CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

----- X

September 18, 2019 Start: 1:40 p.m. Recess: 2:31 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Room

16th Floor

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams

CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Peter Koo
I. Daneek Miller
Inez Barron
Mark Treyger
Carlos Menchaca

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lacey Talbert [sp?], HPD

Andrew Murray Impact Brooklyn

Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research Landmark Preservation Commission

Anthony Fabre

Yvette Acquire [sp?], New York Resident

Jan Jimenez, New York Resident

Nina Malkin, New York Resident

Lynn Massimo, New York Resident

Maria Roca, New York Resident

Cynthia Felix, New York Resident

Jason Stutz, New York Resident

Linda Acini [sp?], New York Resident

Susan Brown, New York Resident

Simeon Bankoff, Executive Director, Historic Districts Council

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 [background comments] SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a sound check 3 4 for the Committee on-- Subcommittee on Landmarks 5 taking place September 18th, 2019. 16th Floor 250 6 Broadway scheduled for 1 p.m. and being recorded by 7 Israel Martinez. 8 UNIDENTIFIED: Turn it on an get to 9 When you do the-- get to the end of all the work. 10 landmarks--11 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. 12 UNIDENTIFIED: Just not cross--13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. We are going to 14 start. Yeah. 15 [gavel] 16 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Good morning. Welcome 17 to the meeting of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, 18 Public Siting, and Maritime Uses. I am Council 19 member Peter Koo. I will be chairing today's hearing for Chair Adams, who is unable to be here today. 20 21 am joined by Council member Treyger and Council 22 member Miller. Oh, no. Council member Barron. 23 Miller is not here. Today we will begin by voting on 24 15 historic landmark designations and to HPD

applications that we heard at our September 4th

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES meeting. The historic landmark designations that include seven historic landmark designations related to the history of the LGBT movement. LU 490, the gay activist alliance firehouse. Former Engine Company Number 13 in Council member Chin's district in Manhattan. LU 491, Café Chino. LU 492, the Women's Liberation Center. And LU 493, the historic landmark designation of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Community Center. All of these in the Speaker's district in Manhattan. LU 494, the James Baldwin residents located in Council member Rosenthal's district in Manhattan. And LU 495, the Audrey Law residence in Council member Rose's district in Staten Island.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

From 1972 to 1987, my district— No.

Not my district. This is a statement from Council

member Rose. And she asked me to read it into the

records. From 1972 to 1987, my district was the home

of Audre Lorde, who lived that 207 Saint Pauls Avenue

with her children and her partner, Francis Craden

(sp?). While living there, she wrote some of her

most groundbreaking work, including the [inaudible

00:04:13] where other people live. She served as

poet of New York State and made lasting contributions

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES through her speeches and her writings. I am proud to say this was followed by a vote from the Landmarks Preservation Commission to designate Ms. Lorde's residence as a landmark of LGBT history. That designation is before this committee today and I encourage my colleagues to vote I as this is a fitting celebration of Ms. Lorde's contributions and ongoing struggle for LGBT equality.

Seven historic landmark designations
located in on Broadway below 14th Street in Council
member Rivera's district in Manhattan. LU 481, the
817 Broadway building. LU 482, the 826 Broadway
building, now the Stram (sp?) Building. LU 483, the
830 Broadway building. LU 484, the 832-834 Broadway
building. LU 485, the 836 Broadway building. LU
486, the 840 Broadway building. And LU 487 the
Roosevelt building. And to additional historic
landmark designations. LU 488, the National Society
of Colonial Danes in the state of New York
headquarters located in Council member Power's
district in Manhattan. And LU 489, the first
Hungarian Reform Church located in Council member
Kallos' district in Manhattan.

2.2

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

We will also vote to approve preconsidered LU 510, the Bronx Point NCPF [inaudible 00:06:51] submitted by HPD pursuant to article 16 of the Journal Municipal Law of New York State for approval of the designation of an urban development action area for property located at 2356 Lot two and Block 2539 lot one and parts of lots two and And a [inaudible 00:07:31] portion of East 150 Street in the Bronx. An approval of an urban development action area project for such area. proposed action would facilitate new property accessible open space along the Harlem River waterfront as part of a new mixed use development that would include approximately 1044 units of affordable housing. Commercial and community facility space. The project is located in Council member Ayala's district. We will also vote to approve preconsidered LU 511 for the Brownsville South project in Council member -- submitted HPD pursuant to article 16 of the Journal Municipal law and section 197 C of the New York City Charter for the destination of property located on 47 New Locks Avenue, block 3855, lot 40. 609 dash 615 [inaudible 00:09:04] street, block 3628, lot nine and 120 dash

```
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
 1
     SITING, AND MARITIME USES
 2
     122 Liberty Avenue block 3693, lots 22 and 23.
     the borough of [inaudible 00:09:23] as an urban
 3
 4
     development action area. Approval of an urban
 5
     development area project for such an area and
 6
     approval -- sorry. An approval of the disposition of
 7
     such properties to a developer selected by HPD.
     Okay. That one here? The project is located in
 8
     districts represented by Council member Barron and
 9
     Council member Espinal. All items are supported by
10
11
    their affected Council members. In accordance with
12
     the wishes of the affected Council members, I will
     now call for a vote to approve LU numbers 481, 482,
13
     483, 484, 485, 486, 487, 488, 489, 490, 491, 492,
14
15
     493, 494, and 495. And preconsidered LU number 510
16
     and 511. Counsel please call the role.
17
                LEGAL COUNSEL:
                                  Treyger?
18
                COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER:
                                            Aye.
                LEGAL COUNSEL:
19
                                  Barron?
20
                COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be excused to
     explain my vote?
21
2.2
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yes. Please.
23
                COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.
24
             Just speaking briefly on LU 511, which is the
```

Brownsville South cluster. Part of this development

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 is located inside of my district and these are small projects and we had some challenges to make sure 3 that, in the end, all of the units that would be 4 built would, in fact, be affordable at the income 5 6 levels of those who presently live there. so, we are 7 very pleased that, through some negotiations, I want to thank the staff that work with the HPD to come to 8 another adjustment in setting the AMI's for those 9 that would be qualified to apply and I'm very pleased 10 that we're able to say that 56 percent of the units 11 12 that are going to be built in the district that I represent will be at 50 percent of AMI or below. And 13 14 that there will be no units at 80 percent and there 15 will be some at 60 and 70 percent of AMI. 16 very pleased on the work that was done and I want to 17 commend the staff for the work that they did and I 18 vote aye on all. LEGAL COUNSEL: 19 Koo? 20 CHAIRPERSON KOO: I vote aye. LEGAL COUNSEL: 21 By a vote of three in 2.2 the affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero

abstentions, the items are recommended for referral

to the Public Land Use Committee and the vote is held

25 open.

