1	COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1
2	CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK
3	
4	X
5	TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES
6	Of the
7	COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION
8	December 12, 2018 Start: 1:02 p.m.
9	Recess: 2:21 p.m.
10	HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16 th Fl.
11	B E F O R E: BARRY S. GRODENCHIK Chairperson
12	
13	COUNCIL MEMBERS: JOSEPH C. BORELLI
14	JUSTIN L. BRANNAN ANDREW COHEN
15	COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES MARK GJONAJ
16	ANDY L. KING PETER A. KOO
17	FRANCISCO P. MOYA
	ERIC A. ULRICH JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

1	COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 2
2	APPEARANCES (CONTINUED)
3	Emily Chase
4	Assistant Commissioner for Public Programs at the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation
5	Matt Drury
6	Director of Government Relations at the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation
7	Adena Long
8	Deputy Commissioner for Urban Park Service and Public Programs at the New York City Department
9	Of Parks and Recreation
10	Emily Walker Director of Outreach and Programs at New Yorkers
11	For Parks
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

14

13

15

16

17

18

1920

21

2.2

23

24

25

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: We are about to start the December hearing for the Parks Committee. If you would like to testify please see the Sergeant at Arms and fill out one of these slips. So far, we have three people from the Parks Department and Emily Walker from New Yorkers for Parks and... which make for a very quick hearing. I am told that we are ready to go, thank you Sergeant at Arms so... good afternoon everybody. My name is Barry Grodenchik, I have the honor of serving as the Chair of the Committee on Parks and Recreation for this term of the New York City Council and today's hearing which are joined up by my colleague Peter Koo representing the great Village of Flushing where I grew up although not quite in his district. We're going to examine the overall state of the Parks Department's recreation centers when it comes to maintenance, programmatic offerings and accessibility. The Parks Department has operated recreation centers since the turn of the 20th century so almost 120 years now. They are a hallmark of the progressive history of this city and its efforts to provide opportunities, recreational opportunities especially for all of its residents.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Today the Parks Department operates 36 of these centers throughout the five boroughs. Recreation centers offer services ranging from indoor pools and weight rooms to basketball courts, dance studios, boxing rings, art studios, game rooms, after school programs and the odd library here and there and as a native New Yorker I can attest to the positive influence that recreation centers have in our city. I spent a lot of winters at night at the Pomonok center which was a NYCHA center but literally attached at the hip to a New York City park, Pomonok Playground. The city has long realized the value of promoting physical activity to encourage healthy living among all groups of New Yorkers. The Shape Up New York City program for instance offers a multitude of fitness programs at numerous recreation centers, parks and other facilities that's why the city should take every reasonable step it can to encourage more participation in physical activity and other types of recreation. recreation centers are one of the major vehicles at the city's disposal for fulfilling that goal and unlike many other amenities offered by the park systems... park system. Recreation centers are open year-round during inclement weather or the

winter months they offer consistent opportunities for
social interaction and recreation to many New Yorkers
who otherwise could be isolated. It is therefore
crucial that the city do all it can to promote its
recreation centers and ensure that they are well
staffed and maintained so that more New Yorkers can
make use of them. In 2916, the Council passed Local
Law 18 to address concerns about high fees and
declining attendance and membership rates. It created
discounted membership tiers and fees for use under
18, seniors, disabled persons and veterans; these
changes, changes resulted in an almost immediate
uptick in attendance. This was a stark contrast from
the 2011 plan that essentially doubled the admission
fees at recreation centers in order to help close a
2.4-billion-dollar budget gap. The adopted plan
consisted of adults paying 150 dollars, double from
the 75 dollars that they had been paying for centers
with pools and 100 dollars, up from 50 for centers
without pools and seniors paying 25 up from ten,
children 18 and under have continued to receive free
admission. These increased fees resulted in a drop in
total attendance of about 65,000 visits from the
fiscal year 2011 to fiscal year 2012. By 2013.

2	recreation center membership had started to rebound
3	and by from 2014 to 2016 membership has increased
4	steadily, however the most recent numbers indicate
5	that membership and attendance numbers fell from
6	fiscal year 2016 to this current fiscal year. For
7	example, attendance fell from 3.6 million in 2016 to
8	about 3.4 million in 2017 down to 3.2 million in
9	2018, while membership fell from 162,000 in 2016 to
. 0	161,000 in 2017 down to 154,000 in this year. I want
.1	to explore why there seems to have been a reversal of
.2	a recent trend, what that implies for the rest of our
.3	recreation centers and whether the decline is due to
. 4	structural issues that we have to keep our eyes on.
.5	Additionally, I want to use this hearing as a step to
. 6	be ensuring that our recreation centers have the
.7	resources, they need to maintain their levels of
. 8	service and are able to grow in the long time long
. 9	term. So many New Yorkers rely on parks and
20	recreation services centers for services and
21	programs that they offer so we have to do everything
22	that we can to maintain a dynamic recreational
23	environment for current and future generations of New
24	Yorkers. I look forward to examining this issue in
25	greater depth today and I would at this time welcome

