

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

November 20, 2019
Start: 1:14 p.m.
Recess: 4:31 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm, 14th
Fl.

B E F O R E: Inez D. Barron,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Laurie A. Cumbo
Alan N. Maisel
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Eric A. Ulrich

A P P E A R A N C E S

1
2
3 Jose Luis Cruz
4 Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost
of the City University of New York

5
6 Christine Mangino
7 Vice President for Academic Affairs and Provost
at Hostos Community College of the City
University of New York

8
9 Karol V. Mason
John Jay College of Criminal Justice

10
11 Dr. Anthony Browne
Hunter College, Department of Africana and Puerto
Rican and Latino Studies

12
13 Dr. Brenda Greene
Medgar Evers College

14
15 Professor James Blake
BMCC, Black Faculty

16
17 Jamell Henderson
CUNY Rising Alliance Coordinator

18
19 Sabina Dorvile
Student Government at CCNY

20
21 Gugeeta Cheetram
Student Leader at Lehman College

22
23 Enrique Pena
Student from Queens College

24
25 Timothy Hunter
Representative from USS

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [GAVEL] Good afternoon.

Good afternoon. I am Council Member Inez Barron; I'm the Chair of the Committee on Higher Education and today, November 20th is Latina Equal Pay Day. Which means that this is the day when Latina pay catches up to that of White, non-Hispanic men from last year.

Today's oversight hearing is on Diversity in Higher Education and Curricula in the City University of New York, CUNY.

CUNY has long been recognized as one of the most diverse university systems in the United States, and in fact, it operates pursuant to a legislatively mandated mission to "maintain and expand its commitment to academic excellence and to the provision of equal access and opportunity for students, faculty and staff of all ethnic and racial groups and from both sexes." As well as to be "of vital importance as a vehicle for the upward mobility of the disadvantage in the City of New York.

CUNY's mission also acknowledges "the imperative need for affirmative action and the positive desire to have city university personnel reflect the diverse communities which comprises of people of the city and state of New York." In fact, a vast and growing body

1
2 of research suggests that a diverse student body,
3 faculty and staff increases creativity, innovation
4 and problem-solving amongst students regardless of
5 background.

6 A diverse faculty can also serve as role models
7 for diverse students who may be **emboldant 3:24** while
8 studying with someone with whom they can relate.
9 However, over the past decade, the number of diverse
10 tenured faculty and administrative officials has
11 decreased.

12 This has lead to concerns over college curricula,
13 which has traditionally emphasized the [**WESTEN**
14 **CANNONS 3:53**], which is defined "as high culture,
15 literature, music, philosophy and art and is highly
16 valued in the west." Whereas we know that Africa is
17 in fact the cradle of civilization, the origins of
18 homosapien, and that arts, culture, written language,
19 philosophy, astronomy, math, monotheism, land
20 cultivation and technology all began in Africa.

21 And the result of the emphasis on western culture
22 has resulted in the marginalization of cultural
23 expressions of people and countries of color and a
24 focus on the works of White men. Additionally,
25 through the racial and ethnic makeup of the CUNY

1
2 student body as a whole, it reflects the diversity of
3 the city, it is a different story at the Universities
4 so-called higher performing colleges, which serve
5 predominately White and Asian students.

6 While the number of women at CUNY is greater than
7 the number of men, apart from Baruch College and the
8 New York City College of Technology, CUNY does not
9 track enrollment with regard to gender outside of the
10 binary, and further lacks data with regard to
11 students and faculty who identify as LGBTQ.

12 At this hearing, the Committee would seek to
13 overview how CUNY works to promote its pluralistic
14 community which has been shown to be fundamental to
15 the exchange of ideas and knowledge and scholarly
16 discourse.

17 Additionally, the Committee is interested in
18 learning about how CUNY capitalizes on its diversity
19 including race, national origin, ethnicity, religion,
20 age, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity,
21 disability, and socioeconomic status to create a
22 vibrant, academic, intellectual and cultural
23 environment that goes beyond representation to
24 general participative membership exemplifying the
25

1
2 benefits that accrue when diversity and inclusion are
3 integral parts of the institutions curricula.

4 Last May, CUNY named then Queens College
5 President Felix Matos Rodriguez as it's Chancellor.
6 As the universities first Latino Chancellor, I look
7 forward to hearing concrete examples of outcomes and
8 CUNY's efforts to increase and improve diversity both
9 within the classroom and in the curricula.

10 Now, I'd like to thank my staff Joy Simmons, my
11 Chief of Staff and Ndigo Washington, my Legislative
12 Director and CUNY liaison, Chloe Rivera the
13 Committee's Senior Policy Analyst, Paul Sinegal
14 Counsel for the Committee and Michele Peregrin, the
15 Committee's Finance Analyst.

16 And in accordance with the rules of the Council,
17 I will ask the Council to administer the affirmation
18 to the witnesses from the Mayor's Administration.
19 Please raise your right hand and the Council will
20 administer the oath.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Do you affirm to tell the truth,
22 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
23 testimony before this Committee and to respond
24 honestly to Council Members questions?

25 Please state your names for the record.

1
2 Good afternoon Chairperson Barron and members of
3 the Higher Education Committee and staff. Thank you
4 for the opportunity to testify before you on the
5 important issue of diversity in higher education
6 classrooms and curricula.

7 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: My name is Jose Luis Cruz and I
8 have the privilege of serving as the Executive Vice
9 Chancellor and University Provost of the City
10 University of New York.

11 I am accompanied here today by two esteemed
12 colleagues, to whom I will in due course yield the
13 floor, so they can provide the committee some
14 specific examples of the many ways in which CUNY's
15 campus communities are collaborating to "capitalize
16 on the university's diversity to create a vibrant
17 academic, intellectual and cultural environment in
18 its classrooms and curricula," the topic of this
19 hearing.

20 Karol Mason, President of John Jay College of
21 Criminal Justice and Christine Mangino, Provost of
22 Hostos Community College will testify after my
23 remarks.

24 Last year, in my role as President of Lehman
25 College and Co-Chair of the University's Faculty

1
2 Diversity Working Group, I had the opportunity to
3 testify before this Committee and left with a full
4 appreciation for the concerns raised during the
5 proceedings about CUNY's approach towards diversity
6 among its faculty; including a perceived lack of
7 accountability for campus efforts to diversify
8 faculty, lack of clarity on reappointment, tenure,
9 and promotion standards among faculty of color; and
10 the unevenness in and differences between student and
11 faculty diversity across and within campuses.

12 Today, I come before you on my fourth month as
13 CUNY's Chief Academic Officer, to state that my
14 confidence in advancing the future is now a
15 conviction for bettering the present.

16 Because to effectively promote our University's
17 pluralistic community and create a vibrant
18 educational, intellectual and cultural environment
19 that goes beyond representation to genuine
20 participative membership, we must build decidedly
21 upon the strong foundation that has been laid and
22 move purposefully from plans and studies to action
23 and accountability.

24 The first step to do this is to problematize the
25 issue of diversity in the classroom and curricula and

1
2 recognize that notwithstanding the position of
3 strength from which our University approaches this
4 issue, the complexity inherent in the work requires
5 both cultural and structural solutions.

6 Because the reality is that by any objective
7 measure, CUNY is a national leader in the issue of
8 diversity in higher education classrooms and
9 curricula. With the most diverse student body in the
10 country and the percentage of our faculty
11 representing minority backgrounds being approximately
12 twice the national average. But the fact remains
13 that we have work to do.

14 For instance, in my time at CUNY, I've been in
15 the room with the provost decided to communicate to
16 the members of a search committee that they needed to
17 go back to the drawing board, because there was
18 insufficient diversity in the candidate pool.

19 Upon reviewing the screening rubrics and rating
20 sheets, the provost asked the Office of Compliance
21 and Diversity to determine if there were additional
22 minority candidates the search committee could
23 consider. As a result, a highly qualified Hispanic
24 candidate was identified, added to the pool and
25 ultimately hired.

1
2 I've been in the room when a junior faculty
3 member of color who had just received a sample
4 syllabus for a general education course sighed loudly
5 when realizing the disconnect between the college
6 experiences of the protagonists in the course's main
7 reading and those of the students she knew to expect
8 in her classroom. And I was there when she
9 immediately resolved to actualize and localize the
10 readings to not only better engage her students, but
11 also capitalize as a result on the diversity that
12 they'd bring to classroom discussions.

13 I've bene in the room when the faculty member
14 presented compelling data to the disabuse those who
15 for years had intimated that the pass rates of
16 students in a gateway science class was destined to
17 be around 30 percent, because for years it had been
18 so, and the characteristics of the students enrolled
19 in the college had not changed.

20 Through innovations in pedagogical deliveries,
21 this faculty member had shown that the pass rate of
22 those students could not only be increased to 80
23 percent, but their learning could be demonstrated to
24 be on par with that of students in a sister
25 institution whose student body had SAT scores that

1
2 were on average 200 points higher. In doing so, she
3 did much to push back against the soft bigotry of low
4 expectations that keeps so many from having the
5 supports and investments they need to meet their full
6 potential.

7 And I've been in the room when a member of a
8 faculty promotion committee for a female African
9 American candidate expressed concerns about the
10 emphasis on the black experience and lack of
11 European-inspired voices in the faculty's scholarly
12 work. I had barely just registered what had been
13 said, when another member of the committee firmly,
14 respectfully, and successfully made the case that the
15 flip of that argument would not be applied to a White
16 male faculty member specialized in European
17 scholarship. That is, no one would be questioning
18 why said faculty member did not speak more about the
19 Black experience in their work. The African American
20 faculty member, needless to say, was promoted.

21 And so, it is, because we acknowledge that issues
22 of diversity play out in different ways in different
23 spaces and that they not always turn out as well as
24 in the examples I have just shared with you here
25 today, that I welcome the opportunity afforded to me

1
2 to inform the Committee about what the University,
3 under the leadership of Chancellor Felix Matos
4 Rodriguez is doing to further enhance the diversity
5 of CUNY's classrooms and curricula.

6 Diversity and pluralism are deeply ingrained in
7 the CUNY value system with its home in the nation's
8 largest, most diverse city, CUNY recruits and
9 attracts a student body that is extraordinarily
10 diverse in language, culture, religion, race,
11 ethnicity, geography, family income, age, sexual
12 orientation, gender identity and educational
13 background.

14 In Fall 2018, for example, CUNY's physical and
15 virtual classrooms hosted nearly 245,000
16 undergraduate students representing 209 ancestries of
17 whom 56.8 percent were female, almost 80 percent
18 people of color. To put some of these numbers in
19 context, according to recent PEDS data, BMCC alone
20 has 1.5 times as many students of color as the entire
21 Ivy League. Similarly, Lehman College on its own
22 enrolls 80 percent as many students of color as the
23 entire Ivy League.

24 But we know that to truly capitalize on this
25 diversity in the classroom, we must do more to

1
2 recruit and retain faculty who understand that our
3 students identity in regards to race, ethnicity,
4 gender, sexual orientation, age, disability and
5 socioeconomic status, is fundamental in the
6 individual learning process as well as the
7 educational progress of the class as a whole.

8 In summary, the diversity in CUNY's classrooms is
9 activated in part, not by any means exclusively,
10 through 39 academic majors across eleven campuses
11 leading to AA, BA, MA, MS Advanced Certificates and
12 Ph.D. degrees in fields such as African Diaspora
13 Studies. Puerto Rican and Latino Studies, Judaic
14 Studies, Middle Eastern Studies, and East Asian
15 Studies, Women's Gender and Sexuality Studies,
16 Disability Studies, among others.

17 It is also activated through 128 Pathways courses
18 classified under the core area of U.S. Experiences in
19 its Diversity, spanning subjects such as Evolution
20 and Expressions of Racism, African American History,
21 Black Poetry, and Philosophical Visions of American
22 Pluralism and an additional 167 Pathways courses
23 under the core area of World Cultures and Global
24 Issues.

1
2 In Fall 2018, nearly 1,000 students enrolled in
3 the aforementioned programs, while 25,000 enrolled in
4 courses in the identified core areas.

5 To move the diversity agenda forward, CUNY is
6 organizing it's work to expand access to diverse
7 students, better support faculty hiring and retention
8 processes and evaluate the effectiveness of its
9 general education offerings, among other initiatives.

10 First, we're actively working to scale proven P-
11 16 initiatives that serve an efficient pipeline of
12 student enrollment that begins at the earliest stages
13 of one's educational journey.

14 Second, we are actively working to enhance the
15 climate on our campuses through the strategic use of
16 recent Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher
17 Education COACHE, survey results in which faculty of
18 color satisfaction was seen to improve in all the
19 surveyed benchmarks.

20 And third, we are actively working on an
21 evaluation of the pathways curricular structure to
22 develop a comprehensive understanding of how it
23 contributes to student momentum and how students
24 experience pathways at the campus level.

1
2 Finally, from an accountability perspective,
3 Chancellor Felix V. Matos Rodriguez we instructed all
4 presidents and deans to establish and state specific
5 goals from the diversity of faculty, staff and
6 administrators that would then be assessed as part of
7 their personal performance evaluations.

8 CUNY has long understood that a vibrant exchange
9 of ideas and perspectives within the classroom is
10 informed by identity. This leads not only to a more
11 engaging and inclusive learning process, but also
12 increases retention, as students want to continue
13 classes in which their individual identity and
14 cultural background is not only respected and
15 reflected, but integral to the functioning of the
16 class as a unit. It is this sense of community that
17 will go on to create positive outcomes outside of the
18 classroom.

19 Take for example the nursing program at Lehman
20 College. Key to the program's pedagogy is the
21 intention to harness the collective power of those
22 individuals in the classroom, who represent a
23 diversity of races and ethnicities. Graduates from
24 the program then export that diversity based
25 education and their diversity training when they head

1
2 out into the field. Thus, bettering the community at
3 large through the administration of effective,
4 culturally sensitive health care. In this way,
5 Lehman's nursing program exemplifies the positive
6 ripple effect of capitalizing on diversity in the
7 classroom and the curricula.

8 For this and so many other reasons, I stand here
9 today optimistic about what lies ahead. I will now
10 yield to my esteemed colleague the Provost of Hostos
11 Community College, Christine Mangino, who after
12 delivering her testimony will turn it over to
13 President Karol Mason from the John Jay College of
14 Criminal Justice. Thank you.

15 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Good afternoon Chairwoman
16 Barron and members of the Higher Education Committee.
17 My name is Christine Mangino and I am the Provost and
18 Vice President for Academic Affairs at Hostos
19 Community College of the City University of New York.

20 At Hostos Community College we are intentionally
21 in the representation of including and diversity
22 throughout our course curriculum and extracurricular
23 activities. This is part of the mission of the
24 college and our general education learning outcomes.

1
2 For example, we have a capstone course, entitled
3 Bronx Beautiful, as the culminating class for our
4 liberal arts students. Part of the course
5 description states students will understand how their
6 education can help them become more aware, educated,
7 and involved members of their communities and
8 therefore empower them to become agents of change.

9 Another way we involve our students in the
10 community is through our service learning curriculum.
11 There are guidelines to become a designated service-
12 learning course through a governance-led approval
13 process. Some elements are a reflection component
14 and outcomes related to our global citizenship
15 general education outcome.

16 Most of the CBO's we have partnered with work
17 with diverse populations and inclusiveness is part of
18 their missions also. Two of our English faculty have
19 been collaborating with the Columbia University's
20 Common Core. Our focus has been on connecting with
21 authors who write about feelings of alienation,
22 conflicted identity and oppression. A highlight is
23 the inclusion of DuBois', *The Soul of Black Folk* and
24 focusing on the concept of double consciousness and a
25

1 sense of double identity Black people carry with them
2 in a predominantly White society.

3 We have an interdisciplinary faculty committee
4 revamping our liberal arts degree to include options
5 in Women's and Gender Studies, the Black and African
6 Diaspora Studies, and Health Care Management, whose
7 focus is understanding current health issues such as
8 health inequity and cross-cultural and interpersonal
9 communications.

10 There is a new LGBTQ course going through our
11 governance process. Within our Aging and Health
12 Studies degree program, our faculty discovered the
13 need to incorporate curriculum on cultural
14 sensitivity. This need was discovered when surveying
15 employers who provide our students internships.

16 In collaboration with our career services staff,
17 we developed two sets of curriculum. The first is
18 now embedded in all the Aging and Health Studies
19 courses and the second has become a workshop our
20 career services staff provide all students
21 participating in internships.

22 The handbook entitled, The Roadmap to Cultural
23 Sensitivity, the Journey to Cultural Awareness, has
24 outcome which include students will develop an
25

1
2 increased self-awareness of differing culturally-
3 based values and beliefs of individuals and
4 organizations and to understand the challenges that
5 arise when differences in culture, values, beliefs,
6 and experiences exist between people.

7 Included activities have the purpose of expanding
8 students understanding of other cultures, building
9 awareness of one's own cultural biases, how to bridge
10 language divides, the importance of nonverbal
11 communication, and the differences between being
12 culturally sensitive and culturally competent. These
13 curriculum have been shared with faculty across the
14 college, so that they too can begin incorporating
15 portions into their own courses.

16 For a few years, we designated a faculty member
17 to be a Diversity Fellow, who works with our Center
18 for Teaching and Learning to plan different
19 activities and conversations to discuss diversity,
20 inclusion, and equality. We recently had a series of
21 conversations to celebrate the 50th anniversary of
22 the Stonewall Riots, as a way to illuminate our LGBTQ
23 faculty and staff members journeys on campus. Another
24 recent event yesterday was titled, Is the Hostos
25 Classroom Really Inclusive?

1
2 Through a college-wide process, we select a book
3 of the year that faculty can use in their classrooms
4 and we have college-wide events to discuss the book
5 and suggest in class activities. Our last four books
6 all speak to themes of inclusion, social justice and
7 equality. The books were just Mercy, Americana, How
8 to Think, and this year it's the Hate You Given. Our
9 Social Science Speakers Series runs every semester
10 and highlights these same themes.

