

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

March 11, 2009
Start: 01:30 pm
Recess: 02:29 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:
CHRISTINE C. QUINN
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Tony Avella
Maria Baez
Gale A. Brewer
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.
Elizabeth Crowley
Bill de Blasio
Inez E. Dickens
Erik Martin Dilan
Mathieu Eugene
Lewis A. Fidler
Helen D. Foster
Daniel R. Garodnick
James F. Gennaro
Vincent J. Gentile
Alan J. Gerson

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Eric N. Gioia
Sara M. Gonzalez
Vincent Ignizio
Robert Jackson
Letitia James
Melinda R. Katz
G. Oliver Koppell
Jessica S. Lappin
John C. Liu
Melissa Mark-Viverito
Miguel Martinez
Darlene Mealy
Rosie Mendez
Michael C. Nelson
James S. Oddo
Annabel Palma
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.
Diana Reyna
Joel Rivera
James Sanders Jr.
Larry B. Seabrook
Helen Sears
Kendall Stewart
James Vacca
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.
Albert Vann
David I. Weprin
Thomas White, Jr.
David Yassky

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Betsy Gotbaum
Public Advocate
City of New York

Dr. Edison O. Jackson
President
Medgar Evers College

Father James Hayes
St. Andrew's Church

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: We have one
3 ceremonial today, but the fact we only have one
4 should not decrease the importance of this
5 ceremonial. It should underscore how important
6 this ceremonial is today. So if I could ask folks
7 to come up. I'm going to give the mike to Tish to
8 kick us off.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Thank you.
10 May all members please join me, all members who
11 believe in education, who believe that education
12 is the great equalizer, who believe in higher
13 education. Medgar Evers, as most of you know, is
14 situated in my district. But this young man does
15 not belong to me. In fact, he belongs to all of
16 us. He has improved the Medgar Evers campus and
17 the quality of education not only in Central
18 Brooklyn but I can dare say that every single City
19 Council Member has a Medgar Evers graduate in
20 their district or a current student. So this
21 honor is not mine alone. It's a bittersweet
22 moment because this great man, this giant amongst
23 giants has announced his retirement. So it's very
24 sad for me because he's transformed Medgar Evers
25 and just made it into a destination college where

1
2 they come from abroad and beyond. So I stand here
3 today, Dr. Jackson, with my colleagues because we
4 are first humbled to be in your presence and two,
5 want to thank you for all that you have done
6 educating students, not only in this city but in
7 this nation and in this world. You will be sorely
8 missed. No one can fill your shoes. I understand
9 that the applications now are up to thousands.
10 But if you want to reconsider? Dr. Jackson, I
11 just want to thank you for providing a liberal
12 education. Thank you for improving the standards.
13 Thank you for increasing the amount of individuals
14 who seek to enter the doors at Medgar Evers
15 College. On behalf of my constituents and the
16 members here, I just wanted to say congratulations
17 for your years of service.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Hand over the
19 proclamation. Before we ask the clerk to read the
20 proclamation, I just want to personally thank you,
21 Dr. Jackson. There is such a long list of times
22 when we've called on Medgar Evers to give us a
23 breakfast space on our Day Out Against Hate, to
24 give us an auditorium when we were doing education
25 and outreach for MWBE companies. I mean just so

1
2 many things. We call, and I'm not going to name
3 them, but other institutions in the city and they
4 don't always say yes. You call Medgar Evers for
5 research help, for support, for space, you and
6 your staff don't just say yes, you say our college
7 is your college. We are the Council's campus. So
8 I just want to thank you so much for giving us
9 resources, help and space where we could be in
10 Brooklyn when we needed to gather with folks.
11 That is invaluable. Not only are your generous
12 but you and your staff are so gracious. Really I
13 would say one of the most gracious staffs we've
14 ever worked with and that type of attitude starts
15 from the top. So thank you so very much. And I
16 wish you, your wife and your family a wonderful
17 retirement. Ma'am, I know that every hour he was
18 with us, every hour he was helping us is an hour
19 he wasn't with you and your family, so you deserve
20 a tremendous thank you too for being so selfless
21 with Dr. Jackson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES:

23 Unfortunately the chair of Higher Ed could not be
24 with us, and I know one of the founders of Medgar
25 Evers College, our own Council Member Al Vann will

1
2 be up shortly. He was one of the original Medgar
3 Evers College and I know he wanted to say a few
4 words as well. But again, on their behalf, I
5 wanted to say thank you. Madame Speaker.

6 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. If we
7 could ask the clerk to read the proclamation and
8 then we'll get to hear from Dr. Jackson.

9 CLERK: Council City of New York
10 Proclamation. Whereas the Council of the City of
11 New York is proud to honor Dr. Edison O. Jackson
12 for his outstanding service to Medgar Evers
13 College and the community. And whereas, since
14 1989, Dr. Jackson has provided stellar service as
15 the president of Medgar Evers College of the City
16 University of New York. During his distinguished
17 tenure, he has reaffirmed the beliefs of the
18 school's founder, Medgar Wiley Evers, the Civil
19 Rights activist who was committed to educational
20 access, excellence in education, public service
21 and to creating success one student at a time. He
22 has spearheaded the construction of the college's
23 \$243 million Academic Complex One, the future home
24 of the School of Science, Health and Technology.
25 And whereas, in addition to being an active member

1
2 of many educational, civic, political, and
3 economic organizations, Dr. Jackson is an
4 acclaimed author. In numerous published works he
5 has shared his singular insights into education
6 issues with a particular focus on minority
7 students. And whereas, Dr. Jackson is not only an
8 educational leader, but an ordained minister who
9 serves on the staff of Bridge Street African
10 Wesleyan Methodist Episcopal Church in Bedford
11 Stuyvesant, upon his retirement he can be proud of
12 his service, as we are, for the legacy he has
13 built to continue to resonate in the minds of
14 countless New Yorkers. Now therefore be it known
15 that we the Council Members most gratefully honor
16 Dr. Edison O. Jackson for more than two decades of
17 tremendous contributions and achievements in
18 higher education. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for
19 the entire Council; Letitia James, Council Member
20 35th District Brooklyn; Albert Vann, Council
21 Member 36th District Brooklyn; David I. Weprin,
22 Council Member 23rd District Queens; Larry B.
23 Seabrook, Council Member 12th District the Bronx.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much
25 Mike. Dr. Jackson.

