

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON YOUTH SERVICES

----- X

January 14, 2020
Start: 10:15 a.m.
Recess: 2:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Deborah L. Rose
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Deborah L. Rose
Margaret S. Chin
Mathieu Eugene
Andy King
Farah Louis

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Susan Haskell
Deputy Commissioner
Youth Services

Darryl Rattray
Associate Commissioner
Youth Services

Gail Brewer
Borough President

Debra Sue Lorenzen
Director of Youth and Education
St. Nick's Alliance

Christie Hodgkins
Senior Vice President
Education and Youth Development
CAMBA

Tarilyn Little
Early Literacy Manager
Expanded Schools

Erica Mason
Cypress Hills Local Development
Corporation

Mary Chang
Director of Childhood Development
Services
Chinese American Planning Council

Gregory Brender
United Neighborhood Houses

Annie Elisa Minguéz Garcia
Director of Government and Community
Relations
Good Shepherd Services

Robert Cordero
Executive Director
Grand Street Settlement

Avio Dumbelo
Executive Director

Marie Choi
Director of Middle School and Community
Programming
YMCA of Greater New York

Faith Behum
Advocacy and Policy Advisor
UJA Federation of New York

Dr. Sat Bhattacharya
Harlem Children Society

Janyll Canals
Senior Staff Attorney
Advocates for Children

Nancy D. Miller
Executive Director and CEO
Vision Services for the Blind

Marcel Braithwaite

Director of Community Engagement
Police Athletic League

Daryl Hornick-Becker
Policy and Advocacy Associate
Citizens'' Committee for Children of New
York

Jenna Hamides
Director of High School Programs
Global Kids

Annemarie Paul
Director of Middle School Programs
Global Kids

Susan Matloff-Nieves
Deputy Executive Director for Youth and
Aging
Goddard Riverside Community Center

Jahzeel Montes
Founder and Executive Director
Internal Creations

Judith E. Klein

Antonio Capian
Assistant Director of Afterschool
Programs
Sheltering Arms

Dr. Vanessa Salcedo
Pediatrician and Director of Wellness and
Health Promotion
Union Community Health Center

Danica Stewart
Community Tutor and Development Manager
Reading Partners

1
2 HONDA YUTA: Test, test, this is the
3 Committee on Youth Services. Today's date is January
4 14, 2020. This recording is being recorded by Honda
5 Yuta in the chambers.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: [gavel] This hearing is
7 called to order. Good morning. [people say good
8 morning] That's what I like. Good morning. [say
9 good morning again]. My name [laughs] thank you for
10 all coming this morning. My name is Council Member
11 Debbie Rose and I'm the chair of the Committee on
12 Youth Services. Today we are conducting an oversight
13 hearing on afterschool programming, COMPASS NYC and
14 Sonnet. In addition to oversight, we will be hearing
15 Intro number 1100, sponsored by Council Member
16 Benjamin Kallos, which would establish a universal
17 afterschool plan, and Intro number 1113, sponsored by
18 Council Member Mark Treyger, which would require
19 reporting on afterschool programs. I would first
20 like to thank the speaker, Corey Johnson, for his
21 commitment to the youth of New York City. He really
22 is a tireless advocate who demonstrates his
23 commitment to youth in everything he says and does.
24 I would also like to thank the young people of this
25 city. You inspire me to be a better person every

1 day, and I rest well knowing that you represent our
2 future well. Finally, I'd like to thank the youth
3 advocates, the providers, and all of those of you who
4 are here to testify today, as well as acknowledge my
5 colleagues, Council Member Louis, who has joined us
6 this morning and we will be joined by other council
7 members, I'm sure. Afterschool programs provide
8 students the opportunity to participate in hands-on
9 learning, explore new interests, and engage in
10 physical activity outside of the school day, outside
11 of the traditional school day. Students may even
12 receive nutritious snacks and meals in afterschool
13 programs, helping to supplement their diets and
14 physical growth. Time and time again research
15 demonstrates that afterschool programs positively
16 impact youth. They experience youth. They
17 experience more gains in math and reading achievement
18 than their peers do who do not participate in
19 aspects. Their school attendance records also
20 improve, while drop-out rates decrease, and they have
21 better attitudes towards school with decreased
22 disciplinary incidents, and experience significant
23 reductions in drug use and other problem behavior.
24 The results are clear. I need to say that again.
25

1 The results are clear and well documented.

2 Afterschool programming is vital and it works. That
3 is why I am such a big supporter and a cosponsor of
4 Intro 1100, which seeks to make afterschool program
5 slots available to all students who request them. We
6 owe it to our young people to make sure that they can
7 access all the benefits of afterschool programming
8 and level the bar. In New York City DYCD is the lead
9 agency that supports New York City youth and their
10 families through a wide range of services.

11 Specifically, DYCD is responsible for afterschool
12 programming through its flagship programs COMPASS NYC
13 Program, which stands for the Comprehensive
14 Afterschool System of New York City. COMPASS NYC is
15 made up of more than 900 programs that provide youth
16 enrolled in grades K through 12 with access to
17 quality afterschool programming. COMPASS NYC is
18 structured into four program models, which include
19 COMPASS elementary, which provides programming to
20 children from kindergarten through fifth grade,
21 COMPASS Explore, which targets elementary, middle,
22 and high school age youth, COMPASS high for ninth and
23 tenth grade students, and SONYC, otherwise known as
24 School's Out NYC, which is the middle school model.
25

1 Each of these models is important, as are DYCD pilot
2 SONYC program and initiatives that help students who
3 are homeless, justice-involved, or who receive
4 benefits through the Administration for Children's
5 Services. As we have consistently fought for
6 increased funding and additional slots for each of
7 these program models we want to understand what more
8 we can do as a city to make such programs grow
9 significantly and are fully utilized. Collecting
10 usage and other data about programs could help in
11 this regard and that's why Intro 1113 by Council
12 Member Treyger is also very important and why I'm
13 also a cosponsor. This bill would require ongoing
14 annual reporting on afterschool program funding,
15 utilization, student demographics, and other criteria
16 by program and by school. I look forward to
17 receiving feedback from DYCD and the advocates on
18 these two bills. We also want to learn what issues
19 exist for providers and advocates and how afterschool
20 programs can be improved. At this point I would like
21 to turn the mic, well, I would have turned the
22 microphone over to my colleagues, Council Member
23 Kallos and Treyger, who will be here before this
24 hearing concludes. I just want to take the
25

1 opportunity before we swear in the witness panel, I
2 would like to thank my staff, Esa Rogers, Christian
3 Ravello, Christine Johnson, and Vanuri Ranawara.
4 Vanuri, I'm going to get it right before it's too
5 long, I'm sorry, and committee staff Paul Senegal,
6 Kevin Katowski, Michele Peregrin, and Elizabeth Arts
7 for all the work that they have done. And now we
8 will have the counsel swear in the panel. Oh, and
9 right on time. We've been joined by Council Member
10 Chin and by Council Member Kallos, who we'll give him
11 a minute to get in his seat.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good morning.

14 I'm Council Member Ben Kallos. You can reach me on
15 social media @benkallos. I want to start with a huge
16 thank you to our Youth Services chair, Debbie Rose,
17 who has been fighting for Summer Youth year in, year
18 out, getting it restored every single time, ah, and
19 also to just the partnership between Mayor Bill de
20 Blasio and the council, and working together to get
21 universal middle school, and the fact that the
22 council, led by our speaker and Debbie Rose was able
23 to get 4000 seats baselined for elementary, and as we
24 look at this legislation for universal afterschool
25 that we authored together, along with Council Member

1 Mark Treyger, who is the Education chair, there's a
2 lot at stake. It's far less common for children to
3 have a stay-at-home parents than generations ago, and
4 far more common for parents to work late with New
5 Yorkers working longer hours than practically anyone
6 else. This is leaving a gap between school dismissal
7 and when parents are home. In New York there are
8 584,597 children in K through 12 that are left alone
9 and unsupervised. With 1.5 million students waiting
10 for an available program and only 632,076 children
11 enrolled in afterschool, according to the Afterschool
12 Alliance. Afterschool keeps young people positively
13 engaged during the hours of 2:00 to 6:00 p.m., when
14 research shows that they're most vulnerable to
15 justice involvement, according to Council for a
16 Strong American. Universal afterschool will increase
17 and equalize educational opportunities, keep kids out
18 of the criminal justice system, and make life easier
19 for parents whose jobs keep them at work until at
20 least 5:00 p.m., if not longer. As a new parent
21 myself, I rely on an extended day and enrichment
22 activities to keep my daughter busy while my partner
23 and I are working. Maslow's hierarchy of needs must
24 be satisfied if we want every child to reach their
25

1 full potential. This means addressing physiological
2 needs with universal breakfast, lunch, snack, and
3 supper, safety needs with Child Health Plus, and
4 finally love, belonging, and esteem through universal
5 afterschool. I want to wake up in a city where every
6 child has love and self-esteem. They need to grow up
7 to their full potential. I am so grateful for Youth
8 Services chair, Debbie Rose, for coauthoring
9 Introduction 1100 and 1113, Education chair Mark
10 Treyger for coauthoring and being lead sponsor in
11 Introduction 1113, and I look forward to having a
12 positive discussion. As mentioned, the mayor did the
13 universal middle schools, which finally achieved, ah,
14 the number of slots it needed, I believe last year,
15 when it went from 135.7 million in funding to 180.5
16 million in funding, and 77,747 slots, and, ah, there
17 are about 500,000 students in kindergarten through
18 fifth grade enrolled in public schools with only
19 47,000 COMPASS slots available to some 9%, according
20 to a 2019 report, ah, and the cost of elementary
21 school afterschool universal was estimated at a total
22 of about 250 million, ah, in last year's preliminary
23 budget hearing we're hoping that the cost pays for
24 itself and that we can get this done. And when we
25

1 look at high school I think currently we're budgeted
2 at about 4.5 million dollars for the high school
3 afterschool program, for COMPASS high and COMPASS
4 Explore, and that with single-digit millions that
5 that is something that we could expand. So I want to
6 thank the bill drafter, Malcolm Buttehorn, committee
7 counsel Paul Senegal, policy analyst Kevin Kotowski,
8 and finance analyst Michele Peregin, who is a huge
9 asset for the City Council, and I want to thank my
10 chief of staff Jessie Towson, legislative director
11 Wilfredo Lopez for their work. Thank you, and I hope
12 we can get this done as soon as possible.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. Thank you,
15 Council Member Kallos. And thank you for all the
16 hard work that you've done moving this, ah, this
17 legislation. And now we'll have the panel sworn in.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please raise your
19 right hands. Do you affirm to tell the whole truth
20 and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and
21 to respond honestly to council members' questions?

22 UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please state your
25 names for the record.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Susan
3 Haskell, deputy commissioner, Youth Services.

4 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: And
5 Darryl Rattray, associate commissioner of Youth
6 Services.

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And you can begin your
8 testimony.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Thank you.
10 Good morning, Chair Rose and members of the Committee
11 on Youth Services. I'm Susan Haskell, deputy
12 commissioner for Youth Services. I'm joined by
13 Associate Commissioner Darryl Rattray. On behalf of
14 Commissioner Chong, thank you for the opportunity to
15 testify today about DYCD's COMPASS and SONYC
16 comprehensive afterschool programs. The COMPASS of
17 New York City's system is comprised of more than 900
18 programs serving young people in grades K to 12.
19 Through a network of providers, COMPASS offers high-
20 quality programs that offer a balance of enrichment,
21 recreation, arts, academic and cultural activities to
22 support and strengthen the overall development of
23 youth. COMPASS aims to help young people explore
24 interest in skills, to develop social and emotional
25 learning, and to cultivate leadership. Through a

1 continuum of afterschool programs from COMPASS
2 elementary to SONYC for middle school students, to
3 COMPASS high, DYCD helps support young people on a
4 pathway to success. Programs are offered at no cost
5 and are located in public and private schools,
6 community centers, and parks and recreation
7 facilities throughout the city, both to leverage the
8 use of public spaces and to help youth find a place
9 that best fits their need. With the COMPASS middle
10 school expansion the city now has the capacity to
11 provide a high-quality afterschool seat to every
12 middle, New York City middle school-age youth. In
13 addition, in 2015 COMPASS launched a program to serve
14 middle school youth in detention and homeless
15 shelters in collaboration with the Administration for
16 Children's Services and Department of Homeless
17 Services, DYCD funded providers to offer tailored
18 programming at six locations that cultivate
19 supportive relationships and encourage participation
20 in enrichment activities. Fiscal year 19 was the
21 fifth year since the historic expansion of
22 afterschool programs under the leadership of Mayor de
23 Blasio. Last year more than 122,000 young people
24 were served in COMPASS. Of these, more than 50,000
25

1 students were served in 315 elementary school
2 programs, 67,600 middle school youth were served in
3 520 SONYC programs. COMPASS elementary and middle
4 school programs are offered five days a week after
5 school on some school holidays. Programs aim to
6 foster social and emotional competencies and physical
7 well-being, provide opportunities for youth to
8 explore interests and creativity, and build
9 confidence and leadership skills, and facilitate
10 community engagement, and engage parents and other
11 caregivers. The middle school model SONYC is
12 structured like clubs, where youth have the
13 opportunity to choose from a variety of activities,
14 including STEM, literacy, leadership development, and
15 healthy living. COMPASS high is designed to help
16 high school ninth graders navigate their new
17 surroundings and matriculate to the tenth grade. In
18 addition to advocacy within the community, the
19 COMPASS high model offers targeted academic, social,
20 and emotional supports. Last year approximately 1500
21 youth participated in COMPASS high. COMPASS Explorer
22 allows providers flexibility to create programs with
23 a specialized focus for different age groups.
24
25 COMPASS Explore programs offer a variety of

1 activities, from preparation for legal careers to
2 boat building. Last year 2595 youth participated in
3 38 Explore programs. This year we strengthen
4 partnerships in connections that support youth and
5 families. To further strengthen access to services
6 we launched Discover DYCD 2.0, which provides search
7 capabilities for New Yorkers to locate DYCD-funded
8 resources. It's being expanded across program areas
9 to include a sign-up feature, which allows users to
10 apply for services directly from the web or a smart
11 phone. In September of 2019 we held Bring Your Dads
12 to Afterschool Event, a spin-off of the annual Take
13 Your Child to School Day, across five boroughs, on
14 the 17th. The goal of Bring Your Dads to Afterschool
15 is to increase the investment of father figures in
16 our afterschool and evening programs. Studies have
17 shown that when men and father figures are involved
18 in activities with young people there's an
19 improvement for children behaviorally, educationally,
20 physically, and emotionally. In celebration of the
21 Lights On Afterschool Initiative we held the Highway
22 to High School Event. Participants from SONYC
23 programs toured high schools, attended student panels
24 and information sessions on the enrollment process,
25

1 led by DYCD high school participants. Finally, I'd
2 like to touch upon the legislation being heard today.
3 Number 1100 by Council Member Kallos requires DYCD to
4 make an afterschool slot available to any student who
5 requests, and Number 1133, by Council Member Treyger,
6 requires DYCD to publish an annual report detailing
7 availability of afterschool services. As you heard
8 today, we've made significant progress in
9 accomplishing the intent of both bills, to expand
10 services and to provide greater access to young
11 people and parents on the availability of services in
12 their community. This year marks the fifteenth year
13 since the inception of the system. What started as a
14 46 million dollar initiative has blossomed to nearly
15 340 million under the leadership of the mayor and the
16 City Council, serving over 120,000 youth last year.
17 These efforts are complimented by our beacon and
18 cornerstone programs, which have also experienced
19 significant investment in the last six years.
20 Working with providers, program staff, principals,
21 parents, and young people we're launching a COMPASS
22 stakeholder engagement planning process to plan for
23 the future and lay the groundwork for even stronger
24 program model in the future, in future request for
25

1 proposals. We welcome continued partnership with the
2 City Council in this process and in continuing to
3 find ways to meet the needs of the city's youth and
4 create opportunities for them to grow and thrive.
5 Thank you again for the invitation to testify today,
6 and we welcome your questions.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. Thank you
9 for your statement. Um, in fiscal 2020, ah, the
10 budget negotiations, the council and administration
11 successfully increased COMPASS elementary programming
12 by baselining an additional 4000 slots at the cost of
13 14.8 million dollars. And we really thank you for,
14 for helping us make that a reality. How many of
15 those slots are currently enrolled, and do you know
16 how many providers were awarded those slots?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We, um,
18 we're very excited to have that investment to be able
19 to expand the elementary afterschool seats. Ah, we
20 knew that some providers would be able to serve young
21 people, had young people that that they would be
22 excited to expand services. We, um, that was funded
23 in the adopted budget and we worked very quickly to
24 get the funding out the door. We surveyed our
25 providers to see who would be, um, you know, had the

1 capacity to quickly ramp up and make sure that more
2 students were served. We were able to contract out,
3 um, this year, ah, more than 3700 of those seats.
4 Those contract amendments, ah, were initiated in the
5 beginning of the November and providers were ramping
6 up through this money. So we look forward to sharing
7 the final enrollment numbers as the providers, um,
8 fill those seats.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, how many
11 providers, um, were provided or awarded those slots?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Um, I'd
13 like to get back to you on that number. More than
14 100 providers were allocated seats in that expansion.

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, were there any
16 delays at the start of the academic year in expanding
17 the program, ah, by the 4000 slots? Yes, obviously,
18 right?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, like
20 I said, you know, we were funded [inaudible] so we,
21 you know, we immediately took steps to see who would
22 have the capacity serving all of the elementary
23 providers to see who, um, you know, had interest,
24 ability, capacity, staffing being a significant
25 component of that. Um, the contracts were initiated

1
2 as soon as we were able to confirm those, um, the
3 acceptance of those contracts by providers for
4 November 1 and, um, and immediately they began
5 enrolling young people.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, could the
7 providers handle another expansion, um, say to double
8 the amount or an additional 8000 slots citywide?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I, we
10 always go to the source to find out what the capacity
11 is of the providers. But I have no doubt. In the
12 past whenever we've been able to expand services our
13 providers have stepped up to make sure that all of
14 the resources are put to best use. I have no doubt,
15 but I don't speak for them. We would, we would,
16 again, engage our stakeholders to respond to that.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Did you experience any
18 disruptions due to the newly required background
19 checks for early childhood, childcare providers, um,
20 that the state issued this year?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I would
22 say, um, thank you for that question. I would say
23 that the, um, that the field in our community-based
24 organizations did experience significant disruption.
25 Those changes were announced in August and our

1 afterschool programs ramp up to begin in September.

2 Um, they were pretty significant changes that needed

3 immediate response. We worked closely with our

4 partners at the Department of Health and in

5 communication with the state Office of Children and

6 Family Services. I do want to point out that the

7 burden of those requirements rests on our funded

8 providers. So they experienced, um, the significant

9 disruption. Their license with the, with New York

10 State OCSF is a direct relationship and our, we've

11 taken our role to provide as much communication,

12 coordination, and support as possible, um, whether

13 through trainings or just sharing information as we

14 get it immediately. Um, my colleagues have arranged,

15 um, special information sessions and we've been

16 pleased to invite the Department of Health to, to

17 participate in those. But that is an ongoing

18 challenge, absolutely.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, what do you think

20 contributed to the delays, um, what contributed to

21 the delays and why weren't they able to get them, ah,

22 ah, the checks, you know, in an expeditious manner so

23 that there were not delays?

