

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY 1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

June 6, 2019
Start: 10:06 a.m.
Recess: 2:46 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
Chairperson

DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
Co-Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ADRIENNNE E. ADAMS
DIANA AYALA
JUSTIN L. BRANNAN
FERNANDO CABRERA
ANDREW COHEN
LAURIE A. CUMBO
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
VANESSA L. GIBSON
MARK GJONAJ
RORY I. LANCMAN
CARLOS MENCHACA
I. DANEEK MILLER
KEITH POWERS
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
RITCHIE J. TORRES
MARK TREYGER
PAUL A. VALLONE
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Juan Ramos
Los Sures, Southside United, Bushwick NSTAT Team

Joseph Hinds
Resident of Tompkins Houses, NSTAT Team

Trudy Pogue
Tenant Association President in the Bronx,
Resident Watch Supervisor

Rhonda Bennett
Resident Association President, Polo Ground
Towers

Reginald Bowman
Citywide Council of Presidents, Seth Low Houses
Brownsville

Renita Francios
Executive Director of the Mayor's Action Plan for
Neighborhood Safety, MAP

Carolyn Jasper
Vice President of Public Housing Operations of
New York City Housing Authority, NYCHA

Steve Lovci
Senior Advisor to the Executive Vice President of
Capital Projects at New York City Housing
Authority, NYCHA

Raymond Rodriguez
Director of the Office of Safety and Security at
New York City Housing Authority, NYCHA

James Secreto
Chief of the New York City Police Department,
NYPD

Crystal Glover
Resident of Washington Houses

Latisha McNeil
Resident of Holmes Towers

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lakeesha Taylor
Resident of Holmes Towers

Shavasia Robinson
Resident of Wagner Houses, Stakeholders of
Mayor's Action Plan

Keith Ramsey
Resident Association President of East Chester
Gardens

Aixa Torres
President of Alfred E. Smith Houses

Daqwon Savage
Resident of Wagner Houses

Anca Grigore
Supervising Attorney, Civil Justice Practice at
Brooklyn Defender Services

Rosetta Cochran
NYCHA Resident for 30 Years

Emily Ponder Williams
Supervising Attorney at Neighborhood Defender
Service of Harlem

Greg Waltman
G1 Quantum

Oleg Chernyavsky
Executive Director of Legislative Affairs of the
New York Police Department, NYPD

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The hearing is
4 now coming to order. Good morning everyone, my.. and
5 welcome to this joint hearing on the Committees on
6 Public Housing and Public Safety. I am Council Member
7 Alicka Ampry-Samuel and I Chair the Public Housing
8 Committee. I am joined by Chair of the Committee on
9 Public Safety, Council Member Donovan Richards. We
10 are also joined by Council Members Diana Ayala,
11 Cabrera, Rory Lancman, Keith Powers, Deutsch, Cohen
12 and I saw Council Member Reynoso just a few seconds
13 ago. The purpose of today's hearing is to discuss
14 safety and security in NYCHA. When we scheduled this
15 hearing, it was immediately after an 83-year-old
16 woman, Miss Jacobs was beaten to death inside of her
17 NYCHA apartment in my hometown of Brownsville. I did
18 not know how unfortunately timely this scheduled
19 hearing would be. Just yesterday, a seven-year-old
20 boy was shot in broad daylight in the courtyard of
21 Mill Brook Houses, a NYCHA development in the Bronx.
22 Thankfully the child survived but others are less
23 fortunate. On Monday, a 31-year-old was shot in the
24 head at a NYCHA development and pronounced dead at
25 the scene. A 15-year-old girl was shot in the leg in

2 the Bushwick Houses on Tuesday night and I saw there
3 was a press conference yesterday. It has been said
4 that a society is measured by how it treats its most
5 vulnerable members. In the wake of incidents like
6 these, today I cannot say that New York City is
7 measuring up. NYCHA tenants are organizing for change
8 and demanding support to improve the safety
9 conditions of their communities, residents should not
10 have to live in fear of crime. Crucially however,
11 residents should not have to live in the fear of
12 police either. Black, brown and low-income
13 communities are often overpoliced but under
14 protected. Simply increasing police presence at NYCHA
15 can lead to increased arrests and the collateral
16 consequences that go with them creating a host of
17 additional problems. There has to be a better way to
18 keep communities safe. In February Mayor De Blasio
19 and Commissioner O'Neill held a CompStat event at MAP
20 site Van Dyke Houses and around that same time
21 Commissioner O'Neill returned to Van Dyke to host a
22 round table discussion about the increasing crime in
23 the community. He was also interviewed by Sade
24 Baderinway with eyewitness news in the clip titled,
25 walking New York City's most dangerous street between

1
2 Tilden Houses and Brownsville Houses and I'll
3 highlight that both Van Dyke Houses and Brownsville
4 Houses are mapped sites and they both are in my
5 district. I appreciate that NYCHA and the Mayor's
6 Office of Criminal Justice, the NYPD and other
7 agencies have implemented numerous programs under the
8 Mayor's action plan for safety... for neighborhood
9 safety and map and... but there has not been a hearing
10 on map since the concept was introduced and I look
11 forward to receiving an update to date on NYCHA's
12 efforts to promote safety and security without
13 relying on a criminal justice system exclusively.
14 NYCHA aims to provide safe, affordable housing to low
15 and moderate New Yorkers, safe housing is not just
16 part of NYCHA's mission statement, it should be a
17 moral necessity. NYCHA, mayoral agencies and the
18 Council must work together to protect the hundreds of
19 thousands of New Yorkers that call NYCHA home. I am
20 not here today to highlight negative stories about
21 NYCHA developments and I'm not here to cause any kind
22 of blame. Families work hard every day and simply
23 deserve a clean and safe home. This is about finding
24 out who is working on what and how together we can
25 work to make the lives of families better, simple,

2 very seriously, however the second thing we have to
3 keep in mind is that there are certain law
4 enforcement tactics that NYCHA tenants have
5 experienced over the years that have the potential to
6 make tenants feel just as unsafe in their homes as
7 crime. I don't think anyone wants to return to the
8 era not so long ago when thousands of individuals
9 every year were arrested for minor trespassing
10 charges because they didn't have their ID on them or
11 because they didn't want to bring a cop to their
12 friend's front door in order to prove that they knew
13 someone in the building. I don't doubt that the
14 department had the prevention of violent crime and
15 drug dealing in mind when they enforced those
16 policies, but I simply do not agree that preventing
17 violent crime requires a heavy-handed approach to
18 minor, nonviolent offences. Unnecessary arrests for
19 minor offences cause people to become mistrustful of
20 cops and that wasn't good for people and it wasn't
21 good for cops. The good news is that I believe the
22 department largely agrees with me, arrests are down,
23 way down and I commend the NYPD for looking for other
24 ways to keep NYCHA buildings safe while also looking
25 to community policing models and targeted enforcement

2 in order to build trust within the communities that
3 the department is charged with protecting. I believe
4 there are more points of agreement on some of the
5 things I want to focus on today. Ultimately crime
6 prevention should not always fall on the shoulders of
7 the police department. There is a limit to what we
8 ought to ask of them. Vertical patrol has become one
9 symbol of an era of policing that I want to move on
10 from primarily because of how it impacted those
11 communities but I think even Pat Lynch would agree
12 with me that asking cops to go up and down poorly lit
13 stairwells looking for people to arrest isn't just
14 bad for the people who live there, it is a danger to
15 the officers as well. We need to focus not on how law
16 enforcement measures keeping people safe but on how
17 we can improve the overall conditions in NYCHA that
18 often lead to crime. Crime prevention is about
19 community building, it's about sound infrastructure,
20 it's about creating safe and well-maintained public
21 spaces. I think the NYPD can be a valuable partner in
22 pursuing those goals because they are out there day
23 in and day out but ultimately it shouldn't be on them
24 to fix every problem. Don't get me wrong, violent
25 crime needs to be addressed but ultimately the long-

2 term solution to violent crime will come from
3 investing in people not arresting them. I look
4 forward to hearing what the administration has
5 planned to keep NYCHA residents safe and what the
6 NYPD believes needs to be done to make their jobs
7 easier. With that being said I will turn it back over
8 to my Co-Chair, I want to thank you for, for co-
9 hosting this important hearing, residents of NYCHA
10 deserve to feel safe like any other people in New
11 York City shouldn't be predicated necessarily on
12 their zip codes or the socioeconomic status,
13 residents deserve to be safe and that's what we hope
14 to accomplish today in this hearing. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We have just
16 been joined by Majority Leader, Council Member Cumbo
17 as well as Council Member Vallone. So, the first
18 panel we will hear from will be residents of NYCHA as
19 we do in our public housing hearings we like to hear
20 from the residents first before we hear from the
21 agencies and so with that we will hear from a young
22 resident as well as residents from the MAP sites as
23 well as someone representing Bushwick Houses. We have
24 a lot of residents who have signed up to testify
25 today but we will only be able to have a small

2 testimony panel first then we'll hear from the
3 agencies and then we'll go back to the resident
4 panels after but we cannot hear all of the residents
5 before we hear from the agency so... Joseph Hinds from
6 Tompkins Houses; Juan Ramos, Los Sures Bushwick,
7 NSTAT Team; Trudy Pogue, I apologize if I pronounced
8 your name wrong, Franklin Avenue Tenant Association
9 and we'll also hear from a development that does not
10 have a MAP site to help with the discussion when the
11 agencies come forth so we'll also hear from Mr.
12 Reggie Bowman representing Seth Low Houses in
13 Brooklyn East. And Miss Rhonda Bennett from Polo
14 Ground. Okay, we'll start with Bushwick and we're
15 going to have to put you on a clock, so we'll put the
16 clock on for three minutes, okay?

17 JUAN RAMOS: Good morning, my name is
18 Juan Ramos, I am with an organization in
19 Williamsburg, in Bushwick called Los Sures, Southside
20 United and we operate the MAP team there. We also
21 work very closely with a program that we started
22 there under neighborhood public safety coalition
23 called the WICK against violence and we have some of
24 our members in the audience so I would just want to
25 shout them out. I want to thank the Council Members

2 for having us here today, for holding this hearing
3 that is very important not only to the NYCHA
4 residents but also to the residents that they engage
5 outside of the development because that goes hand in
6 hand as well and sometimes we forget that those
7 interactions mean a lot because the residents outside
8 of the development also have a responsibility to the
9 safety of the people in the development. So, I just
10 want to... in recent days we've heard a lot about
11 what's happened in Bushwick with some of the
12 violence, we know that just over a year ago we had an
13 anniversary of a double homicide that occurred there,
14 two elderly people and recently as yesterday... day
15 before yesterday we had a young lady that was grazed
16 in the hip during a shootout and while we hear all
17 these things in the news what we don't hear is the
18 good things that are happening at Bushwick and I want
19 to kind of focus on that first because there are a
20 lot of good things happening in Bushwick since the
21 MAP initiative came to Bushwick. For example, we were
22 able to engage residents who at one point in the
23 development weren't aware of many of the things that
24 were happening at the development in order to get
25 people engaged and ready to speak up... out against the

2 violence. I'm happy to say that through our
3 initiative we were able not only to engage residents
4 but get them involved to the point where a lot of
5 them today are now part of the resident association
6 when the resident association was almost not..
7 nonoperational which is an activation onto itself
8 which, which means a lot in order for people to stop
9 the violence in the development. Through our
10 initiative we also were able to begin the WICK
11 against violence through the help of MOCJ which helps
12 us put a team of violence interrupters on the ground
13 and interacting with some of the most violent
14 individuals at the development but also the most
15 vulnerable, vulnerable individuals at the development
16 because they're one in the same. When we look at
17 violence in, in the development what, what we tend to
18 see is that we point the finger at those that we
19 think are the bad guys but little do we know that
20 they're also the ones that are vulnerable to some of
21 the violence and overall what I can say in ending it
22 is that when we look at the violence at NYCHA what I
23 hear from the residents and what I've, I've seen and
24 observed myself is that we need to better define
25 violence, we need better, better to define what it

2 means to have disinvestment in, in NYCHA because it
3 begins with how I feel about being in my apartment
4 and how safe I feel about being in, in the grounds of
5 my development and those go one in the same because
6 if I'm not happy with what I have in my... in my
7 apartment and I go outside and I feel just as bad
8 then I just give up hope and what we're trying to
9 bring to the development is hope and I think that's
10 what MAP has done, I think that's what the WICK
11 against violence is doing in Bushwick and I just want
12 to stand up and say for the residents of Bushwick
13 that they're also sick and tired of seeing the news,
14 they're also sick and tired of being... not being able
15 to sit in their development and watch their kids play
16 and a lot of them have stood up and, and now I have...
17 I'm happy to say that over the last year we've had
18 over seven shooting incidents and the residents have
19 responded to each one when in... when in the past there
20 was never anyone standing up against shootings or
21 speaking out against shootings and we responded to
22 each one with the residents leading the way and I
23 think that the last incident where we saw a young
24 lady that was murdered for example at the hands of
25 her boyfriend, we invited the development that she

2 actually lived in to join us and we have... we had over
3 50 members of, of Cabana Houses join us at Bushwick
4 Houses for a vigil for that victim and as they were
5 leaving they spoke to the residents of Bushwick and
6 say how did you guys organize this and how can we
7 bring this program to our development because we need
8 something like this but I, I commend the residents of
9 Bushwick for standing up and saying we want to do
10 something about this and they've done that so with
11 people power and agency power and the resources of
12 the... of the City Council and all the other
13 institutions that can provide us assistance we can go
14 a lot... go a whole lot more and go harder and harder
15 each year to make things better and the last thing
16 I'll say about Bushwick is that we also need to study
17 the violence at most of the developments because what
18 I can say about Bushwick is that a lot of the
19 violence that takes place, studying it and being
20 involved on the street on it, a lot of the violence
21 doesn't come necessarily from the people that live at
22 Bushwick, a lot of the violence comes to Bushwick...

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
24 talk]

2 JUAN RAMOS: ...and we need... and we need to
3 study that because again the initiatives that we put
4 into the developments are great but this needs a
5 citywide effort, resources invested in the entire
6 community and if we invest more in policing than we
7 do... than we... than what we do in the developments and
8 the surrounding areas of the development then that's
9 a disservice to the community overall. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
11 much and... [cross-talk]

12 [applause]

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quite please... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Wait... I know
16 there are a lot of people here who have... this is
17 their first time coming to a Council hearing, we do
18 not clap or have loud outbursts, we ask that if you
19 do want to express how you feel you can do this [jazz
20 hands] but please do not clap or speak or have loud
21 outbursts but thank you so much. Thank you.

22 JOSEPH HINDS: Good morning, my name is
23 Joseph Hinds. I started work... as a youth worker with
24 Ahmed Daniel last April, I received training on
25 community, community safety but in a way I've always

2 been worried about our community and, and the safety
3 so I've always been on every... on basically... on
4 everybody in my community because that's what you're
5 supposed to be in a community for and we worked on
6 like two action plans, one in the basketball program
7 and the other one is the music program. The purpose
8 of renovating the basketball court is to show the
9 community that we could use the outdoor space for... we
10 could use the outdoor space for more than basketball.
11 In April we hosted our first roller skating event
12 bringing the whole community out over like 200 people
13 came out and enjoyed each other's company, I mean
14 everybody got along no problems and as we were
15 showing them one thing that people could come out and
16 there could be no problems on a regular day, it could
17 be any day and we bring... also bring... been trying to
18 bring them back the basketball tournament for the
19 summer because to get... everybody got their certain
20 talents whether it's basketball, singing, anything so
21 we want to like express and bring out everybody back
22 on... and just make everybody feel right like in a
23 community and for the violence I feel like is, is
24 going down like as long as we just continue to put
25 effort into... back into the community like he said

2 like not into everything policing, policing, it's got
3 to be back to the people and give back to the people
4 and see what they're going to give back like if the
5 effort is... if you all showing an effort to everybody
6 and you all bringing us all this stuff I think... and
7 giving us something to do instead of being bored and
8 standing around maybe bring everybody out and show
9 everybody here and now this is what's... this is what
10 we're supposed to be doing instead of this is what
11 we're not supposed to be doing, give them something
12 to do and I think by bringing... instead... and you know
13 MAP to the communities is just changing all around
14 like everything is just improving to me. I just feel
15 like for everybody to come together and be who they
16 are and feel like they could express themselves
17 that's always going to be a positive vibes, you know
18 but besides that I'm not really like sure like what
19 you all... everything you all expect from us we always
20 will uphold that and make sure we do it like no
21 violence, no like... I don't know like... I don't know
22 what they... you all want to expect we're going to do
23 like... I don't know as it changes... time for a change
24 and somebody got to do it so, if they got to take

2 NSTAT to move... this movement and everybody should
3 just be alongside it and that's why I'm alongside it.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you and
5 can you state your development again?

6 JOSEPH HINDS: Tompkins Houses.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Tompkins
8 Houses...

9 JOSEPH HINDS: Yeah.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Alright, thank
11 you so much for being... [cross-talk]

12 JOSEPH HINDS: Thank you... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...here and
14 thank you for being a leader in your community, I'm
15 proud of you.

16 JOSEPH HINDS: Awe, thank you I
17 appreciate you.

18 TRUDY POGUE: Thank you. Good morning, my
19 name is Trudy Pogue, I'm the Tenant Association
20 President in the Bronx at 1325 Franklin Avenue, I'm
21 also a resident watch supervisor which is... my title
22 is... so, city security aid, okay. I'm here this
23 morning because I have issues and I want it to be
24 known. I've spoken to numerous of people to my
25 district leaders, manager office, PSA 7 and nothing

2 has been done. We had an incident there, it's a
3 senior development first of all, okay, we don't have
4 locked doors, well I have a picture with tape on, on
5 the door... on the lock, okay, we have... we have the
6 homeless coming in and using the stairways as public
7 bathrooms... like a bathroom for a toilet. Also there
8 have been a incident there that was swept under the
9 rug and I'm not pleased about it, okay, because we
10 had a senior there that was choked by a homeless man,
11 we reported it, the guy was picked up, he went... they
12 locked him up for a few days, they told the tenant
13 not to come to court, I don't understand it because
14 to me that was a criminal act and I consider that as
15 attempted murder because if I didn't raise a cane at
16 that gentleman who knows if he would have choked her
17 to death, okay and that was swept under the rug. Our
18 development at 1326 Franklin Avenue in the Bronx is
19 like it's not even on the map, I make complaints,
20 I've, I'm made numerous of... complaints as I said
21 district leaders, I've called them in, I've toured
22 them through the building, I showed them pictures,
23 they have taken pictures and nothing has been done
24 and this has been going on for about two years or so
25 now, enough is enough. Someone has to do something, I

2 wanted to take NYCHA to court, get the tenants
3 together and go to court with the situation but being
4 that these are seniors a lot of them are ill, they
5 cannot go, they, they are afraid, some of them even
6 afraid to come out of their apartment because of this
7 homeless gentleman that is allowed to come on the
8 premises whenever he feels like. Some people call it
9 his building, say he owns the building, this is what
10 they are saying and, and, and I mean I've, I've had
11 enough, the tenants have had enough, okay, someone
12 has to do something.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

14 RHONDA BEMMETT: Good morning, my name is
15 Rhonda Bennett, I represent Polo Ground Towers, I'm
16 the Resident Association President, been residing
17 there 50 years. My... it's not so much of a complaint
18 but my worry is that we have a lot of youth that's
19 doing a lot of the, the crimes but a good thing is
20 that one of the youth, sad to say but he's been
21 incarcerated and so far since he's been incarcerated
22 no one has been getting involved. So, to this day I
23 kind of commend that but it's a sad situation that he
24 had to be incarcerated for petty robberies to stop,
25 I'm asking for NYPD to... they work closely with us but

2 my problem is that we have NCO officers that rarely
3 have time to work with us because they're always in
4 training, training to do this, training to do that
5 and how do you get a community together if you're not
6 able to work with outside agencies because there's so
7 much training. Also safety in our development as far
8 as our buildings we were having FDNY breaking our
9 locks to get into our buildings so that became an
10 issue, the locks you know they cost a whole lot of
11 money and it took us like a big fight, it was my
12 building that they actually broke into. Another
13 building, our building, building 3294955 as soon as
14 the locks get fixed they break them again, I don't
15 understand that we have cameras on each one of these
16 buildings so we have to... NYCHA has to do their part
17 and view these cameras to see who's breaking these
18 doors, NYPD needs to do their part and get these
19 people that's breaking our doors because it's useless
20 to have locked doors that's always unlocked. Through
21 our, our mass action team it's becoming a success, we
22 work very hard thanks to court intervention, center
23 for court intervention, my team over there I
24 congratulate you all on what we've put together and
25 we're actually trying to work with the septic through

2 crime, through prevention of environmental design and
3 we're trying to plant gardens but that's on a hold
4 because right now we have so much construction with
5 the buildings, they're doing appointing of the
6 buildings so that is now an issue because we have all
7 of this scaffolding and then all of this netting
8 which you cannot even see through it so therefore the
9 way they have our buildings blocked off and closed up
10 you're walking through a tunnel which I am... I asked
11 can we please have cameras put up under those
12 scaffolds because I think that is an entrapment area
13 and we need that better lit, cameras there and also
14 with that construction Department of Buildings must
15 be... okayed their plans but it's also a danger because
16 our emergency vehicles cannot come through our
17 development the way they need to, to reach somebody
18 in a building. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Miss
20 Bennett.

21 REGINALD BOWMAN: Good morning, my name
22 is Reginald Bowman, I'm here representing the
23 citywide council of presidents this morning which is
24 the NYCHA group that represents the residents of
25 public housing citywide. I'm also here on behalf of

2 the residents of Seth Low Houses in Brownsville and
3 I'm going to be very brief. I just want to first of
4 all commend the Chair and the Co-Chair for their
5 efforts, I'd also like to commend the Mayor for MAP,
6 I think that it's a very important program that is
7 beginning to address one of the most serious issues
8 that exist in the public housing community in the
9 city of New York. Back in the 1980's I sat in this
10 very spot and talked about the necessity of security
11 for public housing then. As many of you know the
12 history of the public housing police came from a
13 program that was started in the community and
14 eventually led to their being a police department
15 that was dedicated to public housing in New York.
16 Presently we are faced with again the same problem
17 rearing its head and here in the 19th year of the 21st
18 century we are still talking about how to secure our
19 buildings and we have a very serious problem going
20 on. Again, not criticizing the city or the residents
21 who have been working together, I think it's
22 important for a couple of things to be considered as
23 we move forward because if we're going to stem the
24 violence and victimization that happens on our
25 grounds and we're going to make our homes safe and

2 secure as dictated by the 24 CFR 964 regulations
3 we're going to have to use 21st century techniques
4 and standards in order to make that happen. Last
5 night while I was preparing for this I came across
6 various companies that do security and surveillance
7 and create the kind of equipment that's necessary to
8 secure large facilities and large developments and
9 I've often wondered as I come through security here
10 in this... in the City Hall and as I go through
11 security into the NYCHA buildings how they're able to
12 make sure that their buildings are secure and not
13 invaded by the public but they still don't seem to
14 get the fact that if you really want to secure our
15 buildings you're going to have to put some similar
16 systems into our buildings. Make no mistake about it,
17 cameras don't stop crime, cameras do not stop crime
18 especially cameras that are not used for surveillance
19 and are not being watched by anyone so that there can
20 be a response when that crime happens as opposed to
21 recording the crime and then responding to it
22 afterwards. So, all I'm suggesting at this point is
23 we go forward with this process of securing the most
24 vulnerable in the public housing community is that we
25 start investing our money in the modern surveillance

2 systems that are used in the high rises like the
3 Needle on Park Avenue, like getting into this
4 building, like getting into NYCHA. Unless we secure
5 our building's entrances and their exits, unless we
6 secure them with surveillance systems that work,
7 we're going to be back here doing this over and over
8 again as people keep being victimized over and over
9 again. So, my recommendation again is that we
10 continue this process of engagement that's very
11 important and I commend that but we also have to
12 start looking into the 21st century solutions of
13 surveillance and security that are keeping 50 percent
14 of this city secure when they're in their large
15 buildings and you can't... if one of us tried to get
16 into their buildings on a... on a... on a bad day we
17 would be stopped at the perimeter. So, my suggestion
18 again is that we start using 21st century systems for
19 this current problem that we're dealing with in
20 public housing. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
22 much, thank you so much. Miss Trudy.

23 TRUDY POGUE: Hello, there's something
24 that I failed to mention. Not only do they allow this
25 homeless gentleman to continue to take over the

2 place, they're forcing the lady that he choked to
3 move out of the development.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, wow.
5 Well thank you... thank you so much for your testimony
6 today, it's always helpful to be able to hear what's
7 happening in the developments from the families, from
8 the residents as we go into our discussion with the
9 agencies so thank you so much. Okay, so now we'll
10 hear from the agencies. So, representing NYCHA we
11 have Carolyn Jasper, Vice President of Operations; we
12 have Ulcah Busgith with NYCHA; Rodriguez from NYCHA;
13 Chief Secreto from NYPD and Executive Director Oleg
14 NYPD, sorry Oleg, do you want me to try? Okay.
15 Chernyavsky and we've also been joined by Council
16 Member Miller and Council Member Van Bramer. And
17 Counsel will swear you in.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
19 hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
20 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
21 before this committee and to respond honestly to
22 Council Member questions?

