

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

October 30, 2019
Start: 1:36 p.m.
Recess: 4:12 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden

Ben Kallos
Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1
2 PEDRO LUGO: Check, check, this is a
3 sound check for the Stated Meeting. Today's date is
4 October 30, 2019, located in the council chambers.
5 Recording done by Pedro Lugo.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, well, good afternoon
7 and welcome to City Hall. It is a great honor for me
8 to be here to give this wonderful proclamation to a
9 wonderful woman, a staple to our community, holds
10 many titles, many, many titles, the Mayor of East
11 Elmhurst, the Mayor of Corona [applause], but we also
12 know she likes to hold the main title, which is
13 Queen. So to our queen, Mary Lena Moody, she was,
14 she is an entrepreneur and a philanthropist, and she
15 was the youngest of five children. She was born
16 September 16, 1924, in Philadelphia. She was raised
17 by her father, who was a shoe salesman and a barber,
18 and her mother, who took care of their home as well
19 as their aunt in Glassberg, New Jersey, until she was
20 seven. After graduating from Seaward Park High
21 School, Mary worked for IBM at the Brooklyn Navy
22 Yard. Always motivated to move forward, Mary
23 enrolled in NYU University to acquire a teaching
24 license and upon receiving her license she taught
25 beauty culture for adults at the YMCA until 1945.

2 And while at the variety store in the Bronx, Mary met
3 the business proprietor and of course the love of her
4 life, Wilson Moody. Mary knew that there was
5 something special about him. He was a handsome kind
6 and a hardworking man and five years later in 1948
7 they were married and moved to Queens. They had a
8 baby girl and they opened up Big City Realty
9 Business. Over the years Mary and Wilson purchased
10 10 homes and would give back by renting several units
11 to low-income families who might otherwise not be
12 able to find housing. Mary still maintains Big City
13 Realty and four houses. In 1968 Mary and Wilson
14 corroborated and opened Moody's Lounge in Modest,
15 Connecticut. Modest, Connecticut. This lodge
16 served as an alternative for kids being in the
17 streets, hosting at least 30 kids as well as adults.
18 In 1959 Mary became a school aide in an elementary
19 school, working for \$4 a month. Four dollars a
20 month. For those humble beginnings she would go on
21 to work as an educator for more than 35 years. Mary
22 retired in 1995 as a supervisor for the New York City
23 Board of Education, educating paraprofessionals. She
24 was an auxiliary paraprofessional trainer for 25
25 different schools in District 30. Mary has been an

2 active member of the community for decades. She
3 worked with the New York Board of Elections, a Girl
4 Scout leader with First Baptist Church of Corona, and
5 volunteered with Goldwater Hospital collecting toys
6 and gifts for the hospital. She is also the
7 cosponsor of the Flushing Meadows Soapbox Derby, by
8 the way, which I won, thank you, this year
9 [laughter]. My car did win. And the National Night
10 Out Against Crime that helps children outreach for a
11 Christmas celebration at First Baptist Church and has
12 worked with Catholic Charities helping the homeless.
13 Mary is known for her trips and excursions and for
14 several years organized circus trips for neighborhood
15 kids and making sure none of them went hungry. For
16 over 30 years there was her Vanity Fair shopping bus
17 trips. I wish I was invited to one of those and,
18 again, everyone could look forward to breakfast,
19 lunch, and snacks. There was fun games that she
20 hosted. Mary also sponsored trips to different parts
21 of the country and the world. Mary was nominated as
22 Ms. Fine Brown Frame under band leader Buddy Johnson
23 at the Golden Gate Ballroom in Harlem, New York.
24 Mary loves to travel. She loves to party. She loves
25 dancing, which she can do without her cane. By the

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 way, I've seen her and she dances better than all of
3 us in this room. She loves red cars, that we can all
4 attest for, and every few years we see a new red car
5 in the driveway of the home that her beloved husband,
6 Wilson, built for her with his own hands. So 95
7 years of truly living, giving back to your community
8 and touching the lives of countless New Yorkers, we
9 want to wish a happy birthday and a congratulations
10 to Ms. Mary Moody, our queen. [applause] Thank you
11 so much for all that you do for the great people in
12 the City of New York. And I just want to turn it
13 over now, of course, to Mike McSweeney to please read
14 the proclamation, our city clerk.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York
16 Proclamation. The Council City of New York is proud
17 to honor Mary Lena Moody in celebration of her 95th
18 birthday and her outstanding service to her
19 community. And whereas Mrs. Moody was born on
20 September 16, 1924, in Philadelphia, the youngest of
21 five children. Her father was a shoe sales clerk and
22 barber while her mother was a homemaker. An aunt in
23 Glassboro, New Jersey raised her until she was seven.
24 After finishing Seward Park High School Mrs. Moody
25 worked for IMB at the Brooklyn Navy Yard. She

2 received a teaching license from NYU and taught
3 beauty culture for adults at the YMCA until 1945.
4 Three years later Mrs. Moody married Wilson Moody,
5 the proprietor of a variety store, who was also
6 involved in real estate and the couple relocated to
7 Queens to start a family. And whereas Mrs. Moody and
8 her husband operated a real estate business, Big City
9 Realty, and a resort, Moody's Lodge, in Connecticut.
10 The couple purchased 10 houses, renting several units
11 to lower-income families who might otherwise not have
12 been able to find housing. She still maintains Big
13 City Realty and four houses. In 1968 the Moodys
14 opened Moody's Lodge, which served as a summer camp
15 for around 30 children. And whereas Mrs. Moody
16 worked as an educator for 35 years. She started out
17 in 1959 in an elementary school working for \$4 a
18 month. When she retired in 1995 Mrs. Moody was an
19 auxiliary paraprofessional trainer with the New York
20 City Department of Education for 25 different schools
21 in District 30. And whereas Mrs. Moody, an active
22 member in the community for many years, worked with
23 the New York City Board of Education, was a Girl
24 Scout Leader with the First Baptist Church of Corona
25 and collected toys and gifts to donate to children at

2 Goldwater Hospital. And whereas Mrs. Moody organized
3 trips and excursions. She hosted circus trips for
4 the neighborhood children, making sure they were fed
5 and then everyone had a circus flashlight. For more
6 than 30 years she had Vanity Fair shopping bus trips
7 where all could look forward to breakfast, lunch, and
8 snacks. She sponsored and hosted airline trips to
9 Las Vegas and Caribbean cruises. And whereas Mrs.
10 Moody enjoys traveling, gambling, partying, and
11 dancing. She dances without her cane. No stranger
12 to ballrooms, she was nominated in 1942 for Ms. Fine
13 Brown Fame under band leader Buddy Johnson at the
14 Golden Gate Ballroom in Harlem. Mrs. Moody loves red
15 cars and every three years has a new red car in the
16 driveway of her house that her late husband built for
17 her. And whereas Mrs. Moody enjoys the company of
18 her children, Andre Lynch, Diane Sorrow, and the
19 Reverend Patrick H. Young, her grandson, Zachary, her
20 friends and her church family. And whereas now at
21 the age of 95 Mrs. Moody continues to distinguish
22 herself not only in the length of her life, but in
23 the incredibly positive impact she has had in the
24 lives of so many. She has enriched our entire
25 community with her kindness and has earned the esteem

2 of all New Yorkers. Now therefore be it known that
3 the Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
4 Mary Lena Moody in celebration of her 95th birthday
5 and her extraordinary service and enduring
6 contributions to New York City. Corey Johnson,
7 speaker for the entire council, Francisco P. Moya,
8 Council Member 21st District, Queens [applause].

9 UNIDENTIFIED: So before I turn over the
10 mic, I just want to acknowledge that we've been
11 joined by, ah, our great majority leader, Council
12 Member Cumbo, Council Member Dromm, and Council
13 Member Koo, who are here as well. So to our queen,
14 the microphone is all yours.

15 MARY LENA MOODY: Oh, boy. I don't know
16 what to say. Oh, my heart is full. To think a
17 person like me being honored on such a day today with
18 so many wonderful people of New York City. I never
19 thought this would happen to a little country girl
20 from Glassboro, New Jersey, taken a bath in the tin
21 tub in the kitchen. Now I can take a bath in the
22 bathroom. And I'm here enjoying my family and
23 enjoying my 95 years, looking forward to five more
24 years and that'll be it. Thank you. God bless
25 everybody. [applause] Oh boy.

1 STATED MEETING

11

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Let's, let's do this. You
3 can hold. Put out your hand, I'm passing it.

4 [pause]

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Only for the
6 Queen [laughs]. [pause]

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Ladies and gentlemen, can I
8 have your attention please. Can I please have your
9 attention. Quiet on the floor please, quiet on the
10 floor. Quiet on the floor. Council members, please
11 have a seat, please. Quiet on the floor. At this
12 time please place all electronic devices, all
13 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-council
14 employees, non-council employees, please leave the
15 main floor of the chambers. Thank you. Madam
16 Majority Leader.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [gavel] Good
18 afternoon and welcome to the Stated Meeting of
19 October 30, 2019. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo.
20 Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance. I pledge
21 allegiance to the flag of the United States of
22 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one
23 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and
24 justice for all. Roll call.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

1 STATED MEETING

12

2

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

3

COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

5

COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

7

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

9

Borelli.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present.

11

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

13

COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

15

COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

17

COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

19

COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

21

COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aqui.

23

COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch. Diaz. Dromm.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj. Grodenchik.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: King. Koo.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman. Lander.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Louis.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.

1 STATED MEETING

14

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins. Powers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

16 Rosenthal.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aqui.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

21 Ulrich.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

25

1 STATED MEETING

15

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer. Yeger.
3 Matteo.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present. Speaker
6 Johnson.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Right here.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have a quorum.

9 We will now have today's invocation, which will be
10 delivered by Pandeeep Narang, the spiritual leader of
11 the Shri Trimurti Bhavan Temple, located at 10118
12 97th Avenue in Ozone Park, Queens. Please rise.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

15 PENDANT NARANG: [speaking in unknown
16 language] Oh merciful Lord who are benevolent and
17 compassionate, omniscient, omnipresent, and
18 omnipotent. Thy splendor is as fulgent as a
19 thousands of suns put together, with the brilliance
20 of thine illumine our hearts and intellect and guide
21 us a right direction. [speaking in another language]
22 Oh all merciful God, will you protect and inspire us
23 all? Will you nourish us together. May we work
24 together with great energy. We are resolved, be
25 effective, may there be no hostility amongst us. Om

2 peace, peace, peace. [speaking in another language]
3 May there be well-being in all. May there be peace
4 in all. May there be fulfillment in all. May there
5 be auspiciousness in all. Om, peace, peace, peace.
6 Thank you.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I'd
8 now like to ask Council Member Adams to spread the
9 invocation on record.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam
11 Majority Leader. I would like to thank Pandeeep
12 Chunalal Narin for being here today. He is a
13 visionary who has initiated a campaign to revitalize
14 Hinduism and promote humanitarian work all over the
15 world. He is the founder and officiating priest of
16 the Shri Trimurti Bhavan Incorporated, a Hindu temple
17 in Queens where hundreds of devotees worship on a
18 weekly basis. He was selected to receive the
19 Universal Peace Federations Ambassador of Peace
20 Award, an esteemed honor confirmed upon distinguished
21 individuals who accept the responsibility to promote
22 peace in communities all over the world. He also
23 been the recipient of several City Council citations
24 and the Guyana Tristate Alliance Golden Arrowhead of
25 Achievement. Pandeeep Narin was able to organize and

2 execute the first ever South African Hindu youth
3 convention, an event that involved hundreds of youth
4 and is expanding year after year in South Africa, in
5 addition to other humanitarian and philanthropic work
6 in the African continent, spreading the word of God,
7 counseling the disheartened, uplifting the spirit of
8 the less fortunate and serving selflessly whenever
9 and wherever duty calls is the mission of Pandeeep
10 Shunalal Narin. I now make a motion that the
11 invocation be spread in full upon the record.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
13 much, Council Member Adams, and thank you so much for
14 that beautiful invocation. Thank you so very much.
15 We will now have the adoption of minutes by Council
16 Member Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Motion that the
18 minutes of the Stated Meeting of September 25, 2019,
19 be adopted as printed.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
21 will now have messages and papers from the mayor.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication
24 from city, county, and borough offices.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

1 STATED MEETING

18

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and
3 communications.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use call-
6 ups.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: M193.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Clerk.
9 At this time I will ask for a roll call vote on all
10 of the items on today's land use call-up calendar.
11 We are just voting now on the land use call-up
12 calendar.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

- 2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
- 3 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.
- 4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
- 5 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen. Constantinides.
- 6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
- 7 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.
- 8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.
- 9 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch. Diaz. Dromm.
- 10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
- 11 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.
- 12 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
- 13 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
- 14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
- 15 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.
- 16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.
- 17 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.
- 18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.
- 19 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.
- 20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.
- 21 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.
- 22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.
- 23 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.
- 24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
- 25 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: With permission,
I'd like to vote on all land use callups and coupled
items on the general order calendar and all
resolutions.
MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
granted.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.
COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: With permission I'd
3 like to explain my vote on the land use call-ups and
4 the coupled items of general order. I just wanted to
5 say that, I'm sorry. Yes. Oh, yes. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins. Powers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

15 Rosenthal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

20 Ulrich.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo. Cumbo.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 Today's land use call-ups are adopted by a vote of 42
10 in the affirmative and zero negative. We will now
11 have communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
13 Majority Leader. Good afternoon. I want to thank
14 everyone for being here today for this very important
15 Stated Meeting. I want to begin by acknowledging
16 that yesterday was the seventh anniversary of
17 Hurricane Sandy, a tragedy where we lost so many New
18 Yorkers. Seven years ago and still parts of this
19 city have not fully recovered. So today as we
20 remember those who we lost, we must also remember our
21 communities are still recovering and there is still
22 so much more work that we must do to ensure safety
23 and resiliency. Communities in Staten Island and in
24 Coney Island and at NYCHA developments all across our
25 city, and as we mark this anniversary must recommit

2 ourselves to do all we can to help those communities.

