CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING & MARITIME USES

----X

September 9, 2009
Start: XX:XXam/pm
Recess: XX:XXam/pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

LEROY G. COMRIE, JR.

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Letitia James Annabel Palma

Maria del Carmen Arroyo

Rosie Mendez

Elizabeth Crowley

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jenny Fernandez Director of Intergovernmental Affairs and Community Relations Landmark Preservation Commission

Bob Biegen Coordinator Prospect Heights Association

Gib Veconi Secretary Prospect Heights Neighborhood Development Council

Tara Kelly Melissa Baldock Historic Preservation and Public Policy Municipal Art Society

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 3
2	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Good day, I am
3	Leroy Comrie, I'm Acting Chair of the Landmarks,
4	Public Siting and Maritime Use Committee. Today
5	September 9th, 2009, we are here looking at three
6	items today. Manhattan item Community Board
7	number 5, the John Pierce Residence, landmark
8	itemdo I have to read the number?
9	FEMALE VOICE: No.
10	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Thank you.
11	Also, that's in Speaker Quinn's district. Also in
12	Manhattan Community Board 10 in Council Member
13	Dickens district the Mount Olive Fire Baptized
14	Holiness Church. And that is on 308 West 122nd
15	Street.
16	The first one was the John Pierce
17	Residence located at 11 East 51st Street.
18	We're laying over the item for 94
19	Greenwich Street house, and we're also dealing
20	with the Prospect Heights Historic District in
21	Brooklyn Community Board 8, which is why we are
22	joined by the esteemed Councilwoman Tish James.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: The only
24	reason why we're all
25	[Pause]

Τ	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 4
2	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: The only
3	reason why we are all still here because Tish
4	would remind us every day.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Every day.
6	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: We are going
7	to hear first from Jenny Fernandez, who is the
8	representative for the New York City Landmarks
9	Preservation Commission.
10	We are joined by Council Member
11	Annabel Palma, Council Member Maria
12	[Off mic]
13	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE:del Arroyo,
14	I'm sorry, I've been out of this place for a
15	minute.
16	[Off mic]
17	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I know. And
18	Council Member Rosie Mendez and Council Member Liz
19	Crowley.
20	FEMALE VOICE: Ask her to testify
21	on these.
22	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Ms. Fernandez,
23	can you do the testimony on both the John Pierce
24	Residence and the Mount Oliver Church?
25	JENNY FERNANDEZ: Yes. Good

Street was erected in 1904 through 1906 for stone

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 and
3 des:
4 the
5 Aver
6 pres
7 know

the neighborhood.

and building contractor John Pierce and was
designed by noted architect John H. Duncan. At
the time of the building's construction, Fifth
Avenue just south of Central Park was the most
prestigious residential area in the city and was
known as Vanderbilt Row because of that family's
involvement in maintaining the elite character of

Pierce was born in Frankfort, Maine, where his father operated a granite quarry. Pierce succeeded to the family business in 1873 and soon came to control much of the granite industry in Maine. In the early 1880s he moved to New York City to oversee the operations of his New York and Maine Granite Paving Block Company and to expand the market for his firm's products. Pierce soon became one of the largest stone contractors in the country earning the title of Granite King. By the 1890s Pierce had expanded the scope of his business to include general building contracting and he later became involved in a number of largescale civic infrastructure projects, including the construction of New York City's first subway system. Many of the city's most iconic structures

LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 7

2 are erected with the assistance of Pierce's firm.

1

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3 At the turn of the 20th century, 4 Pierce commissioned architect John H. Duncan to design a residence. The most striking feature of 5 the house is the full rustication of the lower 6 7 three floors. The upper floors are faced with 8 smooth ashlar stone, with projecting cornices above the third and fifth stories. 9 While 10 generally austere in demeanor, a number of scuptural elements, including the projecting 11 12 balcony at the second floor and the ornamental 13 stone keystones and wreaths, are in a more lavish 14 Beaux-Arts style.

When completed, the Pierce
Residence stood in the middle of a distinguished
row of houses overlooking St. Patrick's Cathedral.
Within a few years, however, the fortunes of both
John Pierce and the neighborhood changed
dramatically. Pierce's company went into
receivership in 1909 and failed altogether in
1915. He lost his residence to foreclosure in
1914, at a time when many wealthy families were
abandoning the neighborhood to commercial and
apartment house development. The building at 11

Mount Olive Fire Baptized Holiness Church in

Preservation Commission held a public hearing on

On March 24th, 2009, the Landmarks

22

23

24

25

Manhattan.

LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 9 1 the proposed designation. Four witnesses spoke in 2 3 favor of the proposed designation, including a 4 representative of the church, as well as representatives of the Municipal Arts Society, the 5 Historic Districts Council, and the Society for 6 7 the Architecture of the City. There were no 8 speakers in opposition to the proposed designation. 9 10 On June 23rd, 2009, the Commission 11 voted to designate the building a New York City 12 landmark. The Mount Olive Fire Baptized 13 Holiness Church, with its distinctive façade 14 15 combining elements of the Gothic Revival and 16 Romanesque Revival styles, was constructed in 1897 17 for the Second Reformed Presbyterian Church of North America. 18 19 The Reformed Presbyterian Church of 20 North America was founded in the late 18th century 21 by Irish and Scottish worshippers who were fleeing 22 persecution at home for their refusal to take 23 oaths of loyalty to the British government.

church membership in New York City grew, so did

the need for a second geographical division that

24

would serve congregants living in Manhattan north of Chambers Street. On June 11th, 1830, the Second Reformed Presbyterian Church of North America was organized, occupying a structure at 166 Waverly Place. In 1897, the Second Reformed Presbyterian Church constructed this house of worship at 304 through 308 West 122nd Street. The selection of the Harlem site for the building is reflective of the increasing popularity of the neighborhood as a residential community, largely a result of the opening of elevated rail lines through the northern Manhattan in the late 1870s and a proposed subway route in the late 1890s.

In 1943, the Mount Olive Fire

Baptized Holiness Church of God of the Americas

purchased the church and continues to worship

there today, 45 years later. The Fire Baptized

Holiness Church of God of the Americas was founded

in 1898 in Mountville, South Carolina, by a

Methodist preacher, William Edward Fuller, Sr.,

after he received the "Baptism of the Holy Ghost

and Fire" while praying alone in a corn field near

his home.

The one-story, beige brick building

Τ	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES II
2	was designed in the Gothic and Romanesque Revival
3	styles by architect James W. Cole. Distinguishing
4	features of the building include its symmetrical
5	facade featuring pointed-arched window openings,
6	terra-cotta ornament, stained-glass windows,
7	crenellated brick corbelling at the prominently
8	gabled roofline, and decorative pinnacles.
9	The Commission urges you to affirm
10	this designation.
11	[Off mic]
12	[Pause]
13	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Yeah, who's
14	the
15	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I met him at
16	the landmarking
17	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE:who's the
18	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES:but he's
19	not here
20	[Crosstalk]
21	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE:who's the
22	pastor? Who's the pastor of the church now?
23	MS. FERNANDEZ: That's a good
24	question. I will have to look that up and I will
25	let your staff know.

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 12
2	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: And you said
3	there were no speakers in opposition and the
4	church is in favor of the landmarking.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Yes.
6	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: And so Pastor
7	E.G. Scott and Deacon Robert Stewart
8	FEMALE VOICE: Yeah.
9	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE:are the
10	leaders of the church. Excellent. Any other
11	questions on this item? Seeing none in
12	[Off mic]
13	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay, the
14	hearing is closed, the hearing is closed on the
15	Mount Olive Fire Baptized Holiness Church.
16	Now we'll open the hearing on the
17	main item for today, which is the Prospect Heights
18	Historic District and we are joined by Council
19	Member Tish James, who I'm sure has nothing to say
20	on theno, I'm justwho I'm sure has a few words
21	that she'd like to share with us, yeah, after she
22	kept us here on this item.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: First let me
24	thank all of my colleagues for scheduling this
25	hearing on this day, I know that you all have very

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 14
2	District remains strong and it is one of
3	Brooklyn's most architecturally distinguished
4	areas, retaining some of the borough's most
5	beautiful and well-preserved residential streets
6	and featuring a broad array of outstanding
7	residential architecture and popular styles of the
8	late 19th and early 20th centuries. The area
9	continues to retain its cohesion due to its tree-
10	lined streets, it's scale, predominant residential
11	character, and its architectural integrity.
12	It is because of all of those
13	reasons that I support this application and,
14	because of all of the development pressures that
15	we are facing in Prospect Heights, it's critically
16	important that we preserve the character of this
17	wonderful neighborhood and that is why I urge all
18	of my colleagues to vote in support of this
19	application. Thank you, Mr. Chair.
20	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: And now we'll
21	hear from Ms
22	[Off mic]
23	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Yeah, right?
24	Do you have anything you want to add to that, Ms.
25	Fernandez?

