

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

April 18, 2019
Start: 1:17 p.m.
Recess: 3:32 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LAURIE A. CUMBO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
DIANA AYALA
JUSTIN BRANNAN
MARGARET S. CHIN
ANDREW COHEN
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, Jr.
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, Jr.
MATHIEU EUGENE
BARRY GRODENCHIK
ROBERT HOLDEN
BEN KALLOS
ANDY KING
PETER KOO
KAREN KOSLOWITZ
RORY I. LANCMAN
CARLOS MENCHACA
I. DANEEK MILLER
FRANCISCO MOYA
BILL PERKINS

KEITH POWERS
 ANTONIO REYNOSO (PLEASE
VERIFY, VOICE VERY FAINT)
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
CARLINA RIVERA
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH ROSE
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, Jr.
MARK TREYGER
PAUL VALLONE
JIMMY VAN BRAMER
KALMAN YEGER
LAURIE A. CUMBO
COREY JOHNSON

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Maurice Jenkins
Executive Vice President
United Negro College Fund

Cindy Falconer

Dennis Brown

Honorable Mayor David N. Dinkins

Dr. Thomas A. Isekenegbe
President
Bronx Community College

Dr. William Lupfer
Trinity Church
75 Broadway

2 CLERK: [sound check]This is a test.

3 This is a test. Today's date is April 18, 2019, on
4 the Stated Meeting, by Steven Sadowsky. [pause]

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Hello and welcome to
6 the New York City Council. Thank you all so much for
7 being here. I see you all in the balcony
8 representing. Today is Green Day and we are so proud
9 to welcome you all here for our incredible Earth Day
10 legislation package that is going to be passed today.

11 And we so honored because today is a very special
12 day. The New York City Council is proud to honor the
13 75th anniversary of the United Negro College Fund.

14 [applause] So if you all could come up, if the United
15 Negro College Fund can please come and join us. Good

16 afternoon. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. And
17 we are so proud today because this Black History

18 Month continues to go on and on and on and we're

19 going to make it a full year, right? [applause] So

20 the New York City Council is proud to honor the 75th

21 anniversary of the United Negro College Fund for its

22 decades of extraordinary work in advocating for and

23 providing equal access to college for all, especially

24 students of color. In 1944 UNCF was created as a way

25 to help more African Americans to attend college.

1
2 Over the years they have a shining example of what an
3 organization can do in the fight to make a college
4 education accessible and affordable to all. UNCF has
5 raised nearly 5 billion dollars, right? Give it up
6 for 5 billion dollars [applause] to provide
7 educational resources and support that have enabled
8 nearly half a million students to earn college
9 degrees. UNCF has been recognized nationally as an
10 organization that helps under-represented students to
11 become highly qualified college graduates. UNCF has
12 also launched a billion-dollar national scholarship
13 initiative established by the Bill and Melinda Gates
14 Foundation, which awards scholarships to low-income,
15 high-achieving college students. In a time where
16 college seems to be moving farther and farther out of
17 the reach for so many Americans, especially people of
18 color, UNCF's commitment to helping students of all
19 backgrounds achieve their educational dreams is all
20 the more worthy of celebration. Education has always
21 been viewed as the key to achieving the American
22 dream and I thank UNCF from the bottom of my heart
23 for all that you have done to make the dream
24 accessible to so many students. So I ask Maurice
25 Jenkins, executive vice president at UNCF, and Lacy

1
2 Britton, member of UNCF Independent Alumni Council,
3 to please accept this proclamation as well as my
4 council colleagues, and this was brought forward by
5 Council Member Robert Cornegy, as well as Council
6 Member I. Daneek Miller, who is the chair of the
7 Black, Latino, and Asian Caucus, and we are just so
8 proud and honored to have you all here today. I
9 remember growing up and hearing so much about UNCF
10 and the work that you do, even when you're a little
11 child, inspires you to know that an education is
12 obtainable and any time I would do something bad or
13 not on the right path, when my parents would sit me
14 down and give me that lecture, they would always say
15 a mind is a terrible thing to waste. [laughter] So a
16 lot of spankings often accompanied that speech. So I
17 thank you all so much for the work that you do and to
18 continue to raise up generations of young people who
19 are benefitting from a college education, and for
20 basically just laying the foundation for all people
21 to know that a college education is obtainable, it's
22 expected, and it's something that is so very
23 important to our communities. I'm going to now turn
24 it over to the clerk, who will read the proclamation,
25 and then I will turn it over to my colleague, Council

2 Member Robert Cornegy, who has brought this
3 incredible organization here before the City Council.

4 CLERK: Council City of New York

5 Proclamation: The New York City Council is proud to
6 honor the United Negro College Fund, the UNCF, for 75
7 years of extra work, lighting the way to making
8 college education available to minority students.

9 And whereas UNCF was founded in 1944 to help more
10 African American students attend and graduate from
11 college. Since then it has raised more than 4.8
12 billion dollars to provide resources and support that
13 have enabled more than 450,000 students to earn
14 college degrees. To serve youth, the community, and
15 the nation UNCF supports students' education and
16 development through scholarships and other programs,
17 strengthens its 37 private member colleges and
18 universities, and advocates for the important of
19 minority educate. And whereas from the start UNCF
20 has been committed to building a robust and
21 nationally recognized pipeline of under-represented
22 students who because of UNCF support become highly
23 qualified college graduates. The organization also
24 works to ensure that its network of member
25 institutions is a respected model of best practice in

1
2 moving students to and through colleague. And
3 whereas UNCF's north star is to increase the total
4 number of African American college graduates by
5 focusing on activities that ensure more students are
6 college-ready, enroll in college, to persist to
7 graduation. This is done through a three-pillar
8 strategy - positioning member institutions as a
9 viable college option for students and investing in
10 institutional capacity to improve student outcomes,
11 creating transformational support programs to ensure
12 students are enrolling and persisting through college
13 completely and building awareness of educational
14 attainment and cultivating college-going enthusiasm
15 within the African American community. And whereas
16 UNCF's great legacy of steady progress includes
17 numerous highlights. After Senator John F. Kennedy
18 won the 1957 Pulitzer Prize for his book, *Profiles in*
19 *Courage*, he donated the proceeds to UNCF. In 1972
20 UNCF launched a public awareness campaign through the
21 Ad Council around its motto, "A Mind is a Terrible
22 Thing to Waste", which became one of the most
23 recognized slogans in advertising history. And
24 whereas UNCF has continued to make great strides in
25 recent years, in 1999 UNCF launched the Gates

1
2 Millennium Scholars Program, a one-billion-dollar
3 national scholarship initiative established by the
4 Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, which annually
5 awards academic scholarships to low-income, high-
6 achieving college students. The following year UNCF
7 launched its Technology Enhancement Capital Program,
8 I'm sorry, Capital Campaign, which raised nearly \$120
9 million dollars for UNCF member colleagues to
10 modernize technology platforms and increase access to
11 PCs among students and faculty. And whereas today
12 UNCF administers over 400 programs, including
13 scholarship, internship, and fellowship, mentoring
14 summer enrichment and curriculum, and faculty
15 development programs. UNCF also supports more than
16 60,000 students at over 900 colleagues and
17 universities across the country. And whereas in an
18 era when a college education is more expensive than
19 ever before UNCF's mission has never been more
20 important. At this milestone we commend UNCF not
21 only for its longevity but also for its tremendously
22 positive impact on the lives of countless students
23 and alumni and colleagues throughout the nation. Now
24 therefore be it know that the New York City Council
25 grateful honors UNCF in celebration of its 75th

2 anniversary for its extraordinary work championing
3 equal access to college for all Americans. Corey
4 Johnson, speaker for the entire council, Laurie M.
5 Cumbo, majority leader of the New York City Council,
6 Robert Cornegy, Council Member 36 District Brooklyn,
7 and I. Daneek Miller, chair of Black, Latino, and
8 Asian Caucus.

9 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wow. Thank you for
10 all that you have been doing all of these
11 extraordinary years, and so I'm going to turn it over
12 to Council Member Robert Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you,
14 Majority Leader Cumbo. It is absolutely my pleasure
15 to have had a long-term relationship with UNCF.
16 Today is a testament to the fact that as we have a
17 conversation, a larger conversation around
18 standardized high school tests and specialized high
19 school tests that for over 75 years we've had
20 organizations who worked diligently to make sure that
21 black students are taken care of and are present,
22 primarily in historically black colleges and
23 universities, and as the husband of a graduate of
24 South Carolina State, if I didn't mention that I'd be
25 in big trouble, we, I've gotten to witness firsthand

1
2 the impact on communities of color around the world
3 that UNCF has had. So today we are joined together
4 in honoring UNCF on its 75th anniversary. UNCF was
5 founded on April 25, 1944, and has continuously
6 supported private HBCUs, or historically black
7 colleges and universities, advocated for inclusive
8 higher education, and aided hundreds of thousands of
9 students. HBCUs have a vital role in the history of
10 our country. These schools gave black students the
11 opportunity to obtain a higher education when almost
12 no other colleges would. Today HBCUs are an integral
13 part of the higher education mosaic of the United
14 States. They provide opportunities for some
15 Americans who have not otherwise had the opportunity
16 to attend an institution of higher education. HBCUs
17 represent only 3% of colleges and universities, but
18 graduate 20% of African Americans who hold
19 undergraduate degrees. Today we join with UNCF to
20 celebrate the lives positively transformed with a
21 college education. More than 450,000 college
22 graduates whose educations immeasurably enrich our
23 shared communities and the more than 60,000 students
24 attending college each year who will make
25 contributions to our economy, to our culture, to our

1
2 scholarship, and to our civic life in years to come.
3 Today as we continue to work towards opening up the
4 opportunities a college education represents to more
5 people, we must celebrate UNCF's outgoing commitment,
6 ongoing commitment, to investing a future of HBCUs
7 and offering past, present, and future students a
8 pathway to higher education. Congratulations to UNCF
9 on their significant anniversary and best wishes for
10 many more successful years to come. I just want to
11 say that this is also a testament to the fact that it
12 besways the narrative that there are more black men
13 in prison that there are in colleague. We know that
14 that's not true. There are more black men on college
15 campuses across this country studying and preparing
16 themselves to make contributions to our society, and
17 we thank UNCF for its participation and continued
18 support of those young men and women. Thank you.
19 [applause] And we just like to hear we know that
20 there are some remarks from Mr. Jenkins that we'd
21 love to hear today.

22 MAURICE JENKINS: First of all, I want to
23 say good afternoon to all that have gathered here in
24 the chamber and especially to the Councilman. Thank
25 you so very, very much for your support and your

1
2 leadership. It makes a difference. And I have had
3 the wonderful experience of being with the United
4 Negro College Fund for 29 years... [applause]

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Wow!

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Is that my man?
7 I think I see my man, who's got to join us.

8 MAURICE JENKINS: Yes.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes! Major
10 Dinkins.

11 MAURICE JENKINS: Mayor Dinkins.

12 [applause] And so I am just so humbled to be here in
13 this presence and the reason I'm so humbled is
14 because the United Negro College Fund started in 1944
15 and incorporated right here in the city and the state
16 of New York City. So we are incorporated here.

17 [applause] We ran our office here and we were here
18 for more than, over 50 years before we moved to the
19 Washington, D.C. area, where we currently reside. I
20 just want thank you for the impact, the difference
21 that you make. We know that education is an
22 equalizer and we know that. And since we know that
23 and we believe in that, then that's why we work so
24 diligently to make sure that we provide opportunities
25 for young men and woman who want a chance. We're not

1
2 looking for a handout. We're looking for a helping
3 hand. And so therefore I want to say to each one of
4 you thank you very much and certainly to our Mayor
5 Dinkins, who was a big supporter of the United Negro
6 College Fund throughout the years. Thank you and
7 thank you for being here. And I want you to hear
8 from the dividends of what we do, 'cause that's
9 important, and so Cindy is here and she is now a
10 employee of the United Negro College Fund and if you
11 go on our website you will see this young lady who
12 when an undergrad was talking about the impact and
13 the difference that the United Negro College Fund had
14 on her life. So I want her to share that with you.
15 I think that's important to hear.

