

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

August 14, 2019
Start: 1:51 p.m.
Recess: 3:06 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Jumaane Williams
Public Advocate

COREY D. JOHNSON
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson

Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden
Ben Kallos
Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 STATED MEETING

4

2 STEVEN SIDOWSKI: This is a test, this is
3 a test. Today's date is August 14 of 2019 on the
4 Stated Meeting, recorded by Steven Sidowski.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Quiet on the floor please,
6 quiet on the floor. Can all council members please
7 take your seats, all council members please take your
8 seats so we can take a head count please. Thank you.
9 At this time please place all electronic devices, all
10 electronic devices, to vibrate. Quiet, please.

11 Shhh. Will all non-council employees, non-council
12 employees please leave the main floor of the
13 chambers. There is additional seating upstairs in
14 the balcony. Thank you. Mr. Public Advocate.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Good afternoon
16 and welcome to the Stated Meeting of August 14, 2019.
17 I am Public Advocate Jumaane Williams.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Would everyone please rise
19 for the Pledge of Allegiance.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: I pledge allegiance to the
22 flag of the United States of America, and to the
23 republic for which it stands, one nation under God,
24 indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

1 STATED MEETING

5

2

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

3

UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel. Ayala.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

5

UNIDENTIFIED: Barron. Borelli. Brannan.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

7

UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera. Chin.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

9

UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen. Constantinides.

10

Cornegy.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

12

UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Present.

14

UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Present.

16

UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

18

UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal. Eugene. Gibson.

19

Gjonaj. Grodenchik.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

21

UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

23

UNIDENTIFIED: Ben Kallos.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

25

UNIDENTIFIED: King. Koo.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
3 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
5 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
7 UNIDENTIFIED: Lander. Levin.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
9 UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
11 UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
13 UNIDENTIFIED: Louis.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.
15 UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
17 UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
19 UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
21 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya. Perkins.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.
23 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso. Richards.
3 Rivera.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Treyger. Ulrich.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE:

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer. Yeger.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo. Cumbo.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Right here.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. We

22 will now have today's invocation, which will be
23 delivered by Rabbi Moishe Weiner of the Jewish
24 Committee Council of Greater Coney Island, which is
25 located on West 37th Street in Brooklyn.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

3 RABBI MOISHE WEINER: It is an immense
4 privilege to be in the presence of distinguished
5 legislators who have dedicated their lives and
6 careers to the communal benefit. All New Yorkers
7 should stand in your honor. A basic tenet is the
8 concept of divine providence. The holy Baal Shem
9 Tov, the scholar and saint who founded the Hasidic
10 movement, emphasized that everything we see and hear
11 is ordained by the Almighty and should be viewed as a
12 source of instruction to us. If this applies even to
13 mundane matters, how much more so should we
14 contemplate and be inspired by occurrences of a
15 spiritual nature. Let us examine what we can learn
16 from two phenomenon coinciding with this week and
17 this day. Each week in synagogues throughout the
18 world another biblical section is read and studied,
19 based on an annual cycle. Each weekly biblical
20 portion is divided into seven parts, corresponding to
21 the seven days of the week. The section
22 corresponding specifically to today, Wednesday, is
23 the recounting of the divine revelation on Mount
24 Sinai and the giving of the Ten Commandments. Just a
25 few days ago on Sunday, the fast of Tisha B'Av was

2 observed, which is Judaism's most solemn day of
3 national mourning, commemorating the destruction of
4 both the first and second holy temples in Jerusalem,
5 the exile of the Jewish people from their land, and
6 the horrific persecutions of the Jewish people
7 throughout the centuries, culminating with the
8 Holocaust. What can we learn from the confluence of
9 these two events? Biblical commentators struggle
10 with why the Almighty chose to include in the Ten
11 Commandments not only spiritual precepts, but also
12 civil law ordinances, which human intellect compels.
13 Do we need a divine revelation in order to know not
14 to murder? Does the great ideal of you shall not
15 steal require the prerequisite of I am the Lord, your
16 God, in order to be sustained? The resolution of
17 this enigma can be derived from the lesson of the
18 fast of Tisha B'AV and its manifestation in our times
19 in our times in the Holocaust. Germany before World
20 War II was a nation of philosophers and scientist.
21 It was a center of culture, art, and music. Yet this
22 same nation murdered millions of innocents in the
23 name of a developed ethic and they justified genocide
24 on purely rational grounds. The gas chambers were
25 not invented by a primitive, barbaric, and illiterate

2 people. To the contrary, this people excelled in
3 sciences and the arts, but nevertheless sent 1.5
4 million children and 4.5 million adults to their
5 deaths solely because they had Jewish blood flowing
6 in their veins. Also, hundreds of thousands of
7 individuals from other groups deemed racially
8 inferior were brutally slaughter. The Nazi era
9 proved beyond a shadow of a doubt that reason alone
10 cannot be counted on to be reasonable because reason
11 can rationalize. The first tablet of the Ten
12 Commandments between man and God is necessary to
13 provide an anchor for the second tablet of civil laws
14 between man and man. With the lesson of the Ten
15 Commandments and the imperative to seek divine
16 guidance and direction, inspire our legislation, and
17 purpose in life, may we be granted the inner strength
18 and fortitude to ensure that all our decisions and
19 determinations are predicated solely on what is best
20 for our communities and our constituencies, and not
21 be tainted by political or other agendas. With that
22 approach, we will certainly be worth of the blessings
23 articulated in the Sabbath prayers for all those who
24 occupy themselves faithfully with communal affairs,
25 namely, may the Holy One, blessed be He, give them

2 their reward. Remove from them all sickness. Heal
3 their entire body and send blessing and success to
4 all their endeavors and let us say amen.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Amen.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Mr. Public Advocate, we
7 could call on Council Member Deutsch for the
8 invocation and spreading it upon the record.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
10 Rabbi Weiner, and I'll now call on Council Member
11 Deutsch to spread the invocation on the record.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very
13 much, and I just want to mention about Rabbi Weiner,
14 who is the executive director of the Jewish Community
15 Council of Greater Coney Island and all the work that
16 he does, not only for southern Brooklyn residents,
17 but the entire city of New York, and the social
18 services that he has in his staff that work with the
19 less fortunate and on behalf of all sort of Holocaust
20 survivors, the work that he does, and as a sonogram
21 of Holocaust survivors, who my father in particular
22 went through three concentration camps, so it's very
23 meaningful all the work that Rabbi Weiner does and he
24 is a one stop for everyone that needs help, anyone
25 that needs services, and I'm fortunate and we are

2 fortunate to have him located in southern Brooklyn,
3 and he does work in my district and his facility is
4 in Council Member Treyger's district and the work
5 that he does beyond southern Brooklyn is just
6 amazing. So I want to thank Rabbi Weiner for giving
7 the invocation today here on the Stated Meeting in
8 the City Council. Thank you very much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
10 Council Member Deutsch. I want to echo that and all
11 the work that Rabbi Weiner and JCC of Greater Coney
12 Island is pretty much known around the city and of
13 course in southern Brooklyn. And now we have the
14 adoption of minutes. Council Member Cumbo, Majority
15 Leader Cumbo, I apologize.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and I
17 also want to extend my regards and respect for Rabbi
18 Weiner, who does an incredible amount of work in my
19 district. So I certainly thank you. It wasn't until
20 they said you were in Council Member Treyger's
21 district that I then know that you weren't in mine.
22 But I appreciate all that you do and the wealth of
23 support that you provide, particularly for not-for-
24 profit organizations that are looking to apply for
25 council funding. You do phenomenal work at preparing

2 other organizations to do the work throughout
3 Brooklyn, New York, and the city. I make a motion
4 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of June 13,
5 2019, and June 19, 2019, be adopted as printed.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [Message and
7 payments] from the mayor?

