

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

January 30, 2020  
Start: 10:21 a.m.  
Recess: 1:20 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 14<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON  
Chairperson

I. DANEEK MILLER  
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ADRIENNE E. ADAMS  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
DANIEL DROMM  
FARAH N. LOUIS  
ALAN N. MAISEL  
FRANCISCO P. MOYA  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL  
ERIC A. ULRICH

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 2

2  
3 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

4 Pamela Silverblatt  
5 Senior Vice Chancellor for Labor Relations at the  
6 City University of New York, CUNY

7 Matthew Sapienza  
8 Senior Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial  
9 Officer at the City University of New York, CUNY

10 Barbara Bowen  
11 President of Professional Staff Congress, PSC of  
12 CUNY

13 Sharon Persinger  
14 Treasurer of the Professional Staff Congress, PSC  
15 Associate Professor at Bronx Community College

16 Howard Meltzer  
17 Community College Officer of the Professional  
18 Congress Staff, PSC, Full Professor at the  
19 Borough of Manhattan Community College

20 James Davis  
21 Chapter Chair for the Professional Congress  
22 Staff, PSC at Brooklyn College

23 Kara Lang  
24 Adjunct at Bronx Community College

25 Paula Krebs  
Executive Director of the Modern Language  
Association, MLA

Martin Burke  
Professor of History and American Studies at  
Lehman College in the Graduate Center, Chair of  
The University Faculty Senate, Member of CUNY's  
Board of Trustees

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 3

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning. My

4 name is Inez Barron and I am the Chair of the

5 Committee on Higher Education. Today we are

6 conducting an oversight hearing on adjunct faculty

7 employment at CUNY and we are holding this hearing

8 jointly with the Committee on Civil Service and Labor

9 chaired by my esteemed colleague I. Daneek Miller.

10 Witnesses invited to testify today include CUNY's

11 Senior Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer

12 Matthew Sapienza and Pamela Silverblatt, Senior Vice

13 Chancellor of Labor Relations. Also invited to

14 testify today are the professional staff congress,

15 which is CUNY's faculty union; the university faculty

16 senate, university student center, adjunct faculty

17 and labor advocates, groups and other interested

18 parties. As many of you know I'm a proud alum of CUNY

19 and I believe strongly in its mission and students

20 that's why I'm so pleased to be chairing this

21 committee because CUNY students are not just bright,

22 they are engaged in their education. They deserve to

23 have the professors who not only know the subject

24 matter but make it their job to ensure that their

25 students learn it too. Of course this includes

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 4

2 lectures and exams and papers and other coursework  
3 but at its core, student engagement and success are  
4 compelled by professors who have the institutional  
5 support to counsel and mentor their students and to  
6 give them their undivided time in and sometimes  
7 outside of the classroom. Indeed, this can enable  
8 faculty to encourage the potential within their  
9 students as individuals and change their outcomes for  
10 the better. CUNY's legislative mission promotes the  
11 quote, "upward mobility of the disadvantaged in the  
12 city of New York", end quote. This mission is  
13 premised on the assumption that access and  
14 opportunity will be provided to students of all  
15 races, ethnicities and socioeconomic backgrounds but  
16 faculty and staff are also explicitly recognized as  
17 important beneficiaries of this mission. CUNY  
18 advances these values through serving its students  
19 and in supporting its world class faculty from all  
20 backgrounds, values that undergird the university's  
21 fundamental mission of teaching, research and  
22 service. It is important to note that these values  
23 don't go away simply because one has the word adjunct  
24 appended to his or her title. Adjuncts might not be  
25 full time employees, and some may only teach one or

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 5

2 two courses per semester, but they too need  
3 institutional support to serve students, better the  
4 outcomes and to honor CUNY's mission. We have seen a  
5 proliferation of reliance on adjunct faculty at major  
6 universities across the United States as student  
7 enrollments have risen, CUNY is no different.

8 According to CUNY's most recent performance  
9 management report, which was released in last May  
10 2019, the percentage of undergraduate courses taught  
11 by full time professors was just 39 percent at senior  
12 colleges which means that up to 61 percent were  
13 taught by adjunct faculty. Among CUNY's community  
14 colleges only a little more than half of instruction  
15 was taught by full time faculty meaning that nearly  
16 half of all instruction was taught by adjunct faculty  
17 and despite CUNY's mission statement of support for  
18 it's faculty, adjuncts by definition are not entitled  
19 to the same academic freedoms and protections enjoyed  
20 by CUNY's tenured professors nor as they in many  
21 cases entitled to equitable rates of pay or access to  
22 office space to counsel and mentor students or to do  
23 research and other academic supports. These  
24 discrepancies are even more alarming when one looks  
25 at the racial and ethnic demographics of adjunct

1 faculty generally. We intend to learn more about  
2 these demographics specifically at CUNY at today's  
3 hearing. However, a national study found that  
4 underrepresented minorities in adjunct positions grew  
5 by 230 percent over the 20-year period from 1993 to  
6 2013. In contrast, underrepresented minorities in  
7 full time tenured track positions grew by just 30  
8 percent, why is this? Why are we institutionally  
9 marginalizing our minorities in academia? And what  
10 can we learn from this in terms of fairness and  
11 equity for the many black and brown academics out  
12 there who as one CUNY professor previously testified,  
13 they have the money, but they can't buy the ice  
14 cream. That is, they have the credentials, they have  
15 the experience, they get the same full-time teaching  
16 jobs as their white counterparts, why can't they, why  
17 can't they get the respect and protection afforded by  
18 tenure? Is racism to blame here? I pose these  
19 questions, but I do want to acknowledge the efforts  
20 of the professional staff congress and CUNY in  
21 negotiating a new contract that extends some benefits  
22 to its adjunct faculty. These include higher pay for  
23 courses and compensated office hours to counsel  
24 students among others. While we need to explore  
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 7

2 these... while we need to explore more about these  
3 benefits, we also want to learn about what else CUNY  
4 can do to provide institutional support to those who  
5 teach the majority of its classes, it's adjuncts.  
6 Before I turn the mic over to my esteemed colleague,  
7 Council Member Miller I want to acknowledge my  
8 colleagues Farah Louis is here and Danny Dromm,  
9 Council Member Danny Dromm is here and I would like  
10 to thank Joy Simmons my Chief of Staff and Indigo  
11 Washington, my CUNY liaison and Director of  
12 Legislation; Chloe Rivera, the Committee's Senior  
13 Policy Analyst; Paul Sinegal, Counsel to the  
14 Committee and Michelle Peregrin, the Council... the  
15 Committee's Finance Analyst. I will now turn the  
16 floor over to my colleague Council Member Daneek  
17 Miller for his remarks on this important topic.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so much  
19 Council Member Barron. Good morning I'm Council  
20 Member I. Daneek Miller and I am the Chair of the  
21 Committee on Civil Service and Labor. I'd like to  
22 thank my esteemed colleague and Co-Chair Inez Barron,  
23 the Chair of Higher Education for welcoming me to be  
24 a part of this important hearing today. I would also  
25 like to acknowledge Council Member Dromm and Council

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 8

2 Member Louis for their attendance here today. Today's  
3 joint oversight hearing will focus on adjunct faculty  
4 at the city's University of New York. As Council  
5 Member Barron discussed CUNY is the largest urban  
6 public university in the United States providing  
7 accessible, high quality education to more than  
8 274,000 degree seeking students and 276,000 adult and  
9 continuing education students, 25 unique colleges  
10 across the city. For many especially in New York City  
11 CUNY has been a steppingstone, it is a... to a better  
12 life. In order to run a cohesive and effective higher  
13 education institution such as CUNY, CUNY employs a  
14 wide range of distinguished employees. CUNY's faculty  
15 has bolstered noble and posable prize winners as well  
16 as members of national academic... academies,  
17 administrators and professors both tenured and those  
18 who are adjunct make up the heart of CUNY.  
19 Specifically, more important the hearing... this  
20 hearing are the adjuncts that help teach and run  
21 CUNY. Adjunct faculty are those faculty members who's  
22 work... who work in limited capacity for the  
23 university, adjuncts can be professors, associate  
24 professors, assistant professors, adjunct faculty  
25 effectively ensures that CUNY... students at CUNY are



2 adequately taught and served each and every day.  
3 Although vital to CUNY, adjunct faculty are often  
4 underappreciated and undercompensated and work in  
5 difficult conditions with few benefits. For example,  
6 adjuncts frequently work under the threat of having  
7 their courses cancelled days before they start,  
8 rarely receive the health insurance and typically  
9 have little to say about the university's government...  
10 governance and lack of paid office hours, adjuncts  
11 are also offered short term contracts which are often  
12 grossly underpaid. To ensure that adjuncts are  
13 treated better and compensated fairly the  
14 Professional Staff Congress which is the bargaining  
15 union representing the faculty and the staff at CUNY  
16 including adjuncts have fought for additional  
17 benefits for adjunct faculty. Most notably the unions  
18 work was seen within the most recent December 20... 19  
19 ratification of a new collective bargaining  
20 agreement, PSC and CUNY, between PSC and CUNY. The  
21 contract spans a total of 63 months retroactive to  
22 December 17<sup>th</sup> through February 23 of many... of many  
23 provisions relating to CUNY's employees' adjuncts  
24 have won in this case significant concessions in the  
25 new contract which we look forward to discussing. We,

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 10

2 we are not necessarily to assume that these are what  
3 we think they are nor will they leave less work to be  
4 done on behalf of adjuncts. Included in this was  
5 substantial salary increases for three to four credit  
6 courses, a restructuring of adjunct workloads and to,  
7 to include paid office hours and paid professional  
8 development hours, access to professional  
9 development, grants for nonteaching adjuncts and  
10 increased funding for adjunct professional  
11 development fund. Although there are still issues  
12 facing adjunct faculty at CUNY, this contract ensures  
13 better salary and working trends for CUNY's employees  
14 including most importantly adjuncts. Today I would  
15 like to understand exactly the differences between  
16 adjunct and tenured staff at CUNY, how the  
17 implementation of this collective bargaining  
18 agreement will take place, the... what the shortfall...  
19 what is the shortfall if any in this new agreement  
20 and what issues must still be addressed to make CUNY  
21 a better place to work, better work environment for  
22 adjunct faculty, particularly important is the  
23 demographics data for the adjuncts as compared to  
24 full time tenured professors at CUNY. I want to know  
25 where there are noticeable racial and ethnic

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 11  
2 disparities within CUNY when looking at adjuncts for  
3 full time tenured... to... compared to full time tenured  
4 professors and if so, what can be done to address  
5 this disparity. There are questions to ask CUNY, PSC  
6 and the advocates in order to ensure that CUNY and  
7 New York City's education as a whole is where a more  
8 fair, equitable place to work, teach and learn. I'd  
9 like to thank my staff, Chief of Staff Ali  
10 Rasoulinejad; my Legislative Director Brandon Clarke;  
11 Senior Analyst and Advisor Joseph Goldbloom and  
12 Committee team Nuzhat, Kevin, Kendall, Elizabeth and  
13 John our new Financial... Finance Analyst as well. With  
14 that I'm going to pass it back over to my Co-Chair,  
15 esteemed Co-Chair Council Member Inez Barron and once  
16 again thank you for allowing me to be a part of this  
17 important hearing.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much. I  
19 do want to acknowledge we've been joined by more  
20 colleagues; we have Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, we  
21 have Council Member Adrienne Adams here. At this  
22 time, we're going to call the first panel; Matthew  
23 Sapienza, Senior Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial  
24 Officer and Pamela Silverblatt, Senior Vice  
25 Chancellor for Labor Relations of CUNY.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 12

2 [off mic dialogue]

3 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Miss would you  
4 please follow the orders that are given to you, thank  
5 you.

6 [off mic dialogue]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You've been asked  
8 several times to please take another location, thank  
9 you so much. Thank you. At this time, we're going to  
10 ask the Counsel to have... to administer the oath.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Would you please raise  
12 your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth,  
13 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your  
14 testimony before this Committee and to respond  
15 honestly to Council Member's questions?

16 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I do.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Would you please state  
18 your names for the record?

19 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I'm Pamela  
20 Silverblatt, I'm the Senior Vice Chancellor for Labor  
21 Relations at the City University of New York.

22 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Matthew Sapienza,  
23 Senior Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer at  
24 the City University.

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 13

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, you may  
3 begin.

4 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Thank you. Good  
5 morning Chairs Barron and Miller and members of the  
6 Committees on Higher Education and Civil Service and  
7 Labor. As, as you've already heard I'm Pamela  
8 Silverblatt, I'm the Senior Vice Chancellor for Labor  
9 Relations at the City University of New York and as  
10 such I'm the university's chief labor negotiator. I  
11 appreciate the opportunity to speak with you today  
12 about the collective bargaining agreement recently  
13 concluded between CUNY and the Professional Staff  
14 Congress, an agreement that Chancellor Matos  
15 Rodriguez has described as an embodiment of CUNY's  
16 strong and unwavering commitment to its faculty, both  
17 full and part time and its staff and that the PSC's  
18 leadership as well as members of its rank and file  
19 have variously hailed as an historic turning point  
20 that is principled and imaginative, a victory for  
21 every member of the union and for CUNY students and a  
22 critical investment in the quality of education CUNY  
23 provides that will pay dividends for years to come.  
24 It is, as one faculty member correctly said, a  
25 contract to be proud of. By way of background, the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 14

2 new collective bargaining agreement is a 63-month  
3 contract that has a five two percent wage increases,  
4 which compound out to 10.41 percent over the life of  
5 the agreement. It also includes many impressive gains  
6 for the 30... the approximately 30,000 full time  
7 faculty, adjuncts and professional staff in CUNY's  
8 largest union. The focus of my testimony today is the  
9 agreement's significant economic and structural  
10 enhancements for CUNY's approximately 12,000  
11 adjuncts. These enhancements are primarily in three  
12 categories; the first is salary, the second has  
13 student success and adjunct professional development  
14 and the third is stability. First, salary. Over its  
15 term, the agreement increases adjunct pay by 71  
16 percent for adjunct lecturers teaching three credit  
17 courses at the lowest level, raising the lowest end  
18 of the adjunct pay scale for a three-credit course  
19 from 3,222 dollars to 5,500 dollars over the life of  
20 the contract. This is accomplished in several ways.  
21 Teaching adjuncts will benefit from the across the  
22 board wage increases that apply to all employees in  
23 the PSC bargaining unit. moreover, beginning in the  
24 spring of 2020, the current spring that... the current  
25 semester, excuse me, that I think began Monday for

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 15

2 each three credit course taught adjuncts will receive  
3 and be required to attend one office hour per week  
4 for every three credit course for which they will be  
5 paid at their full hourly rate. This means that an  
6 adjunct teaching a three-credit course in this  
7 current semester that, that has just begun will  
8 receive more than a 38 percent pay increase starting  
9 in the spring of 2020. The total number of office  
10 hours is tied to an adjunct's course load and will  
11 range from 15 to 45 paid office hours per semester.  
12 Additionally, in the fall of 2022 semester, the  
13 current salary step schedule for teaching adjuncts  
14 will be replaced by single hourly rates for each of  
15 the adjunct titles, that will also substantially  
16 boost compensation. It is through these changes that  
17 CUNY is able to increase the lowest level of teaching  
18 adjuncts' pay by 71 percent over the life of the  
19 contract. Second, student success and adjunct  
20 professional development. In addition to increasing  
21 adjunct faculty member wages the paid office hours  
22 will provide them with more time to meet with and  
23 advise students as well as to engage in professional  
24 development activities, both of which, as the  
25 Chancellor has noted, are crucial to CUNY's efforts

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 16

2 to increase graduation rates, enhance learning, and  
3 remain a premier university. In addition, adjuncts  
4 will be compensated for attendance at critically  
5 important sexual harassment and workplace, workplace  
6 violence prevention trainings and their access to  
7 professional development opportunities will be  
8 expanded by the agreement to increase CUNY's  
9 contribution to the adjunct professional development  
10 fund, which provides grants and support of research,  
11 course, course study, conference participation and  
12 other scholarly and career advancing activities.  
13 Moreover, for the first time, non-teaching adjuncts  
14 will be eligible to apply for professional  
15 development funds to expand their opportunities for  
16 career advancement. Third, stability. As you know,  
17 CUNY and the PSC agreed to a five-year pilot program  
18 to provide multiyear appointments for teaching  
19 adjuncts, that pilot began in the 2016, 2017 academic  
20 year and was the first program of its kind in CUNY's  
21 history. The pilot was set to expire at the end of  
22 the next academic year, that is... and... academic year  
23 20... 2020 to 2021, but in the new collective  
24 bargaining agreement the pilot was extended through  
25 the end of the 2023-2024 academic year. It provides



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 17

2 teaching adjuncts who meet certain eligibility  
3 requirements to be considered for a three-year  
4 appointment rather than merely the one or two  
5 semester appointments that had previously been the  
6 only appointment options. The program promotes  
7 adjunct job stability and more fully integrates the  
8 adjunct faculty into campus life, it also enhances  
9 academic continuity for our students and lessens the  
10 administrative burdens associated with frequent one  
11 and two semester appointments. In addition to all of  
12 this, the new collective bargaining agreement has a  
13 number of considerable gains for CUNY's graduate  
14 assistants who are also represented by the PSC, they  
15 are graduate student employees who serve as adjunct  
16 instructors and researchers. These include; a 67  
17 percent increase in the amount of time graduate  
18 students may be appointed as graduate assistants,  
19 previously it had been limited to three years, it has  
20 been expanded to five years that will allow for  
21 graduate assist... graduate students as graduate  
22 assistants to earn additional compensation. We have  
23 established a labor management committee to work on  
24 expanding access to health insurance for graduate  
25 student employees through additional funding that has

2 already been set aside in the contract, certain  
3 graduate assistants will have the opportunity to  
4 teach an additional course during the year, which  
5 also will increase their compensation and starting in  
6 the spring 2020 semester an expanded cohort of  
7 graduate student employees in doctoral programs will  
8 be eligible for tuition waivers. These significant  
9 enhancements are just some of the reasons that the  
10 new collective bargaining agreement is one that both  
11 CUNY and the PSC are proud of. We at CUNY  
12 congratulate the union on getting its highest ever  
13 voter turnout for consideration of a collective  
14 bargaining agreement and for their members'  
15 overwhelming support for the ratification. Once  
16 again, I thank you for the opportunity and I would be  
17 happy to answer your questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, just  
19 before you begin, I want to acknowledge we've been  
20 joined by Council Member Alan Maisel. Thank you.