24
25

1 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, the
2 rules were, the new requirements were announced in
3 August and that is the period where staff are ramping
4 up for afterschool. So we've seen a lot of
5 variability in the impact because if you, if you
6 didn't, if you weren't hiring new staff the impact
7 was minimal, because the requirements were for, um,
8 new staff to go through more extensive clearances,
9 um, than ever before, and on top of that, I think the
10 most significant change for DYCD and for our
11 providers was previously the school-age childcare
12 regulations allowed a new staff to work in a program
13 if they were supervised by a cleared staff person,
14 and the new regulations don't allow that. So if
15 you've hired somebody they can't work with children
16 in the program until those clearances come through.
17 That was a very dramatic change for our providers.
18 That really impacted new staff.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Was there a
20 significant impact? Do you know how many providers
21 were, you know, impacted by, um, or affected by the
22 new background check rule?
23

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We're still
25 gathering information. Every SAC program is impacted

1 by this new rule, hundred percent every SAC program.
2 Because even if you have staff, even if 100% of your
3 staff is cleared you're put immediately on a schedule
4 to get those staff recleared. So there's no one who
5 is not impacted. But what we have seen is that some
6 providers, again, primarily depending on how much
7 turnover you happen this year, some of them have
8 reported to us that they have had to hold back their
9 full participation in the program because they're
10 understaffed. They're required, of course, to meet
11 staff ratio. Safety is paramount. We're advising
12 them don't, you know, be serving more kids than you
13 have the ability to safely serve on any given day,
14 and we've made adjustments in our contract
15 requirements to account for that. Um, but we also
16 look, have looked at enrollment system-wide. We
17 haven't seen a huge impact this year. I, I hold,
18 withhold, um, you know, noting how significant that
19 impact will be until we get to the end of year.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So it seems as if, ah,
22 most of the delays have been rectified at this time?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I wouldn't,
24 I wouldn't say, it's not, it's not really, I wouldn't
25 call it a delay per se. I think this is an ongoing

1 challenge that providers will have from now until the
2 foreseeable future every time a new staff is hired.
3 They will be required to do these background checks.
4 So there's, there's, you know, this will be something
5 that we have to work together as a city to, um, to
6 find ways to make as seamless and efficient as
7 possible. There's no indication that there's, you
8 know, a way out of this right now.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: In May 2018 DYCD
11 released a new RFP for COMPASS, which was rescinded.
12 How have the negotiations with the providers been
13 transpiring since then, um, and will a concept paper
14 be issued? If so, when? And if not, why?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes. We
16 are excited to launch a concept paper planning
17 process. As you know, we issued the RFP with all
18 plans to go forward. We got a lot of pushback from
19 providers and we took, um, some months to communicate
20 with providers who giving pushback, to talk to MOCS,
21 and, and we've engaged with you to some degree, um,
22 but what we established was that the best thing we
23 could do for continuity of services for the youth and
24 for the community-based organizations to allow them
25 to, you know, feel confident. The contracts was to

1
2 extend contracts. Our plan is to extend them through
3 June of 2022. So providers will continue to offer
4 those services and we are now launching a full-blown,
5 comprehensive stakeholder engagement process. Ah,
6 the commissioner really wants us to map out a plan.
7 We want to engage with you. We know you have, um,
8 welcomed that engagement any time we've had a
9 hearing, and we certainly want to work with the
10 council, young people, community-based organizations,
11 which we, to culminate in a concept paper that will
12 kind of set the, set the path for a COMPASS RFP going
13 forward.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So you said you
15 extended to, till 2022?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: June of
17 2022. So our plan is to, um, complete a stakeholder
18 engagement process and initiate a concept paper, um,
19 before the end of this administration that would be
20 the culmination of the input from the field.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So would that, um, so
22 that means now they're, um, still going to be
23 functioning at the, at the, um, previous rate, the
24 2012 rate?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: No, um,
3 because the contracts that were, um, initiated in
4 2011 have, um, I think there have been investments
5 since then, um, including, um, cost of living
6 increases and I know there's, um, being impacted
7 right now with the potential to increase, indirect
8 costs. So there have been investments since then to
9 the, to the contracts.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Will it be equivalent
11 to, um, the \$3200 per participate rate?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: It would in
13 most cases be more than that rate.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: It would be more.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yeah.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Would it meet, um, the
17 cost of living, ah, the prevailing wage?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Those, um,
19 there were wage, I don't know the details of the
20 budget increases without my finance people, I
21 apologize. But I know that there was an opportunity
22 for all of the contracted providers to submit their,
23 um, wage increase adjustment asks. Um, there were
24 some, there was an open door for them to, to, ah,
25 tell DYCD and OMB about their additional costs and

1
2 get their contracts amended upward, and just recently
3 we've initiated another process that would allow them
4 to report to us their approved indirect, so they have
5 an opportunity to enhance some of the non-direct
6 expenses that we've heard from providers are critical
7 to providing high-quality service.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Does DYCD feel that,
9 um, the rate per person, per participate, will be
10 sufficient to run, you know, healthy, robust COMPASS
11 programs?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, I,
13 um, I take some comfort in the fact that the
14 providers had the opportunity to tell us. I mean, I
15 think sometimes their cost varied and we, we saw that
16 in their reporting to us on staff costs and we'll see
17 that, I think, in indirect, although I think we've
18 yet to see the, the full impact of that. So I think
19 that, I take comfort in the fact that they're being
20 asked to, um, communicate what their needs are in
21 that way and we will certainly include the cost of
22 the service as a critical component of the
23 stakeholder engagement process.

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: By contrast, what does
25 the private market garner for afterschool services?

1 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I don't
2
3 know the answer to that question. I, um, in the
4 private, I don't, you know, what individual private
5 programs are charging as their fees.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Are you doing any sort
7 of market analysis to find out if, um, the rates are
8 comparable, and if so what is, um, a rate that makes
9 programming, you know, the programming vibrant,
10 robust, and able to, ah, accommodate the needs of
11 polyp.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We haven't
13 undertaken an analysis into privately funded
14 afterschool rates, but we have looked closely at, um,
15 the costs of providing the COMPASS service and, um,
16 again, I think we've, we've provided a few
17 opportunities to, for our providers to get
18 enhancements to the contract amounts and we'll
19 continue to communicate with them about what the
20 right upper extremity costs of providing a program
21 are.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, and, you know, we
23 were, we were, we wanted, the council wanted to be a
24 part of those discussions. Um, do you have a time
25 frame that you're going to bring us into the

1
2 discussions about COMPASS and the new RFP and the
3 rates?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I think
5 following up this hearing we should, um, we can reach
6 out offline and we can should set something up, put a
7 date on the calendar to share our stakeholder
8 engagement plan with you.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um-hmm. I just want
10 to say, I did notice that you said that you're
11 extending it out 2022. We won't be here. It will be
12 a different administration. How is that, um, this
13 administration feels that it's OK to push that off
14 into the outer years without resolving it before,
15 before this administration is out of office?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, I
17 want to say that DYCD issued an RFP and the rates in
18 that RFP for those contracts and it was providers who
19 shared in that process. It's a feedback to the RFP
20 that they wanted us to stop and do a more robust and
21 comprehensive, um, process. So we were...

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: We [inaudible] that be
23 a negative? Wouldn't that indicate that, um, what
24 you were proposing wasn't adequate to do the service,
25

2 to provide the services that we're proposing to
3 provide?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: It did
5 indicate to the city that we should continue the
6 contracts that we have currently and figure, and
7 figure out the pathway moving forward, yes. We
8 responded by saying to that OK, let's, let's, um,
9 lets extend these contracts, do our comprehensive
10 assessment process and then take it from there.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And so you are saying
12 to me that the comprehensive process, this
13 assessment, is going to take until 2022?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: No, I don't
15 think, no, it won't take that long but we want to,
16 our primary concern is continuity of services for the
17 young people. So the contracts will be continued,
18 but this, that process, even the issuance of a
19 contract, concept paper, would have to happen way,
20 you know, way before that in order to, you know,
21 reflect communication and allow time for feedback.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So do you think, so
23 are you seeing an RFP and when?

24
25

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We are
3 committing to a concept paper. Our current plan, um,
4 is for um, early 2021. That's our goal.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. I'm going to let
6 my colleagues ask some questions and I have many
7 more. Yes, Council Member Kallos? Before, I'd just
8 like to acknowledge that we've been joined by Council
9 Member Treyger, who may want to make a statement
10 after council members' questioning, and Council
11 Member Rosenthal.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: When I was in
13 school my favorite part of the school day was
14 afterschool. In particular, during afterschool
15 everyone got to play basketball and teams were
16 equally split without anyone getting picked last or
17 left out on the bench. Suffice to say, I was not
18 good at sports and I loved the afterschool basketball
19 program. Ah, Deputy Commissioner Susan Haskell and
20 Associate Commissioner Darryl Rattray, what were your
21 favorite afterschool activities as children?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I have
23 conceded in some afterschool, um, talks that I spent
24 an inappropriate amount of time of watching General
25 Hospital. But I also, um, participated in the school

1 band very much. I played the flute and I loved being
2 part of that musical community.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

5 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: Oh, this
6 is amazing. Um, thank you for that question. So I
7 guess my most memorable afterschool experience was
8 actually as a teenager. Um, I was 14. Two years
9 prior my mother had just passed away from breast
10 cancer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Sorry.

12 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: I didn't
13 know my father. I was living with my, my older
14 sibling, my sister. Um, and I lived in the South
15 Bronx. So that path of what was happening at the
16 time, '89, '90, um, could have taken me down the
17 wrong path. But afterschool youth development kicked
18 in and before you knew it I was the president of a
19 youth council. We were creating and mobilizing the
20 community. We were doing events. We were, um, my
21 first job was summer youth employment program working
22 in a summer camp program. So we working with younger
23 kids. We were leaders within that community. So
24 that's always going to be, um, the reason why I do
25 this work and the reason why I stay within this job.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you for
3 answering your calling, and thank you to those who
4 funded the programs that allowed you to find it. I
5 had a different line, but I just want to follow the
6 path you kind of laid out about sharing your own
7 personal experience about the community you grew up
8 and alluding to the possibility of justice
9 involvement. Has DYCD ever done a study, do we have
10 any numbers on, ah, for every dollar we spend on
11 afterschool here in the city what the reduction in
12 juvenile justice costs might be?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: There are,
14 there are studies about that, and I don't have those
15 figures at the top of my head. I was in a meeting
16 just yesterday where some of those, um, figures were
17 being shared. At DYCD we also focus, um, in terms of
18 our policy development in the programs on what every
19 young person needs for positive youth development.
20 So you and your question like stated some of the joys
21 and like how the feeling of being successful and
22 basketball may not have been your thing, but I think
23 when we're designing programs we're thinking about
24 how much it means to a young person to develop a
25 positive peer connection to, um, explore their

1 interests, to learn new things, to have a caring
2 adult there, um, and the importance of avoiding
3 negative behavior is critical, um, but we also focus
4 on, on the importance of what every young person
5 needs to be successful, the components of positive
6 youth development.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Ah, there is a
9 silver lining to this basketball story. Ever since I
10 got elected to the City Council and we do staff
11 versus interns basketball I am so great at
12 basketball, you wouldn't believe. [laughter] But
13 just dipping into the numbers, so I believe there's
14 some offs, that we can figure out what an offset is
15 and I would like to work with you on that. But at
16 the preliminary budget hearing of the Youth Services
17 Committee in 2019, again led by our Youth Services
18 chair, Debbie Rose, DYCD was asked how much it cost
19 to offer afterschool to every student who needed it
20 at every school in the city and I believe there was
21 an estimate of about a quarter million dollars and so
22 there's already 150 million dollars allocated and I
23 think our math says that means there's 100 million
24 dollars left to cover that universal elementary.
25 That being said, there might be a difference opinion

1 so do you have an updated estimate? It's been about
2 a year, a little less, ah, do you have an update for
3 how much it would cost for participation, sorry. Do
4 you have an updated estimate for likely participation
5 in elementary and the cost for universal elementary?
6

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We don't
8 have details on what that would cost. We do know
9 that it would be in the hundreds of millions of
10 dollars at the very least, for elementary alone. Ah,
11 we, the bill being discussed today talks about a seat
12 for every young person who asks for it. And, um,
13 those estimates would be very different than, you
14 know, for example, putting the minimum level of
15 service at every school that doesn't have a current
16 city-funded program. So the variables are dramatic
17 in terms of trying to make that estimation. I also
18 want to mention Chair Rose's conversation about the
19 rates, um, because I think, you know, we are planning
20 for the future and what those costs are for providers
21 and I don't think the 2011 rates can apply anymore,
22 so I think that's also...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I agree.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL:

25 ...something that's changing and it would change in

1 terms of a, of a cost estimate. Most importantly, I
2 think in your comment is that that was a, um, that
3 was taking into consideration the expansion only, not
4 existing services that are funded.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: OK, that is
7 helpful to have this clarification. I would also
8 just note that in California, which has 900,000
9 children and we're just talking about elementary, but
10 California's entire program, I think, was initially
11 funded at 330 million. So this would put us, ah, a
12 little bit, if not higher and then also in California
13 they are now at, I think, ten years later, this was
14 the Governor's top issue, Proposition 49. I think
15 it is now funded at 550 million by the State of
16 California, so every 934,000 children, and then they
17 also get 157 million in funding from the federal
18 government. Do you know how much we're currently
19 getting in funding from the federal government to
20 offset our costs?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: DYCD does
22 not receive, to the best of my knowledge, any federal
23 funding for our COMPASS afterschool program.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: OK, to the extent
25 we can get funding through the 21st Century grants,

1 which cover the community learning and what-have-you.
2
3 I think there might be an opportunity for cost
4 savings, and I guess, ah, last and first round I want
5 to make sure I give a chance to our co-author to this
6 whole package, our education chair, Mark Treyger. So
7 when I went to a New York City public high school my
8 favorite part of, ah, school was afterschool clubs,
9 and so that was self-organized by kids and I don't
10 think we actually had teachers. We had like a couple
11 of security guard who made sure we weren't in too
12 much trouble and we got in a lot of trouble.
13 Meanwhile, the public advocate and our Youth Services
14 chair have been strong proponents for University with
15 Jobs, something I also support. DYCD only provides
16 about 4.6 million dollars for afterschool programs
17 serving high school students, about 4142, according
18 to the Independent Budget Office. Do you have an
19 idea of how many high school students would, ah, take
20 advantage of a universal afterschool and what that
21 estimated cost might be?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, I
23 think high school, looking at high school is again
24 many, many variables, depending on what you're, what
25 you want to talk about for a high school program.

1
2 Are you talking about a club that operates once a
3 week, something more comprehensive? Our, DYCD's
4 perspective looking at high school students was the
5 most critical time for them and this was the summer,
6 so though although COMPASS has a much smaller
7 investment in high school in comparison to middle
8 school and elementary school, their out of school
9 time period that is the most significant is the
10 summer, and our summer youth employment program with
11 support from council has grown dramatically, and
12 that's, that's where our, the most significant
13 investment for high school students happen. We also,
14 and we're here for oversight on COMPASS today, but we
15 also operate roughly 200 community centers, um,
16 Beacon and Cornerstone Community Centers, where high
17 school students participate and that's not reflected
18 in the COMPASS program model here, so I, we do have,
19 um, additional services outside of COMPASS.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: One piece I'll
21 note and then I'll pass it back, and I thank the
22 chair for her indulgences. The legislation provides
23 a mandate similar to when the mayor announced
24 universal pre-K. Ah, we finally got universal pre-K
25 on the Upper East Side for this school year. So it

1
2 took us six years to grow from 154 seats to the 1100
3 seats that met the need in the neighborhood. So part
4 of the legislation would actually give to you the
5 opportunity to set forward a plan, control your
6 variables, and what-have-you, and so I know the chair
7 asked about could you continue to expand at a rate of
8 4000 seat or 800 seats or what-have-you. So I think
9 the goal would be to make the commitment, and then
10 the other piece of the bill, which is my favorite
11 part, 'cause I hate reporting bills, is once you hit
12 universal afterschool you stop having to do reports
13 on how you're going to get done [laughs]. Exactly.
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. Um, I just
16 want to, ah, sort of circle back on what Council
17 Member Kallos said. Could you tell us, um, what was
18 the methodology you used to, um, for COMPASS, I mean
19 for SONYC, and could you use the same methodology to
20 establish universal COMPASS?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I, um, let
22 me think back to 2014. Just before I came back to
23 DYCD there was a very comprehensive, again, um,
24 research white paper, um, presented that, um, with,
25 you know, in-depth conversations with stakeholders,

1
2 again, our community-based organizations, about what
3 are the right models, what are the right costs, the
4 Department of Education, working closely with the
5 Department of Youth and Community Development to, you
6 know, do the work that you've, that we've discussed,
7 you know, about what is out there now and what is it
8 that we're committed to providing and, um, I think
9 that was an extremely, again, robust and
10 comprehensive process with a commitment towards, ah,
11 universal middle school.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So would you not apply
13 the same methodology now and, you know, what would
14 that look like and how would you, how soon would you
15 be able to get that done?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, I
17 think, um, this conversation is probably better
18 suited for the, um, budget negotiations, but DYCD,
19 again, we stand ready. If, you know, if the city
20 commits to an expansion of afterschool services we,
21 we can, you know, figure out a policy, again, to make
22 sure that the most young people can participate
23 within a high-quality structure, um, ensuring to
24 every extent possible we're getting to the youth that
25

1 need it most. That would be our, that would be our
2 approach, you know, if an expansion were...

3
4 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So you already have
5 all of the data and the metrics that it would require
6 to have a conversation about the universality of
7 COMPASS?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I don't
9 think we do have all that information. We certainly
10 have good, valuable information based on our existing
11 programs, but we would need to engaging stakeholders,
12 um, we'd need to talk to community-based
13 organizations. We'd want to do some assessments
14 around need, in particular working with the
15 Department of Education and, yeah, I think we, we
16 would need to do quite a bit more.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So wouldn't all of
18 those conversations need to take place before we go
19 to budget negotiations? So that we would, we would
20 really have a clear picture of what, of what, um,
21 what the needs are and what, what it would take to
22 make this, um, a reality? Because, um, all of us
23 that are, are here today and that are not here today
24 and that have legislation, we're, we're not doing
25 this as an exercise in futility. We actually want to

1 see this become the reality. And so if you're saying
2 we need to have those conversations before we can
3 move it to a place where we can achieve universality,
4 I think we need to do that and have some sort of
5 timeline, some timeframe so that we, we get there.

6
7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I, DYCD has
8 valuable information to contribute to the, to the
9 conversation. I don't think we have all the answers,
10 but we, we certainly have valuable information to
11 any, you know, discussion about afterschool
12 expansion.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So we, will be
14 looking, um, to see that there will be conversations
15 the, um, DOE will be brought into, into these
16 conversations, right? And the service providers.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yep, as
18 well as our providers, yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um-hmm. Is it, is it
20 too presumptuous of me to say that maybe we should,
21 um, come up with some kind of summit, some kind of,
22 of conclave where this actually begins to happen?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I will say
24 we have expanded afterschool and community centers in
25

1 this administration, like the expansion is completely
2 unprecedented. We have a more robust afterschool...

3
4 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yes, and I, I do, I
5 have to agree, and I thank you for that.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yeah.

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: But, um, I'd like to
8 see the same type of verve and, and, and
9 aggressiveness that pre-K and 3K, you know, was
10 pursued. Ah, because we know, we can do it. This
11 administration proved that it's doable. And so I, I
12 want to, I want this to be more than just a hearing
13 where we're asking question. I want to see that
14 there are going to be some action steps taken, you
15 know, towards our goal. Um, Council Member Treyger?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you very
17 much, Chair Rose, for your outstanding leadership on
18 this issue. Year after year you have been the, the
19 leader on this and we really appreciate you, and to
20 my colleagues and Council Member Kallos as well for
21 your bill. So we're also hearing, as we've noted, my
22 bill, Intro 1113, at today's hearing, which will
23 require reporting on afterschool programs. And, more
24 specifically, my bill would require DYCD in
25 consultation with DOE to report on the existence of

1
2 afterschool programs and the funding allocated to
3 those programs. And, make no mistake, these are
4 bills and the intent here is to lay the groundwork
5 for universal afterschool for every child. But I am
6 very mindful of that word, universal, because as
7 chair of the Education Committee when we hear about
8 UPK I cannot call it universal when there are
9 hundreds of kids that we know of that have not been
10 seated because we don't have the accommodations to
11 address their special needs. So when I hear about
12 even afterschool programs it is painful when I hear
13 from parents that say well, school is not fully
14 accessible for my child during the school day, what
15 are we doing even after school? The same problem
16 exists as well. So of the children that we're
17 serving in COMPASS or in SONYC, how many of the, is
18 there data on the number of kids that have been
19 turned away or the number of kids that we cannot
20 serve because of their special needs.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: DYCD, thank
22 you for your question, we recognize, um, different
23 needs of different young people and as we, you know,
24 move forward with the expansion of the SONYC program
25 for middle school students, taking some of those

1 things into consideration, District 75, for example,
2 implemented not through DYCD contracts, but
3 implemented their own component of the universal
4 middle school programs, um, so that young people
5 could have an extended day who were participating in
6 D70, D75 programs. We also, um, I think it was
7 mentioned earlier, we put programs in places where we
8 knew young people would be to help make access better
9 for them, whether that was offering services in
10 homeless shelters or offering services in ACS
11 detention programs. And in the past some of our
12 requests for proposals have allowed for providers to
13 apply for a slightly increased price per participate
14 if they are working with, um, if they're working with
15 youth with disabilities to allow for accommodations
16 that might have additional costs to them. So I think
17 we take into consideration when we're implementing
18 our programs that, um, to meet young people where
19 they are and to address varying needs.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right, but,
22 respectfully, why do we keep hearing that parents and
23 children are turned away. I mean, for example, is it
24 accurate to say that the one of the services in
25

2 afterschool programs is homework help or tutoring?

3 Is that correct?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Ah, in many
5 of our programs, yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right. And what
7 happens when a family comes forward and says that
8 their child has dyslexia? How is that issue being
9 addressed in the afterschool programming?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We, we
11 have, um, contracts with providers to help support
12 programs to, um, to better meet, um, with varying
13 needs, so we offer support to our providers to help.
14 Um, structure program activities in order to make
15 sure that they're as inclusive as possible. We offer
16 support specifically to providers and we have, you
17 know, great uptake in those, um, resources when we
18 offer them. Ah, we, I think you would be, um,
19 pleased to see the kind of service that our, um, and
20 some of them have very specialized, some of our
21 providers really have an expertise in this, in
22 working with young people. I would welcome any
23 situation where you learn of a young person who needs
24 extra support to see, um, what we can do to make an
25 accommodation.

1 COMMITTEE ON YOUTH SERVICES 48

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So I just want

3 to give you an example, and actually I think I see

4 some folks from the Coney Island, the YMCA here. Let

5 me give you a concrete example. Because of the lack

6 of existence of afterschool services the Coney Island

7 YMCA voluntarily opened its doors to allow for

8 programming for children in my community to have

9 these types of services, understanding that there are

10 certain sensory needs and certain sensory issues.

11 They did that on their own and I applaud them and I

12 thank them for doing that. But there is no

13 comprehensive plan that I see from the city to

14 actually serve all children. So we, Chair Rose,

15 Council Member Kallos and I, we're serious when we

16 say universal. Every child, from every ZIP code

17 deserves a seat and deserves a shot. And what I'm

18 sensing, and what I'm hearing from families in my

19 district and across the city that is not the case.

20 And so we want to work with you to fight for the

21 funding to make this truly universal, and also DOE

22 needs to aggressively move on its capital plan to

23 make our schools more accessible, to make sure that

24 these spaces are accommodating children during the

25 course of the day and after school and partnering

1
2 with community-based organizations such as the Y and
3 other partners to make sure that we are servicing
4 kids to, to the best of our ability. I think we
5 should all be on the same page here, but I'm just
6 mindful that not every child is currently seated and
7 partly because of the government's own failure to
8 address their needs. So I look forward to working
9 with you and my colleagues to secure resources, but
10 to also make sure that we have an accessible city
11 that meets the needs of our, of our families. And so
12 thank you, Chair, for your leadership, and I turn
13 back my time. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much,
15 Chair Treyger. We've been joined by Council Member
16 Eugene. I just want to ask a question about summer
17 SONYC before I go back to my colleagues. In fiscal
18 year 2020 the budget included one year funding for 15
19 million to support the program for approximately
20 22,000 slots, and year after year the committee and
21 council has successfully negotiated for funding of
22 this program. And I am really, I have to say I'm
23 really thankful. I know oftentimes we beat up on
24 you, but sometimes, you know, it's good to say thank
25 you, and I'm thankful. Can this committee expect to

1 see some of SONYC funded in the preliminary budget,
2 which is set to be released on Thursday, um, and how
3 successful was last year's summer programming and did
4 we meet the enrollment, um, how many schools
5 participated, and how many more schools can we take
6 on this summer? That's a lot, right?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yah.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: But yes,
11 no, no, it's good...