11 This semester included Upending the Ivory Tower;
12 Civil Rights; Black Power; and the Ivy League; and a
13 Blueprint for Economic Justice; Project Equality and
14 Black Women's Economic Activism in America's
15 Industrial Heartland.

16 Our theater productions always focus on themes of
17 social justice and inclusion. Our latest production
18 which was also performed at this year's Fringe
19 Festival was, the Gender of Attraction, which is
20 about transgender relationships.

21 We promote the creation of cultural, social and
22 religious clubs, such as the Black Student Union,
23 Capoeira Club, the Muslim Club, the Veterans Club,
24 the Reimagining Justice Club and the African Club.
25 They recently held a multicultural day and added the

1
2 flags of the Republic of Yemen and Turks and Caicos
3 to represent our student population in our flag
4 collection.

5 Again, these are just some examples of Hostos
6 inclusive curriculum and all of which speaks to who
7 we are as a college.

8 KAROL V. MASON: Good afternoon Chair Barron and
9 members and staff of the City Council Committee on
10 Higher Education. Thank you for the opportunity to
11 present my testimony this afternoon.

12 One of John Jays greatest strengths is its
13 diverse community. With a richly diverse student
14 body that is 46 percent Hispanic, our new class is 50
15 percent Lantinx, 20 percent Black, and 13 percent
16 Asian, John Jay is recognized as both a Hispanic-
17 Serving Institution and a Minority-Serving
18 Institution.

19 We are deeply committed to transforming John Jay
20 from merely a Hispanic and Minority enrolling
21 institution to a truly Hispanic and Minority-serving
22 institution. We work to create a space that
23 authentically incorporates the rich diversity of our
24 students heritages into our curriculum and
25 programming. I will highlight some of our diversity

1
2 and inclusion efforts in the classroom and across
3 campus.

4 John Jay's historic mission and focus on criminal
5 and social justice exists alongside the college's
6 educational values and commitment to inclusion.

7 Using best practices in student-centered pedagogies,
8 classroom tools and training, we are strengthening
9 inclusion. This fall, through our Teaching and
10 Learning Center, we are expanding the design and use
11 of inclusive curricula at the college through year-
12 long faculty seminars, a work group, and six
13 curricular intervention projects.

14 More than 50 faculty, 24 of color and 36 who are
15 women, are rewriting syllabi, developing culturally
16 sustainable course content and assignments, and
17 enhancing their understandings of the contexts in
18 which their students experience historical
19 oppressions and individual traumas through structured
20 discussions and the study of research on racism,
21 sexism, gender identity bias, ethnic and religious
22 hatred and other forms of discrimination.

23 To foster a more vibrant and inclusive learning
24 environment, they are working to include
25 publications, biographies, and images of authors from

1
2 diverse backgrounds in assigned readings and
3 viewings. These changes help us provide our students
4 with role models who reflect their self-images and
5 who inspire them to believe they can succeed.

6 Additionally, the Teaching and Learning Center is
7 advising faculty and staff to use inclusive language
8 and apply social-psychological interventions that
9 support student's sense of belonging at the college
10 and their development of resilient qualities in
11 response to oppression and trauma.

12 Some of these initiatives build upon two
13 intensive lecture series we held in the spring and
14 fall of 2018 that highlighted best practices for
15 Hispanic-Serving Institutions while partnering with
16 other projects already in process that focused on
17 culturally-responsive pedagogy for infusing
18 multicultural content across academic programs. An
19 inspiring example can be seen in the efforts of our
20 HSI, Hispanic-Serving Institution Faculty Working
21 Group, who work on teaching and mentoring practices
22 and improvements.

23 The Teaching and Learning Center also connects
24 with our Presidential Fellows for Curriculum Driven
25 Student Success Initiative, which I launched in 2018,

1
2 inviting all full-time faculty to apply. We selected
3 six inaugural fellows to pursue faculty designed
4 projects and three of the six Presidential Fellows
5 projects stand out as example of inclusive curricular
6 interventions.

7 First, Associate Professor in Psychology Demis
8 Glasford has designed activities in the first year
9 seminars to increase students sense of belonging,
10 work with aligned research for success factors
11 influencing college students of color and growth
12 mindset recommendations.

13 Second, Jill Grose-Fifer, also an Associate
14 Professor in Psychology, has redesigned the
15 introductory psychology course to include student
16 activities on well-being and flipped the classroom
17 strategies to incorporate culturally sustainable
18 pedagogies.

19 Third, Assistant Professor and Chair of our SEEK
20 Department, Monika Son has focused on deepening
21 critical race pedagogy skills in her department
22 faculty and students, carrying these through from the
23 first to the third years of coursework.

24 I also acknowledge that our faculty in several
25 departments, who through their curriculum

1
2 development, scholarship, experiential learning and
3 other unique educational opportunities, expose our
4 students to the political, historical, socioeconomic
5 and cultural possibilities, obstacles and challenges
6 for achieving global social justice and equity, cross
7 cultural and intercultural understanding, respect for
8 human dignity and awareness of human and political
9 rights.

10 In particular, I recognize the leadership of both
11 our Latin American and Latinx Studies Department and
12 our Africana Studies Department. We know that it is
13 important for students of color to see themselves
14 reflected in their professors and administrators.
15 John Jay has committed to expanding diversity among
16 our faculty as we hire.

17 To that end, we are engaged in a robust training
18 of all hiring committees in the best practices for
19 diversity and inclusion. This includes instruction
20 about implicit bias in assessing letters and CVs as
21 well as sharing information about how to avoid biases
22 that can occur in interviews. Additionally, we are
23 intentionally building a diverse pools of candidates
24 by reaching out to provost and department chairs at

1
2 HSI and other MSI institutions that produce PhDs, so
3 that we can have them in our candidate pool.

4 Fostering a campus climate of inclusion and
5 belonging for all of our members is crucial to
6 advancing our broader educational mission of
7 educating for justice in all its dimensions and
8 preparing our students to serve as agents of change,
9 divers leaders of justice in an increasingly diverse
10 America.

11 Last spring, I engaged an external expert team
12 from Working IDEAL to conduct an institution-wide
13 review of the John Jays culture, prevention programs
14 and policies, specifically related to diversity and
15 inclusion, discrimination and harassment.

16 The recently released report highlights our
17 strengths as well as our opportunities to draw upon
18 new research and best practices to strengthen
19 diversity, equity and inclusion across our campus
20 environment and to improve our practices and
21 resources. We are excited to seize upon this
22 opportunity to use data driven research to foster a
23 sense of inclusion and belonging in our community.
24 And we've acted upon some of those recommendations
25 including announcing the creation of a new Office of

1
2 Diversity, Compliance, Equity and Inclusion to be led
3 by a vice president to be identified by a national
4 search, reporting directly to me.

5 We are piloting enhanced diversity training among
6 our senior leadership and in academic and other
7 departments, among other initiatives and additional
8 recommendations that we are considering and
9 implementing will take more time to identify and
10 marshal the resources to implement them.

11 As we continue to work to change the face of
12 opportunity through higher education and ensure that
13 our college community is a model for inclusion, we
14 thank you and your committee for your support of CUNY
15 and the John Jay College of Criminal Justice.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much for your
17 testimony and I have questions. I don't know if
18 other colleagues will be joining us, but if they do,
19 they will have questions as well.

20 Now, CUNY issues a master plan every four years,
21 I believe it is and we're now within the scope from
22 2016 to 2020. Where in that master plan can I find
23 an entry that will direct me specifically to the plan
24 that CUNY has to increase the number of Black
25 faculty, Latino faculty?

1
2 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, I believe the master plan
3 also has a strategic framework associated with it
4 that goes into more detail regarding the goals for
5 the university.

6 The current strategic framework is called
7 Connected CUNY and it actually ends this year. The
8 new Chancellor is putting forth a process that will
9 generate the strategic framework and the accompanying
10 master plan for the next four years, in the first
11 four years of his administration.

12 In the former strategic framework document, one
13 of the goals was around the creation of knowledge and
14 there it speaks to the hiring of faculty, and I
15 believe, I don't have it in front of me, references
16 the mission of the university with regards to
17 diversity issues in the classroom in the research and
18 the work we do for the communities.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I had a complaint in the
20 previous session that the previous master plan from
21 2012-2016, was not in any way evaluated, reflected in
22 the current connected CUNY plan or continuity. It
23 was like two distinct documents and that was a
24 criticism that I had. There was no report that says,
25

1
2 well, from the previous years planned for diversity,
3 we were able to accomplish or achieve.

4 How do we make sure that there is some
5 continuity, some evaluation of what you previously
6 set goals to achieve as we go. We don't want to have
7 three separate documents. So, we're having a new
8 document, how do we ensure that there is some
9 evaluation of what you set out to do as we move to
10 the next so-called master plan?

11 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: That's a very good question. I
12 think the intent on the Chancellor on one of his
13 first actions since becoming Chancellor of the City
14 University of New York, is to have several fronts of
15 accountability.

16 So, first and foremost the accountability is to
17 the campus presidents and the professional school
18 deans. And as a result of that, he has through the
19 goal setting process for the next year, asked each
20 president and dean to establish concrete goals around
21 diversity of faculty staff and the administrator of
22 the colleges. And those goals would then be used at
23 the end of the year for the Chancellor to evaluate
24 each one of the presidents on whether or not they
25 made progress towards those goals.

1
2 So, that's at the most basic administrative
3 level. As we move forward to develop the new
4 strategic plan and its accompanying master plan, the
5 issue of diversity will be front and center. Not
6 only for what it represents in terms of the student
7 body and how the student body is represented across
8 all of our colleges, but of course also with faculty
9 staff and the administration.

10 We intend to have a clear performance, key
11 performance indicators associated with the goals. As
12 you know, typically higher ed and elsewhere, goals
13 are very aspirational but they should also be
14 quantifiable and so, that is part of the strategy
15 that our new Chancellor will be putting forward. And
16 hopefully that will provide for the continuity that
17 the Chairwoman has alluded to.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Who will be a part of the
19 group of persons who come together to in fact create
20 the strategic plan which generates the master plan?
21 Who are the people and on what levels and what's the
22 composition of those persons involved in that?

23 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, the process that will be
24 used to develop the new strategic plan is currently
25 still being discussed with the new administration.

1
2 Generally speaking, I will say that there will
3 representation from not only the system office but
4 the campuses as well and of course, from the
5 different stakeholders that span the university. So,
6 faculty staff, students and administrators will be
7 clearly represented. There is a conversation around
8 how to best engage the communities that we serve in
9 providing feedback and guidance as to what those
10 goals should be and how they should be prioritized.

11 I will be happy to come back to the Committee
12 with more information once those plans are more
13 concrete.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If I were to look at the
15 organizational chart for CUNY, would I see a
16 designated person who is in charge of looking at how
17 we're moving forward to achieve the diversity goals
18 that we set?

19 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, the intention right now is
20 that that be a joint responsibility of the Office of
21 the University Provost, particularly as it respects
22 to the faculty angle and the Office of Human
23 Resources, which has just recently appointed a new
24 Vice Chancellor. And so, I am very much looking
25 forward to her first day and we will be working

1
2 together to figure out what the best way to make sure
3 that we bridge the existing gap between aspirations
4 on this matter in our current state of affairs.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the two of you would be
6 the persons that would spearhead that?

7 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I your testimony, you
9 have some references to the processes that are used
10 to select from the candidates that come forward and
11 I'm trying to find it.

12 Okay, you indicate that in the 2017-2018 year,
13 there was - page 5, the university-wide applicant
14 pool by race ethnicity for 90 searches with
15 underutilization. So, as I recall, there are
16 particular areas that CUNY calls underutilization, I
17 think it's science. Can you refresh my memory about
18 what those areas of underutilization are?

19 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Of course, so basically
20 underutilization is a technical HR term associated
21 with Equal Opportunity Act. And the way that it is
22 used within CUNY and most higher ed institutions
23 across the countries at the department level.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.
25

1
2 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, we will look at, if there is
3 a search that will be done for a faculty member at a
4 particular department, depending on the discipline,
5 there is data from the Labor Department that will
6 suggest what the availability of stem to your point,
7 of faculty members in chemistry for example, are into
8 gender, race and ethnicity.

9 And so, an effort is made when a search is being
10 conducted to ensure that the candidate pool reflects
11 the availability and the department is said to have
12 underutilization in say female or African American or
13 Latino if the current faculty composition in those
14 areas is below the national availability.

15 And so, when we say that there were 90 searches
16 conducted in 2017-2018, that had underutilization,
17 that refers to the fact that there were 90 searches
18 in departments across CUNY where there was a sense
19 that given the data, that the faculty was less
20 diverse and it could be given the availability of
21 professionals in those fields.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, that's what again? That
23 last sentence?

24 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: That the faculty of that
25 particular department was less diverse than it could

1
2 be with respect to the national availability of
3 professionals in that area.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so, your testimony
5 goes on to say that 45 percent or 3,000 of the 7,000
6 applicants were from underrepresented minority
7 groups. Three percent were Italian American, 6
8 percent were unknown and 46 percent were White. What
9 happened to the Blacks? Did we leave them out or I'm
10 missing something here.

11 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Yes, I believe that Black
12 applicants are within the 45 percent.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Within the 45 -

14 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: The 45 percent probably and I
15 can get that breakdown for you Chairwoman. That
16 includes both Black and Latino candidates.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I would like to have
18 that disaggregated, so that I could see that because
19 that's my issue. That's my concern, that's what I've
20 spoken about very pointedly since I've been here.
21 Where is the Black and Latino?

22 So, I really would like to have that
23 disaggregated and then finally, also, it says 55
24 percent of the total hires were from federally
25

1
2 represented minority race ethnicities. Six percent
3 were Italian American, 39 percent White and unknown.

4 So, this is not for me addressing my concern
5 about where are the Black and Latino personnel that
6 we're looking to hire. So, it gets back to my
7 opening remarks about the emphasis that's put on
8 western culture and valuing them more highly. And
9 apparently, hiring them in greater numbers than what
10 would be for Blacks and Latino's. So, I really would
11 like to get that disaggregated, if I could have that
12 information.

13 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: We'll certainly make that
14 available. The one point I will make regarding the
15 data, if that 45 – for those 90 searches with
16 underutilization, 45 percent of the candidates were
17 from underrepresented groups, yet 54 percent of those
18 hired were from underrepresented groups, suggesting
19 that some of the processes that have been put in
20 place at the campuses, have allowed the diversity of
21 the underutilization issue to be addressed
22 effectively.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, well, I can't really
24 determine for myself the impact that this had in a
25 positive way on hiring Black and Latino if I don't

1
2 have them disaggregated and if they just simply
3 lumped — because we know that Italian Americans are
4 considered underrepresented. They're in that
5 category, so that doesn't for me, give me any data as
6 to what number for Black and Latino —

7 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: And we will definitely get you
8 that. I just want to indicate that the Italian
9 American numbers are separate from the 54.4.

10 So, 45 percent were of color and 3 percent were
11 Italian Americans in the pool. From the hiring, 54
12 percent were of color, and 6 percent were Italian
13 American.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

15 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: But we'll certainly get you
16 better data.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. So, I do
18 have some other questions as well.

19 In terms of the candidates who are interviewed,
20 do we have the breakdown as to the number of persons,
21 candidates who applied compared to the number who
22 were interviewed and then eventually to the number
23 that were offered a position? Do we have that
24 information as well?
25

1
2 And, I'm not talking about the group that's
3 called underutilization, I'm talking about system -

4 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: In general.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

6 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Yes, so each campus tracks that
7 through their search processes. I haven't been at
8 the Central Office long enough to know if we have the
9 aggregated data, I believe we do but we can get back
10 to you with the direct information.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great.

12 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Perhaps my colleagues can speak
13 to how it's tracked on the campus level.

14 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, within the campus, before
15 faculty can bring, a research committee can bring in
16 candidates to interview, they need to first submit
17 the list of potential interviewees to our chief
18 diversity office. So, who has to then certify that
19 the pool is representative of the population.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And if it's not then?

21 CHRISTINE MANGINO: They go back and they have to
22 expand to their bringing in for interviews.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and President Mason,
24 in your testimony you said that you announced the
25 creation of a new office of diversity, compliance,

1
2 equity and inclusion to be led by a vice president
3 will be identified by a national search reporting
4 directly to you.

5 So, has that office been filled yet?

6 KAROL MASON: No, the report just came to me and
7 I have just worked on the position description and
8 I'm forming the search committee. We are not using
9 an outside search firm. We are going to use an
10 internal search committee, but I have prior to
11 finalizing the position description, I have been
12 consulting with people across the city and across the
13 country to get the word out that we're going to be
14 looking to hire someone for this position.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then finally, how do we
16 address the issue of the departments heads who are
17 predominantly White and the I think, undo influence
18 they have on in fact selecting who candidates are who
19 are going to rise through the ranks. It's the old
20 boy network that has so often kept certified,
21 qualified Blacks in the lower levels and that allowed
22 them to percolate up to be able to be advanced. How
23 are we addressing that? Breaking that cycle of the
24 old boy network, we talk about cultural sensitivities
25 and all of that, but how are we going to actually

1
2 break through? Are there incentives that we can
3 offer? Are there advances that we can make that will
4 help break that network?

5 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, we make sure that the
6 search committee itself needs to be diverse. If the
7 department itself does not have enough faculty to
8 represent the diversity that we're looking for, then
9 other faculty from other departments join that search
10 firm. For the most part, our chairs are not chairing
11 a search process and then each department, the search
12 committee then submits three names to my office as
13 their recommendations so that we make sure that there
14 is a diverse pool and over the last six years, we've
15 increased the number of diverse faculty from 49
16 percent to 56 percent. So, it's now the majority in
17 our campus.