1
2 DR. EDISON O. JACKSON: Madame
3 Speaker, my beloved Councilwoman Letitia James and
4 to all of you who have done so much in helping us
5 to rebuild Medgar Evers College, you have been so
6 generous, not only in spirit but your resources
7 because we could not be where we are today with
8 this \$243 million academic complex that will open
9 in a year. And when we open it, it will be one of
10 the finest science facilities, not only in this
11 city but in this state and the nation. We're
12 going to invite all of you to come. I won't be
13 here but I will come back for the opening. You
14 also play a significant role in the construction
15 of what we call the School of Business and the
16 Student Service building right there on Bedford.
17 Were it not for your generosity and your belief in
18 my leadership and belief in education, we could
19 not have that building and all the other smaller
20 projects that you have supported. So I wanted to
21 say to all of you to just remind us of the power
22 of education to transform individuals and our
23 young people and not so young thirst for
24 knowledge. What Medgar has been about is
25 providing opportunities and to reach out in areas

1
2 and communities that somehow they say high
3 education is not for me or for my child. So we
4 have become the college of choice. There was a
5 time we were not the college of choice. But I can
6 honestly say that with my team, they're all over
7 there, we have created a place, a sense of
8 community, an ability to affirm that students are
9 valued, that our community is valued. You can see
10 students when they come at Medgar and see there's
11 no gleam in their eyes, they're just there and
12 then when they walk across the stage in
13 commencement and you see the pride and their
14 family members shouting, you know go girl or
15 hallelujah or whatever. What we have done is
16 transform the lives of the graduates and
17 oftentimes the family members because we are
18 educating both. So at Medgar because we generally
19 have an older population, we're not only affecting
20 that student who is graduating but the family
21 members in that family. That's what's so
22 marvelous about Medgar Evers it seems to me. I'll
23 conclude by saying that I just hope that you would
24 ensure that Medgar is protected to do the work it
25 was created to do because it's so easy to get off

1
2 track and to go on to another agenda. I have
3 tried in my 20 years at Medgar to be true to the
4 founders, Councilman Vann and others, their vision
5 about what a college of higher education ought to
6 be about in Central Brooklyn. I've tried to do
7 that to the best of my ability. It's been a
8 wonderful journey. I'm not saying easy, but a
9 wonderful journey. And when you can see the
10 transformation that we have witnessed, it's good.
11 I thank God and my wife for this wonderful
12 journey. So we're going to, not ride into the
13 sunset, we have a home in Virginia, but I'm going
14 to hang out in D.C. in terms of whatever that may
15 be in terms of hanging out. Because there are
16 wonderful opportunities in D.C. I don't know what
17 all that might mean, but I'm going to hang out in
18 D.C. My position is when one door closes, God
19 opens another. He can't open the new door until
20 he can close the old one. So I'm just happy. I
21 could dance and do a hula dance because I've done
22 the work that I was called here to do and to
23 understand that there is a point in time when you
24 are to give up and allow others to secede you.
25 That's what I've done. Thank you so much all of

1

2 you.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SPEAKER QUINN: We were worried Al that you weren't going to get here in time. So I'm so glad you were able to make it up before we ended the recognition and thanks to Dr. Jackson. So if I could give you the mike.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yes. I'll be very, very brief. I am fortunate enough to have been around in Bed-Stuy and was one of the founders. It was a very unique experience. It's the first time a community in the City of New York challenged a high university and said you need to have a college in Bed-Stuy Central Brooklyn specifically for "the black community or minority community" as it were. So it broke precedent. We negotiated and we told them the kind of college we wanted and so on and so forth. It wasn't easy but we worked it out. College number seven as it was called, which became Medgar Evers College. The founders, there were 36 community-based organizations which made up this coalition on education needs and services and we laid out what we wanted this college to be, how this college should impact upon this community. We laid it out

1
2 in a book, if you will. Several presidents have
3 come before this gentleman arrive. Everybody did
4 a little something towards it. But I can say
5 without fear of contradiction, Dr. Jackson, you
6 have made the founders very happy, those that are
7 with us and those who are not with us at the
8 moment. You have fulfilled the dream and we wish
9 you Godspeed as you go through that second door.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Let's make sure we
11 get a picture with Al.

12 [Pause]

13 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you all and
14 that concludes our ceremonies.

15 [Pause]

16 MALE VOICE: Ladies and gentleman,
17 can I have your attention please? At this time,
18 can you place all pagers and cell phones to
19 vibrate and will all lobbyists and non-Council
20 employees please leave the main floor of the
21 chambers. Thank you.

22 [Pause]

23 BETSY GOTBAUM: All rise.

24 GROUP: I pledge allegiance to the
25 flag of the United States of America and to the

1
2 republic for which it stands, one nation under
3 God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for
4 all. Roll call.