16 CINDY FALCONER: Hello, everyone. My
17 name is Cindy Falconer, a dividend of the United
18 Negro College Fund and also development associated
19 with the UNCF New York office, and I am grateful and
20 honored to be a dividend of UNCF. I have been able
21 to find my drive and my purpose through the
22 organization, allowing me to support other students
23 through their matriculation through college and
24 allowing me to support them through helping them to
25 apply for scholarships, helping them to obtain their

1
2 higher education, while also being motivated to
3 graduate from HBCUs and contribute to our society
4 with their knowledge and their drive and motivation
5 as young black men and women of our country. I thank
6 you. [applause] I would like to end this statement
7 with a mind is a terrible thing to waste, but a
8 wonderful thing to invest in. Thank you. [applause]

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All right. It
10 has been updated.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I almost forgot,
12 we're supposed to actually give them then
13 proclamation.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So we are going
15 to now present you with the proclamation and we're
16 going to take a group photo, and we would love for
17 the Mayor Dinkins to be a part of this very
18 auspicious occasion. This has been the most dynamic
19 Black History Month, longest-running ever, and so we
20 are so proud to have Mayor Dinkins to be a part of
21 this today. We are here because of you. [applause]

22 UNIDENTIFIED: I do the proclamation and
23 then I talk?

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes.
25

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, and then I'll introduce
3 the...

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes. Hello.
5 Thank you all so much for being here, and thank you
6 so much for all of my colleagues who are joining for
7 this very historical proclamation that is going to be
8 presented today. Council Member Cabrera has brought
9 forward one of our great legends, and I am proud as a
10 New York City Council member to honor the life and
11 legacy of the late Dr. Roscoe C. Brown, Jr., one of
12 the legendary Tuskegee airmen and educator who passed
13 away in 2016. Dr. Brown has made an indelible mark
14 on the Borough of the Bronx, New York City as a
15 whole, and an entire grateful nation through his
16 remarkable life of outstanding achievements and
17 enduring contributions. As a Tuskegee airman he
18 became a legend fighting for democracy against
19 unspeakable evil in World War II as he simultaneously
20 broke down racial barriers in the army and changed
21 the way people thought about civil rights and
22 equality in America. After his military service he
23 chose to live a life of public service here in New
24 York City. He continued the fight for democracy on
25 behalf of New York City students as a tireless

1
2 activist and educator. He went on to serve as the
3 director of NYU's Institute of African American
4 Affairs before becoming the third president of the
5 Bronx Community College, where he served for 17
6 years, developing new programs in health, human
7 services, and technology. He advised countless New
8 York City leaders and future leaders of our city over
9 the decades of service that defined his exemplary
10 life. On top of all that he did to serve his
11 borough, his city, and his nation, Dr. Brown was also
12 an avid runner who in 1978 cofounded Run the Bronx,
13 which later was renamed to Roscoe C. Brown, Jr. Hall
14 of Fame 10K, 5K, and 2-Mile Walk, and will have its
15 annual event next month. So I ask Dennis Brown to
16 come up. Dennis is Dr. Roscoe Brown, Jr.'s son and
17 he will accept this proclamation on his behalf. I
18 also am calling on my colleagues that are all here to
19 join us for this very auspicious occasion and we have
20 been joined by Speaker Corey Johnson. May we all
21 hope to lead a life as that of the late, great Dr.
22 Roscoe Brown. [applause] Wow. I know like many of
23 my colleagues we can feel the energy and the spirit
24 here in this room today. I'm going to turn it over
25 to the clerk, who will read the proclamation,

1
2 followed by Councilman Cabrera, who has brought us
3 this incredible opportunity, and followed by Council
4 Member Corey Johnson, and then we would love to hear
5 words from you as well as to recognize our Honorable
6 Mayor David Dinkins. [applause]

7 CLERK: Council City of New York
8 Proclamation. The New York City Council is proud to
9 posthumously honor the late Dr. Roscoe C. Brown, Jr.,
10 for his outstanding achievements and his enduring
11 contributions to the Bronx and beyond. And whereas
12 Dr. Brown was a champion for New York City and the
13 nation, he was an influential advisor to many elected
14 officials and an inspirational figure, equally
15 remarkable for who he was, as well as all that he
16 achieved. Although he died on July 2, 2016, at the
17 age of 94, his tremendously positive influence
18 continues to inform and shape our city today,
19 especially his beloved Bronx community. And whereas
20 during World War II Dr. Brown flew 68 missions as one
21 of the Tuskegee Airmen, our nation's belatedly
22 celebrated [applause] first black military aviators
23 in the then-segregated US Army Air Corps. Like other
24 Tuskegee Airmen, he fought for democracy in the skies
25 over Europe while also combating our nation's own

1
2 racial barriers that impeded full citizenship rights
3 in both the army and in society. And whereas when he
4 returned to civilian life in America, Dr. Brown
5 continued to fight for democracy in our schools as a
6 tireless educator and activist. After the war, he
7 took on a triple major at NYU, where he wrote his
8 doctoral dissertation on exercise physiology and
9 before becoming a professor. Later he became the
10 director of NYU's Institute of African American
11 Affairs. And whereas from 1997 to 1993, Dr. Brown
12 served as the esteemed third president of Bronx
13 Community College, BCC. During his 17-year tenure he
14 led BCC's outreach to the city's economic and
15 educational institutions and developed new programs
16 in health technology and human services. In the mid
17 1980s he helped New York State establish the Bronx
18 Educational Opportunity Center to develop vocational
19 training and skills education. He also created
20 programs to increase outreach to Bronx junior high
21 and high schools and other programs to support
22 minority students going into science careers. And
23 whereas Dr. Brown, an avid runner who ran in nine New
24 York City Marathons, was also deeply concerned about
25 the health of and well-being of the community. In

1
2 1978 he cofounded BCC's Run the Bronx, later known as
3 the Roscoe C. Brown, Jr. Hall of Fame 10K, 5K, and 2-
4 Mile Walk. Today Run the Bronx is a major annual
5 event in the Bronx and the second-oldest foot race in
6 the five boroughs, founded on the heels of the New
7 York City Marathon. On May 4, 2019, this community
8 health event and health pavilion will welcome more
9 than 1500 participants around the nation. We extend
10 our best wishes for all of the 2019 Run the Bron
11 participants, whether they are running or walking or
12 cheering on those who do. Now therefore be it known
13 that the New York City Council is proud to honor the
14 life and indelible legacy of Dr. Roscoe C. Brown, Jr.
15 for his many enduring contributions to the Bronx and
16 to all of New York City. Corey Johnson, Speaker for
17 the entire council, Laurie M. Cumbo, Majority Leader
18 of the New York City Council, Fernando Cabrera,
19 Council Member 14th District The Bronx, and all of
20 the members of the Bronx delegation of the New York
21 City Council. [pause]

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Cabrera, thank
23 you so much.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
25 much. I'm so excited about this moment to introduce

1
2 to you a mayor that had such an impact upon our city
3 we're still feeling the effects. But, even more, I
4 know you're coming here as a friend of Dr. Roscoe
5 Brown, a comrade during World War II. My grandfather
6 fought in World War II. He told me stories. He was
7 in the navy, and you're a hero.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Dr. Roscoe Brown
10 also a hero. [applause] We're among heroes here
11 today. And I want you to give a big round of
12 applause to Mayor David Dinkins. Come on, everybody!
13 [applause and cheers]

14 HONORABLE MAYOR DINKINS: Thank you
15 very much. Thank you very much. As most of you
16 know, I was a city clerk for 10 years and I, Mr.
17 Speaker, I used to sit right here in meeting after
18 meeting after meeting. And of course I've been to
19 many, many events here where people were honored.
20 But there is nothing that gives me more pleasure than
21 being here today for my friend Roscoe. [applause] He
22 was quite a guy. And I told the story a while ago,
23 I'm a Montford Morton Marine, first black hoorah.
24 There was the occasion when we were awarded the
25 Congressional Gold Medal and we were supposed to go

1
2 down to Washington to receive it. And so I called
3 Roscoe. I said, man, you know, I didn't do nothing,
4 nobody shot at me. And Roscoe, deservedly, had the
5 Congressional Gold Medal. And so he told me it was
6 all right, I could go. So I went to Washington and a
7 three-star general placed the ribbon around my neck.
8 [applause] But Roscoe was conditioned to being a very
9 special human being who accomplished much and helped
10 so many of us. He was a dear friend to me and I can
11 say without fear of contradiction I certainly never,
12 ever would have achieved the Office of Mayor of the
13 City of New York had it not been for his help,
14 guidance, and just without it even, it just wouldn't
15 have happened. And it is appropriate that so many of
16 you are here to praise our friend. Roscoe was a
17 very, very special human being and he will not be
18 forgotten, and I'm delighted that the speaker of the
19 City Council is here. The speaker, you know, there's
20 so many events here he can't make them all. But he
21 said this one he was gonna make [laughs]. [applause]

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
23 much. And I'd like to turn it over to Speaker Corey
24 Johnson.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: It is always a special day in this historic and remarkable building when one of the most amazing public servants that has ever served the City of New York, a history-maker, not just by becoming mayor, but all the stuff he did before he was mayor, and a living legend. He talks about me showing up at an event at City Hall. This man, I see him everywhere, he's like a man about town. He is active, he is vibrant, and he is, as Fernando Cabrera said, a hero to our city. We are always happy to see the amazing David N. Dinkins here at City Hall. [applause] So Mr. Mayor, thank you, thank you very much. I'm not going to repeat the wonderful words from our majority leader and Council Member Cabrera or the mayor about Dr. Brown, but I will just say that it is so appropriate that at any opportunity possible to recognize and remember and salute the Tuskegee Airmen for their valor and service to our country. Segregation is one of the lasting indelible stains on our country and one that we cannot forget, must not forget, but at the height of that, in the face of that, the Tuskegee Airmen were brave, valiant, unbelievable Americans in what they did, serving our country at a time that they

1
2 were being targeted, discriminated against, and not
3 treated like the full Americans and full heroes that
4 they were. So any time we have the opportunity to
5 talk about that, to remember that, and to talk about
6 the amazing Tuskegee Airmen from our great city of
7 New York City is, I'm getting the chills saying it,
8 it's a great day to be able to remember that history
9 and so we are so honored that you are here today and
10 we are honored to remember Dr. Roscoe Brown, so thank
11 you very, very much. [applause]

12 DR. DENNIS BROWN: I brought one of
13 Roscoe's airplanes with me. Good afternoon. I can
14 see from all the energy here that everyone is either
15 ready to run the 10K, the 5K, or to Cheer People On,
16 Sit By the Roadside K. Now I want to challenge
17 everyone here to channel Roscoe Brown. I want you to
18 channel Roscoe Brown. Now let me give that some
19 context in Roscoe style. You know what I'm talking
20 about, my favorite marine. When Roscoe and I would
21 travel together through all the various
22 presentations, awards, where he would talk about his
23 exploits as a Tuskegee Airman, we would relieve all
24 of his combat missions and details of flying in great
25 detail of minutia. I'm talking to the point of well

