

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

January 23, 2020  
Start: 1:17 p.m.  
Recess: 3:43 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson  
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Diana Ayala  
Inez D. Barron  
Joseph C. Borelli  
Justin Brannan  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Costa Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Mark Gjonaj  
Barry Grodenchik  
Robert Holden

Ben Kallos  
Andy King  
Peter Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Farah Louis  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco Moya  
Bill Perkins  
Keith Powers  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Carlina Rivera  
Ydanis Rodriguez  
Deborah Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Paul Vallone  
Jimmy Van Bramer  
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 OWEN KATOWSKI: Today is January 23,  
3 2020. This the Stated Meeting. We're in the City  
4 Council Chambers, and this is Owen Katowski.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: This is Clibourne,  
6 burn.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Clibourne.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Ahuh,  
9 [inaudible], OK. Now it's Blakeley?

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes, Blakeley.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK. Hello, hello  
12 everyone, good afternoon and welcome to the New York  
13 City Council. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo and  
14 we are now going to begin the honor of our  
15 proclamation ceremony. Will all members that are  
16 present please come forward. We have two living  
17 legends and celebrities in our midst today. We often  
18 talk about and celebrate our actors, our musicians,  
19 but today we have the real celebrities, the true  
20 heroes of our country, and I couldn't be more proud  
21 to have them both here today. I'm so proud that all  
22 of my colleagues are here because this is really what  
23 America and New York is really about. Today we  
24 celebrate the life of a true American hero. Reverend  
25 James E. Blakely was born on January 8, 1920 in

2 Arkansas and listed, and enlisted in the United  
3 States Navy in September 1939. During the Pearl  
4 Harbor attacks he was stationed aboard the USS St.  
5 Louis. And when we heard and he heard of what was  
6 happening in Pearl Harbor he immediately sprung. Now  
7 many people, when they get that call, your heart is  
8 in many different places. But he answered that call  
9 with such bravery, tenacity, and courage that we  
10 recognize and honor that today. But on top of that  
11 he has also seen in his lifetime 100 years. So let's  
12 give it up for 100 years of life. [applause] It is  
13 not only a blessing, but a great honor. During World  
14 War II Reverend Blakely served aboard the USS  
15 President Jackson in major combat operations in the  
16 Pacific Theater, including the battles of  
17 Guadalcanal, Iwo Jima, and Marshall Islands and Guam,  
18 helping to transport troops to the battlefield and  
19 evacuate the dead and the wounded. He served in the  
20 US Navy until his honorable discharge in 1945, where  
21 he began a new life here in New York City. He  
22 resided in my district in Fort Greene, Brooklyn for  
23 many years. I understand that you do not live in my  
24 district, but you moved before I became a City  
25 Council member and I know you would have remained if

1 STATED MEETING

6

2 you knew I was the member. Reverend Blakely has had  
3 the pleasure of sharing his stories for the last 75  
4 years, continuing to inspire generations of our youth  
5 with his amazing story. His perseverance and  
6 determination speaks to the quality of his character.  
7 We thank you for all that you do. We are honored to  
8 share this incredible milestone with you. I also  
9 want to honor at this special time, and we are so  
10 fortunate, when we announced that this was happening  
11 we found out about yet another Pearl Harbor veteran,  
12 Clibourne Sowell, and he is happy to celebrate his  
13 96th birthday with us here today. [applause] And  
14 what a blessing it is that we have reunited these two  
15 powerful, courageous and brave men here at the City  
16 Council. We recognize the sacrifice that you have  
17 made for our country. We are so proud, and we are  
18 going to have to come back and present you with a  
19 proclamation at a later date. We apologize that we  
20 didn't find out about your incredible story. But  
21 hopefully this will bring forward more Pearl Harbor  
22 veterans who have sacrificed so much for our country.  
23 So we will now turn it over. Today we are going to  
24 have, ah, the proclamation read onto the record.

25

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council City of New  
3 York Proclamation. The New York City Council is  
4 proud to celebrate the 100th birthday of Reverend  
5 James E. Blakely, one of the last surviving African  
6 American veterans of World War II and the attack on  
7 Pearl Harbor. And whereas James E. Blakely was born  
8 on January 8, 1920, in Arkansas and enlisted in the  
9 United States Navy in September 1939, on the morning  
10 of December 7, 1941, he was stationed aboard the USS  
11 St. Louis in Pearl Harbor when the call to battle  
12 stations blared. The Japanese had launched a  
13 surprise attack. Awoken by the all hands on deck  
14 order, he began running ammunition to anti-aircraft  
15 guns. Thanks to the courageous work of Reverend  
16 Blakely and the other crew members, the USS St. Louis  
17 evaded torpedoes and joined other vessels in the open  
18 sea. When the USS St. Louis returned to Pearl Harbor  
19 Reverend Blakely helped transport casualties and  
20 other troops to San Francisco. The attack on Pearl  
21 Harbor ended the same day it began, but it would  
22 inform the rest of his life. And whereas later  
23 during World War II Reverend Blakely served aboard  
24 the USS President Jackson in major combat operations  
25 in the Pacific Theater, including the battles of

2 Guadalcanal, Iwo Jima, the Marshall Island, and Guam,  
3 helping to transport troops to the battlefield and  
4 evacuate the dead and wounded. And whereas in  
5 October 1945, one month after the war ended, Reverend  
6 Blakely was honorably discharged and began a new life  
7 in New York City. For several years he worked as a  
8 longshoreman in the docks under the Williamsburg  
9 Bridge before accepting a maintenance position at  
10 NYU. And whereas in the 75 year since World War II  
11 Reverend Blakely has often shared his experience with  
12 others, like his peers in the greatest generation, he  
13 persevered through unprecedented and very difficult  
14 years. Such perseverance is a testament to his  
15 incredible strength of character and an inspiration  
16 to others. Today at the age of 100 he deserves to be  
17 celebrated [applause], at the age of 100 he deserves  
18 to be celebrated not only for his longevity but also  
19 for the tremendously positive impact he has had in so  
20 many lives. He has truly earned the esteem of all  
21 New Yorkers. Now therefore be it known that the New  
22 York City Council gratefully honors Reverend James E.  
23 Blakely and all other veterans of World War II  
24 present in the chambers today for his and for their  
25 extraordinary service and enduring contributions to



2 New York City and the nation. Corey Johnson, speaker  
3 for the entire council, Laurie A. Cumbo, majority  
4 leader, council member, 35th District, and many other  
5 members of the New York City Council. [applause]

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Wow, what an  
7 honor here today. We have two giants in our midst  
8 today, and I wanted to know if anyone from either,  
9 ah, Mr. Clibourne's family or Mr. Blakely's family  
10 would like to speak on behalf of these two great  
11 veterans that are here in our midst today.

12 REVEREND BLAKLEY: Yeah, I'm working on  
13 my second one hundred, um-hmm. I [inaudible] yeah,  
14 bring 'em on, boy. They didn't do anything but wake  
15 up a sleeping giant [chuckles]. Yeah, God bless you  
16 all.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.  
18 [applause] Mr. Sowell, would you like to bring some  
19 remarks?

20 CLIBOURNE SOWELL: [inaudible] seagoing  
21 tub. I never saw the kind of action like he did.  
22 But I was on my way to Pearl Harbor when the war hit,  
23 so, ah, from ah, yeah, to Pearl Harbor. Then I was  
24 sent to the Brooklyn Navy Yard and I was quite a few  
25

2 places, and I never saw action like he did, yeah. I  
3 was more on the home front. But I was there.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Well, we...