for Public Programs at the New York City Department
of Parks and Recreation. I'm joined by Adena Long,
our Deputy Commissioner for Urban Park Service and
Public Programs and Matt Drury, Director of
Government Relations. Thank you for inviting us to
testify today regarding the Parks Department's
recreation centers. We think it would be helpful to
first provide some broader context about the
recreational and programming aspects of our agency's
mission. The recreation unit at NYC Parks falls under
the umbrella of the Public Programs Division, which
is also comprised of aquatics, media education,
puppetry, and education and wildlife including the
Urban Park Rangers. Recreation's mission is to enable
all New Yorkers to lead physically active and
intellectually stimulating lives through sports,
fitness, outdoor adventure, technology, education and
the arts. The division's full-time head count is
approximately 500 staff, including managerial and
programming staff as well as those that provide
technical support and general maintenance. Citywide,
we have 36 recreation centers which are overseen by
Recreation. This includes our newest building, the
Ocean Breeze Athletic Complex, which is an 135,000

square foot indoor track facility that hosted over
175,000 athletes at 86 competitions in 2018. The
remaining 35 centers are older facilities, the oldest
having been built in 1900. Being that, that the
average age of our centers is 66 years, our centers
offer a diverse range in both form and function; 21
have gyms, 12 have indoor pools and 12 feature
outdoor pools. Our recreation centers far exceed
neighboring commercial fitness facilities in terms of
character, culture and community. They boast pools,
gyms, multipurpose rooms, fitness rooms, media labs,
indoor tracks, cardio rooms and classrooms, providing
an inclusive atmosphere not often found at a typical
fitness center. At NYC Parks, we seek to provide
lifelong holistic enrichment, nurturing New Yorkers
of all ages and abilities. We offer a wide variety of
programming, from instructional sports to competitive
leagues, yoga to swimming, rooftop stargazing to
painting, pickle ball to double Dutch, chair aerobics
to Zumba, concerts to lectures, roller skating to
advanced adobe design software certification training
and many more opportunities for engagement.
Additionally, we provide youth of NYC an opportunity
to learn, grow, and develop skills and interests

through programs like swim teams, after school,
summer camp, and adaptive recreation for people with
disabilities. Creating these types of life changing,
soul enriching opportunities is our focus, and it is
what we do best. We further expand our ability to
make these opportunities available to all by working
with partner organizations to provide specialty
programming for New Yorkers, collaborating with
groups such as the Art Students League of New York,
the Public Theater, the Jazz Foundation of America,
America, Jeter's Leaders, the New York Red Bulls,
Madison Square Garden and the New York Jets. As
previously mentioned, we also offer opportunities for
New Yorkers to enrich their interest and skills in
media and technology, which is so important in this
modern society and economy. The media education unit
of public programs provides high quality digital
resources and creative learning opportunities in 33
media labs within recreation centers, including
certification programs for Microsoft office, video
edit, editing and storytelling, photography, and
STEAM aligned classes offering 3D imaging and
robotics. Within the walls of our recreation centers
so far this calendar year, we have offered over 3,250

individual programs, totaling over 500,000 hours of
programming, to approximately 150,000 recreation
center members. In addition to programs, our
recreation center members have access to over 1,350
pieces of fitness equipment that provide exercise and
wellness opportunities in countless combinations. But
at NYC Parks, we don't let brick and mortar limit our
ability to provide programming, and we have a
plethora of offerings for all audiences throughout
the city well beyond the confines of our recreation
centers. Our mobile recreation programs, including
the Play Mobile and Fitness Mobile, allow us the
ability to visit various community events from April
through October and bring these recreational
opportunities directly to New Yorkers, reaching over
25,000 people each season. One of our most popular
mobile movie programs is the Movies Under the Stars
program. This annual summer movie series, hosted in
partnership with the Mayor's Office of Media and
Entertainment, grants us the opportunity to bring
unique and colorful programming to over 50,000 New
Yorkers, right in their local neighborhood park. By
partnering with private organizations, we have been
able to offer New Verkers the chance to take part in