1
2 what time did you get up? Well, when did you go to
3 the bathroom? Well, did you have a lot of coffee?
4 No, because then I'd have to pee. Well then where
5 did you go to the bathroom in such a small airplane?
6 Things like that. So now in 2004 we go down to the
7 Air Force College at Maxwell Air Force Base and we
8 meet a B-25 pilot. And this B-25 pilot then goes on
9 to tell us in the same fashion much of the minutia
10 and details of one of the most important missions of
11 World War II. For him and for Roscoe, one of the
12 underlying things that would come forward would be
13 the underlying narrative of preparation, persistence,
14 and pride. The person we were talking to is very
15 special to this day. On this day, April 18, 1942,
16 the Doolittle Raiders, led by Jimmy Doolittle, 16 B-
17 25s took off of the deck of the US Hornet and did the
18 famous raid on Tokyo. Dick Cole was Jimmy
19 Doolittle's copilot. Every year on this day the
20 Doolittle Raiders would meet and have a toast to
21 their fallen comrades. A little cognac for those who
22 have passed. Just last week Dick Cole, the last
23 Doolittle Raider passed away at the age of 103. So
24 before you go to bed tonight, a little cognac for
25 Dick Cole and the Doolittle Raiders. [applause] Now,

1
2 April is here. March just passed. March 24th 74
3 years ago young Roscoe Brown, Lieutenant Roscoe Brown
4 at that time, saddle up his P-51 and took off from
5 Ramitelli on the longest mission of the 15th Air
6 Force. He was breaking in a new flight leader. He
7 realized even then that the true role of leadership
8 is to develop tomorrow's leadership. So he assumed
9 the position of Tail-End Charlie, the lowest and
10 furthest back position in the flight formation. I
11 would say to him as he told this story, well, weren't
12 you scared? He said no, we only had a 1600-mile
13 round trip. No GPS. No Doritos in the cockpit to
14 keep you awake. So on they go to Berlin. A little
15 bit of trivia. I looked up the mission report. The
16 assignment for the day for the all-black Tuskegee
17 Airmen was different from everyone else's. Their
18 assignment was, I quote, penetration with the bombers
19 to the prudent limit of endurance. Now what the hell
20 does that mean? That means you will fly until you
21 die. Everyone else had a specific assignment. Meet
22 them here. Go back here. Land over here.
23 Interestingly enough, Ramitelli, on the Adriatic
24 coast of Italy, is the southernmost Air Force base
25 for the Army Air Corps. They had the longest to fly,

1
2 were always on time. For the mission to Berlin two
3 groups were late. One got lost in weather and one
4 just left late. But not the Tuskegee Airmen.
5 Meeting the bombers as they approached Berlin he
6 could see streaks at 9 o'clock. He knew these were
7 the German jets. Now, the jets could go 500 plus.
8 The P-51 at its best 400, maybe 450. A little bit of
9 flight school for everyone. When two airplanes come
10 into visual contact for an encounter they try and
11 out-turn each other so you get on the other person's
12 6. If the plane is below you, you come from above,
13 invert, come around on their 6, and make the kill.
14 But what if you're with a jet? A jet that can go so
15 fast you can't turn with, and no spiraling here, so
16 what Roscoe did on his days off, he would take up the
17 other flyers and they would fly that P-51 to its
18 envelope, developing new maneuvers, such that he
19 developed a maneuver that was taught in the Air Force
20 all the way to Korea. This was called the modified
21 split S. What you would do is push the throttle
22 forward, put the nose down, pull the plane up,
23 invert, don't go level, take it almost to a stall,
24 then pull the stick back because you're upside down.
25 It now comes into a screaming red line dive, almost

1
2 tearing the wings off the plane. He did this split S
3 when he saw the jets, under the bombers, and right on
4 to the 6 of the Me 262, a burst, and he takes them
5 out. And as Roscoe would put it to me in our
6 conversations in non-technical terms, I was right on
7 his ass. [laughter] So very quickly he realizes I'm
8 low on fuel. Now here comes your challenge. Low on
9 fuel, 800 miles from home, he says I'm not scared.
10 I'm too prepared to be scared. He went from danger
11 to the heart and found safety. Now he's in a safe
12 zone. I've got to get home. So are you scared now?
13 No fancy maneuvers, Roscoe. He says, no, I got this.
14 I'm on mission, I'm alert, watching my horizon, and
15 I'm tapping the gauge. Anyone remember the movie
16 *Dunkirk*, with the two pilots going over the English
17 Channel tapping the gauge. Is it just stuck or are
18 we out of fuel? And they found out at the end of the
19 movie he was indeed out of fuel, as he coasted to a
20 landing on the beach. So Roscoe's tapping the gauge.
21 Now from that safe zone he goes to where everyone
22 here to do, to his faith zone. Faith in his
23 preparation, his persistence, and pride. Pride not
24 only in the Red Tails, on the back of those P-51s,
25 America's first combat pilots, black combat pilots,

1
2 but all the way to the double V for victory, victory
3 over racism at home and tyranny abroad. So whether
4 you're facing the obstacles of the undulating hills
5 of the Grand Concourse that Roscoe I ran so many
6 times on May the 4th in the 41st running of Run the
7 Bronx go for your safe zone to your faith zone.
8 Because at the end of the day Roscoe would always
9 tell us it is our pursuit of excellence that makes
10 the difference. It is our pursuit of excellence that
11 will endure and it is your pursuit of excellence that
12 will overcome obstacles. And if Roscoe were here
13 today, he would define pride for us in three simple
14 words I know we've all heard before. And I know the
15 marine knows this. Duty, honor, country. On behalf
16 of Roscoe Brown, thank you. [applause]

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Wow, this is the
18 Black History Month ever! Roscoe Brown. Mayor
19 Dinkins, would you join us for a group photo with the
20 proclamation?

21 HONORABLE MAYOR DINKINS: Absolutely.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And we would now
23 like to have words from the president of Bronx
24 Community College. [applause]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PRESIDENT ISEKENEGBE: Good afternoon, everybody. What can I say after an excellent speech by Dr. Brown? On behalf of all of our students, faculty, and staff, I just want to say thank you to the speaker of the council, to all of the council members for honoring us and for honoring Dr. Brown. Thank you very, very much. This is a day that will live in our memory in the history of Bronx Community College. Thank you very much. [applause]

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Mayor Dinkins, we'd love to have you front and center.

HONORABLE MAYOR DINKINS: You know, while I'm getting in to this, would you let me tell you something else about, no, really, this is true. The white bomber pilots would request the Tuskegee Airmen, because you may remember they had red tails? They'd say I want them because when they were, the bombers were attacked some of the other fighter pilots would sort of peel off and go chase them, which was the wrong thing to do. You're supposed to stay with them damn bombers. And that's when Roscoe and the others did. You know, it is so important that you all are doing it, it really is. I've been

1 here on many occasions, Mr. Speaker, but nothing more
2 important than this. [applause]

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
4 much, Council Member Cabrera, for bringing this great
5 opportunity forward, as well as Council Member
6 Cornegy for bringing the United Negro College Fund
7 today. It's been a historical day. And now we'll
8 take a photo and get ready to being the Stated
9 Meeting. [pause]

10 CLERK: Can I have your attention please?
11 Can I have your attention please? At this time could
12 I please have the Sergeant at Arms please clear the
13 main floor of the chambers. We need to start the
14 Stated Meeting, so if we could please clear the main
15 floor of the chambers. Thank you. [pause]

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I
17 said [pause]

18 CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen. Could I
19 have council members please take their seats, please.
20 Council members, please take their seats, please.
21 Please take all your conversations outside. Could I
22 have those back doors closed, please. Close those
23 doors, please. Thank you. At this time, quiet
24 please, quiet on the floor, please. At this time
25

2 please place all electronic devices, all electronic
3 devices, to vibrate. And would all non-Council
4 employees, non-Council employees please leave the
5 main floor of the chambers? Thank you. Madam
6 Majority Leader. [pause]

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And good
8 afternoon and welcome to the Stated Meeting of April
9 18, 2019. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. Please
10 rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

11 CLERK: All rise.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I pledge
13 allegiance to the flag of the United States of
14 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one
15 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and
16 justice for all. Roll call.

17 CLERK: Quiet please.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Barron. Borelli.

23 Brannan. Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

3 Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch. Diaz. Dromm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Gibson. Gjonaj.

14 Grodenchik.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: King.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: KOO.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.
COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.
COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.
COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.
UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.
COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.
UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: HERE.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich. Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo. Cumbo.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
3 have a quorum and we will now have today's
4 invocation, which will be delivered by the Reverend
5 Dr. William Lupfer of Trinity Church, located 75
6 Broadway in Manhattan.

7 CLERK: All rise.

8 REVEREND LUPFER: Thank you, Majority
9 Leader Laurie Cumbo, Speaker Corey Johnson, Public
10 Advocate Jumaane Williams, and council members,
11 especially my friend and representative, Margaret
12 Chin. As you've heard, I'm at Trinity Wall Street.
13 We've been part of this neighborhood for over 300
14 years and I'm honored to pray us into session. Let
15 us pray. God our Creator, we thank you for bringing
16 us here today in service of the people of your great
17 city. We thank you for this day and for this work.
18 We pray that you will guide our council members and
19 be present in their collective wisdom as they work to
20 make our neighborhoods places of inclusiveness and
21 compassion. Bring them together in a spirit of
22 humility, integrity, and openness as they consider
23 the issues that affect those who live and work in
24 this diverse ever-evolving city we love and call
25 home. Be with them in their deliberations and

1
2 decisions. We keep in our heart sounds all who
3 suffer, those who are homeless, incarcerated,
4 unemployed, sick, or hungry, and all who experience
5 any need or want, and we also remember in our prayers
6 those who are seeking to enter our country or our
7 city in search of safety and a better life for
8 themselves and their families. We pray that they
9 encounter compassion in their journey. We give
10 thanks for all who work tirelessly for social justice
11 in our city and beyond, particularly those who seek
12 an end to mass incarceration and the racial injustice
13 that fuels it, and those who seek to break the cycle
14 of homelessness. Give them strength to continue
15 their important work and courage and hope to sustain
16 them when they are discouraged. We thank our council
17 members for the gift of their service to their
18 constituents and to one another. May they be
19 faithful representatives of their neighborhoods while
20 serving the good of our entire city. We ask your
21 blessing upon them and upon this meeting, that their
22 labor may be fruitful and their decisions wise. In
23 your name we pray. Amendment. [pause]

24

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I'd
3 like to now ask Council Member Chin to spread the
4 invocation on record.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Majority
6 Leader. And I welcome Reverend Dr. Will Lupfer to
7 our City Council. Reverend Dr. Will Lupfer...

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Quiet in the
9 chambers.