23

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. We will now 2 3 continue to move on onto another subject. We now move on to public hearings for today. Beginning with 4 5 LU 527, the [inaudible 00:12:46] designation project approval and deposition approval for 7766-- dash 780 6 7 Mai Tai Avenue to facilitate an affordable housing development containing approximately 59 units in 8 Council member Cornegy's district in Brooklyn. 9 are joined today by representatives of HPD and the 10 developer. Mrs. Tobar and Andrew Murray. Yeah. You 11 12 may begin after you identify your -- No. You have to 13 C--14 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right 15 hands and identify yourselves. 16 LACEY TALBERT: Lacey Talbert, HPD. 17 ANDREW MURRAY: Andrew Murray, Impact 18 Brooklyn. Do you affirm to tell 19 LEGAL COUNSEL: 20 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the subcommittee and in 21 2.2 response to all Council member questions? 23 LACEY TALBERT: Yes. 24 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON KOO: You may start.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

LACEY TALBERT: I just want to make sure you all have copies of the presentation and the testimony. We can give to the Sergeant. Okay. Use item number 527 is related to a ULRP application regarding the development of three city of and vacant lots at block 1754, lot 19, 20, and 22 in Brooklyn Council District 36 for a project known as 776 780 Myrtle Avenue. The application seeks UDAP (sp?) Designation and project approval for the three lots as well as disposition and approval for two of the lots, lot 20 and 22. One of the three lots, lot 19, previously received approval for unrestricted disposition by the Board of estimate and 1981, but was never sold and remained city-owned. 776 to 780 Myrtle Avenue is slated for development under HPD's supportive housing loan program or SHLP which funds the rehabilitation and new construction of supportive housing for the home was, people with special needs, and other persons of low income. The development team, Impact Brooklyn, formerly known as the Pratt Area Community Council was selected through a competitive process in 2013, our supportive housing request for qualification. They will provide property management services, as well as act as the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES supportive services provider. Impact Brooklyn proposes to construct a nine story building with a total of approximately 15 nine affordable rental units, plus the superintendent's unit and groundfloor retail space. Upon completion, the building will contain approximately 45 Studios, a one bedroom units, six two-bedroom units, and one two-bedroom unit for a superintendent. Under the SHLP quidelines, 60 percent or approximately 36 of the units will be affordable for homeless households referred from social service agencies such as Department of Homeless Services, or DHS, and the remaining approximately 23 units will be affordable rental units to be filled through HPD's marketing guidelines. The target incomes for this project will be up to 60 percent of the area median income, or AMI. Supportive housing tenants will pay up to 30 percent of their income and rent. Affordable households earning up to 60 percent of AMI or approximately 44,820 dollars for one person to 57,660 dollars for a three person household, will pay rents ranging from 843 dollars for a studio till 1290 dollars for a two-bedroom. In response to community feedback, and, averaging is being contemplated for

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES this project, which would make households between 40 percent and 80 percent of AMI eligible or households earning approximately 29,880 dollars to 59,760 four one person to 38,440 dollars to 57,660 dollars for a three person household. If income averaging is used, rents will range from 522 dollars for a 40 percent AMIs studio till 1843 dollars for an 80 percent AMI two-bedroom. Amenities to be included in the project include supportive services space open to all residents and the building and a shared rear courtyard, community room, green roofs, laundry room, and enclosed by a sickles storage, as well as approximately 3000 square feet of ground-floor commercial space. In order to facilitate the development of this project, HPD is before the landmark subcommittee seeking approval of Land Use item number 527. And I will turn it over to Andrew from Impact to talk you through the project. ANDREW MURRAY: Hello. My name is Andrew Murray. I am a project manager at impact Brooklyn. Not to delve too far into the details over rupee what Lacey had just mentioned, but, again, this is a project. Three vacant lots on Myrtle

Avenue across from the Marcy houses in northern Bed-

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES Stuy. And the project -- Where the developer. are Impact Brooklyn, formerly the Pratt Area Community Council. For over 15 years, we have been serving the communities, and neighborhoods of Central Brooklyn. We are a community development corporation dedicated to fair, affordable, equitable housing. develop-- offer a myriad of services, some of which are behind me. So, to the project, specifically, as Lacey said, it is a proposed nine story building on Myrtle Avenue. It's mixed to use with ground-floor commercial. We will be offering on-site social services in the basement. 60 percent will be devoted to supportive housing. That will be 36 studio efficiency units. The remainder, minus one superintendent will be lottery appointed units. Again, Lacey had mentioned the estimated rents and income. We are considering income averaging, so that would mean, on average, 60 percent AMI, but there will be 40 and 80 percent units, as well. Again, I can go into greater detail of the unit distribution. We have 45 Studios, 81 bedroom units, six two-bedroom units, plus the on-site superintendent. The ground floor commercial space, which is, proximately, 3000

square feet we are considering a nonprofit social

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES enterprise tenant. Namely, they will be a café slash comm-- kitchen space and they are also a workforce development provider, so they will be working for-with members of the community ages 16 to 24 who are both out of school and without work. And that tenant currently is Grand Lo Café. They have a space down by Essex Crossing. We will be utilizing several passive house principles, not the least of which is the VRF. Excuse me. My acronyms to get mixed up sometimes. That is the variable refrigerant flow. Also a tightly insulated envelope, you know, to cut down energy costs, create efficiencies. We will also be utilizing several other green components. We have a green roof, white roof, blue roof. considering rain gardens in the front of the building. We have a-- the green roof will be accessible to residents. We have a sunken courtyard, rear yard. We are also considering 35 to 45 kilowatts of solar paneling to be placed on top of the roof and we also, of course, as in the on-site social services which will be placed in the basement of the property. We are planning on six to eight staff, but that does not include on-site security, which will be 24/7. We would be offering an

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES amenity-- many services, including case management, harm reduction, substance use counseling, and many things to help gear the population in a more helpful direction. This is a design-- the site plan, you're looking from the top from the Birdseye view of the building. As you can see, there was a green roof. We are currently, again, proposing the roof solar paneling on top of the ninth floor. In the rear you have the sunken courtyard and yard, as well. will be, again, nine stories. It is on three lots, 75 by 100 square feet total. Here you have images of the seller and ground-floor. As I mentioned, you will-- we will be putting the social services in the basement. They will have community rooms. Able to utilize the back courtyard, and as well as the ground-floor which will also be housing the commercial tenant which we are proposing, again, will be a café slash commercial kitchen. Lastly, this is our project timeline. We were certified in April. We have gone through the processes since we last met with the city planning commission in late July. are anticipating ULRP approvals sometime within the next few months and, finally, we hope to close after

submitting a state tax credit application to the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

```
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
 1
     SITING, AND MARITIME USES
 2
    housing committee renewal for fall of 2020 and
    ultimately finishing construction within two years
 3
    leasing up by fall 2022. And any questions, please
 4
    do not hesitate.
 5
 6
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much.
 7
    I'm sorry. I had to go across the street to vote
    for-- so, I am asking Council member Barron to take
 8
    over the chair. Thank you.
 9
10
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.
                                                  Thank
    you much for your presentation. I just have a few
11
12
    questions. I believe you said that 36 units are
    Studios?
13
14
                ANDREW MURRAY:
                                 Yes.
15
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON:
                                      Okay. So, the
16
    question that I have is to you have the dimensions of
17
    the studio apartments?
18
                ANDREW MURRAY:
                                 Yes.
                                       I do. On average,
    the studios will run 360 square-- net square feet.
19
20
    360 for all--
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 360. Okay.
21
2.2
                ANDREW MURRAY: And that's of the 45
23
    studios total on average.
24
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So there are 45
```

studios?

```
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
 1
     SITING, AND MARITIME USES
 2
                ANDREW MURRAY: 45 in the building, but
 3
    36--
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 36 are reserved
 4
    for--
 5
                ANDREW MURRAY: for the supported
 6
 7
    residents.
 8
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And the other
    question that I have, then, is which of those units
 9
    are-- that are one and two family-- two bedroom
10
    apartments will be eligible for those who are in
11
12
    supportive, as well?
                ANDREW MURRAY: Uh--
13
14
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Because there
15
    weren't that many that you indicated were a part of
16
    the program.
17
                ANDREW MURRAY: Yeah. The one and two
18
    bedroom units are designated currently for the
    lottery for the 40 to 80 percent AMI.
19
    dwelling units, with respect to the supportive
20
    residents are all studios.
21
2.2
                CHAIRPERSON BARRON: All of those--
23
    Okay. So all of the supportive personnel -- or all
    of the supportive residents will be in studio
24
```