18 KAROL MASON: And at John Jay, we've had very
19 little hiring authority since I've been here because
20 of fiscal constraints, but this year, we are going to
21 be doing some hiring and the provost and I are making
22 it clear to the faculty chairs and we've brought
23 training to the hiring search committee's to make
24 sure they understand the implicit bias and how that
25 works in their selection process. And made it clear

1
2 to them that our goal is to have a faculty that looks
3 like our student body.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and back to the
5 testimony. In your testimony, you didn't have a
6 chance to enter it into the record, but you have an
7 entry that I would like for you to perhaps talk about
8 a little more in depth. It's about Macaulay, it
9 says, Macaulay has enrolled community college
10 students in a bid to - it's on page 5 again. In a
11 bid to expand opportunities to deserving students,
12 who for variety of reasons, have taken indirect
13 routes to college. Under a pilot program called
14 Macaulay Bridge, selected sophomores from Bronx
15 Community College and the Borough of Manhattan
16 Community College, will earn their associate degrees
17 in the spring and then continue as Macaulay at Lehman
18 College students.

19 Can you talk a little bit more about that
20 program? Because I think Macaulay has also been one
21 of the programs that has a limited number of African
22 American students. So, I'm interested to know more
23 about this approach.

24 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Yes, this is - and I'm
25 personally very gratified by this particular project

1
2 as I was the president of Lehman College when I had
3 the opportunity to work with first and second
4 **[INAUDIBLE 56:29]** from Bronx Community College
5 initially. And Mary Pearl; the Dean of the Macaulay
6 Honors College.

7 So, the program basically, it's important for two
8 things. One, it's a concrete example of how Macaulay
9 is trying to ensure that it expands access and
10 provides access to more diverse students. And it
11 also is important because it's looking at how we can
12 use pedagogy in an effective way to accelerate the
13 learning of students that may not have been prepared
14 academically for the Macaulay Honors College upon
15 graduating from high school, but in short order, with
16 the right supports can get to the level where they
17 can join the Macaulay's Honors program during their
18 junior and senior years.

19 So, right now, we have approximately twenty
20 students that started at BCC or BMCC that have
21 participated in special course work in support
22 services and that will now be transferring to Lehman
23 College as part of their Macaulay Honors experience.

24 A lot of the learning that we are doing in terms
25 of what's effective in the classroom to elevate and

1
2 accelerate the learning of our students, will then
3 not only help this particular project expand but
4 also, hopefully inform how we are doing the same type
5 of work elsewhere.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And how were the students
7 selected?

8 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, the students were selected
9 by a committee that included, I believe, and I will
10 correct myself after the fact if my recollection is
11 not correct. Faculty from Macaulay and Lehman and
12 BCC, that was the original partner.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What kinds of criteria were
14 presented to say, oh, this student would benefit and
15 this student might do well.

16 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: I would request permission to
17 submit that on the record, because I will likely not
18 make it justice.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. I had a few
20 more questions. Okay, in terms of the funding, you
21 indicated that there is a hiring – you are not able
22 to hire all of the positions that you would need.
23 Why is that the case? Is it that positions have not
24 been advertised or the budget doesn't allow for those
25 positions to be filled?

1
2 KAROL MASON: I have a deficit in my tax levy
3 budget that doesn't allow me to be hiring, so I'm
4 being fiscally conservative and as people retire,
5 then I use that money that comes from freeing up
6 those salaries to then be able to hire new faculty.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, how many positions would
8 you say you haven't filled or you could have filled
9 had you had the finances for that and do you find
10 that they're in particular departments? Do you look
11 to have certain areas fully staffed and others not?

12 KAROL MASON: So, I can't answer it in terms of
13 what I would have done, because we've been operating
14 under this kind of framework work for my full term.

15 What we've done is when we make hiring decisions,
16 when we do have the availability, the provost looks
17 at the departments and makes a lot of determinations
18 based on how many students are not being taught by
19 full time faculty and looking at a number of factors
20 in order to determine where to hire.

21 So, it's not if a department loses a faculty
22 member, it doesn't necessarily backfill to that
23 department. We take the position and look and see
24 where the need is across the college.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so for example, as you
3 can imagine and as I've often said, I'm very much
4 interested in the African American studies and the
5 African American departments. What kind of impact
6 does this kind of setting have on not having funding
7 or not having the personnel in a particular African
8 American studies department at a particular
9 university?

10 KAROL MASON: I was going to say that I'm
11 probably not articulating this clearly enough.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

13 KAROL MASON: Because I think that what I'm
14 talking about the ratio of full time faculty to
15 adjunct faculty is probably a CUNY-wide demographic.
16 And so, we depend a lot on adjuncts but we do have a
17 strong core faculty in our Africana Studies
18 department. And the smaller departments, the factors
19 that we use to determine where to allocate positions
20 factor in the size of the department. So, our larger
21 departments are not prioritized over our smaller
22 departments at all.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if a person – how many
24 full time faculty members are required to actually
25

1
2 qualify to be called a department? Is there a
3 number?

4 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, it's not necessarily a
5 number. It's the structure based on our charter.
6 So, we have units, so our Black Studies unit was
7 originally one full time faculty member with a
8 handful. Of course, it has now grown over the years
9 but their then within a department of humanities
10 which has a number of different units within it.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, your Black Studies is
12 within the humanities department?

13 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright.

15 KAROL MASON: And John Jay is different because
16 we don't have schools. Everything is an individual
17 department. So, we have a separate Africana Studies
18 department, we have a separate Latin American
19 Studies, Latinx Studies department. We have a
20 separate English department. We don't have a school
21 of arts and scientists or school of humanities and
22 the number of faculty has not been a predeterminate
23 to becoming a department.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, it's not a
25 predeterminate to -

1 KAROL MASON: There are a number of factors.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, there are a number of
3 factors, okay.

4 KAROL MASON: Right.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, in your conclusion, in
6 your testimony, you said, clearly CUNY has long
7 understood that a vibrant exchange of ideas and
8 perspectives within the classroom is informed by
9 identity. This leads not only to more engaging and
10 inclusive learning process, but also increases
11 retention, as students want to continue classes in
12 which their individual identity and cultural
13 background is not only respected and reflected but
14 integral to the functioning of the class as a unit.

15 What can we do for instructors to in fact have
16 that kind of awareness that – well, for presidents I
17 guess, to have that kind of awareness that the
18 composition of the faculty is important, to provide
19 role models for the students who are there, to buy an
20 inspiration, to have the mentoring, a commonality of
21 a common ethnic heritage. How important that is as
22 we go through the selection process for hiring and
23 retaining and elevating faculty that reflects CUNY's
24

1
2 student population. How can we make sure that
3 presidents understand the value of that?

4 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Well, I will say having been a
5 president until just four months ago and having had
6 the opportunity to Co-Chair the Presidents Committee
7 on Faculty Diversity with my colleague Michelle
8 Anderson from Brooklyn College, that I am convinced
9 that our presidents understand the importance of
10 this. And that they are committed to ensuring that
11 there is a better representation among our faculty
12 that is more aligned with our student body.

13 I think that the challenges that we face, sort of
14 including challenges around how quickly we can hire
15 faculty are providing or pacing the level at which we
16 can drive change.

17 The mention I made earlier about our new
18 Chancellor entering his first few months, clearly
19 articulating that this is one of I believe it's five
20 things, major goals that he wants the presidents to
21 establish and be accountable for. Since the message
22 that it's not only about knowing that it's the right
23 thing but making sure that we're investing the time,
24 talent and energy to getting the job done.

1
2 And so, I am very optimistic that as we come
3 before this committee in the future years, we will
4 see a steady uptick in our ability to move these
5 numbers forward.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And at present, I believe,
7 there are seven interim presidents at CUNY campuses,
8 York, Queens, Lehman at the senior colleges, Queens
9 Borough, Borough of Manhattan, LaGuardia Community
10 Colleges and the CUNY Graduate Center.

11 Are there more than this seven or are those seven

12 -

13 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: I think those are the seven as
14 of now.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and where are we in the
16 process? How far in the process are we? Are they at
17 different stages or are they clumped together? And
18 how far along?

19 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: They're at different stages. I
20 believe about three or four of those that you
21 mentioned have searches that are ongoing. Some of
22 them are near completion and others will be launched
23 in the spring.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do we know which ones are
25 near completion?

1
2 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: I believe that the Graduate
3 Center is one of them and I believe Baruch College is
4 another but we can get you more information on the
5 timelines.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so there must be
7 eight, because I don't have Baruch on my list.

8 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, Baruch doesn't have an
9 interim, perhaps that why.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, I see.

11 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: But President Wallerstein has
12 announced his retirement.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and they don't have an
14 interim. Okay, and we had had some questions at the
15 time that the searches began in terms of - Oh, and I
16 want to acknowledge that we've been joined by
17 Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, who is a member of this
18 Committee.

19 We had had some concerns about how these searches
20 are conducted and how it is that the community can
21 play a more integral role in having a voice and
22 interviewing candidates and deciding which person and
23 candidates they feel are a better match for the
24 community. How are we moving in that regard?
25

1
2 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Well, I believe that the search
3 processes, the ones that have already commenced are
4 following the Board of Trustees guidance. And, so
5 there is a search committee that includes I believe
6 five members of the Board of Trustees representing
7 the public interest, if you will. Faculty members
8 and administrators, I believe that it includes at
9 least one member from the community at large. And
10 that is the committee that is in charge of doing the
11 actual vetting of candidates and putting forth the
12 finalists.

13 The finalists will then go through a series of
14 interviews. The nature of those interviews can be
15 open or they can be closed, depending on what the
16 search committee recommends to the Chancellor given
17 trying to balance the confidentiality of the process
18 with obviously the openness of the process.

19 So, it is a possibility tht some searches will be
20 open and some will not, but that is part of the
21 process that's articulated by the board.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, what finalists have been
23 selected? Why would there not be an opportunity for
24 an openness and for those finalists to be able to be
25 presented?

1
2 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, there are several -

3 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Because if it's some places
4 yes and some places no, what determines that?

5 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Well, I think what it tends to
6 determine is the candidate pool at the end and the
7 willingness of the finalists to participate in the
8 open process.

9 In some searches, and I'm talking now sort of
10 generally, higher ed nationally, you will have
11 candidates, finalists that are seating presidents for
12 example elsewhere and would withdraw from
13 consideration because it would undermine their
14 ability to continue at their current employment.

15 So, that's typically the reason why Boards of
16 Trustees as CUNY Board have established flexibility
17 in determining search by search how to manage them.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I see, okay. Okay, I'm sure
19 there will more questions that I'll have that I will
20 see as I - Oh, I did have a question. In terms of
21 Hostos College in your testimony on page two, you say
22 that our focus has been on connecting with authors
23 who write about feelings of alienation, conflicted
24 identity and oppression and you talk about so, the
25 boys book. Who teaches these classes and what's the

1
2 experience of the instructors in terms of an
3 awareness of the authenticity of what's in these
4 books?

5 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, this specific book is
6 actually being taught by our sociology department and
7 before anyone teaches in this program, their going
8 through a year long process of workshops with faculty
9 from Columbia University and colleagues on our
10 campus, they read the books together, discuss issues
11 and determine how to best select parts of it for our
12 classes and what activities should be along with
13 that.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, we would hope that
15 during this year long time, there's some sensitivity
16 and -

17 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, because I was very -
19 so this sounds good, but it depends on the position
20 of the persons who are teaching it, okay.

21 And also, you talk about there's a handbook. The
22 roadmap to cultural sensitivity, the journey to
23 culture awareness. Who prepared that handbook and
24 you said it has activities for the purpose of
25

1
2 expanding the understanding of other cultures. Who
3 prepared the handbook?

4 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, it was a number of our
5 faculty with our career services and our employers in
6 the field and what they are seeing with our students
7 in the internships and the missed steps some of our
8 students might be doing out in the field to make sure
9 that we're being sensitive to students.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright, and then for
11 the students, do we have any kind of survey about the
12 students opinion of the classes once they have
13 concluded taking the classes. Do we survey and how
14 are their responses to those surveys incorporated
15 into what generates for the next session?

16 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, it's part of our entire
17 ongoing assessment process. So, there's surveys at
18 the end of the classes, there's surveys at the end of
19 the workshops with career services and then it
20 informs our practices going forward. That's of
21 course our college we do that.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And yes, the other question
23 is, do the students in their survey indicate their
24 response to whether or not they think that the class
25 was inclusive enough in its presentation?

1
2 CHRISTINE MANGINO: I would have to go back and
3 get that specific information for you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright. Okay, as you
5 continue, please get the mic a little closer to you,
6 so we're making sure that we can record all that.
7 Okay, so the Office of Recruitment and Diversity, the
8 efforts are to recruit and hire ethnically, racially
9 diverse faculty and each individual campus would then
10 design its plan and submit it. Is that how that
11 works? And who reviews the plans and determines
12 whether or not they have met that requirement or the
13 framework that you have set?

14 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, at the campus level, it's
15 typically the Chief Diversity Officer, will work with
16 the faculty, the search committees to ensure that
17 there is a recruitment plan that will adequately
18 address the issues of underutilization if they exist
19 in the department.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And does the central body,
21 the central administration review each of the plans?

22 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: We do not review to my
23 knowledge; I do not review all of the plans. I do
24 know that that the data that I shared on the 2017-
25 2018 work was sort of a pilot that the faculty

1
2 diversity working group, lead by presidents put in
3 place and for that one in particular, all of the
4 diversity plans where there was underutilization were
5 looked at by the central office.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you think it would be
7 helpful for the center office to review the
8 individual campus plans?

9 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: That is one of the items on my
10 list of things to discuss with the new VP or I'm
11 sorry, the new Vice Chancellor of Human Resources
12 around how to structure that work.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I think that it would be
14 helpful and I'm glad that you are looking at that to
15 see how that could be done.

16 Can you talk about the status of the Post-
17 Doctoral Fellowship program which was implemented to
18 diversify the pool of potential faculty and to track
19 future leaders into the disciplines?

20 It's called the Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program.

21 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Yes, I believe that program is
22 one of our funded programs. I do not have the
23 information with me, but we'll certainly get you an
24 update.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I think that would be
3 helpful because it's described as an initiative to
4 support educational projects, scholarly research,
5 creative endeavors and professional activities that
6 promote diversity, affirmative action and
7 multiculturalism. So, I understand that it may be an
8 outside funding source but I think we certainly can
9 benefit from knowing where they are.

10 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Sure.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And additionally, can you
12 talk to us about the status of the Faculty Fellowship
13 Publication program, which is described as developed
14 to assist full time, untenured faculty in the design
15 and execution of scholarly writing projects, via
16 group sessions, and one on one meetings with an
17 assignment or Faculty Fellowship Publication program,
18 because I'm not in the academia world but I
19 understand that it's publish, publish or die.

20 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, faculty are able to apply
21 to CUNY Central and then they're selected and a
22 number of faculty participate each year and they do a
23 year long workshop at Central Office with a cohort of
24 other faculty from other campuses to help support
25 each other in their writing, read what they have,

1
2 give each other feedback and also hold each other
3 accountable to keep them going in writing. It's been
4 very successful. The faculty on our campus who have
5 participated have all come out with publications. A
6 couple with actual books and they end up keeping
7 their cohort informally over the years to continue
8 that work. But what it does is give them also a
9 release from one of their courses that their
10 teaching, so that they have time to put towards their
11 writing.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there any kind of
13 renumeration that they get in accordance with it? I
14 heard you say the release from teaching but -

15 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Okay, so the money goes to
16 release them from the one course, not actual money -

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, there is no stipend
18 attached to this?

19 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Sometimes they have summer
20 salary. There are certain programs within CUNY that
21 will help support them during the summer, so that
22 they will have a summer stipend in order to also do
23 work that way.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what is the status of
25 the Latino Faculty Initiative, which is designed to

1
2 "seek to enhance the pool of applicants for faculty
3 and administrative positions at CUNY", Latino Faculty
4 Initiative?

5 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, I will get that information
6 to you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and do we have a
8 similar plan for Black faculty?

9 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: I will inquire.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I've seen the Latino
11 but I would like to know, is there also a plan for a
12 specific target. I mean, everybody should know, I'm
13 going to ask about Black. Everybody should know
14 that, so I would really appreciate getting that
15 information and seeing how we can make that a reality
16 because we certainly know that Blacks and Latino's
17 are underrepresented, not only in the
18 underrepresented disciplines, but throughout CUNY.

19 So, we certainly want to see how we can do that.

20 KAROL MASON: Madam Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

22 KAROL MASON: I just wanted to add that as a
23 president whose received the message from our new
24 leadership, it is loud and clear and I understand the
25 importance of it and that has given me the ability to

1
2 go back to my provost and to our faculty chairs to
3 say, this is important and I will assessed on how
4 successful this is and that happening. And so, that
5 is a clear message from the leadership that allows me
6 to have a little bit more freedom in how I express
7 myself to the faculty when we talk about hiring.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And we certainly know that
9 what comes from the top is in fact very important and
10 when people see demonstrations that it's not just the
11 conversation but in fact, the actions that
12 demonstrate that that's in fact the reality. There
13 is often times a change and I do want to acknowledge
14 that I spoke with the Chancellor at length. He was
15 just very generous with his time. It wasn't like a
16 one hour meeting and okay, I have something else. He
17 was open ended with his time and I did in fact
18 impress upon him my major concerns and he was very
19 responsive and gave some personal testimony as to his
20 own efforts and successes in bringing Black
21 presidents on, so I did hear him and look forward to
22 seeing how we progress. Because this is a golden
23 opportunity for CUNY at this time with so many
24 vacancies, openings and college presidents positions

1
2 to help facilitate the change that we know is so
3 important.

4 And then, just finally, I think diversity and
5 curricula, that we talk about the curricula. How are
6 individual course syllabus reading lists created at
7 CUNY? And how effective is the individual professor
8 in that, the academic department and other
9 accrediting factors in determining what would be a
10 part of the course syllabus and reading lists that
11 are created?

12 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, every course needs to go
13 through their department curriculum committee and
14 then it goes to a collegewide curriculum committee
15 and then it goes to our senate, which is made up of
16 faculty staff and students and then it goes to CUNY.

17 So, there's a number of eyes on it throughout the
18 process.

19 KAROL MASON: But I wanted to talk about
20 specifically that you have curricula, and then you
21 have what's really taught in the class. And so, what
22 we've been doing at John Jay, again through our
23 teaching and learning center and part of our faculty
24 development days, we had – and I go to our faculty
25 development days and this past year was really eye

1
2 opening to see, we had a special session on how to
3 diversify your syllabus and make it more culturally
4 relevant and we brought in students and faculty
5 members. And people, what they did, was they brought
6 their syllabus with them. The ones they had planned,
7 and so they could look at it and have this intensive
8 workshop where they talked about, this is what it
9 looked like beforehand, this is what it looks like
10 now and people were really engaged.

