

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON  
GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

November 19, 2019

Start: 1:11 p.m.

Recess: 3:50 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM  
Chairperson

FERNANDO CABRERA  
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ADRIENNE E. ADAMS  
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
VANESSA L. GIBSON  
MARK GJONAJ  
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK  
BEN KALLOS  
KAREN KOSLOWITZ  
RORY I. LANCMAN  
ALAN N. MAISEL  
BILL PERKINS  
KEITH POWERS  
FARAH N. LOUIS  
STEVEN MATTEO  
FRANCISCO P. MOYA  
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL  
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
KALMAN YEGER

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jeffrey Shear  
Deputy Commissioner for Treasury and Payment  
Services at the New York City Department of  
Finance, DOF

Jennifer Geiling  
Deputy Director, Policy and Partnerships from the  
Mayor's Office of Contract Services

Andrew Rettig  
Chief of Revenue Protection for the Bureau of  
Customer Services for the Department of  
Environmental Protection

Ted Oberman  
Director of Commercial Exemptions from the  
Department of Finance's Property Exemption  
Administration

Jean Carubia  
Deputy Director, Commercial Exemptions, New York  
City Department of Finance, DOF

Paula Segal  
Senior Staff Attorney in the Equitable  
Neighborhoods Practice, Take Root Justice

Mara Kravitz  
Protect Our Places Coalition

Marcia Eisenberg  
General Counsel at the Jewish Community Relations  
Council

Peter Cook  
Executive Director of the New York State Council  
Churches

Alexandra Brandes  
Policy and Advocacy Manager at Lenox Hill  
Neighborhood House

Robert Foltz Morrison  
Reverend at the Presbyterian of New York City

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

MJ OKMA Okma  
Policy and Campaign Strategist for the Human  
Services Council

Lemuria Alawode-El  
Associate Vice President of Strengthen NYC at  
United Way of New York City

Kobir Chowdhury  
President of Masjid Al Aman Mosque

Mohamed Selim  
Represents Almanir Foundation of Queens

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

4

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good afternoon.

I'm Council Member Daniel Dromm, Chair of the Committee on Finance. Today's hearing is being held jointly with the Committee on Governmental Operations which is chaired by Council Member Fernando Cabrera. We are joined today by Council Member Rory Lancman, Minority Leader Steve Matteo, Council Member Farah Louis, I said Council Member Cabrera already, Council Member Barry Grodenchik, Council, Council Member Antonio Reynoso as well. New York City is home to thousands of not for profit organizations that deliver critical programs and services to the communities throughout the five boroughs, provide for our resident's spiritual and religious needs and do countless hours of charitable work. The not for profit sector is significant in the city's economy. As of 2017, New York City had the highest number of not for profit sector, sector jobs in the state with over 662,000 employees at an average wage of 63,000 dollars. Given the sector's importance in the city it is key to understand the ongoing challenges many of these organizations face and to maintain a commitment to provide support to these vital partners through

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the access to helpful resources citywide. Today's hearing and the bills we are considering is aimed at encouraging city government to look at the not for profit sector holistically rather than taking an agency by agency approach. Much like how EDC and SBS work to study and bring solutions to many sectors across the business industries, the administration should focus on not for profits in a similar manner. I commend the finance commissioner, Jacques Jiha for taking the first step towards that goal. Under his leadership DOF launched a non-for-profit task force comprised of representatives of the Mayor, the City Council and members of the not for profit community aimed at connecting not for profit property owners across the city with local government resources. More specifically the task force focused on addressing several issues largely related to the lack of clarity, information, coordination and outreach about the not for profit property tax exemptions, the lien sale, charges imposed by the New York City Fire Department, water and sewer exemptions administered by DEP and waivers of Department of Building inspection fees. As a result of the collaborative efforts of this task force and of the work of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

6

bill's prime sponsors we have four pieces of legislation before us today that would ease some of the bureaucracy created by the city and create a single point of contact for not for profits to engage with city government and access the many resources we have to offer. The three bills that are in the finance committee are one, proposed Intro 245-A sponsored by Council Member Reynoso which would require DOF to create a not for profit ombudsman person... position, exempt certain property that received a not for profit tax exemption within the prior two years from the tax lien sale, exempt property from tax lien sale where the owner has in good faith submitted an application for the not for profit, profit property tax exemption with DOF, provide notice to class four property owners about exemptions and other actions to remove a property from the tax lien sale and include information on how to remove a property from the tax lien sale when denying applications for certain exemptions. Two, Intro 1776 sponsored by Council Member Ayala which would require DOF and DEP to develop a single application form for the not for profit property tax exemption, the exemption from water and sewer charges



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

communities. As will be discussed in detail during  
the... this hearing the city already offer various  
information, training, financial resources to local  
not for profits. The city also solicits feedback from  
the not for profit sector through various portals.  
Still we can and should do more to ensure easy  
communication between the city and not for profits so  
we can be flexible and respond to fluctuations  
including changes to state and federal law that  
impact not for profit work. To that end among the  
bills to be heard today is Introduction 1784  
sponsored by my colleague Council Member Farah Louis,  
this bill will be... will require the Mayor to  
establish an office of not for profit services to  
offer a liaison to not for profit organization  
simulations to policy and regulations, contracting  
and funding opportunities and programs and benefits  
effecting their sector. This office will advise the  
Mayor and the city agencies on policies affecting not  
for profits... [clears throat] excuse me... an annual... an  
annually... an annual report on recommendations to  
improve the wellbeing of our not for profit sector. I  
would like to thank our Government Operation staff  
Committee Counsel Danny Collins, Policy Analyst

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

9

Elizabeth Kronk and Emily Forgione and Finance Analyst Sebastian Bacchi and as well as my own Legislative Communications Director Claire McLeveighn. I would now like to recognize Council Member Louis for an opening statement. Let me just say that this is her very first bill, congratulations.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Good afternoon everyone, thank you so much Chair Dromm and Chair Cabrera for the opportunity to discuss this bill and I want to thank my colleagues, Council Member Reynoso, Rivera, and Ayala for joining in this package of bills. Yeah that's probably easier. Thank you so much. Across New York City nonprofit organizations are on the ground doing vitally important work in schools, senior centers and other public spaces to provide services our constituents rely on every day. I am intimately familiar with the challenges these nonprofits face in New York City as a former budget director. I know of many other staffers that I have worked with in the past at the council and local nonprofits that shared the same experiences I had which was basically spending a great deal of time helping disgruntled leaders from

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 10  
3 nonprofit organizations to get access to appropriate  
4 contacts at city agencies to navigate how to access  
5 funding, RFPs and other award opportunities as well  
6 as pulling down funding. Navigating these issues  
7 takes valuable time that our offices and these  
8 nonprofits could have been using in order to better  
9 serve our districts. This body could not function  
10 without these organizations, some of them we may be  
11 familiar with Brooklyn Arts Council, Wildcat, Family  
12 Justice Center just to name a few. I believe that  
13 these nonprofits and many others have a  
14 responsibility to clear the path for individuals and  
15 groups seeking to make New York City a better place.  
16 Intro 1784 will establish an office that will provide  
17 guaranteed services to nonprofits seeking to  
18 incorporate and those already providing services  
19 citywide and within our districts to better serve our  
20 communities. This office will function as a liaison  
21 between nonprofits and city agencies that will work  
22 to devise solutions to roadblocks and keep this body  
23 as well as the Mayor informed of challenges  
24 nonprofits might be facing and it will be required to  
25 report on this activity yearly. And I'm glad to see  
this piece of legislation move forward along with

1  
2 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 11  
3 some of the other vital important bills introduced by  
4 my colleagues today creating opportunities for  
5 nonprofits to thrive. Thank you Chairs Dromm and  
6 Cabrera and the council... and Council Members Reynoso,  
7 Rivera, Ayala for your partnership on this issue and  
8 I want to thank the nonprofit organizations that are  
9 here today and those that are supporting this  
10 movement in order for us to stand and work together  
11 to build a greater New York City, thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Very good, we'll now  
13 hear from Council Member Reynoso.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: With gratitude  
15 to the Chairs and also to Council Member Louis,  
16 Rivera, Ayala for the work in ensuring that we take  
17 care of the non for profits in our... in our city that  
18 do such great work. The bill that I am here... that  
19 we're hearing today, Intro 245 that I am sponsoring  
20 provides exemptions from the tax lien sales list for  
21 nonprofits that are in the process of securing a tax  
22 exemption and requires that the city better inform  
23 nonprofits about how they can stay off the list and  
24 the potential consequences if they do end up on the  
25 list. I have more, more comments but I just wanted to  
speak to a couple of examples of what some of these



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

13

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you.

3

We'll now hear from Council Member Rivera.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you Chairs

5

Dromm and Cabrera for allowing me to speak today and

6

for holding this important hearing and I have to

7

thank Council Members Reynoso, Ayala and Council

8

Member Farah Louis for their leadership in moving

9

this legislative package forward. So, the bills we

10

are hearing today will help relieve the financial and

11

administrative burdens that our city's nonprofits

12

have been forced to take on by our outdated tax and

13

city finance system. As a former community organizer,

14

nonprofit employee, Council staffer and now Council

15

Member I have seen the critical impact that these

16

safe and very much sacred spaces play in housing,

17

healthcare, education, the arts and social services

18

both in my district and throughout the five boroughs.

19

I have also unfortunately seen many of our city's

20

nonprofit providers crumble under financial duress

21

and complicated bureaucracy leaving our communities

22

without the resources they need to thrive. The

23

package of legislation which includes my bill Intro

24

1799 is simplifying our often times confusing and

25

unwelcoming finance system for our nonprofit

1

14

2 organizations. Under Intro 1799 the Department of  
3 Finance will be mandated to create and distribute  
4 information on tax exemptions, funding applications  
5 and other resources for nonprofits. This legislation  
6 will allow nonprofits to navigate government channels  
7 with greater ease and streamline their funding  
8 process. The fact of the matter is many of these  
9 organizations are operated by overworked staffers and  
10 volunteers many of whom lack training in complicated  
11 finance and tax law. Organizations are already  
12 struggling to keep their lights on as they apply for  
13 funding and support and as a legislative body, we  
14 need to make sure our finance laws uplift rather than  
15 penalize them. That, that's why I'm proud to support  
16 this package of legislation that will increase  
17 transparency while making it easier for nonprofits to  
18 focus on their missions as service providers and I  
19 look forward to this discussion today and moving  
20 these important changes forward. Thank you so much  
21 for the time.

22

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much

23

24 and before I finish up here, I want to say we've been  
25 joined by Council Members Kallos, Koslowitz, Yeger,  
Cumbo and Van Bramer as well. Now before we hear



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

16

Commissioner for Treasury and Payment Services at the  
New York City Department of Finance, DOF. I am here  
today to testify on three bills related to not for  
profit, NFP organizations. They are Intro 245-A,  
Intro 1776 and Intro 1799. I am joined today by  
Jennifer Geiling, Deputy Director, Policy and  
Partnerships from the Mayor's Office of Contract  
Services to testify on Intro 1784 as well as by  
Andrew Rettig, Chief of Revenue Protection for the  
Bureau of Customer Services for the Department of  
Environmental Protection and Ted Oberman, who is  
Director of Commercial Exemptions from DOF's Property  
Exemption Administration to help me answer your  
questions. I'd like to start off by talking about the  
great work DOF has done in the past few years to  
engage the NFP community and to ensure more NFPs  
renew their property exemptions on time. Through  
DOF's outreach including an NFP portal, letters and  
follow-up calls, we have achieved a 99 percent  
renewal rate for the past two years, which reflects  
an average of 13,000 renewals per year and an average  
of 92 non-responders. This means NFPs do not have to  
file a new application and their exemption has no  
break in period benefit. While we are pleased that

1  
2 the vast majority of NFPs renew their exemptions  
3 through this process, it is also important to point  
4 out that many of the non-responders have their  
5 exemptions renewed during the tax lien sale process.  
6 To further support our service to NFPs, DOF is  
7 looking into other mechanisms that could grant an  
8 exemption for non-responders that would have been  
9 eligible on the taxable status date up to the three  
10 preceding years. In addition, in October 2018, DOF  
11 launched our NFP Task Force to hear from advocates  
12 and NFP representatives about the challenges they  
13 face when applying for or renewing any city  
14 exemption. The Task Force meets about three times a  
15 year and we are pleased that the Department of  
16 Environmental Protection, DEP, the Mayor's Office of  
17 Contract Services, MOCS, the Department of Buildings,  
18 DOB, and Council Finance staff have joined us for  
19 these meetings. One of the recommendations and  
20 concrete outcomes from this task force is a draft NFP  
21 brochure for those seeking to apply for a DOF NFP  
22 exemption. Intro 245-A relates to NFPs and the DOF  
23 tax lien sale process. DOF broadly supports 245-A  
24 which aligns with our efforts to improve the customer  
25 service and flexibility of the tax lien sale process