21 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Thank you. Good  
22 morning Chairpersons Barron and Miller and members of  
23 the Higher Education and Civil Service and Labor  
24 Committees. I am Matthew Sapienza, CUNY's Senior Vice  
25 Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer and I very

2 much appreciate the opportunity to speak with you  
3 about the historic collective bargaining agreement  
4 recently reached between CUNY and the Professional  
5 Staff Congress. Senior Vice Chancellor Silverblatt  
6 has provided a background on the agreement itself so  
7 my brief testimony this morning will focus on the  
8 financial impact of the contract. As contract  
9 negotiations were taking place throughout much of  
10 2019, the university maintained regular  
11 communications with our funding partners at both the  
12 state and city levels. Here in city government, the  
13 Office of Labor Relations and the Office of  
14 Management and Budget both provided invaluable  
15 guidance through the bargaining process. As you know,  
16 earlier this month, the Mayor issued the city's  
17 preliminary budget for fiscal year 2021. We were very  
18 pleased that funding was provided in the financial  
19 plan to fully cover the costs of the PSC contract at  
20 our community colleges. The funding that was provided  
21 was 35.9 million dollars in the current year, 48.2  
22 million next year, 61.1 million in fiscal year 22,  
23 80.2 million in fiscal 23 and 85.1 million in fiscal  
24 24. These funds will cover all aspects of the PSC  
25 agreement for our community colleges including

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 20  
2 salaries and fringe benefits for full time faculty,  
3 adjuncts and administrative staff in the higher  
4 education officer series. These funds will be  
5 allocated to the community colleges' individual base  
6 budgets in the current year, with appropriate  
7 adjustments in the out years. We are grateful for the  
8 city's continuing support of our community colleges.  
9 Chairpersons Barron and Miller and members of, of  
10 each committee, please be assured that the university  
11 deeply appreciates your continued commitment to a  
12 high-quality CUNY education, which is the vehicle  
13 that so many New Yorkers rely on for the path of  
14 upward mobility. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you very  
16 much for, for your testimony and so obviously there's  
17 a lot to drill down on and, and, and I guess for the  
18 purposes of where we are we want to begin very  
19 specifically about... talking about this latest  
20 collective bargaining agreement and its impact on the  
21 adjunct community and, and whether or not there is...  
22 there's been from this council there's been a mission  
23 to achieve pay equity and... throughout the city's  
24 workforce and so we want to see how this agreement  
25 fits CUNY moving in that direction for a long time

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 21

2 obviously there's been some concern about... as, as, as  
3 my opening statement indicated that, that adjuncts  
4 were often overworked and undercompensated and I  
5 think that tends to be consensus, how do we get to...  
6 how do we get to a point that we're really valuing  
7 the services and the work that they provide in a way  
8 that it is demonstrated through compensation through  
9 this agreement here and so I have a couple of  
10 questions and, and, and that is about how we did it,  
11 38 percent is obviously significant and there are  
12 some opportunities, some additional from what I see  
13 some additional learning opportunities that have...  
14 that are presented in this new agreement that didn't  
15 exist before... [cross-talk]

16 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...and so could you  
18 be very... could you specific... and I... and I know you,  
19 you talked about them but could you just reiterate  
20 what those are and how they're going to be achieved  
21 and whether or not that is... what the impact on the  
22 overall agreement is, I know we, we, we walk in and,  
23 and there's a value to the agreement, points set  
24 aside and the rest of that, what impact does... to  
25 specific attention on adjuncts have to the overall

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 22

2 agreement and, and that's kind of down the line but  
3 I, I really want to hone in on the opportunities  
4 that... for additional earnings and whether or not this  
5 includes the other fringes in terms of health care  
6 and the other benefits that they were receiving in  
7 the past so...

8 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...let's start with  
10 that.

11 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Sure, I'll start and  
12 I'll, I'll turn it over to... [cross-talk]

13 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Sure... [cross-talk]

14 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...Senior Vice  
15 Chancellor Silverblatt for more detail and, and, and  
16 thank you Chair Miller for, for you know your, your  
17 good comments about both CUNY and, and our adjuncts  
18 and I appreciate Chair Barron's opening remarks about  
19 how we have a world class faculty at CUNY and we very  
20 much value our entire faculty and... including the  
21 adjuncts and I, I also want to point out too that the  
22 38 percent increase that you referenced that's the  
23 immediate increase that adjuncts at the lower levels,  
24 you know the entry level adjuncts who was making  
25 3,200 dollars per course they're now going to have an

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 23

2 immediate 38 percent increase but when the contract  
3 is fully implemented it, it is a contract a little  
4 over five years that increase will go to 71 percent  
5 so overall over the life of the contract those  
6 adjuncts who are at the... at the entry level at 3,200  
7 dollars go to 5,500 so they'll experience a 71  
8 percent contract over that time.

9 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Thank you, so let  
10 me... let me elaborate a little bit and, and talk a  
11 little bit more from the labor relations perspective.  
12 So, the immediate 38 percent is achieved through a  
13 couple of different elements. So, first as, as you  
14 pointed out Chair Miller the contract is retroactive  
15 so the entire bargaining unit is going to receive  
16 immediately a two percent wage increase that would  
17 have been effective in October of 2018, the entire  
18 bargaining unit again including the adjuncts will  
19 receive another two percent effective in October 19  
20 so those two payments are retroactive and when the  
21 increases are paid and the rates go up and this... you...  
22 that gets implemented they will get those increases  
23 plus starting in the spring semester adjuncts  
24 teaching a three credit course will receive an  
25 additional office hour so for every three credit

2 course which meets... generally for 15 weeks they're  
3 going to get 15 office hours. So, they're going to  
4 get a one third increase in their compensation as a  
5 result of the implementation of the new office hours  
6 which are substantially going to benefit the students  
7 because they're going to be able to have the  
8 additional contact time with their faculty. So, we  
9 think in, in effect restructuring the adjunct work in  
10 this way we were able to... were able to both  
11 substantially increase adjunct compensation in the  
12 direction that this Council has clearly indicated  
13 that it wants to see CUNY going but also provide  
14 valuable contact time for our students with the  
15 faculty so, so that initial restructuring and that  
16 represents I would say and I'm going to leave this to  
17 my colleagues at PSC later but that really is a, a  
18 considerable restructuring of the way adjunct work at  
19 CUNY has historically not just been compensated but  
20 has happened, this is going to be pre-determined time  
21 that adjunct faculty will hold office hours where  
22 their students can come in, can ask follow up  
23 questions, can get further information, can interact  
24 one on one, where former students can come back and  
25 ask an adjunct faculty person perhaps for a



2 recommendation for an advanced or a graduate program.

3 The implementation of office hours, the building in  
4 of office hours that way for adjuncts makes that the,  
5 I would say more similar to the way office hours are  
6 constructed for full time faculty. So, it's both a  
7 paid piece but it's also an education piece.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, so I, I...  
9 yeah, that was the next question how, how like  
10 compensation was this to full... or, or tenured so  
11 it's, it's more consistent with that but were they  
12 performing this task in the past and was there any  
13 compensation available to them?

14 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: There was very  
15 limited compensation in order for adjuncts to be... get  
16 a paid office hour in the past there was a much  
17 higher threshold for what they had to be teaching so  
18 there's a much lower threshold which means a much  
19 more... a much larger group of adjuncts will, will be  
20 getting it, most of our courses at CUNY, we do have  
21 some four credit courses but in the main... the  
22 academic courses are three credits so many, many,  
23 many more adjuncts will now be getting the office  
24 hour and many, many, many more students will have  
25 that benefit.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 26

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, my, my, my  
3 former business agent hat really... [cross-talk]

4 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yeah... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...wants to dive  
6 into this stuff here but, but, but really what I...  
7 what I want to... what I would like to see is, is what  
8 input did PSC have in this in really identifying  
9 these possibilities for further compensation because  
10 a lot of times we, we get kind of stuck on the... on  
11 the... on the tasks that get performed on the day to  
12 day but how do we really enhance the institution by  
13 be... allowing them to perform the tasks that aren't  
14 being performed and giving the students, many  
15 students who need the additional access to these  
16 professors, how, how do we kind of prioritize them  
17 and, and... by compensating and, and creating this  
18 opportunity for the adjuncts so that these students  
19 can come in and have really more time and so I think  
20 if we can identify these types of scenarios across  
21 the board we are providing a better service and, and  
22 therefore kind of get what you pay for so what role  
23 did PSC have in, in being able to identify and, and,  
24 and just tell me about working collectively... [cross-  
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 27

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Okay... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...on this

4 contract.

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I am thrilled to  
6 have the opportunity to do that, I have been... I have  
7 been CUNY's lead labor negotiator for a dozen years  
8 and before that I was the first deputy labor  
9 commissioner for the city of New York for a long time  
10 so I have negotiated with the UFT, I've negotiated  
11 with DC 37, I have negotiated with the spectrum of  
12 unions in, in the city and the PSC is extremely well  
13 informed, they are extremely involved, the leadership  
14 is preeminent and takes it's role as seriously as can  
15 be taken and I think that its fair to say that we've  
16 spent thousands of hours negotiating this contract.  
17 The bargaining for this contract began more than a  
18 full year before the contract was settled and so we  
19 spent a lot of preliminary time exchanging proposals,  
20 bargaining as you know is very complicated and even  
21 when you want something and even when you get  
22 something that's like what you want that its not  
23 usually where you started out so we spent a long time  
24 exchanging preliminary proposals, we provide  
25 educational material back and forth, we have a

2 collaborative working relationship that sometimes as  
3 you know becomes, you know somewhat adversarial in  
4 bargaining, the complete structure of what was  
5 negotiated for the adjuncts, the restructuring of  
6 their work, the restructuring of the office hours was  
7 completely negotiated with PSC, there's not an  
8 element of what I discussed and what I spoke about  
9 that was not completely and fully negotiated across  
10 the bargaining table with the representatives of the  
11 PSC with Barbara Bowen as their lead negotiator and a  
12 very robust bargaining team that represents all of  
13 their constituencies so there's not an element in any  
14 of this that is university unilaterally imposed, this  
15 is all completely bargained for.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, I'm, I'm  
17 going to pass it to my colleague for questioning and  
18 I'm sure everybody on the panel has, has a lot of  
19 questions and, and I'm so.. and I just want to say  
20 that I'm, I'm really glad that, that, that CUNY and  
21 PSC has really set the template for pay equity and  
22 how we get there, how we work together and be  
23 creative and, and value and compensate the people  
24 that deserve to be compensated in, in the way that  
25 they do so before I.. and then.. and, and then the last

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 29

2 time I was reminded that the last time we were all  
3 together we, we were getting arrested, right and, and  
4 for this very reason that, that there wasn't an  
5 investment not just in the students in the  
6 institution but in, in the faculty and staff so we're  
7 glad that we didn't have to get arrested again to  
8 make sure that that happened so, Council Member  
9 Barron.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Thank you  
11 Council Member Miller and we were also fighting for  
12 the Governor to support the maintenance of effort  
13 agreement which didn't happen so we may have to go  
14 back again Council Member and push that issue. I have  
15 several questions before I turn it over to other  
16 colleagues that are here and I first want to  
17 acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Alan  
18 Maisel, I think I did that and Council Member Helen  
19 Rosenthal stopped by as well. What are the... what... the  
20 new price... the new salaries that the adjuncts will  
21 have, you talk about in your testimony that it would  
22 be an hourly rate, what is that, how do we calculate  
23 that hourly rate Miss Silverblatt in your testimony I  
24 believe you mentioned... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 30

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Certainly... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...an hourly rate.

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...so, so what we have  
6 done is... as, I... as I mentioned... so, there is steps...  
7 there is a salary schedule for each of the adjunct  
8 titles so as, as... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: For each title?

10 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many adjunct  
12 titles are there?

13 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, there's adjunct  
14 lecturer, there's adjunct assistant professor,  
15 there's adjunct associate professor and there's  
16 adjunct professor. Within each of those titles there  
17 are several steps, they, they don't have the same  
18 amount in each title some may have four, some may  
19 have six but there are steps in each title and, and  
20 an adjunct like full time faculty progress through  
21 the steps as they gain more service. So, for the  
22 first four years of the contract or for the, the  
23 first four wage increases across the board increases  
24 that are going to apply to the entire bargaining unit  
25 are going to apply to the adjuncts as well so they're

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 31

2 going to get those first four two percent increases..

3 [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Rather than the last

6 two percent increase because there's a 52 percent

7 increase for... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

9 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...everybody we... and

10 in effect this was negotiated.. say negotiated rate

11 also, we negotiated with the union and worked with

12 our funding partners to in effect collapse the steps

13 so adjunct are not now going to have to wait years

14 and years to move through all the steps, we set a

15 single rate in each title and that single rate in

16 each title will mean that the overwhelming majority

17 of adjuncts when that single rate is implemented will

18 get yet another boost up. So, that's... when I talk

19 about single rate or flat rate it really means that

20 for the adjunct lecturer there's going to be one pay

21 rate, for the assistant professor there will be one,

22 for the associate and so on and in doing that and

23 collapsing the four rates or six rates into one we

24 collapsed and we bumped up again fully negotiated and

25

2 that's another element to boosting compensation and  
3 that becomes effective in the fall of 2022.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Fall of 2022 that  
5 collapse becomes effective.

6 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yeah, I'm pretty  
7 sure that's the date.

8 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh, that's right.

9 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yes, okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you find... what  
11 would you say is the concentration of black adjunct  
12 faculties in each of these levels that you have  
13 identified?

14 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, I don't have a  
15 breakout with me by level, I may if I take a moment  
16 be able to talk... tell you about the breakout of  
17 minority federally protected adjuncts versus white or  
18 non-minority but I'm not sure that I, I, I don't have  
19 with me, I know that I do not have that with me.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, but you said  
21 you had some other... [cross-talk]

22 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...a breakout by  
23 level. Right so, so based on the latest information  
24 that was provided the percentage of adjuncts in  
25 federally protected groups is nearly 42 percent and



2 the percentage of what are being referred to as  
3 white, not including I believe Italian Americans  
4 which are a protected group at CUNY is slightly more  
5 than 54 percent.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if you could get  
7 me that desegregation for... [cross-talk]

8 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Sure... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...black, if you don't  
10 have it you could give that... [cross-talk]

11 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I certainly don't...  
12 [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...to me, I'm, I'm  
14 always... [cross-talk]

15 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...certainly do not  
16 have it by level... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...concerned because  
18 when I look at CUNY's data it's horrible in terms of  
19 black and brown professors, adjuncts being adequately  
20 represented, hired, they get... they don't even get  
21 offers for positions at the same level and they don't  
22 get those positions and we've been talking about this  
23 for six years now and looking to really try to see  
24 what we can do to make that a reality.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 34

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah and Chair Barron  
3 if I... if I can I just want to address you at your  
4 very good point about... and we have some data on full  
5 time faculty... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

7 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...new, new hires...  
8 [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

10 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...this is not adjuncts,  
11 its full time but I think, you know we've shown  
12 really good progress and I know there's a lot more to  
13 do and that this is very important to our new  
14 Chancellor, Felix Matos Rodriguez and to our board  
15 but in the fiscal year 2013/14 the percentage of new  
16 full time faculty that were hired that were in  
17 minority federally protected groups was 30.4 percent.  
18 In 2018/2019, five years later, the percentage of new  
19 full-time faculty that were in federally protected  
20 minority groups was 48.1 percent and so... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What year was that?

22 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: 2018/19.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

24 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: So... and just to give  
25 you the data by year, in 13/14 it was 30.4 percent,

2 the next year it went up to 37.2, in 15/16 it went up  
3 to 38.9, in 16/17 it went up to 43.8, in 17/18 it  
4 went up to 46.1 and then in 18/19 it went up to 48.1  
5 so we've had increases in each of the last five years  
6 in, in terms of the percentage of minority  
7 representation of full time new faculty hires. Again,  
8 we want to continue to increase that because we know  
9 that there's, there's certainly room for improvement  
10 there but we think we're showing good progress and we  
11 want to keep on that path in front of us.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Except that... except  
13 that when we disaggregate the figures we don't see  
14 that, see what happens when blacks get lumped into  
15 this whole big category we lose out, we lose out, we  
16 don't get those same kinds of incremental  
17 improvements and that's always been a concern that  
18 I've had... [cross-talk]

19 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...so I, I would like  
21 to see the data because as I recall it's not... it's  
22 not showing growth.

23 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I, I, I do have it so  
24 for... [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 36

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...for, for new faculty...

3 [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...for blacks it... in, in  
6 13/14... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

8 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...the percentage of new  
9 hires was 6.2 percent and in 18/19 it was 12 percent.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 12 percent, okay...