11 And so, you know, you start with what I call your
12 early champions, and we've now got a core group that
13 are out there teaching the other faculty about how to
14 diversify your curriculum. The course are there but
15 how do you teach history? How do you teach
16 psychology, so that the students in the classroom see
17 people in the discipline who look like them, the
18 scholars who look like them. And so, we're seeing
19 the faculty embrace that in a much larger way and
20 taking the initiative to make sure that their
21 syllabus incorporates these concepts as they teach
22 the class.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You mentioned faculty
24 development days. Can you talk to me about the
25 frequency, how often they occur? When do they occur?

1
2 Are they planned to be at the beginning or mid-year
3 and does each campus have the same number of faculty
4 development days?

5 KAROL MASON: Every campus handles things
6 differently. At John Jay, we have Faculty
7 Development Day before the start of each semester.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Before the semester starts?

9 KAROL MASON: Each semester, so we'll have
10 another one in January. We had one in August before
11 the semester started and we'll have another one in
12 January where we have a range of topics and we have
13 tracks that people can take and so, we have a track
14 that throughout the day about if you are interested
15 in having a more culturally relevant curriculum and
16 experience for your students, there's a whole track
17 of things you can do that day. If you want to focus
18 on mental health, there's a track for that throughout
19 the day. And I can say that CUNY has done some
20 wonderful things in terms of preparing all of us to
21 be more culturally sensitive.

22 Last Friday, CUNY Central sponsored a conference
23 on mental health with a Steve Foundation on mental
24 health for a diverse college campus and helping us
25 understand how being Latinx, LGBTQ and disabled, how

1
2 that impacts the experience of our students on campus
3 and how to sensitize the campus to addressing those
4 issues and it was widely attended by people from
5 academic affairs to student affairs.

6 So, CUNY is really taking a leadership in
7 addressing the issues of the diversity of our campus
8 and how do we equip the campuses to be successful,
9 create successful experiences for our students.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, these conferences are
11 offered in addition to the Faculty Development Days
12 that occur on campuses?

13 KAROL MASON: Correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, are there other
15 opportunities and how frequent are they, because I
16 wasn't aware that these were opportunities for
17 faculty and students as well or this is just for
18 faculty?

19 KAROL MASON: It depends on what you are talking
20 about. The Faculty Development Day, that's a John
21 Jay specific concept. I don't know what other
22 campuses do. That's what we do at John Jay.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, okay.

24 KAROL MASON: I don't know that other campuses do
25 but we're doing it and what we've done is the faculty

1
2 teach the classes and they come up with what they
3 want and so, for example the one where we talked
4 about diversifying the curriculum, they brought
5 students into that.

6 Student they had worked with, so students could
7 talk about how their experience differed because the
8 faculty members thought about that in the way they
9 brought the curriculum together.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, do we know if this is
11 something that's campus throughout the system, or is
12 it just specifically campuses that have a dedicated
13 Faculty Development Day?

14 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, every campus has a center
15 for teaching and learning, so how they structure that
16 might be different. So, at Hostos, we have full days
17 but then we also have workshops throughout the
18 semester, usually once a week where faculty can
19 attend. We have a new faculty orientation as an
20 onboard enrolling new faculty, which is a year long
21 mandated program, where they are meeting twice a
22 month for three hours in order to really get
23 acclimated with who are students are but also the
24 services that are on campus, so that we make sure

1
2 that they are able to connect students with what
3 needs to happen.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, with these objectives,
5 are there any quantitative measures that are taken to
6 access whether or not they achieve what the objective
7 was. You know, do we have a quantitative data?

8 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, it's very challenging to
9 access the impact of how faculty have actually
10 applied things in the classroom. So, we try to then
11 circle back and ask them you know, out of what you've
12 learned in that workshop, what have you now
13 implemented going forward but they're more anecdotal
14 than hard quantitative numbers.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, we don't then really
16 have a way to - so, it's self-reported. Professors
17 themselves, the faculty themselves would determine
18 how -

19 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Right, so we have student
20 evaluations at the end of every semester where
21 students evaluate the course and the instruction that
22 they received in that course and we look at that and
23 we actually put in a program a couple years ago,
24 called, The Hostos Teaching Institute, where if we
25 serve faculty, we're struggling and students were

1
2 having you know, some issues with the class. We were
3 asking faculty to attend a yearlong workshop on
4 pedagogy and teaching and classroom management and
5 inclusiveness.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, as we're talking
7 particularly about inclusion and diversity, is there
8 a specific question on that survey that addresses
9 that area?

10 CHRISTINE MANGINO: I'm sure, I'd have to go back
11 and look but I'm sure.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I would appreciate
13 getting an answer to that. And then, in one other
14 point, how is CUNY - we talked a little about the
15 area of the under - I forget the term that they use.

16 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Underutilization.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Underutilization, that's the
18 stem areas right. So, how is CUNY diversifying the
19 curriculum. We talked about hiring and trying to
20 retain faculty in that area, but how are we
21 diversifying the curriculum in those stem areas in
22 addition to getting faculty that's diverse, how are
23 we diversifying the curriculum?

24 Are we talking about the greatness of advocate
25 civilizations historically, you know, the science,

1
2 the exactness of the pyramids, how are we
3 diversifying that to have students be aware that
4 there's some Africans and math should be something
5 that's really easy because of the great history. If
6 we can talk about that kind of progression. So, that
7 students know that there's historically evidence that
8 there's capable examples of the greatness of Africans
9 in the stem areas.

10 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, we require all of our
11 courses to besides assess what is needed for the
12 actual discipline, to also assess something related
13 to our general education outcomes. One of those
14 outcomes being diversity and inclusion. So, they
15 need to show that there are assignments specific to
16 that and that there is learning happening in those
17 areas.

18 And then there is lots of extra-curricular
19 activities right, to the morning, I was at our
20 Science Day, which is a three day event and really
21 showing the diversity of scientists. Women in the
22 sciences and sharing our students successes of the
23 number of students that we have. Women engineers
24 that we now have moving onto senior colleges or on
25 for doctoral programs.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and I think wrapping
3 up, the flexible common core features six liberal
4 arts and science courses and at least one course from
5 each of the following five areas; world cultures and
6 global issues; U.S. experience in diversity; creative
7 expression; individual and society; and scientific
8 world. How does CUNY ensure that every student, no
9 matter of the degree that they are pursuing, a major
10 that they may have declared engages in a diverse
11 curricula?

12 CHRISTINE MANGINO: So, the way it's set out, the
13 whole pathways with that, students have to take 30
14 credits and a specific number of credits in each one
15 of those areas. So, there's no way that you can
16 graduate with a degree and not have experienced a
17 course from those areas.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so, but the required
19 common core consists of four areas. Twelve credits
20 in the associates of arts; associate of science and
21 bachelor's degree; and the English composition
22 courses; mathematical and quantitative reasoning;
23 life and physical sciences.

24

25

1
2 So, how can we be sure that these required
3 courses address the diverse perspectives and issues
4 that we've talked about?

5 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Because they must take one
6 course in Society in the U.S. experience in its
7 diversity. They must take one course in that. They
8 must take one course in the global world cultures and
9 global issues and then they have an extra three
10 credits to go back and take a second course in one of
11 those areas.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, they still have to add
13 one of those five courses in that. Okay, so the
14 required core has how many? How many credits are
15 that?

16 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Thirty credits, so it's ten
17 courses.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Ten courses, and the flexible
19 common core has how many credits?

20 CHRISTINE MANGINO: Well, it's total. So, the
21 top part, the English and math, it is two courses in
22 English, one course in math, one course in science
23 and then the flexible core, they must take one course
24 in each of those buckets and then a second one in one
25 of them.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright, one of those,
3 okay. Oh, I want to acknowledge we've been joined by
4 Council Member Rodriguez, would you have any
5 questions?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: If you don't mind.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I'd like to say
9 something about this. First of all, I apologize for
10 being late, but you know, this fight is a fight that
11 will never stop and when we address you know, the
12 challenges that we face about you know, the need to
13 bring diversity you know, something that we can not
14 promise the presence of the future generation, even
15 now our son and daughter that we will be able fix it.

16 Because everything is a pipeline, so when we have
17 in New York City that we invest \$30 billion to
18 educate 1.1 million students in the public school and
19 from there we recruit and it has an impact on the
20 diversity that we have in the classroom in community
21 college, the senior colleges.

22 So, no doubt that we are facing today a crisis.
23 A crisis that it is only going to be an amount of
24 time. It's like the Me Too Movement. It's like the
25 NYCHA crisis. You know, people leave and they have

1
2 work and they have passed through those buildings and
3 they know, we know, we have been witnesses of those
4 situations of public housing. We have seen how women
5 arrive have being violated for decades but now, we
6 can say we cannot handle it anymore, especially the
7 social media you know, made an impact on being able
8 to know what is going on at the current time in this
9 situation.

10 So, the issue of diversity, for me, it started
11 first with a pipeline. So, when we have the most
12 segregated education assistance in the nation, in our
13 public school, where we invest \$30 billion to educate
14 1.1 million students. And we have the public school
15 of the rich and the public school of the poor and
16 then from the public school for the rich, we get the
17 average increase of students that from elementary,
18 middle, high school, they get ready to say, we have a
19 high chance, we got into Hunter Brooklyn College,
20 City College, the higher tier.

21 So, different from my year then I was in City
22 College in the 80's taking those classes with
23 Professor Jeffrey. You know, organizing to get in
24 the 80's and the 90's and you walk through City
25 College, 80 percent of the students they were Black

1
2 and Latino. Today, that number is on the early in
3 the 70.

4 So, you know, the issue of diversity for me is
5 about unless we deal and we are selected, and we know
6 that that's happening, we will not get into that
7 trouble.

8 So, yeah, there's a lack of diversity when we
9 look in the curriculum. There is a lack of diversity
10 on what are we teaching you know, our youth. I, as
11 an immigrant that I am, I always say that you know,
12 it was recently that we got Bloomberg [INAUDIBLE
13 1:40:41] street after Juan Rodriguez, the first no
14 Native American who settle here insisting 13 and 3
15 Black men from the Island Fiona. 5,000 Black
16 Dominican came to Ellis Island in 1887. Those
17 educational teach in the classroom. So, we have
18 issues on what we are teaching. This is still a
19 European Center curriculum that we use and even
20 though yes, I took certain classes and we had a great
21 professor that they are committed and they go the
22 extra mile, but when we look about the tests that we
23 use in all of those requirement classes, they are not
24 focused on the diversity of the city of New York.

1
2 And I feel that even though we have made
3 progress, we have to do much more. When it comes to
4 the diversity, you know, who are teaching those
5 classes. The diversity is not there. From the
6 hiring committee, those hiring committees, they don't
7 have diversity because you know, unless we you know,
8 send a message from the top down. And I'd love to
9 see the new legacy by CUNY. I happen to see fellow
10 being the Chairman. I happened to see someone that
11 was at also Community College was committed to work
12 with us but I feel that you know, we as a city, we
13 need to demand more.

14 You know, just because we see some diversity
15 today, that's not what we see in literacy of CUNY.
16 For the time, you know, the Chancellor and two or
17 three people being Latino as we are, you know all at
18 some point are for American good literacy position,
19 it doesn't mean that the literacy of the institution
20 who make decisions, who make the hiring committee to
21 decide who are provosts, who are presidents. They
22 reflect the diversity of our city.

23 So, I know that you know, with the Chairman here,
24 you know, we have a voice advocating for this. I
25 know that we can say, you know, we happen to see the

1
2 progress but I just want to highlight it. That we
3 need to do much more. That this is a real crisis
4 that we're dealing with when it comes to the
5 diversity, what are we teaching with the diversity or
6 who are the faces of people leading the department
7 and all the institutions.

8 So, with that, all I can say is adding my voice
9 to let everyone know, we cannot do both and we need
10 to push the institution because the challenges that
11 we face is not a one individual thing. You said
12 cultural, that we have to break. To push the
13 institution, the leadership on curricula and
14 everything in the city of New York should reflect the
15 diversity that we have today.

16 And I end with this, in the 1900 census, the New
17 York City population was 96 percent White, only two
18 percent were Black. Latino nation were not counted.
19 Today, population is 29 percent Latino, 27 percent
20 African American, 70 percent Asian. Let's look for
21 whatever we teach for whoever our leaders in
22 departments to reflect the diversity of the city, we
23 have to create pipeline. We are not building this
24 from pipeline. I hope that with the new leadership
25 we will be able to get closer but you know much more

1
2 has to be done. I have faith in the Chairman, I have
3 faith with the leadership that you bring on board but
4 I know also that he have inherit an institution that
5 traditional has been letting out Black and Latino
6 from leadership to opportunity and again today, in
7 2019, especially to the youth, you know, most of the
8 students are sitting – we lost population in the
9 senior colleges.

10 Thank you Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Council Member.
12 Just one last point, in your testimony, you didn't
13 have a chance to read it into the testimony but it is
14 in your testimony. You talk about the centers and
15 institutes that operate in CUNY. It's on page 9, the
16 campus base centers and university-wide institutes
17 that organize extra-curricular activities and you
18 identify a few of them. The Asian American Center of
19 Queens College; Center for Puerto Studies at Hunter
20 College; The Center for Black Literature at Medgar
21 Evers College; as a number of university-wide
22 entities, such as the Mexican Studies Institute at
23 Lehman College, and the Institute for Research on the
24 African Diaspora in the Americas and the Caribbean
25 housed at the Graduate Center.

1
2 And you also note that there is a \$500,000 grant
3 from the Council Speaker to develop the Center for
4 Ethnic, Racial, and Religious Understanding at Queens
5 College. And there was recently a memo that talked
6 about that; I think that it was announced yesterday
7 that this is moving forward and we're certainly
8 excited about that and we're looking forward to
9 seeing what kind of concrete differences we can
10 expect now that we have these programs in place.

11 But just briefly about the centers, what kind of
12 funding formula is used for the centers that
13 presently exist? There are more than 50 I'm sure,
14 because I have a list of them; I didn't bring it.
15 But what kind of funding formula is used in these
16 giving money and funds to these centers?

17 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, the university is currently
18 doing an inventory of all the centers and institutes
19 and looking at the policies that have been in place
20 to create them in the first place and to monitor
21 their work overtime. The funding based on the
22 current policy was provided to new centers in the
23 institute is meant to get them off the ground.
24 There's no clear formula. It depends on what the
25 scope of the center, the institute is. What other

1 monies they bring to the table from foundations and
2 donors and when they go to the Board of Trustees,
3 they go with sort of a financial plan for the first
4 few years. There are some of our centers and
5 institutes that have been around for a longer time
6 and those have over time, been able to generate funds
7 from the city and/or the state, and some from CUNY
8 Central or the colleges that host them.

9
10 But that is uneven and it's on a case by case
11 basis. So, the work we're doing now is trying to
12 take a look at the policy so that we can ensure that
13 there's equitable access to whatever resources are
14 being provided by the university.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Are they ensured of
16 dedicated space at each campus where they are?

17 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: No.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: They're not?

19 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: No.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so is that going to be
21 a part of what you look at also?

22 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Well, the - and so, there may
23 have to be recertification process of centers and
24 institutes because when they are approved, they must
25 demonstrate that they have already secured funding

1
2 for their operations and space for their operations.
3 And so, over time, what we have seen is that some
4 centers have outgrown their initial needs and so,
5 that puts some pressure on the center and the campus
6 and the university to try to meet those needs, so
7 that they can continue to advance their mission and
8 the flip of that is centers and institutes that may
9 have not continued to evolve and grow. And so, now
10 they are occupying or utilizing resources that maybe
11 made available to others.

12 So, that's part of the analysis that we're doing
13 right now.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And when do you expect to be
15 able to have that completed so that you might share
16 that with us?

17 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: So, we're looking at an internal
18 timetable that would have us take to the Board of
19 Trustees, some recommendations in spring.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright, well, I think
21 that most of the questions that I have that I'm
22 presenting to you; I do have to say that I'm very
23 disappointed that you did not have the data that I
24 asked for because I had asked for it at a previous
25 hearing particularly regarding the Post-Doctoral

1 Fellowship program and the Diversity Projects
2 Development Fund and the Faculty Fellowship
3 Publication program. Well, we did talk briefly about
4 that one, yes, and the Latino Faculty Initiative,
5 because those are questions that I had asked
6 previously. So, I am disappointed that you weren't
7 prepared with that information and I do hope that
8 we'll be able to get from you the information that I
9 requested, as well as the data disaggregated, so that
10 I can look to see how we are moving. And look
11 forward also to the new so-called master plan. Maybe
12 we can get another label for that. The new plan
13 coming forward that shows some kind of evaluation of
14 what previous plans have presented.

16 But I do thank you for coming and thank you so
17 much and we'll call the next panel now.

18 JOSE LUIS CRUZ: Thank you for the opportunity
19 and we will submit the data you have requested, thank
20 you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. Okay the
22 next panel that we'll call is Dr. Anthony Browne from
23 Hunter College, Department of Africana and Puerto
24 Rican and Latino Studies, Dr. Brenda Greene from
25

1
2 Medgar Evers College, and Professor James Blake from
3 BMCC, Black Faculty.

4 Thank you so much for coming and offering
5 testimony on this important topic and you can start,
6 we'll start with far left. And you can give us your
7 name and present your testimony.

8 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Good afternoon Chair Inez
9 Barron and thank you for spearheading this hearing on
10 diversity of curriculum in higher education. I am a
11 full professor; my name is Dr. Brenda Greene and I am
12 a full professor with nearly 40 years of teaching and
13 administrative experience in CUNY.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can you pull the mic a
15 little closer.

16 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Is that better?

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is that better, okay.

18 DR. BRENDA GREENE: So, I am representing several
19 roles at this hearing: I am Professor of English at
20 Medgar Evers College. I am the Founder and Executive
21 Director of the Center for Black Literature at Medgar
22 Evers College and a Member of the CUNY Association of
23 Black Faculty and Staff.

