. They're
15 like, well, we don't, it's not illegal to open a
16 door. It is illegal to open a door without looking.
17 My point being, maybe the people on the ground
18 shouldn't be making those statements and they should
19 leave it to a communications team at the NYPD.
20 Whether or not, it's something you would encourage
21 them to stop doing.

22
23 UNIDENTIFIED: Point, point taken.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK, point taken.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Point taken.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK, so I'm gonna hold you accountable next time it happens.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yes, Council.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK. And then the last thing I want to say is Car-Free Day. There is, there is an opportunity which I think we lack many times about being bold. I don't want to take away from the idea of Car-Free Day. But it's not Car-Free NYC. It is New York City Vehicle Car-Free NYC. We should be shutting down all of the central business district. We should be shutting down the entire city to vehicles. There's no reason why we can't do that. Ah, technically why we can't do that. This is New York City. We're very adaptable people. We learn very quickly. And if you're gonna shut an entire city to vehicles outside of emergency and mandatory like operations that need to happen in the City of New York people will take the train, people will get on bikes, people will figure out an alternative. There's no reason why we can't be moving to a Car-Free, ah, Car-Free, actual Car-Free Day when other major cities are moving to car-free cities permanently. Why can't one day we just shut down the entire city? Even an, even China, big

1 cities in China that have more people than we do, do
2 car-free days and actually shut down the streets. So
3 I just think we could do more.

4
5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: We'd, we'd
6 love to do more. I think on this one it's a
7 conversation we're having with PD and, and also with
8 Counterterrorism just about what, what their comfort
9 level is in terms of staffing and protecting streets
10 we shut down. But, but I agree, it's something we
11 certainly want to expand.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So I need
13 clarity on that. Are we assuming that because,
14 people that ride vehicles are terrorists suspects?

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I'm not, I'm
16 not gonna speak for Counterterrorism, but just
17 they're, they are part of that discussion about how
18 we close streets and how that's staffed. That's
19 always been a factor in [inaudible] streets and, and
20 all the closures we do.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: OK, so, I just,
22 I just don't like call it Car-Free NYC, 'cause it
23 isn't Car-Free NYC. You can wake up and there's a
24 lot of cars in the streets still, um, and I just
25 think it's, we're doing a disservice to what it

1 should be, ah, by not going all the way. Um, and
2 then I just want to, even though there was pointed
3 questions, thank you for the 10 miles in Brooklyn,
4 yes. But I want to get to Brooklyn, not go around
5 Brooklyn. So there's some gaps there that hopefully
6 we get to fill in the very near future. Thank you so
7 much for your time.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you for,
10 for your leadership on Meeker. We were very excited
11 to announce that today, yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So thank
13 everyone. Now we're calling the panel and we're
14 gonna be [inaudible] so please [inaudible] that we
15 take place here so if you take your vote on that be
16 sure that you summarize when you're getting to close
17 to the, your minute and a half.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Zach Miller, Mark O'Connor,
19 Eric McClure, Christine Bertay. [pause]

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, guys,
21 going to plan two minutes.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Hello, ah, dear Committee
23 Chairs and honorable council members. As one of the
24 city leading voice for street safety Chekpeds look
25 for what to work with you in whatever way we can to

1 ensure the safety and well-being of our most
2 vulnerable street users. We must do so now before
3 anymore senseless deaths. In the last 15 years we
4 have been innovators for pedestrian safety. Chekpeds
5 work closely with DOT, NYPD, Port Authority
6 [inaudible] to effect change. And yet the results
7 are disappointing, and we know why. We agree with
8 you that protecting intersection is a critical part
9 of what we should be doing this year and the coming
10 up years. The Department of Transportation is still
11 insufficiently funded to undertake the vast
12 transformation we're asking them to do. But the same
13 time DOT continues to operate if it were a custom
14 tailor shop where every request must be studied and
15 design. And such artisanal processes are inadequate
16 to effect a rapid high-volume changes. DOT must
17 operate on a much larger scale, properly prioritize
18 the most dangerous intersection, and systematically
19 deploy all the safest street features without endless
20 studies and return visits, which the DOT tells us
21 they love to do. They go to one segment and they
22 come back three times, which is three times more
23 work. As a major component of Vision Zero is
24 driver's education in other country not advertising
25

