

fCITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

March 7, 2019
Start: 10:08 a.m.
Recess: 12:21 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Laurie A. Combo
Robert F. Holden
Ben Kallos
Ydanis A. Rodriguez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Matthew Sapienza, Senior Vice Chancellor and
Chief Financial Officer
City University of New York, CUNY

Judy Bertram, Senior Vice Chancellor for
Facilities, Planning, Construction and Management
City University of New York, CUNY

Keesha Fuentes, Childcare Centers, CUNY

Barbara Bowen, President, Professional Staff
Congress, City University of New York, CUNY

2 [sound check] [pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

4 MALE SPEAKER: Good morning.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm Inez Barron, the
6 Chair of the Committee on Higher Education, and I
7 would like to welcome you all to our hearing on the
8 Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget, the Fiscal 2019
9 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, the Ten-Year
10 Capital Strategy and the Fiscal 2019-2022 Preliminary
11 Capital Commitment Plan for the City University of
12 New York. We are joined by Matthew Sapienza, CUNY's
13 Senior Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer
14 and Judy Bertram, Vice Chancellor for Facilities,
15 Planning and Management. Than you for joining us
16 today. Before I begin, as we all know, this is
17 Women's Herstory Month. So, I just want to share a
18 brief bio with one of my heroes. Mary McLeod Bethune
19 was an educator, a stateswoman, a philanthropist, and
20 a civil rights leader among other things. She was
21 the 15th of 17 children whose parents had been
22 enslaved. She walked five miles each day to go to
23 school. Her teacher saw a greatness in her, and
24 helped her get a scholarship to Nova Scotia Seminary,
25 and then to Moody Bible Institute in Chicago. She

2 had hopes of becoming a missionary, but she did
3 become a teacher in South Carolina and then moved to
4 Atlanta, Georgia. In 1904, she started a small
5 school with five girls and her own son. They were
6 ages 16 to 12. She had one \$1.50, but had a desire
7 and a commitment to make the school work. She rented
8 a small house for \$11.50--\$11.00 a month, and she
9 raised money for her school by selling sweet potato
10 pies, ice cream and fried chicken, and--no, fried fish
11 and she developed a curriculum that had the students
12 understand self sufficiency. She was able to garner
13 dollar-dollars from wealthy donors, and her
14 curriculum expanded and included home economics and
15 crafts and then to science, math and business courses
16 and English and foreign language. Her small school
17 that she started with \$1.50 became what is now
18 Bethune-Cookman College in Florida. And in addition
19 to starting a school, she also started the first
20 hospital for blacks in Daytona, Florida. So, just
21 wanted to share that little bit of history with you
22 about who she was, and her great contributions. We
23 know that within the next few years about 65% of all
24 jobs will require a post-secondary education. That
25 is why I am again calling for a restructuring of the

2 New York State Education Policy to provide an option
3 to all students to continue in a free state sponsored
4 educational program for at least two years beyond
5 secondary school. Historically by the end of the
6 1800s it was apparent that the compulsory education
7 through grade 8 was inadequate for the growing
8 industrial age, and I think that we similarly hear at
9 this time have reached the point in the information
10 age and advanced technology that requires high levels
11 of education. And if we make provisions for post-
12 secondary opportunities, we'll be able to extend-
13 expand the career opportunities, and increase access
14 for those who have been marginalized and locked out.
15 CUNY's Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget of \$1.18
16 billion does not vary much from its Fiscal 2019
17 Adopted Budget, and that's a little disappointing
18 because that means that there's not money built in to
19 hire more full-time faculty. As always, there are
20 items in the State's 2019-2020 Executive Budget that
21 remain in question such as the state's share of
22 support for Early Childhood Services and the ASAP
23 programming. The Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget does
24 not include Council initiative support such as
25 funding for the City Council Merit Scholarships or

2 the university's development of new remediation
3 programs. We will, of course, want to discuss all of
4 those things here today. But the year the Council is
5 taking a new approach to its Preliminary Budget
6 hearings to more effectively ensure that the city's
7 budget is fair, transparent, and accountable to all
8 New Yorkers. While efficiency and performance have
9 always been priorities in this body, today we plan to
10 scrutinize the organization that the city's budget
11 more closely than in past years. For CUNY this means
12 we will have a conversation again about the limited
13 number of units of appropriation, use and describe
14 vast areas of university spending particularly around
15 the community colleges. We will also take a closer
16 look at how CUNY organizes \$594 million, ten--\$500
17 million capital 10-year capital strategy and its
18 \$611.4 million Capital Commitment Plan. Many city
19 agency agencies, CUNY among them, developed plans
20 that frontload the vast majority of their funding
21 into a single fiscal year, then commit only a
22 fraction of that amount. Today, I would like to
23 continue talking about why commitment rates are still
24 low at CUNY, and how we can work together to come up
25 with a more rational capital spending plan. I also

2 look forward to hearing more about how the university
3 prioritizes its capital projects. This hearing
4 presents us with an opportunity to review other
5 programs and activities at CUNY as well. The state's
6 requirement that all CUNY and SUNY campuses house
7 food pantries raised important questions about costs
8 and funding sources, and I would like to see where we
9 are a year later, and how CUNY students who are
10 struggling to meet basic needs are doing. Turning to
11 academics, CUNY has developed a number of programs
12 and service to better meet the needs of the 21st
13 Century learners over the past few years, and I would
14 like for us to discuss them as well. But we know that
15 since the 1900s CUNY has had a downward spiral in the
16 number of black faculty, and over the last 20 years
17 up until 2018, CUNY has had an abysmal flat stagnant
18 rate of 12% black faculty. As always, I look forward
19 to discussing hiring practices, and the need for
20 increased diversity both at CUNY's campuses and
21 within its central administration. Before we begin,
22 I'd like to take a moment to thank my staff
23 particularly Joy Simmons, my Chief of Staff, Indigo
24 Washington, my CUNY Liaison and Director of
25 Legislation; Paul Senegal, my Counsel to the

2 committee; Michelle Paragon the Finance Analyst to
3 the Committee; Eisha Wright, the Unit Head and Chloe
4 Rivera, Policy Analyst to the committee. At this
5 time, I'm going to ask the Counsel to administer the
6 oath.

7 LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you raise your
8 right hands, please. Do you affirm to tell the
9 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
10 your testimony, and to respond honestly to Council
11 Members' questions?

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I do.

13 JUDY BERTRAM: I do.

14 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please state your names
15 for the record.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Pull the mic closer.

17 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Matthew
18 Sapienza.

19 JUDY BERTRAM: Judy Bertram.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may
21 begin.

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

23 Good morning Chairperson Barron and staff of the City
24 Council. I'm Matthew Sapienza, CUNY's Senior Vice
25 Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer, and I'm

2 joined by Judy Bertram, CUNY's Senior Vice Chancellor
3 for Facilities, Planning, Construction and
4 Management. We are also joined by several of our
5 colleagues from the university who will assist in
6 responding to questions and concerns from the
7 committee. We appreciate the opportunity to speak
8 with you today about the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2020
9 Preliminary Budget and its effect on the City
10 University of New York. Chairperson Barron, we very
11 much appreciate your strong and continuing advocacy
12 for our students. We come here today at a time of
13 many positive developments at CUNY. Applications and
14 new freshmen enrollments continue to rise to record
15 levels. More students come to CUNY college ready
16 because of pioneer pre-matriculation programs like
17 CUNY Start. Fewer students are starting CUNY needing
18 remedial courses, and those who do are moving credit
19 bearing course more quickly. As a result of our
20 Campus Academic Momentum Campaigns, students across
21 the university are making faster progress to
22 graduation. For the first time with the fall 2016
23 cohort, more than 50% of bachelor students earned 30
24 credits in their first year putting them on track to
25 finish in four years. A record number of degrees,

2 almost 54,000 were granted across CUNY in the 2017-
3 2018 school year. Our six-year baccalaureate
4 graduation rate has grown by nearly 25% in over the
5 last decade, and our 3-year associate-associate
6 graduation rate has more than doubled. Undergraduate
7 degrees awarded to Black and Latino students have
8 increased by over 70% during that same time period.
9 We are very pleased with the these results, but are
10 incredibly and rightfully proud that CUNY is arguably
11 the most diverse university in the nation if not the
12 world, and we're also incredibly proud and please
13 about the appointment of our new Chancellor Felix
14 Matos Rodriguez. CUNY continues to be the best value
15 in U.S. higher education. CUNY costs a fraction of
16 what students pay at private institutions, and it
17 beats most public universities as well. A report
18 issued last fall by the Rockefeller Institute of
19 Government underscores this point. Rockefeller found
20 that 79% of all undergraduates from CUNY's 2-year and
21 4-year schools graduated debt free in 2017. A
22 percentage that has remained stable since 2010. As a
23 result of the generous financial aid programs
24 including the Tuition Assistance Program, Excelsior
25 Scholarships and the City Council Vallone

2 Scholarships along with the Federal Pell Grant
3 Program, and federal tuition tax credits, about two-
4 thirds of CUNY students come tuition free. Only 11%
5 of our full-time undergraduate students paid full
6 tuition in the last academic year. All tolled in the
7 2018 aid year, there was—there were nearly 260,000
8 awards in federal and state education aid to CUNY
9 students totaling over \$1 billion. All of this
10 positive data accentuates the university's vital role
11 an engine of economic and social mobility in New
12 York. Our Fiscal Year 2020 Budget Request is
13 predicated on the idea that for the city and state of
14 New York to thrive and lead in these times, CUNY must
15 continue to play a key role in producing a highly
16 educated workforce for the most globally competitive
17 region of the nation. Now, let me speak to the city
18 Preliminary Budget. We are pleased that the city's
19 Financial Plan provides stability for our community
20 college—colleges through the funding of mandatory
21 costs related to fringe benefits, building rentals,
22 and salary increases resulting from the university's
23 recent Collective Bargaining Agreement with District
24 Council 37. Funding from prior plans will enable to
25 continue programs targeted at college readiness such

2 as ours with all CUNY Math Start and 12th Grade
3 proficiency. We are extremely grateful to the City
4 Council and particularly the Higher Education
5 Committee for securing resources in this year's
6 budget for the Vallone Merit Scholarships. We will
7 ask for your advocacy again as funding for this
8 critical student support program was not included in
9 the Fiscal 20 Preliminary Budget, as you mentioned,
10 Chair Barron. This Initiative provides financial aid
11 to students who graduate with an 80 average from New
12 York City high schools, and who maintain a B average
13 at the university. These merit based awards are
14 available to deserving students at both the senior
15 and community colleges, and our significant
16 contribution to our efforts to speed time to degree.
17 They demonstrate to our students in a tangible way
18 that their city makes it possible to pursue an
19 excellent post-secondary education right here at
20 home. We look forward to working with you, and
21 ensuring that these financial aid awards are
22 protected. We also need your help in restoring \$2
23 million that was provided for remediation in the
24 current fiscal year. CUNY has developed a plan to
25 better tailor remedial instruction to the needs of

2 its students, and to accelerate their degree
3 progress. Advisors strongly encourage students who
4 have their—the greatest need, those who are placed
5 into arithmetic, and those who need remedial
6 instructions in all three skills area: Reading, writing
7 and mathematics. To enroll in CUNY Start on math
8 side, CUNY's effective programs that are helping
9 students achieve proficiency. All of these
10 interventions are low or no cost for the student.
11 Our plan is to eliminate traditional course based
12 remedial instruction altogether within five years.
13 Additional needs to support CUNY's ongoing efforts to
14 increase completion rates are highlighted in our
15 Fiscal Year 2020 Budget Request, which we have here.
16 We are seeking city investment in several significant
17 endeavors. The first is related to support for
18 associate degree programs at our comprehensive
19 colleges. The amount provided for these programs has
20 remained constant at \$32.3 million since 1995.
21 Simply applying the Higher Education Price Index over
22 that time period will result in an additional \$32.8
23 million in annual recurring support. Our first
24 category of strategic investments will expand upon
25 proven approaches that advance student academic

2 success and degree completion. We propose to expand
3 our signature Accelerated Study in Associate's
4 Program, the ASAP program, it's—and it's new 4-year
5 counterpart, Accelerate, Complete and Engage, which
6 we call ACE, and support other academic momentum
7 initiatives that together are accelerating progress
8 to completion, raising graduation rates and crucially
9 closing racial achievement gaps. Expanding and
10 supporting the growth of a diverse body of full-time
11 faculty is also essential to all academic success
12 Initiatives. Second, we need to make sure that
13 students do not become sidetracked in their academic
14 pursuits by issues like food and housing insecurity.
15 Unmet mental and—and physical health needs and the
16 demands of childcare and other basic needs. We
17 propose to increase availability of campus childcare
18 as many of our 16 centers have waiting lists, and to
19 address student food insecurity and homelessness both
20 unfortunate trends in our student body. More
21 specifically, almost 80% of CUNY's first time
22 freshmen come from the New York City public schools where
23 they are eligible to receive breakfast and lunch at
24 no cost. Upon entering CUNY students must pay in
25 full for their meals. While the university has made

2 a commitment to maintain food pantries and to provide
3 food vouchers at the colleges, there is much more to
4 be done. With additional funding we would develop a
5 program to provide swipe cards to be used at
6 university cafeterias throughout the year. Third, we
7 propose to invest in CUNY Works, a set of integrated
8 bold new steps to ensure our students are well
9 positioned to thrive in today's changing world of
10 work. We will scale up CUNY's new Workforce Center
11 to engage employees across ten high growth sectors,
12 and translate their needs into career exploration and
13 development, hard and soft skills training and job
14 placement for our students. Similarly, we plan to
15 grown the availability of paid internships and expand
16 experiential and service learning for our students.
17 Let me turn very quickly to the state budget. CUNY's
18 request to the state includes the community college
19 base aid funding increase of \$250 per student full-
20 time equivalent and this increase in state funding
21 along with continued city support would adequately
22 support community college operations, and enable the
23 university to freeze community college tuition rates
24 for a fourth straight year. In addition, we are
25 hopeful that the Senate and Assembly will restore

2 funding for ASAP and childcare centers. Chairperson,
3 Barron and member of the committee, please be assured
4 that the university deeply appreciates your continued
5 commitment to a high quality CUNY education, which is
6 the vehicle that so many New Yorkers rely on for the
7 past of upward mobility. I would now like to ask
8 Judy Bertram, our Senior Vice Chancellor for
9 Facilities, Planning and Construction Management to
10 talk about CUNY's Capital Budget.