3 I also want to wish those who are celebrating a very
4 happy Diwali. Diwali is also known as the Festival
5 of Lights and it lasts for five days and it marks the
6 start of the Hindu New Year. And as we do at every
7 Stated I want to also recognize some of the important
8 events that have happened recently in our city.

9 Sadly we lost an NYPD detective. Dennis Murphy died
10 due to 9/11-related illnesses. Detective Murphy was
11 an advocate for the 9/11 Victims' Compensation Fund
12 and he tirelessly campaigned to ensure that all
13 survivors received the treatment they so badly
14 needed. He was 57 years old. And I'm glad that he
15 was able to see the Victims' Compensation Fund be
16 enacted before he died. We also lost a former
17 firefighter and Uniform Firefighters' Association
18 President, James Boyle. Jimmy, as he was known,
19 tragically lost his son in the 9/11 attacks, which
20 took so many of our fellow New Yorkers' lives. We
21 will never stop being grateful for Jimmy's many
22 contributions to our city. He was 80 years old. I'm
23 sad to say today we also have lost two New Yorkers
24 who died while on their jobs. Stanislav Supinsky, a
25 construction worker, died on the Lower East Side. He

2 was 52 years old and he died on October 21. The
3 city's Department of Transportation also lost a
4 member of their family, Eduardo Kayya Abreo was
5 killed. He was 44 years old and he died on the Upper
6 East Side during a repaving project on October 22.

7 For all of those that we've lost I'd like to take a
8 moment of silence, so if everyone could rise for us
9 to remember these New Yorkers. If someone could

10 please silence their device upstairs. [moment of

11 silence] Thank you. Moving into our agenda, out of

12 the Finance Committee the council will vote on

13 Introduction 1750 to authorize six business

14 improvement districts across the city to increase the

15 amount that they are authorized to assess. We will

16 also vote on the follow property tax exemptions -

17 Knickerbocker Village in Council Member Margaret

18 Chin's district, Strivers Plaza, in Council Member

19 Bill Perkins' district, and St. Nicholas Manor

20 Apartments in Council Member Perkins' district.

21 Moving on, the council will be voting on the

22 following pieces of legislation. First, Introduction

23 1541-B, sponsored by myself, would create a

24 specialized high school task force that would be

25 charged with addressing the racial and ethnic student

2 bodies inequities of specialized high schools in our
3 city. I am proud of this bill. We are the most
4 diverse city in the country, but our specialized high
5 schools do not reflect that. It is disgraceful and
6 something that all of us should be working to
7 address. This bill does that with the task force,
8 made up of appointees from the speaker and the mayor
9 and it would be required to examine three things.
10 First, the current admission system including the
11 specialized high school admissions exams and whether
12 such exams should be changed or eliminated. Number
13 two, existing programs such as the Department of
14 Education's Discovery and Dream programs. And three,
15 the use of alternative admissions methods, including
16 state standardized admissions and grade point
17 average. I also to recognize and thank the chair of
18 our Education Committee, Mark Treyger, for his
19 partnership, his leadership, him educating me
20 throughout this process on how important this is, and
21 I'm grateful for the hearing that he had on this. I
22 also want to thank the staff who worked on this.
23 Malcolm Buttehorn, Janet Atwell, and Kalima Johnson.
24 Next, the council will be voting on a lot of bills.
25 A lot of bills and resolutions that will strengthen

2 our existing animal welfare laws here in New York
3 City. Over the last decade New York City has proven
4 itself to be one of the most progressive cities in
5 our country across the board, but there is more to do
6 on animal welfare and I am happy we're advancing
7 these bills so that we can stay that way for decades
8 to come. The first is preconsidered Resolution 977,
9 sponsored by Council Member Robert Holden, which
10 calls on the United States Congress and the president
11 to sign the House and Senate bills that are the
12 Preventing Animal Cruelty Torture Act, otherwise
13 known as PACT Act. Next, Resolution 921, sponsored
14 by Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, would call on the
15 New York State Legislature to pass and the governor
16 to sign the Assembly and Senate bills which would
17 provide a tax cut to each, tax credit to each tax
18 payer who adopts a household pet from a shelter. My
19 cat, Moose, is six years old and I adopted him from a
20 shelter a little more than four years ago. I would
21 encourage everyone to do that. Adopt, don't shop.
22 Resolution 379, sponsored by Council Member Helen
23 Rosenthal, would call for the recognition of meatless
24 Mondays in New York City. Introduction 1570-A,
25 sponsored by our Health Committee chair, who oversaw

2 all these bills getting through committee, he did a
3 great job, chair Mark Levine, would ensure that dogs
4 entering kennels, businesses, or establishments need
5 to be in compliance with the New York City health
6 code, which requires that dogs be vaccinated for
7 Bordetella, kennel cough. Next, Introduction 1498-A,
8 sponsored by Council Member Fernando Cabrera, would
9 require the New York City Police Department to
10 publish semiannual public reports on complaints and
11 investigations of animal cruelty allegations.

12 Specifically, the department would report on the
13 number of animal cruelty complaints it received and
14 arrests that happened. Next, Introduction 870-A,
15 sponsored by Council Member Joe Borelli, would
16 require any full-service animal shelter operating in
17 New York City to post photographs of each adoptable
18 animal within three days of receiving such animal,
19 provided that the animal is medically and
20 behaviorally well enough. It would also require the
21 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to encourage
22 non-full-service animal shelters to promote the
23 placement of adoptable animals. Next, Resolution 798,
24 sponsored by Council Member Justin Brannan, would
25 call on the state legislature to pass and the

2 governor to sign the Assembly and Senate bills which
3 would amend the agriculture and markets law and the
4 general business law in relationship of the sale of
5 cats, dogs, and rabbits. This is to make sure that
6 we should only be selling shelter animals in pet
7 stores. That's what we should be doing.

8 Introduction 1478-A, also sponsored by Council Member
9 Brannan, would establish the Office of Animal
10 Welfare, headed by a director appointed by the mayor.
11 The office would be vested with the power to advise
12 and assist the mayor in the coordination and
13 cooperation between agencies relating to animal
14 welfare administration, regulation, management and
15 programs, but it also would be charged with the
16 reviewing and recommending budget priorities relating
17 to animal welfare, preparing an annual animal welfare
18 report, and serving as a liaison for the city
19 regarding animal welfare. Finally, the office would
20 provide outreach and education on animal welfare
21 programs and humane treatment of animals and perform
22 other duties the mayors may assign, the mayor may
23 assign, to help keep animals safe. Introduction
24 1425-A, sponsored by Council Member Keith Powers,
25 would prohibit carriage horses from being worked when

2 the air temperature is 90 degrees Fahrenheit or
3 above, or whenever the air temperature is 80 degrees
4 or Fahrenheit or above and the equine heat index is
5 150 or above. And we have two final pieces of
6 legislation regarding animal welfare, both by Council
7 Member Carlina Rivera. Introduction 1378 would
8 prohibit retail food establishments or restaurants
9 from storing, maintaining, selling, or offering to
10 sell force-fed products or food containing a force-
11 fed product. This bill creates a rebuttal
12 presumption that any item with a label or that is
13 listed on the menu as foie gras is the product of
14 force feeding. Violators would be subject to a civil
15 penalty between \$500 and \$2000 per offense. And the
16 next bill by Council Member Rivera, Introduction
17 1202-A, would prohibit non-exempt individuals from
18 taking or attempting to take any wild bird. Exempt
19 individuals include law enforcement employees or
20 other city employees acting in the scope of their
21 duties, a person authorized by law or permit or
22 person attempting to rescue a wild bird. A shout-out
23 to the Wild Bird Fund, one of the best groups in New
24 York City that save wild birds. Any person who
25 unlawfully takes a wild bird is subject to a

2 misdemeanor and a fine of no more than \$1000. This
3 is because people are illegally trapping wild birds,
4 bringing them to Pennsylvania or other places and
5 using them to kill for shooting practice or for
6 sport. I want to thank the incredible staff who
7 worked hard on this - Zemanual Halu, Sarah Liss,
8 Emily Balkin, Andrea Vazquez, and Smita Deshmove. I
9 really want to thank you. This is an historic day
10 for animals in the New York City Council [applause],
11 a big, important day, and I'm really grateful for the
12 leadership that each member here has shown in saying
13 that we want to be a city that is judged, of course,
14 about how we treat our fellow people, but also we
15 want to be judged by how we want we treat animals and
16 the evolution of how we come to care for animals and
17 how we want to be at the forefront of protecting
18 animals in New York City. So I am very proud, I said
19 earlier at the pre-Stated press conference I never
20 thought I'd be involved in politics. My first job is
21 I worked on a farm. I took care of llamas and
22 miniature donkeys and horses and 30 or 40 Dalmatians,
23 and I wanted to be a veterinarian. So I am really
24 proud of this package of bills that we are doing
25 today. Next up, we have a series of bills aimed at

2 transforming and regulating the commercial waste
3 industry in New York City. This package includes
4 legislation to regulate private carting companies,
5 including Introduction 1574-A, sponsored by Council
6 Member Antonio Reynoso, which authorizes the creation
7 of commercial waste zones. For too long the private
8 carting industry has been able to operate without
9 adequate safeguards to ensure air quality and street
10 safety. Private carters have customers throughout
11 the city, resulting in long, inefficient routes and
12 millions of excess truck miles drive every year.
13 Waste hauling vehicles are needlessly driving through
14 our communities, increasing air pollution that
15 negatively impacts public health and that emits
16 greenhouse gas emissions that contributes to the
17 climate crisis and emergency that our city, country,
18 and world is facing. The creation of commercial
19 waste zones [inaudible] in shorter, more efficient
20 routes, eliminating more than 18 million miles of
21 truck traffic from New York City streets. Not only
22 will this dramatically reduce the environmental harms
23 of this industry, but drivers will no longer be
24 incentivized to drive unsafely to complete their
25 routes. Drivers can go slower and they can be more

2 alert and the workers who work for these companies
3 and the public will be safer. This reform will also
4 incentivize better recycling practices, increased
5 organics processing, and a transition to zero
6 emission vehicles. We have worked diligently to
7 engage with stakeholders throughout this process and
8 we have created an ambitious and achievable package
9 of reform that will overhaul how we, ah, dispose of
10 commercial waste in New York City. Today I am proud,
11 very proud, that we are making our air cleaner, our
12 streets safer, and providing businesses throughout
13 the city more transparent pricing and better
14 services. I'm going to tick through some of the
15 bills. The first are two by Council Member
16 Salamanca. Introduction 1082-A will require GPS
17 devices on waste-hauling vehicles that are used to
18 collect waste in these commercial waste zones and
19 another bill by Council Member Salamanca would
20 require a minimum fine of \$1000 and a maximum fine of
21 \$10,000 for carting companies that receive a
22 violation for an unreported employee. And the next
23 two bills are by Council Member Reynoso. The first
24 is, it would establish the commercial waste zones
25 where the Department of Sanitation would designate

2 commercial waste zones and enter into agreements with
3 up to three private carters to operate in each zone.

