Staff:

James DiGiovanni, Counsel

Elliott Lynn, Counsel

Emily Rooney, Policy Analyst

Rick Arbelo, Policy Analyst

Chima Obichere, Finance Analyst

John Basile, Finance Analyst

****

**THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

COMMITTEE REPORT OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE DIVISION

Jeffrey T. Baker, Legislative Director

**COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION**

Hon. Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair

**October 29, 2019**

**PROPOSED INT. NO. 1557-A:** By The Speaker (Council Member Johnson) and Council Members Rivera, Rodriguez, Levine, Reynoso, Constantinides, Rosenthal, Cumbo, Powers, Chin, Treyger, Lander, Van Bramer, Richards, Cohen, Dromm, Kallos, Salamanca, Levin, Cornegy, Ampry-Samuel, Menchaca, Cabrera, Espinal and the Public Advocate (Mr. Williams)

**TITLE:** A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to five-year plans for city streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces

**ADMINISTRATIVE CODE:** Adds new § 19-199.1 to subchapter 3 of ch. 1 of title 19.

**INTRODUCTION**

On October 29, 2019, the Committee on Transportation, chaired by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez, will hold a hearing on Proposed Int. No. 1557-A, a local law in relation to five-year plans for City streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces. This is the second hearing on this item. The first hearing on Int. No. 1557 was held on June 12, 2019, at which the Committee heard testimony from the Department of Transportation (DOT), advocates, and other interested stakeholders.

**BACKGROUND**

**Comprehensive Transit Planning**

Six thousand miles of roadways and 12,750 miles of sidewalks knit New York City together, connecting over eight million New Yorkers, 60 million annual visitors, and hundreds of thousands more commuters to business districts, tourist attractions, and neighborhoods across the City.[[1]](#footnote-1) DOT has broad control over the City’s transportation infrastructure and street space and is responsible for installing street safety treatments such as bike lanes, medians, and intersection redesigns.[[2]](#footnote-2) DOT also partners with the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) in siting of bus stops and installs bus infrastructure such as bus lanes, bus priority treatments, and shelters.

The City uses a wide array of treatments to improve street safety, increase access for persons with disabilities, and encourage use of mass transit; however, these improvements to the City’s streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces are done piecemeal. Long-term planning is not conducted, leaving communities without a sense of the importance of an individual project and how it helps to improve conditions citywide.

In 2019, New York City Council Speaker Corey Johnson, called for integrated transit planning in his State of the City speech and accompanying report, *Let’s Go: A Case for Municipal Control and a Comprehensive Transportation Vision for the Five Boroughs.* Proposed Int. No. 1557-A would require that the City create a plan for streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces every five years. The plan would prioritize and promote the safety of pedestrians and bicyclists, access to and the use of mass transit, the reduction of traffic congestion and emissions, and improved access to streets, sidewalks, public spaces, and mass transit for individuals with reduced mobility, hearing, or visual impairment. DOT would be required to achieve specific benchmarks for street redesigns, protected bus lanes, protected bicycle lanes, bicycle parking, pedestrian spaces, commercial loading zones, truck routes, and parking.

***Street Safety and Pedestrian Spaces***

New York City has 12,750 miles of sidewalks, 74 pedestrian plazas, more than 30,000 acres of parkland, and it is often cited as the most walkable city in the world.[[3]](#footnote-3) Between 2009 and 2015, pedestrian traffic increased by 36 percent in the Bronx, 165 percent in Queens Plaza, and 293 percent on the Hudson River Greenway, with Old Fulton Street seeing the largest percentage increase in the City at the north entrance to Brooklyn Bridge Park in Dumbo.[[4]](#footnote-4) Between 2009 and 2015, the number of pedestrians increased by 18 percent on weekdays and 31 percent on the weekends citywide.[[5]](#footnote-5)

As pedestrian volume is increasing, the City is also seeing an increase in the use of vehicles. In 2005, there were 1,672,758 registered vehicles in New York City. By the end of 2017, there were 1,923,041 cars registered to City residents.[[6]](#footnote-6) For-hire vehicle services have also exploded in popularity. The number of daily Uber and Lyft trips grew from 60,000 in 2015 to 600,000 in 2018, while daily mass transit ridership declined by 580,000.[[7]](#footnote-7)

Vision Zero

In order to reduce the likelihood of crashes and improve safety for pedestrians and individuals using bicycles, DOT has a toolkit of street redesign features that are meant to, among other things, change driving behavior and increase pedestrian and cyclist visibility. In 2018, DOT completed a total of 139 projects, 97 of which were located at Vision Zero priority locations, increasing the total number of projects since the start of Vision Zero to 495.[[8]](#footnote-8) According to the City’s Vision Zero Year 5 Report, these “engineering projects took a variety of forms in 2018,” including pedestrian plazas, protected bike lanes, pedestrian islands, and raised crosswalks.[[9]](#footnote-9)

 After identifying 293 Priority Intersections (one percent of the City’s 46,959 intersections) and 424 miles of Priority Corridors (seven percent of the 5,791 miles citywide) based on the numbers of pedestrians killed or seriously injured, 90 percent of those intersections and 86 percent of those corridor miles received treatments.[[10]](#footnote-10) These interventions led to a 36 percent drop in pedestrian deaths at those locations.[[11]](#footnote-11)

However, after years of decreasing numbers of serious crashes, the number of deaths from traffic related crashes has increased in 2019 with 85 pedestrian fatalities and 26 cycling fatalities.[[12]](#footnote-12) In calendar year 2018, there were 10 cycling fatalities reported in the city, the lowest number since 2013 when there were 12.[[13]](#footnote-13)

Shared Streets

Over the last decade, the City has designed and implemented additional programs that increase pedestrian space, both short term pilot and permanent programs, these include DOT’s Summer Streets & Weekend Walks and DOT’s Shared Streets initiative. Modeled on events that happen all across the globe, Summer Streets closes off streets to vehicle traffic along seven miles of roadways in Manhattan on three consecutive Saturdays in August.[[14]](#footnote-14) Weekend Walks expanded that concept, to 123 multi-block events spanning all across the City in 2018.[[15]](#footnote-15)