5 CLIBOURNE SOWELL: Yeah, well, you just  
6 take orders, that's all you did. So the places I  
7 went, I'd take orders to go to this place and that  
8 place, but I was only two [inaudible], just two,  
9 [inaudible]. [applause]

10 REVEREND BLAKLEY: I want to tell you  
11 what inspired me. That was the nurses, hospital  
12 nurses, or whatever they are. And there was, there  
13 were the airfield. They could have landed troops,  
14 but they didn't know the damage they had done. From  
15 that morning, Sunday morning, probably about five  
16 minutes to eight until seven or eight o'clock in the  
17 evening, I think they was probably recognizing the  
18 planes coming back to see what damage they had done.  
19 They had woke up a sleeping giant. [applause]

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK, that's OK.  
21 Wow. And that really sums it up on so many levels.  
22 But I want to say to both of you and to everyone in  
23 the United States the minute you serve you express a  
24 level of courageness and braveness that many of us at  
25 home will never understand or know. So whatever role

2 you played in serving this country is a level of  
3 courageousness that we honor and we respect, and we  
4 simply love you. Thank you so much for all that you  
5 have done. We are going to hear final words from Mr.  
6 Sweat, who is going to speak on behalf of Mr. Blakely  
7 as well and his family.

8 MR. SWEAT: The first thing I want to say  
9 is give an honor to the highest in the world, the one  
10 that created the world. And then I want to come done  
11 to the world and honor those that are honoring these  
12 two veterans, and that is thank you to the mayor's  
13 office and all the dignitaries that are here today to  
14 witness, to witness the oldest living veteran that is  
15 a survivor of the Pearl Harbor. I want to say that  
16 this is the reason why I became a veteran and many  
17 other people of color serve these United States of  
18 America, for our honor, for our respect, for our  
19 dignity, and for our alliance to these country, this  
20 country that we so diligently embodied, from the very  
21 beginning of the United States Civil War which  
22 elected us to come into the body of the Union Army as  
23 soldiers, auxiliary, but soldiers. February 1863,  
24 January Emancipation Proclamation was signed which  
25 entitled us the rights. So from there we were born.

1 STATED MEETING

12

2 From the buffalo soldiers to the young Iraqi,  
3 Afghanistan, Lebanon, Gulf warriors of today. We are  
4 standing on these two gentlemen's back, and in  
5 reality we're not even on your back, we're by your  
6 side, and we' so proud because this is our dignity.  
7 This is our respect. These are my fathers. These  
8 are my daddies and yours too. I want to thank you.  
9 Both of you. [applause]

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
11 much, and I want to thank on my staff, Arna and  
12 Lauren and Jason, for making today possible, for  
13 making sure this happened. Thank you so much. This  
14 is really wonderful and so important. If we could  
15 all come together and, and have a group photo that  
16 would be wonderful, holding the proclamation. All of  
17 the veterans here today please come forward. We  
18 don't just honor you on Veterans Day, this is year  
19 round, your service needs to be recognized. Ms.  
20 Blakely? Thank you, thank you, and you are always  
21 welcome at New York City Hall. [pause]

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentleman,  
23 could I have your attention please. Could I please  
24 have your attention, please. Quiet on the floor. At  
25 this time please place all electronic devices, all

1 STATED MEETING

13

2 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-council  
3 employees, non-council employees, please leave the  
4 main floor of the chambers. We have additional  
5 seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you. Madam  
6 Majority Leader.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Good afternoon  
8 and welcome to the Stated Meeting of January 23,  
9 2020. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. For all of  
10 those that can please rise for the Pledge of  
11 Allegiance.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I pledge  
14 allegiance to the flag of the United States of  
15 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one  
16 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and  
17 justice for all. Roll call.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Very present.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala. Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli. Brannan.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.  
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.  
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen. Constantinides.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.  
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.  
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.  
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.  
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene. Gibson.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.  
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj. Grodenchik.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.  
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here.  
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN:  
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo. Cohen.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.  
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.  
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander. Levin.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.  
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.  
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.  
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.  
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.  
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.  
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

16

2

COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

4

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

6

COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

8

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

10

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

11

Rosenthal.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca. Torres.

14

Treyger.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

16

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Present.

18

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

20

COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

22

COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

24

COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

25

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Here.



2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have a quorum.

6 We will now have today's invocation, which will be  
7 delivered by Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu Nakagaki,  
8 spiritual leader of the Buddhist Council of New York,  
9 located at 376 Broadway in Manhattan. For all those  
10 can rise, please rise.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

12 REVEREND NAKAGAKI: So first please stand  
13 with both your feet steady. Let me read the  
14 meditation. Relax your body. Close your eyes  
15 lightly. Breathe out and then slowly breathe in. As  
16 you exhale, let go of your worries, fear, anger, and  
17 grief. Then as you inhale let love, light, life, and  
18 luck come to you. As we celebrate the Lunar New Year  
19 this weekend, let us remember that we that we must  
20 keep our mind and spirit wholesome and fresh always.  
21 When our mind is good our words and actions will  
22 become good. This is the year 2020, which is two-  
23 zero-two-zero, peace circle, peace circle. So let us  
24 practice peace and let the circle of peace expand,  
25 filling our society with love, lights, life, and

2 luck. As a Hiroshima Peace Ambassador and Nagasaki  
3 Peace Correspondent, I would like to remind you that  
4 this year marks the 75th anniversary of Hiroshima and  
5 Nagasaki bombings, which were the result of inhumane  
6 weapons of mass destruction, created here in New York  
7 City during the Manhattan Project. I sincerely hope  
8 and pray that through our actions and words we as New  
9 Yorkers can start a new Manhattan Project of peace  
10 from New York this year of double peace circles.  
11 [speaking in unknown language] Amen. And thank you  
12 very much, and peace to you all, and Happy New Year  
13 to you all. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Thank  
15 you so much, Dr. Nakagaki. We appreciate your  
16 message of peace, certainly a wonderful to begin the  
17 new year. And I'd like to now call on Council Member  
18 Chin to spread the invocation on the record.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Majority  
20 Leader. I am proud to welcome Reverend Dr. Nakagaki,  
21 the president of the Buddhist Council of New York,  
22 founded in 1985 to foster dialogue, cooperation, and  
23 unity within the Buddhist community in the New York  
24 City area, as well as to organize events that promote  
25 education, a Buddhist principle, and interfaith

2 dialogue. The council's home is at 376 Broadway,  
3 right in the heart of my district. Thank you for  
4 your work to promote peace, dialogue, and  
5 understanding for all of our community. And as we  
6 begin this new Lunar New Year and a new decade we  
7 will dedicate ourselves to promote peace, kindness,  
8 and fairness in our city. Thank you very much.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
10 much, Council Member Chin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I would like to  
12 make a motion to spread the invocation in full upon  
13 the record.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you again,  
15 Council Member Chin. We will now have the adoption  
16 of minutes by Council Member Brannan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I'd like to make  
18 a motion that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of  
19 December 10, 2019, be adopted as printed.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Messages and  
21 papers from the mayor.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: [clears throat] Excuse  
23 me. M-205, city debt and reserves.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication  
25 from city, county, and borough offices.

1 STATED MEETING

20

2 COUNCIL CLERK: On M-205, Madam Majority  
3 Leader, the received ordered printed and file. M-  
4 206, TLC appointment.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and  
6 communications.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: OK, there are no  
8 communications and no petitions or communications.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use call-  
10 ups.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: M-207 through M-209.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on a call-up  
13 vote. And at this time I'm asking for a roll call  
14 vote and all of the items on today's land use  
15 calender, this is just on the land use call-up  
16 calendar.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli.