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, take it
24 away and please state your name and position. Turn on
25 the mic and start over.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

RENITA FRANCIOS: My name is Renita Francois and I am the Executive Director of the Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety which I will say again. Good morning Chairperson Ampry-Samuel, Chairperson Richards, members of the Public Housing and Public Safety Committees and residents of the great city we serve. My name is Renita Francois and I'm the Executive Director of the Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety which is overseen by the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today and thank you to Council, the District Attorney's Office and the Mayor for your investment in MAP. I am joined today by Carolyn Jasper from NYCHA and Chief James Secreto from the city of New York Police Department. I stand before you having witnessed what happens when everyday people are in the driver's seat of a vehicle designed to drive change. For decades crime has concentrated in black and brown neighborhoods where poverty, unemployment, negative health outcomes and insufficient resources also existed. This reality, as we know, not only impacted the wellbeing of the residents who lived in those neighborhoods, but also their safety, which is inextricably connected. There

2 have always been people in community working to
3 change this, unfortunately, government hasn't always
4 done enough to be the partner and supporter residents
5 deserve. Confronting this legacy requires
6 acknowledgement that public safety demands a team
7 effort and that residents must be at the heart of it.
8 It is not just about crime and policing. Handcuffs
9 and jail cells will not solve our problems. As the
10 city endeavors to reduce the jail population and
11 lighten the touch of enforcement, we must work hand
12 in hand with residents to build the resource
13 infrastructure that will stop the flow of our young
14 people into the criminal justice system. It calls for
15 acting on the decades of experience and research
16 demonstrating that safety is the organic result of
17 access to learning, work, and play, along with
18 revitalized physical environments that bring people
19 together and promote civic engagement. When we
20 started MAP in 2014 we set out to tackle this
21 injustice in 15 disenfranchised communities head on
22 with the support of NYCHA, the NYPD and city agency
23 partners by connecting the city's resources on the
24 ground, expanding opportunities for work and play and
25 increased health and wellbeing, investing in the

2 built environment, and ultimately, by building a
3 space where residents and government could come
4 together to solve problems. Residents of underserved
5 communities have gone for too long without a say in
6 how to best increase safety in their neighborhoods,
7 but as once was powerfully said to me, "residents
8 don't need a voice for the voiceless, they need the
9 mic". NeighborhoodStat was designed to be a platform
10 for the city and neighborhoods to work together. It
11 is designed to amplify community voice. It was
12 designed for residents to lead. To support resident
13 leadership, we have contracted with our partners at
14 the Center for Court Innovation, Los Sures and also
15 Jacob Riis, to support residents in building their
16 capacity, and hired organizers called MAP engagement
17 coordinators for each development. Resident teams
18 that consists of three youth, nine adults and three
19 seniors, receive trainings in methodologies like
20 crime prevention through environmental design and
21 50,000 dollars per team to implement projects that
22 address a physical space vulnerability using the
23 methodology with the support of NYCHA. Since its
24 launch, NeighborhoodStat has brought together
25 hundreds of residents, city agency partners and CBOs

1 job training, skill building and employment
2 opportunities. We are working with our partners at
3 DYCD, WorkDev, Green City Force, Jobs Plus, NYCHA
4 REES, and private partners to understand the gaps
5 residents have identified and the steps necessary to
6 fill them. They want support for community wellness
7 and mental health resources. We are working with our
8 partners at DOHMH to connect the teams that deal with
9 the issue's residents raised in their priority areas
10 including substance and alcohol abuse, mental health
11 and health disparities. To understand how we arrive
12 at these priorities and solutions, we brought an
13 example from the Castle Hill Houses to help
14 illuminate the NeighborhoodStat process which we will
15 see at the end. The consistency of asks from
16 neighborhoods across the city indicate a need to
17 develop system level responses to these challenges.
18 Beyond providing access to resources in general, it
19 is MAP's goal to be guided by residents to develop
20 and deliver the right resources to the right places
21 at the right time. That is the true opportunity that
22 MAP provides, a coordinated effort to support
23 communities to prevent crime by following their
24 guidance on how to invest in the wellbeing of their
25

2 neighborhood. A healthy neighborhood is a safe
3 neighborhood. By traditional measures, MAP sites have
4 seen a nine percent overall reduction in total index
5 crime, with violent crime falling eight percent from
6 2014 to 2018, outpacing the four percent decline
7 throughout the city's public housing developments
8 during the same period. Year to date MAP sites are
9 down 14 percent in index crime and 15 percent in
10 violent crime, outpacing the city's eight percent
11 reduction in both categories' year to date and the
12 rest of NYCHA's two and four percent respectively. We
13 are currently in the middle of an evaluation that
14 will tell us more about our impact on safety and MAP
15 communities and resident's perception of that impact.
16 In the interim, what we do know about this model,
17 which is being held up nationally and internationally
18 as a model for government and community partnership,
19 is that residents are voting with their feet. Since
20 the NeighborhoodStat's full rollout more than 21,000
21 people have been engaged in this process through
22 public outreach, meetings and events with 220
23 residents taking an active leadership role in
24 resident stakeholder teams. To sustain this momentum
25 and repair decades of mistrust with neighborhoods

2 that have been neglected, it's critical that we, the
3 city partners, continue to show up in this process
4 and follow through on our commitments. Continued
5 engagement from agencies and leveraging civic
6 participation is paramount and we remain steadfast in
7 our commitments with our agency partners both present
8 at this table and our other sister agencies. We would
9 just like to briefly show an example from Castle
10 Hill.

11 [audio example]

12 RENITA FRANCIOS: Thank you.

13 CAROLYN JASPER: Good morning, my name is
14 Carolyn Jasper and I am Vice President of Public
15 Housing of Operations with the New York City Housing
16 Authority. Chairs Alicka Ampry-Samuel and Donovan
17 Richards, members of the Committee on Public Housing
18 and Public Safety and other distinguished members of
19 the City Council. I am pleased to be joined by
20 Raymond Rodriguez, Director of the Office of Safety
21 and Security and other members of NYCHA's team. We
22 also appreciate having our partners from the Mayor's
23 Office of Criminal Justice, MOCJ and the NYPD with us
24 today. In my role, I advise on the overall management
25 of NYCHA's properties and directly oversee property

1 management at approximately half of the Authority's
2 portfolio. As a landlord, we know that good
3 maintenance of our buildings and other infrastructure
4 correlates to crime deterrence. Mr. Rodriguez's team
5 at the Office of Safety and Security is responsible
6 for protecting the Authority's properties, employees
7 and residents. Thank you for convening a hearing on
8 this very important topic, and for the opportunity to
9 provide you with an overview of our efforts to
10 enhance the safety and security of NYCHA
11 developments. As a landlord, our top priority is
12 ensuring safe and secure homes for the nearly 400,000
13 New Yorkers we serve. That aim is at the forefront of
14 our mission, and the focus of many elements of our
15 work. Our approach to fostering safe communities is
16 centered on investing in infrastructure that enhances
17 building security such as cameras, exterior lighting
18 and layered access controls; collaborating with the
19 nation's premier law enforcement agency, the NYPD, as
20 well as MOCJ and other organizations and partnering
21 with residents and connecting them to opportunity.
22 Physical security enhancements at our buildings.
23 Recognizing the important role of security cameras
24 other security enhancements in making residents feel
25

2 safe, we have been working hard to put these measures
3 in place and obtain the funding to do so. Over the
4 past two decades, NYCHA has installed nearly 16,600
5 security cameras at over 200 developments, benefiting
6 more than 310,000 residents. Since 2014, we've
7 invested approximately 200 million dollars in cameras
8 and other security enhancements, funding that's
9 generously provided by City, City Council members and
10 other elected officials as well as through programs
11 like the Mayor's Office Action Plan for Neighborhood
12 Safety and the Manhattan District Attorney's Office.
13 Since 2014, we have installed nearly 8,000 exterior
14 lights at 78 developments, a 101-million-dollar
15 investment in total. Our partners at the Dormitory
16 Authority of the State of New York also installed
17 more than six million dollars of lighting at 13
18 locations in the past two years. In addition, we've
19 put 586 light towers to disrupt criminal activity at
20 targeted locations and improve residents' quality of
21 life. In the past six years, we've also installed
22 layered access controls, new intercoms and front door
23 key fobs and hardware, at 425 buildings across 76
24 developments. I'd like to thank the Council for
25 funding many of these security enhancements, which

2 improve the quality of life for residents across the
3 city. Collaborating with safety and security experts.
4 Ensuring safety is everyone's responsibility and that
5 is why we collaborate with our stakeholders to
6 address safety and security concerns. Our partners at
7 the NYPD are crime fighting experts and we work with
8 them on the placement of security cameras and
9 exterior lighting, relocating.. and relocating cameras
10 as needed. To help the NYPD solve crimes, we share
11 security camera footage, footage with them in the
12 middle of the night if necessary. Since the beginning
13 of the year, we've provided the NYPD with over 6,500
14 video recordings and provided other law enforcement
15 agencies with nearly 2,000 video recordings. We are
16 in constant communication with the NYPD; they
17 regularly provide us with crime reports and valuable
18 intel and statistics. For instance, we coordinate
19 with the NYPD on all of our summer family days at our
20 developments, they provide, provide police coverage
21 presence as well as any information that's relevant
22 to ensuring the community's safety. And the NYPD's
23 Neighborhood Coordination Officers work closely on
24 the ground with NYPD property managers as well as the
25 residents, it is truly a productive relationship. Led

1
2 by the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, the 140-
3 million-dollar Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood
4 Safety, MAP, brings together residents and a range of
5 city agencies to reduce crime at 15 NYCHA sites with
6 historically high crime rates. Its holistic approach
7 of physical improvements such as exterior lighting,
8 expanded programming including job training and
9 strengthened police, resident engagement is making a
10 difference for the residents. For example, the
11 NeighborhoodStat initiative brings together city
12 government and resident leaders, community-based
13 organizations and other stakeholders for periodic
14 meetings to address public safety issues specific to
15 each MAP location. We continue to meet regularly with
16 our partners at MOCJ to build upon the progress we
17 are making through the Mayor's Action Plan.

18 Partnering with residents to foster safer
19 communities. Of course, residents are a key partner
20 in our work to make our developments safer. For about
21 a half a century, thousands of residents have
22 volunteered their time as resident watch members,
23 patrolling their developments and fostering safety,
24 security and community pride in collaboration with
25 property management. To give our youth a safe,

2 productive place to go, we are working with MOCJ and
3 the Department of Youth and Community Development,
4 DYDC, to keep 119 community centers at NYCHA's
5 developments open until at least 11 p.m. this summer.
6 Over the last several summers, an average of about
7 250 participants per site benefited from these
8 extended hours. As part of our work to support the
9 community, I am proud to say that NYCHA has
10 facilitated more than 15,000 job placements since
11 2014. That is being accomplished through a variety of
12 workforce development programs from Jobs Plus to the
13 NYCHA Resident Training Academy. Our Office of
14 Resident Economic Empowerment and Sustainability will
15 continue to help residents launch and advance their
16 careers and open doors to additional opportunities
17 for themselves and their families. Conclusion.
18 Through NYCHA 2.0, our long-term strategic plan, we
19 are working hard to improve our residents' quality of
20 life, from completing repairs faster through skilled
21 trades and maintenance work order blitz to
22 implementing seven days a week janitorial services at
23 our developments with alternative work schedules. The
24 latter means more boots on the ground and eyes on the
25 street, earlier in the day, later in the evening and

2 on weekends. A family's sense of safety is integral
3 to their quality of life and that basic tenet drives
4 so much of the work that we do. We appreciate the
5 support of our partners, including the NYPD, MOCJ,
6 DYCD and the City Council as we work with our
7 residents to foster safe communities at NYCHA. We are
8 especially thankful for funding from Council Members
9 for security enhancements such as cameras and
10 exterior lights and hope that you will continue to
11 partner with us in these efforts. We need funding to
12 not only install this infrastructure, but also to
13 continue to maintain it. Although we commit all
14 available resources and work with our partners to
15 ensure the safety of NYCHA communities, there is
16 always more work that can and must be done. Thank you
17 for your support as we continue to make progress for
18 our residents. We are happy to answer any questions
19 that you may have. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
21 much and I know that Chief Secreto was not giving
22 testimony but you're here to answer all the questions
23 and provide information. So, I'm just going to get
24 started, I know... we have a ton of questions related
25 to MAP and MAP address... is, is currently in 15

2 developments but this is about NYCHA overall so we
3 will get to MAP. So, let's just first start with, in
4 your testimony Miss Jasper you mentioned.. this is
5 just the beginning of your testimony so just like
6 clarification, you mentioned oversight of half of the
7 authority's portfolio directly oversee property
8 management at approximately half of the authority's
9 portfolio, what does that mean, half, like.. so what
10 happens with the other.. who manages the other half?

11 CAROLYN JASPER: So, property management
12 department is divided into six different departments,
13 we have Queens and Staten Island department, we have
14 mixed finance, we have Brooklyn, we have the Bronx,
15 we have Manhattan and we have NGO one so I am
16 responsible for overseeing half of the portfolio,
17 portfolio, I oversee the Boroughs of Queens and
18 Staten Island, I oversee Brooklyn and I oversee mixed
19 finance. Mixed finance has properties within the
20 boroughs of Brooklyn, Manhattan and also the Bronx.
21 So, when we say half of the authority's portfolio
22 that's about perhaps, I oversee approximately 70,000
23 units and approximately 64,000 developments in total
24 and with that I also oversee the, the, the directors
25 are a direct report to me so I have three directors

2 who oversee those three departments that report
3 directly to me and they have support staff that
4 report to them who oversee the property management
5 developments.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so it's
7 not like you have another... like a counterpart that
8 oversee the other... [cross-talk]

9 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, and I apologize.
10 Yes, we do, we also right we have an interim vice
11 president who was currently serving to oversee the
12 other half of the portfolio.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And who was
14 that?

15 CAROLYN JASPER: His name is Albert
16 Ferguson.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. You also
18 mentioned and just now... so, this is kind of getting
19 into the weeds of the cameras and the actual safety
20 and security, you outlined what NYCHA has done over
21 the past two decades, right and two decades is 20
22 years, right and you mentioned how many cameras were
23 installed over the past 20 years and so my question
24 is can you talk to us about the life span of cameras
25 because and... what does that mean to mention you've

2 installed a certain number of cameras over the past
3 20 years when we know that cameras... like cameras that
4 were installed 20 years ago would be irrelevant to
5 this conversation that we're having today or explain
6 to me if I'm incorrect?

7 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, Council... [cross-
8 talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, can you
10 just break down the actual installation of cameras,
11 how many cameras you have overall and how many of
12 them are actually operating today to standard and how
13 many of them do you feel should be replaced and can
14 you explain like the, the actual life span of
15 cameras?

16 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, Council Member
17 thank you... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you...
19 [cross-talk]

20 CAROLYN JASPER: ...for that question. What
21 I will do is that I will ask Steve Lovci who is the
22 NYCHA Senior Advisor to the EDP of Capital Projects,
23 I will ask him to come up and to give you more
24 insight to your question.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. We have
3 to swear you in.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
5 hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
6 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
7 before this committee and to respond honestly to
8 Council Member questions?

9 STEVE LOVCI: I do.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And can you
11 explain what you do again, your... [cross-talk]

12 STEVE LOVCI: Yes... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...title sounded
14 pretty lengthy.

15 STEVE LOVCI: Thank you very much. My
16 name is Steven Lovci, I'm the Senior Advisor to the
17 Executive Vice President of Capital Projects. I do
18 want to say that Deborah Goddard shares her regards,
19 she was unable to attend this due to previous
20 scheduled. Thank you very much for the question. So,
21 in terms of capital and where we are with the
22 construction of, of a project, there is a warranty
23 and guarantee, the guarantee would be the workmanship
24 of the layered access systems, the cameras and the
25

1
2 lighting that's approximately one year and then
3 depending on the... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We always say
5 alert access system so can you just explain that,
6 what is a layered access system... [cross-talk]

7 STEVE LOVCI: Yes, so a layered access
8 system is the, the door fobs, the electrical locks
9 that one has entering their building.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

11 STEVE LOVCI: Those systems have a
12 warranty depending on the components anywhere from
13 one year to ten years so I will get back to you in
14 terms of your exact question on the life cycle... or
15 the life expectancy of a camera, we do monitor all of
16 those and as you know we work with the Council on
17 older camera systems to upgrade those so that way
18 they are working with the overall SOC system in, in
19 the, the, the system... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I don't know
21 what SOC system is?

22 STEVE LOVCI: I apologize... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, going back
24 to the layered access system you said that they can
25

2 be... a, a warranty of anywhere from one year to ten
3 years?

4 STEVE LOVCI: Depending on the
5 components, yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What does that
7 mean cause I... to... it costs so much money to put in a
8 layered access system and can you explain to me where
9 a one-year warranty would be appropriate, that just
10 sounds crazy?

11 STEVE LOVCI: Uh-huh, so usually the
12 workmanship is a one-year guarantee, the camera
13 system you're absolutely correct is a complex system
14 of... that, that has a cost associated to it, it's made
15 up of many components. What I mentioned was the SOC,
16 which is the security operations center that is the
17 network of computers and recording devices and
18 software that is what we refer to as the brains of
19 the system and then you have the low voltage center,
20 those are all typically for one development but there
21 are some scenarios where developments share that
22 system and then once that system is in and that's the
23 most expensive portion of the component there is...

24 [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so breaking that down, if you have a development, let's say a development has no camera system at all, right and Council or someone decides that they want to provide the funding for a system in that particular development, they would then need to purchase what first?

STEVE LOVCI: Right, thank you. So, we work with the Council Members to analyze their... the development that they're speaking about, if that system does not have that central brain that is the first component... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And that's the SOC that you were talking about?

STEVE LOVCI: Correct, that's... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, which is the brain so if it does not have that...

STEVE LOVCI: That is basically the first piece of... that we have to have put in so that way all of the cameras feed into that.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and that's the most expensive piece?

2 STEVE LOVCI: That is the most... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, then the...
5 [cross-talk]

6 STEVE LOVCI: ...expensive... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the... so, that
8 particular piece could last for how long?

9 STEVE LOVCI: I don't have that
10 information; I will get that information to you.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Have you
12 replaced any brains at all in a development that had
13 one?

14 STEVE LOVCI: So, I'm... unfortunately I
15 can't speak to that, I can direct you to the security
16 systems who manage and maintain those pieces...

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The reason why
18 I ask that question is because if you replaced it
19 then we can find out when it was installed the first
20 time and when it needed to be replaced to get a sense
21 of how long it lasts and then at the, the next series
22 of questions would have been related to the cameras
23 that were purchased to go directly with that SOC
24 system and then determine how long those cameras last
25 and then the next question would have been like the

2 level of crime that took place in that development
3 that had that brain and those cameras and, and... so,
4 that's the reason for my questions and I know when we
5 did the briefing I said I was going to ask that
6 question.

7 STEVE LOVCI: Okay, I've just... I've just
8 been handed a card with... excuse me, I'm sorry.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I specifically
10 said that I was going to ask direct questions about
11 the life span of the cameras, the installation and
12 how many there were, and the cost associated with it.

13 STEVE LOVCI: So, I've just received a
14 card... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
16 talk]

17 STEVE LOVCI: ...from... it indicates the
18 cameras life expectancy is ten years.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Okay, so
20 you... so, over the past 20 years, right, according to
21 your testimony you, you installed how many cameras?
22 So, if they're ten-year life expectancy so that means
23 that those original set of cameras have, they been
24 replaced or are they're in the que of processed to be
25

2 replaced or is there a plan to replace them and can
3 you let us know?

4 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, so at this time
5 I'm going to answer two of your questions...

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
7 talk]

8 CAROLYN JASPER: ..presently NYCHA has a
9 total of 16,566 cameras, this is across 207
10 developments, 1,443 buildings and 1,984 total
11 addresses.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so, so
13 out of those cameras, so all of those cameras
14 currently are operating?

15 CAROLYN JASPER: At this point I can't... I
16 don't want to say that they're all operating because
17 we have not gone and asked staff to have a recent
18 survey however, I would like to explain to you what
19 the process is at the property management level..
20 [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CAROLYN JASPER: ...for these small-scale
24 CCTVs that are in place. So, property management is
25 required, right, to have a designated individual

2 check the system daily at the development location so
3 that is their responsibility, if for some reason
4 there's a malfunction or perhaps there is an issue
5 with a camera they're responsible to put in a work
6 order and that way our CCTV unit will address any
7 repairs that are required.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: You, you said
9 in the small scale... [cross-talk]

10 CAROLYN JASPER: I'm sorry, yes, small
11 scale TV... what I would like to do is I would like to
12 have Raymond Rodriguez who I... is our Director of the
13 Office of Safety and Security come up and he can
14 explain to you a little bit more in depth about our
15 CCTV cameras.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, that's
17 perfect because those are my next line of questions
18 to Mr. Rodriguez so I'll just...

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
20 hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
21 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
22 before this committee and to respond honestly to
23 Council Member questions?

24 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes, I do.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Before you get
3 start... before you answer that question Mr. Rodriguez,
4 give me a second... okay, you can continue.

5 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Good morning,
6 basically Raymond Rodriguez as Director of the Office
7 of Safety and Security I am responsible for the
8 physical security, the CCTV unit and the resident
9 watch program which all play a major part in the
10 safety and security of our residents and their
11 communities. Thank you again for your question. In
12 regards to the life expectancy of the cameras it's
13 usually ten years, once a service call is made that
14 something is not working properly whether it's a
15 camera or whether it's the infrastructure recording
16 the, the footage basically we have 48 hours to
17 basically correct that issue and that's something
18 that basically comes from my office, my team from
19 CCTV.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so
21 you're responsible for protecting the authority's
22 properties, employees and residents?

23 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: That's correct.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just so we can
25 be like just clear and plain and simple because

2 everybody already know I just want to get right to
3 the point. In my opening statement I mentioned that
4 an 83 year old woman, Miss James was killed in
5 Woodson Houses, right, she was beaten to death in her
6 apartment and no one knows who killed her, 83 year
7 old in Woodson Houses and so I would like to know if
8 this office is in place and all of the work that
9 you've done related to cameras over the past 20 years
10 how does a... how does an 83 year old woman get killed
11 in her apartment and no one knows who killed and
12 before you answer that question I also want to state
13 that in the same building a couple of years prior to
14 that an 84 year old woman was killed in her
15 apartment, same exact building so can you... so, in
16 order for us to understand what NYCHA is doing
17 related to safety and security and layered access
18 doors and cameras and lighting can you explain to me
19 how this happened in order to better understand the
20 work that you do?

21 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Understood...

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

23 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: It's a very
24 unfortunate... [cross-talk]

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And, and the
3 reason why I said the same... [cross-talk]

4 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yep... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...building is...
6 [cross-talk]

7 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Correct... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...because I
9 need for you to explain that two years later like
10 were there cameras installed, were... you know like
11 just explain to us the process in what you do?

12 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Okay, like I
13 mentioned before it's a very unfortunate incident, my
14 heart goes out to their families, okay, our goal in
15 our department is basically to ensure the safety and
16 security of all our residents is basically paramount.
17 Regarding the question, unfortunately there are no
18 cameras to this day over at Woodson so basically
19 that's something that we have already gotten pricing
20 and so forth and so on basically to put the
21 infrastructure into the development with additional
22 camera resources and that's where we're at, at this
23 point in time.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, this is a
25 senior building?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: That's... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How many...

[cross-talk]

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...correct... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...seniors live in that development?

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: I don't have the total numbers, but we will get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, somebody could find that out. And, and Carter... the... so, the Woodson Houses where this woman was murdered two years ago and then Miss James was murdered May 1st of this year, right, two years last and there was still no cameras so explain to me how that happens and what's the process for like the, the... is... there's a level of urgency or like an expedited process of getting cameras to a development where you know that a senior was murdered and this development, this building is directly across the street from a MAP site, from Van Dyke Houses.

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: So, basically at this point in time we are expediting to get something in

2 place as soon as possible regarding the cameras at
3 that location.

4 CAROLYN JASPER: Excuse me Council
5 Member, thank you for your question, again it was a
6 sad situation as to what occurred, you know our
7 hearts go out to the family and it was a very
8 unfortunate situation. I would like to emphasize that
9 safety is an issue that the New York City Housing
10 Authority we take very seriously and we're working
11 together collaboratively with the NYPD and MOCJ to
12 deter crime wherever possible but at this time
13 regarding your questions relating to, you know the
14 incidences I would like to refer your question over
15 to PD so that way they could perhaps provide more
16 insight if they have additional information on what
17 may have occurred, thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you want to
19 talk about the investigation?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: That's called
21 the pun...

22 JAMES SECRETO: Well good morning, good
23 morning Madame Chair and Chairman Richards. There are
24 two homicides in that building, 393 Powell Street,
25 they're both under investigation and you know I can't

2 really speak much to that but they are under active
3 investigation and we have beefed up our coverage of
4 those... that, that address as... you know in regards to,
5 you know in response to these... to the latter... the
6 latest incident for sure, that building had not
7 particularly been a problem for us, it was a senior
8 building and there's not much crime there normally
9 but that's an egregious crime nonetheless and we
10 beefed up our security in coordination with the 73
11 precinct and Chief... put together a plan for safety at
12 that building going forward.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. Mr.
14 Rodriguez?

15 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Can you speak
17 to the work that falls under your department related
18 to resident watch and like what is that and is there
19 someone that can speak to tenant but I'm going to end
20 my questions there, tenant patrol if that falls under
21 you or if that even exists?

22 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you for
23 your question, basically the resident watch program
24 does fall under our department, basically at this
25 point in time we're... our recruiting efforts continue

2 and in addition to that basically we're trying to
3 also recruit youth as well who are actively
4 interested in keeping their communities safe. In
5 addition to that there is no resident watch at the
6 Woodson Houses. Let me correct that, I just got the
7 answer for the total residents at Woodson, it's 433
8 residents at that location.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I'm
10 actually going to stop with my questions so that my
11 Co-Chair can get to his questions, I, I have a ton of
12 other questions, but can you repeat the number again
13 of seniors that live in Woodson?

14 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: 433, 433.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: 433 seniors,
16 so I just wanted to highlight the fact that that's
17 not a small building, right and even if it was it's
18 still a serious issue and you know clearly if you
19 have two brutal murders of an 83 year old and an 84
20 year old in a development and it's directly across
21 the street from a MAP site there's something that we
22 should be doing, it should not have taken two years
23 so with that I'm going to stop and yield over to my
24 Co-Chair.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
3 Chair. So, let's, let's start with one question and
4 this is going to go to Chief Secreto first, how often
5 does the NYPD conduct security assessments of NYCHA
6 developments? No outbursts please, we're just trying
7 to get information. So, how often do assessments get
8 made in NYCHA, do you request assessment from NYPD as
9 well or do you do your own security assessments as
10 well and if so whom in NYCHA would be a part of that?

11 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council...
12 thank you Council Member for that question. My office
13 does conduct security and safety assessments at the
14 developments during the entire year on a yearly
15 basis.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And how, how
17 many people are in your department?

18 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: At this point in time
19 the actual people that go out and do the assessments
20 are usually about 12 individuals.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, 12
22 individuals go out and do... [cross-talk]

23 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Assessments... [cross-
24 talk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ..assessments of
3 every development in New York City?

4 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: That is correct, on
5 a... on a cycle.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No outbursts
7 please, please.

8 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: On a cycle.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: What is... what
10 is the cycle?

11 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Basically, we would
12 conduct approximately 40 within a quarter, 40
13 developments and that also is in addition to the
14 consolidations as well.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Let me ask you
16 a question, so, so they go out and, and who gets this
17 information on the assessments?

