

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 20, 2018
Start: 1:56 p.m.
Recess: 3:54 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andy Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert Cornegy, Jr.
Chaim Deutsch
Ruben Diaz
Daniel Dromm
Rafael Epsinal
Mathieu Eugene
Deborah L. Gibson
Mark S. Gjonaj
Robert F. Holden
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Council Members:

Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Joseph Borelli
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca
Ritchie J. Torres
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger
Steven Matteo
Laurie A. Cumbo

Larry Marks
Chief Administrative Judge

Cathy Wylde
President and CEP of Partnership for New York

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Robert Haig
Chair of Commercial Division Advisory Council

Father Joe Holcomb

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Today, if members
3 could join me, and if people could begin to take
4 their seats, we're about to begin. That's right,
5 we're all-- Council Member Lancman is here,
6 wonderful. Good afternoon. Today, the New York City
7 Council is proud to honor the New York Supreme Court
8 Commercial Division for its extraordinary service to
9 our community and national economy. For those who do
10 not know, the Commercial Division is an important
11 forum for addressing complex commercial disputes.
12 Local businesses rely on this division for efficient
13 resolution of commercial disputes and litigants all
14 over the world look to the Commercial Division's
15 expertise across the board. They have truly
16 distinguished itself in its approach to helping
17 others and making it a model for other courts,
18 criminal and civil, and we wish them continued
19 success for many years to come. So, I'm going to ask
20 some of the folks of the Commercial Division that are
21 here to receive this proclamation to please come up.
22 As you can see how expedient they are, they are here
23 already. Don't play around. I could go in your court
24 any day; it's efficient. Larry Marks, Chief
25 Administrative Judge, Kathy Wylde, President and CEP

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 5
2 of Partnership for New York, and Robert Haig, partner
3 at Kelly Drye and Chair of the Commercial Division
4 Advisory Council. On behalf the City Council and
5 Council Members Rory Lancman and Paul Vallone, we
6 congratulate you and thank you for your service to
7 our city, and we are so thankful that you are here
8 today. We are going to turn it over to the City
9 Clerk who is going to read the proclamation, and then
10 we are going to have words from both Council Member
11 Lancman as well as Council Member Vallone.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York
13 Proclamation: The New York City Council is proud to
14 honor the New York Supreme Court Commercial Division
15 for its invaluable service to our business community
16 and to our national economy, and whereas in an era
17 when the economy is largely a reflection of
18 globalization and international trade, New York City
19 remains the Center of the business universe. In such
20 a competitive environment, business often choose to
21 locate their headquarters where they have access to
22 efficient, fair, and predictable resolution of
23 commercial disputes. New York owes much of its
24 world-class status as an economic engine to its
25 world-class court, the Commercial Division of the New

2 York Supreme Court, and whereas the Commercial
3 Division is a critically important forum for
4 addressing complex commercial disputes. Litigants
5 all over the world look to the Commercial Division's
6 incredible expertise across the board and complex
7 expanse of commercial law to reach successful and
8 efficient resolutions, and whereas the Commercial
9 Division is uniquely qualified to increase taxable
10 revenue for the City of New York while stimulating
11 job growth. It strengthens New York City's ability
12 to attract and retain businesses which add jobs, fuel
13 demand for real property, and increase tax revenue.
14 The tax revenues from local businesses also provide
15 financial support for the New York State Judicial
16 System, and whereas local businesses rely on the
17 Commercial Division for efficient, just resolution of
18 complex commercial disputes without which businesses
19 would be less inclined to reside and conduct business
20 in New York City. leaders of national and global
21 businesses located within our five boroughs recognize
22 the significant role that specialized business courts
23 play in their business decisions, and whereas, the
24 New York Supreme Court Commercial Division has truly
25 distinguished itself in its responsive, creative, and

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 7
2 adaptive approach making it an influential model for
3 other courts, both civil and criminal, and we wish it
4 continued success in the years ahead. Now therefore
5 be it known that the New York City Council is proud
6 to honor the New York Supreme Court Commercial
7 Division for its extraordinary service to New York
8 City. Corey Johnson, Speaker for the entire Council,
9 Laurie A. Cumbo, Majority Leader, Rory I. Lancman,
10 Chair Committee on the Justice System, and Paul A.
11 Vallone, Chair of Committee on Economic Development.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Wow. Thank you so
13 much, and I want to thank both of my colleagues for
14 bringing forward here today because you're really
15 those unsung heroes that don't get enough attention
16 or accolades or recognition for the incredible work
17 that you do, much of it I'm sure behind the scenes,
18 but we really appreciate all that you do for the City
19 of New York. Council Member Lancman?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you,
21 Majority Leader Cumbo, and to my colleagues who are
22 here today, thank you very much for joining with us
23 in honoring and celebrating the Commercial Division
24 and its extraordinary accomplishments to our city, to
25 our legal system. As Chair of the Committee on the

2 Justice System with some oversight of our courts, I
3 know how extraordinarily complex and diverse our
4 court system is, and that reflects this
5 extraordinarily diverse and complex city. And if we
6 are going to continue to be the commercial capital of
7 the country and enjoy all the benefits of being the
8 center of commerce here in the United States, we need
9 to have a legal system that can support the
10 resolution of disputes of caliber and a kind that our
11 major corporations find themselves in. The
12 Commercial Division really has earned a distinction
13 around the world as being a leading forum for
14 resolution of commercial disputes. And companies,
15 when they are thinking about whether or not they want
16 to grow and even come to New York City, something
17 that's one their mind has got to be whether or not if
18 they find themselves in a dispute of some kind,
19 whether or not there's a forum that is capable of
20 adjudicating that dispute efficiently, transparently,
21 and with some measure of predictability. And that,
22 the Commercial Division has brought and benefitted
23 the entire city. And for that, we're particularly
24 grateful. I want to thank the Chief Administrative
25 Judge Larry Marks, Robert Haig from Kelly Drye who

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 9
2 has been champion of the Commercial Division for so
3 long, and of course, Kathy Wylde representing the
4 corporate community. With that, if I may, I'd like
5 to ask our Council Member Paul Vallone who chairs the
6 Committee on Economic Development.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you,
8 Council Member Lancman and Majority Leader. Just
9 quickly, thank you to Council Member Lancman for
10 acknowledging the hard work of the Commercial
11 Division, and thank you to the team that is here as
12 almost 27 years as a lawyer and spending many of days
13 prior to this life walking into the courts having the
14 best of every department here in New York they
15 practice as an attorney, a privilege and an honor,
16 and thank you for all the hard work, especially as
17 the Chief Judge. New York State sets the bar for
18 every other court and every other system to follow.
19 And it's proud as a lawyer for us to have small
20 things like this, like a proclamation to say thank
21 you to all of the work that you have done, the bar
22 that you have set, and what we all try to attain in
23 the legal system with honor. So, thank you very much
24 for that, a well-earned [inaudible].

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 10

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And would a
3 representative from the group like to speak?

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you so much. Thank
5 you for this proclamation. I can really say that
6 the Commercial Division has been one of the most
7 successful initiatives that we implemented in the
8 state court system, and that's because we strongly
9 believe that if the-- if businesses don't feel
10 confident that they can bring their legal disputes
11 into the New York Courts had have them adjudicated
12 efficiently and fairly, that they will take their
13 business elsewhere along with the jobs that they
14 provide and the jobs that they create, and actually,
15 research has documented that. It's not just a
16 theoretical concern. It's a reality that's been
17 documented. And I should add that the -- New York is
18 a member of an international organization that was
19 formed a couple of years ago. It's called the
20 Standing International Forum of Commercial Courts,
21 and we're a member of that organization, and
22 countries from around the world are part of that
23 organization and they look to the Commercial Division
24 in this state for best practices and model
25 procedures. So, we're very proud of that, and again,

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 11

2 I want to thank the City Council for their support
3 and recognition. Thank you.

4 [applause]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Can we do a group
6 photo? Alright.

7 [break]

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Could I have your
9 attention, please? Can I please have your
10 attention? Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on the
11 floor, please. Quiet on the floor, please. At this
12 time, please place all electronic devices to vibrate,
13 all electronic devices to vibrate, all electronic
14 devices to vibrate. Will all non-council employees,
15 all non-council employees please leave the main floor
16 of the chambers. There is additional seating
17 upstairs in the balcony. Madam?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
19 Chambers, please. All rise for the Pledge of
20 Allegiance. I pledge allegiance to the flag of the
21 United States of America and to the Republic for
22 which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible,
23 with liberty and justice for all. Please be seated.
24 Roll call?

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 12

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Brannan?

10 Cabrera? Chin?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

15 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Presente.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I am here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I am here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos? King? Koo?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I am here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Kallos?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

17 CHAIRPERSON LANCMAN: here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander? Levin? Levine?

19 Maisel?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya? Perkins?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 14

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso? Moya? Powers?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Here.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

10 Rosenthal?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes, I'm here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: King?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 15

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm here, check
6 me in two months.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet

20 in the Chambers, please. All rise for the

21 invocation. The invocation will be delivered by

22 Father Joe Holcomb from Saint Andrew Avellino at 35-

23 60 158th Street in the great borough of Queens.

24 Quiet in the Chambers.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 16

2 FATHER JOE HOLCOMB: Let us place
3 ourselves in the presence of almighty God. All
4 powerful and merciful God, we praise you and give you
5 thanks for all your gracious gifts, most especially
6 the gift of your infinite and unconditional love. It
7 is your gift of love that inspires and drives each of
8 us to seek peace and justice throughout our city, our
9 nation, and our world. To gain awareness that we
10 share a common destiny, which is ultimately
11 transcendent, peace that is not the mere absence of
12 violence, but as a harmonious co-existence of
13 individual citizens within a society governed by
14 justice, one in which the good is also achieved for
15 each and every one of them. Help us through your
16 gift of love to work diligently in these coming days,
17 months and years to seek peace for all in our great
18 city. May your deliberations in this, the City
19 Council of the City of New York, bring about
20 understanding, tolerance, and peace in our city, in
21 our nation, and in our world. We pray this in your
22 holy name, amen.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be
24 seated, and now Father-- and now a member of Father
25 Holcomb's flock, Council Member Vallone will spread

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 17

2 the invocation in full upon the record. Quiet in the
3 Chambers, please.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam
5 Advocate. Father Joseph Holcomb serves as the Pastor
6 of Saint Andrew Avellino Roman Catholic Church in
7 Queens, New York, the parish my family calls home. A
8 native New Yorker, Father Holcomb attended Holy
9 Family Catholic Grammar School, Cathedral Preparatory
10 Seminary, Cathedral College of the Immaculate
11 Conception, and Seminary of the Immaculate
12 Conception. He went on to attain a Bachelor's Degree
13 from Cathedral College in Douglas, New York, received
14 a Master's Degree in Divinity from Immaculate
15 Conception Seminary, and a Master's in Social Work
16 from Fordham University. He was ordained to the
17 Priesthood in 1980 and has been faithfully serving
18 multiple communities ever since. In July 2009, he
19 was appointed as the sixth Pastor of Saint Andrew
20 Avellino Roman Catholic Church, and has worked
21 tirelessly to make improvements on the first day at
22 our parish. His faith and dedication pours into
23 every member of our family as well as the surrounding
24 community. According to Father Holcomb, over the
25 past century the Church has had the most vocations to

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 18
2 the Priesthood or religious life including nuns and
3 bothers of any church in the United States. His
4 efforts have led to the crucial enhancements at the
5 Church and a newly enriched connection with his
6 parishioners. Father Holcomb's work in the Church
7 with the Children of Our Academy, of which all three
8 of my children have attended, has touched thousands
9 of lives and we are so privileged to have him here in
10 our Queens community. On a personal note, during
11 this difficult time for my family, a time where great
12 healing and faith was needed for my wife and
13 children, Father Joe has provided that bond with his
14 prayers for each one of us. I am so grateful that
15 each one of my fellow Council Members and family here
16 at City Hall have now received that same blessing.
17 Thank you, Father Joe.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Bless you father.
19 Thank you for your prayer today. Thank you.
20 Adoption of minutes, Council Member Moya? Motion
21 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November
22 14th be adopted as printed. Messages and papers from
23 the Mayor?