1 and codifies existing DOF practices. DOF also is  
2 asking the Council to make some minor changes to the  
3 bill. State law exempts NFPs from paying property  
4 taxes if they annually confirm their not for profit  
5 status and show that they are using their property  
6 for an exempt purpose. In recent years, DOF has made  
7 great efforts to make the NFP exemption process as  
8 easy as possible. DOF realizes that many NFPs are  
9 small organizations staffed with part-time and/or  
10 volunteer workers that may find the exemption process  
11 challenging; especially when there has been turnover  
12 in the NFP's leadership. That is why we established  
13 the previously described NFP portal, why we sponsor  
14 about 100 community outreach events a year, and why  
15 we launched our NFP Task Force. However, DOF  
16 recognizes that for the small number of NFPs that  
17 fail to renew their exemptions and wind up in the tax  
18 lien sale process, special attention is needed. That  
19 is why DOF's current practice is to remove an NFP  
20 from the tax lien sale at risk pool if it has  
21 received a previous exemption and submits an  
22 exemption for the current year that is substantially  
23 complete. Intro 245-A creates a not for profit  
24 ombudsperson position within DOF, excludes properties  
25





1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

information requirements and standards. Some NFPs qualify for DOF exemptions, but not for DEP exemptions. Requiring all applicants to apply for both through a combined application would create more of a burden for NFPs that only qualify for a DOF exemption. This burden would be felt during the initial application process and during the annual renewal processes. Also, the DOF process is run annually whereas the DEP process is conducted every other year. A combined form would likely lead to NFPs submitting information to DEP when it was not required. DEP and DOF are committed to improving the application process and we are happy to work with the Council to do so. Intro 1799, this legislation requires the Department of Finance to create and publish an informational brochure with information that would be useful to NFPs including information about relevant taxes and exemption. DOF supports this legislation and already has made significant progress in this area. As a part of the DOF NFP Taskforce, DOF has recently completed the final draft of the brochure on NFP exemption. A copy of the draft is attached to this testimony. In addition, DOF has property tax guides that include information about

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the notice of property value, the assessment process, exemptions and abatements, and how to appeal an exemption. DOF is currently updating these documents and is happy to consider including additional information relating to NFP, NFPs that is suggested by the Council. We would like to note that assessments do not change if a property is owned by an NFP; rather the NFP can apply for an exemption from real property taxes or water meter taxes for their property. Intro 1784, as mentioned earlier, our colleague, Jennifer Geiling from the Mayor's Office of Contract Services will testify on this legislation. Thank you for the opportunity to testify this afternoon. We are happy to answer any questions you may have.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you, next.

JENNIFER GEILING: Good afternoon Chair Dromm, Chair Cabrera and members of the City Council Finance Committee and Governmental Operations Committee, also good afternoon Chair Kallos of the Contracts Committee. My name is Jennifer Geiling and I am the Deputy Director for Policy and Partnerships at the Mayor's Office of Contract Services, MOCS and

1  
2 the Executive Director of the Nonprofit Resiliency  
3 Committee, NRC. I am joining the Department of  
4 Finance today to share how the administration is  
5 partnering with and supporting the city's critical  
6 health and human service, HHS nonprofit  
7 organizations. This administration deeply values the  
8 role that nonprofits play in delivering vital  
9 services to our city's communities including our most  
10 vulnerable populations. As our PowerPoint indicates,  
11 if we can get this to work here... sorry, please bear  
12 with me. As our power point indicates here there is  
13 no question that the health and wellbeing of our city  
14 is directly tied to the health and wellbeing of our  
15 nonprofits. In recognition of the significant  
16 partnership, the administration launched the NRC in  
17 September 2016 as a centralized body to hear directly  
18 from nonprofits about operational challenges and then  
19 to design and implement sector wide solutions with  
20 and for those same partners. As I will share in this  
21 testimony Intro 1784 captures the spirit and the work  
22 of the NRC. As such we support institutionalizing the  
23 NRC and look forward to working with you and our  
24 partners to define the right structure to continue  
25 this meaningful work. We appreciate the flexibility

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

provided by the current draft of the legislation. In the three years since it's inception the NRC has established itself as a center for purposeful engagement and policy reform that translates into results-oriented action. More than 100 nonprofit organizations volunteered to participate in our work representing the diversity of the sector with a range in organization size, contracting portfolios, service areas, and populations served. The NRC has galvanized government leaders who oversee procurement, finance, programs and audit across the city's 40 mayoral agencies and the Department of Education. All key HHS agencies are active participants in the committee's work. Specifically, the Department of Youth and Community Development, DYCD, Department for the Aging, DFTA, Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, DOHMH, Department of Social Services, DSS and the Administration for Children Services, ACS. Together our city leaders work hand in hand with nonprofit leaders to understand the everyday challenges of delivering services in a city of this size and operating businesses subject to disparate policies and practices across 41 agencies and hundreds of programs. We roll up our sleeves to do the hard work

1 of unpacking difficult and longstanding problems,  
2 identifying opportunities for mutually beneficial  
3 change and rebuilding policies and practices that can  
4 be effectively implemented and maintained. By  
5 inviting nonprofits to codesign the solutions to  
6 their challenges we create reforms that make sense  
7 and can be successfully adopted. This is a flagship  
8 model of partnership that is enabled through  
9 nurturing honest and transparent conversations and  
10 building trust and understanding. Through this open  
11 and committed dialogue we have completed a range of  
12 projects that support our diverse sector and make it  
13 easier to do business with the city of New York.  
14 Initiatives are identified by providers and target  
15 opportunities to streamline administrative practices,  
16 collaborate on program design and build  
17 organizational financial strength. We are accountable  
18 to the sector and cultivate transparency and  
19 accessibility through publicly sharing our activities  
20 and adopted reforms on our website at NYC dot gov  
21 backslash NRC. As you can see the accomplishments, we  
22 highlight reflect years of hard work to get the  
23 details of each initiative right and hundreds of  
24 meetings to ensure we are hearing each other and  
25

1  
2 developing relevant tools and policies that benefit  
3 the sector. After years of collaboration we now have  
4 a body of work we can all be proud of and providers  
5 are experiencing legitimate relief in many areas.  
6 That said the initiatives that gather the most  
7 attention are those that focus on fiscal reforms,  
8 funding, more flexibility with funding and receiving  
9 funding earlier. I'd like to highlight four  
10 significant achievements in this area which in fiscal  
11 year 2020, FY '20 have come together to significantly  
12 strengthen the business environment for the city's  
13 HHS nonprofit sector. First, FY '20 saw the city's  
14 successful implementation of the NRC's policy for  
15 timely contract registration. This fiscal year more  
16 than 80 percent of July 1<sup>st</sup> HHS contracts were ready  
17 for registration on time across our HHS agencies. Let  
18 me underscore this statement, this fiscal year more  
19 than 80 percent of July 1<sup>st</sup> HHS contracts were ready  
20 for registration on time across our HHS agencies. As  
21 you know late registration is a longstanding pain  
22 point for this sector, this accomplishment was a  
23 breakthrough initiative with critical financial  
24 implications targeting cash flow and greater  
25 liquidity. Established through an NRC working group



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

28

management practices. In FY '20 budgeting, invoicing and advance payments all happen more simply and quickly with a third NRC accomplishment. Universal adoption of HHS accelerator financials, the city's electronic budgeting and invoicing platform for HHS contracts. This year for the first time over 90 percent of all eligible budgets are flowing through this digital system, providers now have the transparency and consistency they have long requested. Finally, the city established a standardized policy on indirect cost rates through the HHS cost policy and procedure manual, the cost manual. The cost manual was developed through the NRC and forms a foundation of a monumental commitment by the city council and the administration to fund indirect cost rates effective this fiscal year. There are numerous other accomplishments including guidebooks on best practices for program development and RFP design, work that was co-chaired by NYC opportunity, a founding leader of the NRC. Streamlining subcontracting processes to enable greater accessibility for small nonprofits and revising the standard human service contracts to create a more equitable partnership. Our work is

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

applicable across all HHS contracts regardless of the contracting agency impacting nearly seven billion dollars and more than 3,000 contracts annually. I'm happy to discuss these initiatives during our question and answer period and invite you to review our work at NYC dot gov backlash NRC. While there is still more work to be done the robust and fruitful collaboration between the administration and the nonprofit sector through the NRC is helping to establish a more supportive and sustainable operating environment for our critical HHS providers. And the work has been continuous since we launched ongoing even as we sit here today. current NRC work groups are focused on enhancing equity and access for community-based organizations integrating a justice informed lens into programs and services and expanding the guides to collaborative communication and standardized audits. Because of our rapid deployment of policy reform small, medium and large nonprofit organizations are already feeling shifts in their relationships with the city and greater financial stability. Under the current structure MOCS remains committed to fulfilling its NRC management role and will continue to launch new solutions like

1  
2 the procurement and sourcing solutions portal,  
3 passport which ensures a predictable and transparent  
4 procurement experience. Intro 1784 captures the  
5 spirit and the work of the NRC collaborating to  
6 identify and solve operational challenges critical to  
7 nonprofits, facilitating conversations between  
8 agencies and providers and creating useful supports  
9 and resources that empower nonprofit organizations in  
10 their relationship with the city. We support  
11 institutionalizing the NRC and look forward to  
12 working with you and our partners to define the right  
13 structure to continue this meaningful work. We  
14 appreciate the flexibility provided by the current  
15 draft of the legislation and I'm happy to take any  
16 questions that you might have. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good, thank you  
18 very much. Let me just start off with a question Miss  
19 Geiling, I hope I said your last name right.

20 JENNIFER GEILING: Geiling, yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Geiling, okay..

22 JENNIFER GEILING: Yes, thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In your testimony you  
24 said that the registration is on time across the HHS  
25 agencies, what does on time mean?



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

32

COMMITTEE CLERK: Do you affirm that your testimony will be truthful to the best of your knowledge, information and belief?

TED OBERMAN: I do.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Please state your name for the record.

TED OBERMAN: Theodore Oberman.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I'm sorry.

TED OBERMAN: Yes, there, there are no other... there are no other charges that would be exempt from the sanitation, DOB, ECB those would be required... those would be fees that the non for profit would have to pay if they were assessed those charges.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you provide the Council with a list of those organizations?

TED OBERMAN: We could, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we'd like to have that. When the city sells a tax lien that is invalid, void or defective the Commissioner of finance may either buy the lien back from the lien sale trust subject to another lien for the invalid lien or a combination of the two. In the last five

1

2 years how many liens has the city either had to buy  
3 back or substitute?

4 JEFFREY SHEAR: I don't have those  
5 figures with me but will provide them.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. When the city  
7 buys back a lien from the trust does it have to pay  
8 more than the amount initially paid by the trust to  
9 the city to purchase the lien in the first place if  
10 so, how much?

11 JEFFREY SHEAR: So, it, it depends on how  
12 far it's, it's gone, I don't... I, I would have to be  
13 able... I don't have numbers with me, but we can  
14 provide you with general guidelines.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And sometimes there  
16 is interest charges on those lien sales that had to  
17 be paid by the city?

18 JEFFREY SHEAR: I don't believe so.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: If a non for profit  
20 has not applied for or renewed a property tax  
21 exemption even though it is eligible if it does  
22 eventually file an application how many years back  
23 can the exemption be applied?

24 TED OBERMAN: Well it, it depends... it  
25 depends on when the property is purchased so real



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

review that and if they're approved we would apply it retroactive to July 1<sup>st</sup>. We also let them file a renewal application the next year and if they're approved, we would... we would reinstate the, the current tax year which at, at this point would be 2021.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

ANDREW RETTIG: And if I could speak to DEP, the... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you just state your name also... [cross-talk]

ANDREW RETTIG: I'm sorry, I'm Andrew Rettig, I'm the Chief of Revenue Protection at DEP. The revocation letter that would go to a not for profit stating that the... because of a failure to respond and recertify would lead to a revocation there is then a 30 day grace period even within that letter and then if shortly thereafter even if the property had then been revoked they then got the application in we would then just, just sort of waive any... you know if there was lets say one quarterly bill had come in we, we would... we would remove that so there, there is certainly...

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 36

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know how many  
3 non for profits fall off the, the exemptions... the  
4 exemption role annually?

5 TED OBERMAN: For failure to renew or  
6 for... because they're sold?

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: For failure to renew.

8 TED OBERMAN: So, the last two years it's  
9 been under 100 each year, that's, that's out of about  
10 13,000 renewals that we, we sent out so..

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Have either DOF  
12 or DE... DEP investigated what may be causing the  
13 organizations to not maintain their exemption status  
14 with the agencies? Do you have any idea of why that  
15 happens?

