|   | SUBCOMMITTEE                     | ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND                 |
|---|----------------------------------|---|
|   |                                  | MARITIME USES 1                                 |
| 2 | CITY COUNCIL<br>CITY OF NEW YORK |   |
| 3 |                                  | X   |
|   | TRANSCRIPT OF TH                 | E MINUTES                                       |
|   | Of the                           |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   | MARITIME USES                    | LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND                    |
|   |                                  | July 16, 2019                                   |
|   |                                  | Start: 1:23 p.m.<br>Recess: 1:54 p.m.           |
|   |                                  | o so a cath an                                  |
|   |                                  | 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16 <sup>th</sup> Fl. |
|   | BEFORE:                          | ADRIENNE E. ADAMS<br>Chairperson                |
|   | COUNCIL MEMBERS:                 |   |
|   |                                  | INEZ D. BARRON<br>PETER A. KOO                  |
|   |                                  | I. DANEEK MILLER<br>MARK TREYGER                |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |
|   |                                  |   |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND   |
|----|--|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 2  |
| 2  | A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)  |
| 3  | Genevieve Michel<br>Executive Director of Government Affairs at New  |
| 4  | York City's Department of Housing Preservation<br>And Development, HPD   |
| 5  | Andrea Alexopoulos   |
| 6  | Project Manager at Asian American for Equality,<br>AAFE  |
| 7  | Christine O'Connell  |
| 8  | Housing Finance and Community Development<br>Specialist  |
| 9  |  |
| 10 |  |
| 11 |  |
| 12 |  |
| 13 |  |
| 14 |  |
| 15 |  |
| 16 |  |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |
|    | ll de la constant de |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND                     |
|----|--|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 3  |
| 2  | [gavel]  |
| 3  | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good afternoon,                               |
| 4  | welcome to this meeting of the Subcommittee on                   |
| 5  | Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses. I'm                  |
| 6  | Council Member Adrienne Adams, the Chair of this                 |
| 7  | Subcommittee and we are joined today by Council                  |
| 8  | Member Barron and we are expecting other Council                 |
| 9  | Members to come in very shortly. Today we will hold a            |
| 10 | public hearing on the 202-207 7 <sup>th</sup> Avenue project and |
| 11 | a vote on the applications related to the 784                    |
| 12 | Courtlandt Avenue project. The 201 through 207 $7^{th}$          |
| 13 | Avenue project consists of two applications submitted            |
| 14 | by the New York City Department of Housing                       |
| 15 | Preservation and Development both of which we are                |
| 16 | hearing preconsidered to facilitate a mixed-use                  |
| 17 | development containing approximately 26 affordable               |
| 18 | residential units and commute commercial space in                |
| 19 | the Speaker's district in Manhattan. Application                 |
| 20 | number C 190253 HAM requests the designation of an               |
| 21 | urban development action area for property located at            |
| 22 | 201-207 7 <sup>th</sup> Avenue, block 797, lots 80, 81, 82, and  |
| 23 | 83 and an urban development action area project for              |
| 24 | such area pursuant to Article XVI of the general                 |
| 25 | municipal law and pursuant to section 197-C of the               |
|    |  |

1 MARITIME USES 4 2 New York City charter, approval of the disposition of such property to a developer selected by HPD. 3 Application number 20195731 HAM submitted by HPD 4 pursuant to section 577 of Article, Article XI of the 5 Private Housing Finance Law requests approval of a 6 7 real property tax exemption for such property and I do have remarks submitted by Speaker Corey Johnson 8 which read, since taking office in 2014, getting this 9 project jumpstarted has been one of my top 10 priorities. After many years of inaction and false 11 12 starts, I am happy that the city is finally moving toward... forward with an affordable housing 13 redevelopment plan for the city owned properties at 14 West 22<sup>nd</sup> Street and 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue. These buildings have 15 16 languished for far too long, but we have a great team in place who will be delivering sorely needed 17 18 affordable housing for this community. For me it is important that the tenants who have lived in these 19 20 buildings will be able to buy into their apartment for 2,500 dollars under the tenant interim lease 21 2.2 program and that all displaced families will have an 23 opportunity to return whether they rent or buy. It is also important that we work together to make sure 24 these units are permanently affordable and that 25

