

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

September 23, 2019  
Start: 10:33 a.m.  
Recess: 11:22 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

FERNANDO CABRERA  
MARGARET S. CHIN  
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.  
MARK GJONAJ  
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK  
FARAH N. LOUIS  
BILL PERKINS  
CARLINA RIVERA  
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL  
RITCHIE J. TORRES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Patricia Zafiriadis  
Associate Commissioner of Housing Incentives with  
The New York City Department of Housing  
Preservation and Development, HPD

Melanie La Rocca  
Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
Buildings, DOB

Gus Sirakis  
First Deputy Commissioner of the New York City  
Department of Buildings, DOB

Max Bookman  
Attorney Representing the New York City  
Hospitality Alliance

Richard Nagin  
Licensed Department of Buildings Filing  
representative

Arie Isaacs  
Senior Code and Zoning Manager at Howard  
Zimmerman Architects

Tom Waters  
Policy Analyst to the Community Service Society  
Of New York

Ellen Davidson  
Staff Attorney with the Legal Aid Society

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Good morning

everyone, I'm Council Member Robert Cornegy, Chair of the Committee on Housing and Buildings. We're here today to hold a hearing on three bills that effect New Yorkers in a variety of ways. These, these include Intro 1545, which will restrict alcohol advertisements near schools, Intro Number 790, which will prohibit multiple for rent signs on a property and Intro 1710, which would extend the city's J-51 tax incentive program until 2020. Today we will hear from the Department of Buildings, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development and Department of Finance as well as from members of the real estate industry, health advocates and other interested members of the public about these bills. Intro Number 1545 sponsored by Council Member Andy King and co-sponsored by myself bars certain signs that advertise alcoholic beverages within a certain radius of K through 12 schools. Underage drinking is an issue across the nation and in New York City. Youth who drink alcohol are more likely to suffer health and other potentially long-term consequences. Increased exposure to alcohol advertising has been shown to

1 result in more favorable attitudes towards alcohol  
2 and to a greater likelihood of drinking alcohol  
3 especially among young people. In addition, these  
4 types of advertisements tend to target students in  
5 neighborhoods of color. Through this legislation we  
6 hope to limit youth exposure to alcohol advertising  
7 near schools and decrease underage drinking. Intro  
8 790 sponsored by Council Member Van Bramer seeks to  
9 limit excessive for rent signage. Excessive for rent  
10 signage can create eyesores, exacerbate vacancy  
11 concerns and in some instances cause pedestrian  
12 obstructions. Finally, Intro 1710 sponsored by  
13 Council Member Richards extends the J-51 tax  
14 abatement, an exemption program until June 30<sup>th</sup>,  
15 2020. This program in a... is an important tool in  
16 preserving affordable housing in New York while  
17 incentivizing the repair and maintenance of existing  
18 housing. Through the J-51 program property owners  
19 receive a tax exemption or abatement for  
20 rehabilitation or conversion of multifamily housing.  
21 While the... while the property is in the program  
22 existing real estate taxes are reduced or eliminated,  
23 tenants of these buildings receive rent stabilized  
24 leases while the J-51 benefits are enforced. I'd like  
25

1  
2 to thank my fellow committee members who are here  
3 today, and we'll hear from the sponsors of propose...  
4 the sponsor of proposed Intro 1545, Council Member  
5 King first.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good morning, thank  
7 you Mr. Chair, I appreciate your time and effort and  
8 energy to tackle this, this issue that we're having  
9 in the city of New York with our young people. I know  
10 as a former professional athlete alcohol was not part  
11 of the equation, it was water and Gatorade. As a  
12 former basketball player myself, the Chair of  
13 Juvenile Justice and a youth developer today I do  
14 understand certain messaging when children are  
15 developing can be critical to their success or their  
16 demise and I think alcohol is one of those things  
17 that should be forbidden around any schools that's  
18 why after seeing a big massive sign being advertised  
19 with a basketball and Jack Daniels in front of a high  
20 school, a middle school and an elementary school I  
21 say how dare those in the business who all think this  
22 is okay messaging for our children. So, I'm thanking  
23 everyone today, I'm asking my colleagues to sign onto  
24 this because alcohol we know kills, we know guns  
25 kill, we know smoking kills, we know all kind of bad

1  
2 activities kills but alcohol is one of the number one  
3 diseases that hurt families each and every day. So, I  
4 thank you again for partnering up and listening to  
5 everyone's conversation, I'm hoping the  
6 administration is on board because this is one of the  
7 best ways that we can save our children's life during  
8 their early stages of education. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, we'd  
10 like to now hear from Council Member Donovan Richards  
11 from the great borough of Queens.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: The best  
13 borough of Queens.

14 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, you always got  
15 to go too far man.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well good  
17 morning, thank you Chair Cornegy for holding this  
18 important hearing. Today we are hearing my bill,  
19 Intro 1710 which would extend the J-51 tax abatement,  
20 an exemption program into June 30<sup>th</sup> of 2020. More  
21 than ever in time as we witness the affordability  
22 crisis and substandard living conditions tenants  
23 endure it is critical that programs such as J-51 are  
24 reaching the right pockets of the city. Tenant  
25 protections and enforcement is critical to ensuring

1  
2 that this tax abatement isn't being utilized to  
3 circumvent taxes at the expense of tenants in  
4 desperate need of repairs in their residential  
5 dwellings. It is my hope that as we look to extend J-  
6 51 that we strengthen and seek to close any loopholes  
7 so that we can accomplish the mission this abatement  
8 seeks to address, that is simply to ensure tenants  
9 can live with dignity and respect they rightfully  
10 deserve. Once again Mr. Chairman thank you and I look  
11 forward to hearing from the administration.