5 CLERK: Arroyo?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

7 CLERK: Avella?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: Here.

9 CLERK: Baez?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Here.

11 CLERK: Barron?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [no
13 response].

14 CLERK: Brewer?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

16 CLERK: Comrie?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: [no
18 response].

19 CLERK: Crowley?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

21 CLERK: De Blasio?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DE BLASIO: [no
23 response].

24 CLERK: Dickens?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

1

2

CLERK: Dilan?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.

4

CLERK: Eugene?

5

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

6

CLERK: Felder?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: [no

8

response].

9

CLERK: Fidler?

10

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Here.

11

CLERK: Foster?

12

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Here.

13

CLERK: Garodnick?

14

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

15

CLERK: Gennaro?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

17

CLERK: Gentile?

18

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [no

19

response]

20

CLERK: Gerson?

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: [no

22

response]

23

CLERK: Gioia?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: [no

25

response]

1

2

CLERK: Gonzalez?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Yes.

4

CLERK: Ignizio?

5

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [no

6

response].

7

CLERK: Jackson?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I'm here.

9

CLERK: James?

10

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: [no

11

response].

12

CLERK: Katz?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Here.

14

CLERK: Koppell?

15

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.

16

CLERK: Lappin?

17

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [no

18

response].

19

CLERK: Liu?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Here.

21

CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:

23

Here.

24

CLERK: Martinez?

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: [no

1

2 response].

3

CLERK: Mealy?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

5

CLERK: Mendez?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

7

CLERK: Nelson?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: [no

9

response].

10

CLERK: Palma?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

12

CLERK: Recchia?

13

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.

14

CLERK: Reyna?

15

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.

16

CLERK: Sanders?

17

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: [no

18

response].

19

CLERK: Seabrook?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [no

21

response].

22

CLERK: Sears?

23

COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: [no

24

response].

25

CLERK: Stewart?

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Oh sorry,

3

Sears is here.

4

CLERK: Vacca?

5

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

6

CLERK: Vallone?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

8

CLERK: Vann?

9

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [no

10

response].

11

CLERK: Weprin?

12

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

13

CLERK: White?

14

COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: [no

15

response].

16

CLERK: Yassky?

17

COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Here.

18

CLERK: Oddo?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [no

20

response].

21

CLERK: Rivera?

22

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

23

CLERK: Speaker Quinn?

24

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

25

BETSY GOTBAUM: We have a quorum.

1
2 All rise for the invocation. By Father James
3 Hayes.

4 MALE VOICE: Please rise.

5 FATHER JAMES HAYES: We gather this
6 day in this most historic chamber as members of
7 this City Council. We assemble in collaboration,
8 harmony and peace for the good of all who live and
9 work in this great city. Strengthen each of us
10 with an inner wisdom and inner vision. We draw
11 together this day on this collaboration as we
12 dialogue, discuss and vote on issues that will
13 enhance the quality of life for all. We as that
14 our exchange of views be tempered by a spirit of
15 unity. This spirit of collaboration will enable
16 us to become more proactive in our planning,
17 create new plans and paths for our future, discern
18 new directions and continue to revitalize our
19 great city. We gather here also in the spirit of
20 gratitude, our gratitude for our giftedness. We
21 stand in thanksgiving for all the gifts of person,
22 time and talent that have been bestowed upon each
23 one here this day. Let us use our giftedness of
24 time and talent for the common cause. Let this
25 gratitude also be tempered by a subtle spirit of

1
2 compassion. We gather in the spirit of courage.
3 As we meet, discuss and vote, we ask for guidance
4 in all of our deliberations as courage can guide
5 our deliberations, our collaborative decisions.
6 Continually let a sense of justice and peace lead
7 the way. Let our collaborative efforts be of
8 benefit for all of the city. As we administer our
9 office, let a spirit of correct judgment speak to
10 the heart. In courage do respect for all life and
11 diversity and foster within us a sense of value of
12 community. Let us be mindful that we can foster a
13 sense of community so that all can have a place at
14 one table. Let our discussions, voting, committee
15 meetings and deliberations become the standard for
16 rule, order and good government. Guide us by
17 light and wisdom during these most difficult times
18 and let our collective spirits of collaboration,
19 gratitude and courage be with us today. Finally,
20 as we stand shoulder to shoulder, let us respond
21 in one voice as public servants, stewards and
22 guardians of this great city by saying amen.

23 BETSY GOTBAUM: Motion to spread
24 the invocation, Council Member Gerson? I'm sorry?
25 Council Member Reyna?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I'd like to
3 make a motion to spread the Invocation by Father
4 Hayes in full upon the record.

5 BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.
6 Adoption of the minutes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I move the
8 minutes be adopted.

9 BETSY GOTBAUM: Messages and papers
10 from the Mayor.

11 CLERK: None.

12 BETSY GOTBAUM: Communication from
13 City, County and Borough offices.

14 CLERK: None.

15 BETSY GOTBAUM: Petitions and
16 Communications.

17 CLERK: None.

18 BETSY GOTBAUM: Land Use call-ups.

19 CLERK: None.

20 BETSY GOTBAUM: Communication from
21 the Speaker.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. We are
23 voting today on a number of important pieces of
24 legislation.

25 BETSY GOTBAUM: Quiet please. I

1

2 cannot hear her. Please be quiet.

3

4 SPEAKER QUINN: First, Intro 57-A
5 which creates a bed bug advisory board. I want to
6 of course thank Chairperson Leroy Comrie who
7 shepherded this through the Consumer Affairs
8 Committee. I think we all want to thank Council
9 Member Gale Brewer for really raising an important
10 cry in this city about the problem of bed bugs and
11 focusing all of us in government on the need for
12 us to respond to this problem. So thank you so
13 much, Gale. I also want to thank Lacy Clarke,
14 Alex Pustilnik and Darren Butvick of our staff for
15 all of their work on the legislation.

16

BETSY GOTBAUM: Quiet please.

