

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

RECESSED STATED MEETING OF JUNE 13, 2019

----- X

June 18, 2019
Start: 4:38 p.m.
Recess: 4:55 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers, City Hall

B E F O R E: LAURIE A. CUMBO
Majority Leader

COREY D. JOHNSON
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin L. Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene

Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry S. Grodenchik
Robert F. Holden
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
Daneek Miller
Francisco P. Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
James G. Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 RECESSED STATED MEETING OF JUNE 13, 2019 4

2 CHERISE TOREZ: [Sound check]. Today's
3 June 18, 2019 Stated Meeting is being recorded by.

4 CLERK: Can I have your attention please.
5 Can I please have your attention. Please, quiet on
6 the floor. Council Members, please take your seats.
7 At this time, please place all electronic devices to
8 vibrate, all electronic devices to vibrate. Will all
9 non-Council employees please leave the main floor of
10 the Chambers. Thank you, Madam.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [gavel] Good
12 afternoon and welcome to the recessed stated meeting
13 of June 13, 2019. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo.
14 Would everyone please rise for the Pledge of
15 Allegiance.

16 CLERK: All rise.

17 ALL: Pledge of Allegiance.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Roll call.

19 CLERK: Adams?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

21 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

23 CLERK: Ayala?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

25 CLERK: Barron?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

3 CLERK: Borelli?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

5 CLERK: Brannan?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

7 CLERK: Cabrera?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

9 CLERK: Chin?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

11 CLERK: Cohen?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

13 CLERK: Constantinides?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

15 CLERK: Cornegy?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aqui.

17 CLERK: Deutsch?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

19 CLERK: Diaz? Dromm?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

21 CLERK: Espinal?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

23 CLERK: Eugene?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

25 CLERK: Gibson?

1 RECESSED STATED MEETING OF JUNE 13, 2019

6

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

3 CLERK: Gjonaj? Grodenchik?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

5 CLERK: Holden?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

7 CLERK: Kallos?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

9 CLERK: King?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

11 CLERK: Koo?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

13 CLERK: Koslowitz?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

15 CLERK: Lancman? Lander? Levin?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

17 CLERK: Levine?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

19 CLERK: Louis?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.

21 CLERK: Maisel?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

23 CLERK: Menchaca?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

25 CLERK: Miller?

1 RECESSED STATED MEETING OF JUNE 13, 2019

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

3 CLERK: Moya?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

5 CLERK: Perkins?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Presente.

7 CLERK: Powers?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

9 CLERK: Reynoso?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

11 CLERK: Richards?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

13 CLERK: Rivera?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

15 CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

17 CLERK: Rosenthal?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

19 CLERK: Salamanca? Torres? Treyger?

20 Ulrich? Vallone? Van Bramer?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

22 CLERK: Yeger?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

24 CLERK: Matteo?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

2 CLERK: Cumbo?

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

4 CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have a quorum.

7 Supplemental Messages and Papers from the Mayor.

8 COUNSEL: None.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Supplemental
10 Communication from City, County and Borough Offices.

11 COUNSEL: None.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Supplemental
13 Petitions and Communications.

14 COUNSEL: None.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Supplemental Land
16 Use Call-Ups.

17 COUNSEL: None.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
19 will now have communication from Speaker Corey
20 Johnson.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon, good to
22 see you, Madam Majority Leader. I want to thank
23 everyone for being here today. I hope all of the
24 dads, grandfathers, uncles and father figures had a
25 very happy Father's Day and I want to thank you all

2 for coming in today on what has been and will
3 continue to be a busy week here at the City Council.
4 We're here today to vote on two legislative
5 resolutions that will help our first responders but
6 unfortunately, I have to begin by sadly marking
7 another tragedy in the New York City police
8 department. Last week, police officer Mike Cady took
9 his own life outside of a police precinct in Staten
10 Island. He was 29 years old. It was the third NYPD
11 suicide in less than ten days. We've lost Deputy
12 Chief Steven Silks and Detective Joseph Calabrese as
13 well. This is a tragedy, all three are tragedies for
14 the Department and for our City. It is a mental
15 health crisis and we need to ensure that the women
16 and men of the NYPD get the help that they need so
17 to Officer Cady, his family and the entire NYPD, our
18 thoughts and prayers are with you. Let us please
19 rise and take a moment of silence for Officer Mike
20 Cady, Deputy Chief Steven Silks and Detective Joseph
21 Calabrese.