our Arts, Culture and Fun program series throughout
the five boroughs, including tango classes in
Washington Square Park, jazz concerts in Harlem and
taikoza drumming performances in Queens. We also
offer outdoor programming in our parks that is
specifically tailored to youth, through our Kids in
Motion and Summer Sports Experience programs. Kids in
Motion engages children in active, outdoor play at
101 sites citywide, and had over 473,000 visits this
calendar year. Similarly, similarly, the Summer
Sports Experience program teaches sports skills;
capturing an audience of young athletic enthusiasts
who are interested in further developing their
skills; that program saw over 34,00 visits this year.
Another successful program for children, the
Puppeteers program, has a home stage in the Swedish
Cottage in Central Park and offers free, mobile
puppet performances and puppet making workshops
citywide. Though youth programming is a priority for
NYC Parks, we know that recreational opportunities
are just as important for adults and seniors. Our
signature fitness and wellness program that targets
adults and seniors is the Shape Up NYC program.
Leveraging financial support from Empire BlueCross

BlueShield and private donors, Shape Up NYC provides
free fitness programming in our parks, recreation
centers and beyond, in locations all throughout the
city. Since the program began in 2003, it has
received over one million visits, which is an
incredible success. This program also features a
train the trainer component; where members of the
public have the ability to become trained fitness
instructors. As part of a larger, agency wide effort
to better activate our outdoor pools, this past
summer, NYC Parks successfully implemented a new
pilot initiative known as Cool Pools. Colorful
design, art, furniture, and programming were used to
reimagine and renovate five pilot outdoor pools
citywide. By investing time and resources in these
aging sites, we transformed traditional pool spaces
into fun, vibrant, and energized spaces offering more
than just swimming. Various aquatics and Shape Up NYC
classes, wildlife and arts education, mobile movies
and other pop up programs were all part of the menu
of activities available at these sites and we look
forward to continuing to reactivate and reenergize
our pools in the years to come. As you can hear, our
recreation unit prides itself on offering a wide

variety of programming to people of all ages,
abilities and interests. For that to be possible, we
need to sustain our recreation facilities, ensuring
that they are in the best condition possible.
Therefore, the agency monitors this with specific,
regular processes and benchmarks. To continually
monitor the state of our recreation centers, Parks
utilizes the agency's asset management park system to
store and analyze maintenance and operational
information about routine upkeep, upkeep and repairs.
Our recreation centers are also inspected twice a
year for safety, cleanliness, and structural
condition via the recreation evaluation and center
assessment program, administered by the agency's
Operations and Management Planning division. In
addition to dedicated maintenance staff, our
playground associates can both facilitate programming
as well as perform light maintenance. Many Council
Members are familiar with the great services provided
by our playground associates, as we have been able to
hire up to an additional 140 seasonal employees,
thanks to discretionary Council Member funding. To
help improve the physical condition of our centers,
we routinely focus on quick wins, small but impactful

improvements implemented to improve the quality of
our recreation centers and to enhance the experience
of our members. Projects have included targeted
facility improvements, improvements to a specific
room in a center, or new equipment purchases. This
approach allows agency leadership to prioritize our
needs and inform decisions making towards future
investments. Beyond the everyday maintenance
conducted by our staff, many of our recreation
centers have received millions of dollars in capital
investment during the current administration to
address structural and mechanical deficiencies,
upgrade fire alarms, and bring buildings up to a
state of good repair. In order to properly assess all
of our building's needs, a capital team of engineers
and technical staff is performing a thorough
assessment of each center one by one capturing and
reporting their findings through a mobile application
created specifically for this purpose. Hamilton Fish
in Manhattan, our oldest recreation center, is the
first one to be assessed. Though the needs of many of
these centers are significant, we are putting the
tools in place to properly prioritize and plan for
the future, so they can remain robust and vital

amenities for the communities they serve. Though
there is much more work needed to be done, the agency
has consistently invested in its recreation centers.
In fiscal year 2015, Parks received 39.5 million
dollars in mayoral funding to address priority
recreation center reconstruction and renovations.
Utilizing these funds, seven capital projects are now
underway at six facilities, including two large
scale, over 20 million, renovations to Brownsville
and Hansborough Recreation Centers. As recently as
the last fiscal year, FY '18, Parks received an
additional 78 million to address priority concerns
within the recreation centers, of which 34 million
has been committed to facility projects citywide,
including 7.1 million to upgrade or reconstruct
safety measures, such as fire alarm systems. These
investments to our facilities are important to ensure
safe and welcoming facilities for our members. NYC
Parks Recreation Centers are membership-based
facilities. Anyone can become a member by submitting
a complete membership registration form, the
appropriate membership payment, and a government
issued ID at any one of our 36 recreation centers
citywide Annual membershin fees for adults ages 25