17

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Intro 57-A is our
19 first step towards dealing with and controlling
20 the problem of bed bugs in the City of New York.
21 In recent years we've seen the number of calls to
22 311 of bed bug complaints skyrocket. We've all
23 heard stories from our constituents who have bed
24 bugs in their apartment and they don't know how to
25 deal with them. One thing we know is bed bugs
don't discriminate. They exist in every
neighborhood, in every borough, everywhere in our

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

city. What we also know is that we don't have a comprehensive response or a comprehensive education program to deal with the problem. Creating a bed bug advisory board with representatives from city agencies with an exterminator, with a public health professional and scientists on the board will compile a group of individuals who will be charged with reporting back in nine months. A group of individuals who will have the knowledge and the resources to come up with a comprehensive plan that will allow the City of New York to come up with a full service plan to deal with bed bugs in our city. I want to thank Gale again so much for her work on this issue. Let me first call on the chair of our Consumer Affairs Committee, Leroy Comrie, and then our leader in this effort Council Member Gale Brewer. Leroy?

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you, Speaker Quinn.

SPEAKER QUINN: I'm sorry, Council Member, if we could get a little quiet in the chambers. If we could take conversations outside or into the committee room. Thank you.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you.

3

I just want to thank Gale Brewer for introducing

4

this legislation and keeping all of us under a

5

clear watch and pushing hard with her diligence in

6

keeping this issue on the front burner. Bed bugs

7

have alarmingly become a serious health threat in

8

our community and we need to do everything in our

9

power to raise awareness and address this crisis,

10

particularly in this climate where many city

11

residents are not able to afford extermination

12

services. No one should live in conditions like

13

this and be exposed to people that are only taking

14

advantage of them. This legislation will go a

15

long way to create the proper means to alleviate

16

this current situation. The Speaker already

17

thanked Alex Pustilnik and Lacy Clarke and Damien

18

Butvick for all of the work that they've been

19

doing. We've been an active committee. We look

20

to continue to stay active to protect consumers in

21

every way possible. Thank you.

22

SPEAKER QUINN: Council Member

23

Brewer.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you,

25

Madame Speaker, Chair Comrie and your staff. I

1
2 also want to thank the City Administration because
3 they've been helpful on this and in our office
4 Shula Warren, Rosalba Rodriguez and Kunal Malhotra
5 for all their work. Certainly the advocates,
6 residents and professionals who will be working on
7 this for some time. Chair Comrie had a hearing
8 about a year ago which I think got us going in the
9 right direction. You know bed bugs are personal
10 and financial nightmare. And I think this
11 legislation, which will be a combination of
12 coordination of the many government agencies,
13 because it's not just a city. People are
14 concerned about exterminators and pest control
15 managers and they are actually licensed by the New
16 York State Department of Environmental
17 Conservation. So that agency also needs to be
18 involved. There are other city agencies that need
19 to come together. I think what we can offer is a
20 fight back. The fight back is education.
21 Education of what to do if you get bed bugs.
22 Education as to what to do if you neighbor does.
23 Education that it's not a stigma. Education that
24 you talk to your neighbors about this issue, that
25 you don't panic and that you feel the government

1
2 is providing a qualified exterminator, information
3 about what you should do in your own home,
4 figuring out who has rights and knowing that it is
5 not that your apartment is clean or dirty. Just
6 as the Speaker said, bed bugs impact everyone. I
7 think the message has gotten across that this can
8 be a mental health issue and we need to address
9 it. So I look forward to working with everyone.
10 I thank the Council Members who have had forms in
11 their neighborhoods for their support and I look
12 forward to getting the problem at least mitigated.
13 Thank you very much Madame Speaker.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
15 much. We are also voting today on another piece
16 of legislation that came through the Consumer
17 Affairs Committee. I want to thank Chairperson
18 Comrie for that, Intro 660-A. I also want to
19 thank the sponsor of the bill, Council Member Dan
20 Garodnick. This piece of legislation will create
21 a license and registration process for all
22 individuals who sell or try to collect debt in the
23 City of New York. We right now have a situation
24 where people, organizations and companies are
25 buying debt then selling the debt to someone else

1
2 for them to collect it. These individuals then
3 call New Yorkers, often misinform them, harass
4 them and try to collect debts which in fact have
5 already been settled. This is the leading call of
6 complaint by consumers to our Department of
7 Consumer Affairs. Right now there is a loophole
8 in the law that doesn't require these individuals
9 who are actually collecting debt or attempting to
10 collect debt to have the same license that debt
11 collectors do in our city. I want to thank
12 Chairperson Comrie and Council Member Garodnick
13 for coming up with this piece of legislation that
14 will close that loophole and give consumers in New
15 York particularly at this tough economic time the
16 protection and recourse they need if they're being
17 harassed by these individuals. Let me call again
18 on Chairperson Comrie and then on Council Member
19 Garodnick.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Thank you,
21 Speaker Quinn. I want to thank Council Member
22 Garodnick and the Urban Justice Center and all of
23 the people that identified this issue. Clearly
24 our nation's troubling economic climate has
25 created hardships, but this is an industry that