10 CLERK: [inaudible]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Reverend Dr. Will
12 Lupfer became the 18th rector of Trinity Church Wall
13 Street in New York City in 2015. As rector, he
14 focuses on racial justice, mass incarceration,
15 homelessness, and low-income housing, and is an
16 advocate for new ways to help those without adequate
17 voice in society. He regularly engages with the
18 Trinity community, the wider church of the faith
19 tradition, not-for-profit organization, and leaders
20 in politics and business. Before joining Trinity
21 Reverend Lupfer was the dean of the Trinity at
22 [inaudible] Cathedral in Oregon, an urban
23 congregation of 1800 members from the greater
24 Portland area. When he's not working for the church,
25 the Reverend likes to travel with his wife and their

2 two children. Their mission in life is to build
3 bridges across culture, race, and custom. And I
4 wanted to thank Reverend Dr. Lupfer for gracing us
5 with his invocation today and I make a motion that
6 the invocation be spread in full upon the record.
7 Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
9 much, Council Member Chin, and thank you so much, Dr.
10 Lupfer, for that powerful and very calming and
11 peaceful speech. Thank you so much. We will now
12 have the Adoption of Minutes by Council Member Adams.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Madam Majority
14 Leader, I move that the Minutes of the Stated Meeting
15 of March 13, 2019, be adopted as printed.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
17 Council Member Adams. And now we will have messages
18 and papers from the mayor.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication
21 from city, county, and borough offices.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and
24 communications.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use call-
3 ups.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
6 will now have communication from Speaker Corey
7 Johnson.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Nice
9 to see you, Madam Majority Leader. I want to thank
10 everyone who is with us on this Thursday. We have a
11 very busy and exciting agenda ahead of us today.
12 Before we begin, I would like to take a moment to
13 acknowledge the fire that devastated Notre Dame
14 Cathedral earlier this week in Paris. This is a
15 tragedy for Paris, but it is a tragedy for the entire
16 world, especially at the start of Holy Week. Like
17 many people, I have been to Notre Dame and I loved
18 it. It is breathtaking, and it was heartbreaking and
19 heart sickening to see that fire and the images of
20 it, and I know I speak for all of us at the council
21 when I say we extend our deepest sympathies to the
22 people of France, who are in mourning. I would also
23 like to remember some of those who have passed in the
24 weeks since our last Stated Meeting. I am sad to
25 report, very sad to report, that we have lost three

1
2 construction workers on the job in New York City in
3 one week. Nelson Salinas, who came here from
4 Ecuador, and worked in construction to support his
5 family; Gregory Echevarria, a father of four, and a
6 veteran who did four tours in Afghanistan. And Eric
7 Mendoza, who was only 23 years old and leaves behind
8 a 5-year-old son in Mexico. The women and men of the
9 construction industry in New York City build our city
10 and their work is extremely important. It is a very
11 dangerous job and this is a reminder to always keep
12 them in our prayers and to take action here at the
13 council that continues to protect them. I also want
14 to remember NYPD highway officer, Mark St. Aramand,
15 who lost his life last week. Officer St. Aramand was
16 a 14-year veteran of the NYPD, and he lives behind
17 his wife, Cecelia and their five young children. Our
18 hearts are with them and the entire NYPD family
19 during this difficult time. And finally I would like
20 to take a moment to acknowledge Humberto Cruz, the
21 former director of the New York State AIDS Institute,
22 who recently passed away. Dr. Cruz was a trailblazer
23 in the public health field and was instrumental in
24 the fight against AIDS at the height of the HIV-AIDS
25 epidemic. His activism was recognized by everyone

1
2 from being honored by the Latino Commission on AIDS
3 to his appointment to President Obama's advisory
4 council on HIV and AIDS. As an openly HIV-positive
5 elected official I am extraordinary grateful for the
6 work of people like Humberto Cruz. I am alive today
7 because of the work that he and many others did for
8 people living with AIDS. He will be deeply missed,
9 but his legacy of activism and innovation in public
10 health will never die, and now I would ask everyone
11 to rise and take a moment of silence for everyone
12 that we've lost. [moment of silence] Thank you.
13 This is our lastest Stated before the Easter and
14 Passover season. These are two incredibly important
15 and beautiful holidays for the Christian and Jewish
16 faiths, and I know many of us here today will be
17 celebrating one or both of these holidays, and so I
18 wish everyone a Happy Easter and a Happy Pesach.
19 Let's dive into our agenda for the day. The council
20 will vote on the following Article 11 property tax
21 exemptions. One in Prospect Park South Portfolio in
22 Council Member Eugene's district, will provide a
23 partial 30-year exemption to eight buildings to
24 preserve 384 units of affordable housing. The
25 council will vote on the following land use items:

1
2 Blondell Commons, applications to facilitate the
3 development of 172-unit, 100% affordable housing
4 project in Council Member Mark Gjonaj's district;
5 2069 Bruckner Boulevard, two mixed-use buildings with
6 65 affordable home ownership units and 265 affordable
7 rental units in Council Member Ruben Diaz, Sr.'s
8 district, and McDonald Avenue Catering, a zoning map
9 amendment to facilitate the operation of a banquet
10 facility in Council Member Brad Lander's district.
11 And lastly, a very exciting site selection for a new
12 322-seat primary school in Council Member Carlos
13 Menchaca's district. I want to thank the land use
14 staff who worked on these items, Jeff Yuen and
15 Chelsea Kelly. Moving on, the council will be voting
16 today on the following legislation. We are voting on
17 the Climate Mobilization Act, [applause] our own
18 version of the Green New Deal. Our planet is closing
19 in on a breaking point. We must, we have to
20 transition from investing in fossil fuel
21 infrastructure to clean renewable energy. We have to
22 act decisively and we have to act now. And I am very
23 proud that this city council is leading the charge in
24 helping our planet which is an existential threat to
25 our existence. Our Environmental Protection

1
2 Committee chair, an amazing, smart, hard-working,
3 advocate, legislator, and champion, Council Member
4 Costa Constantinides [applause] has been an
5 incredible, incredible, incredible leader on this
6 issue, understanding it in a granular way, fighting
7 back exemptions that would have weakened the bill,
8 educating the public on the importance of this, and
9 working on this issue for years. I am so proud of
10 this day for him and for our city and for the world,
11 and you will hear from him soon. Chair
12 Constantinides has been working, as I said, very hard
13 and we are very proud to vote on the following bills
14 sponsored by the chair: Introduction 1253C - this
15 was a megillah [laughter]. It is going to mandate
16 that buildings over 25,000 square feet are not
17 allowed to emit greenhouse gasses at higher levels
18 than set forth in the legislation. These large
19 buildings are responsible for 30% of the greenhouse
20 gas emissions in New York City. This bill would
21 lower those emissions by 40% by 2030 and 80% by 2050.
22 The emissions limits are set based on the occupancy
23 group of the building and are calculated to require
24 emissions reductions from the highest-emitting 20% of
25 buildings in 2024 and the highest-emitting 75% of

1
2 buildings in 2030. The bill will also create the
3 Office of Energy Emissions Performance within the
4 Department of Buildings to oversee the implementation
5 of this legislation and to recommend future policy on
6 building emissions. Introduction 1252A would
7 establish the Property Assessed Clean Energy Program,
8 the PACE Program. With this program, more building
9 owners will be able to make the alterations required
10 to reduce greenhouse gas emissions citywide.
11 Introduction 1317A would clarify the Department of
12 Buildings' obligation to include wind energy
13 generation in its toolbox of renewable energy
14 technologies by establishing additional requirements
15 regarding the construction, installation, and
16 maintenance of large wind turbines in the city.
17 Introduction 1318A would mandate an assessment by the
18 Mayor's Office of Sustainability or such other office
19 as the mayor may designate on the feasibility of
20 replacing in-city gas-fired power plants with battery
21 storage powered by renewable sources. And
22 Resolution 845, which would call on New York State
23 Department of Environmental Conservation to deny the
24 water quality certification permit for the
25 construction of the Northeast Supply Enhancement

1
2 Pipeline, also known as the Williams Pipeline,
3 through New York Harbor [applause]. This, we have
4 more bills from other council members, but all of
5 those bills, each one of them is complicated. Each
6 one of them requires an enormous amount of attention.
7 Each one of them has required years of hard work and
8 study and meeting with many, many, many stakeholders
9 and advocates, and our chair has done that work
10 literally day after day, week after week, month after
11 month. When other people wanted to rush this process
12 the chair said slow down so we can get this right and
13 pass the most far-reaching, progressive, forward-
14 thinking, important piece of climate change
15 legislation that any municipality will have ever
16 passed in the world. And so today is a day for
17 celebration for the City of New York because we are
18 laying the groundwork for other municipalities to be
19 able to follow our lead. If we can do it in New York
20 City, in the largest city in the United States, and a
21 beacon for the entire world, in a city with a diverse
22 building stock of small buildings and large buildings
23 and hospitals and houses of worship, all of these
24 type of buildings, any other city should be able to
25 do it as well, and that is because of the incredible

1
2 staff here who have worked so hard along with the
3 Mayor's Office of Sustainability, who I see are here.
4 I want to thank them for their partnership and
5 helping making today happen, but really we would not
6 be at this day, less than a week before Earth Day, if
7 it wasn't for our great friend and colleague, and I
8 want to give him a big round of applause, Council
9 Member Costa Constantinides. [applause] And Madam
10 Majority Leader, I would ask for when we get to
11 remarks if we could not have a time limit on the
12 chair's ability to speak on this package of
13 legislation.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Certainly.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Next, we're
16 going to vote on two bills, sponsored by another
17 great environmental champion who has done amazing
18 work in this council, Council Member Rafael Espinal.
19 Introduction 1031A will require the Office of
20 Alternate Energy to post and maintain links on its
21 website to information regarding the installation of
22 green roofs and resources and materials regarding
23 green roof systems. And Introduction 1032A will
24 require the inclusion of a sustainable roofing zone,
25 which is a photovoltaic energy generating system, or

1
2 a green roof, in the construction of new buildings or
3 buildings that are undergoing certain major
4 renovations. Next, Introduction 276A, sponsored by
5 Council Member Donovan Richards, would adjust the
6 requirements of Introduction 1032S, for certain
7 smaller residential buildings. It would also require
8 the Department of Housing Preservation and
9 Development to study the impact that compliance with
10 Introduction 1032A may have on affordability while
11 also allowing HPD to limit such requirements for
12 certain buildings. Next, Introduction 1251A,
13 sponsored by Council Member Andy Cohen, would address
14 concerns from building owners that energy, that the
15 energy grading scale of Local Law 33 of 2018 does not
16 accurately reflect a building's efficiency. This
17 bill would adjust the grading scale, assigning higher
18 grades to efficient buildings, which they would then
19 be required to post. And Resolution 66, sponsored by
20 Council Member Steve Levin, will call upon the state
21 legislature to pass and the governor to sign,
22 legislation that would increase the real property tax
23 abatement for the installation of a green roof to \$15
24 per square foot, which would provide an incentive for
25 property owners to build green roofs. The staff on

1
2 this has been amazing. We are so fortunate that in
3 this council we have unbelievably talented people
4 that do this work every single day. We can only do
5 this work because of the talented staff that we have
6 and many of them are here, and I would love for them
7 to stand up as I call their names. Some of them are
8 already standing up. Nicola Ben, Austin Branford,
9 Somara Swanston, Nadia Johnson, Ricky Chala, Brooke
10 Frye, Piers Zonaster, Mega Chen, Brad Reed, John
11 Seltzer, and I'd love the folks from the Mayor's
12 Office of Sustainability to stand as well, because
13 this was a very wonderful joint effort between all of
14 our teams, and I want to give a big thank you to all
15 the staff who worked on this. [applause] We are also
16 voting on a bill you may have heard about before,
17 Introduction 1527, sponsored by Council Members Brad
18 Lander and Margaret Chin. It will require that a
19 five-cent fee be imposed start on March 1, 2020, on
20 paper bags and it would exempt any customer from
21 paying the fee who uses SNAP Program, Special
22 Supplemental Nutrition Program for Women, Infants,
23 and Children, or any other successor programs as full
24 or partial payment towards the items purchased in a
25 covered store. I'm really proud we are doing this.