4 And his other bill is Introduction 1573-A, which

5 would add enforcement of environmental safety health

6 standards to the powers and duties of the Business

7 Integrity Commission, BIC. This clear statement of

8 BIC's authority to act on unsafe practices in this

9 industry would allow the agency to consider a

10 business's practices more broadly upon license

11 renewal. I want to congratulate Council Member

12 Salamanca, but I specifically want to single out

13 Council Member Reynoso, and you're going to hear from

14 him in a few moments and I would ask, Madam Majority

15 Leader, that when Council Member Reynoso speaks I'm

16 happy to give him speaker time so that he's not

17 limited by two minutes because he has worked so hard

18 on this bill today. A little more than a year ago we

19 passed a historic package of bills on waste transfer

20 stations, bills that had languished in this council

21 for more than a decade. And Council Member Reynoso

22 had worked on those bills when he was chief of staff

23 to Council Member Diana Reyna, came into this council

24 and pushed for those bills because his district in

25 north Brooklyn was getting 40% of the sanitation in

2 New York City being dumped in his district. And we
3 know that southeast Queens and the South Bronx were
4 similarly suffering. Council Member Reynoso has
5 worked diligently, thoughtfully, unbelievably hard
6 from when we passed that bill a year and a half ago
7 to today. He has literally been working nonstop. He
8 has chaired the Sanitation Committee for the last six
9 years. I am so proud of the work that he has done on
10 this bill. He has been thoughtful. He has engaged
11 with stakeholders. There wasn't total agreement on
12 what we had to do but I think he handled this
13 responsibly and showed a tremendous amount of
14 leadership and he got into the weeds on what this
15 meant. We had the pre-~~Stated~~ press conference. He
16 was answering the questions in such a thoughtful,
17 granular way. I am so incredibly proud of him and so
18 I want to congratulate him, Council Member Reynoso,
19 and I want to thank the staff who worked on this. A
20 lot of staff worked on this, but specifically Nicola
21 Ben and Nadia Johnson were here nights, weekends,
22 time and again, had dozens and dozens of meetings, so
23 I want to thank you, Nicole, and I want to thank you,
24 Nadia, for your incredible hard work on this bill.
25 OK, finally today the council will be voting on my

2 street's master plan legislation. I want to thank
3 each and every council member and staff member who
4 has been involved in this process. And I want to
5 thank the advocates who have helped push this into
6 the forefront of our city over the last few years. I
7 want to thank Families for Safe Streets, who I think
8 are here. Yes, they are, standing up, these heroes.
9 I want to thank them. [applause] Let's give them a
10 round of applause for the work they do [applause] to
11 make our city a safe place. I want to thank the
12 Riders Alliance, Transportation Alternatives, Bikes,
13 Bike NY and Streets Pact. We have lost too many
14 people in our city this year, last year, the year
15 before, five years before that, ten years before
16 that, because of traffic violence. And because our
17 streets have not been planned properly for all people
18 that need to use them. Our streets were built and
19 were readapted when cars were new and since that time
20 we have made improves in a piecemeal fashion and some
21 of those improvements have been really important and
22 really great, and I'm grateful for the Vision Zero
23 commitment that the administration has made. But we
24 must go farther. We have a record number of cyclists
25 who have been killed this year and there has been

2 vast reporting on that. But what hasn't been
3 reported in the same way is that pedestrian
4 fatalities are up 30% this year. Almost every day,
5 every two hours in New York City, someone is either
6 seriously injured or harmed crossing the street or
7 killed crossing the street in New York City. It does
8 not have to be this way. And this is not rocket
9 science. Other cities around the world, other cities
10 around the United States, have reimagined their
11 streets, have revolutionized their streets, to say
12 that of the 8.6 million people who live in New York
13 City, less than a million and a half own cars. But 7
14 million people in New York City do not own cars. And
15 we have to make sure that our streets work for
16 everyone. Mass transit users who are stuck on a bus.
17 A cyclist who is obeying the rules of the road and
18 gets hit or killed. A pedestrian who has the walk
19 signal but gets seriously harmed or injured. Anyone
20 who questions the importance of us taking this step
21 sit and talk with any of the unbelievably heroic and
22 brave family members that are in this balcony today
23 that have lost a child, that have lost a spouse, that
24 have lost a loved one. Listen to their pain and
25 grief that is unimaginable. And so many of these

2 fatalities and injuries are entirely preventable.

3 They are preventable by changing the way we plan our
4 streets. They are preventable by showing that we are

5 not going to prioritize cars to be the most important

6 things. Car will exist in New York City. But it's

7 about rebalancing to make sure that people remain

8 safe. Today I want to talk about one of those people

9 that we lost, and there are thousands and thousands

10 and thousands of stories that you can here. But

11 today I want to talk about one. Seth Kahn was 22

12 years old when he was hit by an MTA bus in Hell's

13 Kitchen in my district in 2009, almost 10 years ago

14 to the day. His father, Harold Kahn, who is here

15 today, his mother, Debbi Kahn, who is here today.

16 They spoke movingly yesterday about the importance of

17 this bill. Harold described his only child as a "joy

18 to be around", who was handsome, kind, generous,

19 loving, creative, and talented. And 10 years after

20 Seth's tragic death Harold said, of course, that he

21 and his wife miss hearing their son's stories and

22 they are heartbroken, but they will never be

23 grandparents. When we vote on this bill today I'd

24 like us to remember the reason why safe streets are

25 so necessary. This could happen to any one of us.

2 This could happen to any one of our friends and
3 family members, and this is why bold action is
4 needed. I am proud of this bill, but there is so
5 much more work that we must do to continue to have
6 safe streets in New York City. We should not stand
7 by and think, oh, some pedestrians are going to get
8 killed this year. Oh, some cyclists are going to
9 killed this year. It doesn't have to be this way.
10 We've seen in a short period of time with
11 improvements on Queens Boulevard and improvements in
12 Times Square and improvements in neighborhoods across
13 New York City that those improvements have saved
14 lives, but they have been done in a piecemeal way.
15 It is time to have a master plan that fits together,
16 that makes sense for mass transit users, cyclists,
17 pedestrians. We are in the midst of a climate
18 emergency in this world. Eighty-three percent of
19 transportation emissions come from private
20 automobiles, 83%. So this is not just about safety.
21 It's about the environmental disaster that is waiting
22 for us and making it safe to use other modes of
23 transportation. I am incredibly proud of this bill.
24 I think it sets us on a path for a better future in
25 New York City and this plan's goals will be to

2 prioritize the safety of all street users. The use
3 of mass transit, the reduction of vehicle emissions,
4 and also importantly to create access for individuals
5 with disabilities who can't navigate our streets or
6 our sidewalks because they're not built
7 appropriately. Each plan that this bill would ensure
8 would include benchmarks, not goals, but benchmarks.
9 And the first plan would be due in December of 2021.
10 This bill requires reporting in February of each year
11 regarding any update on any changes to the master
12 plan and progress towards achieving those benchmarks
13 laid out in the plan. The New York City Department
14 of Transportation would also be required to conduct a
15 public education campaign on the benefits of each
16 master plan. And I just want to end with this. I
17 want to end with this. There has been a significant
18 amount of pushback to this bill. There has been
19 people saying you're villainizing people that must
20 take their car across New York City. That is not
21 what we are saying here today. We are saying that
22 the streets must be built for everyone. We are
23 saying that to be a twenty-second century city we
24 have to change the way we do things. We are not
25 penalizing anyone. We are making our streets safer.

2 And when you make our streets safer, when you get
3 buses moving, when you make it safer for pedestrians,
4 you are actually making it safe for everyone.

5 Because even people who use their private automobiles
6 to get from a transit desert in New York City to into
7 Manhattan. Even those people cross the street at
8 night with their child in New York City. Even those
9 people walk to the grocery store. Even those people
10 are people that have friends and family members and
11 children that could be exposed to traffic violence
12 through inaction. So this is not mutually exclusive.
13 This is not a zero sum game. This is about us saving
14 countless future lives in the greatest city in the
15 world. We are far behind other world-class cities
16 that are doing this. We know that it works. It is
17 the right thing to do. I announced this as part of
18 my State of the City in March and I want to thank Rob
19 Newman and Kelly Taylor who have worked tirelessly on
20 this since that day. They have been agile. They
21 have been smart. They have been comprehensive. They
22 worked with all the advocates, and I am incredibly
23 grateful to them, and I'm also grateful to James
24 Digiovanni who is the counsel of the Transportation
25 Committee. And lastly I want to thank Ydanis

2 Rodriguez, the chair of the Transportation Committee.
3 He has been the chair of the committee for six years.
4 And every time someone says you can't go this far
5 Ydanis pushes the envelope. Ydanis shows leadership
6 on these issues. I am grateful for him hearing this
7 bill and for him working on this, and when there are
8 not cameras there Ydanis shows up with family members
9 who have lost a loved one to traffic violence, so I
10 want to thank you, Mr. Chair, for your leadership.
11 And with that Madam Majority Leader, before we go
12 into general order time, I would like to give Council
13 Member Reynoso to start off speaker time so that he
14 has enough time to make remarks on the commercial
15 waste zone plan.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes, granted.
17 You may begin, Council Member Reynoso.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, Madam
19 Majority Leader. Thank you, Speaker Corey Johnson.
20 I want to start by saying during my second term in
21 office I sat with the Speaker and he asked me what
22 was important to me and for me, and I told him that
23 waste equity, justice for communities like South
24 Bronx, north Brooklyn, southeast Queens, those are
25 things that were important to me. And he ended the

2 meeting by saying Antonio, if it's important to you
3 it's important to me. He then signed on to both
4 bills, ah, even though they were put together
5 conceptually, because he had faith in the work that
6 was going to be able to do to get us to a point where
7 we're working and trying to satisfy so many people
8 and so many groups. But ultimately reforming an
9 industry that for too long has gone without proper
10 oversight or regulation. Today truly is a victory
11 for the City of New York. The reforms to the private
12 sanitation industry that we will be voting on today
13 will improve the lives of every resident of this
14 city. Our air will be cleaner. Our streets will be
15 safer. Workers will be protected and businesses will
16 have reliable waste collection services. Many people
17 told me today would never happen, that the system was
18 too complex to be meaningfully reformed. That the
19 politics were too difficult. And until today history
20 had proven those naysayers right. However, I knew
21 that we had justice on our side. That ours was the
22 righteous cause. We persisted for six straight years
23 to reach today's vote and I am gratified to say to
24 you today that the righteous cause has prevailed.
25 For years carters have chased customers all over the

2 city, resulting in routes with hundreds and hundreds
3 of stops and in some cases thousands of stops.

4 Dozens of carters serving a single commercial
5 corridor. This puts pressure on drivers and helpers
6 to cut corners in order to complete their routes in a
7 single night. Workers have to blow red lights,
8 speed, and run across dark streets into oncoming
9 traffic, putting themselves and the public in danger.

10 This is not their fault, but a consequence of
11 terrible operational practices imposed by company
12 owners. These companies run old trucks that lack
13 basic safety inspections and spew dirty emissions.
14 Those emissions are further increased by inefficient
15 routes, leaving communities like mine to suffer with
16 high rates of asthma and other respiratory illnesses.

17 And to top all of this, carters are not recycling.

18 Sending more waste to landfill, adding additional
19 methane emissions to the system at a time when we are
20 facing a climate emergency. A commercial waste zone
21 system will put an end to all of this. There are so
22 many people who made this legislation possible and
23 I'm going to do my very best to thank them all. But
24 before that I just want to say as a young boy growing
25 up in north Brooklyn across the street from a

2 Superfund site, a brownfield area, opportunity area,
3 called the Newton Creek, a highway put there by
4 Robert Moses that split my community in half. They
5 built parks on either side of the highway and almost
6 exclusively that is where our young people play. We
7 have three times the asthma entrants running into
8 Woodhull Hospital than the average of the City of New
9 York. When I set out to become a council member I
10 promised that I was going to effect a meaningful
11 change for the people in my district. But I also set
12 out to be a sanitation chair that wanted to effect
13 change for the City of New York in a meaningful way.
14 And today I feel that my mission and being able to
15 look back, if I could, at the young both in the south
16 side that I did right by him and I did right by my
17 community and the young people and the future of my
18 district. This legislation wasn't done alone. It
19 was also waste equity, reducing capacity in my
20 district by 50%, not allowing for 40% of the trash to
21 go to one location. So I want to again thank Speaker
22 Corey Johnson whose courageous leadership on this
23 issue broke the logjam that held up this, that held
24 this up for so many years. I want to thank DSNY
25 Commissioner Katherine Garcia, who knew this was the

2 right thing to do and put the weight of the
3 department behind this effort. Her staff, Justin
4 Glenn, Christine Billy, Greg Anderson, who are
5 valuable partners in drafting this legislation, our
6 incredible legislative committee staff, Nicole Ben,
7 Nadia Johnson, John Seltzer, Megan Chen, Brad Reed,
8 Turza Nassar, and Jeff Baker, who worked tirelessly
9 on this deeply complex, 60-page bill. I want to
10 thank my legislative director, Asher Friedman, who
11 helped write these comments and would never put his
12 name on them, but I just want to say to Asher
13 Friedman thank you so much for the tireless work that
14 you put in this legislation as well. The entire
15 Transform Don't Trash Coalition, the Teamsters, New
16 York Lawyers for the Public Interest, NJA, NDRC, and
17 Align. Your steadfast advocacy woke the city up to
18 this problem and spurred elected leadership in the
19 city to do something about it. I have to send a big
20 thank-you to my own hometown crew, Outrage, who have
21 been the frontlines of environmental justice fight in
22 north Brooklyn for years. And finally I want to
23 thank the journalists who covered this industry and
24 the efforts to reform it. We as elected officials
25 cannot do what we do without the press at a time when