18 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: We pass on all the
19 discrepancies over to the property manager and then
20 it's escalated to the borough management to put in
21 work tickets and get these issues rectified.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Is there any
23 transparent... so, can I go online right now and search
24 anywhere about assessments made at any specific

2 developments in the city right now, is... does the
3 public have access to these assessments?

4 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: I believe they don't.
5 I believe they don't.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: They don't but...
7 so the assessment will go to the property managers
8 and the property managers... [cross-talk]

9 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Documents... [cross-
10 talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...or... say that
12 again.

13 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry to
14 interrupt but basically, it's all... it's all
15 documented and it's in house so it's... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
17 talk]

18 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...available if let's
19 say for example residents wants, wants to reach out
20 and find out what they're... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright...
22 [cross-talk]

23 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...what the issues
24 are... [cross-talk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...I'm going to
3 stop you there.

4 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, I think the
6 first step is to ensure that we have a transparent
7 mechanism that ensures the public and forgive me once
8 again, I really am in a lot of pain today so I'm
9 going to sound a little weird but the pain that
10 residents are going through are nothing that, that
11 I'm certainly at this moment. So, there's no public
12 transparent measures for us... so, can the City Council
13 gain access to all of these assessments, is there any
14 mechanism for that to happen? So, if we requested
15 assessments for every development in New York City
16 can you get that information readily available within
17 24 hours?

18 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Not at this point.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Not at this
20 point.

21 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: We... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Once that
23 information is... so, we're, we're going to request
24 that by the way so let me put that on the record, we
25 are interested in seeing every assessment for every

2 development in New York City so we would appreciate
3 that information being made available to us. So, then
4 that information is passed on to the property manager
5 you said?

6 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Correct..

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Whose job it is
8 to put in a ticket.

9 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Correct.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Correct?

11 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes, sir.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, we're on
13 the record now.

14 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Are we sure
16 that every property manager is putting in tickets? No
17 outbursts.

18 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: At this point in time
19 I would have to get back to you on that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And you're in
21 charge of security for NYCHA?

22 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: That is correct.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Folks quite down
25 please.

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY 65

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I will just say
3 in my own dealings with property managers and I don't
4 want to beat a dead horse, I'm not saying all of them
5 are bad but certainly I often find that the property
6 managers have no idea what the heck is going on at
7 their own development. So, are we sure that property
8 managers are actually walking around every day and
9 I'm not even sure whether we need an assessment made
10 by some specific unit every day, if property managers
11 are walking around and checking the doors they would
12 know if they are locked? So, if I went to Red Fern
13 Houses in Far Rockaway today and I checked every door
14 are we positive that every door is locked?

15 CAROLYN JASPER: Council Member, thank
16 you for your question, I would like to provide some...
17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No, no, no, I
19 want him to answer, okay. He's in charge of security.

20 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: At this point... at
21 this point in time I know that Red Fern is under
22 construction.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I don't... I
24 don't want the political answer, I'm saying today are
25 you confident, forget construction, forget NYCHA,

2 forget Redfern... don't forget Redfern but are you
3 positive that every development in New York city
4 right now has a door that is looked?

5 CAROLYN JASPER: You can't confirm that
6 the doors are locked but they are doing daily
7 assessments of the doors.

8 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: At this... at this
9 point in time I cannot confirm that, but the property
10 management normally has... been assigned to do daily
11 assessment regarding doors, entry ways... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
13 talk]

14 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...anything on their
15 properties... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, but
17 you're not confident that that's happening. And
18 what's the checks and balances in them reporting to
19 you that every door is locked, that every camera is
20 working, who would oversee the process of ensuring
21 the cameras are actually functioning?

22 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: That, that would be
23 the property manager and then it... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright. Okay,
25 let me... let me... like let me go... because I, I think

2 you're, you're... yeah, you're adding a lot... I think 12
3 people is a deficient amount of individuals to
4 oversee all the security assessments for NYCHA, I
5 probably know the answer to this, I know it's not
6 happening... [cross-talk]

7 CAROLYN JASPER: Excuse... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...I also want to
9 know so, how often and it goes back to Chief Secreto,
10 how often... so, when these assessments are made is
11 NYPD there?

12 CAROLYN JASPER: I would like to respond
13 if, if you don't mind.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Sure.

15 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, thank you. So, in
16 response to your question regarding the daily
17 inspection of doors, property managers or
18 superintendents, right, are responsible daily for
19 ensuring that their staff conduct... we have a form, a
20 checklist called the supervisor of caretaker's daily
21 checklist, our, our staff are responsible for
22 checking the doors daily if they find that a door is
23 open it is their responsibility to notify their
24 supervisor and put a, a request, that the supervisor
25 put a work order in for the repair of that door, once

2 that work order goes in the maintenance worker is
3 required to inspect the door, if they're able to
4 repair the door they will make that repair, if they
5 are unable to make, make the repair then they will
6 have to refer that door to a vendor and have that
7 door repaired. Councilman I would also like to give
8 you some data regarding some of the inspections that
9 were done. According to our data we have a total of
10 62,625 work orders that were created in the past 12
11 months from June the 18th to May 2019, those were for
12 public space doors. As of May 31st we have a total of
13 2,582 work orders that are open, I would like to be
14 very clear that those work orders that are reflected
15 as being open those work orders reflect our public
16 space doors as well as our front entrance and our
17 rear exit doors so the total throughout the city is
18 2,582 as of the date that this report was run and I
19 would also like to inform you also that during
20 meetings that I have as a vice president with the
21 borough directors one of the topics that we normally
22 talk about on our agenda is the checklist, the daily
23 checklist, the safety and security as ensuring that
24 when these work orders are being made for both doors
25 and intercoms that our staff that they're following

1
2 up and they're making the repairs as quite... as
3 required, can I sit here today and say every door is
4 locked, no I cannot do that but I can tell you that
5 it is our procedure that our staff check the doors
6 every day. Did I receive confirmation that our staff
7 are performing the daily checklists, yes, I did reach
8 out to our department directors and I asked them to
9 verify that the staff are ensuring that they are
10 performing the caretaker's daily checklist daily.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, so I
12 think that's daily for today but I'm saying every
13 day, where... who... so, you would get... so, they... so,
14 managers would check the list and then who would get
15 that information, would it go to him?

16 CAROLYN JASPER: No, it doesn't... [cross-
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
19 talk]

20 CAROLYN JASPER: ...the, the, the repair of
21 the doors are the responsibility at the local level
22 so the manager and superintendent are responsible for
23 creating work orders and also sending a maintenance
24 worker, if the maintenance worker cannot fix the door
25 then it is the property manager maintenance

2 supervisor's responsibility to follow up to procure a
3 contractor in order to do that work.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, I want
5 to... I want to move from this question I asked because
6 my question was not answered. How many times... when...
7 so, when these assessments are made are NYPD... is NYPD
8 there when assessments are done?

9 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: No, they are not.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And why would
11 they not be included in security assessments for
12 NYCHA housing?

13 [off mic dialogue]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, I'm going
15 to... because I don't want answers created but the, the
16 point of this hearing is for us to think things
17 through and to make it better so that residents feel...
18 can feel safe and I find it troubling, I won't say
19 the word I really think, that the NYPD would not be
20 on grounds with you when assessments are being made.
21 Let me go back to Chief Secreto for a second, I mean
22 being that I know now that NYCHA does not request
23 your presence at assessments, does, does your... does
24 the NYPD ever make recommendations where cameras or
25 lighting should be placed?

2 JAMES SECRETO: Yes, yes Councilman we,
3 we do make recommendations, as a matter of fact I
4 think when these cameras were... I think they were
5 recently upgraded, the small scale, the CCTV cameras
6 were upgraded, the, the... NYCHA and the commander of
7 those PSAs went out and decided where the... they
8 should be placed or they were already placed
9 initially but if they had any changes to be made the
10 Commander of the PSA was, was there as well.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But originally
12 you weren't brought in at the beginning of the...
13 [cross-talk]

14 JAMES SECRETO: No, I, I, I believe the
15 commanders of the PSAs had a say in where, where the
16 cameras were placed.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, let's
18 stay with the you for a second Chief so over the last
19 decade or so violent crime has decreased across the
20 city, can you say the same for NYCHA, where are we at
21 with NYCHA now?

22 JAMES SECRETO: Yes, we... in NYCHA we have
23 pretty much mirrored the, the crime that the city has
24 had, that the city has enjoyed. For example, index
25 crime and I... and I'll go back to 1995 which the

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But Brooklyn
3 North and I... and I appreciate and I have a great debt
4 of respect for you in... for the work that you do
5 certainly day in and day out but the question I have
6 is Brooklyn North has certainly been going off,
7 right, I mean we've seen murder after murder; seven
8 year old shot last night, as he was protecting his
9 grandmother I think I read, read this morning so even
10 with those numbers and it sounds great there are
11 pockets of the city that fail under siege, which
12 strategies are the NYPD using to combat this feeling
13 in the air that people can't sit outside again or you
14 know children can't play on the streets of Brooklyn?

15 JAMES SECRETO: Okay, Councilman you're,
16 you're right Brooklyn North, out of the 60 shootings
17 that we've had so far this year 21 are in Brooklyn
18 North so a third of the shootings are in Brooklyn
19 North but... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And were these
21 at MAP sites or no? One of them is a... [cross-talk]

22 JAMES SECRETO: I know Bushwick has one,
23 Ingersoll has... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
25 talk]

2 JAMES SECRETO: ...I think two so some of
3 them are, are the MAP sites but they're pretty much
4 spread out, there's, there's one development with
5 three shootings with seven... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Which
7 development... [cross-talk]

8 JAMES SECRETO: ...developments... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...is that?

11 JAMES SECRETO: That development is St.
12 Nicholas.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay.

14 JAMES SECRETO: And there's seven
15 developments with two shootings, you want... you want
16 the names on those, the seven developments with two
17 and then there's like 43 with one. So, there's Coney
18 Island, Ingersoll, Marcy, Morris, Queensbridge,
19 Ravenswood and Tompkins they have two each.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, let me...
21 let me go to the NCO program for a second. So, NCOs
22 are tasked with doing community work, building
23 bridges historically with communities that have not
24 had a great relationship with the police department,
25

2 can you speak to what the NCOs are specifically doing
3 at NYCHA housing?

4 JAMES SECRETO: They're kind of tasked
5 with doing everything, how, however they... and they
6 are well trained, I think it was Miss Bennett that
7 alluded to... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: They're not
9 getting trained every day like she said, right, that
10 could just be an excuse.

11 JAMES SECRETO: That... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And you can't
13 blame the City Council for regulating NCOs... [cross-
14 talk]

15 JAMES SECRETO: No... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, so... but...
17 [cross-talk]

18 JAMES SECRETO: They're... they are...
19 [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that training...
21 [cross-talk]

22 JAMES SECRETO: No, they are well
23 trained, we send them... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But they're not
25 going every day like she said... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

JAMES SECRETO: ...not, not every day...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Correct...

JAMES SECRETO: But they are well
trained... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
talk]

JAMES SECRETO: ...and you know we use them
for a lot and they are... you know they're kind of
like, like community affairs but more so they are
tasked with forging relationships with the community,
with the property manager certainly when there's an
incident, they're out there looking at the cameras
and identifying perpetrators and they, they also
solve crimes that in years past would not... would not
get solved because nobody would speak to the police,
people feel more comfortable giving them information,
they also like I said they do these extended video
canvasses where they look at cameras for blocks and
blocks and they're able to identify people involved.
They're just kind of like... and they, they're also
tasked with problem solving so we took a, a look at
the NeighborhoodStat meeting and, and some of the
things that came out of that meeting was, was... and I

2 think again Miss Bennett alluded to the fire
3 department breaking the doors that came up at one of
4 these meetings, the collection of the... of the garbage
5 came up at one of these meetings and those NCOs are
6 part of this... the problem solving mechanism so one of
7 the things Polo Grounds again the... it came out at one
8 of these meetings that people were parking their cars
9 on the grounds now back in the days that you also
10 alluded to in your remarks about the heavy handed
11 policing, we probably would have told some people,
12 gave them some summonses, the officers went to the
13 property manager and tried to identify who these
14 people were that were parking on the grounds so that
15 was their first course of action, finding out who
16 owns the cars to get the cars moved so not just right
17 away towing people and giving them summonses so
18 that's the type of work that the, the NCOs are doing
19 and the type of work they're doing in collaboration
20 with NYCHA.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Now let me talk
22 about CompStat for a second, so I know we always see
23 housing numbers, are, are we doing a better job at
24 breaking down by borough, you know the specific
25 development so we can track, how do we track exactly

2 what crimes are going on and then that, that sort of
3 is a Segway for me going into summonses in NYCHA
4 housing too, in 2008 the NYPD housing PSAs issued
5 8,388 summonses in NYCHA developments, over 2,000
6 were criminal summonses. What was the most common
7 offence for criminal summonses issued and then if you
8 can speak to how many arrests of summonses the NYPD
9 issued for trespassing related offences last year as
10 well?

11 JAMES SECRETO: My, my guess would be
12 that they were marijuana related and... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Still going
14 after weed.

15 JAMES SECRETO: What's that?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I said we still
17 going after weed... [cross-talk]

18 JAMES SECRETO: Are you say... what... you
19 said 2008 though, right... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, oh, 2000...
21 okay, no I said 2018.

22 JAMES SECRETO: Okay, 2018... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: 2018. So, there
24 were 8,388 summonses in NYCHA developments, over
25 2,000 were criminal summonses.

2 JAMES SECRETO: 2018, I have... I have
3 3,132 C-summonses in 2018...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Can you just
5 speak to what that... what that means?

6 JAMES SECRETO: And as far as... that was
7 criminal court summonses so more than... more than
8 likely they're marijuana, I'm going to look here...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, that was
10 two... what was the number?

11 JAMES SECRETO: 18... in 2018 we had 19,
12 1,900 and 19 marijuana summonses and that's all...
13 [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And that was
15 all over marijuana... [cross-talk]

16 JAMES SECRETO: That's all nine PSAs and,
17 and the response teams that we had... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And that was...
19 so, out of the two... wait, so C-summonses 19... over
20 1,900 for... yeah, if you could just...

21 JAMES SECRETO: Okay. Alright, those were
22 arrests that I just gave you, the 1,900... the 1,919 so
23 I can't speak to the, the summonses but I'm, I'm
24 hazarding a guess that they're largely marijuana

2 related but, but now with that being said, you know
3 this year we're at 96.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: You're at 96..
5 [cross-talk]

6 JAMES SECRETO: We're at 96.. [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...of those
8 summonses..

9 JAMES SECRETO: ...so, you know it's... and
10 that's arrests, marijuana related arrests.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And were those..
12 would you attribute those marijuana arrests, you know
13 this is a subject, I love to speak about, would you
14 attribute that to violent crime or..

15 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Well I, I mean Council
16 Member let me just chime in for a second, I think
17 this is the 1,919 number was in 2018 I think what
18 that captures is a time prior to the adjustment of
19 our policy and your, you.. we worked with you on that
20 and you were aware of that during the process as we
21 rolled it out so post new policy relative to how we
22 treat smoking marijuana in public, we're down from
23 the 1,919 number, we're at 96 now which means it met
24 the criteria that was outlined in the.. in the new
25 policy. So, the numbers are.. I mean I think we would

2 agree the numbers are down substantially, I mean I
3 think you, you're also aware of, you know the
4 conversation going on in Albany and if there is an
5 adjustment in the law I think the numbers would wind
6 up reflecting that as well but at, at least now I
7 think citywide the number of summonses are down I
8 think 90 percent... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah and let
10 me... let me just say this I would hope we're focusing
11 our recourses on violent crime offenders; you know
12 not the... and I'm... I know it's a quality of life
13 issue, my seniors don't want to smell marijuana
14 either but you know I would hope that resources are
15 really being devoted to the developments that really
16 need help, you know to, to go after issues that are
17 serious not, not somebody smoking weed on a bench..
18 [cross-talk]

19 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: I, I... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...and then I...
21 and then I also did not hear more about trespassing
22 so can you just speak to how many trespassing related
23 arrests or summonses took place last year?

24

25

2 JAMES SECRETO: That, that, that's way
3 down as well, I'll get those numbers for you but
4 Councilman if, if I may... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
6 talk]

7 JAMES SECRETO: ...you know... you, you spoke
8 about the interior patrols in your remarks and you
9 know that's, that's a big tool for us not necessarily
10 for arrests but to, you know make sure that... you know
11 that people are doing the right things in, in the
12 buildings so we have, you know homeless situations,
13 we have drug use, we have delivery men being robbed
14 when they come to make a delivery so there's
15 different incidents, things are going on inside the
16 buildings that need to be addressed and having grown
17 up in housing I can tell you firsthand that if we
18 knew the police were never coming in the building we
19 would have a field day when I lived there so there
20 has to be some presence of the police coming in and
21 people having that fear that hey, the cops could come
22 through any minute, it's not designed... well I can't
23 speak to what it was designed for but I can speak to
24 what I want now, I don't want the meaning all arrests
25 that, that, that I guess you're talking about as far

2 as marijuana and trespassing but with that being said
3 we want to make sure that the, the building is safe
4 for the people that live there.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I'm going
6 to begin to wrap up, I'll come back for a second..
7 [cross-talk]

8 JAMES SECRETO: Okay...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...round for my
10 colleagues but... [cross-talk]

11 JAMES SECRETO: Can I just get through
12 the trespass?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah.

14 JAMES SECRETO: Last year was 979..
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
17 talk]

18 JAMES SECRETO: ...and this year so... is
19 projected to be 580 at the end of the year... [cross-
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay and I want
22 to thank you, I think that's, that's important work
23 because we... like we said earlier we can't incarcerate
24 our way out of these issues. Can you go through
25 misdemeanor arrests now, in 2018 the PSAs made 10,665

2 arrests in NYCHA developments, 73 percent were
3 misdemeanor arrests and then more than half of all of
4 those arrests were just in four housing PSAs, PSA
5 four, five, seven and eight, can you go through what
6 are driving these arrests and then I'm interested in
7 hearing from MOCJ and others before I, I come back
8 for another round on what are the strategies being
9 utilized around violent crime and particular around
10 NYCHA housing and I find.. in, in your testimony I
11 think it was MOCJ you spoke of 50,000 dollars.. 50,000
12 per development for.. do you think that's enough or do
13 we need more money for programs, when you talk about
14 50,000 dollars for MAP programs it doesn't in
15 particularly show to me in my opinion a real
16 commitment on the administration's part to really
17 have a full blown program in public housing and I'm
18 just.. I want to use the example of cure violence, the
19 crisis management system for instance which can be a
20 real answer to, to, to going.. to, to resolving crime
21 in a whole.. with a holistic approach, how many of
22 these PSAs, how many of these developments have the
23 crisis management system wrapped around them because
24 to me that would be taking a more holistic approach
25 in addressing crime but 50,000 dollars to me is

2 inadequate when you're talking about real programming
3 in addressing crime in neighborhoods. So, I'm going
4 to end on those two things, I could come back, you
5 could get back to me on misdemeanors, NYCHA you
6 heard.. I'm not seeing a real plan right now, I'm not
7 feeling like we are taking a true transparent and
8 aggressive approach in making residents feel safe,
9 no, we're not going to put this all on the police
10 department's doorstep but it is your authority and
11 based on the answers that you gave me today you got a
12 hell of a lot of work to make sure that your managers
13 are actually taking security seriously.

14 JAMES SECRETO: Councilman can I respond
15 to your, your question? Now we're down 2,000 crime..
16 arrests, 2,000 arrests so we had 6,200 last year at
17 this time and we have 4,100 this year and they're all
18 misdemeanors, 2,000 less.. [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: What's the most
20 common misdemeanor charge?

21 JAMES SECRETO: I'm going to say.. I'm
22 going to say it's either marijuana or trespassing but
23 Councilman if I may..

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Go ahead.

2 JAMES SECRETO: On April 20th in Mott
3 Haven Development we had a... we had a murder that
4 emanated from guys drinking and smoking marijuana in
5 a... in a courtyard and they rested the, the liquor...
6 the cups on a... on a 17 year old's... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But that's,
8 that's... [cross-talk]

9 JAMES SECRETO: ...windowsill... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but that's
11 speculation at this moment, you know... I mean and I
12 get that murder... [cross-talk]

13 JAMES SECRETO: I mean... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...you... and I
15 don't want to attribute... [cross-talk]

16 JAMES SECRETO: No, that's a fact...
17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that to
19 marijuana... [cross-talk]

20 JAMES SECRETO: That's a fact... that's a
21 fact, that's a fact... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right, okay,
23 okay... [cross-talk]

24 JAMES SECRETO: ...that that's what this,
25 this murder started over because... [cross-talk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right, but one
3 murder out of all of these misdemeanors and
4 summonses, if, if you're telling me that marijuana is
5 the reason this 83-year-old died... [cross-talk]

6 JAMES SECRETO: No, no, no... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that's, that's
8 not... [cross-talk]

9 JAMES SECRETO: ...no, I'm not saying that
10 sir... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that's not the
12 reason, right?

13 JAMES SECRETO: No, I'm not saying it
14 because they were drinking as well... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right... [cross-
16 talk]

17 JAMES SECRETO: But, but the thing is
18 they were congregating... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Because how do
20 we know whether it was alcohol or weed.

21 JAMES SECRETO: What's... sir?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No, I'm saying
23 how do we know whether it was alcohol or weed that
24 caused it, so I don't want to attribute...

2 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: But I mean Council,
3 Council Member if I could just... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah, uh-huh...
5 [cross-talk]

6 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...if I could just add,
7 I mean I, I think... we got your point and we, we've
8 kind of been through this topic through a number of
9 hearings and it seems to come up and in response what
10 we did was we did redraft our policy, I think you
11 would agree you see a significant decrease in the
12 amount of enforcement but it needs to be acknowledged
13 and I, I think you acknowledge it and you've been...
14 we've been to your... to your district for public
15 safety, town halls and forums and I'm sure the
16 residents that are here in the audience will tell you
17 there are issues that are raised to the police
18 department about smoking marijuana, about
19 trespassing. There was a lady that testified in the
20 first panel that talked about people loitering in
21 the... in the hallways... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
23 talk]

24 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...or in the stairwells
25 and urinating in the stairwells, we need certain

2 tools and we clearly don't overuse those tools, but
3 it is the law nevertheless, the laws are on the books
4 and we need some mechanism... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right... [cross-
6 talk]

7 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...to address the...
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I get that
10 Oleg but that's, that's not the issue, the issue is
11 that you got broken doors, you have security system
12 cameras that NYCHA doesn't even know if works, you
13 know there are a myriad of problems and I'm not going
14 to just associate it with marijuana, you know that's
15 beside the point, if you have broken doors that
16 anybody could walk through at any time of the day
17 that's, that's, that's a gateway to, to a problem and
18 it's not... damn sure not weed and, and also, you know
19 the NYPD should be devoting it's resources to more
20 serious crimes so, we're spending all our time going
21 after low level marijuana offenders that's, that's
22 not the answer in my opinion so I will come back for
23 a second round, I do appreciate the work you've done
24 on reducing the disparity... well not disparities but
25 the numbers but we, we... there's no... it... to me it

2 seems like there's no clear strategy with NYCHA to
3 blame first but NYPD also and I would say playing a
4 role here as well or lack thereof a role and a
5 cohesive strategic plan coming together to do
6 assessments together to address issues around public
7 safety in public housing so I'll leave it at that but
8 we got a lot of work to do.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
10 Council Member Antonio Reynoso thank you for your
11 patience and I know you do have to go to BNT.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, thank
13 you for that Chairs, it's just very important that I
14 be here today because I represent Bushwick Houses
15 which was recently named the most dangerous
16 development in the city of New York in a... in an
17 article in some publication, I don't necessarily
18 think it's the most dangerous development but it's
19 building a, a reputation that I'm not happy with and
20 I think that NYCHA, the NYPD, the admin has fell
21 extremely short in trying to address the issues that
22 we have in Bushwick Houses across the board and I'm
23 going to start by saying I sponsor a basketball
24 league every single year where I have about 160 kids
25 participate and we've had to move it to a neighboring

2 development because the parents don't want the kids
3 playing outside, we have a softball field that hasn't
4 had a permit for a softball game outside of a cops
5 versus kids one time over the last seven years so no...
6 not one game in that ball field, brand new, beautiful
7 ball field. There is a woman that was killed and then
8 a neighbor who peeked out of the door to see what
9 happened and also got killed, we don't have... we don't
10 know who killed either of those folks, we have
11 cameras everywhere in Bushwick Houses and it doesn't
12 seem like it means anything. I've asked for... and I
13 would love to ask you guys what... I feel like there's
14 no coordination happening like what is... I wanted to
15 ask for example Secreto, Chief, what is the city
16 doing that is different in this development outside
17 of MAP that they're not doing anywhere else, do you
18 know what the city is doing outside of MAP in this
19 development in Bushwick Houses that is supposed to be
20 the most dangerous outside of anywhere else, do you
21 know what they are doing?