1
2 The council was at the forefront of the fight to
3 limit the consumption of single-use plastic bags and
4 this is an excellent companion bill to the upcoming
5 statewide bags. Plastic bags are a scourge on New
6 York City and on our environment. I will leave it to
7 Council Members Chin and Lander to speak about it,
8 but they as well deserve an enormous amount of
9 credit. They have been at this for years organizing.
10 The council took action on this, but the New York
11 State Legislature sort of took that action away from
12 us and then, luckily, we have seen movement at the
13 state level to ban plastic bags and allow
14 municipalities to opt in to this five-cent fee on
15 papers bags, so I'm really proud we're doing this
16 today. I want to thank the staff who worked on this
17 as well: Chris Artori, Patrick Mulvale, Nicola Ben,
18 Nadia Johnson, Tirsa Nasir, Megan Chen, and Brad
19 Reed. A lot of people want to talk about the price
20 tag associated with the bills that we are passing
21 today, and it's a fair question and a question that
22 we have to be able to answer and discuss in a
23 thoughtful way, in a way that makes sense. But there
24 is really no price tag that you could put on the
25 future of life on our planet and we must reduce,

1
2 reduce, reduce carbon emissions. It is literally
3 killing the planet. We are a carbon, we are a
4 coastal city, and it is time for us to lead. We are
5 leading today and I am so proud [applause], I am so
6 proud of all the advocates who are in the balcony
7 here today who have been fighting on the frontlines
8 for years, being far ahead of the curve. I've said
9 it before and I'll say it again. Every major civil
10 rights movement, movement for progress in the United
11 States of America, whether it be the anti-war
12 movement or the movement for LGBT civil rights, or
13 the movement for African American civil rights, or
14 the farm workers' movement, or the labor movement,
15 all of these movements were not led by politicians.
16 They were led by people. They were led by people who
17 organized and spoke out and decided that it was time
18 for significant change. And the people who are
19 sitting in this balcony and the people who they
20 represent are the people who are leading this Green
21 New Deal environmental justice movement and these are
22 folks that have been at it for years long before it
23 was a cause that was in the headlines every single
24 day. And so today is a joint effort between the
25 administration, the council, the stakeholders who

1
2 effected by the legislation we are passing today, and
3 all of the advocates who have really showing amazing
4 mettle in getting us to today. So I want to
5 congratulate them as well. [applause] I think that
6 concludes our agenda for today's Stated Meeting and I
7 look forward to proceeding with today's votes. Thank
8 you, Madam Majority Leader.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, thank
10 you so much Speaker Corey Johnson, and I am now going
11 to move us into general discussion and on general
12 orders. I would now like to call up Council Member
13 Costa Constantinides.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: And, again, Madam
15 Majority Leader, no clock for the Council Member.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Certainly.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
18 you, Madam Majority Leader, and first let me begin
19 by, you know, Speaker Johnson, I can't thank you
20 enough for your leadership, your forward-
21 thinkingness, your desire to make this city a greener
22 and sustainable place for not just now, but for 40
23 years from now, when my little boy, in 2050, when the
24 worst impacts, they said, will be felt, 2050 and
25 beyond. My little boy will be a man, the same age

1
2 that I am now. And he will look back on this and say
3 thank you, Speaker Johnson, for leading. So, really,
4 thank you, brother. Today I ask my colleagues to
5 join me and pass the New York City Climate
6 Mobilization Act. The centerpiece of this act is
7 Introduction 1253C, which will require buildings
8 25,000 square feet, of which there are only about
9 50,000 in the City of New York, to meet emissions
10 targets beginning in 2024. These 50,000 buildings,
11 even though they represent a very small number,
12 50,000 out of a million one, are the worst emitters
13 in New York City. They are responsible for 30% of
14 our overall emissions in the City of New York. Under
15 this bill, the worst 20%, the worst performers, will
16 have to meet a target based on their benchmarking
17 they provided to the city, by 2024. Then in 2030 the
18 middle percentages will have to also retrofit as
19 well. For this class, however, an advisory board
20 will be empowered to take a hard look at the metric
21 and determine based on the experience of the first
22 class if a different approach might be better. This
23 new metric, however, must be at least as strict as
24 our carbon metric and it must get us to the 40%
25 reduction by 2030. This will apply to all buildings

1
2 in this class. We as a city can't put stringent
3 requirements on the private sector and not be held to
4 the same standard. Finally, we have also ensured
5 that this does not fall on the backs of the most
6 vulnerable. That's why rent-regulated and senior
7 affordable housing will have to follow a set of
8 prescriptive requirements, such as installing
9 individual temperature controls and heat sensors,
10 things that would not cause MCIs. These requirements
11 will not trigger rent hikes that risk only further
12 destabilizing our neighborhoods. Parents should be
13 able to put their kids to bed without worrying that
14 their homes will be taken away from them by rising
15 rents or rising seas. Housing of, houses of worship
16 will also be held to these prescriptive standards,
17 because while we must reach the 4530 standard we must
18 be respectful of our city's prayer sanctuaries, many
19 of which are also landmarked. Hospitals be held to a
20 specific standard that takes into account their
21 unique energy needs and the role that they play in
22 protecting health and the safety of New Yorkers.
23 And, again, all of the carbon targets in these bills
24 have been calculated so they can all hit their goals.
25 No two buildings are alike and all buildings will

1
2 need help. So that's why in this bill we create the
3 Office of Building Energy and Emissions Performance,
4 to oversee the implementation of the building
5 standards, to give technical assistance to building
6 owners, and if a building owner is suffering a true
7 financial hardship, or have made good faith efforts
8 to buy grid energy credits only to find out they
9 can't them, for instance, the office is going to be
10 empowered to help them out and get an adjustment if
11 really needed. If a building is landmarked they can
12 also apply to get that assistance. Finally, the bill
13 will also create a study to see if a cap and trade or
14 a portfolio model approach might be used to hit these
15 targets. To help us pay for all this, we're also
16 passing Introduction 1252, which creates the City
17 PACE Program. With this program, property owners can
18 be eligible for loans with little or no upfront cost,
19 structured on their payoff of the life of the
20 technology. This way debt service is literally
21 limited to the amount they end up saving from energy
22 costs. [inaudible] program worked in other cities
23 like Chicago, but it's been used across the towns of
24 New York State. Also in the Climate Mobilization Act
25 is Introduction 1317, which creates standards for

1
2 large wind turbines, and Introduction 1318, which
3 directs the state to study the phase-out of all of
4 our fossil fuel plants with using solar, battery
5 storage, and other renewable energies. The speaker
6 talked about the crossroads we are on. We all know
7 humanity's role in climate change and the effect it
8 will have. We know that there is major impact from
9 stronger hurricanes and increased precipitation will
10 cause sea level rise, and the impact of our city.
11 There are talks about the Rockaways, Coney Island,
12 and neighborhoods in Staten Island literally being
13 wiped off the map by the end of the century if we do
14 not act. We see the seriousness of this and have to
15 take real action. Our children and our children's
16 children implore us to do this. No single-handed
17 policy can completely reverse the effects of climate
18 change. But this policy, when enacted, will be the
19 largest emissions reduction policy in the history of
20 New York City or any city anywhere. And I just want
21 to say how proud I am to work with the advocates,
22 Henry Gorito in DC 37, Alian Maritiza Silver
23 Farrell, Pete Secora of New York City Communities for
24 Change, and all of the advocates. I can't name each
25 and every one of you, but thank you for fighting for

1
2 a greener city. Thank you for all my colleagues who
3 have worked so very hard with me, getting down in the
4 weeds and making sure that we get this right. We
5 always will appreciate you, and to the staff, Nicola
6 Bean, as the speaker said. Nicola Bean, Austin
7 Branford, Megan Chen, Tiersa Nasir, Samara Swanston,
8 Nadia Johnson, Jeff Baker, Laura Popa, Brooke Frye,
9 Rickie Chala, Jonathan Seltzer, my own staff, my
10 legislative attorney, Nicholas Wizowski, my chief of
11 staff, Nick Rolson, and Terence Collin, Nicky
12 Coquinos, Josephine Jermosin, Michael Corbet, Joy
13 Choudry, and to the Mayor's Office of Sustainability
14 as well. There's been a lot of sleepless nights. I
15 can attest. I've been dreaming about this bill for
16 weeks now and haven't been getting much sleep. But
17 dreams, dreams, good dreams, good dreams. And, you
18 know, my little boy, who I talked about before, is 9
19 years old, and he asked me, he was so excited today
20 about the bill being passed. But when he becomes of
21 age, all of our sons and daughters become of age,
22 what will be the New York we're leaving them? This is
23 a down payment on their future. The planet that
24 we're borrowing from them, the city that we're
25 borrowing from them, I am so proud that we are able

1
2 to say to them when they ask us what did you do
3 against climate change? What did you do about the
4 greatest threat in the history of the United States,
5 as President Obama has talked about, we can say we
6 took real, meaningful action. Thank you very much,
7 Madam Majority Leader. [applause]

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, Chair
9 Costa Constantinides. Our children and our
10 children's children children thank you. And now we
11 will call up Council Member Chin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Majority
13 Leader. As a representative of lower Manhattan
14 neighborhoods, we are still fighting to fully recover
15 from super storm Sandy. I have seen firsthand the
16 undeniable urgency to pass legislation to protect our
17 environment. And I wanted to congratulate and thank
18 Chair Constantinides and all my colleagues and our
19 speaker on this Climate Mobilization Act. But when
20 it comes to plastic bag pollution that regularly
21 clogs our storm drain, pollute our rivers and litter
22 our trees and parkland, we know that single-use bags
23 are not free. There is a cost and that is borne
24 unfairly by low-income communities of color who have
25 to deal with the quality of life and public health

1
2 repercussion of transporting thousands of tons of
3 plastic bag waste every year. Our council knew this
4 in 2016 when we passed to bring us closer to our goal
5 to reduce single-use plastic bag waste. In order to
6 educate and empower New Yorkers we had to work
7 against a well-funded misinformation campaign by the
8 plastic bag industry that sought to hide the true
9 cost of plastic bags from New Yorkers. I'm pleased
10 that after pre-empting our law the state has finally
11 heard our call and allow a sensible measure to limit
12 the use of plastic bag. But we need to ensure that
13 plastic bags are not merely substitute by paper bag,
14 which can be twenty to thirty times heavier. We must
15 act to impose a modest fee on these and other single-
16 use bags. Our legislation, Intro 1527, would also
17 create a multilingual education for all communities
18 and small businesses, a dedicated fund to distribute
19 free reusable bags to low-income New Yorkers and also
20 exempt residents from SNAP and also from WIC. Now,
21 we have seen other state and country set a global
22 model to fight plastic bag pollution. It's time for
23 New York City to emerge as a leader in its own right.
24 Thank you, Speaker Johnson, for moving this so
25 quickly, and of course my partner, Council Member

1
2 Lander and Chair Reynoso for your unwavering support
3 and of course to the diverse coalition of advocates
4 who have been there with us from the beginning,
5 especially our schoolchildren, our youngsters, our
6 future leader who's been with us all the way fighting
7 for this, and I urge my colleague to vote for Intro
8 1527. Thank you. [applause]

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Thank
10 you, Council Members Chin and Lander for your bravery
11 and your courage, but most importantly your
12 determination. We'll now call up Council Member
13 meniscus.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I
15 want to speak and give incredible props to Council
16 Member Costa Constantinides, the entire team of staff
17 that have been working on this for so many years.
18 But I want to also take this opportunity to thank you
19 all the people on the ground in our neighborhoods. I
20 represent Red Hook and Sunset Park. You have
21 organizations like Uprose, who have been fighting
22 this fight for such a long time, every opportunity to
23 be heard, bringing young people to the forefront,
24 creating an intergenerational, ah, space for advocacy
25 and now on the floor of the City Council we get to

1
2 pass incredible legislation. During the hearing we
3 heard so much from young people and everyone,
4 everyone, but I want to express just the incredible
5 passionate work that young people have been doing in
6 our neighborhoods. When we think about the work that
7 we have to do next I also want to hark and think
8 about the jobs that are being created that are going
9 to help get us to these goals and to these caps.
10 This is going to create a massive amount of jobs and
11 the people on the ground that are going to be working
12 are going to be construction workers, including
13 immigrants and day laborers. We are in the middle of
14 a situation where we are pushing development because
15 of the Green Deal, but on top of that we need to make
16 sure that all these workers are safe. We just heard
17 from three, ah, the speaker talked about the three
18 members of our community who died. These are
19 Latinos. These are immigrants who are dying on our
20 construction sites. So as we push for these measures
21 for green economy, we've got to make sure that they
22 get training and safety and this City Council has
23 committed to that today to ensure that we get that.
24 More to come at the next Stated because we will be
25 pushing legislation to extend the deadline that we

1
2 have set at the City Council, but also bring you
3 resources and new ideas for that access to
4 construction safety education. So let us not forget
5 those that we just honored today in the deaths of our
6 construction and let's honor the new workers that are
7 going to come with incredible safety. Thank you,
8 Costa, thank you Speaker and the rest of the council.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I'm
10 now going to call for Council Member Van Bramer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
12 very much, and with your permission I'd like to vote
13 aye on all.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We're now going
18 to call on Council Member Koo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Majority
20 Leader. Thank you to all of those who stopped by
21 yesterday and supported the students in the historic
22 first [inaudible] in New York City Hall. Thank you
23 Speaker Johnson for making it possible. Tomorrow is
24 the start of Passover and Sunday is Easter, so I want
25 to wish everyone happy holidays and also today voting

1
2 on legislation that would impact hospitals. Take
3 care of our environment is something we must all do.
4 Hospitals were concerned about this but thank you to
5 Council Member Constantinides for working with them
6 on the new targets and compromises. Thank you.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
8 Council Member Koo. Thank you and report of special
9 committees.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] Madam
12 President, I believe that my name is on the list.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: You are on the
14 list for general discussions.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, well that was an error.
16 I apologize. May I speak now?