16 ANDREW RETTIG: I, I can answer for DEP,  
17 as... very close to 100 percent of the entities that  
18 are... that have their exemptions revoked are revoked  
19 for one of two reasons. One is that there is a  
20 problem with the plumbing at the facility, they don't  
21 have a meter, the, the plumb... the, the pipes are  
22 illegal that needs to be fixed and the entity then  
23 doesn't fix that condition which means they lose the  
24 exemption. The other reason is residential spaces,  
25 when we discover that there are apartments in these

1

2

facilities we are required to then revoke unless

3

those facilities... those apartments are separately

4

metered. So, it's for one of those two reasons and

5

it's as close to 100 percent of, of the reason as you

6

can get.

7

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And what about for

8

DOF?

9

TED OBERMAN: Well sometimes for, for

10

people who failed to renew it could be because

11

there's been a change in the administrator who

12

handles this, a lot of times these are very small

13

churches, the, the pastor dies or the person who was

14

in charge of it has moved on, it could be because the

15

property has been sold and the new owner is not aware

16

that there is a renewal and I, I, I really can't

17

answer the... that's the majority of the ones that

18

we've seen for the non-responders.

19

JEFFREY SHEAR: And I would just add that

20

sometimes the organization has ceased to operate and,

21

and frankly sometimes it's difficult for us to

22

discern whether we have simply been unable to get in

23

touch for the reasons that, that Ted has given,

24

there's been a change, a move but sometimes it, it

25

has ceased to operate, sometimes also there's a

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

change in the use of the property so it, it isn't uncommon for a not for profit or religious organization for example to lease certain floors on the property or if they own the... a parking lot to have the parking lot commercially developed so the lot would no longer be eligible because it's not being used for an exempt purpose. So, it's a variety of those things and it's sometimes challenging for us because we are doing all this outreach, we're talking about the last one percent, sometimes we don't know the full story and we very much are anxious to, to find out what it is.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In, in what ways does DOF and DEP collaborate to conduct outreach to ensure that eligible organizations receive the benefits that they are entitled to?

TED OBERMAN: Do you want to answer? I'll go first. So, as part of the non for profit task force of which DEP is also a critical member we have started to on all of our approval letters indicate in, in, in language that the, the exemption is specifically for real estate taxes, it's not for DEP charge... any DEP charges and they should apply to DEP. In addition, on our renewal approvals which come out

2 in June prior to the tax year we also have language  
3 to that effect, that's... that... and we also now receive  
4 or have been receiving on a sort of monthly or week...  
5 I think it's a weekly basis, I'm sorry, requests from  
6 DEP to determine if the property is tax exempt from  
7 the Department of Finance which is used in their  
8 criteria for evaluation.

9 ANDREW RETTIG: I, I would just add that  
10 there are also outreaches throughout the year either  
11 through not for profits or religious organizations  
12 sponsored by, by Council Members that are attended by  
13 both DEP and DOF to explain our different processes  
14 and, and how they... the applicants can complete the  
15 applications.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you work with  
17 other agencies like the FDNY or DOB to do outreach to  
18 these nonprofits?

19 TED OBERMAN: Yeah, I mean they're  
20 usually part of those same information sessions so...

21 JEFFREY SHEAR: Right and, and also part  
22 of our not for profit task force that we referenced.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so with, with  
24 regard to the task force the council appreciates that  
25 the Commissioner... that Commissioner Jiha recognized

2 the need for collaborative dialogue with not for  
3 profit partners and created a task force, what  
4 specifically led the Commissioner to convene the task  
5 force?

6 JEFFREY SHEAR: I think it was out...  
7 inquiries and concerns being expressed by the Council  
8 and its staff and by advocates and representatives of  
9 the non-for-profit community.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How often has the  
11 task force... task force met and are there any  
12 additional meetings planned for the... for the future?

13 JEFFREY SHEAR: The, the, the task force  
14 has been meeting approximately three times a year and  
15 we're planning to continue it indefinitely.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What were DOF's  
17 biggest takeaways from the task force?

18 TED OBERMAN: Well one was to include  
19 language on our approvals that... about the application  
20 process for DEP, we thought that that was, was  
21 critical...

22 JEFFREY SHEAR: I... frankly the, the big...  
23 having a forum like that is really invaluable to us,  
24 we are trying as best we can to reach out to all of  
25 the not for profits, there is 13,000 of them, there

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

are times when we, we don't reach every one, there are... as, as you know we have coordination issues with ourselves and other city agencies and the more quickly we get feedback from our customers and the not for profits are our customers the faster issues can be resolved so that to us is more important than any one particular issue just having that feedback built into the system is extremely important to us.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are your forms or brochures available in other languages?

JEFFREY SHEAR: The, the brochure that I referenced in my testimony as... has not yet been distributed so as, as of now we only have a version in English, frankly we wanted to converse with the Council and, and get your input both in terms of content, distribution and publicity before we formally issue it.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good and I... because you know there's a term on that literature that I didn't know what it meant actually, a certificate of ordination, what is that?

TED OBERMAN: For what's called a parsonage exemption which is covered under real property tax law section 462 which governs property

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

42

which is owned by a non for profit corporation but is used as a living quarters for the officiating clergy, we need to have the certificate of ordination to, you know affirm that this is actually the officiating clergy.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The residency, so...

[cross-talk]

TED OBERMAN: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...religious

organizations would know what that is?

TED OBERMAN: They, they do, and we work

with... we, we work with most people about what's required and, and those we, we will get in different languages and we will have translated as well.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good. Alright,

I'm going to stop here and then I'm going to turn it over to my Co-Chair, Council Member Cabrera. Also, we've been joined by Council Members Moya and Gjonaj.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so

much and because it is her first bill, I'm going to let Council Member Farah Louis ask the questions first.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you,

appreciate it. Intro 1784 would establish the office

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

of nonprofit services, it would serve as a liaison for nonprofit organizations in relation to city policies, procedures, regulations and benefits effecting the nonprofit sector. Where do you envision this office being housed and why?

JENNIFER GEILING: So, I think that the current structure of the NRC has been quite effective and produced results as are listed in the back of the testimony in our resource section and online and welcome the opportunity to discuss that with council what it might look like going forward in order to ensure that we maintain this body of work.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: And many nonprofit organizations contract with the city especially for service delivery purposes which are critical services, how does the office effectively act as a clearing house for contracting issues that may arise?

JENNIFER GEILING: So, one of our biggest areas of work is streamlining, streamlining administrative practices... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

JENNIFER GEILING: ...and the way... I'll, I'll just step back for a minute to explain the way

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

that issues get addressed through the nonprofit resiliency committee, as providers come to the committee with their challenges, their concerns often times they are quite wide and broad and then we take those concerns and collectively identify how we might be able to tack, tackle them in an actionable way to come up with reforms, new practices, eliminate some practices to make it easier to do business so if there are contracting challenges or any other types of administrative concerns we'll take them and unravel them together and put it back together in a way that makes sense.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Hopefully it will be effective, better than what it is now. Several informal organizations exist across the city that have been unable to take the necessary steps to incorporate whether due to resources, lack of information and language barriers, do you have an estimate on how many of those organizations currently exist?

JENNIFER GEILING: I'm sorry, I'm just having a little bit of trouble hear, hearing you but would you mind just repeating that again maybe it's the microphone?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

45

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Of course.. of course, do you have an, an estimate of how many organizations exist that tried to incorporate but could not?

JENNIFER GEILING: I don't... I don't have that information.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: You don't have... can you provide it at a later date?

JENNIFER GEILING: Of ones that tried to incorporate?

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Uh-huh.

JENNIFER GEILING: We don't have that information, I know one of the areas that we're focused on in the nonprofit resiliency committee is obtaining greater equity and access for small community-based organizations, it's a work group that's active right now... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

JENNIFER GEILING: ...and we're focused on trying to understand who out there is looking to do business with the city and how can we make it easier to do that. Also the Mayor's Office of Contract Services is getting ready to release another module

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

for passport, the procurement and sourcing solutions portal and that technology platform is designed to make contracting with the city easier, more accessible, more transparent, clearer so there's a number of initiatives out there that are working on that exact topic.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Okay, I look forward to working with you on that, thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much. I, I first want to thank you for all the work that you have done, I have been working in little known nonprofit, gee, now 32 years and I've seen a vast difference when I first started to what we see nowadays in terms of accessibility to information, resources, where to find, who knows, who to do what which is... at the beginning it was like a maze I have to tell you and this is why this next question, I want more, more details in terms of where would the office for the non for profits office will be, will it be in MOCS or would it be... where exactly would it be and also how would it be different than the NRC?

JENNIFER GEILING: So the way the legislation is written it gives us a lot of options to discuss and I think we should along with our

1

2 partners in the NRC effort and try to identify the  
3 variety of ways that the NRC and its work can  
4 continue into the future. There's, you know a number  
5 of different iterations, it's working very well in  
6 its current format so figuring out how do we ensure  
7 that that continues, you know certainly we're all  
8 committed through the administration but I think  
9 we're here to talk about making sure it goes on past  
10 this.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, so help me..  
12 I'm trying to envision what it would look like, would  
13 you get in... will you... where would the staff come from  
14 that would... there would be... are there staff that you  
15 have right now that you're using, there's other staff  
16 you're going to use, are... and are you working with  
17 other agencies, how... I'm trying to envision... I, I..  
18 let's say I call in from a nonprofit, I want to meet  
19 with somebody who am I meeting with, how many people  
20 will be in that office, do... have you structuralized  
21 and strategized what that would look like or is this  
22 a working process?

23 JENNIFER GEILING: So, I can describe to  
24 you what it looks like now... [cross-talk]

25



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 49

JENNIFER GEILING: ...a work stream, DOP is involved so, so this... the number of folks that are involved with NRC initiatives is quite vast on the city side as well as on the nonprofit side, we don't just have nonprofit organizations but we have about a dozen coalition and membership groups that are there to represent all of the nonprofits that can't be in the room, it's a distributed model that allows for a lot of voices and perspectives and it allows for the right people to be in the room when we're having, you know the particular conversations that we're having and so if, if an individual... if an organization calls and I think that was the second part of your question with a question or with a concern sometimes that's something that we engage the nonprofit resiliency committee around, we bring it into one of our work group meetings, we invite the organization to participate in the conversation, sometimes it's just making the right connection with the right agency and, and enabling that conversation to happen but it's, it's across the whole city and it's encompassing all the, the agencies and, and here at city hall.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Maybe, maybe  
3 what I'm trying to figure out is when somebody calls  
4 in, right and let's say we have the office, would  
5 there be three staffers, four staffers that would be  
6 responsible all day long to make sure that, that all  
7 the connection and connecting the dots are taking  
8 place, is that what I'm looking at here or...

9 JENNIFER GEILING: I think that's the  
10 exciting part of the conversation, right... [cross-  
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-  
13 talk]

14 JENNIFER GEILING: ...what's it going to  
15 look like...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Great...

17 JENNIFER GEILING: Right like this is  
18 what we've got now, do we want to change it, what's  
19 it going to look like?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, I'm  
21 thinking in terms of our fiscal responsibility in  
22 terms of the office what would it cost if we keep it  
23 the way it is, how do we make it better, I'm sure  
24 we're always looking at how to... how to make it better  
25 and so let me... I, I meant to ask regarding the, the,





1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

say I... a nonprofit, right, house of worship purchase a building in August would, would that be retroactive, they, they make the application or will they have to wait until the following January and do they have to pay the taxes for that period of time?

JEAN CARUBIA: Well here's what happens generally if they purchase the property lets say August of this year and they submit an application shortly thereafter and I'll call it an application that is clean, we have all the identifying documents that we need we can put the exemption on retroactive to their purchase date and they will not have to file a renewal for this renewal period because we've just granted their exemption, they would have to file a renewal for the following tax year.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Is there a situation with... is there a month where that wouldn't happen, let's say November, I'm just trying to think if there is a disadvantage if you apply anytime during the year?

JEAN CARUBIA: There is no disadvantage...

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay...

JEAN CARUBIA: We renew... we, we accept applications on a year round basis, we issue and

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

grant exemptions on a year round basis and the way we create our pool of properties for renewal is to not send out a renewal to properties that have just received an exemption July or later in that year.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: This is a change of policy from many, many years ago, right, I think years ago if you didn't apply by a certain time you kind of were stuck with the tax bill, I'm talking about many years ago like 15, 20.

JEAN CARUBIA: Oh, I can't respond to that, that many years ago... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yeah, it was... and I see some hand... nodding and I remember, it was a very scary time, it was a scary time because you know you could purchase a building and you could easily pay 70,000 dollars and that could literally bring a nonprofit down just the first year when you have so many startups, when you're just getting barely started, you purchase a building, you always have unexpected bills, things that you didn't budget for so I'm, I'm... really doing right now is commending you all for the change, whoever changed it whenever they changed it.