11 [cross-talk]

12 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: So, we have gone up.  
13 Again, certainly room for improvement there,  
14 certainly we want to continue to, to show progress on  
15 those numbers but, but we have shown improvement over  
16 the last five years but having said that we know that  
17 there's, there's a lot more room for growth there.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you and so now  
19 that's your new hires, how does that... [cross-talk]

20 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yes... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...weigh out in terms  
22 of faculty, black faculty and minority faculty as  
23 well that leave, how does that weigh out overall?

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 37

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I don't know if we  
3 have data in terms of turn... you know folks who, who  
4 leave the system but... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Because if you're  
6 hiring... [cross-talk]

7 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...yes... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...at 12 percent but  
9 then you have faculty that are leaving for various  
10 reasons that certainly then doesn't maintain or get...  
11 [cross-talk]

12 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...us the numbers to  
14 show that there's increases.

15 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Right, no, understood.  
16 We'll, we'll get you that data in terms of... [cross-  
17 talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I appreciate...  
19 [cross-talk]

20 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...how many... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...that... [cross-talk]

23 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...in terms of  
24 separations I should say.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and what is  
3 the... what is the... what are the hiring practices for  
4 adjuncts as opposed to full time faculty, how are  
5 they recruited and how do they get an opportunity to  
6 present themselves for an interview to hopefully then  
7 finally get a position, an offer?

8 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah, you know what  
9 for full time faculty, you know formal search  
10 processes take place on each of our campuses... [cross-  
11 talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

13 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...usually these are  
14 national searches in terms for... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

16 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...full time faculty,  
17 for adjuncts the process is not as formal, the hiring  
18 is usually done at the department level within each  
19 college, there are often times where the... a faculty...  
20 a full time faculty member will inform the department  
21 that, you know they won't be coming back for the fall  
22 semester lets say and the department has to find  
23 someone to be in that classroom and so they, they'll  
24 decide that they'll go the adjunct route in order to  
25 get someone in quickly so it's usually done at the

2 department level and usually contacts with folks who  
3 are currently in the department whether they're  
4 faculty... other faculty or adjuncts are a, a pathway  
5 in which new adjuncts come in.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what are the  
7 requirements, what's the minimal requirement in terms  
8 of academic background for an adjunct?

9 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Off the... most  
10 adjuncts, I think probably the majority of adjuncts  
11 are masters level educated and that is a difference  
12 than for the professor titles, for professor title  
13 generally have to have a PhD, there are some minor...  
14 in, in various... in certain fields if you have a  
15 terminal degree but generally in any title that says  
16 professor that's a PhD requirement. The title at  
17 CUNY, the full-time title that does not have the PhD  
18 requirement is the lecturer title and I think that  
19 the majority of our adjuncts are in lecturer titles  
20 and that's much more likely to be a masters level  
21 education.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And how long can you  
23 maintain a contract with CUNY as a lecturer, is there  
24 a limit, is there...

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 40

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: No... the answer is  
3 no... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...that the lecturer  
6 title has... it's sort of its own equivalent ultimately  
7 to getting tenure so you can become a lecturer at  
8 CUNY and have an entire career as a lecturer at CUNY,  
9 there is a title... we have so many titles, there is a  
10 title called instructor which is time limited which  
11 gives someone the opportunity if someone comes in and  
12 they're pursuing a PhD it gives them the opportunity  
13 to get a PhD and that title is a time limited title  
14 but the lecturer we have... the lecturer title is  
15 intended to be a career, a full time career title.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, what is the  
17 difference between a teaching and non-teaching  
18 adjunct?

19 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So teaching adjuncts  
20 are in the classroom, that... they're what we're  
21 thinking about and what we're talking about when we  
22 talk about this, professors, you, you may be an  
23 adjunct teaching in a class and even if you're an  
24 adjunct and even if you have a masters level  
25 education your students are most likely going to call



2 you professor so that's what we think about. Non-  
3 teaching adjuncts generally can be in a variety of  
4 administrative roles that's where that title is much  
5 more likely to be used.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And, and I'd also  
7 like to get the disaggregated data as to where blacks  
8 fit into these various levels and the various types  
9 of adjuncts that you have talked about and do we find  
10 that adjuncts as a whole are concentrated in  
11 particular areas of study, are there more  
12 concentrations of adjuncts in any particular major  
13 area of study?

14 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, we would have to  
15 look, I, I think it's fair to say that we have  
16 adjuncts probably in the overwhelming majority of  
17 areas of study however without looking at data I... it  
18 is also I think fair to say that we have real  
19 concentrations of adjuncts probably in large  
20 departments that are likely to have large entry level  
21 classes; English, math so I think you're going to see  
22 adjuncts in every... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Would you find...  
24 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 42

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...discipline... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...many adjuncts or as  
5 many adjuncts in the science, in the hard sciences as  
6 you would in the social sciences?

7 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I, I would have... we  
8 would have to look at that, I would... I would guess  
9 that we have fewer full professors in the hard  
10 sciences than the social sciences so I, I would  
11 expect there to be fewer adjuncts in the same way  
12 that there are fewer full... fewer professors in those  
13 titles.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In terms of now CUNY  
15 having negotiated this contract and increasing the  
16 salary compensation for adjuncts, how does that  
17 impact on those instructors, lecturers who are full  
18 time moving up that ladder that CUNY has, that tenure  
19 track ladder?

20 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: They will continue  
21 on their trajectory, I, I see... I don't see that, that  
22 this impacts negatively at all, they will get the  
23 five two percent raises as... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm talking about  
25 the... how many... how many positions are there that are

2 vacant that, that adjuncts... well full time... full time  
3 faculty would like... would have to be able to move  
4 into, how many vacancies and what determines whether  
5 you maintain a position... whether an institution  
6 maintains a position or fills it with adjuncts rather  
7 than full time faculty?

8 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Its local decisions  
9 made at the campus level and, and made in individual  
10 departments. Like I said earlier there could be... many  
11 times there are examples where the semester is about  
12 to begin and a full time position will leave and so  
13 the search process won't be completed by the time the  
14 semester is going to start and so an adjunct is, is  
15 filled and so there could be situations like that or  
16 someone leaves in the middle of the... in, in the  
17 middle of a semester where an adjunct is filled but  
18 for the most part those are determined by the campus  
19 and, and by each indivial department.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you have any way  
21 of determining which adjuncts would in fact want a  
22 full-time position, how do we know that there are  
23 adjuncts who would in fact want to have a full-time  
24 position but have not been offered one?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 44

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I don't know if we  
3 have that data but one thing that I do want to point  
4 out Chair Barron is that we have say over the last  
5 ten years have successfully negotiated adjunct to  
6 lecturer conversion lines with the... with the  
7 professional staff congress... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Adjunct to lecturer  
9 conversion line... [cross-talk]

10 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Conversion lines...  
11 [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...okay... [cross-talk]

13 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah, where... say over  
14 that time period there have been several hundred  
15 adjuncts that we have... that we have converted into,  
16 into lecturers and so they went from part time status  
17 to full time status... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

19 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...and that has... that  
20 has been successful and then I think at each... again  
21 at each campus there are adjuncts who have been long  
22 serving and have done, you know good work within  
23 their departments that if an opportunity arises that  
24 they'll qualify for that they would be considered.

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 45

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Right... [off mic  
3 dialogue] certainly if... when, when a full-time  
4 position... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Could you talk into  
6 your mic.

7 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Oh, I'm sorry, when  
8 full time positions are going to be filled, full time  
9 professor positions generally require... generally not  
10 required but generally involve significant searches,  
11 often there are national searches done, there's  
12 outreach done to the respective affinity groups and  
13 so if there is going to be a search for a full time  
14 line and there is a qualified adjunct they certainly  
15 can apply for those positions.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, in... [cross-  
17 talk]

18 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: It is known when  
19 those positions are... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, in that line...  
21 my colleague has a question that he would like to  
22 ask.

23 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Sure...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, that, that  
25 is simply... is, is that line that particular full time

2 line as, as we use is it baselined or once you fill  
3 it with an adjunct is it a possibility that it  
4 remains as such or does it go back to a full time  
5 line?

6 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Usually if, if, if  
7 it's... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Or is it local?

9 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Its, its local but  
10 what I... what I... what I do want to add is that usually  
11 the line is full time, the college tries to do what  
12 it can to maintain that full time line but a lot of  
13 it depends on circumstances meaning, you know...  
14 [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What's the data  
16 on diminishing... on those diminishing lines over the  
17 past five years?

18 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Our number of full-  
19 time faculty overall has remained pretty constant  
20 over the last several years at about 7,500 full time  
21 faculty lines throughout the university, we've had  
22 about 7,500 and it's been pretty constant at about...  
23 [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And what, what  
25 percentage is that?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 47

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: We have about 7,500  
3 full time faculty and we have about 12,600 and again  
4 I'm using fall 2019 data, 12,600 part time faculty.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

6 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: So, again a lot of it  
7 depends on circumstances and those could be financial  
8 circumstances, it could be based on the enrollment  
9 within particular courses whether it's full time or  
10 adjuncts so it could change but it depends on the,  
11 the individual circumstances at that campus.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you,  
13 Council Member Adams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you Mr.  
15 Chair, thank you Madame Chair for this important  
16 hearing today and thank you for your testimony thus  
17 far. My questions have to go in line with Council  
18 Member Barron's questions regarding teaching adjuncts  
19 versus administrative adjuncts, do teaching adjunct  
20 faculty typically tend to teach more than one course?

21 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I, I would want to  
22 give you data on that, it is not a... it is not  
23 uncommon for teaching adjuncts to teach more than one  
24 course so they can teach... and again pursuant to the  
25 contract which is negotiated the adjuncts can teach a

2 maximum, there are various constraints but adjuncts  
3 can teach in the main a maximum of three courses in a  
4 semester at a college.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Is there an  
6 average to your knowledge? One, two, the max is three  
7 so...

8 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: We, we would have to  
9 get back... [cross-talk]

10 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: We'd get that to you...  
11 [cross-talk]

12 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...to you, I don't... I  
13 don't want to misspeak on something quite so factual.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay. In, in  
15 looking at administrative, administrative versus  
16 teaching, you mentioned the administrative adjunct  
17 I'm just curious to know what types of administrative  
18 positions in, in the realm of adjunct, can you  
19 explain that a little bit?

20 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, they can... they  
21 can be assigned in a department to, to do various  
22 kinds of administrative work, it, it can be research  
23 work, it can be support work, it can be program work  
24 but it's not teaching in a classroom.



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 49

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay. I think that  
3 is... that's it for now, I may want another round but  
4 thank you very much.

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Council Member  
7 Barron.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, I, I want to go  
9 now to... you talked about the pilot program that you  
10 had and that you'll be extending... [cross-talk]

11 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yes, ma'am.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you have any  
13 analysis of how that program has fared thus far?

14 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: We don't that's the  
15 reason that its, its being done as a pilot, I can  
16 anecdotally say that I think in the initial  
17 implementation where we had a large group that we  
18 were bringing onboard because anybody who met the  
19 eligibility criteria would be moved in, I think that  
20 that initial cohort was a thousand plus people... more  
21 than a thousand adjuncts receiving the three year,  
22 the multi appointments. Once we got the sort of  
23 waiting and pent up group onboard the annual number  
24 of course is going to be small... much smaller because  
25

2 it's just the people who in the next subsequent years  
3 become eligible.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What's the criteria  
5 for being eligible?

6 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And how, how are  
8 adjuncts informed of this... [cross-talk]

9 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Sure... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...opportunity?

11 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Sure, so the initial  
12 criteria as we set them in the first round required  
13 adjunct to have worked for a continuous period of  
14 time, it, it was either ten or 12 direct semesters  
15 continuously without breaks because there was certain  
16 circumstances brought to our attention by the union  
17 where someone may have a break of one semester in  
18 there for medical reasons, you know some other reason  
19 where they might have a break we've negotiated in  
20 this last round the opportunity for it to be I... I'm  
21 going to look at Barbara, I think it was ten out of  
22 12 of the last consecutive semesters in order to get...  
23 in order to become eligible for the multiyear  
24 appointment. I'm sorry, I, I keep moving this.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 51

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the first cohort  
3 had a thousand...

4 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: A thousand... more  
5 than a thousand.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: More than a thousand  
7 and it was a five year... did you say it was a five-  
8 year pilot?

9 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I believe we did it  
10 as a three year and then... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Three year... [cross-  
12 talk]

13 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...extended it an  
14 extra three years, I want to... I want to count the  
15 years...

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, each year  
17 there's a cohort that, that's offered... [cross-talk]

18 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: New cohort... [cross-  
19 talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...this opportunity...  
21 [cross-talk]

22 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yes, yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And they're  
24 guaranteed, or they're offered an opportunity to have

25

2 a three-year contract rather than a one- or two-year  
3 contract?

4 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Right, three-year  
5 appointment... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And at, at the end  
7 of that time can they apply again?

8 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: They, they are... they  
9 need to be considered, it is a mandatory  
10 consideration at the end of the three years, yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I would like  
12 to get whatever data you have as to... and then how  
13 were... how were they informed of this opportunity?

14 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: There's outreach  
15 done at the colleges, there is outreach done by the  
16 union when the contract was initially settled,  
17 there's broad communication that is done to everyone.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And as adjuncts now  
19 are going to be able... or going to be able to have  
20 extended... or extended contact with students will they  
21 have office space that is dedicated where they know,  
22 okay, I'll meet you in room 104?

23 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, similar, similar  
24 to other issues this really is something that gets  
25 handled locally and so we have spoken to the

1  
2 presidents, the provost, all of the administration at  
3 the colleges and I believe that the union has  
4 communicated as well with the Chairs to tell people  
5 that they need to be creative in finding office  
6 space, it is quite possible that there are  
7 departments where they will share office space, where  
8 they might rotate who uses the office, it is possible  
9 if a department has a large enough room that they  
10 could put several desks in and use that for office  
11 space, we are encouraging creativity and flexibility  
12 in, in being able to accommodate the office space  
13 needs.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, do any of my  
15 colleagues, any of my colleagues have any other  
16 questions? Okay, Council Member Louis.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I just want to  
18 thank Chair Miller and Chair Barron for hosting this  
19 oversight meeting today. So, I just have two quick  
20 questions, this is based off of office hours, going  
21 back off of what Council Member Barron mentioned. I  
22 just wanted to know was there an impact on student  
23 performance that led to the implementation in this  
24 negotiation?  
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 54

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, there, there are  
3 study... there are national studies that... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Uh-huh... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...that have been done  
7 that indicate that greater student contact with  
8 faculty fosters better student outcomes and that is  
9 something that the union has continued to cite over  
10 several rounds of bargaining, this... I would say it's  
11 where we got to in this round wasn't just because of  
12 this round, it was really the conclusion culmination  
13 of work that's been done over several rounds and the  
14 union continues to point back to that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: And do you have  
16 the numbers for New York City?

17 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I do not.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Okay, it would be  
19 great if we could have that information so we can see  
20 what's been happening. Also what are the exact... you  
21 mentioned in your, your testimony that there were new  
22 benefits that were given to the adjuncts based off  
23 the negotiations, I wanted to know what are the exact  
24 benefits that are going to be offered to the adjunct  
25 and the non-teaching adjuncts with the new

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 55

2 negotiations, I know like there's an increase in pay..

3 [cross-talk]

4 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Right.. [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: ...the office hours

6 they get paid for as well, what other benefits will

7 the adjuncts receive?

8 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Right, so.. [cross-

9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you.. [cross-

11 talk]

12 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...so there is the

13 salary increase, there, there are the across the

14 board increases and then there is the, the

15 significant step up, there are the office hours,

16 there are increased contributions to the professional

17 development fund on behalf of the adjuncts, there is..

18 I'm just thumbing through to see what I'm missing off

19 the top of my head.. what else.. there is the inclusion

20 as we said of the non-teaching adjunct who were

21 previously not eligible to be able to participate in

22 the professional development fund and something like

23 that is something that we view as a benefit because

24 it's something that in effect we had to agree to, the

25 union has to ask it and we have to be willing to

2 agree so we view that as an enhancement, lets see  
3 what do I have...

4 [off mic dialogue]

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Right, I'm... you know  
6 I'm not sure if in asking your question you were... you  
7 were capturing the graduate assistants, the graduate  
8 employees... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yes, them as well...  
10 [cross-talk]

11 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...also...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yes.

13 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, the graduate  
14 employees there are... there are a few different  
15 opportunities, there's, there was an increase in the  
16 number of hours that could be taught by graduate  
17 assistants, again that enters to or results in  
18 additional pay... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: You mentioned the  
20 waiver as well... [cross-talk]

21 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...there are tuition...  
22 [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: ...for tuition...  
24 [cross-talk]



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 57

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...waivers... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Right...

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...yes, that had only  
6 been available up to five years, we've now extended  
7 the opportunity for those tuition waivers for  
8 graduate students who go into years six and seven, so  
9 we've added two years on the tuition waivers...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: What about health  
11 care?

12 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Health care is  
13 different than for adjuncts and graduate students, so  
14 health care is interesting so we have long provided  
15 health care for a large group of adjuncts unlike  
16 other places, the universities where there's not  
17 necessarily health insurance for adjuncts CUNY has  
18 for a very long time provided health insurance for  
19 adjuncts who meet threshold eligibility just like,  
20 you know in the city workforce if you're a part timer  
21 you have to work the equivalent of half time or  
22 something to get health insurance, in CUNY they have  
23 a threshold criteria and so for... we, we did this many  
24 years ago and actually this is something that we  
25 negotiated not in a round of bargaining but in an off

2 round where we weren't even in negotiations we  
3 negotiated better health care for our adjuncts, in  
4 effect what we negotiated and we needed the city's  
5 support for this because the city manages the health...  
6 we're in the city's health insurance program, we  
7 negotiated the ability for our adjuncts to  
8 participate in the city's health... our eligible  
9 adjuncts to participate in the city's health  
10 insurance plan so they had not been, they had had  
11 health insurance provided by the union welfare fund,  
12 the city under prior administration allowed us,  
13 agreed to allow the adjuncts to move into the city  
14 health benefits program so that has long existed and  
15 the graduate students also years ago we worked with  
16 the state for eligible graduate students to be able  
17 to be in the state what's called NYSHIP where the  
18 SUNY graduate students are also and what we did in  
19 this contract is we set aside money, we've already  
20 earmarked money to have discussions with the union  
21 about what their... about how to expand the health  
22 insurance for graduate students so the money is  
23 earmarked, its set aside and we are going to have  
24 those discussions.