A “shared street” is designed for slow travel speeds where pedestrians, cyclists, and motorists all share the right of way.[[16]](#footnote-16) DOT’s Shared Streets initiative began as a temporary, neighborhood-scale approach to prioritizing pedestrians in the public right of way. Shared Streets were not entirely unprecedented, with areas like South Street Seaport and Jamaica, Queens prioritizing pedestrians and cyclists in the public right of way.[[17]](#footnote-17) In August 2016, the City tried the first scaled-up Shared Streets event in the Financial District, where DOT limited car traffic on a 60-block section for five hours on a Saturday.[[18]](#footnote-18) NYPD put up barriers along the edge of the neighborhood with officers on hand to let vehicles through, aided by temporary five mile per hour speed limit signs, giving pedestrians and cyclists priority in the public right of way.[[19]](#footnote-19) In 2017, DOT tested out the idea again in Chinatown from 5pm to 9pm on the first three Fridays in August.[[20]](#footnote-20)



*Shared Street Broadway and 24th St, Manhattan*

The Administration recently announced that it will examine options for creating new pedestrian spaces in Lower Manhattan, where streets are narrow and sidewalks can be overcrowded.[[21]](#footnote-21) According to DOT, the agency will work with communities in the Financial District to identify potential locations.[[22]](#footnote-22)

***Accessibility***

Accessible pedestrian signals (APS) are devices fixed to pedestrian signal poles to assist the blind or low vision pedestrians crossing the street.[[23]](#footnote-23) Currently, 371 intersections have APS installed.[[24]](#footnote-24) This means just 2.4 percent of the City’s 12,000 intersections with pedestrian signals are accessible.[[25]](#footnote-25) The baseline cost to install APS on existing infrastructure is a little over $8,800 per intersection.[[26]](#footnote-26) Advocates have asserted that while New York City has replaced all of its pedestrian signals at least once since 2000, including the installation of countdown clocks in at least 7,500 intersections since 2006, it has generally only installed APS at 75 intersections per year.[[27]](#footnote-27) In 2012, the Council passed a local law requiring APS units be installed at 25 intersections per year.[[28]](#footnote-28) The Council subsequently increased the pace of installation to 75 intersections per year, beginning in 2016.[[29]](#footnote-29) In 2018, DOT announced that it would install APS at 150 intersections annually in 2019 and 2020.[[30]](#footnote-30)

***Bicycling***

The popularity of bicycling in New York City is growing faster than both the City’s economy and population, at a pace twice as fast as in other U.S. cities between 2010 and 2015.[[31]](#footnote-31) During that period, the City saw significant increases in bike commuters.[[32]](#footnote-32) DOT and the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH) estimate that over 460,000 cycling trips are made in the City daily, which is about triple the amount of trips taken 14 years ago.[[33]](#footnote-33) In 2017, 828,000 New Yorkers rode a bicycle regularly, roughly 140,000 more than just five years ago.[[34]](#footnote-34) Nearly a quarter of New Yorkers, 1.6 million, rode a bicycle at least once in 2017.[[35]](#footnote-35)

As of December 2018, there were roughly 1,217 miles of bike lanes in New York City,[[36]](#footnote-36) up from roughly half that in 2006.[[37]](#footnote-37) According to DOT, the City had installed 119.5 miles of on-street protected bike lanes as of December 2018, triple what it was in 2014.[[38]](#footnote-38) However, the Administration fell short of its goal to install 30 miles of protected bike lanes in 2018 by almost 10 miles, completing just 20.9 miles over the course of the year.[[39]](#footnote-39)

The National Association of City Transportation Officials defines a protected bike lane as one that offers “physical protection from passing traffic” in the form of “a parking lane or other barrier between the cycle track and the motor vehicle travel lane.”[[40]](#footnote-40) The City’s definition of a “protected” bike lane has recently been brought into question, making it difficult to track the Administration’s progress on building this infrastructure. Streetsblog recently reported that nearly a quarter of the City’s “protected” bike lanes installed in 2018 lacked such a physical barrier, offering cyclists “just green paint and prayer.”[[41]](#footnote-41) DOT responded to that criticism with the following statement: “a protected bike lane is a path intended for the use of bicycles that is physically separated from motorized vehicle traffic by an open space, vertical delineation, or barrier.”[[42]](#footnote-42) At 119 miles, these protected bike lanes cover barely two percent of the City’s street grid.[[43]](#footnote-43)

Cycling Safety

A comprehensive report released by DOT in 2017 revealed that between 2006 and 2014, 3,395 cyclists were either killed or severely injured; 89 percent of cyclist fatalities occurred on streets without bicycle facilities, like bike lanes.[[44]](#footnote-44) Research demonstrates that physically separated bike lanes improve bike safety and can reduce instances of cyclist injuries and death.[[45]](#footnote-45) A 2014 DOT report on protected bike lanes found a 74 percent decrease in average risk to a cyclist, a 22 percent reduction in pedestrian industries, a 17 percent reduction in crashes with injuries, increased travel times and even increased retail sales along corridors with protected lanes.[[46]](#footnote-46)

**Protected v. Conventional Bike Lane Miles est. 2009-2018[[47]](#footnote-47)**

****

Another report from 2014 found that protected bike lanes increased ridership anywhere from 21 to 171 percent, with about ten percent of new rides drawn from other modes.[[48]](#footnote-48) According to Transportation Alternatives’ BikeNYC 2020 survey, two-thirds of the City’s riders said they would ride more frequently if the City installed more protected bike lanes.[[49]](#footnote-49) Of those respondents who had never ridden a bicycle in New York, but would not rule out trying in the future, 80 percent cited fear of drivers as a reason why they have not started riding yet, and 67 percent mentioned the lack of protected bike lanes making them feel unsafe.[[50]](#footnote-50) Research has also consistently shown that women, in particular, are more likely to ride in areas that are connected to bike lanes or greenways, physically separated from traffic.[[51]](#footnote-51)