2 JEFFREY SHEAR: Right. So, so our goal is  
3 not to penalize not for profits and so even with the,  
4 the deadlines that my colleagues have explained  
5 during the tax lien sale process if not for profits  
6 come forward at that time we will grant the exemption  
7 as well because our goal is not to sell the tax lien,  
8 our goal is not to give a bill, our goal is to get  
9 the information that's needed so we can grant the  
10 exemption, that, that is our priority, it is not to  
11 issue penalties of any type.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And what's the  
13 policy if you have a nonprofit and you want to rent  
14 to another... a nonprofit let's say during the day,  
15 what's the current policy for that?

16 JEAN CARUBIA: It is possible for a not  
17 for profit to rent to another not for profit, but we  
18 will ask for documentation, the same documentation  
19 that we ask for from the owning non for profit..  
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Uh-huh... [cross-  
22 talk]

23 JEAN CARUBIA: ...and if that entity itself  
24 qualifies in its own right as if they own the  
25 property we will or we can grant them an exemption



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 57

has to be a non-for-profit organization, it, it can't  
be a... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-  
talk]

JEAN CARUBIA: ...for profit senior center  
or a for profit school and I'm just sort of find... I  
think I'm getting at what you're saying... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Right... [cross-  
talk]

JEFFREY SHEAR: Right, in some situations  
as I alluded to earlier it... depending on the  
arrangement they may lose the non-for-profit  
exemption on a portion of the property... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-  
talk]

JEFFREY SHEAR: ...right, it... so if some  
portion is being rented out by commercial rates and  
they're receiving a profit then it may be oh, the  
fourth floor that no longer is eligible but the  
bottom three floors because that's still being used  
for say religious purposes that is getting the NFP  
exemption so in that situation we may be granting a  
75 percent exemption as opposed to 100 percent. So,



1

2

of the property but we're likely to grant it a full exemption as of the date that the tenant vacated.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's very, very helpful and last question regarding... getting back to the office for nonprofit, do you foresee... this is a place that people could actually walk in and receive services or would this be only over the phone, are we talking about a website, how are people going to get their resources, how do our... nonprofits are going to learn about the fact that this office actually exists?

13

14

15

16

17

18

JENNIFER GEILING: That's what we would talk about, right, it sounds like you have a list of starting questions that we would talk about with our partners and, you know understand what we're doing today and if, if there, you know is opportunity or interest in doing things different in the future.

19

20

21

22

23

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, so it's the starting block, one... and last question, what other resources would this office require in order to effectively be able to connect with city agencies as prescribed in Intro 1784?

24

25

JENNIFER GEILING: Again, we're effectively connecting providers with agencies now so



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

JENNIFER GEILING: So, the working groups identify how they're going to curtate a broad challenge, a conceptual issue and break it down into a tangible project with measurable goals for implementation, create a policy document around implementation, bring it to the full committee for review and approval, if it's approved by the full committee of nonprofit organizations and the NRC we then move to implementation. Because the policies and practices are codesigned with city agencies and nonprofits they... what... by the time they come to approvals status they've taken into account the considerations on the ground for both parties and they make a lot of sense for implementation and so we, we work together to try to understand why agencies are, are engaged in activities the way that they are, what that feels like on the ground for nonprofits, sharing ways that we might improve or change and then collectively coming together to write what that looks like.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What would be some of the challenges that the nonprofits continue to face?

JENNIFER GEILING: I think... you know there's a lot... I mean there's still a lot of work to

1  
2 be done, right, we've accomplished a lot but by no  
3 means is this... representation of like work is done,  
4 everything is, you know peachy king, scrumptious, you  
5 know whatever adjective you want to use. Some of the  
6 key priorities that we hear from nonprofits right now  
7 is, you know we did a, a very effective job of  
8 registering contracts on time for July 1<sup>st</sup> start  
9 dates, let's, let's do that again for FY '21 and you  
10 know we're putting it on ourselves to even do better  
11 than what we accomplished last year in our pilot  
12 year, passport is a big initiative for the sector,  
13 it's a citywide system that's going to impact the way  
14 that we do business with vendors across all sectors  
15 but for nonprofits its going to provide that  
16 transparency that they don't have, it's going to  
17 provide that roadmap to registration that they  
18 currently don't have readily accessible to them, it  
19 facilitates conversations inside of a system in real  
20 time so that's another key priority for the sector  
21 and then they continue to come to us with additional  
22 ones. As I mentioned before we're working on creating  
23 greater access and equity for those small nonprofits  
24 understanding who they are and how we can bring them  
25 into contracting if that's what they're interested in

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

doing and growing their businesses, also trying to understand how we might incorporate issues around justice involved communities into our programs and services.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Commissioner Shear, in terms of organizations that might rent from the church on an hourly basis is that factored into the equation of whether the property is being used to raise money or is there... is there a... what... I guess a threshold you have to go over or is that not looked at or how do... how do you deal with that?

JEFFREY SHEAR: Well I think that the general threshold is whether the owning organization is making a profit off of the lease but I'm going to let Miss Carubia expand on that.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I would assume in most cases they're probably losing money.

JEAN CARUBIA: I'm not aware of any organization that rents from a non for profit on an hourly basis... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Like a church or a... you know they rent it out to a community-based organization.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

64

JEAN CARUBIA: Often when we've seen houses of worship say that they have something like, you know alcoholics anonymous... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

JEAN CARUBIA: ...there were some other group, if the money is what is known as de minimis we're not going to reduce their exemption.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, that's, that's what I wanted to know, thank you. Okay, thank you and we have questions now from Council Member Gjonaj followed by Council Member Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Chairs. Department of Finance created a non for profit task force which aimed to connect non for profit property owners with local government resources addressing issues related to the property tax exemptions, tax.. lien sales, water and sewer, DEP, DOB exemptions and the FDNY imposed charges, if a task force has already been created in 2018 and has reasonable success why should a formal office be created?

JEFFREY SHEAR: Alright, so I, I think that question is both for me and for Miss Geiling. So, the, the office relates to Intro 1784 which I think relates to the, the contracting issues that

1

2

have been discussed today, the task force that the

3

Department of Finance has set up with our sister

4

agencies relates primarily to tax and water and sewer

5

charges and, and delinquencies resulting from that so

6

it's really two separate efforts. I don't know if, if

7

Jennifer wants to add to that.

8

JENNIFER GEILING: Yeah, just two

9

additional points. So, so first the nonprofit

10

resiliency committee, a lot of the work that we do

11

translates into reforms in the contracting process

12

but it is not established as an office or a center

13

for contracting reforms, it's a center for

14

centralized conversations with the city and

15

nonprofits in order to take sector wide action which

16

as I mentioned before it does translate many times

17

into contract based actions but it's, it's across the

18

board programmatic as well as, you know the contract

19

is the basis of the relationship between the city and

20

the, the nonprofit. And then the second thing if I

21

may is the NRC is designed to collaborate across all

22

city agencies and our initiatives flow through to all

23

city agencies and so we collaborate with DOF, we're

24

continuing our conversations how we can support one

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

another in the work that we're pursuing on behalf of nonprofits.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you but I want to stay focused a bit on the task force, is that okay?

JENNIFER GEILING: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, it, it...  
[cross-talk]

JEFFREY SHEAR: Yes, it's okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: The, the report does not include statistical evidence that the task force is not sufficient to meet the needs instead of creating this office, am I correct?

JEFFREY SHEAR: I'm sorry, I'm not sure which report you are alluding to.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: My understanding there was a, a report that was issued based on the findings of the task force and it didn't indicate that the task force wasn't sufficient and that it required an office dedicated, that there is no evidence that we would need a specific office versus a continued task force that will address and assess the needs and intergovernmental agencies working with non for profits.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 67

JEFFREY SHEAR: The, the non-for-profit task force that is hosted by DOF has not issued a, a report, so, so I'm just... I'm...

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I thought there was... in 2018 there was a requirement that a report be issued by a task force on its findings, am I wrong here?

JEFFREY SHEAR: I, I, I'm not aware of that. We, we established the task force in 2018... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

JEFFREY SHEAR: ...I'm not aware of us having issued the report, the one thing that I did testify to was that we drafted a brochure relating to tax lien sale and exemptions but I'm not aware of our having issued a formal report.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And maybe... Chairman, maybe that's what we should be looking for, asking for a report from the task force on its findings as we determine the future of... the future needs of our not for profits. I'll... thank you for that, I think maybe there was a misunderstanding between the guide that you proposed and the report

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

and there was no mention in the report of a need for an office or that the task force wasn't sufficient to meet the needs and assessments of non for profits.

JEFFREY SHEAR: You know we're... I'm happy to sit down with, with you and, and your staff to... so that we can get to the bottom of the, the misunderstanding.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. So, policy proposes all levels of government threaten work of all non for profits, policy makers including this administration, your departments and various agencies whether intentionally or unintentionally take away the needed resources imposed unnecessarily, unnecessary burdens and its appeal to decision making creating harmful barriers and changes and changes and laws in ways that disrupt the work of these charitable non for profits, arguably and I heard you say that we're not looking to penalize, we're not looking to punish our non for profits but arguably shouldn't the same arguments be made for small businesses in New York City, shouldn't we actually be striving not to penalize, not to harm or punish but actually work with non for profits and for profit entities so they can continue to thrive?

1  
2 JEFFREY SHEAR: In general, I, I would  
3 say yes and my, my colleagues at the Department of  
4 Small Business Services aren't here today so I think  
5 they, they would be best placed to respond to those  
6 concerns.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But I would  
8 imagine that would be a mission for this  
9 administration and all of our agencies and  
10 departments to say for the balance and future of New  
11 York City we should be looking at this in a holistic  
12 view where all entities whether they are non for  
13 profit or for profit.

14 JEFFREY SHEAR: I believe that's the  
15 mission of the Department of Small Business Services.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, then is it  
17 fair as Small Business Chair I would imagine it would  
18 be appropriate for me to ask that question for my  
19 struggling small businesses, the microbusinesses, the  
20 mom and pops, why should non for profits be exempt or  
21 treated any differently from small businesses when it  
22 comes to communications, when it comes to striving to  
23 improve the environment or any legislation or policy  
24 that undermines their very existence.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON  
1 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 70

2 JEFFREY SHEAR: We believe in clear  
3 communication to small and large businesses; we  
4 believe that's very important in our role at the  
5 Department of Finance.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Would you be  
7 surprised that the way that many of our small  
8 businesses or big businesses find out about  
9 legislation and policy is when they are in violation?

10 JEFFREY SHEAR: I, I think that we are  
11 willing to have a conversation with you about the  
12 issues that they're having.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: New York City  
14 currently has 6,000 rules and regulations which for  
15 profit and non for profit must comply with, there is  
16 no easy to read, no transparent or easy to follow in  
17 any other language which is also a need for our  
18 businesses or non for profits to be able to  
19 understand the rules and regulations that they're  
20 supposed to adhere with and the only way they find  
21 out is when someone issues normally in the form of a  
22 pink little piece of paper that says you're in  
23 violation please pay, it doesn't work, it doesn't  
24 work for the for the profit or the non for profit and  
25 it's just not the communications, its 6,000 rules and



1  
2 it's the infractions, it's the policies, it's the  
3 legislations, the former taxation that undermines  
4 their very existence so if SBS can't do it I assure  
5 you whatever office we come up with for the non for  
6 profit will have the same hurdles and obstacles and  
7 challenges ahead of themselves and rather than have  
8 two separate offices, one for small businesses and  
9 one for non for profits because the mission is the  
10 same, we can have one office.. [cross-talk]

11 JEFFREY SHEAR: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...as the resource.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you.

14 Alright, now I want to say we have been joined by  
15 Council Members Rosenthal and Rodriguez and Council  
16 Member Rosenthal has questions.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
18 much, it's great to see the team, I'm so pleased to  
19 hear that you're heading up the nonprofit resiliency  
20 committee, it really makes a lot of sense and it's  
21 great and you've done amazing work over the last few  
22 years. I just... I want to check a couple of things  
23 just to get a pulse. Eighty percent... talking first  
24 about timely registration, what's the statistics, so  
25 it was July 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019 80 percent were registered?





1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

flow, okay, so what does that mean and how do we make change and the providers said one area that would be very helpful with cash flow is to have a consistent standard policy for advances.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yep.

JENNIFER GEILING: So, okay, what does that look like, what are you experiencing on the ground, this is what I have with agency A, this is what I have with agency B, program C doesn't even have advances at all, this is what's happening in other municipalities like our research even goes beyond the city of New York... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh...