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So, but the most
13 important one...

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We got it.

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: ...was can we expect
16 to see some of SONYC funded in the preliminary
17 budget, which is set to be released Thursday. That's
18 the most important.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I don't the
20 answer to that question, but I do know that if and
21 when funding does come for the summer we've proven
22 year after year that our providers will, um, ramp up
23 as quickly as possible. We were able to contract out
24 more than 22,000 of those seats and we enrolled
25 nearly 22,000 young people in those summer programs

1
2 and if it is funded in the budget we will again work
3 quickly to get that funding out and make sure we
4 maximum the number of young people who will get to
5 participate in those summer programs.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: I, um, I have to agree
7 that when, um, when we do get the additions, um, our
8 providers are wonderful and they, they meet the
9 challenge, but they shouldn't be challenged to the
10 point where they are notified so late in the process
11 that it becomes, you know, more challenging. I would
12 hope that DYCD is, you know, really working with the
13 administration to get it funded in the preliminary
14 budget so they have adequate time, so that they don't
15 have to be stressed, so that they don't have to, um,
16 at the last minute jump through hoops to meet, you
17 know, to meet, which is something that's supposed to
18 be a gift become something super stressful and
19 something that, um, becomes, um, problematic,
20 difficult, you know, it puts a strain on, on their
21 programming. So, um, I'm sorry that you don't know
22 if it is going to be, you know, released Thursday.
23 But I would hope that, um, DYCD would be really
24 trying to impress upon the administration how
25 important that it is a part of the preliminary

1 budget. Um, and so, um, you said that you were able
2 to meet the enrollment, and, um, do you know how many
3 of the schools, um, you know, had programming for
4 summer SONYC?
5

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I don't
7 have the details on how many, um, different programs
8 were funded, but we would be happy to get you that
9 information.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: That's really
11 important. I mean, you know, Council Member Treyger
12 and Kallos and I are, are trying to make this
13 universal. It would really help if we knew, you
14 know, just where these programs, you know, are and
15 how many we need to fill the gaps.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: You meant
17 the summer programs in your question.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: SONYC.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Summer SONYC, Um-hmm.
21 Council Member Rosenthal, good to see you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It's good to
23 see you, Chair Rose. Um, I want to thank you for you
24 and Council Member Kallos for holding this hearing,
25 ah, and I'd like to follow up on what Chair Rose and

1 Council Member Treyger have raised. Um, you know, I
2 appreciate the fact that you're painting a very rosy
3 picture here. But the truth is government is failing
4 our children and it fails our children every time it
5 has to count on the City Council in the eleventh hour
6 identifying funding for summer SONYC. You're saying
7 that we're nearly filling all the 22,000 slets.
8 That bar is so low, so low. I know this because I
9 hear from constituents in my district who don't know
10 whether or not their kids will have a chance to be in
11 a summer program and therefore, ah, they, they assume
12 they're not going to be enrolled and make other
13 plans, which means putting them in front of the TV
14 all summer long. And frankly slots are filled so
15 quickly that my families can't even get in. I mean,
16 the definition of universal, we could say we have
17 universal public school for our kids, K through 12,
18 pre-K through 12. We don't have universal
19 afterschool or universal summer school or universal
20 things for them to do on Saturdays and Sundays. And
21 the impact of that is twofold. One for the kids who,
22 um, really could use the help and be nurtured. They
23 don't have equity. And then there are quite a few
24 children who really need to be occupied and whose
25

1
2 parents want them to be some place that is
3 constructive for them. When I talk to, you know, and
4 again this is one side, the one side is there are
5 kids who could really benefit for whom there is no
6 equity. They have no access to these programs, and
7 that holds them back academically. There are also
8 kids who, um, you know, in my talking to, ah, you
9 know, the head of the community centers, they know
10 who these kids are, who can't get into their programs
11 because they don't have two dollars in a sliding
12 scale to pay every day. And so they miss out. I've
13 got providers who want to provide afterschool
14 programming and evening programming, weekend and
15 summer programming. They want to do this. But
16 government sets them up to fail by telling them at
17 the last minute that they may or may not have a
18 contract, by severely underfunding them, by paying
19 them a year and a half later. How can you hire for
20 that? Government sets them up to fail. And
21 therefore we're failing our children. I think DYD,
22 DYCD has a responsibility to understand demand for
23 this program, to know where the absence, where the,
24 ah, holes are, where we're not funding programs, and
25 what's frustrating is you're painting a very rosy

1 picture that special ed kids are being, their needs
2 are being taken care of. They're not. You know, the
3 nonprofits may or may not have the bandwidth to reach
4 out to DYCD to get a specialist for a curriculum for
5 the kids with a variety of special needs kids who
6 they're serving, right? So I mean this with all due
7 respect, but, you know, it would be very helpful to
8 hearing your testimony not the rosy picture but where
9 we could be doing better. You know, on the Upper
10 West Side we're having some issues with youth, um,
11 minor crimes, after school, right, these kids are
12 getting into mischief, serious mischief, and my
13 constituents are coming to me and asking for more
14 police, and I say to them we don't need more police.
15 What we need is afterschool programs, and the
16 principals want to put them in afterschool programs.
17 They know who these kids are. They want to provide a
18 service for them, but there's nothing, because
19 there's nothing free. It's not universal. Or
20 whatever is free is totally jammed pack. There are
21 no slots left. So I don't understand why, um, I'm
22 wondering what, um, the mayor is doing, what you are
23 doing, to address the prevention issue. And to make
24

1
2 sure there's equity for kids who need afterschool,
3 for enrichment.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Thank you
5 for your passion for young people. We share that
6 passion. And, um, you know, forgive me for, for
7 being rosy about our programs, but we spend the
8 majority of our day working on the task at hand,
9 which is like implementing and supporting the, you
10 know, hundreds of thousands of young people that we
11 do work for and we have the privilege of seeing that
12 work all day long, and that's where that energy is
13 coming from. Um, certainly we, we are open to, you
14 know, if you talk about particular issues on the
15 Upper West Side we'd love to meet with, you know,
16 people in your community and see if we can identify
17 seats for them. I think, it might, it may be that we
18 do have places for them to go and it's why we have
19 invested significant resources in, like I mentioned
20 Discover DYCD 2.0, um, I'm not convinced that you
21 can't go online and find an available resource for.
22 But depending on, I don't know what age level you're
23 talking about or, or what specific location, but I
24 think one of the things we, we battle in our, um, in
25 our outreach efforts is to, um, we're just, we

1
2 continually want people to know about the programs
3 that we do have, and we may be able to find an option
4 for those young people. I, I see your point about is
5 every single young person in New York City in a
6 program, no. But, um, we would like to work with you
7 and see if there are options. Sometimes there's a
8 foregone conclusion that there isn't a resource
9 available and we want to say like let's talk because,
10 um, you know, it's our job wherever there is
11 availability to make sure we can link up a young
12 person with a service.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I mean, with
14 all due respect, sure I'm happy to sit down with you
15 and I'll tell you the neighborhoods and if you can
16 find me a program, great. There are 50 other
17 districts that are having the exact same problem. So
18 it's not like I'm unique, number one. And number
19 two, I'm pretty familiar with the afterschool
20 programs and the summer programs in my district, and
21 I want to be clear. There are no slots available,
22 none. There are, every year there are lists of
23 families on wait lists who do not get in. So if you
24 want me to pick up the phone and call the deputy
25 commissioner every time, you know, I have somebody on

1
2 a wait list I'm happy to do that. But, um, I'm not
3 sure that's comprehensive planning. I, ah..

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, I am
5 not suggesting that. I'm saying we have publicly
6 available tools now to help, um, people find
7 resources, and they're useful...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right, but I
9 think what I'm saying is your hands are tied and I, I
10 wish you would admit that and, and join with us in
11 fighting to lift up these nonprofits that are trying
12 to do the best they can. I mean, in, you know, when
13 we look at delays in contracts, DYCD has, you know,
14 is, is the largest, has the largest number of
15 contracts and is the farthest behind on getting those
16 contracts registered, so, you know, these providers
17 can be paid. It's just a reality. It's not the, you
18 know, well, you have a lot to do. Well, yes, you
19 have a lot to do. That's why you need the resources
20 in order to get that done well. We are big city by
21 definition, so are you getting, if, if you're behind
22 in getting these contracts registered there's a
23 reason. It's not because you're inept. It's because
24 you, you're being set up to fail. You don't have the
25

2 resources you need to get it done. Are all of your
3 ACOs trained on PASSport?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You know, last
6 time I checked the answer was no. I mean, it's OK,
7 it doesn't bother me. It's just, so, let's, what do
8 we do to get them trained? You know, the nonprofits
9 are trained. They're ready to go.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yeah.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: They're not
12 getting paid.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I'm not
14 here to respond on behalf of the ACO, but I will say
15 the expertise in DYCD's ACO unit is very strong.
16 We're offering training..

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Again, it's
18 not about expertise. It's about numbers. Do you
19 have enough staff to get it done? You're, you're
20 woefully behind in getting those contracts registered
21 and it's to the detriment of all New Yorkers. The
22 link is, is, it may be circuitous but it's very
23 clear.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I'd like to
25 offer to look at that data with you again offline. I

1 don't, I'm not, you know, I don't have the ACO data,
2 but I know how, you know, I'd like to, we'd like to
3 explore that further.
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, so, just
6 to, last question, Council Member, to Council Member
7 Rose's question. Will there be funding for summer
8 SONYC in the preliminary budget or not? Because if
9 not we are gonna have a job on our hands, ah, in
10 budget negotiating team fighting again for it. And
11 let me tell you, ah, for all New Yorkers you have no
12 fiercer advocate than Debbie Rose, who, who is laser
13 focused on making sure our kids get the summer
14 programming they need. And I would argue [inaudible]
15 even in SONYC, um, you know, these are kids who
16 really need full day, on the weekends, ah,
17 programming. So is the mayor putting it, I mean,
18 it's no, it's not like it's, ah, um, you know, this
19 is real work so I, I don't need to be surprised or
20 not surprised. Is the mayor gonna have it in his
21 preliminary plan? It's an easy yes or no.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Ah, I, I,
23 without, I don't have my finance team here. I don't
24 have the answer to that question. I will say
25 Commissioner Chong has in his testimony here many

1 times to Council made it clear that we support this
2 service and when it's funded we, again, we believe
3 it's a valuable service for young people in the
4 summer and we are aligned with you in our support for
5 summer services for young people, and I think he's
6 made it clear that this is a, this is a program area
7 that we support.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

10 Thank you, Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much.

12 Um, I want to thank you for, you know, going down
13 that road, Council Member Rosenthal. You know, we're
14 talking about issues in our city right now, um, we're
15 talking about an increase in hate crimes. We're
16 talking about an uptick in, um, in miscellaneous, ah,
17 crime, and, um, and a lot of it has to do with young
18 people who are misdirecting their energies and, um,
19 are not avail, are not, don't have the resources
20 available that they need and our afterschool
21 programming addresses social development. It's an
22 educational program and for us to talk about, oh, we
23 need to do something about the uptick in hate crimes,
24 we need to do something about the uptick in, um, in,
25 ah, low level, ah, nonviolent crimes that's

1
2 happening. It's like talking out of both sides of
3 our face if we're not recognizing how important it is
4 for us to fund fully these afterschool programs and,
5 you know, universal afterschool would address a lot
6 of the, of the issues that we're seeing now and
7 we're, we're taking a circuitous route, we're looking
8 all over the place and, um, I think the answers are
9 right in front of our face and for us not to
10 acknowledge it and to act as if, um, that, you know,
11 afterschool is some panacea that is only, you know,
12 um, available for a few, you know, privileged young
13 people, because that's what it turns out to be, it's
14 a privilege right now to be able to participate in a
15 free afterschool program. I think we're missing the
16 mark and it has to be a part of the conversation at
17 DYCD has with, um, the administration, um, and it
18 drives back to the point that we need to know what
19 that funding is gonna look like in the early stages,
20 in the preliminary budget, so that we can really
21 have programming that's gonna meet the needs of our
22 young people. We've been joined, I'm very excited
23 about a very important guest. We have with us, um,
24 Borough President Gail Brewer, who would like to

1 testify. Um, Borough President, Council Member Chin,
2 we have some more. I'm sorry.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Sorry, Gail, you
5 just gotta wait. I don't want to let them go. I
6 have questions. [laughs] [laughter] Yeah, I really
7 want to thank our chair for her leadership. I think
8 Council Member Rose and I have been on the Youth
9 Committee since we started in the City Council, ten
10 years. In the first four years in the previous
11 administration every year was fighting the cutback.
12 I remember all the rallies and all the demonstration
13 just to save the program that we had. And in this
14 administration when it first started we were very
15 hopeful. And we do want to thank the mayor for
16 helping to expand, you know, afterschool program,
17 middle school program, SYEP. But is always has been
18 strong advocacy from the council, OK. From Council
19 Member Rose, Council Member Eugene, who chaired the
20 Youth Committee before, constantly we have to be on
21 the case to fight. And what we ask DYCD what's to
22 work with us, right, to kind of jointly see what is
23 the funding that's needed to get us there. It was
24 the same thing for the summer youth program. And we
25 made such great progress. And that's what we want to

1 do for the afterschool program, for the elementary
2 school kid, every single kid deserve a seat if they
3 want one, right? Because some parents who are more
4 well-to-do, they can send their kids to [inaudible]
5 class or whatever. But there are kids, immigrant
6 kids, low-income family kids, who needs this
7 afterschool program. I was an afterschool teacher,
8 back in the '70s, and the summer component was part
9 of it. It was afterschool and then it goes into the
10 summer. That's why we don't understand why every
11 year in this past six, no, five years. The first
12 year the mayor put the money in. I think for the
13 last two years we had to fight to put the summer
14 component back. And that, that is not right.
15
16 Meanwhile, there are waiting lists for afterschool
17 program and I don't know if DYCD keep this stat, you
18 know, the statistic, and also the coordination with
19 the Department of Education, because when principal
20 wants to do afterschool program how do they do it?
21 They don't get enough funding to do that. It's
22 pitiful that there are kids because they need the
23 program, the parents have to pay, and these are
24 immigrant parents, low-income parents. They are
25 forced to pay thousands of dollars a year for the

1
2 afterschool program and summer program because
3 there's not enough free afterschool program and
4 summer program in the school. That's a reality,
5 'cause some of the school in my district, I have
6 afterschool program but you have to pay. It's run by
7 nonprofit because the parents demand it, they need
8 it. They gotta work. They need those program. So
9 what we're asking DYCD is work with us. Let's look
10 ahead and work with the providers, how do we get
11 there? How can we increase it every year so that we
12 can get to universal, that we can meet the needs of
13 every kid. But we're not hearing that from you. I
14 mean, even Commissioner Chong, every time when we
15 have the budget hearing, right, yes, you support it.
16 But I want to hear that you are advocating with the
17 mayor that money needs to be in this budget to
18 increase the seats, right? I don't hear that, and
19 that's how we get frustrated. We want to work with
20 DYCD. And there needs to be coordination with DOE.
21 Every single elementary school. I'm not even going
22 to, you got the middle school part. But the middle
23 school part is a little bit different, right? It's
24 not five days a week. Kids kind of choose what
25 program they want to participate in, um, and it's in

1 the school, it's outside of school, and it's been
2 very successfully. I've gotten very positive
3 response, you know, feedback from the parents.
4 They're great. But let's focus on the elementary
5 school. Let's get to that point where every kid who
6 needs one, needs a seat gets it. And the providers
7 are here. I mean, they're, they're nonprofits who
8 are charging. Get them into the portfolio so that we
9 can make sure that families, you know, don't have to
10 pay thousands of dollars and they can't afford it.
11 But they have no choice, because they don't want
12 their kids to be, you know, running around the
13 streets. So how do you coordinate with DOE to make
14 sure that every single elementary school has an
15 afterschool program for every student that needs it?
16 I mean, you told, I mean, you answered Council Member
17 Kallos' question. You benefitted from afterschool
18 program, right? And I saw students of mine, right
19 now I've seen, I have a judge who was in my
20 afterschool program. I have a DA who is in, was in
21 the afterschool program, business owner. The kids
22 did well because there was an afterschool and summer
23 program for them. So how do we get there? Do you
24 guys talk about it in DYCD?
25

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Listen, we
3 talk about afterschool every single day. Every hour,
4 every single day.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But do you talk
6 about getting to a point where every kids in
7 elementary school needs it gets one?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We
9 definitely appreciate your passion and advocacy. We
10 share your dream, your vision of, of, ah, afterschool
11 for every young person who, who wants it. We are a
12 hundred percent with you in that vision. We, we'd
13 work every day to make, um, the best of afterschool,
14 to make sure it's the highest quality, to make sure
15 we're reaching as many young people as possible. We
16 are a hundred percent with you. We work very closely
17 with the Department of Education. When we do have
18 additional resources, um, we work very closely with
19 them to identify the school that, that has the least
20 and, and would benefit the most from an available
21 resource. We're in very close communication with
22 them to coordinate our resources so that we're
23 maximizing the value to young people. We, we a
24 hundred percent share your vision for afterschool.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, I want to see
3 that in this year's budget, OK? If you share our
4 vision then we want to see something, we want to see
5 concrete in the preliminary budget in this budget
6 present, so when Commissioner Chong comes to the
7 budget hearing I want to hear him talking about
8 projecting how much funding DYCD would need to get us
9 another step further. Right, Council Member Rose?

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Absolutely.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: OK, so you...

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I got her
13 back.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...bring that back
15 to the Commissioner.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Will do.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. You know, like
19 after Council Member Chin there's not very much more
20 to say. However, you can't get off that easily. Um,
21 I have a few more questions, um, Borough President.
22 Is that OK? Um, ah, the committee, we've heard from
23 the advocates that they're under-enrollment in SONYC.
24 Um, is there under-enrollment in the SONYC program?
25 What is the, um, complete budgeted number of middle

1 school afterschool slots? Um, then I have a few
2 more. Ah, no. SONYC has exceed, um, enrollment in
3 SONYC has exceeded the contracted seat, as far as I
4 can remember, in every year over the course of the
5 expansion. Um, there may be a few SONYC programs
6 that, um, that reach out for support for outreach to
7 increase their enrollment, but overwhelmingly they
8 are fully enrolled and exceeding enrollment targets.
9 Currently we are contracted for 51,000 seats and we
10 over the years have approached roughly 70,000 in
11 enrollment for those seats.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Do you have a wait
14 list for SONYC?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I think
16 that question probably varies from provider to
17 provider. The overwhelming majority of SONYC
18 programs are meeting their targets and able to meet
19 the need in the school. There are some programs that
20 are over-enrolled and, um, we're aware of some
21 programs that have a wait list. It's a, it's a small
22 percentage of the overall SONYC portfolio.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, there's a
24 separation of approximately 18,000 slots for middle
25

1 school, um, afterschool from SONYC, from the SONYC
2 program?
3

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I'm not,
5 I'm not sure what you mean by that, like the
6 separation of seats.

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So before SONYC there
8 was an afterschool program, um, that had slots,
9 approximately 18,000 slots, that are separate from
10 your SONYC 51,000. Do you still hold those
11 afterschool slots, you still have?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I would, I
13 would like to discuss this offline just to make sure
14 I understand, um, the question. I think, what I
15 think, the 18,000 rings true as the number of young
16 people who were served in middle school afterschool
17 programs prior to the middle school expansion.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Were they rolled in?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Absolutely,
20 those were rolled in and, um, SONYC is actually
21 offered five days a week after school and it's a more
22 [rust] program than it was prior to this
23 administration. But when the expansion happened all
24 of those contracts were brought up to the same price
25 and robust, um, level of service as the expansion

2 seats were. So it's one model now for all the SONYC
3 afterschool.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And what does that
5 cost? What is the cost per, per, participant?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Again that
7 varies now based on, um, provider...

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: We still have people
9 at the two different rates?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We, we
11 still have some people....

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: The 2012 rate and...

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We still
14 have, um, people at two different rates based on
15 whether or not there's an educational specialist on,
16 on board. But what I'm speaking to more is the, um,
17 adjustments that the administration, investments the
18 administration made based on like wage, wage
19 adjustments and, and now, um, indirect. They'll be a
20 varying, varying prices.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Have all of the
22 programs been told that, um, they should get an
23 educational specialist on board so that they could
24 get the, the higher rate?
25

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: It's a
3 factor of the request for proposal that they
4 responded to. So it's, if they have a contract, um,
5 in, in response to the RFP that, that it required
6 that, then they do and if not then they, um, the City
7 Council-funded programs that were baselined didn't
8 have the educational specialist as part of the
9 program model. The DYCD-funded, um, contracts had
10 that as part of their core, um, part of the model.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: How do we bring them
12 up to the, the, a comparable rate, which is \$32,
13 right, at the, the newer rate. The old rate is \$28.
14 How, you know, they responded to the previous RFP.
15 There hasn't been a new RFP. So how do we get them
16 up to the same, the same rate?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I think
18 that's a really important question. That is part of
19 the planning to go forward. In creating a new model
20 for COMPASS we'll work that out in our stakeholder
21 engagement. I think that's important.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. So we're back to
23 that timeline about this RFP and these conversations.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes.
25

1 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: That we're not, we're
2 looking to happen before 2022, yes?