25 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 59

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: You're welcome.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, I just  
5 want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council  
6 Member Rodriguez and I believe he has a question.

7 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Sure.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
9 thank you Chair and how do you anticipate that this  
10 budget proposed in Albany will effect any agreement  
11 that you already have made with the PSC, any  
12 projection on how this budget will have a negative  
13 impact on CUNY?

14 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh. Councilman  
15 Rodriguez the, the Governor's executive budget was  
16 issued last week and so, you know we're going through  
17 that to, to evaluate the impact of it, we know that  
18 this is, you know the first round in the budget  
19 negotiations in Albany and that the assembly and  
20 senate will, will come up with their proposals and  
21 that, you know we have until April 1<sup>st</sup> to have an  
22 enacted budget so we're going to continue to talk  
23 with our, our funding partners up there and both the  
24 executive, the assembly and the... and the senate to...  
25 about all of our needs that we outlined in the budget

2 request including collective bargaining costs and  
3 we're hopeful that when the final budget is enacted  
4 that we'll have additional support to help cover all  
5 of our needs.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But the budget  
7 proposal as it is, we know that is very negative of  
8 CUNY, right?

9 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I wouldn't say its  
10 negative, the, the overall budget for the senior  
11 colleges increases about 2.2 percent, we got some  
12 additional money for fringe benefits in, in there,  
13 the opportunity programs were kept at current year  
14 levels which is something that has been different in  
15 years past so we were grateful to see that, some  
16 additional funds on capital so while there's a lot  
17 more needs that we'd like to see covered in the final  
18 state enacted budget wouldn't necessarily... it was  
19 negative... I think there were some, some real positive  
20 items that were in there for CUNY in the state  
21 executive budget.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, but we  
23 also know that in this budget they did not address  
24 how colleges, call it Hunter College, school, I mean  
25 any area related to nursing, city college school of

2 engineer it causes a student... it causes a college  
3 three times to graduate a, a student at an engineer  
4 school than another college student that graduated  
5 like myself in political science but the college only  
6 gets the same amount of dollars per student, same  
7 thing in the Sophie Davis, does a student in the  
8 Sophie Davis... they don't get any additional even  
9 though it costs the college three times more to  
10 graduating... [cross-talk]

11 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...you know the  
13 average so it's still this budget they don't address  
14 that difference, right, in college that they have  
15 the... [cross-talk]

16 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Right, the, the... on  
17 the state side for the community colleges there is a  
18 base aid for FTE, for student FTE so that's a two...  
19 this year is 2,947 dollars and the proposal in the  
20 executive budget was, was that that would repeat...  
21 [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But let me...  
23 let me start from this...

24 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah...

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 62

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Because  
3 there's no... the back and forth there's no  
4 explanation, there's no detail, the formula as cities  
5 right now...

6 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...a student who  
8 graduated from political science like myself...

9 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...if I cost a  
11 college let's say 7,000 dollars a year...

12 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...the college  
14 gets the 7,000 but it... any college that requires that  
15 they need to have additional labs, that they need to  
16 have additional science and engineer and instead of  
17 saving it cost 21,000 dollars to graduate this  
18 student... [cross-talk]

19 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...the state  
21 doesn't address the difference... [cross-talk]

22 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: No... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...the college  
24 is still continuing to get 7,000 and therefore it had

25

2 an impact on how much they can pay for, for their  
3 professors.

4 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Right, for, for the  
5 four year colleges there is no per student FTE  
6 formula like there is for the community colleges, the  
7 state... for senior colleges it's more incremental  
8 based budgeting so there's not a per student amount  
9 that SUNY receives or, or CUNY receives so those  
10 things in terms of more costly programs are handled  
11 internally with... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But it costs  
13 more to graduate a student in a school of  
14 engineering... [cross-talk]

15 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Sure... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...than to  
17 graduate a student in political science.

18 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Sure...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And the  
20 college doesn't get additional funding to graduate  
21 that student even though we have colleges like the  
22 school of engineering, city college which is the one  
23 that graduates more students of color in the nation  
24 and even though we have Sophie Davis that is in risk,  
25 you see we don't know the future of Sophie Davis and

2 a lot got to do with the funding so I feel that as we  
3 are having this conversation with the... you know how,  
4 you know we are looking at the adjunct and the  
5 tenured professor we also need to look at the  
6 specificity of those...

7 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...and... but  
9 putting that aside where do we have more adjunct and  
10 tenured professors at senior colleges or at community  
11 colleges?

12 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I don't know if we  
13 have that data but let me check really quick...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And as you  
15 look at the data... [cross-talk]

16 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah, I, I... [cross-  
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...I address...  
19 [cross-talk]

20 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I believe... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...Chair you  
23 know that as I said before when I... when I went to  
24 city college even though the black and Latino  
25 population increased in our city today different



2 from... if you walk through city college today you

3 don't think that this is the same city college...

4 [cross-talk]

5 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...that we have

7 in the 80's, you think that each state college have

8 been gentrified like we used to be 80 percent of the

9 students black and Latino and today population at

10 senior colleges even though we grow up in population

11 wise the student population is like at 71 percent

12 black and Latino so I would like to see where do we

13 have more adjuncts because after Badillo and CUNY

14 went through the whole things about getting rid of

15 remedial courses which are benefiting others to be

16 here, what they did was a student who averages at

17 least less than 80 they are sent to community college

18 and I would like to see where... do we by any chance

19 have... if we look up percentage do we have more, you

20 know adjuncts at community college where they have

21 more need, where they also have more... they, they had

22 to work with a student that they are... it takes six

23 years for them to graduate even though they're

24 supposed to graduate in two years because most of

25



1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 67

2 percent, I don't know that number right now, needed  
3 remedial courses, you know they work so hard and I  
4 think... and again this is not new because now I look  
5 back on when we took over city college and CUNY in  
6 the 80's and I say we did a favor to the  
7 administration, because of our fight we were able to  
8 restore the funding and I hope that the students they  
9 will do the same thing this year around, we need to  
10 organize the way we do our part but definitely you  
11 know we need to address for god's sake, you know the  
12 whole things about the difference in salary and I  
13 think that we need to have a better plan to provide  
14 the opportunity to every adjunct professor to get the  
15 tenure at CUNY.

16 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, just in  
18 conclusion what is the amount that is presently in  
19 the, what is it the adjunct professional development  
20 fund, what's the dollar amount in that fund?

21 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I need to get back  
22 to you with that figure...

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and in terms of  
24 the budget that we've talked about once again  
25 students are being asked to increase what they pay in

2 tuition so I'm not pleased with the state budget  
3 because tuition is being increased once again and the  
4 services that are expected to be provided at our city  
5 universities and community colleges and part of CUNY  
6 is being borne by students so I'm not at all pleased  
7 by what's going on at the state budget and I want  
8 that to be on the record, we're again asking students  
9 to bear the brunt of that increase and students have  
10 indicated to me that... once again, you know it's...  
11 tuition is one factor but then there are all the  
12 other factors that go into that which are not in any  
13 way compensated if a student doesn't have those kinds  
14 of aid programs that they can get and so I just want  
15 that to be reflected that I don't think the  
16 Governor's budget does much for CUNY in terms of... in  
17 terms of supporting what the cost is, the full cost  
18 for attending CUNY. I think that concludes the  
19 questions that I have... [cross-talk]

20 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Chair Barron?

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes...

22 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: If I could just  
23 answer your last question...

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 69

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...my colleague had  
3 the answer with her... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

5 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: I believe that the  
6 adjunct professional development fund presently has...  
7 presently receives approximately 150,000 dollars a  
8 year and that allocation is going up to 660,000  
9 dollars a year so there's an approximately 500,000-  
10 dollar increase going in there.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And where do those  
12 funds come from?

13 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: They, they come from  
14 in effect the university, they come out of the  
15 settlement, they're considered part of the settlement  
16 and what we... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

18 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...consider the  
19 settlement package we have money... wage increases and,  
20 and other funds.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

22 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...and it's about a  
23 half a million dollar increase annually... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.  
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 70

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, yep... so, I, I  
3 just before we let you go, and we do have other  
4 panelist there. I want to talk about not necessarily  
5 the cost but is this a... is this fully funded as, as  
6 we talk... as the colleagues mentioned there, this  
7 contract obviously there's some, some, some costs  
8 associated with it, is this a fully funded contract  
9 as we see now or are there other provisions that have  
10 to happen in order for, for, for this to fully come  
11 to fruition?

12 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: No, for the community  
13 colleges the city has fully funded the contract in  
14 the current year and in all of the out years.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And senior?

16 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Senior colleges we're  
17 still working through the process with, you know our  
18 funding partners in Albany... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Uh-huh... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: ...and we're hopeful  
22 that we'll get additional support in the final state  
23 enacted budget on April 1<sup>st</sup>.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay and when we  
25 talked about the, the, the office space for the... for

2 the adjuncts is, is the cost associated with that  
3 factored in? Is there a possibility that you don't  
4 have space, if you don't have space you don't approve  
5 that, the, the hours?

6 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: If there are  
7 modifications that colleges are planning to make to  
8 the physical infrastructure to accommodate more  
9 office that's not included in the... in the costs of  
10 the contracts, that would be separate.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is, is there a  
12 possibility that if, if the space is not available  
13 then these meetings don't occur and that, that this,  
14 this... these goals aren't achieved?

15 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: No, these... this is...  
16 this is committed for, this is part of the contract,  
17 this is inked and committed to on behalf of the  
18 university and the union and so... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, so does that  
20 mean... [cross-talk]

21 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...even if there's  
22 not... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...you meet in  
24 Starbucks somewhere that they're still going to be  
25 paid?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 72

2 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: If, if, if in fact  
3 they have to... if in fact they have to, you know use a  
4 corner... the... a corner in the library or you know set  
5 aside some room in the cafeteria because there is no  
6 other option and we certainly hope that's not the  
7 case then the... there will be the meetings and there  
8 will be the compensation, it is absolutely committed  
9 for, there is no excuse that... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so that's  
11 really important that we've achieved our compensation  
12 goals... [cross-talk]

13 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yes... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...but it's also  
15 that these services get delivered in a manner that  
16 they should that they do deserve space, right and  
17 that's really what we're talking about here aside  
18 just from the compensation and finally just as a  
19 more... a, a point of clarity on the, the pay  
20 increments, the top pay, we said that after 2022 that  
21 that would not exist or would it continue to exist  
22 and at what levels?

23 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: So, if it weren't  
24 for the complete restructuring the way we did this  
25 then what would have happened is the steps would have



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 73  
2 remained in each of the titles and each of the steps  
3 would have gone up by the two percent, the across the  
4 board increases would have been applied so they would  
5 have gotten... the steps would have gotten that two  
6 percent and... but... and the adjuncts would have  
7 continued to have to progress through those steps  
8 based on time but we've collapsed it and in the main  
9 the overwhelming majority of adjuncts are going to  
10 get a raise as a result of that and for people who  
11 might not have seen a raise there are, you know some...

12 [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is that for the  
14 life of this contract... [cross-talk]

15 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Yes... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...or is that  
17 permanently collapsed?

18 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: It's permanently...

19 [cross-talk]

20 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Permanent... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...collapsed, it's  
23 permanently... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay... [cross-  
25 talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 74

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

3 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: ...it's done, it's  
4 permanently collapsed.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, that,  
6 that's... uh-huh, uh-huh, good and we... I think we do  
7 have other questions that we'll send. Let me just ask  
8 you this, we understand that you have new leadership  
9 and, and, and quite frankly how involved has... how  
10 involved and or how committed to the new leadership  
11 has the new leadership been to seeing that, that,  
12 that we create this just environment for the adjuncts  
13 and, and, and the other faculty within the CUNY  
14 community?

15 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: You know certain...  
16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...because we've  
18 been fighting this fight for a really long time...  
19 [cross-talk]

20 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...and, and...  
22 [cross-talk]

23 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...and I... and I  
25 know it takes courage at the top.

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Absolutely agree and  
3 I'm so glad you raised that Chair Miller and, and I  
4 go back to what you said earlier in the hearing about  
5 some of the noise and some of the activity that had  
6 been taking place in prior years about the adjunct  
7 issue, some of the activity that was going on and I  
8 just want to say that, you know getting this  
9 agreement done and more importantly getting something  
10 done that was meaningful for the adjuncts was  
11 Chancellor Matos Rodriguez's top priority, he, he  
12 took over as Chancellor on May 1<sup>st</sup> and within the  
13 first six months the contract was negotiated and we  
14 have a historic agreement on the adjuncts and so I  
15 agree with you that strong leadership means  
16 everything and we're certainly grateful at CUNY we,  
17 we have that with Chancellor Matos Rodriguez and the  
18 team he's building so he and his team and I know our  
19 board as well are fully committed to making sure that  
20 there's equity with our... with our workforce.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, thank  
22 you very much for your testimony.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, you're...  
24 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 76

2 MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Thank you... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 PAMELA SILVERBLATT: Thank you... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...excused.

7 [off mic dialogue]

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Alright for the next  
9 panel we have Barbara Bowen from PSC; Sharon  
10 Persinger; James Davis and Howard Meltzer.

11 [off mic dialogue]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, welcome  
13 and you may begin, we'll start on my far left.

14 BARBARA BOWEN: Do we have to swear in?

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No.

16 BARBARA BOWEN: Oh, okay. Good morning  
17 still... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning...

19 [cross-talk]

20 BARBARA BOWEN: ...thank you so much. I'm  
21 Barbara Bowen, I'm President of the Professional  
22 Staff Congress CUNY and I really want to thank the,  
23 the Chairs, the two Chairs of this hearing and the  
24 many Council Members who have made it a priority to  
25 be here, we really appreciate that, this is a

2 critical issue and I'm very grateful that so many of  
3 you are here and I also love it that the Council is  
4 probing so deeply a public sector contract, I think  
5 that's fantastic and I love the effort to understand  
6 the complexities of a contract, ours is a complex  
7 contract and we really appreciate the, the knowledge  
8 and the curiosity you bring to it, I, I think that's  
9 great, I love hearing about contracts in this room so  
10 thank you so much and I, I also want to acknowledge  
11 that we initially had asked for this hearing while we  
12 were deep in the struggle to get this contract and  
13 that was a while ago, we won't say when but that was  
14 a while ago and I know you have both worked in the  
15 meantime in our on the ground fight, our struggle  
16 which included many actions including the civil  
17 disobedience you talked about and so when we first  
18 asked you to do this joint hearing we had not yet  
19 achieved this contract so I want to thank you for,  
20 not only for holding the hearing but for the work  
21 you've done between when we asked and now to support  
22 our being able to achieve this contract. You have  
23 been vocal supporters, the Speaker also, I intervened  
24 directly with the Speaker, he has been a supporter  
25 and the Mayor, we met directly with the Mayor in

1  
2 order to reach this very creative agreement and also  
3 the new Labor Commissioner Renee Campion, we worked  
4 closely with her so there have been a number of  
5 people working on it and with the Division... the OMB,  
6 Dean Fuleihan and others and the result as Matt  
7 Sapienza said is that in the Mayor's preliminary  
8 budget this contract is recognized, it's fully funded  
9 in all its aspects so I think that is something that  
10 we should start by saying thank you for and that  
11 we're proud of and that there's real accomplishments  
12 in this contract. My message is going to be that  
13 there is a... this contract accomplishes a lot but  
14 there's still a lot to do, I mean that is my basic  
15 message. My colleagues are all I think going to talk  
16 about the conditions of adjuncts on the ground and  
17 particularly about hiring adjuncts but I'm going to  
18 talk a little bit about the contract, what it does  
19 and does not achieve and where we need to go from  
20 there. Council Member Barron you started the hearing  
21 by talking about institutional support and that is a  
22 critical issue for adjuncts and by institutional  
23 support I would include pay and working conditions.  
24 The PSC under our leadership has fought for a long  
25 time to improve the conditions for adjuncts, bit by

1 bit by bit we have made improvements. We are pushing  
2 against the conditions that Council Member Barron and  
3 Ydanis Rodriguez mentioned which are budgetary and I  
4 want to talk about those before I finish, that is...  
5 that's the backdrop and what I would say is the  
6 backdrop to this whole issue is what I would call  
7 impoverishment by design. CUNY is impoverished by  
8 design, it's not a mistake, it's not an accident,  
9 CUNY would not be this poor if there were not a  
10 public policy designed to impoverish it, that's the  
11 backdrop. And under... against that backdrop we have a  
12 loss of full-time faculty positions over years and  
13 years. In the 1970's before the fiscal crisis hit  
14 CUNY had 11,500 full time faculty and far fewer  
15 students than today, now we have 7,500 full time  
16 faculty and more students so how do you teach more  
17 students with less money, why are there fewer full  
18 time faculty because they cost more. So, as the heart  
19 was pulled out of the CUNY funding for complicated  
20 reasons that cannot be disentangled from racism, that  
21 cannot be disentangled from austerity policy, the  
22 heart was pulled out of the funding and yet more and  
23 more students want the beautiful education that we  
24 still manage to give them. So, how do you do that,  
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 80