through 61 is 150 dollars for access to centers with
indoor pools or 100, 100 dollars for access to
centers without pools. Annual memberships for seniors
ages 62 and up, veterans, people with disabilities,
and young adults are discounted and only cost 25
dollars and annual memberships for youth under age 18
are free. Additionally, New Yorkers ages 25 to 61 car
receive a 10 percent discount for all adult
memberships if they have an IDNYC card. The latest,
latest Mayor's Management Report noted a drop in both
attendance and memberships for our recreation
centers. We believe there are a few contributing
factors for those changes. Firstly, attendance
tracking includes all visitors to our facilities,
including those who are simply seeking access to
bathrooms or other amenities, without a membership.
The agency has now begun enforcing our membership
policy, which allows for only members to make use of
the facility, more strictly at our recreation
centers, for the safety of all of our patrons.
Implementing this policy helped make our centers more
secure and enjoyable for our members, by helping us
to better control access and allowing us to more
accurately record usage in our facilities, but it

clearly had an effect on attendance figures relative
to past years. Second, as we strive towards upgrading
our buildings and services, we are phasing out the
use of our near 20-year-old membership tracking
system, RecWare. While it has been useful for much of
its time, its limitations that have led to
discrepancies it has limitations that have led to
discrepancies in attendance counts in recent years.
We are working to identify a new software vendor
through the city's procurement process and look
forward to being, being able to implement new
membership software in the near future. This new
system will have much more flexibility and
functionality with regard to data capture, storage
and analysis and will be fully integrated with the
Parks website. Additionally, many of our recreation
centers gain access to the internet through the
city's wireless network, NYCWiN. We do occasionally
encounter connectivity outages and gaps, which can
impact our ability to process memberships or track
member and visitor data. We are currently assessing
our connectivity needs at each site and tailoring
specific data solutions where possible in each site.
Lastly, success sometimes breeds new challenges.

While everyone can appreciate the upgrades to our
recreation facilities being delivered through Quick
Wins and major capital projects, these projects are
disruptive and inevitably lead to restricted access
or closures for a given amount of time. We always
seek to redirect members and, and programming to
alternative sites when a planned closure takes place,
but at times, we cannot predict service disruptions.
For example, emergency repair work to Roy Wilkins
Pool in 2017 required several months to address, but
given the sudden nature of the work required, the
center unfortunately lost one of its main attractions
and center attendance suffered as a result. Though
they do result in a short-term loss in attendance,
these closures for repairs are obviously necessary
and helpful in the long term, to keep these
facilities in working order. In closing, we would
like to reiterate the positive impact that, not only
our recreation centers, but our entire recreation
unit has made across the five boroughs. We strive to
bring free and low cost, accessible programming to
all New Yorkers. While these photos have given you a
taste of some of our offerings, you each have a
standing offer to join us at any of our recreation

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 centers or outdoor programs. Thank you for this opportunity to share our work with you as we serve 3 New Yorkers focusing on fun, health and happiness. We 4 appreciate your continued advocacy and support. We 5 will now be happy to answer any questions you might 6 have. CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Thank you very 8 much for your testimony, do any of my colleagues have 9 any questions before I get into this? Uh-oh I 10 11 shouldn't have asked, Mr. Koo go ahead. No, you go 12 first because I'm going to be here till the end, but 13 I know people have other places to go at times. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Mr. Chair ... 15 [cross-talk] 16 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Even though... 17 even though we all agree there's nothing more 18 exciting... [cross-talk] COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah... [cross-talk] 19 20 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...than a Parks and Recreation hearing so... I just want to put that 21 2.2 out there. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, yeah. First, I want to thank Department of Parks for 24

extending the swimming pool, the Flushing Corona Park

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

for another six months for those groups, I just received confirmation from the Department and forgive me I don't know why... what was the reason that you want to move that out in, in the first... in the beginning?

MATT DRURY: Sure, so I... so we can briefly address that. So, at the Flushing, Meadows Corona Park aquatic center was previously operated... previous to 2014 was operated by a concession era, essentially as a concession, in 2014 the agency reclaimed operations... central operations so as such there were... are some preexisting fee for service programs that run counter to the, the agencies general mission of offering sort of free programming, a lot of the programs and their wonderful organizations that offer them but the notion that they're fee for service and the fees are actually quiet considerable in many... in many instances its rather duplicative of swim instruction, swim team program, a lot of those sort of offerings that are already offered by the agency directly at the aquatic center so as such in the long term we don't believe that fee for service, you know programs of that nature have... are... we don't believe that that's really

the best place for them to take place. Having said that, we understand that, you know we want them to be able to find, you know alternate locations and things like that which is why we were proud to... happy to offer the extension for six months so that we can work out longer term solutions.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, after six months can you duplicate the services these groups provide?