2 they are coming under attack. I want to thank, take
3 a moment to recognize the incredibly important work
4 that they do. This bill first and foremost is about
5 environmental justice. But I want to close by
6 speaking about the people who feel the impacts of
7 this industry most acutely. On April 3, 1968, 51
8 years ago, Dr. Martin Luther King delivered the last
9 speech he would ever give on behalf of striking
10 sanitation workers in Memphis, where he uttered the
11 fateful words "I may not get there with you, but I
12 want you to know tonight that we as people will get
13 to the Promised Land." The bill we are voting today
14 delivers on the promise of Dr. Martin Luther King
15 made to those workers so many decades ago. Workers
16 like Mark Turbialo, who lost his life doing the job
17 that so many like him, vulnerable members of our
18 society, folks who have had contact with the justice
19 system, undocumented folks, who do this job night in
20 and night out. I'm proud to be able to say to those
21 workers that justice will no longer be delayed. I am
22 proud that today we can deliver on a small piece of
23 Dr. King's dream. And thank you all. Thank you.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Congratulations,
25 Council Member Reynoso. Great job. Madam Majority

2 Leader, this concludes speaker's time. I turn it
3 back to you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
5 much, Speaker Corey Johnson. We will now move on to
6 any members that are wishing to discuss the bills
7 being voted on today, and we will first begin prior
8 to doing that with Council Members Moya, followed by
9 Council Member Reverend Diaz.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you, Madam
11 Majority Leader. I will be voting yes on all except
12 1574-A and 1425-A. Thank you.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.
14 Council Member Reverend Diaz.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam
16 Chair Lady. I just want to vote yes on all the
17 agenda for the land use committee and only no on the
18 Introduction 1574-A and 1557-A. Thank you.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. And
20 we will now begin general orders, starting with
21 Council Member Cabrera, followed by followed by
22 Council Member Cornegy, and followed by Council
23 Member Borelli, and just a reminder that we are
24 speaking only on the bills that are being voted on at
25 this time.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
3 much, and I'll make it real brief. Intro 1498-A will
4 require NYPD to report data regarding animal cruelty
5 complaints on its website on a semiannual basis, no
6 later than January 30 and July 30 of each year,
7 beginning in 2020. The data will include the number
8 of complaint reports allege an act of animal cruelty
9 and the number of animal cruelty arrests by precinct.
10 Animal abuse is part of the cycle of violence.
11 Intentional animal cruelty has shown to correlate
12 with other crimes, including violence against people.
13 We know that women who enter domestic violence
14 shelters often report that their partners hurt or
15 killed the family pet. We also know that hoarding
16 behavior causes animal to suffer extreme neglect and
17 can indicate that the animal hoarder needs social or
18 mental health services, preventing adequately, ah,
19 punishing animal cruelty helps end the cycle of
20 violence to both animals and humans. I want to thank
21 speaker. I want to thank the chair, Mark Levine, the
22 council staff, but I also want to give a special
23 thanks, ah, in regards to this bill to Aly Feldman
24 Taylor. I know you're listening right now, I know
25 you're here. I want to thank you because you

2 inspired me to introduce this bill and today shall
3 come to pass. Today is a good day for animals. And
4 I want to congratulate also all of the sponsors of
5 all of the animal rights bills. Thank you so much.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Now
7 we will hear from Council Member Cornegy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Madam
9 Majority Leader. I want to first start by
10 congratulating my colleague, Antonio Reynoso, on the
11 tremendous amount of work he put in on this bill.
12 But I want to respectfully disagree with 1574. The
13 bill to create commercial waste zones is opposed by
14 many in the business and labor community and without
15 a doubt will kill jobs. While I agree with my
16 colleagues and advocates that industry should be
17 informed to be better, I believe we can achieve that
18 goal with more targeted and less harmful policies. I
19 understand that we are in a climate emergency and
20 that City Council feels the needs to do everything to
21 address this crisis. But our city needs nuanced and
22 flexible leadership. Being progressive should not
23 mean anti-business. City Council should not be
24 regarding jobs and opportunity out of existence,
25 especially for our city's most vulnerable workers.

2 The commercial waste industry was significantly
3 reformed in the 1990s to eliminate corruption and
4 create a truly competitive market. This bill will
5 possibly create monopolies, which in turn reduces
6 accountability and increases prices. Additionally,
7 my other two primary concerns with the bill is
8 reduction of low barrier to entry jobs, especially
9 for individuals who have been involved with the
10 criminal justice system and without a high school
11 degree, and increase costs for small business and
12 increase burden on business in general. These are
13 good-paying jobs that City Council is eager to snatch
14 away from the hard-working New Yorkers. The impetus
15 for Intro 1574 is to make our streets safer by
16 reducing truck traffic and improving the environment.
17 There is a narrative that haulers are criss-crossing
18 the city in a desperate to get business. Sure, there
19 are bad actors in the market that low-ball prices and
20 do not abide by safety norms and regulations, but
21 creating commercial waste zones is not the targeted
22 policy solution we need to solve these issues. If we
23 want to get bad actors off the road, let's push the,
24 let's push the Business Integrity Commission to
25 implement minimum pricing, which it already has the

2 authority to do. Setting a price, setting a price
3 floor ensures that union jobs and laborers are
4 protected against unfair and unscrupulous competition
5 and our streets become safer. Additionally, the
6 industry has already been making progress on
7 increasing safety, training, and practices reducing
8 its environmental impact. I often hear in the
9 council that we need a holistic approach to solving
10 the housing crisis, that we need to ensure people
11 have good-paying jobs to pay for rents and mortgage,
12 which is why many members are supporting a prevailing
13 wage for service and construction workers in the
14 development of affordable and supportive housing
15 projects. [inaudible] and union jobs make housing
16 more accountable and secure.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
18 Council Member Cornegy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I just want to
20 finish by saying I cannot support Intro 1574 or the
21 creation of commercial waste zones. This is an
22 answer to search, this is an answer in search of a
23 problem. The solution to the problem before us today
24 can and ought to be address through more targeted and
25 less harmful public policies.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
3 Council Member Cornegy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: The people of
5 New York are counting on Council to expand
6 opportunity workers and are not, opportunity, workers
7 are not disposable and businesses are not piggy
8 banks. Thank you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
10 much. We will now hear from Council Member Ritchie
11 Torres.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I would like to
13 vote on all general items. I vote aye on all.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now call
18 on Council Member Borelli, followed by Council Member
19 Rivera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you, Madam
21 Majority Leader. I'm speaking out today against a
22 bill that I was once actually a sponsor of and after
23 going through the hearing process I've decided that I
24 no longer support and I actually oppose. Today we
25 will be forming a task force to reevaluate and exam

2 and essential will be providing cover for the fact
3 that a significant fraction of our city's public
4 middle schools are unable to produce students that
5 can pass any sort of standardized testing or
6 objective measures. And I have a DOE quality
7 snapshot here on my desk as an example. A school
8 with 300 students. Let's call it School X. It's a
9 school that doesn't produce the quality students who
10 could pass the test. The DOE tells us that schools
11 like this have the second-highest rating for student
12 achievement. They're telling us the school has the
13 highest level of rigorous instruction. They're
14 telling us the school has the highest rating of
15 teachers. They tell us that 87% of kids pass their
16 classes and 88% of kids in this school, School X, are
17 next-level ready. It's on, it's on paper, it's
18 online. But when the DOE has any other measure
19 outside of their control we see a school of failure.
20 In this particular school, only 18% of kids can pass
21 state English exams and 16% can pass math, both below
22 city and state averages. And I've asked DOE to
23 explain this multiple times and they've always
24 refused and given blank stares. Now, unsurprisingly,
25 when these students go on to high school they're not

2 going to make the elite high schools. But even the
3 schools we can track, they go on to schools that have
4 low graduation rates, low SAT scores, low Regents
5 passing rates. And there's dozens of middle schools
6 like this school I have as an example. You just have
7 to go online and look. So instead of having a task
8 force that might hopefully at best pull two or three
9 of the kids from this school and put them in an elite
10 high school, I think it's better that we have a task
11 force to examine, in all candor, why we have so many
12 schools where DOE is telling us everything is A-OK,
13 but where students can't pass any objective
14 standards. I would urge all of my colleagues to, to
15 not support 1541 and hopefully go back to the drawing
16 board at some point to get a task force to examine
17 middle school failure.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
19 Council Member Borelli. We will now be followed by
20 Council Member Rivera, Lander, and Levin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you. I
22 want to take this opportunity to speak on two pieces
23 of legislation being voted on today that I am proud
24 to be the lead sponsor of. These two bills are part
25 of a historic package the council is considering

2 today to advance animal rights across a number of
3 different industries and areas. We are voting on
4 these bills over 150 years after New York State
5 became the first state in the nation to pass an
6 animal cruelty law, and I hope we will continue that
7 proud tradition today of advancing animal rights. My
8 legislation to prohibit the sale of force fed foie
9 gras will finally put an end to one of the cruelest
10 and most inhumane practices in the food industry. No
11 longer will these animals suffer from the diseases,
12 ruptured organs, esophagus trauma, broken bones, and
13 illnesses that come as a result of violently forcing
14 birds to eat more grain in weeks than they would
15 normally consume in their lifetime. The method
16 itself is abusive and it's unnecessary. And many
17 countries and cities in the globe have enacted their
18 own ban, and I'm excited the five boroughs are
19 joining them. At the same time, we've heard from
20 stakeholders regarding the effects of this bill and
21 that's why the legislation we are passing today
22 includes a phase-in period for any impacted
23 businesses so that they might work to change
24 production approaches to shift some of their focus to
25 other established and lucrative markets. My other

2 bill, Intro 1202, will target illegal acts long
3 observed by constituents in my district and others
4 where poachers forcefully capture pigeons and other
5 birds from our streets and bring them illegally to
6 other states, where they are kept in terrible
7 conditions until they are shot for sport. This bill
8 will give our animal abuse officers in the NYPD the
9 ability to capture these traffickers and prosecute
10 this disturbing criminal behavior. We wouldn't be
11 here passing this legislation without the work of so
12 many committed advocates and council staff. I have
13 to thank chief of staff Jason Goldman, our committee
14 counsel, Zayemanual Halu, and Sarah Liss, senior
15 policy analyst Emily Bolkin, our legislative
16 counsel, Nicholas Connell, of course voters for
17 animal rights, the Humane Society, Veterinarian
18 Medical Association, the Animal Legal Defense Fund...