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes. We're
4 planning to initiate that very soon.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. Um, is funding
6 for COMPASS NYC and SONYC reimbursable?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yes, OK. Um, funding
9 for COMPASS and SONYC collect, used to be out-of-
10 school time remained relatively steady from fiscal
11 year 18 to 20 at approximately 340 million. Yet the
12 number of participate slots decreased from 126, ah,
13 126,000 in fiscal year 18 to 122,000 in fiscal year
14 19, and a targeted 110,000 in fiscal year 20. Can
15 you explain how relatively steady funding has led to
16 fewer slots over these years and does this reduction
17 in slots improve program quality or simply serve
18 fewer youth? And, and how did you derive, um, a
19 targeted number as 110,000 for fiscal year 2020?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: In the MMR
21 our targeted seats is roughly the number of seats
22 that we're funding, the contracted number of seats
23 available is, is, is our target, um, or something
24 very close to that. We report in the MMR total
25

1 enrollment and very often our providers are able to
2 serve more than we, um, than the target, than the
3 number of funded seats we contract with. We report
4 all that enrollment in the Mayor's Management Report.
5 And, um, I think you, um, are referring to
6 comparison, did you say, 18 to 19 in the Mayor's
7 Management Report? There was a slight, um, drop,
8 still far exceeding the number of funded contracted
9 seats in COMPASS, and we, we, we think that that is
10 attributed to the fact, as I mentioned in our
11 testimony, we launched a, a brand new data system,
12 DYCD Connect. Any one of our providers is utilizing
13 this new system and there was a learning curve for
14 providers for like where they had previously been
15 using the same system for over 10 years, um, they
16 were, they were learning a new, and we think it's
17 less likely that they actually served fewer young
18 people. There was no reduction in service, no cut to
19 contracts, then that there may have been some bumps
20 in learning the new system, and we've already seen
21 and expect to see in this fiscal year, the second
22 year of the, of utilizing that new system, that those
23 numbers are back to prior levels.
24
25

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: What kind of system
3 did you put in place that they couldn't keep track of
4 the number of students that were enrolled?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Oh, no,
6 it's, it's, it's a beautiful IT system, but I'm just
7 talking about anything as simple as your login or...

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: But my question is how
9 did they lose, you know, the number of students, the
10 number of participants they had? If, you're saying
11 they were actually there, is that what you're saying?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I don't
13 know...

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: That they, they are
15 actually there but, um, we saw a decline in
16 enrollment. I'm not sure, how, how does that
17 happen, and it's a significant number? And you're
18 saying it's become of some learning curve for the
19 data collect?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: It was 3%.
21 It was a 3% dip, which still left us far above the
22 number of contracted seats for COMPASS. It wasn't a
23 significant dip, and I don't know exactly across the
24 system of 900 programs like what caused that dip. I
25 think we can, we can learn more about that in

1
2 discussions with providers. But I guess that it's
3 not an accident that that was also the year where
4 they, where they had previously, you know, you use IT
5 systems. You're using one in and you're fluent in it
6 and everything is, is perfect. You adjust to a new
7 system and it may, um, impact your, your fluency, we
8 already have seen an uptick. Is it possible that
9 they just had a dip in the number of served? That
10 seems unlikely to us, um, but we can, we're happy to
11 discuss that with you further.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: You just, we just
13 didn't account for 4000, ah, participants in, in that
14 year because of a new system. That's what you're
15 saying.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I know we
17 exceeded our targets and our contracted numbers in
18 COMPASS. Um, I don't have an affirmative reason why
19 system-wide we saw a little dip. I don't.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Then, um...

21 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: I'm
22 just, one of the things that we see when we migrate
23 systems, and, again, imagine that COMPASS, between
24 COMPASS Beacon and Cornerstone there's over 3000
25 staff that are trained in our internal systems and

1 that year during the migration we were doing the
2 trainings and, again, we, we don't have the
3 systematic investigation on this, but we would
4 imagine that some of that dip is attributed to, um,
5 the training of staff, staff getting to the sites,
6 and turning the data into the system, that that could
7 have been part of that drop-off.

8
9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, so can you tell me
10 why, um, you targeted um, ah, only 110,000
11 participants were targeted for 2020 when in 2018 we
12 were, um, we were serving 126,000?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Well, I
14 think technically speaking...

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Why are we serving
16 less?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: 110, you
18 mean, why don't we lift the target?

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: How did you, how did
20 you come to this targeted number of 110,000 versus,
21 you know, more than, we were serving more than that.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes, we
23 are, we still are.

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And in previous years
25 and when we were giving less money into the budget.

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Um, I don't
3 know if I follow that budget point, but we, we are,
4 again, to the point about whether SONYC is enrolled,
5 we have traditionally exceeded, our providers have
6 traditionally exceeded the number of contracted seats
7 in their programs. We have continued to do that,
8 even last year and the years before, and we
9 anticipate we'll continue to do that. When we're
10 setting our targets, um, you know we do look at past
11 actuals. We don't go too far beyond what we're
12 paying in contracted providers and our targets, but
13 we want to represent when they are able to serve more
14 than we give them a contract for. So we, we like to
15 include the true enrollment number, not capped at the
16 number of, um, contracted seats they have, but to
17 reflect the true number of young people who are
18 benefitting from the service.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: We're going have an
20 offline conversation.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Excellent.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, school capacity.
23 You know, how many elementary, middle school, and
24 high schools do not have DYCD-funded afterschool
25 programs?

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We have
3 some rough numbers on that. Bear with me one second.
4 Roughly speaking, there are about 1800 schools. And,
5 um, roughly speaking we are serving about 880, almost
6 900 of those schools with a city-funded afterschool
7 program. Um, approximately 550 of those are DYCD-
8 funded programs and roughly 330 of them are
9 Department of Education programs. Which leaves about
10 1000 schools without a city-funded afterschool
11 program.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, do you, um, do you
13 know how many, ah, have 21st Century, ah, grants?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Those are
15 included in the count, DOE numbers.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Those are the DOE
17 numbers?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Those are
19 administered by the Department of Education, yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. Um, and how many
21 young people are on a wait list for COMPASS NYC
22 programs, and do you know by which grade, which
23 school level, elementary, middle school, and high
24 school?
25

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: That's an
3 interesting question. We haven't in the past in the
4 past had a way to give data on the number of young
5 people who aren't able to be served in our programs.
6 We have initiated this new, um, comprehensive data
7 system, allows for the first time the public to apply
8 to a program online, and we think that that will
9 allow us to assess demand a little concretely. We've
10 been asked these questions by council, um, for many
11 years and we haven't had like a systematic way to
12 report on that. Ah, we just recently launched this
13 feature so it would be new to the, the beginning of a
14 new afterschool cycle and we're looking forward to
15 monitoring that. But right now you could go get a
16 map of the city, look at the programs closest to you,
17 identify a few that you're interested in, submit an
18 application right there on line, and follow your
19 status, whether they're responding to you to come in
20 and fill out more complete information, whether
21 you're ultimately enrolled, or whether you're put on
22 a wait list. And so we anticipate in the future to
23 have better data on, um, on those numbers by program.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And then someone is
3 going to input, um, the data that says that they've
4 been enrolled or not?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. Have you had many
7 principals, or how many principals or school
8 officials have DYCD to establish afterschool
9 programs? Do you have any, any data on that?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: I could get
11 back to you on that. We do keep track when people
12 ask, um, about programs. Yeah, we could get back to
13 you on that.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Is there any
15 coordination with your STEM, your COMPASS NYC STEM
16 program with, um, the private sector, um, and do you
17 have mentors from the private sector working with
18 these programs.

19 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: So we
20 have many STEM efforts. I think, to get to your
21 question, ah, one of the efforts that we did over
22 time, um, was we worked with the New York Academy of
23 Sciences to, um, place, ah, grad students and post
24 docs into our afterschool programs to actually train
25 our staff, but also implement the curriculum across

1 our programming. So that's everything from robotics,
2 um, there was some DNA study, I mean, um, curriculum
3 activities going on with a myriad of STEM curriculum
4 that was being implemented within our programs. We
5 also have other, um, direct initiatives that we, um,
6 fund so we have one called Lego My Lego, which is our
7 citywide robotics competition where young people are
8 trained through our partnership with the US, I mean
9 First Robotics, um, to implement a robotics
10 curriculum through the program year. Um, they create
11 robots, learn how to code, and then we bring them
12 together for the culmination at the end of the year.
13 But that's just two of our efforts.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Do we have any
16 problems and, and if so how many, um, that address
17 the needs of students with other abilities? Um, we
18 have people with different types of learning
19 abilities, um, autism, things, you know, other
20 abilities that, um, do we have any programs that work
21 with special, um, special populations?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We do. We
23 do have, we have programs that specialize in working,
24 um...

25 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Afterschool programs?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: ...children
3 with special needs, and we have programs that
4 include, um, children with special needs and work in
5 like a more integrated fashion. I'm trying to think,
6 um, Children's Aid Society, I can think off the top
7 of my head, runs a program for, um, blind young
8 people I believe.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Are they listed? Are
10 they listed in your, your database, where, you know,
11 um, a parent might be able to access those programs?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We, we have
13 search words on our programs.

14 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: We'll
15 double check.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: We're gonna
17 get back to you and double check the search words to
18 help the public find a suitable program.

19 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: One of
20 the, yeah, just adding on, one of the features of
21 Discover DYCD that a parent can go, two additions to
22 this. One, a parents can go in and create a profile,
23 so they can create a profile for the household, um,
24 multiple ages, young people in the household, from
25 the teenagers down to the elementary age young

1 person, and apply for programs based on their age and
2 also seeing what's available and what they, um, are
3 eligible for. In addition to that, um, anyone from
4 the public can search against keywords for
5 programming. So if you're looking for a photography
6 program or a GED task program you can help find that
7 by, by keyword search as well.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And I know that's up
10 and running, right?

11 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: That's
12 correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And, um, I just wanted
14 to make sure that, you know, our special populations
15 are also, that they, you know, that the information
16 is there for them to access.

17 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: So it's
18 possible to put in there. I think we want to get
19 back to you because we want to ensure that, um, the
20 providers are actually labelling it that way and
21 putting those keywords in there. I don't want to say
22 yes that it's in there and they haven't done so.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. Thank you. Um,
24 sorry, OK. You almost got away. Blame it on, blame
25 it on my council. Um [laughs], not yet. Intro 1113

1 would require reporting on afterschool programming,
2 including the demographics of students served in
3 participation data. What obstacles do you see in
4 collecting the data required by this bill? What
5 information do providers currently collect and report
6 to DYCD regarding their programs and students? And
7 is there any information that's not specified in the
8 bill that would be useful for DYCD to collect in
9 connection with its afterschool programming?
10

11 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: So I
12 believe throughout this discussion, um, you see that
13 we do share the data, the goals around data
14 transparency and access, and using data to inform
15 program. Um, we believe that the majority of what we
16 do have out in the public now fulfills the goals of
17 the bill, um, through, through our technology
18 efforts. The two efforts, one is DYCD Connect, again
19 that's the internal management system that our
20 providers are using to enroll participants, attach
21 them to activities, um, take their daily attendance
22 and, and manage their daily programming. Um, also,
23 of course, we've spoke about in length Discover DYCD
24 where the public are able to go on, apply for
25 programming, and create that profile I just

1 mentioned, um, and learn about our services and
2 identify services and apply for services, um, for
3 their household. We do see that some of the data,
4 some of the data that the bill calls for we don't
5 currently, um, collect, as far as this confidential
6 data that we don't collect. Um, and we also feel
7 that around the bill that detailing some of the site-
8 specific demographic information and information may
9 create a confidentiality, um, issue at different
10 sites, and that's something that we would love to
11 speak with you offline about.

12
13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yeah, yeah, we
14 definitely need to talk about that, um...

15 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: As we,
16 as we...

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: You see I'm frowning.

18 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: And the,
19 as we disaggregate the data by site now you know at
20 different sites the population being served and,
21 again, for public available consumption that could be
22 a confidentially issue for the groups of people who
23 we are serving at different sites. But if the
24 council, if anyone wants access to data, that's
25 something that we've been working with you guys on

1
2 offline and that we can continue that, but I would
3 love to get into details around that, um, offline.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Well, maybe that part
5 of it, um, would sort of be, um, inured into it that
6 it's not a part of the public, the public record, um,
7 but City Council would have access.

8 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: You want
9 a special login? I'm joking. No, we should speak.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. Um, is there
11 anything that you think the bill should include that
12 it did not, in terms of data that should be
13 collected?

14 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: No,
15 again, I believe that we, and what we do collect and
16 put out to the public we do fulfill the majority of,
17 I guess what the bill, the spirit of the bill is
18 calling for.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. And, um, these
20 are quick yes or no. At the prior hearing in October
21 2018 DYCD testified that it was in the beginning
22 stages of digitizing its, ah, data collection
23 systems. What's the status of the project, and how
24 has this project streamlined data and information
25

2 collection? And what is the estimated cost to fully
3 complete the project?

4 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: It's
5 not, if you're referring to our, the management
6 system we're using, DYCD Connect and...

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Discover.

8 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY:
9 ...Discovery DYCD, mission accomplished.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: It's mission
11 accomplished, OK.

12 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: Well,
13 again, we are continuously, um, innovating that,
14 those systems. For instance, Discover DYCD 2.0 was
15 just released, which now allows the profile creation,
16 the search of our programs, and then the actual
17 applying for our programs, um, within that session.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. And do you
19 collaborate with your not-for-profits on afterschool
20 program design?

21 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: Yes,
22 absolutely.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: You do?

24 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: Um,
25 through stakeholder engagement we have a series of

2 focus groups, um, meetings with providers
3 continuously to ensure that we are collecting
4 information.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Does this
6 collaboration include rates?

7 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: Yes,
8 they do.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yeah?

10 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: They do,
11 yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK. And it is, it is
13 a part of the conversations that you have in the
14 budget when you talk about the budget? It's not, you
15 just don't use the, you just don't ask them for
16 feedback about the rates, you actually then take it
17 and move it on so that it becomes a real conversation
18 [with it]?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER HASKELL: Um-hmm.

20 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: So yes,
21 ordinarily during the, the creation of a concept
22 paper or creation of an RFP that's part of the
23 process. For instance, when we went through the
24 feedback sessions for the Beacon RFP, um, where, I
25 know the history of it, at one point Beacons were

1 funded at \$400,000. During the last administration
2 they got cut down to an average of \$340,000 per
3 Beacon, which is not enough to operate a Beacon
4 program, of course. Um, this administration made a
5 huge involvement, but one through the feedback that
6 we received through community engagement and
7 engagement with the stakeholders and now on average
8 Beacons are funded at \$610,000 a year.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: All right. Thank you.
11 We're gonna, you're gonna get back to me about how
12 we're gonna equalize the, um, the two groups that are
13 getting, one's getting \$2800 per participant and the
14 other is getting \$3200, right? OK. Thank you. And
15 thank you for your, for testifying today. And thank
16 you, Borough President Brewer, for being so patient.
17 Um, the mic is now yours. And I want to mention that
18 Council Member Eugene had joined us.

19 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Thank you very
20 much.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Whenever you're ready.

22 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: DYCD is so
23 polite. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: [laughs]

25 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Ah, anyway...

1 COMMITTEE ON YOUTH SERVICES 91
2 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER RATTRAY: I was
3 raised by afterschool programs.

4 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: I can see
5 [laughter]. Anyway, thank you very much. I am Gail
6 Brewer, Manhattan Borough President, and I certainly
7 want to thank, ah, Youth Services chair, ah Deborah,
8 Debbie Rose, and certainly Council Members Chin and
9 Kallos, and everyone who has been here in the past,
10 and it is an honor to testify today. One of the
11 reasons I wanted to be here is as the borough
12 president I have to say going to the schools, this is
13 why this hearing is so important, there are two
14 requests from the principals. One for the elementary
15 schools, and this has been discussed over and over, I
16 don't have an afterschool program. It is the number
17 one request, and the second is for a social worker,
18 which is not part of this hearing, but it's something
19 that you have taken up. Afterschool, as you have
20 said, Madam Chair, and certainly others, certainly
21 Council Member Chin, is the number one request when
22 they don't have it, particularly for the Title 1
23 schools. So I really appreciate this opportunity.
24 Um, I'm always in favor, as you are, of more youth
25 programs. There should be afterschool opportunities

1
2 in every school and programs throughout our
3 neighborhoods, and I just want to add sometimes the
4 problem is there is like three days a week, and that
5 doesn't help if you work, and sometimes it's not
6 free, and then there's a scholarship, but the problem
7 is not everybody, a) there's not enough money for the
8 scholarship and then it becomes then and us, and
9 there's a very strange dynamic that takes place. So,
10 and, as you indicated, the middle school program is
11 working, because that is constantly cited. How is it
12 that the middle schools, thank you, Mr. Mayor, we do
13 appreciate that. But what about us, on elementary
14 school? And, as speaking just for myself, what it
15 does is it drives parents to the charter schools
16 which have afterschool. So for many, many reasons
17 this hearing is incredibly important. Um, I'm on the
18 same track as you are and by connecting schools and
19 programs and providing this small amount of
20 discrepancy money that we have as borough presidents,
21 we try to support the afterschool. We obviously
22 advocate for more programming. Just to give you
23 some, ah, statistics, we work with something called
24 BetaNYC, which is housed in our office. Ah, they do
25 nothing but work on data, um, and in Manhattan there

1 are about 160 providers, according to, ah, BetaNYC,
2 running about 1100 programs. But that's for young
3 people of all ages. And we all know it's not just
4 about the number of programs, but the quality.
5 Providing services is good. But ultimately long-term
6 youth development, that word is so important,
7 programming must help our youth to succeed and our
8 community thrive, and you know that already. We have
9 a rich history of research-based youth programming in
10 New York City and I'm pleased that Commissioner Chong
11 has continued it. Programs that provide caring
12 relationships and engaging activities, programs that
13 promote high expectations that offer opportunity for
14 young people to contribute and then provide
15 continuity, programs that don't focus on fixing
16 problems, but rather build on the strength of each
17 young person. These are the programs that can make a
18 lasting difference, but they have to exist in order
19 to make that lasting existence. We know how to do it
20 with initiatives like the Beacon program, born under
21 Mayor Dinkins and Youth Commissioner Richard Murphy,
22 who was my idol. It is a national model. Beacons
23 integrate programs, family preservation, health,
24 empowerment, sports, for a greater effect. Every
25

1 program we fund does not have to provide it all. But
2 we need to be able to identify gaps and bring
3 together those services, supports, and opportunities
4 that can meet the goals of our young people and help
5 them excel. An afterschool STEM program, which you
6 brought up, Madam Chair, may be a great resource for
7 some young people, but it could serve even more youth
8 and be even more effective if it's connected to
9 counseling and career advertisement and the arts.
10 I'm a big believer in STEAM, as I'm sure you are. We
11 are always concerned that a young person might drop
12 out of a program if he or she faces and life trauma,
13 and we shouldn't have to scramble to find services
14 for that young person. A good youth development
15 program will help that young person to be resilient
16 and integrated services will ensure proper
17 intervention and support, but you need services in
18 order to have all of this. We also need to remove
19 some of the barriers to providing youth programming.
20 A new initiative that allows borough presidents the
21 ability to waive some school usage fees for some
22 programs is helpful and we've been using that. But
23 all schools should be available for programming every
24 afternoon and evening, seven days a week, 32 weeks a
25

1 year. An open school building can hold several
2 programs in an evening, ultimately saving money for
3 everyone. And I just want to emphasize that we
4 talked about afterschool, but I am finding that there
5 isn't enough, ah, Saturday and Sunday, I consider
6 that afterschool, um, in the community centers, many
7 of whom providers are here today. Um, it did exist.
8 Some things happened, um, in the last, I don't know
9 if it's six years or 10 years, I don't want to get
10 into a Bloomberg versus de Blasio discussion. But
11 the fact of the matter is there used to be more
12 weekend and evening in the neighborhood, not just in
13 the school, and there's some change there. Um, I, we
14 absolutely have to have these community centers,
15 particularly those that are near NYCHA developments,
16 open on the weekends and into the evening, preferably
17 until 11:00 p.m. Um, so we want NYCHA community
18 centers and we want senior centers, if necessary, ah,
19 and libraries to be used more frequently. The hours
20 have been cut. Libraries, yes, are open, thanks to
21 you, more hours, but they need more. If a senior
22 center closes at 4 o'clock an evening youth program
23 can be placed there. I know, I know, I know.
24 Sharing space is not easy. I know teachers feel that
25

1 way. But it's not impossible, particularly when
2 programs support each other and are compatible. As
3 Richard Murphy said, and he pointed out, our youth
4 spend only a small percentage of their time in
5 school. It's an important percentage. But
6 ultimately to ensure the well-being of our young
7 people, we need to provide adequate resources and
8 quality programming for all young people during non-
9 school hours, including the weekends. This is not as
10 simple as homework help or midnight basketball. This
11 is about hiring quality staff. I want to just say
12 one thing about The Door, where I am a huge
13 supporter, as an example, to unionize staff, and it
14 is very, very long term. And when you go to ask why
15 does The Door work, yes, it has a youth component.
16 Youth are very much in charge. But the other issue
17 is long-term staff and it's unionized. So this is
18 about hiring quality staff that stay because they're
19 paid enough, offering a range of well-integrated
20 opportunities and ensuring that appropriate supports
21 are available in all of our programs. So just so you
22 know, in the Manhattan Borough President's office we
23 are analyzing the data of the programs I mentioned at
24 the beginning of my testimony and we're trying to
25

1 ensure that existing youth programming is offered at
2 the hours when it is needed the most. Um, and then
3 we'll try to fill the gaps. So I'm simply here to
4 say congratulations on the two pieces of legislation,
5 um, and, more importantly, there is something
6 desperately missing in terms of our afterschool
7 programs for the Title 1 schools that are elementary
8 and there's something desperately missing with the
9 opportunity for weekend and later into the evening
10 for our, um, community-based organizations, many of
11 which are here today. Most recently in East Harlem
12 we met because there are a high incidence in terms of
13 the COMPStat numbers for NYPD and it turns out that
14 program hours have been cut. So, and it also turns
15 out that although we have many programs for homework
16 and sports and so on, there's no central place where
17 young people can gather and be themselves, and that
18 is also a component similarly to The Door, where you
19 can have breakfast, lunch, and dinner. You can have
20 youth-centered opportunities, and you can just hang
21 out, get health services if you need it. And I think
22 that's something that we need to be looking at in
23 every single neighborhood. So thank you very much
24

1
2 for this important hearing, and it's really an honor
3 to be here, and your issues are real. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much,
5 Borough President. I wanted to ask you, you said
6 that, um, you sometimes pay a fee, you waive, ah, to
7 waive, I guess the opening fees for the school?