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Excuse me. M-178 and 179,
9 mayoral appointments.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Rules, privileges, and
11 elections.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Communications
13 from city, county, and borough offices.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Petitions and
16 communications.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Land use call-
19 ups.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: M-180.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. At this
22 time I would ask for a roll call vote on today's land
23 use call-up calendar. This is just on land use call-
24 ups, not on the legislation that is before us today.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Holden. Adams.

1 STATED MEETING

14

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Before I give my
3 vote I'd just like to shout out my SYEP interns,
4 Davia Wilson, Camora Gaily, Robert Matthews, Jada
5 Mercado, and Brandon Hamilton. We will miss you this
6 summer, and thank you for your work with my office.
7 I vote aye.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel. Ayala.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Barron. Borelli. Brannan.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera. Chin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen. Constantinides.
15 Cornegy.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal. Eugene. Gibson.
24 Gjonaj. Grodenchik.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
4 UNIDENTIFIED: King. Koo.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
6 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
8 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.
10 UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.
12 UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.
14 UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.
16 UNIDENTIFIED: Louis.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.
18 UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.
20 UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.
22 UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.
24 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye. And I'd like

16 to just acknowledge my interns, Adair Martinez and

17 Nihás Sayeda, who, Nihás is a sophomore at Brooklyn

18 College and she's going to law school after

19 graduation and Adair was, um, participated in

20 participatory budgeting and is a junior at Mercy

21 College, and so they were excellent and I'd like to

22 thank them for their service.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here, aye.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.
3 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Treyger.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.
5 UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.
7 UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.
9 UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer. Yeger.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.
11 UNIDENTIFIED: Borelli.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.
13 UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.
15 UNIDENTIFIED: Cumbo.
16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.
17 UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council
20 Member?
21 UNIDENTIFIED: Aye.
22 UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.
23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.
24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Today's land
25 use call-ups are adopted by a vote of 39 in the

2 affirmative and zero in the negative. We will now
3 have communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Public
5 Advocate. Nice to see you, good afternoon. I thank
6 everyone for being with us today. I'd like to start
7 by wishing everyone a belated Eid Mubarak. We are
8 really grateful that we have such a big Muslim
9 population in New York City and I hope that they are
10 enjoying the holidays. Before we jump into our
11 legislative agenda I'd like to take a few minutes to
12 address some of the deeply sad and shocking news and
13 events that have taken place over the last few weeks
14 since we last met as a body. First and foremost, I,
15 like many of you, am horrified, horrified by the
16 recent slew of shootings and acts of gun violence
17 that have taken place over these last weeks,
18 including those here in New York City in Brownsville
19 and in Crown Heights. My thoughts are with Council
20 Members Alicka Ampry-Samuel, Majority Leader Laurie
21 Cumbo, Council Member Inez Barron, and their
22 communities, who continue to have to reel from the
23 pain and attempt to heal after these shootings take
24 place, and I am stunned and heartbroken that we also
25 need to hold space for so many other cities and

2 communities that have felt the impact of gun violence
3 just in the last few weeks. First the town of Gilroy
4 in California at a festival and then of course we saw
5 what happened in El Paso, Texas, and in Dayton, Ohio
6 on the same day. The enormous amount of damage that
7 has been done by guns and hate in this country has
8 been horrifying for a long time, but it seems like we
9 always reach a new level and I hope and pray that
10 lawmakers will not just hope and pray but will take
11 necessary action at the federal level but we know
12 that it is on all of us as citizens to continue to
13 call for meaningful change, not just thoughts and
14 prayers, even though we do offer our thoughts and
15 prayers, and I'm incredibly sorry for the families
16 and communities that have been intimately affected by
17 this harm and who continue to grieve in the wake of
18 this senseless gun violence. Moving on, again, once
19 again, to individuals that have died from 9/11-
20 related illnesses since the last Stated Meeting when
21 we called on Congress to act and give 9/11 first
22 responders the respect and support that they deserve.
23 After 15 years of tireless advocacy we saw the
24 federal government finally pass and sign a bill to
25 permanently extend the Victims' Compensation Fund,

2 but despite that victory it's important to remember
3 that we still live with the impact of 9/11 and 9/11-
4 related illnesses, and there are many, many families
5 who continue to be painfully aware of that fact
6 because of what they have to face every single day,
7 and I'd like to take a moment to remember the service
8 members who have passed since our last meeting -
9 James Sotol, a mechanic with the FDNY, Harry Strack,
10 a member of Local 3IBW who supported electrical work
11 at Ground Zero in the aftermath of the attacks.

12 Officer Raymond Harris, who served in the 77th
13 Precinct of the NYPD. Thomas Fennally, a firefighter
14 with the FDNY. Anthony Brognano, a detective with
15 the NYPD in Brooklyn. State Police Commander Jeffrey
16 Secora, who spent 24 years on the force and supported
17 search and recovery efforts at Ground Zero. I'm also
18 incredibly, incredibly saddened by the news of recent
19 deaths of several members of the NYPD. Just this
20 past weekend Officer Kimberly Lohara passed away when
21 she crashed on the Henry Hudson Parkway. She was 24
22 years old and served in the NYPD in a precinct on
23 Staten Island. And yesterday we learned that, yet
24 again, another member of the NYPD, Officer Johnnie
25 Rios, took his own life. Officer Rios was 35 years

2 old and this brings the total number of officers who
3 have died by suicide for the year up to eight, and
4 six since June. In addition to the heartbreaking
5 news that we received yesterday, the police
6 department also lost Sergeant Terrance McEvoy, who
7 died by suicide at the end of July. My thoughts and
8 prayers are with the families and friends of Office
9 Lohara, Sergeant McEvoy, Officer Rios, and all of the
10 members of the NYPD during this deeply upsetting
11 time, and we ask any person who is struggling in our
12 city, but also if you are a cop or part of the NYPD
13 please seek the help that you need. There is no
14 shame in asking for help. Mental illness is the same
15 as any other type of illness and we want everyone to
16 get the support that they need. The FDNY
17 unfortunately also lost one of their own yesterday,
18 Lieutenant Brian Sullivan, a 27-year FDNY veteran
19 died from a heart attack after his shift. And
20 additionally Jose Martins, a construction worker, was
21 killed while working at a construction site in Queens
22 two weeks ago. Grandville Wiltshire was also killed
23 by working at a restaurant in Queens and he was 67
24 years old. Now I ask that we all rise and have a
25 moment of silence in honor of the many lives that we