it education and where is this element? It seems to be forgotten. Ah, Chair Rodriguez, you mentioned many time during your speech education and I think is the right thing and we need to educate drivers a lot more than we are doing today. And while the DOT is at least as good intentions the NYPD as far as we are concerned is a no-show in traffic safety. Chekpeds is a proponent of law and order. But NYPD behaviors as an occupation force, overwhelming pedestrian with their squad cars, trucks, SUV, all parked on sidewalks and dangerous and bike lane. They block bus lane and bike lanes. And, ah, conjure the images of tank. I've lived in an occupied city. This just like that. So they appear to loathe leaving their cars and prefer speaking to people on loudspeakers as if the local resident were the enemy. And as you mentioned if the intervening crash their bias in favor of drivers is evident, even if the pedestrian of cyclist is dead in front of them. For traffic safety to improve we need a profound change in NYPD mentality. With two-thirds of the program missing and one-third not operating at full efficiency it is no wonder the progress is so slow. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] to stay with the two minutes [inaudible] because there's another hearing coming here.

MARK O'CONNOR: Good afternoon, everyone. Thank you all for convening this hearing. Chairman Rodriguez, I applaud your leadership and that of your council members to make New York City streets equitable and inclusive, and safe. My name is Mark O'Connor. I'm deputy director at Transportation Alternatives. New York City streets should prioritize living people over cars. They should provide opportunities to celebrate to connect neighborhoods and interact with your neighbors without fear of crossing the street. Most importantly, they should be safe and they should foster progress and opportunity for the next generation. Instead, however, our streets do the exact opposite. In the past two decades more than 6000 people have been killed in traffic on city streets, including children, every single day. Hundreds of thousands have been injured and generations have been denied the opportunity to walk, bike, and access reliable, efficient transit. This epidemic affects everyone, old and young. So far in

2020 the oldest person killed was 90 years old. The youngest was 10-year-old Shiran Panti. Our city is failing us. New York City DOT has achieved a lot under Commissioner Trottenberg and her team. They are national pioneers on Vision Zero and people are alive today because of their work and Mayor de Blasio's policies. But we must recognize that people are also dead and families forever incomplete because of what has not been done, because proven life-saving measures have not been implemented by this administration or every administration before it. As a city we are still prioritizing parking and the expedient movement of lethal multi-ton cars and trucks over the safety and well-being of living, breathing New Yorkers. We have designed and built our streets and infrastructure to produce exactly the carnage and congestion that we experience every day. We know the tools that are needed to address this. What's needed is the political will and courage. And we call upon the city and Mayor de Blasio, at Transportation Alternatives we call upon the administration and this council to take the following critical steps. One, starting this year the city must live up to its commitment under the Green Wave

plan for cycling in New York City plan, including building at least 30 miles of protected bike lanes annually and starting in 2022 50 miles annually under Transportation Master Plan. This council, led by Speaker Johnson, shows the kind of political will and courage that our city needs when last year you passed the Transportation Master Plan, Local Law 195 of 2019. The plan takes effect in 2022, but the work and funding must be dedicated now. We must also establish New York City as a world leader for car and truck safety standards, including adopting speed governors and intelligent speed assistants. We must also implement daylighted intersection citywide, including bulb-out intersections, which can reduce the and avoid the risk that Commissioner Trottenberg highlighted from daylighting intersections. Finally, I want to speak briefly to, be very quick, the city must address the unacceptable lack of bike parking facilities, which is a detriment to growing cycling in the city, and finally the City Council must legalize e-bikes and change the council's harmful 2004 law and I recognize the council members here today, particularly the Council Member Menchaca, um, for his tremendous leadership in fighting for to

address the draconian enforcement against food delivery workers in New York City. Thank you all.