[cross-talk]

JENNIFER GEILING: ...and providers designed this policy and the administration accepted the recommendation and adopted it. What's really amazing about FY '20 why, why the slide say it's a breakthrough is that while the advances have been around for a few years they were certainly maximized with timely registration because as you mentioned they come into play when the contracts are registered so if they're registered on time you're getting those advances at the start of the fiscal year.



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 77

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yes, that's  
3 what I was getting at... [cross-talk]

4 JENNIFER GEILING: ...and the third one,  
5 yeah, they have another 25 percent advance on their  
6 annual budget.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's right  
8 and then the following year?

9 JENNIFER GEILING: Same thing, they, you  
10 know go... whatever the renewal process is once its  
11 registered 25 percent advance, 25 percent advance, 25  
12 percent in advance.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's great.  
14 What's the timing, we just negotiated the indirect  
15 rate, I know this is not exactly on topic but, we  
16 just negotiated the indirect rate, do you have a  
17 sense of whether or not any additional funds will be  
18 in the November modification or the preliminary plan?

19 JENNIFER GEILING: I don't have that  
20 information.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay and then  
22 just checking on passport, you've implemented phases  
23 one and two, is that correct?

24 JENNIFER GEILING: Correct.  
25



1 but happy to have conversations with you about...

2 [cross-talk]

3  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Only curious,  
5 I mean currently do nonprofits have to register on  
6 both passport and accelerator?

7 JENNIFER GEILING: It depends on the  
8 scenarios and happy to meet with you with our team  
9 that's... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
11 talk]

12 JENNIFER GEILING: ...you know more  
13 intimately involved with passport.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thanks, and  
15 congratulations again, I know this was a really big  
16 effort.

17 JENNIFER GEILING: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

19 JENNIFER GEILING: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Chair Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Quick question,  
22 just so I could wrap up regarding Intro 1784, is  
23 there any edits that you see that we need to do on  
24 the bill and is it broad enough?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

JENNIFER GEILING: So, I think that

there's room for conversation so I think we should, you know have the conversations about what NRC or... NRC might look like, the work that we're doing into the future so... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But in regards

to the bill, you know because if it's broad enough then you could have one of the bills passed, you could have that level of conversation, it's, it's... but in terms of the bill is there anything there that concerns you, anything that you see that we need to edit, is it broad enough to make sure that we cover all the bases?

JENNIFER GEILING: Yeah, so again looking

forward to having the conversations with our partners, with council.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, thank you

so much.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay and I only have

a couple more as well. Proposed Intro 245-A would require DOF to designate an individual to serve as the ombudsperson for the non for profit property owners and respond to inquiries related to property tax exemptions, denial, termination or revocations of





1

2 the payment centers, they will take customer  
3 inquiries and call us up while someone is right at  
4 the desk when we can answer questions we will and  
5 when they get our applications for new exemptions  
6 they forward them on to us so we have a very good  
7 relationship with our external units or our customer...  
8 our business centers, they pretty much know what to  
9 do but 3-1-1, our web mailbox gets lots of traffic  
10 and we respond to that.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay and can you  
12 describe the role and responsibilities of the  
13 ombudsperson, persons currently at DOF including  
14 SCRIE and DRIE ombudspersons?

15 JEFFREY SHEAR: SCRIE and DRIE... you want...

16 JEAN CARUBIA: SCRIE and DRIE are... while  
17 I work with commercial exemptions I know that the  
18 SCRIE and DRIE ombudsperson on the personal side of  
19 the house tries to make in roads with organizations  
20 especially for SCRIE and DRIE to put the word out  
21 there that the... there are these benefits that many  
22 renters probably or may be unaware of so they do  
23 community outreach, they go to senior centers and  
24 places like that and provide assistance with even  
25 completing the application.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

JEFFREY SHEAR: And, and I would.. the other positions I'm aware of in DOF as I mentioned we have the office of the tax payer advocate, we have a newly created office, parking summons advocate and we do have a tax lien sale ombudsperson who's appointed within the collections division again to sort of be the place to come to for people who feel like they're falling between the cracks.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, okay and finally let me just say.. ask which, which city agency or office is responsible for updating the content on New York City nonprofit?

JENNIFER GEILING: Sorry, historically the Mayor's Office of Contract Services has managed the NYC dot gov nonprofit's website and we have input and partnership with our city agencies.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, from what I understand the New York City nonprofit doesn't currently have any information on property tax exemption or exemption for water and sewer charges, is that correct?

JENNIFER GEILING: I'm not familiar with that specifically but happy, you know to post additional information, we work with our city agency

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

partners, we don't own the NYC nonprofit's webpage but we, you know keep it updated and we take information from our agency partners and enable it to be part of the website.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay and we'd like to work with you further on that. And is this website intended to be a comprehensive resource for nonprofits who would like to engage with the city?

JENNIFER GEILING: So, the website is designed to provide resources for both providers that currently do business with the city and for those who are interested in doing business with the city so we provide information and we try to identify sort of which road you might go down through the tabs along the top.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much, I think we're going to end here with the administration and we're going to call up our advocates now. Thank you for coming in and for giving testimony.

JEFFREY SHEAR: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

JENNIFER GEILING: Thank you as well.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON  
1 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 86

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, we have three  
3 panels and we're going to limit our speakers to about  
4 three minutes each. First up will be Paula Segal,  
5 Take Root Justice; Yassier Selim from Almanir...  
6 Almanir Foundation; Mara Kravitz, Protect our Places  
7 Coalition and Marcia Eisenberg from the Jewish  
8 Community Relations Council of New York.

9 [off mic dialogue]

10 PAULA SEGAL: Chairpersons good  
11 afternoon. Before my time actually starts, I just  
12 want to point out that I am a member of the not for  
13 profit task force which was created in direct  
14 response to request... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What's, what's your  
16 name?

17 PAULA SEGAL: I'm sorry, Paula Segal,  
18 Take Root Justice. The not for profit task force is  
19 something that the agency has voluntarily created and  
20 voluntarily convenes whenever it feels like, the last  
21 meeting was in January of 2019, it is now mid-  
22 November 2019, I have not been invited to another  
23 meeting though I agree that the conversations that  
24 happen in that room are useful because they tip the  
25 agency off to things like you should send your

1

2 notices in a colored envelop instead of a white one  
3 and we're really glad to give them good ideas that  
4 does not change the big picture which is that the  
5 risk for organizations for mistakes that the agency  
6 or organization administrators make or guests in our  
7 communities is immense, the risk if you don't open  
8 that white envelop is that a lien will be put on your  
9 property and sold to a Wall Street investor who can  
10 foreclose on the church and sell it to anybody with a  
11 clean deed. I don't care if it's one percent of  
12 properties, this year the department sold liens like  
13 that on 50 properties that E.A.T. itself has granted  
14 exemptions for in the past five years where there has  
15 been no change in the owner so I don't know... there...  
16 it... that risk is just too great, that's 50 properties  
17 too many. You heard... I, I wrote something very nice...  
18 [cross-talk]

19

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just to get to...

20

[cross-talk]

21

PAULA SEGAL: ...right here and you have

22

it... [cross-talk]

23

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...just... [cross-talk]

24

PAULA SEGAL: ...in front of you about

25

Deputy Commissioner Shear, I'm so angry because I

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

feel like we just spent an hour talking about something that doesn't exist, the non for profit task force is not a thing that exists in law or practice, it's a nice thing but it's not a thing that we can rely on and we just went on an hour long detour pretending that that was something that actually happens... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I wouldn't call it an hour-long detour...

PAULA SEGAL: Okay, but... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...we have... we have... [cross-talk]

PAULA SEGAL: ...I'm sorry I'm... I see that I'm on the clock so I'm going to try to get my points in and... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right, okay, I'll stop the clock for a second.

PAULA SEGAL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, but we, we do have to extract from the administration that's our job as elected officials but we're here also to hear what your concerns are as well and I know that you have a number of concerns... [cross-talk]

PAULA SEGAL: Thank you... [cross-talk]

1

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...so we're going to

3

hear what you have to say also and then we will be

4

communicating again with you.

5

PAULA SEGAL: I really appreciate that,

6

thank you. I feel a little better. So, it was

7

frustrating to hear Deputy Commissioner Shear who has

8

been a really good partner in all of this say things

9

that are simply untrue under oath one of which he

10

said that the Department is already taking properties

11

out of the lien sale list that have had exemptions in

12

the last two years. The list the department published

13

of liens sold includes 16 such properties, that might

14

be their plan for fiscal 20 but they didn't do it in

15

19 so he can't sit here and tell you that is what

16

they're already doing and there's no need for a bill

17

to tell them to do that and it's just incredibly

18

frustrating since I'm pulling information from their

19

own website, I'm not even looking at organizations

20

where the department has improperly denied an

21

exemption and you'll hear from one of my clients in a

22

moment but the other thing that Commissioner Shear

23

suggested is that they were only willing to pull

24

organizations from the lien sale list if they had

25

previously had an exemption even if they were in the

1

2 process of appealing a denial through the proper  
3 channels whether it's through refiling an application  
4 to the department or through the tax commission,  
5 that's nonsensical, right? You... if you're... if you've  
6 been denied and you're appealing you've never had an  
7 exemption before that's the point. So, them saying  
8 they're only willing to pull organizations from the  
9 lien sale list if they've already had an exemption in  
10 the past that makes no sense. There are also ways in  
11 which the passport system is being weaponized against  
12 organizations that own property. With the advent of  
13 passport organizations that are service providers do  
14 better to a leased property as opposed to own it  
15 because anytime they get into any kind of  
16 administrative morass with the Department of Finance  
17 that shows up in passport as though it's a credit  
18 rating system and then the folks at passport won't  
19 approve the contract registration unless the  
20 organization actually gives the Department of Finance  
21 money it doesn't owe. So, if any, anybody who's on  
22 the steps with us before this hearing saw a big check  
23 that we blew up because they're actually all refund  
24 checks of money that organizations have loaned to the  
25 administration because that was their only way

2 forward to either stay out of the lien sale or to, to  
3 pass the registration process with passport. I did  
4 write down some things, you have them..

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I got it right here.

6 PAULA SEGAL: Yep.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, I'm going to move  
8 my... [cross-talk]

9 PAULA SEGAL: Those are... those are my  
10 immediate thoughts.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, alright, thank  
12 you for sharing that, I hear what you said, and we'll  
13 look into that further and I know that you've been  
14 communicating with Sebastian in my office as well,  
15 okay... [cross-talk]

16 PAULA SEGAL: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good... [cross-talk]

18 PAULA SEGAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...alright, next  
20 please.

21 MOHAMED SELIM: Hi, my name is Mohamed  
22 Selim and I represent Almanir [sp?] Foundation which  
23 is a non-for-profit religious organization in Queens.  
24 First of all, I would like to thank all, all of you  
25 to give me the opportunity to express my firsthand

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ordeal of going through the very difficult process of exemption. So, we purchased a property worth about a million dollars in 2010 and we shortly after that applied for the exemption. Our exemption was denied and you know we applied it again with... trying to fill up the, the... they had given to us, it was denied again and the third time again and the third time we never got a response back and it's very difficult to communicate, the 3-1-1 number doesn't give you enough information, if you go to the office you just are given the application again to fill it out, there isn't a, a... an advisory over there who will help you go through the procedure. The other thing is that the time when we were applying we still owed taxes and those were huge amounts of money, we did not have that amount to pay because we are engaged in providing religious, social and a lot of education and charity services to our community. Unfortunately in 2015 we got a letter that our property has been foreclosed, it was a very dramatic letter for all of us, we had no idea what to do because this million dollar property we were just going to lose it and this came from the hard working people of our community who made small donations so that we can

1

2 establish this organization. You can just imagine  
3 losing a million dollars, how dramatic and how  
4 stressful it was for all of our management but  
5 fortunately we came across Miss Paula Segal and she,  
6 she helped us out and we presented the same  
7 documentation, nothing different but this time she  
8 was behind us and we were able to go through the  
9 procedure and again nothing different, the same  
10 documents and in that procedure we lost about 26,000  
11 dollars paying towards legal fees, hiring attorneys  
12 and whatnot and still after that we were not sure we,  
13 we would come out of the foreclosure. It is only when  
14 Miss Paula came on, onboard she helped us out through  
15 this ordeal. We got the 32,000 dollars which we had  
16 paid in taxes, but we never got the 26,000 dollars of  
17 legal charges which we had paid. So, I believe that  
18 this bill is very important, we should take a... into  
19 consideration, make the process easier for us, you  
20 know we are there to help the community and we  
21 request, request our government to be more  
22 cooperative with us.

23

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very

24

much, next please.

25

MARA KRAVITZ: Hi there, I'm...