25

apartments.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes. And these 3 specifically are going to be residents aged 55 and older. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh. 6 ANDREW MURRAY: Yeah. 7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's important to know. 8 9 ANDREW MURRAY: Yes. 10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's good. And the solar panels that you are planning on having, 11 12 what will they provide? What energy will they 13 provide? 14 ANDREW MURRAY: As it is currently drawn 15 up and, of course, this can change, but we are 16 planning, as proposed -- again, it's the early 17 stages. About 35 to 45 kilowatt of energy and that 18 will most likely provide energy electricity for the common area. 19 20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Common areas. 21 Okay. Okay. Great. 2.2 ANDREW MURRAY: Which is pretty 23 extensive, of course, in a nine story building.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. Are there any other questions from any other panels? Okay. Thank you so much.

ANDREW MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We're not doing

that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. there any members of the public who wish to testify on these items? Seeing none, I close today's public hearing and these items are laid over. Next, we will hear designations in the Sunset Park neighborhood of Brooklyn represented by Council member Menchaca. 496 is the Sunset Park South historic District. 497 is the Sunset Park North Historic District. 498 is the Sunset Park 50th Street Historic District, and LU 499 is the Central Sunset Park 50th Street Historic District. We will also hold a public hearing on LU 528, the LPC designation of the Bay Ridge Parkway, Doctors Row Historic District in Council member Brannan's district, also in Brooklyn. I will now recognize Council member Menchaca to offer up remarks.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

1

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you, Chair Barron, for giving me this opportunity to say 3 hello and welcome. [Speaking foreign language] 4 application that we are seeing before us has an 5 6 incredible story that is rooted in the power of 7 Sunset Park and the voices of the people who live in there, who work there, and care for Sunset Park. 8 The application before you also has an incredible story 9 about the landmarks team at the city, listening and 10 really understanding the needs of Sunset Park. And 11 12 the beautiful thing about it was that, like many stories that start without seeing eye to eye, 13 14 discussion and dialogue, productive dialogue happened 15 and both pressures be getting into understand that 16 there was a common ground and research was done and petitions were signed, photographs were taken, 17 18 stories were told, and what you see is the result of that an incredible work and residents in Sunset Park 19 20 did not stop and nor should have they. And the government did not stop and nor should have they. 21 2.2 And we didn't stop until we got to a point where we 23 are today. In these designations that really, and a lot of ways, they are historic for historic 24 25 districts, but they also are unprecedented in a way

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES and in the way that they came out. And I think that was a big gesture from the landmarks preservation commission that said Sunset Park deserves something different and we got that. And so these blocks are beautiful blocks and I hope that, if you are listening and don't know Sunset Park, to calm and see these beautiful blocks to really see the appreciation of the work that our communities have done to keep these blocks in tact being because we are facing some incredible pressures of gentrification and pressures of foreign investment that are coming in and buying these buildings, tearing them down, and destroying the fabric of our community. And that, we are saying no to today. So I'm really proud to be representing these incredible, incredible families and the incredible organizations that are behind them and the nonprofit and the energy. So, I'm just so proud moment -- A proud person. A proud New Yorker today. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council member. We had joined today by representatives of the Landmark Preservation Commission. We have Kate McHale and Anthony Fabre. Fabre. And before you begin, counsel will swear you in.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
truth, and nothing but the truth and your testimony

5 before the subcommittee and in response to all

6 | Council member questions?

2.2

ANTHONY FABRE: I do.

KATE MCHALE: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Thank you. You may begin.

KATE MCHALE: Okay. Thank you. Good afternoon, Council member Barron and subcommittee members. I am Kate Lemos McHale, director of research at the Landmarks Preservation Commission. Thank you for the opportunity to present these four districts in Sunset Park today.

The Sunset Park Historic districts, shown here on our map of New York City landmarks and historic districts are the result of an extensive study of the Sunset Park neighborhood in response to requests from the Sunset Park Landmark Committee and with the strong support of Council member Menchaca. We thank you for that. Their designation is aligned with an agency priority under Chair Carol to study communities underrepresented by landmarks. We

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES studied a large area encompassing the blocks between fourth and seventh avenues and 60th and 40th Streets, shown here. And such a large study area, we developed a framework for identifying historic district boundaries that should include intact rows of buildings that exemplify Sunset Park's historical and architectural development and incorporate blocks with the strongest character, highest integrity, and cohesiveness that, together, create a distinct sense of place. As part of our process of studying and proposing has storage districts, we need to extend says owner outreach and we held two public meetings in Sunset Park to describe our proposal and speak with homeowners about working with the Landmarks Commission. Chinese and Spanish language interpretation services were offered at both these meetings for anyone who needed translation. Following our outreach, the four districts were calendared in January 2019. They contain a total of 539 properties and consist of the most cohesive and intact concentrations of high quality architecture in Sunset Park, representing its primary periods of development. At the public hearing on May 7th, 26 people spoke in favor of all four districts,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES including Carlos Menchaca, Council member Menchaca, and representatives from the Sunset Park, landmarks, committee and its business improvement District, the Historic Districts Council, the New York Landmarks Conservancy, the Society for the Architecture of the City. Testimony related to specific districts included one person who spoke in favor of Sunset Park 50th Street, one in favor of Central Sunset Park, and six who spoke and opposition to Sunset Park South. The Commission also received 42 written submissions in favor of all for historic districts including from Assembly member Felix Ortiz in Community Board Seven, as well as two written submissions in favor of Sunset Park South, eight in favor of 50th Street, four in favor of the Central Sunset Park, and one in favor of Sunset Park North. The Commission also received five written submissions supposed to one or more of the districts.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Sunset Park's historical development was closely connected to its working waterfront, in particular the vast complex of Bush terminal and the arrival of public transportation through the area.