ERIC MCCLURE: Good afternoon. My name is Eric McClure. I'm the executive director of StreetsPAC. Mr. Chair, thank you for convening this hearing and, and I want to thank you specifically for really pushing the city on technology and trying to get to the root of the problems that are leading to so many deaths caused by heavy vehicles. As you pointed out earlier in your remarks a disproportionate number of New Yorkers are being killed or maimed by, by heavy trucks, um, and not only commercial vehicles but also large pickup trucks or SUVs. While the mayor signed legislation in 2015 mandating the installation of side guards, it gave a nine-year window in which, um, that would happen. The city is moving very much in that direction, ah, the private carting industry not so much, only a fraction of private carters have installed the mandatory side guards at this point. Um, and of course side guards are only the tip of the iceberg and, and, um, will only save you if you're being dragged under a truck. They won't save you if you're hit head-on. Many European and Asian cities are well

1 ahead of New York in implementing life-saving
2 technologies, including warning sensors that alert
3 drivers to the presence of people on foot or on
4 bikes, that alert them to distraction and drowsiness,
5 and even intelligent speed assistance systems that
6 limit the engine power to ensure speed limit
7 compliance. European and Asian trucks are also in
8 many cases better designed than the trucks we have
9 here in New York with the cab sitting over the
10 engines, allowing for much better visibility. We
11 should be mandating such cab designs for city-owned
12 and operated vehicles, and we also need Albany and
13 Washington to do their part to mandate better vehicle
14 design and safety equipment. And we especially need
15 the state legislature and the governor to make
16 licensing of drivers more rigorous and to pass laws
17 that make, that hold reckless drivers accountable.
18 But heavy commercial vehicles are far from the only
19 program. More than 6000 pedestrians were killed in
20 crashes across the US in 2019, the most since 1990.
21 The culprits in many cases were increasingly large
22 and more powerful SUVs equipped with big touch
23 screens and other distractions. The Department of
24 Transportation has recognized that drivers of SUVs
25

are responsible for an increasing share of deaths in New York. But we need more than awareness efforts and appeals to drivers' better natures to deal with these deadly machines. We're at a point now where it's time to begin regulating the types of vehicles that can be driving in densely populated areas of New York City. Manhattan streets are overrun with Suburbans, Yukons, and Expeditions, whose very names underscore their inappropriateness for urban streets. We must give serious thought to restricting the weight and size of the private vehicles that can be operated legally in the city, and we need to look to the EU requirements that all new vehicles that are sold, beginning in two years, have speed-limiting systems. The technology exists to make streets safer. We need the political will to require it. We shouldn't accept being second to any other city around the world. The future of Vision Zero lies in reducing the number and size of vehicles in New York City and interventions that will prevent drivers from speeding or operating their vehicles in dangerous and irresponsible ways. Thank you.

ZACH MILLER: Good afternoon. My name is Zach Miller and I am testifying on behalf of Kendra

Hemps, president of the Trucking Association of New York. I would like to thank Chairman Rodriguez as well as the members of the committee for the opportunity to testify before you today. Safety is the highest priority for the Trucking Association of New York and we are committed to making New York City roads safer for all road user. To that end, the trucking industry invests approximately 9.5 billion annually in safety in four core areas - driver safety, training, compliance with safety regulations, onboard safety technology, and safety incentive pay. One of the things TANY is looking to do long term and we're really excited about is the development of an urban driving training program, which will be comprised of video modules that will focus on the unique challenges associated with operating large commercial vehicles in highly congested urban environments, such as New York City. TANY offers fleet training programs to our members through a combination of seminar and webinar based programs. This training focuses on education, fleet, on educating fleet owners on the rules, regulations, and best practices in implementing effective safety initiatives within their fleets. Um, we work in

1
2 conjunction with the city DOT. Um, we have created a
3 number of trucks [inaudible] programs, which help
4 educate cyclists and pedestrians about truck blind
5 spots. We're looking to expand that partnership with
6 DOT. We're looking to sort of take on a lot of that
7 on our own in some of the schools and community
8 centers. Um, and we are having quarterly meetings
9 with DOT specifically about Vision Zero and how to
10 improve safety for everybody. So, thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: One question.

12 OK. Let's go right to it. Local Law 195. We passed
13 something but it's not gonna happen until the next
14 administration. How do you all feel about that and I
15 mean is that, are we done there, and I guess I'm
16 asking that because everything we just talked about
17 was all about infrastructure and design, stuff that
18 we need to do now and stuff that it can't wait until
19 the next administration. So I'm, I'm interested as
20 someone who is on your side and with you on the
21 ground. If we need to do something else, if we need
22 to do something different, ah, I want to hear that
23 now. Because at this point we're not gonna see it
24 until 2022 and I'm not feeling that that's

accountable. It's your opportunity, that's my question.