1 STATED MEETING

21

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: King. Koo.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ:  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander. Levin.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.  
COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I vote aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.  
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.  
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Rose. Rosenthal.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here, yes.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca. Torres.  
Treyger.  
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I'd like to vote  
yes on all land use call-ups and with your  
permission, I'd ask for unanimous consent to vote yes  
on all coupled general orders and items on the  
calendar. I vote aye. Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo. Cumbo.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Today's land use  
13 call-ups are adopted by a vote of 45 in the  
14 affirmative and zero negative. We will now have  
15 communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
17 Majority Leader. Good afternoon. I want to thank  
18 everyone for being here for today's Stated Meeting.  
19 On Monday I joined many of you and fellow New Yorkers  
20 to celebrate and honor the life, legacy, and impact  
21 of the Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. His work,  
22 as we know, is clearly not done, especially here in  
23 New York City. We have segregated schools, a soaring  
24 homelessness population, and an affordability crisis  
25 that makes this city a struggle for many, many of our



2 citizens. We must continue his fight for equality  
3 and justice here in our city and whenever we see  
4 oppression. I also want to acknowledge that  
5 yesterday we marked the 47th anniversary of the Roe  
6 v. Wade decision by the united States Supreme Court.  
7 Unfortunately, the right to choose is being  
8 challenged in too many places and we must ensure it  
9 remains in place for each and every American, not  
10 just for those who live in New York City or New York  
11 State. And as we do at every Stated Meeting, we  
12 remember those we have sadly and tragically lost to  
13 9/11-related illnesses. I'm sorry to say that today  
14 we have four First Responders to remember. NYPD  
15 Sergeant James Bast and NYPD Detective Maureen  
16 O'Flaherty were both lost to 9/11-related cancer.  
17 Detective O'Flaherty passed away on November 28 of  
18 last year, but it was just recently announced. She  
19 was 57 years old. Sergeant Bast died at the age of  
20 49 years old on January 14. We also lost Alfred Clay  
21 Ludlum, who served with the National Guard on  
22 September 11, and Richard Edward Hanrohan, who was an  
23 EMT who served down at Ground Zero. If we could all  
24 pause for a moment of silence for Sergeant Bast,  
25 Detective O'Flaherty, Alfred Clay Ludlum, and Richard

2 Hanrohan. [moment of silence] Thank you. I'd also  
3 like to acknowledge that Monday marks International  
4 Holocaust Remembrance Day. We will be commemorating  
5 the millions of lives that were lost during the  
6 Holocaust. Monday also marks the 75th anniversary of  
7 the liberation of Auschwitz. I know that Council  
8 Member Espinal just got back from a trip to Poland,  
9 where he visited. We mark these occasions knowing  
10 that anti-Semitism is a cancer that is infecting many  
11 countries around the world, including the United  
12 States, and sadly even here in New York City we have  
13 seen the cancer of anti-Semitism that has been  
14 spreading. Today and every day we stand with Jewish  
15 New Yorkers and Jewish people around the world  
16 against hate and against anti-Semitism. As we  
17 continue to mourn the memories of those lost we honor  
18 those who have survived the Holocaust and we are, ah,  
19 and who are with us still today, and we say never  
20 forget, never again. We will also be voting on an  
21 important resolution in just a few moments by Council  
22 Member Deutsch that commemorates Internal Holocaust  
23 Remembrance Day throughout the city and a resolution  
24 that promotes Holocaust education because we know  
25 education is the key. The council is also sadly

2 losing a member of our administrative services  
3 division. Cheryl King Lawson, who we love, is  
4 retiring after a long career here. We are so  
5 grateful for her service and, is she here? Is she  
6 with us? Is she with us today? I don't see that she  
7 is. But I really want to thank Cheryl for her long  
8 service to the City Council. We wish her the best.  
9 [applause] I also want to congratulate two special  
10 New Yorkers who are named in this year class of  
11 Baseball Hall of Famers, Derek Jeter and Marvin  
12 Miller. By any standard, Derek Jeter is one of the  
13 most amazing baseball players in the world. He is  
14 unanimously loved by Yankees' fans and anyone who  
15 appreciates the game. I want to congratulate the  
16 Captain and the Yankees. And lesser known, but  
17 equally powerful in how he changed baseball was  
18 Marvin Miller. Miller was a Bronx-born, Brooklyn-  
19 bred union leader who was instrumental in creating  
20 major league baseball's Players' Associations to  
21 represent major league baseball players. He gave  
22 players a sense of dignity and reminded them that  
23 we're not there for the sport. They were people who  
24 had rights and needed protection as well. He will be  
25 honored posthumously in July with Derek Jeter. New

2 York is a union town and a baseball town and we're so  
3 proud of both of these men and New Yorkers. Before  
4 we dive into our legislative agenda, I want to just  
5 put on the record and say a big thank-you to Andy  
6 Byford, the president of New York City Transit, for  
7 everything he has done [applause] for our city. It  
8 may be one of the toughest jobs in the world, running  
9 the subways and buses, and he did an outstanding,  
10 outstanding, outstanding job. Any elected official  
11 who worked with him would tell you that. He got to  
12 know community leaders. He showed up at the hospital  
13 or in courtrooms when transit workers were assaulted.  
14 He worked well with union leaders. He worked well  
15 with elected officials. He rode the subways and  
16 buses every single day, wearing a name tag that said  
17 Hello, my name is Andy Byford. In two years he has  
18 turned the system around. It is a sad day that he is  
19 leaving. Ah, he felt our pain as commuters and he  
20 worked to make the system better, and so I am  
21 grateful to Andy. We will miss you. And last, but  
22 not least, a very happy Lunar New Year, in the Year  
23 of the Rat, to all of those who will be celebrating  
24 on Saturday. Now let's dive into our legislative  
25 agenda. Out of the Finance Committee, the council

2 will vote on the following items. A preconsidered  
3 resolution that will start the legislative process  
4 for approving the extension and assessment increase  
5 of the downtown Flushing BID in Council Member Peter  
6 Koo's district. He's worked very hard on this, and  
7 Peter, we're grateful for your hard work on this. I  
8 know the people of Flushing are as well. We were  
9 just at the wonderful, ah, Flushing Chinese Business  
10 Association dinner just a couple of weeks ago, ah,  
11 and I really want to thank you for your leadership on  
12 this. We're also going to be voting on an Article 11  
13 property tax exemption in my district at 319-321 West  
14 38th Street, which will construct 11 new affordable  
15 rental units. Moving on, the council will vote on  
16 the following pieces of legislation. First, the  
17 council will be voting on the resolution I just spoke  
18 about by Council Member Chaim Deutsch to honor the  
19 Holocaust. To combat hate we need to educate. This  
20 resolution is a step in that direction and so  
21 important right now as we deal with this alarming  
22 spate and crisis of anti-Semitic cancer that has  
23 spread in our city. Preconsidered resolution 1225,  
24 sponsored by Council Member Deutsch, will recognize  
25 January 27, 2020, as Holocaust Remembrance Day, and

2 the week beginning on January 27, 2020 as a citywide  
3 week of Holocaust education. I want to thank the  
4 staff who worked on this, Balky Smerig, Leah  
5 Scripiak, and Kevin Kotowski. Now, next we have a  
6 piece from the Civil Service and Labor Committee, and  
7 this is by our chair, Chair Daneek Miller,  
8 Introduction 1785, a very important piece of  
9 legislation. I want to congratulate you, Daneek, on  
10 this really important bill, which will extend health  
11 insurance coverage benefits to surviving family  
12 members of deceased municipal employees who died as a  
13 natural and proximate result of an accident or injury  
14 sustained while performing duties for the city or who  
15 died because of a condition related to the attack on  
16 9/11. I want to thank the staff who worked on this,  
17 Nuchat Chowdhury, Kevin Kotowski, and Kendall  
18 Stevenson. Next, the council will vote on a  
19 government operations piece of legislation by our  
20 Government Operations chair, Fernando Cabrera.  
21 Introduction 991, which will authorize the Office of  
22 Administrative Trials and Hearings to dismiss a  
23 violation enforced by the New York City Taxi and  
24 Limousine Commission pertaining to a defective  
25 vehicle light or lights. OATH may dismiss the