11 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Good morning,
12 Chairperson Barron and committee members. It is a
13 pleasure to be here today. [background
14 comments/pause] It is a pleasure to be here today,
15 and I'm happy to have this opportunity to discuss
16 with you our Capital Budget. The City Council has
17 been an outstanding partner to CUNY especially to our
18 community colleges where providing support for
19 critical maintenance work in major new buildings. In
20 recent years, your support has been instrumental in
21 helping CUNY to complete pool restorations at BMCC
22 and Bronx Community Colleges, major expansion of
23 libraries at Medgar Evers and La Guardia. Creation
24 of a new dining facility at Queensborough Community
25 College, renovation of the 500 Grand Concourse

2 building fourth floor at Hostos Community College and
3 installation of a largest photovoltaic array in
4 Manhattan on BMCC's Chamber Street building. All
5 these projects added or upgrade space, and would
6 enrich those campuses with modern well designed
7 facilities that inspire students. IN recent years
8 the Council has provided hundreds of millions of
9 dollars to CUNY that fund hundreds of project, in
10 particular at the community college. Because of your
11 generous support of critical maintenance funding,
12 CUNY has been able to address some of the most
13 challenging critical maintenance issues at these
14 campuses. In particular, your allocation of long-
15 term funds that allow CUNY to add to project that are
16 in process to help CUNY move several important
17 critical maintenance projects along. Last year the
18 Council provided \$10 million, which CUNY has request
19 this-the-requested the state match that would then
20 give us \$20 million. As you know from our previous
21 discussions, achieving a state of good repair within
22 the system is CUNY's priority. One of the largest
23 ongoing critical maintenance projects is the
24 replacement of the façade at La Guardia Community
25 College's Center 3. This enormous building is 100

2 years old, and its façade must be replaced if the
3 building is to be preserved. I am happy to report
4 that we expect to complete construction of this \$125
5 million project by the end of the year. I hope that
6 you all will take pride in the realization of what
7 would be a community treasure. If you've driven by
8 the building recently, you must have noticed the
9 amazing transformation. Other critical maintenance
10 projects that have benefitted from—benefitted from
11 Council funding are: The ongoing Campus utility
12 project at Bronx Community. We re completing phase 4
13 and starting phase 5. In total, the project cost is
14 over \$170 million, and there is still yet another
15 phase. A complete replacement of the electrical
16 system at Queensborough Community College so that the
17 college no longer suffers from power outages, and the
18 phase renovation at Hostos Community College 500
19 Concourse Building, and roof replacements across the
20 university, which are in need of repair at every
21 single campus. We are please to report all this
22 activity, but must emphasize the critical maintenance
23 continues to be our major capital priority at our
24 community campuses, and we are still need of your
25 support for that long-term effort. We have over 7

2 million square feet of community college facilities,
3 three-quarters of which is over 40 years old. The
4 most serious needs remain to be the infrastructure
5 systems that support facilities' operations. We are
6 pleased—also pleased to inform you that we are
7 planning to expand our space in Inwood for the CUNY
8 in the Heights Program associated with the Borough of
9 Manhattan Community College and Hostos. The
10 expansion will allow us to continue to increase vital
11 higher education services to the community, and
12 providing many career ladders to educational
13 attainment and career. We estimate that the
14 expansion will cost \$6 million. We continue to seek
15 additional city and state funding building expansion
16 projects at every borough. For instance, we are very
17 much in need for another important initiative, which
18 is \$50 million for a new permanent facility for
19 Guttman Community College. The work at our
20 facilities continues and it's integral to realize
21 those important goals. CUNY is a community treasure.
22 Thank you for your support, and all you do for CUNY
23 and New Yorkers. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for your
25 testimony, and we'll get right to the heart of the

2 matter. So, we know that of the proposed \$1.18
3 billion that CUNY has proposed, 95% of that falls
4 into one of three categories, broad categories is
5 units of appropriation. So, the Council has brought
6 this to CUNY's attention several times. However, how
7 is the conversation with the Office of Management and
8 Budget--Office of Management and Budget about
9 restricting funding to the community colleges and to
10 more units of appropriation going?

11 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is that going to
13 have all of that in one?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How is that going?

16 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, thank
17 you, Chair Barron. Yeah, currently we have five
18 units of appropriation. We have a personnel service
19 and--and other than personnel service, OTPS units of
20 appropriation that mainly for our community colleges
21 as you mentioned. Then there's a separate PS and
22 OTPS U of A for the Hunter campus schools, and then
23 the fifth one is for our appropriation to the senior
24 colleges. And so we have had discussions about--with
25 OMB about creating more units of appropriation

2 especially for those first two that I mentioned for
3 the community colleges to break that out some more.
4 We don't have a—a final result of that yet, but we'll
5 continue to talk to OMB through budget cycle and
6 happy to take input or recommendations from the
7 Council and the Higher Ed Committee or Council
8 Finance staff about how we could be more transparent
9 in terms of how we budget.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How do you then
11 internally record and manage those shifts since it's
12 not designated in the particular—have there been more
13 units—units of appropriations we'll be able to see
14 and track that? How do you do that internally?

15 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well—well,
16 currently in the city's accounting system in—in the
17 financial management system there is a budget code
18 for each community college. So, we are able in the
19 city system to track it by community college, and
20 then in our own internal system which—which
21 interfaces with the city system, again, we do have
22 specific accounting structures for our community
23 colleges and for various programs within the
24 community colleges. So, we are able track it that
25 way, but—but I hear you about providing more

2 transparency and we'll certainly be able to continue
3 the discussions with the Office of Management and
4 Budget about doing that and again, happy to hear from
5 whatever input you or the Council staff might have
6 about how we can—how we can help you in terms of
7 getting information on—on CUNY's finances.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Of the \$1.1 billion,
9 the \$320 million for Community College units of
10 appropriation or one-third is not directly assigned
11 to an individual college. So, that's a third of the
12 budget that's essentially through a single budget
13 code. How can we get greater transparency--and a
14 part of that you just answered—with a clear
15 oversight? So what can you recommend that would help
16 us to do that, and how was this funding used over the
17 course of a year?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Alright. So
19 that \$320 million that's in—in that one account that
20 we mentioned, and is not distributed—not distributed
21 to the Community Colleges, about two-thirds of that
22 comes from centrally managed accounts for fringe
23 benefits and for energy costs. So, for fringe
24 benefits and energy, we don't allocate those to the
25 community colleges. We pay the bill centrally and

2 they all come out of that one account. So, that—that
3 accounts for the—the bulk of that, but again, we
4 certainly can provide reports in terms of the
5 distribution of fringe benefits to the community
6 colleges and energy costs as well. We do—we do track
7 that and account providers. (sic)

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How many new needs
9 have—has CUNY presented for this year?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right. No,
11 thank your for asking that questions. So, we have
12 our university budget request, which I'm going to
13 hold up to show all of you, and hopefully you'll have
14 received or will be receiving your copy soon. We do
15 have several requests to—to the city for funding for
16 new needs. Some are mandatory. Some are
17 programmatic. On the programmatic new needs we were
18 very encouraged the other day to hear the Mayor's
19 announcement and—and the Council Speaker's
20 announcement about the Fair Fares Program and that's
21 going to include CUNY students, and who we're—we're
22 very pleased about that. That was part of our budget
23 request. We did—we did ask for discounted Metro
24 cards for our students. We have a whole slew of
25 needs in this document for food insecurity,

2 homelessness, childcare centers, and additional
3 faculty. So it's all laid out in our budget request
4 and they've been provided to the Administration, and
5 we're hoping that in the Executive Budget that we'll
6 see a good majority of our programs funded in the
7 Mayor's Executive Budget.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You talked about
9 hiring faculty.

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What—what is your—
12 can you expand on that?

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: So, yeah. We
14 are in this budget request, which is the 2020 Budget
15 Request, but we also included 4-year financial plan
16 in the request. We are seeking to hire 200
17 additional full-time faculty across the university in
18 each of those four years so that the increase would
19 be 800 over four years. Right now we have about
20 7,500 full-time faculty. So, this would grow to well
21 over 8,000 over four years.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the number now
23 is 7,500?

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: It's about
25 7,500?

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Full time?

3 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, we can
4 get you the approx., the exact number, I should say,
5 but it's around 7,500 full-time faculty. Thank you,
6 Michael. It's actually 7,627 for Fiscal 18.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and what would
8 be the cost for 200 additional full-time instructors--
9 -

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --Uh-hm.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --for each of those
12 four years or over the four years that you're talking
13 about?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right, the
15 cost for the additional for Fiscal 20 it's \$8.3
16 million at the senior colleges and \$4.1 million at
17 the community colleges. So, it's about \$12.5 million
18 a year. So, over the four years it would be about \$50
19 million, over the four years.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, I was going to
21 talk about this a little later on, but since we're
22 here--

23 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --how are we going
25 to make sure that--CUNY has a term--underutilization,

2 and labor market indicators, how is CUNY going to
3 make sure that we meet the goals that we've set. In
4 your 2012-2016 "so-called Master Plan" you said that
5 you would have a Council inclusion and excellence and
6 their recommendations would ensure diversity in
7 departments and executive centers. You would have a
8 faculty fellowship publication program, diversity
9 project, development fund, post-doctoral program,
10 CUNY Scholar Diversity. That was in your 2012-16
11 plan.

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, now you're
14 talking about hiring more faculty, but the hiring
15 that you have done has not changed the percentage of
16 faculty particularly Black faculty--

17 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --has not changed
19 that number overall. So, what are we going to do
20 different so that at the end of next year when you
21 come here again, we're not still at 12%?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, and I-I
23 want to point out to you Chair Barron a few things,
24 but one is--

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --in our
3 Budget Request the--the category there with full-time
4 faculty we call it, Expand and support diverse body
5 of full-time faculty because we know that not only
6 hiring new faculty is important but making sure that--
7 -

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --we have a
10 diverse body of full-time faculty. It's important.
11 We know that. There's an issue that you've raised
12 over the years, and--and we appreciate the need to do
13 that. So, a few things I would say. One is that I
14 know the Higher Ed Committee had a hearing back in
15 the all on this topic where our--our interim
16 Chancellor Vito Rabinowitz Testified along with
17 President Jose Luis Cruz at Lehman College and
18 Claudia Schrader from CUNY Bronx Community College.
19 So, since then a couple of things I just want to
20 report on. One is the Chancellor's Faculty Diversity
21 Working Group, which is chaired by President Cruz at
22 Lehman College and President Michelle Anderson at
23 Brooklyn College finalized their report on the
24 Faculty Diversity Working Group, and presented it to
25 our Board of Trustees at their November meeting. So,

2 now—the recommendations for that report are being
3 rolled out to out our campuses. One of the things
4 that we're really excited about that I being worked
5 on also by our Office of Human Resources is they're—
6 they're developing a diversity dashboard. So,
7 they're developing technology where we can more
8 easily and transparently report and our colleges can
9 more easily track the diversity numbers at their
10 campuses. So, that's under development now, but we
11 are really encouraged that's going to help
12 significantly. So we will continue to report on the
13 progress here. Most of the hiring that happens in
14 faculty happens in the fall semester when we're
15 staring a new academic year. So the recommendations
16 that we report we won't see bear fruit right now, but
17 we think for next fall when we hire a new cadre of
18 faculty that we will see some progress and we'll be
19 happy to come back and report to you on that.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In your—at the—I'm
21 not sure. In the June I think 2018 Board of
22 Trustees' meeting Queens College had an entry on the
23 calendar where they wanted to—where they were awarded
24 a contract of—not exceed \$6 million to develop the
25 International Student Success Program for the

2 purposes of bringing in international students, and
3 they project that it would generated \$12 million
4 annually in tuition. So, of course, they had some
5 economic motive to having this program.