1
2 took advantage of a loophole, created firms and
3 legal firms that wanted to try to take advantage
4 of people that were unaware that their debt was
5 reassigned to other people. That their debt,
6 oftentimes which it even had been resolved on one
7 level had been sold to a debt collector that they
8 did not recognize and then wind up putting them in
9 court. The things that we're doing to close this
10 loophole is critical. The things that we're doing
11 to make sure that this is no longer the number one
12 complaint to the Department of Consumer Affairs
13 where they were primarily picking on minority
14 communities and new and immigrant communities.
15 It's a major opportunity to protect consumers
16 today. I want to especially thank Council Member
17 Garodnick for the way that he took on four lawyers
18 by himself during the hearing. He did an
19 excellent job of making sure that the primary
20 reason for this legislation would be voted out
21 today and I urge my colleagues to vote for Intro
22 660.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
24 much, Chairperson Comrie. Council Member
25 Garodnick.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank
3 you, Madame Speaker and thank you to Chairman
4 Comrie for his patience, his leadership and for
5 those very nice words. I wanted to just add one
6 thought about the Department of Consumer Affairs
7 and the number of complaints that they have seen.
8 It is true that this is the number one complaint
9 that they get about practices of debt collectors
10 that are unfair or illegal or unscrupulous. But
11 what is interesting is that the number of
12 complaints have gone up significantly. From 2004
13 to 2006, there was a 70% increase in these
14 complaints. And then from 2006 to 2008, they went
15 up again another 70%. So what we are trying to do
16 here is close the loophole that the Speaker
17 mentioned to make sure that those who are pursuing
18 New Yorkers are playing by the rules that we set
19 here in New York. There are 300,000 cases brought
20 against New Yorkers every year for consumer debt.
21 That's an extraordinarily high number of cases.
22 Just to put that in perspective, there are only
23 320,000 cases filed in all of America in federal
24 district courts in the civil and criminal areas in
25 the whole country. The judgments against New

1
2 Yorkers total around \$800 million every year. And
3 unfortunately, too many people simply default
4 because they don't know that they're supposed to
5 show up in court. They don't recognize the
6 notices that they're getting. They don't know who
7 they're getting the notices from because it's not
8 the name of the person from whom they've incurred
9 the debt. They don't recognize the amount because
10 it's not any amount that they recognize after late
11 fees and interest payments and all of the rest of
12 it. The effect of course is devastating
13 particularly on the working poor in this city who
14 sometimes don't know that they're being pursued
15 until the moment that their bank accounts are
16 frozen or their wages are garnished. Now we're
17 not saying that people shouldn't be paying their
18 debts, they should. But what we want is an
19 orderly system of debt collection and not a system
20 of menacing harassment, something we have seen too
21 often in this city. A situation where collectors
22 are calling people at all hours of the day,
23 tracking them down at work, against the law. What
24 we want to make sure is that the additional rules
25 that we're putting forth today allows the

1
2 Department of Consumer Affairs to keep watch over
3 bad actors and to make sure they have leverage
4 over them and to bring it within the nexus of the
5 city's regulatory scheme. And to make sure that
6 all of those notices when people get them that
7 they include some basic information like who was
8 the original creditor here, where do we call back
9 if we have a problem and to make sure that there
10 is a human being to answer the phone. The
11 background information, a confirmation in writing
12 within five days once a debt has been paid so that
13 debts can't be resold and then re-pursued. That's
14 something that happens frequently. This is
15 something which is extremely important
16 particularly now and the Speaker noted that
17 because too many people are falling behind. We
18 have difficult economic times. We want to make
19 sure that there is an orderly system. Again, I
20 want to thank the Speaker and the Chair of the
21 Consumer Affairs Committee and particularly the
22 Urban Justice Center which came out with a report
23 called "The Debt Crisis and the Impact on the
24 City's Working Poor" in 2007 which is what gave
25 rise to this legislation once I read that report.

1
2 And of course to Lacy Clarke from the Consumer
3 Affairs Committee and Lucy Jaffee [phonetic] from
4 my office. I want to thank them for their support
5 and all of their help. Thank you, Madame Speaker.

6 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Dan. I
7 also want to underscore your and Leroy's thanks to
8 the Urban Justice Center, to Lacy Clarke, to Alex
9 Pustilnik, Darren Butvick who also worked on Intro
10 660-A as well as 57-A. We're also passing 867-A
11 today, a bill which reinvigorates and slightly
12 reformulates the Waterfront Management Advisory
13 Board. I want to thank Jeff Haberman, Jeff Daker
14 [phonetic] and Patrick Mulvihill who all worked on
15 this legislation. This Waterfront Management
16 Advisory Board is a Charter mandated advisory
17 board but it has not met or existed with members
18 since the Dinkins administration. We are a river
19 city, a city composed mostly of islands. Yet
20 literally and figuratively in many ways we've
21 turned out back on our river and our waterfront
22 and not seen it as perhaps our greatest natural
23 resource though it really is the natural resource
24 that helped us begin and grow into the greatest
25 richest city in the world. By reconvening this

1
2 Waterfront Advisory Board, coupled with the
3 legislation we've passed that requires a
4 waterfront plan be promulgated every ten years, we
5 will help return our city's focus to the river as
6 a tremendous natural resource. I also want to
7 note that in 867-A we add to the Waterfront
8 Management Advisory Board the requirement that the
9 board create plans for recreational activity on
10 our waterfront. We want to make sure that
11 although our waterfront is an appropriate place
12 for commerce and when appropriate could be used
13 for residential development, but we also need to
14 see it as a tremendous resource to develop and
15 expand recreational activities in our city. And
16 as more and more New Yorkers over this recession
17 decide to stay home for vacation, having
18 recreation on our waterfront is even more
19 important. I want to thank Chairperson Nelson for
20 his work on this bill and for taking it through
21 his Waterfronts Committee. I want to call on
22 Chairperson Nelson please.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Thank you,
24 Madame Speaker. There is economical opportunity
25 here which of course is extremely important to