24 Founded in 2002, the Center for Black Literature
25 - is that better now?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's better.

DR. BRENDA GREENE: Okay, I hope everyone heard everything.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I hope so.

DR. BRENDA GREENE: Okay, so founded in 2002, the Center for Black Literature was established to expand, broaden, and enrich the public's knowledge and aesthetic appreciation of the value of Black literature through conferences, readings, workshops and educational programs and to ensure that the public is exposed to a broad range of Black writers.

The CUNY Association of Black Faculty and Staff was formed in October 2018, shortly after we presented at a hearing on Blacks in higher education, Black programs and Black studies here at the Council and its mission is to support the academic and professional development of Black faculty, staff and students, as well alumni across CUNY and to serve as a resource for the retention, recruitment, advancement and growth of Black faculty, staff, students and alumni at CUNY.

Journalist and scholar Pamela Newkirk recently wrote a book on Diversity Inc. and reminded us that the whole talk around diversity began in 1968, when

1
2 President Johnson had legislation around civil rights
3 and the Voting Act.

4 Since 1968, the concept of diversity has been
5 expanded to encompass other racial and ethnic
6 minorities along with women, people with physical and
7 mental disabilities, the LGBTQ community and other
8 marginalized populations. These groups have distinct
9 characteristics and the plight of racial minorities
10 in general and African Americans in particular have
11 been overshadowed by the categories within this
12 widely used term of diversity.

13 My remarks will focus on racial diversity with a
14 particular emphasis on curriculum representing the
15 disciplines within Black Studies programs. Those are
16 the disciplines around literature, sociology,
17 history, gender studies and psychology.

18 So, the question is do we have a way to gauge
19 whether CUNY has a system in place to examine
20 material, textbooks, discussions, etc. that promote
21 diverse cultural experiences and backgrounds.

22 So, there are two areas that I'd like to refer
23 to; Black Studies Programs and Pathways.

24 Black Studies Programs and Departments and Black
25 Faculty play an important role in ensuring and

1 serving the intellectual, academic, sociocultural,
2 and professional needs of all students and in
3 fulfilling the goals, vision, and mission of the City
4 University of New York. The advent of Black Studies
5 strengthened democratic practices throughout the
6 nation and democratized our academic institutions.
7 However, given our current political climate and in
8 an age when American democracy may be breathing its
9 last breath, it is not surprising that Black Studies
10 and Black peoples in CUNY find themselves
11 increasingly marginalized and discounted. This
12 situation is extremely disturbing and problematic.

14 How do we address this problem? It's well
15 documented that students who enroll in Black studies
16 programs will have opportunities to take courses
17 focused on the Black experience. Furthermore, it is
18 documented that there is a positive correlation
19 between the number of faculty who teach in Black
20 Studies programs and throughout academic departments
21 in CUNY and the number of Black Studies courses that
22 are created and taught.

23 We must also support Black Studies degrees at
24 CUNY. There are five senior colleges that currently
25 offer Black Studies Degrees in CUNY. These include

1
2 City College, Brooklyn, Hunter, York and Lehman.
3 John Jay College, Queens, New York City Tech and
4 Baruch offer Black Studies minors or concentrations
5 and the Graduate Center offers an Africana Studies
6 track within the Master of Liberal Arts Studies and a
7 Certificate in Africana Studies.

8 So, one of the major reasons for the diminishing
9 state of Black Studies programs in CUNY is the non-
10 replacement of Black Studies faculty. And the CUNY
11 report on Faculty Diversity, Black Studies programs
12 are included under the area of Ethnic and Cultural
13 Studies. By counting Black Studies as part of area,
14 Ethnic and Cultural Studies, this report distorts the
15 number of Black Studies program and Black faculty
16 within CUNY. And even with the blurring of Black
17 Studies, the number of Black faculty in area, Ethnic
18 and Cultural Studies, decreased by 1.6 percent from
19 2010 to 2017. From 2010-2016, the number of Black
20 Faculty hired was eight. In 2016-2017, the number of
21 Black faculty in that one year hired, was two across
22 CUNY.

23 So, if we want curriculum that reflects
24 diversity, we have to hire more Black faculty.

1
2 So, I'm going to turn now to Pathways. Pathways
3 has two components where we can look at how we
4 diversify the curriculum.

5 One is the Flexible Core and Pathways and one is,
6 the College Option. The Flexible Core requires that
7 students take courses in the areas of world cultures
8 and global issues, U.S. experience in diversity,
9 creative expression, individual and society and the
10 scientific world.

11 So, the buckets of world cultures and issues and
12 your experience in diversity are natural places in
13 which to have curriculum representing Black studies
14 or representing racial groups.

15 So, what I did was just to look on the colleges
16 websites about what kinds of courses are offered in
17 their flexible core, and it was very uneven. A
18 review of the courses on the website appears that
19 those colleges that have more Black and Latino
20 faculty seem to have a higher number of course
21 focused on racial diversity and that goes in hand
22 with what I said, if you have faculty who represent
23 racial diversity, you will have more courses created.
24 I saw that in LaGuardia Community College, BMCC and
25

1
2 Lehman, they seem to have a higher number of courses.
3 Now, this is just looking at the website.

4 Additionally, courses have the college option
5 that's not in your report, but the college option
6 gives colleges an opportunity to create other
7 required courses. They have to have a combination of
8 another nine courses in the college option. At
9 Medgar Evers College, we used as part of our college
10 option, the concept of a sociocultural diversity
11 cluster. So, all students must take at least three
12 credits in the sociocultural diversity and then
13 another six credits as part of the college option in
14 integrative discipline.

15 So, the sociocultural diversity cluster becomes
16 another way where you can offer courses that are
17 racially diverse.

18 So, what are our challenges , or current
19 challenges? Current challenges is that although
20 nearly 25 percent of students in CUNY are Black, the
21 institutional support for programs reflecting Black
22 Studies has been reduced over the last three years.

23 Colleges have failed to replace faculty who have
24 retired or resigned, thereby affecting program growth
25 and the number of Black Studies majors.

1
2 In some colleges, there are no full time or part
3 time faculty directly connected to the Black Studies
4 programs. There is a high attrition rate for
5 directors or coordinators of Black Studies Program
6 and in one college, there have been five coordinators
7 of Black Studies in ten years.

8 The administration tends to cancel upper level
9 Black Studies course and thus eliminating courses
10 needed for the major and affecting retention in the
11 program.

12 Solutions, without vigilance and deliberate
13 strategies, we will roll back and represent social
14 worlds that lack racial diversity. We must change
15 the culture and address what Pamela Newkirk calls in
16 her books, the cancer of the culture around racial
17 diversity. We must ask whether there really is a
18 will to address diversity. We've been at this for a
19 number of years and we're still talking about it.

20 Black Studies must be respected and supported
21 within the confines of CUNY. And we must be
22 sensitive to exploring creative ways to offer
23 components of Black Studies.

24 So, for example, at Medgar Evers College, we
25 developed an AA degree on African Diasporic

1
2 Literature and we have a BA degree in the pipeline
3 waiting to get approved by the college body on
4 African Diasporic Literature. That is not the same
5 as Black Studies but it's a component.

6 Students enroll in Black Studies course when
7 their offered and these courses must be supported
8 within degree programs and with full time faculty.

9 Colleges must utilize deliberate strategies that
10 support and retain Black studies programs and
11 faculty. Colleges must use their websites to promote
12 courses that reflect racial diversity. You have more
13 students who are now doing E permit. They go to other
14 colleges to see what courses they can take. They
15 should be able to see those courses reflected on the
16 website and I saw very few courses.

17 CUNY offers no master's degree in Africana or
18 Black Studies. It's amazing that there is still no
19 master's degree at a place called CUNY, the City
20 University of New York in Africana or Black Studies.

21 The Graduate Center should develop a Black
22 Studies program that's in concert with the foundation
23 of Black Studies as a discipline and reflective of a
24 broad range of thinkers across disciplines.

1
2 Data on Black Studies Programs and Black Faculty
3 hires with respect to status and colleges need to be
4 documented, it should not be grouped under Area
5 Studies.

6 And finally, we need to look at the whole concept
7 of liberal arts degrees, like Studies programs often
8 fall under the liberal arts. In the broader sense,
9 the liberal arts support learning that involves
10 diverse course work, so students can develop a range
11 of knowledge. The data show that the skills they
12 develop in the liberal arts are applicable to any
13 job. So, liberal arts graduates enter a range of
14 fields. There's been a focus on stem, we need to
15 focus on the liberal arts and not tie degree programs
16 and course curriculum to courses that are technical
17 or skill based where we say that they will have their
18 job. Thank you.

19 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Good afternoon, I am Dr.
20 Anthony Browne; I'm the Chair of the Department of
21 Africana and Puerto Rican/Latino Studies at Hunter
22 College, as well as the Chair of the CUNY Association
23 of Black Faculty and Staff.

24 I thank Councilwoman Barron and her staff for the
25 opportunity to present today. Research shows that

1 students and faculty benefit from a diverse
2 curriculum. Diversity in the curriculum enhances
3 critical thinking by raising new issues and
4 perspectives, by broadening the variety of
5 experiences shared, by confronting stereotypes on
6 issues of race, ethnicity, gender, sexual
7 orientation, and class, among others. It exposes
8 students to different perspectives, by allowing a
9 broader variety of experiences.
10

11 The curriculum itself communicates important
12 messages about the importance of diversity or the
13 lack thereof. On the first day of classes, when a
14 student browses the syllabi created by their
15 professors, do they see readings that reflect their
16 experiences? The key question is what qualities does
17 the university want their graduates to have? If one
18 of them is to prepare students to thrive in a diverse
19 democracy, then a diverse curriculum is essential.

20 Diversity requirements are a common method
21 utilized by universities to ensure that graduates
22 have knowledge and competencies in this area. Hunter
23 College, where I teach requires four courses that
24 would satisfy its Pluralism and Diversity
25 requirement. They are one, non-European societies,

1 particularly those of Africa, Asia, Latin America, or
2 those indigenous to the Americas. Two, one or more
3 of the following groups in the US; African Americans,
4 Asian Americans, Latino Americans, and Native
5 Americans. Three, women and or issues of gender or
6 sexual orientation. Four, Europe, including ways in
7 which pluralism and diversity have been addressed.
8

9 In addition, CUNY instituted Pathways
10 Requirements for graduation in the Flexible Common
11 Core where students are required to take six courses
12 in the following area: World Cultures and Global
13 Issues; U.S. Experience in its Diversity; Creative
14 Expression; Individual and Society; and the
15 Scientific World. However, course offerings across
16 the university tend to be uneven reflecting in part,
17 the power and influence of administrators and
18 departments.

19 In order to develop racial literacy, we need a
20 base of knowledge. For instance, students should
21 understand the historical processes of inclusion,
22 exclusion, and subjugation of African Americans.
23 They should know the history of Black activism for
24 civil and human rights. In an era where facts are
25 questions, our classrooms play a vital role in

1
2 alleviating misconceptions around race. Helping
3 students for example, learn about inequalities as
4 well as policies to reduce disparities in wealth,
5 education, policing, health, public policy and debt.
6 We know that when students are only exposed to
7 dominant perspectives, they come to believe that
8 viewpoints from other racial or ethnic groups are
9 insignificant and lack value, intellectual worth, and
10 scholarly credibility.

11 Ways to promote a diverse curriculum; the
12 recruitment of a diverse faculty arguably is the most
13 effective method in diversifying the curriculum at
14 CUNY. Recruitment of Black faculty can be a
15 challenge particularly in departments with an uneven
16 history of tenured Black faculty. A strategy that
17 has been successfully utilized by both public and
18 private universities to address faculty diversity is
19 cluster hiring.

20 A cluster hire would involve hiring a critical
21 mass of Black faculty members based on shared,
22 interdisciplinary research interests. These hires
23 could be in a single department or a cross
24 disciplinary research area that would provide the new
25 hires with a community of scholars that would reduce

1 feelings of isolation and marginalization. At the
2 same time, these scholars would utilize their
3 interdisciplinary training to diversify the
4 curriculum and learning experiences through theories,
5 methods, readings, and pedagogical approaches.
6

7 For CUNY, building on the university's research,
8 teaching, demographics and location, a cluster hiring
9 initiative would enhance the university's existing
10 research capacity, contribute new discoveries and
11 applications of knowledge, and address real world
12 problems that require cross disciplinary expertise.

13 For example, a cluster hire centered in Africana
14 Studies around the theme of Black Futures, would
15 attract Black faculty whose teaching and research
16 focuses on challenges facing urban areas that might
17 include race and social justice, educational and or
18 health disparities, urban housing, poverty, policing,
19 and any other topic that speaks to persistent
20 concerns facing New Yorkers. Research would be
21 coordinated through a Black Futures CUNY wide
22 Disciplinary Group that would coordinate research,
23 funding, cross disciplinary collaborations, and the
24 dissemination of research.

1 Teaching and Learning Centers; several CUNY
2 campuses have some variations have some variation of
3 teaching centers that allow faculty to share and
4 discuss practices that can be incorporated into their
5 teaching and research. These centers conduct
6 seminars on diversity, inclusion and pedagogy that
7 allow faculty to reflect on their current approaches
8 and learn new ones. More often than not, faculty
9 members have not been trained to seek out and infuse
10 diverse readings and pedagogical approaches in their
11 courses. These centers would allow faculty to
12 critically examine their classroom practices and
13 assigned course materials. Faculty cannot depend
14 exclusively on the material they learn while they are
15 in graduate school. Instead, they must hold
16 themselves accountable for introducing new literature
17 to which they may be unaccustomed in order to enable
18 students to understand differences.

19
20 More specifically, by engaging in collaborative
21 peer review, faculty can receive feedback on the
22 readings of other material they select for their
23 courses. This practice can enable faculty to
24 identify diverse literatures, built on the expertise
25

1
2 and knowledge of their colleagues, thus enhancing
3 their own knowledge.

4 In closing, faculty must be intentional in
5 incorporating cultural inclusion into their pedagogy
6 and new course. Diversity, learning, and engagement
7 are cyclical and largely dependent upon
8 accountability, collaboration and multicultural
9 consciousness among faculty. Thank you.

10 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: Good afternoon. I am
11 really thankful for being here today Councilwoman
12 Barron. I have to say that every time I've come to
13 one of these meetings, I have learned a lot about
14 CUNY. Not just BMCC but the questions that you've
15 asked and some of the answers that you've gotten is
16 illuminating. It really gives me an understanding of
17 what's happening CUNY-wide. So, it's an honor to be
18 here and I thank you for having this hearing.

19 I am here with a little heavy heart today and
20 before I get into my testimony, I just want to say
21 that on my way over here, I was trying to get the
22 status of a study abroad program to Africa. And I
23 thought that was something that I really thought was
24 really important given that this is the 400th year
25 anniversary of the enslavement of Africans in

1
2 American and I thought about being in Africa and
3 touring the slave castle and looking at that, what
4 they call the door of no return. That it would have
5 been great to have our students visit the West Coast
6 of Africa and return. Because we, never as decedents
7 of these slaves supposed to return to Africa.

8 I found out that there is no Black Studies
9 program or study abroad program to Africa. There is
10 not one coming up in the summer and there wasn't one
11 in the spring. And when I began to ask why, I was
12 told that the study abroad committee made the
13 decision that they would be going to Spain and Mexico
14 and France and one other country that doesn't come to
15 mind but not Africa because I didn't have enough
16 money. China, that's where they're going. So, they
17 went to China last year and going back to China this
18 year but nothing in terms of Africa. And that tells
19 me about the mindset of people in CUNY, faculty in
20 CUNY.

21 So, in my testimony, I decided that I would
22 outline the power centers that exists within the City
23 University that makes the determination as to what
24 happens in terms of programs, curriculum, hiring, the
25 motion, sabbaticals, etc.

1
2 So, I start with the Chairpersons of each
3 academic department, which is a head of that
4 particular department. The Chairpersons have a
5 Personnel and Budget Committee that they chair and
6 the person on the Budget Committee makes the
7 decisions as to who gets hired, who gets promoted,
8 who gets tenure, who gets sabbaticals, etc. And they
9 make recommendations to a college-wide person on the
10 committee who then makes recommendations to the
11 President or the Provost who makes it to the
12 President and then to the Board of Trustees.

13 Now, here is where the problem is at BMCC, I
14 would say 80 percent of the people in these
15 committees are White faculty, 80 percent. It might
16 be even higher in the departments because a lot of
17 departments have no back faculty members.

18 So, people who are making these decisions are
19 making these decisions to hire people, to have
20 programs like a Study Board to Africa from a very
21 Eurocentric perspective and it shows very little
22 understanding and sensitivity or desire, as far as
23 I'm concerned to really relate to people of color.

24 So, you have your Chairpersons, you have your
25 Personnel and Budget Committees, and you have what

1
2 you call the Academic Senate. The Chairpersons meet
3 with the Personnel and Budget Committees of their
4 department, they make recommendations to the College-
5 wide committee, which consists of all the chairperson
6 and then they make recommendations to the President.

7 Again, 80 percent of them and more are White.

8 When you don't have Black faculty, you have no power
9 because you are not sitting at the table. And the
10 only way you can sit at the table is you got to be
11 hired and you got to be full-time. Then you can have
12 a vote and a voice but if you're not hired, you don't
13 have a vote and you don't have a voice. Only those
14 people who are hired have the vote and the voice and
15 those are White faculty members for the most part.

16 So, we're excluded, not only from positions but
17 we're also excluded from wealth because the money
18 that comes in to pay the salaries of people who are
19 hired comes from tax dollars. City University is
20 supported by tax dollars. So, you get hired, you get
21 paid, you get promoted you get paid, you get tenure
22 you get paid, you become a recipient of the wealth
23 that you get through your salaries etc.

24 Black faculty members are excluded from all of
25 that. If we do get into the university, we're

1
2 generally at the lower levels of management. We're
3 generally at the lower levels of faculty
4 appointments. We're generally around the level of
5 lecturer or assistant professor etc., which is less
6 money than a tenure professor or somebody who is on
7 sabbatical or whatever.