| 1  | MARITIME USES 5   |
|----|---|
| 2  | owners are not incentivized to sell by receiving                |
| 3  | windfall profits. We will have questions following,             |
| 4  | we're going to go ahead and introduce the panel.                |
| 5  | [off mic dialogue]  |
| 6  | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: We've been joined by                         |
| 7  | Council Member Treyger and we are going to have our             |
| 8  | vote before we hear from HPD. We will now vote on LUs           |
| 9  | 467 and LU 468 both submitted by the Department of              |
| 10 | Housing Preservation and Development regarding the              |
| 11 | 784 Courtlandt Avenue project in Chair Salamanca's              |
| 12 | district in the Bronx. LU 467 is an application                 |
| 13 | pursuant to section 505 of Article XV of the general            |
| 14 | municipal law of New York State and section 197-C of            |
| 15 | the New York City Charter for the fourth amendment to           |
| 16 | the Melrose Commons Urban Renewal Plan for the                  |
| 17 | Melrose Commons Urban Renewal area. The amendment               |
| 18 | would remove a 50 a 45-foot height restriction from             |
| 19 | site 15 imposed by the current urban renewal plan for           |
| 20 | certain buildings in R7-2 and R7-A districts. LU 468            |
| 21 | is an application submitted pursuant to Article XVI             |
| 22 | of the General Municipal law for approval of an urban           |
| 23 | development action area designation for the property            |
| 24 | located at 359 East 157 <sup>th</sup> Street and 784 Courtlandt |
| 25 | Avenue, block 2404, lots one and two and the approval           |
| ļ  |   |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND          |
|----|---|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 6                                       |
| 2  | of an urban development action area project for such  |
| 3  | area pursuant to 197-C of the New York City Charter   |
| 4  | for the disposition of such property to a developer   |
| 5  | selected by HPD. The related applicants would exempt  |
| 6  | the development site from a height limit in order to  |
| 7  | facilitate the construction of a seven-story mixed    |
| 8  | use building with approximately 20 residential units  |
| 9  | all of which will be affordable, ground floor retail  |
| 10 | space and community facility space. I will now call   |
| 11 | for a vote to approve LUs 467 and 468, Counsel please |
| 12 | call the role.  |
| 13 | COMMITTEE CLERK: Adams?                               |
| 14 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I vote aye.                        |
| 15 | COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?                              |
| 16 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.                    |
| 17 | COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger?                             |
| 18 | COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.                          |
| 19 | COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of three in                |
| 20 | the affirmative, zero in the negative and with zero   |
| 21 | abstentions the items are approved for forwarding to  |
| 22 | the full land use committee for forwarding to the     |
| 23 | full land use committee and the vote is held open.    |
| 24 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. As stated,              |
|    |   |

25 the vote will be held open. We will now hear

| 1  |   |
|----|---|
|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND              |
| 1  | MARITIME USES 7   |
| 2  | testimony from Christine Redcalf, Redclaff; Genevieve     |
| 3  | Michel; Andrea Alexopoulos, you may begin.                |
| 4  | GENEVIEVE MICHEL: The preconsidered land                  |
| 5  | use actions before this subcommittee today are            |
| 6  | related to the development of a project know as 201-      |
| 7  | 207 $7^{th}$ Avenue in Manhattan district three. The item |
| 8  | related to C 190253 HAM consists of the proposed          |
| 9  | ULURP actions that seek urban development at [cross-      |
| 10 | talk]   |
| 11 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, we're going to                   |
| 12 | stop you really quickly so that Counsel can swear you     |
| 13 | in.   |
| 14 | GENEVIEVE MICHEL: I know [cross-talk]                     |
| 15 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I'm sorry.                             |
| 16 | COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right                  |
| 17 | hands, please state your names.                           |
| 18 | GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Genevieve Michel.                       |
| 19 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Christine,                           |
| 20 | Christine Radcliff O'Connell.                             |
| 21 | ANDREA ALEXOPOULOS: Andrea Alexopoulos.                   |
| 22 | COMMITTEE CLERK: Do you affirm to tell                    |
| 23 | the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth      |
| 24 | in your testimony before the Subcommittee and in          |
| 25 | answer to all Council Member questions?                   |
|    |   |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND 1 MARITIME USES 8 2 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Yes. ANDREA ALEXOPOULOS: Yes. 3 CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Yes. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, please 6 continue. 7 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: And disposition of city owned property for a development site consisting 8 of four city owned multiple dwellings. The zoning 9 district is R8-A C2-59 with a FAR of six. The lot 10 area of 3,700 square feet and a total developable 11 12 area of 22,000 square feet. Additionally, the item related to C2-0195731 HAM consists of an Article XI 13 tax exemption, exemption request for a term of 40 14 15 years. Located at block 797, lots 80, 81, 82, and 83 in Manhattan, Council District three, the project is 16 slated for redevelopment under HPD's affordable 17 18 neighborhood cooperative program or ANCP, the site is comprised of four contiguous city owned buildings 19