24 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 19

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
3 from City, County, and Borough Offices?

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M121 and
5 M122, budget documents.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Finance.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
8 communications?

9 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
11 ups?

12 COUNCIL CLERK: M123.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Roll call at this time.
14 I ask for a roll call vote on all of today's items on
15 the Land Use Call-up Calendar, just the Land-Use
16 Call-up Calendar.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
18 Chambers.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Permission
23 to comment on the Land-Use Call-up in my district.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council
25 Member.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 20

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: This
3 housing development project that's on the grounds of
4 Marcus Garvey Village ignited some really heated
5 community conversations, and negotiations that have
6 direct impact on not just the existing residents of
7 Marcus Garvey, but also the nearby churches and the
8 community as a whole. The original proposal included
9 724 units across seven buildings that went up 12
10 stories in an already dense community, but with
11 several months of advocated-- several months of some
12 serious advocating on behalf of the community about
13 what's best for the community, I'm glad we have come
14 to some form of middle ground. I'm glad that we'll
15 be able to see eventually affordable housing 80
16 percent under 60 percent AMI and the other 20 percent
17 between 61 and 80 percent AMI, and that's truly
18 affordable for the Brownsville community. And so,
19 I'm proud to be able to vote on this particular
20 project, and I look forward to really working with
21 Marcus Garvey and the L&M developers on behalf of the
22 community in collaboration with my colleague Council
23 Member Barron in the months and years to come. So
24 with that, I'm going to vote aye on all the Land-Use
25 Call-ups, but I also ask for permission to be able to

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 21
2 couple items on the General Order Calendar in all
3 resolutions.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you
6 so much, and happy holidays to everyone.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Happy
8 holidays.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I like that sweater.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all and
14 I'll hold my comments for when it's presented. Thank
15 you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Brennan?
17 Cabrera?

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

24 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 22

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye [sic].

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: King?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: With your

23 permission, can I vote on all Land-Use Call-Ups and

24 then everything on the calendar today?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 23

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander? Levin?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet. Quiet in
20 the Chambers, please.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 24

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso? Richards?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose? Rosenthal?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres? Treyger?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer? Williams?

22 Yeger?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye on all [sic].

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 25

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 Today's Land-Use Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 43
8 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the
9 Chambers as we now hear from the Speaker, Corey
10 Johnson.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Thank
12 you all for being here with us this Thursday, our
13 last Stated Meeting of 2018, and--

14 [applause]

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: we have a busy agenda
16 ahead of us. Before we get into our agenda, I want
17 us to take some time to send my best wishes and the
18 best wishes of the entire City Council to the seven
19 firefighters who were injured in Sunnyside Queens
20 last week responding to a fire in Council Member Van
21 Bramer's District. To the FDNY I say, and I know all
22 of us say thank you. Thank you for your bravery and
23 your courage, and our thoughts continue to be with
24 the Sunnyside community and the members of the FDNY
25 and their families who were injured last week. I

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 26
2 also want to take this time to acknowledge the loss
3 of again, two 9/11 First Responders who we have lost
4 since our last Stated Meeting. Detective Steven
5 Mullen and Lieutenant Jennifer Meehan both died from
6 illnesses they developed during their time serving
7 down at Ground Zero. Let's remember Detective Mullen
8 and Lieutenant Meehan, and keep their families in our
9 hearts. We are forever grateful to these heroes for
10 their sacrifice. I am also sad to note that today,
11 today is a very somber anniversary here in New York
12 City. four years ago today, two police officers were
13 assassinated in their car, targeted for their
14 uniforms that they wore while they were protecting
15 and serving our city as they were sworn to do,
16 Detectives Wen Jen Lu [sp?] and Rafael Ramos [sp?]
17 were taken from us and from their loved ones four
18 years ago today. We will never forget them. We will
19 forever their memories, and so I'd ask everyone to
20 please rise and take a moment of silence in memory of
21 Detectives Mullen, Lieutenant Meehan, Detective Lieu
22 [sp?], and Detective Ramos.

23 [moment of silence]

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. I apologize
25 if it's Detective Ramos, not Ramos, Ramos. I'd also

2 like to acknowledge a few staff members who are
3 leaving us, sadly. They won't be with us at the
4 beginning of next year. We're losing Yuriv Veet
5 [sp?] this week. He has been at the Council for
6 several years. First, with the Community Engagement
7 Division, and most recently with the Finance
8 Division. Yuriv, we wish you luck and we want to
9 thank you for all that you have done here at the
10 Council. Where is he? Is he here? He left. See
11 ya. We also are saying goodbye to Jeanette Merrill
12 [sp?] from the Finance Division. Jeanette was with
13 us for three years covering the Health Committee and
14 the Hospital Committee and the Mental Health
15 Committee. I got to work with Jeanette when I was
16 Chair of the Health Committee. Jeanette, I want to
17 thank you for everything you did for me when I was
18 Chair of the Health Committee. I want to thank you
19 for everything you've done for the current Chairs and
20 for the Council as a whole. I'm really grateful for
21 all the work we've done together, especially all the
22 work you did with me on HIV and AIDS funding. So, I
23 want to thank you, and I want to wish you best in
24 your next chapter. If we could have a round of

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 28

2 applause for Yuriv and Jeanette. Jeanette's in the
3 back. Jeanette, if you could stand up?

4 [applause]

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: There is someone else
6 who is leaving us in 2019 that I want to acknowledge.
7 Today, is our final Stated Meeting with our Public
8 Advocate Letitia James.

9 [applause]

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yay, we got the cake.
11 Tish James has been a proud fighter for all New
12 Yorkers as Public Advocate. I am so sad to see her
13 leave us today. The good news is for us is that she
14 is going to-- the good news for us-- Majority Leader,
15 the good news for us is that Letitia James is going
16 to continue to fight for all of us in her new role as
17 the next Attorney General of the State of New York.
18 Tish is a dear, dear, dear, dear friend of mine,
19 someone who I love, and I know she's a dear friend of
20 most people here, and I know that I speak for all of
21 us when we say go get 'em Tish. We are so proud of
22 you. We are so proud of you. We are excited for
23 what you're going to do, and let me say, if I was
24 breaking the law in the State of New York, which I am
25 not, I would be terrified right now of the thought of

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 29
2 Attorney General Tish James coming after me. I'd be
3 losing sleep. So, Tish, you're going to crush it. I
4 can't wait to watch you and root for you. We love
5 you, Tish James. Another big round of applause for
6 the amazing Public Advocate, Letitia James.

7 [applause]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And this is Cake
9 Man from Fort Greene.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Can someone blow those
11 candles out? Tish, did you want to say anything, or
12 do you want to hold it 'til later?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I want to hold it.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You'll hold it, okay.

15 Okay, we're going to-- if folks could sit down. Now
16 we're going to jump into our docket for the day.
17 Now, the Council will vote on the following Land Use
18 items, a preliminary-- by the way, Tish James said to
19 me on the steps this morning of City Hall, "You
20 better not do anything to single me out today, you
21 hear me? You hear me?" I said, "Tish, come on." I'm
22 not joking. Then I said, "Just wait, Tish." So we're
23 going to vote on the following Finance items: The
24 Preliminary Budget extender allowing Mayor de Blasio
25 to submit the Fiscal Year 2020 Preliminary Budget by

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 30
2 February 7th, an expense budget modification, and a
3 revenue budget modification implementing the changes
4 to the Fiscal 2019 November plan, and 20 Article XI
5 property tax exemptions preserving a total of 1,069
6 units of affordable housing. These properties are
7 located in Council Member Cabrera, Gjonaj, Diaz,
8 Salamanca, Gibson, Cohen, and Rivera's Districts.
9 The Council will vote on the following Land Use
10 items: The Council will vote to approve zoning text
11 amendments to modify the special Garment Center
12 District to allow for the conversion of buildings
13 from manufacturing to office space, standardized sign
14 regulations, modified bulk regulations to ensure
15 conformance of historical context with the purpose of
16 revitalizing garment manufacturing in this area.
17 There's been a tremendous amount of work, a
18 tremendous amount of work for years, and I want to
19 acknowledge my partner in this effort, our great
20 Borough President Gale Brewer. I'd also like to
21 thank the New York City Economic Development
22 Corporation President James Patchett, the Garment
23 District Steering Committee, and so many others who
24 have been crucial helping make this reality. I want
25 to thank my District Chief of Staff, Eric Botcher,

2 and my District Director Matt Green [sp?]. Together,
3 we are taking a big step towards ensuring the garment
4 manufacturing industry has a permanent home in New
5 York City. The Garment District is an integral part
6 of our city's economy and the New York fashion
7 industry, and today we're making sure that it will
8 flourish for years to come. The Council will vote to
9 approve with modifications, a zoning text amendment
10 proposed by the New York City Department of City
11 Planning to establish restrictions on hotel
12 development with an M1 light manufacturing district
13 citywide. I want to thank our Chairs, Chair Rafael
14 Salamanca and chair Francisco Moya, for working
15 together with their colleagues to shepherded [sic]
16 this thorough the Council. It was not easy, and
17 Francisco and Rafael have worked tremendously on this
18 over the last year. SO I'm very, very grateful for
19 all the work that they've done. We also want to vote
20 on the Franklin Avenue rezoning and the designation
21 of a mandatory inclusionary housing area Option One.
22 During negotiations, Majority Leader Cumbo secured
23 commitments from the applicant to increase onsite
24 affordable housing as well as the significantly
25 increased future affordable housing developed on the

2 adjacent site. We'll be voting to approve, as
3 Council Member Ampry-Samuel said and as Council
4 Member Barron will speak to in a little while. We're
5 going to vote to approve the Marcus Garvey Village
6 applications with modifications to facilitate the
7 development of seven mixed-use buildings with 676
8 affordable housing units on unused portions of the
9 Marcus Garvey Village housing development in
10 Brownsville located in Council Member Barron and
11 Ampry-Samuels' districts. Also, we're going to vote
12 to approve with modifications a rezoning in Council
13 Member Steve Levin's district to facilitate the
14 development of a 12-story commercial office building
15 at 29 J Street in Dumbo. The Council will vote on the
16 site selection of new schools. The first school is a
17 432-seat primary school and a 231-seat 3K and UPK
18 facility in Minority Leader Matteo's district on the
19 former Saint John's Educational Campus. The second
20 school is 380-seat primary school in Council Member
21 Menchaca's district on the site of Saint Rosellia
22 [sic] Church. I want to thank the Land Use staff,
23 Brian Paul, Amy Levetan [sp?], Julie Levin, John
24 Douglas, and Raju Mann. Moving on, the Council will
25 vote on the following legislation: First, we're

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 33
2 going to vote on introduction 1288A sponsored by
3 Council Member Ben Kallos, which will apply the
4 campaign finance system that voters just approved to
5 covered elections held prior to the 2021 primary
6 election including special elections held this year
7 in 2019. I want to thank the staff who worked on
8 this, Brad Reed, Elizabeth Cronk [sp?], Emily
9 Forgeone [sp?], Zachary Harris, and Rob Newman.
10 We're also going to vote Introduction 863A sponsored
11 by Council Member Jumaane Williams which would
12 prohibit employment discrimination and discriminatory
13 harassment based on an individuals' reproductive
14 health choices. I want to thank the staff, Rachel
15 Cordero [sp?], Amenta Killawon [sp?], Harbani Ahuja
16 [sp?]. We're also going to vote on Introduction 748A
17 sponsored by Council Member Fernando Cabrera, which
18 would establish OATH procedures for violations of the
19 Taxi and Limousine Commission's laws or regulations.
20 We'll vote on-- Jason, you're killing me over there.
21 We're going to vote on two pieces of legislation
22 requiring reporting of sexual abuse in city jails.
23 The first, Introduction 933B sponsored by Majority
24 Leader Cumbo will require the Department of
25 Correction to report on incidents of sexual abuse and