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes, permission
18 granted.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you, Madam President.
20 Today we're passing monumental, ground-breaking
21 environmental protections of which we can and should
22 all be proud. As I said this morning at committee,
23 Mr. Chairman Constantinides deserves much credit for
24 leading his life's work to today's achievements. I
25 will join in voting for the entire package that is

1
2 coming out of the Environmental Protection Committee,
3 I think it's wise, and I am grateful for his
4 leadership. I arise to speak on another bill that is
5 coming from a different committee, Introduction 1527.
6 Mr. Speaker is right that those utilizing the brown
7 paper bags, ah, if they are using their benefits card
8 at the time they're making their purchase will not
9 pay a fee. However, I think there's an important
10 distinction and as the speaker said when he mentioned
11 it, it's if their using their card in full or in
12 part. But as we know, those of us who have been
13 involved for a long time in the business of helping
14 people with their benefits, benefits run out in the
15 middle of the month, sometimes even earlier than
16 that, and the distinction that we need to note is
17 that once the benefits run out if somebody who is
18 poor, somebody who has benefits pays cash for their
19 products, they will not receive a free bag. The poor
20 will not be completely exempt. Only when they're
21 using their benefits card. And I think it's
22 important to note that because I do believe this is a
23 tax. I believe it's a tax on the people who can
24 least afford it. I know there are very good reasons
25 to do this. I know there are, and the people who are

1
2 supporting this have their hearts in it for the right
3 reasons. I believe it and I know it's true. But I
4 also think that we do need to think about those who
5 can't afford it, those who are having trouble making
6 ends meet, those who need a little extra. And they
7 will have this tax on them and for that reason, Madam
8 President, I will be voting aye on the entire package
9 but I will not be able to join in voting for Intro
10 1527. Thank you for accommodating me and I apologize
11 for the switch on the list. Thank you. [pause]

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Report of
13 standing committees.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
15 Environmental Protection, Intros 276A through 1318A
16 on page 2, Climate Mobilization Act.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Happily in an excited
18 way amended and coupled on general orders.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
20 Finance, preconsidered Reso 846, organization
21 funding.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
23 orders.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 395 and
25 Reso 851, Prospect Park South.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
3 orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
5 Land Use, LU 369 and Reso 852, McDonald Avenue.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
7 orders.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 373 and Reso 853 through
9 LU 375 and Reso 855, Blondell Commons.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
11 orders.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 379 and 380, 1640
13 Flatbush Avenue.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
15 modifications and referred to the City Planning
16 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of
17 the Council, and Section 197D of the New York City
18 Charter.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Excuse me. LU 382 and Reso
20 856 through LU 385 and Reso 859, Bruckner Boulevard.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
22 orders.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 396 and
24 Reso 860, school facility.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
3 orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on
5 Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, preconsidered
6 Intro 1527, paper bag fee.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
8 orders.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: On the general order
10 calendar, Intro 720, site safety training.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We're recommitting this
12 to the Committee on Housing and Buildings.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Resolution appointing
14 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Commissioner of Deeds
16 is coupled on general orders and at this time I would
17 ask for a roll call vote on all of the items on
18 today's general order calendar.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I'd like to vote
21 aye on all and wish everyone a happy Easter and
22 Passover, and blessings to everyone. Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With permission I'd like to vote on all land use callups and coupled items on the general order calendar and all resolutions, and congratulate Council Member Constantinides on this historic legislation. Thank you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible] permission to vote on all on general orders and land use, especially those that are a environmental friendly bill, and congratulations Costa and the speaker and all the advocates. With these bills we will be doing what we can to save our planet. So with that I vote aye.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Permission to explain my vote?

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission granted.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I just want
3 to congratulate all my colleagues on this package of
4 bills. But I jus want to just speak briefly on, um,
5 1527. This was a very, a real struggle for me
6 because I remember when this conversation about
7 charging five cents per bag came up in my community
8 and a lot of seniors felt some kind of way about it
9 and did talk about the stress that this will cause on
10 them and, um, I will say that I do appreciate the
11 fact that we will be able to have a robust initiative
12 of being able to provide reusable bags throughout
13 community and to those who will need it so that there
14 won't be this five-cent fee. But I just wanted to
15 say on the record that I did struggle with 1527 just
16 up until a few minutes ago, honestly, but I do vote
17 aye on all and appreciate everyone's efforts on the
18 bills, and I do vote aye on all. Thank you.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Ayala.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye on all.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
24 explain my vote?
25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
5 just want to echo the comments made by my colleague,
6 Alicka Samuels, and I also want to say I vote aye on
7 all with the exception of Land Use 374, no, I'm
8 sorry, 379, and 380, and the accompanying
9 resolutions. I believe that until this body takes a
10 strong look at what we're saying is affordable and
11 until we move away from the 25% so-called affordable
12 and 75% market we're doing a disservice to the people
13 who live here. Thank you.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Borrelli.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
16 except Intro 276, 1032, 1253, 1527. Thank you.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I want to say a
25 special thanks to Council Member Margaret Chin for

1
2 her leadership and alongside Brad Lander, Council
3 Member Lander as well. We have literally hundreds of
4 thousands of bags the Department of Sanitation has
5 available for those who are in need of them. I was
6 one of those who was against this bill a couple of
7 years ago, but when I started seeing bags flying all
8 over my districts, in trees and causing all kinds of,
9 ah, clogging in the drainage system, etc., etc.,
10 etc., I am seeing what was happening in other states
11 where some of my brothers live and there is life
12 after this bill, and its going to be good for the
13 environment. I also want to congratulate my
14 colleague Constantinides, ah, and thank you for your
15 consideration with the houses of worship. They do
16 have a responsibility for the environment as well,
17 but it was just right. It was just right, all the
18 adjustments that were made in their consideration,
19 and with that I vote aye on all.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and
21 happy belated birthday, Council Member Cabrera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, thank
23 you so much.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Chin.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all,
3 and I wanted to tell my colleague I look forward to
4 coming to your district to help the Department of
5 Sanitation to give out reusable bags, to seniors, to
6 low-income families, I think it's going to be
7 exciting. It might be difficult in it beginning, but
8 I think people will get used to it and I also really
9 wanted to congratulate Chair Constantinides again
10 because New York, New York City is taking the lead.
11 It's time for, ah, environmental justice, um, and
12 we're taking a big step, and I want to wish everyone
13 a happy Passover and happy Easter, and I vote aye on
14 all. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Constantinides.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam
20 Majority Leader, may I be excused to explain my vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'll be
24 very brief. I just want to congratulate all of my
25 colleagues today who are passing legislation, Council

1
2 Member Espinal and his Green Roofs bills, Council
3 Member Donovan Richards, who has been a great
4 environmental advocate in his own right and doing so
5 many amazing things, so thank you, Council Member
6 Richards, and to Brad Lander and Council Member Chin
7 as well. Congratulations on your legislation. I
8 know it's been a long time, and thank you again to
9 Speaker Johnson. I vote proudly aye on all.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I want to first
17 say that for the first year since I've been in the
18 council I got a hundred on my environmental, so I'll
19 be keeping with that. I knew you'd clap, Donovan.
20 So I want to keep with that. I want to say
21 congratulations to Council Members Espinal, Richards,
22 Constantinides, Chin, and Lander. Many people know
23 that in the last session I did vote no on the bags,
24 but due to, um, commitment from the chairs to do a
25 very robust round of not only education but

1
2 disbursement of bags I changed to a yes. I'm proud
3 to be a part of a body that is relentless in its
4 pursuit to have a clean NYC. I want to thank the
5 speaker for his commitment to making sure that those
6 people who have opposing views are protected and have
7 an opportunity to have those opinions heard, and on
8 that I vote aye on all.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam
16 Chairlady. I'm here to vote no on Resolution 1513,
17 1514, 1522, 1527, 1580, 1532, 1540. And by the way,
18 ladies and gentleman, 1527 would put a burden on
19 senior citizens. I'm here to fight and protect
20 senior citizens. I understand supporting the
21 environment. But senior citizens would be burdened.
22 It's a burden on senior citizens and the City of New
23 York and we're here to protect and I want senior
24 citizens, the senior citizens of New York City to
25 know, especially in the Bronx, that they have someone

1
2 here that will stand for them, that will fight for
3 them, and this is wrong on senior citizens. I'm also
4 voting no on Resolution 847 and 849. God bless you
5 all. Thank you very much. Happy holiday.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
10 explain my vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
12 granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you,
14 Majority Leader Cumbo. Well, I'm excited to be
15 voting on these bills, bills that would make New York
16 City greener, cleaner, and more livable for all New
17 Yorkers. As we all know, we're living in a time
18 where a federal government continues to push back and
19 roll back all the progress we've made in the
20 conversation of fighting climate change. It's
21 important for cities like New York to step up with
22 bolder and more aggressive policies. Together with
23 my colleagues, Council Member Donovan Richards and
24 Steve Levin, we are passing a package of legislation
25 that would require pretty much a lot of New York City

1
2 buildings in the five boroughs to have a sustainable
3 roof. I believe that these bills will deliver the
4 type of action our country and the globe needs to
5 fight climate change. Whether it's a green roof as
6 beautiful as one we see on top of the Barclay Center
7 or solar panels or both, in the 21st century
8 sustainable buildings must be a part of our building
9 design. Before I go any further, I just want to give
10 a few quick shout-outs to a few folks who have been
11 working with me on these bills for many years, the
12 founders of Brooklyn Grange, the People's Climate
13 March, Aziz Decan, Steve Peck, the founder of Green
14 Roofs for Healthy Cities in Toronto, which has set
15 the model for green roof legislation, Lisa Bloodgood
16 from the Newtown Creek Alliance, Costa, my colleague,
17 for getting this through the committee and getting it
18 [inaudible] for us to vote, and the speaker, of
19 course. Green roofs are pleasing to the eye, but
20 they offer so much more than just a view. We can use
21 green roofs to advance the cause of environmental
22 justice, especially in neighborhoods like the ones I
23 represent, where there is a disparity in air quality
24 and green spaces. Green roofs reduce air pollution
25 by absorbing pollutants. For example, in my district

1
2 we have some of the worst asthma rates, while we also
3 have some of the worst air quality, issues that green
4 roofs can help alleviate. Green roofs have been
5 proven to mitigate urban island effect by cooling
6 down buildings and bringing much-needed economic and
7 physical relief for residents and businesses alike.
8 A cooler building means more comfort and less energy
9 costs. Not only do sustainable roofs reduce car
10 emissions, they are also a boon to local economy,
11 creating good-paying jobs and encouraging the growth
12 of a green sector economy. There are many other
13 environmental benefits, like cleaner water, and I
14 would go on and on and on, but I just really want to
15 say thank you to all my colleagues who voted on this
16 bill, and it's a great day for New York. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you for
18 your leadership.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,
20 I just want to remind the council members that are
21 hear that we are voting on two resolutions, which
22 you'll bring up later in the agenda, and so we do
23 need to maintain a quorum, so we need members to
24 remain for the remainder of the meeting until we get
25 to general discussion.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain my vote?