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
20 Council Member Rivera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: And of course my
22 legislative director, Jeremy Unger. It's a big day
23 for animals and we should continue to be at the
24 forefront of the movement. I hope you all will join
25 me in supporting these bills. Thank you.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
3 much, Council Member Rivera. We will now be joined
4 by Council Member Lander, Levin, Rodriguez, and
5 Ulrich.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
7 Majority Leader. There are so many good bills on the
8 calendar today and when I vote I'll speak about the
9 comprehensive streets planning bills. Speaker
10 Johnson, it is a, a really great step forward for
11 saving lives in our city, and congratulations to
12 Council Members Rivera and Brannan, and so many
13 others. But I want to speak for a minute now in
14 support of 1574. There are some really big issues
15 facing the challenges in the city right now. We've
16 got an environmental crisis that falls hardest on
17 low-income communities of color. We've got an income
18 equity and workers' rights crisis, which falls
19 hardest of workers of color, and we've got a safe
20 streets crisis, which actually falls hardest on every
21 community. I am not aware of any other piece of
22 legislation that does something about all three of
23 those things besides 1574. For too long we have
24 allowed private sanitation to flaunt all those
25 things, to drive all over the city, to not attend to

2 reducing waste, to cause the most harm in communities
3 of color, to put low-income workers of colors lives
4 at risk and put pedestrians' lives at risk without
5 adequate regulation or attention. And this 1574-A is
6 a result of a lot of years of hard work and planning
7 and remarkable organizing. It makes smart steps on
8 all of them. Ah, this is a smart bill. It's not
9 anti-business. There will still be competition. It
10 just will be competition amongst businesses, all of
11 whom are required to have sane routes, to observe
12 safety standards, and to pay attention to
13 environmental and recycling requirements. I was
14 honored to be the original sponsor of this bill, but
15 when Council Member Reynoso came into this body and
16 made clear he wanted to step up to the leadership of
17 the sanitation committee to do right by his
18 constituents and by our whole city, I recognize that
19 that thing we say when we want the people who are
20 closest to the problem to be in the lead and making
21 the solution that this remarkable coalition that has
22 so many people in the balcony, from environmental
23 justice, from environmental groups, from labor, from
24 safe streets, had the right champion in Council
25 Member Reynoso. Antonio, you've done the body proud,

2 your community proud, and this coalition proud.
3 Congratulations.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.
5 Council Member Levin, followed by Council Member
6 Rodriguez and Ulrich.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
8 Majority Leader. I also want to speak on Intro 1574
9 and thank and acknowledge Antonio Reynoso for his
10 leadership on this bill. This took a lot of
11 political, professional, and personal courage to put
12 this bill forward and put in the hard work with his
13 staff and the committee staff to get this bill done,
14 and I want to obviously acknowledge all the advocates
15 that have been there as well and they've done an
16 incredible job. You know, as we've learned in recent
17 years there, the current state of affairs with the
18 private carting industry is in such desperate need of
19 reform. A single route for a shift for a private
20 hauler could include hundreds and hundreds of pickups
21 in a single shift. That means they will be picking
22 up in an eight-shift shift it could be every 30
23 seconds for every minute that they have to do a
24 pickup in order to get home to their families. That,
25 that condition contributes so greatly to what we see

2 on our streets, which is speeding trucks, trucks
3 going through red lights, making reckless turns,
4 backing up down the wrong, backing up down streets,
5 going the wrong way down one-way streets. When we
6 see that, the practice in business right now is
7 contributing to that, and it is putting New Yorkers
8 at risk every single day. And we see it by the
9 number of people that have been killed by private
10 hauling trucks, which far outpaces the number of
11 people that are killed by DSNY trucks. This is a
12 bill that will have more impact on reducing truck
13 traffic on our streets than any other piece of
14 legislation that I will have voted on in my entire
15 time here in the council, and so I just want to
16 encourage my colleagues to vote yes on this bill.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
18 Council Member Levin. We will now hear from Council
19 Member Rodriguez, followed by Ulrich, Menchaca, and
20 Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
22 Majority Leader. First of all, thank you, Council
23 Member Reynoso. There's one thing that we have in
24 immigrants, black and Latino nation community which
25 is we had a higher level of our children dealing with

2 asthma. I feel that that organization or the
3 industry, the way how we pick up, is so important and
4 I feel that, you know, that this is about social
5 justice, and that's only one step that we have to
6 make in order to be sure that, you know, we take away
7 so many trucks from places, from the South Bronx,
8 from Washington Heights, all the places in Brooklyn,
9 Queens, Staten Island. We need to be sure that we,
10 you know, protect our children, and then we don't
11 have to make the number too high, the higher
12 percentage of asthma in New York City. Second, thank
13 you, Speaker Johnson, today is a historical day.
14 With the transportation master plan what we are
15 saying is that first of all we are listening loud and
16 clear to all the members of the TA. Sometimes it
17 takes decades. I know that when you were starting
18 organizing not many people understood the work that
19 you were doing, the Families for Safe Streets. We
20 would never know how to stand up every day, wake up,
21 go to sleep, without having a loved one that didn't
22 die because, you know, they were dealing with some
23 tough issue. They just died because irresponsible
24 and many time criminal drivers, you know, leave the
25 scene after hitting someone, and also because we as

2 the City of New York has not doing, has not been
3 doing the urban planning, having pedestrians and
4 cyclists at the center of our city. So today with
5 this plan it's more than putting the Band-Aids in a
6 crisis that is affecting our city. What we are doing
7 is putting the start together. [speaking in Spanish]
8 Thank you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll
10 now hear from Council Member Ulrich.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam
12 Majority Leader. I will be voting later on. But I
13 did want to speak on two of the bills today and just
14 briefly explain my vote. The first is my opposition
15 to Intro to 1574-A, the commercial waste zone bill
16 that is being passed today. I know how hard Antonio
17 Reynoso worked on this particular issue and I know
18 how deeply he cares about it and I don't want to take
19 away from that in any way, but I have heard from
20 many, many, many small businesses that are genuinely
21 concerned about the possibility of price fixing and
22 the monopolies that will result as a result of this
23 bill's passage. When we create these commercial
24 waste zones and we allow for only a certain number of
25 large carting companies to bid on these zones they

2 are going to, in a sense, be able to determine what
3 the prices are and don't make any mistake. If they
4 can make more profits they will. They will squeeze
5 out the smaller carting companies that don't have the
6 capacity or the ability to compete with them for some
7 of these bids and as a result of that I think that
8 who will suffer the most will be the small businesses
9 that are going to be forced by the City of New York
10 to hire one or two or maybe three companies in each
11 commercial waste zone. That is going to put an
12 unbelievable burden on the small businesses that are
13 already struggling to stay in businesses. This city
14 does not do enough to support small business men and
15 women in this city who are truly the backbone of our
16 economies. We keep passing regulations and bills
17 that bring them to their knees and it is no surprise
18 that so many vacancies are occurring across the city.
19 So I think it's bad for business and that's why I'm
20 voting against it. I do want to express concern,
21 very briefly, on 1557-A, but I'll reserve that for my
22 comments for voting because I see my time is out.
23 Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
25 Council Member Ulrich. We'll be followed by now

2 Council Members Menchaca, Deutsch, Lancman, and
3 Powers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: In 2012

5 Superstorm Sandy came and devastated many of our
6 communities and it was a wake-up call for so many of
7 us, especially those who enter the City Council with
8 a mission to do what we could to bring climate change
9 and those issues to the forefront of what a municipal
10 government could do. One of those seeds and that
11 promise that we carried into the council was 15, what
12 we understand now is 1574-A, and that included the
13 incredible leadership of my brother from the north in
14 Brooklyn, Antonio Reynoso. So much of that courage
15 has sustained itself because of the coalition behind
16 this work and the transformation that needs to happen
17 to an industry that has been not just polluting and
18 making our streets unsafe, but has led to the deaths
19 of so many workers. Immigrant workers. And so I
20 want to thank the Speaker and all his staff for the
21 work that they have done to ensure that this bill is
22 a good bill and it is. Transformation is not easy.
23 It's hard. But it's also necessary. And as we think
24 about climate change and what it forces us to do to
25 think different, to act differently, this is one of

2 those bills that does that. Even the opponents of
3 this bill tell us that sure, there are bad actors,
4 but we have a law to fix that. And that's why the
5 law is the strongest way to transition us so that we
6 can actually have a just transition for this economy
7 of private carters. But that's not the only thing
8 that we're voting on today, and we're also voting on
9 animal rights bills, including foie gras and the work
10 that we're doing to ensure that animals are protected
11 as we move forward with an industry that can be more
12 humane. There's nothing humane about putting animals
13 through this, and so for me this is why I'm saying
14 yes to all the bills today. Again, Reynoso brought
15 in a seed that grew and we all helped it grow. I
16 want to continue to do that as we all force ourselves
17 to think differently, act differently, and legislate
18 our way through. Thank you.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

20 Council Member Deutsch. Again, Lancman and Powers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,

22 Majority Leader. I have serious concern about Intro
23 1574-A and as a member of the Sanitation Committee
24 I'm disappointed and I feel that many of the issues
25 have not been appropriately addressed. The redrafted

2 version of this bill was first unveiled just a few
3 weeks ago, and I along with a dozen of my colleagues
4 believe it deserved its own hearing. For many of the
5 smaller private carters Intro 1574-A will upend their
6 industry and their business. The least we could do,
7 the least we could have done was to allow them an
8 opportunity to further speak about the many
9 challenges that this bill presents. They fear a mini
10 monopoly system that will run jobs and their family-
11 owned businesses into the ground. They fear that
12 there will be job losses during the staggered
13 implementation of the bill. They fear a process that
14 favors larger companies and quashes smaller ones. I
15 have questions about how this bill will impact the
16 city's budget. Other cities that implemented this
17 system ended up with enormous unexpected costs when
18 the waste zone plan was unsuccessful. Will the
19 taxpayers be shelling out more money to support
20 commercial waste zones? I question why the bill's
21 text reads that up to three carters will be assigned
22 to each zone. Why not just say there will be three
23 assigned? I question why this council is seeking to
24 remove competition in these zones, which I believe
25 will result in higher collection costs for smaller

2 businesses across our city. I look at Los Angeles,
3 which implemented a similar system that has caused a
4 large increase for the businesses that are utilizing
5 these private carters. We as a council should be
6 having a discussion about why the chambers of
7 commerce oppose this bill and why the business
8 improvement districts oppose this bill. I want to
9 add that as safety must be our first and top priority
10 and I believe that most, if not all, of the private
11 carters are in compliance. Finally, I just want to
12 express my deep dissatisfaction with the process by
13 which this new Intro 1574-A was rushed through
14 without time for renewed discussion. Another few
15 months of negotiation would be a small price to pay
16 to get it right. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
18 Council Member Deutsch. We will now hear from
19 Council Members Lancman, Powers, and then finally
20 Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: On Intro 1574
22 the fact is that the private cartering industry is a
23 rogue industry and it has been for a very long time.
24 It is rife with workplace safety violations, wage
25 hour violations, and every other abuse of working

2 people that you can think of. How many working
3 people have to die before this city will act. This
4 bill will make workplaces safer. Period. And for
5 that reason alone I would support this legislation.
6 But consider the environmental damage that is done to
7 the city every day. Do we really need 90 different
8 carting companies criss-crossing the city in the
9 months inefficient patterns imaginable adding to
10 pollution and to noise and to just the general mayhem
11 that exists on our streets, which the speaker's
12 legislation is trying to address. Finally, let me
13 say that having three carting companies compete for
14 business in each zone is not a monopoly. It is the
15 definition of not a monopoly. This legislation has
16 struck a balance to allow for competition but in a
17 sane and orderly way. And if there's one thing that
18 is lacking in the carting industry today it is sanity
19 and order. Let me just mention another bill I want
20 to share a thought on. It's Intro 1202, ah Council
21 Member Carlina Rivera's bill regarding harassing and
22 harming pigeons. I'm just concerned, and I want
23 members to think about for a moment we are making it
24 a misdemeanor for someone to take, for someone to
25 harry a pigeon. Now that may seem trivial. It may

2 not seen like an important issue. But this council
3 has been in the business the last few years of
4 reducing penalties for low-level offenses and we
5 should think hard before we make it a penalty up to a
6 year in jail for something that kids or street
7 vendors might find themselves doing...

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
9 Council Member Lancman.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: In the ordinary
11 course of their day. Thank you.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We're
13 now going to hear from Council Members Powers,
14 followed by Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I'm
16 just going to speak on a few bills here today, but I
17 will try to be quick. First, I want to join my
18 colleagues in support of the commercial waste zoning
19 proposal sponsored by my colleague, Council Member
20 Reynoso. I think he has gone through extensive
21 debate and dialogue on this bill and has found his
22 balance between the needs of the city as a whole and
23 the concerns of the impacted industries here. I
24 support him on this bill and I am one of the
25 districts that has probably the most need around

2 commercial, ah, commercial carting because of
3 representing midtown Manhattan, I think, after my,
4 you know, my conversations with him I think he has
5 worked diligently on this and I again will praise him
6 for how much engagement he had on this bill and I
7 will be voting in support of it. Second, I want to
8 thank all the folks here today on the street safety,
9 street master plan legislation, which will give us a
10 better vision for the City of New York rather doing
11 this on an ad hoc basis, looking at different
12 neighborhoods, looking at our whole city, and looking
13 to create an integrated network. I want to thank the
14 Speaker and nearly half the council that supported
15 that bill, including myself. And finally, I ask all
16 of your support on the package of legislation today
17 that's before the council relating to animal rights,
18 including my legislation here today. I think this is
19 a very important day for New York, as a leader on
20 these issues and to find a better balance between
21 being a city of commerce and a city that has empathy
22 and supports animal welfare. I would also note I
23 have a resolution that opposes the Trump's
24 administration changes or proposed changes to the
25 Endangered Species Act, which I think I just last

2 stated to ask people to sign onto that as well. I
3 think this is a great day. I think this is an
4 important Stated Meeting, and I am proudly voting in
5 support of all these bills ahead of us. Thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

7 Council Member Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
9 Majority Leader. I wasn't planning on speaking
10 during general orders, but when folks knock the
11 public schools Treyger does have to respond. And I
12 have much respect with Council Member Borelli. I
13 would just ask in his data that he's collected about
14 the School X, how much [inaudible] funding is that
15 School X short by? Because the school in my district
16 is short by \$900,000 dollars and that's the
17 difference between not having literacy teachers and
18 coaches, guidance counselors, social workers, art
19 programs, music programs to help kids advance. I'd
20 ask how many full-time social workers the school has,
21 how many full-time counselors the school has. I'd
22 also remind my, my colleagues of the story of Anthony
23 Ramos, a student that was underperforming, a student
24 that had difficulty on standardized exams,
25 particularly reading exams as well, but yet is one of

2 the top performers of our time on Broadway and on the
3 national and international stage. The last time I
4 checked you have to read a script to perform on
5 Broadway and memorize information. And he did pretty
6 well. The speaker's bill, and I don't want to speak
7 for him on this, but the speaker's bill was born out
8 of a frustration that the public, parents, educators,
9 children, advocates, were shut out of the mayor's
10 initial announcement about specialized schools.
11 That's where that was, that's where that came from.
12 Show me where there's been a government-sponsored
13 task force made up of advocates and educators and
14 parents looking at this issue. Even the mayor's own
15 [inaudible], who I respect enormously, did not
16 mention at this time anything about specialized
17 schools. So I think the speaker did not prescribe a
18 solution, he prescribed a process that is inclusive
19 of all stakeholders. And we may not even agree with
20 all that. But let's at least agree that we have a
21 major problem and we should involve people at the
22 front lines to help shape the process. And with
23 that, I am within my time. And I yield back to the
24 majority leader. Thank you.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I
3 will now bring it to Speaker Corey Johnson.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
5 Majority Leader. Before we vote, if I could have
6 quiet in the chambers...