22 [pause]

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. I want to
24 dive into today's very brief Stated Agenda. The
25 Council will vote on two legislative resolutions both

2 sponsored by our State and Federal Legislation
3 Committee Chair, Council Member Andy Cohen. These
4 legislative resolutions are very important. Every
5 stated meeting, I recognize 911 first responders who
6 lost their lives due to illnesses they contracted
7 down near the World Trade Center on that horribly
8 fateful day. By passing these bills to help our
9 police and firefighters, the Council is demonstrating
10 its commitment to emergency first responders who
11 devote their lives to protecting all New Yorkers.
12 The first is preconsidered SLR with accompanying
13 Senate and Assembly Bills and it will seek to provide
14 parity for members of the FDNY to other fire
15 departments across the State of New York by providing
16 a five year lookback window for retirees who are
17 diagnosed with lymphatic, digestive, hematological,
18 urinary, neurological, breast, reproductive or
19 prostate cancer or melanoma with the same presumption
20 of evidence for disability benefits. Right now the
21 members of the FDNY do not receive this five year
22 look back which all other fire departments give
23 across the State of New York so this is us really
24 making sure that folks that may get cancer by serving
25 our City when they retire that they get that look

2 back so they get the benefits that they deserve.

3 This is the right thing to do. The second is
4 preconsidered SLR with accompanying Senate and
5 Assembly bills and it will allow certain members of
6 the New York City police pension fund to receive a
7 membership date in the New York City police pension
8 fund attributable to service in the titles of the
9 police cadet program or the police cadet program
10 number II in the New York City police cadet program.
11 Members of the New York City cadet corp. eligible to
12 join the New York City employee retirement system
13 NYCERS, but cadets that served prior to 2012 were
14 unfairly denied the opportunity to join NYCERS when
15 they served in the cadet corp. As a result, these
16 cadets not only lost out on the opportunity to
17 receive pension credits but those who went on to
18 become police officers after July 1, 2009, were
19 denied the opportunity to become Tier II members of
20 the police pension system and instead they were
21 placed in either Tier III or Tier III R of that
22 system both which provide reduced benefits from Tier
23 II. This legislation, this home rule seeks to
24 correct this inequity. I'm really glad we're doing
25 this today. These cadets, 390 of them approximately,

2 almost all of them are police officers or some of
3 them now are detectives, or lieutenants, or sergeants
4 of color, many of them are women and they have had to
5 live with stress and instability and feeling like
6 they were not being treated as other folks because of
7 potentially a misclassification that happened and
8 this is really us fixing this wrong, making sure that
9 they are given the same level of pension benefits as
10 other people who do the same exact work and so I'm
11 grateful that today we are taking this action before
12 the legislative session concludes in Albany where
13 these two home rule messages that will be sent up to
14 the State Capitol tonight so that tomorrow members of
15 the State Legislature can pass these Assembly
16 incentive bills and ensure that firefighters and
17 police officers are treated with dignity and respect
18 in our City and that we are righting some wrongs that
19 had existed in the past so I'm grateful that we're
20 doing that today and I look forward with proceeding
21 with today's votes. That concludes our agenda for
22 today's brief stated meeting, and I want to thank
23 you, Madam Majority Leader and I turn it back to you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
25 Speaker Corey Johnson. We will now move into

1 RECESSED STATED MEETING OF JUNE 13, 2019 13

2 discussion of General Orders. Seeing none,
3 Supplemental Report of Special Committees.

4 COUNSEL: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Supplemental
6 Reports of Standing Committees.

7 COUNSEL: Report of the Committee on
8 State and Federal Legislation, preconsidered SLR 13,
9 Parity for Firefighters.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
11 orders.

12 COUNSEL: Preconsidered SLR 14, Pension
13 Extension for Police Officers.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
15 orders and at this time I'll ask for a rollcall vote
16 on the two items on today's general order calendar.

17 CLERK: Maisel?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

19 CLERK: King?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Yes.

21 CLERK: Torres?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes.

23 CLERK: Adams?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye.

25 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

1 RECESSED STATED MEETING OF JUNE 13, 2019 14

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

3 CLERK: Ayala?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

5 CLERK: Barron?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote yes on SLR
7 13 and I abstain on SLR 14.

8 CLERK: Borelli?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

10 CLERK: Brannan?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

12 CLERK: Cabrera?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'll be signing
14 yes.

15 CLERK: Chin?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

17 CLERK: Cohen?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

19 CLERK: Constantinides?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

21 CLERK: Cornegy?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye and
23 my gift is I will not explain my vote.

24 CLERK: Deutsch?

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to
3 explain my votes.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I'll be speaking
7 for Council Member Cornegy as well so I'm proud to
8 vote today in favor of both of these bills which
9 rights wrongs that were done to some of the first
10 responders of the FDNY and the NYPD, the two most
11 important law enforcement agencies in our City. Our
12 cadets deserve their fair share of their rightful
13 pensions and 911 responders who until now were not
14 eligible for certain pension benefits because of
15 diseases incurred at Ground Zero deserve access to
16 those funds. Thank you, Chair Cohen, for your
17 sponsorship on these extremely important bills and I
18 also want to thank our Speaker Corey Johnson for
19 making sure, ensuring that these two home rules are
20 brought here to the Council. Thank you very much.