12 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you Council  
13 Member Richards. I'd like to remind everyone who'd  
14 like to testify today to please, please fill out a  
15 card with the Sergeant, we'll be sticking to a two  
16 minute clock for all public testimony and now we'll  
17 administer the oath of... we will administer the oath  
18 to the administration before their testimony. Good  
19 morning.

20 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Good morning.

21 MELANIE LA ROCCA: Morning.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Do you affirm to tell  
23 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth  
24 in your testimony before this Committee and to  
25 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

8

2 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Yes, I do.

3 GUS SIRAKIS: Yes.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: They can begin.

6 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: You can begin your  
7 testimony at any time.

8 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Good morning Chair  
9 Cornegy and members of the Housing Committee.. the  
10 Committee on Housing and Buildings. My name is  
11 Patricia Zafiriadis and I'm the Associate  
12 Commissioner of Housing Incentives with the city.. New  
13 York City Department of Housing Preservation and  
14 Development also known as HPD. Thank you for the  
15 opportunity to testify on Introduction 1710 sponsored  
16 by Council Member Richards. This bill would extend  
17 the J-51 benefit program that is available for the  
18 rehabilitation and upgrade of New York City's housing  
19 stock. The J-51 program has played a significant role  
20 in the improvement of New York's housing stock since  
21 the program's inception during the 1950s. The New  
22 York State J-51 tax benefit program is a property tax  
23 abatement and or an exemption given to residential  
24 apartment buildings for certain alterations or  
25 improvements. Boiler or window replacements are

1 common types of eligible work. After doing the  
2 rehabilitation work owners are eligible for a J-51  
3 tax abatement and in certain cases a J-51 tax  
4 exemption as well. The abatement is an actual  
5 reduction in the amount of tax an owner pays and is  
6 related to the cost of work. The exemption ensures  
7 that the owner doesn't have to pay taxes on the  
8 increase in value resulting from the rehab work. All  
9 J-51 recipients receive abatements, but exemptions  
10 are only issued in cases where the Department of  
11 Finance determines that the J-51 eligible renovation  
12 will lead to an increase in assessed value. The  
13 extension of the J-51 program is an important piece  
14 in the city's interest in providing safe, habitable  
15 and affordable housing to residents of New York City  
16 and the administration supports the Council's  
17 reauthorization of this tax benefit program. Thank  
18 you again for the invitation to testify on this bill,  
19 I look forward to answering any questions you may  
20 have.  
21

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Commissioner I just  
23 want to thank you for the brevity in your testimony..  
24 [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: You are very  
3 welcome... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...this morning, it  
5 is very, very refreshing for a Monday morning, thank  
6 you.

7 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: It's my pleasure.

8 MELANIE LA ROCCA: Good morning,  
9 unfortunately I won't be as brief, but I'll try to  
10 read faster. Good morning Chair Cornegy and members  
11 of the Committee on Housing and Buildings. I am  
12 Melanie La Rocca, the Commissioner of the New York  
13 City Department of Buildings. I'm joined today by Gus  
14 Sirakis, my First Deputy Commissioner and together  
15 we're pleased to be here to offer testimony on two of  
16 the bills before the committee today regarding  
17 signage. Signs including accessory signs and  
18 advertising signs must comply with requirements in  
19 both New York City building code and the New York  
20 City's zoning resolution. The regulations in the  
21 building code address permitting and structural  
22 issues and the regulations in the zoning resolution  
23 address issues including permissible service area,  
24 projection and height. Collectively these regulations  
25 exist to protect the public from dangerous or

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 illegally installed signs and to reduce visual  
3 clutter. As such the Department takes seriously its  
4 obligation to enforce these laws. With that being  
5 said Local Law 28 of 2019 instituted a moratorium  
6 which will run until February 2021 on the issuance of  
7 violations for accessory signs which are also  
8 referred to as business signs. The Department  
9 recognizes that educating the business community  
10 regarding applicable laws and regulations is critical  
11 and is conducting outreach to small business owners  
12 so that they know exactly what they need to do to  
13 bring their signs into compliance. This outreach  
14 includes direct mailings to businesses who have  
15 received violations from the Department for illegally  
16 installed signs and direct out, outreach to these  
17 businesses by our community engagement staff. We will  
18 also encourage... excuse me, we also encourage small  
19 businesses to visit our borough offices on Tuesday  
20 nights during our open house where they can receive  
21 one on one advice from department experts on signage  
22 issues or any construction projects they are  
23 planning. We thank this committee for its partnership  
24 on behalf of the small business community and look  
25 forward to updating this committee further on the

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 implementation of this law. The first bill before the  
3 committee, Intro 17... excuse me, Intro 790 would  
4 prohibit the placement of more than one ground or  
5 wall sign advertising the availability of retail or  
6 commercial space for rent on each side of a vacant  
7 commercial or mixed-use building. We would like to  
8 discuss this bill further with this committee and  
9 with its sponsor to better understand the issue its  
10 seeking to resolve and to craft a careful solution..  
11 carefully.. a careful solution to such issue. Our  
12 concern is that the... this bill could have unintended  
13 consequences of resulting in additional enforcement  
14 actions being taken by the Department against  
15 businesses and residential buildings seeking to rent  
16 their vacant space and reactivating that segment of  
17 streetscape. Additionally, we are concerned about  
18 making it more difficult to operate a business in New  
19 York City by adding another layer of regulation.  
20 Finally, this Committee should be aware that  
21 depending on the content of these signs, the  
22 Department may be unable to take enforcement action  
23 until local... until the Local Law 28 moratorium on the  
24 issuance of violations that I previously, previously  
25 mentioned has been concluded. The next bill before

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

the committee, Intro 1545 would prohibit advertised alcoholic advertisements on an outdoor sign with, within 500 feet of any direction of a school. Research suggests that greater exposure to alcohol advertisement can increase the likelihood of underage alcohol consumption and encourage heavier alcohol consumption. For these reasons the administration banned alcohol advertising on city property earlier this year and we are fully supportive of this bill as it reaffirms the administration's position on alcohol advertising. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Commissioner La

Rocca although you said your testimony was a little... was longer it still pales in comparison to some testimonies we've been... we've heard that are six and seven pages, so I thank you as well for the... [cross-talk]

GUS SIRAKIS: Six and seven... [cross-talk]

MELANIE LA ROCCA: Thank you... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...for the... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 MELANIE LA ROCCA: ...and you are very  
3 welcome.