1
2 this city at this time. Although the Waterfront
3 Management Advisory Board has existed in the City
4 Charter, it was incredibly underutilized since its
5 inception. Intro 867-A gives the Advisory Board a
6 fresh start in the little tweaking that we did in
7 its mission of bettering approximately 578 miles
8 of New York City's waterfront property. The
9 Waterfront Management Advisory Board will increase
10 public participation in the development of
11 waterfront policy and contains a strong potential
12 to create more jobs and substantial recreational
13 activities as well as it will also we believe
14 bring in more revenue for the city. So I want to
15 thank Speaker Quinn. I want to thank my
16 colleagues, Lou Fidler, Gale Brewer, Oliver
17 Koppell, Alan Gerson and Tom White and also Jeff
18 Baker, counsel to the committee and Colleen Pagter
19 and Steve Zolts [phonetic] from my staff and all
20 of the staff of the Speaker for putting this
21 through. Thank you.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very
23 much. We're also voting today on Intro 840. It's
24 increasing fees for permits issued to operators of
25 dumps, non-putrescible waste transfer stations and

1
2 putrescible solid waste transfer stations and
3 establishing registration fees for intermodal
4 solid waste container facilities. I want to thank
5 the Mayor's Office and also Chairperson Comrie as
6 well as Jarret Hova and Jeff Haberman for their
7 work on this legislation. That concludes
8 Communications from the Speaker.

9 BETSY GOTBAUM: Discussion of
10 General Orders. Seeing no one, we'll move right
11 on. Report of Special Committees. Quiet please.

12 CLERK: None.

13 BETSY GOTBAUM: Report of Standing
14 Committees.

15 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
16 Consumer Affairs Intro 57-A, Bed Bug Advisory
17 Board.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
19 on General Orders.

20 CLERK: Intro 660-A, practices of
21 debt collectors.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
23 on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
25 Finance, Intro 850-A.

1
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled
3 on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1854,
5 designation of organizations to receive funding.

6 BETSY GOTBAUM: Quiet please.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 1023 and
10 Reso 856, Haven Plaza.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
14 Land Use. LU 931 and Reso 1857 through LU 982 and
15 Reso 1858, various ULURPS.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
17 Orders.

18 CLERK: LU 984 and Reso 1859, UDAP
19 Bronx.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
21 Orders.

22 CLERK: LU 991 and LU 992, various
23 applications.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Approved with
25 modifications and referred to the City Planning

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City Charter.

CLERK: LU 998 and Reso 1860 through LU 1022 and Reso 1870, various applications.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Preconsidered LU 1024 and Reso 1871, mixed use develop.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. Intro 840, fees for solid waste transfer stations.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Waterfronts. Intro 867-, Waterfront Management Advisory Board.

SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

BETSY GOTBAUM: General Order Calendar.

1
2 CLERK: Resolution appointing
3 various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General
5 Orders. And at this point I'd ask for a roll call
6 on all items that have been coupled on the General
7 Order Calendar please.

8 CLERK: Arroyo?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

10 CLERK: Avella?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: I vote yes
12 on all items except the Toll Brothers project,
13 Land Use 1003, 1005 and Preconsidered Land Use
14 1024 as well as the Battery Maritime Bill project,
15 Land Use numbers 1000 and 1002, 1006, on those two
16 items with the three Land Use specific items I
17 vote no.

18 CLERK: Baez?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Aye.

20 CLERK: Brewer?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

22 CLERK: Comrie?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on all.

24 And congratulations to Council Member Gale Brewer,
25 Dan Gardonick for introducing and passing these

1

2 bills today.

3

CLERK: Crowley?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on

5

all.

6

CLERK: Dickens?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

8

CLERK: Dilan?

9

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Madame

10

Public Advocate, may I have a moment to explain my

11

vote?

12

BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Just a point

14

of information, are we on Land Use call-ups or are

15

we on General Order Calendar. No Land Use call-

16

ups? Okay, I'd like to explain my vote on Intro

17

57-A. I'll start by saying I'm going to vote aye

18

on all items on today's agenda. But I

19

particularly want to compliment Council Member

20

Gale Brewer on her leadership in this issue. I

21

think the constituents that I represent jointly

22

with Council Member Reyna, the people of Bushwick,

23

stand to gain the most benefit from the creation

24

of this advisory board. I have constantly come

25

into contact with families who have bed bugs in

1
2 their homes. She's absolutely right on the mental
3 stress that they face, the mental damage it does
4 to the children who are affected and the lack of
5 education on how to properly dispose of bed bugs.
6 I just want to thank her for this creation of this
7 advisory board. I wholeheartedly look forward to
8 working with this advisory board to make sure that
9 it has the greatest amount of impact so that we
10 can rid not only Bushwick but this entire city of
11 this problem. With that, Madame Public Advocate,
12 I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: De Blasio?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DE BLASIO:

15 Permission to explain my vote?

16 BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DE BLASIO: Thank
18 you. Two important Land Use items that we're
19 voting on today in my district. I want to thank
20 the Speaker and Chair Katz, and Chair Avella for
21 all of their support and hard work on these
22 issues. I want to thank the City Planning
23 Commission, especially Amanda Burden and Purnima
24 Kapur. These are both I think very good news
25 stories. The East Windsor Terrace/Stable Brooklyn

1 rezoning, an incredible example of a community
2 getting together and deciding on a positive path
3 for the future of their community. The City
4 Planning Commission was really impressed by the
5 work community folks did to come up with their
6 plan and then work with them to perfect it. So
7 that's a great story. The Toll Brothers site in
8 Carroll Gardens, a very substantial amount of
9 affordable housing, new open space and
10 environmental cleanup and a good community process
11 that led to that. So these are I think two very
12 important steps forward for our communities in
13 Brooklyn and I urge everyone to support them. I
14 vote aye on all.