22 JAMES SECRETO: Well, you know I think
23 the Mayor's Office probably can add to, to that
24 question but I know the, the Cornerstone community
25 centers are open but that's... there's 119 of those so

2 it's not to your question... to your point it's not
3 just a MAP, there's social services, there's
4 resources, you know police resources but again to
5 your point we put resources where they're needed
6 whether it's map or not so, you know I, I don't know
7 what the answer to that is, you know other than...
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I guess what I'm
10 saying is that you're just going to do what you do
11 and I don't think that works, right, you can't just
12 use the similar protocols across the board to keep
13 addressing issues the same way, there needs to be a
14 targeted approach in certain developments that is, is
15 different to try to get different outcomes because
16 you guys all talked about the decrease in crime,
17 that's not happening in north Brooklyn, in north
18 Brooklyn over the last three years there's been an
19 increase in crime and what there hasn't been has been
20 an increase in resources from the city to address
21 those issues. We have a... now we have a... I call it a
22 cure violence light because I've been asking for cure
23 violence for the last four years in Bushwick Houses
24 and the city has told me no, last year they gave me
25 100,000 dollars instead 50 so thank you very much,

1
2 100,000 and then this year we fought again after
3 every single murder that happens you guys give me
4 another 50,000 dollars, that's how... that's how I see
5 you guys talking to me about this issue, I don't
6 think that's appropriate, I think we need to be
7 proactive, I don't want to keep seeing one of my
8 young people die, a young person that works, that's
9 lives in the development, plays basketball in my
10 league and also goes to the Cornerstone died in this
11 development as... and then I got another 50,000 for
12 that, I don't think these kid's lives are worth
13 50,000 at a time, that's not acceptable. You need to
14 have a comprehensive approach as to how you're going
15 to deal with this, to have a security person come in,
16 do an assessment, give it to the property managers
17 and never do any follow up to see if his assessment
18 was handled is, is just not good management and I
19 feel like it's amateur hour and I can't have Bushwick
20 Houses be run amateurly, it needs to be run
21 professionally in order to deal with these issues.
22 So, what I'm asking today is we should get a cure
23 violence light over there so that we could see... cure
24 violence not a cure violence light which is what I...
25 so that we can have real resources come to these

2 kids. I've asked for an expansion of the community
3 center, have you been to that community center? It's
4 four or five classrooms and the smallest gym where
5 you can't even take a jump shot in, in... and I've
6 asked for that gym to be replaced and NYCHA told me
7 no, I want to be very clear, NYCHA said no, they
8 won't expand the gym, I just want them to bust down a
9 wall and expand it so that the kids can find that
10 and... for it could be an attractive place they said
11 no. The kids two years ago got promised by the
12 Mayor's Office that they would get a recording studio
13 because they said music is the thing that would
14 attract the most kids to the community center, it's
15 been two years they still don't have a community... a
16 recording studio, now I have to pull money out of my
17 discretionary to pay for a promise that you made that
18 you never committed to. So, it's like you show up,
19 you make commitments, you make promises, the kids and
20 people keep dying in this development and you don't
21 fulfill any of them, if you want to deal with this I
22 want you to address the issues of the community
23 center, put in real funding and resources and work
24 coordinated and I don't think that's happening and I
25 want to be clear, I don't want Chief to send me more

2 cops, it's resources so these kids have options and
3 we don't have that, the Cornerstone program is just
4 a, a step in the right direction but it's just a drop
5 in the bucket, we need triage, we need triage and you
6 guys need to go... bring those resources and right now
7 I'm just saying that because it... I feel very
8 uncomfortable that I got to move my kids from
9 Bushwick Houses to go play basketball in Williamsburg
10 Houses and what that means to them, they lost the
11 space, the... there's no laughter in the playgrounds
12 anymore and I think we have... we, we're a part of that
13 problem and I've been saying this for four years.
14 Another thing is that the Cornerstone site, the, the
15 managers of the Cornerstone site left, they closed
16 the Cornerstone site after a shooting and left to
17 Williamsburg Houses and they didn't do any work for a
18 week, that, that place was shut down because they
19 was... they feared for their lives, right and they were
20 doing it as a protest asking for the city to do more
21 and they came back but these kids that live in
22 Bushwick Houses they don't get to close up, they got
23 to go back to Bushwick Houses, they got to deal with
24 that so you guys are falling extremely short, stop
25 giving me 50,000 dollars at a time and throwing chump

2 change at me, these kids deserve more and I, I just
3 wanted to make more of a statement than anything
4 else, would love for you to, to try to respond to
5 this because if you think you can close the gap on
6 what I've been dealing with locally I would love to
7 hear it.

8 CAROLYN JASPER: I thank you for your
9 question and I hear and I understand your concerns, I
10 may not be able to answer some of your questions but
11 I would like to respond to a few of the questions
12 that I may able to respond, for the questions that I
13 can't respond to the Housing Authority will follow up
14 and we will provide you with a response either today
15 at... or at a later time. I would just like to
16 reemphasize again that we at the New York City
17 Housing Authority take safety and security of our
18 residents and our staff very seriously. With that
19 said I would just like to kind of give you a little
20 overview about Bushwick Houses, a few of the points.
21 I don't believe we have any cameras there, NYCHA does
22 not traditionally fund CCTV cameras at our
23 developments so we're talking about safety and
24 security. Once again, we manage property, we're
25 responsible as I mentioned before for inspecting the

2 doors and the intercoms and I can say that our staff
3 is responsible, that is our procedure and the doors
4 are being checked daily. Funding for CCTV systems..
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So.. but do you
7 say.. you can check them daily, are they.. are they..
8 [cross-talk]

9 CAROLYN JASPER: The doors... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...working right
11 now?

12 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, the doors are
13 checked and repaired daily by.. let me finish, by a
14 maintenance worker, if they cannot be addressed by a
15 maintenance worker then it is our responsibility to
16 obtain a vendor, will the vendor be there the same
17 day, no, the vendor will not be there the same day so
18 there may be doors that are open awaiting for staff
19 to.. in order to.. again, we have to procure a vendor..
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Well you're
22 just.. well you're just talking about protocols..
23 [cross-talk]

24 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay... [cross-talk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: The people
3 living over there they don't... they can't deal with
4 protocols, they have open doors every single day so,
5 so you... yeah, you got protocols, I got protocols in
6 my office if they're not working it's for naught and
7 right now we have buildings that don't have... that
8 have open doors...

9 CAROLYN JASPER: Respectfully so, I
10 understand that, and I would just like to also say we
11 also deal with vandalism as well. Many times, some of
12 our doors are opened and sometimes the doors are not
13 necessarily damaged but there may be an object placed
14 in the lock so sometimes when we... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No, they're just
16 opened, you can... we could... we could... I would love for
17 you guys to go to Bushwick... [cross-talk]

18 CAROLYN JASPER: So... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...Houses and make
20 an assessment walking with me but I want to say we
21 went on a trip three years ago to New Jersey to see
22 these new modern ways of how we're going to deal with
23 security in NYCHA where we're going to upgrade the
24 lobbies, have somebody in the lobby present like a
25 security guard that will tell people when they can

2 come in and can't come in, that never came to
3 fruition, we have layered access that doesn't even...
4 that, that I don't know how... it doesn't even work, if
5 we have key fobs and they're supposed to work and
6 we're supposed to have doors that are strong enough
7 to not break down, I just... I just think it's amateur,
8 just... we either got to do it or we don't and this
9 protocol that you're talking about they've done...
10 they've always done this protocol, you're not telling
11 me anything different than I've heard six years ago
12 about how you're going to address safety but what has
13 happened in those last years is an increase in crime,
14 an increase in murders. My young people are like
15 dying so I just feel like you need a different
16 approach, I don't want to hear protocol anymore...

17 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Be creative and,
19 and I don't think that creative exists right now in
20 NYCHA... [cross-talk]

21 CAROLYN JASPER: Respectfully so, if you
22 would just like me to make a few other points and
23 I'll be... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: But let's get to
25 the points then... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CAROLYN JASPER: Sure, okay... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...and, and... so I
4 can go... [cross-talk]

5 CAROLYN JASPER: I will, so Bushwick
6 Houses is a participant in the Mayor's action plan
7 for neighborhood safety MAP and an initiative led by
8 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, MOCJ, the
9 number of CCTV cameras at development varies based
10 upon availability of funds, when NYCHA receives
11 funding for CCTV systems it prioritizes our
12 installation at front and back entrances, if there is
13 sufficient funding CCTV cameras may also be installed
14 in elevators, on building exteriors, development
15 grounds... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So, you're
17 trying to tell me... [cross-talk]

18 CAROLYN JASPER: ...and or window landings...
19 [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...that you want
21 me to fund CCTV cameras for Bushwick Houses?

22 CAROLYN JASPER: Well I'm, I'm mentioning
23 that this how CCTV cameras are funded so if we can
24 receive the funding in order to fund... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: How many
3 buildings are in Bushwick Houses and then I want you
4 to tell me how much it costs for me... [cross-talk]

5 CAROLYN JASPER: We will get that info...
6 [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...as an
8 individual Council Member that gets five million
9 dollars a year to, to, to give to my entire community
10 related to parks, schools, libraries, NYCHA, I handle
11 all that, how much is one building worth of CCTV
12 cameras and then I want you to tell me how many
13 buildings are in Bushwick Houses and then I want you
14 to tell me how much it costs and... [cross-talk]

15 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...how you're
17 going to put... I mean I want to talk about Donovan
18 Richards has... how many buildings are in Redfern?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: About 15.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: 15 buildings and
21 you want him to, to install cameras in Redfern so,
22 the Council Members that have NYCHA developments in
23 their district have a burden to provide cameras for
24 you and if you have no... [cross-talk]

25 CAROLYN JASPER: No... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...if you have no
3 NYCHA in your development you could put them to
4 parks, you can make the schools look nicer, you could
5 fix libraries, but we have to deal with safety.

6 CAROLYN JASPER: I'm sorry Council Member
7 I'd just like to make a correction, that previously
8 Bushwick Houses has received 4.56 million dollars in
9 investments for new lighting, CCTV cameras and
10 layered access controls and I believe that you did
11 fund that so we thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So, so, wait a
13 minute but... first they said we didn't fund it then
14 they find out I did five point... 4.5 million dollars
15 my problem is not that, my problem is that it's just
16 the same... my... I feel bad that I gave the 4.5 million
17 to you for cameras, I should have given it to the
18 community center so we could expand the gym so the
19 kids could do better. What I'm saying is I don't
20 think we're talking, there's not enough
21 communication, coordination going on to address this
22 issue and I feel like I'm doing it alone with my
23 community and that there's not enough help, it's a
24 crisis in Bushwick and I'm... I hope you hear my
25 urgency...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes...

3 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...and I don't
4 even want to... I, I just feel uncomfortable hearing..
5 because you're not going to give me solutions, you're
6 just going to talk about what you do, and I don't
7 like what you do.

8 CAROLYN JASPER: Thank you, any other of
9 your concerns I would ask if you could please
10 intervene... [cross-talk]

11 RENITA FRANCIOS: I, I want to... [cross-
12 talk]

13 CAROLYN JASPER: Thank you... [cross-talk]

14 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...first I want to say I,
15 I appreciate your passion and your frustration, and I
16 respect it, that's number one. Council Member
17 Richards asked earlier about the 50,000 dollars, you
18 brought up 50,000 dollars and I can say as a person
19 who grew up in a low-income housing situation who
20 knows what it's like to sleep... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Uh-huh... [cross-
22 talk]

23 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...up against mold, to
24 have bullets come through your window... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Uh-huh... [cross-
3 talk]

4 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...there is no amount of
5 money that I could say that these folks deserve, they
6 deserve the world and we understand that but the
7 comments... the comments that we're not doing anything
8 new or different or not coordinating I don't feel
9 that that gives the due respect to the work that
10 people are trying to do, doing something new is
11 empowering people to change the narrative in their
12 community to own their spaces, to be able to speak
13 out against violence, to come out in the community
14 and say this is our space and we own it, that is
15 something new and you know we are... there's always
16 more that we can do and we're trying to do that and
17 we are committed to doing that and we're happy to
18 meet with you, to meet with the community, to
19 continue to talk, to continue to advocate... [cross-
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: But you can't
22 deny... and I hear you, like I have... we have the MAP
23 that, that... [cross-talk]

24 RENITA FRANCIOS: Yep... [cross-talk]
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...the MAP program
and the... and the WICK that these guys right here
wearing the blue shirts that... [cross-talk]

RENITA FRANCIOS: Absolutely... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...we have they
know what we need but you know what they're doing
right now, they have to go to... what do you call
those, vigil after vigil after vigil after vigil they
don't got time to organize these other events and
well you know what... [cross-talk]

RENITA FRANCIOS: Absolutely... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...if we give them
twice as much money and they got twice as many people
doing that work then maybe they... half of them could
plan vigils unfortunately and the other half could
plan events for the community that's what I'm saying
it's just... it's not working and I don't feel like
we're thinking about it, you... I feel you're just
trying to keep my quite... [cross-talk]

RENITA FRANCIOS: That's not true...
[cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...and doing
3 enough... [cross-talk]

4 RENITA FRANCIOS: That's not true..
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...so, so then
7 let's, let's sit down...

8 RENITA FRANCIOS: Let's sit down...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...let's have a
10 comprehensive plan, talk to these kids in the
11 Cornerstone program, think about infrastructure too,
12 the, the building is a mess, the, the community is,
13 is not a, a high quality environment for these kids,
14 Williamsburg Houses has a beautiful facility but we
15 shouldn't have to run away to that beautiful facility
16 every time we have a problem, we should have our own
17 spaces that are meaningful and NYCHA shouldn't say no
18 to anything, they should be open to the possibility
19 of expanding community space if it.. if it could mean
20 the difference between saving a kid's life or not.

21 RENITA FRANCIOS: I think that's the
22 beauty of this program and I agree with you that all
23 of these people now have a place where they can talk
24 directly to government.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: But I'm, I'm...

[cross-talk]

RENITA FRANCIOS: I meant the folks in
this room.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I hear you, I'm,
I'm, I'm done I'm just saying.. [cross-talk]

RENITA FRANCIOS: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...I hope you
heard me because I think for a long time I've been
talk, talking to a wall and I feel like hearings are
great because I get to come at you and you... this is
public now so people know what I've been trying to do
behind closed doors... [cross-talk]

RENITA FRANCIOS: Absolutely... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...now you see it
out in the open so thank you.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Majority
Leader Laurie Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, I just
want to note is there and I apologize because we have
a, a budget negotiation meeting downstairs, is there
someone here from NYCHA that's head of capital, that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

understands the capital budget, that's head of
capital programs here?

CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, Steven Lovci.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: That's you. remind
me of your name again.

STEVE LOVCI: My name is Steven Lovci,
I'm a Senior Advisor on Capital.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you have
someone who is the actual director of capital
programs at NYCHA, is... does that person exist on
staff?

STEVE LOVCI: Yep..

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And who would that
be?

STEVE LOVCI: That's Deborah Goddard, the
EVP of Capital who has testified previously
unfortunately due to schedule conflicts could not be
here today.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, I would like
on the record because we have asked NYCHA for a
capital meeting in my office and they have
consistently sent low level staffers who are
completely unaware of the capital process who are
reading on their phone talking points to answer

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 questions that they're not able to answer and we had
3 a meeting with Walt Whitman, Ingersoll, Farragut,
4 Lafayette Gardens as well as Atlantic Terminal to
5 discuss the capital needs in my office and a low
6 level staffer was sent, not low level in terms of
7 intellect but low level in terms of this person is
8 not empowered to be a decision maker nor do they
9 understand the complexities of the capital budget as
10 it pertains to NYCHA so I'm asking on the record here
11 this month we want to have a meeting with your
12 capital director as well as yourself to discuss
13 capital needs in my development.

14 STEVE LOVCI: We'll definitely make that
15 happen and we'll do that through our intergov.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And that's a
17 commitment in this month?

18 STEVE LOVCI: We will make that happen
19 this month.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. My
21 second question goes into the security dynamics in
22 terms of NYCHA. So, my constituents have eloquently
23 and fought very hard for improvements to our
24 basketball court, our playgrounds, our handball
25 courts, areas where our youth are in desperate need

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 for education, activity, the ability to come together
3 but we have gotten push back in terms of saying that
4 these are not high level priority items and that they
5 are not being pushed through because of other capital
6 needs, what is the timetable because in any real
7 security plan you have to have spaces where the youth
8 can actually play, where children can go on a
9 playground, where young people can have basketball
10 tournaments but if those facilities are not available
11 to them particularly during the summer we have a huge
12 challenge on our hands.

13 STEVE LOVCI: Yep, I understand your
14 question and thank you very much for it. As you know
15 and you've been at the capital hearings in regard to
16 the overall budget for the capital program, city
17 funds are allocated to particular items... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Right... [cross-
19 talk]

20 STEVE LOVCI: ...and the federal funds are
21 focused on taking care of heating plants, boilers,
22 roofs, the exterior of the building and focusing on
23 the resident's buildings themselves, grounds and
24 other pieces, there is funding associated to those
25 but it is not as much as heating plants, steam

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 plants, gas risers, those infrastructure pieces that
3 are very important to the resident's daily lives in
4 their homes. We are teaming up with other agencies
5 and we are working with the Council who have given us
6 discretionary funds in the past to do playground
7 upgrades and other ground improvements and we always
8 appreciate those funds and those can be allocated to
9 those particular upgrades. I believe we did a dance
10 studio at Atlantic Terminal that turned out really
11 well and we thank you very much for the funding that
12 you provided that resident... that community center and
13 I believe that that program is... been a great one for
14 the community.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: It has been a
16 great one however there was a flood there and now the
17 dance studio is buckled and so the, the young people
18 actually can't utilize it in the same way so I
19 thought that was a good step in the right direction
20 that the... those resources were put forward for the
21 dance studio but I'm, I'm unaware of how the space is
22 being utilized since the flood happened.

23 STEVE LOVCI: Okay, I will look into
24 that.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, my second
3 question goes into... and I... and I just want to add we
4 provide out of our capital budgets as Council Member
5 Reynoso said, we provide... each Council Member... so
6 that you know, each Council Member gets about I'll
7 say four million dollars in capital that they have
8 the power to allocate within their own district so if
9 we give a million or two million to our NYCHA
10 developments that decreases the amount that we're
11 able to put into schools, parks, infrastructure, all
12 of these different things that we want to improve so
13 many other things but if we're giving you our capital
14 dollars to do basketball courts, to do those
15 renovations and you sit on that money then it is for
16 no use for the entire community, nobody actually gets
17 to benefit from it so we need.. most of us here have
18 two and a half years left and I am not leaving
19 without these capital improvements being made to my
20 district, my residents deserve it, they fought hard
21 for it, our young people deserve it, this is the
22 least of what we can do to keep them safe in their
23 communities. So, I, I wanted to touch on one other
24 aspect, this came up during a meeting, it seems like
25 it's a... it's a game where everyone says it's the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 other person, the issue of people breaking into NYCHA
3 developments sleeping in the hallways, sleeping in
4 the stairwells, setting up basic... you know this is...
5 someone's setting up a home in the stairwells and it
6 happens time and time and time again, the PSA three's
7 say that it has everything to do with the Department
8 of Homeless Services, Department of Homeless Services
9 says it has to do with the Police Department than it
10 has to do with NYCHA and they're... I mean whatever is
11 happening the same situation continues to happen,
12 it's most persistent in Atlantic Terminal as well
13 Lafayette Garden in my district and many of the other
14 developments so can you speak to what is the real
15 plan to address this because nowhere else in the city
16 of New York would people tolerate people setting up a
17 home in someone's stairwell and lobby and creating
18 such an unsafe environment for children, for seniors,
19 for families, I mean there has to be a serious plan
20 around this.

21 JAMES SECRETO: That, that does fall on
22 the Police Department as Homeless Services as well
23 because we don't want to arrest someone that's
24 homeless so usually, we team with Homeless Services
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 and we find some resource or shelter or whatever and
3 remove them from the building.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Who removes them?

5 JAMES SECRETO: The police department and
6 homeless services so... but we have... you know they
7 have... we have to know specifics and that's another
8 thing that interior patrols would come across,
9 someone homeless in Atlantic Terminal or Ingersoll or
10 wherever once we go in the building and see who's in
11 there and get them out but we... you know we certainly
12 don't want to arrest them but we want to... [cross-
13 talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What if that
15 individual broke into an apartment on Park Avenue and
16 set up their home there, what would be the... how would
17 that be viewed in the same way? Let me tell you...
18 because and I'll tell you why, I... when we campaign to
19 run for office we have to door knock in different
20 developments, some you can get in, some you can't but
21 when I go on the other side of Myrtle Avenue and I go
22 into some of those fancy high risers they called the
23 police on me and the police were ready to arrest me
24 for knocking on someone's door in one of those
25 developments.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JAMES SECRETO: Uh-huh, uh-huh, yeah...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And I had to talk
my way out of it.

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Sure, so Council
Member, I think... I mean I think what, what the Chief
is trying to say and I think that what the position
of the Department is and this happens in, indoors as
well as outdoors, we have a homeless population and
what we try to do rather than create in criminal
records for them is to, to link them up with some
type of service whether it be a shelter or some other
type of service that they need. With that being said
unlike the... being out in the street sitting on the
bench or, or just basically out on a sidewalk, when
you are in a building and you have no right to be in
the building that is a crime in New York, right and
that's... we do have that tool, I mean we'll of course
try to connect somebody that's without a home to
proper services to the best of our ability to do
that, we have a homeless outreach unit that partners
up with Department of Social Service... Department of
Homeless Services and we go out together and we try
to connect these folks with the proper services, if

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 that fails, if we... if we have a situation that
3 somebody is in a NYCHA building in the stairwell
4 setting up home in, in the stairwell they don't have
5 a right to be there and if our ability... if our
6 efforts to connect them with some type of shelter or
7 some type of service fails and we find them in there
8 we do have the ability to arrest unlike, unlike the
9 street, unlike being on the sidewalk.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Let me say this is
11 a very sensitive issue, I'm extremely sensitive to
12 the issue of homelessness and I understand that more
13 often than not the people that are homeless look just
14 like me and my family so I get it and I understand it
15 but at the same time it creates an unsafe environment
16 to allow people to sleep in stairwells as well as
17 lobbies, as well as hallways, it just creates such an
18 unsafe environment and it can't just be that we look
19 at this as a low income community of color, you know
20 and, and let me tell you there are many individuals
21 in the development that sympathize with the
22 individuals that are sleeping there but we can't
23 continue to have this type of dynamic fester because
24 it creates such an unsafe environment, everyone here
25 on this panel would not tolerate for two seconds that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 type of dynamic in their living situation, I know I
3 would not be able to live comfortably having a son
4 that's two years old and there's somebody sleeping in
5 the stairwell as we're trying to get up and through
6 to go to school every morning. So, I want to see a
7 real plan of action that's... that really takes this
8 situation into consideration and understands that
9 unfortunately we have to be tougher on this issue, I
10 can't have my seniors afraid to go outside of their
11 homes because they don't understand what's going to
12 happen to them when they want to go downstairs and
13 check their mail or pick up their grandchildren, they
14 shouldn't have to live in that type of fear.

15 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yeah and just, just to
16 clarify what I... what I'm not saying is that when an
17 officer approaches and tries to offer services and if
18 the person says no, rejects the services and says
19 well I'll just stay here because I'm comfortable here
20 that's not the solution, we're not walking away from
21 that and saying well then you can stay there, we're
22 going to address the issue so if we can... we can solve
23 it, I mean that is neighborhood policing is to try to
24 resolve issues without necessarily jumping straight
25 to enforcement, right, so if we can do that, if we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 can connect somebody with services, if we can resolve
3 the issue whether it be through NCOs, through
4 homeless outreach or through housing cops or regular
5 precinct cops if we could address the situation
6 without taking enforcement with... helping somebody
7 connecting them to resources that's clearly what we
8 want to do, however, if that fails if the individual
9 does not want the services and simply wants to stay
10 in the stairwell and set up camp and they don't live
11 in the building that is not a solution that is
12 acceptable to us, they cannot stay there, we do have...
13 unlike in... on the streets and the sidewalk where a
14 person has the right to be there you don't have an
15 automatic right to set up camp in a housing in the
16 NYCHA stairwell much like you said nor do you have
17 the right to set up camp in a Park Avenue apartment
18 building so much like the Park Avenue building the
19 NYCHA building is the same, it's open to residents of
20 the building, it's open to their guests clearly but
21 it's... people can't just go in there and decide to
22 live in the stairwell.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I appreciate your
24 comment and I appreciate your response but... I mean
25 even as you're speaking it's just something that was

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 brought up earlier just what you're saying you
3 provide those services but what my residents and TA
4 leaders continue to tell me is they come right back
5 so you may do all that you're saying that you're
6 doing but the next tenant leader meeting I have they
7 say they came right back and so it's like I want to
8 have meetings with my TA leaders but they're like
9 what's the point, why do we keep coming to meet with
10 you every month and the same issues are, are the same
11 issues, what are you actually doing directing it to
12 me and so I have to direct that to you, I mean the
13 truth of the matter is this security system that is
14 within NYCHA is nonexistent, I mean in any normal
15 society you would have regular security patrols, you
16 would have surveillance cameras that people are
17 actually looking at, you would have doors that
18 actually lock and stay locked, you would have all of
19 these different sorts of things but we kind of do it
20 in this like... how would you say, like... you're not on
21 the offense you're always on the defense, you're not
22 offensively having people that walk the grounds, walk
23 the stairwells, you have a police department that
24 does what's known as verticals but verticals aren't a
25 security plan for thousands of people living in a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 particular development, it's just... it's really
3 unfortunate that we're leaving a community of people
4 so vulnerable, any building that had the lack of
5 security that our NYCHA developments have would be
6 grounds for an unsafe community and environment.
7 NYCHA residents are not more prone to violent acts
8 than any other community it's just that there is no
9 security present at all and that's what festers this,
10 that's really what the system of broken windows was
11 actually supposed to be created upon, when you leave
12 environments not people in disarray, broken windows,
13 lobbies not cleaned, people sleeping in the
14 stairwells, it creates an environment of festering of
15 violence and that's really what we have to address.