Long consistent rows of houses were designed by Brooklyn architects for speculative developers, as

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES many as two and three family homes. Early owners and residents of Sunset Park include German, Irish, Italian, Danish, Finnish, and Swedish immigrants and today the neighborhood retains lively emigrant communities and character. The neighborhood took its name from the park completed in 1911. This amenity, along with the extension of an elevated railway along Third Avenue and 1893 and the announced man of the planned fourth Avenue subway in 1905 spurred rapid residential development, which was essentially completed by World War I. These maps show Sunset Park in 1898 and 1903, vividly illustrating the extent of development and just a five year period as an extended eastward from the industrial port. just a note on the layout of these slides, our maps are rotated and so East is generally down, West is up towards the poor, and North is to the right. There are three major phases of development and Sunset Park. Late 19th century development as typically characterized by row houses with brown stone and brick façades with flat fronts or projecting bays such as the row shown on the left here on 58th Street. Early 20th century development between 1901

in 1909 we see more two-family row houses and with

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES more ornate elements constructed throughout the neighborhood and development between 1910 and 1920, after the subway extended through the neighborhood is generally characterized by larger apartment buildings, flats, and tenements, such as the one shown on the right, which became a finished co-op. This map of building dates and all four districts represents the general distribution of these primary periods of development throughout the neighborhood. Sunset Park's older 19th century buildings tend to be close third of Fourth Avenue at the top of the map. Buildings constructed after the turn of the century are more prevalent in the blocks between fifth and seventh avenues and to gather these four districts contain the strongest concentrations of the three periods of development history in Sunset Park. So, now, I'll just take you quickly through each one. The Sunset Park South historic District consists of approximately 285 residential buildings located between 54th and 59th streets and fourth and fifth avenues. This historic district has a high level of integrity, as is shown in the dominantly green color on the map. A portion of 57th Street contains

buildings either with major alterations or of

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES different scales and building dates that did not reflect to the historic character of surrounding streets and this portion of 57th Street was not included in the district. The area includes a strong concentration of Sunset Park's oldest buildings. was mostly constructed in the 1890s. And it contains a rows of stone and brick fronted houses shown on this map of row house typologies and what the map shows is the different materials that are used in the facades, as well as the different bay shapes, but what we found really are very strong rows of consistent style and shape. And in these images we see stone and break row houses within the Sunset Park South historic district featuring angled and round days, intact stoops and railings, and carved and molded ornaments. The houses often incorporate decorative elements and alternating patterns to differentiate houses and long rows. These images from 56th Street show examples of the rich ornamentation found in the neighborhood in this historic district. Sunset Park 50th Street historic district consists of two rows of 25 houses framing 50th Street between fourth and fifth avenues.

Constructed between 1897 and 1903, this section of

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES 50th Street is one of the neighborhood's finest historic box, notable for its cohesive rows of remarkably well preserved brownstone fronted houses. All of the houses here were designed by just to architects, so it is incredibly consistent. houses on this blog feature hives stoops, projecting bays, and richly textured brownstone fronts. façades combine the rough surfaces and curb linear ornament of the Romanesque revival style with the angular forms and classical details of the Renaissance revival style. With its unified row and high degree of historical integrity, the Sunset Park 50th Street historic District remains one of its neighborhoods stand out blocks. The Central Sunset Park historic District consists of approximately 148 buildings located on 47th and 48th Street between fifth and sixth avenues and along Sixth Avenue. Constructed between 1897 and 1906, the central area incorporates some of that area has outstanding turn of the century residential architecture and includes intact blocks found along Sixth Avenue that extend the character of the mid-blocks and strengthen the sense of place. The districts consistency and age

type and high integrity is shown on these maps.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES districts row houses are clad in bright, limestone, brownstone, or a combination and its streetscapes feature consistent cornice lines, a rid them of projecting bays, and high stoops with intact iron railings and elaborate carved ornament. And here you can see some examples of the intricate carved detail and stoops within the Central Park-- Central Sunset Park historic district. And, finally, the Sunset Park North historic District consists of approximately 56 buildings on the south side of 44th Street between fifth and seventh Avenue. well-preserved blocks overlooking Sunset Park are notable for their cohesive rows of limestone and brick fronted houses and apartment houses all representing the neighborhoods architectural development just following the turn of the 20th century. These blocks have a special character along the park. They include a unique row of limestone fronted houses, one of the neighborhood's most intact and consistent blocks of brick flat fronted row houses, and for apartment buildings designed in 1913 with an eclectic mix of classical and arts and crafts detailing. Overlooking Sunset Park on a sloping hill, this block has a strong sense of place

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES highlighted by its fine architecture and natural topography. With their geographical distribution throughout the neighborhood, the four historic districts capture the primary periods of development and resulting range of residential building typologies in Sunset Park. Together, they tell the story of Sunset Park's development history and capture its most significant architecture and streetscapes. Thank you. And I am happy to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Are

2.2

community?

there any questions from the panel or comments?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah. I just want to ask-- you know, so much of the presentation really was rooted an analysis that your team put so much time and effort in going out into the community. How important it was for the community to organize so early and present so much information to this process? How important was that work from the

KATE MCHALE: Oh, it's very important and we appreciate it very much. We, of course, have taken to our own sanity and our own analysis and we took them five that was provided to us and then, you

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

know, really at the whole neighborhood and area to analyze the request way then that broader area and not really allowed us to definitively identify the strongest areas that, together, tell such an important story of the neighborhood's development.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I think that's just an important point to make about the kind of ground swells support. The committee -- not just the committee. The community board and all the business is and I think it's just like an important part of this story and narrative. And the last question I have is we are looking at for applications at once. I remember at one point we thought that was just never going to be possible and that was hard because I think no one wanted to let go of that possibility and here we are with four different districts, noncontiquous, never really happened before. Can you talk about the importance of how or what makes it so important to look at four districts and one neighborhood together?

KATE MCHALE: Well, it was. And, as you said, I think we came at this in a creative way and a lot of the discussions that we had about how to do that and the support that we had from all of you is

```
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
 1
     SITING, AND MARITIME USES
 2
     so important. And this is a district that has these
     areas, but in between are areas where there have been
 3
    more changes or the development has led to the, you
 4
 5
     know, less consistency in the streetscapes. And just
    in terms of how to really recognize and protect those
 6
    areas that stand out and that are-- really retain
 7
    their historic character, I think it was a wonderful
 8
    sort of process and the framework that was developed
 9
10
    to really to get to this was very important.
                COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I couldn't
11
12
    agree more and that's exactly what we are doing.
    are protecting Sunset Park. Thank you.
13
14
                KATE MCHALE: Thank you.
15
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Council
16
             Now, we will move on to LU 528. Doctor's
    member.
17
     Row. Yeah. Do you want to give testimony or --
18
                [background comments]
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah.
19
20
                COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA:
                                            There are
21
     other ones, I'm sorry.
2.2
                KATE MCHALE: Okay. Good afternoon,
23
    Council member Koo and subcommittee members.
    Kate Lemos McHale of the Landmarks Preservation
24
```

Commission. Thank you for this opportunity to

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 present the Bay Ridge Parkway doctor's Row historic District designated on June 25. The historic 3 4 district is the first in Bay Ridge and as are the Sunset Park districts the first and Sunset Park and 5 6 is a distinguished example of the neighborhood's 7 transformation from a suburban resort community to a middle-class urban neighborhood in the early 20th 8 century. In addition to the high quality of its 9 10 architecture, it has acquired a noteworthy association and as a doctor's Row, thanks to the 11 12 number of medical professionals who have lived and had offices on the block. Both historically and 13 14 currently. The historic district is located between 15 fourth and fifth avenues in the Bay Ridge 16 neighborhood of Brooklyn, as shown on this map. 17 request to evaluate the block came from the community 18 with support from Council member Brannan and Community Board 10. At its public hearing on May 14, 19 20 and in written testimony, the commission received support from the 11 organizations and individuals 21 2.2 including State Senator Andrew Gounardes, Council 23 member Justin Brannan, Brooklyn Community Board 10,

