

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

November 13, 2019
Start: 10:33 a.m.
Recess: 10:47 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: I. DANEEK MILLER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
DANIEL DROMM
FARAH N. LOUIS
FRANCISCO P. MOYA
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
ERIC A. ULRICH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Good morning ladies and gentlemen. I am Council Member I. Daneek Miller and I am the Chair of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor. Two reasons why we are here today, we will be hearing and examining automation and it's impact on New York City workforce and so I think that we, we, we want to jump into that and it's going to be quite interesting as we look at some of the impacts of what we've seen on technology and, and the workforce as we move forward and reexamine some of the things that we have seen over the past few years and see if we can come together with, with some new ideas and concepts that will enhance the quality of the workforce, the productivity and the work that is being done but before we do that we are going to be voting on a very important piece of legislation. Proposed, proposed Intro 1321C, it is about expanding the prevailing wage law for building service employees at the city development projects. The legislation will... which was introduced by Council Member Rafael Espinal, Junior. In New York State the prevailing wage law requires that contractors on state funded contracts, construction projects pay the

1 workers no less than the wage and benefits level
2 prevailing within the local construction market. This
3 law exists to protect the construction workers from
4 being undercut by low wage often out of state
5 contractors bidding for large government construction
6 contracts and ultimately ensuring that jobs and
7 working conditions for our local residents. A number
8 of studies show that prevailing wage laws contrary to
9 what it's critics say attract to hire... attract and
10 hire the industry's most productive workers with the
11 most advanced technology and equipment, protect the
12 blue collar middle class, increases the skilled to
13 the lower skilled workers through promotion of on the
14 job training and apprenticeships and lower... and it
15 also lowers fatal and non-fatal injury rates in
16 construction statewide. Proposed Intro 1321C will
17 expand this law, this bill would require that the
18 payment of prevailing to building service employees
19 in buildings where a private developer receives at
20 least one million dollars in discretionary financial
21 assistance from the city or city economic development
22 entity for the city development project. The proposed
23 bill would cover additional developers and projects
24 removing them from the exemption in the prevailing
25

1 wage law for affordable housing and the not for
2 profit developer's residential projects. Building
3 service workers in most residential projects with 120
4 units or more receiving financial assistance for new
5 construction or preservation would be required to pay
6 a prevailing wage. The bill would however exempt
7 smaller residential projects with less than 120
8 units, certain supportive housing projects, deeply
9 affordable, preservation projects and NYCHA projects
10 financed through the federal rental assistance
11 demonstration program. This past June the Committee
12 held a hearing to hear a number of pieces of
13 legislation; proposition 1321C was heard. At that
14 time, it was proposed as 1321A. As we took into
15 consideration the testimony that we had heard... that
16 we heard at that time and that we are hearing we
17 amended the bill in order to ensure that the
18 legislation would have an overall benefit greater
19 than the possibilities and its shortcomings. So, be,
20 be, before we bring this to a vote, I just want to
21 say that I've read recently some of the critics that
22 said that prevailing wage amongst service workers
23 would undermine the affordable housing industry. I'm...
24 I would submit that they're not mutually exclusive
25

1 that we can provide dignity, respect and fair
2 compensation for workers at the same time ensuring
3 that we continue to grow our affordable housing
4 market. Therefore, I would urge my colleagues as I am
5 to vote yes on this legislation. I'd also like to
6 thank my staff for helping to put this together Ali
7 Rasoulinejad, Brandon Clarke, Joe Goldbloom, as well
8 as committee staff Malcolm Newshat [sp?], Kevin and
9 Kendall. Bill?

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: William Martin,
12 Committee Clerk, roll call vote, Committee on Civil
13 and Service Labor, Introduction 1321C, Chair Miller?

14 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: I vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Proud to be a co-
19 sponsor on this bill, I proudly vote aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Louis?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: By a vote of
23 four in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no
24 abstentions the item has been adopted by the
25 Committee.

2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you, we'll,
3 we'll hold the vote open and we'll take a moment to
4 kind of transition over and then we can begin the
5 hearing.

6 [gavel]

7 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, here we go
8 again, once again. I'm Council Member I. Daneek
9 Miller and I'm the Chair...

10 [off mic dialogue]

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: The final vote
12 on Introduction 1321C is adopted by the Committee,
13 four in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no
14 abstentions.

15 [off mic dialogue]

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: No... I'm going to
17 close this hearing. Alright, the vote is now closed.

18 [gavel]

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

November 19, 2019