2 violation as long as the driver or owner has fixed  
3 the light no later than one day after being issued a  
4 violation and provided proof of correction, such as a  
5 statement of correction issued by a state inspection  
6 authority or auto repair shop, along with the TLC  
7 summonses to the TLC, and I want to thank the staff,  
8 Daniel Collins, Elizabeth Cronk, and Emily Forgione.  
9 The council will also vote on a bill to protect  
10 consumers who may want to pay in cash. Increasingly,  
11 retail and food stores have refused to accept cash  
12 and allow for only credit or debit transactions.  
13 This practices punishes the under-banked. We don't  
14 live in a one-size-fits-all city. Our economy needs  
15 to be open to all New Yorkers. Introduction number  
16 1281, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres, who  
17 has worked very hard on this for the last year, would  
18 prohibit food and retail establishments from refusing  
19 to accept cash from consumers. This bill would also  
20 prohibit establishments from charging cash-paying  
21 consumers a higher price than those using a credit or  
22 debit card, and I want to thank the staff, Balky  
23 Smerig and Lia Scripiak for their work on this.  
24 Next, the council will vote on a bill to address the  
25 lack of affordable diverse retail space and

2 prevalence of storefront vacancies in the city. The  
3 rise in commercial rents and the increased presence  
4 of large chain stores is felt most acutely by our  
5 city's small businesses and the retail crisis we see  
6 in empty storefronts across New York City. To  
7 understand the problem of vacancies and challenges  
8 faced by mom and pops, the council passed a series of  
9 local laws last year to gather data on the city's  
10 commercial retail environment. We will continue to  
11 work on legislation to address small business  
12 concerns and we have Introduction number 1408-B,  
13 sponsored by Council Member Rafael Espinal, which  
14 will require the city to conduct a neighborhood  
15 retail needs assessment for sizable development  
16 projects that receive significant financial  
17 assistance from the city. Where a need is  
18 determined, commercial space could be offered at  
19 below-market rent to small businesses that meet such  
20 needs for goods and services in the neighborhood, and  
21 I want to the staff who worked on this, Stephanie  
22 Jones and Noah Miksler. Finally, the council will be  
23 voting on a package of legislation that aims to close  
24 loopholes in our city's lead laws. Sadly, the days  
25 of lead poisoning are not over in New York and it



2 should be, because lead poisoning is entirely  
3 preventable. Although New York City banned the use  
4 of lead paint in 1960, we are still seeing cases of  
5 New Yorkers who are impacted by the effects of lead  
6 in buildings. This is especially true of children  
7 who are most at risk with problems associated with  
8 lead. In 2018 nearly 4000 children, 4000 children,  
9 were flagged for elevated blood lead levels. That is  
10 unacceptable. That is why the council took immediate  
11 action last March to pass 10 piece of lead-related  
12 legislation designed to strengthen the city's Local  
13 Law 1 of 2004 by our colleague, who has always been a  
14 leader on this, Council Member Bill Perkins, who  
15 deserves an enormous amount of credit for his  
16 leadership. It's also known as the Childhood Lead  
17 Poisoning Prevention Act. There is no safe lead  
18 level and the following laws we hope keep pace with  
19 the most up-to-date practices and standards to better  
20 protect New York families, especially children. The  
21 first bill, Introduction number 420-B, sponsored by  
22 Council Member Costa Constantinides, will focus on  
23 the issue of lead in our parks throughout New York  
24 City. This bill would require the Parks Department  
25 to test for lead concentration levels in areas of

2 parks under DPR jurisdiction that contain exposed  
3 soil and are used for active play or passive  
4 recreation whenever a capital project occurs in such  
5 area. If the test finds that a bare soil area has a  
6 lead level at or above the level set forth in Title  
7 40 of the Code of Federal Regulations, DPR must  
8 cover, replace, or otherwise remediate the area. I  
9 want to Christopher Sartori for his work on that  
10 bill. The second bill, Introduction number 904-A,  
11 sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera, targets  
12 the issue of lead in pregnant persons. For pregnant  
13 persons who test positive for an elevated blood lead  
14 level the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene  
15 would be required to conduct an investigation to  
16 identify the potential sources of their elevated  
17 blood lead level. The bill would require the agency  
18 to monitor the child after birth for elevated blood  
19 lead levels and to proactively assess whether the  
20 apartment where the child resides contains any lead  
21 paint hazards or unsafe lead paint conditions. DOHMH  
22 would also be required to conduct outreach to new and  
23 expecting parents regarding the availability of  
24 inspections for peeling paint or deteriorated  
25 subsurface or underlying defects in their apartment

2 and to provide them with information about blood lead  
3 testing for children, unsafe construction or  
4 renovation work practices, and the availability of  
5 inspections for such practices. I want to thank the  
6 staff who worked on this, Zeamanuel Halu, Megan Chen,  
7 Tizir Nasar, and Austin Branford. Next, Introduction  
8 919-A, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres,  
9 would require that within five years of the bill's  
10 effective date, or one year of a child moving in, a  
11 thorough inspection of a dwelling unit be conducted  
12 by an EPA-certified inspector and include a specified  
13 inspection protocol. It would also require home  
14 improvement contractors to show that they are EPA  
15 certified to ensure they are prepared to follow lead-  
16 based paint-related safety standards. Next,  
17 Introduction number 891-A, sponsored by Council  
18 Member Steve Levin, would expand the meaning of  
19 multiple dwelling for the purposes of lead laws to  
20 also include private dwellings where at least one  
21 unit is not owner occupied. As currently drafted,  
22 the requirements to investigate and remediate lead  
23 hazards in dwellings only apply to multiple  
24 dwellings, excluding certain smaller buildings where  
25 residents may still be at risk of lead exposure.

2 This bill would result in the smaller buildings being  
3 held to a similar standard, protecting more people.

4 And finally Introduction number 873-A, sponsored by  
5 Council Member Margaret Chin, would require schools  
6 under the Department of Education jurisdiction to  
7 conduct regular surveys and inspections of certain  
8 spaces for lead paint, of lead-based paint hazards,  
9 the results of which would be made publicly available  
10 and delivered to parents and guardians. The bill  
11 would also require HPD when conducting certain  
12 inspections to determine whether there has been a  
13 violation of the requirement to remediate lead  
14 hazards when a unit turns over. Further, it would  
15 establish a presumption that a building owner who is  
16 unable to provide a record of having remediated lead  
17 hazards at turnover has violated the requirement to  
18 do so. I just want to reiterate for the council  
19 members here and for anyone who may be watching the  
20 staff at the City Council is the best staff. We have  
21 the smartest lawyers and policy analysts, and Tirza  
22 and Austin and Zay and Megan and Jeff and Laura and  
23 everyone who worked on these bills have been working  
24 on these bills for longer than two years. We did a  
25 package a year ago. We're doing a package now.

2 They're working on another package. They have been  
3 relentless in trying to protect the most number of  
4 children possible in New York City by pushing the  
5 envelope on these bills and the staff that has worked  
6 on this, I want to, they don't know the number of  
7 kids that they've protected through their incredible  
8 hard work, and I want to give the staff here a round  
9 of applause for their work on this lead paint package  
10 that they've done [applause], the second package of  
11 work in helping children across New York City. I  
12 want to thank all of them. And with that, Madam  
13 Majority Leader, I turn it back to you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
15 Speaker Corey Johnson. We'll now move into  
16 discussion of general orders. As no members have  
17 signed up, seeing none, report of special committees.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Reports of  
20 standing committees.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
22 on Civil Service and Labor, Intro 1785, health  
23 insurance.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
25 orders.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
3 on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, Intro  
4 1281, cashless payments.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
6 general orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
8 on Environmental Protection, Intro 420-B, soil lead  
9 testing.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
11 general orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
13 on Finance, preconsidered Reso 1227, Flushing BID.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
15 orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1220-  
17 A, transparency resolution.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
19 orders.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 602 and  
21 Reso 1232, tax exemption.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
23 orders.