Bike infrastructure can also be a cost-efficient way to improve public health outcomes. A Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health study found that the 45.5 miles of the City’s bike lanes built in 2015 likely increased the probability of riding a bicycle by nine percent.[[52]](#footnote-52) The research team’s model then determined that over the lifetime of all residents, bike lane construction produced additional costs of only $2.79 per person while improving public health outcomes even for those who do not ride, making bicycle infrastructure more cost-effective in improving health than many other preventive approaches.[[53]](#footnote-53) According to another study, building bike infrastructure in low-income communities of color can also reduce health inequities.[[54]](#footnote-54) Vision Zero improvements have been largely concentrated in wealthier neighborhoods, particular in Manhattan, leaving most communities of color throughout the City without this critical infrastructure.[[55]](#footnote-55)

As mentioned, cycling fatalities have increased in 2019. In an effort to address cycling fatalities and to further increase cycling safety, on July 25, 2019 the Mayor announced the release of the “Green Wave” Bicycle Plan (Green Wave report).[[56]](#footnote-56) The plan would cost the city approximately $58 million over 5 years to implement[[57]](#footnote-57) and focuses on increasing the city’s network of protected bike lanes with the goal of having a fully connected network by the year 2030.[[58]](#footnote-58)

Additionally, the Green Wave report spells out the plans that the city has for the 10 neighborhoods in Brooklyn and Queens that were designated in 2017 by DOT as Bike Priority Districts. These 10 districts were chosen due to the high number of cycling fatalities in those areas and because they lacked an inadequate amount of dedicated protected bike lanes.[[59]](#footnote-59) In these 10 districts, the city plans to install more than 20 miles of protected bike lanes by the end of 2019, with a stated goal of installing 75 miles of protected bike lanes by the end of 2022.[[60]](#footnote-60)

DOT also plans to increase cycling safety by reducing the number of speeding cars by installing additional traffic calming treatments at 50 intersections throughout the city with a history of a high number of bike injuries in 2019.[[61]](#footnote-61) Some of the measures that DOT utilizes to calm traffic include installing raised speed reducers like speed bumps and speed cushions, narrowing or removing lanes, extending or expanding a curb, installing traffic diverters and median barriers, and utilizing raised crossings that enhance visibility.[[62]](#footnote-62)

***Buses***

Although hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers—in particular low-income residents and those living in the outer borough—rely on bus service every day, bus ridership has been declining due in large part to slow service. Between 2012 and 2018, bus ridership declined by nearly 15 percent.[[63]](#footnote-63) In the first half of 2018, ridership fell by another 5.36 percent.[[64]](#footnote-64) The MTA estimates that bus ridership will continue to decline through at least 2022.[[65]](#footnote-65) DOT’s responsibility for the City’s streets and sidewalks directly impacts bus speed. In addition, DOT has the ability to impact the quality of bus service through the siting of bus stops and installation of bus shelters.

Buses are operated by two distinct component agencies of the MTA: New York City Transit (NYCT), which includes most bus routes, and the MTA Bus Company.[[66]](#footnote-66) In 2018, NYCT President Andy Byford called for a full redesign of the entire bus network by 2021.[[67]](#footnote-67) In some cases, this would include all-door boarding with the New Fare Payment System (NFPS) that will allow riders to “tap and go,” expanding off-peak service, and improved customer experience measures including new bus maps, real time passenger information (RTPI) and digital information screens.[[68]](#footnote-68)

Select Bus Service (SBS) was first introduced in 2008 and is New York City’s version of bus rapid transit (BRT). With roots in Brazil in the 1970s, BRT is a bus system designed to increase speed and reliability compared to traditional local bus service by treating buses more like rail systems, utilizing completely dedicated rights-of-way and other features, such as raised platforms.[[69]](#footnote-69) The MTA and DOT incorporate features of BRT to various extents when introducing a new SBS route in New York, including off-board fare payment and all-door boarding, less frequent stops, dedicated, marked bus lanes, traffic signal priority (TSP), and distinctive branding.

However, a criticism of SBS is that it does not go far enough and therefore is not a “true” BRT system. Similarly, a frequent criticism of bus service is the slow speed.[[70]](#footnote-70) According to a 2018 report, of the nine routes implemented prior to 2016, five experienced a ridership decline in comparison to the year prior to implementation when those routes operated as local or limited service, reducing ridership by 0.2 percent in total.[[71]](#footnote-71) The report attributes this failure to poor implementation, design flaws, poor maintenance, oversight, and enforcement.[[72]](#footnote-72)

Since 2008, 18 SBS routes have opened on 16 corridors, and the M14A and the M14D routes opened in June 2019.[[73]](#footnote-73) Bus lanes and street design, better enforcement, and TSP can all be implemented by the City, but the implementation of SBS routes requires close coordination with NYCT. In 2018, NYCT announced SBS expansion would be on hold because of budget constraints.[[74]](#footnote-74)

Bus Improvements

As of June 2018, the City had installed roughly 120 miles of bus lanes.[[75]](#footnote-75) Fifteen miles of bus lanes were added between 2017 and 2018’s progress reports.[[76]](#footnote-76) Historically, DOT has implemented two primary types of bus lanes: “curbside lanes,” where parking and standing at the curb is not permitted and “offset bus lanes,” which are one lane away from the curb, and therefore allow for curbside parking and standing.[[77]](#footnote-77) All of the City’s bus lanes have signs posted along the route and the lanes themselves are either marked “Bus Only” and/or painted red.[[78]](#footnote-78) Bus lanes only restrict traffic during certain hours of the day, and many offer midday hours where parking and deliveries are permitted.[[79]](#footnote-79)

*Transit Signal Priority*

TSP which shortens red lights for idling buses and extends green lights for approaching buses.[[80]](#footnote-80) City buses spend about 21 percent of their time stopped at red lights.[[81]](#footnote-81) DOT began implementing TSP in 2012 and now TSP is currently implemented at 594 intersections, with another 364 intersections under study by DOT.[[82]](#footnote-82) TSP is currently on 12 bus routes and DOT is studying another five routes out of 325 total bus routes (18 Select Bus Service routes, 235 local/limited routes, and 72 express bus routes).[[83]](#footnote-83) DOT anticipates that by the end of 2020 there will be TSP at 1,200 out of 7,850 intersections with a bus route (this figure excludes Midtown).[[84]](#footnote-84)