2 have lost in the last few weeks, both here in New
3 York City and around the entire country. [moment of
4 silence] Thank you. I'd also like to take a minute
5 for a few staff announcements. Caitlyn O'Hagan, who
6 as many of you know has been a key member of our
7 finance division is sadly for us leaving the council
8 to pursue her Ph.D. in education policy at NYU. She
9 has been with the council for almost five years,
10 first as Council Member Gibson's budget director and
11 then as a senior financial analyst covering education
12 and the capital budget. She is a star and we are
13 going to miss her. Tomorrow is her last day and we
14 wish her luck in graduate school. Here she is, so
15 let's give Caitlyn a very big round of applause
16 [applause] and I want to thank her for her amazing
17 work. Also, Monica Abend, who has served in Majority
18 Leader Cumbo's office for the past six years is
19 leaving the City Council at the end of this money.
20 Monica is moving on to joint the office of our
21 attorney general, Leticia James, where she will serve
22 as a deputy director for intergovernmental affairs,
23 covering the great boroughs of Brooklyn and Queens,
24 and Monica is someone who many of you know, who has
25 served Laurie's district and this body so well. We

2 are immensely grateful for her passion and enthusiasm
3 and hard work and talent. I know the majority leader
4 is very grateful for everything that Monica has done
5 and so I want to say best of luck and congratulations
6 to Monica, wherever she is, where is she? Is Monica
7 here? There she is. Congratulations, Monica.

8 [applause] OK, we're going to dive into today's

9 agenda. The council will vote on the following

10 Article 11 property tax exemptions approved by the

11 Committee on Finance - 340 South Third Street, in

12 Council Member Reynoso's district, Harlem House in

13 Council Member Bill Perkins's district, and Olinville

14 Manor in Council Member Ritchie Torres's district.

15 The council will vote on the following land use items

16 - a 306-seat universal pre-K center in our zoning

17 chair Council Member Francisco Moya's district. I

18 know he has worked really, really hard on this. It

19 is a big deal for his community and I want to

20 congratulate him on getting this done. We're voting

21 on East New York North NCP, which is an affordable

22 housing development in Council Member Espinal's

23 district, and two applications in my district, 201 to

24 207 Seventh Avenue, a small building, but I have been

25 working on this building for more than a decade,

2 longer than I was in the City Council, so I am very
3 excited about this nine-story small building at the
4 corner of 22nd Street and Seventh Avenue, finally.

5 And 515 West 18th Street, garage special permit.

6 Moving on, the council will be voting on the

7 following legislation. First, Intro 30-A from

8 Council Member Margaret Chin, which would

9 significantly strengthen the ability of the

10 Department of Housing Preservation and Development to

11 recover relocation expenses where a building owner's

12 negligence or failure to maintain a property results

13 in a vacate order and tenant displacement. I want to

14 thank the staff who worked on this bill, Austin

15 Branford and Megan Chen. They are always amazing.

16 And we will be voting on, we're also going to be

17 voting today on an important set of bills and a

18 resolution related to how some of our federal

19 benefits are administered here in New York City.

20 These bills show the council's commitment to treating

21 people with respect and dignity as they make use of

22 our public benefit system. Unfortunately, this vote

23 comes at the same time as yet another vicious and

24 inhumane attack from the Trump administration against

25 our nation's social safety net, an attack directly on

2 immigrants and low-income individuals. The new
3 public Charge rule put forward by the Trump
4 administration I believe is hateful and inhumane and
5 undermines what we stand for as a city and what we
6 should stand for as a nation, and I of course want
7 the people of New York City to know that we will
8 continue to stand with our immigrant communities and
9 fight back against these policies. The bills and
10 resolution that we're voting on were introduced after
11 an incredibly disturbing video of one woman's
12 experience in a human resource administration
13 building in Boerum Hill came to light last December.
14 These bills cannot change, sadly, what happened to
15 Jazmine Headley or how she and her son were treated,
16 but we are aiming to improve our public benefit
17 system to better serve all New Yorkers. Introduction
18 1349 from Council Member Danny Dromm will require the
19 NYPD to implement child-sensitive arrest policies
20 that could help minimize trauma and long-term
21 consequences for kids whose caregivers are being
22 arrested. Clearly, officers should not be ripping a
23 baby out of their mother's arms like we saw on that
24 video, and this bill will require the police
25 department to retrain its officers on how to handle

2 situations like Jazmine Headley's so hopefully it
3 never happens again. I want to thank the staff who
4 worked on this important bill, Daniel Addis, Josh
5 Kingsley, and Brian Crow. In the package of bills
6 specific to the Human Resource Administration, we
7 first have Introduction 1382-A from Council Member
8 Helen Rosenthal, which would require HRA to perform
9 an audit of its operations policies and procedures at
10 job centers and SNAP centers with the goal of
11 increasing operation efficiency. Related to Council
12 Member Rosenthal's bill is Introduction 1350-A from
13 Council Member Vanessa Gibson, which would require
14 HRA to develop and implement a plan to improve client
15 experiences based on the audit required in Council
16 Member Rose's bill. HRA would be required to
17 implement that plan by January 1,2021. Next is my
18 bill, Introduction 1332-A, which would codify an
19 Office of Constituent Services within the Department
20 of Social Services. This office would be responsible
21 for receiving and addressing comments, questions, and
22 complaints in a timely manner. The office would also
23 develop strategies and recommendations regarding
24 communication with clients and benefit recipients.
25 People receiving public benefits should be able to

2 navigate the system in a way that doesn't place an
3 undue burden on them and the Office of Constituent
4 Services will help to ensure that for New Yorkers who
5 turn to HRA. Introduction 1389-A, sponsored by our
6 Public Advocate, Jumaane Williams, would require HRA
7 to report on instances in which public assistance was
8 terminated or denied. These reports would provide
9 valuable insight into the various hurdles public
10 assistance recipients face when applying for or
11 maintaining their benefits. Introduction 1359 is
12 sponsored by Council Member Steve Levin. Council
13 Member Levin has done an enormous amount of work to
14 move these bills forward as chair of the Committee on
15 General Welfare and I really want to personally thank
16 him for his tireless commitment and leadership on
17 this package of bills. His bill would require HRA to
18 report on instances in which public assistance was
19 terminated and subsequently reopened within three
20 months. This data will help us identify how often
21 technical glitches within the state welfare
22 management system cause benefits to be wrongfully
23 terminated. And Introduction 1333-A from Council
24 Member Adrienne Adams would require HRA to provide
25 reporting on enforcement activity within job and SNAP

2 centers, including on arrests, summonses, removals,
3 escorts and incidents with use of force.