2 harassment to incarcerated individuals. The second
3 is Introduction 1090A sponsored by Council Member
4 Danny Dromm which will require the Department of
5 Correction to report on incidents of sexual abuse,
6 harassment, and force by the Department of Correction
7 to people who are visiting city jails. I want to
8 thank the staff Brian Crow [sp?] and Alana Siven
9 [sp?]. We're also going to vote on Introduction 633.
10 This is a big one. Sponsored by Majority Leader
11 Laurie Cumbo, which would require the Mayor's Office
12 of Data Analytics to report on an annual basis data
13 from every city agencies looking at gender,
14 ethnicity, and race at multiple pay bands to find
15 instances of pay disparities. The Council on an
16 annual basis will also be given 90-day access to
17 employment level data for all city workers so that we
18 can conduct our own statistical analysis. This is a
19 giant step forward for pay equity in New York City.
20 It took years of work, and there are many, many
21 people I'd like to thank. I want to thank Gloria
22 Middleton, the President of CWA Local 1180 and all of
23 her wonderful members. I want to thank Beverly
24 Newfield of POWHERNY. I want to thank our incredible
25 Chair of Civil Service and Labor, my friend Daneek

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 35
2 Miller, and of course, Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo.
3 That's just a few of the people. And I also want to
4 thank the former President of CWA Local 1180, Arthur
5 Chiliodus [sp?]. I want to take a moment to tell you
6 why this bill is so important. This bill is about
7 equality. It is about equal pay for equal work, and
8 it's about time, and this is so important, that the
9 City recognize the contributions that people of color
10 and women and especially women of color make to our
11 city every single day as part of our city's
12 workforce. By passing this bill today the Council is
13 saying that we are not happy with the status quo. We
14 will fight for equal pay and we will fight for
15 diversity. We will know that-- we know that all
16 workplaces are better when they reflect the diversity
17 of our city, but for too long that has not been
18 reflected where it matters most, in paychecks. Pay
19 gaps and opportunity gaps for women and people of
20 color are a reality for far too many people in this
21 city every single day, and it's even worse in city
22 government than it is in the private sector in New
23 York City. That is shameful. Women employed in our
24 city government, our municipal government, face a
25 gender wage gap that is three times larger than the

2 gender wage gap in the private sector in New York
3 City, three times larger in city government than it
4 is in the private sector in New York City. This is
5 unacceptable, and today the Council is fighting back
6 in a big way. I am so proud of all of us in this
7 room. This bill will help us find and eliminate
8 instances of pay discrimination in the city's
9 workforce, whether that be discrimination based on
10 gender or race or ethnicity or age or disability or
11 any other protected category that's enshrined in our
12 city's Human Rights Law. I'm reminded today of the
13 late great Shirley Chisolm. She said that you don't
14 make progress by standing on sidelines. You make
15 progress by implementing ideas, and today, we are
16 implementing the idea of equality. I want to thank
17 the staff who worked on this for a very long time,
18 Malcolm Butehorn [sp?], Jeff Baker, Andrea Vasquez,
19 James Sabudi [sp?], Rose Martinez, Elma Sawi [sp?],
20 Brad Reed, Amenta Killawon [sp?], Harbani Ahuja
21 [sp?], and Leah Scripiyak [sp?]. we'll vote on Pre-
22 considered Introduction 1300 in relation to the
23 naming of 68 thoroughfares and public places,
24 including Chief of Detectives William Alley [sp?],
25 Chief Ronald Spattafora [sp?], Police Officer Manuel

2 "Manny" Vargas who all died of illnesses related to
3 their service on 9/11. And we're also going to vote
4 on cultural icons. Christopher Wallace, AKA Biggie
5 Smalls is getting a street renamed after him, as well
6 as the Wu Tang Clan and Woodie Guthrie. On a
7 personal note, Queens Boulevard and 71st Road is
8 going to be renamed Adelaide Connaughton Way.

9 Adelaide was a dear friend of mine. She was a
10 longtime partner of the City Council's Lynn Schulman
11 who works in our Community Engagement Division, and I
12 am so happy that we are voting today on this, and I'm
13 so happy that Adelaide's many, many contributions to
14 this city is being recognized with a street renaming
15 in the borough that she loved. Adelaide, we miss

16 you. We will keep you in our hearts. I want to
17 thank the staff who worked on this: Christ Artori
18 [sp?], Patrick Mulvahil [sp?], Chima Obecheri [sp?],
19 and Monica Lejack [sp?]. Finally, we'll vote on the

20 last piece of legislation introduced by Public
21 Advocate Letitia James, Introduction 1075A would
22 require the Department of Sanitation to establish a
23 pilot program to collect organics from buildings
24 wholly occupied by one or more city agencies and

25 institutional special use buildings. I want to thank

2 the staff, Nicole Abben [sp?], Nadia Johnson, and
3 John Seltzer. I also was remiss in earlier not
4 saying, and I'm sure that Council Member Rose who is
5 not with us here today, so she can't say it because
6 she is dealing with something personal today. I'm
7 really sad that her really wonderful-- is she here?
8 Is Winnie [sp?] here? I'm really that-- sad, but
9 happy for Richmond County, that her Deputy Chief of
10 Staff, Adweena [sp?] Martin, Winnie Martin, who's
11 been at the Council since 2012 is leaving to now
12 become the new Richmond County Public Administrator.
13 She'll be the first woman and first person of color
14 to ever hold that position on Staten Island.
15 Congratulations, Winnie; we will miss you.

16 [applause]

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Okay, since this is the
18 last-- the final stated meeting of 2018-- the final
19 stated meeting of 2018, I want to take a moment and
20 reflect on this past year. I can't express how
21 honored and humbled I am to serve the people of New
22 York City alongside all of you here. Adrienne, Alan,
23 Alicka, Andy Cohen, Andy King, Antonio, Barry, Ben,
24 Bill, Brad, Carlina, Carlos, Chaim, Costa, Danny,
25 Debbie, Diana, Donovan, Eric, Fernando, Francisco,

2 Helen, Daneek, Inez, Jimmy, Joe, Jumaane, Justin,
3 Kalman, Karen, Keith, Keith Powers, Laurie, Margaret,
4 Mark-- that's an inside joke-- Laurie, Margaret, Mark
5 Gjonaj, Mark Levine, Mark Treyger, Matthew, Paul,
6 Peter, Rafael Espinal, Rafael Salamanca, Ritchie,
7 Robert, Bob, Rory, Ruben, Steve Levin, Steve Matteo,
8 Vanessa, and Ydanis. Did I miss anyone? Thank God I
9 didn't miss anyone. I want to thank every single one
10 of you. I want to thank every single one of you. I
11 get to stand up here and make these remarks twice a
12 month. This body is only strong because of the
13 members who make up this body. You all are the ones
14 who serve this city every single day, who serve your
15 approximately 170,000 constituents, and at a time
16 where there is dysfunction and distrust in
17 government, I believe at the federal level in many
18 instances, I believe the New York City Council is a
19 place that is a force for good in people's lives in
20 New York City. I've always believed that government
21 can be a force for good and should be a force for
22 good, and I believe that the members of this body and
23 this institution play a crucial and critical role in
24 serving New Yorkers, and I believe you all do that
25 every single day. So, I am so deeply honored that I

2 get to serve alongside of you. I also want to thank
3 a few other people, if I may. I want to thank my mom
4 who is my rock. I want to thank my sister, Melissa,
5 my nephew, Van who's a year-and-a-half. I want to
6 thank some of the incredible staff, and I can't name
7 all of them. I can just name a few of them, some of
8 the staff that I interact with every single day here
9 in this magnificent building. I want to thank the
10 Chief of Staff, Jason Goldman, for his incredible
11 work since he took over in June. I'm not allowed to
12 swear on the floor of the City Council, but people
13 said this place is going to be in big trouble when
14 Ramon Martinez leaves, and I think we're doing just
15 fine, and that's because of Jason's leadership. I
16 want to thank Cici Scott [sp?], my Chief of
17 Operations. I want to thank my shadow, the guys who
18 is always with me, Sean Kofflan [sp?], Lilian Pescone
19 [sp?], Anthony Perez [sp?], Jenn Formino [sp?] my
20 communications director. I want to thank Eric Botcher
21 [sp?], my District Office Chief of Staff and my
22 entire District Office staff, and I want to thank
23 Phyllis and Robin who greet everyone with a smile
24 downstairs when they come into the Speaker's Office.
25 So, I want to thank you all, and I also want to thank

2 the amazing detectives that I get to spend time with
3 every single day from the New York City Police
4 Department. I want to thank Sergeant John Gee [sp?],
5 who lead that detail, and I want to thank Malik whose
6 here, and Ray, and Faisal, and Pat and Frank. I want
7 to thank all of them for everything they do for me
8 and they do for the City of New York. So, I want to
9 thank you all for everything you do as well. I am
10 extremely proud of what we accomplished, and I hope
11 you all are proud of what we've accomplished this
12 year as well. It's really actually amazing what
13 we've been able to do just in one year. We stood
14 with survivors and we passed the Stop Sexual
15 Harassment Act in New York City which is among the
16 strictest legislation of its kind in the country. We
17 stood with taxi drivers and for-hire vehicle drivers
18 to protect them at a time when the industry is in
19 upheaval, and we became the first major city in the
20 world to regulate app-based for-hire vehicle
21 companies like Uber and Lyft. We took a major step
22 for our City's safety in affordable housing by
23 passing legislation to help crack down on illegal
24 hotels. We helped people who can't afford to get on
25 the subway every morning by winning Fair Fares in our

2 budget, something that is literally going to make
3 everyday life better for hundreds of thousands of
4 poor New Yorkers. We helped our children in our
5 schools by securing 125 million dollars in Fair
6 Student Funding. I'm looking at you, Mark Treyger.
7 We listened to the parents of disabled children and
8 committed 150 million dollars to ensure that our
9 schools are accessible. These parents came to us.
10 They asked for our help, and we, the Council,
11 delivered for them. We fought for NYCHA residents,
12 for runaway and homeless youth, the LGBT community.
13 We got life-saving speed cameras turned back on. We
14 fought for immigrants who are under attack in our
15 city, and I could go on and on. We have had such a
16 great year, and I am so proud of everyone in this
17 room, everyone, the members, the staff, everyone
18 who's standing in this room. I want to thank you all
19 for making me the Speaker of this body. I want to
20 thank you for fighting every day for the people of
21 this city, and I hope you all have a happy holiday
22 season with your loved ones and a happy New Year. I
23 hope you get some rest over the next couple of weeks,
24 because we're not finished. We're coming back, and I
25 hope to do much more in 2019. I am so excited for

2 what we've done this year and what we will do.

3 Sending love to you all and your families. Thank you
4 very much. Let's get on with today's votes.

5 [applause]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank
7 you, Mr. Speaker. Discussion of General Orders
8 beginning with Council Member Kallos. No. Next,
9 Council Member Rosenthal. Pass. Council Member
10 Cornegy? Cornegy?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes, thank you,
12 Madam Public Advocate/Attorney General. I just want
13 to speak on my streetcar naming. I'd like to take a
14 moment to share a brief bio of Fannie Pettie Watts
15 who with today's passage of Intro 1300 will have a
16 stretch of Decatur Street in Brooklyn co-named Fannie
17 Petty Watts Way in her honor. Fannie Pettie Watts
18 was born in Perry [sic], Georgia on December 20th,
19 1899 and attended public school of Savannah, Georgia.
20 She continued her formal training at Georgia State
21 College, and she later graduated from Howard
22 University with a Bachelor of Arts in Education. She
23 also achieved her post-graduate degree in social work
24 and housing at New York University. Fannie Pettie
25 Watts then relocated to Brooklyn where she married

2 the late John G. Watts and was also the mother of two
3 sons. Professionally Founder Fannie Pettie Watts was
4 a social investigator for the Department of Social
5 Services in Brooklyn. She was also the Director of
6 the Cradle Roll [sic] Division of Brooklyn's Nazarene
7 Congregational Church where she assisted with the
8 organization and development of prenatal parenting
9 classes and gatherings for expectant parents. She
10 was an active member of Nazarene Congregational
11 Church until her death. Additionally, and very
12 importantly, Fannie Watts as an active participator
13 in the local block association and was the link
14 between community development workers and a range of
15 other local authority and voluntary sector providers
16 such as the police, social workers, and teachers.
17 Her commitment to the Bedford-Stuyvesant Community
18 and her focus on community collaboration led to the
19 creation of a number of volunteer opportunities and
20 community leadership roles. Fannie Pettie Watts was
21 one of the co-founders of Zeta Phi Beta Sorority
22 Incorporated. She's a life member and held
23 membership with Delta Alpha Zeta Graduate Chapter in
24 Brooklyn, New York. She is credited with organizing
25 Omicron Beta Chapter in Brooklyn. Fannie Pettie

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 45

2 Watts's triumphant life ended August 22nd, 1995 and
3 was buried in the Cemetery of the Evergreens in
4 Brooklyn, New York. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member Cumbo? Yes.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I had it written down,
8 but I inherited a gift from you this year, which was
9 a loss for you, but a gain for me. I am
10 extraordinarily grateful that someone you're not able
11 to bring along with you to the Attorney General's
12 Office from your police detail, the amazing second-
13 grade detective Rene Molina [sp?] has been with me
14 since the beginning of October, and I thought I
15 mentioned his name, and I apologize for not, because
16 I love Rene and I know you love Rene as well. So, I
17 wanted to be sure that I included Rene Molina in my
18 thanks today.