24

25

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
3 on Governmental Operations, Intro 991-C, OATH  
4 violations.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
6 general orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
8 on Health, Intro 1904-A, lead in pregnant persons.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
10 general orders.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
12 on Housing and Buildings, Intros 873-a, 891-A, and  
13 919-A, lead-based paint removal.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
15 general orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
17 on Small Business, Intro 1408-B, retail space.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
19 general orders.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: On the general order  
21 calendar, resolution appointing various persons,  
22 Commissioner of Deeds.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
24 orders. And at this time I'm asking for a roll call  
25

1 STATED MEETING

40

2 vote on all of the items on today's general order  
3 calendar.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: With particular  
6 congratulations to my colleague, I. Daneek Miller, on  
7 the passage of Intro 1785, I vote aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampy-Samuel.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on  
14 all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all,  
17 except Intros 1281 and 1408.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to  
22 explain my vote?

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'll make it  
25 really, really short, but I want us to, ah, remember



2 our fellow Puerto Ricans. I just got back from  
3 Puerto Rico last week. Especially Guanica and the  
4 surrounding towns, the areas were devastated.  
5 They're still in need of help, ah, but especially  
6 mental health, ah, chaplains and the sort, so let's  
7 please remember them and I appreciate everyone who  
8 supported my bill, 0991, to help our taxi drivers,  
9 and my congratulations to all my colleagues. Thank  
10 you so much.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I first wanted to,  
14 um, wish everyone a happy and healthy Lunar New Year,  
15 invite all of you to come down to my district to  
16 celebrate, and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on  
22 all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission?

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission

4 granted.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. Ah,  
6 Reso 1225, ah, will for the second year in a row  
7 acknowledge International Holocaust Remembrance Day  
8 in New York City on January 27th. Additionally, it  
9 will establish a citywide week of Holocaust  
10 education, urging educators and parents to broach the  
11 subject with their students and children. Growing up  
12 as the son of Holocaust survivors it was ingrained my  
13 identity that my parents had lived through  
14 unimaginable horrors. Although, like many survivors,  
15 they didn't often talk about specifics, their  
16 experiences during the war had a significant impact  
17 on our family. Knowledge of the atrocities that my  
18 parents and millions of others suffered through is,  
19 just a generation ago, is ever-present on my mind.  
20 It is an extremely personal endeavor of mine to  
21 ensure that our children, our grandchildren, and the  
22 future generations never forget what happened during  
23 the Holocaust. We all know the saying, those who did  
24 not learn history are doomed to repeat. Baseless  
25 hatred, unfounded bias, and anti-Semitism were all

2 factors in what eventually lead to a genocide of six  
3 million Jews. As the generation that lived through  
4 the war and is dwindling, and at a time when we are  
5 seeing a rise in violent anti-Semitism, it is more  
6 important than ever that we face this crisis head on.  
7 We have a duty to ensure that young people are  
8 knowledgeable about the Holocaust. If you want to  
9 equip the next generation with tools they need to  
10 fight bigotry and build a peaceful future, then we  
11 need to educate them about the consequences of  
12 prejudice and mistreating others. We cannot afford  
13 to lose the memories of those who survived the  
14 Holocaust. The lessons of the past are lessons for  
15 the future. Thank you to my Jewish Caucus  
16 colleagues, particularly Council Member Karen  
17 Koslowitz, for their partnership on this legislation.  
18 Thank you, Speaker Johnson, for your consistent  
19 efforts to increase Holocaust education and fighting  
20 anti-Semitism. Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: How do you vote,  
22 Council Member?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to  
5 explain my vote?

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
7 granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you.

9 We're voting today on Intro 1408, which will mandate  
10 affordable rents for commercial space and affordable  
11 housing developments. This legislation is a part of  
12 a broader conversation around how to keep rents  
13 affordable for small businesses in New York City.  
14 Just as we have set-asides to address affordability  
15 crisis for tenants, we must have set-asides to tackle  
16 the growing vacancy crisis for small businesses.  
17 When developers receive tax breaks for building  
18 affordable housing they can still turn large profits  
19 by renting out ground floor commercial space to big  
20 box stores and chains, instead of our local mom and  
21 pops. While a neighborhood may gain more affordable  
22 units, the commercial spaces in these new  
23 developments can lead to secondary displacement  
24 because of the strain they create on local  
25 businesses. Affordable housing developers have to

2 take a holistic approach to what their footprint in  
3 the neighborhood is going to be. These developments  
4 give opportunities for low and middle income  
5 residents to stay put in their communities and should  
6 be offering the same stability to small businesses.  
7 In order to protect the integrity of our city we have  
8 an obligation to protect all of those who contribute  
9 to its rich cultural landscape. With that said, I  
10 vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene. Eugene.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on

17 all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Pass.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I vote aye on

22 all, and I want to thank my colleague and the chair  
23 of the Jewish Caucus, Chaim Deutsch, for his words  
24 today. He is the son of survivors. Regrettably, in  
25 my family there were none, except for the people who

2 lived already here in the United States. So we  
3 remember the Holocaust and may the memory of the six  
4 million always be for a blessing. With that, I vote  
5 aye on all.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: King. Koo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all, and also  
13 want to wish everyone a happy Lunar New Year. If you  
14 have time, you can come to join our parade this  
15 Saturday at 11:00 a.m. on Union Street, Flushing, of  
16 Union and 37th Avenue. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander. Levin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
24 explain my vote?

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to thank  
5 Speaker Johnson and my colleagues and all staff on  
6 the lead legislation that we're passing today. I  
7 want to acknowledge Council Member Bill Perkins for,  
8 ah, for sponsoring the bill in 2004, which really  
9 demonstrated that thoughtful and aggressive city  
10 legislation out of this body can have a real impact.  
11 Um, if you look at the data the key inflection point  
12 over the last 25 years was in fact that legislation  
13 in 2004, which changed how this city addresses lead  
14 poisoning. Um, in fact, it followed on a prior  
15 legislation from only five years earlier, but really,  
16 um, changed the paradigm and what we're doing today  
17 is building on that because, as the speaker said,  
18 lead poisoning is entirely preventable. There's not  
19 a single, there's no reason whatsoever why a child  
20 should have lead exposure. Lead has been banned in  
21 this city for 60 years and it's been banned  
22 nationally for close to 40 years, or over 40 years.  
23 So there's no reason in the world why a child should  
24 be exposed to lead. It's some, every place that a  
25 child is exposed to lead somebody is responsible for

2 cleaning that up. Somebody was responsible prior to  
3 that lead poisoning for cleaning it up. So we're  
4 here today to day that we're going to continue, this  
5 body is going to continue until, um, lead poisoning  
6 is eradicated here in New York City. I also want to  
7 acknowledge my colleague, Chaim Deutsch, on his  
8 resolution recognizing Holocaust Remembrance Day and  
9 Holocaust Education in New York City Week. It is  
10 vitally important that our young people understand  
11 what happened in the Holocaust, see it in the context  
12 of genocides throughout history, knowing that  
13 genocides continue up until this day and, um, around  
14 the world, and so, um, it is, it is, ah, it's  
15 incredibly important that we do not, those of us that  
16 don't know the past are doomed to repeat it. So we  
17 must always continue to educate our children. Thank  
18 you very much. I vote aye on all.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye on  
21 all.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.



2 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to  
6 explain my vote, please?