4 Introduction 1403, sponsored by Council Member Chaim
5 Deutsch, would require HRA to report annually on the
6 number of comments, questions, and complaints made by
7 clients on whether inquiries have been resolved, and
8 the most frequent category of inquiries. And next

9 there are three bills from Council Member Alicka
10 Ampry-Samuel. Introduction 1335-A would establish a

11 pilot program for having social work services

12 available at HRA job centers to interact with

13 clients. The bill would require the provision of

14 these services at every job center by January of

15 2021. Introduction 1336-A would require HRA to

16 conduct trainings on de-escalating conflict and

17 trauma-informed care for all employees who work in

18 job centers or SNAP centers, including contract and

19 security staff. And Introduction 1337-A would

20 require HRA to provide a designated space for

21 children at every job and SNAP center. These spaces

22 would include comfortable seating and age-appropriate

23 educational materials. Introduction 1347-A,

24 sponsored by Council Member Laurie A. Cumbo, Majority

25 Leader Laurie Cumbo, would require HRA to maintain

2 systems that allow clients to reschedule appointments
3 over the phone and also from the majority leader is
4 Resolution 1721. This resolution calls on the state
5 legislature to pass and the governor to sign
6 legislation that would provide benefit recipients
7 with a grace period before terminating their public
8 assistance or SNAP benefits due to a change in income
9 or employment status. This change would likely be
10 significant for many recipients as it would give them
11 time to contest the termination of benefits and to
12 prepare for the termination. I want to thank the
13 staff who worked on this entire HRA package - Amita
14 Kilawan, Agatha Mavropolis, Crystal Pond, Julia
15 Heromis, Smita Desmuk, and Andrea Vazquez. They
16 worked really, really, really, really hard on this
17 package and, are they here? I think some of them are
18 here, and I really want to thank them for their
19 leadership and help in getting this package done.
20 And finally Resolution 978, from Council Member Farah
21 Louis, calls on Congress to pass and the president to
22 sign the Violence Against Women Reauthorization Act
23 of 2019, also referred to as VAWA, which lapsed
24 earlier this year after it was not extended by
25 Congress. I also want to note that this is the first

2 piece of legislation sponsored by Council Member
3 Farah Louis that we are voting on [applause] since
4 her election to the council, so I want to
5 congratulate her on this incredibly, incredibly
6 important resolution. Congratulations, Farah, on
7 this really important resolution we are passing
8 today. And I want to thank the staff who worked on
9 this resolution with Council Member Louis, Brenda
10 McKinney and Chloe Rivera. That concludes our agenda
11 for today's Stated Meeting. And I look forward to
12 proceeding with today's votes. Thank you, Mr. Public
13 Advocate.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, Mr.
15 Speaker. We will now move on to discussion of
16 general orders. First we have Majority Leader Cumbo.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, Public
18 Advocate Jumaane Williams, and I want to just begin
19 by simply thanking our speaker, Corey Johnson, and
20 again Council Member Steve Levin and all of my
21 colleagues, particularly the Women's Caucus, for
22 recognizing the great tragedy that happened to
23 Jazmine Headley and this package of legislation that
24 so many of us have put forward really exemplifies the
25 unity that this body has because several individuals

2 made a calculation that day in that HRA office that
3 Jazmine Headley because she is a black woman, because
4 she is a mother, because she is a single mother
5 looking for services that she is entitled to somehow
6 didn't matter and that she had no support and that
7 she had no backup and that whatever was going to
8 transpire was going to be business as usual. But
9 today this council comes together to say Jazmine you
10 absolutely have backup. You have 51 council members
11 who are here today to say that you count, you matter,
12 and that we are going to put the appropriate
13 provisions in place to begin to make sure that this
14 rampant behavior does not continue in the City of New
15 York. So I proudly urge all of my colleagues to vote
16 on this package of legislation. This is something
17 that will change the dynamics for so many women
18 across the city and individuals who come to HRA
19 looking for support at a time when they are most
20 vulnerable. So I proudly worked with all of my
21 colleagues and thank you all for your support.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

23 Council Member Chin, followed by Council Member
24 Dromm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Public
3 Advocate. Today we will vote on my bill, Intro 30-A.
4 Far too often predatory landlords create unlivable
5 conditions that lead to emergency vacate orders that
6 not only uproot tenants' lives, but also force them
7 into a revolving door to the shelter system. As
8 representative of lower Manhattan, I have seen too
9 many incidents where tenants are forced to pack their
10 entire lives into a suitcase and leave their homes in
11 the middle of the night to evacuate an unstable
12 building that a negligent landlord failed to
13 maintain. It cause unimaginable hardship and trauma.
14 Sometime it creates a pipeline into the shelter
15 system that is tough to break. As of this month HPD
16 sites 876 households in emergency shelter as a result
17 of a vacate order. We cannot allow greedy landlords
18 to take a back seat to the suffering they have caused
19 and drag their feets on making the repairs to lift a
20 vacate order. Introduce 30-A will force these
21 landlords to pay up, creating a system for the city
22 to charge landlords for temporary housing for these
23 tenants. By passing this bill we are introducing a
24 new tool to hold the city's worst landlord
25 accountable and push them to speed up the repair

2 process to bring these families back home sooner. I
3 thank Speaker Johnson and Housing and Building Chair
4 Cornegy for your support and also the council lawyers
5 and legislative staff, including Megan Chan, Austin
6 Bradford, Janan Zilca, as well as HPD staff. We have
7 worked to push this through, and my deputy chief of
8 staff Marian Guerra for getting us to the finish
9 line. I urge my colleagues to vote on this bill.
10 Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

12 Council Member Dromm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
14 much. First, I want to thank Speaker Corey Johnson
15 and the Public Safety chair, Donovan Richards, for
16 the commitment to reviewing how city agencies,
17 including HRA and the NYPD, interact with individuals
18 throughout the city. Last year's unfortunate
19 incident involving Jazmine Headley highlighted the
20 need for law enforcement to proceed with due
21 sensitivity. When arrest of parents and caretakers
22 are inevitable, the police should be following proper
23 procedures that consider the welfare of the children
24 involved. Introduce 1349-A does this by requiring
25 the creation of guidance aimed at reducing the trauma

2 of arrest on both parents and their children. Such
3 guidance will minimize the more traumatizing aspects
4 of parenteral arrests and provide such parents the
5 opportunity to ensure that their children are in safe
6 hands. Notably, the NYPD will be required to work
7 with partner organizations to offer assistance to
8 arrested parents. Together with my council
9 colleagues and the advocates, including Tanya Prupak
10 of the Osborne Association, the New York Initiative
11 for Children of Incarcerated Parents, and Sebastian
12 McGuire, my counsel, I look forward to continuing to
13 examine ways in which we can mitigate the harmful
14 collateral impacts of the criminal justice system.
15 Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
17 Council Member Dromm. It is a point of personal
18 privilege. On December of 2018 we all saw in the
19 experience of Jazmine Headley the worst of what our
20 government has to offer the people of the City of New
21 York and today I am glad that we are showing the best
22 of what government has to offer in response to what
23 occurred. I'm very proud to have a bill in this
24 package, a companion bill to, ah, the Committee Chair
25 Levin. So I just want to thank Speaker Johnson and

2 Committee Chair Levin and all the council members who
3 are part of this and the entire body for, as the
4 majority leader said, not letting this issue go and
5 making sure we did something about it to try to
6 prevent it from happening again. I want to thank the
7 committee staff, Agatha Magropolis and my first
8 deputy for policy, Nick Smith, and director of
9 legislation, Michelle Kim. And there is none other
10 listed for general orders so we will move on to the
11 report of special committees.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Reports of
14 standing committees.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
16 Finance, preconsidered Reso 1022, transparency reso.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
18 orders.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 501 and
20 Reso 1029 through LU 504 and Reso 1032, tax
21 exemptions.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
23 orders.