Historic Districts Council, and the New York

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
Landmarks Conservancy. There was no opposition to designation.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Bay Ridge was primarily an agricultural community until the late 19th century when resorts and suburban residences were constructed along the shore. Bay Ridge Parkway was originally envisioned as a Boulevard to connect to the Shore Drive along New York Bay and the historic district is a prominent tree-lined block. The plan to construct the fourth Avenue subway line, announced in 1903, was the primary catalyst for rapid speculative development in a rage and jubilant Realty man, as you can see in this advertisement. It reached 86th Street in Bay Ridge and in 1916. Bay Ridge development company was organized in 1904 and its secretary builder, Arthur Douglas Constant, was charged with constructing row houses on both sides of Bay Ridge Parkway between fourth and fifth avenues, shown here and an advertisement from 1907 at work, quote, calculated to supply a long felt want for one family houses in Bay Ridge and will constitute the only complete block of such residences in the section, end quote. entire block was constructed in segments over seven years between 1906 and 1913, primarily between 1906

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES and 1909. A.D. Constant constructed most of the buildings and the rows were designed by just two architects. Benjamin Driesler, a prolific Brooklyn architect and William Flanagan. The block developed was a cohesive appearance over all. evaluation and boundary analysis of the potential district, LPC staff studied a broader area and found that this lot, in particular, stands out within the larger neighborhood context due to its high architectural quality and consistency, which, in combination with the Parkways Boulevard feeling, creates a strong sense of place and historic character. Within the historic district, the row houses are set back behind spacious area ways and are primarily characterized by limestone façades, bowed or angled fronts, low stoops, stone window and door surrounds, and embellished cornices typical of the Renaissance revival style. The north side of the block is shown here. It's architecturally very consistent. On the right is a brick building at the eastern end of the block which was constructed to house a doctor's office, a trend that would become ubiquitous in later years. The south side of the

street includes brick row houses shown on the left,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES limestone fronted row houses similar to the north side shown on the right, including eight with colonial revival entrances that were advertised as house colonials and described by the Bay Ridge development company as having, quote, and exterior design and that is something entirely new in house building, end quote. As this map illustrates, the historic district has a high level of integrity. Alterations are mostly limited to the replacement of doors and windows, changes to area waves, or the addition of a basement doctor's office entrance, such as shown on the left. Since this data and telephone directory has provided information regarding medical professionals who live door had offices on this block between 1910 and 1960, indicating a rapid increase in medical professionals on the block. Among the first reference to it as a doctor's Row appears to be from a Brooklyn Daily Eagle real estate advertisement in 1949. By 1950 and continuing into the 1960s, as shown on this map, well over half of the buildings house to doctors and other medical professionals, either with offices or in residence. Other blocks in the city have been referred to as Doctors Row,

including examples within LPC designated districts in

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	the South Bronx, Manhattan, and Brooklyn. The term
3	seems to have typically been used for promotional
4	real estate purposes and to emphasize particularly
5	elegant blocks with in a neighborhood. In these two
6	photos taken in 1907 and 2019, 112 years apart, you
7	can see the block still looks very much as it did in
8	the first decade of the 20th century. It strongly
9	reflects the architectural and historical development
10	of this section of Bay Ridge and still houses
11	doctors' offices. Thank you for the opportunity to
12	present his historic district. I am happy to answer
13	any questions.
14	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much.
15	Yeah. There are no questions from Council members.
16	KATE MCHALE: Okay. Thanks.
17	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. You are
18	excused. Now, we are proceeding to public panels.
19	First we have Yvette huh? Asho?
20	[background comments]
21	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Aquire [sp?]?
22	YVETTE AQUIRE: Yeah.
23	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Juan No. Jane
24	Jimenez and Nina Malkin.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 YVETTE AQUIRE: Should all three people-3 4 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah. Three people [inaudible 00:49:56]. 5 [background comments] 6 7 CHAIRPERSON KOO: You may begin after you identify yourself. Yeah. You just take-- Whoever 8 want to go first, go first. 9 10 [background comments] YVETTE AQUIRE: Ah. Okay. Is it on 11 12 now? Okay. I usually could use--13 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Start over. 14 YVETTE AQUIRE: Okay. My name is Yvette 15 [inaudible 00:50:41]. I'm a resident of Sunset Park. I own a brownstone on 47th street since 1974. I've 16 17 been in this community from the time I was a child. 18 We have been working on this process of maintaining our brownstones from the time that I could remember, 19 20 going back at least 30 or 40 years. We have had the support of every Council person for the past 20 21 2.2 years. We've had the support of Carlos Menchaca for 23 the past seven years. We've had the support of Silas Gonzalez for 10 and a half years, almost 11 years. 24

We had to support of Alex-- Angel Rodriguez before

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES then, so this is a history of support from our elected officials. We have our Congresswoman who has—— Anita Velasquez for the last 20 years who has also been very supportive of this movement and the maintenance of these brownstones have been kept by this community. We have all protected them like they were our babies and we have—— we're very grateful to have gotten to this point and so we really would love to make sure that this supported and that we get through this process. Thank you.

2.2

JAN JIMENEZ: Thank you, Chair Koo. My
name is Jan Hudes [sp?] Jimenez. I live at 554 48th
street in Brooklyn in the Central— what's being
called the Central Sunset Park designated area. I
have been a homeowner there with my husband for 20
years. So, I'm going to read my statement just
because it'll be more efficient, I think. The land
marking initiative before you represents a unique
opportunity to celebrate the built environment of
Sunset Park by protecting blocks that best rest of
the neighborhoods historic contribution to Brooklyn
and New York City. Of four historic districts
designated by the Landmark Preservation Committee
instill a sense of place, history, and pride for all

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES who live, work, and simply stroll through our beautiful neighborhood of Sunset Park. This proposal is the culmination of an amazing neighborhood effort to preserve the architectural integrity of a small portion of Sunset Park. I'm very fortunate to live on a block that is still visually cohesive and showcases the architectural form and beauty that creates the type of beautiful streetscapes that we are seeking to preserve. My husband and I were block captains for this effort and, with neighbors who speak the many languages on our block, we had conversations about this initiative with residents and every home on our block. Without exception, we heard overwhelming support for preservation efforts as our neighbors expressed dismay over the architectural changes being made on surrounding blocks as loops, cornices, and lentils are replaced, rooftop additions are built, grand parlor floor windows are diminished in size with brick infill and entire stone façade are replaced by brick or tile. In the most disturbing instances, we see an entire house is being demolished from the ground up and replaced with out of context and out of scale new building. When such changes happen to even a single

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 building, the impact reverberates up and down the block. It diminishes the visual glory of our streets 3 and that forever altered a block that stood in 4 5 harmony for more than a century. Sunset Park is in danger of losing its sense of place and its 6 7 neighborhood feel. These characteristics that make our wonderful neighborhood special and unique foster 8 a sense of authentic human attachment and longing. 9 They inspire us to care for our built environment 10 and, with their preservation, will contribute to 11 12 legacy as community history and pride on which future generations will build. I encourage you to accept 13 14 our application. To approve application. Thank you. 15 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Next. Yeah. 16 NINA MALKIN: Yeah. Hi, everyone. How's 17 Better? My name is Nina Malkin. I live on that? 18 54th street and I'm a relative new, to Sunset Park where my husband and I are there for 15 years. 19 20 we were looking for houses, we looked all over Brooklyn, all over Queens, a little bit Jersey. 21 2.2 Forgive us. We kept coming back to Sunset Park 23 because it was just so beautiful and we thought how 24 could regular people live in these beautiful homes?