16 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yeah and I think... I, I
17 agree with you and I think the, the point of trying
18 to connect somebody with services rather than simply
19 taking enforcement because we can do that and to your
20 point, the residents will tell you that well they may
21 have taken enforcement and he or she left but they're
22 back the next day and they keep coming back. If we
23 connect them, if we're successful in connecting an
24 individual to the proper service then maybe they
25 won't be back the next day, maybe we... they will... we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 will find them some sort of housing, we will find
3 them a place to go where it resolves the issue long
4 term rather than the quick fix because an arrest is
5 certainly an option, right, you will take somebody
6 out of that stairwell in that moment eventually
7 they're not going to be imprisoned forever, they're
8 going to be let out probably within 24 hours or less
9 and if all they're doing is coming back all we're
10 doing is we're part of this vicious cycle of arrest,
11 come back, arrest, come back, arrest, come back so
12 what we're trying to do is go out of the box that's...
13 and you've spoken to the police commissioner many a
14 times, that's what neighborhood policing is, is to go
15 out of the box to try to figure out solutions that
16 are non-enforcement, solutions to the extent possible
17 or practicable and to try to do that and that
18 generally results in a longer term solution of
19 placing that individual in a home somewhere and then
20 they no longer come back to the stairwell and you're,
21 you're, you're dealing with the issue individual by
22 individual and trying to play that long term solution
23 but if not and as I said to you and as I'm saying to
24 the residents here if there's an individual that's in
25 a stairwell in NYCHA much like any other building,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 high end buildings on Park Avenue we have a penal law
3 tool of arresting the individual for, for, for being
4 in a building when they don't have a right to be
5 there and that's certainly a tool that we have, the
6 idea is to solve it longer term and we're going to do
7 our best to do that but we also... we always have that
8 tool.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just want to
10 charge you all to do that because as elected
11 officials we have to think about the schools, the
12 libraries, the churches, the house of worships, DOT,
13 we got to think about our NYCHA developments, we got
14 to think about the arts, funding, pay parity, this is
15 your lane and while you're in that lane and this is
16 really the main issue that you have the ability and
17 the time and the space and the resources to focus on
18 let's get to those long term solutions. Thank you so
19 much to both my Co-Chairs, thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you and
21 I know that Council Ayala has to also go back to BNT,
22 so Ayala followed by Council Member Gjonaj.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you and
24 thank you... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: She was... she
3 was actually on the list before you were.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: You got here late
5 Mark. Thank you all for being here, I just... I wanted
6 to rather than share my testimony, to read to you
7 some of the concerns... some of the, the incidents that
8 have occurred in my district in the last six weeks.
9 So, actually a little bit longer than that because in
10 April, early April we had a 15 year old that was shot
11 in the face while walking through Patterson Houses;
12 May 21st I had an incident at Wagner Houses where
13 over 50 young people were involved in some sort of
14 gang violence where they... and they were literally
15 beating each other up, one of the kids that was
16 coming out of his building minding his own business
17 was actually the victim of whatever was transpiring
18 in front of the building, he was beat up and hit over
19 the head with a metal pipe, all of these are
20 nonfatal; I had shots fired at Jefferson Houses on
21 May 18th; female slashed in the face May 22nd, it was
22 actually a 76 year old female who was approached by a
23 40 year old who inquired about her granddaughter
24 having been in a fight the day before and slashed the
25 76 year old across the face; East River Houses May

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 26th, we had two people shot one fatally; May 28th,
3 male non-fatal shot at Johnson Houses; June 2nd at
4 East River Houses I had another male slashed; just
5 yesterday I had a seven year old shot in the leg at
6 Millbrook Houses and last week I had a woman, 20 year
7 old that was brutally raped at Mitchell Houses on the
8 roof. And I want to read to you... this is just an
9 example, there were more, I actually didn't have time
10 believe it or not to print them but I'm happy to do
11 that because I believe that I requested a meeting
12 with both NYCHA and NYPD to talk about the public
13 safety situation in my district so I just wanted to
14 give you an example of what my constituents are
15 living through each and every single day. I represent
16 the most public housing of any other Council Member
17 on this body and this is what we live through, we
18 live in fear so much so that I don't even allow my
19 own children to frequent the local playground because
20 I don't know that my kid is going to make it home
21 that night and I am responsible not just for my
22 children, I am responsible for the children of every
23 other constituent in that district so it's a lot that
24 I have to go to sleep with every single night. It is
25 a responsibility that nobody should have to bear

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 with, there's no reason why anybody's child should be
3 walking through whether you live in public housing or
4 not and not make it home that night. I wanted to read
5 this to you because we, we... you know we, we talk
6 about all of the money that we put into MAP and
7 there's a lot of money in my community, there's a lot
8 of... there are a lot of resources, it's not by lack of
9 resources, we have them, we're not coordinating them
10 effectively, nobody is measuring success, nobody is
11 coming back to see if they work but they exist, they
12 exist and so I want to read to you one of... this is a...
13 this is actually from the Executive Director at the
14 Wagner Cornerstone who wrote a letter to DYCD in
15 response to something that occurred at that
16 cornerstone back in October and this is a development
17 that is also the recipient of a MAP program. So, he
18 writes, I'm not going to say to who, but he writes, I
19 write this to you this morning after one of the East
20 Harlem Cornerstones, Wagner was literally shot up the
21 evening of 10/23. Only weeks ago, a number of Taft
22 Johnson young men and... were brandishing baseball bats
23 outside of our Clinton and Lehman Cornerstones. The
24 significant youth violence in East Harlem is growing
25 incrementally despite the comparatively recent

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 incarceration of approximately 150 young men from
3 Wagner, East River, Johnson and Taft. This violence
4 is burgeoning despite our East Harlem base cure
5 violence program initiative, this violence spreads
6 despite the Manhattan DA's Office hub initiative and
7 related collaborative funded projects. Our Wagner
8 Cornerstone violence is spreading despite MAP efforts
9 who offer supportive initiatives for example SYEP
10 slots. When one recognizes the substantial extra
11 added efforts focused on our East Harlem community
12 the significant failure of these efforts needs to be
13 mindfully considered, understood, and serve as a
14 lesson moving forward and that's, that's a deep
15 message because he's absolutely right, if we're
16 investing all of these resources who the heck is
17 coming back to determine whether or not they're
18 actually working, there's no reason why at a MAP site
19 we should see violence continue to grow or stagnate
20 when all of these resources are supposedly being
21 poured into it and if it is the fact that, that these
22 numbers are growing because my understanding is that
23 NYPD is only monitoring for the seven major crimes
24 but... so, when I've asked, I'm like who's measuring
25 success, what are the outcomes, well we've only had

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 one fatality at this development, really, is that how
3 we measure success because we had one fatality so the
4 people that got shot and made it don't count, the
5 people that were slashed and made it don't count, the
6 kid that was beat up with the pipe doesn't count,
7 the, the, the kid that was riding around on national
8 night out on a city bike with a handgun on him
9 looking for somebody to kill that night that doesn't
10 count, those incidents make up what we're seeing at
11 these developments and that's not what I'm hearing
12 from the city agencies. It, it, it sounds like, you
13 know we're doing good so we're doing that, but nobody
14 is coming back, nobody is coming back to see if these
15 programs are actually working. I actually met with
16 PAL for Wagner for instance and I said well are you
17 supposed to be a PAL, that's what I'm reading is part
18 of the MAP program, well we did one event last year,
19 there's no reason why there shouldn't be programming
20 happening at this development every single weekend,
21 there should be something happening all of the time.
22 Same thing happened with SYEP, we're supposed to be
23 recruiting kids for SYEP, I walked the grounds for..
24 to recruit kids at those MAP sites this summer and
25 what the kids were saying was we don't want to apply

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 for SYEP, well why don't you... why don't you want to
3 apply for SYEP because they're going to send us to
4 work at NYCHA developments and we're going to get
5 beat up, we don't want to work at NYCHA developments
6 so who's, who's talking to the young people to
7 determine that... you know what their issues are so
8 that then they could make corrective action and then
9 maybe better market this to... so that they, they
10 understand that they're not being sent to...
11 necessarily to NYCHA development, they could work at
12 my office, they could work wherever but we're getting
13 them involved in the programs that we're putting in
14 there to supposedly reduce gun violence so, you know
15 really I'm just voicing, you know my frustration
16 because this comes on the heels of a seven year
17 getting shot yesterday and this is as you can see
18 based on, you know all of the other incidents that I,
19 I reported, it's been over two months of consecutive
20 somebody is getting shot, I'm tired of standing on
21 the corners, I'm, I'm tired of saying I'm sorry, I'm
22 tired of giving false hope to my constituents and so
23 there has to be something done, we need to make sure
24 that we're providing... actually providing programming
25 at these developments and I want to know specifically

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 in my developments what programs are in there and I
3 want to know when they started, who's running them,
4 how many times they're operating, if you're doing... if
5 you're claiming that you're doing all of these extra,
6 extracurricular activities which I am not seeing then
7 I want to know when they were done, how many people
8 came in, how... what was the outreach plan because I
9 don't see any of this happening and I also want to
10 know what the heck is NYCHA doing because as far as
11 I'm concerned NYCHA's response to everything is call
12 the police, call the police, call the police, the
13 police department is not the private security system
14 for the New York City Housing Authority. The, the New
15 York City Housing Authority is a landlord, it has the
16 responsibility to ensure the public safety of each
17 and every resident that lives at those developments
18 and that is not happening. That is not happening and
19 then we sit here and we cry because we're saying that
20 the police is over policing and, and, and locking up
21 all our young people well maybe if we were dealing
22 with those families that need a little more
23 supportive services that maybe we wouldn't be here.
24 So, I want to know what exactly is NYCHA's plan other
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 than calling the police to remediate some of the
3 violence that I'm seeing in my district?

4 RENITA FRANCIOS: Okay, I'll... good
5 afternoon Councilwoman, thank you for reading the
6 letter, the testimony everything that you've
7 presented to us, you are right, we have to do a
8 better job of coordinating, there are a lot of
9 resources in your district and we are trying to do
10 that. Someone mentioned earlier that we can't just be
11 defensive that we have to be offensive and that's how
12 we see the work of the stakeholders, the things that
13 they choose may seem innocuous; gardens, activating
14 green space but really those things are offensive to
15 Majority Leader Cumbo's point about creating an
16 environment where crime cannot thrive, things have to
17 be beautified and maintained. We have to create these
18 opportunities for people to come together in a
19 positive way and so we want to promote that through
20 the stakeholder's teams from the programmatic
21 perspective definitely we hear you. In the past when
22 MAP started all of the developments got the exact
23 same programs, in the last year and a half we have
24 tried to be better at iterating on it, we haven't
25 left, we're still there to your point about who comes

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 back to see whether or not things work. We are in
3 communication with folks to understand how they
4 interact with the programs, which ones they feel are
5 working, which ones they feel are not and honestly,
6 you know we didn't get into this situation overnight
7 and institutional racism and inequity are deeply
8 entrenched and it is difficult for us to climb out of
9 it, that is not an excuse but I do want you to know
10 that we are proactively working on it, we have had..
11 when I started with MAP we did not have a guaranteed
12 SYEP for all of the young people at MAP sites, we do
13 have that now and in, you know your district we have
14 progressively reached more young people every year.
15 We know that there is mistrust between residents and
16 government because of the things that have happened
17 historically and so the uptake of our programs as
18 with every program sometimes is lacking, people don't
19 always trust those opportunities because of the lack
20 of opportunities that existed and so we have a two
21 prong thing that we have to do, we have to help
22 people realize that the opportunities are real and in
23 doing that we hope to get people to participate in
24 them but we also have a responsibility to listen when
25 people say that those things don't work for their

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 community and that they're not working and that is
3 part of the reason why we have these stakeholders to
4 inform us on what their priorities are. In terms of
5 coordinating for the summer and the youth issues in
6 East Harlem, I think that you were made aware but I'm
7 not quite sure that there was a roundtable recently
8 between the youth providers in your neighborhood, the
9 engagement coordinators, SCAN, GOSO, a number of
10 partners participated in that, we are hoping to have
11 a proactive strategy for this summer... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I'm, I'm going to
13 tell you... I'm going to stop you right there I'm going
14 to tell you that I met with the same stakeholders and
15 there is no plan and I actually had to bring everyone
16 in to sit down to find out what exactly are you doing
17 with the public dollars that you're receiving because
18 we're not seeing that translate into the communities
19 that we're providing services or supposed to be
20 providing services for and I wanted to see a map of
21 what this summer was going to look like because if we
22 have all of these programs providing services at
23 specific developments that are high volume, you know
24 crime areas then there shouldn't be a moment in time
25 when there's a lapse of service and yet it took that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 meeting to initiate a, a larger conversation because
3 I'll tell you that I'm not privy to those
4 conversations because the elected officials are
5 completely cut out of the equation when it comes to
6 MAP and when it comes to anything else and we're the
7 only ones that know where the money is coming... we're
8 the only... we're the ones that are funding a lot of
9 these programs and yet nobody consults with us to
10 find out what... you know what we think is happening.
11 So, you know listen, I'm going to continue to have
12 meetings and I'm going to continue to dig and I'm
13 going to continue to push people to do what they're
14 supposed to do because I, I was actually at, at
15 Carver Houses a couple of weeks ago and this mother
16 was like hysterical crying, her son just got shot
17 under the... under the, the CCTV cameras that we put
18 in, he was shot and murdered there, 20 years old,
19 there's nothing that I'm going to be able to do to
20 bring her, her son back but she was hysterical crying
21 because she wanted the NYPD van that was removed from
22 104th Street between Park and Madison put back. There
23 needs to be more, I don't... I don't want to hear about
24 beautifying gardens, I don't see the correlation
25 between fixing a garden and reducing gun violence,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 yes, people should feel great about where they live,
3 yes, it's nice to walk into a beautiful environment
4 but that is not reducing gun violence, I'm sorry, it
5 isn't and if that is the focal point of MAP then I
6 will tell you that you need to scrap it and you need
7 to start again.

8 RENITA FRANCIOS: Okay, so I hear what
9 you're saying but I want to also reiterate that what
10 the residents choose to focus on for their crime
11 prevention through environmental design project is
12 their decision, self-determination... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: That is not true...
14 [cross-talk]

15 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...is part of that...
16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: That's also not
18 true... that is not true, I'm not going to... I'm not
19 going to discuss it with you... [cross-talk]

20 RENITA FRANCIOS: That is true... [cross-
21 talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...it with you
23 because I, I mean I could be here forever but that is
24 not true because the residents did not decide that
25 they would focus primarily on the gardens as a way of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 reducing gun violence in their community, that's what
3 they were told was the... what the program was about.
4 When I asked anyone in my district what is MAP,
5 beautification projects at public housing, what the
6 heck is the correlation between the beautification
7 projects and the reduction in crime, there hasn't
8 been any, MAPs been there for three years enough time
9 for you to be able to measure or not it was
10 successful. I'm not going to ask any more questions,
11 I think I made my point, I will have a separate
12 meetings in the next... in the coming weeks with NYPD
13 and with NYCHA because I want to know what the plan
14 is for my district come... for this summer because my
15 residents cannot continue to live terrorized in their
16 own communities. Thank you, thank you Miss... Madame
17 Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
19 you, next we'll hear from Council Member Gjonaj.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Chairs,
21 it's very difficult to follow my colleagues and their
22 passion and their commitment but I do have some basic
23 questions. I would imagine when it comes to safety
24 and security it's our priority, we want to make sure
25 that everyone feels safe in their home and in their

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 community. There's a pre-active approach to that to
3 prevent crimes from happening which include
4 deterrence such as cameras, law enforcement,
5 verticals, presence, patrols and then there's a
6 reactive approach and the reactive approach would be
7 if there's an incident, a crime what are we going to
8 do to prevent that similar crime from reoccurring,
9 right, this is... I imagine we're all on the same page
10 on this one. Two years and where's that gentleman
11 that was talking about the security, if you could
12 grab a seat because some of these questions are going
13 to be directed towards you. Two years and two murders
14 later, we're still bidding on camera and security
15 installations, that inherently is the problem and the
16 frustrations that you've heard echoed from so many of
17 my colleagues, the limited funding that we do have
18 available we put into projects to fill a void, to
19 address an issues that's not being addressed to only
20 find out that it's going to be years before you guys
21 get out of your own way to spend the money that was
22 allocated to you and I'm going to use your own
23 numbers and I just want to make sure that I
24 understood this, when you do security evaluations you
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 have a team of 12, you do 40 per quarter, correct, 40
3 buildings per quarter?

4 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Developments.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: 40 developments...

6 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Developments... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...per quarter...

9 [cross-talk]

10 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...per quarter.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, we have 325
12 developments using that math you're looking at
13 roughly two years for all of our developments to be
14 surveyed.

15 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Correct.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I don't see that
17 actually being done by a group of 12 and to have a
18 thorough evaluation where you can go through 40... well
19 I'm going to break it down because now I'm really
20 intrigued, so, that's 40 complexes, we got 2,418
21 buildings, is that correct Chair? 2,400 buildings,
22 2,400 buildings divide that by 40, right?

23 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You're... actually
25 it's got to be 160, you're doing 15 buildings a day.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes, we are.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That's... [cross-talk]

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: We're, we're... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...more... [cross-talk]

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...averaging at least two to three developments every week and a development can go as far as one building to as much as maybe 35 buildings it all depends on the... on the size of the campus.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That's seven days a week using the number 15.

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Not necessarily.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay, well... [cross-talk]

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Maybe... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...five days a week... [cross-talk]

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...I should... maybe I should clarify... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...you can... you can tell me and the Chairs that 15 buildings that's more

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 than one building per person on making their
3 assessments can be done in a day adequately walking
4 that building and terming all those needs and seeing
5 it... evaluating the corners of the current systems are
6 not capturing, that's impossible, I come from this
7 business, I come out of real estate. Some of these
8 complexes are 20 stories high, for you to walk the
9 staircase can take a half a day let alone evaluate
10 every need of that building, I'm going to get back to
11 that. What is the cost of, and I think this was
12 already asked but no one had an answer for a CCTV
13 system per building, would have to be broken down per
14 camera I would imagine?

15 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: What is that cost
17 roughly?

18 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Don't have the
19 numbers at this point in time, I can get back to...
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Will you please
22 get that to me?

23 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Absolutely.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I want to go back
25 to the doors and the evaluations and that whole

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 protocol about every day that we're evaluating and
3 making a walk through to see what doors are closed
4 and operating properly and on what we do from there
5 but my bigger question is doors don't break daily and
6 there's vandalism involved and the definition of
7 insanity is doing the same thing over and over again
8 expecting a different result. What are we doing to
9 prevent those doors from being vandalized so there is
10 some security in these buildings, are we putting
11 cameras there to actually catch the culprits in the
12 act and then once we catch the culprits what are we
13 actually doing and what if they're repeat offenders
14 what are we doing and this may be a little counter to
15 what some of my colleagues feel about arrest and
16 trespassing, can't have it both ways, right?

17 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Correct.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That we're going
19 to have to arrest somebody to prevent the crime from
20 continuing, there's got to be some law enforcement
21 and I asked a bunch of questions but I'm going to go
22 back to yesterday's meeting with the Pelham Parkway
23 tenants association, newly formed, NYCHA property,
24 what was once the iconic NYCHA facility for the state
25 has deteriorated to a condition that's deplorable and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 to the conditions... Chairs that they brought up were
3 Mark I can't get the assistance that I need, I have a
4 group of 20 or more young and adults that are smoking
5 marijuana that don't get out of your way to go up the
6 stairs and our seniors are threatened, the tenants
7 are threatened and there's nothing that we can do,
8 we're not going to give them tickets, we're not going
9 to arrest them, we're... we... every time there is a
10 vertical that's done they run to another building,
11 what are we going to do? The second issue they
12 brought up is the trespassers and most of these
13 complexes have first floor windows, we have peeping
14 Toms, what are we going to do if we're not going to
15 ticket them or arrest them, give the patrols or the
16 manpower that's needed, what are we... and these are
17 not residents, I want to reiterate this, trespassers
18 don't belong there, they're not visiting, they're not
19 guests, barbecuing all night long peeping into
20 people's apartments using their grounds and their
21 buildings as their urinals and smoking marijuana that
22 is a quality of life issue for the residents that
23 live there that don't care to have that aroma work
24 their way into their apartments nor do they want to
25 expose their children to that type of behavior. What

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 are you guys going to do, I want to be a partner and
3 I want to be that bully pulpit for you, if you can't
4 say it, I'll say it for you, what do you need?

5 CAROLYN JASPER: Thank you for your
6 question, just to respond to some of the comments
7 that you made, yes there is a lot that needs to be
8 done and as I mentioned before I spoke about the
9 housing authority and I'm going... not going to, you
10 know kind of go over that in depth however, you know
11 I spoke about us checking the doors daily, yes, the
12 doors are vandalized, yes we do have issues at times
13 with keeping the doors locked however we continue to
14 emphasize to the staff that it is still our
15 responsibility that if those doors break daily it is
16 our responsibility to ensure that they are repaired.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I agree..

18 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, now I agree
20 with you... [cross-talk]

21 CAROLYN JASPER: So, when we... [cross-
22 talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...we're going to
24 repair them every day and that's not the case but
25 we're saying... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...they're going to
be repaired daily, we know that's not the case.

CAROLYN JASPER: Right...

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...and we're going
to improve that and we're going to try to make that
better where... on a... on a 24-hour emergency basis
we're going to have repair crews out there... [cross-
talk]

CAROLYN JASPER: Well... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...because months
go by without these doors being repaired and that
means months go by where you're getting... suppose...
allegedly repair... there's a report that's generated
from the super to the maintenance supervisor to the
manager to somebody and it's just... [cross-talk]

CAROLYN JASPER: Okay... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...a vicious wheel.

CAROLYN JASPER: And so in response to
some of your other concerns, when we talk about, you
know acts of vandalism and crime at the development,
yes, at some of our developments we do have CCTV
cameras and yes, we do have staff that are
responsible for reviewing the cameras. What we can

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 also.. at, at times again, you know when our staff
3 review the cameras sometimes they may not be able to
4 identify the individuals who are in the footage
5 however property management are able to reach out to
6 some of our, I would say resident leaders if they
7 would like to off record and at times, you know if we
8 can identify if people live in the complex, so if
9 individuals notify us individually then property
10 management can take the proper follow up action by
11 calling in a resident. In addition, when individuals
12 are arrested for major crimes, right, it is our
13 responsibility to ensure that we follow up and call
14 in those families and where necessary call those
15 families in for termination of tenancy. I also have..
16 you know I don't have to read it off, but I do have
17 data.. [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How many.. I'm
19 sorry, how many doors were broken last year, give us
20 a number?

21 CAROLYN JASPER: Sure.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And I remember
23 2,682 were still not addressed.

24 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, what I provided
25 you with I mentioned that for the past 12 months from

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 June 2018, from May of 2019 there was a total of work
3 orders created of 62,625 work orders... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: For?

5 CAROLYN JASPER: The entire year, when I
6 talk about doors I'm talking about our interior
7 doors, our stair hall doors, our front entrance
8 doors, our rear exit doors, okay... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Of the 62,000
10 doors... [cross-talk]

11 CAROLYN JASPER: Of the 62,225 work
12 orders that were created for repairs; it may have
13 been repairs, it may have been broken glass, it may
14 have been a variety of missing doorknobs... [cross-
15 talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: What was that
17 number?

18 CAROLYN JASPER: 62,625 number of work
19 orders created; we closed a total of 60,437 work
20 orders.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Stay with me on
22 that one.

23 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Of the 62,000
25 doors that were... that... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CAROLYN JASPER: Work orders... [cross-
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...work orders...
5 [cross-talk]

6 CAROLYN JASPER: ...created, yes, work
7 orders created throughout all of our developments
8 throughout the city.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: About doors?

10 CAROLYN JASPER: This is doors, yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Good, how many
12 vandals have been arrested, how many actions have
13 your brought against families to evict because
14 according to what you said one of the that you have
15 is you'll bring in tenant leaders to figure out who's
16 doing the damage then if you determine that it's a, a
17 resident you'll actually... [cross-talk]

18 CAROLYN JASPER: Let me clarify... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...issue a letter...
21 yeah.

22 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, I would like to
23 clarify, it's not always resident leaders, let me
24 just clarify, I want to mention that if they would
25 like to they're able to view the footage or their

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 board members with the personnel, NYCHA in order to
3 try to try to identify these families. At many times,
4 again, if we can identify the individual who, again
5 is causing the vandalism we will follow up. At this
6 time I cannot identify out of the number of work
7 orders that I have here how many residents have been
8 called in for the vandalism, many times the doors at
9 times are vandalized sometimes during the evening,
10 during the day when no one is around and it's very
11 difficult to identify individuals if we don't have
12 the footage... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Right... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CAROLYN JASPER: ...however... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So... my point we
17 said we're going to be proactive to prevent the crime
18 from happening or we can be reactive that once a
19 crime occurs that we take measures to prevent it from
20 reoccurring so if you don't have cameras that could
21 actually capture the vandalism that's being done
22 whether it be a resident or a nonresident.

23 CAROLYN JASPER: I'm sorry again there
24 are times where, where again if they see individuals
25 on the footage they may not be able to identify the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 individual perhaps as being a resident so that has
3 been reported over the years as well so it can be...
4 and, and I do know that there have been incidences
5 throughout the agency over the years where
6 individuals have been identified for a variety of
7 things, vandalism to the cameras, vandalism to the
8 doors so there have been... there have been cases where
9 individuals have been identified and property
10 management staff has taken the appropriate action to
11 call in that family and send that family down for
12 termination of tenancy in many instances again it
13 depends on the type of crime, of course that family
14 may not... their tenancy may not be terminated but
15 again depending on the type of crime it's a
16 possibility that that individual may be permanently
17 excluded from the household. Now if you would like us
18 to perhaps go further into our policy I can have
19 Daniel Kiss who is here with us representing our law
20 department who is the Chief of our tenant
21 administration and hearing division, he's here and he
22 can come up and also give testimony...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That would be
24 great but I want to get back to why it took two years
25 for you to still bid on cameras after two murders and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 we still don't have... and that will probably mean
3 another year or so after the bid is done that the
4 cameras go in so in essence you're looking at perhaps
5 four years for CCTV cameras to be installed in a
6 complex of over 200 units, is that what... of senior
7 housing, is that what I remember or was that 400, 400
8 units, double murder, can you elaborate on this so we
9 have a better understanding? I mean it only took one
10 day to survey the building, right?

11 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: At this point in time
12 the, the pricing that we got for both developments,
13 for both buildings because Woodson is... does... is
14 comprised of two buildings side by side... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-huh... [cross-
16 talk]

17 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...we have a total of
18 680,000 dollars to make this thing happen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yeah... what was
20 that dollar amount?

21 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: 680,000 dollars.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: To make what
23 happen?

24 RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: To basically put in
25 the cameras and the layered access.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Great so work,
work, work this out for us, in one day you surveyed
that building, what happened the following day?

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Well the first day we
went, and we surveyed both buildings..

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-huh...

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: ...after that we, we
engaged with capital projects and got a pricing for
all the equipment that would be available.. well
another words to be utilized at that location.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How long did that
take?

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Excuse me?

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How long did that
take?

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: Probably a, a few
days.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Very good so now
we're up to four days, then what happens?

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: At this point in time
the process goes over to capital projects at this
point in time.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Who can tell me..
[cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1

2

RAYMOND RODRIGUEZ: After... [cross-talk]

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...what happens at
capital now?

5

CAROLYN JASPER: Steve Lovci...

6

7

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Chairs thank you
for the consideration, but I think I'm going to shed
some light on something here.

9

10

11

12

13

STEVE LOVCI: Okay, to clarify this is
obviously an example but if there's funding
associated to that project then that project would go
into design, obviously procurement and then
construction.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, walk me
through this; four days after that gentleman's team
went out and made the evaluation, suggested the
equipment that was needed it was sent to your
department, capital, where are we and what time frame
did you need now, the money was allocated, 680,000,
it's two years later, I need you to help me fill out
the gap?

22

23

24

25

STEVE LOVCI: Okay, I've been told that
there's no funding allocated for that development but
we would... we can definitely sit down with you outside
of this hearing, go through that particular project

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 and, and work out a timeline if you would like me to
3 go through a, a scenario of a project that's funded
4 we can... I can go through that with you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Chairs I
6 apologize I thought we were going to shed some light
7 here on an issue and apparently, we're not because
8 apparently, we just got stonewalled again. I just
9 heard there was money available... allocated, 680,000
10 and within a minute there was no money allocated so I
11 doubt we're going to get to the bottom of this...