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader, and good afternoon colleagues. It's really a great honor to join with all of you in voting in the affirmative on this incredible package related to environmental justice and addressing climate change and really making sure that the City of New York is leading on this very important issue to save our planet. I am grateful for our environmental protection chair, Council Member Costa Constantinides, and I want to also thank Council Member Donovan J. Richards, Council Member Steve Levin, and Council Member Rafael Espinal for their leadership, and really making sure that the City of New York is not only leading the way, but we're looking at both short- and long-term goals, recognizing that a lot of these efforts are going to

1
2 take several years to implement. I am also speaking
3 on behalf of preconsidered Intro 1527. I want to
4 thank Council Member Margaret Chin and Council Member
5 Brad Lander for their leadership and also
6 acknowledging and going on the record, two years ago
7 when this body voted to impose a fee on plastic bags
8 I was one of those council members that was opposed
9 to the idea of posing a fee, for many of the
10 sentiments that have already been expressed in terms
11 of low-income and vulnerable communities feeling that
12 burden at a greater advantage, and during that time
13 as an elected official we are always in the business
14 of learning and growing, and certainly this is an
15 effort we are undertaking that is going to change the
16 behavior and the practice that New Yorkers have and
17 so while this legislation is really codifying what
18 the state legislature has done and really making sure
19 that the City of New York is going to now buy into
20 this effort, I'm grateful and calling all of my
21 colleagues, particularly my Bronx delegation, to make
22 sure that we can aggressively get all of our Bronx
23 residents, our supermarkets and small businesses on
24 board so we can help educate our residents so that we
25 can all be a part of saving our community and living

1
2 in a cleaner environment for the sake of our
3 children. So with that, congratulations colleagues.
4 I wish you all happy holidays, happy Passover, happy
5 Easter, and happy Resurrection Sunday. I vote aye on
6 all. Thank you.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Just briefly,
10 Madam Majority Leader, if you'll indulge me. I want
11 to thank Chair Constantinides for listening to and
12 acting upon the concerns that I had that would have
13 affected over 10,000 families in my district. With
14 that I vote aye on all, except for 1527, which is a
15 no, and I wish everybody a joyous holiday weekend
16 regarding Passover and Easter. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye on
20 all, except Intro 1527, which I see as just another
21 tax, especially on seniors.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Congratulate,
24 congratulations to Costa, Brad, and Margaret. I vote
25 aye on all.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: King.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to
4 all who got legislation passed today.
5 Constantinides, job well done. I vote aye on all,
6 and happy Resurrection Season to all.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Congratulations to
9 Council Member Constantinides and Council Members
10 Chin and Lander, and also Council Member Espinal for
11 passing important bills today. I vote aye on all.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to
15 congratulate my colleague, Costas, and my friend on
16 his magnificent legislation. I won't be around in
17 2050, but my grandchildren will [laughter], so thank
18 you. And also to Margaret and Brad, thank you. I'm
19 already collecting my bags, you know, to go shopping,
20 and I want to wish everybody happy holidays.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and
22 you're going to live forever, Karen. And Karen, how
23 do you vote on all?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

25 [laughter]

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I hope my hair looks
3 that good in 2050.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [laughs]

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Because you look
6 amazing.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: No on 1527, but
9 aye on the rest.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
16 Majority Leader. I've said this before, but it
17 really is true. Every night when I get home my
18 daughter, Rosa, who is 15, says to me, Dad, what did
19 you do today about climate change? This planet that
20 you're handing off to us needs urgent action. What
21 did you do about it today? And I'll be honest, most
22 days I don't have anything that good to tell her, but
23 today there's a lot to say, and I want to give big
24 props to Costa on all the legislation there to be
25 able to say we're passing the most aggressive action

1
2 to reduce emissions and energy consumption in our
3 largest buildings is extraordinary. Ah, to Council
4 Member Espinal, the bill requiring solar and green
5 roofs on top of new construction is going to make a
6 huge difference in Gowanus and all throughout the
7 city and obviously I am thrilled that we are finally
8 taking action to get rid of the scourge of plastic
9 and single-use bags. Three years ago this council in
10 a close vote, and I'm really encouraged by the fact
11 that today's vote I think will be a stronger one,
12 voted 28-20 to take action on bags, but as you know
13 the state overturned us and in that time we have
14 sent, spent, sent over 25 billion single-use bags to
15 our landfills, 25 billion bags, hundreds of thousands
16 of pounds of solid waste, costing the city something
17 like 50 million dollars, and finally we are going to
18 take real action, not just to get them out of the
19 trees and the storm drains, but to get them out of
20 our landfills as well. Here's the beautiful thing.
21 That little fee, as much as it annoys people, it acts
22 incredibly to get people to bring reusable bags
23 instead of take a new one, and all across the world,
24 all across the country, in all kinds of cities,
25 regardless of people's income, their race, their age,

2 their family size, whether they think of themselves
3 as environmentalists, that small fee helps all of us
4 bring reusable bags and stop having waste that we
5 just don't need. Big props to the advocates, to
6 NRDC, New York League of Conservation Voters, Plastic
7 Bag [inaudible] dot organization, Nilpeas, Citizens'
8 Campaign for the Environment, and so many more who
9 got us here today. I vote aye on all.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you and
11 thank you for your leadership.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
18 Majority Leader. I just want to thank and
19 congratulate all of my colleagues on their
20 legislation passing today, Council Members Lander and
21 Chin, on this amazing and long-fought and hard-fought
22 victory here on this legislation. Congratulations
23 Council Member Espinal for his amazing work on
24 advancing green roofs in our city, Council Member
25 Richards for his work as well, to the speaker and to

1
2 the entire staff here at the council. It's
3 unquantifiable how many hours went into this package
4 of legislation, um, staff hours, really considered
5 thought in making sure that we are doing the best
6 that we can do and being responsible to future
7 generations. I want to obviously acknowledge all the
8 advocates that worked hard on these issues, the
9 environmental advocates, the social justice advocates
10 who have made climate change and combating climate
11 change a priority for our city in realizing the
12 economic impact and the social impact that this is
13 going to have for many years to come in making sure
14 that we are doing everything we can. And last and
15 most importantly I want to acknowledge Costa
16 Constantinides, who was so considerate and thorough
17 and thoughtful in negotiating this legislation and
18 was a total professional and made sure that she bill
19 was the best that it could be, that it wasn't rushed.
20 He toiled on this for over two years and as a result
21 we have a bill that we can all be proud of, that the
22 entire city can be proud of, and we are handing off a
23 better city to future generations and with that I
24 vote aye on all. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1527. No on 1253. No on 1032 and 276. Aye on the rest.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader, with profound heartfelt gratitude and congratulations to Council Member Constantinides and of course the other sponsors of the great bills today, Council Members Chin, Lander, Espinal, and with best wishes to New Yorkers celebrating and observing Pesach and Easter in the coming days I proudly vote aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No on 1527, yes on everything else.

UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to explain?

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: First of all, I'd
3 like to congratulate my colleagues on this incredibly
4 courage legislation that is being passed today,
5 particularly Costa, for your hard work, Former Chair
6 Richards, and Margaret. This has been a long time
7 coming. Congratulations. Before I vote aye on all,
8 but I also want to say that I did some investigation
9 and there is absolutely no truth to the rumor that
10 our colleague, Robert Cornegy, will be leaving to
11 coach St. John's University. [laughter] And happy
12 holidays to all. Aye on all.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye and a
15 very big congratulations to my colleagues, including
16 Costa, for his bill today. Thank you for all your
17 hard work.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thanks.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I want to
25 congratulate Margaret Chin and Brad Lander for the

1
2 work that they did with single-use bags and this
3 council for being thoughtful about a comprehensive
4 approach to dealing with single-use plastic and
5 single-use paper bags. I also want to let the
6 council know you can call me the reusable bag man.
7 If you need bags, give me a call and I will make sure
8 the Department of Sanitation gets you your bags. You
9 can text me or you can shoot me a call. I'll make
10 sure it happens. Yes, I'll get a beeper, there you
11 go. And for Costa, I'm giving out names, the New
12 York City Council's Captain Planet for the work that
13 he did today. I really want to give him a shout
14 because this was not easy to do and again the City
15 Council has been comprehensive about what, how
16 they're thinking about the environment. So thank
17 you, Costa, for the work you did and to my colleague,
18 Donovan J. Richards, Steve Levin, and Rafael Espinal,
19 also being a part of the team and making sure that
20 this city will look much better and will be left in a
21 better place because of the work you did and my 15-
22 month-old baby, Alejandro, is going to be very
23 grateful for the work that we did here today. So
24 thank you and I vote aye on all.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Happy to follow
7 Bag Man, I guess we can call you, Reynoso, right?
8 [laughter] Bag Man. Ah, what an honor to be here
9 today. First off, let me start by thanking the
10 speaker, ah, and both Chair Costa Constantinides and
11 my other colleagues on this outstanding package of
12 bills. You know, these bills are really bold. They
13 are a bold response to the effects of climate change
14 and I know Debbie Rose sits to my left, I know Carlos
15 Menchaca represents Red Hook, Carlina represents the
16 Lower East Side, and our communities were impacted by
17 Hurricane Sandy and we need a bold response to
18 really, to scourge, to stop the scourge of climate
19 change for our communities. On a day like this when
20 it rains, Daneek Miller and I know there will be
21 homeowners in our districts whose basements are under
22 water. When we have these storms that seem to be
23 coming more ferociously and frequently, ah, over a
24 few months of the year, communities like the
25 Rockaways are impacted horribly, flooding, you can't

1
2 even drive through roads. So when people talk about
3 the impacts later, we are living with the impacts
4 now, and this is why these bills are good. I'm happy
5 to sponsor Intro 276, which will requiring buildings
6 five stories or smaller to install green roofs, solar
7 panels, or small wind turbines as we move forward. I
8 know I've got a few seconds left, but I'm just
9 thinking back to those senior citizens who could not
10 walk downstairs in their buildings because their
11 common areas weren't lit, they couldn't get access to
12 their drugs if they needed it. I know when I got
13 elected there were still people without electricity,
14 I mean, you're talking over a year after Hurricane
15 Sandy had already occurred. So having solar panels
16 and a renewable future will ensure that our
17 communities could survive in the future. So once
18 again I want to thank Costa for thinking out of the
19 box and really being courageous in moving this
20 package of bills, and all my other colleagues, and
21 with that being said I vote aye.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Congratulations
24 everyone, it's really exciting that we're taking
25

2 action now for the future and I proudly vote aye on
3 all.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to
6 congratulate my colleagues on this historic
7 environmentally responsible bills and I vote aye on
8 all.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Treyger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
15 explain my vote, please?

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I'd
19 like to speak about Intro 1527. In the previous
20 council I did not support the bill that created a fee
21 on plastic bags because I felt the bill did not go
22 far enough. I wanted a ban. I wanted also back in
23 2007 when I worked for a state lawmaker part time, I
24 worked on a bill in Albany to ban plastic bags in New
25 York State and we were told it would never happen.

1
2 Take a good look today. California has banned
3 plastic bags and imposed a fee on paper bags back in
4 2014, and I'm glad that we are now taking bolder
5 steps with this current measure. As someone who has
6 argued that the city has not done enough to reduce,
7 reuse, and recycle and as someone who has joined
8 Southern Brooklyn Residents in Opposition to a waste
9 transfer station that now stands facing my district,
10 I think it would be hypocritical for us to block
11 measures that reduce the amount of waste we are
12 producing. So I am glad that we are taking steps to
13 do away with plastic bags in New York and I support
14 this legislation because this fee can help us reduce
15 reliance on paper bags while helping cover the cost
16 of reusable bags for New Yorkers. And with that also
17 I want to commend all of my colleagues on their great
18 bills and a big shout out, he deserves a lot of kudos
19 today, Costa, because he really listened to
20 everyone's concerns, he made adjustments where he
21 felt where necessary but never compromised the
22 integrity of his bills. He is a true lawmaker in
23 every sense of the word, a true public servant, and
24 with that I vote aye on all.