 *Enforcement*

In January 2019, Mayor Bill de Blasio announced a plan to increase bus speeds by 25 percent in his State of the City address.[[85]](#footnote-85) As part of the address, Mayor de Blasio committed to push the State Legislature for more camera enforcement along bus lanes and committed to increase the New York Police Department’s (NYPD) enforcement by dedicating seven tow truck teams for to enforce against vehicles blocking bus lanes.[[86]](#footnote-86) From January to April of 2019, police have towed 432 vehicles blocking bus lanes and ticketed 17,000 bus lane violators.[[87]](#footnote-87) State law only allows the city to use cameras on 16 routes, but currently only 13 routes have cameras.[[88]](#footnote-88)

*Bus Stop Amenities*

The City has 16,000 bus stops, but just 22 percent have shelters.[[89]](#footnote-89) The MTA has control over bus stop locations, but DOT is responsible for bus stop design and construction. In 2006, DOT entered into a 20-year contract with JCDecaux (formerly Cemusa) to own and manage bus shelters; accounting for advertisement space, the installation of these bus shelters raises revenue for the City.[[90]](#footnote-90) However, it is unclear how or whether DOT prioritizes spending and locational decisions for bus stop amenities. A 2018 TransitCenter report notes “the majority of new shelters replaced existing shelters, whose locations had been decided years ago.[[91]](#footnote-91) For the 200 additional shelters, DOT didn’t set criteria for prioritizing which stops should get a new shelter. Instead, the Department requested proposals from City Council Members and Community Boards, a stark contrast to St. Paul’s Metro Transit’s approach of asking the riders — the people with the most direct concern and knowledge.”[[92]](#footnote-92) The 2018 TransitCenter report found that real time passenger information (RTPI) is one of the most desired amenities by riders.[[93]](#footnote-93) At the time TransitCenter released its report, DOT had installed real-time information at 220 bus stops as of 2018 with a commitment to install 150 more of these signs by the end of 2018, a goal cited in NYCT’s Fast Forward plan (NYCT’s plan for modernizing the subway and bus system).[[94]](#footnote-94) Similar to bus shelters, the installation of RTPI is driven and funded primarily by local elected officials including City Council Members, State Assembly Members, and Borough Presidents.[[95]](#footnote-95) While the City Council’s funding and advocacy is largely responsible for the rollout of this useful infrastructure, this method of planning and funding infrastructure has caused disparities across the system.[[96]](#footnote-96)

*Better Bus Action Plan*

In April 2019, DOT released the *Better Bus Action Plan*, based on the Mayor’s commitments in his State of the City. The *Better Bus Action Plan* focuses on improving bus speeds rather than adding new routes, though DOT indicated in the report that they will work with the MTA to restart the SBS program.[[97]](#footnote-97) In order to increase bus speeds 25 percent by 2020, DOT will:

* Improve five miles of existing bus lanes per year;
* Install 10–15 miles of new bus lanes per year;
* Conduct a pilot up to 2 miles of physically separated bus lanes in 2019;
* In 2019, implement DOT street design projects that benefit 600,000 daily riders;
* Add 300 TSP intersections per year;
* Expand bus lane camera enforcement;
* Increased NYPD bus lane enforcement with seven dedicated tow truck teams; and
* Evaluate and improve bus stops.

DOT will pilot the two miles of physically separated bus lanes using concrete jersey barriers, rubber curbs, plastic bollards and concrete median curbs.[[98]](#footnote-98)

The Administration’s proposal was met with some criticism. One news outlet pointed out that DOT currently installs seven bus lanes per year, while the plan only includes 10-15 lane miles per year.[[99]](#footnote-99) DOT already committed to installing TSP at 1,000 intersections by 2020.[[100]](#footnote-100) Reports indicated that 300 per year commitment would only be an increase of 200 intersections but there are 12,000 signalized intersections in the City.[[101]](#footnote-101)  Similarly, while DOT will upgrade five miles of citywide bus lanes per year with various improvements, there are 111 miles of dedicated bus lanes.[[102]](#footnote-102)

**ANALYSIS OF PROPSED INT. NO. 1557-A**

 Section one of Proposed Int. No. 1557-A adds a new section 19-199.1 to subchapter 3 of chapter 1 of title 19 of the Administrative Code. Subdivision a of this new section defines the following terms:

* “Accessible pedestrian signal” is defined as a device that communicates information about pedestrian signal timing in a nonvisual format.
* “Bicycle network” is defined as a contiguous network of protected bicycle lanes, designated bicycle paths on bridges, off-street bicycle paths or trails, and shared streets. A bicycle network would be connected by intersections with mixing zones, fully split phases, delayed turns, offset crossing designs, or similar street treatments designed to improve safety and reduce conflicts for all street users at intersections.
* “Bicycle network connectivity index” is defined as a figure measuring the extent and completeness of the bicycle network, based on the number of choices a cyclist has for turning from one bicycle route onto another, without leaving the overall network.
* “Bicycle lane network coverage index” is defined as a numeric figure representing the percentage of residents of the city who reside within one mile of the bicycle lane network.
* “Bus stop upgrades” is defined as the addition to a bus stop of a bus shelter or bench and sign equipped with a system that conveys arrival times or other passenger information in real time.
* “Pedestrian space” is defined as a means an area for pedestrian circulation, use, or enjoyment including, but not limited to, pedestrian plazas, curb extensions, sidewalks, safety islands, shared streets, and triangles, and which may contain amenities such as tables, seating, trees, plants, lighting, bike racks, or public art.
* “Protected bicycle lane” is defined as a portion of a street or intersection that is designated for the exclusive use of bicycles and that is separated from motorized vehicle traffic by physical barriers, or is an off-road or raised pathway.
* “Protected bus lane” is defined as a bus lane that is protected by physical barriers or is monitored by stationary or mobile bus lane photo devices that automatically produce an image of any vehicle that violates a bus lane restriction at the time of such violation.
* “Shared street” is defined as a street designated by DOT with recommended speed limits of five miles per hour and that allows use by motor vehicles, pedestrians, and individuals using bicycles.
* “Transit signal priority” is defined as a technology capable of facilitating bus movements through intersections controlled by traffic signals.