16 CLERK: Eugene?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

18 CLERK: Fidler?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye.

20 CLERK: Foster?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.

22 CLERK: Garodnick?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

24 CLERK: Gennaro?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

1

2

CLERK: Gentile?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on

4

all.

5

CLERK: Gerson?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: May I be

7

excused to briefly explain my vote?

8

BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: I just want

10

to first thank Chair Katz and the entire Land Use

11

team for their work and their support for the

12

zoning changes involving the Battery Maritime

13

Building. As we approve this application my

14

colleagues you should know that we are continuing

15

our efforts to open up the waterfront, to make the

16

New York Harbor accessible to all New Yorkers and

17

we are creating on the harbor what will be a

18

wonderful, magnificent new cultural and community

19

space. I want to thank Speaker Quinn for her

20

leadership is making this happen. Immediately

21

before coming to this meeting I left a meeting

22

with owners of a single room occupancy building in

23

my district dealing with the bed bug problem in

24

efforts to clean up and remove that scourge from

25

that particular building. So I want to

1
2 acknowledge Gale Brewer for her role in keeping
3 all of our beds and bedrooms and units safe and
4 healthy but seriously free from this terrible
5 epidemic which is affecting so many New Yorkers.
6 I vote yes on all. Thank you.

7 CLERK: Gioia?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: Thank you.
9 Madame Public Advocate, may I have a second to
10 explain my vote?

11 BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: I just want
13 to congratulate Council Member Gale Brewer and
14 Council Member Dan Garodnick who have both done
15 fine jobs fighting for people who need somebody on
16 their side, both bed bugs and debt collectors are
17 pervasive in this city and unfortunately take a
18 huge out of those who can least afford it. So I'm
19 proud to vote yes on all today. Thank you.

20 CLERK: Gonzalez?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye on
22 all.

23 CLERK: Ignizio?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes. If I
25 could briefly explain my vote.

1

2

SPEAKER QUINN: Can we get some quiet please?

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I was seeking a no vote so I can go up on Charlie Barron in my no's from Courtney Gross' story but I don't have any today. But did want to point out my gratitude towards the Council, the Speaker and Inez Dickens for helping us achieve a grant for diabetes for Staten Island University Hospital which is in today. For those of you who don't know, my wife has had juvenile diabetes since she was five years old and we deal with it on a day in and day out basis. It's a very difficult situation that we deal, both her as a mother and while she was giving birth. It is an epidemic that is attacking our kids. It is an epidemic that is attacking our younger people who are getting older and it's attacking children at a very early age. For this Council to be leading the way in trying to educate and work on services for children with diabetes and preventive services so that they never come down with the disease I think is something that should be applauded. So I wanted to thank both the Speaker, Inez Dickens and

25

1

2 my Council colleagues for fighting hard for this
3 important initiative.

4

CLERK: Jackson?

5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I'd like
7 to congratulate Gale Brewer, our leader on the bed
8 bugs epidemic in the City of New York and Dan
9 Garodnick, I'd like to thank you on behalf of all
10 of the consumers in my district that will benefit
11 from your legislation. I vote aye on all.

11

CLERK: James?

12

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I am present
14 and I vote yes on all Land Use call-ups and
15 General Orders and I vote aye. Thank you.

15

CLERK: Katz?

16

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Madame Public
18 Advocate to explain my vote?

18

BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.

19

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Never mind.
21 I vote aye on all.

21

CLERK: Koppell?

22

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye on
24 all.

24

CLERK: Lappin?

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I would

1
2 request permission on the Land Use call-ups. I
3 vote aye on the General Order Calendar although
4 with a congratulations to Gale Brewer. I have to
5 say I will never sit on those benches in the
6 subway again. And I will hate you for that
7 forever.

8 BETSY GOTBAUM: Quiet please.

9 CLERK: Liu?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.

11 CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye

13 on all.

14 CLERK: Martinez?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Aye.

16 CLERK: Mealy?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I pass.

18 CLERK: Mendez?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

20 CLERK: Nelson?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye.

22 CLERK: Palma?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [no
24 response].

25 CLERK: Recchia?

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye on

3

all.

4

CLERK: Reyna?

5

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

6

CLERK: Sanders?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS:

8

Congratulations to Council Member Garodnick and

9

Brewer. I vote yes to all.

10

CLERK: Seabrook?

11

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye on

12

all.

13

CLERK: Sears?

14

COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Aye.

15

CLERK: Stewart?

16

COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Yes and

17

present.

18

CLERK: Vacca?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

20

CLERK: Vallone?

21

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on

22

all.

23

CLERK: Vann?

24

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye on all.

25

CLERK: Weprin?

1

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye on all.

2

3

CLERK: White?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Aye on all.

5

CLERK: Yassky?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: I vote aye

7

on all. I just want to thank the sponsors of the

8

two bills here for pushing these issues forward.

9

We too have had increased reports of bed bugs in

10

my district as well. Gale, I very much hope that

11

this task force will produce some relief. I also

12

want to thank Council Member Garodnick. I think

13

that we are now getting out ahead of the curve

14

just as we did with Council Member Fidler's

15

initiatives on foreclosures years ago. The coming

16

crisis in consumer debt, this will help us get out

17

in front of. Plainly these folks need to be

18

licensed. So thank you, Council Member Garodnick.

19

CLERK: Mealy?

20

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Could I

21

explain my vote?

22

BETSY GOTBAUM: So ordered.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to

24

thank my colleagues, Dan Garodnick, Gale Brewer

25

and Mike Nelson. I vote aye on all.

1

CLERK: Palma?

2

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

3

CLERK: Oddo?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

5

CLERK: Rivera?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye

7

on all.

8

CLERK: Speaker Quinn?

9

SPEAKER QUINN: Aye.