8 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Yep.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Um, is that fee, ah,
10 pretty, um, is it the same for each school? Does it
11 vary, um, and, and approximately what, you know,
12 what, what is that fee?

13 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: I would have
14 to get back to you. I can say that it was started to
15 the credit of the Brooklyn borough president making a
16 fuss about some of the fact, it is outrageous that
17 youth programs have to pay and they used to have to
18 pay exorbitant fees to go into the schools. But we
19 have been able, I think we've gotten a lot of calls.
20 We've been able to waive whatever that school fee
21 was, obviously working with the custodian. But I
22 could get back to you as to the exact amount. It's
23 true in all five boroughs.

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: It would be, it would
25 be helpful.

2 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Mr. Otto
3 should be using this opportunity, if he is not, and I
4 will tell him right now, Dimi Otto.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: [laughs]

6 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: You know how I
7 am.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much,
9 Borough President. Um, yeah, that, that number I
10 think would be helpful.

11 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Yeah, we'll
12 get back to you.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So I thank you. And I
14 thank you for doing that, and, and for the borough
15 presidents that, that are doing it. And I totally,
16 um, agree with you that all of the Title 1 schools,
17 ah...

18 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Elementary.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Ah, should, and our
20 community schools should be able to utilize, um, the
21 services also. So I thank you so much. Council
22 Member Kallos would like to ask you.

23 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Manhattan Borough
25 President Gail Brewer.

2 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Yes, Council
3 Member Kallos.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: What was, what
5 was your...

6 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: This is an
7 ongoing discussion and joke, just so you know.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: What was your
9 favorite afterschool program when you were a child?

10 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Oh, God, I
11 have no idea. What did I do? I can't remember. I
12 don't remember. It was too long ago. [laughter]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Let the record
14 reflect that, ah, the Borough President refused to
15 answer this question...

16 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: I did. I have
17 no idea. It was so long ago.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Can you, so can
19 you share a little bit of the structure of the
20 afterschools that you see in Manhattan, where some
21 schools are actually to able to get it for free from
22 nonprofit providers, ah, and get it through DYCD,
23 versus others where it's funded by PTA, ah, and, ah,
24 where some of them charge in the school for the
25 afterschool, can you just?

1
2 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Yeah, I mean,
3 I think, you brought up, I think the, the chair
4 brought up, the 21st Century. Well, guess what.
5 It's only a three-year program, I believe. And when
6 it ends then everybody's running around trying to get
7 money for something that is equally quality and free.
8 I mean, I've had that in like three or four schools.
9 And for some reason they weren't, ah, apprised in a
10 timely fashion. So that's an example. It's a great
11 problem. The second would be, I can't tell you how
12 many times it is, understandably, either a nonprofit
13 or a for-profit, I have to say, unfortunately, and in
14 that case, ah, as good as the services they may be
15 they often charged to the parents, even in Title 1
16 schools, I'm afraid to say, and there is
17 scholarships, but not enough and it's a very, ah,
18 them and us. Ah, so I see a lot of that. Then I
19 see, liberally, um, having to walk the young people
20 'cause there isn't an afterschool program in that
21 school, to something that's nearby, right? And it
22 doesn't work. You know, you have to figure out how,
23 who's the teacher's gonna do it, pay that teacher,
24 ah, per session, and there is, again, parents who are
25 uncomfortable with that taking place. You have

1
2 safety issues. Um, in some cases, believe it or not,
3 we have pre-K. Pre-K does not have afterschool.
4 Many of the centers that are in the neighborhood
5 can't take pre-K. Boys and girls, for instance,
6 can't take pre-K under their, ah, mandate. So
7 there's a real lack of comprehensive vision for the
8 elementary schools. It's a hodge podge. And I think
9 that's why your bills are so important. Universal
10 makes sense. Um, I get so many complaints on this
11 topic. It's, it's almost, you're calling for
12 universal afterschool. I'm saying there's a
13 universal complaint about afterschool for elementary.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Devil's argument,
15 ah devil's advocate, and I've actually already gotten
16 this question multiple times. Ah, should universal,
17 should afterschool be for all children in our public
18 school regardless of socioeconomic status, ah, or
19 should children from families that can quote unquote
20 afford it, ah, be, have to pay a fee, or should it be
21 just universal?

22 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: I mean, I
23 would model, I hope I'm correct on this, in the
24 middle school. Middle school, as I understand it, is
25 Title 1. Everybody in a Title 1 school has an

1
2 afterschool program. At least start with that for
3 the elementary. I have, I have Title 1 schools with
4 no afterschool program or one or two days a week.
5 That doesn't work. So that, I think that's where I
6 would start.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much,
9 Borough President.

10 BOROUGH PRESIDENT BREWER: Thank you very
11 much.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: As always, very
13 insightful. Um, so now the moment we've been waiting
14 for. Um, we will have, um, why do you have me
15 reading this things? [laughs] The next panel will be
16 Erica Mason from CHLDC, Robert Abbot, Cypress Hills
17 LDC, um, Tarilyn Little from Expanded Schools, Mary
18 Chang from CPC, ah, Readers, Ready Readers, I'm
19 sorry. And Debra Sue Lorenzen from St. Nick's
20 Alliance. Christie Hodgkins from CAMBA. Wow. Do we
21 have enough chairs? You might have to squeeze in,
22 get a little close. When you're ready, please
23 identify yourself.

24 DEBRA SUE LORENZEN: Not on, am I on?

25 Hi, I'm Debra Sue Lorenzen at St. Nick's Alliance,

1 and we are the largest youth services provider in
2 north Brooklyn. Thank you for all you've done to
3 support the youth services field in New York City.
4 It's been extraordinary to be part of this world for
5 the last, long time, let's just say. Um, you know,
6 and also thank you for the opportunity to testify on
7 behalf...

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: I just want to say,
10 we're gonna try to give everybody three minutes.

11 DEBRA SUE LORENZEN: OK.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: So if you could like
13 really hold tight to it. We have 26 people, OK.

14 DEBRA SUE LORENZEN: You got it, thank
15 you. Um, we're here as a community to testify that
16 the COMPASS afterschool centers are a critical part
17 of the solution to help every child achieve their
18 academic potential, beginning with reading at grade
19 level. St. Nick's Alliance and my colleagues here,
20 who'll be speaking about the Ready Readers program,
21 have designed literacy models that are specifically
22 for the afterschool space that are allowing our
23 afterschool children to succeed at a very high level.
24 For example, at St. Nick's Alliance 63% of the
25 children in afterschool are reading at grade level,

1 compared to 42% of their peers at the same schools.

2 I'm going to pass the mic on to CAMBA.

3
4 CHRISTIE HODGKINS: Hi, I'm Christie
5 Hodgkins, senior vice president for education and
6 youth development at CAMBA, and together with
7 expanded schools, CPC, and, ah, Cypress Hills, ah, we
8 have been in a collaborative since about 2014 with
9 our Ready Readers Initiative. And, um, this is a
10 literacy enrichment model that was designed to
11 enhance reading engagement and excitement about
12 reading and higher order, ah, reading comprehension
13 skills, primarily for kindergarten through third
14 graders, and that was in alignment with, um, the
15 city's initiative of having every kid on grade level
16 in terms of reading by third grade. And, um, we have
17 further developed a model for fourth and fifth
18 graders, which we call Rising Readers, um, and that
19 was really born out of one, the kids being very
20 excited and wanting to continue with the literacy,
21 ah, with the literacy enrichment, and just briefly to
22 say that, um, last year we had close to 2000 children
23 participating across our collaborative and that 56%
24 demonstrated growth at a pace that exceeded the
25 expectations for their grade level. Um, which is

1
2 very, very exciting. I'm turning it over to you,
3 Tarilyn.

4 TARILYN LITTLE: Hi, good afternoon. My
5 name is Tarilyn Little. I'm the early literacy
6 manager with Expanded Schools. Um, before I talk a
7 little bit about, um, a little bit more about our
8 program, I just wanted to share from a personal
9 experience I myself am a native New Yorker from
10 Jamaica, Queens, born and raised, um, and have
11 experienced the afterschool programming from really
12 all different lenses that you can as a participant
13 going to afterschool from the ages of 5, um, in my
14 native Queens, um, at 14. It was my first job, when
15 I got my little green working paper slips, um, back
16 in the day, um, and really built my career up through
17 the afterschool space before becoming a classroom
18 teacher and then returning to the afterschool space
19 as a program developer and training, um, and so I've
20 had a chance to really witness the power of
21 afterschool as a participant, as an employee, um, and
22 as a classroom teacher being able to see what the
23 afterschool programs provided to my students, that
24 they weren't necessarily getting during the day. Um,
25 so wholeheartedly believe in the power of

1
2 afterschool, having experienced it from all those
3 different lenses. Um, like St. Nick, our Ready and
4 Rising Readers collaborative, um, really believes
5 that afterschool is a powerful space for all
6 students, but especially for literacy enrichment,
7 which we know is important, not only for their
8 success in school, but also life and what I also
9 believe is a social justice issue for our students as
10 well. Um, and so with that in mind our Ready and
11 Rising Readers programs really focus on training
12 community educators who work at community-based
13 organization and bringing literacy enrichment
14 programs to students that are joyful, that are
15 meaningful, um, and not only supports the skills that
16 they are learning during the school day, but also
17 take advantage of what's unique about the afterschool
18 space. And so with Ready Readers, which, um, targets
19 our kindergarten through third grade students,
20 they're engaging in meaningful interactive read-aloud
21 programs where they are learning new vocabulary.
22 They are having discussions and interactions with
23 their peers using comprehension questions, um, and
24 after each book also engage in an activity, um, that
25 really helps them extend the learning of the book and

1 so that might be an arts-based activity. It might be
2 performing. It might be STEM. But they're engaging
3 in a creative activity to extend learning. Um, and
4 then with Rising Readers those are student-led
5 choice-based literature circles for our fourth and
6 fifth grade students. So that's really the pipeline
7 or the next step of what are students in getting in K
8 through third. Um, and just to close up, through
9 these programs we are really seeing that not only are
10 we supporting their literacy skills that they're
11 learning during the school day, but these programs
12 also support positive identity development. They're
13 supporting culture competence. They're supporting
14 social and emotional learning. Um, and we focus our
15 book selection on this concept of mirrors and windows
16 and really students seeing themselves through
17 literature and also learning about the world as
18 they're developing their literacy skills, um, and I'm
19 going to turn it over to some of my colleagues to
20 talk about what the impact has been, but wanted to
21 share the experience we're trying to craft for
22 students and why we think that's so important across
23 New York City. And thank you for letting me share.
24
25

1 Thank you, good afternoon. I'm Erica
2
3 Mason from Cypress Hills Local Development
4 Corporation.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Turn your microphone
6 on please.

7 ERICA MASON: Oh. I'm Erica Mason from
8 Cypress Hills Local Development Corporation, and I'm
9 following Tarilyn's testimony because one of our
10 pillars for Ready Readers and Rising Readers is
11 professional development for our staff. And, um,
12 every year we have our staff fill out a survey at the
13 end of the year to give them time to reflect on the
14 experiences of the students as well as their own
15 experiences. I'm going to read a couple quotes that
16 I have from those surveys so we could get a good
17 picture on what our students and staff experience in
18 the literacy programming. So Kavon reported that,
19 um, I learned that there is more to books than words
20 and pictures. I like reading a lot more myself than
21 I did when I was in school. I'm proud that my
22 students are actually receiving life tools while
23 reading and growing into themselves. My students
24 have a plethora of new words as well as their
25 meanings that they're able to use properly in their

1 own writing pieces. Karen reported that she is proud
2 to say that after homework help some students will
3 grab a book and start reading. They'll hold the book
4 up as I do and read the pictures to their classmates.
5 They get excited when I say it's Ready Readers time.
6 Ah, Ashley stated that showing the kids the
7 importance of reading books has made me read more in
8 my own free time. Kids have learned to use the
9 vocabulary we taught them in Ready Readers and
10 learned to like reading and appreciate the fun in it.
11 And Teddy said students have learned more about
12 diversity and differences in people from the books we
13 read in Ready Readers. I believe they've grown to
14 understand that not everyone has to look the same to
15 be friends. And finally, um, Hassa reported that my
16 students have learned many more vocabulary words. I
17 focused on the themes of kindness and respect, and
18 I'm proud that they've taken what they've learned and
19 shown it within their very own classroom. So the
20 experiences for the students as well as the staff
21 have been very impactful in this approach to literacy
22 programming.

24 MARY CHANG: Thank you, Chair Deborah L.
25 Rose and members of City Council for the opportunity

1 to testify today. I'm Mary Chang, director of
2 childhood development services at CPC, Chinese
3 American Planning Council. Um, Chinese American
4 Planning Council's childhood development services
5 believes that all children, their families, and
6 society benefits from a high-quality childhood
7 programming and that there is a critical link between
8 a child's early experience and later life success.
9 I'm one of those success. I went through afterschool
10 at CPC, came back, taught, continued to serve in CPC,
11 and I want to provide those same enrichment and
12 empowerment activities for my children and for all
13 the children in the community that we service. Um,
14 so I'm grateful to testify on the issues that impact
15 individual families and the children that we serve,
16 and grateful for the council for their leadership on
17 these issues. We believe that universal afterschool
18 is needed to promote educational equity and access,
19 and to ensure the children's safety. Because the
20 city relies on community organizations to deliver
21 these afterschool programs we hope that the city will
22 fully fund the universal afterschool contracts. The
23 city should develop a price per participant that
24 ensures program quality, includes living wage for
25

1 staff, and supports professional development,
2 professional being key in this matter, and I think
3 that's why Ready Readers has been so successful in
4 terms of it, and also indirect expenses. A robust
5 program ensures that children and families will have
6 equality and culturally competent program. One key
7 example is the Ready Readers program. Um, as
8 collaborates since 2015 on the program, this cohort
9 between Expanded Schools, Cypress Hills LDC, and
10 CAMBA funded by Brooke Astor Grant of New York
11 Community Trust. We are asking that the New York
12 City Council urge DYCD and the mayor's office to
13 continue to fund literacy model, and next COMPASS and
14 SONYC RFP. Ready Readers is a proven model and that
15 could be replicated through the next, um, RFP.
16 Overall, Ready Readers has increased student
17 acquisition of reading comprehension skills necessary
18 to succeed in later grade through the integration of
19 reading, writing, and speaking, and listening in the
20 structures, ah, that develops an understanding of big
21 ideas and ensures times for practice in the
22 afterschool setting, making it very, um, effective in
23 terms of that. As well as it's become a high
24 potential for pathway for retention rate for the
25

1
2 staff. Um, we've had teaching, teaching staff who
3 have now gone into the field of teaching to give back
4 to the community as well. So we're really proud of
5 that, um, and so 97% of the educators have increased
6 their confident, um, delivering reading comprehension
7 instruction over the year. And we have 73% who are
8 indicating that they would like to stay in the field
9 of childhood education, within this field. So, we
10 hope that you can continue your progress and pray for
11 this. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. Thank you
13 all. Um, do you have any suggestions for how DYCD
14 could better, could better support as providers? Um,
15 and if you...

16 ROB ABBOT: Maybe I could speak to that
17 [inaudible].

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Oh, I'm sorry.

19 ROB ABBOT: I, it's...

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: I am so sorry.

21 ROB ABBOT: It segues well. Your
22 question segues well with my testimony.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: [laughs]

24 ROB ABBOT: So I'll [teach] a little bit
25 of that. Ah, good morning. I'm Rob Abbot. I work

1 at Cypress Hills Local Development Corporation.
2 We're a multi-services organization, serving Cypress
3 Hills in East New York, Brooklyn. We provide,
4 providing afterschool programs since 1988, ah, and
5 currently have 1700, ah, seats in programs in
6 partnership with 12 community school districts, 19
7 schools. Ah, thank you, Chairperson Rose, and the
8 Youth Services Committee for the opportunity to
9 speak. Um, Cypress Hills is in full support of
10 greater access to afterschool programs. Our
11 elementary programs, in particular, always on waiting
12 lists. We believe school-age childcare should be a
13 right. But what I'm here to highlight is the current
14 crisis precipitated by the regulators of licensed
15 school-age childcare and the lessons that crisis can
16 provide for those in government and its partners who
17 care about safe, high-quality, and accessible school-
18 age childcare. Um, in August of this year we became
19 aware of the Dear Provider letter, um, from OCSF
20 detailing the overhaul of the clearance system for
21 staff of SAC programs. We held nine licenses and did
22 not receive that letter directly for any of those
23 licenses. Um, we comply with state regs with a one-
24 week turnaround. To date we have not received a
25

1 clearance letter for one, none, ah, no new staff
2 person hired since September 25. We have almost 50
3 pending staff people and 300 children waiting for
4 childcare. We have heard about a 45-day turnaround
5 promised on staff clearances. We are up to 100 days
6 and counting. While DOHMH has been building their
7 capacity to implement this new system, they have sent
8 inspectors out to conduct inspections, including
9 proof of clearance. Carrying violations on licenses
10 can interfere with reimbursement on government
11 contracts and just adds to the already heavy burden
12 on nonprofit organizations. Attrition among
13 afterschool staff is not just season to season. It's
14 within season. Many of our staff are college
15 students whose schedules change in the middle of
16 year. Hemorrhaging of staff cannot be stemmed by
17 replacements when the clearance system is in
18 gridlock. Every week the gridlock continues and
19 continues now. This is ongoing. Children in SAC
20 programs are less safe. As the afterschool system in
21 New York City has grown providers have not seen
22 evidence the system to support it, including DOHMH,
23 have grown with it. Licensees have experienced DOHMH
24 as often inefficient, uncooperative, and reactive.
25

1
2 The current crisis is an acute system of the chronic
3 issue of lack of [inaudible] integration that puts
4 providers in a bind and makes SAC programs less
5 accessible to families. This issue needs attention
6 now and as the system grows. I'd also like to point
7 out that the summer component of SAC programs rely on
8 summer youth employees and the summer youth
9 employment program for the influx of staff necessary
10 to be able to take children on field trips, to
11 playgrounds and parks, and swimming. This is a
12 budgetary necessity and also provides thousands of
13 SYPs with meaningful employment. With thousands of
14 school-age, of school-age childcare staff currently
15 waiting clearance there's a second crisis looming,
16 affecting more systems that serve New York City young
17 people. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much.

19 RON ABBOT: You're very welcome.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: It bothers me to hear
21 that any programming is, ah, being impeded by
22 bureaucratic, um, inefficiencies. Um, I'll be nice.
23 Ah, it is a, it's a federal regulation that came down
24 and it is being, um, monitored by DOH.

1
2 RON ABBOT: Yes, ma'am. It's for a law
3 passed in 2014, um, that New York State didn't
4 implement, um, and then obviously, lots of things
5 clearly happened. Um, I think our point is that the
6 impact of dealing with kind of how that went down
7 between 2014 and then an automatic turnaround, that
8 DOHMH is not even yet, as of today, prepared to
9 address, right. We literally have gotten not one
10 clearance letter. Um, the impact is on providers and
11 children and families, and that's the reality we're
12 dealing with right now.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yes. I, I appreciate
14 your concern and, um, and, ah, while I have no
15 oversight over that, I am willing as the chair to
16 write a letter...

17 RON ABBOT: Thank you so much.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: ...just to express, you
19 know, our concern and our displeasure in, in this,
20 ah...

21 RON ABBOT: Thank you so much.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: ...really inefficient,
23 um, whatever, oh, I am so good. I already wrote a
24 letter to the Commissioner. [laughter]

25 RON ABBOT: Thank you, Chairperson.

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you very much.
3 Wow. How's that for a government response?

4 RON ABBOT: That is, that is a good
5 response.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: That's pretty good.
7 OK. Thank you. OK, and the chair, and I've been
8 informed that the chair of our health committee has
9 also met with the DOH.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So I want to jump
11 in. Ah, I'm, I'm the, in addition to being a sponsor
12 of this bill with Youth Services Chair Rose, I'm also
13 the Contracts chair. So relating to a lot of the
14 concerns that have been brought up, you already have
15 a commitment from me to, it's actually really easy
16 when you're working with Debbie Rose, ah, to work
17 with our Youth Services chair to support you and so,
18 ah, outside of this hearing we'll continue to work
19 with folks and with your coalition to make sure folks
20 are getting paid on time and that the indirect rates
21 are being respected and will work. I just had a, a
22 quick question across the board, ah, just in terms of
23 what your current capacity is and, ah, what your
24 capacity to scale might be given the already rapid
25 expansion of middle school and so as we try to figure

1
2 out how to phase it in, what do you think the right
3 phase-in would be and over what time, if we are
4 successful?