2 you cut your biggest cost, which is labor and fill in  
3 the big cost, the central work we do with cheaper  
4 labor, that's, that has... is how CUNY has survived.  
5 Several colleges would have had to close with the  
6 amount of funding drop we have experienced if it were  
7 not for CUNY's strategy of filling in the core work  
8 of instruction with underpaid instructors, I mean  
9 that's the story, CUNY's budget is balanced on the  
10 back of adjuncts and increasingly students and so  
11 adjuncts and, and full time faculty and staff are  
12 also underpaid, we are all subsidizing the state and  
13 city's failure and policy not to fund CUNY properly,  
14 that's what's happening and the union has had that  
15 gigantic mountain to climb in front of us since we  
16 took leadership in part on the premise that we would  
17 work for adjuncts and that by working to change the  
18 conditions, improve the conditions for adjuncts we  
19 would improve the conditions for everyone, that was  
20 the premise of our struggle that a gain for adjuncts  
21 lifts everyone and I think the remarkable thing about  
22 the contract vote that Vice Chancellor Silverblatt  
23 talked about is that not only did it have a very  
24 strong, positive vote and a huge turnout but the  
25 contract was overwhelmingly supported by full time



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 81  
2 employees who receive far less in this contract, you  
3 know proportionately than part time employees. Full  
4 time employees got a 10.41 percent increase, adjuncts  
5 on average got a 45 percent increase and full timers  
6 exhibited extraordinary support, we all know that  
7 this supports all of us. So, we have this gigantic  
8 mountain to climb which is systemic policy driven  
9 planned underfunding for the university that educates  
10 working class people, people of color, the poor,  
11 immigrants in this city and women, I mean an  
12 overwhelmingly majority of women that's who we  
13 educate and that's why CUNY's underfunded. So, we've  
14 been working against this and contract by contract  
15 we've been making gains as Vice Chancellor  
16 Silverblatt said on adjunct health insurance, a big  
17 breakthrough, graduate employee health insurance,  
18 piece by piece by piece and in this contract we set  
19 out to prioritize as a whole union, 30,000 people in  
20 the union, the... you know many, many full time faculty  
21 and staff but as a whole we decided to prioritize  
22 part time salary needs, part time faculty, adjunct  
23 faculty salary needs and we worked very hard. I agree  
24 with the CUNY administration members you just heard  
25 that we worked well in partnership together, we had a

2 very robust bargaining team, several members of which  
3 are right here, we had a bargaining team that  
4 included adjuncts and full timers, we did years of  
5 research to develop our position and the key change  
6 in the contract as Pam Silverblatt noted was to pay  
7 adjuncts for more of the time they work, they're paid  
8 on an hourly basis so there are two ways you can  
9 raise the total pay of somebody on an hourly basis,  
10 you either increase their hours or you increase their  
11 rate, we did both in this contract, that's what it  
12 comes down to. Adjuncts do many, many more hours of  
13 unpaid work than we have still managed to get them  
14 paid for, the union proposed that they... now they're  
15 getting paid for one additional hour per week to do  
16 an office hour, the union wanted three additional  
17 hours per week to spend some of that time to, to  
18 credit and pay, some of that time for preparation,  
19 grading, emailing students, there's... I mean several  
20 of you here are educators you know, you don't just  
21 walk into a classroom and say hello and think of your  
22 class, you have to prepare and grade and do  
23 everything else. We took a big step in that direction  
24 but we're not all the way there yet so the big step  
25 was increasing the pay for a three credit course by

2 33 percent that is adding an additional hour and that  
3 means that cumulatively because so many courses,  
4 about 33... or 30,000 are taught by adjuncts at CUNY  
5 each semester that means cumulatively about 425,000  
6 hours more paid work and more time critically  
7 invested in students, that's what happened in this  
8 contract that there is... so, they... and we prioritized  
9 the office hour because the office hour is an  
10 opportunity for students to know that you are there  
11 even if you're not in an office and we are working to  
12 deal with the space issue but wherever it is that you  
13 say you're going to be regularly, you know every so  
14 and so afternoon from two to three or whatever it is  
15 you are there and our premise was that students who  
16 are taking the course with an adjunct should have  
17 just as much opportunity to have regular scheduled  
18 time with their instructor as somebody taking the  
19 same course with a senior professor and it's just  
20 starting this week, it's very exciting, we've been...  
21 several of us have been talking with department  
22 chairs on the different campuses who are working  
23 mightily to implement it and it's going to mean  
24 hundreds of thousands more hours person to person  
25 invested in our students. All the research shows that

2 the primary, a primary factor in student's academic  
3 success and retention in college is time one on one  
4 with their faculty and that time outside of class  
5 sometimes matters even more than time inside of class  
6 so that's what we created in this contract and are  
7 very proud of. There are other improvements for  
8 adjuncts in the contract that you heard about before  
9 and together they add up to not conditions of parody  
10 or equity and I want to talk about that, we are not  
11 all the way there, I want to emphasize that, we  
12 wanted 7,000 per course, we got to 5,500 from 3,222,  
13 that's a very, very big jump but it's not all the way  
14 to 7,000. We are still working on it; we're working  
15 on it right now but together with the various things  
16 we have negotiated we've put together a package that  
17 improves adjunct conditions. The... as far as we know  
18 and have been able to find the increase for adjuncts  
19 in this PSC contract was the biggest increase  
20 nationally in any contract for this number of adjunct  
21 faculty, it is way above the average even of  
22 contracts that had to go to strike to be settled. In  
23 the previous round we took a strike authorization  
24 vote even though as you know very well Daneek for  
25 public sector employees that engaging in a strike,

2 not taking the vote but engaging in a strike is  
3 prohibited by the Taylor Law, our members  
4 overwhelmingly voted yes that they were prepared to  
5 strike and I think they would be again but we were  
6 able to do this without a strike with many, many  
7 other actions, many actions for years to build up to  
8 it and jointly with full time and, and part timers  
9 and we can talk more later about the gains in the  
10 contract if, if you'd like to hear more but I do want  
11 to say that, that we're not all the way there yet,  
12 could I ask you to pour me some more... sorry, it's  
13 allergy season, sorry, thanks. Thank you. I do want  
14 to say that we have not solved the problem yet, there  
15 are still 12,000 or I think Matt Sapienza said more  
16 than 12,000 adjunct faculty at CUNY. There is a role  
17 for adjunct faculty, some of the adjuncts at CUNY are  
18 people who have a full time and you know very  
19 satisfying job elsewhere, it could be a high school  
20 principal for instance who comes in and teaches one  
21 course in the education department, could be somebody  
22 in... an accountant who comes in and teaches a course  
23 in accounting, nursing, a person who has a full time  
24 position teaches a course or two in specialized... and  
25 by the way in answer to your question before, our

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 86

2 data show that the average number of courses taught  
3 by an, an adjunct is two, it's about two on average.  
4 So... but there, there's going to be a role especially  
5 in a city like New York for really exciting people to  
6 come in and teach a course on an additive basis, the  
7 problem at CUNY is that the basic instruction is  
8 being done increasingly by adjuncts, that has to  
9 change and also adjuncts are concentrated in the  
10 intro level courses where statistically students are  
11 most vulnerable to dropping out. They are... there are...  
12 there's a higher percentage of adjuncts at the four  
13 year colleges than the two year colleges, you might  
14 expect it the other way but there's more, a higher  
15 percentage at the four year than the two year, 39  
16 percent of instruction only at the four year colleges  
17 is being done by full timers, the, the rest, 61  
18 percent by adjuncts and we are especially concerned  
19 that in the early courses that a student takes when  
20 they are very vulnerable to dropping out they need  
21 more hands on time with the instructors and that was  
22 one of the reasons for the office hours but there is  
23 much more that needs to be done, salaries need to be  
24 further lifted, health insurance could be expanded,  
25 security of appointments, we won a three year

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 87

2 appointment which is much better than a one semester  
3 appointment but we would like continuity for  
4 adjuncts, we'd like better job security and above all  
5 we would like CUNY to switch and be... have the funding  
6 to provide more full time positions so that the  
7 majority of positions could have the security, the  
8 protection, the pay, the institutional support that  
9 you mentioned Council Member Barron which includes  
10 time for research, support for research that's what  
11 every faculty member should have and our position is  
12 that in a school like CUNY where our students often  
13 come in with very strong needs and our heroic to get  
14 there in the first place that our faculty should have  
15 more support not less support than the average  
16 faculty, we should have lower teaching loads not  
17 higher teaching loads than the average faculty  
18 because our students deserve more and they have  
19 exhibited such a level of real heroism to be there in  
20 the first place so we should be investing more in  
21 them. so, I want to be very clear that there's lots  
22 to do in future contracts, we need more pay and we  
23 need equity conditions and furthermore we need many  
24 more of the part time positions converted to full  
25 time positions, I mean that will be a key and we have

2 done that in previous agreements with management and  
3 hope to do it again. And then I'll just conclude  
4 before turning it to my colleagues by saying that the  
5 underlying... the underlying issue of course is funding  
6 and this impoverishment by design and until the  
7 funding basis of CUNY is revolutionized this problem  
8 cannot fully be solved. What we did in this contract  
9 took a lot of creativity and a decision by full time  
10 faculty and staff to prioritize some others more than  
11 themselves, there were ways that we moved things  
12 around in the contract to enable the biggest share of  
13 the increase to go to adjuncts, you can't just... we  
14 can't do that, that's not going to take us out of our  
15 budget problem, it's not going to solve the whole  
16 adjunct employment problem, the problem is budgetary,  
17 the city is to be commended by coming up front and  
18 saying they will fully fund the contract in all the  
19 future years but the city needs to do more and in the  
20 fundamental budgetary support for CUNY. A, they need  
21 to increase the amount that the city puts into the  
22 four year colleges because right now the city puts in  
23 the same amount to the four year colleges that they  
24 have for more than 20 years not even increased by  
25 inflation, that, that amount has to increase at least



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 89

2 by inflation. Seventy five percent of CUNY... of city  
3 high school graduates who go onto college go to CUNY,  
4 the city does so much to try to invest in those  
5 students and get them ready to graduate, get them  
6 propelled toward college then they come to college  
7 and they find oh, they, they're not going to see a  
8 full time professor, they're not going to have time  
9 to see somebody in their office, that's not right,  
10 we're telling students so much about how you've got  
11 to graduate, go to college, go to college and when  
12 they get to college they find that no writing tutor  
13 hours, library hours are cut, no books bought in the  
14 York College library for a year, that's what they  
15 find so the city needs to up its contribution to the  
16 four year colleges. The city also needs to up its  
17 contribution to the two year colleges and then the  
18 state and you asked about this Council Member  
19 Rodriguez, the state has not yet committed to fully  
20 funding the across the board increases, they have  
21 made commitments to us that they will fund the  
22 adjunct office hours which is tremendous and  
23 represents a real investment, the Governor has spoken  
24 about it personally and publicly but the state needs  
25 to increase its contribution to CUNY and recognize

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 90

2 that it is the state's responsibility to fund a  
3 public university as a public good and I would ask  
4 the Council Members because you're always asking what  
5 you can do and how you can be advocates, I would ask  
6 you to join with us in calling... you know you're  
7 elected officials you have political clout with other  
8 elected officials especially in Albany, the state  
9 needs to accept the premise that there needs to be  
10 more revenue this year, there's a budget deficit in  
11 the state, 6.1 billion dollars, the Governor has said  
12 no new revenue, no new personal income tax, we have  
13 not had a statement yet from the state senate about  
14 increasing the highest level personal income tax on...  
15 I'm talking about people who earn multimillion a year  
16 and billionaires, New York could do that easily and  
17 bring in more revenue so I would ask you as Council  
18 Members to advocate as you have for this contract but  
19 also for city... for an increase in this year's city  
20 budget especially to the city's contribution to the  
21 four year colleges and so that by April 1<sup>st</sup> the state  
22 has accepted the premise that there has to be a  
23 change in the personal income tax at the highest  
24 brackets and a commitment to funding the people we  
25 teach and the people we love, I mean that's why we're

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 91

2 here because we love teaching here and working here,  
3 we're here out of that love of our students and to  
4 have that undermined every day by the lack of funding  
5 is criminal in my view and we're asking you to  
6 support us with that. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

8 SHARON PERSINGER: Hello everyone, I'm  
9 Sharon Persinger, you had an introduction earlier, I  
10 am the Treasurer of the Professional Staff Congress  
11 and I'm also an associate professor in the Department  
12 of math and computer science at Bronx Community  
13 College, I've taught there for over 20 years, I, I  
14 went to graduate school at the CUNY graduate center  
15 so my connection to CUNY goes back 40 years now, a  
16 little hard to accept that. I'm... I guess our, our  
17 presentations will be pretty similar, we all have... we  
18 have a view of this university that is formed by the  
19 work we do both within the university and, and then  
20 working for the... for the union of the faculty and  
21 staff. We were called here to talk about adjunct  
22 employment and some specifics about this particular  
23 contract, I do want to go into details since other  
24 people have done a, a good job of that. I do want to  
25 acknowledge that this contract does make adjunct

2 working conditions, compensation and job security  
3 better; we fought hard to win those gains, there was  
4 tough work at the bargaining table and then in the..  
5 all of these sessions behind the scenes but it's  
6 still not good enough. We don't get to rest and say  
7 that the... this problem... even when you think only  
8 narrowly of the problem of adjunct compensation and  
9 job security we don't get to rest and say that  
10 problem is solved. I do want to go on mostly and talk  
11 about an issue that I see arising in my own  
12 department in my own campus and it is definitely  
13 connected to the same persistent issues of the  
14 underfunding of the university. The things that are  
15 specific to my department, a math department at, at  
16 my college, a community college, I don't want to say  
17 that this is universal but I think there's some  
18 things that are happening that are related to the  
19 department and to the community colleges that you  
20 might find in other places. Math and computer science  
21 at BCC is one of the larger departments in the  
22 college, we have 30 to 35 full time faculty and it  
23 varies from time to time but at any time certainly 50  
24 adjuncts maybe sometimes as many as 70, it's  
25 primarily a service department, we provide the math

2 courses that are required by other curricula so that  
3 means statistics in precalculus are some... probably  
4 some 30 percent of what we teach, the department's  
5 other main function is to provide the developmental  
6 math courses that prepare students to succeed in  
7 those college level math courses that their major  
8 requires and the department also offers two majors, a  
9 mathematics major and a computer science major and we  
10 do the standard first two years of a curriculum in  
11 those majors. What that means is that, I checked this  
12 for the details in this academic year so the 2019 and  
13 then spring 2020 academic year we offered 176  
14 sections of courses in fall 2019, 157 in spring 2020,  
15 those are comparable numbers to what we've been  
16 offering in the past few years, that, that is that  
17 difference between fall and spring is not unusual but  
18 they are smaller so the number of sections that we're  
19 offering tend... is declining that's because of the, I  
20 think the up and down in the college's enrollment,  
21 this has been a... we're told a... sort of a difficult  
22 year for CUNY enrollment total. There's also the  
23 issue that the, the university has changed the way it  
24 assesses a student's need for developmental math  
25 education that allows more students to immediately

1 roll... enroll in the math course that they're required  
2 so they're reducing the number of, of developmental  
3 level, remedial level courses that we offer so it..  
4 which means the total offerings of the department has  
5 declined. I'm not really talking about whether that  
6 was a good idea or a bad idea but I'm just saying  
7 that, that our observation is that it is... has  
8 happened. When you put all these numbers together  
9 this is in contrast to the Vice Chancellor's earlier  
10 reports about what fraction of education is, is  
11 offered by adjuncts and what by, by part timers. At  
12 the community college in my department at least our  
13 numbers are approaching what the senior college  
14 numbers are and what the, the, the CUNY overall  
15 numbers are. The number of courses, sections taught  
16 by adjuncts is running in around the 60 percent and  
17 the number taught by full timers is running around  
18 the 40 percent and it's a little surprising to me..  
19 well it, it shouldn't be surprising when you look at  
20 what's actual... what, what has happened you'd think  
21 that this reduction in the number of sections offered  
22 would give the college the opportunity to increase  
23 the percent of courses taught by full time faculty  
24 without actually having to increase the number of  
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 95

2 full time faculty, you just keep the number of full  
3 time faculty the same, there are fewer courses, those  
4 full time faculty are teaching courses, they're  
5 teaching a larger fraction of the courses but that's  
6 not happening. The number of full-time faculty is  
7 being allowed to decrease. My department has lost  
8 four full time faculty to retirement or death in the  
9 last two years, we have not hired any full time  
10 replacements, we've not even hired substitute  
11 replacements which is a... full time substitute  
12 replacement, PSC contract has a limited situation  
13 that allows hiring of a full time temporary position.  
14 We've even been... I, I did not hear this myself, I'm  
15 quoting my department chair, we've been told that our  
16 department has too many full time faculty, yeah and I  
17 mean I... the only way I can see this is another  
18 instance of accommodating to the underfunding of the  
19 university. I read the briefing paper for this  
20 hearing, it was... it was useful to me, it's a... to see  
21 the quotation from the, the trustee's manual of  
22 general policy which says that an adjunct faculty  
23 member is someone who's appointment is made for a  
24 limited purpose such as a special course or courses  
25 or for a limited duration, that might have been the

1 case at the time that was written but that is  
2 certainly not the case now. The university hires  
3 adjuncts to teach practically every course in the  
4 catalogue, they're hired because they're less  
5 expensive than full time faculty. The university  
6 isn't given adequate funding to allow for the hiring  
7 of full-time faculty to teach even the majority of  
8 its courses much less to teach every course that's  
9 not a special course. It is kind of interesting to me  
10 to... that... to, to look at some contradictions, when we  
11 talk about the working conditions of adjunct faculty  
12 we say they have no job security and that is because  
13 it... except for these people who are now on three year  
14 appointments and, and the number of adjuncts in those  
15 three year appointments is a... it's approaching 20  
16 percent of the total adjuncts by now except for those  
17 contracts are on a semester by semester course by  
18 course basis. Adjuncts can be told you'll be teaching  
19 these two courses and then the day before the  
20 semester be... starts be told oops sorry, we had to  
21 cancel your course or we had to give your course to  
22 somebody else who's course was cancelled so they,  
23 they really do have no job security yet, at least 20  
24 percent of them in increasing numbers keep the job  
25



2 for more than five years so that they can qualify to  
3 be considered for these longer term appointments and  
4 that means that the college has evaluated their work  
5 and found it positive and they want to keep them and  
6 they want to stay in the job so we have this odd  
7 contradiction of there is no formal job security yet  
8 people are doing satisfactory work and they want to  
9 continue doing the work. It's a contradiction that we  
10 don't always think enough about. Anyway I think the  
11 real thing is that, that CUNY needs more full time  
12 faculty for educational reasons, having to do... to  
13 meet... with meeting the needs of the students, for the  
14 labor standards reasons of the, the people who are...  
15 who have the education and experience to do these  
16 jobs should be hired in full time jobs with good  
17 compensation and good benefits and job security and  
18 just as President Bowen has said it's a matter of  
19 getting the university funded well enough.