24

25

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
3 General Welfare, Intro 1332-A through 1403-A, on page
4 4, HRA package.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
6 general orders.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
8 Housing and Buildings, Intro 30-A, vacate orders.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
10 general orders.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
12 Land Use, LU 477 and Reso 1033, and LU 478 and Reso
13 1034, UDAAP Manhattan.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
15 orders.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 479 and 480, Avenue U
17 rezoning.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
19 modifications and referred to the City Planning
20 Commission pursuant to Section 197-D of the New York
21 City Charter.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: [clears throat] Excuse me.
23 LU 500 and Reso 1035, Franklin Guest House.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
25 orders.

1 STATED MEETING

37

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 505 and
3 Reso 1036, pre-kindergarten center.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
5 orders.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 506 and
7 Reso 1037, UDAAP 190 Essex Street.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
9 orders.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
11 Public Safety, Intro 1349-A, child-sensitive
12 policies.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
14 general orders.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: On the general order
16 calendar, Intro 12810-A.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 466 and Reso 1038, West
19 18th Street garage.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
21 orders.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Resolution appointing
23 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
25 orders. And at this time I ask for a roll call vote

2 on all of the items on today's general order
3 calendar.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With

8 permission to explain my vote of aye on all, ah, with
9 gratitude to my colleagues. Council Member Chin,
10 your bill will address issues that happen in my
11 district all the time. I really appreciate your hard
12 work on that. Council Member Dromm, I really
13 appreciate your work in making sure the NYPD and
14 those who think they can just Randall's Island Park a
15 baby out of a mother's hand that that just won't
16 happen again. And to all my colleagues, Council
17 Member Levin, for your leadership in moving this
18 legislation through the General Welfare Committee. I
19 just want to say it is imperative that we get to the
20 bottom of the institutional failures that led to
21 HRA's terrible treatment of Jazmine Headley. Ms.
22 Headley and too many other New Yorkers are
23 essentially being punished for their need to ask for
24 assistance as if poverty were a crime. As a society

2 that is our failure, not theirs. I vote aye on all.
3 Thank you very much.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to
6 explain my vote? Thank you, Mr. Public Advocate.
7 All she needed was a chair and what she got was her
8 1-year-old baby wrestled from her arms. What she got
9 was arrested and jailed, when she could have been at
10 her job providing for her child. The horrible
11 details of Jazmine Headley's experience at a Brooklyn
12 HRA center went viral in December. Protocol inside
13 HRA offices is in desperate need of reform. I am
14 proud to join my colleagues in a package of
15 legislation to improve treatment of clients and
16 quality of service at HRA centers. My bill, 1333-A,
17 would require the Department of Social Services,
18 Human Resource Administration, to report on arrests,
19 summonses, removals, escorts, and use of force
20 incidents occurring in their centers. This bill is a
21 necessary step to improve accountability and
22 transparency, and I want to thank Speaker Johnson,
23 Council Member Levin for their leadership, and
24 championing this ground-breaking legislation. I
25 would like to thank the entire body for your support

2 and your spirit to propel Jazmine Headley into a
3 positive role instead of a negative role, and I
4 encourage my colleagues to support this entire
5 package to prevent families in need from incurring
6 unnecessary future trauma or brutality ever again. I
7 vote aye on all.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Ayala.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Borrelli.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Chin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
16 explain my vote? I just want to take this
17 opportunity to congratulate all my colleague on the
18 HRA package legislation. And I hope that this will
19 bring reform to HRA to really do the job to help
20 people in need and to treat them with the respect
21 that they deserve. And I also wanted to tae this
22 opportunity to thank my wonderful summer intern, who
23 has been great working with us in the district office
24 and also in the legislative office, James O'Grady,

1 STATED MEETING

41

2 Joanne Zen, Hanyu Lin, and Mella Sujani. And I vote
3 aye on all. Thank you.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen. Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'd just also
8 like to take chance to say what a pleasure it was to
9 work with my summer interns, Samora, Kayla, Jiboya,
10 and Emmanuel, some of which will be returning to
11 major colleagues and universities around the country.
12 You guys are awesome. Aye.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to
15 explain my vote? So Intro 1403 as part of this
16 package of bills will require public reporting of the
17 number and nature of complaints, comments, and
18 questions by HRA and DSS clients. This information
19 will aid us in identifying the most common issues
20 faced by those seeking assistance from these city
21 agencies. Every year my office helps hundreds of
22 people navigate the system to receive benefits. They
23 often report back about the unacceptable,
24 inappropriate way they are treated, whether it is
25 verbal abuse, being made to wait for many hours, or

2 being forced to jump through bureaucratic hoops, we
3 need to end any mistreatment of those who may be down
4 on their luck. This bill, along with other bills in
5 this package, sponsored by my colleagues, will take
6 preventive action to ensure that our fellow New
7 Yorkers are not subjected to traumatic experiences as
8 they attempt to put food on the table and care for
9 their families. So with that said, I vote no on
10 Intro 1349 and while I support and appreciate the
11 intent of Intro 1349, I believe it's an excellent
12 bill, just I have some, um, I have some issues by
13 tying the hands of law enforcement when to report to
14 ACS. When people reach out to me in my office I
15 always take the approach to better safe than sorry
16 policy, and with that being said I vote no on 1349
17 and aye on the rest.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si in total.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

2

UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos. Koo.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

4

UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

6

UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

8

UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to

11

explain my vote?