19 [applause]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you for
21 that. Council Member Cumbo?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I rise
23 today so very proud of the legislation that we are
24 passing today. This is an incredible opportunity
25 along with Council Member Miller as well as Public

2 Advocate Letitia James. We are making Her-story
3 today. And I have a quick story to share about it.
4 My parents are here today, and my mother and father
5 were both general managers at Off-track Betting, and
6 they met. They fell madly in love, and here I am,
7 but upon finding out that they're both managers at
8 Off-track Betting, they had discuss their finances,
9 and when my mother found out that my father was
10 making way more money than she was, let's just say
11 head rolled at OTB, and ultimately she wound up
12 making more money than him. But that's just one of
13 those stories. Not everyone has the opportunity to
14 find out if their counterparts are making the same
15 amount of money as they are. We are here to change
16 that in the City Council today, and I'm so proud to
17 work with Council Member Miller. We are creating the
18 transparency that so many individuals need to know to
19 understand if there are wage disparities that are
20 happening every single day. As Rihanna said it in
21 her pop song, "Pay me what you owe me." But even
22 better, Dolly Parton said it, and I'll say in
23 closing, forty years ago, "Working nine to five, what
24 a way to make a living, barely getting by. It's all
25 taking and no giving. They just use your mind and

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 47
2 they never give you credit. It's enough to drive you
3 crazy if you let it. Nine to five, yeah, they got
4 you where they want you. There's a better life. And
5 you think about it, don't you? It's a rich man's
6 game, no matter what they call it, and you spend your
7 life putting money in his wallet." And we know that
8 many African-American women have to work a whole year
9 plus eight months in order to make what their white
10 male counterparts make. And I want to thank the
11 dynamic and powerful black and brown women of CWA who
12 brought this legislation forward by-- excuse me. They
13 brought this legislation forward through a lawsuit
14 that they created. This has brought transparency to
15 the City of New York. I want to thank Gloria
16 Middleton for all of her incredible work and all the
17 dynamic members of CWA who took their power and their
18 energy to create a way for New Yorkers all across the
19 city. So, I'll close because my comments are coming
20 to an end. I don't want Letitia James to feel that
21 she's giving me some extra time, but I'll take it up
22 on General Orders. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Council Member Yeger?

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 48

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. Madam
3 President, first in your last meeting, I honor you
4 for your service. We've know each other for a long
5 time. I was proud to support you five years ago. I
6 knew that was the right decision. I know you're not
7 going far, you're still Brooklyn, and you're only
8 going a few blocks away, sometimes upstate, but
9 you'll always be Brooklyn, and I'm proud to call you
10 a friend. Your work here has been incredible. Good
11 luck to you and Godspeed.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I
13 appreciate that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I rise today,
15 Madam President to talk about a bill that my good
16 colleague Council Member Kallos has proposed. He's a
17 longtime champion of smart, increased public
18 financing. He's always been open about that. He's
19 always been honest about that. And I know that his
20 bill comes from a good place and it has good
21 intentions. In my view, sometimes process is as
22 important as the intended result, and we see that
23 during the debate that we're having here in this body
24 over Amazon. This bill was introduced last Tuesday.
25 We had a hearing on Wednesday. Under the Charter,

2 that was the day that it laid on the desk of the
3 members in this chamber and we voted it out of
4 committee today, and today we will vote it on the
5 floor. The bill will require the City of New York as
6 per the fiscal estimate to spend four million dollars
7 in the next calendar year, four million dollars from
8 January 1st 'til November of next year. In my view,
9 I don't think that we need to spend four million
10 dollars on a race that's already receiving public
11 funds. The six to one is generous; eight to one is a
12 little more generous. There's no question the voters
13 chose eight-to-one for the future, but they didn't
14 choose it for this special election that's happening
15 in 75 or so days. And we had a choice to not spend
16 an additional four million dollars. We could have
17 spent it on NYCHA. We could spend it on school
18 teachers, police, libraries, road repairs, homeless,
19 healthcare, all the other things that we talk about
20 in this Council that we want to spend money on that
21 we can't because we can't afford it, and here's four
22 million dollars-- Madam President, I'm wrapping up in
23 a second. Its four million dollars that we're going
24 to spend. I know that the proponents of this bill
25 come from a good place, I do, because they-- every

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 50
2 single person who is supporting this bill comes from
3 a place where we ran on the public financings. We
4 receive the money from public financing. We wouldn't
5 be here, perhaps, but for public financing, but it is
6 four million dollars, and it's a chance to say that
7 we don't have to spend this money. Nobody's not
8 going to run for Public Advocate because that extra
9 eight-to-one, that extra two dollars for every dollar
10 is not given, nobody. Nobody has said so far, "I
11 will not run because I won't get enough money." So,
12 it's a chance to say no. It's a chance to give that
13 money to something more useful. Thank you, Madam
14 President, for indulging me with the extra time. And
15 again, Godspeed to you. It's not going to be the same
16 without you up there.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Bless
18 you. Council Member Kallos?

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Kallos
20 doesn't need to speak at this time he said.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Ulrich?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Okay, alright.
24 Well, first, I want to say, Madam Public Advocate--
25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 51

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Start the
3 clock.

4 [laughter]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. My
6 you're leaving such large shoes to fill, let's just
7 put it that way, but you've always been such a
8 wonderful friend, and the City of New York has
9 benefitted immensely from your public service, and I
10 wish to add my voice to my colleagues in honoring
11 your service and your commitment to every single New
12 Yorker, and we wish you the best. We know you're
13 going to do a fantastic job as the Attorney General.
14 I want to talk about what my colleague Council Member
15 Yeger brought up with respect to the Campaign Finance
16 bill that we're voting on today, Intro. 1288A. I will
17 be abstaining on that bill, because I intend to
18 benefit from it. So, I think it would be conflict of
19 interest for me to vote on something that is going to
20 make it easier for me to receive public funding. So,
21 I don't want my abstention on that bill to be seen as
22 anything else other than me just being cautious. And
23 I would advise respectfully my colleagues who are
24 also seeking that same office, if they are going to
25 be participating in the matching funds program, they

2 should abstain, too. I think it sends the right
3 message to New Yorkers that we are running a
4 transparent good government operation here in the
5 City Council. So, again, no disrespect to Council
6 Member Kallos. I think it's a great bill, but I just
7 can't vote for it if I'm going to benefit from it.
8 Thank you very much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
10 standing committees.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: On the report of special-
12 -

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 Excuse me. Council Member Barron?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. I just want to say that I stand
17 with my colleagues that have street namings,
18 particularly Fannie Pettie Watts. She was the founder
19 of Zeta Phi Beta, which has been noted, and that's
20 the sorority that I pledged when I was at Hunter.
21 Fannie Lou Hamer is having a co-naming, Muhammad Ali
22 Jinnah Way as well as Audrey Law [sic]. I just want
23 to commend my colleagues for that. I want to just
24 bring comments on the Marcus Garvey extension project
25 which was alluded to earlier. First, before I talk

2 about the project just briefly, Marcus Garvey was an
3 outstanding individual. Born in Jamaica, came here
4 in 1916 and started what became the largest mass
5 organizations across the world, United nat-- the
6 Universal Negro Improvement Association. He also
7 founded a doll factory for black dolls because he
8 realized there was a shortage of black dolls. He
9 organized the Black Nurses, because that was also a
10 shortage that we had here in this country. And he
11 bought three ships and starting a shipping line. So,
12 his motto was, "One God, one aim, one destiny, and he
13 gave us the black liberation flag, the red, black and
14 green. But to talk about the project in my remaining
15 seconds, I'm very pleased to be able to share this
16 project with my colleague. They wanted 12 buildings.
17 We said that's too dense. They came down to seven.
18 They wanted 12 stories. We said that's too high.
19 They came down to seven. I just want to encourage my
20 colleagues to make sure that we benefit that we need
21 for our community. So, at the Marcus Garvey
22 Extension Project you will be able to get a studio
23 for rent of \$215 to \$837 dollars, depending on your
24 income. Or one bedroom from \$283 to \$1,058. A two-
25 bedroom ranging from \$425 to \$1,280 or a three-

2 bedroom apartment ranging from \$512 dollars to
3 \$1,472. So I just want encourage my colleagues
4 negotiate and where people are not bringing in
5 apartment that are in some way matched to the income
6 of the people who live in that community. They are
7 not doing a service to those who are struggling to
8 stay there. And I'll have more to say about later.
9 And also, this project will have supportive housing
10 in it, and we're looking to negotiate a separate
11 single building in phase tree. Thank you so much.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 Reports of standing committees.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the committee
15 on civil and human rights, Intro. 863A, employment
16 discrimination.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Mr. Speaker?

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled in
19 general orders.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
21 on Civil Service and labor, Intro. 633 A, pay equity
22 reporting.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
24 General Orders.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 55

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the committee
3 on Criminal justice, Intro. 933 B and 1090A, sexual
4 abuse reporting.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and couple on
6 General Orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Repot of the Committee on
8 Finance, Pre-considered Intro. 1303 budget extender.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
10 Orders with a message of necessity.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered Reso. 674,
12 transparency reso.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
14 Orders.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M121 and
16 Reso. 677, and M122 and Reso. 678 budget documents.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
18 orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LU 290 and
20 Reso. 679 through Pre-considered LU 309 and Reso. 698
21 on page five tax exemptions.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
23 Orders.

24

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 56

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Governmental Operations, Intro. 748A, OATH
4 hearings.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on-- amended
6 and coupled on general orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro. 1288A Campaign
8 Finance Law.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
10 General Orders.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 on Land Use LU 259 and LU 269, zoning amendments.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
14 modifications and referred to the City Planning
15 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of
16 the Council and Section 197D of the New York City
17 Charter.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 270 and Reso. 699 and
19 LU 271 and Reso. 700 Franklin Avenue rezoning.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
21 Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 272 through LU 281 on
23 page nine, Marcus Garvey Village and 29 J Street.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
25 modifications and referred to the City Planning

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 57

2 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of
3 the Council and Section 197D of the New York City
4 Charter.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 287 and Reso. 701 and
6 LU 288 and Reso. 702 school facilities.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 289 and Reso. 703,
10 sidewalk café.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
14 on Parks and Recreation, Pre-considered Intro. 1300
15 in relation to the naming of the 68 thoroughfares in
16 public places.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
20 on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, Intro.
21 1075A, organic waste collection.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: On the General Order
25 Calendar Intro 720, site safety training.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 58

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 259 and Reso. 704
4 through LU 281 and Reso 713 on page 13 various
5 applications.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing
9 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
11 Orders, and at this time I would ask for roll call
12 vote on all of the items on today's General Order
13 calendar.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
15 Chambers.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No on Intro.
20 1288A, aye on all the rest.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
23 explain my vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 59

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. As I
3 have said before, New York City is facing an
4 overwhelming crisis with homelessness. The ANHD has
5 done reports and they've shared with us what the AMIs
6 are in each of our communities. The most oppressed
7 group or the most challenged group to find housing
8 are those who are formerly homeless, those are 30
9 percent, 40 percent, 50 percent. Yes, when we came
10 in, we did the rezoning and it passed, but the MIH is
11 far too low for us to really make an impact on the
12 crisis that we're facing. I do not believe that LU
13 270 and 271 brings housing to a community that has
14 only 16 percent of its residents making 100,000
15 dollars or more presently to address that project to
16 bring in 70 percent at market-rate. So, for that
17 reason I'm voting no on 270 and 271. Aye on all the
18 others. Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
21 except 1288A and a Merry Christmas to all and a best
22 of luck to our Attorney General-Elect, and may you
23 spend as little time as possible in Albany.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 60

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Madam Public
6 Advocate, I was going to spend time [sic]-- it's
7 always a privilege to talk about whoever getting an
8 opportunity to pass my own bill here today, but I
9 want to spend my time really talking about you. I
10 remember when I came in nine years ago. We were
11 sitting in the same row in the back. We were in the
12 corner, and there were some that said, "She will
13 never be Public Advocate." And I was thinking about
14 that today, and it's amazing how destiny always makes
15 a way for people who have a good heart. You have a
16 good heart. Stay to the truth. Fight for the truth
17 and for justice for the poor as you always have, and
18 I also want to commend your staff. You have amazing
19 staff like Timothy Tapia [sp?] and others that really
20 you know how to empower future leaders, and in doing
21 so you empower your office. let me just say here in
22 closing, I want to thank the Speaker, Brad Reed,
23 Senior Counsel, and also Elizabeth Cronk [sp?], Zack
24 Harris [sp?], and my own staff, Claire Maclavane
25 [sp?] for Intro. 748A, and I want to thank to all my

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 61

2 colleagues who will be voting aye on this bill that
3 is going to help taxi drivers, and with all their
4 burdens and financial burdens they're facing today.