Preservation Alliance, Prospect Place Block

On June 23rd, 2009, the Commission voted to designate Prospect Heights a New York City Historic District. The Prospect Heights
Historic District includes approximately 850 buildings, predominantly single-family row houses

22

23

24

5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

and apartment buildings constructed for the most part between the middle of the 19th century and the early 20th century. The Prospect Heights neighborhood is located immediately north of Prospect Park and is bounded by Atlantic Avenue to the north, Eastern Parkway to the south, Flatbush Avenue to the west, and Washington Avenue to the east.

The area was occupied by the Lenape Indians at the time of European contact. During the 18th century the land came into possession of a number of different owners, several of whom were It was still predominately farm and slave owners. wood lands until the middle of the 19th century.

The two most important factors in the growth of Prospect Heights were transportation improvements and the development of Prospect Park. These transportation improvements included new links between Prospect Heights and the ferries along Brooklyn's waterfront.

Construction began on Prospect Park in 1866 and the park opened to the public in 1871, although it was not yet complete. The land in the southeast part of the district was taken for the

1 LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 18 park but was not included in the final design and, 2 3 after years of litigation, was sold and developed 4 starting in the 1890s. The earliest houses were built in 5 the Italianate style of architecture, popular from 6 7 about 1840 to 1870. Row houses began to be 8 designed in two variations of the Italianate style: the Anglo-Italianate, popular from about 9 10 1865 to 1870, and the Italianate style with Second Empire elements, popular from 1870 to 1885. 11 12 Prospect Heights has houses dating from the second half of the 1870s and the 1880s designed in the 13 neo-Grec style by prominent Brooklyn architects 14 15 such as the Parfitt Brothers, John H. Doherty, 16 Nelson Whipple, Jeremiah Gilligan, Eastman & Daus, 17 and Marshall J. Morrill. 18 The earliest multiple dwellings in 19 the district appear on Vanderbilt Avenue in the 20 early 1870s. Vanderbilt Avenue and Flatbush 21 Avenue, two of the major thoroughfares in 22 Brooklyn, are characterized by multi-family 23 residential buildings with ground floor commercial spaces in Prospect Heights. 24 25 The Prospect Heights Historic

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 19
2	District has some important institutional
3	buildings, including the former Public School 9
4	Annex, the Duryea Presbyterian Church, and the
5	former Mount Prospect Laboratory.
6	The Prospect Heights Historic
7	District remains among Brooklyn's most
8	architecturally distinguished areas, retaining
9	some of the borough's most beautiful and well-
10	preserved residential streets, and featuring a
11	broad array of outstanding residential
12	architecture in popular styles of the late 19th
13	and early 20th century. The area continues to
14	retain its cohesion due to its tree-lined streets,
15	scale, predominant residential character, and its
16	architectural integrity.
17	The Commission urges you to affirm
18	the designation.
19	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Any questions
20	for Ms. Fernandez? Seeing none, thank you, Ms.
21	Fernandez.
22	We have Mr. Peter Gordon Stein
23	[phonetic] that has stayed, are you still here,
24	Mr. Gordon Stein?
25	MALE VOICE: He had to leave.

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 20
2	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: He had to
3	leave? And somebody took the
4	[Off mic]
5	[Pause]
6	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Bob Biegen?
7	FEMALE VOICE: Yep.
8	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: You can come
9	forward, and Gib Veconi, you can come forward, and
10	Melissa Baldock? Okay, you can identify yourself
11	'cause you
12	[Off mic]
13	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: You have to
14	turn on the mic, sir, I'm sorry.
15	BOB BIEGEN: Councilman Comrie,
16	Councilperson James, and all the Committee
17	Members, my name is Bob Biegen, I'm the
18	Coordinator of the Prospect Heights Association.
19	It was founded in 1997 to promote the Prospect
20	Heights Neighborhood and raise community pride by
21	drawing attention to Prospect Heights late 19th
22	century architecture, great restaurants, religious
23	institutions, and its numerous cultural amenities.
24	Prospect Heights benefits from the
25	cultural and economic diversity of its residents

[Pause]

23

24

25

GIB VECONI: Thank you, Mr. My name is Gib Veconi, and I'm Chairman. Secretary of the Prospect Heights Neighborhood

services.