21 22<sup>nd</sup> Street. As part of the ANCP program guidelines, 22 city owned multiple dwellings are conveyed to 23 restoring communities HDFC for one dollar per tax lot 24 and then rehabilitated by private developers selected 25 through a competitive process to create affordable

containing 14 units on the corner of 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue and

1 MARITIME USES 9 2 cooperatives for low- and moderate-income households. The developer will sign a site development management 3 agreement with restoring communities that will be in 4 effect until conversion occurs and title transfers 5 from restoring communities HDFC to a tenant formed 6 7 HDFC cooperative from the time of the cooperative conversion the developer will remain the property 8 manager for at least one year. After the first year 9 the co-op will have the choice of keeping the 10 developer as property manager or hire a new company 11 as approved by HPD. The four buildings in the 7<sup>th</sup> 12 13 Avenue cluster were taken into city ownership through 14 an in-rem foreclosure action in 1976 and in November 15 1997 the existing tenants entered into the tenant 16 interim lease program. As a requirement of the TIL 17 program, tenants form tenant associations to manage 18 their buildings and collect rents under a net lease from the city of New York until such time as the 19 20 tenants have met all the milestones and are ready for next steps. Generally, buildings in ANCP undergo 21 2.2 substantial rehabilitation, however in this case the 23 four buildings will be demolished and replaced by a single multiple dwelling building thus requiring 24 ULURP. Three of the buildings have been vacated due 25

1 MARITIME USES 10 2 to structural stability issues and tenants have been temporarily relocated in nearby neighborhoods. The 3 last remaining tenant in 207 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue we hope will 4 5 be temporarily relocated by the end of July 2019. After the conveyance, construction will be undertaken 6 7 by the developer who proposes to build a nine-story mixed use building with ground floor commercial space 8 for which a use has yet to be determined. The 9 residential portion of the project will contain nine 10 studios, ten one bedrooms, five two bedrooms and two 11 12 three-bedroom apartments. The residential amenities will include a rooftop terrace, community room, a 13 lobby garden space, bike room, package storage area, 14 15 a laundry room, the co-op interest attributable to 16 occupied apartments will be sold to the existing tenants for 2,500 dollars. Additionally, the 17 18 maintenance is anticipated to be approximately 40 percent of AMI for existing tenants which is roughly 19 20 628 dollars a month for studio, 801 for a one bedroom, 976 for a two bedroom and 1,122 for a three-21 2.2 bedroom unit. The cooperative units attribute 23 interest attributable to vacant apartments will be sold to a price affordable to families earning no 24 more than 165 percent of area median income. In order 25

| - | MARITIME USES 11                                      |
|---|---|
| 2 | to facilitate development of the project and maintain |
| 3 | long time affordability, HPD seeks approval of these  |
| 4 | preconsidered items which include the Article XI tax  |
| 5 | exemption for total benefits of approximately         |
| 6 | 3,794,206 dollars with a net present value of         |
| 7 | 1,059,922 dollars. Thank you. I'll now turn it over   |
| 8 | to AAFE.  |

9 ANDREA ALEXOPOULOS: Hi, my name is 10 Andrea Alexopoulos, I'm the Project Manager at Asian 11 Americans for Equality or AAFE for short. AAFE is a 12 45-year-old nonprofit community organization that was founded in the civil rights movement in Chinatown. 13 14 Our organization was born out of a grassroots group 15 fighting to get local workers access to construction 16 jobs at government development sites and we've been 17 fighting for equal opportunities and equal rights in 18 New York ever since. Our services span from safety 19 net social services to neighborhood small business 20 support to home ownership counseling to affordable housing rehab and development. AAFE is deeply 21 committed to preserving affordable housing throughout 2.2 23 New York City and providing new opportunities for our city's diverse communities. This is a rendering of 24