4 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: For your brevity as  
5 well. As a true testament to me, me being apologetic  
6 about taking up so much time and being late I am  
7 going to forego my round of questions and allow my  
8 colleagues to ask questions first because they've  
9 been here for quite some time so we're going to begin  
10 with Council Member...

11 [off mic dialogue]

12 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...Council Member  
13 Cabrera.

14 [off mic dialogue]

15 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Nice haircut by the  
16 way... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I just have one  
18 question and, and maybe this could have been also  
19 directed to the sponsor of the bill but when you look  
20 at Intro 790 and thank you Mr. Chair for allowing us  
21 to go first, that's... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I also made a  
23 comment about your very youthful looking haircut.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Oh, thank you  
25 sir. Thank you, thank you, you're too much but in, in

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 regards to Intro 790 I'm just curious when it comes  
3 to LED signs would that be... would you see that as  
4 applicable to... because in an LED sign you will have  
5 multiple, you know like advertisement taking place  
6 every so many seconds, how would you understand...  
7 [cross-talk]

8 MELANIE LA ROCCA: Sure, so L, LED or  
9 illuminated signs are in fact considered signs so  
10 that would be an area of enforcement the department  
11 could do.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But if this bill  
13 were to pass, right and I'm a business owner and I  
14 want to have... you know I want to have three different  
15 advertisements taking place, you know I don't want to  
16 mention any specific companies but company A, company  
17 B, then advertising company three or product and so  
18 forth, would this bill obligate the business owner  
19 just to advertise just one product?

20 MELANIE LA ROCCA: So, 740 would... is  
21 specific as written as specific to the placement of  
22 signs advertising the availability of retail or  
23 commercial space within a vacant commercial or mixed  
24 use property so in the example you're giving that  
25 would constitute a sign if it were advertising a good

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 or service that was not available at that location,  
3 that would be considered signage, that would be  
4 covered under current rules.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay. Alright,  
6 alright, thank you so much.

7 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: No problem... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I appreciate  
10 your answer.

11 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Council Member  
12 King.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you  
14 Commissioner, I appreciate your level of support for  
15 our legislation, it gives me hope that we can get  
16 this actually passed and done because it seems that  
17 we're on the same track with the city as well with  
18 other advertisement on city properties. My question  
19 would be to you is this, I'm not even sure that this  
20 goes far enough as far as the 500 square feet whether  
21 it's from the property line or from the door but I  
22 will look to figure out with the committee on how do  
23 we make sense of it whether it starts from the door  
24 of a school, for me I would say property lines of a  
25 school. One of the things I have a big question and I

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 will... I will ask you for the record, I know as far as  
3 the legislation how it's written it says those  
4 businesses... excludes those businesses who have their  
5 license through the New York State liquor authority,  
6 my concern with that as well even if a bodega can  
7 advertise a corona sign if I come outside a high  
8 school and the bodega is right across the street from  
9 a high school it's the same advertisement so it kind  
10 of defeats the bill of the purpose of trying to have  
11 that point of advertisement cease to exist, what  
12 would be your response in figuring out how do we  
13 manage that?

14 MELANIE LA ROCCA: So, twofold with  
15 respect to the distance, so you're correct to point  
16 out the legislation is silent to the way in which 500  
17 feet from the advertisement should be calculated and  
18 we would look forward to working with the Committee  
19 in order to ensuring that the legislation is clear  
20 because our goal is to ensure that we are effectively  
21 and uniformly applying the same standards across the  
22 city. For the second point, I, I would say this,  
23 you're correct, again the law does create an  
24 exemption for establishments that are licensed by the  
25 state for either the sale or manufacturing of

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 alcoholic beverages. This department stands ready to  
3 enforce this law should it move forward and we stand  
4 ready to play our role in ensuring the safety and  
5 wellbeing of children and so I would leave that  
6 conversation respectfully to the committee but know  
7 that we're ready to, to move forward with the  
8 enforcement.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, thank  
10 you for those answers, thank you Mr. Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Council Member  
12 Richards.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you Mr.  
14 Chair and just a few questions. So, I wanted to hear  
15 a little bit more about how many buildings receive J-  
16 51 benefits between 2018 and 2019.

17 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure, thank you for  
18 that question. According to the most recent DOF tax  
19 expenditure report from fiscal year 2019 which is  
20 calculated in units, over 103,000 units citywide  
21 receive a J-51 tax exemption and over 359,000 units  
22 citywide receive a J-51 tax abatement. I want to note  
23 that these numbers are from a snapshot in time so  
24 they may include both new buildings in the program  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 and those that entered the program over a decade ago  
3 but are still receiving J-51 benefits.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And can you  
5 just break down, how do you track and how could  
6 tenants track if their buildings are taking advantage  
7 of J-51?

8 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sorry, just to  
9 understand the question, how will tenants know...  
10 [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: What is the  
12 process for informing tenants?

13 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure, so J-51 is,  
14 is a tool that's out there to give relief to  
15 homeowners looking to do work on their buildings and  
16 improve conditions and it also in rental buildings  
17 provides tenants with greater protections. To apply  
18 for J-51 that process occurs after the completion of  
19 work and what we do once we verify the work has been  
20 done is we also make sure that the units are  
21 registered with the state as rent stabilized, rent  
22 stabilization... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So DHCR,  
24 correct?