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Are you speaking about
6 universal afterschool?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Ah, yes, so in
8 terms of prioritizing elementary, the borough
9 president mentioned prioritizing Title 1. But I
10 think one of the questions that DYCD asked was about,
11 ah, provider capacity and they kind of pointed,
12 pointed towards your group, so this is I think a
13 question I'd like to just ask of everyone of just
14 where you currently are, ah, and where you, where you
15 feasibly could be, especially if you knew that there
16 was going to be continued funding, not just like
17 here's some money, do all of it without getting paid
18 more.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: So, um, I like that getting
20 paid more component. I do believe that the next RFP
21 that comes out from DYCD needs to take into account,
22 um, the need to, ah, provide enhanced staff
23 development for all of our youth workers to build
24 capacity within the field. I think that's a really
25 critical component of any kind of expansion. With

1
2 the SONYC expansion, um, and even with the expanded
3 number of slots, all of that translates to a need
4 for, um, more youth workers, um, and it's a low-wage
5 job, it is minimum wage to \$15 to \$18 an hour, and,
6 um, one of the ways that we can foster retainment is
7 really giving, creating pipelines and pathways for
8 career development, um, and creating a more enriching
9 experience for them as they grow in their young
10 adulthood.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: I would just add, um, you
12 know, providers capacity is directly related to, um,
13 you know what the health of the other systems that
14 are out there. So Rob has talked about the
15 challenges with the background check clearances with
16 OCSF. Um, you know, there's also a lot of delay and
17 run-around with the Department of Education's [pets]
18 clearance. Ah, I don't know if you're aware that
19 these minimum-wage employees, um, college students,
20 some high school students, have to be fingerprinted
21 and fully cleared by the Department of Health, ah,
22 OCSF, and also the Department of Education, which if
23 you've read in the news recently, um, they've
24 acknowledged a huge back, ah, log in, in the
25 clearances that they need, ah, to do. So I think

1 that, you know, I think we all support universal
2 afterschool, but there needs to be a real stepping up
3 in the systems that support us in being able to go
4 into schools. Because we can't bring children on
5 board if we have staff who are not fully cleared to
6 work, to work with them.

8 ROB ABBOT: I would just add that, you
9 know, um, Council Member Kallos, that, ah, your bill
10 address, we would, ah, also agree, a real issue. We
11 are absolutely, um, struggling, um, continually with
12 waiting lists, ah, elementary school afterschool, um,
13 and hearing from principals who don't hear from
14 afterschool. A phenomenon that we are aware of is
15 principals who are desperate for afterschool 'cause
16 parents go elsewhere, ah, to programs where there are
17 afterschool programs. Um, so there, these challenges
18 are real, um, but the, um, the need is real and as a
19 sector, ah, we would absolutely work with the city to
20 expand afterschool.

21 MARY CHANG: Yeah, at CPC we actually
22 have 11 sites open in three boroughs. Six of those
23 are COMPASS sites and five of those are actually fee,
24 a really small nominal fee, for service sites. Um,
25 and that was due to the district borough office

1
2 telling us that, you know, they wanted more service
3 for their children, principals reaching out to us,
4 because there was not that same service afterschool
5 quality care. And so at CPC we've taken on those
6 costs of it, a bulk of the cost of it, just to make
7 sure that we serve all children. Ah, so we want to
8 ensure that those, even the nominal fee programs,
9 that we have quality that's sustainable across the
10 board and not just, not just because we're a COMPASS
11 program, we provide more, but we want to see that, we
12 want to be where agencies, CBOs, can also take on
13 that cost of servicing, so that indirect fee is
14 really important to us in terms of that, to have that
15 capacity-building as well, and as well as also the
16 staff retention, also the background checks, and
17 those talks in between regulators, ah, sorry,
18 agencies that needs to be there.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you all.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And our next panel.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, next panel. Gregory
24 Brender, United Neighborhood House. Robert Cordero,
25 Grand Street Settlement. Marie Choi, YMCA of Greater

2 New York. Annie Minguez, Good Shepherd Services.

3 Faith Behum, UJA Federation of New York. And Avidum

4 Bellow, CPRC.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yes, as soon as, you,
7 um, you're settled, identify yourself and your
8 organization, and have at it.

9 GREGORY BRENDER: I am Gregory Brender
10 from United Neighborhood Houses. Thank you, Council
11 Member Rose, Council Member Kallos for all your
12 leadership on this issue and the opportunity to
13 transfer. United Neighborhood Houses is a policy...

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Could you pull your
15 mic a little closer, Gregory?

16 GREGORY BRENDER: Sure.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you.

18 GREGORY BRENDER: Ah, better? Cool. Ah,
19 United Neighborhood Houses is a policy and social
20 change organization comprising 43 settlement houses,
21 um, in New York City and upstate. We are long-time
22 proponents of universal access to afterschool and a
23 part of Campaign for Children, which has been working
24 for years, ah, to ensure access to high-quality,
25 stable systems of early childhood education and

1
2 afterschool for every child in New York City, and we
3 really appreciated the opportunity to work with the
4 City Council and with DYCD, ah, to expand access to
5 afterschool. Ah, we do support moving to universal
6 and really recognize the need. We hear every day
7 from providers who have wait lists from schools who
8 are reaching out to their CBO partners, saying we
9 want you to come to another school. We want you to
10 expand in our school. And so we see the need, but we
11 do believe that there's a need for certain steps to
12 make sure that we actually have the infrastructure in
13 place to ensure that providers can offer high-quality
14 programs. Ah, the first and most important step, and
15 it's one that's really addressing a crisis, is to
16 design a system to quickly process background checks
17 for the staff coming into afterschool programs. Um,
18 afterschool providers and advocates, we jointly
19 support stringent checks to make sure that everyone
20 who has access to children, be they a staff member or
21 volunteer, um, is checked in the most comprehensive
22 way possible, and we depend on our partners in
23 government to have systems in place to make sure that
24 that can happen. Um, we need that system to be
25 working in place to clear the backlog of staff

1 members who are waiting to work in afterschool
2 programs, who are waiting to serve children,
3 sometimes doing administrative working, sometimes
4 just starting to wait, to start their jobs, so that
5 these programs can get going and can start providing
6 the needed and quality services, um, that they are
7 actually being paid by the city to do. Um, we also,
8 ah, want to ensure that the rates are both adequate
9 and equitable. Ah, we appreciate you bringing up the
10 difference between the programs funded at \$3200 and
11 \$2800 in the COMPASS programs. And we appreciate
12 hearing that there's going to be the beginning of a
13 process that seems like it will go on until past the
14 end of this administration, ah, for [inaudible] the
15 RFPs. Um, we really hope that DYCD, MOCS, other
16 parts of the administration work closely with
17 providers, both to determine, ah, what are the needs
18 of the communities, because providers who are working
19 every day in the communities know what they are, and
20 what are the rates that are actually going to cover
21 those costs. Um, we also want to make sure that, ah,
22 the rates cover, ah, disparate funding levels and
23 increases the [inaudible] in minimum wage and other
24 increases, um, including thresholds for overtime
25

1
2 exemptions. Um, we hope that this can be a
3 collaborative process, um, and that the input of
4 providers, the input of community members, is taking
5 place and thank you again. It sounds like my time is
6 up. But, again, we appreciate all of your leadership
7 and the opportunity to work with the council on these
8 important issues.

9 ANNIE MINGUEZ: Hi, thank you so much for
10 allowing us to testify on the oversight hearing and
11 also for your leadership, Council Member Rose and
12 also Council Member Kallos. Thank you so much for,
13 um, not only introducing these bills in conjunction
14 with chair, but also for inviting providers to join
15 you in conversation about, ah, the bill. I will
16 submit my full testimony for the record. Um, I want
17 to just reiterate that a lot of the comments made by
18 Gregory Brender of UNH are those of Good Shepherd.
19 You know, Good Shepherd opened its first afterschool
20 program in Red Hook...

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Did you state your
22 name?

23 ANNIE ELISA MINGUEZ GARCIA: Oh, Annie
24 Elisa Miguez Garcia, ah, the director of government
25 and community relations for Good Shepherd Services,

1 and Good Shepherd Services opened its first
2 afterschool program in Red Hook in 1991. And since
3 then we've been expanding programs throughout the
4 Bronx and Brooklyn. We currently serve 3000 children
5 annually. And we, we focus, you know, like one of
6 the things that you've heard today is on our
7 approaches and our encouraging, encouragement of
8 young people, and that's really important, at the
9 core of everything that we do. So we're excited
10 that, um, these bills have been introduced and that
11 the council is talking about elementary universal
12 afterschool. It is something as a member of the
13 steering committee of the Campaign for Children we
14 fully support and we want to ensure that there's a
15 partnership with us as these conversations continue
16 and so I was glad to hear you, Chair, say that you
17 would like to be in conversations with DYCD as they
18 look at this. Um, in my testimony I outlined a lot
19 of things, but I just want to make sure to say, um,
20 that, again, the sector has been forced to advocate
21 on an annual basis for the inclusion of funding to
22 support SONYC summer programming in the adopted
23 budget. Any bill referencing universal access needs
24 to include a summer component. Any commitment from
25

1
2 the administration to work with providers to support
3 the work force needs, including the clearances that
4 we've been talking about today. It's also critical
5 that the council continue to partner with the
6 administration to develop an implementation plan that
7 includes lessons learned from the SONYC expansion and
8 that any new slots are adequately funded. High
9 school afterschool, I just want to say, Good Shepherd
10 runs four afterschool programs for high school
11 students. We look forward to working with the
12 council to develop a strategy for real investments to
13 increase programming to high school students. There
14 is a need and we're ready to fill that need. Um,
15 I'll leave that, then. Thank you so much. Willing
16 to answer any questions.

17 ROBERT CORDERO: OK, thank you. Robert
18 Cordero, executive director of Grand Street
19 Settlement. Thank you, Chair Rose and the committee.
20 I wanted to give a special shout-out to Council
21 Member Chin, we're in her home district, and, and,
22 um, and for Chair Kallos for his leadership on this,
23 ah, on this potential legislation. Ah, Grand Street
24 Settlement was established in 1916. We've been
25 providing youth services for over 103 years. So we

1 have something to say on this topic. Grand Street
2 supports, fully supports, efforts to implement
3 universal afterschool in New York City. As one of
4 the leading providers of afterschool programs in New
5 York, we know that quality afterschool programs are
6 one of the best ways to support working families, and
7 that these programs can equip students and their
8 families to step out of poverty and into opportunity.
9 Grand Street currently serves over 4500 students and
10 their families in our afterschool programs at 26
11 sites across lower Manhattan and Brooklyn. This
12 includes eight SONYC programs, two COMPASS programs,
13 and nine DYCD-funded Cornerstone Community Centers.
14 We've provided over 3000 hours of out of school
15 afterschool learning to these young people in the
16 last year. Our afterschool programs are designed to
17 support the goal of closing the opportunity and
18 achievement gaps between children in our communities
19 that we serve and their more affluent peers. Our
20 model has been developed and refined and through
21 decades of experience and is founded in evidence-
22 based and evidence-informed practices. Grand Street
23 offers our young people a safe, healthy, and
24 nurturing environment through which they can explore
25

1 a wide variety of experiences not otherwise available
2 to them, including science, technology, engineering,
3 arts, and math. 77% of our afterschool participants
4 reported that our afterschool program made them more
5 interested and engaged in STEM and STEAM topics. As
6 the City Council debates universal afterschool, here
7 are our recommendations. We fully support the United
8 Neighborhood Houses and Campaign for Children's
9 priorities. And in addition we want to expand as a
10 community-based provider to give a little bit more
11 perspective. If we do this, fully fund the programs.
12 We have to fund raise to cover the subsidy and the
13 gap when these programs are covered on a government
14 contract in order to fully support the costs. Don't
15 build a system on the backs of community service
16 providers who struggle with unfunded mandates and
17 late payments and delays due to bureaucratic snafus
18 like clearances. Focus on the areas of highest need.
19 I'm happy to hear DYCD say that earlier their
20 leadership, schools and districts in New York City
21 are not equal. Look holistically at the community
22 resources that are already in place, like PTAs, or
23 lacking, and build resources in the communities where
24 they are most needed, like in Brownsville, Brooklyn.
25

1
2 Final two, coordinate these resources, federal, city,
3 state, and private, and please allow flexibility at
4 the community level. Afterschool programs can have
5 their biggest impact if they're given the flexibility
6 to meet basic needs and build programs from there.
7 Thank you for the opportunity.

8 AVIO DUMBELO: Good morning. My name is
9 Avio Dumbelo. I'm the executive director of
10 [inaudible]. But I'm here today to support the, in
11 favor of the afterschool program. Ah, my son is, is
12 a senior attending RIC and I have two daughters who
13 graduated from New York City public school. As a
14 parent who was intimately involved in New York City
15 public education system for 20 years, I understand
16 the [inaudible] of parental involvement in educating
17 their children. I was a [inaudible] in my children's
18 education, becoming the president of the Community
19 Educational Council in District 32 for six years.
20 And also I was the treasurer on City Council of High
21 School in 2010 to 2011. I'm in favor of the
22 universal afterschool program, which mandate for an
23 afterschool program slot for any student who request
24 one. This is a good news. There is no doubt that
25 afterschool program, if properly planned and

1 administered, would be vital in helping our children
2 to succeed in reaching their goals. The first step
3 in ensuring the success of this program must be
4 adequately researched to identify practical solutions
5 that will best serve our diverse communities.

6 Specifically, focus group of the most successful
7 members of the respective [inaudible] community must
8 be conducted to weigh the solutions. It can inspire
9 and transform the life of our childrens. We need
10 those solutions that will best help to level the
11 playing field for our childrens. Additionally, we
12 must recognize that there is no one size fit fall
13 approach that can work for the diverse communities.

14 Therefore, program designed for black and browns
15 community must be structured to effective positive
16 result in those communities. Program that includes
17 further educations are essential for high school
18 student, including mechanical, electrical, and other
19 skills that the student can market directly to the
20 publics. These skills will undoubtedly build
21 confidence. Other results is trading a skill which
22 contribute real life value, include book clubs,
23 writing contests, debating, and homework help. We
24 must help our children to grow with our evolving
25

1
2 economy with [inaudible] training and skill. We must
3 prepare them to at least have the option to become
4 entrepreneur. We have to design a program so that
5 the kids also in future have something to look at in
6 future. In short, our children need a source of
7 inspirations and motivations, and to help ensure that
8 they do not submit to hopelessness. Finally, any
9 investment we make in our children is an investment
10 in our respective community that help to rebuild our
11 middle class. Thank you.

12 MARIE CHOI: Hi, my name is Marie Choi.
13 I'm the director of middle school and community
14 programming for the YMCA of Greater New York. Thank
15 you, Chair Rose and the Youth Services Committee
16 members for the opportunity to testify on DYCD's
17 COMPASS and SONYC programs, the reporting bill of
18 existing afterschool programs and the universal
19 afterschool bill. I want to thank the council for
20 being zealous advocates for youth services by
21 securing 4000 new COMPASS slots in last year's
22 adopted budget. We need this zealous advocacy to
23 continue as we call the administration to issue a new
24 COMPASS and SONYC RFP. The COMPASS program is
25 currently a two-tier, two-tier per participant rate

1 system, one cohort of nearly 200 programs contracted
2 at a rate of \$2800 and the other cohort of
3 approximately 125 sites contracted at a rate of
4 \$3200. The COMPASS sites at the lower rate are not
5 required to have an education specialist, whereas the
6 other one are requested to have one for at least nine
7 hours a week. And we know that education specialists
8 are essential for quality afterschool programs. They
9 align afterschool lesson plans to school day learning
10 and are often certified educators. These two tiers
11 need to align to receive substantially more in
12 funding to provide the high-quality services that our
13 city's children deserve. Consider the fact that the
14 \$3200 cohort contracted, contracts, were executed in
15 2012, where the average salary for a site director
16 was \$45,000, and frontline staff earned about \$11.50
17 per hour. Um, the SONYC is also comprised of two
18 tiers of services offered, one cohort of
19 approximately 80 middle school programs that have
20 dedicated summer camp slots and the other of 400
21 middle school programs without dedicated summer camp
22 slots. Thank you to the council, a large number of
23 these SONYC programs summer program slots have been
24 restored year to year. However, this year to year

1 funding is not best practice, as providers cannot
2 properly promote and plan summer camp programs when
3 funding is announced in June. A barrier to assessing
4 afterschool and summer camp is the availability of
5 these services. When possible the Y works with PTAs
6 to operate fee-based Y afterschool, such as PS-228 in
7 Jackson Heights and in other instances we manage to
8 operate Y afterschool programs with funding from the
9 council's Afterschool Enrichment Initiative, such as
10 PS-33 in Chelsea. This remedy is only a Band-Aid and
11 it is not sustainable as operation costs increase. A
12 more sound and sustainable solution would be to
13 expand COMPASS and SONYC site lists. Another
14 pressing issue that the sector is facing is the new
15 OCSF clearance process for all SAC-licensed programs.
16 Effective September 25, 2019, all new staff are
17 required to complete additional federal background
18 checks prior to beginning employment in our
19 afterschool programs. Just to wrap it up, this
20 process has completely slowed down our hiring of
21 staff. In the 70 Y afterschool programs we have
22 submitted over 250 staff for clearance and we have
23 received only 30. This has severely impacted the
24 scope of our services across New York City. We
25

1
2 currently have over 500 children citywide on the
3 city, on a wait list as a result of this backlog.

4 Thank you for letting us testify, and just like my
5 colleagues here we also, the YMCA also supports the
6 spirit of both pieces of legislation.

7 FAITH BEHUM: Good afternoon, Chairperson
8 Rose, Council Member Kallos. My name is Faith Behum.
9 I'm an advocacy and policy advisor at UJA Federation
10 of New York. Established more than a hundred years
11 ago, UJA is one of the nation's largest local
12 philanthropies. UJA supports a network of nearly 100
13 nonprofit organizations, serving those that are most
14 vulnerable and in need of programs and services. Our
15 network of nonprofit partners oversee COMPASS and
16 SONYC school year and summer programs throughout the
17 five boroughs. As a member of the steering committee
18 of the Campaign for Children, UJA has advocated to
19 increase access to high-quality afterschool and
20 summer programs for children and youth across the
21 city. Recognizing the need for universal afterschool
22 and summer programs, we also acknowledge expansion of
23 these programs must be done in a way that assists
24 providers and rectifies current issues with the
25 system. So a lot of the issues I'm gonna talk about

1 I'm gonna to be echoing my, my colleagues here. Um,
2 but first and foremost rates, um, for COMPASS and
3 SONYC programs, ah, providers receive to manage the
4 programs must be improved before universal
5 afterschool programs are initiated. Current rates
6 included in COMPASS and SONYC contracts makes it,
7 make it extremely difficult for providers to offer
8 high-quality programs to participants. Second, rate
9 discrepancies must be addressed in COMPASS programs
10 to adequately support the providers of these services
11 before making the program universal. A number of our
12 providers are continuing to receive \$2800 per child,
13 which is \$400 less than their \$3200 base rate. Um,
14 also implementation of indirect rates and cost of
15 living adjustment varies by COMPASS and SONYC
16 programs. Some programs have received funding for
17 COLAs in their contracts while others continue to
18 wait for this funding. Third, talking to the
19 staffing issue, acquiring enough employees to staff a
20 universal afterschool program would also be
21 challenging for providers. This has recently been
22 exasperated by the new comprehensive background check
23 requirements instituted by the New York State Office
24 of Children and Families and overseen by DOHMH in New
25

1
2 York. Just in summary of that, providers support
3 rigorous background checks for all staff. But the
4 inability to hire in a timely manner has put a huge
5 strain on the entire afterschool program system. Any
6 consideration of transitioning to a universal
7 afterschool system must include improving the
8 comprehensive background check system. Um, lastly,
9 um, Intro 1100 would make afterschool programs
10 available for every student, um, but we'd also like
11 to see a summer programming component to that. Um,
12 summer programming is a crucial piece of out-of-
13 school supports that should be included in this
14 legislation. Thank you so much for your support and
15 we look forward to advocating with you in this
16 upcoming budget negotiations. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: I'd like to recognize
18 that Council Member Perkins has joined us. Thank
19 you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: If you have not
21 already submitted your testimony in writing, if we
22 can get that today if possible. I just wanted to beg
23 forgiveness. I have a hearing next door on the local
24 procurement of food with Manhattan Borough President
25 Gail Brewer, so I will have to excuse myself after

1 this panel. I wanted to thank everyone for
2 testifying. I guess the question that we have coming
3 from DYCD is in terms of capacity for growth and I
4 understand the universe of other issues that impact
5 it based on what the other panel shared, but if you
6 can share what your current capacity is, and assuming
7 we fix everything, in a perfect university we're
8 actually paying what we're supposed to every single
9 seat, ah, what kind of capacity would you have for
10 growth and what would you prioritize? If anyone
11 wants to answer that?
12

13 ANNIE ELISA MINGUEZ GARCIA: Um, I, I can
14 take. So I think that similar to DYCD, all providers
15 need to kind of go back, look at the number of
16 schools in their district, think about, um, staffing
17 is a big issue here, so if we're not able to fix kind
18 of like this issue that we're having now, we might
19 not be able to ramp up for an expansion. So think
20 that they almost go hand in hand. We have to kind of
21 fix the concerns around clearances that we have right
22 now. But if you're, I think we all would probably
23 give you the same answer, that the answer is yes, we
24 would be willing to, ah, expand and to provide more
25 services in our community. For some of us we have

1
2 wait listing programs. Um, I know that we've in the
3 past been able to track those and it would be
4 interesting if the council would like to engage
5 providers around that conversation, about do what
6 wait lists look like and as you're looking at the
7 conversation with DOE around what schools don't have
8 services, if there could be like a matching, um, I
9 just think that, you know, the partnership is going
10 to be crucial as we have these conversations.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So I will bite.
12 If you could all share what your wait lists currently
13 look like.

14 ANNIE ELISA MINGUEZ GARCIA: I don't have
15 my numbers with me, but by site, but I have requested
16 them from our program director so I'll be sure to get
17 back to you on that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.
19 Anybody else, your wait list?