25

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND               |
|----|--|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 12   |
| 2  | the future building at the site at 201–207 $7^{\text{th}}$ |
| 3  | Avenue. Page down. I don't know how to work this.          |
| 4  | [off mic dialogue]   |
| 5  | ANDREA ALEXOPOULOS: Thank you. For this                    |
| 6  | project AAFE has selected Amie Gross Architect to          |
| 7  | work on this project as the architect of record, they      |
| 8  | have extensive experience with affordable housing          |
| 9  | with a focus on community integrated design. Some of       |
| 10 | the amenities were already discussed earlier. The          |
| 11 | final building will have a rooftop terrace, a              |
| 12 | community room, all the units will be handicap             |
| 13 | accessible and ADA compliant, the building will also       |
| 14 | be very energy efficient and will achieve enterprise       |
| 15 | green community standards. This is a detailed image        |
| 16 | of the building elevations for the future building.        |
| 17 | This is a detail of the ground floor of the proposed       |
| 18 | building, to the left you can see the entrance to the      |
| 19 | residential space along West $22^{nd}$ Street. While the   |
| 20 | commercial spaces front to $7^{th}$ Avenue on the bottom   |
| 21 | of the page. The commercial spaces have been               |
| 22 | subdivided into three small spaces based on feedback       |
| 23 | from the community board in order to accommodate           |
| 24 | smaller local retailers. There's also some outdoor         |
| 25 | space in the rear of the building that is accessible       |
|    |  |

1 MARITIME USES 13 2 only through the residential corridor at this time. This is an image of one of the typical floor layouts, 3 this has a two-bedroom apartment on the corner in the 4 5 orange, one bedroom in purple and blue is a studio. The building will also have two three-bedroom units, 6 7 so these are the typical layouts for those, those floors with the three bedrooms on the corner and you 8 have the one bedroom above and two studios. This 9 floor is for the resident amenities on the eighth 10 floor of the building. There's a laundry room and a 11 12 recreation room for the tenants where they can have meetings with their co-op, they can also have a party 13 14 in there or be able to access the space as they wish. 15 There's also a shared roof garden for all of the 16 tenants. The ninth floor of the building has a ... has a setback, a bit of a tower as required by zoning so 17 18 this is a schematic of the ninth-floor plan where you have two units up there. And that is the current 19 20 design as it stands now so let us know if you have any questions. 21 2.2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much 23 for your testimony today and, and presentation. There

25 and the Speaker had specific questions on this

24

are questions, I understand that community board four

MARITIME USES 14 2 project so let's go ahead and talk about some 3 unresolved issues that remain. Is it possible to 4 extend the HPD regulatory agreement for income and 5 resale restrictions?

1

GENEVIEVE MICHEL: So, generally speaking 6 7 when we're looking at the length of our regulatory agreement we focus on the length of the tax exemption 8 just to make sure that we're setting buildings up for 9 success into the future, you know on this project the 10 length of the Article XI is 40 years, that's the 11 12 longest it can be via state law but you know have 13 certainly heard the request from both the Speaker and 14 community board to see if there is any way we can 15 work out a longer term of affordability and are, you 16 know testing out some options internally to try and 17 figure out if there's any path to success there.

18 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, so this will be 19 ongoing with the community board and the Speaker 20 then, okay. Can a new 130 percent AMI income tier be 21 created in addition to the 160 percent AMI tier for 22 non-returning tenant units?

GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Yeah, so I think under the ANCP program and certainly in these sorts of HDFCs we try to make sure that there is one AMI level