25

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Yes, correct, DHCR...

3 [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: ...rent stabilization  
7 is one of the strongest tools for tenant protections  
8 that are out there and we take compliance very  
9 seriously so we make sure that the units are  
10 registered and only then are benefits given to the  
11 building and then the state will manage the annual  
12 registration thereafter.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And are tenants  
14 informed is I guess the question I'm asking that...

15 [cross-talk]

16 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Well as part of the  
17 process tenants would execute a lease that's rent  
18 stabilized but again tenant protection... you know rent  
19 stabilization is one of the strongest protections  
20 that are out there, and it's overseen by the state  
21 not by HPD.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And so, the  
23 city... and I would assume you would have some interest  
24 in... ensuring that those units stay rent stabilized  
25 so... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: We absolutely...

3 [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So... [cross-

5 talk]

6 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: ...take compliance

7 with the program very seriously, we have... this

8 administration has inserted some of the most

9 aggressive compliance tactics out there for tax

10 incentives programs, we've taken unprecedented steps

11 to ensure buildings follow all tax benefit and

12 abatement requirements working at the front of the

13 process and monitoring the buildings throughout, we

14 are absolutely invested in, in... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right and what

16 are the ramifications if someone takes advantage of

17 this and perhaps tries to get rid of rent stabilized

18 apartments and have you found any cases of that

19 happening and what, what are the ramifications?

20 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure, give me one

21 moment... okay, so as I've mentioned compliance and

22 enforcement is a top priority for us, we have a unit

23 at HPD that's focused on this function, they are

24 ready at any time to handle any referrals of

25 noncompliance, what they would essentially do after a

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 building is given the opportunity to cure is initiate  
3 revocation proceedings and we're actually in process  
4 right now with revoking the benefit on a property.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right and how  
6 many have been found to be in noncompliance, do you  
7 have those numbers?

8 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: For the J-51  
9 program... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yes... [cross-  
11 talk]

12 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: ...I don't have those  
13 numbers there but as I mentioned we have a unit that  
14 was created within the past two years that is focused  
15 on this function for all of our tax incentives  
16 programs and they've done a, a lot of work in  
17 ensuring the operationalizing normal compliance  
18 proceedings and they are at the ready to take any  
19 referrals of noncompliance.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And just go  
21 through what are some of the improvements that a  
22 landlord could take advantage of when they do... when  
23 they take advantage of J-51.

24 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: What kind of work?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yes.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure. Give me one moment. Okay. So, J-51 covers a variety of work from major capital improvements to moderate rehabilitations to limited conversions only with substantial government assistance. The... by far the most common scenarios we see are major capital improvements and that includes the type of work that would fall under what you would expect; boiler, burner, windows, roof, waterproofing, paint, electrical, rewiring, elevators, that sort of thing. So, J-51 is really an important tool in ensuring housing quality is maintained throughout the city while also ensuring tenant protections are put in place for renters.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And how does HPD once again ensure that these things are happening, do you come and inspect or is it self-certification, how do... [cross-talk]

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...how, how... [cross-talk]

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure, we have... [cross-talk]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...would you...

[cross-talk]

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: ...a variety of ways, let me just take you through the application process a little bit. Okay. So... applications are filed after work is done, there are a variety of different things that we do but if for example the work exceeds 10,000 dollars we will do an in place... an inspection of the work to make sure the work was done but as normal course of business for every... any project we also review CPA certifications of the work and complete the application and as I mentioned we ensure that the units are registered and rent stabilized before we enact the benefits.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And take me through where has this tax abatement been utilized the most, can you speak of... [cross-talk]

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...geography of...

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure, I can definitely do that. Let's see, according to the DOF tax expenditure report in fiscal year 19 we saw 27 percent of the abatements in Brooklyn and in Queens, 26 percent of the abatements in the Bronx and 19

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 percent of the abatements in Manhattan with one  
3 percent in Staten Island. For exemptions it was a  
4 little bit different, we saw 22 percent of exemptions  
5 in Manhattan, 48 percent in the Bronx, 20 percent in  
6 Brooklyn and eight percent in Queens and one percent  
7 in Staten Island. So, there's a mix throughout the  
8 city but I will say that geographic use generally  
9 tracks with the type of housing stock that is more  
10 prevalent in these boroughs so where you see more  
11 multi house... family house... buildings, larger  
12 buildings you will see more exemptions and  
13 abatements. The exception that I will note is that  
14 there are certain properties in Manhattan south of  
15 110<sup>th</sup> Street that are ineligible for the program.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And New York  
17 City is a big place so when you read off the boroughs  
18 that's great...

19 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Yeah...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but I, I'm  
21 interested in you digging a little deeper and I guess  
22 that today I'm not expecting you to go through every  
23 community in New York City... [cross-talk]

24 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Right, right...  
25 [cross-talk]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but we want to ensure that obviously this incentive is being utilized in places especially where the housing stock is in most need of rehabs, right, so how do you ensure that that is happening?

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Yeah, I, I mean I think our goals are the same Council Member, we think it's a really important tool to ensure housing quality throughout the city, I don't have the data on a more granular level available to me but I'd be glad to continue a... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I would love to... [cross-talk]

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: ...conversation... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...see that before we proceed and I think I'm... and, and just go through your outreach strategy, how do building owners find out that this... that they're eligible for a J-51?

PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure...

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: What is your... HPD's outreach strategy?

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Sure, as I  
3 mentioned before owners general submit a J-51  
4 application after they complete their work, all of  
5 the information and the full process and application  
6 forms can be found on HPD's website and also by  
7 calling 212-863-5517, J-51 is a program that has been  
8 in existence for quite a long time but our website is  
9 there with full information and we're always happy to  
10 talk to people further who are interested in the  
11 program.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And so, you  
13 don't do any direct mail or any of that to building  
14 owners to let them know?