5 Thank you so much, and I wish you truly the best, and
6 my God's favor be upon your life.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Bless
8 you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1288, aye
11 on the rest.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just wanted to
17 take this opportunity to thank the Speaker and all my
18 colleagues for all their support this year. My
19 district has been crazy, busy, hectic, never a dull
20 moment, but I am just so appreciative of all the
21 support, and of course to our Public Advocate, it'll
22 be great seeing you on the state, and we have to look
23 forward so much good that will be done. And I want
24 to wish everyone a happy holiday and a joyful and

25

2 wonderful new year. And I vote aye on all. Thank
3 you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to
7 explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I also just want
10 to thank and congratulate the Speaker on an
11 incredibly productive and successful first year. I
12 want to profess my love for our Public Advocate, and
13 I'm thrilled you're going to be our Attorney General.
14 I want to wish my colleagues a happy holidays and a
15 happy New Year. I'm going to abstain on 1288, and
16 I'm going to vote yes on all other items on the
17 General Orders Calendar.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: May I be
21 allowed to explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I just
24 wanted to congratulate our Public Advocate soon to be
25 Attorney General, Tish James. Thank you for-- I

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 63
2 won't know this chamber without you. I've been here
3 as a staffer, seeing what a great Council Member you
4 were and a great leader you've been, and now as a
5 Public Advocate, and then moving into the Attorney
6 General's role, whether it's working in our district
7 together at a crop less gardens or on climate change,
8 every day I know how much you care about New Yorkers
9 and how you put every New Yorker first, so we look
10 forward to seeing you do that on a statewide level.
11 Congratulations. I'm wishing you all the best.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And I
14 vote aye on all.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
18 explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: First of all, I
21 want to thank Speaker Johnson for giving us a full
22 first year, probably one of the most productive years
23 at the Council, for fighting for us as a body, and
24 putting us first. I want to say to Tish James, just
25 go get 'em, Tish. And I vote aye.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 64

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to
5 explain my vote?

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, firstly, I'd
8 like to acknowledge the presence of my adopted
9 parents, Mr. and Mrs. Cumbo who are sitting right
10 behind me, and I just want to thank the Speaker for a
11 great year and his friendship, partnership, and to
12 you, Public Advocate, for your friendship over the
13 last four-plus years and prior to Public Advocate as
14 a Council Member in your district, in Williamsburg, I
15 think the 35th. And I want to wish all my colleagues
16 a happy and healthy new year and happy, healthy
17 holidays to everyone, and I vote aye on all.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
24 much. I want to congratulate the Speaker on a very
25 productive year. I want to thank Council Member

2 Koslowitz and congratulate Lynn Schulman on the co-
3 naming on Adelaide P. Norton Way. Adelaide was a
4 friend of mine. She was a compassionate, wonderful
5 human-being. She fought for the voiceless. She
6 fought for the LGBT community. She fought for those
7 who are re-entering society, the formerly
8 incarcerated, and for the criminal justice involved
9 individuals. She is truly missed, and I love her
10 dearly. And with that I'm going to vote aye on all
11 except for 1288A I vote no.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you. I'd like
18 to vote yes on all except on 863A, and also there is
19 a bill here that I have no full understanding because
20 it deals with Taxi and Limousine Commission, and that
21 bill was supposed to go to my committee, but
22 [inaudible] Government Operation, and this is the
23 bill that my committee, we want to deal with it,
24 because they as the drivers and it's hurting the
25 driver. This is wrong what you're doing, what we're

2 doing. I'm voting yes on 748A. This bill we have,
3 ladies and gentleman, eight drivers have killed
4 themselves. The pressure because of the-- the
5 pressure that have been put on them [sic], and we
6 have to-- we're supposed to be alleviating their
7 burden, not putting more burden on them. The Mayor
8 don't want [inaudible] bill. Now we do need-- we
9 need another bill, and I didn't want to see that bill
10 in my committee, because it was wrong for the driver.
11 This is the bill. This is wrong. It's no good.
12 It's not good for the driver. Besides that, I'm
13 voting yes on all. Merry Christmas. Happy Chanukah
14 and Happy Kwanza to all of you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
18 explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I just really
21 want to congratulate Tish James on becoming our State
22 Attorney General and for all the great work you've
23 done here, and I admire all the legislation you've
24 passed as Public Advocate. So thank you for all the
25 great work you've done, and I want to congratulate

2 Corey, and wish him a good luck on his new endeavor
3 of becoming the Public Advocate January 1st. You
4 have big shoes to fill. Good luck with that. And I
5 vote aye on all.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Permission to
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I would like to
12 thank Speaker Corey Johnson for your leadership, you
13 know, keeping this body such a powerful body, and we
14 feel all empowered and inspired by your work. Thank
15 you very much. And I know that you mother should be
16 very happy of that. And I would like to join my
17 colleagues also to congratulate one more time Public
18 Advocate, and I thank [sic] General-elect Letitia
19 James. Many of us, we had the opportunity to serve
20 with you when you were a Council Member and also as a
21 Public Advocate. We know that you are ready, and you
22 know what you are made of. Go for it.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: And all the best-

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 68

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: for the borough
5 of Manhattan. And to all of you here in the chamber,
6 my colleagues and all of those who are here today for
7 this great Stated Meeting, I want to wish you a very
8 blessed and happy, healthy holiday season to you and
9 your loved one. With this, I vote yes on all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate. I say that one last time. I'd like
18 to congratulate all of our colleagues passing bills
19 today, particularly want to highlight our Majority
20 Leader Laurie Cumbo on a great bill related to pay
21 and employment data, and I also want to congratulate
22 Chair Daneek Miller and CWA Local 1180 and all of the
23 advocates, and I too want to join all of my
24 colleagues in congratulating our amazing Speaker
25 Corey Johnson and his team for an incredibly

2 successful year in addition to all of the incredible
3 budget successes that he cited. I am particularly
4 grateful for all of my colleagues in supporting
5 myself and Fernando Cabrera on the Jerome
6 Neighborhood rezoning plan. Thank you. And Fair
7 Fares and Fair Student Funding and school
8 accessibility, really important to me in my district-
9 - Summer Youth and COMPASS and SONYC, adult literacy
10 and EFAP, we truly made such a difference this year,
11 and I am grateful to be a part of this body. Want
12 to thank our Finance Chair Danny Dromm, our Finance
13 Director Latonya McKinney [sp?], and my heavy-hitters
14 that really helped me on the Subcommittee, Regina
15 Poreda Ryan [sp?], Chima Obecher [sp?], Rebecca
16 Chaisson [sp?] and Nathan Toth. Thank you for
17 helping me as a new Chair of a Subcommittee created
18 by our Speaker. I want to thank my team, Team
19 Gibson, for holding me down both here and in the
20 district office led by my new Chief of Staff, Wendy
21 Gyagos [sp?]. And finally, as I wish everyone a
22 happy holiday season, I want to join in recognizing
23 our incredible Public Advocate. Although I am often
24 mistaken and called Ms. James Tish, so many times
25 throughout this city, there will never be another

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 70

2 Tish James, and you will certainly be missed. You
3 have been an advocate, a litigator, and agitator, a
4 motivator, a champion, a leader, a role model, a
5 friend, a source of encouragement for so many of us
6 here and in the City. You have really set the bar
7 tremendously high, shattered glass ceilings, and
8 overall been a phenomenal woman. So, as one chapter
9 closes, Tish, and your new chapter opens, we wish you
10 success. We look forward to working with you in your
11 new role, and yes, you go get 'em. Happy holidays to
12 all my colleagues. Merry Christmas. Happy Kwanza.
13 Happy Chanukah. Happy Three Kings Day, and I look
14 forward to working with each and every one of you in
15 the New Year. God bless. Thank you. I vote aye on
16 all with the exception of 1288, I will abstain.
17 Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: First of all, I
24 just want to wish you, and I'm excited for your
25 future, but mostly I'm excited for New York, Tish.

2 Speaker, thank you on a great year. I wish all of my
3 colleagues a happy holiday, and most of all, a
4 healthy, peaceful and productive New Year. I vote
5 aye on all except Intro. 1288A.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I was worried
9 you forgot how to pronounce it. It's okay, Donovan.
10 Madam Public Advocate, I have rarely asked your
11 indulgence to explain my vote, and I don't think
12 today is a good day to start to do that, so I'm not
13 going to. However, I want to thank my Speaker, Corey
14 Johnson, for an outstanding first year, and
15 especially, Corey, for realizing my dream of ending
16 the budget dance on emergency food, and I'd be remiss
17 if I didn't thank my partner in that, Steve Levin. I
18 want to wish everybody a happy and healthy and safe
19 holiday season. It's not going to snow before
20 Christmas, so you got no excuse to go where you're
21 going. Happy New Year, a healthy new year for
22 everybody, and Helen, if you'll give a moment to talk
23 to Tish James privately. No. I just want to wish
24 her the best of everything. Last Saturday night I
25 was with her and we were at a party in southeast

2 Queens together, and the room was packed and there
3 was my friend Tish just sitting in the corner by
4 herself, Attorney General-elect of the State of New
5 York, no pretense about her, no heirs about her, just
6 living her life as she always does. And Tish, I grew
7 up in public housing. I never realized that I could
8 be an elected official, but you carry with you the
9 dreams of millions of young children who can now
10 dream of making their world a better place. A young
11 girl from New York City who rose to the top, or most
12 of the way to the top. There's still room for growth
13 for all of us. So, I'm not going to put you in
14 trouble today, but I just want to say I am so
15 thrilled to have supported you, and look forward to
16 seeing you as our next Attorney General on January
17 1st, and with that, I withdraw my request to speak on
18 this. I do vote aye on all. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to
22 explain my vote?