12

PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission

13

granted.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very

15

much, Public Advocate. I just want to thank, I want

16

to thank the speaker and Council Members Adams,

17

Cumbo, Ampry-Samuel, Gibson, sorry, I'm reading

18

through all the names here, Rosenthal, you the Public

19

Advocate, Council Member Deutsch, for all the work

20

that everybody did here on this historic set of

21

legislation that really seeks to shine a light on the

22

practices at HRA at the job centers and SNAP centers,

23

and ensuring that our government is accountable to

24

the residents of New York and that everybody is

25

treated with the dignity that they deserve, and we

2 have that obligation as a city to strive to do better
3 and when we see an injustice and we have that
4 obligation as a city to strive to do better and when
5 we see an injustice like what happened to Jazmine
6 Headley to commit ourselves to fixing it. And so I
7 want to thank Jazmine herself. She testified in
8 front of the committee on this legislation. She
9 exhibited a tremendous amount of courage in the face
10 of a really devastating experience and she chose to
11 turn that terrible experience into a mission and into
12 motivation, and so I just want to thank her and
13 acknowledge all the bravery that she has exhibited.
14 And in particular I just want to thank, I want to
15 thank all the committee staff that worked on this
16 legislation and then in particular I want to thank my
17 colleague, Majority Leader Cumbo, Council Member
18 Adams, Council Member Ampry-Samuel, Council Member
19 Rosenthal, for bringing such moral clarity to this
20 issue throughout the last several months and for
21 really leading this body on this legislation. Thank
22 you. I vote aye on all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye on
3 all.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Louis.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
8 granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I want to
10 congratulate all of my colleagues on today's passage
11 of the Justice for Jazmine legislative package that
12 you all worked so hard on and for your attention and
13 advocacy like Jazmine who won't have to experience
14 this type of inhumane treatment. So thank you all
15 for your hard work on this package. I also want to
16 thank Speaker Corey Johnson for his leadership in
17 moving Resolution 9784, in which we're calling on
18 Congress and the president to reauthorize the
19 Violence Against Women Authorization Act. It's
20 demoralizing that we have to ask each and every year
21 for the federal government to renew this life-saving
22 piece of legislation and as a survivor of domestic
23 violence and domestic abuse, I understand firsthand
24 why these resources are needed and why these
25 resources are tailored for folks like myself to

2 ensure that we have a place of refuge and resources
3 to make it to the next day. By passing this
4 resolution we are sending a clear message that...

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council
6 Member? We can do that when we do the resolutions.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Sorry?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: When we do the
9 resolutions, we'll be doing the resolutions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Oh, sorry.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: No problem.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to thank
23 Council Member Louis for her legislative victory and
24 the rest of the city council on packages that we're
25 passing today. I want to also give light to a

2 transparency resolution that you're also voting on
3 today that includes a 4 million dollar, almost 4
4 million dollar package of resources that we're giving
5 to citywide organizations and small organizations to
6 focus on census work. This is work that is coming
7 out of the task force that Speaker Johnson appointed
8 myself and Council Member Rivera, there is an
9 incredible team behind this that is working day and
10 night to really build a focused response with the
11 administration and I'm so happy that this is the
12 first [inaudible] of money. This funding is going to
13 go to really prepare organizations that have been
14 thinking about this for years and I hope that the
15 council members that are here today present
16 understand that we're going to keep working and that
17 each and every one of you are going to be responsible
18 in a lot of ways to really ensure that count is and
19 happens in your districts. Some of these census
20 tracks are going to be hard to get to, but we're
21 going to rely on our work because we know our
22 districts more than anyone else and so I want to say
23 thank you for supporting this resolution, this
24 transparency resolution, to the finance team and the
25 entire task force staff, and to my partner, Carlina

2 Rivera. I'll go to war with you anywhere. Thank you
3 so much. I vote aye on all.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
6 explain my vote please?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
8 granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I first want to
10 thank my colleagues, particularly Chair Levin and
11 those involved in this package of legislation that
12 promotes and protects human dignity. And I also want
13 to say in doing so what I noticed that this bill does
14 and includes also, it is that when we, I as the chair
15 of Civil Service and Labor talk about the job that is
16 being done to provide critical services, in providing
17 those services it is training, it is supervision, it
18 is guidance, it is tools and resources that are
19 necessary and this is a bold package that ensures
20 that the tools and resources for everybody to do
21 their job properly is being done. I would also like
22 to take the opportunity to highlight and thank my
23 summer interns as well, Nesha Chaudry and Anika
24 Lamia, as well as I have with me today Mr. Dane Allen
25 and Mr. Jordan Robinson, who are recent graduates of

2 Eagle Academy School for Young Men, are on their way
3 to Cornell and American University, respectively, and
4 we are expecting great things to come back to the
5 council very soon. So thank you and I vote aye on
6 all.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on
15 all.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to
20 explain my vote, briefly? I just want to say thank
21 you to everyone for the package in getting justice
22 for Jazmine Headley and to Council Member Menchaca
23 and everyone who assisted us with census funding, and
24 I think, though, most importantly to Council Member
25 Louis for not just pushing your resolution forward

2 but for sharing your personal story. Congrats to
3 all, and I vote aye.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Ah, thank you,
18 Mr. Public Advocate. Thank you, my colleagues. My
19 apologies for missing the invocation earlier. I was
20 on a call to deal with lead in schools, which I will
21 be following up on to make sure that our children and
22 staff are safe. But I do appreciate Rabbi Weiner for
23 his invocation here today. I want to congratulate
24 all my colleagues on their very important ground-
25 breaking, historic legislation being passed,

2 addressing very serious issues in our city, and I
3 just want to note, the speaker mentioned earlier
4 Caitlyn O'Hagan. If there is one person that knows
5 literally where every dime is budgeted in a over 32
6 billion dollar DOE budget, it is Caitlyn O'Hagan.
7 She has a mastery understanding of the DOE's budget
8 process, numbers, the SEA capital plan, which we're
9 still grappling with. She is an enormous, tremendous
10 assets here that we have in the New York City
11 Council. She is the official fact checker when it
12 comes to the budget process with DOE, the largest
13 city agency and department. Her service has been
14 invaluable to me as chair of the committee. I'm sure
15 my colleague, Councilman Chair Dromm, would agree
16 that she has been a dynamo and a force in so many
17 different ways and she is entering a prestigious
18 Ph.D. program at NYU, which is NYU's big gain. But I
19 have asked her to continue to serve the city into a
20 greater capacity. So Caitlyn, thank you for your
21 enormous, tremendous service to the City Council.
22 You have made me a more effective chair of a very
23 important committee here in the City Council. We are
24 grateful for your service. Thank you so much. And
25 with that I vote aye on all.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I apologize. Aye
8 on all, with the exception of Intro 1349, on which I
9 vote no, and with the exception of Resolution, in
10 which I abstain. Thank you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Cumbo.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: All items on today's
16 general order calendar are adopted by a vote of 41 in
17 the affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero
18 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1349-A,
19 which was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative,
20 2 in the negative, and 1 abstention, and Resolution
21 1022, which was adopted by a vote of 40 in the
22 affirmative, zero in the negative, and 1 abstention.
23 The revised land use call-up votes, the revised land
24 use call-ups vote is 41 in the affirmative, zero in
25 the negative.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
3 referred to committees, as indicated on today's
4 agenda.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: We will now
6 move into the discussion of resolutions. Are there
7 any members who would like to speak on today's
8 resolutions, and I believe Council Member Louis?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you. As I
10 stated earlier, I just want to thank Speaker Johnson
11 for his leadership and for moving this resolution
12 forward and accelerating the progress of Reso 978,
13 asking for Congress and the president to reauthorize
14 the Women Against, sorry, the Violence Against Women
15 Reauthorization Act. This is an opportunity for us
16 to stand up for survivors right here in our city and
17 the United States. So we're asking for Congress to
18 move forward with reauthorizing this bill. Thank
19 you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
21 Council Member. This is my first time back since the
22 primaries. I want to make sure upon the record
23 congratulating you. Congratulations on your first
24 piece of legislation and in your courage in sharing
25 your personal story attached to it. And I want to