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
8 granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam  
10 Majority Leader. Madam Majority Leader, Dr. King  
11 said that all labor that uplifts humanity has dignity  
12 and should be undertaken with painstaking excellence.  
13 1785 is how we honor this excellence. Intro 1785 is  
14 how this city demonstrates its value and how we as a  
15 city value the service of every single one of our  
16 municipal employees, particularly the brave civilian  
17 responders who answered the call of 9/11.  
18 Introduction 1785 extends health insurance benefits  
19 to the spouse and children of any municipal employee  
20 killed while performing their duties. It also  
21 recognizes the heroic efforts of civilian workers who  
22 answered the call on 9/11 by providing health  
23 benefits to the families should they contract a  
24 condition developed as a result of the loss of their  
25 loved ones from 9/11. The passage of this bill is a

2 big win for the dedicated municipal work force that  
3 makes the city run each and every day and it assures  
4 that all of our dedicated civilian civil servants  
5 will have the peace of mind that they richly deserve  
6 by knowing that their families will be cared for and  
7 provided the health insurance and it will endure if  
8 the tragedy should strike in the course of their  
9 duty. I'd like to thank Speaker Johnson, um, my  
10 colleagues for voting on this, and the members of the  
11 Civil Service and Labor team, Malcolm, Nizak,  
12 Kendall, Kevin, and Brandon. Thank you so much, and  
13 I implore my colleagues to vote yes.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I want to vote  
18 aye on all, and also express appreciate for the  
19 Speaker recognizing the horror of lead paint  
20 poisoning in our communities and look forward to  
21 continuing to work with him and my colleagues and  
22 this council to make sure that all our children and  
23 families are safe from that tragic experience that so  
24 many have experienced. Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to

9 explain my vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission

11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Just want to  
13 thank, um, everyone for their support as we are  
14 approving and voting on these next lead bills. It's  
15 shocking that in 2020 children and families in New  
16 York City are still being exposed to poisonous levels  
17 of lead, but this council has taken real leadership  
18 to combat this failure with passing bill after bill,  
19 and I'm so thankful to the speaker, to the staff  
20 here, especially, ah, Zay, to Jason Goldman, to my  
21 legislative director, Jeremy Unger, and as co-chair  
22 of the Women's Caucus I'm proud that we're voting on  
23 this bill that will ensure that the city conducts  
24 thorough investigations when pregnant mothers test  
25 positive. I am looking forward to a lead-free NYC.

2 And congratulations to all my colleagues with bills  
3 in this package as well, and to the many others that  
4 we'll be passing today. Thank you so much. I vote  
5 aye on all.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I will get  
9 back.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: You'll pass.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose. Rosenthal.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Um, with  
13 gratitude to my colleagues, Council Member Chin and  
14 Council Member Koo, for, ah, the very, um, delicious  
15 way of celebrating the Chinese New York. Thank you  
16 for that. And congratulations to all my colleagues  
17 with the lead bills, extraordinary, to Council Member  
18 Rivera and others, and also with gratitude to my  
19 colleague, Council Member Torres, for his bill on,  
20 um, ah, no longer, ah, allowing cashless food  
21 establishments. I appreciate his work on that. So  
22 with that I still vote aye on all.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca. Torres.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to  
4 explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Ah, so, just  
8 building on comments by Council Member Rosenthal to  
9 commend the leadership of Council Member Chin and Koo  
10 as well, not just for the celebration we have the in  
11 council for the Lunar New Year, but I remember when I  
12 was still a teacher and we had a policy in place  
13 where I had to mark students absent for observing  
14 their holiday, and thanks to leaders like council  
15 members Chin and Koo, ah, we now have an official  
16 holiday for schools on the Lunar New Year, and I just  
17 want to publicly say that and thank them for their  
18 leadership and for their support. Also, on the issue  
19 of lead, it was this council that stood up and  
20 demanded that not just certain classrooms, but common  
21 spaces in schools were tested as well, so this  
22 council will be very proud on its record of  
23 protecting children in the City of New York, and to  
24 my colleague, Council Member Torres, who continues to  
25 speak up for the voiceless and continues to make sure

2 that all people are heard N I just commend him and  
3 all my colleagues on their bills. And with that I  
4 vote aye.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer. Yeger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: May I be excused  
10 to explain my vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
12 granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam  
14 Majority Leader.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam  
16 President. Today we are voting on Intro 1281, ah,  
17 and I agree with some of the aspects of what the bill  
18 intends to accomplish. I don't think any store  
19 anywhere in the United States should refuse to accept  
20 American currency. I also don't think that it's our  
21 job to tell businesses in the city how to run. And I  
22 really don't know what it is that we think happened  
23 when we were loaned the titles that by the people  
24 that we represent that makes us think that we have  
25 the right to tell businesses how to run on matters

2 not related to public health, public safety, but  
3 simply our own preference for what we think is smart  
4 or right or fair, or nondiscriminatory. For example,  
5 I like Coca-Cola. Many people do. I walk into a  
6 store, they only sell Pepsi. Are we going to rely,  
7 are we going to require that they now carry Coke?  
8 Walk into a restaurant, they don't have butter on the  
9 table. Am I going to require that they do? Or what  
10 if they only have butter on table? Are we going to  
11 make sure that we take care of those who can't take  
12 lactose and have margarine instead? We're inserting  
13 ourselves into the business of business in a way that  
14 we don't have the right to do, in my opinion,  
15 although obviously based on the vote tally there are  
16 a number of people here who believe otherwise. But I  
17 also want to, in the last couple of seconds that I  
18 have, point out that the first penalty imposed on a  
19 business that fails to comply with this law is no  
20 more than \$1000. The second penalty and thereafter  
21 is \$1500. So, as we know, the City of New York never  
22 weaponizes our statutes. They surely will never take  
23 one of our statutes and walk around the city looking  
24 for businesses that aren't complying so that they can  
25 slam them with a \$1000 ticket just for walking in the

2 door. And I look forward to 10 months from now, one  
3 money after the nine months, when we start getting  
4 the calls from the businesses that are getting  
5 slammed with these summonses. With that, Madam  
6 President, I vote aye on all, with the exception of  
7 Intro 1281. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

11 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: No on 1408, no  
12 on 1281, and permission to vote yes on all land use  
13 call-ups. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to  
18 explain my vote?

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
20 granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: First, I want to  
22 congratulate Council Members Chin and Koo and wishing  
23 all a happy Lunar New Year. I also remind all of my  
24 colleagues that we must keep the people of Puerto  
25 Rico in our hearts and prayers. They're still



2 recovering from the hurricane and now to be faced  
3 with a second natural disaster, um, the people of  
4 Puerto Rico need our help and our assistance and I  
5 hope that we will rise to the occasion again by  
6 opening our doors for those that are seeking relief  
7 here in the City of New York. I want to congratulate  
8 Council Member Chaim Deutsch on the remembrance of  
9 the Holocaust. We need to be reminded of this, to  
10 never allow it to happen again. So to the Jewish  
11 community, we will always remember the tragedies and  
12 the atrocities that were committed against you. As  
13 we move forward to a lead-free New York City, I am  
14 pleased to see that we have not excluded NYCHA from  
15 this requirement. NYCHA is the single-largest  
16 landlord and we have more children that are being  
17 poisoned by lead paint in NYCHA facilities than any  
18 other properties out there. So I am not only pleased  
19 to see that they're included and going to be held to  
20 the same standard and accountability as we protect  
21 all of our children, but most importantly the most  
22 vulnerable and those are the residents of NYCHA  
23 facilities. I echo some of the concerns of 20, 1281-  
24 A, and not that the intentions are not good. But the  
25 penalty that these small businesses are always

2 subject to for not complying with rules they may not  
3 be aware of, and I caution my colleagues in trying to  
4 do good that we often find ourselves punishing and  
5 penalizing the very groups that we're looking to  
6 protect, and that's our small businesses. So I do  
7 support 1281 in the intentions. I just remind all of  
8 the penalties associated and we should further give  
9 warning before we give punishment or fines. So I  
10 vote all on aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to  
13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First of all,  
17 thank you Council Member Bill Perkins for being a  
18 pioneer on what we are extending today, the removal  
19 of lead paint. I remember being an activist, not a  
20 Council Member, and being here at this step facing a  
21 lot of opposition from real estate, having the  
22 lawyers and other Manhattan Improvement Corporation  
23 that worked with you and the council at that time to  
24 draft a bill to remove lead paint from residential  
25 building. Now we are extending what you started, and

2 I feel that we have the big responsibility to also  
3 make NYCHA accountable for the removal of the lead  
4 paint to be done by professionals, to be done by  
5 professionals. We did it when we include the law  
6 that made HPD, they made everyone who do removal of  
7 lead paint from residential being done by  
8 professional. But we didn't use the same language on  
9 the NYCHA part. So we need to be sure that when lead  
10 is identified in any NYCHA apartments those worker  
11 has to be trained or retrained to be sure that  
12 they're doing a proper job. So let's continue  
13 expanding that requirement for all lead paint to be  
14 removed by professional, and with that I vote aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo. I vote aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. All  
19 items on today's general order calendar are adopted  
20 by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, zero negative,  
21 and zero abstentions. With the exception of Intro  
22 1281-A, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the  
23 affirmative, 3 negative, and zero abstentions. And  
24 Intro 1408-B, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in  
25 the affirmative, 2 negative, and zero abstentions.

