

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

January 22, 2019  
Start: 10:19 a.m.  
Recess: 10:28 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Donovan J. Richards  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Justin L. Brannan  
Fernando Cabrera  
Andrew Cohen  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Rory I. Lancman  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Keith Powers  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Paul A. Vallone  
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check] [pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alrighty, good  
4 morning. My name is Donovan Richards, and I'm the  
5 Chair of the Public Safety Committee. We are  
6 actually having two hearings today. First we will  
7 hold a vote on two bills: Introduction No. 1234-A a  
8 Local Law to amend the New York City Charter in  
9 relation to creating an Office for the Prevention of  
10 Hate Crimes sponsored by Council Member Levine and  
11 Introduction 1261-A a Local Law amend the New York  
12 City Charter to in relation to requiring educational  
13 outreach within the Office of Prevention of Hate  
14 Crimes sponsored by Council Member Deutsch. In  
15 November when we heard these bills, we learned about  
16 the NYPD's Hate Crimes Task Force. While they appear  
17 to be doing excellent work, we also learned that  
18 their job is focused on investigating crimes and  
19 finding the perpetrators. Their work is not about  
20 addressing the underlying reasons that people turn to  
21 hate, and it's not up to them to make sure that young  
22 people in the city learn to embrace the diversity we  
23 cherish. One thing really struck me was how often  
24 hateful speech and conduct that people experience  
25 doesn't rise to the level of a crime, but nonetheless

2 has severe consequences. In some ways, this  
3 statement can have a more lasting impact than the  
4 crime. I said in November that as a society we can't  
5 just relay on the police to change minds and hearts.  
6 This is something we are going to have to do  
7 together. The hearing convinced me that that that  
8 was absolutely true, and that these bills are  
9 absolutely necessary. An office within the  
10 Administration dedicated to coordinating a response  
11 between our city agencies making sure that victims in  
12 communities targeted by hatred are made to feel safe  
13 again, and conducting education and outreach about  
14 the impact of hate speech and value of a multi-  
15 cultural society would implement—would complement the  
16 efforts of the NYPD, and would help guarantee that  
17 people in all of our communities feel welcome in this  
18 great city, and just as we come off of MLK Day, I  
19 wanted to certainly quote one of his most powerful  
20 quotes, which is darkness cannot drive out darkness.  
21 Well, let me start them again. In returning hate for  
22 hate, multiplies hate adding deeper darkness to a  
23 night already devoid of stars. Darkness cannot drive  
24 out darkness. Only light can do that. Hate cannot  
25 drive out hate, only love can do that. That being

2 said, I am going to turn the mic over to Council  
3 Member Deutsch who is a lead sponsor of on Intro  
4 1251-A.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,  
6 Chair. With the recent rise in hate crimes across  
7 our city and country, it is important that we as  
8 elected officials make every effort to promote  
9 tolerance and understanding. Today we are voting on  
10 Intro 1261, a bill co-sponsored by Council Member  
11 Donovan Richards, and myself, which would require the  
12 city to do educational outreach and training in  
13 schools, within our community to educate people about  
14 the impact and effect of hate crimes. This bill  
15 works in consort with Council Member Levine's Intro  
16 1234, which establishes a Hate Crime Prevention  
17 Office. Intro 1261 will require this office to  
18 coordinate with relevant agencies, interfaith  
19 organizations and community groups to implement  
20 effective outreach on this subject. In addition,  
21 Intro 1261 will also require the Hate Crime  
22 Prevention Office to work with the Department of  
23 Education to create a curriculum within the New York  
24 City school system to address issues relating to hate  
25 crimes. Our city is a melting pot, home of New

2 Yorkers from 150 countries who speak more than 80  
3 different languages and 40% of New Yorkers are  
4 immigrants. Mutual respect and understanding of  
5 people with different ethnicities, religions and  
6 belief systems can go a long way towards creating a  
7 more peaceful, tolerant New York City. With that, I  
8 vote aye and I encourage my colleagues to do the  
9 same. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alright, thank you  
11 Council Member Deutsch. I just want to acknowledge  
12 the members we are joined by this morning: Council  
13 Members Cohen, Deutsch, Powers, Menchaca, Rodriguez  
14 Vallone and Cabrera. Alrighty, I guess I will call-  
15 ask the Clerk to call the roll.

16 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk.  
17 Roll call vote Committee on Public Safety,  
18 Introductions 1234-A and 1261-A. Both items are  
19 coupled. Chair Richards.

20 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Cabrera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye

23 CLERK: Cohen.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye

25 CLERK: Deutsch.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

3 CLERK: MENCHACA.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye

5 CLERK: RODRIGUEZ.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to  
7 explain my vote?

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Yes, sir.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I believe that  
10 every group in our city, in our nation has been a  
11 victim of hate crimes. We can go back to the  
12 beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century and look at the Irish,  
13 the Italians, African-Americans being the victims,  
14 the Jewish have been a victim of hate crimes. As  
15 someone born and raised in another country, a recent  
16 immigrant that came here in 1983, we have lived a lot  
17 of experience of being a victim of hate crimes. So,  
18 I feel that creating this office and taking the  
19 necessary steps to address how we as a city have to  
20 be a leading one addressing hate crimes and to  
21 eradicate hate crimes regarding—regardless who those  
22 hate crimes have been committed against it. We  
23 message with action or intention. So, for me again,  
24 as someone that has been shoulder-to-shoulder working  
25 with the rest of my colleagues from the angle of the

2 Jewish community, African-Americans, the GLBTQ  
3 community and all of us, and all of us, and signing m  
4 name of the bill that I had not be added to  
5 especially 434-A and very proud, I vote aye.

6 CLERK: Vallone.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic] Aye

8 CLERK: Powers.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: By a vote of 8 in the affirmative,  
11 0 in the negative and no abstentions, both items have  
12 been adopted by the committee.

13 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, alrighty.  
14 Thank you. Alright, I will now close us out.  
15 [gavel] Alrighty. We will now move on to the  
16 oversight portion of today's agenda, the Civilian  
17 Complaint Review Board. We are also hearing a bill I  
18 am sponsoring Introduction No. 1106, a Local Law to  
19 amend the Administrative Code of the city of New  
20 York. [pause] Okay. We'll start back over. Okay  
21 the vote is adjourned. [gavel] Alright, we thought  
22 the vote was adjourned. We're going to reopen it.

23 CLERK: Continuation roll call vote  
24 Committee on Public Safety, Council Member Brannan.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I vote aye



1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

9

2 CLERK: The vote now stands at 9 in the  
3 affirmative.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 31, 2019