MARK O'CONNOR: So speaking for Transportation Alternatives we would have loved to see the, um, Transportation Master Plan take effect much sooner. Unfortunately that was kind of the compromise with the current administration. Um, but we...

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: But we have to take responsibility for that, too, right, like?

MARK O'CONNOR: Yup.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, and that's all of us. So I want us to, we all need to take responsibility for that.

MARK O'CONNOR: You should have done better, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah.

MARK O'CONNOR: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: We need to hear that. Like that, that's what I'm asking for. Like we, this isn't gonna move if we just kind of push it on to the Mayor's Office. What can we do better?

MARK O'CONNOR: So, so, there's the Master Plan. There's also the Green Wave Plan that

1 the DOT has, and other city agencies, have committed
2 to. Um, they are elements of the plan that should be
3 accelerated right now and I would say in the current,
4 in the upcoming budget negotiations the, the council
5 certainly has, certainly has an opportunity to, to
6 influence that, um, and through various legislation
7 also to require the implementation of various
8 elements. So I would take a look at the, ah, Green
9 Wave Plan, which has a host of, of good policy
10 measures. Um, the only downside to it is that
11 they're just aspirations and, ah, and statements, and
12 if they can be held, if they can be required to
13 implement that, that would be great. There's a host
14 of legislation I think we, we'd love to work with you
15 on, um, to require that.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Can I, I'd like to answer
19 if possible. Ah, you know, in, when the DOT
20 published the Vision Zero study they had like a
21 pedestrian plan for each of the boroughs. In each of
22 those pedestrian plan there was a list of the most
23 dangerous intersection for pedestrians. And the
24 question is what has happened to those intersection.
25 And, you know, and then we have an update of what are

1 the most dangerous intersection now. And I think
2 there is nothing to slow down to take the top 50 and
3 say this must be in the budget now and they need to
4 be in the budget the way, ah, Chair Rodriguez is
5 talking about, which is to separate the cars from the
6 pedestrian and not do a small, you know, touch-up,
7 right? We need to do a real re-engineering of those
8 intersection with really safety for pedestrian and I
9 think this is totally feasible and there is no reason
10 to wait on that.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: And if could just add very
13 briefly, ah, I do think that the technology is
14 important in terms of being able to intervene with
15 dangerous drivers, that we do need to move the
16 reckless driver accountability act forward as quickly
17 as possible. I, I hear it's probably aging soon,
18 which is great, but let's move it through the council
19 as quickly as possible and get it signed. Um, and
20 then using technology like speed controls and, and
21 governors to reduce the speed of vehicles and make
22 sure that they're adhering to the speed limit, um,
23 and anything else we can do to, to, to really curtail
24 dangerous driving is absolutely key to Vision Zero.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] is that the other committee they're waiting to also use the room. Now we, thank you, and we will continue working together.

UNIDENTIFIED: Chris Wald, Dane Drosik, Ann Harvey, Richard Robins, Katherine Willis.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you again. If you take more than two minutes you just summarize as you're getting close to the two minutes. Thank you.

HOLISH VAUD: I'll be very brief. Thank you for having me. My name is Holish Vaud. I'm president of the parents' association at my children's public elementary school, the East Village Community School. There are 330 students in our school that come from around 250 families. Most children arrive by foot or scooters. 35 are driven in by yellow school bus and about 40 are being dropped off by cars. There is a growing movement of families that are using bicycles in order to drop off and pick up their children from school. When I joined the school five years ago there were about 10 families. Today there are about 50. People use bike seats to carry small children, cargo bikes to carry

two or three children, tandem bikes, electric scooters, electric bikes. Families choose to use bicycles despite the fact that there is no safe bike infrastructure to use. My children cannot ride their bicycles to school because there is no safe way for them to ride on. If I allow my children to ride in the street they will be hit by a car and die. The sidewalks are narrow and crowded with people. In two years my daughter will be 12, the age limit for riding on the sidewalk. She won't be able to ride in the unsafe street. I carry my children in a cargo trike. The city's Department of Transportation prioritizes private vehicle storage over safety of people using [inaudible] devices. Bike lanes are not designated in order to preserve parking spots. Less than 25% of households in Manhattan own cars. Yet most curb space is designed as car storage. Free parking is an impediment to safe streets. DOT's policy of not designating loading zones results in bike lane blocking by delivery and utility vehicles. Placard corruption by the NYPD is prevalent and consistent. Placard holders are abusing their placards, parking vehicles illegally, blocking bike lanes and parking on side walks. The NYPD refuses to

enforce the law and the members of the police force are the lawbreakers. The NYPD sabotages every street safety project by parking their vehicles on it. Parents are endangering their lives and their children's life riding the street with motor vehicle traffic although they choose a clean, sustainable, pollution- and noise-free mode of transportation. The city needs to prioritize these modes yet rejects them.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