| 1  | MARITIME USES 15                                      |
|----|---|
| 2  | across the board I think just to make sure that, you  |
| 3  | know tenants are there, there is equity among the     |
| 4  | tenants but I think, you know again we are looking at |
| 5  | whether or not there is a way to make the project     |
| 6  | more affordable across the board, I think with all of |
| 7  | the history that we talked a little bit about today   |
| 8  | and certainly the Speaker and the community board     |
| 9  | are, you know even more aware of than I am the        |
| 10 | financing on this project is really tough and so I    |
| 11 | think it's going to be financially difficult for us   |
| 12 | to bring down those AMIs but we are giving it our     |
| 13 | best shot and seeing what is possible.                |
| 14 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, I'm sure the                 |
| 15 | Speaker and the community, community board would      |
| 16 | appreciate that 160 percent AMI tier is extreme.      |
| 17 | Okay, according to the flip tax schedule after year   |
| 18 | 15, the seller would be able to get back 80 percent   |
| 19 | of the proceeds of the sale leaving 20 percent to go  |
| 20 | back to the co-op, what is this breakdown after 15    |
| 21 | years?  |
| 22 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Excuse me. Post 15               |
| 23 | years, the 20 percent remains so it's… from 15 until  |
| 24 | your 40, 20 percent of the profit will come back to   |
| 25 | the co-op.  |
|    |   |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND          |
|----|---|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 16                                      |
| 2  | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, so restate that              |
| 3  | again.  |
| 4  | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Sure, so we have a               |
| 5  | flip tax schedule for all purchasers where profit is  |
| 6  | subject to be split between the seller and the co-op. |
| 7  | Years one through three, there's a zero percent       |
| 8  | profit recognition from, from any party and then it   |
| 9  | increases by five percent from years four to 15, at   |
| 10 | year 15 you sort of max out at your ability to retain |
| 11 | profit and 20 percent will always go back to the co-  |
| 12 | op and that's… year, year 15 is when you max out and  |
| 13 | then that goes until the conclusion of the regulatory |
| 14 | agreement.  |
| 15 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, got it, thank                |
| 16 | you. Is it possible to establish resale price caps to |
| 17 | prevent windfall profits, profits for all purchasers? |
| 18 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: The flip tax                     |
| 19 | schedule is a means to restrict profit over time and  |
| 20 | incentivize long term home ownership, it, you know    |
| 21 | incentivizes that for every year that you are living  |
| 22 | in the co-op and that you're essentially waiting or,  |

or you're just ... you're just living in the co-op, this

is your primary residence, you are not ... you're not

25

23

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND 1 MARITIME USES 17 2 getting a windfall, you're, you're subject to sharing your profit with the co-op. 3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: So, the wind tax 4 5 would be the remedy. 6 CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: The, the flip tax ... 7 [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: The flip tax, I'm 8 sorry would be the remedy... [cross-talk] 9 CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: ... is, is that 10 remedy, yes. 11 12 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, alright. Is it possible to require that all units be sold back to 13 HDFC for resale? 14 15 CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Do you want to 16 talk... [cross-talk] 17 GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Yeah, I mean I think 18 our interpretation of local law 64 as passed by the council would actually prevent that from happening. 19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. Okay, thank 20 you, I'm, I'm going to come back to you, I think 21 2.2 Council Member Barron has some questions. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, thank you Madame Chair. These maintenance fees sound like 24 they're close to what it would be for rental in my 25

| 1        | MARITIME USES 18  |
|----------|---|
| 2        | community so they really sound great; 628 for a   |
| 3        | studio, 81… 801 for a one bedroom, 96… 976 for a two  |
| 4        | bedroom and 1,122 for a three bedroom so I, I commend   |
| 5        | the community and the Speaker for negotiating those   |
| 6        | maintenance rates. I do have some questions, it was   |
| 7        | partly the question that was raised by, by the Chair  |
| 8        | talking about creating a new 130 AM income tier in  |
| 9        | addition to, so I heard you say the 165… well 160,  |
| 10       | 165 is what you have established but can we have  |
| 11       | another income band in addition to that so that not   |
| 12       | all… a certain percentage at that 130 in addition to  |
| 13       | the 160, 165?   |
| 14       | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: So, we in ANCP   |
| 15       | we're really setting our income tier based on what it   |
| 16       | costs to develop the project, this is a particularly  |
| 17       | expensive site. As Genevieve mentioned we   |
| 18       | traditionally do renovations so new construction is   |
| 19       |   |
|          | not our bread and butter but in this case because of  |
| 20       | not our bread and butter but in this case because of<br>the site conditions we, we have to move towards a new   |
| 20<br>21 |   |
|          | the site conditions we, we have to move towards a new   |
| 21       | the site conditions we, we have to move towards a new construction, that is particularly costly, there's  |
| 21<br>22 | the site conditions we, we have to move towards a new construction, that is particularly costly, there's other there's other reasons why this is particularly |