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Congrats to Tish
25 James, unbelievable accomplishment and Godspeed.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 73

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Happy and healthy
4 holidays, and I just want to thank Speaker Johnson
5 for tremendous leadership and attention, and
6 certainly it was an entertaining year, a very fast
7 year, but what we accomplished is amazing thanks to
8 you. I am still amazed at you, and what you can
9 remember, the names you could remember, the faces and
10 so forth, and also the-- for putting up with, again,
11 the texts late at night and tolerating it and
12 answering me, and I think we have kind of a good
13 time, but thank you very much for a great year,
14 Speaker Johnson.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Sorry. Aye on
17 all except Intro. 863A.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: This time I'd
21 like permission to explain my vote.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: On November 6th of
24 2018, New Yorkers overwhelmingly voted to get big
25 money out of New York City politics. After a decade-

2 long fight for real campaign finance reform, New York
3 literally took matters into their own hands by voting
4 yes on ballot question one. That is, 1.4 million
5 voters flipped their ballots over to page four, voted
6 on question one with 1.1 million voters choosing yes.
7 To put that in perspective, that's almost as many
8 people as voted in favor of this measure voted for
9 Mayor in 2017, whether it was de Blasio or
10 Malliotakis. New Yorkers could not have been clearer.
11 This was a mandate for New Yorkers to get big money
12 out and reform the system now. I want to thank
13 Speaker Johnson for endorsing question one on the
14 ballot, recognizing this mandate of the voters and
15 his leadership. However, despite voters clearly
16 making-- knowing this reform is what they wanted, the
17 changes did not take effect until 2021. Introduction
18 1288 extends the newly adopted Campaign finance
19 system to the February 2019 Special Election,
20 September 2019 Primary Election, and November 2019
21 General Election for Public Advocate, and the cascade
22 of elections that will follow. This legislation will
23 allow ballot question one to lower contribution
24 limits from \$2,550 citywide to \$1,000 increased
25 public matching. Every small dollar contribution

2 matching every dollar up from six to eight for \$250,
3 public grant from 75 percent. There's so much more,
4 but in the remaining 30 seconds I wanted to thank Rob
5 Newman, Brad Reed, Elizabeth Cronk, but I did want to
6 take a moment at the risk of upsetting the next
7 regulator at our state despite her wishes, I just
8 want to thank New York City Public Advocate for her
9 partnership and giving me an opportunity to stand
10 with her where she stood up to small companies like
11 Comcast, locked that merger, pushed Charter to
12 actually provide affordable internet for over a
13 million low-income New York City residents, and now
14 she's going to be in a position to actually make sure
15 they follow through on their promise, fighting to
16 make sure that every New Yorker can save for their
17 pensions, and as we try to do that in Albany, it is
18 you who will likely end up suing to make sure that we
19 can save for our retirement. And as we try to
20 implement electronic voter registration, it will be
21 your office that will be suing to make sure that we
22 can make it easy for people to vote. You've got a lot
23 ahead of you. I am confident you will get it done.
24 I am so grateful to have you as the attorney for the

2 City of New York, and I can't wait for you to
3 represent all of us as a state. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Oh, I vote aye on
7 all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Koo?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Public
10 Advocate, may I explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: First, I want to
13 thank the Speaker and the staff, especially Jason,
14 Cici [sic], and the wonderful staff doing a wonderful
15 job for all of us and for the City of New York.
16 Second, I want to congratulate for being the next AG
17 fighting for all New Yorkers for equal justice and
18 equal opportunities. I wish you very good luck in
19 your next journey.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Lastly, I want to
22 wish happy holidays to all my colleagues, because we
23 together doing many, many good things for the
24 citizens of the city, making lives better for
25 everyone. And I want to wish those who undertake

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 77

2 next journeys running for office, wish all of them
3 good luck, and I vote aye for all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be
7 excused to explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: A year ago I
10 knew that Corey Johnson was going to be a very good
11 Speaker, but I never imagined that he would be a
12 great Speaker. I am happy to be able to spend my last
13 three years in the City Council under the leadership
14 of Corey Johnson. Thank you. To Tish, I started off
15 being a Council Member with you. You were a Council
16 Member and Public Advocate. I've watched you grow,
17 and I continue to watch you grow for the rest of my
18 life. So, thank you for everything that you have
19 done, and it's a pleasure to know you. And with
20 that, I vote aye on all, and I just want to wish
21 everybody happy holidays, merry Christmas, happy New
22 Year, and happy Kwanza.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: With
3 congratulations to Speaker Johnson on a truly
4 extraordinary year as Speaker and for this body and
5 with genuine excitement for my friend Tish James
6 becoming my lawyer of her 18 million or 19 million
7 fellow New Yorkers, I vote aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
11 permission to explain my vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Madam Public
14 Advocate we're really going to miss you. Without
15 your courage I don't know if we would have had the
16 guts to form the Progressive Caucus and to push for a
17 living wage, and paid sick days and police reform.
18 Without your friendship I know for sure I would have
19 missed my 15th anniversary dinner with my wife
20 instead of having my son and especially my daughter
21 gain a role model that they look up to constantly, so
22 we really are going to miss you here, but we are just
23 so thrilled you will be fighting fiercely for the
24 rights of all New Yorkers, and we're grateful and
25 we're counting on you. Thank you.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 79

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I have to say one
4 other farewell as well. This is the last meeting for
5 Annie Levers as my Policy Director. Starting next
6 week she will be joining the Speaker's team. Mr.
7 Speaker, you are gaining someone who is truly one of
8 the smartest and most hard-working and delightful and
9 decent people that I have ever had the opportunity to
10 work with, any fast-food workers, and car wash
11 [inaudible] and Lyft and Uber drivers, and tenants
12 protected from harassment and people who want a more
13 integrated City, and I are deeply, deeply grateful
14 for the years that we spent together. I'd be lying
15 if I said I was happy about it, but I am genuinely
16 thrilled for you and for the people of New York who
17 get to benefit from your work and an even strong--

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Sorry,
19 Brad.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I also want to
21 congratulate Council Member Williams on Intro. 863A
22 to expand the New York City Human Rights Law to
23 protect New Yorkers from discrimination based on
24 their reproductive health choices. I want to thank
25 Council Member Kallos for pushing forward Intro.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 80
2 1288A which I'm pleased to vote for, and with only a
3 certain amount of begrudging, I vote aye on all
4 orders on the General Calendar, and I request
5 permission to vote aye on all Land Use Call-ups?
6 Madam Public Advocate? I vote aye on those as well.
7 Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
13 Public Advocate. First, I want to thank the Speaker
14 on an amazing year and for his leadership and his
15 friendship, and I know that that really goes for
16 every member of the New York City Council. I'll
17 quote Ritchie Torres in saying, "If Corey had an
18 approval rating in the City Council, I suspect it'd
19 be nearly 100 percent." I think that that's
20 absolutely true. He has been so amazingly accessible
21 to Council Members, and sensitive to issues both big
22 and small, and we greatly appreciate everything you
23 do for us, Speaker. Thank you. Congratulations.
24 Madam Public Advocate, I think it needs to be noted
25 how much you have done for this Council and your

2 dedication to this Council. And you've been a member
3 of this body for over 15 years, and you have seen
4 this body grow as an institution, and you have had a
5 meaningful impact on its strength and all the
6 important issues that it has worked on over the last
7 15 years. You have been right there front and center,
8 and we're so grateful, and we're going to miss you
9 very dearly. And I can just say personally, as I
10 first met you I was a staff member. I was 24 years
11 old, and you always treated me with respect and
12 decency, and it was a pleasure to serve with you as a
13 neighbor in the Council and with you as Public
14 Advocate. I can say to all New Yorkers that you will
15 have an attorney general that is not only a very
16 decent person and a very honest, but a person with
17 utmost integrity-- utmost integrity-- and that is the
18 most important quality that you can have in an
19 attorney general, somebody that we can have absolute
20 confidence in, and I'm proud that you'll be serving
21 that role. And lastly, before I vote, I just want to
22 -- is I want to thank you. I also want to thank my
23 colleague Laurie Cumbo for sponsoring the renaming of
24 a street in the 33rd District in honor of Ken
25 Thompson--

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 82

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Yeah.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: our late District
5 Attorney in Brooklyn who did so much in his time as
6 District Attorney, and is gone far too soon. We send
7 our love to his family during this holiday season,
8 and we're very honored to be able to pass this small
9 token to the Thompson family today, and with that, I
10 vote aye on all. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:

14 Congratulations, Tish.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: My daughter
17 and my family love you a lot. And Speaker, thank you
18 for the great job, Jason, Chief of Staff, and the
19 whole team here. And I would like to refer briefly
20 about two important co-names among a few that we have
21 here. One is Carlos Cruk [sic] who was a Dominican
22 brother who-- I didn't get to meet him, but he played
23 a major role together with Malcolm X organizing,
24 spending his time fighting for social justice. And
25 Carlos Cruk from the Dominican Republic from San

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 83

2 Pedro Margaret [sic], and he played important role in
3 that movement. Also, today to we are naming San
4 Romero de las America after [inaudible] Romero [sic]
5 who was killed in El Salvador, one of the most
6 important leaders that we had in the 80s who inspired
7 many of us to be fighting since the 1980s for
8 immigrants and for social justice, and with that, I
9 vote aye.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
13 Public Advocate. Permission to briefly explain my
14 vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you so much.
17 I think he stepped out, but I do want to congratulate
18 Speaker Johnson and an extraordinary successful first
19 year, and I want to thank him personally for helping
20 to make this such a fulfilling and impactful year to
21 me, and he's back. You missed the nicest things any
22 Council Member has ever said about you, Mr. Speaker.
23 Trust me, they were great. And Madam Public--

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] You can
25 say it again.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 84

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: You want to--
3 replay the tape. Madam Public Advocate thank you for
4 inspiring me. Thank you for daring to make history.
5 I will miss you very, very much around this building,
6 but I will be swelling with pride as you ascend the
7 heights. Please don't be a stranger to your friends
8 here in the City Council. We will miss you. We need
9 you. And we celebrate you. And of course, I will be
10 for the last time telling you that I will be voting
11 aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I love you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to vote--
22 - I'm going to vote aye on all. And one of the
23 things I'm most proud of is now the seventh school in
24 the district, and this now totals over 3,000 seats
25 that will be coming to District 38, an incredible

2 feat and a testament to the work that we're doing on
3 the ground with parents who had been leading that
4 discussion and restabilizing the relationship with
5 the SCA, and that's going to help not just over-
6 crowded issues, over-crowding issues, but the sense
7 of power and empowerment of our moms in our district.
8 I want to say thank to Corey Johnson our Speaker, and
9 thank you for continuing to empower me in voice as
10 the Chair of Immigration. The work that we do
11 together is not only important, but it is felt on the
12 ground. All my colleagues, we got a lot of work to
13 do. We're going to do it together, and so I wish you
14 a feliz navidad and happy holidays for next year.
15 And then finally, I want to address our Public
16 Advocate. We're going to miss you. I met you the
17 first week that I came to New York when I was Coro
18 [sic] fellow. You were our first interview, and if
19 you could imagine the DNA that you restructured in my
20 body to fight was all because of you. That propelled
21 me into where I am today. That shows up in a lot of
22 different spaces where I challenge the institutions
23 that I'm a part of, that I'm not a part of, the Mayor
24 to the Governor, and even you, and I want to say
25 thank you for allowing me to continue to do that

2 work. And you will be the next attorney general of
3 the incredible state, and we will fight together, and
4 I hope that you can join-- we can join together in
5 that fight. We have laws-- we have a lot of work to
6 sue the hell out of Trump. We have a lot to sue the
7 Governor. We have a lot of work to sue the Mayor,
8 and I think when we find that moment of justice,
9 we're going to do that together, I have no doubt.
10 Thank you so much.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
14 explain, please?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Before I lose
17 this voice. So, I want to start by saying
18 congratulations once again to our next attorney
19 general, my good friend and colleague, my sister, and
20 who is absolutely not going anywhere if you know
21 Tish. You will see her. She will pop up everywhere
22 that you walk in the door, and here comes Tish. So
23 we're excited about the work that you're going to do,
24 the work that we'll continue to do together. I want
25 to take a moment to talk about Intro. 633. Today,

2 after three long years of tense legal battles and
3 negotiations, we have a made a break-through in our
4 ongoing efforts to combat systematic racism and
5 unconscious bias and how our City values is work done
6 by women and people of color within the civil service
7 core and its workforce. We will pass landmark pay
8 equity legislation, Introduction 633, that finally
9 lifts the curtain on the extreme disparities that
10 have limited the upward mobility and earning
11 potential of these dedicated workforce members who
12 toiled for generations only to see that there ascent
13 slowed by a deep-seeded culture of nepotism,
14 privilege, and sexism. For years the Administration
15 acted in a way that was contrary to its principles of
16 fairness and equity for all New Yorkers regardless of
17 gender, race, by resisting our efforts to obtain
18 demographic information that would effectively
19 eliminate pay discrimination. But we have pushed
20 hard for a bill that would enable through data
21 analysis necessary to fix these inequities and to
22 promote a genuinely merit-based civil service system.
23 for that, I want to thank Public Advocate, Attorney
24 General Tish James, Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo,
25 Speaker Corey Johnson for the courage to once again

2 bring this to the floor and see it to fruition,
3 President Gloria Middleton, and of course, my friend
4 and mentor Arthur chilliotis [sp?] as well as the
5 staff that have worked so hard to pass this
6 legislation that will make a difference in the lives
7 of women and folks of color who have unjustly been
8 passed for promotion and today will bring pay equity.
9 If you would indulge me, I'd just like to thank the
10 Civil Service staff, counsel, Malcolm, Kevin,
11 Elizabeth, and Kendall, from my staff, Brandon Clark
12 and the great Joe Goldblum [sp?]. and I'd just like
13 to leave by wishing everyone a happy and safe holiday
14 season, but also I am also losing a staff member
15 today who will be moving on to go to work in the
16 state, and that is Mr. Aksh Patel [sic] is going to
17 move forward, but I think that is what we're all
18 about here, cultivating that next generation of
19 leadership, and I am very proud of the work that we
20 have done together and look forward to working with
21 each and every one of you in the year 2019. Thank
22 you, Madam Public Advocate.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 89

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Love you Tish.