KATHERINE WILLIS: Good afternoon. There we go. Good afternoon. My name is Katherine Willis and I'm a co-chair of the Brooklyn Activist Committee for Transportation Alternatives. As a volunteer for TA one of my goals is to get as many people as possible out of cars and onto bikes in New York City, especially in Brooklyn. We need to make biking not only very accessible but attractive as a way for different folks to get around instead of driving. However, this goal of mine is increasingly difficult to achieve. So many people were killed on bikes in 2019, nearly two-thirds of whom in Brooklyn, and several long-time bicyclists I know are afraid to ride as they used to. But even before 29 people died

1 due to unsafe street design and conditions, rampant
2 reckless drivers, and a lack of urgency from city
3 government, people I know and love from outside of TA
4 had already expressed a justified fear of biking in
5 our streets. We owe it to not only those who
6 currently or used to bike to improve street and
7 vehicle safety, but to those who would newly bike
8 rather than rely on cars if were safer to do so. One
9 example of this is my younger brother, who moved to
10 Sunset Park in July. Um, in the days leading up to
11 his move he called me to say that he was excited
12 about the idea of getting a bike, um, but this made
13 me afraid for his safety and I had to tell him so,
14 and then two days after he moved [inaudible] who is
15 the same age as my brother was killed on July 29 nine
16 blocks from his new apartment. The success of Vision
17 Zero can be judged by looking backwards, but it can
18 only be accomplished by planning forwards. As we
19 look back on the past year we can see that our city
20 did not do enough to move towards zero traffic
21 fatalities. To say that we're in crisis is an
22 understatement. Currently we've not only failed the
23 past and present folks who bike, walk, and even take
24 cars in New York City, but we're failing those who
25

1 will in the future. Without protected bike lanes,
2 out of the door zone, and effective traffic calming
3 infrastructure [inaudible] was killed tragically and
4 preventably. Unless the city escalates the pace and
5 funding for safe streets and vehicles and does more
6 to get people out of cars we will continue to
7 sacrifice people in every borough to unmitigated
8 traffic violence.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

11 RICHARD ROBBINS: Hi, Chair Rodriguez
12 and, ah, Council Members Reynoso and Menchaca. Thank
13 you so much for having this. My name is Richard
14 Robbins. I serve in Manhattan in CB7. I'm on the
15 transportation committee. But I'm speaking for
16 myself. Vision Zero is a big idea. If we want to
17 save lives we can't stick to business as usual. And
18 Chair Rodriguez, you said this morning you're looking
19 for big ideas. Ah, we talked a lot about technology.
20 I don't need to go into detail, but we should mandate
21 crash avoidance technologies at least on all for-hire
22 vehicles, MTA buses, New York City fleet vehicles,
23 and heavy vehicles that do business with the city,
24 and lobby Albany to require crash avoidance
25 technologies on all cars sold in New York State. The

1 Reckless Driver Accountability Act we need to enact
2 as soon as possible. Ah, one thing about
3 enforcement. The local precincts don't have many
4 officers who are trained in radar and the officers
5 really hate doing traffic. That's not why they
6 became officers. I would love to see the police
7 split so you have a dedicated police force that's
8 doing traffic enforcement separated from the local
9 precincts. It also doesn't make sense to have the
10 precincts divided in such small areas for traffic
11 enforcement, ah, and splitting up neighborhoods into
12 small precincts. It makes sense for crime, not
13 necessarily for traffic. Ah, we also should have
14 strict enforcement, especially of the 25 mile per
15 hour speed limit. Other people have already
16 mentioned how if you drive 25 you've got cars behind
17 you either recklessly illegally passing you or right
18 on your tail. Ah, we also need your speed radar
19 signs to let people know that they're speeding in
20 addition to enforcement. Ah, we should educate
21 drivers. My local precinct analyzed 187 vehicles
22 involved in crashes at several, ah, of the worst
23 intersections. Only 15 of those, 15% of those
24 vehicles were from Manhattan and 63% were from New
25