Paragraph one of subdivision b would require DOT to issue and implement a master plan for the use of streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces every five years. In developing each such plan, the DOT would prioritize and promote: (i) the safety of all street users; (ii) on-street priority for mass transit vehicles; (iii) the reduction of vehicle emissions; and (iv) access for individuals with disabilities.

Paragraph two of subdivision b would state that by December 1, 2021 and by December 1 of every fifth year thereafter, DOT would issue such plan for the five-year period beginning January 1 of the following year.

Paragraph one of subdivision c would state that each master plan issued pursuant to subdivision b of this section would include proposals for street redesigns, protected bus lanes, protected bicycle lanes, bicycle parking, pedestrian spaces, commercial loading zones, truck routes, and parking, including the identification of specific routes, locations, or areas of the city for such proposals. In addition, each such master plan shall include benchmarks regarding such proposals that shall be achieved no later than December 31 of the final year of such plan.

Paragraph two of subdivision c would state that the master plan due by December 1, 2021, would include, at a minimum, the following benchmarks:

1. the installation of at least 150 miles of protected bus lanes, in coordination with the metropolitan transportation authority, with such lanes located along a median where feasible, with at least 20 miles of such lanes installed during the first year of such plan and at least 30 miles installed during each subsequent year of such plan;
2. the implementation of transit signal priority in at least 750 intersections along bus routes during the first year of such plan and at least 1,000 intersections during each subsequent year of such plan or until transit signal priority is implemented in every intersection where such installation is feasible along every bus route where buses capable of utilizing transit signal priority are operated;
3. the installation of at least 250 miles of protected bicycle lanes, with at least 30 miles of such lanes installed during the first year of such plan and at least 50 miles installed during each subsequent year of such plan;
4. the implementation of bus stop upgrades at no fewer than 500 bus stops serving buses operated by the MTA during each such year of such plan;
5. the redesign of at least 2,000 intersections with a pedestrian signal pursuant to the checklist required by section 19-182.2, with at least 400 such intersections redesigned during each year of such plan;
6. the installation of accessible pedestrian signals at no fewer than 2,500 intersections, with installation of such signals at no fewer than 500 intersections during each year of such plan;
7. the assessment and amendments to commercial loading zones, truck routes, and related areas to support freight movement and curb access citywide;
8. the development of parking policies to prioritize and promote: (1) safety of all street users; (2) on-street priority of mass transit vehicles; (3) reduction of vehicle emissions; and (4) access to streets, sidewalks, public spaces, and mass transit for individuals with disabilities; and

(ix) no later than December 31, 2023, the creation and maintenance of no less than 1,000,000 square feet of pedestrian space.

Paragraph three of subdivision c would state that the master plan due no later than December 1, 2026, shall include the following benchmarks:

1. the completion of a connected bicycle network and ensure a bicycle lane network coverage index of 100 percent;
2. the installation of protected bus lanes on all bus routes where such improvements can be installed;
3. the installation of accessible pedestrian signals at no fewer than 2,500 intersections, with installation of such signals at no fewer than 500 intersections during each year of such plan;
4. the implementation of bus stop upgrades at all bus stops serving buses operated by the MTA where such upgrades are feasible; and
5. the redesign of at least 2,000 intersections with a pedestrian signal pursuant to the checklist required by section 19-182.2, with at least 400 such intersections redesigned during each year of such plan; and

(vi) the installation of or upgrade of pedestrian ramps at no fewer than 3,000 intersection corners.

Paragraph one of subdivision d would require DOT to submit such plan by December 1, 2021 and by December 1 of every fifth year thereafter, to the mayor and the speaker of the council, and post such plan on the DOT’s website.

Paragraph two of subdivision d would require that by February 1, 2023 and by each February 1 thereafter, DOT submit to the mayor and the speaker of the council and post on the department’s website an update regarding any changes to the plan from the previous year, the bicycle lane network coverage index, and the status of the implementation of each benchmark identified in such plan, including but not limited to those benchmarks listed in subdivision c. Such information would include a data set containing data on geographic feature boundaries, as represented by points, lines, or polygons. In addition, each report due beginning February 1, 2028 would include the bicycle connectivity index for the previous year.

Subdivision e would mandate that DOT conduct a public education campaign regarding the benefits of each master plan, including, but not limited to, the impacts on safety, the environment, accessibility, mobility, and the city’s economy.

Section two of Proposed Int. No. 1557-A would provide that this local law takes effect immediately.

Proposed Int. No. 1557-A

By The Speaker (Council Member Johnson) and Council Members Rivera, Rodriguez, Levine, Reynoso, Constantinides, Rosenthal, Cumbo, Powers, Chin, Treyger, Lander, Van Bramer, Richards, Cohen, Dromm, Kallos, Salamanca, Levin, Cornegy, Ampry-Samuel, Menchaca, Cabrera, Espinal and the Public Advocate (Mr. Williams)

A LOCAL LAW

To amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to five-year plans for city streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Subchapter 3 of chapter 1 of title 19 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended by adding a new section 19-199.1 to read as follows:

§ 19-199.1 Master plan. a. Definitions. For the purposes of this section, the following terms have the following meanings:

Accessible pedestrian signal. The term “accessible pedestrian signal” means a device that communicates information about pedestrian signal timing in a nonvisual format.

Bicycle network. The term “bicycle network” means a contiguous network of protected bicycle lanes, designated bicycle paths on bridges, off-street bicycle paths or trails, and shared streets. A bicycle network shall be connected by intersections with mixing zones, fully split phases, delayed turns, offset crossing designs, or similar street treatments designed to improve safety and reduce conflicts for all street users at intersections.

Bicycle network connectivity index. The term “bicycle network connectivity index” means a figure measuring the extent and completeness of the bicycle network, based on the number of choices a cyclist has for turning from one bicycle route onto another, without leaving the overall network.

Bicycle lane network coverage index. The term “bicycle lane network coverage index” means a numeric figure representing the percentage of residents of the city who reside within one mile of the bicycle lane network.

Bus stop upgrades. The term “bus stop upgrades” means the addition to a bus stop of a bus shelter or bench and sign equipped with a system that conveys arrival times or other passenger information in real time.

Pedestrian space. The term “pedestrian space” means an area for pedestrian circulation, use, or enjoyment including, but not limited to, pedestrian plazas, curb extensions, sidewalks, safety islands, shared streets, and triangles, and which may contain amenities such as tables, seating, trees, plants, lighting, bike racks, or public art.