20 BARBARA BOWEN: Before, before Howard  
21 speaks, sorry, I, I just wanted to say I know that  
22 not everybody from CUNY could stay but I hope that  
23 you also are hearing that we affirm what's been said  
24 by the CUNY negotiator we really had a strong working  
25 partnership to get this done and I think it's worth

2 hearing that especially when so often we hear about  
3 labor management antagonism, sure there was plenty of  
4 antagonism but it took trust and professionalism and  
5 a real working partnership to get this done and  
6 certainly I agree with what was said about the new  
7 Chancellor he personally intervened so while I'm not  
8 saying everything is perfect, far from it, I think it  
9 is worth acknowledging that labor unions and  
10 management can't always say that about each other and  
11 I, I certainly affirm what was said about that and I  
12 think the contract we have is a result of that  
13 partnership.

14 HOWARD MELTZER: I want to thank Council  
15 Member Barron and all the members of the Council for  
16 allowing me to speak today. My name is Howard  
17 Meltzer, I'm the Community.. one of the three  
18 Community College Officers for the DSC CUNY, I'm a  
19 full professor of music at the Borough of Manhattan  
20 Community College and I just wanted to say in  
21 addition to my printed remarks a question arose about  
22 what non-teaching adjuncts do and I thought, thought  
23 since I was a person in a department who had several  
24 non-teaching adjuncts I could clarify that. In our  
25 department non-teaching adjuncts are as ancillary

2 members to the faculty we have vocal classes. For  
3 example, our non-teaching adjuncts are the piano  
4 accompanist for those classes so that's actually a  
5 fairly typical assignment. It's... usually a non-  
6 teaching adjunct is somebody while they have contact  
7 with the students, they are not responsible for  
8 grading a class, they're serving as some sort of  
9 assistant to the instructional purpose. So, I hope  
10 that's a useful clarification for... as an answer to  
11 that question. As I said I'm a full professor in the  
12 department of music and art Borough of Manhattan  
13 Community College and I served for six years as Chair  
14 of the Department. Many of you have been strong in  
15 your advocacy for CUNY including your support for  
16 funding, the contractual raises and adjunct office  
17 hours at BMCC and the other community colleges. Our  
18 new contract and the provision of paid office hours  
19 are a step on a path to relieving the burden placed  
20 on faculty and students by the university's continued  
21 dependence on contingent faculty and staff but the  
22 colleges dependence on part time faculty is a system  
23 of the... is a symptom of the uncertainty of budget  
24 from year to year, from semester to semester. That  
25 uncertainty has administrative and academic

2 consequences. As a full time professor, I have  
3 sufficient advance knowledge of my teaching  
4 assignments to invest time and energy and preparation  
5 of supplementary course materials, research directed  
6 specifically to classroom assignments, investigations  
7 of updates and pedagogy. While the paid office hour  
8 is a step in acknowledging that much of what  
9 constitutes meaningful student experience derives  
10 from work outside of the classroom I ask you to  
11 consider how discouraging it is for an adjunct  
12 instructor to prepare materials only to be told that  
13 due to the exigencies of scheduling the class they  
14 had worked so hard to prepare would not be theirs. By  
15 definition part time work at one campus implies that  
16 the individual has work elsewhere. One of our most  
17 talented young adjuncts, an individual with a  
18 completed doctorate from an excellent public  
19 institution lost a class because of scheduling this  
20 semester, his work outside of BMCC limits his ability  
21 to substitute one teaching assignment for another.  
22 Each semester has an overture... as an overture, a  
23 period of anxiously watching enrollments hoping that  
24 all the classes will make. While the impact on  
25 faculty members is obvious, the impact on students is

1 real as well. Just this week I noted that a class in  
2 our department's music major was cancelled and only  
3 one of the students in that cancelled section found a  
4 place in another class at another time. I am familiar  
5 with the students who lost the class, some of them  
6 have personal issues, work conflicts, issues of  
7 health concerns that preclude them from simply  
8 switching to another section. While cancelling class  
9 is maybe cost effective in the short term, in the  
10 long run the students and the university pay for it  
11 through delayed degree completion. While it might be  
12 difficult to generate hard numbers, my experience  
13 suggests that treating faculty as and classes as  
14 easily exchangeable, impersonal work units leads to  
15 lower retention of students and greater faculty  
16 turnover. There is a difference between quote, "a  
17 lean efficient", unquote budget and the starvation  
18 diet. I urge the honorable members of the City  
19 Council to advocate for increased funding for CUNY.

20  
21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

22 JAMES DAVIS: Thank you for the  
23 opportunity to speak. I'm James Davis and I'm the  
24 Chapter Chair for the PSC at Brooklyn College where I  
25 teach in the English department. I'm very grateful

2 Chair Barron for your advocacy and I'm grateful as  
3 well for my own Council Member, Laurie Cumbo, thank  
4 you for being here today. As a proud parent of two  
5 daughters who attended PS 11, we're very happy for  
6 your advocacy as well, thank you. My colleagues have  
7 articulated I think very... in a very compelling way  
8 the pressures that persist despite the advances that  
9 were made in the most recent labor contract and so I  
10 want to be very brief, I want to touch on two things.  
11 The first of which Professor Meltzer just mentioned,  
12 the university's dependence increased dependence on  
13 student tuition intersects with this question of  
14 contingency and what it means is that adjunct faculty  
15 are disproportionately affected by the kind of  
16 precariousness that's introduced with the... with the  
17 increased dependence on tuition. Increased dependence  
18 on tuition means that at every point department  
19 chairs and deans and administrators are very  
20 anxiously monitoring the number of sections of  
21 classes that get offered and the number of students  
22 in every section. Now any good administrator is  
23 always going to be monitoring those numbers but  
24 because of how intensely they rely on student tuition  
25 this funding issue, you know goes directly to like

2 last minute calculations about increased efficiencies  
3 and it does mean as Howard suggested that at the drop  
4 of a hat they're looking to either close classes or  
5 preemptively to, to make sure that departments don't  
6 run, you know any courses that may not be required  
7 and when a course gets cancelled not only does it  
8 mean as Howard said that students have to scramble  
9 but it also means in many cases that the faculty  
10 member who, you know may well have been a contingent  
11 faculty member loses the class and may in fact lose  
12 other rights and benefits like their eligibility for  
13 the three year appointment that's been referred to or  
14 frankly their eligibility for health insurance,  
15 right, if it's... if they're relying on their CUNY  
16 employment for health care. So, that's an enormous  
17 consideration, right and so you... it places department  
18 chairs and others in a position, an impossible  
19 position of having to decide between continuing  
20 employment of good faculty members who they need and  
21 have relied on or kicking them off their health  
22 insurance to say nothing of the other impact. So, I  
23 think it really is a disproportionate effect on our  
24 contingent faculty, the fact that we rely so heavily  
25 on student tuition. The last thing I wanted to

2 mention is just and I don't think it's come up yet  
3 here but to me it throws into really stark relief  
4 the, the question of contingent versus full time  
5 employment at CUNY. Look at the data, the  
6 discrepancies have grown between the SUNY, our SUNY  
7 brothers and sisters and at CUNY, as full time... as,  
8 as a function of full time equivalent student, right  
9 SUNY has continued to increase the number of full  
10 timers and CUNY's numbers have declined again in  
11 proportion to the full time equivalent students that  
12 we enrolled and that's not right, I mean it, it's...  
13 we, we would want to obviously not, not see our SUNY  
14 colleagues where we are but we believe that the  
15 students in the city university are entitled to those  
16 ratios of full time faculty as we... as our SUNY  
17 colleagues enjoy. So, you know and that gets to your  
18 question earlier Chair Barron about how to create  
19 more opportunities particularly where diversity is  
20 involved, more opportunities for contingent faculty  
21 members to move into full time lines. This issue of  
22 conversion from long serving adjunct appointments  
23 into full timers can be used, can be used in a  
24 deliberate way to, to change the demographics of the  
25 full-time faculty. So, thank you.



CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much.

To your point about reaching out to our colleagues in Albany, we certainly know that that's something that we have to do especially when those in leadership like to bandy about the title that they are progressive and I think that that's something we need to remind them, you can't say one thing and do something that does not support what you say you believe in and what you think is important and not withstanding the so called deficit that the state is facing, there are ways as you have indicated that we can fill that gap, that we can make that budget work if we look at those persons who are the top tenth of one percent of the population of salary earners and, and have them contribute a little bit more and certainly there's one particular person in Albany that I can support and know that he will be there... be there with that regard. In terms of... you said that... Professor Meltzer you said that you were the head of the music department...

HOWARD MELTZER: That's true...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In your experience at the music... as the head of the department what opportunities... what numbers of faculty were full time

2 and part time and what opportunities did you have to  
3 make some appointments in that regard?

4 HOWARD MELTZER: Well we... the numbers  
5 will scare you a little bit because when I first say  
6 that currently our department has about 24 full time  
7 people and over a hundred adjuncts but the specialty  
8 of music means that we actually have people teaching  
9 musical instruments so we have... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11 HOWARD MELTZER: ...people... we have a  
12 disproportionate number of adjuncts who were teaching  
13 actually what adjuncts are really supposed to do  
14 which is we need somebody to teach jazz voice, we  
15 don't have a sufficiency to run... to give a person  
16 with that specialization an entire schedule but we  
17 hire an adjunct to take care of the couple of  
18 students who are interested in that particular field  
19 and that's really I think what an adjunct should do.  
20 In terms of what the progression has been in my  
21 tenure as chair we hired I would have to look back at  
22 my notes but I think we hired about eight people,  
23 half of those hires were people who had been adjuncts  
24 prior to being full time faculty members which means  
25 that we had hired adjuncts of such a high quality

2 that they were competitive in a national search that  
3 when we looked at... usually in a search in music or  
4 art we get between 150 and 200 applications and that  
5 is actually small for a department and out of those  
6 applications some of our own adjunct faculty members  
7 rose to the top and we were able to give them full  
8 time teaching positions. One thing that is...  
9 departments don't have the last say on hires and this  
10 actually speaks to some of your concerns about  
11 diversity in the faculty.. [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That was my  
13 following question... [cross-talk]

14 HOWARD MELTZER: Yeah... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...continue.

16 HOWARD MELTZER: Yeah, which is on at  
17 least two occasions I sent a person of color as one  
18 of our three final candidates and the person was not  
19 selected.. [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, you're saying  
21 departments do not have the final say...

22 HOWARD MELTZER: That's true... [cross-  
23 talk]

24

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 108

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and it gets moved  
3 on, there are recommendations, here are three  
4 finalists and who makes that final decision?

5 HOWARD MELTZER: At BMCC that was the  
6 provost, that is... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The provost... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 HOWARD MELTZER: ...the provost who makes  
10 that decision, so we have on occasion advanced a  
11 diverse candidate and then, then somewhat surprised  
12 and never really received an explanation as to why  
13 the final decision was made.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I'm glad to  
15 have that information and I'm glad that I asked you  
16 for your own personal experiences as the chair of the  
17 department, yeah and in terms of the other two  
18 panelist we thank you very much for what your  
19 contributions are and I'm going to ask my Co-Chair...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yes, forgive me  
21 for running away but I... as city members are being  
22 called away its kind of one by one and others and,  
23 and, and honestly we're, we're talking state budget  
24 not mutually exclusive right that you're being hit  
25 now with, with, with Medicaid cuts and, and all these

1 things that happen and, and, and it's kind of... it's  
2 setting us up for why this can't happen or some of  
3 the things that we've discussed today and, and so we,  
4 we have to make sure that we're working with our  
5 partners such as PSC to really understand what the  
6 needs are but also creatively how do we get to where  
7 we need to be and, and we're so appreciative of that.  
8 I did have a question about the graduate students  
9 because when we looked at the, the ratification, the  
10 ratification at... with, with graduate students  
11 learning at the same level as, as the rest of the... of  
12 the PSC members, when we talk about what some of  
13 their concerns are and, and how... what do we do to, to  
14 try to mitigate some of those concerns as we move  
15 forward, not now but as we move forward because we  
16 know you can't do it overnight...

18 BARBARA BOWEN: Good question and also  
19 just a moment to acknowledge that the Vice President  
20 of the PSC Andrea Vazquez who has an appointment at  
21 the grad center is here with us and you... I'm not  
22 being flippant when I say you really have to ask  
23 those who did vote no because what's in the contract  
24 for graduate employees is really significant, I don't  
25 think the... to the best of my knowledge the vote no

2 was not based on thinking there's not enough for  
3 graduate employees in particular because as Vice  
4 Chancellor Silverblatt said there are some big  
5 advances here including two more years of free  
6 tuition for doctoral candidates, expansion of health  
7 insurance and some other provisions that are  
8 significant but there was... there was a, a lot of  
9 concern among graduate employees many of whom are  
10 also adjuncts because they, they can be employed as a  
11 graduate assistant and then supplement that by  
12 teaching courses in adjunct and there are... was a lot  
13 of joining together and being critical of the union's  
14 agreement to a contract that didn't include 7,000 a  
15 course, we set our goal very publicly and I know you  
16 know this from your work in labor, I mean you have to  
17 make a decision as a union about whether you name  
18 what you're really aiming and know that you may not  
19 get there and take that risk or set your sights low  
20 and think oh well we better not raise people's  
21 expectations, we better just say what we think we can  
22 get, we refused to do that, we took what we thought  
23 was the principled position and said what we were  
24 going for and we did not reach that, that's typical  
25 in union contracts, we got a long way but we didn't

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 111

2 get there and I think that... and you may hear from  
3 others this afternoon who, who feel that we shouldn't  
4 have accepted that deal that we should have said lets  
5 break the Taylor Law and go on strike, 5,500 or a 71  
6 percent increase is not enough, let's use this moment  
7 and push and get more, we... you know always the  
8 hardest decision in bargaining is when to stop and we  
9 made that decision together, we feel we have an, an  
10 agreement that really does stand and is a  
11 breakthrough, it's a landmark among adjunct  
12 agreements nationally, it's not everything we need  
13 but I think in the graduate center there was a  
14 concentrated feeling of resistance and that we should  
15 not have accepted anything but our absolute goal  
16 which was 7,000 and that was a hard decision for all  
17 of us internally those of us on the bargaining team,  
18 very hard decision and we think it was the right one  
19 but I certainly understand the feeling of urgency and  
20 impatience with not getting everything we wanted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Well that's all I  
22 had for... I just... that, that kind of stood, stood out  
23 for me but having, you know spent a great deal of my  
24 life in, in, in your world and it is understanding  
25 how those things happen and... but certainly not taking

2 for granted the, the concerns that they have and,  
3 and, and almost start immediately on how do we  
4 achieve that or using this kind of as the foundation  
5 to achieving those goals and that, you know we, we  
6 said a number and we, we may not get it this time but  
7 we're going to get there.

8 BARBARA BOWEN: We're going to get there.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Absolutely, thank  
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I just have one  
12 further question, in our briefing documents there are  
13 CBA highlights and I wonder if you could just perhaps  
14 speak a little bit more about the highlight that says  
15 there's improved funding and firm timeframes for HEO  
16 differential awards.

17 BARBARA BOWEN: Okay, the... HEO stands for  
18 higher education... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

20 BARBARA BOWEN: ...officer which is a term  
21 CUNY uses for professional staff... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

23 BARBARA BOWEN: ...who do a number of  
24 different jobs including registrar, financial aid  
25 counselor, sometimes in information systems, many



2 different jobs, they're academic professionals but  
3 they're not classroom instructors. We... in the  
4 previous contract we negotiated a salary differential  
5 for those in the three... well in... most of the titles  
6 in that series those are titles where you have to be  
7 reclassified to go into a higher title and a higher  
8 salary to move into a higher title and salary, you  
9 have to go through a reclassification and that's a  
10 very difficult process because it has to be shown  
11 that you are doing a different job from the one you  
12 did at the lower title that creates a kind of  
13 bottleneck at the top of those pay grades and a  
14 frustration that the person might be stuck at that  
15 top level for a long time.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And before you go  
17 further, aren't there a large number of blacks and  
18 Latinos in those HEO titles?