2 The revised land use call-ups vote 46 in the  
3 affirmative and zero negative. Introduction and  
4 reading of bills.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been  
6 referred to committees, as indicated on today's  
7 agenda.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
9 will now move into the discussion of resolutions. If  
10 members have signed up to discuss today's resolutions  
11 we will call on them at this time. Members have  
12 yielded their time for the resolutions and now I will  
13 go right into reading today's resolution into the  
14 record. Members who wish to vote against or abstain  
15 on today's resolution should register your vote with  
16 the clerks at the dais. Preconsidered resolution  
17 1225, resolution recognizing January 27, 2020, as  
18 Holocaust Remembrance Day and the week beginning on  
19 January 27, 2020, as a citywide of Holocaust  
20 education in New York City. All in favor say aye.

21 [chorus of ayes]

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All opposed.  
23 Abstentions. The ayes have it. We will now move  
24 into general discussion, and we will begin with  
25 Council Member Torres.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you, Madam  
3 Majority Leader. I just want to respond to the  
4 comments from my colleague, Council Member Treyger,  
5 Yeger, I'm sorry. There is a huge difference.  
6 First, I think the notion of questioning government's  
7 right to regulate business is just simply an  
8 absurdity. There are regulations of business at  
9 every level. I would encourage my colleague to  
10 familiarize himself with the modern administrative  
11 state. The question is is the regulation in question  
12 have a rational basis? Is it arbitrary and  
13 capricious? The fact is here in New York City There  
14 are 780,000 people who are under-banked, right.  
15 There are hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers who  
16 have no bank accounts, who have no access to debit or  
17 credit and therefore have no means of purchasing  
18 goods and services in an increasingly cashless  
19 marketplace. And so insuring that those vulnerable  
20 New Yorkers have access to goods and services in a  
21 marketplace, in public accommodations, is a  
22 legitimate policy goal. I will confess to you, it is  
23 an expression of my policy preferences, because  
24 that's what we do in our society. Most of the laws  
25 we enact are an expression of our policy preferences

2 and our values, so I'm, I'm quite confused by what I  
3 took to be just an attack on my integrity as a  
4 legislator. This was a good-faith attempt to ensure  
5 that more people have access to goods and services  
6 and this bill was carefully crafted. If there were  
7 businesses that have grown accustomed to a cashless  
8 business model, we allow those businesses the option  
9 of installing a cash conversion machine so that they  
10 can contain to retain the efficiency benefits that  
11 come with a cashless business model. So this was  
12 carefully crafted. This bill strikes a thoughtful  
13 balance between equity and efficiency. And I stand  
14 by it, so thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
16 Council Member Torres. We will go to Council Member  
17 Koo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Majority  
19 Leader. Today I am introducing a resolution, Reso  
20 1229, calling the federal government to pass the  
21 Adoptee Citizenship Act of 2019. This bill will  
22 close a loophole in the Trial Citizenship Act of 2000  
23 that prevents international, internationally adopted  
24 children from receiving US citizenship, despite being  
25 legally adopted by US citizens. This issue concerns

2 adoptees from all countries in America, and in  
3 particular those from Korea, as they account for one  
4 of the largest internationally adoptive groups in  
5 this country. Many adoptees who grew up in America  
6 homes, in American families, never even knew they  
7 weren't American citizens until they applied for a  
8 job. Then, to add insult to injury, many learned  
9 they could even be deported. Indeed, many have been  
10 deported. Often the reasoning behind the lack of  
11 status are simple oversights or missing documents.  
12 And while the government attempted to rectify this  
13 issue in the past, it left out those children who had  
14 already turned 18 by the time the law went into  
15 effect. Simply put, we need to put an end to this  
16 injustice. I ask my colleagues to join me in  
17 supporting this resolution calling for the passage of  
18 the Adoptee Citizenship Act of 2017 so that we can  
19 finally give our adopted Americans the support  
20 citizenship they deserve. We have in our presence  
21 Ms. [Mijin] Kim. He is president of New Zealand  
22 Korean American Heritage and he is also, she is also  
23 a former president of Korean American Association of  
24 Greater New York. Thank you.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
3 much. We'll now hear from Council Members Barron,  
4 followed by Rodriguez, followed by Eugene.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ah, thank you,  
6 Madam Majority Leader. As has been mentioned, we did  
7 celebrate what would have been the 95th, 91st  
8 birthday of Dr. Martin Luther King and just to call  
9 attention of some of his legacy. It was in 1962 that  
10 Dr. King was labeled by the FBI as the most dangerous  
11 man in America, and then in 1967 following his  
12 pronouncements against the war in Vietnam he was  
13 ostracized and said that he felt betrayed by many of  
14 the leaders, including some within his own circle.  
15 But today, of course, with hindsight, ah, and those  
16 who are engaged in the battle for social justice and  
17 civil rights we see Dr. King as a man of commitment,  
18 conviction, and courage. He was a visionary, not  
19 just a dreamer. He was a visionary who thought of  
20 matters beyond the immediacy of his own initial  
21 advocacy and dared to venture beyond the local and  
22 national injustices to this day and to speak out  
23 against the evil tentacles of militarism that  
24 perpetrated, ah, that are perpetrated by the United  
25 States and claim the lives of innocent people in



2 foreign lands. And one of his quotes that is most  
3 precious to me is the one that says that the function  
4 of education is to teach one to think intensively and  
5 to think critically. And he says that intelligence  
6 plus character, that is the goal of education. And  
7 that gives me a segue into calling attention to the  
8 centennial celebration of Zeta Phi Beta Sorority, an  
9 international black sorority, founded at Howard  
10 University in 1920, original founders, as has been  
11 cited by my colleague previously, um, Cornegy, who  
12 mentioned them in a plaque that he presented, were  
13 Arizona Cleaver, Pearl N. Neil, Myrtle Tyler, Viola  
14 Taylor, and Fanny Petty. And they are based on the  
15 principles of scholarship, service, sisterhood, and  
16 final womanhood, and they are a progressive  
17 organization that seeks to address the ills of  
18 poverty and prejudice. And I'm proud to say that as  
19 an undergrad I did pledge Zeta Phi Beta Sorority.  
20 Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Congratulations,  
22 Council Member Barron. And I would now like to call  
23 on Council Members Rodriguez, Eugene, Levin, and then  
24 Menchaca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
3 Majority Leader. First of all, thank you to all to  
4 colleagues that become co-prime of the municipal  
5 voting rights bill. They are Council Member  
6 Menchaca, Dromm, Espinal, Cabrera, Chin, Cohen,  
7 Kallos, Miller, Van Bramer, Levin, Reynoso, Rivera,  
8 [inaudible] Lander, Cornegy, Adams, Ampry-Samuel,  
9 Levin, Louis, Powers, Rosenthal, Diaz, Cumbo, Eugene.  
10 Public Advocate, Miller, also supported by the  
11 Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams, Manhattan  
12 Borough President Gail Brewer, as also Council Member  
13 Perkin, Council Member Richards, Council Member  
14 Constantinides, Council Member Torres. The US, when  
15 we look at the, according to the US called Title 18  
16 it say Section 61, Section 611 say voting by aliens,  
17 noncitizens, are authorized to vote in local election  
18 if allowed by state. However, no citizens are barred  
19 from voting in the following office: Presidents,  
20 vice presidents, US Senate, US House of  
21 Representatives. I lived from '83 to 2000 with a  
22 green card. I washed dishes. I drove a taxi. I  
23 worked in a factory. I became a teacher in '93. I  
24 taught hundreds of students. I was a co-founder in  
25 school. I helped many election, many candidates,