Protected bicycle lane. The term “protected bicycle lane” means a portion of a street or intersection that is designated for the exclusive use of bicycles and that is separated from motorized vehicle traffic by physical barriers, or is an off-road or raised pathway.

Protected bus lane. The term “protected bus lane” means a bus lane that is protected by physical barriers or is monitored by stationary or mobile bus lane photo devices that automatically produce an image of any vehicle that violates a bus lane restriction at the time of such violation.

Shared street. The term “shared street” means a street designated by the department as such with recommended speed limits of five miles per hour and that allows use by motor vehicles, pedestrians, and individuals using bicycles.

Transit signal priority. The term “transit signal priority” means technology capable of facilitating bus movements through intersections controlled by traffic signals.

b. Master plan. 1. The department shall issue and implement a master plan for the use of streets, sidewalks, and pedestrian spaces every five years. In developing each such plan, the department shall prioritize and promote: (i) the safety of all street users; (ii) on-street priority for mass transit vehicles; (iii) the reduction of vehicle emissions; and (iv) access for individuals with disabilities.

2. By December 1, 2021 and by December 1 of every fifth year thereafter, the department shall issue such plan for the five-year period beginning January 1 of the following year.

c. Benchmarks. 1. Each master plan issued pursuant to subdivision b of this section shall include proposals for street redesigns, protected bus lanes, protected bicycle lanes, bicycle parking, pedestrian spaces, commercial loading zones, truck routes, and parking, including the identification of specific routes, locations, or areas of the city for such proposals. In addition, each such master plan shall include benchmarks regarding such proposals that shall be achieved no later than December 31 of the final year of such plan.

2. The master plan due by December 1, 2021, shall include, at a minimum, the following benchmarks:

(i) install at least 150 miles of protected bus lanes, in coordination with the metropolitan transportation authority, with such lanes located along a median where feasible, with at least 20 miles of such lanes installed during the first year of such plan and at least 30 miles installed during each subsequent year of such plan;

(ii) implement transit signal priority in at least 750 intersections along bus routes during the first year of such plan and at least 1,000 intersections during each subsequent year of such plan or until transit signal priority is implemented in every intersection where such installation is feasible along every bus route where buses capable of utilizing transit signal priority are operated;

(iii) install at least 250 miles of protected bicycle lanes, with at least 30 miles of such lanes installed during the first year of such plan and at least 50 miles installed during each subsequent year of such plan;

(iv) implement bus stop upgrades at no fewer than 500 bus stops serving buses operated by the metropolitan transportation authority during each such year of such plan;

(v) redesign at least 2,000 intersections with a pedestrian signal pursuant to the checklist required by section 19-182.2, with at least 400 such intersections redesigned during each year of such plan;

(vi) install accessible pedestrian signals at no fewer than 2,500 intersections, with installation of such signals at no fewer than 500 intersections during each year of such plan;

(vii) assess and amend commercial loading zones, truck routes, and related areas to support freight movement and curb access citywide;

(viii) develop parking policies to prioritize and promote: (1) safety of all street users; (2) on-street priority of mass transit vehicles; (3) reduction of vehicle emissions; and (4) access to streets, sidewalks, public spaces, and mass transit for individuals with disabilities; and

(ix) no later than December 31, 2023, create and maintain no less than 1,000,000 square feet of pedestrian space.

3. The master plan due no later than December 1, 2026, shall include the following benchmarks:

(i) complete a connected bicycle network and ensure a bicycle lane network coverage index of 100 percent;

(ii) install protected bus lanes on all bus routes where such improvements can be installed;

(iii) install accessible pedestrian signals at no fewer than 2,500 intersections, with installation of such signals at no fewer than 500 intersections during each year of such plan;

(iv) implement bus stop upgrades at all bus stops serving buses operated by the metropolitan transportation authority where such upgrades are feasible; and

(v) redesign at least 2,000 intersections with a pedestrian signal pursuant to the checklist required by section 19-182.2, with at least 400 such intersections redesigned during each year of such plan; and

(vi) install or upgrade pedestrian ramps at no fewer than 3,000 intersection corners.

d. Reporting. 1. By December 1, 2021 and by December 1 of every fifth year thereafter, the department shall submit such plan to the mayor and the speaker of the council, and post such plan on the department’s website.

2. By February 1, 2023 and by each February 1 thereafter, the department shall submit to the mayor and the speaker of the council and post on the department’s website an update regarding any changes to the plan from the previous year, the bicycle lane network coverage index, and the status of the implementation of each benchmark identified in such plan, including but not limited to those benchmarks listed in subdivision c. Such information shall include a data set containing data on geographic feature boundaries, as represented by points, lines, or polygons. In addition, each report due beginning February 1, 2028 shall include the bicycle connectivity index for the previous year.

e. Public education campaign. The department shall conduct a public education campaign regarding the benefits of each master plan, including, but not limited to, the impacts on safety, the environment, accessibility, mobility, and the city’s economy.

§ 2. This local law takes effect immediately.

LS 10165

10/22/19 11:30PM

1. Center for an Urban Future, Destination New York (May 2018) *available at* <https://nycfuture.org/research/destination-new-york>; Federal Reserve Bank of New York, The Evolution of Commuting Patterns in New York City Metro Area (Oct. 2005), *available at* <https://www.newyorkfed.org/medialibrary/media/research/current_issues/ci11-10.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, About DOT, <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/about/about.shtml> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Charis Atlas Heelan, *The World’s Most Walkable Cities*, Frommer’s, *available at* <https://www.frommers.com/slideshows/819366-the-world-s-most-walkable-cities> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019); Laura Laker, *Where is the world’s most walkable city?*, Guardian, Sep. 12, 2017, *available at* <https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2017/sep/12/walkable-city-worlds-most-new-york-melbourne-fes-el-bali>;