Development Council. PHNDC's members are civic

and merchant associations in Prospect Heights

community who PHNDC represents on issues relating

to housing, economic development, physical

environment, safety and security and social

On behalf of our members, I'd like to thank the Subcommittee for considering the designation of a historic district in the Prospect Heights neighborhood and for the opportunity for our organization to speak today in support of the creation of such a district.

Prospect Heights has a large set of contiguous blocks of mid to late 19th century residential structures. The existence of such a large number of buildings from the same period of architectural styles ranging from neo-Grec to Italianate to Romanesque revival makes Prospect Heights unique even in a borough of historic neighborhoods and gives it a special sense of place.

Further, the transition from blocks of lower three-story brick houses on Bergen Street on the north side of the district to four to five-

LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 23 story brownstone and limestone houses on Prospect Park and Sterling Places on the southern end of the district is a lasting reminder of the socioeconomic diversity that has thrived in our neighborhood from its development in the late 19th century until today.

Finally, Vanderbilt Avenue represents one of the very few commercial thoroughfares of historic Brooklyn whose buildings have seen relatively little change.

The character and scale of Prospect Heights is threatened today by development seeking to maximize the amount of floor area available to be built under the district's zoning. Although the current R-6B zoning on most Prospect Heights side streets is contextual for the neighborhood, the deep lots on those streets mean that many lots in the neighborhood of more than 25% under-built relative to allowable density, and some are up to 75% under-built. On Vanderbilt Avenue, the current R-7A zoning would enable the existing three and four-story buildings to be extended up to seven stories.

This situation has led to historic

Park Slope, Boerum Hill, Fort Greene, Clinton

Hill, and now Crown Heights, Prospect Heights does
not currently enjoy the protection of historic
designation. That's why PHNDC has led a community
initiative seeking designation of a Prospect
Heights Historic District. Over 20 volunteers
worked to collect photographs and data on more
than 1,000 buildings in Prospect Heights in

Since that time, PHNDC has held numerous block meetings, promoted two neighborhood-wide forums, and reached thousands of community residents by mail. We have presented LPC with more than 400 letters of support and over 400 response cards from neighbors who are hoping the Council will act before another building is destroyed or altered forever.

preparation of a request for evaluation that was

submitted to LPC in the spring of 2007.

The initiative to create a Prospect Heights Historic District has also received the support of Community Board 8, our Council Member, Letitia James, Assemblyman Hakeem Jeffries, Assemblywoman Joan Millman, State Senator Eric Adams, Brooklyn Borough President Marty Markowitz, and Congresswoman Yvette Clark.

Т	hank you o	once again	for th	e
opportunity to s	speak in s	upport of	histori	C
designation for	Prospect 1	Heights.	Please	act
swiftly to prese	erve our h	istoric ne	iahborh	ood.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Any questions?

Oh I'm sorry, you didn't identify yourself, but I think you said you're not the person identified so....

TARA KELLY: Hello my name is Tara
Kelly and I'll be speaking on behalf of Melissa
Baldock, the Kress Fellow for Historic
Preservation and Public Policy at the Municipal
Arts Society in support of the Prospect Heights
Historic District.

The Municipal Art Society is a private nonprofit membership organization that fights for intelligent urban planning, design, and preservation through education, dialogue, and advocacy. MAS enthusiastically supports the designation of the Prospect Heights Historic District and we would like to thank Council Member Letitia James for her support and leadership which have helped us get to this point today.

Prospect Heights is of great

importance to MAS. In the wake of the proposed
Atlantic Yards development, the future of Prospect
Heights' historic resources came into question.
In response, MAS worked closely with the Prospect
Heights Neighborhood Development Council to

conduct a survey of the neighborhood.

The neighborhood's involvement and dedication were remarkable. Over 20 members of the Prospect Heights community were involved in the surveying and the preparation of a comprehensive proposal submitted to the LPC. In part due to that enthusiastic engagement, today there is widespread support in the community for this designation.

The Landmarks Preservation

Commission voted to designate Prospect Heights in

June because of its rich historic architecture.

The neighborhood includes some of Brooklyn's

finest historic residential architecture. It

includes beautiful blocks of row houses

articulated in the neo-Grec, Romanesque revival,

Renaissance revival, and Second Empire styles.