15 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: At this time, we do  
16 not.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And, and let...  
18 and let me ask you this, when you find out perhaps a  
19 building is in major disrepair or there's a certain  
20 amount of complaints like I'm assuming lodged against  
21 certain residential buildings would you then offer  
22 them this incentive or how does that work?

23 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: No, that's, that's  
24 a good question, I, I want to emphasize that J-51 is  
25 just one of many tools in HPD's toolbox for ensuring

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 housing quality throughout the city and ensuring the  
3 viability of quality affordable housing, we have a  
4 number of different programs that we can engage with...  
5 property owners with and so much of that information  
6 is available on our website but we would really  
7 encourage property owners with needs to engage with  
8 us so we can take a holistic look and, and talk about  
9 what the right fit would be for different financing  
10 programs we offer and so forth, J-51 again is one of  
11 many tools.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, I look  
13 forward to working with you closer on this and..

14 [cross-talk]

15 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Thank you... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...thank you for  
18 your testimony, thank you Mr. Chair.

19 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Thank you so much.

20 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, I'm  
21 going to just give some context to why 790 in  
22 particular... I'm sorry, 1545 is so important to me. In  
23 another life I was responsible for conducting with  
24 students an alcohol outlet density survey for  
25 Brooklyn and Manhattan where we GIS mapped signs or

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 advertisements, alcohol advertisements and then did  
3 a... did a commercial overlay, proximity to schools,  
4 proximity to churches, proximity to recreation  
5 centers and it was... it was pretty bad at that time  
6 and this was maybe two decades ago and I'm not... I'm  
7 not at liberty to mention the companies because there  
8 were two companies that were very egregious in their  
9 advertising and I was actually personally sued so I  
10 can never mention their names in public, big shout  
11 out to the legal system in New York that didn't allow  
12 me to do that but... so, it's, it's incredibly  
13 important to, to, to begin to make some steps towards  
14 remedying it so, does, does the city collect data on  
15 advertisements of alcoholic beverages that are near  
16 schools and if so what are the findings?

17 MELANIE LA ROCCA: So, we don't currently  
18 collect that data as there is no prohibition against...  
19 around that content however we do know of certain  
20 locations where signage exists so currently outdoor  
21 advertising companies are required to register signs  
22 with the Department that are either 900 feet from an  
23 arterial highway or 200 feet from a park so we are  
24 aware of a certain universe.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Also, if I'm not mistaken didn't the MTA have regulations put in for advertisements on the trains and in subways?

MELANIE LA ROCCA: Correct, the MTA banned advertisement of alcohol, alcoholic beverages in 2018 so that is in existence currently.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Right, so this.. we feel like this is obviously inconsistent with what the city has already done to some degree to make sure that our, our children at least are safe from targeted advertisement and that's what kind of we called it, was it was pretty targeted based on proximity to schools, parks, recreation centers so there's already been some work done around it, we think the bill goes a little bit further, its not a panacea obviously to get rid of all because we have.. you know as long as we have the internet and as long as we have television and radio that's a whole nother medium but from the city's concern we feel like this bill would, would.. [cross-talk]

MELANIE LA ROCCA: Certainly.. [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...at least be helpful in, in shaping the way advertisement to

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 minors or targeting advertise... targeted advertising  
3 is dealt with.

4 MELANIE LA ROCCA: We very much agree, I  
5 mean for the reasons you laid out obviously the  
6 Department of Buildings is not the public health  
7 expert but certainly there has been research to show  
8 the correlation between the two and, and certainly  
9 you're right to, to point out to the MTA and the  
10 Mayor's, obviously the Mayor's executive order  
11 earlier this year establishing the same prohibition  
12 so we are... we are fully supportive.

13 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, thank you so  
14 much for your answers, I believe there are no more  
15 questions we're going to move to the, the, the  
16 general panels, thank you so much for your time and  
17 your commitment to these bills.

18 PATRICIA ZAFIRIADIS: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, the first panel  
20 is Max Bookman, Arie Isaacs and I think that's  
21 Ritchie Nalan, so sorry, Nagin [sp?], sorry, Mr.  
22 Nagin. Yes, are you... are you a doctor?

23 RICHARD NAGIN: No.

24 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Because that's a  
25 doctor's handwriting, I'm just teasing...

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 [off mic dialogue]

3 RICHARD NAGIN: I, I can do it... write  
4 neatly if I take my time...

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I know we don't  
6 allow for you to take your time around here, no  
7 taking your time in this place.

8 [off mic dialogue]

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Sure, yeah. So,  
10 once you've made yourselves comfortable, we are going  
11 to begin your testimony, I ask that you state your  
12 name in totality for the record and then you can  
13 begin your testimony. I'm sorry, we do have you on a...  
14 we changed it to a three-minute clock...

15 MAX BOOKMAN: Oh, very nice, okay, I got  
16 to come up with an extra minute to... what, what I want  
17 to say. Thank you... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Yeah, it goes... it  
19 goes really quickly so...