N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, Plaza Program - List of Plazas, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/list-of-plazas.pdf>; and N.Y.C. Department of Parks and Recreation, *About the New York City Department of Parks & Recreation*, *available at* <https://www.nycgovparks.org/about> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Winnie Hu, *New York’s Sidewalks Are so Packed, Pedestrians Are Taking to the Streets*, N.Y. Times, Jun. 30, 2016, *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/01/nyregion/new-york-city-overcrowded-sidewalks.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. David Meyer, *Car Ownership Continues To Rise Under Mayor de Blasio*, StreetsblogNYC, Oct. 3, 2018, *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2018/10/03/car-ownership-continues-to-rise-under-mayor-de-blasio/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Angie Schmitt, *Study: Uber and Lyft Caused U.S. Transit Decline*, StreetsblogUSA, Jan. 22, 2019, *available at* <https://usa.streetsblog.org/2019/01/22/study-uber-and-lyft-are-responsible-for-u-s-transit-decline/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. City of New York, *Vision Zero: Year 5 Report* (Mar. 2019), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/visionzero/downloads/pdf/vision-zero-year-5-report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Vision Zero View *available at* <http://www.nycvzv.info/> and Graham Rayman, *Bicyclist struck by van in Queens dies from her injuries*, N.Y. Daily News, October 18, 2019, available at <https://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/nyc-crime/ny-cyclist-dies-crash-20191018-gxzw632edrchpbpefsw7txgmbm-story.html> [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Green Wave, A Plan for Cycling in New York City,* July 2019, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/bike-safety-plan.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. N.Y.C Department of Transportation, About Summer Streets, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/summerstreets/html/about/about.shtml> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019) [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, N.Y.C Weekend Walks, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/weekendwalks/html/find/find.shtml> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019) [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. N.Y.C Department of Transportation, Presentation to Community Board 6: 43rd Street Shared Street (Nov. 6, 2017) *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/43rd-street-east-midtown-shared-street-nov2017.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Stephen Miller, *DOT Studying Shared Space for Three Blocks Next to Willoughby Plaza*, StreetsblogNYC, Sept. 17, 2014, <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2014/09/17/dot-studying-shared-space-for-three-blocks-next-to-willoughby-plaza/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. David Meyer, *First-Ever “Shared Streets” Brings Stress-Free Streets to Financial District*, StreetsblogNYC, Aug. 15, 2016, *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2016/08/15/first-ever-shared-streets-brings-stress-free-streets-to-financial-district/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, Twitter, Aug. 3, 2017, *available at* <https://twitter.com/NYC_DOT/status/893204333189369856>. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Press Release, N.Y.C. Mayor, *One NYC: Mayor de Blasio Announces Transportation Measures to Increase New Yorkers’ Mobility* (Apr. 2018) *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/204-19/onenyc-mayor-de-blasio-transportation-measures-increase-new-yorkers-mobility#/0>. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, Accessible Pedestrian Signals, <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/infrastructure/accessiblepedsignals.shtml> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Accessible Pedestrian Signals Program Status* (Dec. 2018) *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/2018-aps-program-status-report.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. Disability Rights Advocates, Class Action Lawsuit Alleges NYC Sidewalks Won’t be Safe for Blind Pedestrians for 170 years, Jun. 27, 2018, *available at* <https://dralegal.org/press/class-action-lawsuit-alleges-nyc-sidewalks-wont-be-safe-for-blind-pedestrians-for-170-years/> [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Accessible Pedestrian Signals Program Status Report* (Dec. 2017), *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/2017-aps-program-status-report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. Disability Rights Advocates*, supra* note 25. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. Local Law 2012/024. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Local Law 2014/060. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation*, supra* note 24. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. Transportation Alternatives, *BikeNYC 2020* (Nov. 2017), *available at* <https://www.bikenyc2020.org/dl/BikeNYC_2020_Report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Cycling in the City: Cycling Trends in NYC,* (Jan. 2017), *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/cycling-in-the-city-jan2017.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Cycling in the City*, *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/bicyclists/cyclinginthecity.shtml> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. City of New York, *Vision Zero: Mayor de Blasio Announces New York City Added Over Twenty Miles of Protected Bicycle Lanes in 2019*, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/604-18/vision-zero-mayor-de-blasio-new-york-city-added-twenty-miles-protected-bicycle> (*last accessed* October 28,2019) [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Winnie Hu, *More New Yorkers Opting for Life in the Bike Lane*, N.Y. Times, Jul. 30, 2017, *available at* [www.nytimes.com/2017/07/30/nyregion/new-yorkers-bike-lanes-commuting.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2017/07/30/nyregion/new-yorkers-bike-lanes-commuting.html) [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Protected Bicycle Lanes in NYC* (Sept. 2014), *available at* <http://www.streetsblog.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/2014-09-03-bicycle-path-data-analysis.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Gersh Kuntzman, *De Blasio Built 20.9 Miles Protected Bike Lanes This Year—Yet Falls Short of Record*, STREETBLOG NYC, Dec, 19, 2018, *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2018/12/19/de-blasio-falls-short-of-record-miles-of-protected-bike-lanes/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. National Association of City Transportation Officials, One-Way Protected Cycle Tracks, *available at* <https://nacto.org/publication/urban-bikeway-design-guide/cycle-tracks/one-way-protected-cycle-tracks/> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. Gersh Kuntzman, *FACT CHECK: City Did Not Build 20.9 Miles of Protected Bike Lanes This Year,* STREETSBLOG NYC, Dec. 20, 2018, *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2018/12/20/fact-check-city-did-not-build-20-9-miles-of-protected-bike-lanes-this-year/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. City of New York, *Infrastructure: Sustainable Streets: 2013 and Beyond* (2013) *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/2013-dot-sustainable-streets-5-infrastructure.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Safer Cycling: Bicycle Ridership and Safety in New York City* (2017), *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/bike-safety-study-fullreport2017.pdf>.  [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Michael Anderson, *The First Major Academic Study of Protected Bike Lanes in the U.S. Is Out*, People For Bikes, Jun. 2, 2014, *available at* <https://peopleforbikes.org/blog/the-first-major-academic-study-of-protected-bike-lanes-in-the-u-s-is-out/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Protected Bicycle Lanes in NYC* (Sept. 2014), *available at* <http://www.streetsblog.