20 ROBERT CORDERO: It's actually, ah,
21 Robert Cordero from Grand Street Settlement. It's
22 actually hard to determine wait lists because it's
23 different from potential demand. There could be
24 demand where parents want the service, are not aware,
25 um, of it. As the borough president mentioned

1
2 earlier, may not even be aware what is available or,
3 or Council Member Rosenthal, um, so you could have,
4 ah, a wait list. Where we see the most wait lists,
5 honestly, is the summer camp programs, and I know
6 that we're not talking about that now, but I think
7 that's always the last, what was described earlier,
8 where there was not enough slots to fill the demand
9 for summer camp programming. Afterschools, I think
10 it is more difficult because you could have a wait
11 list, but that might just be a fraction of what the
12 demand would be, um, and so you know, I'm sure all of
13 us can get back to you, or UNH and others, on what
14 the actual wait lists look like, but I wouldn't, I
15 would just start that as a watermark for what the
16 true demand is, is like, especially given the fact
17 that only half the schools in the city have actual
18 afterschool programming that's funded by the city.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. Um, I
21 thought it was interesting that you made, um, a
22 distinction between the wait list and demand. Ah,
23 and I like that, because I understand the difficulty
24 in establishing the wait list and that the demand
25 which still, could still far exceed, um, what the

1
2 wait lists look like. So how would we capture what
3 sort of like what the demand is? I think that's,
4 because that's sort of what's at the crux of this
5 whole, you know, hearing is trying to show that the
6 demand, we know it far exceeds what, you know, what
7 we're getting the services we're getting now, but
8 trying to sort of assess what that, that demand
9 actually is, um, at least that's the conversation
10 we're getting from the administration, um, so do you
11 have any ideas about how we might be able to capture
12 what the demand is? I know, so it's a conundrum,
13 right?

14 GREGORY BRENDER: I think that probably
15 the best way to go about it is looking not so much at
16 sort of how many people apply to programs, but to
17 take, um, sort of an assumption based on a percentage
18 of the number of children in the public school
19 system. Um, I'm not, we've been trying to figure out
20 what that take-up rate would be because we know once
21 you sort of make it known that that there's a program
22 available, and we saw this happen with, with pre-
23 kindergarten, um, the take-up rates increased. So I
24 think it comes not so much on a, it's not a kind of
25 number based on, um, like we've an X number who apply

1 to Grand Street and Y and another organization, but
2 that, you know, some percentage of, ah, of children
3 would participant, and we suspect in elementary
4 school it would be higher than the rates of
5 participation in SONYC just because, um, to some
6 extent elementary school students have, ah, fewer
7 options, um, in that they're more limited in their
8 mobility.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK.

11 ROBERT CORDERO: Chair Rose, I would say,
12 look, no one's talking about compulsory afterschool
13 programs necessarily, but a way to just opt out. I
14 think so much of the problem, if we fixed all the
15 other parts of the system, but the way for parents
16 who don't speak English, who might not have a high
17 school or an elementary school education navigate the
18 system. When we run universal pre-K programs also
19 it's, is maddening. I think just an auto-enrollment,
20 streamlined system in the areas of highest need with
21 the lowest income students is a really great place to
22 start and look, and then the rate of those children
23 enrolling would be, would be much higher, and it
24 would almost be an opt out, because the fact of the
25 matter is the parents are working, or they're going

1
2 to school, or they're doing gigs and they need that
3 extra time beyond 2:30, 3 o'clock, 3:15 to, to get to
4 5 or 6 o'clock when they're home, or later. And so,
5 you know, I think this kind of biting around the
6 edges, if you're gonna go universal go big, you know,
7 where every child has the opportunity, is already
8 enrolled, and then the assumption is that it is
9 needed. They can disenroll or they can pay for a
10 fee-based if their parents can do it, or they opt out
11 of the system. But I think how the system gets
12 built, how children enroll into seamlessly, will also
13 be less burdensome, honestly, for the city, for DOE,
14 and for community-based providers like Grand Street
15 and the others that are testifying today.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And that makes a big,
17 it makes for a big dollar figure when we talk budget.
18 Yes, sir?

19 AVIO DUMBELO: Well, I would just
20 [inaudible] if you say it's going to be universal, I
21 know it might sounds, you know, a lot of money. Can
22 we have some doubt the kids will take advantage of it
23 if you build? If you build, if you have the system in
24 place they will come. [laughs] So that's the way I
25 look at it. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. I want to
3 thank you all for your testimony today. Um, and, ah,
4 because we have so many people and time, we have a
5 number of questions that we really would like to have
6 answered. Um, I'd like to send them to all of our,
7 um, everyone who testifies and if you would take a
8 little time to just give it back to us. We can't
9 enter it in the record, but your testimonies, um,
10 will be in the record, but we need it, um, to try to
11 collect some of the data, um, that we'd like to use,
12 um, in our argument with the administration, OK?
13 That's for all of the, the panelists. Thank you so
14 much. The next.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Council Member?

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yes?

17 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Oh, OK. Um, if you're
19 looking for the Contracts Committee that's next door.
20 Um, I wouldn't want you to be in the wrong place, and
21 we're gonna to lose Council Member Kallos shortly to
22 the Contracts Committee.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you want me to
24 call the next panel?

25 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON YOUTH SERVICES 146
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, next panel, Dr.
3 Sat Bhattacharya, Daryl Hornick-Becker, Citizens'
4 Committee for Children of New York. Ah, Dr. Sat with
5 Harlem Children Society. Ah, Janyll Canals,
6 Advocates for Children of New York. Nancy D. Miller,
7 ah, Vision Services for the Blind. Marcel
8 Braithwaite, the Police Athletic League, and Monte
9 Paul, Global Kids Inc.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And while they're
11 assembling, we have for the record testimony from
12 Stanley M. Isaacs, Neighborhood Center, Rhonda
13 Braxton, who is the deputy director of Youth Services
14 Committee on Youth Services, um, and this is from the
15 Stanley M. Isaacs Neighborhood Center, and it will be
16 entered into the record. As soon as you're
17 assembled, you may state your name and your
18 organization and you can begin. Doctor?

19 DR. SAT BHATTACHARYA: Thank you, Ms.
20 Chairman Rose, council members, Council Member Ben
21 Kallos. It's an honor to be speaking here on behalf
22 of an organization that I founded 20 years ago. Ah,
23 I founded this organization called Harlem Children
24 Society to address the needs of under-resourced,
25 underserved folks in STEM careers, science, tech,

1 engineering, and math. Back then, 20 years ago,
2 there was serious dearth of folks in such careers.
3 I'm from Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center. I'm a
4 director of cancer research at various facilities at
5 Sloan-Kettering. I also live in the neighborhood
6 where I started the organization. The organization,
7 Harlem Children Society, even though it is Harlem
8 Children Society, people think it is just in Harlem,
9 but we serve over the years all over the city, in all
10 boroughs. So it started with three students in my
11 lab doing hands-on research in science and
12 technology, and over the period of 20 years we have
13 evolved over, um, 800 students, and 5000 students
14 have gone through the program in all these years.
15 We've been following these students from high school,
16 because I strongly believe that the students have to
17 be engaged at very young levels and groomed over a
18 period of time in very intense research. So it is
19 very extremely hard work. We take the uncut diamonds
20 from the various poorest districts. All the students
21 who qualify in the program are below poverty line,
22 Title 1 schools, ah, and because they're below
23 poverty line over the period we have seen
24 consistently that 30%, 35% are African American, an
25

1
2 equal number of Hispanic students, and then
3 immigrants of all sorts. So, ah, so that has been
4 consistent over the period of time. Um, and as it
5 has grown we've been following the students in
6 undergraduate years. So those students who come from
7 the high school and we've also gone experimenting
8 with middle school, um, and we've been following
9 through, um, through undergraduate and some through
10 graduate schools. So we've had a history of students
11 who have gone through our programs for all these
12 years, coming in, doing intense research, everything
13 from space research to environmental research, to,
14 ah, to all sorts of cancer research, in
15 neuroendocrine research, and so forth. And as we've
16 been following our students many of them, my former
17 students are already professors at Harvard, Yale,
18 Stanford, some with double M.D.s and Ph.D.s, but they
19 started when they were 14, 15, 16 years old. So this
20 is what we have seen, is students may come from
21 extremely challenged backgrounds and we pair with
22 students from Bronx and Brooklyn and Manhattan, the
23 Upper East Side, the Upper West Side, wherever they
24 are, and because of the unique school system that has
25 evolved in our country for several decades now, that

1 families go to their school districts and, and they
2 remain there till they hit college and university,
3 and that's where, it's a bigger challenge for them,
4 ah, that students coming from outside the country
5 fare better than students within the country or
6 within the city. And so there's a high drop-out rate
7 for African American and Hispanic students all over
8 the country. As many as 40% of all African American
9 and Hispanic students drop out in the first few
10 semesters, first two semesters in the country, in all
11 universities and colleges. Why? Because they're not
12 trained. The school systems usually don't train
13 these students for college-level tasks. So we've
14 been following them. We need an assistance from the
15 city, and I think because it's a hands-on program, it
16 is a skills-based program. It's an employment
17 program. I feel strongly that the city and the DYCD
18 should, should perhaps help us to facilitate this
19 process. Thanks.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much.
22 Thank you.

23 JANYLL CANALS: Thank you for the
24 opportunity to discuss how New York City can create a
25 plan for universal afterschool programming. My name

1
2 is Janyll Canals, and I'm a senior staff attorney
3 with Advocates for Children.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Can you pull your mic
5 a little closer to you?

6 JANYLL CANALS: I'm sorry, yes. Um, my
7 name is Janyll Canals. I am a senior staff attorney
8 with Advocates for Children. For more than 45 years
9 Advocates for Children has worked to ensure high-
10 quality education for New York City students who face
11 barriers to academic success, focusing on students
12 from low-income backgrounds. Through our work with
13 families we see the need for universal afterschool
14 programming and especially for families with limited
15 financial means. Afterschool programs help improve
16 children's development, safety, and academic
17 performance. Such programs allow children and youth
18 to engage in academic and developmental enrichment
19 activities in a safe environment. We therefore
20 support Intros 1100 and 1113. As the City Council
21 advances these bills, we would like to make a few
22 recommendations to help ensure that universal
23 afterschool programming is accessible to all
24 students, including students with disabilities,
25 students in temporary housing, and students in foster

1 care. Although afterschool programs must serve
2 students with disabilities and provide reasonable
3 accommodations for students to participant, we've
4 heard from families that programs are not always able
5 to meet the needs of these children. For example,
6 one parents contacted Advocates for Children after
7 her child's afterschool program requested that she
8 pick her child up every day from the program early
9 due to his behaviors related to his disability. A
10 plan to create universe afterschool programming must
11 ensure that all students can benefit from such
12 programming, including students with disabilities.
13 We recommend adding a provision to Intro 1113
14 requiring that the Department of Education and DYCD
15 report the steps that both agencies have taken to
16 better support afterschool programs in meeting the
17 needs of students with disabilities. Another barrier
18 that we see with afterschool programming is
19 transportation. For students in temporary housing,
20 foster care, and students with disabilities the
21 Department of Education provides door-to-door busing
22 to student, to a student's residence at the end of
23 the school day. If a child would like to participant
24 in an afterschool program the parent must either pick
25

1 the child up or pay for alternate transportation.
2 This policy significantly limits access to these
3 programs for many students who rely on Department of
4 Education transportation to get home from school.
5 Given this significant obstacle, we also recommend
6 adding a provision to Intro 1113 requiring that the
7 Department of Education and DYCD report on their
8 efforts to address transportation barriers, including
9 efforts to expand door-to-door busing to help
10 students who qualify for school day busing access
11 afterschool programs. Our written testimony also
12 includes additional recommendations. We thank the
13 council for its leadership on these bills and look
14 forward to working with the City Council to move them
15 forward. Thank you.

17 NANCY D. MILLER: Thank you. My name is
18 Nancy D. Miller. I'm executive director and CEO of
19 Vision Services for the Blind. Everything you said I
20 agree with. Um, I would just like to add Visions has
21 run an afterschool program for blind high school
22 students, um, for, ah, close to two decades now.
23 Previously it was funded through DYCD OST. When OST
24 was eliminated for high school students we lost that
25 contract. We do get some state funding in order to

1 continue the afterschool program. It is free of
2 charge. Any legally blind student is welcome to
3 attend. It's five days a week, up until 7 o'clock at
4 night. So it meets some of the unmet needs of blind
5 high school students. I heard DYCD talk about how
6 students with disabilities are integrated into
7 afterschool programming. However, if we're going to
8 be tracking the use of afterschool we need to break
9 out which students with which disabilities are using
10 which afterschool programs. Tracking is great, but
11 if all students are combined together we won't get
12 the evidence that we need whether or not students
13 with disabilities are being served at the same level
14 as students without disabilities. I also feel
15 strongly that we should track by disability. We
16 heard about a great program in Brooklyn that serves
17 children with autism. We serve children who are
18 blind, including children with other disabilities,
19 and there are many other specialized programs that do
20 exist. But are we serving people with disabilities
21 in our afterschool programs at the same level
22 regardless of what their disability is? We also feel
23 that there needs to be choice. There are specialized
24 programs like Visions. There are also integrated
25

1 programs, inclusion, where students have a choice of
2 being in a school program. Afterschool
3 transportation is a big issue. We teach blind high
4 school students mobility, how to get around New York
5 City independently. But if they're bused to the
6 school the school will not allow them to travel from
7 the school to our afterschool program. Because if
8 you're bused in, you must be bused out. We very much
9 would like Department of Education to be flexible and
10 allow a student to be cleared for independent
11 mobility so they can attend the afterschool program
12 of their choice. We also feel there should be carve-
13 out funding. The New York City Department for the
14 Aging right now is looking at building innovation and
15 flexibility into their RFP and we feel DYCD should do
16 the same. There are some programs that don't fit
17 into the constraints of their request for a proposal,
18 like Visions program. And so we cannot apply for the
19 funding. The numbers we serve are fewer, but the
20 intensity and the comprehensiveness of the service we
21 provide, um, we believe should allow us to apply for
22 essential white might be a sole source program
23 funding, where specialized services have the
24 opportunity to apply outside of the COMPASS or other
25

1 RFPs. We also feel the Department of Education must
2 educate students with disabilities and their parents
3 about the array of afterschool programs. Yes, it's
4 important that DYCD has this interactive internet
5 interface, but many of the students we work with and
6 their families do not have internet at home. So if
7 DYCD is only using an internet portal, these students
8 and their parents will never know that the programs
9 exist and DOE has an obligation to make this
10 available to students and parents that don't have
11 access to the internet. And we also feel that
12 although it's required by law that students with
13 disabilities have a transition plan in their
14 individual programs, many students with disabilities
15 do not have a transition plan. Afterschool programs
16 deal directly with the transition from school to
17 colleague or school to work, and we want to make sure
18 that those transition plans mention afterschool
19 programming and that the afterschool programming is
20 available for those students who need it. Thank you.

22 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: Good afternoon,
23 Council Member Rose. Thank you for the opportunity
24 to speak. My name is Marcel Braithwaite. I'm the
25 director of community engagement with the Police

1 Athletic League. The Police Athletic League supports
2 and inspires New York City youth in partnership with
3 the NYPD and the law enforcement community, and we
4 thank you for your partnership specifically in Staten
5 Island, and I've had a wonderful experience working
6 with you. Um, the Police Athletic League supports
7 the concept of universal afterschool programming. We
8 recommend the development of a detailed program
9 implementation blueprint to accompany the bill. Any
10 plan to support this bill must include an assessment
11 of the current system, provisions for vulnerable
12 youth, and adequate levels of financial support for
13 host agencies. A successful expansion is only
14 possible if adequate levels of financial support to
15 host agencies is a part of the plan. To implement a
16 quality program, we should calculate the cost per
17 youth, to include the additional cost agencies incur
18 to market, administer, supervise the program. In
19 addition, the council must provide funding so that
20 the salary or stipend parameters can be set at a
21 competitive rate. And we also implore the council to
22 be mindful that school-based as well as community
23 centers are a valuable part of the afterschool
24 infrastructure and system, and we encourage you to
25

1 think of that as well. Thank you very much for the
2 opportunity to testify, and the rest is included in
3 our written testimony.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. Um, did
6 you identify yourself?

7 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: I did, but I can do
8 it again.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK.

10 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: My name is Marcel
11 Braithwaite. I'm the director of community
12 engagement for the Police Athletic League.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you.

14 DARYL HORNICK-BECKER: Good afternoon.
15 My name is Daryl Hornick-Becker, and I'm a policy and
16 advocacy associate at the Citizens' Committee for
17 Children of New York. CCC is a 75-year old
18 independent multi-issue child advocacy organization,
19 dedicated to ensuring that every New York child is
20 healthy, housed, educated, and safe. CCC is also a
21 lead organization of the Campaign for Children, and
22 so my statement today will echo many of their
23 concerns. I'd like to thank you, Chair Rose, and all
24 the members of the Committee on Youth Services for
25 holding today's hearing on afterschool programming.

1 High-quality, year-round afterschool programs allow
2 children and youth to engage in academic and
3 developmental enrichment activities in a safe
4 environment. Further, they allow parents to work and
5 support their families, thus preventing economic
6 insecurity. Afterschool programs are a win for a
7 children, families, communities, and taxpayers. CCC
8 applauds the City Council for its long-standing
9 commitment to preserving and expanding access to
10 these afterschool benefits. Today I would like to
11 speak about building on these wins, specifically as
12 it relates to Introduction 1100, or the Universal
13 Afterschool Program Plan. While we greatly support
14 any effort to expand afterschool access towards
15 achieving universality, we have some concerns with
16 the legislation as it currently stands. Firstly,
17 calls for universal afterschool fall short if they
18 don't include a summer component. New York's kids
19 need universal year-round access to programming. But
20 instead the current system leaves children and their
21 families behind, either waiting until the last minute
22 to find out if they have a summer slot or not funding
23 them at all. Every year since 2014 34,000 summer
24 SONYC slots for middle school students have been cut
25

1 by the administration, and every year we must fight
2 to restore them. We fully expect the same budget
3 dance to happen again this year, leaving parents
4 waiting to the last minute to find out if they have
5 programming over the summer. Additionally, this puts
6 immense strain on the afterschool providers, who must
7 develop budgets, staff up, and enroll their programs
8 all at the last minute. A real immediate commitment
9 to expanding afterschool access would mean finally
10 baselining the full 34,000 middle school summer slots
11 and including them in earlier versions of the budget.
12 Secondly, a universal afterschool plan must raise
13 current rates for elementary school slots. There are
14 still many COMPASS afterschool slots for elementary
15 school students that we funded by the previous
16 administration at a base rate of \$2800 per student,
17 \$400 less than the current \$3200 base rate.
18 Universal afterschool legislation should first
19 eliminate these per-child rate disparities so as the
20 system expands it doesn't leave some programs behind.
21 Lastly, slots need to be first added where they are
22 needed the most. This is elementary school, where
23 there are approximately 500,000 students where there
24 are only 47,000 afterschool slots. Prioritizing
25

1 elementary school access would ensure that all slots
2 are filled and that would added funding there's an
3 oversaturation of slots and competition between
4 programs. CCC is excited by the council's interest
5 in achieving universal afterschool and we believe
6 that by addressing our concerns and those of the
7 advocates here today we can achieve a truly
8 universal, year-round afterschool system that
9 benefits all New Yorkers. Thank you for the
10 opportunity to testify.

12 JENNA HAMIDES: Hello. Thank you for
13 hosting this hearing. My name is Jenna Hamides. I
14 am the director of high school programs at Global
15 Kids. I am also the mom of a 9-year-old girl who's
16 in fourth grade. Global Kids advocates, activates,
17 and inspire us, young people from underserved
18 communities in all five boroughs to take actions on
19 critical issues facing their communities and the
20 world at large. Global Kids taps into young people's
21 interests and leadership potential, fostering an
22 inquiry-based environment that encourages critical
23 thinking, academic achievement, and global
24 competency, and we have been doing this work for 30
25 years. Um, like I said before, I am here as an

1
2 advocator, but I also as the parent of a fourth-grade
3 student in the Bronx, um, to say that universal high-
4 quality afterschool program needs to be a priority.

5 In my professional career in youth development I have
6 seen the power and impact that high-quality
7 afterschool program has on students. I want my child
8 and every New York City student to be able to have
9 access to those programs free of cost.

10 ANNEMARIE PAUL: All right, good
11 afternoon and thank you so much for being an advocate
12 and a supporter of afterschool programs, Chair Rose.
13 Um, I wanted to say, I am Annemarie Paul and I am
14 also with Global Kids. I'm the director of middle
15 school programs. And I wanted to say what makes
16 Global Kids special is that our students take action
17 to improve the world around them. We have an annual
18 youth conference that is planned and led by our
19 students. They educate their peers on matters of
20 climate change, racial and gender equity, and
21 criminal justice reform. Students have participated
22 in the March for Our Lives, Black Lives Matter,
23 Action Leagues, and recently the Youth Climate March.
24 Our students given back to their communities by
25 volunteering their time and donating goods. At

1
2 Global Kids we believe that strong relationships are
3 the backbone of strong programs, and to that end we
4 employ two to four full-time youth development
5 professionals at all of our afterschool sites. We
6 find that this makes it seamless, our partnership
7 with schools, and, most importantly, we develop
8 incredible relationships with students in the
9 process. We greet them in the morning. Our doors
10 are open throughout the day. We work with teachers
11 to conducting pushing activities. We accompany
12 schools on school trips, and we conduct lunchtime
13 activities. As a result, all of our programs are
14 over-enrolled, but it's costly to provide all-day
15 services to our schools. In our high school programs
16 it means that staff are there two days a week versus
17 five days, and in our SONYC programs it means that we
18 have a reduced number of activity specials, activity
19 specialists, and it makes it impossible to have a
20 dedicated educational specialist who doesn't also
21 occupy other roles within the organization. And
22 furthermore, as we know, we have young professionals
23 who have made a decision to give back to their
24 communities, often struggling to make ends met. And
25 I don't think that that is an adequate reward for

1 making those sacrifices. And lastly I want to say
2 thank you once again, um, to Chair Rose and also
3 Council Member Helen Rosenthal for so saliently
4 describing the issue with summer camp funding, right,
5 and why that's problematic, and we recommend, of
6 course, that summer camp funding is including in the
7 preliminary budget process. We know that the status
8 quo is unjust to children and families and also to
9 providers. And so I just want everyone present to
10 imagine the depth of learning experiences, trips, um,
11 partnerships, that we could plan for and create if we
12 were given the appropriate opportunity to plan for
13 our students and our students deserve that. Thank
14 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. I want to
17 thank you all and let you know that all of your
18 comments are so salient and that we are, um, not only
19 recording it, but that we are going to take them into
20 consideration, you know, when we are negotiating the
21 budget. Um, and again, we have one more panel, one
22 more panel. So, um, I have some questions that I
23 know you have the answers to, so we will be sending
24 them to you, and if you will be as kind to, to answer
25 them for us, um, so that we can have the data that we

1
2 need to fight this fight. So thank you all so much
3 for being so patient and being her today. And our
4 next panel is.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Susan Matloff Nieves,
6 Goddard Riverside Community Center. Jazheel Montes,
7 International Creations, Inc. Judith Klein,
8 representing herself. Alton Mabel, Tropigate Inc.
9 Antoine Capalan, Sheltering Arms. Dr. Vanessa
10 Salcedo, pediatrician, Union Community Health Center.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you all. When
12 you get seated, please identify yourself and your
13 organization. And you can begin. And thank you for
14 your patience.