But all we saw around us as we walked up and down the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES blocks were regular people and their children playing on the stoops and their dogs being walked and curbed and taken care of and their gardens being small little courtyard gardens being maintained. Then we kept coming back and back and, until we found that we looked in and our charger opted we were like, this is When we do, we felt like we belonged here because it felt like everybody belonged here. Everybody deserves a beautiful place to live in these were the kind of-- I mean, I'm out Brooklyn native and these were the kind of two family and three family homes that I, you know, grew up around only-just not that nice. And when we started to see some of the development that was going on in the neighborhood by people who didn't actually live there, it was very disturbing to us. We thought, what's going on? What are they doing to our beautiful place? And started to lose, not just its beauty, but it's feel. People didn't look ni-newer people didn't look each other in the eye and didn't say hello. And when we found out that we could get involved in trying to landmark the neighborhood, that's one hour block and everybody

else's block really started to come together and I

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

```
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
 1
     SITING, AND MARITIME USES
 2
     started to meet ladies and gentlemen from other
    blocks that I didn't know so well. So, I don't
 3
 4
    really have a prepared statement, but I do want to
    think the LPC for their efforts, the Sunset Park
 5
 6
    landmarks committee led by Lynn Massimo [sp?] for
 7
     getting this off the ground, the Council, and Mr.
 8
    Menchaca for everything that you all have done.
     Thanks so much and please do approve our application.
 9
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Next panel
10
    Maria Roger. Lynn Massimo. Sure. Jason Stutz. You
11
12
    want to do four? Cynthia Phyllis.
                LEGAL COUNSEL:
                                 We've got to take the
13
14
    vote for it.
15
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Oh.
                                      Oh.
16
                LEGAL COUNSEL:
                                 So before they begin.
17
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah. Yeah. Before you
18
    guys start, we have to make the -- We have to take a
    vote for Council member Miller. Yeah. You want to
19
20
    call [inaudible 00:58:12].
                LEGAL COUNSEL: On LU number 481, 482,
21
2.2
     483, 484, 485, 486, 487, 488, 489, 490, 491, 492,
23
     493, 494, and 495 and preconsidered LU number 510 and
     511, Council member Miller, how do you vote?
24
```

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you. With a vote of four in the affirmative and zero in the negative 3 in zero abstentions, the items are recommended for 4 full Land Use Committee. 5 6 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Council 7 member Miller. Now, you guys can start after you identify yourself. Yeah. 8 LYNN MASSIMO: Is this thing on? 9 10 No. CHAIRPERSON KOO: No. Please speak to the 11 12 mic. Yeah. LYNN MASSIMO: Is this thing on? 13 name is Lynn Massimo. I live at 526 47th Street in 14 15 Brooklyn. Thank you, Council member Koo for chairing 16 today and for the other Council members who are here. 17 And for Council member Menchaca who has been with us 18 at every meeting, thank you. [background comments] 19 20 In 2012, I spearheaded LYNN MASSIMO: the Sunset Park Landmarks Committee, which is a 21 2.2 grassroots organization that has been fighting for a 23 land marking detection for our neighborhood for seven years. But, before the incarnation of this 24

particular effort, in the 1980s, the Sunset Parkers

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES fought for protection and successfully got the neighborhood onto the national register. So, today, you are seeing the culmination of decades of Sunset Parkers passionate dedication to preserving our neighborhood. On many of blocks, generations of Sunset Parkers has kept their row houses intact and looking historic, but rampant out of context renovations are erasing that history. I have included some photos of the beautiful and then the other two pages are of the rampant out of context renovations. That history, which is both the history of architecture and the history of an immigrant community, it deserves to honored and preserved. while preserving the history, we can still embrace the future. On Friday, solar panels were installed on my roof and it sailed through the LPC approval process. So, we've got past and future, you know, happy together. So, and when I speak, please here not only my single voice, but the voice of literal thousand that support preserving in Sunset Park. Our organization did an enormous amount of outreach. did more than 16 outreach events in the neighborhood. We gave more than seven and walking tours. We gave

trolley tours. We have a trolley. We had trolley

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 tours and we canvassed door-to-door on-- about 16 blocks. So, who supports it? Over six--- Sorry. 3 4 Over 3000 Sunset Park residents signed our petition 5 in support. Over 400 homeowners wrote support 6 letters. Our Council member Menchaca, Assembly 7 member Felix Ortiz, Congresswoman Anita Velasquez, former State Senator Jessie Hamilton, Community Board 8 seven, and other community organizations which are 9 Rose and Sunset Park fifth Avenue bid and the Chinese 10 American Planning Council, Greenwood Cemetery, the 11 12 Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce, the Bethelship Norwegian United Methodist Church. They are all in 13 14 support. I'm also here is the member of the 15 Community Board seven and I did bring a letter from 16 the board, which reaffirms their unanimous support of 17 all for historic districts. So, thank you very much 18 for your time and please vote yes on all four districts. Thank you. 19

MARIA ROCA: Good afternoon. [speaking foreign language] I am Maria Roca. I am here not only representing myself as a longtime resident of Sunset Park, in 1964 when my family first came to Sunset Park, the also the membership and— of the

20

21

2.2

23

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES members of Friends of Sunset Park. By the way, we also submitted a letter of support.

[background comments]

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

2.2

23

24

25

MARIA ROCA: It's okay. Just wanted to go on record. I know. Much of what I would say here has been said about the dedication of this community for generations. For generations that have brought us to this moment and do you use to the right word. Culminated in this day. It is a good day indeed. There are some better memories because certainly it should be a bigger-- a larger number of homes that are landmarked, but it has been said before. Some of them no longer worthy of land marking because of the greed of some that didn't appreciate it and some to whom what we wanted to honor, what we want to honor, what we want to preserve doesn't really resonate with So, for either or. So, let's start here. I can say is that I hope to be back here for an-- I don't-- Relax. For the next round after week, for air to add to this because we know that can happen. So I want to-- and it should have been because, if we do not stay focused and intends on preserving not only Sunset Park, but many, many other New York communities that face extinction. We see it in the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES

2.2

paper every day. It's in the news every day. New York well no longer be then New York that we all of and care about. So, I said before, I certainly want to think so many people who, for generations, have worked on this in one way or another, to the two Lynn's, the other Lynn not being here, of the Sunset Park Landmarks Committee, HTC for being a staunch supporter and always there for us. Our Councilman and everybody else and I hope to see you all here in the near future adding to this. So, yes. Without question, please approve because, if not, you're not going to get rid of us. Thank you.