20 MAX BOOKMAN: Thank you Mr. Chairman. My  
21 name is Max Bookman, I'm an attorney, I represent the  
22 New York City Hospitality Alliance which is a not for  
23 profit trade association that represents our eating  
24 and drinking establishments in New York City and when  
25 I'm not wearing that hat my firm represents several

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 hundred on a yearly basis bars and restaurants,  
3 hotels in alcohol licensing matters, we're considered  
4 a specialist in the field of alcohol licensing  
5 regularly giving educational classes to other lawyers  
6 and to restaurants and bars in the field of alcohol  
7 licensing so on behalf of the alliance which is the  
8 hat that I'm wearing today I first want to thank you  
9 Mr. Chairman for the opportunity to speak and for  
10 your advocacy for our small business community, we've  
11 worked with you on many matters in the past and we  
12 count you as an ally and so we thank you for your  
13 leadership for matters important to our industry. And  
14 so in that spirit of friendship when we disagree we  
15 let you know and this is a bill that I think in, in  
16 broad principle everybody could agree that underage  
17 drinking is something that we stand against and the  
18 alliance certainly does that's why when we worked  
19 with the NYPD to come out with this booklet, best  
20 practices for night life establishments which is now  
21 in it's third year, we devoted an entire section to  
22 age verification to combat underage drinking. I want  
23 to make two brief points today which I hope you'll  
24 consider, and I hope Committee Counsel will take into  
25 consideration as you further consider this bill. One

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 is a legal point and the other is more of a policy  
3 point. So, the legal point is that there is some  
4 fairly established case law already which limits the  
5 city's ability to restrict what liquor licensed  
6 businesses licensed by the state liquor authority can  
7 do. In the field of alcohol regulation the city has  
8 had laws that have been struck down in the past when  
9 it's interfered what the ABC... what the ABC law allows  
10 and so I provide those citations in our comments and  
11 I hope you'll take a look at them because we do have  
12 concerns that this law would be preempted by the... by  
13 the state ABC law which relates to the second point  
14 which I want to make which is more of a policy point.  
15 I think the, the bill sponsor and I heard your words  
16 Mr. Chairman, we agree that the type of alcohol  
17 advertising that you have in mind is not something  
18 that's appropriate for children but what I don't want  
19 to sweep up is our small businesses who also have  
20 valid reasons to want to advertise in their  
21 neighborhoods and so if you think of for a moment,  
22 you know an Italian restaurant that wants to do a  
23 billboard that shows people sitting around the dinner  
24 table and maybe one of the parents in the billboard  
25 is enjoying a glass of wine, currently under the way

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 we read the, the bill that could be interpreted we  
3 think to be prohibited and I don't think that's  
4 really what anyone's intent is and we would certainly  
5 hope that there could be clarifying language in there  
6 so that our small businesses that do hold liquor  
7 licenses or beer and wine licenses can still be able  
8 to advertise to their communities and... with ten  
9 seconds to go.

10 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, be, before we  
11 move on though I think that's an interesting point  
12 and its still subtle nuances because certainly the  
13 bill doesn't seek or, or would not like to have  
14 unintended consequences where it damages a small  
15 business's ability to advertise, I... my intent and  
16 understanding of intent of the bill was those alcohol  
17 sponsors and the large ads that they place, I won't  
18 mention their names in this context but that are...  
19 that are displaying ads that, that are clearly  
20 designed to capture the attention of a younger  
21 demographic is what we are referring to but we... I  
22 will gladly look closely at the bill to make sure  
23 that it doesn't have a disproportionate negative  
24 impact on small businesses, mom and pops as you've  
25 mentioned.

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 MAX BOOKMAN: Thank you for that  
3 clarification Mr. Chairman and we're happy to work  
4 with you... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: No, no, no, it's...  
6 [cross-talk]

7 MAX BOOKMAN: ...on that language... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...it's those subtle  
10 nuances that we need to, to, to make sure that we're,  
11 we're aware of... [cross-talk]

12 MAX BOOKMAN: And that's why we're here...  
13 [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Right... thank you.

15 MAX BOOKMAN: Thank you sir.

16 RICHARD NAGIN: Hello, my name is Richard  
17 Nagin, I'm a licensed Department of Buildings Filing  
18 Representative. I'm here to help you to an egregious  
19 thing happening at the Building Department.

20 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Did, did you just  
21 say help me to?

22 RICHARD NAGIN: I'm going to help you to  
23 it, yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Alright.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 RICHARD NAGIN: You know what I mean.  
3 Anyway... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I just... I just  
5 enjoy that, go ahead, I'm sorry.

6 RICHARD NAGIN: The, the DOB... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I'll, I'll give you  
9 another 30 seconds for just helping me through  
10 something.

11 RICHARD NAGIN: Thank you. The DOB has  
12 instituted this new system of filing where the intent  
13 is to pretty much stop people from meeting face to  
14 face where everything is done online and instead of  
15 improving what they already had to do this they  
16 started a whole new system which is stupid, their  
17 public portal if you go to print an application the  
18 printing overlaps, their answer is well log in and  
19 you can print the PDF, I said what about the general  
20 public, oh, they can register for an account and when  
21 you go to file something it's costing the people...  
22 it's costing the developers and the contractors and  
23 everybody a, a... an exorbitant amount of money. For  
24 instance, if you wanted to build a one story  
25 warehouse the old way you filed the new building

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 application that would cover the construction,  
3 structural, plumbing, mechanical, curb cut and the  
4 construction expense and then a separate application  
5 for the paving, now everything is six separate  
6 applications; the new building, the old system and  
7 the other work types a separate application with  
8 separate filing fees, with record management fees  
9 which was supposed to be to cover the cost of  
10 scanning stuff even though everything is uploaded.  
11 The system doesn't work, there are... they know it  
12 doesn't work, their answer is well fill out this form  
13 and we'll get back to you in two days like when an  
14 owner logs in they have to be registered, they log  
15 in, it comes up with their main company name but  
16 every building is owned by a separate entity but  
17 there's no way to change the entity name and their  
18 answer is well the owner can change his company name  
19 and his... and, and they just... it's just like not  
20 working and instead of trying to fix it they just  
21 keep adding more staff and from what I gather the  
22 Buildings Department people hate it, the filing reps  
23 hate it, everybody hates it but for some reason they  
24 keep forging ahead and it's just not working and you  
25 got to do something to, to stop them.