3 Love you Speaker. I vote aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all, and
7 congratulations, Tish.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to
11 explain my vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I won't be as
14 efficient as Moya, but I'll try. I just want to say
15 congratulations also to the Speaker for what is a
16 very successful year. I also want to congratulate
17 him, Eric Botcher [sp?] and the staff here for the
18 Garment District that's passing today which is
19 something they have worked on for a very long time.
20 So I want to say congrats to them. I want to say
21 also that we are doing a lot of street renamings,
22 Biggie and all them, and I know the one that is
23 really meaningful is the one for Adelaide today, and
24 I know Lynn Schulman is here, and that is such an
25 important thing to memorialize her, the work that she

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 90
2 did to Fortune Society, the work that she's done in
3 her community. I know that we'll be-- this is really--
4 - maybe not the one everybody knows as much, but the
5 one that's really going to be personal to this body.
6 So thank you for all those who participate in that.
7 And finally, Ms. Public Advocate, we're so proud of
8 you. I think you've heard it so I don't want to be
9 repetitive, but I know you probably want me to be
10 repetitive. We're really proud of you. You came
11 from this body. You keep on going up. Maybe
12 President is next. We don't know. But we are really
13 proud of the work you're doing and your partnership
14 and your leadership here. We'll miss you up there.
15 Corey Johnson will be the next Public Advocate, and
16 Corey Johnson, I want to say as the former Health
17 Chair, if you were a restaurant you'd get an A grade
18 on the front of it. We look forward to you being the
19 short term Public Advocate as well. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And Merry
22 Christmas.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
25 explain my vote?

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: First off, I
4 want to congratulate Tish who's been relentless, I
5 want to say, principled, more importantly and I think
6 that's an attribute that we need to keep in mind as
7 leaders and being conscious of our city and now
8 obviously our state. You've proven that you don't
9 have to change who you are to succeed, and I think
10 that that's the biggest lesson I think you taught
11 many in this body and people across the state and
12 country. You can be Tish. You don't have to all of
13 a sudden be called Letitia. You have to call me
14 Letitia. Tish is fine. My community really
15 appreciates you and thank you for being a source most
16 importantly of inspiration to women I know across the
17 state, but most importantly, I want to say to those
18 young women in our community of color who really look
19 up to you, and that was certainly present last week
20 at the party at the Giabrua [sp?] Club. I want to
21 thank the Speaker and congratulate him on a great
22 term so far. You know, when times of controversy
23 come up, and it's easy as the Speaker to sort of shy
24 away from things, and I want to thank Corey for his
25 leadership and standing with us when Ms. Hedley [sic]

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 92
2 was attacked, because he could have easily just
3 shrunk in that moment. And I know we had a private
4 meeting this week, and he was just as strong in that
5 meeting with both the Police Commissioner and the
6 head of HRA. That's what leadership is about, and I
7 want to truly thank you for standing with us, and I
8 know there were many of us, including me at one
9 point, who might have thought you were going to rule
10 with an iron fist, and that the battle days could
11 come back if we weren't with you, but you've proven a
12 lot of people wrong, and I want to congratulate you
13 on a good term. To Edwina, to Ashkar,
14 congratulations on moving forward in your next
15 endeavors. You've been great to work with, always
16 respectful, pleasant and smiling, and I want to thank
17 you for who you are and congratulate you. With that
18 being said, I vote aye on all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Tish, keep
22 slaying. I vote aye on all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic]

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 93

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You could pass. You
3 could pass if you want.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
5 explain my vote?

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
8 I'm just so grateful that my friend Adelaide
9 Connaughton is having a street named after her, the
10 Adelaide Connaughton Way was certainly something
11 special. She was an amazing woman. Left us-- she
12 left us way too soon. Not only a Queens's community
13 leader, but really a leader for the City on many
14 important issues. I will miss her. I'm also
15 delighted that a block of West 63rd street in my
16 district will be co-named Sesame Street. Sesame
17 Street serves children everywhere from every
18 background, and the truth is that they are
19 extraordinary on how they serve the entire-- yeah,
20 you look great. I get an extra second for that. You
21 know, Sesame Street serves over 150 million children
22 in 150 different countries, and it's consistently
23 been ahead of its time, promoting understanding and
24 kindness across social, cultural, and economic
25 barriers. Their most recent Muppet is Lily who is

2 homeless, and I heard from Lily the other day. She
3 is a remarkable little Muppet. So, Sesame has a
4 number-- Sesame has a number of other programs.
5 Their autism initiative fights stigma often
6 associated with autism for over 10 years. The Sesame
7 Street characters and content have helped families of
8 military families, helped children of military
9 families manage the obstacles of deployment,
10 relocation, injury and grief. The Sesame Street
11 workshop has conducted outreach and education with
12 millions of the world's most vulnerable children
13 including those displaced by the tragic conflict in
14 Syria and refugee populations both in the Middle East
15 and Bangladesh most recently with the Yemeni
16 community. So thank you, Sesame Street, for leading
17 by example and showing all of us that a better world
18 is possible through simple acts of kindness and
19 understanding. And congratulations to you, Speaker,
20 for your awesome first year. Really appreciate all
21 the support you've given to the Committee on Women.
22 Thank you. Oh, and I'd like-- oh, wait. And
23 congratulations to you, Madam Public Advocate--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 Thank you.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 95

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: for being a
3 leader for women throughout the country. We really
4 appreciate that.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I vote aye
7 on all. Yeah, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Permission to
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: First, I would
13 like to congratulate our Speaker on a productive
14 year, and I look forward to 2019, and I would like to
15 congratulate you, Madam Attorney General-elect. The
16 Bronx is proud of you. And I speak for all of my
17 NYCHA residents in my council district when I say
18 that you got it right by naming NYCHA the worst
19 landlord in the City of New York, and we will
20 continue-- I know we will continue to work hand-in-
21 hand to right that wrong. Happy holidays to all, and
22 I vote aye on all. Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 96

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Public Advocate,
6 I will never forget how in the pouring rain you came
7 down to Coney Island on the Boardwalk to support
8 myself, Councilman Deutsch and our group, a small
9 group of people that wanted to preserve the Boardwalk
10 at a time when the Mayor opposed us, and as always,
11 Tish James wins, and we thank you for always being
12 there and having our back on issues hyper-local,
13 citywide, statewide. We wish you much continued
14 success, Attorney General-elect. Mr. Speaker, I want
15 to say that I enjoy watching you on Good Day New
16 York, and I've seen you in action in the Budget Room
17 both here at City Hall and up in Albany with meetings
18 with the Governor. We would not have achieved as
19 Education Chair, we would not have achieved the
20 significant historic victories for our schools and
21 for all of our kids if not for your leadership. You
22 do not take no for an answer, and I am so proud to
23 call you my Speaker and a friend. I also just want to
24 very briefly mention that we're having a street co-
25 naming in my district after Woody Guthrie. That's

2 right Woody Guthrie, one of the most important,
3 influential musicians of the 20th century. His music
4 and lyrics reflected the country's deep struggles
5 with inequity and social justice raising awareness
6 about issues including, but not limited to, racism,
7 politics, warfare, economic inequality and labor
8 practices. He settled in Coney Island on Mermaid
9 Avenue in 1943 where he spent many years of his life,
10 and by the way, he is so connected to Coney Island
11 that his family spread his ashes into the water at
12 the beaches of Coney Island. And Bob Dylan once
13 referred to Woody Guthrie as the true voice of the
14 American Spirit. I ask for your support for this
15 legislation because I believe we have a
16 responsibility to ensure that current and future
17 residents of our city do not forget the legacy of
18 art, music and words as agents of change that Woody
19 Guthrie forged across this nation and right here in
20 Coney Island. It was in New York City where Woody
21 Guthrie wrote perhaps his most famous song, "This
22 Land is Your Land." Well, Woody, this block is your
23 block. And with that, I vote aye on all. Happy
24 holidays. Happy New Year. Thank you.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 98

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excellent. Thank
3 you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I would be remiss
9 if I did not congratulate Corey Johnson on one year
10 of being a fantastic Speaker of the Council. I'll be
11 at the Council Christmas party later, so that means
12 I'll be calling you around 2:00 a.m. to congratulate
13 you again. Expect a call. I'm just warning you now.

14 [laughter]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: You can laugh;
16 it'll happen. But you know, he treats the three and
17 a half Republicans here very well.

18 [laughter]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: We're still
20 waiting for Holden. I don't know what's going to
21 happen, but--

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Holden,
23 you--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [interposing] He's
25 in the Republican row, so.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Holden, you look good
3 in that seat.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: He looks good
5 here. I'm just saying. But we get treated better
6 than we should, I think, but anyway.

7 [laughter]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I also wanted to
9 share a story about Tish James. We have a Department
10 of Veterans' Services in this city now, a fully
11 dedicated agency that serves more than 200,000 men
12 and women who have served our country. We put MOVA,
13 the Mayor's Office of Veterans Affairs, on the ash
14 heap of history and for good reason. It was always
15 underfunded, never had the resources or the staff
16 that it needed to do outreach and provide services
17 and referrals for veterans and their family members.
18 We got rid of MOVA and we passed that bill, we did
19 it, my colleagues. But I have to tell you, I
20 believe-- and I want to say on the record-- that bill
21 would not have been passed and the Department of
22 Veteran Services would not exist today if it were not
23 for the strong and early support that we received
24 from Public Advocate Letitia James. She was out there
25 in the rain, in the cold, with the advocates, with

2 the veterans, with the people who care about
3 veterans, and we beat that drum all the way to the
4 floor of the City Council, and that bill was signed
5 into law by Mayor de Blasio shortly thereafter. So,
6 Tish, on behalf of all the veterans that you have
7 helped, in particular, I want to say thank you again.
8 Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: And I vote aye on
11 all, except Intro. 1288A in which I abstain. Thank
12 you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,
15 congratulations.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: God bless you
18 and your family. Take this next week, please shut
19 your phone off, enjoy the time, because you deserve
20 it. You earned it. You worked harder than anyone
21 we've ever seen before. From myself and my whole
22 family thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: To everyone, to
25 Corey, Speaker, our leader, Corey, thank you very

2 much for always standing with it-- empowering each
3 and every one of us and giving us the best year I
4 think we've ever had. So with that, I say aye on all
5 except for Land Use 259, which I say no. God bless
6 every one of you. Merry Christmas, happy holidays,
7 and a healthy, healthy New Year.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
10 briefly explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.
13 First of all, I vote aye on all, including on all
14 Land Use Call-ups. I, too, want to congratulate
15 Corey Johnson our Speaker on an amazing first year.
16 His support on big things and small including such a
17 thing called Amazon. On this day when we celebrate a
18 trailblazer and a woman who has accomplished so much,
19 I feel like I have to mention Gertrude McDonald [sp?]
20 and the street that we're honoring for her in our
21 beloved Sunnyside, Queens. A lot of folks don't
22 remember now, but Gertrude McDonald was the first
23 woman to receive a major party nomination for State
24 Assembly in the 1960s. We honored her in this
25 chamber when she was approaching 100, and she made