1 York City. There were more cars from New Jersey than
2 from Manhattan, ah, in crashes on the Upper West
3 Side. Ah, so we need to educate drivers, especially
4 from outside New York City about, ah, New York City's
5 traffic laws. We need better data analysis like what
6 the precinct was able to do. Ah, but the precincts
7 don't have access to the raw data in digital form
8 from the police accident reports, the PARs. Ah, so
9 they can't do good analysis. Also, the currently
10 available police data that's made available to the
11 public doesn't have a lot of essential information
12 such as the direction of travel or ZIP codes of the
13 vehicles. So we can't access a lot of information
14 that would be really helpful for us. Ah, double
15 parking is a major issue, especially Fresh Direct.
16 Ah, they got 28,000 tickets in 2018 and paid only 1.8
17 million dollars for those tickets. That's a fraction
18 of the cost (clears throat), excuse me, of, ah, the
19 cost of fair way paid for rent just of their one
20 flagship store of 6 million dollars. So we basically
21 have a business blocking our streets and creating
22 hazards and paying, ah, a pittance in order to run
23 their business, ah, from our streets. Alternate
24 side, there's a study that says drivers spend 107

1 hours a year searching for parking. So in addition
2 to causing a lot of, ah, pollution we're causing
3 congestion, crashes, from alternate side parking.
4 Ah, bike enforcement is enforcing the wrong things.
5 We should be enforcing wrong way riding on side
6 walks, not cyclists riding slowly just to get numbers
7 up. Finally, most importantly, ah, DOT is the only,
8 ah, city agency responsible for public safety that
9 has to defer to me, ah, people on community boards
10 who have absolutely no expertise in traffic. We
11 shouldn't give people like me a veto over DOT on
12 public safety issues. Thank you very much.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Ah, is it me? Give me
16 time, I'm sorry. Um, as far as vehicle, I was once
17 hit by a car, ended up having two brain surgeries.
18 Another time biking and this concerns me, potholes.
19 Someone cut me off. I ended up hitting your pothole,
20 triple somersault off the bike with the bike landed
21 on my head, which didn't help me any further, with a
22 broken arm. My [inaudible] is about the potholes.
23 They cause injuries as well and probably other
24 problems with cars coming by because then they have
25 to stop. If someone's disabled they shouldn't have

1 to look at the ground. They should be looking at the
2 cars coming by. In fact, one time I was walking, um,
3 trying to get away from a pothole and a car zooms by
4 and almost hit me. So they're right about the signs
5 with giving them time to cross. But I'm really here
6 because they have a law here and it's called the
7 Pothole Law, that citizens, that the city cannot be
8 sued by citizens, ah, because the city is not
9 responsible for injuries, even death, it said death,
10 even if it's the city's fault with roads that aren't
11 right, potholes that are there, unless the city is
12 notified first of the pothole any person getting hurt
13 in that pothole before gets, can't sue. I had two
14 broken feet crossing the street in a pothole and I'm
15 told in court since you're the first one hurt in that
16 pothole we're not liable. Now, I'm sorry, I just
17 passed in pictures of the pothole. Who's responsible
18 for that? Someone's responsible. They left either a
19 plate off from when they built it, it's a hole. And
20 why do they have a law that doesn't protect
21 pedestrians? You're all talking about people dying
22 and everything, but when it comes to protecting
23 pedestrians you have a law that does not protect
24 them. You can't, we don't have to clean that street,
25

1 we don't have to fill in the potholes, you can't sue
2 us unless a citizen reports it. You're violating the
3 ADA laws, ah, the justice, the ADA laws for
4 disability. Crosswalks are included in that ADA
5 where crosswalks are supposed to be accessible.
6 Leaving potholes until a citizen reports the pothole,
7 you're not taking responsibility for enforcing the
8 ADA laws and making sure the crosswalks are
9 accessible.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: OK.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: And that's my point, too,
13 why do you...