6 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How much money is
8 CUNY devoting in dollar amounts to making sure that
9 we get the diversity, the black increase that we say
10 we want to have? How much money? What's the dollar
11 amount--

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
13 Yeah.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --that CUNY is
15 putting into that? Because we know talk is cheap as
16 they say, but when we was to really do something, we
17 put some dollars to it to back it up. So, what's the
18 dollar amount if CUNY thinks this is important and
19 recognizes the advantages of having a diverse faculty
20 both as models for students and increased
21 intelligence and interaction and being able to move
22 about in very a very diverse role? What's the dollar
23 amount that CUNY is dedicating to make this a reality
24 so that it comes off the pages of the master plan and
25 the connected CUNY Plan.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, we will
3 get you that number, Chair Barron. I don't have it
4 today. There are things that we are doing centrally
5 like you—you mentioned earlier the Faculty Fellowship
6 Program, which we—we're initiating centrally. (sic)
7 There are things that our colleges are doing on their
8 individual campuses. So, we will go back and work
9 with our campuses to find out what each of them are
10 spending on diversity initiative and combine that
11 with what we're doing centrally and—and be able to
12 report back to you. But one thing because you raised
13 it, Chair Barron, I just wanted to mention very
14 quickly about international--

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

16 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --students,
17 and we've very pleased with the—with the program that
18 Queens College is putting in place, but we ought to
19 be mindful of international students that throughout
20 the country the number of international students that
21 are coming to the United States is—has been going
22 down the last couple of years--

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --with some of
25 the concerns coming from the changes that the federal

2 government. So, that's something we're concerned
3 about as well, and we're keeping our eye on, but
4 innovative things like Queens College are doing I
5 think will--will help a lot.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, back to the
7 other load of questions. Well, of course, you know
8 that's the interest that I have in and always had--

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
10 Absolutely.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --looking to make
12 some concrete changes and improvements.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Absolutely.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In the Mayor's
15 briefing, the Administration called for programs to
16 eliminate the gap of \$750 million to be reflected in
17 the Executive Budget, and as part of that plan, CUNY
18 was asked to pay \$6.8 million. So, how to you plan
19 to achieve this pay?

20 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I, of course, don't
22 think that we should be reducing the programs, but
23 this what the Mayor has proposed and this is what
24 we're negotiating, but how are you planning to
25 address that peg?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, I know.
3 Thank you for raising that, Chair Barron. We were
4 notified on Tuesday of this week of our target, which
5 is amassing (sic) \$6.8 million.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Certainly, you
8 know, we—we want to see funding increases in our
9 operating and—and capital budgets, and so any time
10 there's—there is a pay program that creates a
11 challenge for our campuses. We will need to work
12 with our campuses individually to distribute that
13 reduction target to them, and have them come back to
14 us and let—let us know how they're going to do it.
15 I'm sure that they'll—there'll have to be some
16 service reductions, but I know our community colleges
17 will do what they can to try to keep that away from
18 direct instruction and student support costs to our
19 students. So—so we don't have a plan fully flushed
20 out yet. I will add that in our budget request, we
21 were targeting about \$6.6 million in administrative
22 efficiencies at our community colleges for the next
23 year. So, the number is very close to what we were
24 planning to do anyway, which is good, but we'll try
25 to do as much from the administrative areas, and

2 again keep it away from instructional and student
3 support areas as we can

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, you just said you
5 had targeted \$6.6 million at the campuses, and the
6 administrative--

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
8 At the community colleges, yes. Now, in our Budget
9 Request, we had targeted \$6.6 million administrative
10 efficiencies, and we wanted to redirect those to our
11 strategic investments, and academics and student
12 support. That was our plan, but now it appears that
13 that--those funds are gong to have to go towards the
14 PACE Program, unfortunately, but--but we do have plans
15 in place to try to create--achieve those saving
16 through administration and not through instructional
17 of student support.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, is that going to
19 be a one shot, or is that going to be baselined?

20 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We're planning
21 that it's base--we're planning that it is going to be
22 baselined.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And will--how will
24 each campus be given a target amount? Will it be
25 based on the student population or what's the

2 criteria? Each school is given a targeted amount and
3 it's different for each school.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes and
5 usually--

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] How is
7 that calculated?

8 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, we--we
9 haven't distributed it yet, but usually it's--it's
10 based on the operating budget for each of those
11 campuses. So, \$6.8 million. We have seven community
12 colleges. Some are larger than others. So, you
13 know, the--but proportionally it will be based on--on
14 their Operating Budget. That's what we've done
15 historically.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, it will--will be
17 an equal percentage of each school's operating
18 budget?

19 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes, yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. A few more
21 questions before I go to my colleagues. The Fiscal
22 2019 Budget includes one-time various intra-city
23 transfer of 100--of \$12.1 million added to student
24 internship and fellowships, \$121 million added, thank
25 you, to student internships and fellowships, and the

2 largest of which includes \$45 million to mental
3 health support. Right, we know that it's a very
4 critical issue.

5 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What can you tell us
7 about this program? How many students participate,
8 and what are the services that's taking place?

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes. So think
10 you. We do have a very robust inter-city program,
11 and we do—as—as you mentioned, Chair Barron, generate
12 about \$100 million a year in intercity revenue, but
13 the program you mentioned is a collaboration between
14 Hunter College because I know you're a very proud
15 alum of Hunter. Hunter College and the city
16 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, and it's a
17 four-year grant, and the purpose of the program is to
18 develop what we're calling the Mental Health Service
19 Corps that will recruit, train and create more than
20 300 Early Career Behavioral Health Clinicians in
21 healthcare practices that would be distributed
22 throughout all of the neighborhoods of New York City,
23 and so these clinicians would serve in the Mental
24 Health Service Corps for three years, and they would
25 earn valuable experience in—in their clinical work,

2 and so, again, we're very excited about this.

3 There's students that are—that are participating,
4 and—and the grant is for four years.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Are these students
6 located throughout the campuses or are they
7 concentrated or is it just at a campus.

8 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
9 It's—it's—right, it's—it's a collaboration. It's at
10 Hunter College, but these students are distributed
11 throughout the five boroughs. So, they're—they're
12 working throughout New York City.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And CUNY has a
14 historical relationship with other city agencies in
15 providing services and partnerships to their
16 students. What new programs are—what new programs
17 are on the horizon that we can look forward to?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah. I know
19 we have a lot of terrific agreements with our
20 partners in other city agencies. One of the ones
21 that we're really excited about is called the CUNY
22 Internship Program, and it's for IT jobs for our
23 students, and so through this program we're offering
24 over 700 internship programs throughout 18 different
25 city agencies, and we expanded it this year, and one

2 of the things I always try to point out, and it-and
3 historical—a historical program that we've had it's
4 intercity (sic) agreement with the DOITT is the 311
5 Center very often I say if people call the 311
6 Center, there's a very good chance that a CUNY
7 student is going to answer the phone. So, CUNY
8 students are vey involved in that as well, but—but
9 the Internship Program is what we're really excited
10 about to be able to provide work experience for our
11 students and provide our services to our fellow city
12 agencies.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And as we're talking
14 about, are there any plans for using this opportunity
15 and gathering information from the Census to make
16 partnership with that so that CUNY students can be
17 engaged in that?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, that's a
19 good thought and—and we've had some preliminary
20 discussions about the Census and—and what opportunity
21 that can have for our students, and so I appreciate
22 that—that suggestion, and we'll bring it back to
23 folks at the central office, and—and see what—what
24 role CUNY students can play in that process.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I think the deadline
3 is quickly approaching. So, you might want to really
4 have somebody look at that very quickly, and can you
5 just quickly give us an update on the—what was it?
6 The—the Solar Program that CUNY had been involved
7 with, New York Solar Smart.

8 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: We have, as I
9 reported before, we have the largest solar array on—
10 on the

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Can
12 you pull the mic a little closer? Thank you.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: As I reported
14 before, we just completed installation of the largest
15 solar array in Manhattan on Bronx Community College.
16 We're doing another program on the facilities at
17 Queens College. We have an ombudsman to the industry
18 that basically assists companies in registering to
19 be—to provide solar. So, we have a whole unit that—
20 that takes care of that.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So--

22 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]
23 And I think—I think we made history in—in Manhattan
24 and I think we're going to made—make history in
25 Queens at Queens College.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. I'm going to
3 take step off, a break and I'm going to defer to one
4 of my colleagues, Council Member—we've been joined by
5 Council Member Rodriguez and Council Member Holden,
6 and Council Member Rodriguez has some questions, and
7 then I'll come back.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
9 Chair. I believe that CUNY, of course, most of us we
10 have a problem (sic) with CUNY. We were never here
11 without it happened that big door that opens to us in
12 different occasions to be able to get a degree. For
13 me the best Master Degree that I got was not my
14 bilingual education, but it's to be an activist, and—
15 and I think that that's an experience that is
16 priceless. I believe that CUNY is in crisis right
17 now, and I believe it's a matter of time when that
18 will blow up. I believe that it's happening under
19 our watch, and I don't know how much more we will
20 continue to suppress that reality to pull lose
21 numbers out because we come every year and we share
22 those numbers, but at the same time that we as a city
23 and a state talk about providing \$3 billion subsidy
24 to Amazon, for me I'm talking about I was a former
25 grad, and someone who cares for CUNY, and someone

2 that as a former teacher that I know the dozens and
3 hundreds of students that I taught for 13 years, they
4 only were able to become top engineers from City
5 College because CUNY opened the door to it. But when
6 I saw that other conversation and, of course,
7 everyone had to play their role, I don't want to put
8 you on the spot. It is our role to be watching this.
9 I don't think that CUNY was and it is seriously
10 considering to be a top partner to talk about there's
11 a \$3 billion incentive to Amazon. There should \$500
12 million incentive to CUNY, the institution that
13 should be the one training those workforces. That is
14 not enough to say we will create 25,000 jobs. 25,000
15 jobs of people that we rotate from Google to Apple to
16 Facebook, from California to New York City, but not a
17 plan to say CUNY will play role training those, at
18 least 50% New Yorkers from here, but we should aim to
19 be working with Amazon if by any chance Amazon will
20 be coming here. So, when I look at these numbers in
21 all reality it's about are we living in night? Are we
22 living in a dream? Like are we really putting it—we
23 are living like the MTA, a crisis that for decades we
24 tried to handle it with a—with a bandage, and no one
25 is talking about it until the last three years. They

2 would say, What the hell is going on? How many
3 colleges at CUNY are operating on deficits?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]

5 In the new-

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]

7 If you don't mind, just tell me the number. How many
8 campus do we have?

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We have 25.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Twenty-five,
11 and again I'm doing my part. I don't want to put the
12 leadership on this path. It's my role to advocate
13 from Albany to the city. How many of the 25 are
14 right now operating on deficits?

15 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: In our Media
16 (sic) Financial Report that we issued a few months
17 ago there--there were three colleges of the 25 on
18 grant. In our Media Financial Report that we issued
19 a few months ago, we were projecting that three
20 colleges within the current fiscal year in deficit.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yep, and
22 that's--that's our reality, and again, of course like,
23 it's like I used to be former and co-founded Luperon
24 High School, a small school--

25 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --that was
3 created for to a new incoming student from Latin
4 America from Jay Hedges and to John. So, all of you
5 create a good pipeline to connect us the student with
6 opportunity. We even went through the process when
7 the student they were not accepted in the senior
8 colleges. City College did a pipeline, and pilot
9 program, and they took a number of students that in
10 the traditional way they would be rejected from the
11 senior colleges, and they did it again the pilot
12 program, and they proved that all the students that
13 they took they not only graduated, but they graduated
14 with a 3 point above average. And now they are
15 professional. Now they are middle-class and now
16 they're contributing more. SO, when I look at again,
17 Luperon is my-my baby even though I had to advocate
18 for George Washington and other schools because that
19 other school that I went after graduating from
20 Brooklyn City College. So, when I look at City
21 College now and I see that to graduate a student in
22 the School in the School of Engineering costs three
23 times or more compared to the average student, and
24 the college it's not get this money. So, here and
25 this is the college in the nation graduated the

2 largest numbers of students—of persons or students of
3 color. So, when and how can we from the city to the
4 state address that reality to say—and—and we know
5 that's one of the colleges that is operating on
6 deficit. So, what is our plan? How can we be
7 helpful, and what will you do for a new aim from
8 central office to address colleges such as City
9 College that they have departments and schools that
10 it cost them three or four or five times more. I did
11 political science, but the School of Engineering cost
12 like \$15,000, and probably \$3,000 for a political
13 science or—or anther area. Well, how are—how are you
14 at Central Office being helpful because we're talking
15 about with college that it's operating in a deficit
16 of more than \$10 million that they have the School of
17 Health. They—they have the School of Engineering
18 that it cost them much more, and those schools (sic)
19 Chairman is the one that we have the better
20 opportunity to see more especially Black and Latino
21 students graduating from Engineering to the School of
22 Health. So, how is CUNY dealing with this program,
23 and how this budget will reflect a change to be
24 helpful to colleges such as City College?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. I
3 think hearings like this are—are very helpful to that
4 process for us to communicate very directly to
5 whether it's the City Council or when we testify in
6 Albany for the State Legislature about what our—what
7 our serious and critical needs are. We have our
8 budget requests for Fiscal 2020 and our Four-Year
9 Plan where we're laying out the needs on the
10 operating end and on the capital side as well. I
11 think that this budget request that we put together
12 this year, which our Board of Trustees approved back
13 in January, that this was probably the---the boldest
14 and most aggressive request that we've had in many,
15 many years at the University because as to your
16 point, Councilman Rodriguez, we wanted to make sure
17 that folks in both city government and state
18 government understood what the needs of our campuses
19 are, what the needs of our students are. So, this is
20 a very aggressive request. We worked very hard on
21 it, and—and—and had good direction for not only the
22 Administration, but from our Board of Trustees. We're
23 very involved in putting the request together this
24 year, which we appreciate, and from our perspective,
25 we—we are asking the city to contribute more and the