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/2014-09-03-bicycle-path-data-analysis.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Borough Pedestrian Safety Action Plans: Vision Zero Update* (2019) *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/vz-2019-update-city-hall.pdf>*.* [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Eric Jaffe, *Protected Bike Lanes Aren’t Just Safer, They Can Also Increase Cycling*, City Lab, Jun. 2, 2014, *available at* <https://www.citylab.com/transportation/2014/06/protected-bike-lanes-arent-just-safer-they-can-also-increase-cycling/371958/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. Transportation Alternatives, *supra* note 31. [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. Carolyn Szczepanski, *Bike Share’s Gender Gap*, The League of American Bicyclists,Jun. 27, 2014, *available at* <https://bikeleague.org/content/bike-shares-gender-gap>. [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. Jing Gu, et al., *The Cost-Effectiveness of Bike Lanes in New York City* (2017), BMJ Journals, *available at* <https://injuryprevention.bmj.com/content/23/4/239>. [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. Philip Noyes, et al, *Cycling in the City: An In-Depth Examination of Bicycle Lane Use in a Low-Income Urban Neighborhood* (2014), Journal of Physical Activity and Health 11 (1): 1-9. [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. Transportation Alternatives, *supra* note 31. [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. *Vision Zero: Mayor de Blasio Announces "Green Wave" Bicycle Plan to Address Cycling Fatalities -- With Citywide Protected Bike Lane Network and Increased Enforcement*, *See* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/368-19/vision-zero-mayor-de-blasio-green-wave-bicycle-plan-address-cycling-fatalities---/#/0> [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Green Wave, A Plan for Cycling in New York City,* July 2019, available at <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/bike-safety-plan.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
59. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
60. *Id.* at p. 9. [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
61. *Id.* at p. 16. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
62. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
63. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
64. Bus Turnaround Coalition, *Fixing NYC’s Buses: 2018 Progress Report* (2018), *available at* <http://busturnaround.nyc/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/BusTurnaround-2018-Progress-Report-FINAL.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
65. Metropolitan Transportation Authority, *MTA 2019 Final Proposed Budget, November Financial Plan 2019-2022, Volume 2* (Nov. 2018) at V.305, *available* at http://web.mta.info/news/pdf/MTA-2019-Final-Proposed-Budget-Nov-Financial-Plan-2019-2022-Vol2.pdf. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)
66. Metropolitan Transportation Authority, The MTA Network – Public Transportation for New York Region, <http://web.mta.info/mta/network.htm>(*last accessed* October 28, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-66)
67. Metropolitan Transportation Authority, *Bus Action Plan* (Apr. 2018), *available at* <http://web.mta.info/nyct/service/bus_plan/bus_plan.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-67)
68. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-68)
69. Institute for Transportation & Development Policy, What is BRT?, <https://www.itdp.org/library/standards-and-guides/the-bus-rapid-transit-standard/what-is-brt/> (*last accessed* October 28, 2019); Institute for Transportation & Development Policy, *Recapturing Global Leadership in Bus Rapid Transit* 5 (May 2011), *available at* <https://www.itdp.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/20110526ITDP_USBRT_Report-HR.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-69)
70. N.Y.C. Comptroller, *Improving Select Bus Service: Putting the Rapid in Bus Rapid Transit* (Apr. 2018), *available at* <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/improving-select-bus-service-putting-the-rapid-in-bus-rapid-transit/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-70)
71. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-71)
72. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-72)
73. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Better Bus Action Plan 2019* (Apr. 2019), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/brt/downloads/pdf/better-buses-action-plan-2019.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-73)
74. David Meyer, *Supposedly Cash-Strapped MTA Halts Expansion of Select Bus Service* (Aug. 15, 2018) *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2018/08/15/supposedly-cash-strapped-mta-halts-expansion-of-select-bus-service/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-74)
75. David Meyer, *Bus Drivers and Riders Call on Mayor de Blasio to Build 60 More Miles of Bus Lanes*, StreetsblogNYC, Jul. 31, 2018, *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2018/07/31/bus-drivers-and-riders-call-on-mayor-de-blasio-to-build-60-more-miles-of-bus-lanes/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-75)
76. Bus Turnaround Coalition, *supra* note 62. [↑](#footnote-ref-76)
77. City of New York, Select Bus Service, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/html/brt/html/about/bus-lanes.shtml>. [↑](#footnote-ref-77)
78. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-78)
79. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-79)
80. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *Green Means Go: Transit Signal Priority in NYC* (Jan. 2018), *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/brt/downloads/pdf/brt-transit-signal-priority-july2017.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-80)
81. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-81)
82. Staff Communication with DOT. [↑](#footnote-ref-82)
83. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-83)
84. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-84)
85. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *supra* note 73. [↑](#footnote-ref-85)
86. City of New York, *Mayor de Blasio: Delivering our Promise to Make New York City the Fairest Big City in America*, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/021-19/mayor-de-blasio-delivering-our-promise-make-new-york-city-fairest-big-city-america#/0>. [↑](#footnote-ref-86)
87. David Meyer, *City Unveils Steps to Meet its Commitment to Faster Bus Speed*, Streetsblog, (April 19,2019) *available at* <https://nyc.streetsblog.org/2019/04/19/city-unveils-steps-to-meet-its-commitment-to-faster-bus-speeds/> [↑](#footnote-ref-87)
88. Noah Manskar, *Use More Cameras, Keep NYC Buses Moving*, Patch, Mar. 2019, *available at* <https://patch.com/new-york/new-york-city/use-more-cameras-keep-nyc-buses-moving-pols-say>. [↑](#footnote-ref-88)
89. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-89)
90. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-90)
91. TransitCenter, *From Sorry to Superb: Everything You Need to Know about Great Bus Stops* (Oct. 2018), *available at* <https://transitcenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/BusReport_Spreads.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-91)
92. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-92)
93. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-93)
94. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-94)
95. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-95)
96. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-96)
97. N.Y.C. Department of Transportation, *supra* note 73. [↑](#footnote-ref-97)
98. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-98)
99. Vincent Barone, *Bus Speeds to Increase by 25 percent by 2020*, *Mayor de Blasio vows,* AMNY (January 2019) <https://www.amny.com/transit/bus-service-nyc-1.25750709> [↑](#footnote-ref-99)
100. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-100)
101. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-101)
102. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-102)