MATT DRURY: We believe so, absolutely...

[cross-talk]

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

MATT DRURY: ...you know I... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And you... and you will provide it for free?

MATT DRURY: Yes, absolutely. So, our swim team programming, our, our swim instruction programming are, are free, you know like we understand these organizations may want to have continuing conversations, we're, we're open to that obviously but in the long term, you know that, that status quo though we were happy to kind of, you know indulge it for some period of time in the long term is, is untenable.

2.2

another thing I want to ask you about, ping pong, right, ping pong is a very inexpensive like program and, and it's not only very popular in Asian countries its actually very popular in, in Europe... in European countries... in European countries so I want to know like how many facilities that you guys have, have ping pong tables or do they... or do they... very few or a lot of them have it?

EMILY CHASE: We love table tennis...

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

EMILY CHASE: We offer table tennis or ping pong at many of our facilities including Sunset Park, Chelsea recreation center, it's a very, very popular activity.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah because the reason I ask that because... the reason is a lot of people in my community which is like Flushing area they all come to ask me, you know they want to find a facilities to play ping pong especially for senior citizens and, and I mean some of the senior centers they provide one table to two tables but we want to find a good facility that they have like five tables or... that a lot of people can play and enjoy together

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 so I think that is a very inexpensive capital 3 improvement, it like cost almost nothing just buy a table, a few hundred dollars and they will bring 4 their own paddles and balls and, and don't under... 5 6 don't underestimate the, the game of ping pong, it's 7 really good, it has been proved to cut down Alzheimer disease and will cut down... not, not eliminate but 8 decrease, right, yeah because your coordination all 9 the time, yeah. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I think you have 12 unanimous consent among the members here for ping 13 pong. I, I would ask maybe on behalf of Councilman 14 Koo, I know he has the Al Oerter Center in his 15 district so that's the closest that I know of in 16 Flushing... [cross-talk] 17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: The one near Home 18 Depot, right? CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Yeah, so maybe 19 20 we can look at ping pong there... COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah... 21 2.2 MATT DRURY: Үер... EMILY CHASE: We do offer... we do offer 23

ping pong or table tennis at Al Oerter and we also

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 work to have tournaments cross boroughs, so we can... 3 [cross-talk] COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah... [cross-talk] 4 5 EMILY CHASE: ...look at perhaps involving the community at Al Oerter in a tournament where they 6 7 can compete against another borough. COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, the last 8 thing... [cross-talk] 9 10 EMILY CHASE: We appreciate the suggestion... [cross-talk] 11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: ...I want to ask is 12 13 just like providing Wi-Fi hotspots in parks is really 14 important, now do we... do we have like hotspots in 15 parks that you can identify and tell people hey, you 16 know I mean its hard to provide Wi-Fi for the whole 17 parks so... but certain parts... certain parts of the ... 18 you provide a bench and then just say this is a hotspot bench so people who need to use Wi-Fi can sit 19 20 down there and, and do whatever they want to do. 21 MATT DRURY: Yeah... no, I... internet 2.2 connectivity is becoming like a, a very valuable 23 amenity that people, you know sort of seek and so I ... and there certainly is Wi-Fi available at many of our 24

park properties and, and I'd have to ... we'll have to

1	COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION
2	get more information about how the signage works or
3	when, what that's when that's available but, but
4	yeah, we, we agree, you know the flip side of course
5	is that sometimes people try to get away from
6	electronic devices and our, our less interested but
7	obviously natural areas… [cross-talk]
8	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah but sometimes
9	[cross-talk]
LO	MATT DRURY:things of that nature but
L1	where appropriate, yeah, I think that's something we
L2	we, we are always looking to, to address.
L3	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, I think
L4	your department is one of the greatest among all the
L5	[cross-talk]
L6	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I agree… [cross-
L7	talk]
L8	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO:agencies.
L9	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Don't, don't be
20	too nice to them, I mean and ask probing [cross-
21	talk]
22	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: It's like you, you
23	[cross-talk]
24	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK:questions
25	[cross-talk]

2	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO:provide a good
3	service, right and a day in the park is much cheaper
4	than a day in the hospital.
5	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: That's for sure
6	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Right, thank you Mr.
7	Chair… [cross-talk]
8	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Thank you thank
9	you Council Member Koo as always. I got a couple of
10	questions here more than a couple. You gave us the
11	total budget… or can, can you give me the total
12	budget for this part of the Department of Parks and
13	Recreation?
14	EMILY CHASE: Our budget is approximately
15	30 million for staffing and 2.7 million for OTPS that
16	includes recreation, media education and aquatics.
17	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Does that
18	include nights of movies and all that, does that in
19	encapsulates everything, no, maybe, yes?
20	MATT DRURY: That's, that's sort of
21	baseline agency funding, that wouldn't [cross-talk]
22	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay [cross-