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: ...have a law that doesn't
16 protect, and you're talking about all these things
17 about protecting citizens. Look at your own DOT for
18 simply making sure the crosswalks are accessible. If
19 I was in a wheelchair and hit that hole the
20 wheelchair would tip over.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So we will
22 definitely, you know, pothole and the condition of
23 the street from the perspective of being safe for
24 pedestrian, cyclists, your priority, we will continue
25 working with, you know, all, eh, community boards...

UNIDENTIFIED: Community boards do absolutely nothing.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, miss, sorry. I get it.

UNIDENTIFIED: I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So we will continue working addressing this, as I know you heard the level of, eh, alarm that we have in this situation, so we will definitely follow with DOT and other agency. But we need to leave it there. Now we're going to be calling the next panel.

UNIDENTIFIED: But I wanted to say something about the cars.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we will follow. I'm sorry, one of the staff they can follow with you. Rick, if you don't mind, can you take the information so that we can follow with you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Who is it?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, miss. Next panel now.

UNIDENTIFIED: Who?

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: He will follow with you.

UNIDENTIFIED: OK, come on.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Rick, just take her information, please.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rendy Rodriguez, J. Ocanela, Mary Razon, Scarlet Nunez, Sandy Rodriguez. [pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [speaking in Spanish]

SCARLET NUNEZ: Good morning. Um, thanks to Ydanis Rodriguez and all of you for this opportunity. We are [inaudible] from the [inaudible] High School. My name is Scarlet Nunez and our team members are, um, Sally Rodriguez, [inaudible], eh, Randy Rodriguez, and [inaudible] and today we came here to talk about a project that we think can save lives.

UNIDENTIFIED: Cycling is surely one of the best ways to travel in New York City to and from, to and from school. However, there has been an increase in the number of cycling trips that end up in tragedy in the last few years. Although we have a cycling community at our school, parents are becoming more and more afraid to let us bike to school and that is the reason that we decided to use what we've

1 learned in robotic class to create a product that
2 will help with the issue.

3 UNIDENTIFIED: We create this project
4 because we saw that a lot of cycling accidents happen
5 every day. As cyclists we notice that when a cyclist
6 is behind a car people open the door and the cyclist
7 [inaudible] don't pay attention because they are
8 looking backwards. So they hit and an accident
9 happens. What we want to prevent is that the cyclist
10 doesn't have to look behind. Our helmet will help
11 and will alert so they won't have to look back and
12 pay attention in front.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Using hardware and software
14 we came up with the idea of creating what we called a
15 smart helmet. This helmet offers what other products
16 on the outside don't, giving control to the rider.
17 This means that, um, as we know other products
18 outside are meant to help the rider after the
19 accident. What our product does is by giving control
20 to the rider we are giving them, the rider a chance
21 to, uh, perform, uh, invasive maneuver to prevent the
22 accident. Uh, using, uh, this camera, uh, we are
23 able to, uh, receive, uh, how, the speed and the
24 distance between the car behind the bike, the, the
25

1
2 bike, and with this information we could create a
3 program that sends information to the helmet alerting
4 the rider if, ah, ah, where or how long would it take
5 for the impact. Ah, with this information we could
6 also add, ah, a monitor which also shows the rider
7 what's behind them so we eliminate the need to look
8 back, which is one of the main causes of accidents.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you so much everyone
10 for inviting us here to show you how our product will
11 impact [inaudible] in a positive way. Our purpose is
12 to save more life with our innovative idea, which
13 will lead for more safety. Once we finish we hope to
14 have the opportunity to come back and show you how
15 our project will be operating. Thank you very much.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So we will
17 continue working with you. Congratulation, and again
18 this school is a school that, eh, was established to
19 work with new coming in student from Latin America.
20 They created a robotic program with the teacher who
21 is back there working with them, and right now they
22 have a five million dollar funding that, eh, is
23 provided by the council and the mayor and they are
24 one of the few schools that they're going to be
25 competing now nationwide on [inaudible] innovation

competition. So hopefully the smart helmet that they are looking to present will be the one that will win. And we hope again that from DCAS, who is back there, DOT, eh, all of us can be supporting all again how our young people can be thinking about making, eh, bringing new innovation and how cyclists will be safe in our streets. So [speaking in Spanish].

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [speaking in Spanish] OK, thank you. So and with that this hearing is adjourned. [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 3, 2020