19 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

20 SHARON PERSINGER: Yes... [cross-talk]

21 BARBARA BOWEN: ...there are and that was  
22 one of the reasons we did this, they... and maybe  
23 Andrea wants to say something but the largest... the  
24 title that has the largest concentration especially  
25 of women of color... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 114

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

3 BARBARA BOWEN: ...is the assistant to HEO  
4 title... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

6 BARBARA BOWEN: ...and we have been very  
7 concerned about, about using the contract as a whole  
8 as a way to address systemic racism, I mean we, we've  
9 also done it with the lecturer title which is the  
10 faculty title that has the highest concentration of  
11 people of color and we added money on the salary to  
12 the faculty title this time, on the assistant to HEO  
13 title we also did a salary increment in addition to  
14 this differential so they're, next year in the  
15 contract there is an increment on the salary for  
16 every assistant to HEO, a 1,000 dollar increment and  
17 the differential was created in the last round of  
18 bargaining to address the difficulty that happens  
19 when somebody's title cannot be reclassified because  
20 they're not doing a different job but they're doing  
21 the job they have so well and with such... and at such  
22 a volume that they deserve something more so we  
23 negotiated a permanent salary differential of 2,500  
24 for people in that circumstance and this year in this  
25 contract what we did was increase funding for that

2 provision so there could be no, no college that would  
3 say we don't have the funding to do it and we also  
4 put in time frames for the decision by which... by  
5 which the President has to say yes or no on that  
6 differential... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, it's up to the  
8 President to decide, to accept that?

9 BARBARA BOWEN: It's, it goes through a  
10 series of peer reviews and that's one of the things  
11 that was very important to us because full time  
12 faculty and part time faculty personnel decisions go  
13 through peer review so the, the first step on the  
14 differential is a peer review which... meaning other  
15 people in the title are part of a committee that...  
16 they're assembled on each campus, they make a  
17 recommendation and it goes to a next committee and  
18 like all appointments, every appointment at CUNY,  
19 every promotion, every appointment is technically  
20 made by the President whether the president actually  
21 sits there and makes each one is, you know doubtful,  
22 they, they delegate some of those appointments but  
23 every appointment is actually finally by the board  
24 but these decisions are made in three steps and they  
25 involve crucially peer review.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 116

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, when will the  
3 President of the institution have to make a decision?

4 BARBARA BOWEN: They have six months,  
5 correct Andrea and there are two dates that we put in  
6 the contract if you apply by January 1<sup>st</sup> you get a  
7 decision by July... June 1<sup>st</sup> and if you apply by July  
8 1<sup>st</sup> you get a decision by February 1<sup>st</sup> so that people  
9 at least know when they're decision will be made.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, these HEO titles  
11 the position... the persons in those positions have to  
12 make an application and... [cross-talk]

13 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes, or they can... [cross-  
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...have... [cross-talk]

16 BARBARA BOWEN: ...they can apply  
17 themselves or be recommended and I will say that one  
18 thing that's really distinctive at CUNY that we have  
19 maintained is parody between the salary schedules of  
20 the professional staff in the HEO title and the full  
21 time faculty titles. So, with the exception of the  
22 assistant to HEO title they're all pegged to  
23 assistant, assistant professor, associate professor,  
24 full professor so we have maintained that parody.

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 117

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you,  
3 that's good to know so that we can follow up... [cross-  
4 talk]

5 BARBARA BOWEN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...in six months, in  
7 six months... [cross-talk]

8 BARBARA BOWEN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and see... [cross-  
10 talk]

11 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes, we can give you...  
12 [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...what the results  
14 are... [cross-talk]

15 BARBARA BOWEN: I don't know Andrea if  
16 you want to say anything on the results, they've been  
17 pretty good so far, but we think they will improve.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. Any  
19 other questions? Okay, thank you... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I, I just wanted  
21 to make a statement and, and just having been a part  
22 of so many negotiating teams and responsible for  
23 negotiating just a number of contracts and... that I, I  
24 have... I have sought to be as thoughtful and, and  
25 creative to really addressing all the needs

2 holistically of, of the bargaining unit and it is.. it  
3 is absolutely not easy to kind of please everyone,  
4 right, when you represent a pleather of titles..  
5 [cross-talk]

6 BARBARA BOWEN: That's right... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...people doing all  
9 different things and everybody feels they should be  
10 compensated in a way but still maintaining the  
11 integrity of the body.. bargaining unit just listening  
12 to you guys this is, is.. it's so just feeling and  
13 thoughtful... [cross-talk]

14 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...that you know I,  
16 I could just go line by line in each title and, and,  
17 and see that the thought and, and, and what you put  
18 into it. How, how large was, was your negotiating  
19 team?

20 BARBARA BOWEN: 50... what... how many, 20?  
21 22, no... 15 on the bargaining team, yeah, 15 on the  
22 bargaining team and you've got four of them here  
23 Andrea, James, and Sharon and Howards on our  
24 executive council.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 119

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I, I... just see my  
3 colleagues, it's... to get to this is, is so... it's,  
4 it's unique, it's, it's, it's rare and, and this is  
5 not just... you know I've, I've worked obviously even  
6 outside of New York City and, and this is, is, is  
7 really commendable, it is absolutely... [cross-talk]

8 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...commendable,  
10 it's something to hang your hat and be... and really be  
11 proud of...

12 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you and I'm not...  
13 [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...you know and...  
15 [cross-talk]

16 BARBARA BOWEN: ...sure you were in the  
17 room when I, I said Council Member Miller that you  
18 had asked the question about Chancellor Matos  
19 Rodriguez and I, I agree with the answer, he, he did  
20 step in immediately and made the contract a priority,  
21 I'm sure we'll have disagreements in the years to  
22 come but it was really important to have him in that  
23 position taking a detailed and broad interest in the  
24 contract and the... I think you can feel the years of  
25 working across the table with the CUNY negotiators

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 120

2 too that we have, I mean we have... this, this contract  
3 was a reach, it's creative, it took some risks and,  
4 and also I'm pleased to see that you know your  
5 response of thoughtfulness and there were a lot of...  
6 there were a lot of contributors and our membership,  
7 you know they weren't on the team but they were on  
8 the team in a way because they were constantly part  
9 of what created the leverage to do it so it wasn't  
10 just our bargaining team it was the whole membership  
11 too.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, let me just...  
13 two, two things is... and this first I've, I've always...  
14 you know I... my favorite King quote is, is all labor  
15 that uplifts humanity that, that uplifts humanity  
16 has, has value and should be undertaken with  
17 painstaking excellence and, and this I assure you  
18 this requires painstaking excellence to get in a  
19 room... in a room with, with these kind of minds, it is  
20 but I think more importantly is this... we have all  
21 struggled with, with this pay equity issue throughout  
22 the city, we, we did it with... [cross-talk]

23 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...with the lower  
25 level of early childcare... [cross-talk]



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 121

2 BARBARA BOWEN: Yep... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...education and  
4 now we have EMS, EMTs and, and all these other  
5 bargaining units that are happening by virtue of  
6 gender and race that they're not being compensated  
7 as, as, as white male counterparts and, and, and it  
8 is very clear that what we know is padding bargaining  
9 that governs, you know the Taylor Law and, and  
10 governs... and government workers in the state of New  
11 York does not get us there, it does not achieve the  
12 type of equity that we need, this kind of  
13 thoughtfulness, this is... every time that I... it, it,  
14 it just annoys you that you walk in a room and it's  
15 like no, no, no we're, we're negotiating now and you  
16 know we're going to take care of it but we're, we're  
17 still governed by padded bargaining and.. [cross-talk]

18 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...that... everybody  
20 is going to get the same and it's still going to be  
21 that difference and it's... [cross-talk]

22 BARBARA BOWEN: That's right... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...not going to  
25 solve the problem, how do you convince members to

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 122

2 take less that it is value in what you... and I... and  
3 I'm just taking it all in, it's a beautiful thing so...  
4 [cross-talk]

5 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...I am really so  
7 appreciative but it is also absolutely the template  
8 for how we achieve the goals for the... our entire  
9 municipal workforce that adds... there's a reason why  
10 65 million people visit New York, right, it is  
11 because of the municipal workforce... [cross-talk]

12 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...the services  
14 that we provide, right, public education, public  
15 safety, health... [cross-talk]

16 BARBARA BOWEN: That's right... [cross-  
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...and all these  
19 things people feel the value and, and so we had to  
20 figure out a way to compensate people equitably and,  
21 and you guys are, are really at the forefront of that  
22 and, and so I'm, I'm... [cross-talk]

23 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...I'm absolutely  
25 in awe of this and you know I've been... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 123

2 BARBARA BOWEN: We know... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...we've been back  
4 and forth... [cross-talk]

5 BARBARA BOWEN: I know... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...with this for,  
7 for a few years... [cross-talk]

8 BARBARA BOWEN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...right but to get  
10 here and, and here just the intricate details, it  
11 takes a lot of work and your team should be  
12 commended.

13 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you, we know that  
14 we, we know how far we have to go also and... you know  
15 we do, this was a step and we are eager, you know I  
16 can't wait to get back in the bargaining room, I, I  
17 want to get going on the next one, we have... we have  
18 more to do so thank you for the support to help us  
19 get this far. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Yes, call  
21 the next panel please.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kara Lang; Grace  
23 Duruaku; Paula Krebs and Martin Burke.

24 [off mic dialogue]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 124

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is the fourth person  
3 here or have they left? You called four names, right?

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Yes.

5 [off mic dialogue]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, well if the  
7 fourth person... fourth person comes before we end,  
8 we'll let them join the panel. Thank you, you may  
9 begin.

10 KARA LANG: Hi, my name is Kara Lang, I'm  
11 sorry I didn't provide a testimony because I didn't  
12 realize it was going to work that way but I'm one of  
13 those adjuncts that have been working for a 11 years  
14 at Bronx Community College and when I first started  
15 to work there the, the cap for the student body was  
16 25 now it's 30 and so in two of my classes, I teach  
17 two classes, there are 60 students so this contract  
18 which I voted against is a productivity contract in  
19 addition to the fact that I am teaching now more  
20 students than I have when I initially started. The  
21 fact is, is that this contract doesn't take into  
22 account all of the... I was just sitting and responding  
23 to students who are emailing me by the way, the  
24 contract doesn't take into account all of the work  
25 that I do in terms of reading their papers and

2 preparing my lessons, when I go into that second  
3 office hour I don't have an opportunity to do read  
4 their papers because I have expectations that my  
5 students are going to be coming in to talk to me so  
6 I'm still going to be working that extra hour which  
7 I'm only going to be paid a little bit more for and  
8 all the other hours that I work in the evening till  
9 12 o'clock at night reading my student's papers. On...  
10 in addition to the fact that many of us voted against  
11 the contract because we believe that this office hour  
12 is just part of a productivity deal, we had... remember  
13 we live in New York City, we had asked for 7,000  
14 dollars now, not 7,000 dollars at the end of the  
15 contract but because it's almost impossible to live  
16 in this city on the salary that we make that 5,500  
17 dollars by 2023 is surely not adequate. Most of the  
18 people are now teaching two classes so if you  
19 consider that if we're going to make 4,000 dollars  
20 they're going to make 8,000 dollars, 16,000 dollars  
21 and with some of the, the other things that are part  
22 of it if you make 20,000 dollars in a year that's  
23 really starvation wages in New York City which brings  
24 me to what I initially was going to talk about, this  
25 woman who I don't whether you could see, her name is

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 126

2 Thea Hunter or her name was Thea Hunter, she died,  
3 she worked... she was an adjunct for City College, she  
4 work... she was in her 60's so she wasn't old enough to  
5 get on Medicare and because her life was so  
6 precarious she didn't necessarily get constant health  
7 insurance either and so she had to figure out as a 64  
8 year old woman... or 62 I think; was she going to pay  
9 for rent, was she going to pay for hospital, was she  
10 going to pay for food, was she going to pay for  
11 transportation, she had to decide with that little  
12 bit amount of money how was she going to survive and  
13 she did not, she ended up dying because she took care  
14 of her own illness rather than being able to go to  
15 school... go to the hospital she ended up dying of  
16 pneumonia. So, this is the state of affairs that the  
17 adjuncts are in perennially and even with this new  
18 contract we are still in the same state that we were...  
19 the cost of living is still going up in New York, it  
20 hasn't stayed the same so given the fact that the  
21 cost of living has gone up that whatever we won in  
22 terms of the contract has not really supported the  
23 cost of living in reality. In addition to the fact  
24 that I was at a faculty senate meeting in... at BCC and  
25 it was clear from the President that there was an

2 impact statement and that people were going to be  
3 laid off because of the fact that this contract is  
4 not fully funded and as much as... and even the, the  
5 person from the Chancellor's Office, even though he  
6 said CUNY and the, the junior colleges are funded,  
7 the senior colleges aren't funded and in addition to  
8 that Cuomo now wants... because the buildings are in  
9 tremendous disrepair, right, there's mold, there's  
10 asbestos, the walls are falling down, I last semester  
11 didn't even have lights in my classroom and when I  
12 raised it at the faculty senate meeting the person  
13 who was the head of building, buildings and grounds  
14 or you know physical plans said it's not that we  
15 don't have the bulbs but we don't have enough people  
16 to check on the ballast versus something else that  
17 might be going on in the school so here I'm almost  
18 teaching in the dark because even if you flip the  
19 switch the lights aren't going on and so the reality  
20 is that there are going to be budget cuts, the  
21 reality is that people are teaching more students  
22 even if they're teaching fewer classes and reality  
23 is, is that Cuomo has now said that if he's going to  
24 fix those buildings that he's willing to put two  
25 dollars in for every dollar that that particular

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 128

2 campus is going to have to kick in in order to pay  
3 for the fixing of the buildings so if that's in fact  
4 the case that's going to come out of a generalized  
5 budget, that means that if that money is going to go  
6 to fixing the buildings as opposed to it just coming  
7 from the state then in fact they are going to be  
8 people who are going to be going. There are whole  
9 schools now in, in city tech that had to lay off all  
10 of its English tutors and with that extra hour the  
11 Chairman of the department and I, I think there's a  
12 grievance here has decided that those tutors... those...  
13 that extra hour will go for tutoring everybody who  
14 comes into the school not just for your own  
15 individual student, you know what I'm saying? So, the  
16 whole thing is complete productivity, it's not a  
17 raise, 5,300... or 5,500 by, by 2023 means more of the  
18 sea of hunters in the world. There was a woman who  
19 was in her car who was going from campus to campus  
20 and fell asleep and she died of carbon monoxide  
21 poisoning, this story is typical, it's not unusual  
22 and so without Cuomo kicking in fully funded CUNY,  
23 instead of making the students pay, that was what the  
24 argument was from the faculty senate at BCC that the  
25 students needed to pay so that we can regularize the



COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 129

2 funding of... you know of CUNY and I said well where is  
3 the... Cuomo and De Blasio's responsibility in, in  
4 funding it so even when the tuition... some people are  
5 getting TAP, the tuition has gone up but there's no...  
6 there's no filler of that gap so the students pay the  
7 difference between what they get from TAP and what  
8 the actual cost of the, the... their education actually  
9 is. Okay, so what I wanted initially to say was our  
10 colleague Thea Hunter an adjunct at, at City College  
11 died in early 2019 because CUNY is being starved to  
12 death, her story is unfortunately typical, not  
13 unusual. According to an article in the Atlantic and  
14 I think this is where you got your figures from  
15 also, from 1993 to 2013 the percentage of  
16 underrepresented and minorities in non-tenured track  
17 part time faculty positions in higher education grew  
18 by 20... 230 percent, by contrast the percentage of  
19 underrepresented and minorities in full time tenured  
20 track positions grew by just 30 percent and there was  
21 a point that wanted to make in response to something  
22 that you had asked and somebody... one from the  
23 Chancellor's Office said that minority growth is, is  
24 by 12 percent and that's better than it was before  
25 but if in fact adjuncts are the ones that are largely

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 130

2 working and in my department in history we have 23  
3 adjuncts to 19... it was 16 full timers, if in fact  
4 it's the case that adjuncts are working more hours  
5 than full timers then what is the actual number of 12  
6 percent because they're smaller as, as a group than  
7 we as adjuncts are. So, instead of looking at  
8 percentages, 71 percent sounds wonderful but 71  
9 percent by 2023 is only 5,500 dollars, we have to  
10 start really asking about numbers not just about  
11 percentages. When CUNY was a hundred percent white  
12 before 1969 it was free now in the junior colleges  
13 they pay 7,000 and something and in the senior  
14 colleges 9,000 something, completely funded by the  
15 government, I am a recipient of that policy but after  
16 the advent of open admissions everything changed,  
17 tuition was imposed and privatization took off now  
18 student fees pay 40 percent of the budget and while  
19 many students receive financial aid the tuition has  
20 gone up exponentially while the aid has remained  
21 stagnant. The CUNY budget is racist, not designed to  
22 get our students either through school or actually do  
23 the job of educating them. Again, according to the  
24 Atlantic nearly 80 percent of faculty members were  
25 tenured or tenure tracked in 1969, now roughly three

2 quarters of faculty are non-tenured, the jobs that  
3 are available as an adjunct or as a visiting  
4 professor this is all the Atlantic, rest on shaky  
5 foundations as those who occupy them try to balance  
6 work and life often without benefits and still the..  
7 I'd like everybody to continue to look at her, Thea  
8 wobbled for years, the faculty now is majority  
9 adjunct, people who themselves cannot make ends meet,  
10 we are living on other people's couches, we're  
11 working three jobs so when you have to work another  
12 hour it means that you don't get the opportunity to  
13 go to that other school to make some extra money  
14 because not everybody is going to work around your  
15 schedule. It is like prison but without any  
16 possibility of parole. There was just one victim of  
17 the system that is being starved by people who want  
18 ot employ the business model to the City University,  
19 that is let's make this a profit making system..  
20 sorry, let's hire faculty at the lowest wages  
21 possible so that the Governor and the Board of  
22 Trustees do not have to fulfill their obligations to  
23 provide quality education for all New Yorkers. In the  
24 meantime the wealthy get to send their children to  
25 private schools continuing to be unconcerned with

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 132

2 hundreds of thousands of people who pass through CUNY  
3 yearly, they are unconcerned with the health hazards  
4 that are forced.. that we are forced to confront  
5 daily, mold, asbestos, walls falling just to name a  
6 few horrors visited upon the CUNY.. community.. the  
7 CUNY community. CUNY is being starved for funds  
8 because education is no longer a priority because  
9 what matters to the wealthy is to maximize profit and  
10 your.. and.. sorry, and unfortunately the, the people  
11 that ostensibly represent us, the Governor, the  
12 Mayor, people like that really are concerned very  
13 little for the people that.. the hundreds of thousands  
14 of people that we educate on a daily basis. We need..  
15 we demand a commitment from whatever the Council  
16 people can do and from the.. from Cuomo that.. I'm..  
17 that so called.. that they no longer.. that vote for  
18 budgets that will cut the City University off its.. at  
19 its knees but will fight for a free, fully funded  
20 school system, it means in my opinion that people  
21 have to resign, right, their position if they are  
22 going to continue working for a racist system that's  
23 only profit driven and does nothing more to educate  
24 the students. My students more than ever need the  
25 tutoring and the, the writing lab and by the way the

2 writing lab has mold and everything in it as well  
3 which is completely unhealthy, the faculty and  
4 students alike will no longer tolerate this  
5 disrespect, we are organizing and mean to stop these  
6 cut backs from continuing. So, by and large... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If I could ask you  
9 to wrap up your... [cross-talk]

10 KARA LANG: ...okay, by and... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...testimony... [cross-  
12 talk]

13 KARA LANG: ...large I think it's important  
14 not to look at the, the statistics but look at the  
15 actual numbers and the reality of the people who's  
16 lives are being affected on a daily basis.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Next  
18 panelist.