8 The point I'm making is that the university plays
9 this game of diversity and expansion of diversity but
10 when you really look at it, there was a Chronical of
11 Higher Education article that came out and said, BMCC
12 is the most diverse campus among management in the
13 nation. And the interim President [INAUDIBLE
14 2:25:39] cap on it. So, I went and said, wait a
15 minute. Am I blind? I'm looking around, we're the
16 most diverse in management in the country. And what
17 I found out is this, we might be but what they forgot
18 to say, they didn't break into top management, middle
19 management, lower management.

20 Now, we might be diverse, but not at the top, no
21 way. If you just go to the website at BMCC and just
22 look at the college Presidents cabinet, 80 percent of
23 them are White. Then you look at what's happening in
24 the lower levels, directors or assistant directors,
25 you know, etc., they are mostly Black. So, yeah,

1
2 we're diverse but the distribution of wealth is going
3 to the top. It's not filtering down to the bottom.

4 So, anyway, I just wanted to point out that until
5 we deal with the structure, the power centers in the
6 university, you know, that's the faculty who makes
7 the decisions as to what courses are offered and what
8 courses will not be offered. Who will get hired, who
9 will not get hired. That comes from the academic,
10 from the faculty. That comes from the faculty, the
11 chairpersons etc. As long as there is no diversity
12 there, we're not going to look for a lot of Black
13 folks. That's just to say frankly, I've been here 48
14 years, I know what I'm talking about. Okay, I've
15 seen Black people come and not be replaced and
16 they're waiting for me to retire.

17 Seriously, and when I retire, they are not going
18 to replace Blake again with somebody that looks like
19 me. So, if you look at BMCC, I'm sure it must be
20 happening at other schools. As we retire, we are not
21 replaced by people of color. We're a small number in
22 the beginning and as we retire, we become even
23 smaller. Okay, and it's going to take a lot more
24 than talk to correct this.

1
2 So, I have some suggestions that I put in my
3 testimony. Okay, of course we have to hire more
4 full-time Black and Latino faculty. And that has to
5 be a commitment other than words. It's year after
6 year and we talk about hiring more Black and Latino
7 faculty and it's just not happening or it's happening
8 in such a small pace that is really not happening.

9 You know, somebody said to me, oh, Blake, we
10 should be happy. Man, in the science department they
11 just hired a Black person. I said, oh yeah, how many
12 full time people do you have? Oh, about 50
13 something.

14 Well, you just hired one so I should be happy.
15 That's the mindset that people have you know, and
16 they said, we're making progress because we hired one
17 or we hired two. The President should review the
18 hiring practices, the college President should review
19 the hiring practices of each academic department and
20 reject candidates for positions in that department
21 and departments with a history of not hiring Black
22 and Latino faculty.

23 CUNY Central should reject candidates for
24 appointment from those colleges because it goes from
25 the President then goes to the Board of Trustees.

1
2 And the Board of Trustee could step in and say, you
3 know, look, no, no, no. Go back, let's look at the
4 history of the hiring in your particular college, in
5 your particular department and reject those things.

6 College Presidents should be evaluated. It
7 should be part of their evaluation should be how they
8 deal with improving faculty diversity in the college
9 and in the administration and their respected – that
10 should be something in the evaluation because people
11 respond to things that they're going to be evaluated
12 on. You know, and because what you are being
13 evaluated on is important for your growth and your
14 development professionally.

15 So, if CUNY says diversity is important, they
16 make the one of the criteria for evaluation of a
17 college president and that every, every, every body
18 in the college from the administration to the staff
19 etc., should be taking courses in sensitivity
20 training and dealing with cultural awareness and
21 competency. You know, we send out information and
22 everybody must take this test on sexual misconduct,
23 you know, because it's an important issue.

24 Well, everybody needs to take the test and go
25 through some motions about learning about cultural

1
2 sensitivity because that's also an extremely
3 important issue, so that should be there to.

4 And finally, that every, every student before
5 they graduate from either senior college or community
6 college should be mandated to take a course in Black
7 Studies. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much for your
9 testimony and I've got lots of questions before we
10 move on to the next panel. But I'm particularly
11 concerned about the addendum that you have to your
12 testimony from a student who indicates that the class
13 was given an assignment to portray themselves as
14 Muslims. An assignment given to non-Muslims students
15 to portray themselves as Muslims and the student here
16 in this document indicates that many of the customs
17 and symbols were ridiculed and deferred to replacing
18 the hijab with a hoody and the jokes were made about
19 Islam and they pretended that Muslims drink alcohol
20 and use liquor bottles. Just that it was very
21 offensive and that when they presented it to the
22 instructor, well, I think the instructor said that
23 she dismissed my concerns and did not correct the
24 students but appeared to approve their behavior.

1
2 The student complained to the Diversity Office
3 and the Vice President of Student Affairs and the
4 College President and the Vice President of Student
5 Affairs and the Chairperson of the English
6 Department. This is what I'm looking at here. They
7 all dismissed my concerns and told me that what
8 happened was for "educational purposes." I find that
9 alarming, disturbing and unacceptable. I really do
10 and the students, as I know there is freedom of
11 speech, but it should not include discrimination and
12 hate against students regarding their religion.

13 So, was this a topic? Was this matter discussed?

14 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: Well, actually, what
15 happened was that you are reading something that was
16 entered into the minutes of the academic senate in
17 October of 2017. That's when it occurred and when
18 the student went before - came to me and told me what
19 happened, and we felt that we needed to have
20 something that deals with Islamophobia in the college
21 and that one of the committees that deal with that is
22 the Academic Senate. And so, we brought it before
23 the Academic Senate, actually what happened, is I
24 tried to bring it before the Academic Senate and I
25 was shut down. I kept trying to bring it down and I

1
2 was shut down. No, it's not something that could be
3 discussed in the Academic Senate, you know, this is
4 something that belongs in another forum, etc., but
5 the student and I continued to go to the Senate to
6 ask them to address the issue and finally after
7 almost a year or more, the Senate decided that they
8 would take up the issue.

9 But it just shows you how - oh, what happened was
10 this. They said that this was not an issue for the
11 Academic Senate, this was the faculty, majority White
12 faculty of the Academic Senate said that this is not
13 an issue for the Academic Senate. And we went away
14 for a holiday and we came back and we found out that
15 there was a workshop being held in one of the
16 theaters that was being sponsored by the Academic
17 Senate and it was dealing with sexual harassment.
18 So, my question to the Senate was, how could you have
19 a workshop on sexual harassment that didn't go
20 through the Academic Senate. When we've been trying
21 to get Islamophobia through this Academic Senate.
22 How did you do that? And the response that I got
23 from the Chairperson was, oh, we just felt it was
24 more important. Okay, and of course you know, we had
25 to do what we had to do but we got their attention

1
2 because the disconnect is so wide. You know, in
3 terms of the racial disconnect, that people just
4 didn't see or understand why we were so upset. You
5 know, I'm a Muslim first of all. You know, I would
6 be you know, anyone would be upset if they made
7 mockery of your religion but they couldn't understand
8 that you know, and why was I standing with the
9 student? They couldn't understand that, so finally
10 the student requested that his statement be put in
11 the minutes of the Academic Senate.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, I mean, I'm
13 reading what it says that it was brought to the Vice
14 President of Student Affairs. It says the College
15 President and I'm sure that there is another
16 opportunity to me to find out what the persons that
17 are indicated here as having been presented with this
18 issue to give me their opinion, their side, their
19 understanding of what happened. So, I've learned you
20 know, there's always another perspective, so I would
21 love to follow up on this and find out in that regard
22 what's happened. But I have lots of questions in
23 general for the panel about the testimony that you
24 did present.

25

1
2 Can you clarify for me college option. You said
3 the college option has nine credits. Does every
4 college have this opportunity for nine credits?

5 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Yes, this is part of
6 Pathways.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

8 DR. BRENDA GREENE: So, Pathways you have the
9 common core and then you have the flexible core,
10 which is – the flexible core is 18 credits, I believe
11 and then the college option is 9 credits. And so,
12 all students have to take courses in those levels.
13 The college option, colleges have an opportunity to
14 decide how they want to have courses distributed in
15 the college option.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so how many credits
17 are the required common core?

18 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Thirty credits.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And within those 30 credits,
20 it's 18 credits for flexible and 9 credits for
21 optional, college option?

22 DR. BRENDA GREENE: No, it's 30 credits for the
23 common core. Help me here right, it's 30 credits
24 form the common core.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Because what I heard the
3 panel before say was that it was 30 credits of 10
4 courses each but that it included course from the
5 flexible common core.

6 Okay, so, that's my question. The college, each
7 college can decide whether or not they want to have 9
8 credits?

9 DR. BRENDA GREENE: No, each college has to have
10 the college option. They can decide how those
11 credits are distributed.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Each college must have the
13 college option of 9 credits?

14 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Right, I don't think the
15 college option was mentioned in the previous
16 discussion.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It wasn't, so that's why I'm
18 trying to figure -

19 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Right, so the college option
20 - so, within our college option, we included, you
21 have to take - we include another bucket.
22 Sociocultural Diversity, so every student has to take
23 one course in sociocultural diversity and then the
24 second part of the college option would be
25 integrative knowledge. So, they have to take two

1
2 courses, 6 credits in an area that combines two
3 disciplines.

4 So, going back to the diversity issue, the
5 diversity issue is very clear in a flexible core
6 because you can do the US in diversity or you can do
7 world cultures. However, my review of how those
8 courses are created within the flexible core, varies
9 across colleges. Some like I think it's at Lehman,
10 they had a lot of courses that focused on Latino and
11 Asian American and Black, whereas other colleges they
12 use diversity in a much broader way.

13 And just let me add this. That courses that are
14 in the flexible core, have to be approved by
15 Pathways. There's a Pathways Committee that approves
16 the courses and there are certain criteria and
17 guidelines that colleges have to follow. However,
18 there are broad enough, so that if your US diversity,
19 it doesn't have to deal with racial diversity. It
20 can be the - I'm just trying to think of just United
21 States, US World History, United States History.

22 Okay, so you can say that in United States
23 History, within that course they are going to address
24 different racial groups, different ethnic groups and
25 so that it ends up meeting the criteria of the

1 flexible core, but it's really not specific enough.
2 Of course, that would be more specific enough if you
3 had in the flexible core, African American History,
4 could conceivably be part of the flexible core if a
5 college chose to do that but I don't see that
6 colleges are really using the flexible core to
7 promote racial diversity as much as it could be
8 promoted. So, that's another way of really zeroing
9 in and promoting racial diversity. I hope that made
10 it clearer.
11

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, that's clear. In terms
13 of the fact that this is the 400th year since 1619,
14 because certainly we've been here longer than 400
15 years. That's talking about enslavement, but we were
16 here before Columbus, for those of you who might be
17 interested in reading the book. It's entitled, They
18 Came Before Columbus and it's Dr. Ivan Sertima, which
19 is very enlightening, but in terms of acknowledging
20 this great time, how are study abroad trips
21 authorized? Who does that?

22 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: They come through the
23 study Abroad Committee of the college.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's Central or at each
25 college?

1
2 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: At BMCC we have a study
3 in Broad Committee, I'm not sure what happens in
4 other schools. And the committee is elected by
5 members of the Academic Senate and they deliberate on
6 proposals that are made to them for study abroad
7 programs and then they vote on it.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, at your institution,
9 it's the committee at that school that decides where
10 they're going to go.

11 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: Right.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And is it generally one
13 trip, one location?

14 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: No, it's several. It's
15 China and it's Mexico.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Within one academic year,
17 there is several?

18 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: During the summer.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, during the summer.

20 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: During the summer months,
21 okay, and last year they went to Brazil and when to
22 China and went to Mexico and Spain. This year, their
23 going to Mexico, China and when I asked about the
24 other countries, I was told, I couldn't - they didn't
25 want to tell me, they said, we're going to make an

1
2 announcement next week. And I wanted to know why
3 because a student was asking about Africa.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, do student submit
5 proposal, does faculty submit proposals? How are
6 these selections reviewed? Is it a proposal? Is
7 there a process? Is there an outline?

8 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: The proposals are
9 submitted by faculty from various departments.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: By faculty, okay.

11 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: Yeah, Modern Language
12 Department for example might submit a proposal for a
13 study abroad program to Spain. On the center for
14 ethnic studies, submitted a proposal called the Black
15 experience in Africa.

16 So, different departments submit different
17 proposals in that committee.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, there was a proposal
19 that was submitted?

20 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: There was a proposal
21 submitted by the Center for Ethnic Studies called the
22 Black Experience at Africa and it was turned down.

23 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Can I just add that I think
24 it really varies across colleges. I mean, we don't
25 even have a committee. It seems like really at

1
2 Medgar Evers College, we have a study abroad director
3 and faculty can submit proposals but the criteria for
4 which proposals will be supported, which students
5 will get scholarships, it seems to be dependent on
6 factors that are not clearly defined and that are not
7 transparent.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, that's what I'm trying
9 to get at. What's the process?

10 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Yeah, we don't have - it's
11 not a transparent process at our college.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: There's no criteria listed
13 for how it will be evaluated?

14 DR. BRENDA GREENE: No, I know the faculty can
15 submit proposals. We had one faculty member at our
16 college who decided to raise \$20,000 and take
17 students - he raised the money and took students to
18 South Africa because he didn't feel like he was
19 really getting support.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, that person did that
21 independent?

22 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, I thought that was
24 college supported.

1
2 DR. BRENDA GREENE: No, it was not college
3 supported.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, where does the money
5 come from? Dr. Blake, where does the money come
6 from? Is there a budget line?

7 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: Yes, there is. The money
8 comes from the BMCC Association, which is the fiscal
9 body that governs the student activity fee that each
10 BMCC student pays.

11 So, every year, monies are allocated to the Study
12 Abroad program from the student activity fee. So, in
13 reality, the students are paying for it, because it's
14 coming out of their student activity fee.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is that the same thing at
16 Medgar?

17 DR. BRENDA GREENE: It comes out of the student
18 activity fee but again, there's a lack of
19 transparency with respect to really how much money is
20 there and there's some students who might apply for
21 scholarships from other sources. There used to be a
22 stock. I don't know if that's still available. The
23 CUNY used to have a fund where they would support or
24 supplement the funding for students who are doing
25 study abroad programs.

1
2 But really, if the colleges are not really
3 raising enough money and the student activity fees,
4 because they cannot support most students. Most of
5 our students are working students and you know; they
6 do many things to try and raise money.

7 So, if the college is really not supporting it,
8 they have to go to other funds and then colleges go
9 to the funding that they raise in discretionary
10 accounts to supplement the student activity fee.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, Dr. Browne, in your
12 testimony you talked about teaching and learning
13 centers and the centers conduct seminars on
14 diversity, inclusion and pedagogy. They allow
15 faculty to reflect on the current approaches.

16 So, not every campus has a teaching and learning
17 center?

18 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: It's my understanding no.
19 Several do and they have become quite popular over
20 the last decade or so. Largely because we've
21 recognized that faculty need to upgrade their skills,
22 their pedagogy. And so, this becomes a space whereby
23 they can come together as peers and engage in that
24 process and there have been good data showing the
25

1
2 outcomes nationally for faculty who undergo a process
3 such as this.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How would this compare to
5 the conferences and the faculty development days that
6 were referenced in the first panel? Do you have any
7 idea how?

8 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: I'm not sure about the
9 Faculty Development Days. I know professional
10 associations, there are often workshops for members
11 on developments in the discipline, best practices,
12 etc., and so, colleges serve, the conferences rather,
13 serve as a site, whereby faculty can engage in a very
14 didactic process that they can then bring back to
15 their students.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Does Hunter have a Teaching
17 and Learning Center?

18 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Yes, we do.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and who heads that up?
20 Who is in charge of that?

21 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: There is several faculty
22 members from various departments who are in the
23 leadership. It's called an ACERT at Hunter; I don't
24 recall exactly what the acronym stands for.

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ACERT?

1
2 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: ACERT, yes. But they have
3 done a number of workshops. I have a faculty member
4 whose currently a fellow with ACERT from Africana
5 Studies and he actually just put on about three weeks
6 ago a fabulous panel encompassing faculty from other
7 campuses looking at Africana Studies and developments
8 in the discipline and it was well received, I
9 attended it.

10 So, there have been several initiatives such as
11 that around issues of diversity, also increasing the
12 technological capacity of faculty etc. So, the
13 Teaching and Learning Centers engage in a broader
14 array of practices designed to enhance faculty and by
15 extension, the experience of learning for students in
16 our classrooms.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You mention technology and
18 I'm glad you did. Is there a way that we can look at
19 how we can incorporate much of might be readily
20 accessible through the worldwide web that in fact
21 supports what we want to achieve. Is there a way?
22 Have we talked about that? Is there a way to do that
23 that would be able to be monitored or controlled or
24 utilized by campuses? Particularly in terms of
25 getting faculty to change, because remember, we're

1
2 talking about faculties, they're the ones that are in
3 the classrooms and controlling what goes on and
4 designing the curricula.

5 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Given the advances in
6 technology we've seen just in the last decade, I
7 would say, there's so many innovative technologies
8 that have become available. Certainly, you know,
9 Blackboard now is pretty widely used but there is
10 faculty who have created You Tube channels if you
11 will, that outline courses. There are so many
12 websites etc., dedicated to various topics. There
13 are podcasts that have become available that are done
14 by and for faculty that certainly touch on course
15 material relevant to students that have now become
16 very pervasive that we also incorporate in the
17 classroom.

18 There are technologies like Clickers and other
19 things that we can get instant responses from
20 students. And so, speaking for my campus, all these
21 technologies are available, encouraging and
22 incentivizing faculty to take advantage of it,
23 particularly given our current generation of students
24 that have grown up in the digital age, to make sure
25 that we are not teaching in a 20th Century fashion.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

3 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: For 21st Century students.

4 So, that's something I'm very cognizant of and we are
5 pushing and strongly encouraging our faculty to
6 remain technologically relevant, so we can connect
7 with our students for the new age.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, we've just gotten a
9 message that what school?