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Before we go into a
9 vote on all the items on the general order calendar
10 today, I recognized them before, but I want to
11 dedicate my vote here today on this master plan bill,
12 1557, to some of the people that are with us today
13 that are here in these chambers, and I want to
14 recognize them again for their incredible courage
15 through unimaginable grief to get us to this moment,
16 to push me, to push the envelope, to continue to
17 press to save lives. I want to dedicate this vote to
18 Debbie Kahn, Harold Kahn, Raul Emquiro, Melanie
19 Bryant, Jane Martin Levaud, Mary McNulty, Fabiola
20 Mendiotta, and Amy Cohen, all from Families for Safe
21 Streets, and Mark O'Connor and Danny Harris from
22 Transportation Alternatives. And with that I yield
23 back to you, Madam Majority Leader.

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

74

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
3 much, Speaker Corey Johnson. Now we will move on to
4 report of special committees.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Reports of
7 standing committees.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
9 on Education, Intro 1541-B, Specialized High School
10 Task Force.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
12 general orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
14 on Finance, Intro 1750, Business Improvement
15 Districts.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
17 orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 568 and
19 Reso 1147 through preconsidered LU 570 and Reso 1149,
20 tax exemptions.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
22 orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
24 on Health, Intro 870-A, on page 2, through Intro
25 1570-A on page 3, animal welfare package.

1 STATED MEETING

75

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Proudly amended and
3 coupled on general orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
5 on Rules, Privileges, and Elections, preconsidered
6 Reso 1141, committee changes.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
8 orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1142,
10 Juvenile Justice Committee.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
12 orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
14 on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, Intro 1082-
15 A through Intro 1574-A, Private Carting.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
17 general orders. Congratulations, Antonio Reynoso.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
19 on Transportation, Intro 1557-A, Comprehensive Street
20 Planning.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
22 general orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: On the general order
24 calendar, resolution appointing various persons
25 Commission of Deeds.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
3 orders. And at this time, Madam Majority Leader, I'm
4 asking for a roll call vote on all of the items on
5 today's general order calendar. What a busy day.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and
7 congratulations to all my colleagues.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I'm sending
10 prayers and condolences to the family of Emir Griffin
11 who was sadly and senselessly gunned down in my
12 district. With that, I vote aye on all.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Request time to
20 explain my vote.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
24 just want to speak briefly on 1541-B, which
25 establishes a task force. Council Member Treyger has

2 indicated some of the matters that need to be
3 considered in regards to ah, our discussion about how
4 schools are performing. But I just want to say that
5 it's been documented that no other city uses one
6 standardized test to decide whether or not students
7 will be admitted to a particular elite school, as we
8 call them. And also the NAACP brought a case saying
9 that there was no predictive validity associated with
10 this one standardized test. And you know that
11 although black and Latino students represent 70%,
12 they are about 10% of the specialized schools. So I
13 applaud the speaker for saying we need to look at
14 what the conditions are. We need to look at other
15 measures that can be considered in terms of admitting
16 students who are black and Latino, particularly into
17 the so-called specialized schools. There is no other
18 justification to say that they only are 10% in that
19 population when they represent 70% of the entire
20 student body. And with that I want to say I vote aye
21 on all with the exception of 1425-A and 1574-A,
22 mainly for the reasons that were laid out by Council
23 Member Cornegy. Thank you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
25 Council Member Barron.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you, and
4 permission to explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. I'll
8 be voting aye on all except Intros 1202, 1378, 1425,
9 1521, 1557. I want to thank the staff for their work
10 on Intro 870, specifically Sarah List, Sarah Liss,
11 Zea Manuel, and my staffer, Frank Masha. I also want
12 to just address some of what my friend and colleague,
13 Mark Treyger, said. I think he did a, a good job of
14 identifying some of the, the shortfalls and funding
15 lack and problems associated with middle schools, and
16 that justifies the point of why we need to focus on
17 them. I think the example he gave of pointing to a
18 person who succeeded despite the shortcomings of
19 middle schools also justifies the need to put the
20 bull's eye, so to say, on why middle schools seem to
21 be failing a significant portions of our students.
22 Thank you very much. I'm sorry, ah, just a mistake
23 as well. I said 1521. I meant to say 1541. Thank
24 you.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all
6 except 1082-A, 1574-A, and 1541-B.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

9 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: No on 1202,
10 1378, 1425, 1541, 1557, and 1574. Aye on the rest.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. I first
17 wanted to thank the Finance Committee for supporting
18 the tax exemption at Knickerbocker Village.
19 Combating the housing crisis isn't just about
20 creating new affordable housing. It's also about
21 protecting the precious affordable housing stock we
22 already have. In immigrant communities like Two
23 Bridges we have seen how rising rents,
24 gentrification, and a shrinking pool of affordable
25 places to live have threatened to displace long-time

2 residents. Today the council will pass a resolution
3 to help preserve the affordability of 1590 housing
4 unit at the Knickerbocker Village complex, so that it
5 remains a home for working New Yorkers and seniors on
6 fixed income. Built in 1924, Knickerbocker Village
7 has been in desperate need of investment to address
8 its aging infrastructure need. Nevertheless, they
9 should not be put on the backs of low-income tenants.
10 Today, thanks to our work with the tenant, HPD, and
11 DHCR we have secured our property tax exemption for
12 the next 50 years so that tenants wouldn't have to
13 face substantial high rent increase and can stay in
14 their home. I also wanted to congratulate all my
15 colleagues for passing important legislation today,
16 especially to our speaker, to Council Member Rivera,
17 and to Council Member Reynoso on your fight for
18 environmental justice on that long journey and you
19 finally are victorious, so congratulation. I vote
20 aye on all.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: May I be
3 excused to explain my vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
7 you. I just want to thank and congratulate Antonio
8 Reynoso for all of your hard work. I'm proud to be a
9 member of the Sanitation Committee, proud to do the
10 work, to assist you in the work that's being done to
11 make our streets safer, to bring sanity to the waste
12 industry, and to finally stand up for workers. So
13 thank you for all the great work that you're doing in
14 this committee and, and ensuring that this bill gets
15 done, and to all the advocates that worked so
16 diligently. I congratulate them as well, as well to
17 our speaker, Corey Johnson, on 1557 and your great
18 bill. You know, we need to move into the 22nd
19 century, as you talked about, and that means we need
20 safer streets and streets that are comprehensively
21 designed, not one street at a time but looking at
22 every borough, every street, and making sure we get
23 it right so that we can feel safe crossing the
24 street. Getting milk should not be a dangerous
25 endeavor. So thank you, Speaker Johnson, for your

2 leadership. I vote aye on all with the exception of
3 1425-A, in which I vote no. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. And I
5 just want to remind all members that we need to keep
6 a quorum. We have four more resolutions that need to
7 be heard that require our full attention and quorum.
8 Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote no Intro
11 1378, 1425, ah, 1574, aye on all the rest.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Pass.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
20 explain my vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
24 Majority Leader. And good afternoon to all of my
25 colleagues and thank you for not just being here, but

2 for the incredible legislation that's before this
3 body today. I want to thank the Speaker for his
4 leadership on the transportation master plan, which
5 will ultimately create more safer streets for all New
6 Yorkers. I dedicate my vote today on Intro 1557-A to
7 a dear friend of mine, Marlin Palaccio, who was
8 killed on January 9, 2017, as he was crossing the
9 street to go pick up his son from daycare. He was
10 killed in the crosswalk and died at the scene, and he
11 never made it to pick up his son. And in his honor,
12 I lift up his name. I grew up with him, someone who
13 had so much more to give, but I am thankful for the
14 time I knew him and in honor of him and so many
15 others that Speaker Johnson mentioned I certainly
16 will be voting aye on Intro 1557-A. I also want to
17 congratulate Council Member Antonio Reynoso for his
18 tremendously hard work on the commercial waste
19 industry bill and really looking at a delicate
20 balance and trying his very best to make sure that
21 communities like mine in the south and west Bronx are
22 treated fairly when you talk about commercial waste
23 and we are not continuously inundated with city trash
24 all over the city coming to our borough and really
25 looking at reducing truck traffic and making sure

2 that we address a real problem we have in the Bronx,
3 which is asthma. We are inundated with so many young
4 people and families that struggle and face asthma
5 every day, and so I appreciate Council Member's work,
6 as well as all of the advocates, and I certainly want
7 to commend my colleagues who led the way on all the
8 bills on today's agenda that relate to animal rights
9 and animal safety. I appreciate your relentless
10 efforts and all of your work and making sure that we
11 provide safety for New Yorkers, for people and
12 animals and everyone else and so with that I would be
13 voting aye on all and congratulations to my
14 colleagues. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Pass.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Um, Madam
20 Leader, your permission to explain my vote.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Ah, first I
24 want to congratulate the speaker on 1557-A, and I do
25 hope that as we go forward reworking our

2 transportation network we remember those residents of
3 the city, including all of my constituents, who have
4 few, if any, mass transit options. That has to be
5 part of this solution if we're to get people out of
6 cars and get them into mass transit and I hope we can
7 build on the work of Councilman Miller and the
8 Atlantic ticket to expand opportunities, um, which
9 would be a true game changer, to let people in the
10 furthest parts of our city access to Long Island
11 Railroad and Metro North at a much, much cheaper
12 cost. Secondly, um, I am opposing 1574 today and I
13 think that the goals of the bill are laudable. I
14 largely agree with them. I know that we can do much
15 better than what the current private carter system
16 has in place and I congratulate my colleague, Antonio
17 Reynoso, on the bill. The bill has tremendous
18 potential and is written, likely pass, they will rein
19 in the worst practices of the carting industry while
20 cutting down on the miles traveled over our streets.
21 My problem with this legislation is that it cuts too
22 far, in my opinion, the number of carters which will
23 be able to serve our communities. As written, there
24 will be 20 new zones created throughout the city
25 under this legislation and the bill provides for up

2 to three carters per zone, but it certainly doesn't
3 guarantee that. And I believe if it, that's the goal
4 that we wanted why not vote that into legislation as
5 my colleague, Chaim Deutsch, said earlier. Ah,
6 unfortunately, I believe that this bill has a very
7 good chance at creating a monopoly in the city and as
8 written it's possible that one carter can control up
9 to 75% of the routes in this city. Um, finally, I
10 want to associate myself with Council Member Ulrich's
11 remarks. What am I supposed to tell my constituents
12 and what are all going to tell our constituents when
13 the inevitable complaints arise about carters and
14 that there is no one else to go to. I'll cut my
15 remarks short, Madam Leader, and I vote aye on all
16 except 1425 and 1574.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all except
20 for Intros 1541, 1557, and 1574.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK:

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: No on 1425 and
4 aye on all others.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: In an abundance
7 of caution, no on 1202 and yes on all the others.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
10 permission to explain my vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
12 granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Ah, first of all
14 I want to say congratulations to the speaker on the
15 streets master plan bill and thank him for all the
16 work that's gone into it, and obviously give my great
17 gratitude to, ah, Families for Safe Streets and all
18 the families who are here. The fact that you have
19 turned just grievous loss through extraordinary
20 courage into a city whose streets are safer for
21 everyone of our families is just an extraordinary act
22 of generosity and courage, and we really, really
23 honor it, and this bill will build a city that we all
24 are safer to live in, and Speaker, I really commend
25 you on it. Um, I also just want to add on, on 1541