2 just revise a vote. Intro 1349-A, which was adopted
3 by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 2 in the
4 negative, and zero abstentions. Seeing no one else
5 for comments on the resolutions, I'll now read
6 today's resolutions into the record. Members who
7 wish to vote against or abstain on any of the
8 resolutions to register your vote with the clerk at
9 the dais. Resolution 721, resolution calling on the
10 state legislator, legislature, to pass and the
11 governor to sign legislation that would provide a
12 grace period before terminating public assistance or
13 supplemental nutrition assistance program, also known
14 as SNAP benefits, due to a change in income and/or
15 employment to allow time to contest the termination
16 of benefits or prepare for the termination. All in
17 favor please say aye.

18 [Chorus of Ayes]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: All opposed?
20 Any abstentions. The ayes have it. Resolution 978,
21 resolution calling upon Congress to pass and the
22 president to sign the Violence Against Women
23 Reauthorization Act of 2019. All in favor please say
24 aye.

25 [Chorus of Ayes]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: All opposed?
3 Any abstentions? The ayes have it. We will now move
4 into general discussion. We have signed up Council
5 Member Levine and Council Member Rose.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Mr.
7 Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [inaudible]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Excellent. There
10 are 600,000 people in the five boroughs of New York
11 City who lack health insurance. Many of them are
12 undocumented immigrants, and I am pleased to be
13 joining with Speaker Johnson and Council Member
14 Carlina Rivera today to introduce a bill that would
15 establish a program to help those hundreds of
16 thousands of New Yorkers who lack basic health care.
17 This is Intro 1668, which would establish a citywide,
18 five boroughs, comprehensive system of primary care
19 health based in clinic and public hospitals to allow
20 low-income New Yorkers, people who lack health
21 insurance, to access the basic components of health
22 care, from annual physicals to vaccinations to
23 referrals to specialists. This is an incredibly
24 important initiative. I expect that our colleagues
25 will be hearing much about it in the weeks ahead, and

2 I encourage all of you to join us as co-sponsors on
3 what we believe will be extremely consequential for
4 low-income New Yorkers, for undocumented immigrants,
5 and those in need of health care in New York City.

6 Thank you.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Mr. Public Advocate, I
8 just want to say I'm really grateful for Council
9 Member Levine, the chair of our health committee's
10 leadership on this, and I look forward to this bill
11 being heard.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.
13 Council Member Rose.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Public
15 Advocate. My colleagues today, I'm thrilled to
16 announce two bills, one which aims to increase the
17 use of summer meals and one that expands SYEP to
18 include all children regardless of their immigration
19 status. Intro 1675 will call for the Department of
20 Education to mail summer meal information including
21 to all eligible students. This information would
22 include the three nearest locations, operations
23 hours, and eligibility guidelines. Summer meals are
24 offered to all children under ages 18 and under at no
25 cost at several sites across our city, including

2 public schools, community pools, public parks,
3 libraries, and NYCHA locations throughout June, June
4 through August. Low-income parents often rely on New
5 York City school food for free meals for their
6 children throughout the school year. So this would
7 make sure that parents and students would know that
8 the meals are available and where they are available
9 to them. The second bill also relates to our young
10 people. I'm proud to joint Public Advocate Jumaane
11 Williams in Intro 1670, a bill that would make all
12 young people of New York City regardless of
13 immigration status eligible for Summer Youth
14 Employment Program. I know firsthand how important
15 SYEP is and we want all of our young people from
16 across the city to have that same opportunity. We
17 should not perpetuate a two-tiered system among our
18 youth. We're living in New York City. If you are
19 attending our public schools you're a New Yorker.
20 And so it's in everyone best interest to have these
21 opportunities available. And I'm really proud to co-
22 author this with Public Advocate Williams. Inez
23 Barron, Council Member Barron, asked me to recognize
24 and thank her intern in her absence, Aniqua Faz. She
25 is an intern for Council Member Barron in her

2 legislative office and once a week at the district
3 office. She is entering her third year at Baruch
4 College with a major in operational management and
5 her interests are working with college students and
6 teaching. And Council Member Barron thanks her for
7 her service to her off. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.
9 Majority Leader Cumbo.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I
11 rise simply to recognize critically acclaimed author,
12 Toni Morrison, who died on August 5. She was an
13 American novelist, essayist, editor, teacher, and
14 professional emeritus at Princeton. Many know her
15 for her first book, *The Bluest Eye*, which was written
16 in 1970. Her first novel, published at the age of
17 40, which really just goes to show that we have so
18 many lives in us and so many opportunities to be who
19 we were always meant to be. She was critically
20 acclaimed for her *Song of Solomon*, which brought her
21 national attention and won the National Book Critics'
22 Circle award. In 1988 she won the Pulitzer Prize, an
23 American book award, for *Beloved*. She is a national
24 treasure. She has someone that has influenced
25 American culture greatly. She has always had her

2 finger on the pulse of politics and world affairs.
3 She will be greatly missed. She is an American
4 legend, a hero, and certainly someone who is going to
5 continue to influence our literary world throughout.
6 And I hope that we feel all inspired by what she has
7 been able to accomplish and all of the work and the
8 masterpieces that she has produced that will always
9 be a part of the American record, and certainly an
10 inspiration to all African Americans throughout this
11 world. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
13 Council Member Cumbo. And I would like to ask my
14 colleagues to also sign up to Intro 1670. It's co-
15 sponsored by myself, Council Member Rose, who spoke
16 on it, and Council Member Chin. This morning we had
17 about 200 teenagers come out for a press conference
18 in support of the Youth Employment Education Program
19 to parallel the Summer Youth Employment Program by
20 ensuring that all residents and young people,
21 regardless of their immigration status, can get the
22 essential skills needed to be the best residents when
23 they get older, and I want to thank the speaker for
24 bringing up the gun violence that has been occurring,
25 not only around the country but also in the city, and

2 I hope that this body takes some time to be prideful
3 of seven, eight years ago this body started a
4 initiative that was a lot of people had some
5 skepticism on with 5 million dollar. That initiative
6 is now over 40 million dollars. There is an Office
7 of Gun Violence Prevention based on the work of
8 Majority Leader Cumbo and Gibson that has been proven
9 to help reduce gun violence in this city. So I hope
10 this body is proud of the work it's done, hopefully
11 continue pushing that forward with funding and
12 resources and credit to the Crisis Management System
13 that is sometimes left out in this discussion on the
14 supply side while we wait for our federal government
15 to hopefully do something on the demand of, on the
16 supply side of gun violence. With that, oh, thank
17 you, I want to call again on Majority Leader Cumbo.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Not at all trying
19 to monopolize since I'm seated in this seat. But I
20 wanted to just, um, Speaker Corey Johnson already has
21 done so, so eloquently, but I just wanted to wish
22 Monica Aben, my chief of staff and legislative
23 director a farewell. She has done so much for my
24 office over the years and she started in my office in
25 2014 and she has continued to do extraordinary work.