| 1  | MARITIME USES 19                                      |
|----|---|
| 2  | as part of the development of this project, there's   |
| 3  | as part of demolition this is going to be a brick by  |
| 4  | brick demolition versus a wrecking ball style         |
| 5  | demolition and, and all of that sort of enhances the  |
| 6  | cost of the project. So, when we're looking at what   |
| 7  | it costs to renovate we have to look at what it costs |
| 8  | to pay back that, that investment and so the          |
| 9  | maintenance is part of the repayment of the           |
| 10 | investment but also the, the upfront, the sale the    |
| 11 | sale prices that we get from selling the occupied and |
| 12 | the vacant apartments, that's another way that we're  |
| 13 | able to sort of pay down or pay off that investment   |
| 14 | that's, that's being made at such a high amount. So,  |
| 15 | that's why our sale prices for the vacant apartments  |
| 16 | have been set at 160 percent of area median income.   |
| 17 | Genevieve also mentioned that in these limited equity |
| 18 | co-ops when we are talking about one unit, one vote   |
| 19 | we are… we are very cognizant of, of the need to have |
| 20 | equity across the… across the co-op structure and so  |
| 21 | setting separate income tiers in the co-op so that we |
| 22 | can have sort of differentiation instead of instead   |
| 23 | of that sort of similar equity is, is a concern for   |
| 24 | the program.  |
|    |   |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND          |  |
|----|---|--|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 20                                      |  |
| 2  | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, well I hear                |  |
| 3  | what you're saying but I, I take exception to that, I |  |
| 4  | don't I don't think that that influences the          |  |
| 5  | conditions that you're trying to establish. What's    |  |
| 6  | the size of the studio apartment?                     |  |
| 7  | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Do you have a                    |  |
| 8  | breakdown of that?                                    |  |
| 9  | GENEVIEVE MICHEL: 385 square feet.                    |  |
| 10 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and in your               |  |
| 11 | testimony, you say that the co-op interest            |  |
| 12 | attributable to attributable to occupied apartments   |  |
| 13 | will be sold to the existing tenants, how many        |  |
| 14 | tenants are there and you, you talked [cross-talk]    |  |
| 15 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: There… [cross-talk]              |  |
| 16 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:about one that's                |  |
| 17 | still to be relocated but how many tenants are        |  |
| 18 | actually still a part of this plan?                   |  |
| 19 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: We have five                     |  |
| 20 | families associated with this future co-op, four of   |  |
| 21 | them have been relocated out and one is has accepted  |  |
| 22 | a relocation unit and is in the process of being      |  |
| 23 | relocated out, temporarily [cross-talk]               |  |
| 24 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, so there are               |  |
| 25 | only five?  |  |
|    |   |  |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND          |
|----|---|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 21                                      |
| 2  | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: There's five.                    |
| 3  | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, all the rest               |
| 4  | are going to be new?                                  |
| 5  | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: 11 excuse me, 21                 |
| 6  | units would be… are vacant.                           |
| 7  | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, how many                   |
| 8  | units will be constructed in this?                    |
| 9  | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: 26 total.                        |
| 10 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: 26 so most of                  |
| 11 | them are going to be new so most of them are going to |
| 12 | be sold at that 165 percent of the AMI.               |
| 13 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: We, we are going to              |
| 14 | sell units at 150 percent of area median income and   |
| 15 | then we're going to restrict the income of, of those  |
| 16 | sale prices to families earning no more than 160      |
| 17 | percent AMI to give us a little marketing ban room.   |
| 18 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and I had                 |
| 19 | another question, if it comes to me in the next two   |
| 20 | minutes, I'll, I'll ask it and thank you, thank you   |
| 21 | Madame Chair.   |
| 22 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you Council                  |
| 23 | Member, just… [cross-talk]                            |
| 24 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I remembered.                  |
| 25 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Go right ahead.                    |
|    |   |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND         |
|----|--|
| 1  | MARITIME USES 22                                     |
| 2  | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think I                     |
| 3  | remember. Yes, is there a requirement that the       |
| 4  | tenants how long must a tenant or the co-op owner    |
| 5  | have this as their primary residence?                |
| 6  | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: For the duration of             |
| 7  | the regulatory agreement so… [cross-talk]            |
| 8  | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you                     |
| 9  | [cross-talk]   |
| 10 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL:when we market                   |
| 11 | [cross-talk]   |
| 12 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay [cross-                  |
| 13 | talk]  |
| 14 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Yeah.                           |
| 15 | COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And then you                  |
| 16 | know okay, according to the flip schedule if they    |
| 17 | leave… okay, good, thank you.                        |
| 18 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: Yeah, uh-huh.                   |
| 19 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you Council                 |
| 20 | Member Barron. Along those same lines what is the    |
| 21 | unit size breakdown for the units that will          |
| 22 | accommodate the five returning tenants?              |
| 23 | CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: There are out of                |
| 24 | the five families two will be relocated into a three |
| 25 | bedroom will be returning to three-bedroom           |
|    |  |