2 state to contribute more, but to your point, we know
3 that we have to do more internally as—as
4 administrative leadership as well and so we do have
5 an Administrative Efficiency Program that we're in
6 Year 2 where we're targeting \$75 million in
7 administrative efficiencies so that that can go back
8 into investments in both instruction and student
9 support, and the other thing that we're—we're
10 targeting is we know we need to do more fundraising
11 both from the central office and—and our campus
12 leadership as well. So, we are doing that for the
13 campuses that are projecting deficits and that are
14 feeling some fiscal stress, we—we worked with them
15 just about every single day to try to identify not
16 only resources for them, but also efficiencies and
17 how they can be better at—at using their funds, and I
18 know folks at the campuses are work very hard to try
19 to do that. So, it is a collaborative effort, but
20 we're certainly looking for opportunities like this,
21 like this morning to—to make our—our case to here at
22 the City Council, but also to our funding partners in
23 the Administration, and—and out state government as
24 well.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: My-my last
3 point is that first of all, I-I believe that the-that
4 was consummated (sic) even though we expect it from
5 provost and presidents to raise money, but I feel
6 that it is our responsibility to also to have a plan
7 to say in this budget we're going to be working
8 together so, that those colleges again they support
9 that they need to cover the deficit that they have.
10 Because even though we have seen a reduction of
11 population especially a student of color in the
12 senior-in the top senior colleges. When I was there,
13 80% of the students they were Black and Latino Today
14 the student population of Black and Latino, even
15 though we grew up, and today's population the city is
16 29% Latino, 27% African-American. Our numbers are on
17 70%. So, we've been going down in senior colleges.
18 So, by skill, those are the colleges that we are
19 seeing some diversity. So, in each path those
20 colleges when the positions are empty, they've frozen
21 those positions. They are not hiring new people and
22 those are positions that they are important to
23 provide the services to our students. It's not only
24 that we have 7,000 something. What happened when one
25 of those positions already that person retired seven

2 moths ago. Those presidents cannot hide those—with
3 their replacement. That's the direction that they
4 have for central office. So, it's not that the new
5 one will add the 7,000 more. It is that in city—in
6 CUNY today, the President have his hands tied right
7 now because of the financial situation, and here yet
8 we do a lover's day (sic) The student go there and
9 advocate, and here we can—you're doing the best you
10 can, but we are not providing the financial support
11 that CUNY needs in order for those institutions to
12 deal with the deficit, and they are the only
13 opportunity that someone like me, a person who comes
14 from the working under-served community. They will
15 have to be graduating. We know that ASAP work, but
16 still the funding is not there to cover every single
17 student. We know that college prep work, but we know
18 that we are not providing—being able to get the
19 financial support to enroll every single student to
20 be part of the colleges now. So, in fact the movies
21 (sic) is over. It's like, you know, are would like
22 going around telling the same movies that we did like
23 before I became—I was the Chairman of this committee
24 and—and Council Member Barron and now in the in the
25 Council—and now Chair Barron, too. It's like CUNY

2 need help, and I know that you're limited to being
3 open on other crisis that CUNY is going through. We
4 need to do our part because this crisis will not be
5 helping too much too long. This crisis will explode
6 in our hand. So, I feel that the top colleges, the
7 community college, they need financial support, an
8 issue that included as any subsidy that we bring from
9 Albany to New York City to any private corporation.
10 This is the best investment that we can make, and the
11 budget that we are allocating is not enough from the
12 city to the state. So, all I say it's about to my
13 colleagues for you guys, you know, I know that you're
14 limited on how much you share with us. We need more
15 information. We need to deal with this crisis
16 because if not, our children will pay the
17 consequence. The last question for me is about, you
18 know, of course on the hiring-

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] You're
20 sounding like the Baptist preacher who says: And as
21 I close and as I close. So, please make this your
22 last question because we have to get back to the
23 other questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: On hiring we have a
25 crisis. We are not ready to handle it. They Hiring

2 Committee, the structure that we have through
3 colleges, it doesn't reflect diversity. You go one
4 by one. The composition of the Hiring Committee, the
5 process of the Hiring Committee is not structured to
6 bring the diversity that we deserve in the city of
7 New York. It's controlled by white male, and you can
8 go and look at it one by one. I hope that someone
9 will take the initiative to handle with this. The
10 institute--and that's in 30 seconds--I will finish
11 with this: How the funding that we are putting to
12 the institute that money, would that money go
13 directly to them from day one because that's not
14 happening. The funding that we allocated to the
15 Dominican to the Puerto Rican to the Mexican
16 Institute, as soon as the handshake is done and the
17 money is approved, that money should be sending
18 directly and that money should not be used of the
19 reduction of the investment that CUNY is doing. So
20 what is going on? How can we assure that other
21 funding for this fiscal year in the next few days,
22 they will be sending completely to other institutes
23 and what plan do we have to--when we put the funding
24 for the next coming budget, that money will be going
25 to them directly.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah. No, I'm
3 glad you raised that, Chairman—former Chairman
4 Rodriguez or Council Member Rodriguez about the
5 institutes because that is a key component that again
6 we're going to be looking to the Council to help us
7 to restore funding for those institutes, Centro, the
8 Center for Puerto Rican Studies at Hunter College,
9 and other Dominican studies in the cities you
10 mentioned and Mexican Institute. None of that
11 funding was put in the Mayor's Preliminary Budget.
12 It all zeroed out. So, we are looking—going to be
13 looking to the Council to help us get those funds
14 restored, and to your question, a 100% of what the
15 Council allocates to those institutes goes directly
16 to those institutes, 100%.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: When the
19 fiscal year opens we—we work with our campuses to try
20 to try those funds around as quickly as we can, but
21 100% goes to those institutes.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council
23 Member. In your testimony you indicated that that
24 the roof replacements across the university is a

2 major project, and all of the campuses are in need of
3 repair. What's the cost of these roof replacements?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The-the-the
5 roof replacements can--

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Can
7 your turn your mic on?

8 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: It kind of-it
9 depends upon the size of the roof. The roof
10 replacements can go from \$5 million (sic)

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay,
12 so what have you budgeted for these roof
13 replacements?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The total amount
15 \$30--\$35 million.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And are all college
17 campuses going to be having--will have their roofs
18 replaced or are you--have you targeted particular?

19 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Well, we have
20 300 buildings, but on every single campus we are
21 looking at replacing roofs.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if I--

23 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]
24 Some--some, you know, if you take on some campuses
25 we're replacing a large roof. Some campuses we're

2 replacing a small roof. It depends, but we're—we are
3 hitting every single campus and that's a priority.
4 So you will see for the next let's say four or five
5 years that we will continue to do that.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So it's ongoing?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: It's ongoing,
8 right because here's the problem. If you don't fix
9 the roof, you basically doing any work inside the
10 building could be affected by that. So, that is—I
11 don't want to say the number one priority, but that's
12 up there. So, any—if you go to any campus, you will
13 find us repairing some roof.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, in your Ten-Year
15 Capital Strategy, the City's Ten-Year Strategy totals
16 \$104 billion, and that's \$14.5 billion larger than
17 the \$89.6 billion in Fiscal Year 2018 and 2028 Ten
18 Strategy Plan—Ten-Year Plan and CUNY's Ten-Year
19 Capital Strategy totals \$594 million, which is just
20 2% of the city's total strategy. So, is this actually
21 a Ten-Year Plan when you frontload in let's say Data
22 Process. You have an amount for 2020. You have an
23 amount for 2021 and 2022 and then it sort of zeroes
24 out and the same thing with Energy Conservation
25 Projects. In 2021 in 2022 you have amounts and then

2 it's zeroed out. So, we just think that those are
3 the only years that the money is needed or the
4 project will be completed in just those years that's
5 indicated here?

6 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Well, it--

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So--

8 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Sorry.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Go ahead.

10 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: So, if-if you
11 just look at Data Processing and you look at \$23
12 million--

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

14 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: --and you take
15 the \$23 million and you divide by our let's say 24 of
16 25 campuses, that's not a significant amount of money
17 for each campus. So, that's where you get the 23,
18 and for CUNY because we're doing renovations all over
19 every campus, you could have included in those
20 renovations funding for IT infrastructure and IT
21 equipment. So, this doesn't really capture the whole
22 point of it.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But why is there any
24 dollar amounts for 2024, 2025, 2026, 2027? Why isn't
25 there?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]

3 Wait a minute. This--this is kind of the amount of
4 money that we have. We will come back and talk to
5 you. We will come back and talk to you about what's
6 needed. Now, as far the planning goes because I know
7 you're--you've brought this up before: How do we
8 plan? How do we know what--what we need going
9 forward? So, this document is our planning document.
10 [bell] Oh.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-hm, go ahead.

12 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Not--not so much
13 the Capital Commitment Plan that you see here. So,
14 this document is like 250 pages, and it lists for
15 every single campus what the priorities are.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We usually get that
17 in January when we go to the--

18 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]
19 Right, right.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --the planning (sic)
21 officer.

22 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Right. You can
23 get it online.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, do you work with
25 OMB on long-term planning and--and is it reflected in

2 the strategy? Any-any involvement that you have with
3 OMB for this planning? And what's the portion of
4 CUNY's property? What portion of CUNY's property is
5 city-owned versus leased, and I think about a year
6 ago I asked you what was the evaluation of the real
7 estate that's—that CUNY owns? I don't know if I ever
8 got an answer to that question. So what portion is
9 city-owned versus leased? What is the value of the
10 property that's city—the real estate the CUNY owns,
11 and what portion of CUNY's community college property
12 is city-owned versus leased, particularly for the
13 community colleges?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: For all of CUNY
15 we have somewhere between 28 and 29 million square
16 feet. Of that, a million of that is leased—is leased
17 space.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: One million of--?

19 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Of the 28
20 million.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 28 million. Okay.

22 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: And the value—I—
23 I—I think it's 30—the value of replacing all of CUNY
24 is 30—I think it's 30—I—I—I'll get back to you, but I
25 think the value of replace—of replacing every

2 building at CUNY is like \$33 billion, but let me get
3 back to you. That's what I remember.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And—and for
5 community colleges, what—what portion is city-owned?
6 Do you have that breakout?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: I don't, but I
8 can give that to you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so we could
10 ask you for that as well. So, CUNY has—CUNY relies
11 on \$100 billion--\$100 billion to support students
12 across its seven community colleges, and we know that
13 these buildings are more than 50 years old, and many
14 of these buildings are close to 100 years old. So,
15 how would we prioritize the Capital Plan, and we've
16 asked this question before? Okay, of all of those
17 entries in your book, how do we prioritize those?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Okay, there is—
19 there's two ways we prioritize. One is we sit down
20 and actually we're starting the process again as of
21 April 1st. We sit down with every single—every
22 single campus, and we look at what projects are
23 ongoing. Then we look at what we asked for the year
24 before, and we basically come up with what the
25 priorities for the—the campus, and what we believe

2 the priority, and where does come from? In 2000—the
3 first time we did it was 2007 and in 2012 we did an
4 update, and now we are doing it—an update to look at
5 the condition of CUNY and look at every single
6 system, and come up with a priority of what needs to
7 be replaced. So, we do it with—this is with the
8 campuses and then we have a numerical system where we
9 basically take a look at it to bring the—to bring
10 CUNY up in a state of good repair. So, we do it two
11 different ways.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And just before I go
13 to Council Member Holden, CUNY School of Medicine at
14 City College the liaison has a—the Liaison Committee
15 on Medical Education is the official accrediting body
16 for medical education programs in the U.S. and Canada
17 that lead to an M.D. Degree and their visit was on
18 January 21st. How can you tell—can you tell the
19 committee the results of their visit, and can you
20 give us an update on the process that the CUNY School
21 of Medicine's accreditation process has been? Is it
22 ongoing? What's the timeframe, and is the LCME
23 inquiring into the financials of the school?

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. I can
25 take that one, Chair Barron. The LCME I don't have

2 a—a formal response about the specific visit that
3 they had in January, but they have been visiting.
4 There is a partial accreditation of the medical
5 school by the LCME, and we are working with both the—
6 the medical school and the LCME to ensure that full
7 accreditation is granted to the college, which we're
8 hoping will be later this year. We are---

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Later
10 this year they should receive full accreditation?

11 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: In 2019,
12 that's what—that's what we're—that's what we're
13 expecting, and we're hopeful but we know that we have
14 to provide some more information LCME, which we're
15 happy to do. I know that there are meetings coming
16 up, which I will be participating in, and our Interim
17 Chancellor will be participating in as well. To your
18 point, we want to ensure that the LCME that the
19 financial supports are in place for the medical
20 school. It—it was a big priority in our budget
21 request as well. We are seeking additional funds
22 from the state for the medical school, but they are
23 doing good work at the medical school, and we want to
24 be supportive of them, and we'll work with the

2 college and the LCME to ensure a full accreditation
3 shortly.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And who's leading the
5 School of Medicine? Is there person in the position
6 of lead? (sic)

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
8 Yeah, the--the founding dean for the medical school is
9 a gentleman named Moitzio Treabsan, and he recently
10 resigned. I believe it was back in January, and
11 there is a--an interim dean that has been appointed
12 right now who was Dean Treabsan Deputy. So, it's,
13 you know, in a seamless transition so far, and it is
14 part of the--of--of City College and so President Vince
15 Boudreau has ultimate authority of the medical
16 school. It's into this part of City College.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, are you
18 confident that the accreditation requirements will be
19 met in full?