[off mic dialogue]

MARA KRAVITZ: Hello, better? Hi, I'm

Mara Kravitz, I'm with the Protect our Places

Coalition, we're a group of dozens of nonprofits,

community organizations that have been directly

impacted by the tax lien sale or that are umbrella

organizations for this group that have been impacted

by the sale. I've been supporting nonprofits that

have been stuck in this sale since 2016 and over the

years I've been... I've worked with gardeners and

community gardeners, people who are in houses of

worship, people who provide veteran resources, all

sorts of different groups watching them as they've

scrambled to pay off debt that they never should have

owed to the Department of Finance as they became

aware of, of paying off debt from, from private

collectors that were reaching out to them and then as

they've had to address the threat of foreclosure. So,

this is an issue that's been impacting groups on the

ground for years, it can't keep going on, it's been

wonderful to watch you all take action on it and to

watch the ways the Department of Finance has been

pressured by advocates to change the practices

towards it but the need for it is really imperative,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

it's a no brainer, nonprofits do not... should not be  
paying property taxes and the... and the way it's been  
handled is complicated and can be made much simpler  
and much easier. So, I'm glad we're here today to  
halt such an obviously wrong scheme and what seems  
less obvious and one thing I wanted to bring up is  
what happens when charity organizations no longer do  
have the capacity to steward the... their real  
properties that... their places. In general charity  
owned assets, as you know they reflect years of  
public investment through direct government funding  
as well as through foundation support in which  
private donors are provided governmental tax benefits  
in exchange for the gifts that they make towards the  
common good. So, it's really vital that these spaces...  
that, that we do everything we can as a... as a  
government to support these spaces so that they can  
stay in, in common use for the common good beyond the  
individual use of one charity. So, I... as... so, it's  
very important that... especially given the, the  
apparent scarcity of affordable community spaces in,  
in our unbridled market, free market conditions in  
New York City this is an incredible opportunity for  
us to make sure that the public investment into these

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

spaces is continued. So, moving forward considering how the current legislation can, can make sure that the new ombudsperson will be created and that will be created has to work with HPD and third party transfer or a similar program so when charity organizations no longer have the capacity to steward property residents in the city as a whole can benefit from a, a transfer to another responsible charity. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you, next please.

MARCIA EISENBERG: Hi, my name is Marcia Eisenberg, thanks very much, I'm glad I'm here, I'm glad you're holding these hearings and I appreciate that the, the two committees are looking at this very seriously. I've been the General Counsel at the Jewish Community Relations Council and also run a program there called Legal Assistance for Jewish Organizations and I've been doing it for 33 years. I'm also on the same task force which hasn't met for a while, we don't know why but it was quite fruitful when we were meeting, and it was good. I have over the decades I've spend enormous amounts of time working with all kinds of nonprofits, religious organizations, schools, etcetera in the Jewish

1

2 community and also there's the churches and the  
3 mosques that I've worked with also. They've all had  
4 the same problems dealing with the city and it works...  
5 you know it's all the other fees and charges that  
6 you've heard about already. The other thing is the  
7 Department of Finance has also spent an enormous  
8 amount of time working with all the different  
9 organizations that have to deal with the application  
10 and renewal process. There is an enormous amount of  
11 time and energy by both the applicant organizations  
12 and the city and some of the messes just never can  
13 get fixed because of timing, etcetera. We all kind of  
14 thought the tax lien sale... I'm, I'm a very old lawyer  
15 and it used to be they took title to the properties  
16 if you didn't pay and I was dealing with 200 Jewish  
17 properties in 1986 that didn't even know they had  
18 been... the proper... they didn't own their property  
19 anymore that the city owned the property, that was  
20 the level of communication in 86, it's a lot better  
21 now but tax lien sales go through pretty quickly even  
22 though they give a lot of notice and what happens  
23 with the tax lien sales or as other people have  
24 mentioned if you owe money to the city and you have a  
25 contract with the city you have a lot of problems. I

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

deal a lot with religious organizations which don't have contracts with the city because they can't because of church state separation, and they have a lot of problems. The lien sales or even the threat of lien sales is a major disaster for any of these organizations because it impacts on their contracts, it impacts on their, their donors, their, their money that's coming in, their reputation and just... it's just a ripple effect through the entire city if any agency gets wind that they're having a tax lien sale or going in, it's just a real disaster. The city has gotten better at communicating I must admit but there's still a lot of people who, who are missed and it's a lot of organizations who are missed. I... whoop, I'm done. I just wanted to say this new initiative I think is been a very good step and I really support it, the only thing I thought about was that I thought that the ombudsman would... person, excuse me, really should have more power, I felt that it... that that person or entity or... should be able to pull out properties from tax liens for appropriate reasons besides what's defined and what you decide in legislation and also I thought maybe the City Council would like to use it's oversight power to require and

1  
2 monitor periodic reports from the Department of  
3 Finance and make sure that they're doing what they  
4 need to do and I kind of thought the single  
5 application form was a great idea even though things  
6 are very different most of the other agencies they  
7 only give exempt... they only give the exemptions to a  
8 subset of what the Department of Finance has already  
9 saying should be eligible. I know there's a devil in  
10 the details but it seems to me that the city agencies  
11 many of them have the capabilities of groups being  
12 able to upload all the documents they need and have  
13 them archived instead of it disappearing out of... out  
14 of each of these agencies and groups having to  
15 reapply and reupload and resend in all their stuff  
16 all the time and I think that something analogous to  
17 the deeds that are held in the city that anyone has  
18 access to and you can see it and it doesn't disappear  
19 and the agencies can look at it would be a much  
20 better, more centralized way to really run this whole  
21 thing, it's... a, a lot of time is wasted by the city  
22 agency which is kind of silly for the city and, and a  
23 disaster for the nonprofits. I thought the small  
24 business services office might be a good place for  
25 having an office but I, I just don't know enough

1

2 about it, that was what someone has suggested. I  
3 think it should be a place that really cares, I  
4 listened to MOCS, I know about MOCS but again since  
5 nonprofits can't do contracts that's much of their  
6 focus and I don't know if they can do both things at  
7 the same time. Thank you very much, it's an important  
8 problem and I really hope you can help.. [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thanks, thanks  
10 for your suggestions as well, I've read them just  
11 before you were seated, and we'll take them into  
12 consideration definitely. With regard to the, the  
13 meetings, the task force meetings I'm disappointed to  
14 hear that they have not met since January 19, we will  
15 look further into that.. [cross-talk]

16 MARCIA EISENBERG: And I called.. [cross-  
17 talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...and see what's going  
19 on with that, I felt that that was.. if that's the  
20 case and I don't have no reason to not believe you  
21 was somewhat dishonest and maybe they said it was  
22 last year but.. [cross-talk]

23 PAULA SEGAL: But they said quarterly..  
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1 GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 101

2 MARCIA EISENBERG: No, there was... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 PAULA SEGAL: ...which is interesting.

5 MARCIA EISENBERG: ...it was supposed to be  
6 quarterly and the thing that I thought of was that  
7 they actually shifted the tax lien sale to August  
8 this year plus they have a new database and a new  
9 thing they're doing on the websites so I just didn't  
10 know if they got overloaded and didn't have... I, I...  
11 that's the only thing I can come up with...

12 PAULA SEGAL: It doesn't... they do it when  
13 they feel like it that is not good enough.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh.

15 MARCIA EISENBERG: By any stretch of the  
16 imagination.

17 PAULA SEGAL: Yeah, it really... I was  
18 looking for it and I thought what's, what's  
19 happening, why is it not meeting because it was very  
20 useful.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

22 PAULA SEGAL: There was also something  
23 that came up earlier about a report that report is  
24 something that the tax payer advocate's office is  
25 supposed to create, the office of the tax payer

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

advocate is something that the Council mandated the last time the lien sale was reauthorized, there is an annual report, when that office... that office focuses on individual pay, payers, individual... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

PAULA SEGAL: ...of tax payers though their staff has been great and there's... since we've been working with them there's always one person in that office who understands the nonprofit situation and usually the calls get... do get routed to that person, there's been a change in staff and the new person... it's not... it's not clear to me how much they advocate and how much they see their role as providing information, I've been told by staff at that office that their role is to provide information, that is not good enough but the authorizing legislation for the tax payer advocate's office does not clarify that they're supposed to do something more than provide information, it doesn't clarify what their role is with regards to not for profits at all.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Chair Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Just a quick question, it took you... if I heard you right three years?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

103

MOHAMED SELIM: No, more than three years, we applied in 2011 and Miss Paula got onboard on 2016 so that's when we got it.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Wow and... [cross-talk]

PAULA SEGAL: You got the check in 2017...

MOHAMED SELIM: I believe in 2017... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, were you able to get everything you, you... I'm sure every they, they force you basically to pay taxes.

MOHAMAD SELIM: Yeah, we used to get bills every, every... quarterly.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, did you get your money back?

MOHAMAD SELIM: We got the taxes which we paid but we didn't get the legal charges which we paid to halt the for, foreclosure, we had hired attorneys and we hired other people to help us out so the attorney I believe itself was 17,000 dollars.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, they still owe you 17,000?

MOHAMAD SELIM: I'm sorry?

PAULA SEGAL: Yes...

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

104

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: How much they  
still owe you, the city?

MOHAMAD SELIM: No, the taxes they have  
returned us back.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Oh, okay..

MOHAMAD SELIM: But the legal charges  
which we paid to help us halt the foreclosure those  
are just down the drain.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yeah, just a  
hardship. Look I'm a pastor of a church... [cross-talk]

MOHAMAD SELIM: Okay... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ..I know what  
houses of worship go through, it is... you're working  
with volunteers, you... it's not like you get a  
contract from the city, you're guaranteed money, you  
know coming in whenever it comes in, it's, it's a lot  
of guessing work you're making when it comes to your  
budget to put that added burden on you really shame  
on the city that it took that long and then the, the,  
the big question that I have is why that it took an  
outside entity and thank you for helping out, it just  
raised a lot of red flags to me why it took so long  
and then it took somebody to basically do the same  
thing, not basically, literally do the same thing and

2 those are the things that really tick me off when it  
3 comes to treating one group of people different than  
4 others.

5 MOHAMAD SELIM: Right and the most  
6 upsetting thing was we didn't submit anything new,  
7 the same documentations which we... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yeah, that's...  
9 [cross-talk]

10 MOHAMAD SELIM: ...had been submitting..  
11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...shocking...

13 MOHAMAD SELIM: ...all the... all the way  
14 through.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...baffles me.

16 PAULA SEGAL: That's, that's really bad.

17 MARCIA EISENBERG: It's actually not  
18 uncommon for the Department of Finance not for profit  
19 unit to take an extremely paternalistic view to these  
20 applications and use them as an opportunity to  
21 enforce all kinds of laws that aren't theirs to  
22 enforce so in this case they were concerned that the  
23 community center was being run out of a building with  
24 a certificate of occupancy for a doctors office and  
25 they refused to grant the exemption because of that

2 and you submitted exactly the same thing plus a two  
3 line letter from me that said that is not your law to  
4 enforce, that's nice and that was the only difference  
5 between the... you know the first and second  
6 application and the third one which was exactly the  
7 same... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Wow... [cross-  
9 talk]

10 PAULA SEGAL: ...plus a little note.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Shocking.

12 MOHAMAD SELIM: I just remember one thing  
13 important you said in 2017 we got another tax bill  
14 after all of this and we called the office and they  
15 said no...never mind just ignore it, you know don't  
16 worry about it your next bill will show as zero and  
17 that's what happened and... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Wow... [cross-  
19 talk]

20 MOHAMAD SELIM: ...she... in fact two weeks  
21 ago was the first time we got a letter in the mail  
22 asking us to renew our exemption and that was the  
23 first time I went online and did it and it was not an  
24 easy thing to do, it should have been an easy thing,  
25 I'm an IT consultant so... I mean going on the computer

2 and filling out a form shouldn't have been difficult,  
3 but it was, not an easy thing to do.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you for  
5 sharing. I'll give her back to the Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, very good,  
7 thank you all for coming in, we're going to ask... yes,  
8 quickly...

9 MARCIA EISENBERG: I was going to say  
10 what... they did run... oh, I am on... what he ran into was  
11 the... in 2013 the Department of Finance started  
12 requiring that you had to have a C of O that... and it  
13 was... that you were doing in your building what the C  
14 of O allowed and I called up and said this is going  
15 to be a disaster in Brooklyn and Queens because no  
16 one's at home in Brooklyn in the Department of  
17 Buildings, I don't know if it's gotten any better  
18 because I haven't had to do an application and they  
19 said oh well you know... this was... this is a little  
20 story, they said oh here are the people you need to  
21 contact in the Department of Buildings, they gave me  
22 names and numbers, I spent a month leaving my number,  
23 leaving my name to about four different people in the  
24 Brooklyn Department of Buildings, no one ever called  
25 me back, I called and called and went back and said

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

there is no one there, I don't know where they are but I can't get... I can't get a, a... they have like a letter that says they, they won't object, object to what you're doing, I can't find anyone to talk to, I've left extensive messages and that's what is a problem in a lot of... at least in two of the five boroughs, I don't know about the Bronx I just don't get many clients there and... or Staten Island but it's not good to have that... I mean I think it's a good idea to make a group be doing things according to code etcetera but if there's no Department of Buildings I, I don't know what you're supposed to do.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We have a new Commissioner at the DOB, she just started about six weeks ago so we're looking forward to doing some changes there.