10 UNIDENTIFIED: It's BMI.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so it's across the
12 campuses, BMI has a project but they are going to one
13 particular place in Africa and they think there's a
14 lack of funding. So, we'll look into this and see
15 what more can be done.

16 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: If I could just add briefly.
17 My department is finalizing the process of a study
18 abroad to Puerto Rico and we have had students
19 previously who have gone to Africa through Brooklyn
20 College and also gone to Cuba through Baruch a few
21 years ago.

22 So, certainly we need to augment and develop
23 additional study abroad opportunities. Our
24 department also is in the process of thinking about
25

1
2 South Africa and Gona as part of our study abroad
3 experience.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Would that be open to
5 students from other campuses, or would it be
6 restricted to your particular campus?

7 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: It can be open to students
8 from other campuses. Particularly the study abroad
9 Cuba I referenced earlier, our students went with a
10 faculty member from Baruch who had organized that
11 particular trip.

12 And so, students, yes, are able to go across
13 campuses and participate in these study abroad
14 opportunities.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, Professor Blake, in
16 your testimony, one of your suggestions said that - I
17 can't find it. Something to the affect - oh, here it
18 is. That Central staff should reject candidates for
19 appointment for most colleges that have a poor record
20 of hiring Black and Latino faculty.

21 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And I had asked if there
23 were other kinds of incentives that CUNY could
24 institute that would make it more attractive to hire
25 Blacks and I just wanted to put into the record that

1
2 SUNY Chancellor, I had a meeting with her and they
3 have a program at SUNY, which is called PRODI-G. And
4 it stands for Promoting Recruitment Opportunity
5 Diversity Inclusion and Growth at SUNY campuses. And
6 that they are doing is that they are in fact giving
7 financial incentives to those college campuses that
8 have demonstrated hiring a Black and Latino and
9 faculty to be on their campus.

10 So, they understand and this to me is something
11 that's concrete. Okay, we're looking, this is what
12 we want to do and as you do it, we will under right
13 the cost of that person; I think it's two or three
14 years and then we're going to expect you to continue
15 to do that. But I think that certainly we've got to
16 do more than talk and set goals. We've got to have
17 something concrete that would in fact get to where we
18 say we want to do.

19 And I did want to ask you, has the organization
20 had an opportunity to meet with the Chancellor?

21 DR. BRENDA GREENE: No, we haven't.

22 PROFESSOR JAMES BLAKE: No.

23 DR. BRENDA GREENE: We've gotten no response.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, you haven't. Well, I
25 certainly will look to see how I can support that

1 meeting happening, so that he can hear directly from
2 the body what their concerns are, especially as we
3 know that this is such an important topic to him. We
4 always talk about making sure that people who are
5 most directly affected are at the planning, the
6 strategy, the thinking processes to make sure that we
7 don't get something that does not reflect what we
8 know has been effective in our interactions. So, I
9 certainly will reach out to let him know that you are
10 looking for a meeting and in anyway that I could
11 facilitate that happening, certainly now that we are
12 televising it, he knows that that is something that's
13 important to me, to make sure that we can get that
14 moving and get it on the table.

16 As we talk about all of these things we want to
17 do, I think it would be important for this body to be
18 a part of designing that strategic framework, which
19 they call their master plan or master, whatever they
20 call it. To make sure that he hears directly from
21 the people who are most intimately involved in making
22 sure that we have those kinds of advances.

23 So, I do want to thank you for your testimony.

24 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Can I just add this, I was
25 just looking -

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, just one other thing.
3 Cluster hiring, how does that work?

4 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Essentially the university
5 commits itself to hiring a critical mass. In this
6 case, a Black faculty across various disciplines. By
7 doing so, you create a built in community of support,
8 so as Professor Blake mentioned, you're not hiring
9 one person who is part of 50 you know and feeling
10 alienated. And so, this cluster essentially comes in
11 together. They you know, have various initiatives
12 that allow them to support each other as they go
13 through the tenure promotion process at the college.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Where has it worked and how
15 successful has it been?

16 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Cornell is an example that
17 comes to mind. I want to say about four years ago, I
18 think they hired at least six Black faculty.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's not many.

20 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Well, that was a little
21 unprecedented for the university.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But I mean the fact that six
23 is, you know, wow, we got six.

24 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Yeah, but this is the nature
25 of higher ed and that was in many ways close to

1
2 unprecedented in terms of particularly Ivy League
3 schools, yes.

4 DR. BRENDA GREENE: I think Vanderbilt did that a
5 little while ago.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you know how many?

7 DR. BRENDA GREENE: I don't know how many.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But I think that that's
9 important, so that again, it's not isolated. It's
10 not individuals and I would imagine they would stay
11 together as a cohort, meet together, concerns that
12 they had they would share them.

13 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Absolutely, yes, and that's
14 the idea of doing that because the alienation and
15 then issues of retention become a major challenge
16 when it becomes one individual. In many cases, that
17 one individual may be the first in the history of
18 that department being hired. So, you can imagine the
19 stress and the pressure of trying to navigate an
20 academy from that vantage point.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's great, I hope that
22 when you get to have the meeting with the Chancellor,
23 you can share that with him.

24 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: Absolutely.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, that he can have that as
3 a consideration.

4 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Excuse me, I just want to for
5 the record, just to go back to the whole flexible
6 course. Okay, so the common core is 30 credits and
7 12 credits of those are the math and science and then
8 the 18 credits is the flexible course. The common
9 core consists of basic core courses and then the
10 flexible core. And then the college option is 12
11 credits.

12 So, it's 3 credits, we have two buckets in our
13 college option. So, the college option is 12
14 credits. So, we've divided our college option into
15 two parts. The integrative knowledge cluster and the
16 sociocultural cluster. So, you have 30 plus 12,
17 which is 42 for Pathways.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, Pathways is 42 areas
19 that's designated. Okay, okay, that's good. Okay,
20 any other parts that you want to share?

21 Okay, thank you so much for coming and giving
22 your testimony.

23 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Thank you so much.

24 DR. ANTHONY BROWNE: And thank you for your
25 leadership on this issue.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And let me know when you're
3 having your next meeting. You know, I have had
4 conflicts but I certainly want to continue to -

5 DR. BRENDA GREENE: Okay, thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you so much.
7 And our final panel is going to be called. We have
8 Jamell Henderson from CUNY Rising Alliance, the
9 Coordinator for that program and Sabina Dorvile from
10 Student Government at CCNY.

11 Oh, have they submitted slips? Okay, you are
12 going to be joined by two others as they complete
13 their slips. Just a brief pause so the panel can
14 start all together.

15 The two additional panelists are Gugeeta
16 Cheetram, and Enrique Pena **3:07:38**. If I've
17 mispronounced your name, when you pronounce them,
18 I'll get it right, thank you so much. We'll start on
19 the far left of the panel.

20 GUGEETA CHEETRAM: Hi, can you hear me? Hello.
21 Hi there, good afternoon Chairwoman Barron. My name
22 is Gugeeta Cheetram. It's okay, it happens a lot.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Pull the mic a little
24 closer.

1
2 GUGEETA CHEETRAM: Okay, my name is Gugeeta
3 Cheetram; I am a student leader at Lehman College and
4 an alumna for Guttman Community College.

5 Transferring to a college with a vast diversity of
6 ethnic studies is impactful for me and my following
7 peers because of the opportunity to learn about our
8 heritage and culture.

9 The sole purpose of this testimony is not to only
10 advocate for ethnic studies in our CUNY campuses but
11 also to highlight the need for more professors of
12 color to teach those courses. By having the
13 professor, student connection will be able to impact
14 the student at a higher level within the classroom.
15 Because they are able to learn the material at a
16 personal level.

17 Within the ethnic study department/program at each
18 CUNY campuses, the student will be able to find a
19 secure place for themselves and resources that will
20 be beneficial. The NYC Council had given CUNY
21 \$3,170,000 to CUNY to fund the ethnic study, but yet
22 that money is still less. The ask is for more
23 funding to the ethnic study at different CUNY
24 institutions, not to take away student pride of
25 learning.

1
2 So, the ask is to give us more money for these
3 programs to help us enhance the program that is
4 given, like the resources, everything that's being
5 offered.

6 We're in an institution that is diverse in a city
7 that is diverse with population and ethnicity but
8 yet, our CUNY campuses our CUNY faculty and staff are
9 not diverse in our education as much, nor is it
10 diverse in our staff and faculty that are teaching
11 those courses. To have those professors there to
12 help us and guide us with their experience is
13 beneficial for our students.

14 For example, take Lehman Mexican study for
15 example, we're receiving 285,000 compared to our
16 colleagues across CUNY. There are only five full
17 time staff at Lehman with over 20 part time staff.
18 The Mexican Study is focus to – they're forced to
19 plan only six months into the future, instead of a
20 year. Because of the limited funding they received
21 to provide the resources they currently have for the
22 student. With the budget they were given from the
23 NYC Council, they were able to provide research
24 activity, CUNY MSI Archive and Library, Educational
25

1
2 opportunity initiative, legal counsel for immigrants
3 and for the students who attend conferences as well.

4 Addition to these program, Lehman Mexican Study
5 provides scholarship and indigenous and diaspora
6 language with Columbia College. With this program,
7 all Lehman students have access to join and apply to
8 the resources being offered. We are here to empower
9 our students voice by given them the resources they
10 need.

11 So, at CUNY, we're not only focusing with one
12 study or one ethnic or one culture, we're trying to
13 be open to all of the studies and all of the culture.
14 So, yes, Lehman, we have Africana Study, we have
15 Mexican Study. Yes, we have Italian, American Study
16 and Italian Studies but yet, we need more professors
17 within those fields. We need those professors that
18 are there, so that they know who we are and to relate
19 to us at a personal level. To have students see
20 their professor up there and saying, I could be in
21 your place are not just that. Understanding the
22 material that is being taught to them at a more
23 personal and in-depth level is essential for their
24 wellbeing and educational environment. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

1
2 JAMELL HENDERSON: Good afternoon everyone,
3 Chairperson Inez Barron it's always a pleasure to see
4 you again and to the members of your committee in
5 absence. My name is Jamell Henderson and I am the
6 CUNY Rising Alliance Coordinator, and it is good to
7 be in this position now giving back not only as an
8 active alum, but now as the elite organizer
9 representing over 25 different organizations who are
10 educating, mobilizing, energizing and you know,
11 interacting with the public as well as to push the
12 agenda for the city and state to fully fund CUNY once
13 and for all, as we did before.

14 You have my testimony, but I felt that is very
15 important that I share as part of our vision plan
16 that students need to share their experiences of
17 what's really happening in the classroom. The public
18 does not know that there is a lack of diversity in
19 our classrooms because it's not talked about.

20 As a proud four time CUNY student, I've been a
21 part of CUNY for 15 years with 2 master's, an
22 associates and baccalaureate degree and I can tell
23 you I have experienced classes where I was the only
24 Black student in the room.

1
2 Most recently at the CUNY Graduate Center, where
3 it is 87 percent White students. When I graduated in
4 the class of 2019, the number of PhD students that I
5 counted that looked like me among the class of over
6 175 graduating PhD students, were five.

7 I had the honor in the spring of 2018 to teach –
8 I mean spring of 2019 this year to teach at Brooklyn
9 College, to give back but first, I was one of two
10 Black Professors in my political science department
11 at that time.

12 So, the urgent need for us to be present is
13 there. But it's not just as part of more faculty
14 being a resemblance of us but there needs to be
15 increase enrollment of our communities in CUNY. The
16 enrollment has for some colleges has gone up but for
17 among African American, Hispanic, Lantinx
18 communities, it has gone down and you can look at
19 over the trends especially on campuses like Brooklyn
20 College, Baruch, City, CSI and a few others that have
21 seen such dramatic changes.

22 More importantly, the importance of Africana
23 Studies, the importance of African American Studies,
24 the importance of Asian Studies, the importance of
25 Puerto Rican and Latino Studies, is so crucial

1
2 especially in this political environment that we are
3 living in. It is extremely important that the people
4 of our city know the sacrificial contributions of our
5 liberties, of our lives and of our freedoms that has
6 helped to build this city to be where it is today.

7 If it wasn't for me taking a class on civil
8 rights and Black power, which was taught by my
9 mentor, Dr. Jeanne Theoharis; a distinguished
10 professor at Brooklyn College, where this past
11 semester I was able to come full circle by teaching
12 that same class. I would not have learned that there
13 were 19 hero's who were students, who literally
14 fought against administration to push for African
15 American Studies and Puerto Rican and Latino Studies.
16 If it wasn't for that particular course, I would not
17 have known that there were movements of student
18 leaders that look like me and others on this table
19 who was at your college, BMCC, City College, who
20 locked campuses doors because they requested and
21 demanded that there be more faculty and staff that
22 looks like them.

23 So, these studies are extremely crucial, not only
24 to the wellbeing and the understanding of what it is
25 to be a student in CUNY, but it's also important to

1
2 understand the great contributions that we have made
3 in this great concrete jungle of the city of New York
4 but as part of the American fabric known as the
5 United States of America.

6 We are living in a time right now where our city
7 and state should not be playing games and dangling
8 higher education as a carrot on a stick. If we're
9 going to be the next innovators and the leaders
10 that's going to be teaching the next generation of
11 our city and our state, we need to be not only
12 providing more funding for our colleges to have more
13 professors that are a reflection of the city of New
14 York especially for unfortunate underprivileged
15 communities, but it's very important that the studies
16 of different ethnicities that represent this great
17 city be taught, understood, and that these
18 individuals will begin to understand the experience
19 behind our experience in navigating this city going
20 forward.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

23 SABINA DORVILE: Good afternoon, my name is
24 Sabina Dorvile; I am a senior at the City College of
25 New York and I am here as the Secretary of Senate for

1
2 Student Government. First and foremost, I would like
3 to say thank you to the Chairperson Council Member
4 Barron and the Committee Council for giving me this
5 opportunity.

6 So, I'm here today about City College and the
7 different experiences a lot of us people like me are
8 facing as students. So, for many years, we know that
9 CUNY has been facing the same crisis of little to
10 none faculty of color, especially Black professors
11 and women and under the 1969 protest, which was
12 mainly at CCNY, they requested the five demands which
13 included hiring faculties that are reflected of the
14 city and especially CCNY being that it's located in
15 Harlem, we are still seeing less and less of that
16 demand of course, CCNY and also CUNY in general.

17 Right after the protest, some studies including
18 the Black Study Department and under Ethnic Studies
19 were developed into the school, but now they have
20 been devolved into programs instead of in full
21 departments and facing budget cuts continually.

22 And right now, there's one full time faculty at
23 the Black Studies program, which is the director of
24 the program and only one full staff member and all of
25 our professors are adjuncts. They're already

1
2 overtired, underpaid and also, our programs are
3 forced to have the classes cross listed with other
4 departments that already do not have diverse faculty.
5 For example, I'm a political science major but with a
6 minor in Black Studies. At the political science
7 department, there's only one Black Professor and he's
8 not even a faculty. He only teaches once a year, the
9 first semester in ethnic and racial politics in
10 United States. He is the only one at the political
11 science department.

12 So, as students, we can actually count how many
13 professors of color, especially Black Professors on
14 campus. So, personally, as an immigrant from Haiti,
15 being that Haiti is the first Black country to gain
16 its independence, I was drawn toward the Black
17 Studies department because I wanted to know more
18 about the experiences of Black people in the United
19 States and also on African continent and relating
20 that to where I come from and my history. And at
21 first, I was really happy, but then I was forced to
22 grapple with the reality of not being able to take
23 classes that were once offered because of budget cuts
24 and lack of faculty members.

25

1
2 In light of our classes like mentioned, were
3 cross listed. So, last semester, I took African
4 politics and African American political taught, both
5 being cross listed with the political science
6 department and taught by White men and in one of my
7 classes, the first day the professor actually told
8 us, he was not well versed in African American
9 history besides slavery until he started teaching the
10 class.

11 So, basically, we're being used as guinea pigs in
12 order for him to understand our history, our
13 experiences and our daily struggle.

14 So, a lot of us were shocked by that the first
15 day. This is what we're faced with and one day, many
16 of us walked out of the classroom because we were so
17 tired of the emotional toll that it was taking on us
18 and the fact that sometimes he was not receptive to
19 our opinions when it comes to our daily struggle, the
20 unconscious racism and the different belief, the
21 implications of the 13th amendment. This is not to
22 say that the professors of color would have 100
23 percent agreed with us, but at least they could have
24 related to us on a personal level and also give us
25 advice and actually help us with our future.

1
2 Because of that, I don't think a lot of the
3 professors that are now teaching Black classes, Black
4 Studies classes, a lot of them are not culturally
5 sensitive and also, they are not aware that
6 themselves, they carry privilege with them. And
7 also, they have their own personal biases that many
8 of us students that are taking students of color, do
9 not have the privilege to do so. Every time we walk
10 out of our home, we are faced with the reality, a
11 reminder that we are Black or we are Lantinx or
12 because we don't confirm to certain binary genders
13 that you are a lesbian or you are not human enough.

14 My friends and I who are majoring or minoring in
15 ethnic studies have to sacrifice our extracurricular
16 activities every semester because we have only 20 or
17 less classes offered and those classes are offered
18 only at a specific time which is in conflict with
19 classes that we need for our majors or for our
20 fellowships.

21 This does not only affect our emotional being, it
22 also hinders us when we are applying for graduate
23 studies because a lot of those graduate studies like
24 applying for law school, they ask a letter of
25 recommendation from full time faculties and tenured

1
2 professors. If we are Black Studies majors, we do
3 not have any full time faculties. How is that
4 helping us prepare for the future? We are supposed
5 to go on and become the person in front of us
6 teaching the class, but if we are not afforded the
7 professors that look like us or full time professors
8 at our own studies majors, how are we supposed to do
9 that?