20 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes. I know
21 we still have a lot of work to do on that, and--and
22 again, I know the LCME has very, you know, strict
23 and--and important guidelines that have to be met, but
24 we are confident that they will be met.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Council
3 Member Holden.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair
5 Barron.

6 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I want to
7 congratulate Vice Chancellor Bertram for a wonderful
8 building at City Tech. It was just opened. The
9 ribbon cutting, I attended the ribbon cutting. It's
10 so magnificent. I only saw the auditorium, but it's
11 a world class auditorium, and they had to wait until
12 after I left at 40 years at City Tech to-to build
13 this wonderful building, I-I just, you know, and by
14 the way speaking of the roof on Namm Hall, I was
15 there 40 years. We were on the top floor, the 11th
16 Floor of Namm Hall. There wasn't a year that the
17 roof didn't leak. It-we had to constantly. It would
18 actually, you know, get into the computer and destroy
19 equipment, and-but we had leaks for every year for 40
20 years, and that's how bad it is. And I-so I
21 understand that it takes a tremendous capital
22 allotment, a budget to-to address just some of the
23 campuses, and it's just-but we always had a problem
24 there, but it's a great building. I just wan to as

2 Vice Chancellor Sapienza I missed how many faculty
3 lines that we're—we're going to hire full time.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Oh, yeah. No,
5 thank you. In our budget request, we are seeking to
6 hire 200 additional full-time faculty in each of the
7 next four years. So, it would be a total of 800 over
8 four years.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And those will be
10 actually new lines. Just how many people on an
11 average—how many full-timers retire in a particular
12 year?

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, it's
14 usually a few hundred, two to three hundred per year
15 depending on, you know, any one year, but—but yes,
16 that's an important point.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] But
18 two to three hundred a year. So, we're not--

19 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
20 We thought that--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] So,
22 we're not—we're not keeping pace then?

23 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, yeah,
24 no, these are in that position. So—so we want to
25 replace the people that will—that will attrit by the

2 period of time in or-or leaving the university and on
3 top of that, we want to have 200 new faculty.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
5 Two. Okay so these are, yeah, so-so that would
6 happen in our department. We-I was in the
7 Communication Design, and we'd always-every-every
8 year we lost. If somebody retired, we would hope to
9 retain that line--

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
11 Yeah.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --but didn't.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: No, it's an
14 important distinction. These-these--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] A
16 bunch of cuts.

17 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: These are 200
18 net new positions that we're seeking.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, that's a
20 good target, and I'm glad. What's the-university
21 wide, what's the full-time faculty student ratio?
22 Because we never reached close to our target in full-
23 time faculty ratio to-to student.

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah. You
25 know, I-I-I think a data point that we look at when

2 it comes to that is the amount of instruction that's
3 taught by full-time faculty, and that number has been
4 pretty stagnant over the last several years. It's in
5 the high 40, 46, 47, 48 percent range, and we'd
6 certainly like that to be higher. One of the
7 challenges is trying to secure funding to hire an
8 additional full-time faculty, but one of the
9 challenges that we also have had has been that
10 enrollment has continued to grow. So, we haven't
11 been able to—to keep pace, and so our overall number
12 of 7,627 when you compare it to, you know, 10 years
13 ago, the number of full-time faculty, has grown, but
14 our enrollment has grown at a greater rate, and so we
15 haven't been able to keep pace. [background
16 comments] So, thank you Michael. So the ratio of
17 folks—senior full-time equivalent—equivalent to full-
18 time faculty for fall 2017 was at 28.8. So, the
19 number of student full-time equivalent to full-time
20 faculty is 28.8. Right.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, 28 to 1?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Which is a lot

24 then, and the problem with CUNY over the—I started in

25

2 the '70s at City Tech. [background comments] What
3 happened?

4 FEMALE SPEAKER: Nothing. You're fine.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I put it—I
6 started in the '70s, and we had let's say if we had
7 20 faculty—full-timers, we had 10 adjuncts, and it
8 turned upside down actually to the point where we had
9 in—in my department over a hundred part-time
10 adjuncts, and less than 20 full-time. So, and the
11 university was going in that direction, and—and as a
12 result the students didn't get the mentoring. We
13 didn't—they didn't because only the full-time at that
14 point—full-time faculty had office hours where the
15 adjuncts didn't. Some of the adjuncts now have a
16 one-hour office, but that's nearly enough. So—and
17 many of the students as—as years went on would need
18 more counseling. They would need more mentoring,
19 more job placement, which a lot of the faculty in our
20 department did.

21 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, what—what I—
23 and I know it's was, it was always budgetary. We
24 never got enough from the state or the city, but I—I
25 just hope we can turn that around a bit because it's—

2 it hurts the student. We would see that, you know,
3 you'd have lines out the door. You'd have to go way
4 beyond as a full-timer, go way beyond your--your
5 office hours to just-- You know, in my department we
6 had a thousand students or it still has, a thousand
7 students in one department, and if you had 20
8 faculty, full-time faculty you were overwhelmed. So,
9 I'm--I'm glad that we're going to hire at least 200
10 per year in addition to the ones, the faculty that
11 we--that retires, but still we're so behind in that
12 area.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Just a couple of--
15 just--am allowed to cut one--one or two more
16 questions, Chair, Chair Barron?

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [off mic] Yes

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. The
19 childcare. I know Queensborough Community doesn't
20 have childcare. Are we--are we looking in the future
21 to try to get that there?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We have--we
23 have 16 childcare centers currently. So, we don't
24 have it at every campus, and--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] But
3 should that be the target going forward?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Absolutely,
5 and as part of our budget request as well, we were
6 seeking \$1.8 million for additional childcare
7 services, additional slots for our students. We want
8 to try to make sure that the childcare centers are
9 open in the evenings because we have a lot of
10 students that are coming in the evenings, and—and
11 need childcare services so that's a really important
12 component of our budget request, and again, we're
13 looking to both the state and city that—to help us on
14 that because both the state's proposed budget and the
15 city's Preliminary Budget would reduce the funding to
16 childcare centers currently. So, we're looking to
17 not only get those funds restored, but to—to have
18 enhanced services as well through our budget request.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay and just—how
20 many of those childcare facilities take in infants?
21 Because I know some of them don't. I think City Tech
22 at one time might have had infants but then—

23 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
24 Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --they don't do
3 it any more.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I think that--I
5 think--Keesha Fuentes--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Because that's
7 when you actually need--

8 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
9 That's what I'm talking about.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: That's when you
11 need the childcare the most if you're--if you're, you
12 know, if--if you have the baby and then you want to go
13 back to school, you have to wait sometimes years so--

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Just before you
15 answer, I'll ask the Counsel to administer the oath.

16 LEGAL COUNSEL: Yes. Please raise your
17 right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth the whole
18 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony,
19 and to respond honestly to Council Members'
20 questions?

21 KEESHA FUENTES: I do.

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please state your name
23 for the record.

24 KEESHA FUENTES: Keesha Fuentes. [coughs]
25 Currently we have four centers that have infant--

2 infant childcare programs. We have several centers
3 that would like to open up for infants. However,
4 they do not have the space, and they would need
5 capital funds in order to do so. Right now, we only
6 have four. [coughs]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, at least at
8 City--so there's no infant care at City Tech and they
9 just opened a new building.

10 KEESHA FUENTES: Right there's none at
11 City Tech.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Well, we should.
13 I--I--that's why that at a previous hearing that before
14 the build--building was actually completed, that we
15 should at City Tech expand because that's--again,
16 that's what I--you know, I had students that had to
17 leave and--and take leave because of the pregnancy and
18 we--I didn't see her for years after that because
19 there was no way that she could get the childcare.
20 So, it's very important that we try to go in that
21 direction especially in the budget. I'd like to see
22 that happen. It happened a lot, and at City Tech
23 when you open a new building you get more space, and
24 there should be, you know, at least in that school,
25 but certainly Queensborough has a lot of space. It

2 has many buildings, a sprawling campus and no
3 childcare, no childcare whatsoever. So, I think we
4 need to—and I know, you know, you want this to happen
5 so I'm not, you know, I'm not blaming anyone. I just
6 think we need to make it a priority. As for
7 diversity that I was on the Appointments Committee in
8 my college for over 20 years, P&B and some colleges
9 that we—we would actually do the interview-
10 interviewing and hire faculty, and I never thought
11 that the colleges or at least my college put enough
12 emphasis on hiring from the adjunct pool, and—and
13 again, in my department we had over 100 adjuncts to
14 choose from, and so we knew, we—we actually knew
15 their qualifications. We knew by a resume you can't
16 tell the person's race more often than not. So, we
17 would take the best three resumes or best 10 resumes.
18 We would call in for the interviews, and then submit
19 three to the Administration, the best based on their
20 interviews, but we knew that we had a many times 100
21 adjuncts to choose from. It seems that the
22 university or the—the college or the Administration
23 was not interested in hiring from within. So, I
24 think—and—and to address the diversity problem
25 throughout the university, again I mentioned this at

2 one hearing: Look at the adjunct pool to-to actually
3 reach you goals because you have very, very good
4 adjuncts. Many times most-many of them were in the
5 industry, and certainly had the experience and-and
6 you-and many times we had adjunct faculty teaching
7 for decades, and excellent, excellent faculty. So, I
8 would-I would urge that that you try that.

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you,
10 Councilman Holden. That's a great point, and over
11 the last ten years or so, I think there have been
12 three instances where we worked with our, in fact,
13 the Professional Staff Congress to do adjunct, to
14 lecture conversions, to move, as you say, long
15 serving adjuncts, and who qualify for the lecturer
16 position into the full-time lecturer position. And I
17 think we've done-the total is about-I think it was
18 about 200, but we can get you the exact number of
19 adjuncts that converted to lecturers, and-and our
20 campuses we're very happy with that. So, we're-we're
21 hoping that we can do some more conversions in the
22 future.

23 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: And Councilman
24 Holden, now the hall has a new roof.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Beautiful

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: It has a new
3 roof.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Again, it figures
5 when I leave everything improves. So, thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just
7 before—I just want to acknowledge we've been joined
8 by Council Member Kallos and Council Member Laurie
9 Cumby—Cumbo. I'm sorry. Just before I go to you,
10 Council Member, it's a quick question. [pause] I'm
11 going to defer and let my colleague go because he
12 went and came back.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. Well,
14 there's a lot happening. The Mayor is having a press
15 conference on mayoral control. We're also having a
16 press conference because they want to steal the—the
17 revenues from marijuana legalization from low-income
18 communities of color.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Who said that it's
20 going to go through? So, you brought another topic
21 in. Let's focus on today.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No worries.
23 Sorry, about that. [laughter]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon.
25 How are you today?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Hello. Good
3 morning.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: In the PMMR, you
5 currently have no target set for enrollment. Is CUNY
6 interested in seeing enrollment decline or would you
7 like to see it increase as the population of our city
8 increases, or you want it to stay flat? I think also
9 helpful. What should the goal be?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah. I think
11 overall we want—we—we definitely want to see
12 enrollment increase, but for each individual campus
13 that might be different. There might be some
14 campuses that we feel are at their maximum that we
15 want to hold a lot--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] So-
17 -

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --but I think
19 overall we do want to see an increase.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. So, will
21 you change your targets in the MMR with an up arrow
22 to indicate that throughout the CUNY system you're
23 looking for the community college enrollment and the
24 senior colleges to go up?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. Yeah,
3 well, we'll—we'll work with the Administration on the
4 next iteration of the other--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]
6 Okay, so, and—and I guess--

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
8 And the methods and reports to reflect that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Next—next
10 question. As we talked about economic development,
11 one of my colleagues brought up Amazon and \$3 billion
12 for 25 or 35 or whatever many billion dollars in
13 incentive. Do CUNY graduates earn more income and,
14 therefore, pay more taxes than folks who do not
15 possess a community college or college degree?

16 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Absolutely,
17 and not only that, but I think the data shows that
18 about 80% of CUNY graduates actually remain in New
19 York State and New York City after they graduate.
20 So, not only are they earning a higher salary because
21 they have a CUNY degree, but they're staying here
22 and—and are contributing to the tax base.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I—I—I thought
24 that would be your answer. Now, I'm really pleased
25 about the testimony, and about a \$300 million—sorry--

2 \$295 million investment in La Guardia Community
3 Colleges and Bronx Community College for
4 infrastructure. Will that yield additional seats
5 that you will have additional students and additional
6 capacity?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [off mic] The
8 local--the--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] Is
10 your mic on?

11 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [on mic]--at La
12 Guardia--

13 MALE SPEAKER: Put your mic on.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: The--the roughly
15 \$300 million will it yield new school seats? Will it
16 yield more economic activity?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: It will--it will--
18 the La Guardia will will--will basically yield more--
19 more seats, more space because we have--we had to take
20 care of the interior before--the exterior before we
21 touched the interior. So, now--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] So,
23 but this won't affect the interior? The interior is
24 the next phase?

25 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: How much is that
3 phase going to cost?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Well, we are--the
5 size of that building is almost--it's--it's 800,000
6 square feet, which is almost the size of one or two
7 of our colleges. So, each floor of that building to
8 renovate it costs somewhere about in the excess of -
9 \$80 million. So, in that building 5--4-1/2--4-1/2
10 floors are occupied.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay.