12 [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But I... wait...

14 [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...without your
16 help... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just a quick
18 follow up on that, is there a separate like line or
19 budget for cameras at all, I know that... you know we
20 already know that there's a budget in place for
21 boilers and elevators and, and lead remediation and
22 everything else, is there at all a focus, a plan, a
23 strategy right now for cameras outside of the Council
24 or the state legislators allocating that money?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 STEVE LOVCI: Chairman I will get to your
3 question very... immediately I just want to... Council
4 Member to explain the estimate that you were given,
5 that number that you were given you were asking how
6 much a camera system would be for two buildings that
7 was just an estimate, we're under... we would have to
8 double check the FMS system but it is our
9 understanding that there is no allocated funds for
10 this project. We can talk offline but at this point
11 in time there's no allocated... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Then I'm going to
13 refer to the question the Chair just asked... [cross-
14 talk]

15 STEVE LOVCI: Yep... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...is there a pot
17 of money that's set aside specifically for security
18 and cameras, I believe that was the question... [cross-
19 talk]

20 STEVE LOVCI: And I'll... so, we come to
21 you and... in a capital hearing to explain the budget,
22 the dollar amount and our needs according to the
23 physical needs assessment and where we allocate those
24 funds. The majority of the funds for the... for the
25 capital program are going to go to the roofs, the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 bricks, the heating plants, the gas risers, those
3 items that are associated to the residential
4 buildings, there is some funds that go to the
5 entrances but the majority of the funds, there's a
6 small grant that comes in from federal, the majority
7 of the funds associated to CCTV layered access and
8 cameras comes from discretionary from the Council
9 Members, the state DASNY portfolio that was... [cross-
10 talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm sorry to
12 cut you off because you know we've, we've been here a
13 while now, when I asked my question just now I
14 specifically said, I understand if there's funding
15 for boilers and elevators and everything else I just
16 listed and then I said can you explain to me the
17 planning or funding outside of the funding from the
18 Council and the state legislators, I specifically
19 said that and so your response just now was kind of
20 regurgitated like spitting back to me, like you're
21 answering a question based on... using the same
22 language in the question so I'm ask... so, I... so, we've
23 covered all that so I'm asking what is NYCHA's plan
24 outside of the funding that you get from the City
25 Council and the State Assembly and to be specific can

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 you speak to the 680,000 dollars that's needed for
3 Woodson because you said during this testimony that
4 there... that clearly you have identified a, an urgent
5 need in Woodson so if you've identified an urgent
6 need for cameras can you explain to me like what are
7 you doing about that?

8 STEVE LOVCI: So, I'm going to answer
9 your first question, our city funding is allocated
10 specifically for items, those are capital items so if
11 it is a allocation for roofs we use that roofs, if
12 it's an allocation for brick work we use that for
13 masonry, federal dollars are focused on those items
14 that the city can't afford, things like steam pipe
15 systems so in terms of the overall portfolio no... very
16 little federal dollars and we can get you the exact
17 number, it's a small grant, go to CCTV and layered
18 access, it is only the funds that are allocated from
19 the city for CCTV and layered access that go to CCTV
20 and layered access.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, unless we
22 pay for cameras in our budget then there will be no
23 cameras at all installed in NYCHA developments?

24 STEVE LOVCI: Out of the capital funds...
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Out of any funds?

3 STEVE LOVCI: I can speak for capital,
4 our capital funds go to heating plants, brick, roofs
5 and... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, so it is
7 your testimony today that unless the City Council or
8 state representatives pay for cameras in the
9 developments there will be no installation of cameras
10 in the developments?

11 STEVE LOVCI: My testimony is that city
12 funds are allocated, and I can only use those funds
13 for what it is allocated for. So, if it is allocated
14 for roofs, I can only use those funds for roofs.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Would you like
16 to answer that question?

17 CAROLYN JASPER: I would just like to
18 respond, so how much has NYCHA invested in cameras in
19 LAC I will respond to that, since 2014 192 million
20 262, 962,000, 192 million has been invested in
21 cameras in LAC, most... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, what does
23 that mean... [cross-talk]

24 CAROLYN JASPER: ...of the funding... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...so that's,
3 that's... [cross-talk]

4 CAROLYN JASPER: Most of the funding...
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...funding not...
7 that, that... [cross-talk]

8 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, most... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...did not come
10 from... [cross-talk]

11 CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...City Council...
13 [cross-talk]

14 CAROLYN JASPER: Most of this funding
15 comes from the City Council, we appreciate this
16 partnership that keeps, keeps the residents safe,
17 NYCHA has invested 156, 306, 196 and DSNY managed
18 35,956,866 million.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I'm... yes
20 or no?

21 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: If City
23 Council did not... if not one of my colleagues
24 allocated funding for new cameras would NYCHA be able
25 to install new cameras in a development and let's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 speak directly to Woodson Houses, 680,000 dollars is
3 needed to install cameras in Woodson Houses and does
4 that include the, the, the SOC, does that include the
5 brain?

6 STEVE LOVCI: Yeah, that includes...

7 [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, that's
9 500,000 for the brain and if it's 680 that means
10 180,000 for the cameras in the two buildings?

11 CAROLYN JASPER: Chair can I please... I
12 would just like to... because I don't think you asked
13 for this information before but I do have it, you
14 wanted to know the cost of the installation and the
15 SOC, I do have that here so I would like to provide
16 that to you if that's fine, I know you had asked for
17 it earlier in the testimony.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, I thought
19 somebody answered that, okay.

20 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, so just to let you
21 know this is an example for a development with two
22 buildings, two entrances and two elevators, the cost
23 estimate would be approximately 680,000 dollars.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Like Woodson?
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CAROLYN JASPER: The SOC is one per
3 development would be 160,000, low voltage center
4 which would be one per building would be 15,000
5 dollars, the fiber per building would be 15,000...
6 [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, you
8 totaled that up?

9 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, the outside cameras
10 would be eight per building which is 52, the inside
11 cameras, four per building would be 26,000 and lobby
12 cameras two per entrance would be 13,000 dollars for
13 a total of 680,000 dollars for two buildings.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so
15 that's like in Woodson, so Woodson is two buildings,
16 right so where you get the number for the, the 680,
17 right, so the question is still there's an urgent
18 need for cameras at Woodson, how are you going to get
19 the funding to install the cameras in Woodson?

20 STEVE LOVCI: The bulk of the funding and
21 I think this goes back to reiterating that same
22 answer, the bulk of the funding comes from the City
23 Council and those discretionary funds for CCTV
24 cameras.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is it
3 difficult to just answer a question directly?

4 STEVE LOVCI: We, we don't put these..
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: No, seriously
7 is it... [cross-talk]

8 STEVE LOVCI: ...we don't put these..
9 [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...difficult?

11 STEVE LOVCI: No, the... you're asking me
12 the question about where we're getting the funds to
13 do this work and you know our physical needs
14 assessment, you know our budget... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But I also
16 know... [cross-talk]

17 STEVE LOVCI: ...problem... the problem..
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...we need to
20 prioritize... [cross-talk]

21 STEVE LOVCI: ...we, we prioritize... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...something you
24 prioritize and you get it done when you want to get
25 it done so my question is you had an 84 year old that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 was killed in a building two years ago then you had
3 another 83 year old woman killed in the same exact
4 building and there's been a need for cameras and the
5 community has been asking for cameras for quite some
6 time now and these two buildings are located directly
7 across the street from a MAP site, Van Dyke Houses
8 where the Mayor and the Commissioner himself sat and
9 did a CompStat meeting on February 5th and in that
10 same week Commissioner O'Neill came back and met with
11 the community about the needs in the community and
12 the crime, if they're turned around and walked down
13 the block with Sade Baderinway from eyewitness news
14 and talked about the increase in crime in that
15 neighborhood and so you already... so, yeah I know the
16 issues that you have but you also know what you've
17 been dealing with and you also know your budgets and
18 what you prioritize based on the funding that you get
19 in so is this a priority and if it is why are you
20 depending or stressing that we need to pay for it
21 when you have the funding to be able to pay for it by
22 maneuvering some other deals that you have going on
23 so the question is how are you going to make that
24 happen?

25 STEVE LOVCI: I can't speak for that.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CAROLYN JASPER: Council Member we will...
3 we will get back to you with a response.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That... [cross-
5 talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: My bad, you
7 were talking.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: No, no, thank you
9 Chairs, I'm ready to wrap up because I loved it, you
10 were... I asked for your assistance, I couldn't get
11 the, the answers I was looking for, but I think we're
12 onto something and I think we're going to have to
13 continue. I do want to go back to the questions about
14 what am I going to do with Pelham Parkway housing?
15 Yesterday's meeting with the new association brought
16 to my attention the group of young men and adults
17 numbering up to 20 that are smoking marijuana, taking
18 up staircases preventing residents from being able to
19 use the staircase.

20 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Is that one of our
21 buildings...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: As well as the
23 trespassing that's done on the grounds with all night
24 long barbequing and music playing that is going to
25 impact us the whole summer with the peeping Toms that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 are going up to the windows of the first-floor
3 apartments?

4 JAMES SECRETO: I'll look into it and
5 I'll address the, the issues that you, you bring
6 forth.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That's what I
8 told them yesterday that I'm going to have to look
9 into it and I'm going to have to figure this out with
10 the local precinct and... [cross-talk]

11 JAMES SECRETO: Pardon... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...you... [cross-
13 talk]

14 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: I mean Council Member
15 we'll connect with you, I mean you brought this to
16 our attention, I... we'll address it, we'll talk to you
17 offline and get specifics about where exactly these
18 complaints are specifically and in the... in the
19 process and whoever is... whether it's the precinct or,
20 or, or housing we'll address the conditions, I mean
21 what you are describing are crimes, I mean there's no
22 two ways about it, right, people can't trespass,
23 that's against the law, smoking marijuana in public
24 is against the law, we try our best to, to alleviate
25 some of the lower level crimes through nonenforcement

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 solutions but at the end of the day and you
3 crystalized the point, sometimes enforcement is
4 necessary and we have those options on the books
5 still and if we can't resolve it, if we can't address
6 the concerns of the... of the residents that you're
7 highlighting to us through nonenforcement means then
8 we're going to address it through enforcement means
9 but the end result is, is that the people that are
10 coming to you, the residents that are coming to you
11 that can't live their lives, that their quality of
12 life is being negatively impacted that can't stand,
13 that's not a... that's, that's not an appropriate end
14 result here so whichever way we're going to address
15 it whether it be enforcement or nonenforcement we are
16 going to address it.

17 CAROLYN JASPER: And excuse... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay... [cross-
19 talk]

20 CAROLYN JASPER: ...me I would like... also
21 like to mention that the Housing Authority would also
22 join you with the Councilman in, in that meeting as
23 well.

24 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you so
3 much, I'm just going to wrap up with a few questions.
4 So, just getting back to NYCHA for a second so you
5 spoke of vandalism, I think... I believe of the doors,
6 in a situation like that would you then contact
7 you're your property manager than contact the NYPD to
8 alert them that there's... doors open or how would... or
9 we would just leave it until that door was serviced?

10 CAROLYN JASPER: Well basically with they
11 do is that they're required to contact the PD and
12 also an officer of safety and security just to let
13 them know so they can make that a post condition
14 that, that, that door is not locking and that it is
15 open.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay and how do
17 we know... and just... and I'm not trying to be funny...

18 [cross-talk]

19 CAROLYN JASPER: No, that's... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...here but...

21 [cross-talk]

22 CAROLYN JASPER: ...fine... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...I just think
24 checks and balances is, is important and just going

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 back to the assessment so they would... they would then
3 contact PD, how do you know that they're doing that?

4 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, so the managers
5 they can... they will normally call PD and they will
6 speak with them and let them know.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Who would they
8 speak with in PD?

9 CAROLYN JASPER: I would say an officer;
10 I would have to find out who they speak to... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
13 talk]

14 CAROLYN JASPER: ...but when you speak with
15 the managers would let you know and I just also
16 wanted to mention that our managing superintendents
17 have a very good rapport with the NCO's as well so if
18 they're having issues at the location they do speak
19 with them and they do inform them where they're
20 having their issues.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But, but that
22 question goes back once again; the, the million
23 dollar question, how do you know that that's actually
24 happening?

25 CAROLYN JASPER: Well... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Because there's
a lot of discretion given... [cross-talk]

CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...to the
managers and I expect managers... [cross-talk]

CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...to be treated
with respect and dignity... [cross-talk]

CAROLYN JASPER: Okay... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...because they
are managers... [cross-talk]

CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but just as in
my office I have managers there are checks and
balances so I still want to get reports from my
managers so would... who in NYCHA would then receive a
transcript of, you know what's happening?

CAROLYN JASPER: So, just to let you know
we do have visibility into what is going on at the
developments based on the number of work orders and
the system and what they call their service level
agreements, right, so realistically I mean I have
like I mentioned approximately 70 properties I cannot
get an update every single day from a property so the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 visibility is there with reports that we're able to
3 go into the system and review. As mentioned before
4 the structure in the boroughs is that the managers
5 and superintendents report into a regional asset
6 manager who oversee approximately five to seven
7 properties, it is their responsibility to touch bases
8 with the managers, to review our online reports, to
9 review our work orders, again to see what the
10 productivity is and also to do spot checks. Our
11 regional asset managers are also required as I
12 mentioned previously to check specific items at a
13 development and again, they're responsible for
14 checking to ensure that each of their developments
15 are performing the daily checklists and also putting
16 in work orders.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right and does
18 the... these reports ever reach the Chairperson's desk?

19 CAROLYN JASPER: I have the reports, so
20 the reports that... again, our reports... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: The assessments
22 and everything reach... just very direct... [cross-talk]

23 CAROLYN JASPER: ...so, when we talk...
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...question...

3 [cross-talk]

4 CAROLYN JASPER: ...about the assessments,
5 again, I will have to speak with the officer of
6 safety and security regarding the reports that are
7 going out to property management. When we talk about
8 the oversight of the doors and the daily maintenance
9 of the doors and the property, the life that is the
10 responsibility of property management... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Got that but
12 does... do these reports ever reach the Chairperson's
13 desk?

14 CAROLYN JASPER: The reports... okay, so I
15 can say again, the Chair and... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yes or no
17 question.

18 CAROLYN JASPER: Well I... well when I
19 talk... when you talk about... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And if you're
21 unaware, if, if it's not happening... [cross-talk]

22 CAROLYN JASPER: Well... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that's okay
24 but I just want to know do these reports reach the
25 Chairperson at all.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CAROLYN JASPER: So, again I can't say if
3 they reach the Chairperson however... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
5 talk]

6 CAROLYN JASPER: ...I can say... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
8 talk]

9 CAROLYN JASPER: ...that we all, all of the
10 Housing Authority employees we do have access, those
11 who are working in the offices we do have access to
12 reports and I'm pretty sure that individuals in the
13 Chair office they provide, you know information
14 regarding reports... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
16 talk]

17 CAROLYN JASPER: ...and statistics as well.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay. Alrighty,
19 just... last few questions to... I know Oleg is used to
20 me saying this, PSAs can you just speak to how much
21 personnel is assigned in these... to each PSA and then
22 just speak to any... are there any additional needs
23 that PSAs need across the city and then for
24 communities that don't have PSAs Chief Secreto would
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 you still oversee those developments or you just
3 specifically oversee the PSAs?

4 JAMES SECRETO: So, I guess you're
5 alluding to like out in Far Rockaway, Rockaways,
6 Staten Island, yeah those are overseen by the patrol
7 borough, so Queens South and Staten Island are
8 covered... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And... but you're
10 in charge of housing technically, right?

11 JAMES SECRETO: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: For NYCHA?

13 JAMES SECRETO: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Is there any
15 reason that you wouldn't oversee those developments...
16 [cross-talk]

17 JAMES SECRETO: I think... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...or is that a
19 Commissioner call?

20 JAMES SECRETO: I think the logistically
21 because they were so far away that they were, you
22 know handed off to patrol so, you know for response
23 purposes or whatever, I think it would be a long trek
24 from PSA nine to get out to the Rockaways and for PSA
25 one to get out to Staten Island.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Do you think
3 that you should have jurisdiction over them since
4 you're this... your commission... I mean the, the Chief
5 of Housing, do you think that it would be wiser to
6 just have all of the developments under your
7 jurisdiction to a greater degree?

8 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Do you want me to
9 answer this?

10 JAMES SECRETO: Go ahead, yeah.

11 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: So, Council Member...
12 [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oleg, this
14 sounds like a Commissioner question but go ahead...
15 [cross-talk]

16 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Sure, I think I, I
17 think you're, you're answering your own question but
18 I, I mean I think the important piece to point out is
19 if you take a look at the Rockaways and what we did,
20 you know going into this hearing is took look at...
21 compared todays numbers versus 1995... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh, uh-huh...
23 [cross-talk]

24 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...the, the significance
25 in 95 was when housing police were actually dedicated

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

for example to the Rockaways, crime is down 74
percent... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yep... [cross-
talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...versus, versus that
time so... and the other thing to point out... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But the... and
not... [cross-talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...and I think... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...to cut you off
but let me tell you why, it's because... it's the
culmination of cure violence, the, the crisis
management system... [cross-talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yep... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...jobs, real
community engagement, community centers that are
actually starting to function, they weren't really
functioning so it's a real culmination of things that
have really driven the crime down, out that we still
have a ways to go... [cross-talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yep... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but obviously
that's not happening across the entire city... [cross-
talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: So, I mean on... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but... [cross-
talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...your point I, I
think... I agree with you and that's... I mean that is
neighborhood policing, right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...not to solve every
issue, every... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...condition through...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
talk]

OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...greater enforcement
and more troops on the ground, it's to think out of
the box and, and come up with other solutions, I mean
the important... one important point I want to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 highlight is even though housing... the... for example
3 the Rockaways, we'll use the Rockaways because that's
4 your district but the Rockaways even though they
5 don't fall under housing bureau the precincts that
6 cover actually have a dedicated contingent of
7 officers that are specifically tasked with patrolling
8 housing in your district. The other piece to
9 highlight is and you, you mentioned some of the non-
10 enforcement programs and the Chief can certainly go
11 into some of the things we're doing that are out of
12 the box and not necessarily enforcement based to
13 address crime and I think you highlighted some really
14 good points, we also have points. For example, a
15 basketball league that we created that has a
16 classroom component and the Chief will go into that,
17 virtual reality program that we do, J-RIP that we do
18 and the... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: The football
20 league is starting.

21 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Right and then we have
22 additional programs that we partner with NYCHA and we
23 partner with other sister agencies to, to, to address
24 other concerns and, and to, to address issues not
25 necessarily through enforcement and I, I think... I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 mean I think at the end of the day that's working
3 because we're actually seeing at least in the last
4 five years arrests are down by 140,000 arrests in a
5 year, summonses are down by close to 80 percent,
6 street stops are down from a height of close to
7 700,000 in, in 2011 I think to under 11,000 last
8 year, the jail population is below 10,000, right, so
9 we're actually.. and crime is at record lows year over
10 year so we're able to address crime through
11 neighborhood policing, through these new strategies
12 without necessarily defaulting to enforcement and
13 we're actually seeing positive results.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Good, got that
15 but I'm just.. I'm trying to understand why Chief
16 Secreto would not have all of public housing in his
17 portfolio if he's the chief of housing.. [cross-talk]

18 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Well I, I think it's..
19 [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...and why would
21 the...

22 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yeah, I think.. I mean
23 like anything else like all deployments anytime we
24 redraw sectors, anytime we add a precinct, for
25 example, the 116 or the 121 in Staten Island lines

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 are with... lines are redrawn, we do these evaluations
3 based on what we're seeing on the ground, the
4 department always does these evaluations and
5 decisions were made just logistic based decisions not
6 to shortchange any particular development anywhere in
7 the city but to better address and more... give a much
8 more rapid response to the needs of those particular...
9 [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Got it... [cross-
11 talk]

12 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: ...developments... [cross-
13 talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Got it, got it
15 but you know when ever and at least the, the, the
16 press conferences I've been to whenever there's an
17 issue about public housing the person who is on the
18 hot seat is him and he has to respond whether it's
19 PSAs or not so I'm just... let's have further
20 conversations on this... [cross-talk]

21 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Sure... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...because I
23 think there should just be one central place that we
24 look to when it comes to housing and it seems to be
25 all over the place right now. Last of the questions

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 for MOCJ, is there a plan to expand crisis management
3 system, appreciate the work MAP does but we know
4 crisis management has certainly worked, is there
5 anything in the works on that and then I guess the,
6 the question... and, and I do want to be sensitive to
7 NYCHA to a great degree on the cameras because they
8 have so many other structural needs and it would be
9 irresponsible for me to sit here and say that I
10 shouldn't chip in, I don't mind chipping in, I think
11 I've probably funded every development out in the
12 Rockaways for, for CCTVs but what, what other
13 investments or structural things should we be looking
14 at that you think could make the world much easier
15 for all of... all of you and for NYCHA residents? So,
16 if we had to think outside the box and give one or
17 two things what are some investments that you think
18 could work and once again I applaud the NYPD because
19 I know my colleagues may differ, we don't need more
20 enforcement that has not shown that it's worked in
21 the past so I think that the direction that you're
22 moving in is... moving in is the correct, correct
23 direction but what are some other things that we can
24 be doing collectively to make the world better when
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 it comes to community investments? Let's start with
3 MOCJ.

4 RENITA FRANCIOS: Thank you for that
5 question, so to your first question I can... I cannot
6 begin to speak for the crisis management system, I
7 only speak for MAP but in terms of what is working we
8 are in the middle of an evaluation with promising
9 results about the... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Who's doing the
11 evaluation?

12 RENITA FRANCIOS: John Jay is doing the
13 evaluation.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, uh-huh,
15 alright... [cross-talk]

16 RENITA FRANCIOS: happy, happy to share
17 the preliminary results with you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Any plans to
19 expand MAP outside of the 16 developments?

20 RENITA FRANCIOS: Outside of the 15 MAP...
21 [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: 15, I'm sorry...
23 [cross-talk]

24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...developments, we are...
3 we are still building the car and driving it so we're
4 trying... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
6 talk]

7 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...to perfect the
8 NeighborhoodStat model, there are various parts of
9 the initiative that we know residents find effective
10 that have benefited other developments so there's
11 the... 44 developments have received permanent lighting
12 upgrades or allocations for them, some of those have
13 been completed including a pilot at Whitman and
14 Jefferson and three developments so far I believe
15 with about 40 more or so to come. What we've seen
16 with SYEP and what has worked for the guaranteed
17 slots that MAP residents have this year NYCHA has
18 their own special allocation the same way that MAP
19 does outside of MAP developments or a few of their
20 developments as well and then there's also the
21 extended hours, the late night hours and the summer
22 and weekends for community centers, all of the
23 community centers have that not just MAP
24 developments.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And let me just
3 go back to, to that again, I meant why do we have to
4 wait for developments to be crime ridden before we
5 expand MAP, all developments should have MAP so I
6 think we should go with that as our mindset, we don't
7 have to wait for the building to start burning down
8 before we respond so I think that should be something
9 that you, you look at citywide whether we have the
10 money or not just planning with that... [cross-talk]

11 RENITA FRANCIOS: Yeah... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...in mind, we
13 should not wait... [cross-talk]

14 RENITA FRANCIOS: Yeah, I mean... [cross-
15 talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...till
17 developments reach their peak of crime to then want
18 to respond.

19 RENITA FRANCIOS: We're definitely...
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But we should...
22 [cross-talk]

23 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...not doing that...
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah... [cross-
3 talk]

4 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...as you heard the
5 gentleman from Seth Low that was here earlier spoke
6 very positively about what MAP is doing for his
7 neighborhood, he doesn't live in a MAP development so
8 the resources and the events and the programming and
9 all these opportunities for a community in cohesion
10 extend to the residents who live nearby... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And do you
12 think 50,000 dollars is enough for you to go... [cross-
13 talk]

14 RENITA FRANCIOS: So, I want to clarify,
15 MAP has invested over 100 million in programming
16 alone to date... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: 100 million...
18 [cross-talk]

19 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...and more than 400
20 million dollars total, the 50,000 dollars is just for
21 the resident teams to allocate for themselves, I
22 don't know of any other initiative that gives
23 residents that, that money to allocate for themselves
24 for public safety matters, I'm not by any means
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 saying that that's enough, it's more like seed money
3 for them... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
5 talk]

6 RENITA FRANCIOS: ...to realize the first
7 step in their vision and in some areas, they're
8 working with their Council Person to engage on how
9 their priorities... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And can we get
11 a breakdown on how that 400 million was spent?

12 RENITA FRANCIOS: Sure.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, that's a
14 request that we have. I think... I think that is... that
15 is my... and, and if there... are there any other
16 investments that you believe we should be doing that
17 will make life easier for NYCHA residents?

18 JAMES SECRETO: Councilman if I... we have
19 a... we have a successful program out in East New York
20 in Brownsville that United Cornerstone basketball
21 league... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
23 talk]

24 JAMES SECRETO: ...and this is about... I
25 think this is our fifth season, going to kick off in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 July and it's a cops and kids basketball league but...
3 and there's nothing necessarily new about that but
4 what makes this program so unique is that the kids
5 have to participate in a classroom component and, and
6 in this classroom component there's, there's job, job
7 opportunities, there's resume building, there's life
8 skills, there's GED prep, college prep, there's guest
9 speakers, some athletes come, I know John Wallace a
10 former Knick and alum of Syracuse he came the first
11 year and they have stakeholders that invest in this
12 program and it's been... it's been very successful. We...
13 some anecdotal stories, one kid wanted out of a gang
14 and through this program he was able to get out of
15 the gang. Another one who was going to join a gang as
16 his... because of his involvement with this basketball
17 league he decided against joining the gang which his
18 family members were, and he went in another
19 direction. We were also able to, the, the first year
20 that... the MVP of the league, very good basketball
21 player, he divulged that he was homeless, that, that
22 him and his family were homeless and we were able to
23 help him along with the stakeholders to get his
24 family an apartment, get a voucher for an apartment.
25 So, this league has been highly successful. What I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 haven't been able to do is expand it to the other
3 PSAs, you know throughout the city, it would... it
4 would be a home run if we could. What we have been
5 able to expand on is now the second component is
6 called options where they have virtual reality
7 scenarios, I think the police Commissioner talked
8 about it back in January at his state... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I get it...
10 [cross-talk]

11 JAMES SECRETO: ...NYPD... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
13 talk]

14 JAMES SECRETO: ...they actually borrowed
15 that and I won't say stole, they actually borrowed
16 that and started it in PSA two and now looking to
17 expand it citywide and they have but what it does is
18 so there's a lot of these young people are into
19 computer and video games and what have you and it's
20 kind of modeled after our FAS fire arm simulator that
21 the police department has, the kids get... they get a
22 headset and they're, they're faced with different
23 scenarios maybe a gang initiation, maybe getting
24 high, maybe holding a gun... a female holding a gun in
25 her purse for somebody, different scenarios that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 these kids help design and curriculum that DOE drew
3 up. So, if we could expand on those programs it would
4 be home run.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: NYCHA. You said
6 where do you start.