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, that, that  
3 particular insight is important to me... [cross-talk]

4 RICHARD NAGIN: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...the, the, the new  
6 Commissioner has committed to making corrections in  
7 areas of efficiency and effectiveness, right, so we  
8 all have a... the... I think we all have the same goal;  
9 I'd like to hear from you after your testimony about  
10 how we could possibly... [cross-talk]

11 RICHARD NAGIN: I, I'd be... I'd, I'd love  
12 to meet with you... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Okay... [cross-talk]

14 RICHARD NAGIN: In fact, I've, I've  
15 emailed the building department complaining and the  
16 new commissioner included... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Uh-huh... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 RICHARD NAGIN: ...and I got a warning  
20 letter that I was being unprofessional because I was  
21 complaining.

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Well I don't... I  
23 don't know if you use HIP in it or... [cross-talk]

24 RICHARD NAGIN: No... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...so, I don't...

3 [cross-talk]

4 RICHARD NAGIN: I was... I was very polite.

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, listen I, I  
6 certainly would like to hear some good.. [cross-talk]

7 RICHARD NAGIN: Yeah, so why don't... why  
8 don't we... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...no nonsense..  
10 [cross-talk]

11 RICHARD NAGIN: ...I'll, I'll get in touch  
12 with your legislative director and we'll... [cross-  
13 talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Right, he's right  
15 there.

16 RICHARD NAGIN: Yeah, we'll, we'll set up  
17 a meeting.

18 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Okay.

19 RICHARD NAGIN: Great.

20 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Alright... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 RICHARD NAGIN: Okay, great... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you Mr.  
24 Nagin... [cross-talk]

25 RICHARD NAGIN: ...thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: You, you don't have  
3 to leave yet.

4 RICHARD NAGIN: No, I'm cool.

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Alright, but we can  
6 move onto the... [cross-talk]

7 RICHARD NAGIN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...the next  
9 testimony.

10 ARIE ISAACS: Hi, good morning, my name  
11 is Arie Isaacs, I too am a class two code and zoning  
12 representative in New York, I work for Howard, Howard  
13 Zimmerman Architects as, as their Code and Zoning  
14 Manager, I also am here to just state in front of the  
15 Council some of the concerns that I and a number of  
16 expeditors have in New York about the new DOB Now  
17 system, that's the official name DOB Now, the, the  
18 fact that filing representatives such as myself are  
19 not officially able to file jobs with the city of New  
20 York as per... as per this new system only the  
21 architect or engineer of record is allowed to  
22 formally do that, that's a change in procedure that  
23 makes things more difficult for all parties involved.  
24 In addition as sort of a general request my hope is  
25 that the, the DOB will enlist the assistance of

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 filing representatives like myself, those of us who  
3 do this every day for a living since we are the ones  
4 who are working with the system it would make sense  
5 to me that we, we should have some input and some  
6 involvement in its construction, in its operation and  
7 my hope is that the city will give some consideration  
8 to allowing that to happen. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, we had a  
10 conversation with the former Commissioner and now the  
11 current Commissioner and with all due respect to her  
12 and in her absence I don't remember the exact answer  
13 that she gave to me for why the change was made but  
14 if you would reach out to my office we can continue  
15 this dialogue. So, you should know that whatever  
16 level of success we've had as an office has been  
17 based on having these conversations often, so I'd  
18 like to hear from you formally. I, I... it works better  
19 for me if you submit to me recommendations... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 ARIE ISAACS: Sure... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...I... because I'm,  
23 I'm, I'm dually bound to turn your concerns into  
24 recommendations, into policy and legislation so if  
25 you could help me skip one of those steps by just

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 giving me the recommendations, I would greatly  
3 appreciate it.

4 ARIE ISAACS: Sure.

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you... [cross-  
6 talk]

7 ARIE ISAACS: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you. Thank  
9 you so much for your testimony, we're going to move  
10 to the next panel which is Ellen Davidson and Tom  
11 Waters. So, we'll get...

12 [off mic dialogue]

13 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: You too, thank you.

14 [off mic dialogue]

15 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, again I just  
16 ask that you submit your names in totality for the  
17 record and then you can begin your testimony whenever  
18 you'd like.

19 ELLEN DAVIDSON: Sorry, Ellen Davidson,  
20 Staff Attorney with the Legal Aid Society.

21 TOM WATERS: Tom Waters, Housing Policy  
22 Analyst to the Community Service Society of New York.  
23 Thank you for this opportunity to testify on J-51,  
24 did the same thing seven or eight years ago the last  
25 time it was renewed and much of what I want to say is

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 the same as then. J-51 is an extraordinarily  
3 expensive program and its costs have run away from  
4 its benefits because many provisions of it don't,  
5 don't fit the present-day reality of housing in New  
6 York City. The, the program from its beginning in the  
7 50's was changed many times over the years to sort of  
8 broaden its sweep and make more and more improvements  
9 to buildings eligible for the benefits of J-51, that  
10 stopped in the 90's but the program continued to grow  
11 tremendously as real estate activity in the city  
12 increased and I believe the J-51 benefits were given  
13 to more and more improvements that would have been  
14 made without the incentive undermining the efficiency  
15 of the program. You can get the flavor of that by, by  
16 looking at figure one in my... in our testimony that,  
17 that shows what's happened over the last 18 years,  
18 it's on page three, which is that of the four  
19 components of the program that are analyzed  
20 separately by the Department of Finance in their  
21 report on tax expenditures, two of them are, are  
22 shrink... are going down and two of them are exploding  
23 upwards, it's the abatements, the abatement component  
24 of the program that is shrinking and the exemption  
25 component that is increasing and that's happening

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 regardless of whether you're talking about rental  
3 apartments or condos and co-ops. I think the reason  
4 for that... it certainly isn't because anyone decided  
5 that they thought there should be more exemptions and  
6 fewer abatements nor is it because anyone anticipated  
7 the kinds of changes that happened and thought that a  
8 shift from abatements to exemptions would be a good  
9 response to that and designed it into the program but  
10 this was not intentionally designed into the program  
11 I'm certain. Instead its just because of intended  
12 consequence of provisions that were intended to  
13 target the program so exemptions are not available  
14 if... you can't get exemptions in Manhattan below  
15 Harlem, well more and more of the high end  
16 development of the city is outside of Manhattan below  
17 Harlem and that's why exemptions are exploding.  
18 Should I keep going?