12 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: We are working
13 on that--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] So,
15 you're going to do one more floor for \$80 million.
16 That will increase your capacity by at least 20%?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: I can't--I'll
18 have to get you what the percentage is. It depends
19 on what the program is that's in there.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. How many
21 people can you educate in a hole in the ground?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Not many.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Does CUNY
24 currently own a hole in the ground in my district?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: CUNY owns the
3 site at 74th Street. Yes, and they--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] And
5 how would you describe that site? Is it a site where
6 it is ready to educate students?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: No, it's not.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. Do you
9 currently have a plan in this whole document and all
10 your testimony to do something with that hole in the
11 ground?

12 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Well, actually
13 the request for the need for the building is in this,
14 in--in our request, but we are now meeting with the
15 state. We're meeting with the city, and we're
16 meeting with MSK as we speak to talk about what we
17 can do to basically take care of the issue that
18 you're describing.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: What--what are the
20 number of--how much are you asking for in your
21 document?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The new
23 document asks for \$300 million for the Core and
24 shell.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And for \$300
3 million how many square feet and how many student
4 would you be able to educate?

5 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The—definitely
6 Core and shell and that would be the entire
7 population of that nursing school.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So what is that
9 population in the nursing school?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: I'll have to
11 get back to you on the total population.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And do nurses
13 make a living wage? Do they earn somewhere around
14 \$60 to \$80,000? Do they earn more than the area
15 median income, and are those good jobs that we should
16 be creating that have economics attached to them?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: I think they're
18 very good jobs. Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: \$300 million.
20 We've actually raised that for just a park in my
21 district. They have invested \$275 million in a park.
22 Can—will—will CUNY commit \$300 million to get this
23 done, and fill this hole in the ground and educate
24 hundreds if not thousands of nurses--

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]

3 Well, the-

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --and generate
5 the economic activity that comes with it?

6 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The \$300
7 million is for the core and shell.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So how much to
9 get it all done?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Probably \$800
11 million

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: It's \$300 million
13 to build and entire building and then you're
14 estimating a half a billion dollars that's for the
15 inside?

16 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]
17 We're building science—we're building a science
18 building where half of it is for a new nursing school
19 and the other half is for research.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Why is you number
21 \$800 million when I believe Hunter's number is \$360
22 million?

23 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Because if you
24 look it's just the—I think that's in the range of \$60

25

2 million that you're talking about is the core and
3 shell.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I-I think that
5 there's a problem when we're talking about \$300
6 million and then you're throwing out another-it's
7 \$800 million additional on top of the \$300 or the
8 total?

9 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The-the total.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I-I-can we get
11 the \$300 million to get the shell built?

12 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Well, we are
13 really pushing very hard to basically ask for that.
14 We made a request.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Is it in your
16 request to the Council? Is it in your testimony
17 today?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: It's in the
19 request.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Will you-will you
21 ask us right now for the \$300 million?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Yes, I will ask.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Can you ask?
24
25

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: We need money
3 to build the--the science building that core and shell
4 \$300 million.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay, thank you.
6 Next question. I see that according to our numbers
7 you have 1,000--14,166 full-time instructional staff,
8 17,986 part-time instructional staff. Is that
9 roughly accurate?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I think full-
11 time staff we have about 7,600 full-time staff, and
12 part-time staff I'm sorry Councilman Kallos, can you
13 repeat that number that you had?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'm talking about
15 instructional staff.

16 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, I have 14,166
18 full-time instructional staff from the fall of 2017
19 numbers which we have access to, and 17,986 part-time
20 instructional staff.

21 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, the
22 full-time staff is about 7,600 instructional staff
23 and the part-time staff I will get you the actual
24 number, but I believe it's probably about 13,000 not
25 17,000.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay, so our
3 numbers are actually better for you than your numbers
4 because you're saying that there are twice as many
5 part-time staff than full-time staff. So, could we
6 perhaps go from-what-if-So, I guess the first
7 question: Do you think that professors and
8 instructional staff and educational staff can do a
9 better job if they are full-time or part-time?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Research shows
11 that in terms of progress to degree for students and
12 outcomes for students that it's better to have a
13 full-time instructor.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. I
15 really appreciate that level of honesty. Will CUNY
16 in the interest of the information you just shared-
17 thank you, because otherwise we would have gone back
18 and forth a lot-commit to doubling the instructional
19 staff so that full-time instructional staff so you're
20 not relying on part-time instructional staff. By the
21 way, this is personal to me because my mother was an
22 adjunct at John Jay and La Guardia and that was not a
23 living.

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: She was on free
3 and reduced school lunch while she was teaching at-at
4 CUNY.

5 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: No, I hear you
6 and-and in our budget request we are seeking funding
7 for-to hire 800 additional full-time faculty over the
8 next four years. We very much value our-our part-
9 time faculty. We have a wonderful adjunct faculty,
10 but as I said earlier, the studies do show it's
11 better outcomes for students with full-time faculty.
12 So, we do have a commitment to grow our full-time
13 faculty, but again, we-we're seeking funding and are
14 the first to do so.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Would you be
16 willing to be a little bit more aggressive, and just
17 say let's double the full-time faculty and double the
18 number of students we can-Sorry, so we can increase
19 and do better by our students?

20 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, if we
21 can-if we can get funding for \$800 over four years
22 we'll start there, and-and, you know, make sure that
23 we can continue to hire more full-time faculty.
24 Doubling is-is a very aggressive, you know, number.
25 So, I-I don't want to commit to that right now, but

2 our request is seeking funding for \$800 over four
3 years.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] My
5 final question it relates to the Excelsior
6 Scholarship. I--

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yep.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: When I was
9 running in 2012, I wanted to make CUNY available
10 through a very similar model. Governor Cuomo
11 proposed a model. That's something that I support,
12 but I'm disappointed. According to our numbers
13 there's only 475 out of 23,000 Excelsior recipients
14 in the CUNY system. Is that correct and how do we
15 get Excelsior for more CUNY students.

16 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah. I think
17 that number probably refers to the number. That
18 sounds close to the number of community college
19 Excelsior recipients. The total number of Excelsior
20 recipients in last year in Academic year 17/18, which
21 was the first year of the program, was a little over
22 3,300. So, CUNY had about 3,300 Excelsior students
23 in--in the first year.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: How do we
25 increase that?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.
3 It's 30,264 in year 1.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So how do we—how
5 do we increase that number?

6 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, we are
7 expecting an increase for this year, and again, you
8 know, we're in the middle of—of the year, and so—
9 [background comments] So—so numbers are—we do expect
10 an increase in the numbers and we—and we think that
11 we'll have well over 4,000 for this year. It's only
12 year 2 of the program. So, I think as the program,
13 you know, continues that we will certainly see an
14 expansion at CUNY.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I just
16 need to get a little clarity. You say you have 7,627
17 full-time instructional personnel.

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct as of
19 2018, as of fall 2018, and that's full time.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] That's
21 with both the senior and community colleges?

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct. Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then in a
24 document that—that you have submitted here on page
25 223 it says that there are 11,600 part-time faculty.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, that--
3 it's--it's probably a little bit more now--

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

5 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --but yes,
6 that sounds like it's in the--in the ballpark of where
7 we are in part-time faculty.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then for adjunct
9 full-time employee count according to the City Human
10 Resources Management system it indicates that there
11 are 1,841 adjuncts on payroll.

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I'll have to
13 check that number. We consider the adjuncts part-
14 time employees. So--

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So--?

16 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --I'll have to
17 go back and check that.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, be--

19 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, I'm
20 sorry that it is, but--

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yeah,
22 and we'd like to get that by college reports.

23 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
24 Yeah, we'll go back and look them up.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The entry in my
3 information says: Adjunct full-time.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
5 Okay, we'll go back and look it up.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, it's somewhat
7 confusing.

8 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if you could
10 clarify that would be great.

11 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We will.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Now, Council Member
13 Holden talked about new employees. Did you tell us
14 how many of those were adjuncts who moved up?
15 Because I know that's an issue that he has raised
16 before, and in addition to that question, what would
17 be the cost for the 200 employees that you want to
18 target--

19 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
20 Right.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --over the next four
22 years? What would be the cost if we looked
23 internally to the adjuncts who are already--

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
25 Yeah, yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON:--who are already
3 familiar with the university who have demonstrated a
4 level of competency? What would be the cost for us
5 to move adjuncts already within the system to those
6 other lines?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right. I-I-
8 I'm going to give you an answer that doesn't directly
9 answer your question, but because it--the answer
10 really is that it depends and it depends on how many
11 courses that adjunct is teaching. So, the average--
12 the average amount an adjunct earns per course
13 currently is about \$3,600 per course. So, if they're
14 teaching let's say two courses a semester and they're
15 teaching four courses a year, the probably would be
16 earning about \$14,000 as an adjunct. So, if we're
17 looking to convert that person to a full-time
18 lecturer let's say, that would probably cost us \$50
19 to \$60,000 for that one person. If someone--if
20 there's an adjunct teaching a higher workload and
21 zoning in the \$20,000 range then the cost would be
22 less of converting them. So, it really depends on
23 the--

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] The
25 individual.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --individual
3 adjunct that we're targeting to--to be converted into
4 the lecture series.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Who decides on
6 maintaining an adjunct roster rather than hiring a
7 full-time instructor?

8 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: It's at the
9 local level at the college level--

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] The
11 college President.

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: The college
13 president has the ultimate responsibility, and just
14 to drill down a little bit more, at the department
15 level, the department chair is working with the
16 college provost and the college president.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there a time
18 limit on how long person can stay at a particular
19 title before they either move up or are terminated or
20 can no longer use them?

21 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: For an adjunct
22 no.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But for--are there
24 other titles, thought that have the requirement?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, for the—
3 for the full-time faculty, there is and—and I don't
4 have the specifics, but we can get it for you, but I
5 know that there is a time for which they will either
6 be granted tenure or not, but we can get back to you
7 with the specifics on that, but—but yes there is a—
8 there is a time limit on that.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Going back to
10 childcare, what's the status of it? First, what's
11 the status of the Childcare Center at City, which was
12 a target that we talked about four—at least four
13 years ago?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [off mic]
15 Thanks, Julie. (sic)

16 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: So, we were—we
17 were in the process of renovating that house. That
18 was the—I think that was the old president's house,
19 and that building will be completed for the next
20 term, and it looks pretty terrific.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Why did it take so
22 long? You could have demolished it and put up
23 another building for the time that it's taken, and to
24 be so far behind schedule for opening.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: The—the reason
3 we're so far behind schedule is because we had issues
4 with the contractor. That's—that's what the delay
5 was.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You couldn't just
7 terminate the contractor a little?

8 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: [interposing]
9 You know, I have to tell you we had numerous
10 discussions about whether we should do that or
11 whether we should—we should not, and where—where we
12 had it two or three months ago. We made a decision
13 and we're going forward, and in construction projects
14 that—that's what comes up if you have problem with a
15 contract. If you like cut the contractor off or you
16 let the contractor stay, and I have to say that there
17 were people in this room I sometimes want to cut if
18 off they come back and tell me. So, that's kind of
19 the step that you would take, but this one has been a
20 real problem.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there a way then
22 for you to be able to make some note of that in your
23 evaluation of the process so that the city has on
24 record what your concerns were regarding the delay I
25 this project?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERTRAM: Well, this-
3 this--this project was built by our partner DASNY, and
4 they absolutely know about that, and there is a
5 record of performance for every contractor so we
6 don't land up in the same position, but this--this
7 building should have been finished six months ago.
8 You're absolutely right.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How does CUNY or the
10 college determine the age groups that will be served
11 and that's a follow-up also to the question. Someone
12 who has a child who's under a year, but they want to
13 come back, only six months old or whatever the age is
14 and they want to come back. How does CUNY determine
15 the ages that they will service at a particular
16 childcare center?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Chair Barron,
18 if it's alright to you, I'd like to make another call
19 to the bullpen and ask Keesha Fuentes to--

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

21 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --come and
22 join us to address that.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. [pause]

24 KEESHA FUENTES: [coughs] It's actually
25 based on their license capacity. If they have a

2 license for infant, toddler, or toddler pre-school,
3 they'll be able to serve that need. I they don't,
4 then they'll have to refer them to another campus to
5 serve them.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But it's determined
7 by the license that they have?

8 KEESHA FUENTES: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and also I
10 think following up on the question, I think that
11 there needs to be consideration that as we go into
12 construction that we build in a component that talks
13 about incorporating, as a matter of fact, a childcare
14 center so that persons coming into the program and to
15 the college. So, you can add that into your plans
16 for the \$300 million that you're asking for the
17 construction of the nurse's quarters on 72nd Street.
18 I think we can be forward thinking with that, and I
19 think it will help or increase the parity in terms of
20 women being able to get back into the workforce.
21 Just a few more questions and I do thank you for your
22 patience. The State Budget talks about \$250. Well,
23 it talks about the FTE, and the university has
24 requested a \$250 increase.

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm,
3 correct.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, how are we
5 going to try to—what's the total that we need to
6 actually be able to make sure that the funding that
7 we get for FTEs is adequate? Because it hasn't
8 matched inflation over the years.