MARCIA EISENBERG: That would be good, thanks.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Believe me even in our Council offices we've experienced some of what you've experienced so... yep. Thank you, thank you all for coming in.

[off mic dialogue]

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

109

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we have been joined by Council Member Robert Cornegy and our next panel is Kobir Chowdhury, the Reverend Peter Cook, Alexandra Brandes I think it is and Frank Lang, Frank left, okay. Yes, we got it off the... on the... off the record, yep so we'll call up Reverend Robert Foltz Morrison, yep, oh okay.

[off mic dialogue]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, please, yep.

KOBIR CHOWDHURY: Good afternoon, my name is Kobir Chowdhury, I'm the President of Masjid Al Aman. I'm not him just for clarification, I have been mistaken. I feel actually very powerful right now because I, I feel like I'm talking to the, the people it's, it's an opportunity that is afforded to, to, to really... and I have scripted something but I, I just went off because I feel like I just need to speak from my heart, you know our property was exempted from property tax for three decades or more, I was a child, 17 year old when I came, I've, I've been part of this mosque and they have been exempted all the time. In 2010 they have had issues because... and we're the most vulnerable community, we are first generation, we don't speak English, we're not

1

2 educated, we are supporting a family here, we also  
3 left half of the family back home, many things  
4 contributes to our problems that's why things don't  
5 get done in a normal pace. So, property tax exemption  
6 was maintained up until 2000... well it was maintained  
7 all the time. In 2010 they found out that they  
8 haven't been renewed for ten years because people  
9 didn't know what to do and how to do it and they had  
10 other priorities. So, I had I think... comptroller was  
11 John Liu was the comptroller at that time so we seek  
12 some help from their office, I filed the application,  
13 exemption was approved and then retroactively  
14 reversed 328,000 dollars for the whole time, 11, 12,  
15 13 we renewed every year. It comes 2014 we were  
16 denied, why, because our building is not done, it's  
17 under construction so somehow the, the state law  
18 doesn't allow it but the city imposes it on us saying  
19 that you have to be a, a certain... you have to have a  
20 certificate of occupancy to, to be able to be  
21 exempted. So, denied, we apply again, denied and  
22 every time March 15<sup>th</sup> comes it's a scary day for me,  
23 I'm in the admin from 2016 then we have extended till  
24 May 1<sup>st</sup> and I'm so happy that you could relate to  
25 this, it's, it's how you tell the congregates who

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

111

donate a dollar, 50 cents or whatever they can and then now that it's going on public record for lien to be sold property can be lost, somebody can auction it off, this is an investment from all, all generations that are living in this community for 30, 40 years, we don't know how to handle it. Thanks to our creator Paula came around and she was the, the educated voice for us, she... actually she had helped us, I didn't know she was helping for a couple of years prior but long story short we are now squeezed with the Department of Building violation ECD violations, Finance Department is taking all of this against us and we cannot complete the building because it was done... some of the things that we have done was in need of correction, we are repairing a new building, we have been constructing this building since 2001 under, under the same permit so our situation is unique and, and the same building under construction with the same usage, we are running under TPA, temporary of public assembly with five... with three live fire guards, I'm one of them, I trained, other people... five of us are trained so every time we're having service three of us have to be present, this is our condition and I don't think it's going to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

112

improve, I'm going to be honest not in the next three months, not in the next six months because we have to get the... we are... we are altogether now, we are getting it done, we are getting the plumbing signed off, electric signed off, we are doing the... we have done the, the mechanical system, we are very close but we're not there yet but when you come to this other hearing we went about a month and a half ago you talked to the Finance Department I feel like they're, they're heart is a little different, I mean I, I don't know, I can't... they can't relate to us. I feel like, you know when I was part of community education council in, in district 19, you know there's something called individualized education plan for a child that is in special need, we are in special need, our circumstances, our problem cannot be solved with every other... notes and codes and, and situations, we... and it's like I was saying from the... from the... early on, early prayer to the late prayer we have six, 700 people participating on each prayer, we have to break them into different sessions. Is it our... is it my fault that the community is growing, is it my fault that our next generation, our children want to come to the mosque and not be on the street,

2 you know dealing drugs and selling or doing wrong  
3 things, it's not our fault that every body's trying  
4 to participate and, and take part in the program that  
5 is making everybody better and, and building a better  
6 community together so I, I feel like we need to be.. I  
7 mean every other nonprofit has unique situations, but  
8 our situation is, is very different, very unique and  
9 we need to be treated with that uniqueness and  
10 kindness and I'm so happy that I'm here, thank you  
11 very much for your time.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you for that  
13 testimony, it's a... it was really emotional and  
14 heartfelt and... [cross-talk]

15 KOBIR CHOWDHURY: But I have reached out  
16 to Sebastian to try to arrange a couple of meetings  
17 with... but I, I failed somehow it didn't work out...  
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Where do you live?

20 KOBIR CHOWDHURY: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Where do you live?

22 KOBIR CHOWDHURY: Elgin Park, we are at  
23 the borderline of Queens and Brooklyn.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Sabastian...  
25 [cross-talk]



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

of the city? Is this the interest of the Finance Department, who, who is... who is interested in that? Who's not interested in our community and our growth and our prosperity?

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We'll, we'll work with you on it, yep.

KOBIR CHOWDHURY: Thank you, thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yep, absolutely. Okay, next please.

ROBERT FOLTZ MORRISON: I'm the Reverend Robert Foltz Morrison, I work with the Presbyterian of New York City which has 103 faith communities within the five boroughs of New York City, some of them are as old as 350 years or more, it began with... before there were any kind of property issues around so you can imagine as a spiritual leader how many property issues I get to deal with on a regular basis and I'm glad to be here before you and I'm also glad to be speaking in support of the work that you're doing on legislation and I also want to say that I, I don't feel like I'm speaking only for myself, there are somewhere between six to 8,000 religious organizations in New York City. Many of us as my

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

brother said here are facing some of the similar situations and so we talk together to each other and I do want to think of them as I'm with you here. There are two things that I want to lift up first that have already been lifted up. One is I do think the guidelines and having an ombudsperson is going to be extremely important for two groups, one is that many of these religious organizations that I work with that others work with are, are staffed by volunteers and the volunteers only have so many hours, so much time, changes happen as has been stated earlier and communications don't always get done but there's another group that I also want to bring to the city's attention and that's the people that the volunteers and paid employees go to in the city's structure that sometimes don't seem to know all the nuances of how religious groups work or even the nuances of what happens with all the city processes because as they change I don't know what happens down at the lowest level. I'll give you an example, one of our volunteers in the Bronx had to go more than 20 times to deal with a violation that was... having fines, the fines, you know are going to next go to the Department of Finance, next go to lien, we

1  
2 got a property consultant that went in and said well  
3 the Presbyterian owns this property, we want to see  
4 the Presbyterian property owner, we're a 13,000  
5 member organization, we don't have an individual. So,  
6 anyway we, we finally went three levels up and got  
7 through to somebody who understands how a church  
8 system works like ours so there's another group of  
9 people that need to be informed on how these issues  
10 work. The lastly is more of an encouragement to say  
11 if you've never heard of the halo effect I want to  
12 bring to your attention and it's in my report that a  
13 study by partners for sacred places and the director...  
14 and the director of University of Pennsylvania's  
15 school of Social Policy and Practice found that the  
16 average urban historic sacred place generates over  
17 1.7 million in economic impact annually, that's by  
18 hiring people, by purchasing supplies and by  
19 countless volunteer hours that if they were to put a  
20 dollar value they'd be there. So, when you take these  
21 kinds of nonprofits out of your community you're  
22 taking economic value as I think was already pointed  
23 out here and so I want to say that as we move forward  
24 we move forward with you and wanting to work with you  
25 remembering of profit from Jeremiah who once said

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

that as you seek the welfare of the city where I have sent you and pray to the lord on it's behalf in it's welfare you will find your welfare and so we do need to work together, our mutual welfare is important. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What a good way to end, thank you, next please.

PETER COOK: I wish to thank the Finance Committee and its staff and the members who introduced these four bills we are here to talk about today. My name is Peter Cook and I am the Executive Director of the New York State Council Churches, the Council represents 7,000 congregations from eight partnered denominations across the state of New York including a couple of thousand congregations within the city of New York and some of those churches as Bob referenced have been here since the city's conception and have done much over the centuries to make the city what it is today. One dimension of the New York State Council's work is to work with congregations to improve, renovate and add on to their buildings and property so that they can better serve their neighborhoods and the city as a whole. We want congregations which often have to deal with old

1  
2 buildings and deferred maintenance to think much more  
3 creatively about how they can access a wider variety  
4 of resources beyond what can be generated by their  
5 membership alone. We invite congregations to think  
6 about partnerships that can be used to do things like  
7 build affordable housing, construct schools, child  
8 care centers and medical clinics, food programs and  
9 community gardens and neighborhood meeting places and  
10 so we are partners with the city to do economic and  
11 community development which is inclusive of a wide  
12 variety of residents and does not seek to displace  
13 people from their neighborhoods through urban renewal  
14 or gentrification but helps them to thrive where they  
15 live. So, given our historic and current missions to  
16 the city and the challenges before us we are very  
17 concerned as the council churches about the burdens  
18 that are being placed on our congregations right now  
19 because of the way the city has set up these  
20 regulations and would like to see those changes. I'd  
21 also like to lift up the idea of the ombudsman which  
22 we think is a really good idea, somebody who  
23 understands congregations would be very helpful but  
24 also that to work with other departments within the  
25 city which are seeking to partner with congregations

2 to do creative things and to try to not just  
3 interpret regulations but also bring to congregations  
4 attention and resources that they might be able to  
5 utilize that would actually help to move their  
6 organizations forward and improve their property.  
7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much  
9 and next please.

10 ALEXANDRA BRANDES: Good afternoon, my  
11 name is Alexandra Brandes and I'm the Policy and  
12 Advocacy Manager at Lenox Hill Neighborhood House.  
13 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today at  
14 this hearing considering Intro 1776 to streamline not  
15 for profit exemptions, we fully support Intro 1776.  
16 Despite legislation enacted in 1887 to receive  
17 exemption from water and sewer charges based on the  
18 benefit charitable organization's confer to society  
19 it has become increasingly difficult to receive and  
20 maintain these exemptions. First DEP requires  
21 recertifications every two years, a list of all  
22 contracts and proof from each government contractor  
23 that none of them are providing water and sewer  
24 funding. This requirement is based on a 1970  
25 legislative amendment and a mayoral executive order

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

from 1980. In practice it is very burdensome to recertify every two years, list every contract and impossible to prove we are not getting water and sewer funding. It is impossible because since our inception we've been exempted and you can't get funding for something that isn't charged to you and without an expense... sorry, further getting letters from every government funder is completely impossible and frankly a waste of time. Second, other nonprofits I've spoken to are losing longstanding exemptions even though their purpose and programs have remained the same. There have been two court cases on this issue and DEP's attempts to revoke longstanding exemptions were found arbitrary and capricious. Unfortunately, most not for profits cannot litigate this issue so when they lose, they have to spend the money that is meant to go to homelessness, domestic violence, other vital services on water and sewer. Based on this we are requesting you support the revocation of executive order 43, investigate the exemptions lost in the past several years to correct any arbitrary revocations, develop a more transparent, fair and consistent process for exemptions going forward and create the opportunity

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

for all not for profits to receive an exemption based on the enormous public benefit they provide to our city. Thank you for the opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I could relate to your story, I just finished back in March four and a half year process in building our, our building, our sanctuary and I'll tell you what I'm thinking of doing here which is somehow pass legislation to this legislation and we'll have to talk to the staff and see how we could draft this that... it's, it's a little... it's, it's... as a matter of fact in considering a building you have to consider do I want to build because then they're not going to give me my tax exemption... status during that time which is going to cost me more money to do it, is it safer just to keep it the way it is right now and so I, I think that we need to have some legislation because it makes no sense, if I'm the nonprofit and I meaning the organization and we are doing the construction we're doing it as a nonprofit, we get donations as a nonprofit, we do everything as a nonprofit, nothing has changed except I'm trying to build this building to do exactly what you said to, to help our young

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

people and I know you're ready to explode so I, I better let you speak, go ahead.