7 CAROLYN JASPER: No, thank you for your
8 question, I'm not going to ask for more cameras
9 because I know that that has been asked before but
10 what I would like to... so, I've been in the Housing
11 Authority for many, many years and we've held
12 meetings, you know within developments or within
13 communities where we've had high crimes or quality of
14 life issues so in addressing some of the issues
15 collectively between NYPD, collaboration between
16 MOCJ, PD and also some of the Council Members, you
17 know if you have like problematic developments
18 perhaps let's go to that development and let's talk
19 about what some of the various issues are, let's talk
20 about housing's rules and regulations and breach of
21 rules and regulations and you know some of the issues
22 that we're encountering to educate the residents
23 collectively on how we can work together on improving
24 conditions within... you know within our communities,
25 talk about the issues about again, the doors and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 being proactive instead or reactive again, you know
3 unfortunately there are instances that occur that we
4 can't control but however in moving forward
5 proactively perhaps we can look different... look, you
6 know to do things a little differently with
7 responding beforehand collectively and going out to
8 these developments and just having meetings with the
9 residents to educate them in areas of safety and
10 security, housing rules and regulations and you know
11 perhaps there are other resources that we can also
12 talk about at those meetings to help those within the
13 community.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you, I'll
15 turn it back over to the Chair, thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: One program
17 that I didn't hear mentioned was the juvenile robbery
18 intervention program, the J-RIP program and I
19 mentioned that because I worked very closely and
20 intimately with Chief Jaffe when she was working in
21 Brownsville in East New York coming out of PSA two
22 out of the trailer in the back and I know that
23 sister, Miss Bennett was talking about the robberies
24 in her development and how you see that things change
25 because this young person is now incarcerated but the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 juvenile robbery intervention program was to address
3 that so the young folks did not have to go to jail,
4 it was an intervention program and so if you can
5 would you be able to explain to us what's happening
6 with J-RIP because I did speak to some of the
7 officers a couple of weeks ago and you know they're
8 still around but there's no increased resources
9 placed into the program so can you talk about that?

10 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yes.

11 JAMES SECRETO: I, I just wanted to ask
12 something, I know Council Member Richards left but
13 with that United Cornerstone basketball league it
14 started out the first season one development against
15 another; Tilden against Van Dyke Seth Low and then
16 they... in, in the subsequent seasons they've decided
17 to kind of integrate the developments so some kids
18 from Tilden would play with some kids from Van Dyke
19 and, and that's big because they can't go... you know
20 out there you can't... if you live in Tilden you can't
21 go to Van Dyke and vice versus so them playing on the
22 same team was big and so... and we're looking in... to
23 expand on that as well. As far as J-RIP it's still,
24 still going well, it's in the seventh PSA two and the
25 73, PSA five and East Harlem 23 and now in the 114

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 PSA nine, 1,000... 1,100 kids have gone through this
3 system and right now I think the number is more like...
4 there's 63... I'm going to... I'm, I'm not going to do
5 the math here, there's 63 kids in PSA two, 56 in PSA
6 five and 89 in PSA nine. One of the things that we
7 have done and maybe we'll have to change the, the
8 name from a robbery because we're seeing that these
9 young kids; 14, 15, 16 are also involved in shootings
10 now so we don't want to just limit their, their
11 involvement to robberies we're now including
12 especially up in East Harlem, Harlem as Council Woman
13 Ayala talked about Wagner, Jefferson, a lot of these
14 kids are 14 and 15 years old so we've included them
15 in the program and, and what we do is we go and visit
16 them at home, talk to the parents, check their
17 attendance at school, make sure they're going to
18 school and, you know some, some... as we were getting
19 prepared yesterday I got a text from, from the
20 lieutenant from PSA nine telling me that they just
21 attended the graduation, one of the kids graduated
22 from a culinary school and another kid graduated from
23 Seton Hall so there's like some success stories
24 coming out of there, the stats are... you know the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 stats, the, the robberies have come down but more
3 importantly the kids are put on a... on a good path.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, we
5 have... I remember one young man from the program was...
6 he had a lot going on but two years ago he was the
7 hired contracted photographer for the State Assembly
8 when they had their caucus and that was a young man
9 who was part of the program, worked the program and
10 his family was involved because one thing with J-RIP
11 it's not just the young person it's the wraparound
12 services for the entire family and so I would like
13 when we're talking about MAP and the different
14 programs and resources for, for... you know for people
15 to actually know about all the other programs that
16 you have so that everyone can work together because
17 when the sister talked about the robberies in her
18 development in Polo Ground I immediately thought
19 about J-RIP and, and there could be lessons learned
20 there so a lot of times we spin our wheels when there
21 are programs and resources that are doing amazing
22 jobs and they can be scaled up or incorporated into
23 the program but we're not doing that, we're all at
24 the table thinking about the next great thing and
25 sometimes you don't have to reinvent the wheel.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 JAMES SECRETO: I, I just got a note
3 from, from MOCJ that we have expanded the basketball
4 program and, and, and she's 100 percent right and
5 they just had a tournament at 145th and, and the west
6 side there, the, the park there and we had teams from
7 the Bronx, Harlem, there was one from Newburgh
8 upstate and from Suffolk County that they came and
9 participated in it and that's in addition to the MAP
10 tournaments that we have.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
12 you. So, we're just... I'm... its... I only have three
13 questions left and it's just more about clarity and
14 it's just a breeze through quickly. Just how many
15 developments do not have cameras right now and how
16 many residents does that reflect? So, that's just...
17 so, we just need to know the number of developments
18 that do not have cameras and the difference in crime
19 between those that do have cameras and the ones that
20 don't, so, if you can give us a, a comparison of the
21 crime statistics between developments that have
22 cameras and those developments that do not and how
23 many unlocked doors are there currently and because
24 you mentioned 2,580 and so I just wanted to know is
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 that the current number of doors that are unlocked
3 and if there is a timeline or a timeframe?

4 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, the information
5 that I have here is for the past 12... thank you for
6 your question, I apologize, the, the information that
7 I have here that I reported is from June 2018 through
8 May of 2019 so we will have to give you current
9 information.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Okay, so
11 we just need to know the current number of doors that
12 are unlocked, and I did send over some pictures to
13 you... [cross-talk]

14 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and that's a
16 picture... the, the first picture is of a door and the,
17 the front door and that is the senior development,
18 that is Franklin Avenue and you can clearly see where
19 the door itself is taped up and the other picture is
20 of a staircase with feces and the other is a homeless
21 person's belongings under the scaffold and the other
22 is a man who assaulted one of your employees, a NYCHA
23 worker... [cross-talk]

24 CAROLYN JASPER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...so, those are
3 the pictures that you have before you and so after we
4 can... [cross-talk]

5 CAROLYN JASPER: Sure... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...we can
7 discuss it for follow up...

8 CAROLYN JASPER: Sure...

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And also can
10 you... the Comptrollers report, in the Comptrollers
11 report from 2018, 299 developments were visited and
12 65 percent... according to the report 65 percent of the
13 doors were unsecured, can you respond to the report
14 for the record and were there any improvements made
15 as a result of the report?

16 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes, I do have a copy of
17 the report and there were improvements made,
18 tremendous improvements made so if you would like to
19 have a copy of the report, we do have that report.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We, we have a
21 copy, I just wanted to know your response... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CAROLYN JASPER: Oh, we... yes... [cross-
24 talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...to the
3 report... [cross-talk]

4 CAROLYN JASPER: ...we do have a copy of
5 the completed report where we have property
6 management staff follow up and on that same report we
7 had them indicate actions taken to address those
8 repairs in addition to indicate whether or not, you
9 know if at the time they found the door open we asked
10 the actions taken in order to complete the repair and
11 so they provided an update and they indicated that
12 the doors were repaired.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Okay.

14 CAROLYN JASPER: So, I have a copy of the
15 report with the responses that we received from the
16 properties.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, that
18 would be very helpful. For Miss Francios, can you
19 just kind of sum up how do you measure success for
20 MAP, the MAP program... [cross-talk]

21 RENITA FRANCIOS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and can you
23 answer that question in light of what came out of
24 Council Member Reynoso's and Council Member Ayala's
25 questions and, you know there, their passion for

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 what's happening in their districts within their MAP
3 programs so how do you measure success?

4 RENITA FRANCIOS: So, I think, you know
5 the textbook answer is that we are in the middle of
6 an evaluation, you'll see those results but for us
7 personally from my team who works hard on this every
8 day for the engagement staff that's on the ground we
9 measure it by how many people are showing up in this
10 process to say we want to see something done, we want
11 to play an active role in that and we want to
12 understand what it means for the public to be a part
13 of public safety so in my testimony when I said
14 21,000 people had been engaged in this process to us
15 that is an indicator of some level of success, this
16 is our first round doing that so we will compare that
17 against how we do in future years of course. Through
18 programmatic contacts we've had 500,000 people
19 almost, nearly 499 something odd thousand people be
20 connected to programming through MAP and I'm saying
21 contacts because some of those people obviously could
22 be repetitive. In the evaluation we will have a
23 better understanding of resident, resident perception
24 of our work, that is very important because MAP has
25 more than one goal, it wasn't just about reducing

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 crime, it was about increasing safety and perceptions
3 of safety and there's... the only way you can know that
4 is to ask the people so we will see survey results on
5 that. The other thing was to increase community
6 cohesion which to me is spoken to by the number of
7 people as I said engaged in this process, those are
8 the ways that I would measure success, do I think
9 that there is a point where we can say we have been
10 successful, if one person is shot... if there's one
11 shot fired or one person is robbed I don't know that
12 we could say that, we may never get to that point but
13 it's... to me it's about constantly iterating and
14 working on it and having people who understand that
15 experience at the forefront of this, you know
16 empathy, transparency, accountability, those things
17 are free, they don't... it doesn't cost anything to
18 implement that but we have to find a way to
19 operationalize those values with our agency partners
20 and track the way we're determining whether or not
21 empathy and accountability and transparency are
22 deployed and that's the way I think that we measure
23 success on our team.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
25 you and I do have one last question, this is... this is

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 the last one. For NYCHA, please provide an update on
3 the removal of nonessential scaffolds and sidewalk
4 sheds and is there a plan to remove the nonessential
5 scaffolding and sidewalk sheds at the non-MAP
6 developments and, and again the pictures that I sent
7 up you can see where there's scaffolding around that
8 senior development and the person's shopping cart is
9 affixed to the scaffold in that photo so can you
10 please just let us know what's happening with the
11 scaffolding?

12 STEVE LOVCI: We, we'll get back to you
13 on all of the scaffolding, we have those numbers and,
14 and we're constantly working to take those down.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Alright, well...
16 alright, so that concludes our questions, we have a...
17 we actually had 13 pages of questions so we'll follow
18 up with those and we'll be expecting the questions
19 that we had today be... you were going to say
20 something. Go ahead.

21 CAROLYN JASPER: So, we have... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Mic, okay.

24 CAROLYN JASPER: Thank you for that
25 question, so we have a total of 132,618 linear feet

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 as of... well this says February 15th, 2019, we'll have
3 to provide an update, it was about three months ago.
4 It says here LL2 construction sheds, what does that
5 mean?

6 STEVE LOVCI: So, this is... again, we'll
7 get you all of this information but Local Law 11
8 work, this would be the municipal construction sheds
9 of about 28,000 linear feet, we have Local Law 11
10 emergency sheds which is roughly around 61,000 linear
11 feet, we've got project sheds so those would be
12 associated to construction projects for roofing or
13 other façade pieces around 18,921 linear feet so that
14 is just... those are just projects that are... that would
15 not be part of the Mayoral roofing, the Mayoral
16 roofing program has around 23,463 linear feet of
17 sheds, every time you do a construction project you
18 have to put up the, the shedding to protect the, the
19 residents and, and then that covers around 483
20 buildings that have sheds.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, the
22 question was just about the plan of the removal not
23 the... you know like the... [cross-talk]

24 STEVE LOVCI: The numbers, right... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ..the... all of
3 the sheds that you have yet... [cross-talk]

4 CAROLYN JASPER: And just to let you know
5 from January 18th through February 15th, 2019
6 approximately 36,500 linear feet of shedding has bene
7 removed.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, alright,
9 so again we'll follow up with you on that and so that
10 concludes this level of questions, thank you so much
11 for your testimony today, clearly, we have, you know
12 a lot of work to do together. I will say that there
13 has no... there, there has not been funding allocated
14 for... so far for Woodson Houses and so we should have
15 a conversation about that as well collectively and do
16 round table discussions to really talk about and
17 drill down on the safety and security amongst our
18 developments and what we can all do together. So,
19 thank you so much and enjoy your day. The next panel
20 we will hear from is Miss Louise Green in Pink
21 Houses; Karen Caldwell in Pink Houses; Mary Redick,
22 Pink Houses; Clarisa, I can't make this out,
23 Patterson Houses; Inez Jackson, Polo Ground; and Gail
24 Baez, Polo Ground. Miss Glover you can come up. Miss
25 Glover, Washington Houses; Latisha McNeil, Holmes,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 Holmes Towers, Lakeesha Taylor, Holmes Tower; Maggie
3 Larkins, Far Rockaway and Helene Redd, Bailey Houses.
4 Maggie Larkins. Jeannette Salcedo, Salcedo, Castle
5 Hill; Christine Brown, Castle Hill; David Grant, Los
6 Sures; Sandra Tapia, Bushwick Houses; Rochelle McGee,
7 Bushwick Houses; Rattisan Joylyn, St. Nicholas Houses
8 and Adele Braxton, St. Nicholas Houses. Okay. So, you
9 can begin your testimony and I would please ask that
10 you state your name clearly and the development that
11 you represent. Thank you.

12 CRYSTAL GLOVER: Good morning, I'm going
13 to speak loud and clear. Good morning Committee on
14 Public Housing and Committee on Public Safety. Thank
15 you for having this oversight hearing on safety and
16 security in NYCHA. My name is Crystal Glover and I am
17 a resident of Washington Houses. I saw on the twelve
18 o'clock news about a month ago about a man stealing a
19 kiosk machine from a NYCHA management office on 1st
20 Avenue. The kiosk is where we... is where our yearly
21 resident affidavit information is stored, it was
22 mentioned once and they pulled the report probably
23 because they don't want the residents to be alarmed
24 but wait, it gets worse. Here is where I fit in, a
25 few weeks ago I come into my building at nine p.m., I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 look into my mailbox and remove a letter, at 11:30
3 p.m. my son comes home and thanks me for finding and
4 putting his ID in the mailbox, he said it must have
5 fallen from off his neck when he was going down the
6 stairs that day. I told him it wasn't me that put it
7 in there and the mailbox... the postal people don't
8 work that late. So, the next day I decided to put my
9 key in other boxes to see if it would fit and sure
10 enough, one other box opened, I was shocked, I have
11 proof and I have witnesses. I emailed my property
12 manager she replied and said the mailbox issue has
13 been brought to the attention of the PSA and she
14 notified the maintenance supervisors and that they
15 are looking into the matter. I also spoke to her by
16 phone and she expressed how serious a matter this is.
17 I have not heard from her since. I went to the post
18 office... I went to the post office to have my mail
19 stopped and to make arrangements to be able to pick
20 my mail up there because I don't trust it coming to
21 my mailbox. Mr. Bell, the supervisor at the post
22 office made me fill out a card that says the mail
23 will be saved from that day to the day I pick... to the
24 day I pick, you see I can't afford a P.O. box. Thank
25 god I had him write a letter to confirm our

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 conversation, guess what, the mail didn't stop and
3 it's still coming to my mailbox. I want the world to
4 know, especially NYCHA residents that anybody can get
5 into your mailbox and NYCHA don't give a damn.
6 Anybody can also get into your apartment too. One day
7 I come home, put my key in the door but the door was
8 already open. I was shocked and did notice a person
9 running down the stairs. It's criminal, it's a
10 felony. I sent emails to the borough office, CC Diana
11 Ayala, my City Council rep and even the public
12 advocate as well as Monica Morales from PIX 11 news
13 about the mailbox situation, none of them have gotten
14 back to me. I also want you to know that the NYCHA
15 federal monitor, Bart Schwartz formed an advisory
16 committee. He gave an advisory board meeting open to
17 NYCHA residents, the meeting was in Brooklyn, I went,
18 Mr. Schwartz promised me openly after I slipped him
19 my question that he would be willing to come to
20 Washington Houses, I haven't heard from him yet. This
21 issue with the mailbox and apartment doors, the fact
22 that anybody can get into your house and get into
23 your box is very troubling and I want to know what is
24 going to be done about it. NYCHA and the city looks
25 at residents as poor, welfare, retired, disabled,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 disenfranchised, under... voiceless, socioeconomically
3 deprived and we are citizens... all this money and I
4 can go on and on and on. As... they look at us as
5 garbage and the fact that we residents don't raise
6 enough hell gives them the right to walk all over us.
7 They put smoke free policies together first and then
8 ask what our opinion is later. I know because I was
9 on the panel. I got on the panel after I called and
10 made a complaint about the cigarettes and the reefer
11 smoke coming into my apartment. Residents, my email
12 address is g Crystal 2234 at Gmail dot com.
13 Criminals, politics are going to have our butts in
14 the streets if we don't get busy. It's up to the
15 residents, we got to take charge, these tenant
16 associations that aren't doing... that aren't sticking
17 to their bylaws they're not doing their jobs and
18 NYCHA and resident engagements will tell you oh well
19 you're bylaws and your... and your tenants associations
20 are democratic and independent and we can't come up
21 there and tell them nothing but yet their asses are
22 there when it's time for elections, okay, so those of
23 you, the young people that came here today take down
24 my Gmail because these district leaders who don't
25 even really... they deal with judges and so forth,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 there's so much garbage going on in these
3 developments any time I can open up people's
4 mailboxes. I told the postal man, the supervisor my
5 mail is still coming to my apartment, he didn't even
6 pay me any attention, they look at us as garbage
7 whether you're working poor, whether you're disabled,
8 whether you... whatever you are. New York City Housing
9 Authority employees make more money than in any other
10 state in New York City, they get crazy money and they
11 aren't even doing their jobs. So, you residents who
12 have tenants associations, if you don't have a TA you
13 form one and you tell them bums that are... that are
14 your TAs, tell them you want a by... a copy of the
15 bylaws, ten percent of the membership in most bylaws
16 is what has to... you have to be a member in most
17 tenants association... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Miss Glover...
19 [cross-talk]

20 CRYSTAL GLOVER: ...and you have to have
21 ten percent of the membership to address these fools
22 that are... that are leader... that are so called leaders
23 in your developments and on that note I thank you
24 very much and I'm hoping because Miss Samuels is very
25 professional and I'm... just like Bert Schwartz, the so

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 called monitor who promised me that he was coming to
3 my development and did not contact me yet, he's the
4 federal monitor. I'm hoping that somebody today
5 that's listening will tell me what I should do that
6 my key won't fit in other people's mailboxes... [cross-
7 talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
9 talk]

10 CRYSTAL GLOVER: ...because that's a
11 federal offence and it's a disgrace and my ancestors
12 didn't bleed and die for this garbage; we are United
13 States citizens and we deserve better.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Miss
15 Glover, thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Someone here
17 from NYCHA, okay, can you take her information? Thank
18 you.

19 LATISHA MCNEIL: Okay. Hi, good
20 afternoon. My name is Latisha, I'm from the Holmes
21 Towers. My concern is, I feel like Holmes Towers and
22 Isaacs are kind of falling on... under the radar
23 because of its location. In all actuality it's a lot
24 of unsafe conditions going on in our development.
25 One, I'm concerned because they're proposing to put a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 50-story building in our development when the current
3 issues that are going on, be it safety, environmental
4 issues, whatever is going on right now it's not of a
5 concern but this building. Our door has been broke so
6 many times which I know this issue has come up but at
7 the same time the, the, the intercom doesn't work
8 for, for our guest to come in and out which causes
9 people to prop doors open so that their family
10 members could come in and out. Then there's the
11 trespassers, there's the drugs that's going on.
12 Listen, I grew up in Mitchell projects, that's where
13 I'm from, I couldn't go out to play as a kid because
14 my mother feared me not returning home. I do not want
15 that for my children, I want my children to be able
16 to go out, I want my children to be able to go out
17 and make friends and flourish and grow the way that
18 they're supposed to as children, I don't want my
19 daughter to continue to ask me mommy why can't I go
20 outside and my answer is, baby right now is not the
21 time. I don't want to keep telling her that because I
22 know how that feels to be jammed up in a house
23 because of safety issues and at Holmes Houses right
24 now it's a very big safety issue. After a certain
25 time, I will not even go out to throw my garbage out

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 because there's someone lurking in the hallway and
3 it's like what do you do. There are times where I
4 have to go outside to take my daughter to school and
5 I'm stepping over homeless people and it's like, like
6 what... I fear for the safety of me and my children and
7 it's really... it's really getting really, really bad.
8 There's... I... from... last I've known it's illegal to
9 have barbecues on, on NYCHA property, ever since the...
10 ever since it hit 70 degrees there's charcoal fumes
11 coming in my window and I have very young children,
12 what is that doing to their respiratory system, you
13 have a no smoke policy in place but there's charcoal
14 fumes coming in my window in addition to the
15 marijuana, in addition to the K2, in addition to
16 everything else that's being smoked. Then let's go to
17 the prostitution that's going on, I come in from work
18 the elevators are being held up because of the
19 traffic, it's like Grand Central Station on 92nd
20 Street and 1st Avenue, it's like Grand Central.
21 There's no... there's cameras in one side and no
22 cameras on the other side so what... any... someone who
23 knows the way around they're going to go to the side
24 where there's no cameras. So, my question is, where's
25 the money for the rest of the cameras because of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 course you can't put cameras in one place and not put
3 them in the other because then that's where the
4 traffic is going to go. So, I'm just lost as to
5 what's going on with Holmes because I just feel like
6 it's falling under the radar and the more it falls
7 under the worse it gets, it's, it's, it's horrible
8 right now, it's really, really bad. Has anybody
9 gotten killed yet, no, fortunately but honestly, it's
10 only a matter of time? Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

12 LAKEESHA TAYLOR: Good afternoon, my name
13 is Lakeesha, I'm also from Holmes. I'm going to also
14 speak on the safety issue and what's going on at
15 Holmes. There was a time when Holmes was the place to
16 be, we were rated number one project and everyone
17 wanted to live there, people sued actually to move in
18 to Holmes because it was in a great neighborhood,
19 it's on 92nd Street between 1st Avenue and York
20 Avenue, you... people will believe oh, you speak so
21 well because this is where we came from. People
22 wanted to live there and actually said they want to
23 build a beautiful luxury home build, building there
24 of 50 stories on top of buildings that are only 25
25 stories again because we have this great view of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 East River but again like Latisha just said, we have
3 this problem of homelessness because again what is
4 NYCHA doing, nothing, absolutely nothing. Again, as
5 you heard the, the, the pomp and circumstance of oh,
6 there's vandalism, yes there is but we have these
7 crap doors that keep breaking and why is that,
8 because of these contracts that you keep giving to
9 these people that again give us these doors that
10 what, break and then what, here you go, you get a
11 five year contract with this vendor and then what,
12 your management forgets to renew it and then what, we
13 have to wait for them to figure who you're going to
14 give this contract to again and then what, you give
15 it to the same people that what, don't fix it, don't
16 know what to do. The same thing with our elevators,
17 again I just got stuck in the elevator on the weekend
18 because why, I was speaking to the elevator, I have a
19 list of all my numbers, my ticket numbers that I give
20 in to say that the elevator is not working and what
21 happens, me and my two sons are stuck in the elevator
22 and I have to speak calmly because I don't want to
23 get them excited but, but why, because time after
24 time I continue to do what I'm supposed to do and
25 give in my ticket numbers but what does NYCHA do, the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 same shim sham, bamboozle that they have done for
3 years and years, not follow up, not continue to do
4 what they're supposed to do to their residence as we
5 are. They look down on us because we live in public
6 housing and like she just said we are people, yes,
7 there are some people on welfare, there are some
8 people who are retired, there are seniors, there are
9 working people who work in public, there are people
10 who serve, there are people who have... who have been
11 in the military, we are people, we are humans, we
12 have done service, we have done everything we need to
13 do and there are people who don't do what they need
14 to do. there's a woman in my building who lets a bum
15 in every day and again we have complained, we have
16 told them, this is the man that urinates in the
17 staircase, this is the man that poops in the
18 staircase, we have reported this to the management
19 and what has management done, absolutely nothing.
20 This is the same man that our NYCHA workers have to
21 step over to clean the staircase and I feel for them
22 because this is their job and they're trying their
23 best, they have reported it to the police, we have... I
24 personally have a great relationship with our local
25 policeman, my children love our local policemen

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 because they are not afraid because I raise them not
3 to be afraid of the policemen because this is what we
4 are supposed to do as parents because I want them to
5 grow up and be safe and learn and live and grow and,
6 and prosper but again NYCHA is not doing what they
7 are supposed to do. What happens ten years, you
8 expect these cameras to last ten years but are you
9 doing the upkeep? Are you... are you focusing? I've had
10 a neighbor tell me someone stole her key right
11 outside her door and guess what, there's a camera
12 right there, they told her she could not look at it,
13 they told her the police were supposed to look at it
14 and no one looked at it. They stole... she was
15 terrified that someone was going to come into her
16 house so again where is your connection with your...
17 with your residents, there is nothing, so speak to
18 your manager, speak to them, you can't speak to your
19 manager, you have to go through your housing
20 assistant. When you have a problem you have to follow
21 the chain and the chain is broken, the chain is
22 broken and like she said that her mailbox key... guess
23 what, we have the same problem as... at Holmes because
24 you know why, because housing keeps going to these
25 same vendors that give you the same cheap product and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 it... guess what, it's broken. How is NYCHA, it's
3 broken and I'm sorry you're not trying to fix it,
4 it's been broken for years. I grew up in housing and
5 guess what, homeless people have been sleeping in
6 the... in, in housing projects for years because guess
7 what, those doors have been open for years. So, the
8 Mayor has made a new, new law about the homelessness,
9 the homeless population and this is the biggest
10 problem, you are making these laws and it's becoming
11 a bigger problem, you don't want to... you don't want
12 to arrest them but who's suffering? NYCHA residents.
13 You're making this law about smoking in, in housing
14 and guess what, you're not enforcing them. I've been
15 dealing with my neighbor underneath me for three
16 years, she's been smoking, she's been having her
17 music on, I've been writing letters, I've been
18 telling my, my manager for three years. Her file is
19 downtown for termination, who's suffering, me and my
20 family for three years, who is suffering, I am but
21 you're not doing anything. You have these rules and
22 regulations but you're not enforcing them, you keep
23 going to these same vendors and you're not doing
24 anything, you've been wasting money for years and
25 who's suffering, we are. Time needs to change; time

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 keeps moving on and we keep suffering. This is
3 ridiculous that we keep suffering, you keep doing the
4 same thing over and over and over again. You say oh,
5 call that... call the 718 number and put in your
6 ticket, why am I pausing, because my ticket is in, my
7 ticket has been in for two years and I'm still
8 waiting for my closet to be fixed, I'm waiting for my
9 sink to be fixed, I'm waiting for my toilet to be
10 fixed and I'm waiting and this is sad these are the
11 stories I hear from the elderly people they don't
12 want to come outside because they can't sit on the
13 bench anymore and this is the... this is the condition
14 you have these people sitting in because they're sad
15 and they're afraid to come outside and they know the
16 cameras don't work because it's raining and the water
17 has set in, in the cameras... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Miss
19 Taylor... [cross-talk]

20 LAKEESHA TAYLOR: ...and they're start...
21 [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you...
23 [cross-talk]

24 LAKEESHA TAYLOR: ...I'm sorry, one moment...
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you...

3 [cross-talk]

4 LAKEESHA TAYLOR: ...and they just sad...

5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you...