24

23

talk]

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 MATT DRURY: ...include the significant 3 discretionary funding that's, that's provided through the… [cross-talk] 4 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: So, those 5 movies... [cross-talk] 6 7 MATT DRURY: ...generosity... [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...those movie 8 9 nights you're talking about are funded by people like 10 us? 11 MATT DRURY: Many are funded through the 12 agencies so some... [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay... [cross-13 14 talk] 15 MATT DRURY: ...of that is included but 16 its, its... [cross-talk] 17 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: That's what I 18 thought... [cross-talk] 19 MATT DRURY: Yes, we're at... added value 20 we're able to have ... to expand and, and you know ... 21 [cross-talk] 2.2 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay... [cross-23 talk]

2.2

MATT DRURY: ...sort of augment those, those investments as well thanks to the support of the council.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay and I know in the past there were layoffs or maybe people weren't hired back due to budget cuts, have we gotten back to where we were prior to the difficulties that we had?

MATT DRURY: Head count in general has essentially regained... is, is now essentially at par with its, its previous peaks, I think following in the early 2000's there were... yeah, there were some significant dips in cuts, but the agency generally speaking at large has, has regained those, those, those positions back.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. And you had member... mentioned in your testimony that one of the reasons that attendance is down is because there's a stricter enforcement policy now so that we obviously... our rec centers are enclosed places and we want to make sure that the public can recreate safely so you've been... you have been using a stricter enforcement policy in terms of if, if you're not a member you're not coming in are there any other

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

reasons that, that you have identified that there is a decline and if... and is there one set of people; younger people, older people, you know people with a disability, veterans or any discernable patterns there?

EMILY CHASE: Well membership and attendance has declined, we do currently have 150,000 members and we had over three million visits to our centers in FY '18, a couple of notable things that we think are contributing factors in terms of attendance and membership as I said we are phasing out the use of our nearly 20 year old membership tracking system, RecWare, it has its limitations, its led to discrepancies of attendance counts in recent years so we're working to identify a new software vendor through the city's procurement process and look forward to be able... being able to implement new membership software in the near future and, and we are hopeful that this new system will have much more flexibility and functionality which will allow us to better track the members and attendees.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Can you give us a little… just a little bit about how that software was… I mean its 20 years old so, I mean I'm almost 59

2.1

2.2

now you got me worried so maybe things don't work so well as they get older, but can you give us a limit... an idea of the limitations? I assume that this software has been augmented from time to time over 20 years, but I guess now it's just reached the end of its usefulness.

EMILY CHASE: Yeah and there are certain features that are a bit cumbersome so for instance we had identified a button that was essentially allowing us to track visitors that entered the facility for a large event. So, say you have a, a huge track and field meet or a basketball tournament and you have large numbers of people flowing into the facility, you could hit a multiple of ten rather than hitting one and that function... functionality was not clear so we had to adjust that in, in. When, when we identified that some of our staffers used that incorrectly we had to make an adjustment, its, its... the, the system in short is cumbersome and difficult to use.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Time to move on, is that what you're saying? Would you say... you know one the things that I learned I've learned as Parks Chair of almost a year now is that parks are much

stronger as a sum of many, many different pieces and
we could go on and on and there are probably dozens
and dozens of different things that people come to a
park for whether it's, you know a big park like
Central Park or Cunningham Park in Alley Pond in my
district or the Corner playground, you know that dots
most of New York City so it's fair to say that
recreation centers are kind of like for some people
what a bocce court would be or a tennis court because
even though they offer a wide variety of services,
some people that visit rec centers may not go to
another park facility, do you find that to be true?

EMILY CHASE: Yes, these are most certainly community hubs, people come to socialize, to relax, to take a break, to get out of their homes, we welcome passive recreation especially for our seniors in our recreation centers, these are... these are home, homes away from home for a lot of New Yorkers.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I would... I... yes, the, the, the ones I've seen... I was especially intrigued of the one at Thomas Jefferson Park which is just busy, and it had bumper pool which I haven't seen since I was about eight years old, so it's been

a while. We have noted in, in my question list a
number of centers that are currently closed for
maintenance or construction issues including Herbert
Von King Center in Brooklyn, the Saint John's
Recreation Center in Brooklyn as well, the Tony
Dapolito Center in Manhattan and the Sorrentino
Center in Queens as well as you kind of mentioned in
your testimony Roy Wilkins Park, can we talk about
the status updates on, on when we might expect to see
these open again?