19 PAULA KREBS: Chairpersons Barron and  
20 Miller and members of the Committee on Higher  
21 Education and the Committee on Civil Service and  
22 Labor thank you very much for this invitation. I'm  
23 Paula Krebs, I'm the Executive Director of the Modern  
24 Language Association and I want to take the contract  
25 for... in relation to adjunct faculty employment at the

2 City University of New York and put it into the  
3 context of the standards for such employment set by  
4 professional association for the disciplines of  
5 language and literature that's what I represent. So,  
6 founded in 1883, the Modern Language Association of  
7 America is the national association for approximately  
8 24,000 higher education professionals including 426  
9 from CUNY, who teach... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sorry, just let  
11 me interrupt, if I could ask that you give us the  
12 highlights of your testimony... [cross-talk]

13 PAULA KREBS: Its really quick... [cross-  
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so you're not  
16 going to read... [cross-talk]

17 PAULA KREBS: ...I'm not going to read... I'm  
18 not reading the six... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

20 PAULA KREBS: ...pages, no, no, no... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you...  
23 [cross-talk]

24 PAULA KREBS: ...I want... just wanted to let  
25 you know in case you didn't read it who we were,

1 okay. The Association provides professional  
2 development support for departments of English and  
3 foreign languages and helps to establish standards  
4 for curriculum and employment. In our recommendation  
5 on minimum per course compensation for part time  
6 faculty members, the MLA calls for a standard three  
7 course... three credit course to be compensated, this  
8 is our as a professional association our  
9 recommendations, a standard three credit course to be  
10 compensated at a rate of 11,100 dollars. This  
11 recommendation is based on the assumption of a full-  
12 time load of three courses per semester. Now I...  
13 that's not the standard load at a community college  
14 or at some campuses but that's what's that's based  
15 on. The recommendation for courses as part of I  
16 higher teaching load such as that at community  
17 colleges is 7,400 dollars per course. Now that amount  
18 includes preparation time and office hours, I want to  
19 make clear to that. The annual full time equivalent  
20 of these recommendations is key to our  
21 recommendations for full time salary for entry level  
22 instructors, that's how we break that down. Just 43  
23 percent of college and university courses offered in  
24 language and literature were taught by tenured track  
25

2 faculty members as of fall 2017. The rest of these  
3 courses were taught by faculty members especially  
4 those paid by the course who do not have the job  
5 security or academic freedom protections that come  
6 with tenure. Most part time faculty members in US  
7 colleges and universities and they often hold the  
8 terminal degree in their fields, have no access to  
9 long term contracts or health insurance. Scholarly  
10 societies such as the MLA recognize the need to both  
11 empower and protect teachers in our disciplines as  
12 they educate college and university students in  
13 writing, language skills, literature and culture. In  
14 our disciplines, English and the other modern  
15 languages, the overuse of part time faculty  
16 employment is especially common, English and math are  
17 the two biggest areas for overuse of, of adjuncts  
18 because we serve everybody, all the students take our  
19 courses. Most colleges and universities require first  
20 year writing courses, and many require a year of  
21 foreign language for all students. When universities  
22 fail to recognize the continuing need for these  
23 courses that is you're always going to be teaching  
24 these courses, they are continually in, in your  
25 schedule and don't determine staffing on the basis of



2 that continuing need but it could... but persistent  
3 determining at the last minute. Students who take  
4 those courses are taught by qualified professional  
5 instructors and whom the university is unwilling to  
6 make a long-term investment and who the... then cannot  
7 make the long-term investment in the students that  
8 they teach. Retention of students through to  
9 graduation is an acute concern for CUNY and other  
10 public higher education institutions especially open  
11 access institutions. A recent Gardner Institute study  
12 reports that the first college year is central to the  
13 achievement of an institution's mission and lays the  
14 foundation on which undergraduate education is built.  
15 When students, especially those at access-oriented  
16 institutions are not taught by faculty members who  
17 will be there a semester or a year later for those  
18 students, the quality of the student experience is  
19 reduced. We applaud the City University of New York  
20 for its pilot program for multiyear appointments for  
21 part time faculty members. At the MLA, we hear  
22 frequent stories of part time faculty members having  
23 classes cancelled as late as two weeks into a  
24 semester leaving an instructor with severely reduced  
25 income when it's too late to seek additional teaching

1  
2 elsewhere. Instructors who know that they'll be  
3 continuing at CUNY will be able to be more available  
4 to students; students will be able to count on their  
5 instructors to write letters of recommendation and to  
6 offer advice after the classes are over. At the state  
7 university where I used to be a dean in Massachusetts  
8 two thirds of the enrollment was either first  
9 generation college students, students of color or  
10 Pell grant recipients or some combination thereof and  
11 I saw many, many students who wanted to apply for  
12 opportunities, study abroad, internships but couldn't  
13 get letters of recommendation from faculty members  
14 because they'd only been taught by adjunct faculty  
15 members who were not back on campus the next  
16 semester. A revolving door for introductory classes  
17 doesn't do anybody any good. Students, especially the  
18 students at CUNY schools, benefit from being able to  
19 develop mentorship relationships with faculty members  
20 over time; the teachers they have in their first year  
21 can be important resources for them, touchstones as  
22 they move along in their college careers. Too often  
23 in public higher education however, the instructors  
24 who teach the introductory classes are treated as  
25 expendable and interchangeable and the result is that

2 faculty members cannot invest in students beyond one  
3 class and first and second year students never seen  
4 the... see the same professor twice. The members of the  
5 Modern Language Association take very seriously the  
6 obligation of the association to improve the working  
7 conditions of part time... part time faculty members.  
8 Insecure employment conditions are especially  
9 prevalent in less commonly taught languages for, for  
10 which universities rarely reserve full-time  
11 positions. So, if, if you... you're teaching Arabic,  
12 you're teaching farcity or teaching Kiswahili, you're  
13 not employing a full-time tenure track person in this  
14 position. Those faculty members who are in...  
15 especially in, in vulnerable positions because many  
16 of many of them are immigrants, don't have the job  
17 security when they don't have continuing contracts it  
18 makes their situations even more complicated. We're  
19 currently undertaking a, a study of those conditions  
20 nationally for those languages. Eleven-point four  
21 percent of our membership identifies as working less  
22 than full time and that's an increase from last year  
23 of more than two percent, we now have a dedicated  
24 slot on our governing board for part time faculty  
25 members. One of our board members is making only half

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 140

2 of the income she had counted on this semester as a  
3 course was removed from her schedule a week before  
4 the semester began. The other part timer on our board  
5 can't attend next month's board meeting because she  
6 had to pick up another job to make ends meet. The  
7 working conditions for these two PhDs in language and  
8 literature are sadly absolutely typical in US higher  
9 education today. The MLA and other disciplinary  
10 associations are working to improve the situation and  
11 we're pleased to see the City University of New York  
12 taking steps in the right direction. Thank you for  
13 asking the MLA to contribute to this discussion.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

15 MARTIN BURKE: Thank you Chairs Barron  
16 and Miller for the invitation to speak at the joint  
17 meeting of the Committee on Higher Education and the  
18 Committee on Civil Service and Labor. My name is  
19 Martin Burke and I'm a Professor of History and  
20 American Studies at Lehman College in the Graduate  
21 Center and it's been my privilege to serve as the  
22 Chair of the University Faculty Senate and in that  
23 capacity as a member of CUNY's Board of Trustees. The  
24 University Faculty Senate is authorized by the bylaws  
25 of the board and it's charged in part with the

2 formulation of policy relating to the academic  
3 status, roles, and rights and freedoms of the  
4 faculty. And it's about the roles and the academic  
5 status of my colleagues, especially my part time  
6 colleagues I'd like to speak today. In the fall of  
7 2019, the term for which there's the most up to date  
8 figures, there are 20,152 faculty members on the  
9 campuses and schools of the City University of New  
10 York; 7,522 or 37.3 percent of them held full time  
11 appointments, 12,630 or 62.7 percent were part time  
12 positions. Roughly speaking then, a bit more than a  
13 third were full timers and a little less than two  
14 thirds were adjuncts. While the part time faculty  
15 offered upwards of at least 50 percent of all classes  
16 across CUNY, they do so in conditions that are not  
17 commensurate with our full-time peers. Assignments of  
18 office space as we've heard before is almost always  
19 done to meet the needs and demands of the full-time  
20 faculty. Adjuncts often share crowded quarters which  
21 hamper their ability to advise, consult with and  
22 mentor our students. At present the university is  
23 actively assessing it's physical assets with the  
24 goals of monetizing them and the UFS would ask that  
25 the university also evaluate the allocation of office

1 space on the campuses in terms of the quite literally  
2 pressing pedagogical and professional needs of the  
3 part timers. Some members of the adjunct faculty do  
4 more than offer courses, they conduct research,  
5 deliver papers, publish articles and books, compose  
6 music, they write poetry. They are, in the words of a  
7 recent resolution passed by the American Historical  
8 Association, scholars off the tenure track. Yet the  
9 resources available to them continue to.. continue to  
10 be active are scant and they're distributed unevenly  
11 from department to department and campus to campus.  
12 CUNY's part time professors require access to studio  
13 and performance space, laboratories, and state of the  
14 art, high speed computing in order to realize their  
15 creative and scholarly potentials and to share this  
16 with our students and the larger community. Through  
17 its support of the CUNY Academy for the Humanities  
18 and Sciences Adjunct Travel Awards, the university  
19 has been making a contribution to these ends. But far  
20 more support and far more ways are required for both  
21 the cohorts of scholars off the tenure track and  
22 those many who are struggling to get onto it. The  
23 status of the faculty also extends to the roles  
24 played by adjuncts in the organizational life of  
25

2 their campuses and the larger university, in  
3 particular through the structures of shared  
4 governance. Here again the circumstances vary campus  
5 to campus. At some institutions, such as Hostos  
6 Community College, part timers are enfranchised; they  
7 can cast votes for and are represented in, college  
8 council and academic senates. At other campuses, such  
9 as the City College they are not. This leads to the  
10 perplexing situations in which a majority of the  
11 faculty who do the better part of the teaching are  
12 unable to participate in curricular development at  
13 their schools. At the university wide level, although  
14 adjuncts do serve in the UFS, even their position  
15 remains somewhat tenuous. We're now in the process of  
16 revising our Charter to ensure that the standing of  
17 full time and part time faculty is the same. We've  
18 recommended that campus governance bodies do the same  
19 in the cause of fully enfranchising and  
20 institutionally integrating all CUNY faculty. To this  
21 end, we've made strides in, including adjunct faculty  
22 in the UFS. In addition to making significant  
23 contributions to ongoing charter revisions, under my  
24 leadership we've established the Contingent Caucus,  
25 which discusses many of the concerns I raise today

2 and explores best practices for ameliorating them.

3 Furthermore, in the last two electoral cycles my

4 fellow senators have chosen two adjunct faculty

5 members to serve on the UFS Executive Committee which

6 conducts the Senate's business in between our plenary

7 sessions. During the fall 2019 term, the university

8 administered a faculty job satisfaction survey,

9 prepared by the collaborative on academic careers in

10 higher education, at the senior, comprehensive and

11 community colleges. The results of this COACHE survey

12 as it's called have been circulated on the campuses

13 and will serve for the basis for changes in relevant

14 practices. At present, a committee is examining and

15 comparing results university wide to similar ends.

16 However, the members of the faculty participating in

17 the COACHE process were limited to full timers. Over

18 60 percent of the university's faculty, the very part

19 timers whose level of job satisfaction and

20 suggestions for improvement may well have been

21 dramatically different, were excluded. In

22 anticipation of the next COACHE cycle in 2023, the

23 UFS strongly encourages the central administration to

24 make sure all CUNY faculty are surveyed. In these and

25 other aspects of professional life at CUNY, the



1  
2 distances and the experiences and the expectation of  
3 adjunct faculty and their full-time colleagues are  
4 marked. This needs to be reduced. Whether  
5 inadvertently or deliberately, the university has  
6 become a national leader in depending on contingent  
7 labor. The UFS urges CUNY to become a leader in  
8 addressing and overcoming the dilemmas faced by our  
9 adjunct colleagues. We need to become one faculty, as  
10 our own contingent caucus puts it. On the senate's  
11 behalf then I'd like to thank the Chairs and the  
12 Committees for the opportunity to bring these matters  
13 to your attention.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I thank the panel  
15 for your presentation. Was there any explanation Dr.  
16 Burke as to why only full-time faculty was included  
17 in the survey?

18 MARTIN BURKE: Chair Barron that's an  
19 excellent question... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I mean even if you  
21 wanted to disaggregate the results that you got from  
22 that study why would you not want to have that base  
23 of information?

24 MARTIN BURKE: The, the... before the cycle  
25 started I and my director Dr. Matthew Cotter met with

2 the staff in the university's office for faculty  
3 affairs, they explained to us that the COACHE which  
4 is developed at Harvard simply does not have a  
5 mechanism for surveying part time faculty, we replied  
6 that we thought this was quite odd.. [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sure somebody..  
8 [cross-talk]

9 MARTIN BURKE: ...after all... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...could make an app  
11 for that.

12 MARTIN BURKE: Yes, quite, yeah, after  
13 all it was Harvard and the university which had  
14 already contracted when it had with it but it strikes  
15 me that both the results of the COACHE which are  
16 being discussed on campus and will be discussed  
17 university wide are at best partial and it's critical  
18 if the university is going to take tax levy dollars  
19 provided by the city of New York and the state of New  
20 York to survey faculty on job satisfaction in order  
21 to change conditions.. [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 MARTIN BURKE: ...that the better part of  
24 the faculty, the part timers have to be included and

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 147

2 I would ask you then as Chair of the Higher Education  
3 Committee... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

5 MARTIN BURKE: ...to make it clear to the  
6 university when the COACHE next leaves in 2023 or  
7 when the horses are being groomed in 2022... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 MARTIN BURKE: ...that CUNY be serious  
11 about this and open up the COACHE to all faculty.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I think that's  
13 critical, I... it seems like it would be a simple  
14 matter to resolve.

15 MARTIN BURKE: Chair Barron as, as you  
16 well know nothing tends to be simple at the City  
17 University ever... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, you know  
19 there's... when there's a will there's a way and if you  
20 want to do it you can make it happen... [cross-talk]

21 MARTIN BURKE: I agree... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...that generally is  
23 what, what functions here and to the other panel  
24 members thank you for your presentation and I, I  
25 heard your emotion as you talked about Thea Hunter

2 and sorry for her passing. Now just one question,  
3 have you always been an adjunct or have you been  
4 full... [cross-talk]

5 KARA LANG: Always... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You were always an  
7 adjunct... [cross-talk]

8 KARA LANG: Always, I, I... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Did you want to be a  
10 full-time instructor?

11 KARA LANG: I, I realize that there's  
12 just no possibility of that happening.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

14 KARA LANG: So, I accepted being an  
15 adjunct... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

17 KARA LANG: ...but I, I'm not accepting  
18 poverty wages.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, well thank you  
20 all for your presentation, thank you so much.

21 MARTIN BURKE: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And I will ask my  
23 Co-Chair if he would adjourn this hearing, no...

24 [off mic dialogue]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 149

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so I want  
3 to thank everybody for coming out this afternoon and  
4 for participating in this important hearing, I want  
5 to thank my Co-Chair for agreeing to hold this  
6 important oversight hearing for such a relevant  
7 institution as, as, as CUNY long overdue. With that  
8 this hearing is adjourned.

9 [gavel]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

February 13, 2020