1 MARITIME USES 23 2 apartments and three will be returning to two-bedroom apartments. 3 4 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: So, essentially, 5 they're going back to the same set up that they ... 6 okay, great. How will the 21 vacant units be 7 marketed? They'll be marketed 8 CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: through HPD marketing procedures which requires that 9 the developer prepare a plan and market publicly, 10 advertise in multiple sources, advertise on HPD's 11 12 website and that they receive applications, randomize those applications, there's only a preference for New 13 14 York City residents, it's not a community board 15 preference but it's a preference for New York City 16 residents and we go down the list after the list is 17 randomized those that qualify are the first to 18 purchase. 19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: That was going to be 20 another question as far as community board preference is concerned and, and why is there no community board 21 2.2 preference? 23 CHRISTINE O'CONNELL: There are returning tenants to this building so there is no community 24

25

preference.

## MARITIME USES

1

2

## CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Understood,

3 understood, okay. And speaking about the community 4 board can you review the feedback that was provided 5 by community board four that's been incorporated in 6 the building design or anything else that came from 7 CB four that was incorporated in your decision 8 making?

ANDREA ALEXOPOULOS: Sure, I would say 9 first of all the design itself of the façade was very 10 much a factor of community board input, this 11 12 neighborhood has a lot of mercantile buildings so 13 there was a lot of feedback about style and façade 14 details that were incorporated, we had many different 15 versions of the façade so this was a late stage 16 design that was meeting their satisfaction. They also wanted the entrance on 22<sup>nd</sup> Street, that was 17 18 accommodated, they also wanted this rear yard space not to be accessible from the commercial space 19 20 because they have concerns about loud restaurants at night, so we had that connecting only through the 21 2.2 residential area. They also as I mentioned before 23 were very vocal about having smaller retail spaces, they also would like there to be language in the 24 regulatory agreement to not allow chain stores so 25

| 1  | MARITIME USES 25                                     |  |
|----|--|--|
| 2  | that's something that we can look to accommodate as  |  |
| 3  | well. They also had what else there's a lot of       |  |
| 4  | elements. They, they had us bump out this community  |  |
| 5  | this commercial space into the residential lobby a   |  |
| 6  | bit, you can see that it's the corner kind of juts   |  |
| 7  | into the residential lobby so they wanted to maximiz |  |
| 8  | the commercial space for the co-op so that it could  |  |
| 9  | maximize its own revenue from the commercial spaces. |  |
| 10 | Anything else? Okay, thank you, among other things   |  |
| 11 | that's, that's about those are the main ones.        |  |
| 12 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you very              |  |
| 13 | much, it looks like there's, there's pretty decent   |  |
| 14 | representation from CB four involved so thank you    |  |
| 15 | very much. Are there any other questions from my     |  |
| 16 | colleagues, Council Member Treyger, no. Okay, thank  |  |
| 17 | you very much. We are thankful for your testimony    |  |
| 18 | today and you are excused.                           |  |
| 19 | GENEVIEVE MICHEL: Thank you.                         |  |
| 20 | CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Are there any members             |  |
| 21 | of the public who wish to testify on these items?    |  |
| 22 | Seeing none the public hearings on these two         |  |
| 23 | preconsidered items are now closed and the items are |  |
| 24 | laid over. Our vote on LU 467 and 468 are also       |  |
| 25 | closed, this concludes today's business. I'd like to |  |
|    |  |  |

|    | SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND     |    |
|----|--|----|
| 1  | MARITIME USES                                    | 26 |
| 2  | thank the members of the public, my colleagues,  |    |
| 3  | Council and Land Use staff for attending today's |    |
| 4  | hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned.       |    |
| 5  | [gavel]  |    |
| 6  |  |    |
| 7  |  |    |
| 8  |  |    |
| 9  |  |    |
| 10 |  |    |
| 11 |  |    |
| 12 |  |    |
| 13 |  |    |
| 14 |  |    |
| 15 |  |    |
| 16 |  |    |
| 17 |  |    |
| 18 |  |    |
| 19 |  |    |
| 20 |  |    |
| 21 |  |    |
| 22 |  |    |
| 23 |  |    |
| 24 |  |    |
| 25 |  |    |
|    |  |    |

## <u>C E R T I F I C A T E</u>

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

July 22, 2019