19 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Yes.

20 TOM WATERS: Abatements are limited by  
21 the value of the property and the number has not been  
22 updated over the years so it's a... the, the, the limit  
23 for property value that the abatement applies to is  
24 getting lower and lower relative to values in the  
25 city and therefore it's getting more restrictive. So,

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 those, those... the... nobody... these things are supposed  
3 to be targeting the incentive to buildings with low  
4 income tenants who really need the incentive to get  
5 decent conditions but it's not working anymore  
6 because the city has changed since the last time  
7 these provisions were updated and it has an  
8 unintended result of shifting from abatements to  
9 exemptions an unintended result of letting this  
10 program grow faster than it needs to and in fact  
11 abatements are the better targeted part of the  
12 program and exemptions are the less well targeted  
13 part so it's getting less well targeted in addition  
14 to those problems. And I'll, I'll stop there.

15 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

16 ELLEN DAVIDSON: And from the Legal Aid  
17 Society one of the things that we wanted to talk  
18 about was the lack of enforcement that has gone on  
19 with the J-51 building. I listened to the Deputy  
20 Commissioner's testimony about their great  
21 enforcement unit, we represent a building in Queens  
22 which received the J-51 benefit starting ten years  
23 ago and the landlord did indeed say I'm going to  
24 register the units, he registered ten units in his  
25 build... in his 110 unit building as rent regulated and

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 those ten tenants got access to SCRIE and DRIE  
3 benefits but the clients that we represented had no  
4 access to any benefits because they were told they  
5 were not regulated because HPD was unable to simply  
6 go from seeing that ten units were registered to  
7 seeing that their own system said that this was 110  
8 unit building so it's been our experience that  
9 there's no enforcement of the regulation. In my  
10 testimony I talk about how the city talks... talked to...  
11 lawsuit about how unimportant the rent regulation  
12 part of the statute was and how they didn't see any  
13 reason to enforce it and in addition the point of J-  
14 51 is to lessen the increase that tenants get for  
15 major capital improvements because a landlord can get  
16 both the J-51 benefit and a major capital improvement  
17 benefit and the way it is supposed to work is the  
18 tenants get a 50 percent of the major capital  
19 improvement that is approved by HCR but as you could  
20 see from HPD's testimony there's not a lot of  
21 conversations going on between the city and the  
22 state, they both have their own... so, there's no  
23 mechanism to ensure that a building that gets a J-51  
24 that HCR knows that the building is getting a J-51  
25 and therefore the tenant gets the benefit of the

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS  
2 reduction in the MCI increase and so from our  
3 perspective to the extent that this, this, this  
4 program is renewed it should have additional  
5 enforcement mechanisms in it to make sure that the...  
6 very important tenant protections that the agency  
7 talked about are actually protections tenants  
8 receive.

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, those, those  
10 amendments and or adjustments to what we spoke about  
11 today of the bill, you know the extension itself have  
12 you documented that somewhere outside of your  
13 testimony because obviously I'm going to go back over  
14 your testimony in particular but... [cross-talk]

15 ELLEN DAVIDSON: Sadly I think we, we did  
16 not know that J-51 was coming up for renewal, we, we  
17 are happy to work... we're happy to work on if we had  
18 more time, recommendations that could be part of  
19 changes to the law, we, we found out that this was on  
20 the agenda about a week and a half ago and it just  
21 didn't give us enough time to produce anything but I,  
22 I think we'd love to work with you and to come up  
23 with ways of, of making this program better.

24 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, I'm not the  
25 bill sponsor but as the Chair of the Committee I'd be

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS  
2 interested to hear those recommendations so to the  
3 extent that you could put it together, you know  
4 relatively quickly. This is... this is a hearing and  
5 this is actually what hearings are designed to do so  
6 I... if you could get that to me sooner than later I'd  
7 greatly appreciate, even, even a rudimentary document  
8 to, to have us look at it to make sure that we're  
9 making... you know that the intended purpose of the  
10 extension meets the needs and the goals, right,  
11 that's, that's... [cross-talk]

12 ELLEN DAVIDSON: Yeah... [cross-talk]

13 TOM WATERS: Yep... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: ...the goal here so...  
15 [cross-talk]

16 TOM WATERS: Yeah, we can do that. Also,  
17 I did do a report in 2012 on J-51 which is on the CSS  
18 website and I can... I can send a... send you a copy as  
19 well.

20 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: If you... if you do  
21 that, I'd greatly appreciate it... [cross-talk]

22 ELLEN DAVIDSON: Because you had  
23 recommendations in it?

24 TOM WATERS: Yes.

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I would... I would appreciate that.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Yes, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I'd appreciate it as well if you get something that you can share with, with me as well. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Okay, so what, whatever... I'll commit to you that whatever they're able to, to turn around for us we will definitely share with the Committee and we have some of the most capable council in this committee so I'd really appreciate if you could get that to me sooner than later.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Great.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you and I'll talk to the bill sponsor as well.

ELLEN DAVIDSON: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you so much for your testimony. So, in the record landmark hearing we are about to close, do you have any comments Council Member?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I'm glad we had this opportunity to go through this, it's, it's been very timely for... as far as I'm concerned, and we look forward to moving forward with it and making something happen.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Housing and Buildings is adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

September 30, 2019