7 [cross-talk]

8 LAKEESHA TAYLOR: ...and we need to fix it.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
10 thank you so much and you have all of the.. her list
11 of issues.. [cross-talk]

12 CRYSTAL GLOVER: I'm sorry, I mean to
13 mention about the policing, you can't... the police are
14 not going to come and kick people's doors down unless
15 you call them and make a report so you can sit here
16 and grill the cops all day if you want to, they are
17 not coming up there to knock anyone's door down, you
18 have to put a complaint in first and they have to do
19 an investigation.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you...

21 [cross-talk]

22 CRYSTAL GLOVER: ...things run by protocol
23 for those who don't know that, those that's getting
24 paid all this money that don't know because we
25 residents we know.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

3 CRYSTAL GLOVER: Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
5 much for your testimony today ladies, thank you so
6 much as well as the baby, we heard loud and clear.
7 Next we'll hear from Shavasia Robinson with Wagner
8 Houses; Latrell Baxton with Boulevard Houses; Robin
9 Wilder, Butler Houses; Terry Heard, Butler Houses;
10 Lisa Kenner, Van Dyke Houses; Keith Ramsey East
11 Chester Gardens; Miss Carmen Quinones, Douglass
12 Houses; Hellana Bell, Polo Ground; Shelevya Pearson,
13 Seth Low and I have here that those are the last two
14 NYCHA residents, correct?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Did anybody
16 else fill out a slip? Now is your moment.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: One more NYCHA
18 resident.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Ma'am, ma'am
20 you filled out a slip?

21 [off mic dialogue]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alrighty, now
23 is your chance. Now is your chance. If you didn't
24 fill out a slip now is your chance and then you can
25 go up there.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, Barbara G.
3 Barber from Drew Hamilton and after the last resident
4 panel then we'll hear from...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Ma'am you can
6 go up, ma'am, okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We want to do
8 Brooklyn Defenders at the same time with Rosetta
9 Cochran but that'll be with the Brooklyn Defenders.
10 And Gregory Walt, Waltman.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alrighty, you
12 may begin.

13 SHAVASIA ROBINSON: Hello, my name is
14 Shavasia Robinson, I'm a resident at Wagner Houses,
15 thank you for having me...

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I hate to
17 cut you off, I do want you to... if you could start
18 with the timer real quick, so I, I do want you to
19 stick to the time because we actually have to leave
20 out of the chamber... [cross-talk]

21 SHAVASIA ROBINSON: Okay, time really is
22 a issue.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

24 SHAVASIA ROBINSON: No problem, thank
25 you. I just want to speak on the MAP program in my

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 development. Okay, once again my name is Shavasia
3 Robinson, I'm a resident of Wagner Houses, I'm a
4 Mayor's action plan stakeholder and also a member of
5 the step committee which is the crime prevention
6 through... crime prevention through environmental
7 design. I've been a part of this initiative for about
8 one and a half years now and I'm very excited about
9 our NSTAT project. We will be beautifying the
10 basketball court as well as the empty space that's
11 being underutilized by two shipping containers and
12 also being used as an inefficient dog park. The
13 beautification of these spaces will allow us to bring
14 a variety of programming and services to our
15 residents and we... and that will promote pride in
16 place. We work with different organizations that
17 focus on the youth and youth development and we have
18 multigenerational programs as well so... because we're
19 trying to promote positive interaction among our
20 neighbors to ensure an increased public safety. Since
21 I started with this initiative, I've grown a great
22 deal and I've learned how to interact with the youth
23 and the members of the community in a positive level.
24 I look forward to the implementation of this project
25 as well as being a member of the Mayor's Action Plan

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 for many years to come. I also look forward to seeing
3 a duplication of this initiative in other areas
4 throughout the city. I look forward to working with
5 the PSA five NCOs, I look forward to working with the
6 City Council and other community members and I thank
7 you for listening, have a great afternoon.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.
9 Don't all go at once.

10 KEITH RAMSEY: I'll do it. Okay, good
11 afternoon. My name is.. I'm, I'm sorry, I come here
12 today.. thank you for having the, the hearing. There
13 is a problem with safety and security in NYCHA but
14 it's, it's not the way you think. I, I am the
15 Resident Association President of East Chester
16 Gardens partnering with NYCHA has been great and
17 difficult, confusing over the years, it's up and down
18 but NYCHA has plenty of problems but I do believe
19 that despite its issues I believe NYCHA tries to do
20 the best it can in the safety and security
21 department. Now in 1965 when Moynihan wrote about the
22 common destruction of the black family, the out of
23 wedlock birth rate was 25 percent amongst blacks,
24 1991 it was 68 percent, in 2011 it was 72 percent and
25 2019 it's 77 percent and what did Marcus Aurelius,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 the Roman philosopher mean when he said poverty is
3 the mother of crime, he wasn't trying to justify
4 crime, the majority of people, poor people anyway
5 they, they work on the straight and narrow but he
6 wasn't trying to justify crime he was trying to be
7 realistic. Some of the people who have been consigned
8 to society's margins will consider it that they
9 haven't much to lose by breaking the law and they'd
10 be right. In 2019 Facebook, world star, hip hop, and
11 media take up are three of the social media platforms
12 that show off people in a shameful, disgraceful,
13 disgusting display that destroys our image every day,
14 all types of shameful, disgusting acts, crimes being
15 committed for the world to see; do I blame certain
16 races for not wanting our people around them and in
17 their stores, no because these same people living
18 next door to me, these same people in my lobby they
19 break my doors, they, they're barbequing, they're on
20 the roof, they're drunk and they're high, they're
21 illegal animals are running free, their kids are
22 running around recklessly, they play their music all
23 hours of the day and night, they're rolling dice,
24 this is them and this is considered normal hood
25 behavior. The, the majority cultural people are the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 women and what it is they're violent, they will fight
3 without a second thought and they don't have no
4 respect for no man, they'll get up in a man's face
5 any... in any minute and threaten them and, and they'll
6 fight and they're not afraid of the police, that...
7 they'll fight the police too. So, what it is with
8 this violent dysfunctional people who live in public
9 housing, the ones that are suffer are the decent
10 residents, the seniors, that are scared to death to
11 sit on the bench, the working residents, the children
12 that don't have a shot, it's the majority of us. The
13 illegal occupants are rampant, there are many... so
14 many residents renting rooms, you can't keep up with
15 it, there needs to be a special department in the
16 housing authority that deals with that. I request
17 that you have an exploratory committee also on
18 subleasing and illegal occupants in NYCHA to punish
19 the residents that do not follow the rules and
20 regulations, I will give you a copy of this... [cross-
21 talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
23 talk]

24 KEITH RAMSEY: ...and I'll send it to you
25 because it, it was a little bit much... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

KEITH RAMSEY: ...alright... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, it was...
it was a lot... it was a lot... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: You're right
about that... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...it was a lot...
it was a lot, thank you, thank you so much.

AIXA TORRES: Good afternoon Chair people
of the Committees of the Public Housing and Public
Safety. My name is Aixa Torres and I'm the President
of Alfred E. Smith Houses. Ironically enough I live
right across the street from police headquarters and
when they evacuate, they actually evacuate to Alfred
E. Smith and we still have issues. We have a shelter
of approximately 300 people who decided that they
could use our grounds to do things and even though
the doors might be fixed it still has not resolved
the issues and the problems that we have with safety
in terms of that. I personally want to thank Council
Woman Margaret Chin, my Council Woman because the
cameras that we do have she gave the money for but
one of the biggest issues and the biggest problems

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 that, you know we face is that there's a certain
3 sense of... or there are certain employees at NYCHA who
4 think that residents in public housing are
5 unsophisticated enough to understand how things
6 should be and that being said the only way that
7 things can really work is if we do a we and we work
8 together. The NCO program, I have to tell you is
9 really working from PSA four and my residents do
10 attend their blockbusters and they have listened, and
11 we have had improvement in terms of what we do. So,
12 it's about having conversations and like every other
13 development we have issues. Our biggest issue I think
14 across the board is that people think that because we
15 live in public housing.. this is public housing they
16 can come and step all over our grounds, bring their
17 dogs, do all kinds of things because this is public
18 housing. The reality of it is that it's against the
19 law if they are not there as guests and if they're
20 not invited and I think that needs to be publicized
21 that people just can't come into public housing and
22 do whatever and that includes kids coming into our
23 neighborhood and just going through with their roller
24 blades and scaring the mess out of people and
25 children because they feel it's okay because it's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 public housing, riding their bicycles, it's the same
3 thing... I hate Citi Bike because we have one not on
4 our grounds, right off the grounds and people take
5 the bikes and they think they can ride through our
6 development without being cautious of the fact that
7 we have a lot of seniors with walkers and so I say
8 that... I say all of this because at the end of the day
9 we the residents of public housing are tax payers
10 unlike the president and all his cronies, we pay
11 taxes and we... it's not about we deserve, it's our
12 right as American citizens to have these things.
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
15 much.

16 DAQWON SAVAGE: How you doing, I'm Daqwon
17 from Wagner Projects, I am here with MAP, I just
18 recently came home so it's like I'm trying a new
19 transition of trying to change my life and basically
20 since I've been coming home I actually got 25 other
21 people that I actually go with to get our OSHA 30s
22 and trainings with the outer borough fight back
23 program so I'm just trying to sit here and benefit
24 and get them to think better and think differently
25 but I... like, like a couple of people were saying when

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 I was listening everybody kept saying it's like.. it's
3 the gangs, there's safety with the gangs, the kids in
4 the lobbies, smoking, drinking and everything, we
5 just all got to talk to each other. I feel like if
6 people know what people are going through it will be
7 a better situation because a lot of people go through
8 different things and do things for different reasons
9 so it's like they could grow bad, they couldn't have
10 food that's why there's probably a lot of robberies,
11 you don't know if somebody ate, they got to do what
12 they got to do to eat so I think we just need to
13 reach out and to talk to all the young people to see
14 if we can stop them from going down the wrong path
15 before they make it, let's just all communicate to
16 make everybody feel like family, if we're a community
17 we got to start acting like one and that really all I
18 have to say.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
20 Daqwon you said, thank you for your powerful
21 testimony and thank you for coming down to City Hall,
22 very noble of you to come down here and testify
23 today. I have a question for you, what are some
24 things that we can do or what are some things that
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 MAP can do to be better, what are some things that we
3 can do to strengthen the program?

4 DAQWON SAVAGE: Well for one it's a good
5 program, we got good people that care and I feel like
6 that actually cares so for one I say like we got to
7 get people that's not just there for the money or for
8 the publicity we got to get them there that actually
9 care, it's different when somebody actually cares
10 about you, you can feel it and it makes you want to
11 change and it makes you want to do better like you
12 feel like somebody else is watching over you so I
13 think it's that and to keep the projects busy;
14 basketball tournaments, cookout, music, just have
15 everybody talking and communicating with one another
16 and that's how you start to realize, see what people
17 are going through and trying to help them convince
18 them from doing what they're probably about to do, it
19 could be suicide, it could be trying to join a gang
20 because you don't have... it feels like nobody is there
21 for you or just being a follower so it's like just
22 chosen them before it happens because a lot of stuff
23 happens just because of following and it's like you
24 want be down or you want attention so I just say
25 reach out, talk to them and show them that you care.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Proud of you,
3 stay on the straight and narrow... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah, that's
5 right... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...stay a part of
7 the program and I'm, I'm just... you know I don't get
8 emotional all the time but little teary-eyed sitting
9 here now... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but very proud
13 of you... [cross-talk]

14 DAQWON SAVAGE: Thank you... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...you're on the
16 right track, you're a leader... [cross-talk]

17 DAQWON SAVAGE: Yeah... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...and I want you
21 to... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yep... [cross-
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...stay on that
25 path.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

DAQWON SAVAGE: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I would... could
have been where you're at too.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, thank
you.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah, that's
cool. Yeah, yeah, I'm proud of you, thank you. Okay.
Rosetta Cochran; Anca... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Nobody tell my
wife I was in here crying, alright?

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...Grigore, like
I just want to jump up and hug him, right and Emily
Ponder Williams. So, Brooklyn Defender Services,
Neighborhood Defender Services, and Brooklyn Defender
Services and the last two Gregory Waltman and Erica
Overton join the panel, is Erica Overton still here?
Okay, this is the last panel. And you can start.

ANCA GRIGORE: I apologize, one second...
okay. Okay, good afternoon. My name is Anca Grigore,
I'm a Supervising Attorney, the Civil Justice
Practice at Brooklyn Defender Services. I don't want
to take up too much more of everybody's time and I
really want to focus... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Could you
3 speak just a little louder...

4 ANCA GRIGORE: Oh, yes, no problem.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

6 ANCA GRIGORE: Is that better?

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Uh-huh.

8 ANCA GRIGORE: As I said I don't want to
9 take up too much more of everyone else's time and I
10 really want to focus on our client Rosetta Chochran
11 who is here to testify but I did want to first thank
12 the Council for the opportunity to testify today
13 about safety and security in NYCHA developments and
14 we're going to focus our testimony on what we see as
15 NYCHA's continued over reliance on the NYPD for
16 safety and on the criminal justice system instead of
17 other recommended safety measures that we've all
18 heard about here today. Through our clients we see
19 over policing, regular false arrest on NYCHA property
20 all the time and I wanted to touch on something that
21 Chairperson Ampry-Samuel touched on earlier is that
22 it's not just these arrests that are a problem but
23 the collateral consequences that come with these
24 arrests. Specifically, we see NYCHA going incredibly
25 hard on eviction proceedings based on these arrests

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 that often result in dismissals in criminal court. We
3 see these eviction proceedings, which they call
4 termination of tenancy proceedings often used as
5 punitive rather than preventative, we see NYCHA
6 deferring to and trusting any allegation made by the
7 NYPD even when the allegations contradict everything,
8 they know about a long term tenant. And we've touched
9 on this a lot today but we also see the continued use
10 of NYCHA's so called not wanted list which was talked
11 about a lot today as the trespass list but we've
12 heard NYCHA call it their not wanted list and these
13 are not of non-residents, a lot of the people on the
14 trespass list are actually NYCHA residents just
15 trying to come home. And NYCHA doesn't follow up with
16 these arrests to see if they were dismissed or they
17 were never prosecuted in the first place, they stay
18 on the list regardless. So, we have many client
19 stories in our written testimony that I would
20 encourage the Council to read over including
21 recommendations but again I wanted to get to Miss
22 Cochran's testimony as soon as possible, who I think
23 has a perfect example of what we're seeing as.. you
24 know at a time when there's egregious conditions in
25 NYCHA, delays for repairs, everything we've heard

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 today about lack of cameras, locked doors, lighting,
3 NYCHA seems to be focusing their energy on
4 aggressively pursuing eviction for insignificant and,
5 and unsubstantiated criminal allegations.

6 ROSETTA COCHRAN: Hello, good afternoon.

7 My name is Rosetta Cochran and I have lived in a
8 NYCHA development for 30 years, I have always had a
9 good reputation in the neighborhood with my
10 management office, with most of the people in the
11 neighborhood, the kids and the people in the
12 neighborhood call me ma that's because I like to feed
13 my neighborhood. I'm known for keeping the kids out
14 of the building, telling them that, you know we need
15 to keep the building clean. I'm a single mom, I
16 raised seven kids, five of my children are adults
17 now, two of them still live home with me. My youngest
18 son is still living with me and then he's having a
19 lot of problems. He's 17 and he has a problem with
20 detectives keep stopping him, keep frisking him or
21 you know searching his pockets and stuff and all he's
22 doing is sitting outside just... with his friends
23 they're talking and they're laughing, he's not... he's
24 not in any gang, he don't get in trouble, he's a good
25 student in school. It really seems like NYCHA and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 NYPD are a team together against all of the tenants,
3 I myself have been targeted by NYPD and actually...
4 well currently evicted from NYCHA as a result of.. I'm
5 still living in my apartment while my eviction is
6 appealed and is pending. I was evicted because I was
7 caught up in a raid of my building where over 40
8 people were picked up, they accused me of dealing
9 drugs even, even though the undercover cop.. the
10 undercover officer.. description did not match mine
11 they was still... there was still... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Take your time.

13 ROSETTA COCHRAN: I know I'm really
14 nervous, I went through a lot... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No problem.

16 ROSETTA COCHRAN: Even though the
17 officers found out that I wasn't the person that they
18 were looking for, the criminal charges against me
19 were still eventually dis.. the criminal charges
20 against me was dismissed but NYCHA still went forward
21 with the eviction. Despite my good relationship with
22 the management and my neighborhood testifying on my
23 behalf they were.. I was innocent, NYCHA took the
24 arresting officer's word over mine. It's, it really
25 hurts.. it really hurts me because not only have they

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 known me for... as a tenant for 30 years but the city
3 has spent more money defending the officers who
4 testified against me in a lawsuit than they have
5 spent on any officer in the city. NYPD is keeping its
6 tenants safe... what? Oh, after this experience it has
7 become clear to me that NYCHA, NYCHA cares more about
8 their relationship with NYPD than they keep in the
9 tenants... than in keeping their tenants safe. This is
10 also... this, this also became clear because at the
11 time NYCHA was trying to evict me, all the tenants in
12 the building was complaining about how dark the
13 lights are, they're dim, we can't see what's going
14 on, we have traffic in and out our yards and stuff,
15 they never had cameras, we still don't have any
16 cameras, they put a little bright light out now but
17 if you work like most of the people in our building
18 do you're still scared to come out at six o'clock in
19 the morning and come home late at night because the
20 light... the lighting is still messed up so... [cross-
21 talk]

22 ANCA GILGORE: And the lock on the door...

23 ROSETTA COCHRAN: Yeah, no locks on our
24 door, the front door and the back door, they made it
25 public for the people to walk through our building,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 people from the street who don't live in the building
3 can walk through the building all day long, all night
4 long and they be around on the side of the windows,
5 people urinating, there's a lot of things going on
6 that I think NYCHA need to realize and the cops is
7 out there but they don't believe nothing anybody
8 says, they still will listen to us and tell us to go
9 to the precinct to put a report in. So, thank you for
10 hearing me speak about what's going on in my
11 neighborhood, I'm just so nervous, I had to speak
12 right now.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
14 much for your testimony and we'll make sure that we
15 follow up with NYCHA and, and let's talk after.

16 ROSETTA COCHRAN: Okay.

17 EMILY PONDER WILLIAMS: Hi, my name is
18 Emily Ponder Williams, I'm a Supervising Attorney at
19 Neighborhood Defender Service of Harlem and I also
20 want to briefly speak to what I see as the
21 inconsistency in NYCHA's practice of aggressively
22 prosecuting termination of tenancy proceedings. While
23 we've heard a lot today about their renewed focus on
24 partnerships, engagement and safety not involving the
25 criminal justice system because in our experience

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 that is not what we are seeing behind the closed
3 doors that are NYCHA's termination of tenancy
4 proceedings. So, I just want to speak briefly about a
5 couple of examples and make some recommendations. For
6 example, last year NDS represented a 58-year-old
7 resident, Miss Smith who's 24 year old grandson was
8 arrested in the lobby of her building. When asked
9 whether he knew anyone living there, Thomas stated
10 that his grandmother did even though he did not. The
11 NYPD proceeded to charge Thomas with trespassing in
12 his grandmother's building. However, the NYPD
13 forwarded information about his arrest to NYCHA for
14 the termination of his tenancy. NYCHA then accused
15 Miss Smith of allowing Thomas to live with her
16 without obtaining permission and began termination of
17 tenancy proceedings on this basis and the fact of
18 Thomas's arrest. When Miss Smith first appeared for
19 the termination of tenancy hearing without an
20 attorney, she was told she could either agree to
21 permanently exclude Thomas or face the risk of losing
22 her apartment at a hearing. Only after NDS took on
23 her case and pointed out the weak evidence that
24 connected Thomas to the apartment and Miss Smith to
25 the alleged illegal activity was she able to get a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 more favorable agreement that did not involve
3 permanent exclusion which would have barred Thomas
4 from even visiting the apartment. Without an attorney
5 Miss Smith like many others would have chosen to
6 avoid the risk of losing her home by permanently
7 excluding her grandson from her apartment and
8 effectively her life. Another example, Miss Miller, a
9 30-year-old... an NDS client with a 30 year old... 30
10 year addiction history faced the termination of her
11 tenancy based on her arrest for possessing controlled
12 substances in her home. When she was identified as a
13 candidate for the Manhattan drug court program, she
14 was allowed to defer any criminal sentencing provided
15 she completed an extensive inpatient and outpatient
16 drug rehabilitation program. Upon completion of that
17 program her case would be dismissed but rather than
18 staying the termination of her tenancy proceedings to
19 give Miss Miller an opportunity to reap the benefits
20 of that program NYCHA moved forward with its hearing
21 proceedings. Thanks to hours of work from our staff
22 Miss Miller successfully fought those charges and
23 stayed in her home but countless others are victims
24 of the adversarial approach that punish... pushes
25 residents toward termination hearings even when

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 they're actively engaged in a pre-trial diversion
3 program meant to promote rehabilitation and reentry.
4 As a result, they're deprived of a stable home that
5 would allow them to continue their recovery upon
6 completion yet evicting residents who have been
7 rehabilitated through a court sanctioned diversion
8 program does not make NYCHA any safer. These
9 practices... these practices... sorry, my... quickly my
10 recommendations. NYCHA should decline to, to pursue
11 termination of tenancy proceedings where residents
12 are engaged in or have successfully completed
13 alternative to incarceration programs and
14 additionally NYCHA should reduce the use of
15 stipulations of settlement that include permanent
16 exclusion particularly where family... the family
17 member does not reside in the apartment or can
18 provide evidence of rehabilitation. Thank you for
19 your time and for having this hearing today.

20 GREG WALTMAN: Good afternoon Council
21 Members, general counsel. My name is Greg Waltman, I
22 have a clean energy company called G1 Quantum. It was
23 inspiring to hear the heartfelt testimony from so
24 many NYCHA residents today in line with HUD official
25 Lynne Patton and Public Advocate Jumaane Williams in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 their advocacy on behalf of, of, of the NYCHA
3 residents and as one testified today, it seems that
4 it's more than just throwing money at the problem,
5 it's actually having people that have an interest and
6 want to see people improve their conditions and want
7 to work with people as opposed to working against
8 them and obviously I can't speak to... firsthand, you
9 know experience with that to an extent but it seems
10 that there are budgetary concerns and constraints
11 that are hindering the type of relationship that
12 should be created with NYCHA officials and residents
13 so that positive synergies can be created and, and
14 when I speak to that I speak to that in... with respect
15 to the green new deal and a solution set forth and
16 proposals that have been presented to the Council
17 and... for different types of budgetary concerns to be
18 essentially censored by the media value, issues and
19 hyper protectionism to impair funding for different
20 types of NYCHA related issues and budgetary fiscal
21 constraints is, is just not appropriate. I, I, I feel
22 that, you know there are... there are these programs in
23 place and, and people have the responsibility to not
24 try to create entrapping types of legal conditions
25 that perpetuate and stymie a person's... a person's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 progress in life but, but find the type of balance
3 necessary to advance not only... you know with, within
4 the constraints of NYHA but the type of context in a
5 whole and, and when you... you're able to parse through
6 the value illusion of choice of solutions in pairing
7 budgetary and fiscal constraints you're able to
8 address these problems in the proper context and I...
9 and I feel like public advocate Jumaane Williams,
10 Lynne Patton, HUD official and other, other types of
11 advocates on behalf of, of NYCHA in, in resolving
12 this issue have, have, you know... you know paid a big
13 price to bring this to their attention and I'd just
14 like to reiterate that these solutions do in fact
15 exist and once you parse through value imposing upon
16 the council to create an illusionary type of
17 budgetary constraint you begin to see the solution
18 and be able to create the synergies that I was
19 speaking to. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
21 much, thank you everyone for your testimony today and
22 just for the record I want to state that we received
23 testimony from the Equitable Infrastructure Group for
24 the record and we also received photos for the record
25 from Franklin Avenue Houses that depict... which is a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

ON PUBLIC SAFETY

1
2 senior development that depicts homelessness and some
3 other issues and we also received testimony from
4 Center for Court Innovation for the record. I want to
5 thank Counsel Madiba Dennie for your hard work as
6 well as Jose Conde for your hard work and... I know
7 Ricky but Ricky Chawla for your work, thank you so
8 much and... do you have anything else...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh yeah, I got
10 to thank Daniel Ades; Casie Addison and Nevin Singh
11 for their work and my Legislative Director Jordan
12 Givens, thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And that will
14 conclude the hearing.. the, the hearing today with the
15 Committee on Public Safety and the Committee on
16 Public Housing, Safety and Security in NYCHA June
17 6th, 2019.

18 [gavel]

19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

June 23, 2019