2 for those who would like some data for thinking
3 about, um, our specialized high schools and what
4 screening does, I really would invite you to come to
5 District 15. As many of you know, last year we
6 eliminated the screens that select in the high
7 schools of our district, there's 11 of them. And
8 three of them, ah, used screens to essentially have,
9 as a result, more segregated middle schools. This
10 fall we did away with those screens and I've been in
11 the middle schools of D15 and they are tremendous
12 places. You would be happy to see what the kids are
13 learning there, how well they're learning together,
14 how ready they are to be in integrated settings, and
15 how effectively those schools and those teachers can
16 deliver high-quality education to all our kids in
17 integrated settings. I really hope you'll come take
18 a look. Something good is happening, ah, that this
19 task force can build on and that we can all build on
20 if we have the courage to get past some of our fears
21 and how we think about it, and take some bold steps
22 forward towards the city that we really want to live
23 in. I vote aye on all.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin. Levine. Louis.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all, except
3 1574-A and 1557. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
8 granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I already spoke
10 on some of the other bills, but I wanted to continue
11 with the frame of thought that Superstorm Sandy
12 really kind of shook us all and the work that we're
13 doing here in this council is really in response to
14 that. I want to lift up the master plan that the
15 Speaker has been fighting for, ah, and that we have
16 been joining in supporting a master plan for the
17 streets, safe streets. In my district we are seeing
18 the laying out of the Fourth Avenue bike lane. If
19 you haven't seen it, I welcome you for a bike ride.
20 Come with me. It's beautiful. It's a, it's a
21 street, it's an avenue that I have taken many, many
22 times and that never felt safe. Now it does. This
23 kind of master plan takes something like that, one of
24 the longest, if not the longest, stretch of protected
25 bike lane and connects it so that I have and that

2 everyone has, including families, Council Member
3 Reynoso just showed me a photo of his little baby,
4 ah, Alejandro, in a balance bike, and thinking when,
5 when will he be able to get on the streets and ride
6 with his father, who rides a bike, my brother from
7 the north, and those are the kind of questions that
8 our families are asking right now. When is it going
9 to be OK for us all to get on a bike and be safe.
10 This master plan does that. And I just want to
11 commend the Speaker for going out so strong, without
12 any hesitation whatsoever, and has, has stood strong.
13 I can't wait for more of this and so I, let's, let's
14 keep going, let's move forward. [speaking in
15 Spanish] I vote aye on all.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on all
18 except for 1425, 1557, and 1202.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Except for 1541
21 and 1574, I vote aye on all.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye on
24 all.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Quiet in the
3 chambers.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
7 explain my vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just want to
11 note that my bill is not the only one that is going
12 to be passed here today. I just want to, as a safe
13 streets advocate, want to thank Speaker Corey Johnson
14 for the great work that he did, and I just want to,
15 ah, clarify one point, there was a question asked
16 during the media time. Breaking car culture is not
17 about getting rid of cars. It's about understanding
18 the privilege that it is to have a car. And
19 understanding the responsibility of having a vehicle
20 that can kill someone and just the utmost
21 responsibility that you need to have in the City of
22 New York, so I just want to make sure people. It's
23 not about getting rid of your cars. It's about being
24 responsible if you have one and understanding your
25 privilege. And our responsibility to build policy

2 around that and understanding those two, those two
3 foundational elements of it, and I vote aye on all
4 and congratulations to all my colleagues, and I know
5 I make this hard on you guys sometimes, so to all my
6 colleagues I really, really want to thank you for
7 this vote today. I know it's not easy, and I know
8 that you guys, that, that I put you in tough
9 positions. So, again, I vote aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
12 explain my vote briefly?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. I
16 want to join my colleges, ah, Adrienne Adams and
17 Miller and also voicing my, um, condolences to Emir
18 Griffin and his family in southeast Queens, who was
19 unfortunately gunned down senselessly. I also wanted
20 to congratulate Council Member Reynoso in the
21 coalition. I know this has not been an easy
22 conversation. If it was easy it would have been done
23 a long time ago. But I think today we are setting a
24 new standard, ah, for the private carter industry,
25 and really this, to sum it up, it speaks to, um,

2 ensuring that your ZIP code doesn't necessarily
3 determine whether you have access to clean air or
4 not. You know, there's been a lot of conversations
5 today about monopolies in the industry, but asthma
6 and environmental injustice has had a monopoly on our
7 communities for decades and today we are finally
8 taking a step forward to ensure that we can correct
9 that. Ah, this bill is not a magic fix. Ah, I hope
10 that the city and the administration really follows
11 through, ah, after this bill is enacted, ah, because
12 we pass a lot of pieces of legislation here, but if
13 the will is not there on the administration side, ah,
14 to ensure that the mission is fulfilled here, ah,
15 this is just a pipe dream. I also want to
16 congratulate, um, the Speaker on his bill and I
17 wanted to just echo, ah, Council Member Grodenchik on
18 his words that, you know, there's a lot more
19 investments we also need to see in communities, ah,
20 that are transit, transportation deserts as well, but
21 this bill is certainly a major step forward in
22 ensuring that, ah, as New York City evolves that the
23 roadways are open for everyone and we have to
24 recognize that New York City is growing and changing
25 and we have an obligation to ensure everyone feels

2 safe, ah, who travels our streets. With that being
3 said, I vote aye.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
7 explain my vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to vote aye
11 on all, but I want to pay special tribute, um, to
12 Harold and Debbie Kahn and their son Seth, um, as
13 well as Amy Cohen and her son, Sammy, and every
14 family member who has lost a loved one to traffic
15 violence and with that I vote aye. And to Amy's
16 whole family as well.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: With a big thank
20 you to all of the advocates that lead the way for so
21 many amazing pieces of legislation to be passed, I
22 vote aye on all.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Today is a big
7 day, especially for not only those items that we
8 mentioned related to Families for Safe Streets to
9 make the streets safe, but also for the animal right
10 advocate, and for so many sectors that we are showing
11 today that we care, we want to make the city a city
12 that is based on social justice. Talk about animal
13 rights, it's a human right. We talk about an
14 individual being killed. You know, thousands of
15 people are sent into, are sent to, in critical
16 condition to a hospital, dying every week because we
17 don't have safe street. So with this master plan, as
18 I said before, it's about a strategy for the future.
19 It's about leading nationwide the movement that is
20 calling to establish city throughout the nation more
21 walkable, more pedestrians and cycling friendly. But
22 today also we are saying that the City of New York
23 has a responsibility to put the dollars to build more
24 protected bike lane. That 24 protected bike lane
25 that we did in last year and the previous year is not

2 enough. And that's why with this plan the speaker
3 was able to lead, to negotiate, to be sure that we
4 have a more ambition plan to increase the numbers of
5 protected bike lane. What we have seen is a more of
6 the infrastructure of bicycle in New York City are
7 only in the wealthy community. They are not in the
8 [inaudible] community. Just look at the map. That
9 is three block putting together. There's not
10 infrastructure in the South Bronx. There's not
11 infrastructure in Washington Heights. There's not
12 infrastructure in immigrant and working-class
13 community. So I feel that this plan isn't only about
14 policy. It's about putting the dollars where we need
15 it. But also most of the cyclists who work in the
16 City of New York are killed in intersections. So
17 this morning it's also calling DOT to say let's
18 redesign our streets, especially the intersection
19 where we are losing most of the cyclists so that they
20 will be safe, as pedestrians should be safe, too.
21 With that, I vote aye.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Um, permission
25 to explain my vote?

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

5 Ah, I vote aye on all, with congratulations to the
6 animal rights advocates for their win for the
7 animals, ah, with congratulations to Council Member
8 Reynoso for his win for environmental justice, um,
9 and with, with deep, ah, congratulations and
10 appreciation to the speaker for his win for safety of
11 all New Yorkers. Ah, I especially honor the Lerner
12 family and appreciate the dedication of Families for
13 Safe Streets. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all,
17 except for 1378-A.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
21 briefly explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Ah, so I want to
25 congratulate all my colleagues, ah, for, for their

2 very important pieces of legislation today, and also
3 just, you know, credit the speaker with regards to, I
4 think, his important bill, as someone who represents
5 a district in southern Brooklyn that has seen, um,
6 traffic fatalities, that has seen young children
7 killed because of, ah, reckless drivers, ah, had
8 seen, we have seen southern Brooklyn, ah, bicyclists
9 killed by reckless drivers. Ah, we need to overcome
10 a certain contradiction where sometimes my neighbors,
11 who I deeply respect, say that we are the outer
12 boroughs and we're very disconnected, and here's a
13 plan to increase connectivity to the rest of New York
14 and to make our streets safer for all those who share
15 our streets. I think we have to advance safety,
16 commonsense safety measures forward. So I, I do
17 support this in the name of safety and also in the
18 name of equity and access for all regions of New York
19 City. And with that I vote aye on all.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to
22 explain my vote?

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
24 granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Briefly, thank
3 you Madam Majority Leader. Um, I am voting, um, on
4 all of today's agenda with the exception of a few
5 bills. But I just want to, ah, speak briefly on the
6 speaker's master plan, Intro 1557-A. Um, I
7 represent, ah, like many of my colleagues, a
8 transportation desert. And my district has had its
9 own share of fatalities involving cyclists and, ah,
10 we know that there is real carnage on the street and
11 the Vision Zero does not always work, and that the
12 administration has not done enough, quite frankly, to
13 protect everyone who uses the streets in our city.
14 So I first want to commend the speaker for putting
15 forward such a bold and ambitious plan to improve the
16 safety of all New Yorkers who share the road. The
17 only thing that disappoints me about this particular
18 bill is the lack of a formal process for a meaningful
19 and real community engagement, that when we discuss
20 and when we plan for bus lanes, protected bike lanes,
21 pedestrian plazas, and other things that are
22 desperately needed in every community and in every
23 borough, there is really nothing in the bill except
24 for the public education campaign listed at the very
25 end that speaks to the role of the local community

2 boards, the local elected officials, and the local
3 community groups that live in those communities and
4 will be dealing with, ah, those additions that will
5 be installed into those communities. And so I would
6 like to see this amended somewhere down the road.
7 When I said on New York One yesterday that the devil
8 was in the details, that was not meant to trivialize,
9 ah, or to show any disrespect for the families of
10 victims of the carnage that's been going on in New
11 York City, ah, but it's simply to speak to the fact
12 that we need to involve all the stakeholders in a
13 community when we are doing, ah, community planning
14 and improving transportation alternatives in our
15 communities. I recently signed a letter of support.
16 I want a protected bike lane on Crossway Boulevard
17 between Howard Beach and Broad Channel. We just had
18 a fatality there. That is a good example of
19 communities working with DOT to put in the
20 infrastructure that's desperately needed. With that
21 said, I'm only going to abstain on 1557-A for the
22 reasons I just stated. I'm voting no on 1425-A and
23 no on 1574-A, and aye on all others. Thank you very
24 much.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to
4 explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I just wanted to
8 remind everyone that our speaker over two years
9 started this battle for advocacy for animal rights
10 when we created for the very, very first time in the
11 history of this city and a battle that goes back for
12 many generations, that my family and my mom always
13 instilled in us, that if you didn't even have an
14 animal shelter how could you talk about animal
15 rights. And this council unanimously stood together
16 and basically forced the mayor to put that in the
17 budget and create for the first time animal shelters
18 in every borough. And you can't have animal rights
19 unless you have an animal shelter in every borough,
20 and those now are being sited and built due to your
21 leadership. I was proud to cosponsor those bills
22 with you, and that's part of the legacy of today's
23 bills, that we take the next step to providing the
24 promise that we did from day one for all those who
25 advocated for animals, and a voice that was not

2 always heard in this city, and now we can, when we're
3 done we can say we proudly started that revolution
4 and will always continue to fight for those rights,
5 for the animals that make such a big difference in
6 everyone one of our lives and adopt, adopt, adopt.

7 So I thank you, Speaker, for that and all the council
8 members who continue that fight today. I do wish to
9 advocate for those transportation deserts. I know
10 the Speaker even put in his, ah, his annual address
11 acknowledging the communities that still do not have
12 a subway, like mine, and we border Nassau County, and
13 that's how far away we are from the city, and so it
14 is not a privilege, it is our right, that we must
15 drive. So I take some of the comments that were made
16 today about the privilege of driving. No, I have no
17 other way of getting into that, into the city. So if
18 someone wants to build that train into my district
19 we'll be happy to take it. If somebody wants to
20 expand the MTA buses so I can get onto those buses
21 we'll happily take it. Until that day comes we will
22 continue to advocate for sharing the streets safely
23 for everyone. So with that I vote aye on everything.
24 I abstain on 1541-B and no on 1557-A. Thank you,
25 Speaker.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
5 explain my vote?