2 We began our careers 10 years ago as arts
3 administrators and found ourselves here at City Hall
4 trying to make our way throughout these halls, and
5 it's been an honor and a privilege to work with her.
6 We have accomplished so much, blood, sweat, and
7 tears. We fight like cats and dogs. But she has
8 remained loyal throughout her time here and many know
9 her for her passion and her strength and her
10 determination to get the job done, and I just wanted
11 to just, you know, state a few of the dynamic things
12 we were able to accomplish together, the anti-sexual
13 harassment training, lactation rooms in businesses
14 and government office, NYPD sexual assault training,
15 creation of the Office to Prevent Gun Violence, DOE
16 sex ed, reporting and transparency, percent for art
17 increases, pay equity reporting, M/WBE advisory board
18 reporting and transparency, creation and codification
19 of the Commission on Gender Equity, text 911, as well
20 as managed the Committee on Women and Women's Caucus
21 during 2014 and 2018. So we've done a lot together.
22 We often get the credit for all the work that our
23 staff does, but she's done extraordinary work. I'm
24 so proud of her. She will be amazing in everything
25 that she does, and I just want to say to Public

2 Advocate Jumaane Williams as well as Attorney General
3 Tish James, we have an incredible talent at, I mean,
4 recruiting for my office, the most talented
5 individuals throughout the City of New York and I'm
6 confident that my staff will continue to make both of
7 you incredible leaders, as you already are. And we
8 will be having cake to celebrate Monica downstairs in
9 the members' lounge, so if you all would like to join
10 us and have a slice of cake that would be awesome.
11 Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.
13 Now a shout-out to my first deputy for community
14 engagement, Crystal Hudson. I just want to clarify
15 the work we do have to do on the demand side and we
16 are looking for the federal government to work on the
17 supply side on gun violence. Council Member Miller.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Public
19 Advocate. I didn't want to get out of here, I'd be
20 remiss for all the inquiring minds that were
21 wondering about this Mylar balloon legislation that I
22 will be introducing along with Council Member
23 Constantinides and Espinal. Mylar balloons are made
24 of metallic nylon materials which short circuit
25 electrical power lines, impose serious power risk,

2 fire, and electrical outages. Last December Con Ed
3 determined that in my district the Hollis Power
4 Station was compromised by one of these balloons
5 rising and taking out the transformer and taking out
6 the power to 1500 households. This is the second
7 time that this has occurred in our district. As we
8 saw last month from the heat wave and related outages
9 in Brooklyn and Queens and Manhattan, our electrical
10 infrastructure is already incredibly vulnerable, and
11 who would think that a balloon can take out
12 infrastructure in such a way. This legislation seeks
13 to inform consumers by requiring retailers to attach
14 a label about warnings about the risk of fire,
15 electrical outages due to these balloons and its
16 weight prior to sale. Failure to do so would incur a
17 civil penalty for balloons being improperly sold and
18 I encourage my colleagues to vote yes on this.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

20 Council Member Grodenchik.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
22 Mr. Public Advocate, and I just beg the indulgence of
23 my colleagues here. I have to tell you I was quite
24 annoyed to read that an administration official of
25 the current federal administration believes that the

2 words of the New Colossus that stand at the base of
3 our Statue of Liberty need to be rewritten and I was
4 offended because 116 years ago my grandfather, just
5 before Christmas, my grandfather Max Aaron

6 Grodenchik, he sailed passed the Statue of Liberty
7 and was soon joined by Celia Barashonsky, who he
8 married 109, 10, 11 years ago in Councilwoman Chin's
9 district on East Broadway, and they were followed by
10 my grandparent, Chaim Rosenfeld and Fanny Malhood.

11 And so with the indulgence of my colleagues I would
12 like to read the New Colossus, which was written by a
13 native New Yorker, Emma Lazarus, a Sephardic Jewess
14 who died much too young, and the poem goes like this,

15 "Not like the brazen giant of Greek fame, with
16 conquering limbs astride from land to land, here at
17 our sea-washed sunset gates shall stand a mighty
18 woman with a torch whose flame is the imprisoned
19 lightening in her name, Mother of Exiles. From her
20 beacon hand glows worldwide welcome and her mild eyes
21 command the air-bridged harbor that twin cities
22 frame. Keep ancient lands your storied pomp, she
23 cries, with silent lips. Give me your tired, your
24 poor, your huddled masses yearning to breathe free,
25 the wretched refuse of your teeming shore, send

2 these, the homeless, tempest tossed to me, I lift my
3 lamp behind, beside the golden door." She doesn't
4 mention that they should come from Europe or Africa
5 or Asia or any other place on the face of the earth.
6 This city has been welcoming people from all over the
7 world for hundreds and hundreds of years and I think
8 Ms. Lazarus got it exactly right, and that is why to
9 this day that poem is on the Statue of Liberty, may
10 it ever be so, and thank you to my colleagues for
11 listening to that today.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.
13 Council Member Treyger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Mr.
15 Public Advocate. Colleagues, I'm also pleased to
16 introduce a bill today that prioritizes swimmer
17 safety. There have been too many tragedies this
18 summer in the water and our city must do everything
19 possible to protect our swimmers. My bill I'm
20 introducing will amend the code, administrative code,
21 in New York City in relation to requiring the
22 demarcation of boating and bathing areas at city
23 beaches. This will make it clear through the use of
24 buoys or signs to boats, Jet Skis, and other
25 watercrafts that they cannot enter designated

2 swimming areas. In my district, Jet Skis often speed
3 into the swimming area, endangering children and our
4 families. But even when the NYPD Harbor Unit is
5 ticketing offenders, offenders are able to fight the
6 ticket and beat the ticket because there aren't
7 currently any clear markings where they can and
8 cannot enter. This bill will change that and make
9 sure all swimmers feel safe and secure in the water.
10 I appreciate my colleagues for their time and for
11 their support. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so
13 much. And I'll now call on the speaker to close
14 today's meeting.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Public
16 Advocate. I want to end by just thanking everyone,
17 of course. I hope everyone has a safe summer. And I
18 just want to, of course, publicly state Donovan
19 Richards is a fantastic member of this body and I am
20 extraordinarily proud that he is chair of our Public
21 Safety Committee. I think he has done a wonderful
22 job in that position. He has spoken his mind
23 [applause], he has talked about his personal
24 experience, and he has my complete and full
25 confidence and support, and I wanted to say that on

2 the record today. Thank you, Donovan, for your
3 leadership, for your advocacy, for being a thoughtful
4 and great leader in this city and in chairing that
5 committee, and with that today's Stated Meeting of
6 August 14, 2019, is hereby adjourned. [gavel]

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 31, 2019