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, I know.
10 That's a great point, Chair Barron. We—we've been
11 fortunate in that the last five years the Legislature
12 and the governor had increased the state base aid,
13 but you're absolutely right in that if you go back to
14 2008 right before the Recession, and you add
15 inflation to what the base aid number was, we are
16 behind. It should be—currently the base aid for FTE
17 is \$2,847 for student FTE, but if—if again, you take
18 that 2008 number and add inflation on it, it should
19 be well over \$3,000. So, we are short, and we are
20 seeking \$250 to—to get us back to—to that level, and
21 we're hopeful that folks and our—our funding partners
22 in the Assembly and the Senate will be able to—to
23 help us reach that level.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And regarding the
25 TAP gap, it's the difference between what the

2 student's TAP grant is and the tuition charges. If
3 the state does not come in and fill the gap, which is
4 estimated at \$72 million--

5 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Okay.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --and growing to \$85
7 million in the out years, what's CUNY's plan to fill
8 the gap?

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, the--the
10 TAP gap is--is revenue foregone. So, it's--it's
11 revenue that we would have earned that we're not
12 earning. So that is a really important and--and
13 primary component of our budget request. We are
14 seeking \$20 million a year for over the next four
15 years to help us close that TAP gap. So, that would
16 provide \$80 million and then additionally, we're
17 seeking about \$5 million. It's \$4.9 million for what
18 we call TAP Gap Parity. Because the way the TAP
19 works, as you described Chair Barron, is it looks at
20 what CUNY's tuition rate is versus the maximum TAP
21 award.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-hm.

23 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: The colleges
24 that have a greater proportion of students that
25 receive TAP are the ones who are foregoing more

2 revenue proportionally. So, we're looking for \$4.9
3 million in order to give to those campuses to provide
4 more parity when it comes to the TAP Gap. So, it's a
5 really important component of our budget request, and
6 we are—we are talking to the folks in both the
7 Assembly and the Senate to try to get some help there
8 in the State an Active Budget.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what was the
10 last time that the TAP ceiling was raised? Do you
11 know?

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, the last
13 time the TAP ceiling was raised was probably some
14 time in 2012 and '13. I can get you the exact
15 number, but right now it's \$5,165 and it's been—it's
16 been several years since it was raised.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: It was around
19 2013.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And in terms of that
21 parity, you mentioned schools that have greater
22 numbers of students and also the senior colleges--

23 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --which has a higher
25 tuition has that--

2 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah and the
3 TAP Gap I should point out is only an issue at the
4 senior colleges. Our community college tuition is
5 \$4,800. So, we're below the TAP, maximum TAP award.
6 So, we don't have a TAP Gap at the community
7 colleges. So, the TAP Gap that we're referring to is
8 \$72 million, and ours is all at the senior colleges.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, okay. Council
10 Member Holden, do you have any further questions?
11 Okay, great. [pause] Okay. So, before we let you
12 go--

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --we just--we have a
15 list of things that we would like for you to follow
16 up with.

17 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: (1) is the dollar
19 amount that's devoted to improving diversity hiring.
20 (2) A census plan for CUNY. Details and the costs,
21 et cetera.

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: (3) A portion of
24 CUNY's community colleges of property that is city-
25 owned versus leased and the number (4) the adjunct

2 professor break-out by community college, and we have
3 some conflicting data between--

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --what we have. So,
6 we would ask for--

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --resolution with
9 those issues.

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
11 Yep, we'll work with Council Finance staff to-to
12 clarify that. Thank you. That's very helpful.
13 We'll get back to you on-on all of those points.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, just before
15 you go, let me look at my notes. It seems like
16 there's something I'm forgetting. [pause] Just the
17 other portion of making sure that we use the pool of
18 talent that we have, not just for bringing adjuncts
19 to lecturers' positions, but moving people past the
20 assistants and associate professor ceiling that seems
21 to be there at CUNY.

22 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We want to make sure
24 that we—we remove those barriers, and that we give
25 support to the people that are there, and in terms of

2 new hires, that's great, but we've got to keep the
3 percentages growing, and the only way we're going to
4 do that is by retaining the faculty that we do have.

5 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: An excellent
6 point. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. I think that
8 is it, and with that. If we have further questions,
9 we'll send them to you.

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much
12 for your time.

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you for
14 your support. [background comments]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We'll call our next
16 panel. If there's anyone else who's here, and you
17 haven't filled out an appearance card, you can see
18 our clerk at the desk, and get a card and fill it
19 out. At this time, we're going to hear from Barbara
20 Bowen, who is President of the Professional Staff
21 Congress. [pause]

22 FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic] I need help.

23 (sic)

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No, you can talk to
3 the sergeant-at-arms. He'll help you. Thank you.
4 It's still morning. So good morning.

5 BARBARA BOWEN: Good morning.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And we're so pleased
7 to have Barbara Bowen here from Profession Staff
8 Congress, and we extend this opportunity for you now
9 to give us your testimony.

10 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you very much.
11 Thank you Chairperson Barron, and I also thank the
12 other members. I know Council Member Holden is here,
13 and others have been here. We thank you all for
14 holding the hearing, and also the Finance Committee.
15 It's very important for us to have the opportunity.
16 We'll be submitting written testimony. So, I'll
17 just—I'll go over our main—I'd like to raise our main
18 points, and I have a couple of comments on the
19 questions that were asked of the CUNY Administration.
20 First, I—I want to say that we are very grateful, the
21 30,000 members of the PSC who include part-time and
22 full-time faculty and staff. Very grateful for the
23 City Council's advocacy, continued advocacy for CUNY
24 students and for our faculty and staff. It makes a
25 huge difference to us. We also in this budget in the

2 Mayor's Preliminary Budget for 2020, we're grateful
3 to see that he continues his commitment that he's had
4 throughout his term of office to increase funding for
5 STEM programs and ASAP in the community colleges and
6 to fund the city workers' contracts. That may seem
7 like a no-brainer to fund the contract, but it is not
8 everywhere, and that's an important commitment and we
9 are grateful to the Mayor for that. We're also
10 please to see a modest increases in the Preliminary
11 Budget of \$8.3 million for the community colleges,
12 but we're concerned that the \$6.8 million peg with a
13 cost savings to good will eat up most of this gain.
14 We do have concerns that the Mayor has again zeroed
15 out almost \$12 million in critical programs such as
16 childcare services. They should really be included
17 in the base budget, and not be an item for discussion
18 every year, and I-I noted that you did have questions
19 about that. I want to applaud the city's commitment
20 to keeping the community college tuition affordable.
21 The tuition for the 4-year colleges has gone up every
22 year by \$200. It's very important that the city has
23 enabled that tuition to remain affordable and that
24 CUNY has not had to raise the community college
25 tuition for four years, but the resources on campus

2 are stretched to the limit, and there really needs to
3 be an increase in funding. I mean the—the main
4 message that we have to deliver is that yes we—we
5 noted that the Mayor has added funding for specific
6 programs. We also note that some line items are
7 zeroed out, but above all, we need to see an
8 increased investment in CUNY, and this is a point
9 that we've raised with the Mayor. He--here's an
10 Education press conference going on downstairs in
11 City Hall as I came in. The Mayor has made real
12 strides at the begging end of school, Pre-K and Pre-
13 Pre-K and those are absolutely important, but we feel
14 that CUNY is such an important part of the city, such
15 and engine of development and advancement that it's—
16 that progressive for the city should highlight CUNY
17 in a way it has yet to be highlighted. So, there are
18 a few things that we want to focus on, and I'll just
19 give you some of the numbers. We are requesting an
20 additional investment of \$112.8 million in next
21 year's budget to be able to provide continuing
22 quality education, and this breaks down as \$70
23 million, 7-0 in mandatory cost increases, and I'll be
24 submitting this. So, you'll have all the details.
25 That's \$35 million in building rentals and fringe

2 benefits, et cetera, and then \$35 million for-to
3 fulfill the negotiated agreement that I remember
4 Chairperson Barron spoke so powerfully about when we
5 testified right in this room about having full-time
6 faculty be able to have more time with students and
7 having a more reasonable teaching load. That
8 agreement was reached and that day of testimony I
9 think was pivotal, and I thank the Council for that,
10 but it has not been funded. It has to be funded.
11 Otherwise, it's just going to be an occasion for
12 bringing in more underpaid adjuncts, and defeating
13 the entire purpose. The purpose was to give more of
14 the faculty more time to invest in individual
15 students because that is the key factor in student
16 progress, and student completion. When that
17 agreement has not been funded, it just means that the
18 courses that a full-time faculty member might have
19 taught, are now being filled in by part-time faculty
20 who have zero paid time in many cases to spend with
21 students. So, that flips the entire purpose, and
22 we're calling on you to fund that, and the amount
23 that [coughs] CUNY requested in the past, \$35
24 million. We are also requesting \$32.8 million to
25 cover two decades worth of inflation in the amount

2 that that the city contributes to the senior colleges
3 at CUNY. Historically, the city has contributed to
4 the colleges for the number of students who are
5 associates degree programs in four-year colleges
6 because the city historically, and in analog to all
7 of--other cities, is responsible for the two-year
8 degrees. The State for the four-year and higher
9 degrees. There are many, many students in associates
10 programs in the four-year colleges. The city has
11 contributed for that purpose for the education, but
12 the number has not gone up in more than two decades.
13 And we support, and ask you to support CUNY's
14 Administration's request that that go up just by the
15 amount of inflation. And finally we ask you—I think
16 you asked about the TAP Gap. It's largely a problem
17 in the four-year colleges because that's where the
18 tuition gap occurs, but there are again associates
19 degree students who are paying four-year college
20 tuition because they're in a four-year college, and
21 the TAP Gap for them is about \$10 million. So, we're
22 asking you for two things there: (1) Is to call on
23 the city to fill that TAP Gap of \$10 million, and to
24 urge your colleagues in the State Legislature who
25 have been very good on this, very strongly. Had a

2 big rally yesterday. You would have loved seeing all
3 those beautiful students. They were everywhere in
4 the Capital yesterday, but to urge your state
5 colleagues and the Governor to put in the money to
6 cover the more like \$74 million gap that now exists
7 in the—in the four-year colleges, which is funded by
8 the state. And it's a—it's just not a logical
9 structure to build in a deficit for every student who
10 comes in with TAP. I mean it's a deficit creator
11 with every student. It's great that the students
12 don't have to pay the difference between the full TAP
13 amount and the full tuition, but to create a
14 structural deficit for every student who comes in
15 with TAP doesn't make fiscal sense. It's just not
16 good policy, and we ask the city to lead the way, as
17 you have many times, and fill that TAP Gap for the
18 associate's degree students, and call on the state to
19 do the same. I want to speak a little bit about the
20 chronic under-funding at CUNY and also about adjunct
21 faculty. So, let me start with the adjunct faculty.
22 You asked some very probing questions and Council
23 Member Kallos asked—asked some questions. I think
24 part of the confusion in numbers is that the—the—I
25 had stated the National Data uses the phrase

2 instructional staff to cover more than faculty in the
3 classroom. It covers people who are working in
4 instructional. It could be working in counseling and
5 other areas. So, I—I think the confusion in the
6 numbers could be—it can be clarified, but let me talk
7 about the adjuncts. We are currently working—let me
8 just take those up—we're currently working with the
9 city with the Office of Labor Relations and with the
10 Mayor's Office to resolve our contract, and as the
11 union that represents both the part-time and the
12 full-time faculty and the professional staff, we have
13 made this the contract in which we must solve the
14 scandal of adjunct pay, and as you pointed out there
15 are two problems. One is the low pay, and the other
16 is the overuse of adjuncts, and there was time when
17 an adjunct might be somebody like one of you on the
18 Council or your staff who might come in from a full-
19 time job of decently paid full-time job, and teach
20 one course as an enhancement. There's always a place
21 for that in colleges. That's an addition for
22 students, but what's happened now is that with the
23 budget being so hollowed out by both the city and
24 state that the basic, the most central operation of
25 the university, teaching is where the university has

2 been forced to cut costs, and they've cut costs on
3 labor. Of course, in a university the biggest cost
4 is labor, and that is primarily teaching. So, how
5 has CUNY survived years and years of chronic
6 underfunding by both the state and the city, even
7 more acutely by the state? They've done two things:
8 (1) Raised tuition so students are paying more, and
9 (2) Cut their biggest cost, which is teaching. So,
10 instead of a full-time faculty member paid \$80,000 a
11 year—I mean our pay is not high. \$80,000, \$90,000 a
12 year. You have four or three part-time faculty
13 members paying 3—paid \$3,000 a course or \$3,500 a
14 course, and so it's about a quarter of the per-course
15 rate, a third or a quarter. So, that's how they've
16 cut their—their labor costs in order to survive a
17 budget that has been decimated. So, we are calling
18 on the state and city to rebuild that budget, and in
19 the meantime as the labor union especially at a
20 moment where both the city and state have take
21 leadership roles in raising the minimum wage. We
22 have said that this is the contract in which the
23 adjuncts also must make a decent wage, a living wage
24 because if you take the \$3,200 minimum pay per course
25 and divide the by the number of hours it takes to

2 actually teach a course, grading, preparing, meeting
3 with students, responding to their emails, counseling
4 the actual pay works out to be just about minimum
5 wage or lower. So, for people with PhDs and Masters
6 Degrees teaching the next generation of college
7 students, responsible for conveying to them the
8 message that if you finish your college degree, a
9 good future awaits you. That very person who has a
10 college degree and a couple of advanced degrees is
11 making less than minimum wage. There is something
12 very wrong about that. So, we have been working with
13 the city and the Office of Labor Relations to try to
14 come to a resolution of our contract, and we call on
15 the City Council let's say not if but when we reach
16 that resolution, and I think we have some good ideas
17 for you to support the funding necessary to solve our
18 contract because just being honest there is no way to
19 resolve the adjunct pay issue within the framework of
20 the existing fairly modest raise that are across the
21 board in all the city contracts, which are around 2%.
22 Raising a \$3,200 wage by 2% does not get you
23 anywhere, and we're calling for \$7,000 per course for
24 adjuncts, which is in line with other—it's fairly
25 modest actually. Fordham pays \$8,000, Barnard pays

2 \$10,000, Rutgers as well as Penn State pays \$6,000.