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you and
3 happy belated birthday, Council Member Treyger.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on all
6 with the exception of preconsidered Intro 1527.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote aye on all
9 with the exception of 1527, and my best wishes to all
10 for a wonderful Easter and a wonderful Pesach. Thank
11 you.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Cumbo.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All items on
17 today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote
18 of 47 in the affirmative, 0 negative, and 0
19 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1527, which
20 was adopted by a vote of 38 in the affirmative, 9
21 negative, and 0 abstentions. Intro 276A, which was
22 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2
23 negative, and 0 abstentions. Introduce 1032A, which
24 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2
25 negative, and 0 abstentions. And Intro 1253C, which

1
2 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2
3 negative, and 0 abstentions. [applause]

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Quiet
5 in the chamber. We are now going to go to
6 introduction and reading of bills.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are referred
8 to committee as indicated on the agenda, and Madam
9 Majority Leader I was remiss. On all of the very
10 complicated bills that we voted on today the amazing
11 guy who runs this body every single day did an
12 incredible job and I really, really want to thank my
13 chief of staff, who is an incredible resource to all
14 the members and staff here, Jason Goldman, for his
15 hard work on that. [applause]

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now move
17 into the discussion of resolutions. Are there any
18 members who wish to speak on any of today's current
19 resolutions that we will be addressing shortly?
20 Today's resolutions. If no members have signed up
21 today to discuss today's resolutions, I will now read
22 them into the record below.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] please, sit
24 down.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I'll now read today's resolutions into the records. Members who wish to vote against or abstain on any of these resolutions should register your vote with the clerk at the dais. Resolution 66, a resolution calling upon the state legislature to pass and the governor to sign legislation that would increase the real property tax abatement for the installation of a green roof to \$15 per square foot. All in favor say aye.

COUNCIL RESPONSE: Aye.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All opposed? Abstentions? The ayes have it. Preconsidered resolution 845, resolution calling upon New York State Department of Environmental Conservation to deny the Water Quality Certification Permit for the construction of the Northeast Supply Enhancement Pipeline through the New York Harbor. All in favor say aye.

COUNCIL RESPONSE: Aye.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All opposed? Abstentions? The ayes have it. All right.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now move into general discussion.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please
3 [inaudible].

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have two
5 members that have asked to speak on today's general
6 discussion, beginning with Council Member Barron,
7 followed by Council Member Kallos.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ah, thank you. I
9 just want to call attention to the fact that today
10 we're celebrating the 50th anniversary of the student
11 strike and takeover at City College, and I was there
12 earlier today. They had a commemoration service and
13 they wanted to highlight the fact that it was 50
14 years ago that the community residents, community
15 activists and students decided that...

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Quiet in the
17 chamber.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you....
20 decided that City College in particular was not doing
21 enough, and it was their fight and their sacrifice
22 that brought about open admissions, that instituted
23 the opportunity for students who graduated and need
24 some remedial assistance to be able to get that and
25 to have black studies instituted in CUNY, ethnic

1
2 studies, Spanish, ah, ethnic studies as well, Puerto
3 Rican studies as well. And it was a battle that was
4 long time coming. Of course, it was 1969. It was an
5 era when all of that was happening. And we've lost
6 much of that. We no longer have the child
7 development center that had a focus for people who
8 lived in the community, the president is talking
9 about bringing in another agency to operate that and
10 we're going to look to see how we can combat that.
11 But I just wanted to highlight the fact that it 50
12 years ago that we did have the open admissions policy
13 and with pushback we no longer have 40% black
14 students at City College, we only have 18% black
15 students at City College and that's a problem and
16 that's an issue that we have to address. And finally
17 I just want to call attention to the passing of a
18 dear friend of ours, Stanley Connard passed. He was
19 a great activist. He was a political person, a
20 product of the New York City schools. He attended
21 Amherst University and while he was there he was
22 responsible for the founding of the W.E.B. Dubois
23 Department of African American Studies, which is one
24 of the first departments to grant a degree in black
25 studies. He was responsible for the founding of the

1
2 Carter Woodson Culture Literacy Project, as well as
3 Heritage House, which is in my colleague's district
4 in Brownsville, and he was a great fighter for Boys
5 and Girls High School. He battled so that it would
6 not be closed. He served on the school leadership
7 team. He was a part of the Care Center and he was a
8 community associate. And he's going to be sorely
9 missed. We extend our condolences to his family. He
10 was a loving, selfless person. He talked about
11 community all the time and the reason that he did
12 that was he was involved in making sure that we
13 advance as a person. He's going to be sorely missed.
14 Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and I
16 share your sentiments. Thank you so much. Council
17 Member Kallos, followed by Council Member Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Parks should be
19 for playing, not pesticides. All families should be
20 able to enjoy our city parks without having to worry
21 that they're being exposed to toxic pesticides that
22 could give them and their families cancer. My
23 daughter isn't allowed to play on the grass,
24 especially because as a baby she puts everything in
25 her mouth. I look forward to working with all of you

1
2 and our city agencies to ban toxic pesticides and
3 keep our children safe. That's why today I'm joining
4 with Council Member Carlina Rivera and we are proud
5 to introduce a bill, 1524, that bans the use of toxic
6 pesticides, including glyphosate, commonly known as
7 Roundup, from city parks and lands. The evidence
8 that Roundup poses a serious health threat is
9 mounting, despite Monsanto's efforts to defend its
10 product. Recently two courts have awarded 78 million
11 and 80 million dollars, respectively, to two
12 groundskeepers when juries deemed that they developed
13 cancer in part from prolonged use of Roundup. New
14 York City has relied on Roundup far too much. In
15 2016 Roundup was applied over 1000 times by the
16 city's Department of Parks and Recreation.
17 Introduction 1524 moves city agencies to biological
18 pesticides which are derived from naturally occurring
19 substances as opposed to synthetic substances. There
20 is the general acceptance that biological pesticides
21 are usually inherently less toxic than their
22 conventional counterparts and are often much more
23 effective at targeting a specific pest. Biological
24 pesticides can also be used in smaller quantities and
25 break down in the environment more rapidly. Further,

1
2 the bill adds measures to prevent harmful pesticides
3 from contaminating water systems by preventing
4 synthetic pesticides from being sprayed within 75
5 feet of a body of water. I would like to thank all
6 the parents, advocates, actually I introduced this
7 bill on behalf of kindergarteners and expect experts
8 who helped us draft a bill that will put New York
9 City at the forefront of banning toxic pesticides.
10 You may have just heard from them now. I want to
11 thank a kindergarten teacher, Paula Rogovan, whose
12 kindergarten class as PS-290 first brought this issue
13 to my attention and actually came to City Council to
14 advocate for this reform, and took over City Hall
15 with the cutest protest you'll ever see in your life.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
17 much, Council Member Kallos. And now we will have
18 Council Member Treyger, followed by Council Member
19 Levin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I
21 would like to speak about my new resolution, 850,
22 which calls on the New York State government to pass
23 and Governor Cuomo to sign into law legislation
24 introduced earlier this year in the state senate and
25 the state assembly by State Senator Roxanne Persaud

1
2 and Assembly Member Michealle Solages. That bill
3 would help put an end to the unacceptable, antiquated
4 practice of non-consensual pelvic examinations
5 conducted by medical students on unconscious
6 patients. No patient should ever have to enter a
7 medical for care and leave the victim of such an
8 egregious violation of their body and their human
9 rights. Medical students under the supervision of
10 training physicians enter operating rooms and perform
11 pelvic examinations on anesthetized patients prior to
12 surgery. Although patients at teaching hospitals are
13 provided with consent forms indicating the
14 involvement of medical students, the forms do not
15 always explicitly disclose the nature of this
16 investment. Horrifically, this is a practice that is
17 legal in 45 US states, including New York. The
18 American Medical Association, the Association of
19 American Medical Colleges, and the American College
20 of Obstetricians and Gynecologists have all denounced
21 the practice and recommended that patients must be
22 specifically informed and provide consent before any
23 such procedure can take place. The senate and
24 assembly bill would prohibit performing or
25 supervising a pelvic examination on an anesthetized

1
2 or unconscious female patient without first obtaining
3 the patient's icon to the pelvic examination unless
4 the examination is within the scope of the patient's
5 surgical process or diagnostic examination, for which
6 informed consent has been obtained. Thank you, and I
7 urge my colleagues to sign on.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.
9 Council Member Levin, followed by Council Member
10 Menchaca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
12 much Madam Majority Leader. Today I am proud to
13 introduce Intro 1528, a bill that will increase
14 opportunities for jail diversions citywide and
15 improve access to health care treatment in the
16 criminal justice system. This bill will establish a
17 two-tiered healthcare screening for people who are
18 arrested and awaiting arraignment, enabling defense
19 attorneys and judges to assess healthcare needs and
20 identify appropriate treatment before a person enters
21 jail. According to the Vera Institute, more than 40%
22 of people in the city's jail system receive some
23 behavioral health services. These numbers are
24 significant and we know that for a vast majority of
25 people with serious behavioral or mental health needs

1
2 jail is not the appropriate solution. We have an
3 opportunity to improve our protocols before a person
4 even enters the criminal justice system and divert
5 them to the care and treatment that is right for
6 them. As New York City works to close Riker's Island
7 we need to do everything that we can to decarcerate
8 and effectively divert people out of jail and connect
9 people to treatment and community supports that work.
10 This program was first modeled in the Manhattan
11 Detention Center in 2016 with great success. It is
12 time that we take citywide. I want to thank my
13 colleagues, Council Member Carlos Menchaca and Diana
14 Ayala and Margaret Chin for introducing this
15 legislation with me and I urge all of my colleagues
16 to sign on as well. That's Intro 1528. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.
18 Council Member Menchaca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I
20 want to point to something I mentioned earlier when
21 we were passing an incredible Green New Deal for New
22 York City, ah, and incredible jobs that we're going
23 to be creating, our work sites, our construction
24 sites are not safe. And the people who are dying are
25 immigrants in our city who have yet to get access to

1
2 construction safety classes, OSHA, the standards that
3 this council voted on a few years ago. Preconsidered
4 Intro 1533, what I'm hoping everybody signs on to, is
5 co-primed by me and the Public Advocate, Jumaane
6 Williams, and this really points to the very
7 dangerous industry of the construction work and the
8 tragic deaths of the three workers that we spoke
9 about and we honored this morning, or earlier today,
10 underscores the extreme danger facing construction
11 workers. Even despite the passage of Local Law 196,
12 which mandates safety training for workers, the law's
13 implementation has not met its original intent. To
14 this day many of the estimated almost 200,000 workers
15 in the city still await this mandated training and as
16 the administration has failed to release funding to
17 develop curriculum in a timely way, this is
18 especially the case for day laborers who make up a
19 significant portion of the construction workers and
20 are amongst the most vulnerable workers. They're
21 being told to go and get training, workers are being
22 told by private contractors to go get training and it
23 is our responsibility to ensure that everyone has
24 access. This bill will extend the deadline and with
25 a couple other pieces and policy changes we're going

1
2 to be able to unleash a real robust opportunity for
3 everyone to get educated. We are in a crisis and
4 extending the deadline is the one immediate step that
5 we can take and we will be doing this at the next
6 Stated, so I hope that you can all joint us. We want
7 to pull a briefing together to ensure that everyone
8 understands this very intricate and nuanced
9 situation, but I'm committed with the Public Advocate
10 and the Speaker to make this happen. Thank you so
11 much.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you Council
13 Member Menchaca. And with no other members signed up
14 to speak, we will now call on the speaker to close
15 today's meeting.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Today's Stated Meeting
17 of April 18, 2019, is hereby adjourned. Everyone
18 have happy Pesach and Easter. Thank you, Madam
19 Majority Leader.

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 28, 2019