CYNTHIA FELIX: Good afternoon. My name is Cynthia Felix and I live on 50th Street between fourth and Fifth Avenue. Hon. Council people and members, I would like to thank you for the opportunity to speak this afternoon. I would want to think the LPC for their support and flexibility with our community and letting us do a very unique proposal with four distinct districts. Especially for the 50th Street proposal, which is a standalone street, and I want to think Council member Menchaca for his vision and dedication to Sunset Park and always saying [speaking foreign language] when we

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES need him. I want to thank the Lynn's for starting the Sunset Park landmark commission and always being there for us. And, most importantly, I want to think my neighbors and the homeowners and the tenants for their tireless efforts to maintain a 100+ year home. It isn't easy, folks. You break a wall and something else pops up that you have to fix. You find a hole and you have to maintain it to integrity and it is not an easy thing to do. But a group of us was dedicated enough to do that and that is why we are here today. It was a collective effort. It's not easy. The Z thing is to make it new and to put things, but we didn't want to do that. We looked around and I was born and raised in the same house that I am living in now and, in the past 15 years, architectural changes have gone all around me. look around and where I grew up has changed tremendously, but a group of us decided we don't want to change where we live. We want to keep it the same. We want to see things that are old and maintain that piece and why we want to do that is because those changes take away the sense of place in New York City and, while we realize that you can't

hold on to everything, we do believe that development

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 must be done with forethought and consideration and the creation of historic districts does just that. 3 It reassures us that our homes will keep the 4 5 integrity and the original architect will preserve the fabric of the future of Sunset Park, not for our 6 7 kids, but for our kids kids, too. These blocks 8 instill a sense of place, history, and pride. I grew up on my block playing stupid ball and are block 9 priorities are celebrations of what we have with our 10 families. We look back at our memories and it makes 11 12 I look up and down the block. me proud. I look at the flowers our families grow and sitting on the 13 14 stoop and reminiscing about things that are going on 15 and it gives me just a sense of pride in this really 16 big said anywhere sometimes you feel all alone. you go back into those blocks and you feel a sense of 17 18 family and that is really important. And helps us preserve the beauty and celebrate the beauty. 19 20 humbly ask you to help us preserve the beauty and celebrate the beauty of Sunset Park by preserving 21 2.2 these blocks that we've worked so hard to maintain 23 throughout our own families and so that we could pass 24 that on to our own families for years to come.

25

you.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

2.2

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Next gentleman.

JASON STUTZ: My name is Jason Stutz. live at 469 54th Street in Brooklyn with my wife, We've been there 15 years. We moved to their because of what it already is. I was looking at the picture in Bay Ridge. I said, oh, that's a rage, but we had pictures from the LPC earlier of our neighborhood and what we're talking about is something that inspires life and all of us. When you walk down these blocks, they feel good and that goes a lot deeper than just this is what we want. subconscious. And it's important that we feel that way. That we feel like we belong and you had that feeling when you walked down the streets and it's beautiful and we should keep it that way. For life's sake. A lot of the changes that have been made just seemed to be made for some instant gratification of people making money and things like that. not all that is important. And so all four of these districts we feel like our important and we think the LPC. Everybody who has worked on this, I think, would agree. It just feels so good. And when you see things that are-- you just have to be there and I think we all know. That's all we need to say.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	It's a beautiful place and we would like to leave the
3	beauty intact. Thank you for your consideration. We
4	hope you will vote for it. All four.
5	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Yeah.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Can I have one
7	question?
8	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Sure. Council member
9	Menchaca.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
11	Chair, for a quick question. So here's my conundrum.
12	Are we going to have four different parties?
13	UNIDENTIFIED: Yes. Of course.
14	JASON STUTZ: Five.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Five.
16	MARIA ROCA: Each group gets and then
17	the big one.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And then the
19	big one. Okay. [speaking foreign language] Thank
20	you.
21	MARIA ROCA: [speaking foreign language]
22	[background comments]
23	CHAIRPERSON KOO: The next panel will be
24	Susan Brown, Linda Acini, and Simon Bankoff.

[background comment]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Three of each. Yeah.

3 | One of each.

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Could you please identify yourselves and then you can start.

Yeah.

LINDA ACINI: Good afternoon, Council. am Linda Acini. I live that 441 Bay Ridge Parkway and I would like to thank you for having us here today and we are of course hoping that we will be voted in. Bay Ridge Parkway is, as LPC said, predominantly in an intact street. The street has a real sense of importance in the neighborhood, but, when you branch out into Brooklyn and other parts of New York, people know Doctors Row. They had been calming to physicians there for many years. are generations of physicians, dentists, attorneys practicing on the street, I know several of them personally. I purchased the house in 1982. I came in with my husband at the time. He was an internist. I am an RN. We purchased from a family practitioner who had purchased from a DO. My daughter is a surgeon. So, we kind of embodied the medical -- the caring and the medical professions that it lived and thrived on this very beautiful street. The street

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES also gives the individuals who walk up and down the street-- and we get a lot of lot of traffic. People get a real sense of stability, strength, sense of place, and are block Association has replanted all the tree wells. We have had more trees planted in conjunction with Forest Street and the block is, once again, beautiful and thriving. We are also deeply concerned, as Sunset Park beautifully brought out, the changes are not and hand saying or surveying the community. The changes that people want to make to these buildings just are not consistent with and don't really enhance the people that live in the buildings and in the neighborhood. I can tell you that, since we have got into this place today, there is a sense of pride in our community that I did not sends before we started. It's a really--grown. People are like, yeah. We are this place. We are this community and I think it is gray than I think it is -- I am hopeful and secure that you will vote for us. Thank you. SUSAN BROWN: We have waited for this day

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

for years. Thank you for listening to us. My name is Susan Brown. I have owned a home on Bay Ridge Parkway, Doctors Row, for 50 years. Landmarks

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES preservation is going to be our salvation. Their protection is crucial to our maintaining the integrity of our beloved rock for now and in the future. Of the brief. We will be honored to be designated landmarks preservation commission first historic district in Bay Ridge and we hope for more telecom. Thank you very much.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

SIMEON BANKOFF: Good afternoon, Council members. Simeon Bankoff, executive director of the Historic Districts Council. I'm really happy to be here today to testify on all five of these historic districts. They are both long-- Bay Ridge in Sunset Park long time projects that we have been working with the communities on. In Bay Ridge, as Lynn had mentioned, the Sunset Park-- sorry. In Sunset Park, as Lynn mentioned, the sunset Park community wanted some recognition in the 1980s and protection for their neighborhood, so they hired Anders Scott Dolkart who is one of New York's most preeminent architectural historians to write a report getting a large section of the neighborhood on the national register of historic places. That was in 1988. Please keep in mind that New York State only adopted its own registry of historic places in 1980.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES was a reasonably new preservation strategy and hours stayed and now was one of the largest historic districts in the state at the time. However, fastforward 25 years and, while the NR status hadn't had any ill effects, it hadn't really helped preserve the wonderful character of the neighborhood. So, and 2012, late 2012, ACC met with Lynn Massimo and Lynn Tondrek [sp?] And their neighbors and began working through our six to celebrate program with them to help shape a picture perfect community campaign to gain the local landmark designation that they spoke about. Based on the NR research, neighbors canvassed their neighbors. They met with a number of generations of elected officials, including Council member Menchaca who has been so very helpful. created a popular community led movement to help preserve their physical character of the neighborhood. Along the way, they forged ties with other community organizations and even helped rescue the last freestanding mansion in the neighborhood from demolition. They were among the first community groups to meet with this mayors administration to request landmark designation and have been remarkably

patient for the last five years it took to get us to

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES this point. So, thank you all very much for seeing this over the finish line. Particularly, I would like to just say at the last-- when the Landmarks Commission mentioned that they met with the owner's twice, it was because the first time a number of people in the community wanted and I have it-- you know, wanted to enlarge the historic district and, in what I saw to be really unprecedented move, Landmarks listened to them. The agency listened to them and came out and came -- and did and expanded their project, which is fantastic. Now, with regard to our friends in Bay Ridge, back in 2012, we also worked with community members in Bay Ridge and sponsored a survey of that remarkable neighborhood which was funded with by public funds from New York State. We delivered the survey to the local Council member, Vini Gentile at the time, and the Landmarks Commission, but there was not a lot of community support behind it at the moment, so we sort of let the matter go. Imagine our delight years later when neighbors in the area got in touch with us about the possibility of landmark designation. We started working closely with these people. Fortunately, one of our staff lives in the area, so evening meetings