3 Rutgers is currently organizing for \$7,000. So,

4 it's-it's in the realm, and that's what we're calling

5 for and we are calling on the City Council to support

6 us as we hope that we come to a conclusion and are

7 able to reach a contract agreement. And finally,

8 there are other supports that the City Council has

9 been very strongly—very strongly advocating for. We

10 are thrilled that the DREAM Act has finally passed,

11 and that has been enacted. That is fantastic news.

12 That may increase the TAP Gap because those students

13 are now eligible for TAP. So, we'll ask you to—to

14 make sure that that does not occur, and we call on

15 you as always to do—and I know you've done this under

16 Council Member Inez Barron's leadership—to make the

17 case that there should be overall increase in CUNY

18 investment. So, we call on the Council this year to

19 support us in our advocacy for \$112.8 million, which

20 would cover mandatory costs to cover the TAP Gap,

21 address the teaching load agreement that we came to,

22 and also to ask you for your support when we reach

23 that beautiful day when adjunct faculty at CUNY will

24 be paid a living wage, and we will not be Sweat Shop

25 U, and really a disgrace. And above all, we ask for

2 all these things because every single one of them has
3 an impact on students' education. It's all about
4 students' education, and that's—that's why we're
5 here, which we do what we do, and we call on you to
6 support that. So, thank you very, very much.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Ms. Bowen
8 for coming and offering your testimony. In terms of
9 adjuncts, do we have any idea of the percentage of
10 those who are adjuncts who don't want to move to
11 full-time? They're satisfied and happy with just one
12 or two courses that they're teaching?

13 BARBARA BOWEN: We've done surveys of
14 that, because I would like to know that number more
15 precisely, too. We say there are about 12,000
16 adjuncts. I think that the number that Sapienza gave
17 you was 11,600. So, about 12,000 adjuncts. Taking
18 it the other way, taking your question the other way,
19 I would say there are at least 3,000 maybe 4,000 or
20 maybe slightly more who would want to be in a full-
21 time position. Those are largely people who went
22 through graduate schools as I did. They got their
23 advance degrees. They came to look for a job with
24 their PhD and maybe a Master, maybe two Masters and
25 then they found that nationwide, and especially in

2 CUNY because the—the budget had been hollowed out,
3 the full-time jobs had dried up. The others might be
4 somebody who is a professional in maybe a creative
5 fields or government, somebody like you. There are
6 some people who are teachers in the K through 12
7 system who teach in our Education Departments. There
8 are some people who are nurse's for instance who
9 teach in the Nursing Departments, but I would say
10 there are, you know, several thousand, maybe 4,000
11 who would make the move if they could from part-time,
12 you know, a patchwork of part-time jobs to a full-
13 time job.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And of those 4,000
15 that's your estimate, of those 4,000 do we know if
16 they have credentials that would, in fact, allow them
17 to become full-full professors or associate
18 professors? In other words, do they have PhDs?

19 BARBARA BOWEN: Right. Some have PhDs,
20 and again we've—we did a survey of—I'll get you the
21 results. I mean for one thing it's—it's difficult to
22 reach every adjunct because some are just there for a
23 semester. So, I don't feel that the results were
24 scientifically verifiable, but we did do a survey of
25 what your highest degree was. There's quite a high

2 percentage who have a PhD. So, they could be--there's
3 some with published books. They could be a candidate
4 for a research job. There are many, many others. Of
5 course, they all have to have an advanced degree. So,
6 the others would have a Masters Degree or an MFA, and
7 they could be a very strong candidates for a
8 lecturer's job.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What's the average
10 length of service? How long does the average adjunct
11 stay as an adjunct before they move on or leave the
12 system.

13 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes. I think that those--

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] How
15 long are they adjunct?

16 BARBARA BOWEN: I just looked at those
17 statistics, and I can get them to you. The--of the
18 current--I'm thinking back. The 2018 adjuncts there
19 were well over--there were well over 2,000 who had
20 been here maybe it was five years. I'll have to get
21 you that to be precise about it because we did do a
22 regression of how long everybody had been here. I
23 would say the average adjunct, just guessing might be
24 at CUNY four years, but there are people in my own
25 department at Queens College who are adjuncts who

2 have been there 30 years, 30 years. There are many
3 adjuncts who have been there 15, 20 years. So, there
4 are, you know, there are adjuncts who are 75 years
5 old and still teaching and they've been adjuncts for
6 their whole career.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you see an
8 opportunity to work with CUNY in terms of using this
9 adjunct pool to fill this hopeful 200 new hires that
10 they want to get?

11 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you see an
13 opportunity to actually have a structured program to
14 be able to benefit from the--

15 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --persons BARBARA
17 BOWEN: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: -- that are adjuncts
19 now?

20 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes, and I would say
21 great as it would be to another 200 full-time
22 faculty, the point you raised or Council Member
23 Kallos earlier, and that's--that does not address the
24 need. I mean we're 5,000 full-time faculty short.

2 So, to say 800 in whatever it was, four years or
3 something--

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Four years.

5 BARBARA BOWEN: Yeah, that does not get
6 us anywhere near the need. This is a structural
7 short-changing of our students.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So
9 that--

10 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] So, yes on
11 this. So, on the other point you raised, the union
12 has—I won't say negotiated because hiring management
13 maintains that as their prerogative, but we have come
14 to agreements in the past on several programs to
15 hire—to create new full-times lines reserved for
16 adjuncts who have taught for a certain number of
17 semesters consistently, and we've done several of
18 those agreements, and in each one there have been a
19 100, 200 or more hires out of the existing CUNY
20 Adjunct Pool. It's still as competitive hire, but in
21 order to be considered, you have to be a current CUNY
22 adjunct, and you have to have taught for five years
23 or—or whatever. That, and so we have successfully
24 done that several times. I'd love to do it again.
25 It has been fantastic as a program. I've seen it in

2 my own department. Completely transformational, and
3 we are very eager to do it with CUNY again.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: CUNY said that the-
5 the ratio is about 29 to 1, and that's the ratio of
6 all the instructional staff, and we know that not all
7 of them are actually doing instruction. So, that was
8 I think the ratio for full-time employees. If you had
9 5,000 more, what ratio would that generate?

10 BARBARA BOWEN: I-I might have missed it
11 when they said that. They said that was the ratio of
12 faculty to students? Student/faculty ratio?

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes--

14 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] Because I
15 think--

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --because Council
17 Member Holden asked that question.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Full-time faculty
19 to students, you know--

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Students.

21 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] Full time
22 faculty to students, actually--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --to the students
24 ratio.

2 BARBARA BOWEN: Okay. The last time we
3 looked it was more like 33, and we did a table, which
4 I can send you of other places, you know, where
5 it's, you know, in the University of Maryland it's
6 maybe 18 to 1, 20 to 1 other places. I can't do the
7 computation without really looking at the numbers
8 more carefully, but it would—it would be completely
9 revolutionizing our faculty. I mean we have 7,600 or
10 so full-time faculty now. If you added 5,000, you're
11 up to 12,000 full-time faculty or more, almost 13,000
12 for the same number of students, and the ratio would
13 go down by like three-quarters because that
14 represents about a 70% increase. There are 5,000
15 over 7,600. So they—the ratio would go down by about
16 three-quarters, and, you know, you're—I know you're
17 an educator and I know you understand that really
18 nothing makes a bigger different than how—how big the
19 classes are, and how much time your faculty have with
20 you. So, if there is one thing I could change at
21 CUNY it would restore the budget so they could pay
22 the part-timers that we have fairly and transform the
23 faculty to a full-time faculty.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Professor, a whole
3 other faculty. (sic) I'm going back to your CUNY
4 days.

5 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Council Member
7 Holden, do you have any questions.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes, Barbara,
9 thank you so much for your leadership. Talking about
10 adjuncts, for decades adjuncts got no healthcare--

11 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] That's
12 right.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --low pay, and in
14 my college City Tech, we had adjuncts for decades who
15 had to run around to different institutions to teach
16 another class, run-go out to-up to the Bronx and
17 teach a course there, go down in Manhattan, teach a
18 course there, and run over to City Tech--

19 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] That's
20 right.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and-but what
22 you did in the union just-just to get healthcare for
23 if you taught over six hours two classes, and an
24 officer hour--

25 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --which was an
3 amazing accomplishment. I never thought I'd see
4 that, but what--what continually happened--what's
5 happening is that these adjuncts, you're right,
6 they're almost teach--teaching for minimum wage.

7 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] It's
8 disgraceful.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It's--it's
10 amazing.

11 BARBARA BOWEN: Right

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I don't know how
13 they do it. Many of them for decades, but we need--
14 but the only reason that it's not moving is because
15 that's what--what CUNY has to do because we don't get
16 funded.

17 BARBARA BOWEN: That's right.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: We don't get the
19 funding. So, and they're not hiring full time as
20 much as they should. Obviously, we're always behind,
21 and they have to function with an adjunct faculty on
22 low pay, and we--we allow that, and the state is
23 allowing that. So, what we need to do is again,
24 you're fighting the great fight. \$7,000 is not a lot--

2 BARBARA BOWEN: Right.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --for one course,
4 and, but we need to actually implement that, and I
5 hope that that works, and--and I thank you for your
6 leadership.

7 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: The adjuncts are
9 the abused class in CUNY definitely.

10 BARBARA BOWEN: Yes. Well, thank you
11 Council Member Holden, and I know that of all the
12 people here you know that better than anyone else,
13 and I appreciate that, and I think having the
14 Council's support as we try to come to an agreement
15 with CUNY, with CUNY management, and try to have the
16 support of the Mayor [coughing] and the Governor to
17 reach that is really important. And for you to be
18 able to say, you know, it--it is not right for people
19 to be teaching for minimum wage. So, yes, we were
20 able to get a paid office hour for every two courses
21 for people teaching a certain number of courses.
22 There should be a paid office hour for every course.
23 I mean why is it that? I mean we now have 60% of the
24 courses in the four-year schools taught by adjuncts.
25 So, that means that 60% of the time a student is

2 going to be in a class where she or he has a chance
3 of not having any regulated time outside of class to
4 meet with the professor. As you said, that person is
5 then dashing off to City College or-or some place
6 else to teach or to a dog walking job or janitorial
7 job. One of the adjuncts spoke to me about bumping
8 into a student when he was working as a janitor, and
9 the student looked at him and said, Professor, and he
10 was the first to say there is dignity in the
11 janitorial work, but it was a hard moment when a
12 student said to me: You're my professor and you're
13 the janitor in this building? I mean there is
14 something very wrong with the-the message that sends
15 to the students, and the-the message it sends about
16 how much New York City values their education. I
17 think it's a-a terrible message.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: We-we have such a
19 dedicated adjunct staff that many of them would
20 volunteer time--

21 BARBARA BOWEN: They do, yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and stay after.
23 They come before classes. You just can't show up--

24 BARBARA BOWEN: [interposing] Right.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and teach a
3 class and then run. So many of them would say ask-
4 answer questions for the students, stay--they had one
5 paid office hour. Some of them.

6 BARBARA BOWEN: Some of them.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Some of them--

8 BARBARA BOWEN: Right.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and would stay
10 two or three or four hours.

11 BARBARA BOWEN: Right.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, it's not
13 fair--

14 BARBARA BOWEN: It's not fair.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and it's--and
16 it's really not fair, and I'm, you know, the fight
17 you are fighting is definitely worthwhile. The
18 adjunct faculty we need to get more of them into
19 full-time. I would--I would think like 80% of my--the
20 adjuncts at my--my--in my department would want a full-
21 time position rather than running around to every,
22 you know, every part of the institute--of CUNY to try
23 to just make ends meet, and it's--and it's really not
24 fair. So, again I thank you very much.

25 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I have to run to
3 another meeting.

4 BARBARA BOWEN: Okay. Thank you very
5 much. Thank you. It's great to have your--your
6 questions.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much
8 for your testimony, and we look forward to getting it
9 in written form--

10 BARBARA BOWEN: Right. Thank you so much.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --and then we can
12 review it. Thank you.

13 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you Council Member,
14 and thank you for your leadership.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I did
16 want to--I knew there was another questions I wanted
17 to ask CUNY before they left. Just wanted to make a
18 comment that we're so pleased that we now have a
19 Chancellor at the helm who's steering CUNY as it's
20 moving forward, and look forward to having a chance
21 to dialogue with him, and to get him to tell us how
22 he's going to help CUNY to continue to grow, and in
23 my opinion, I'm opposed to annual tuition increases.
24 We're glad the Community College has not been able--
25 has not had to bear that brunt, and my objective is

2 to make CUNY tuition free. That's my objective, and
3 with that seeing no others wishing to give testimony,
4 this hearing is adjourned. [gavel]

5 BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 4, 2019