21 CLERK: Diaz?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Yes.

23 CLERK: Dromm?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yes.

25 CLERK: Espinal?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

3 CLERK: Eugene?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

5 CLERK: Gibson?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest
7 gratitude to our Speaker and Jason Goldman and Chair
8 Andy Cohen, I am proud to vote on today's agenda and
9 certainly want to thank my colleagues for their
10 support in making sure we continue to provide the
11 needed support to our first responders in both the
12 FDNY and the NYPD. I'm very proud that we're voting
13 on this and I look forward to the Governor signing
14 these measures into state law after the legislature
15 votes on them tomorrow, so I proudly vote aye on all.
16 Thank you, Speaker, thank you Jason and thank you
17 Chair Cohen.

18 CLERK: Gjonaj?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

20 CLERK: Grodenchik?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

22 CLERK: Holden?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

24 CLERK: Kallos?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

2 CLERK: King?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

4 CLERK: Koo?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

6 CLERK: Koslowitz?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Happily, I

8 vote aye.

9 CLERK: Lancman? Lander? Levin?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

11 CLERK: Levine?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Louis?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Maisel?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

17 CLERK: Menchaca?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

19 CLERK: Miller?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Moya?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

23 CLERK: Perkins?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Powers?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: With a great
3 appreciation for all those who serve the City, I vote
4 aye. Thanks.

5 CLERK: Reynoso?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

7 CLERK: Richards?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

9 CLERK: Rivera?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

11 CLERK: Rodriguez?

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Before he votes, I want
13 to wish him a Happy birthday. Happy birthday, Ydanis
14 Rodriguez.

15 [applause and crosstalk]

16 CLERK: Rose?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

18 CLERK: Rosenthal?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Happy
20 birthday, Council Member Rodriguez and I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Salamanca? Treyger?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

23 CLERK: Ulrich? Vallone? Van Bramer?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

25 CLERK: Yeger?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

3 CLERK: Matteo?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

5 CLERK: Cumbo?

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

7 CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: With deep appreciation
9 for the men and women of the NYPD and the FDNY, I'm
10 really glad we're having this hearing today to make
11 this important fix. I vote aye.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. All
13 items on today's general order calendar are adopted
14 by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0
15 abstentions, with the exception of SLR 14, which was
16 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0
17 negative and 1 abstention. Supplemental Introduction
18 and Reading of Bills.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
20 referred to committees as indicated on today's
21 agenda.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you and we
23 will now move into general discussion. We have
24 Council Member Inez Barron.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
3 Majority Leader. If we lived in a perfect society,
4 we would have a utopia and we might not even have a
5 need for this body to talk about legislation to look
6 at how we can bring equity to our people who are
7 living here but we don't live in a perfect society
8 which means that we have got to take those actions
9 that correct injustices. When Richard Kilonzo
10 [phonetic] came before this body the first time, the
11 question that I asked him, as you can well imagine,
12 was how was he going to address the systemic racism
13 that exists in the education system and he gave a
14 response which talked about having training about
15 implicit bias and talking about having a culturally
16 sensitive curriculum and talked about programs and
17 initiatives that would address the inequities that we
18 face in our educational system and those are the
19 kinds of inequities that we see when we look back to
20 the founding of this country and look at the
21 [Inaudible] clause and we look at the battle at CFE,
22 Campaign for Fiscal Equity to make sure that we
23 brought the money to those black and brown
24 communities had not gotten it and for us to not
25 address the challenge of correcting the systemic

2 injustices that our communities have faced I think
3 does a disservice to us. It exists and as long as we
4 continue to call it other than what it is and to do
5 the dog whistles and say oh people who are being
6 hired are not qualified. We know what that meant
7 when we heard it at first. I think that it does an
8 injustice and does not allow us the opportunity to
9 make corrections in what we see exists in all of our
10 schools in the educational system, all of our black
11 and brown schools so calling on my colleagues who
12 have not yet signed onto the BLAC letter to sign on
13 to the letter so that we can let this chancellor know
14 we support his efforts to bring justice and equity to
15 black and brown children in this City. Thank you.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
17 Council Member Barron. Seeing no others, we will now
18 at this time, we will call on Speaker Corey Johnson
19 to close today's meeting.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The Stated Meeting of
21 June 18, 2019 stands in recess until tomorrow. Thank
22 you very much. [gavel]

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 1, 2019