15 SUSAN MATLOFF-NIEVES: Ah, thank you.
16 Hi, I'm Susan Matloff-Nieves. I'm the deputy
17 executive director for Youth and Aging at Goddard
18 Riverside Community Center. Thank you so much,
19 Chairwoman Rose. We just so treasure your advocacy
20 and your passion. Um, Goddard Riverside is a
21 settlement house. We're a multiservice neighborhood
22 center, actually serving all of Manhattan, but
23 focusing on the Upper West Side and Morningside
24 Heights in Harlem. We are, I guess I would just in,
25 in brief summary, if you fund it we'll fill it. We

1
2 have no funding for our elementary school children,
3 um, because of the demographics of the Upper West
4 Side, which is extraordinarily wealth, but we still
5 have pockets of poverty, NYCHA buildings, low-income,
6 Mitchell Lama, rent-stabilized tenants. Most of our
7 schools did not qualify for COMPASS funding. We have
8 two, we are currently and have for many decades run
9 afterschool programming in two NYCHA developments,
10 Amsterdam Houses and the Wise Towers. They were not
11 eligible for Cornerstone because only, only directly
12 operated centers by NYCHA became Cornerstones. So we
13 met with the commissioner. He explicitly said to us
14 four times, no, no, no, no, stop asking me. If that
15 requirement was changed we could provide free
16 afterschool. Currently half of our families make
17 less than \$25,000 a year. We are forced to charge
18 them a fee. Our board raises hundreds of thousands
19 of dollars that they target almost entirely to our
20 youth programs. It's unsustainable for our agency to
21 keep with rising costs and it's unsustainable for our
22 families. Um, it's, um, and I guess I'll just leave
23 it at that. We would, we absolutely could take 200
24 kids. That's our, our licensed capacity. We're
25 currently serving something under 150 and we would

1 happily partner with schools, but we would
2 particularly love to be able to continue our NYCHA
3 centers because they're, they're beautifully equipped
4 centers with fantastic facilities that we've
5 renovated and the families feel comfortable and safe
6 there. We've served several generations. And
7 finally, in closing I would just say I was a New York
8 City latchkey kid in elementary school. I do not
9 want our city to be doing that to other kids. So
10 thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you so much.
13 Um, did you, ah, in your statement you indicated that
14 there, you would like to be a part of the program?

15 SUSAN MATLOFF-NIEVES: Absolutely. If,
16 if you released the RFP, if DYCD releases the RFP we
17 will start writing tomorrow.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK.

19 SUSAN MATLOFF-NIEVES: We absolutely have
20 the capacity, and I'll be happy to answer any of your
21 follow-up questions. Thank you. Thank you very
22 much.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you.

24 JAZHEEL MONTES: Hi, good afternoon
25 everybody. Thank you, Chair Rose, for leading, ah,

1 this important effort and for allowing the
2 opportunity to testify today before everybody here
3 and the panel. Um, my name is Jazheel Montes. I'm
4 the founder and executive director of an [inaudible]
5 nonprofit named Internal Creations, whose mission is
6 to develop leadership, self-sufficiency, and learn
7 life skills through learning music, specifically the
8 classical guitar, a style of music, a style of music-
9 making that's unbeknownst to a large number of
10 students and the general public. Internal Creations
11 has been around for six years, and we are a small
12 organization with a large impact. I am here before
13 you to advocate in favor of a fully funded, quality,
14 universal afterschool programming. I, too, was once
15 a New York City public school student and I can
16 attest that afterschool programming was the catalyst
17 to create the man I am today and the career I have
18 the privilege of being a part of. Afterschool
19 programming not only keeps our children safe and
20 productive from the hours of 2 to 6 p.m. and the
21 weekends until parents home, it is also an
22 opportunity for our youth to experience the
23 opportunity of learning different content and other
24 crafts that are not usually offered during the school
25

1 day due to the school's own restrictions, whether
2 it's time or funding. As Manhattan Borough President
3 stated in her testimony earlier, we are unfortunately
4 one of those organizations that are forced to only
5 provide programming two days a week due to funding
6 issues and are excited to work together in order to
7 push this bill. The universal afterschool program
8 can provide consistency, which is a key component in
9 education, and for development of a skill or a
10 person. This bill can also help students discover
11 possible passions and inspirations that they would
12 not have uncovered if they did not experience this
13 afterschool programs, in our case music. Many times
14 if a student is not feeling like they are achieving
15 greatness during the school day, they learn that they
16 thrive during our afterschool guitar ensemble by
17 seeing the tangible results, thus resulting in the
18 positive changes in their school attendance, academic
19 approach, and understanding of life's challenges and
20 how to overcome them. This opens the door to more
21 than just being a great student with a well-rounded
22 education. It also creates conscious kids that makes
23 for better people. Ah, issues that we have
24 encountered that, um, I want to bring forth, it
25

1
2 mostly has to do with schools because of the lack of
3 funding. And also the communication within the DOE
4 schools and CBOs and, you know, the providers.
5 Schools don't really communicate, from my experience
6 being a small organization, whether or not they will
7 have funding for the next year to be able to continue
8 the programming that the kids so want, thus leaving
9 us, ah, kind of in the air, and students wondering
10 whether or not they will continue to have this
11 program that they love and if the program doesn't
12 return the next year they're highly disappointed and
13 often, you know, left out in the air, too, with no
14 opportunities. And also follow-ups as an
15 organization it does cause to have a large staff
16 turnover because the staff expects to be year after
17 year and the retention becomes lower. Some of the
18 things that we would like to bring up, too, is, um,
19 an idea that may seem radical but I remember this
20 question was posed earlier is having principals
21 create a mandatory afterschool attendance for
22 elementary, middle school, and for high school, maybe
23 for the freshman year of high school, so that way all
24 the students that are being funded through this, ah,
25 through this initiative are actually present and ca

1
2 be a part of the programming. And if there are
3 students who live too far or, you know, if students
4 in high school are working, ah, which they shouldn't
5 at the freshman year, ah, they can provide
6 documentation to opt out of this, but I think with
7 the actual mandatory thing the funds that will be
8 directed universally, as I remember somebody from the
9 previous panel mentioned, I think it would create a
10 larger impact because sometimes we need to create
11 those disciplined borders for students to understand
12 what an afterschool program is and what it does and
13 the possibilities that it has. I know for me it
14 changed my life when I was forced into taking an
15 afterschool guitar program 'cause I did not want do,
16 but then became my passion and my career now. Thank
17 you.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you, and next
19 time you testify you have to do it musically.

20 [laughter]

21 JAZHEEL MONTES: I'll bring the guitar
22 next time.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: [laughs] Thank you.

24 JUDITH E. KLEIN: Hi, my name is Judith.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: You have to turn it on.

1
2 JUDITH E. KLEIN: Oh, sorry. My name is
3 Judith, middle initial E, last name Klein, K-l-e-i-n,
4 lots of Judith Kleins out there. Ah, I'm, thank you
5 for giving me the opportunity, Ms. Rose, to speak.
6 Um, I've been concerned for a long time about the
7 problems of, um, bullying and, ah, violence and, um,
8 I'm a dance movement therapist. I've also been a
9 teacher and went through, ah, um, let's see, I'm
10 losing my thought here. Anyway, I have a background
11 in teaching. I don't know, do you know the name Raul
12 Wallenberg? A lot of people don't. He's our third
13 honorary citizen of the United States. He was 31
14 when he volunteered to go to Budapest, Hungary as a,
15 as a Christian, and I emphasize that because of the
16 reason. A Swedish diplomat volunteered to go to
17 Budapest, Hungary at the end of World War II. In six
18 months he saved over 100,000 Jews from the Nazis and
19 Hungarian Arrow Cross. He was arrested by the
20 Soviets along with his chauffeur, Vilmos Langfelder,
21 thrown into the gulag. His chauffeur died in prison,
22 but the Soviets lied repeatedly about Mr. Wallenberg.
23 He is of course no longer with us because 2012 was
24 his centenary. There is an organization called the
25 Raoul Wallberg Committee of the United States and it

1 has a hero's program. Ah, if I may, just read you
2 what they say here. Um, a study of heroes serves as
3 a living monument to Raoul Wallenberg's humanitarian
4 values, deeds of course, and nonviolent heroism. And
5 I'll give you an example afterwards of what the
6 effect of his, um, story is. Heroes is a unique
7 academic and character education program, K through
8 12 plus adult, revitalizing the tradition of real
9 heroes, role models drawn from diverse historical
10 periods, ethnicities, and areas of accomplishment.
11 This multicultural, interdisciplinary program
12 integrates social studies and conflict resolution,
13 reading, writing, and language arts, character
14 education, the arts, ethical research strategies and
15 skills, service learning, intergenerational sharing,
16 analysis of hero versus celebrity. Celebrities are
17 not necessarily heroes and heroes are not necessarily
18 celebrities. Sometimes you have a unique individual
19 who is both. But it's rarely so. Recognized for the
20 exemplary way it merges character education with
21 academics, the Hero's Program has been used by
22 overall a million students in all 50 states in the
23 United States in a broad diversity of settings,
24 ranging from public, private, and independent schools
25

1 in inner city, suburban, and rural areas, all adult
2 prisons in the State of New Jersey and in the
3 midwestern federal penitentiary, the Western
4 Pennsylvania School for the Deaf, grades pre-K to 12,
5 the Harlem Day Charter School, the Boys and Girls
6 Clubs of Greater Washington, gifted, special
7 education, ESL classes, libraries and teacher
8 centers, and in five foreign countries, including at
9 the Raoul Wallenberg School in Sweden and the
10 International School in Paris. Study of heroes has
11 been professionally evaluated in different setting
12 with uniformly positive outcomes. Through the
13 example of Raoul Wallenberg and other multicultural
14 heroes featured in a study of heroes, students of all
15 ages learn and develop tolerance, respect, and
16 responsibility, critical thinking skills, academic
17 skills and artistic expression, creativity and
18 invention, the difference between the concepts of
19 hero and celebrity, strategies to counter violence,
20 xenophobia, intolerance, and bullying, positive
21 responses to negative peer pressure,
22 intergenerational sharing, family and community
23 involvement, leadership and citizenship. So I think
24 this would be ideal, starting with an afterschool
25

1 program, eventually going through the regular school
2 program. Ah, I want to give you two examples of this
3 program does.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: OK, you have to wrap
6 up.

7 JUDITH E. KLEIN: Oh, OK. So then I'll
8 skip those. I just want to, I have two others. All
9 right. The other thing, I'm a dance movement
10 therapist. One of my colleagues, Rina Kornblum,
11 developed a program called Disarming the Playground,
12 Violence Prevention Through Movement and Pro-Social
13 Skills. She developed because her children when in
14 elementary schools there was a lot of bullying and
15 other problems, ah, adults accosting children, and so
16 developed this program of movement and the, the
17 dramatic drop in bullying and the children are able
18 to get the help that they needed. And I have this
19 thing, and the last one, um, Southern Poverty Law
20 Center, ah, you may know of it. They have a
21 tolerance magazine, they have programs. So those are
22 the three. I would strongly suggest that you have
23 these programs in your afterschool programs and along
24 with all the others, because I think they're very,
25 um, important. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you very much,
3 and in the times that we happen to be in now, um,
4 those programs are very much needed. Thank you for
5 bringing that to the City Council today.

6 JUDITH E. KLEIN: And I will give you
7 this.

8 ANTONIO CAPIAN: Good afternoon. My name
9 is Antonio Capian. I'm with Sheltering Arms. I'm
10 the assistant director of afterschool programs.
11 Thank you, Chair Rose and the committee, for allowing
12 us to testify before you today. Sheltering Arms is
13 one of the city's largest providers of education,
14 youth development, and community and family well-
15 being programs for the Bronx, Manhattan, Brooklyn,
16 and Queens. We serve 15,000 children, youth, and
17 families and 2500 of those youth are enrolled in our
18 afterschool programs. We have 10 contracts with
19 DYCD, four COMPASS, five middle school SONYC
20 programs, and one pilot juvenile justice program.
21 We're grateful for the council's ongoing support for
22 afterschool programming in New York City and your
23 understanding for the need of these services. We
24 fully support the expansion, ah, of afterschool
25 programs in order to meet the demonstrated demand for

1
2 these services. However, there's some systematic
3 challenges that threaten to undermine the quality,
4 ah, of the system if they're not addressed. We've
5 heard it at length before, background checks. Um,
6 just to give an anecdote on it, we've submitted at
7 least 30, ah, staff to get cleared by OCSF since
8 September. Um, that's not to say that we don't have
9 staff who've applied and dropped out of the process
10 because of the, because of the length of the
11 clearances. So that's not saying those numbers. Um,
12 with those 30 we haven't received not one clearance.
13 Other agencies have, I believe another agency said
14 they received 30. We've shelled out 30 and we
15 haven't heard one thing at all. This puts us in an
16 impossible situation because when we try to serve
17 afterschool, um, students we can't, we can't continue
18 to serve our contract goals. And more importantly,
19 are we talking about paperwork, are we talking about
20 safety? Ah, what's the importance? What's the
21 importance of value here? Um, in order to create
22 safety we need staff. In order to have staff we go
23 through an on-boarding process. This process isn't
24 affecting all of the agencies that are speaking here,
25 but we have been blocked by the agency that seems to

1 fund us and mandates us. So we definitely continue,
2 um, we want your support to, ah, continue that
3 effort. We support the recommendation set forth by
4 the Campaign for Children to end this hiring crisis.
5 As we enter our summer, when we go into the summer
6 program we on-board almost 130 staff members
7 throughout our ten sites, including summer youth
8 employment program youth who start July 1, where the
9 programs start. There's no time to clear them and
10 then have them in a program. We have summer youth
11 employment youth come on board because it helps us
12 with our ratios to continue to maintain safety. Um,
13 in addition to that, summer programming, as has been
14 said before, baselining funding for SONYC programs
15 and making COMPASS elementary year round. Currently
16 our expansion for COMPASS programs in elementary is
17 only funded for the school year. This then goes down
18 to the baseline, um, of, of the support that we
19 receive in afterschool. Um, we support the universal
20 afterschool, um, efforts that are gonna be put forth.
21 And I just want to leave you with this thought.
22 Universal afterschool, yes, we have to create, we
23 have to fix the programs of clearing and getting
24 staff on board, but we are also, I haven't heard many
25

1 children say I want to be a teacher when I grow up.
2 I want to be a political scientist when I grow up. I
3 hear children say I want to be a guitar instructor, I
4 want to be a dance instructor, I want to be a, a talk
5 show host, and other things like that, because that's
6 what they see. So if we give, when we move to
7 university afterschool we are charged to help
8 children identify their interests, explore these
9 interests, and light the passion within that child to
10 make that passion grow into high school, into
11 college, and into a career. So then our children
12 have other examples to look forth to, not just the
13 traditional models that we see in society, which are
14 not bad, but as we get more progressive as a society
15 we have to be more creative. So, again, I leave with
16 the thought of let's invest in our children by
17 creating safety, a universal afterschool program, and
18 let's continue to push the needle towards passion,
19 um, involvement into the child's future. Thank you
20 very much.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: And let the church say
23 amen. All right. Next. Thank you.

24 DR. VANESSA SALCEDO: Good afternoon. My
25 name is Dr. Vanessa Salcedo. I'm a pedestrian and

1 the director of wellness and health promotion at
2 Union Community Health Center, which is a federally
3 health qualified center in the Bronx. Thank you for
4 the opportunity for being a voice for my community
5 health center, and also for the families that I
6 serve. Um, Union Community Health Center is in
7 support of this legislation of universal afterschool
8 programs. As a pedestrian in the Bronx I get
9 frequently asked by my parents for advice on
10 opportunities for safe places while they work, for
11 programs for extra tutoring, for programs for
12 extracurricular activities and sports for their
13 child. Our parents are really having difficulties
14 because of availability and financial constraints, as
15 has been talked about all day. And on the other
16 side, when I ask my patients what they do after
17 school or what have they done over winter break, the
18 common answer is nothing. And if I do get an answer
19 is play video games or watch YouTube. And we know
20 this is not productive activities for our childrens
21 and studies show that increasing screen time
22 decreases physical activities, also contributing to
23 childhood obesity. We know that this constant
24 exposure to social media is, is encountering, they're
25

1 getting encountered by cyber bullying and childrens
2 are getting more problems with self-esteem and space,
3 and we know now that kids are getting higher rates of
4 depression and anxiety and even suicidal ideation by
5 social media. Um, as I mentioned and has been
6 mentioned today, unsupervised teens are more
7 vulnerable at sexual high-risk behavior, which leads
8 to STIs and teenage pregnancies, which I do see. And
9 my patients do disclose that this is the time when
10 they're unsupervised that these activists do happen.
11 This was really concerning for me and my community
12 health center. Ah, we wanted to take action. We
13 didn't want to wait. So we created two programs,
14 Bronx Teen Fit program that helps, um, work with our
15 physical therapy department to do exercise and proper
16 exercise and find opportunities of physical
17 activities in the community and also bring a wellness
18 component to teach them about different activities
19 and STDs and pregnancy prevention. We also created a
20 program called Calm for teenage girls that help them
21 more on mindfulness and yoga and also, um, all the
22 programs have a behavioral health component with our
23 behavioral team. You know, these programs are great
24 but they're limited. You know, they're limited and
25

1 we have limited capacity. We could only, um, have
2 the capacity for 10, um, students at a time. Um, I
3 make sure that there's a strong evaluation component
4 so they could tell us how to improve the programs,
5 and unanimously the kids are telling us that they
6 want it, and they want it longer, and they need it.
7 You know, all, the evidence has shown that all these
8 programs, extracurricular, high-quality programs, are
9 improving the child's self-perception, achievement in
10 schools, and reducing behavioral problems. That's
11 why it's really critical for us to really create and
12 pass this legislative for safe structured environment
13 to support the development of our youth. Thank you.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Self-care is really
16 important. They do need to learn that early.

17 DANICA STEWART: Good afternoon. My name
18 is Danica Stewart and I'm a community tutor and
19 development manager for Reading Partners, a literacy
20 nonprofit that provides low-income, struggling
21 students with one-on-one tutoring throughout New York
22 City. I'm sorry, Council Member Rose, we are not in
23 Staten Island. I know. But I'm honored to speak to
24 you about the impression...

1 COMMITTEE ON YOUTH SERVICES 182
2 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Turn her mic off right
3 now. [laughter] No, I'm only kidding. [laughs]

4 DANICA STEWART: But I'm honored to speak
5 to you about the importance of afterschool
6 programming. I'd like to thank Chair Rose and the
7 rest of the committee for allowing us to create a
8 space to talk to the public on this matter. Reading
9 Partners' mission is to help children become lifelong
10 readers by providing individualized instruction with
11 measurable results. In each of the 22 schools that
12 we're currently partnered with, Reading Partners
13 transforms dedicated space into a reading center,
14 where we recruit and train community volunteers to
15 tutor and serve students who are kindergarten through
16 fourth grade, who are anywhere from one month to two-
17 and-a-half years behind in their reading proficiency.
18 Utilizing the expanded school day, an afterschool
19 programming helps us recruit tutors to our higher-
20 need, low-income schools, ultimately meeting the
21 needs of students. Reading Partners has experienced
22 the value of afterschool programs firsthand.
23 Afterschool programs allow additional homework
24 support, academic support, and enrichment
25 opportunities. According to the Afterschool

1 Alliance, the average cost per child for afterschool
2 programming is at least \$113 per week. And 43% of
3 parents cite that the high cost of local programs
4 being the primary reason for not enrolling their
5 child in afterschool programming. Providing
6 effective afterschool programs for everyone can
7 improve academic performance, reduce risky behavior,
8 promote physical health, and provide a safe
9 structured environment for children of working
10 families. The benefit to the community fans far
11 further than just students. Afterschool
12 opportunities provide a chance for families to engage
13 in the work force while knowing their child is cared
14 for and also allows community members to lift up
15 their, their students. Additionally, Reading
16 Partners will aim to provide literary professional
17 development, um, to nonliterary-focused partners in
18 afterschool setting. By sharing our literacy
19 expertise and resources we can help afterschool staff
20 choose engaging read-aloud books and ask guiding
21 question to help students practice key literary
22 skills. This type of collaboration can and does
23 occur with Reading Partners and other nonprofit
24 partners. We see that it's effective through the
25

1
2 increased support that students receive across
3 multiple disciplines after school. This allows
4 students to succeed at school and far beyond. We ask
5 that you support this legislation to allow students
6 to have access to universal afterschool programming,
7 which will positively affect and impact New York City
8 families, especially in under-resourced commissions
9 that we serve. Thank you for the opportunity to
10 speak.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSE: Thank you. I want to
12 thank you all for your testimony. Every last one of,
13 of you hit a mark that's really important and
14 critical in the development of our young people, and
15 so I want to thank you for being so patient. I want
16 to thank you for being here. I want to thank you for
17 working and serving our young people with little
18 resource. Ah, we hope to be able to change that.
19 And, um, we will be sending you a list of the
20 questions and if you could, um, send us some response
21 so that we would have the data we need to fight. And
22 thank you all. Have a great day. And this meeting
23 is adjourned. It is [gavel] 2:08.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 31, 2020