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES were somewhat easier. We also found a strong partner in Council member Brannan and leaders at the local community board. And let me be very clear that this project would not have happened without the remarkable work of Linda, who was the right person at the right time. We were genuinely thrilled when Landmarks Commission reacted supportively this proposal. In fact, fast track to this project. all our years working with the agency and when it says process, I can honestly say this is one of the swiftest designations of the local historic district that we have ever seen. The positive agency action was made only more important by the current lack of designated properties in this area of Brooklyn and, given the communities support and interest in this project, we have been getting a lot of calls from neighbors wanting to know more about it. So, and given the Landmarks Commission's openness and the Chairs commitment to spreading the agency's influence and areas that are being underrepresented, we have hoped that we will see many more landmarks in southern Brooklyn and other areas of the city soon.

So, thank you all very, very much. These are two

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING. AND MARITIME USES stories that I wish there were more of, but let's really celebrate them.

2.2

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council member, do you have questions?

question that I have-- and this is maybe the Simon.

By the way, congrats, Bay Ridge. Congrats. And it is great that we are celebrating in South Brooklyn neighbors. Really to Simon, how important is it that communities organize around this issue and you played such an important technical role, but like really how four and is it that communities come out and organize and build this kind of constituency around this kind of question?

not going to say it's impossible without a strong community organization, but it is very, very more unlikely to happen. Additionally, in addition to—the whole purpose of historic preservation and not about the regulation of architecture. It's about the celebration of a special sense of place and a community growing and feeling that it's ca—that it has a voice in the future of its neighborhood. And without that communal voice, it's a kind of pointless

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 effort. Additionally, because at the end of the day, every government action is reliant on community 3 4 compliance, if you have a situation where no one is 5 going to be compliant, where communities are incredibly, incredibly opposed to this-- the 6 7 Landmarks Commission is one of our least resourced agencies in the city of New York. They've got an 8 enormous amount of work to do and there are enough 9 10 people who want their attention that they are not going to force it down the sort of necks of people 11 12 who are just trying to get by. Instead, what they want are strong community partners who will help 13 further the action so it becomes a success. So I 14 15 think that what the Sunset Park community did which 16 was truly remarkable and was-- when I say picture perfect, was that they went door to door and actually 17 18 analyzed it and, when Chair Shrinivasen [sp?} saw the charts that showed, oh well, we've talked to 85 19 20 percent of people on this block and, of that 85 percent, you know, 76 percent said yes and the other 21 2.2 24 percent were like, sounds okay. Like those are 23 actual numbers that they said, oh, wow. This is a

24

real thing.

```
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
 1
     SITING, AND MARITIME USES
 2
                COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: It's people
    power. I hope you and the LPC are ready for five
 3
    parties of celebration. And maybe six. We'll get
 4
 5
     invited to Bay Ridge. Thank you.
 6
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay. No more questions
 7
     from Council members.
 8
                COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Just wait a minute.
 9
     Is there another--
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Panel?
10
                COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: panel coming up?
11
12
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: No.
13
                COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could I make a
14
     statement?
15
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Sure.
16
                COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.
17
                CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council member Miller
18
     wants to make a statement.
                COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
19
20
     Chair. So, as I sit and I read through the pamphlets
     and I read the community reports and I look up, then
21
2.2
     I am reminded of a home that I grew up in, my
23
    grandmother's home, in Prospect Heights that looks a
24
     lot like that and the blocks itself. And so, I was
```

downstairs and I was just talking-- and I represent

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 Southeast Queens and so, what do we all have in common here? And that is the fact that 76 percent of 3 New Yorkers rent and to have this type of 4 5 conversation that values homeownership, that values communities and integrity of communities is not often 6 7 what happens here at City Council. And it's difficult when it comes to common issues that support 8 homeowners that we can kind of core lasts around 9 those common issues. And, certainly, and Southeast 10 Queens we have a few landmark communities that are 11 12 very, very important, but what I find equally important is that I just appreciate the appreciation 13 14 for communities and the value of this committee and 15 landmarks as communities transition. There are a 16 number of things that happened and was mentioned by one of the other speakers earlier is that that is how 17 18 you preserve the integrity of communities. This is one took of land marking and that is the beauty of 19 20 this mosaic of new York city that, you know, sometimes you want Chinese and you want to go to 21 2.2 Chinatown and do other things and just not that you 23 can't get it on the corner, but you don't get the fullness and the richness of communities or getting 24

[inaudible 01:23:25]. And so I'll leave with this.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC 1 SITING, AND MARITIME USES 2 There was a ti-- there was an article in one of the major dailies on the weakened section about a month 3 4 back and it talked about the lack of housing in new 5 York city and that we needed more density and then it 6 went on to say how dare communities such as Southeast 7 Queens and South Brooklyn communities have such low 8 density like we're not doing our part. And, you know, I reject that. It is the quality of life that 9 10 we work so hard for and not just to obtain, but to preserve that quality of life. And the fact that it 11 12 is not mutually exclusive. That we cannot create housing and density where necessary where applicable 13 14 and, at the same time, preserve the integrity of what 15 we have here. So, I thought that this is--16 sometimes you think this a long fight, specific to you or your community, but then you see that there 17 18 are others throughout the city that are fighting to preserve the integrity of their community, as well. 19 20 So, I just wanted to add my two cents in that and how I -- Yeah. Value the work that you are doing and I 21 2.2 may have to invite you out to help, although we 23 actually have a pretty strong landmark committee that 24 works within the community to preserve the integrity

of Southeast Queens. So, thank you for your work.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES

2.2

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And thank you, Mr. Chair, for allowing me to say a few words.

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Council member Miller. Yeah. So, that's-- You guys are all done. Yeah. Are there anymore members of the public who wish to testify on these items? Seeing none, I now close today's public hearing and these items are laid over. On September 1st, the City Council held a 10 hour public hearing--

UNIDENTIFIED: 10 hours?

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah. On the borough-based jails proposal and received feedback on all ULRP applications associated with the project. In order to exercise the Council's discretion over the [inaudible 01:26:01] mandatory ULRP applications, the Council adopted a core resolution at last week's Stated Meeting. Those items are on the calendar for September 18th. But to be sure, the Council accepted testimony on all ULRP applications on September 5th, including the [inaudible 01:26:27] mandatory applications. I now open public hearings on LU numbers 518, 519, 520, 521, 522, 523, 524, 525, and 526. All witnesses will be limited to one minute.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, AND MARITIME USES
2	[background comments]
3	CHAIRPERSON KOO: Are there any members of
4	the public who wish to testify on these items?
5	Seeing none, I now close today's public hearing. All
6	items are laid over. I would like to thank the
7	members of the public, my colleagues, counsel, and
8	the land use staff for attending today's hearing.
9	The meeting is now hereby adjourned.
10	[gavel]
11	[background comments]
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 24, 2019