2 from David Dinkins to Assemblyman [inaudible] to  
3 Council Member [Linades]. I contribute. I pay  
4 taxes. As I, as I lived those year from '83 to today  
5 there's close to one million New Yorkers who pay  
6 taxes that deserve to have the right to elect their  
7 citywide leaders. Thank you, everyone. I'm very  
8 proud the [broad] coalition that we have, NAACP, the  
9 National Justice, Immigration Coalition, 43 groups,  
10 and all of us together. Thank you.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
12 Council Member Rodriguez. Now we have Council Member  
13 Eugene, Levin, Menchaca, and Yeger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very  
15 much, Madam Majority Leader. I would like to speak  
16 about Intro 1858, calling on the, for the  
17 Administration Code of the New York City to be  
18 admitted in relation to sign that are posted at the  
19 entrance of New York City park to ensure that they  
20 are visible at night. As I speak today, there are  
21 large number of honest and hard-working New Yorkers  
22 that are issued summons for being on city park land  
23 after closing hours. In many instances the people  
24 who are issued the summons were unaware of the park  
25 hours due to the sign not being visible in the

2 evening hours. Anyone visiting a city park knows all  
3 too well that many park do not have operating hours  
4 that are posted prominently and that, the warning is  
5 difficult, if not impossible, to read at night.

6 Making matters even more difficult and confusing for  
7 park visitor is the fact that the hours are of  
8 operation are not uniform. The revised

9 Administration Code should clearly make certain that  
10 park hours be displayed in luminous lettering and  
11 posted in such a manner that someone approach the  
12 park sign will immediately see them clearly. It  
13 greatly troubles me everything that one of my

14 constituent inform me of being issued a summons for  
15 unknowingly being in the park after hours. We have a  
16 large number of residents who struggle to make end me  
17 in New York City. And many of them, the same people,  
18 receive summons for violating a posting that they  
19 couldn't see. I ask my colleagues to support this  
20 legislation. Thank you very much, Madam Majority  
21 Leader. Thank you.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 Council Member Levin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Ah, thank you,  
25 Madam Majority Leader. Ah, I just wanted to follow

2 up on the speaker's remarks about Andy Byford and how  
3 effective he's been over these last couple of years  
4 in, um, in directing New York City transit. Um, I  
5 know, as I said in the pre-States press conference, I  
6 take the 7 train every morning, which was one train  
7 that had the signal upgrades done and I rarely wait  
8 more than a minute or two on the platform before the  
9 train arrives. Um, I also want to acknowledge Jimmy  
10 Van Bramer for, ah, and other council members for  
11 advocating for that to happen. But, um, it do hope  
12 that the MTA and New York City Transit are able to  
13 effectively carry out the plan that Andy Byford has  
14 helped develop. And with regard to 1281, um, I just  
15 want to ah, associate myself with the comments of  
16 Council Member Ritchie Torres on, um, on the validity  
17 of this legislation. Um, you know, there are, ah, as  
18 he said, 700,000 New Yorkers that are under-banked.  
19 Um, they don't have access to a debit card. They  
20 don't have access to a credit card. Um, perhaps we  
21 should be doing more at the city level to get more  
22 people banked. But there are still going to be tens,  
23 if not hundreds, of thousands of New Yorkers that  
24 won't have access to that. Um, we have a  
25 responsibility in this legislative body to make sure

2 that they have access to all the goods and services  
3 that anybody else has access to. Um, and, ah, if  
4 they currently don't have access to those goods and  
5 services, um, then that is, ah, ah, that is a, that  
6 is a shame and it's, and it's something that we have  
7 every responsibility to correct. Um, so I don't see  
8 it as an undue intrusion of government. It is just  
9 ensuring that people have a fair shot at all the  
10 goods and services offered in this city. Thank you.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

12 Council Member Menchaca, finally, and then Council  
13 Member Yeger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I  
15 want to continue and start right off where Council  
16 Member Levin spoke to the bill around cash, really  
17 access for cash opportunities at retail stores and  
18 say that there are multiple pieces to this that we  
19 have to consider. Ah, I want to second everything  
20 that was said by Council Member, ah, the chief  
21 sponsor, Torres. What I also want to remind people  
22 that this conversation and what this bill did was  
23 also lift up conversations around surveillance, that  
24 each of these cards, and anytime you go and purchase  
25 anything on a credit card or anything with a

2 technology, a financial technology chip, ah, that  
3 data continues to be collected by many different  
4 companies. That conversation is connected to  
5 something that we all know here around, ah, financial  
6 technology chip on IDNYC. We're in the middle of  
7 those conversations. The Mayor's Office continues to  
8 push, ah, other allies and the unions to bring a  
9 financial technology chip to IDNYC. I am against  
10 that, and many of you and my colleagues are. But  
11 that, that's a conversation that also needs to be had  
12 when we talk about cash, ah, the cash economy. Next,  
13 I want to talk about 1867, ah, and Council Member  
14 Rodriguez, my co-prime sponsor on this bill, ah, and  
15 I and so many of you are also in support of restoring  
16 the rights of our community members, green card  
17 holders and folks who have work authorization to  
18 participate in our democracy, and so I hope you can  
19 all join in this conversation. This is gonna be a  
20 complicated conversation to restore those rights and  
21 to allow for our city to embed that voice into our  
22 municipal elections. And this is a game-changer for  
23 us. We've seen so much of that already in  
24 participatory budgeting. All or a majority of those  
25 have been cast in non-English ballots. That's what

2 we're talking about. That's what we need to do.

3 Let's do this together. I can't wait. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and  
5 finally Council Member Yeger.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam  
7 President. I want to be very clear for the gentleman  
8 who may have been confused. First of all, I  
9 appreciate the gentleman's suggestion that I  
10 available myself of the opportunity to study law.  
11 Thank you for that. And secondly, no integrity was  
12 attacked here today, and if he thinks otherwise he  
13 ought to review the tape of my remarks. We are  
14 imposing a penalty on businesses that fail to comply  
15 of up to \$1000 a summons on the first go-around. The  
16 first time they get smacked with a summons is going  
17 to be up to \$100. I think we all know that up to  
18 means \$1000, because that's the way the city does it.  
19 So they're gonna look for a new revenue stream.  
20 They're gonna find and it's gonna be in the pockets  
21 of the small businesses that are making business  
22 decisions right now that they choose to accept credit  
23 cards and not cash. Are there legitimate reasons for  
24 why businesses make that choice? Sure. Do I want  
25 businesses to take cash and not to refuse it?



2 Absolutely. I think it's wrong and I think it's  
3 dumb. But if they're making the choice, they're  
4 making the choice. I'm not assuming that we never  
5 regulate business. But, as I said before, there's a  
6 good population of the United States, of the world,  
7 that is lactose-intolerant. Should every restaurant  
8 that offers butter on the table now be forced to put  
9 margarine next to it? Is that a requirement so that  
10 we are not discriminating against those who can't  
11 tolerate lactose. Where does it stop? At what point  
12 do we say this is that important, OK, that's where it  
13 stops, we're not going any further. It's just on the  
14 cash. Should we be changing the tablecloths in  
15 restaurants from color to only white so as to not  
16 discriminate against those who are color-blind? At  
17 what point do we say we're not going to regulate  
18 businesses to the point where we are stepping on  
19 their throats, as I believe we're doing today. And  
20 that's my point. And thank you very much, Madam  
21 President.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. The  
23 revised land use call-up vote is now 47 in the  
24 affirmative and zero negative. And we will now have  
25 closing remarks by Speaker Corey Johnson.

1 STATED MEETING

74

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The Stated Meeting of  
3 January 23, 2020, is hereby adjourned. Thank you.

4 [gavel]

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

75

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 2, 2020