EMILY CHASE: Absolutely, first of all we look to avoid all types of closures for our recreation centers when repair is needed in order to cause the least amount of disruption to our members so our member access to our centers is of the utmost importance and, and just to make the distinction not all of the ones you mentioned are fully closed, I can... I can go through that now; Von King Center in Brooklyn is closed doing... due to an ongoing capital project to renovations to a multipurpose performance space and we're... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: The whole center... [cross-talk]

EMILY CHASE: ...our... [cross-talk]

2.2

1	COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION
2	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK:is closed?
3	EMILY CHASE: The whole center is
4	[cross-talk]
5	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay [cross-
6	talk]
7	EMILY CHASE:closed and our parks
8	capital division is anticipating completion in winter
9	or spring of 2019. At Saint John's Recreation Center
LO	in Brooklyn, the facility is closed doing due to an
L1	ongoing capital project, the HVAC and we are
L2	anticipating completion in winter of 2019. Tony
L3	Dapolito is… [cross-talk]
L4	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Does that mean
L5	this coming winter or next [cross-talk]
L6	EMILY CHASE: Yes, yeah in a in just a
L7	couple months we hope [cross-talk]
L8	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. Okay, I
L 9	just wanted to make sure we're on the same page.
20	EMILY CHASE: Absolutely. Tony Dapolito
21	Recreation Center in Manhattan is open, it was just
22	closed very briefly… [cross-talk]
23	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay [cross-
ЭΔ	talkl

2 EMILY CHASE: ...due to emergency boiler 3 work.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: We're making progress, good.

EMILY CHASE: And Sorrentino Recreation

Center in Queens, it's not completely closed at all

but because of ongoing capital work certain portions

of the facility have been closed at various times.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: And the Roy
Wilkins is it just the pool at Roy, it's the one that
I'm really familiar with, they have a great pool
there, they have a small weight lifting area, they
have a large gymnasium... [cross-talk]

EMILY CHASE: So, this facility... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...and other stuff... [cross-talk]

been undergoing capital improvements since March of 2018 and their experiencing a number of upgrades; a new roof over the gym being one of them and so some programming spaces and areas of the building are... need to be closed to complete that work.

2.2

2.2

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, it's an old building I know it, it was a military facility before it was the park.

EMILY CHASE: And just to add we do update the website when there are specific closures to spaces within the facility or if the entire facility requires closure, so we lean on our website to get information out to our constituents.

back to membership a little. We noted earlier in, in my opening statement a decline after the, the fee increase in 2011, are you seeing other reasons, are you... have you... you know its... these, these centers are obviously extremely important to the city, over three million visitors which is an awful lot of people and, and 150,000 regulars so the, the question that I have are we seeing competition from, you know private services or is there anything that we could be doing to enhance the experience, I know there's always more that we could be doing but I'm just wondering if there's anything that people have been telling you that you haven't told me yet?

ADENA LONG: Thank you, I appreciate that... [cross-talk]

	CHAIRPERSON	GRODENCHIK:	Thank	you
Commissione	er… [cross-ta	alkl		

ADENA LONG: So, we can appreciate the, the concept that we have competition with other commercial entities however, we see our rec centers as being much more than a, a fitness entity that you might spend ten dollars a month on because of all of the programs that we've mentioned previously; the after school, summer camp, the Kids in Motion programming, senior programming, adaptive programming, our pools, our gyms... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: You... and you even have competition from other city agencies; we have Beacon programs, right, so... I mean there's other... there are social service agencies that are funded by the city...

ADENA LONG: Honestly, we see them more as supplemental than competition, we are not necessarily competing for the same funds and certainly there's enough demand in the city... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Certainly... [cross-talk]

2.2

ADENA LONG: ...for all of us to be helping in that regard.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, well if it was up to me every school would be open pretty much from six a.m. to midnight but that's another story for another hearing. Does the Department of Parks and Recreation have a single budget line for these centers or are they spread out over a number of lines or how does that work?

EMILY CHASE: All revenue collected from all the recreation centers for recreation goes into one budget code and revenue source.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: And I'm assuming that we're subsidizing these centers that the fees are not getting anywhere close to... its, its fine, I mean we have plenty of money fortunately right now enough but, you know it's what we do, and we want people to enjoy so... you want to say something Matt?

MATT DRURY: No... yeah, just, just confirming that, you know we think the, the current fee structure is, is... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Reasonable...