ALEXANDRA BRANDES: Yeah, right that was a question for me, we are in the process... we're in the middle of litigating this point... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay... [cross-talk]

ALEXANDRA BRANDES: ...so as, as the President, Kobir pointed out earlier we had... we had a hearing recently before the tax commission and that is the center of the case, it is simply not the Department of Finance's job to be enforcing anything with relation to the building code, the state law is very clear on this, if we lose at the tax commission we will go to the court, if something weird happens there we will be back to you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Please... [cross-talk]

ALEXANDRA BRANDES: ...to say we need a bill but hopefully we're going to get a nice clear decision. We got a very clear decision from the tax commission about the fact that they can't penalize groups because they're capital campaigns take a long time... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

124

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

ALEXANDRA BRANDES: ...earlier this summer now we've discovered a new problem which is that the new administration of the tax commission has decided that their decisions don't have presidential value and they're refusing to publish them. The old general counsel, I'm in touch with him for the tax commission he used to just put them in books and you could come to the library at the tax commission and look at them and if something was useful to your case you could use it, they don't do that anymore and they don't publish them anywhere online and I, I don't know if I'm... and I know I'm speaking to a couple of attorneys up there just because they don't have presidential value, nothing has presidential value if you're in the same level of court, it only becomes presidential if you go above it, that doesn't mean it's not something you might want to show the judge but... so they're making those decisions impossible to find and we have been told impermissible that in order to use a good decision we got for one client in another client's case we need the first client's written permission which is bonkers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Wow.

ALEXANDRA BRANDES: So, we could use some help on that, that's in my nice notes that say thank you to the people I'm really mad at right now but... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So... [cross-talk]

ALEXANDRA BRANDES: ...do read to the last page... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...I, I've, I've been here for ten years and I know this court cases and so forth, i like to get things codes, I like... I like... I like it to come into law because once it's into law it protects, it enables for organizations not to go through what you are going through and we find this in every type of houses of worship that go through this process in trying to better the community, this is the thing you're trying to do something good and I know that's frustration on all of you that you have up here it's like we're trying to do things literally often for free, you know we're doing a lot of free stuff for the city and I guess no good deed goes unpunished and those days need to come to an end, I'll give it back to my Co-Chair.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well said, okay, thank you very much to this panel. We're now going to call up the next panel, thank you. Okay, MJ OKMA Okma, Human Services Council of New York; Lenora... Lemuria Alawode-El, sorry if I messed up your name and Lucy Sexton. Yes.

[off mic dialogue]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is MJ OKMA here? Okay, Lucy? and Lemuria? Oh, that's you, okay. So, Lucy's not here? Okay, thank you. Why don't you start.

MJ OKMA: Hi, good afternoon. My name is MJ OKMA Okma and I'm the Policy and Campaign Strategist for the Human Services Council, we're a membership organization of 170 human services providers here in New York City. Both Intro 1784 and 1799 aim to streamline information for nonprofits which is a positive goal however providing educational resources and assistance for nonprofits will not address the needs of the human... of the city's human services sector. The main issue facing this sector is not a lack of understanding of city policies and contracting processes, it's chronic underfunding and unfunded mandates. Most recently

1

2 last week the council passed Intro 1321-C without a  
3 fiscal analysis of its impact on human services  
4 contracts and without pairing its passage with the  
5 appropriate budget increases to cover its mandated  
6 cost and while the indirect funding initiative  
7 established in the fiscal 20 budget was a major step  
8 forward on the path towards rightsizing human  
9 services contracts providers that... providers are  
10 deeply thankful for more work needs to be done on  
11 this issue. The truth is we need fundamental change  
12 to address... to address the unfunded contracts and...  
13 that impacts services across the city and stifle the  
14 wages of the human services workforce. Currently city  
15 contracts knowingly provide inadequate rates per  
16 service unit and do not provide cost escalations for  
17 OTPS or guarantee cost of living increases for the  
18 workforce. Because of this the nonprofit human  
19 services workforce has borne the brunt of this  
20 underfunding. This is in effect an indirect  
21 government workforce and yet there are some of the  
22 lowest compensated workers in the New York... in New  
23 York's economy. In New York City the human services  
24 workforce is 82 percent women and 80 percent people  
25 of color and they're making significantly less than

1 those outside the sector with similar credentials.  
2 These low and stagnant wages also lead to chronic  
3 staffing issues as providers struggle to hire and  
4 maintain qualified staff. The chronic underfunding  
5 and unfunded mandates imposed on this sector has led  
6 to an environment where organizations across the city  
7 are being forced to scale back services or  
8 consolidate just to survive and the workforce is  
9 dramatically underpaid for their labor. Establishing  
10 an office or a guidebook for, for nonprofits create  
11 positive resources and we are in support of these  
12 intentions but it must be stressed that both of them  
13 fall short in a system that is setting up those same  
14 human services organizations for failure by not  
15 covering the true cost of providing quality services.  
16 Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very, very  
19 much, I'm just going to go to the next person then,  
20 we'll have some questions.

21 LEMURIA ALAWODE-EL: Good afternoon, my  
22 name is Lemuria Alawode-El, I am the Associate Vice  
23 President of Strengthen NYC at United Way of New York  
24 City, an organization that works with hundreds of  
25 nonprofit organizations in New York City. I'm here to

1 share our thoughts regarding Intro 1784 which would  
2 establish an office for not for profit services. For  
3 80 years the, the United Way of New York City has  
4 worked to support vulnerable New Yorkers throughout  
5 the five boroughs, we do this by partnering with  
6 community-based organizations, schools, businesses  
7 and government agencies to address immediate and  
8 long-term needs around education and financial  
9 stability. United Way is currently working with over  
10 700 nonprofit organizations across the city. We pay  
11 close, close attention to the needs of the nonprofit  
12 community in New York, when the Executive Director of  
13 a multiservice organization shares challenges they  
14 are experiencing we connect them to potential  
15 supports. When a food pantry is looking for extra  
16 hands to provide services, we leverage our corporate  
17 partnerships to find volunteers. When an organization  
18 needs to invest in infrastructure upgrades to better  
19 serve the local community, we provide operating  
20 grants to strengthen and build capacity. Our aim is  
21 to ensure that the nonprofit organizations are  
22 stable, strong and well positioned to improve  
23 outcomes for New Yorkers. We commend the City Council  
24 for seeking further non... for further support for  
25

1

2

nonprofit organizations across the city. These

3

organizations fill an important role in providing

4

critical social services for New Yorkers often

5

leveraging funding from city, state and federal

6

government. Ensuring that there's ongoing two-way

7

communication and collaboration between the nonprofit

8

organizations and the city is essential. In addition,

9

we also offer the following considerations for

10

strengthening the nonprofit sector in New York City.

11

One, address the chronic underfunding of nonprofit

12

organizations. Nonprofits need adequate and timely

13

funding for their work. According to a report by Sea

14

Change Capital Partners and Oliver Wyman about 40

15

percent of nonprofit organizations in New York City

16

have cash operating reserves of less than two months

17

this means they have a minimal amount of resources to

18

cover immediate expenses and almost no margin for

19

investments. Delayed payments for social service

20

contracts create financial burdens. As... last January,

21

Comptroller Stringer's Office released a report

22

showing that 89 percent of human services contracts

23

in 2018 were sent to the Comptroller for

24

certification after the contract start date. In April

25

Sea Change Capital Partners found that social service

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

contracts were registered an average of 221 days after their start date an estimate... an estimate that the financial burden on nonprofits registration delays add up to as much as 774 million dollars. Even when funding is received it does not cover the full cost of providing services requiring nonprofits to fill the gaps by fundraising from private resources and foregoing essential needs this directly contributes to low or stagnant wages for the human services workforce. And annual pay for a human services worker in New York City is 29,000 dollars, far below the income needed to make ends meet. Low wages in this sector primarily effect women, over 80 percent of human service... human services workforce are women and 44 percent are women of color. Nonprofit organizations need additional opportunities to secure unrestricted operating funds and allow them to make the needed investments in infrastructure or systems. These kinds of investments increase nonprofit capacity and increase inefficiencies but remain out of reach for many organizations. We need to streamline processes to ease administrative burden. Over decades of working with nonprofit organizations we have witnessed the administrative

1

2 challenges that organizations experience when  
3 applying for government contracts contracted with the  
4 city or submitting reports. Organizations that work  
5 with multiple agencies sometimes have to submit  
6 separate reports through different portals every  
7 year. For organizations that are dependent on  
8 government funding this process takes multiple days  
9 of staff time that could otherwise be spent  
10 delivering services. Reporting or monitoring  
11 requirements can sometimes force organizations to  
12 duplicate efforts. We know many nonprofit  
13 organizations that spend a lot of effort reporting to  
14 various agencies sometimes each with their own data  
15 system effectively submitting the same data in  
16 different formats. We've also heard from nonprofit  
17 organization staff that they wrestle with  
18 inefficiencies; they don't feel like they have the  
19 opportunities to propose solutions, some  
20 organizations are so dependent on city funding that  
21 they're afraid to voice their concerns. Any new  
22 structure supports must consider the power dynamics  
23 between the city and the nonprofit organizations. We  
24 must find opportunities to address the challenges, at  
25 the same time that nonprofit organizations are

1

2 experiencing financial challenges the need for  
3 services remains very high. Every four years we,  
4 United Way in collaboration with other partners  
5 develops the New York City self-sufficiency standard  
6 which reviews the cost of living in the city and who  
7 is struggling to make ends meet. Last year reports  
8 show that 40 percent of New Yorkers, working families  
9 are not making enough income to meet their basic  
10 needs of housing, childcare, food, health care,  
11 transportation, and miscellaneous items. The  
12 nonprofit organizations exist to serve this large  
13 share of New Yorkers and contribute to a stronger  
14 more resilient city. We encourage the city to find  
15 innovative solutions for addressing challenges that  
16 nonprofits face. Chronic underfunding, increasing  
17 cost of doing business and unmet demand for services  
18 will not be addressed by incremental improvements.  
19 What we need are bold actions that are designed  
20 together with the nonprofit community and that are  
21 responsive to the needs of New Yorkers and the  
22 organizations that serve them. Understanding the  
23 experience of the people working in nonprofit  
24 organizations is critical for designing solutions  
25 that make a difference. The city must learn from

1 nonprofit organizations and must do this in a way  
2 that compensates people for the time they spend  
3 sharing their insights and addresses the power  
4 dynamics at play between funders and grantee... and  
5 grantees. The Sea Change Capital report identifies  
6 recruiting and retention issues and rising real  
7 estate costs at some of the... and some of the... as some  
8 of the persistent challenges for nonprofits. The city  
9 could help design innovative approaches to strengthen  
10 the sector by focusing on the most impactful issues  
11 for example around retaining staff or securing  
12 affordable space. We thank you for the opportunity to  
13 share our thoughts on the challenges facing  
14 nonprofits in New York City and believe that  
15 investing in organizations that serve New York City  
16 is the right action to improve the lives of low-  
17 income New Yorkers for the benefit of all.

18  
19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very  
20 much. You know in the last budget negotiations we  
21 included an increase in the indirect rate for  
22 nonprofits and it's supposed to be released by the  
23 November plan which we think is coming up at the end  
24 of this week, beginning of next week and then that  
25 should be carried through to the 2021 budget, I mean

1  
2 I don't know what's included in that, nobody's  
3 included me in the... those negotiations at this point  
4 but we're hopeful that that's going to be able to at  
5 least provide you with some relief.

6 LEMURIA ALAWODE-EL: Yeah, so the portal  
7 for nonprofits to be able to file for their indirect  
8 rates just opened yesterday so that's, that's in the  
9 process and we're confident that that... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry, can you  
11 just repeat it, it's so hard to hear.

12 LEMURIA ALAWODE-EL: Sorry, the portal  
13 for nonprofits to file for their indirect rates  
14 actually opened yesterday and we're confident that  
15 that process is currently going smoothly and that is  
16 filling, filling in a major hole in human services  
17 contracts but it doesn't address issues of other than  
18 personnel services and personnel services which are  
19 also underfunded.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so I think  
21 we're looking forward to continuing to work on those  
22 issues with you because we recognize in the council  
23 how important it is to, you know fund you properly at  
24 the right levels and the, the amount of services  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

that you provide to New Yorkers so, I know that that's a, a priority for us.

LEMURIA ALAWODE-EL: Yes and thank you so much for your support of the indirect investment and the work that you've done on this, it really has made a difference.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

LEMURIA ALAWODE-EL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, good, we're, we're with you and thank you very much for coming in and for participating in today's hearing and with that we're going to adjourn at... oh, my goodness, ten minutes to five, 4:50 in the afternoon.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

November 29, 2019