10

[Pause]

11

BETSY GOTBAUM: All items on

12

today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a

13

vote of 46 in the affirmative, zero negative and

14

zero abstentions with the exception of LU 1000 and

15

Reso 1862 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the

16

affirmative, one negative and zero abstentions;

17

and LU 1001 and Reso 1863 which was adopted by a

18

vote of 45 in the affirmative, one negative and

19

zero abstentions; and LU 1003 and Reso 1865 which

20

was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative,

21

one negative and zero abstentions; and LU 1005 and

22

Reso 1866 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the

23

affirmative, one negative and zero abstentions;

24

and LU 1006 and Reso 1867 which was adopted by a

25

1
2 vote of 45 in the affirmative, one negative and
3 zero abstentions; and Preconsidered LU 1024 and
4 Reso 1871 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the
5 affirmative, one in the negative and zero
6 abstentions. Introduction and reading of bills.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are
8 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

9 BETSY GOTBAUM: There is no
10 resolutions and no discussions of resolutions.
11 Let's go to General Discussion. Council Member
12 Gennaro.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you,
14 Madame Public Advocate.

15 BETSY GOTBAUM: Quiet please, it's
16 hard to hear him.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I'd like
18 to talk about Resolution 1850 that is being
19 introduced today. It has to do with natural gas
20 drilling in New York City's water supply or the
21 prospect of that happening. This is a very
22 dangerous situation for the water quality and
23 would almost certainly require the city to have to
24 build a costly filtration plant at a cost of \$10-
25 \$20 billion or more. This is the type of activity

1
2 that is completely inconsistent to our unfiltered
3 water supply and Reso 1850 speaks to that. It
4 calls upon the State Legislature and calls upon
5 the Governor. There's a whole kind of movement
6 that we're doing on this that would greatly be
7 pushed forward by people signing on to Reso 1850.
8 Thank you Madame Public Advocate.

9 BETSY GOTBAUM: Council Member
10 Brewer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just want
12 to introduce two interns, Ali Swadwick [phonetic]
13 who is a New York University student and Merika
14 Balocturin [phonetic] who is also an NYU student.
15 I think we all know that we have great interns and
16 these are two of the best. Would you two please
17 stand up.

18 BETSY GOTBAUM: Council Member
19 James.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I'm urging
21 all of my colleagues to sign on to Reso 1851 which
22 calls upon the Bloomberg Administration to
23 discontinue the practice of de-funding child care
24 centers midyear and thus closing desperately
25 needed childcare services throughout the city.

1
2 BETSY GOTBAUM: Quiet please. It's
3 very hard to hear the Councilwoman.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: It's
5 consistent with his proposal to transfer 3,500 ACS
6 low income children to the Department of Education
7 to discontinue kindergarten at ACS centers all
8 throughout the City of New York. It again
9 reflects his indifference to low income people and
10 to moderate income people, particularly at a time
11 when there are no cost savings associated with
12 this proposal and it appears that it will cost
13 more than it is worth. It also indicates that in
14 fact there is no plan for these children at 3:00.
15 Most of these childcare centers are open from 9:00
16 to 6:00. The Department of Education, as everyone
17 knows, closes its doors at 3:00. There is no
18 program at this point in time for children after
19 3:00. So my question to the administration is
20 what is the plan for these children after 3:00?
21 What will be the safe passage to after school
22 programs for low income children all throughout
23 the City of New York? Why are we fixing that
24 which is not broken and why do you continue to
25 show such indifference to low income and moderate

1
2 income people in the City of New York? I would
3 urge the administration to reconsider and
4 discontinue this practice of again closing down
5 desperately needed childcare centers which are
6 economic engines in low income communities. Thank
7 you.

8 BETSY GOTBAUM: Anybody else.
9 Council Member Avella. Excuse me, I didn't see
10 you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: That's all
12 right. I want to bring my colleague's attention
13 to Intro 942, Intro 943 and Reso 1848 which are
14 basically a number of reforms regarding the City
15 Council, making the position fulltime and trying to
16 make the City Council more transparent and
17 reducing the power of the Speaker and enabling
18 committee chairs and individual Council Members to
19 have more of a say in what happens in this body.
20 I know these bills and reso will be controversial
21 but I think we owe it to the people of this city
22 to make this body more ethical and more
23 transparent. When we leave it and some of us will
24 be leaving for other offices, or leaving the
25 Council in general in the next couple of years,

1
2 why not make it a more ethical body, a more
3 transparent body, and leave it better than what we
4 found it. I hope you'll take a serious look at
5 these reforms. I expect a big controversy on
6 them. But I have to tell you I think if we do
7 this, we leave our mark on the City Council,
8 making it a better place than what we found. I
9 hope you'll give it serious consideration.

10 BETSY GOTBAUM: Council Member
11 Fidler.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I had not
13 intended to speak and was actually with the rest
14 of you please to see that we're actually going to
15 have a meeting that was going to end by classroom
16 dismissal time. But I cannot let the comment that
17 Mr. Avella just made go unanswered on the record.
18 I don't believe this is an unethical body and I
19 object strenuously to the characterization that
20 the business that we do here is done unethically.
21 If Mr. Avella has something on his conscience he
22 needs to clear, then he ought to clear it. But I
23 have no problem with the job I do here. I don't
24 have a problem with the job my colleagues do here
25 and I don't believe that the characterization of

1

2 unethcal belongs in this chamber coming from his
3 mouth. I'm a little tired of the high and mighty
4 holier than thou attitude because quite frankly
5 I'm proud of the job that most of us do here.

6

BETSY GOTBAUM: Anybody else?

7

Comments, questions? The Council meeting of March

8

11th is over.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Donna Hintze certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Signature_

Date September 18, 2009