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
7 granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you. I
9 just want to say in particular congratulations to
10 Council Member Reynoso, who has been incredibly
11 determined and dogged in his desire to see justice
12 prevail here, and I have great respect for him and,
13 ah, while there are so many important things we are
14 voting for today, ah, Speaker Johnson's initiative is
15 something that I could not be prouder to vote for.
16 It will save lives. Ah, it is visionary. It is
17 needed and incredibly, incredibly forward-thinking.
18 So very, very proud to vote for that in particular,
19 but all, other things on the agenda, I vote aye on
20 all.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,
24 may I be excused to explain my vote?
25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very
5 much. This, ah, I rise on Intro 1557, um, a very
6 commendable, very laudable bill and I congratulate
7 the speaker. He put in an enormous amount of time.
8 The members of this council who worked very hard to
9 get this to the right place. The goals are laudable.
10 The department shall prioritize and promote the
11 safety of all street users, on street priority for
12 mass transit, reduction of emissions, access of
13 individuals with disabilities. It provides for a
14 plan with X number of, ah, protected bike lanes. I
15 think that's a great idea. I don't think the city
16 should ever build a bike lane that isn't a protected
17 bike lane. There are too many people being killed in
18 our city, some of them in my district over the last
19 couple of months, a young child a few weeks ago, um,
20 a bicyclist on Coney Island Avenue about two or three
21 months ago during the summer. This plan is great
22 because it has great goals. But it has a false
23 metrics of X miles to be done with Y, but it doesn't
24 say that these are the criteria by which we determine
25 where these miles are built. Why not require that

2 every bike lane be protected and that no bike lane
3 which is not protected be built? This plan doesn't
4 do that. Why not establish here by this council how
5 and where and in what form and with actual criteria
6 of need and use lanes ought to be established instead
7 of a blank number of miles per year? It's a blank
8 check. And that means ultimately we're turning over
9 our authority to a couple of bureaucrats, a bunch of
10 bureaucrats, and they're going to decide what to do,
11 where to do it, how to do it, to get to that number
12 because now it's a magic number. Not a plan for this
13 is what needs a bike lane, this is what doesn't, this
14 is where it ought to be, this is where it oughtn't.
15 For that reason, I'm going to vote no on 1557. And I
16 want to just say, I want my child, who is a biker, a
17 bicyclist, to be safe. I want every child in the
18 city to be safe. I don't believe this bill gets us
19 to that place and I think it could be better. Thank
20 you. I vote aye on all, Madam President, with the
21 exception, as I said, Intro 1557. And also with the
22 exception of Intro 1541, 1574, 1202, 1307, 1425. I
23 abstain on Resolution 1141 and that's it for now.
24 Thank you very much, Madam President.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to
4 explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, um, I just
8 wanted to say, I just want to touch upon first, ah,
9 1557. Ah, there's seven million car, ah, people in
10 New York City that own cars and I'm proud to say that
11 I'm not one of them. Um, I was a motorist for over
12 30 years and I never thought I'll ever use mass
13 transit and give up my vehicle. Um, I live in a
14 district where many or most people rely on their cars
15 and after giving up my personal vehicle seven months
16 ago I am now a proud transit rider. I reduced my
17 driving to more than 50%. Our streets, um,
18 especially in southern Brooklyn, are congested and
19 many people in my district rely on the vehicles to do
20 car pool, to get the kids to school, ah, to go
21 shopping, and, um, and I, I definitely encourage
22 those who own vehicles if they could get out of their
23 cars even once a week or once a month to use mass
24 transit and to reinvest that money into our transit
25 system, opposed to using their cars and reduce

2 congestions, congestion, on our streets. That would
3 be a, a, great opportunity, ah, for southern
4 Brooklyn, in my, especially in my district. Um, my
5 concern, um, the intent of the bill is amazing and
6 the speaker worked very hard on, on this master plan.
7 But I, I personally, I don't trust government. I
8 had, ah, certain implementations in my district where
9 it's still not done and it's more than a year, and I
10 have no confidence in our administration when it
11 comes to implementing and partnering with community
12 boards and listening to elected officials who know
13 their district best. No, nobody wants to see any
14 crashes, any fatalities, anywhere in our city. But
15 if we all work together as one and working on these
16 issues, then I think we could get a lot done. I just
17 got a bike lane in my district that's totally
18 unprotected. It's a shared bike lane with vehicles.
19 I live on a bike lane. I live on an unprotected bike
20 lane. And I'm willing to work, to continue working
21 with the Department of Transportation on plans to
22 connect our, our bicyclists in southern Brooklyn, and
23 with that I'm going to vote no on 1557, no on 1541,
24 ah, no on Intro 1574, 379, 1378, and Reso 798, and
25 aye on the rest.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
3 Council Member Deutsch. Again, quiet in the chamber.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to
9 explain my vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you,
13 Majority Leader. Today we sent a terrible message to
14 our small business owners. While we always discussed
15 the importance that they bring to our city, the tax
16 base and the employment that they are, the message
17 that we've given our small businesses today is we
18 hear you, but again we'll do what's in your best
19 interest because we know best. Bill 1574, I
20 wholeheartedly believe, will be revisited in the
21 future when we realize we created a monopoly. The
22 entire borough of the Bronx under this bill will be
23 allowed to provide one carter. Decades ago we
24 removed organized crime successfully from the carting
25 business. What we just did is empowered Wall Street

2 publicly traded companies to take over the entire
3 carting industry for New York City. It will allow
4 two to possibly three carters to control this entire
5 market, undermining the very existence of our small
6 businesses by putting another burden on them. The
7 same businesses that we always strive to protect.
8 Women, minority-owned businesses, and if that wasn't
9 enough we could have done more by just providing and
10 mandating eco-friendly electric hybrid vehicles be
11 used. We could have given worker protections and
12 mandated that they have all of the protections that
13 are needed to make sure that our workers are
14 protected. It is a sad day for New York City and I
15 know we're going to regret this day, and I know that
16 this bill will be looked at in the future and
17 revised. I vote no on 1574-A. On Resolution 379-A,
18 meatless Mondays, I would support marijuana-less
19 Mondays, cigarette-less Mondays, drugless Mondays, or
20 any other Monday that would protect the more than
21 four people a day that die to drug overdoses.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
23 Council Member.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I abstain on
25 1557. I am part of a lawsuit that challenges the DOT

2 does not peg cars against motorists and bikes. A
3 Morris Park corridor connects two of the largest
4 investments in New York City [inaudible]...

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
6 Council Member Gjonaj.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I, I ask to
8 continue, briefly.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Briefly, but
10 please bring your remarks to a close.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: One hundred
12 businesses on Morris Park Avenue have been undermined
13 with a truck delivery zone that only of those
14 businesses could use, making it impossible for those
15 businesses to survive, undermining again the
16 existence of a commercial corridor. That corridor is
17 going to connect two Metro North stations. It's
18 going to connect the Morris Park Metro North Station
19 and Parkchester. The community asked that we wait,
20 let's do a feasibility study before you implement
21 this Vision Zero plan and DOT's response was no, we
22 know best. Well, I'm sorry to say government does
23 not know best. And community input...

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
25 Council Member Gjonaj.

1 STATED MEETING

111

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Falls on deaf
3 ears. I also vote no on Resolution 798. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
5 Council Member Gjonaj.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: On this historic day I
10 proudly vote aye on everything on our agenda.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
12 Council Member Johnson. And I just want to remind
13 the body that we are counting all of the votes. It's
14 going to take a moment. So I need everyone to please
15 remain seated in order for us to remain and to have
16 quorum. [pause] OK, Quiet in the chamber.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please, sit down.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All items on
19 today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote
20 of 48 in the affirmative, zero negative, and zero
21 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1425-A,
22 which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the affirmative
23 and 11 negative, zero abstentions. Intro 1557-A,
24 which was adopted by a vote of 35 affirmative, 10
25 negative, and 2 abstentions. [03:37:43 Transcriber's

2 Note: Revised vote for INT 1557-A is 37 affirmative,
3 9 negative, 2 abstentions. Intro 1574-A was adopted
4 by a vote of 35 in the affirmative, 13 negative, and
5 zero abstentions. [03:37:50 Transcriber's Note:
6 Revised vote for INT 1574-A is 34 affirmative, 14
7 negative, no abstentions.] Intro 1541-B, which was
8 adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative, 7
9 negative, and 1 abstentions. Intro 1082-A, which was
10 adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1
11 negative, and zero abstentions. Intro 1202-A, which
12 was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 5
13 negative, and zero abstentions. Intro 1378-A, quiet
14 in the chamber, which was adopted by a vote of 42 in
15 the affirmative, 6 negative, and zero abstentions.
16 Resolution 1141, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in
17 the affirmative, zero negative, and 1 abstentions.
18 The revised land use call-up vote is 48 in the
19 affirmative and zero negative. Thank you again for
20 your patience. We will now go into the introduction
21 and reading of bills.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
23 referred to committees as indicated on today's
24 agenda.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
3 will now move into the discussion [loud cheering].
4 Thank you, quiet in the chamber. Congratulations to
5 all of you. Thank you for being here for this Stated
6 Meeting.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: But again we have
9 to remind you that we need quiet in the chamber.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We need, we need to
11 keep quorum because as Council Member Gjonaj said, we
12 have a meatless Monday's resolution to vote on.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: That's right
14 [chuckles]. We also have four resolutions that need
15 to be discussed today. Are there any members who
16 wish to speak on any of today's resolutions, other
17 than Council Member Helen Rosenthal? Seeing no other,
18 I now call on Council Member Helen Rosenthal and,
19 again, quiet in the chamber.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you,
21 Majority Leader Cumbo. You know, the phrase meatless
22 Mondays perhaps brings mockery, um, and, ah, so let's
23 talk about the seriousness of what and why meatless
24 Mondays matter so much, right? The highest cause of
25 death among men and women in the United States is

2 heart disease. The largest cause of heart disease is
3 eating meat. So by taking out one day of the week
4 from eating meat, encouraging people not to eat meat
5 one day of the week, cardiologists have said this
6 will decrease heart disease by 15%. That's not a
7 joke. Having a plant-based diet...

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Please continue.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'll wrap it
10 up quickly. But 30% of the, um, carbon monoxide,
11 carbon, ah, monoxide released into the air comes from
12 the caring of the millions of, ah, animals who we
13 eat. If we move to a plant-based diet climate change
14 would slow down. That's not a joke. So as a, ah, a
15 very proud plant-based diet eater I am grateful to my
16 colleagues, grateful to the speaker, for voting yes
17 on this resolution. Thank you very much.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
19 much, Council Member Rosenthal and congratulations.
20 Do we have any other members that wish to speak? If
21 no other members have signed up to discuss today's
22 resolution I will now read them onto the record.
23 Members who wish to vote against or abstain on
24 today's resolution should register your vote with the
25 clerk at the dais. Resolution 379, resolution to

2 recognize meatless Monday in New York City. All in
3 favor say aye. [chorus of ayes] All opposed.
4 Abstentions. The ayes have it. Resolution 798,
5 resolution calling upon the New York State
6 Legislature to pass and the governor to sign A6298-
7 S4234, an act to amend the Agriculture and Markets
8 Law and the General Business Law in relationship to
9 the sale of dogs, cats, and rabbits, all in favor say
10 aye. [chorus of ayes].

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Adopt, don't shop.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All opposed.
13 Abstentions. The ayes have it. Resolution 921,
14 resolution calling on the New York State Legislature
15 to pass and the governor to sign A.26, which would
16 provide a tax credit to each tax payer who adopts a
17 household pet from a shelter. All in favor say aye.
18 [chorus of ayes]. All opposed. Abstentions. The
19 ayes have it. Resolution calling on the United
20 States Congress to pass and the president to sign
21 HRA, 724, and S479, the Preventing Animal Cruelty
22 Torture Act, otherwise known as the PACT Act, and
23 this would be for Resolution 977, known as the PACT
24 Act. All in favor say aye. [chorus of ayes] All
25 opposed. Abstentions. The ayes have it. We will

2 now move into general discussion. I see no members
3 on the docket for general discussion. But I would
4 like to recognize today is also the last day of Corey
5 Ortega, the director of the Black, Latino, and Asian
6 Caucus, who will be moving on to Delta Consulting as
7 the VP of government relations. He's also gotten
8 married this year and been recognized in 40 under 40.
9 We will miss him at the council but we know that he
10 will do well in all of his endeavors. [applause]
11 Thank you so much to Corey Ortega. And
12 congratulations. This has been a phenomenal year
13 for you. I'll now turn it over to Speaker Corey
14 Johnson to close out this meeting.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: On this historic day
16 for animals, for having safer streets, for totally
17 reorientating how we collect garbage in New York
18 City, on this very, very big historic day I proudly
19 say that the Stated Meeting of October 30, 2019, is
20 hereby adjourned.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.
22 Congratulations to everyone. [applause and cheers]
23 [gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

117

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 22, 2019