10 I believe we should have people that can relate
11 to us and it's unacceptable because we are living in
12 New York City, a diverse environment and yet classes
13 at CUNY do not reflect that. The programs are
14 getting bigger but the - so the office is the Black
15 City's program, the Lantinx program are not able to
16 serve us because their budgets have been cut every
17 single year and they cannot - specifically at CCNY,
18 they cannot hire any professors because we're under a
19 hiring freeze. So, this is not being faced on a
20 daily basis.

21 I'm happy that we have the Council Members and
22 also CUNY staff that are working endlessly to solve
23 this issue, but I believe in order to truly solve
24 this problem, we have to have professors of color on
25 the hiring committee.

1
2 And also, the hiring committee, that are no
3 people of color, should take [INAUDIBLE 3:28:14]
4 tests in order for them to see the reality when
5 they're looking at certain people or when they
6 receive their resume and based on just their name,
7 they can just reject this person from not continuing
8 with the process.

9 I believe there should be educational programs in
10 place to make sure that once the professors of color
11 are hired, if they are hired, there should be
12 conferences support, financial support and also, the
13 fact that they have to face aggressions from other
14 professors at their own department. I believe that
15 we also need to make ethnic studies classes required,
16 because right now, I'm taking the philosophy class
17 that I really do not care about but I have to take
18 it, because it's required. Why not make a Black
19 Study one on one required? Why not make a Latin
20 American Studies class required. It's the same
21 thing. I've been learning about White philosophers
22 or western history my whole life, so why not bring
23 those classes required and make sure that the
24 students are actually well versed in other peoples
25 culture and being culturally sensitive.

1
2 So, I'm here today because I'm really passionate
3 about that and since I'm a senior, even though I'm
4 graduating next semester, I would like to make sure
5 that the student body that elected me, that I'm
6 representing some time in the next two years are able
7 to take those class and are required to take those
8 classes.

9 Again, thank you for having me and I'm looking
10 forward to working with you all.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, next.

12 ENRIQUE PENA: Alright, good afternoon Council
13 Members, Fellow Students, everyone else in the room.
14 My name is Enrique Pena; I'm a student from Queens
15 College. I'm a USS delegate. I'm a dreamer and I'm
16 a proud New Yorker just like anyone else in this
17 room.

18 I wanted to briefly address the situation
19 regarding my own education in CUNY. I'm a Latin
20 American Studies Major at Queens College, intended
21 major. I'm a sophomore, I have not been able to
22 declare that yet. And why? Because of how CUNY is a
23 slowly but steady underfunding and killing our Ethnic
24 Studies programs. Out of the about 60 different
25 classes that were listed to fulfil requirements of my

1
2 career, fewer than ten were offered in the previous
3 year and considering classes that I cannot take
4 because of previous requirements that are also not
5 being offered, or Spanish classes that I simply am
6 not allowed to take because of that being my first
7 language, I am currently struggling to find most of
8 the classes that I'd need to graduate with that
9 degree.

10 I have talked to counselors, to the Academic
11 Center, I have talked to every office I could ask to
12 like why that was happening and got no answer and if
13 you ask me the same way I have been asked so many
14 times before, why didn't I go talk to the same
15 department. I have, I didn't know that the chair of
16 the department have taken a sabbatical and no one had
17 been assigned to replace them and since there's only
18 one person in charge of the whole department, that
19 means it wasn't possible for me to seek any help.

20 For a whole year I've been making calls, sending
21 emails, going to different offices and I feel I've
22 been fooled into a major that I may not be able to
23 complete because the first thing to go to or when
24 there's a budget cut in CUNY is ethnic studies.

1
2 Queens College has a history of unrest, which I
3 am proud of. 50 years ago, in 1969, in all around
4 CUNY, students took over campuses to ask for racial
5 justice, to condemn the war, to make sure our
6 university becomes the beacon of hope, that only for
7 a White minority that existed back then, but for
8 people to look the majority of this room. The
9 majority of New York, people that look like me. That
10 is how we got our Ethnic Studies departments in the
11 first place. That is how we got SEEK, that is how
12 CUNY opened admission to people of color and became
13 the institution I speak in behalf of today. But I am
14 tired of speaking up. I am tired of going to hearing
15 after hearing to tell the same sob stories to
16 denounce this systemic problem that New York has let
17 happen for so long.

18 You're not asking the right questions, so let me
19 help you with some.

20 Why is it that in 1976, the year that CUNY
21 finally stopped being a White majority institution,
22 it started charging tuition?

23 Why is it that we keep telling ourselves that the
24 answer to the previous question is a fiscal deficit

1
2 when we managed to have the biggest expansion of CUNY
3 during the Great Depression?

4 Why is it that when tuition was just imposed, the
5 student money covered about 20 percent of CUNY
6 budget, but now we finance about 50 percent? Why the
7 disinvestment? Why is it that disinvestment put in
8 the back of middle class students of color?

9 Why can we spend \$11 billion in prisons, and a
10 few hundred of millions in police officers in the MTA
11 to lock people up that look like me but not invest in
12 education for the same demographic for a much lower
13 cost? And let me repeat the word invest, because
14 education is not an expense, it is an investment.

15 I cannot speak about education without mentioning
16 my mother. She studied in Peru to be an educator,
17 and then went on to get a Law degree in 1996, but
18 when I came to the US in 2016, she came with me to
19 work for a minimum wage as a home attendant, facing
20 sometimes discrimination because she doesn't speak
21 English, but fighting non-stop, so I get to be here
22 today, speaking my truth and the truth of our people.

23 So, you know why I dare today to criticize a
24 Mayor that calls himself progressive and runs for
25 president saying that he supports Free College for

1
2 all yet underfunds CUNY and applauds cops arresting a
3 lady selling churros in the Subway, because in that
4 woman, I see my mom, I see my dad. I see nuestros
5 tfos y abuelos and there you see how the words of the
6 Peruvian poet Cesar Vallejo become a reality. To
7 know more is to be more free, because through
8 education, we buy our freedom. Through education we
9 thrive in this country. That is why this is
10 important to me, because I know the story of my
11 fellow dreamers that came to this country facing the
12 biggest hardships just to get this chance. When I
13 came to New York City in 2016, I enrolled in high
14 school and was sent to an international school in
15 Queens for English Language Learners, where almost
16 every student was immigrants and a big part of them
17 were dreamers like me. And that school did not have
18 access to honors programs, to AP classes, to sports.
19 But you say you want those students to succeed. You
20 still ask about diversity, and there's a segregated
21 school in Queens where you still fail to provide the
22 most basic level of education, in comparison to
23 students in that same building, but in a different
24 school, in a different floor. A school that was for
25 citizens and did offer classes like many AP classes

1
2 and a personal experience. I had an engineering prep
3 in Peru and wanted to take an advanced class in math,
4 but the highest that I could take in my school was
5 Algebra 2 and upstairs it was AP Calculus and I
6 wanted to take that class, I talked to my principle,
7 I talked to as many as possible and it wasn't
8 possible. And so, I was not given a chance and I
9 cannot even imagine how many students have gone
10 through the same issue in only my own school.

11 I supported students in my old high school for a
12 couple of years through the ASPIRA organization,
13 founded in 1969 by Dr. Antonia Pantoja, that saw back
14 then the same issues we are discussing right now. It
15 took Dr. Pantoja a civil rights lawsuit against New
16 York City in 1972 to be able to provide a bilingual
17 education to students in the city. To use the
18 efforts of Dr. Pantoja to segregate students and
19 refused to give them a basic education is just an
20 insult to everything she stood for. And city
21 officials should be ashamed of the outcome.

22 I'm tired of seeing how students like me are
23 pushed out of the educational system, and into jails,
24 int the military complex, or the streets. I'm tired

1
2 of trying to help students when the whole system
3 wants us to fail.

4 So, if this hearing was organized to know why do
5 we have issues with lack of diversity in our schools,
6 I'm giving you the answer. New York City has one of
7 the most segregated school systems in the country.
8 If students of color can't even get through high
9 school, don't expect them to go to college and by
10 hiking tuition and not giving enough investment in
11 CUNY, you are purging out students of color like me
12 that wanted an opportunity in this country, in this
13 university system but pay college out of pocket and
14 cannot afford that anymore. You make us choose
15 between a meal and an education, so invest in CUNY,
16 invest in schools, invest in us. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Before you go, I
18 just wanted to say, it's always the students and
19 those who have been through CUNY that are most
20 critical and have the keen insight of what really
21 needs. They're not distracted, their not disengaged,
22 their at the very heart of what goes on and, in the
23 testimony, you talked about all of the challenges and
24 you talked about the success of students getting what
25 they wanted and it's because they fought. IT's

1
2 because they took on presidents, faculty, Board of
3 Trustees, Mayor's, governors, to get what they wanted
4 and nothing comes without a struggle. It never has
5 and it never will.

6 Power concedes nothing without a demand. So,
7 we've got to continue to make demand and put action
8 on those demands. So, I hear you saying that you're
9 tired, but don't get weary. You know, go to sleep,
10 get a good nights rest and get up ready for the
11 battle because the battle continues, it's ongoing.

12 And again, the struggle of the late 60'sa and
13 70's is what gave us where we are and it's true,
14 tuition came when it was no longer White. When other
15 communities came in and made their demands and at the
16 end of the open access period, open admissions
17 period, that's when got the tuition imposed and like
18 you said in your testimony, for various reasons that
19 they put on the table to say that's why they had to
20 do it. But we've got to continue to battle, we've
21 got to continue to struggle, we've got to continue to
22 call out those forces that are misdirected and
23 keeping us from getting what it is that we are
24 entitled to.

1
2 And I don't think I've said it yet this hearing,
3 so yes, we're still fighting for Free Tuition.
4 Talking about tuition freeze, yes, but my position is
5 that we need to have free tuition and it's only
6 because it was free to those students who graduated
7 with a B or better average that I was able to go my
8 Hunters College and it's only because it was free
9 that I was able to go. Both of my parents worked,
10 but we didn't have the money that it would have cost
11 if I had to pay tuition.

12 So, we've got to continue to vigilant, continue
13 to organize and not be distracted and move forward
14 and I thank you all for all that you are doing and
15 encourage you to get other students involved,
16 mobilize and willing to challenge and confront those
17 things, those obstacles that are unjust and that keep
18 them from moving forward.

19 Okay, thank you and I do have one last panelist.
20 I want to thank you, you're excused, thank you so
21 much. And our last panelist is Timothy Hunter and is
22 he here? Oh, there he is. And he is the
23 representative from USS.

24
25

1
2 Thank you, welcome, you can give us your name and
3 your testimony. Pull the mic close, closer, push the
4 button.

5 TIMOTHY HUNTER: Hello, there we go. So, my name
6 is Timothy Hunter; I'm the Chairperson of the
7 University Student Senate and CUNY Student Trustee.
8 I didn't actually plan to be here today but I'm
9 giving a testimony on behalf of my Vice Chair Natalie
10 Segev from John Jay Community College. She's the
11 Vice Chair of Senior Colleges and she's an amazing
12 individual and she couldn't make it today because of
13 some prior engagements that she had and it was an
14 emergency that she had to go attend to.

15 So, her testimony reads as says. Good afternoon
16 City Council Members. My name is Natalie Segev; I am
17 the Vice Chair of Senior Colleges for the CUNY
18 University Student Senate and a student at John Jay
19 College. Thank you for holding this hearing on
20 ethnic studies at CUNY.

21 The lack of funding in our public higher
22 education system has many negative impacts. One
23 consequence that does not get nearly enough attention
24 is how underfunded CUNY effects on our ethnic studies
25 departments. The institution prides itself with its

1
2 diverse students. In the Fall 2018, CUNY reported
3 that the largest student population in all its
4 schools were Hispanic students at 30.8 percent. The
5 second largest student population were Black students
6 at 24.8 percent. So, why is it that CUNY has an
7 academic curriculum that is not reflective of the
8 students that they are supposed to serve?

9 At John Jay College of Criminal Justice, budget
10 cuts to the Africana Studies Department mean that in
11 the past six years, the department has been unable to
12 hire new faculty members. Even if it was to replace
13 a retired faculty member. Around ten to fifteen
14 years ago, the department had eleven full time
15 faculty members. Since then, the Africana Studies
16 Department has had a steady increase. Their minors
17 program more than doubled and they serve over 1,000
18 students. Yet, they only have six full time faculty
19 members. These faculty members not only teach but
20 create programming and advise their students.

21 As a result, the Africana Studies Department is
22 unable to offer all the courses displayed in the
23 course catalog.

24 Unfortunately, this is an issue across CUNY
25 campuses. The Department of Africana Studies at

1
2 Lehman will have to offer a significantly reduced
3 amount of course for the upcoming Spring 2020
4 semester. The Department just finalized their Spring
5 schedule and cited a reduction in \$20,000 in their
6 adjunct budget. This means the department cannot pay
7 for the same amount of classes that were offered last
8 Spring. To provide additional context, Lehman's
9 Department of Africana Studies had been able to offer
10 numerous courses on Saturdays in Spring 2019.
11 However, they will only be able to offer one class
12 this upcoming Spring. This is harmful for many
13 students, who cite lack of course offerings being the
14 reason why they cannot fulfill their requirements in
15 a timely manner and delays them from graduating.

16 On the flyer for this hearing a question was
17 posed. Do you feel that there aren't enough ethnic
18 studies courses offered to fulfill your degree
19 requirement? I believe, just based on the two
20 examples presented, that due to budget cuts, the
21 answer is no. No there aren't enough ethnic studies
22 courses offered to fulfill degree requirements.

23 Just to give a little personal anecdote, again, I
24 really didn't expect to be here, but I, myself have
25 taken some Africana Study classes at my personal

1 schools, New York City College of Technology and
2 those have been the courses that have changed my
3 life. Those have been the course that encourage me
4 to get into student leadership and those have been
5 the courses that got me where I'm at now and I don't
6 where I would be without that, because those are the
7 same values that my mom, who went to Medgar Evers
8 College was instilled and that kind of carried on
9 generationally.
10

11 So, this same push for diversity and higher
12 education and inclusion has created a movement that
13 has encouraged a lot of students to get more involved
14 and its put us in places where we can actually
15 succeed. And you know, I think this is a
16 conversation that has always continued to be had and
17 as I do more research on this, I know we only got in
18 two weeks ago and you realize that there is supposed
19 to be a massive plan five years ago or four years ago
20 that kind of was supposed to fix and remedy a lot of
21 these things and to see that there hasn't really been
22 enough like you know, like emphases on what you know
23 the university can do for it.

24 I know we have a new Chancellor who is amazing, I
25 know we have a new University Provost whose also

1
2 really, really great. I think that like now is the
3 time for us to kind of take a real comprehensive look
4 at what it is that we need to do for these
5 departments and for our students.

6 Again, the seven presidents across the board that
7 are interim, I hope to see a much more diverse group
8 get in. Not only diverse in like you know, just
9 races as well as gender. You know, I think that we
10 have especially the new women presidents like
11 President Mason who was here earlier today and you
12 know, President Schroeder Kay CC and also the interim
13 president at York, who's also a woman of color
14 President Ennis[SP?]. I think these are presidents
15 that have a huge emphasis on student services because
16 that's their background. I think that when you have
17 more culturally responsive administration, there's
18 like a trickle down effect that you know, now, like
19 it trickles down to our faculty and to our students.

20 Because it helps seeing people that look like you
21 and I think that just highlighting the faculty
22 disparity, again, just looking at some of these
23 documents is very disturbing. You know, less than
24 five percent full time faculty across the board that
25 are like not only men and women of color, I think

1 things that that, like you know, it's very - it's
2 something that I think that we should all be taking a
3 real comprehensive look at because it's important
4 that like you know, where we're being sensitive. I
5 know like even me, I'm a part of New York City Men's
6 teach, which is an initiative to kind of increase the
7 amount of men of color in the classroom because I
8 actually want to be a teacher and an educator that
9 students can look at and say, wow, you know, theirs
10 Mr. Hunter. Like you know, that's someone that looks
11 like me in front of the classroom and I think that
12 with City Council, I know we have people that are
13 extremely receptive to these things and I appreciate
14 Chairperson Barron, for being like a huge advocate
15 for everything that you know, involves diversity and
16 gender equity and getting people that look like us in
17 the classroom.

19 And not only in the classroom but also in those
20 offices, because those are important as well. And I
21 think with this new Chancellor, it's important and
22 this hearing was needed because it highlights the
23 situations that we need to kind of like take you
24 know, like we need to take action on, especially as
25 it relates to administration and higher education

1
2 diversity. And the retention of our students because
3 at the end of the day, we want all of our students to
4 succeed and these students wouldn't be here if they
5 didn't want that.

6 And I also just want to thank the students and
7 Jamell for coming out and everyone else that had the
8 opportunity to stick around. I know I went late and
9 I know we're really late as well, but I just want to
10 appreciate and let you all know that you know, the
11 students and behalf of all the students at CUNY,
12 thank you all for the work that you all are trying to
13 do, especially when it relates to diversity. Because
14 it's important that we're being sensitive to all
15 these topics and any questions that you can ask, I'll
16 definitely be willing to answer them to the best of
17 my ability.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much. I just
20 want to encourage you in your journey to move forward
21 and to be a model as you say for those who are
22 looking at you and you just need to know that people
23 are always watching wherever it is, so just continue
24 to be strong. Continue to be vocal, be an example to
25 others around you and encourage them to use their

1
2 voice and use their presence and use their body and
3 use their intelligence to make sure that we can
4 advance to get what we rightfully need. And it's
5 been pitiful the steady decline in faculty that's
6 reflective of the population that they serve, but
7 we've got to continue to put the pressure on and now,
8 as has been cited before, is a great possibility with
9 all of the new presidents that are going to be
10 appointed, it's a great possibility, so we'll see
11 what happens as these positions are filled and what
12 kind of agenda presidents insist they see from the
13 faculty in their schools and what they are doing to
14 help the faculty departments realize yes, White men
15 have great privilege and power and the ability to
16 make sure that they maintain that power. So, we've
17 got to challenge that and make sure. We've got to
18 break the glass ceilings and the racial bars and all
19 of that to make sure that we get equity.

20 So, I want to thank everyone whose come to
21 testify. Seeing no other panelists, this hearing is
22 now adjourned. Thank you. [GAVEL]

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 1, 2018