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 102

2 her 100th birthday, and she is a legend in Queens and
3 certainly in Sunnyside. And she often talked about
4 how difficult it was for a woman to run for office
5 when she ran for office in the 1960s and then
6 continued to be a civic leader for over half a
7 century. I also want to say to you, Madam Public
8 Advocate, I recall a meeting off-end that I believe
9 only you and I probably remember where there were a
10 lot of cultural leaders in a room under a previous
11 Speaker, and the meeting didn't go as we thought it
12 was going to go, but as you now ascend to this new
13 leadership position and the sky is truly the limit
14 for you, I think about that meeting, and how far
15 people go when people underestimate them. I know you
16 remember that, too. It's an important reminder of
17 your uncommon decency with respect to that moment, me
18 and my mother. So, I want to thank you and
19 congratulate you on your path and your journey.
20 Thank you very much.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
24 excused to explain my vote?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very
3 much. First, I want to align myself with the words
4 of Council Member Barron when speaking on MIH;
5 however, I'm going to be consistent and vote aye on
6 all and all Land Use Call-ups because of the Option
7 One, but my hope is that this body will look at MIH
8 again and correct the things that were wrong. I do
9 want to mention Intro. 863 which is called the New
10 York City Boss [sic] Bill. It actually expands now
11 beyond employers. The bill adds a sexual and
12 reproductive health decision to the Human Rights Law.
13 It is the largest expansion in the nation, locally.
14 I want to thank Council Member Eugene, the Speaker,
15 Council Member Cumbo, Council Member Rosenthal,
16 Rivera, Chin, the Women's Caucus, the Progressive
17 Caucus, all the sponsors, central staff, the Speaker,
18 Jason Goldman [sp?], Jeff Baker, Rachel Codera [sp?],
19 Habana Adjula [sp?], Planned Parenthood New York
20 City, even Catholic Charities who spoke to me with
21 their issues, and I'm glad we were able to get it
22 done, Mike Toomi [sp?], my former LD, Malik Wright
23 [sp?], my LD now, Administration and the Commission
24 on Human Rights. This is one of those things I
25 didn't realize wasn't already a law, but there were

2 some gaps in the state and federal law, and now I'm
3 happy that we're allowed to close those gaps now:
4 Coverage in wide-ranging from abortion and birth
5 control usage to in vitro fertilization, the HIV
6 testing, and counseling. I'm glad that this city is
7 going to be leading the nation in how to fight back
8 against Trump. Corey Johnson, I have been waiting
9 nine years to serve in a council that understood the
10 name to be a true co-equal branch of government and
11 push back when necessary on this Mayor. I'm very
12 proud to now say that I serve on that council. So
13 thank you for the past year. I did want to say I'm
14 glad that my bill is being passed on the same day as
15 Council Member Cumbo's pay equity bill. Public
16 Advocate Tish James, I can't say it, but you know
17 where I'm going, okay?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Don't say it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS:

20 Congratulations. You have made history. I have
21 served with you and seen you as a Public Advocate.
22 Your voice has been a part of almost all of the major
23 things that we've done here. I thank you for being
24 one of the core 34 that passed a construction site
25 safety. I know that the snow chains must have

2 brought you some good luck, and so I hope you can let
3 me hold them, or at least try on your shoes or
4 something, because I have some big dreams ahead.
5 Happy holidays to everyone, and thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm sorry, I
8 just wanted to say-- I wanted to shout out Mohammad
9 Ali Gina [sp?] being co-named. He's a founder of
10 modern [sic] Pakistan and is going to be the
11 beginning of Little Pakistan. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And how do you
13 vote?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all,
15 and-- aye on all and all Land Use Call-ups.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,
18 may I be excused to explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. I'm not
21 going to echo by word what everybody else has said,
22 but my feelings I made known earlier. With respect
23 to the street namings, clearly Council Member
24 Rosenthal has the best street co-naming on this
25 entire bill, but I wish to quickly mention my salute

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 106
2 to Council Member Richards for naming the-- co-naming
3 the street for Rabbi Rafael Palkovitz [sp?]. He was
4 a tremendous scholar in my community. He was a
5 personal Rabbi to members of my family and he was a
6 leader and a pioneer in Far Rockaway, and that was a-
7 - that is a wise choice and I salute you for doing
8 that. Madam President, I vote aye on all with the
9 exception of 1288 and Intro. 633 on which I vote no.
10 Thank you very much. Happy holidays to all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I just
14 want to start off by also thanking Speaker Corey
15 Johnson. You have done an amazing job at elevating
16 the issues that matter most to members, and for that,
17 I thank you. I also want to congratulate you for the
18 cover of City and State. Quite remarkable in your
19 first year. This is really phenomenal. I also want
20 to bring attention to individuals I didn't get a
21 chance to thank with Intro. 633A, our wage
22 transparency bill. I want to thank Laura Popa, Jeff
23 Baker, Teirsa Nasir [sp?], Rachel Cadera [sp?],
24 Gloria Middleton, Arthur Chilliotis [sp?], Beverly
25 Nufil [sp?], Amenta Killawon [sp?], Malcolm Butcheron

2 [sp?], Monica Abben [sp?], and Sebastian Levenson,
3 and all of the people that made this possible. I also
4 want to recognize the Biggie Smalls and Ken Thompson
5 Street co-namings. The Biggie Smalls co-naming was
6 quite a controversial one, but it's undeniable that
7 Biggie Smalls was perhaps the most internationally
8 renowned figure coming out of Brooklyn, New York, and
9 he has left his print on the boroughs of Brooklyn,
10 New York. It's undeniable that he is an ingredient in
11 the identity of Brooklyn, New York. And when you
12 think about Ken Thompson, our first District Attorney
13 ever elected from the borough that's of African-
14 American descent, these are two individuals that
15 lived a block away from one another, but yet have two
16 very distinctive stories, which is what Brooklyn is
17 made of. And to my love, Public Advocate, now
18 Attorney General-elect, I love you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Love you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: It has been an
21 exciting road. There's a song that reminds me of
22 you, "The Wind Beneath my Wings," and it says, "It
23 must have been cold there in my shadow to never have
24 sunlight in your face. You were content to let me
25 shine. That's your way. You always walked a step

2 behind." Well, I didn't exactly always walk a step
3 behind, and it wasn't actually always cold in your
4 shadow. It's been red-hot, fiery, controversial, the
5 greatest roller coaster ride that I have ever been
6 on, and you are the greatest, and we are so excited.
7 It's been an honor for you to be my predecessor, and
8 as you continue to rise, I continue to rise, and keep
9 warming up that seat for me. Thank you. And I vote
10 aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Love you. Love
12 your parents.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: OH, and I want to
14 thank them, too. I want to thank my parents for being
15 here.

16 [applause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And although
18 Prince is not here, I want to thank him as well,
19 because I didn't know how I was going to get through
20 this first year as the Majority Leader mom, but so
21 many of you have been so helpful, and I thank my
22 parents for helping me get through this year. It's
23 been an exciting ride, and Prince has informed so
24 much of the legislation that I have passed this year.
25 Thank you all so much.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all, and
5 if people want to celebrate our outgoing Public
6 Advocate and Attorney General-elect with the cake
7 that we got, hopefully there will be very few people
8 who speak during General Discussion so we can get out
9 of here. So, I vote aye on all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: As we wait for the
11 results, I just want to say-- I want to congratulate
12 the Speaker and his staff for an incredible year. I
13 want to congratulate President Middleton, who I guess
14 has left, and Arthur Chilliotis, and all the members
15 of CWA, and the Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, who's
16 an excellent friend, my dear sister, my little
17 sister, and my neighbor. I want to thank her for
18 this long trail to justice for women in New York
19 City. Thank you for honoring my neighbor Ken
20 Thompson who was a great District Attorney in the
21 borough of Brooklyn, and thank you for voting for my
22 bill today, my last bill here in the City Council,
23 which would expand organics collection in the City of
24 New York. It's been a bittersweet moment for me. For
25 the past 15 years, five years as Public Advocate and

2 10 years as the City Council representing the 35th
3 District. This beautiful storied room has been home
4 to so many memories for me. It's been the great
5 honor of my life to work here with you in the
6 People's Chamber doing the people's business.
7 Together in this room we fought for transparency and
8 accountability from our government. We have worked
9 every year to ensure that the old saying that a
10 budget is a moral document is more than just a
11 talking point. You guys have actually actualized it.
12 It's been great to work with this tremendous staff,
13 and I will always respect staff as a former staff
14 member. I know that we don't get anything done
15 without our staff, and so I truly honor them and
16 appreciate them and will always respect them. We
17 have passed laws that reflect the needs and values of
18 the people who trusted us to represent them, even
19 especially those New Yorkers traditionally excluded
20 from the halls of power. And even though today is my
21 last day sitting in this chair, presiding over this
22 body, it will always-- this will always be the place
23 where a girl from Brooklyn without rich friends-- I
24 was trying to do this without crying--

25 [applause]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: This girl from
3 Brooklyn without rich friends and without powerful
4 connections, she plowed through believing in her
5 convictions, and believing that-- believing in a
6 simple concept called justice and was given the
7 chance to serve as a dually elected in the voice of
8 the people. And so today I just say thank you and
9 just to remind all of you the most vulnerable amongst
10 us, the poor, the residents of NYCHA who are
11 suffering, seniors, children, veterans, all of those
12 who are excluded, they speak through us. Continue to
13 speak for them. Thank you so much, and God bless
14 you.

15 [applause]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Please join us in
17 the committee room for cake. Cake Man Raven [sic],
18 it's the best cake in the City of New York.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on
20 today's General Order Calendar--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Prove
22 me wrong.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: were adopted by a
24 vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0 and 0 abstentions,
25 with the exception of Land Use 270 and 271 which was

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 112
2 adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1
3 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro. 1288A which
4 was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 6
5 negative and 3 abstentions, and Intro. 863A which was
6 adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 2
7 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro. 748A which
8 was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1
9 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Land Use 259
10 Resolution 704 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in
11 the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions, and
12 Intro. 633A which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
13 affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions, and the
14 revised Land Use Call-up vote is 48 in the
15 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Introduction and
16 reading of bills?

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
18 referred to Committee as indicated on the agenda.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of
20 Resolutions, the Resolution 566-- quiet in the
21 chambers, please. We are still in session.
22 Resolution calling on the state legislature to pass
23 and the Governor to sign A10935A and S8844A which
24 would amend the education law to automatically enroll
25 optional employees in the New York City Board of

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 113

2 Education Retirement System, BERS, after 90 days of
3 employment unless the employee affirmatively opts in
4 or out of the program in advance. Any discussion?
5 All of those in favor say aye.

6 COUNCIL AS A WHOLE: Aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
8 opposed? Any abstention? The ayes have it. Now
9 General Discussion, and the only speaker is Council
10 Member Rivera.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Alright, so
12 there's a resolution--

13 [off mic comments]

14 [laughter]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: [inaudible] Give
16 me one second. I just want to clear my throat. So,
17 I'm introducing a resolution today to ask Congress to
18 pass the Count Victims Act, which is to help speed up
19 access to benefits for disaster victims and aid in
20 agency and nonprofit coordination during and after
21 disasters. I say this because many of you know I'm a
22 proud Puerto Rican woman-- woman-- and there are
23 still people in Puerto Rico who are suffering. The
24 President still will not admit how many people have
25 died on that island, 2,975. So I ask you to join me

2 in supporting this resolution, and to everyone who
3 has helped me around issues on Puerto Rico, Land Use,
4 Zoning, Women's Issues-- a special thank you to Corey
5 Johnson, Jason Goldman-- he's been alright-- and to
6 everyone here thank you for making my first year
7 really, really special. I'm really proud of this
8 body. Happy holidays. Let them eat cake.

9 [applause]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.

11 And now closing remarks from our Speaker Corey
12 Johnson.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: This meeting of
14 December 20th, 2018, the last Stated Meeting of the
15 New York City Council in this first year of the new
16 session is hereby adjourned, and would everyone
17 please join us in the member's lounge celebrating our
18 Public Advocate Letitia James. As they said, let her
19 eat cake.

20 [gavel]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank
22 you guys. Thank you so much. Thank you.

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 21, 2019