These row houses are interspersed with churches

and small commercial and apartment buildings,

1 LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 28 adding to the richness of the neighborhood's 2 3 architecture. Located just north of Prospect 4 Park, the neighborhood has seen few changes since 5 it was first developed in the mid to late 19th 6 7 century and is one of brownstone Brooklyn's most 8 intact neighborhoods. Containing over 850 9 buildings, Prospect Heights is the largest 10 district designated by the LPC in decades. 11 It is important to note that the 12 agency's ability to undertake larger districts 13 like Prospect Heights in recent years has been 14 due, in large part, to the increased funding it 15 received from the Council. When there are large-16 scale development plans and rezonings that effect 17 New York City's historic resources, it is critical that the LPC step in to ensure that these 18 19 resources are protected. MAS applauds the LPC for 20 doing just that in this instance and urges the 21 City Council to join Council Member James in 22 supporting this district. 23 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Any questions? 24 Council Member James? 25 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Not a

question, but a comment, I just want to first
apologize for the delay, and thank you for the
fact that you stayed around. It, to me,
represents and reflects your commitment to the
community and your commitment to this preservation
application, which is something that I strongly
support given all of the development pressures in

support given all of the development pressures in and around Prospect Heights. And given the possibility of that big project, it's really

critically important that we preserve the wonderful character and integrity and dign

wonderful character and integrity and dignity of

this wonderful and this architecturally-sound

community.

So, again, I thank you for your work, I know we need to focus on the rezoning, the down-zoning, which is something that I am committed to moving and working with you and with the Community Board to make that a reality, and hopefully we can begin this year and hopefully achieve it next year.

I also want to say, I just received an e-mail from Jasper Goldman, who did the video, who just indicated that he's relocating to Cuba.

And he invited me to his farewell party, and I

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 30
2	hope that you can join him as well. Again, thank
3	you for your hard work.
4	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Why is he
5	relocating to Cuba? 'Cause he's getting more
6	money for his house is that
7	[Crosstalk]
8	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES:
9	[Interposing] No, apparently, according to the e-
LO	mail, Cuba has preservation issues and he's
11	dedicating his life to preservation issues
L2	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay.
L3	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES:and he's
L4	going to take up the challenge and he's relocating
15	to Cuba.
L6	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. God
L7	bless him.
18	[Off mic]
L9	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Any other
20	members have any other questions? Seeing none,
21	then I would declare this hearing closed. And
22	then I would ask the legislative counsel to do the
23	roll call, coupling all items on today's agenda.
24	Thank you all for coming and
25	staying, sorry for the delays. And I look forward

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 31
2	to an affirmative vote on these issues.
3	CHRISTIAN HYLTON: Christian
4	Hylton, Counsel to Committee. Chair Comrie?
5	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Aye on all.
6	MR. HYLTON: Council Member Palma?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.
8	MR. HYLTON: Council Member Arroyo?
9	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.
10	MR. HYLTON: Council Member Mendez?
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote yes
12	and I want to thank my colleagues for their
13	patience and congratulate my good friend and
14	sister Tish James on this designation.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.
16	MR. HYLTON: Council Member
17	Crowley.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote
19	aye.
20	MR. HYLTON: By a vote of five in
21	the affirmative, none in the negative, no
22	abstentions, items are approved and referred to
23	the full Land Use Committee.
24	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE:
25	Congratulations to all, congratulation to Council

1	LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & MARITIME USES 32
2	Member James.
3	By request of one Council Member,
4	we will hold the meeting open for him to try to
5	get here by
6	FEMALE VOICE: No, he's not going
7	to come now.
8	[Pause]
9	CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Update, the
LO	hearing will be closed immediately because no one
11	else will be making it to the hearing today.
12	Land Use Committee meeting is
L3	tomorrow at 10 a.m. Please be on time or please
L4	inform the committee of your exact time so that we
L5	can do what we need to do quickly. Thank you very
L6	much.
L7	I declare the hearing closed. Have
18	a good day.
L9	
20	
21	

${\color{red} \underline{C} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{E} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{R} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{T} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{I} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{F} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{I} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{C} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{A} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{T} \hspace{0.1cm} \underline{E}}$

I, Tammy Wittman certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Tanny Willman

Signature_____

Date _October 2, 2009_