24 [cross-talk]

2.2

2.2

MATT DRURY:extremely reasonable and,
and provides, you know great access, you know these,
these are, you know annual fees, obviously 150 for
centers with a pool, 100, you know for those without
for an annual fee we believe and that's for adults
not to mention all the various, you know discounts
and other programs that folks have described so we
believe it's really wonderful.
CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, I just
want to announce that the Bronx has joined us, we've

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, I just want to announce that the Bronx has joined us, we've been joined by Councilman Andrew Cohen and Council Member as well Mark Gjonaj, do you gentlemen have any questions?

 $\label{eq:council_member_cohen:} \mbox{The Bronx has} \\ \mbox{always been here.}$

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: You have, well I didn't want to know.

[off mic dialogue]

 $\label{eq:chairperson} \mbox{CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK:} \quad \mbox{I'll be happy to} \\ \mbox{give it to you right now.}$

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I'll just pipe in that, you know I have a rec center in the Williamsbridge Oval and Sarah is the Director, I don't know Sara's last name but I have to say she is

1 COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 2 incredibly committed and really I think does... you

4 stretches them and, and really makes the programming
5 there attractive and she's a... you know I mean really

know she has limited resources but she really

6 I think really the heart of that particular rec

7 center so I just want to... as long as we're on the

8 record here I want to give her a shout out because I

9 think she does tremendous work.

EMILY CHASE: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you... [cross-

12 talk]

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

3

EMILY CHASE: ...that's Sara Bishow.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Thank you, it's always good to hear good things about our Parks Mr.

Gjonaj, I'll come back to you. Thank you. Are there any other... if you had your druthers would there be other discounted memberships, is there anything we're missing that we should think about in the future, future budget years?

MATT DRURY: Actually, we think the current fee structure represents a, a fair and, and appropriate cross section.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. I wanted
to get in and I'll come back to my questions but I
in your testimony on page three you mentioned that
anybody can become a member by submitting a completed
membership form and payment and a government issued
ID, what happens for people that don't have a
government issued ID, I know we have the New York
City ID program now but not everybody wants to take
advantage of that and I'm just wondering if we've had
to turn away people from that and whether it's
something we should be looking at?

MATT DRURY: Yeah, we'd have to get back to you in terms of how often that, that, you know comes up but because... especially because we do accept IDNYC, you know I believe the... you know the, the, the intent here is obviously just a, you know proof of residency, right, so... you know to the degree that... and we're always happy to partner with organizations to get word... more word out about IDNYC but that as, as... you know and other folks obviously... you know if it's a driver's license or other forms like that's fine as well but... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay... [cross-

25 talk]

2.2

2.2

MATT DRURY: ...but we have not seen that as a tremendous hurdle or, or burden.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, I, I, I
haven't either, but I just wanted to ask that
question. And can... I don't know if you did it but can
you tell me the number of events that take place in
the New York City, are all the events... now I, I
understand there are different kinds of events,
there's puppet shows, right and there's movies,
there's the philharmonic which can draw, you know 50
or 100,000 people depending... about 7,000 people in,
in my park, Cunningham Park but I'm just wondering if
you can tell me how many different events there are
in New York City parks a year and I know it's a
staggering number...

MATT DRURY: The exact amount...

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I want the exact amount Mr. Borelli will not be satisfied otherwise, you can get back to me, I'd love to know the answer because it... you know as parks chair... Commissioner Silva calls himself the Commissioner of fun so I guess that makes me the Chairman of fun so... not as much fun as zoning and franchises Mr. Moya but almost as much but it's something that I'm curious about

because we always would like to increase your budget
and I'm going to make a major push for that in the
coming 2020 fiscal year budget but that would be
helpful to see, you know and I and it's also good
for us just to know so we have an idea of exactly
what's going on, we have kind of a handle on the
number of visitors to New York City parks, which is
currently pegged at 130 million a year although I
would argue it's probably more based on the numbers
just from Central Park being 40 million and our
beaches being, you know upwards of 20 million so I
would be curious to, to get not if not today then
in, in the coming days or weeks a breakdown on
exactly how many events there are. I you know I know
every day there are events everything that you do I
would be very curious to see that and maybe a lot
more than we think, and I think parks if that's the
case then parks should be getting credit for that.
So, Commissioner if you want to take a, a small stab
at it…

ADENA LONG: Well I, I want to... you're right we do a lot of events and recreation in and of itself does many events not only self-generated events, but we also partner with, with many of the

2.1

2.2

council members on providing events for their districts and, and in their communities. Above and beyond that and, and we will get back to you on, on real numbers but I thought it important to make this distinction is that we have park administrators and we have park groups and we have permeated events that occur in our parks so it's really sort of coming from many different sources... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Right, that's why... [cross-talk]

ADENA LONG: ...at a... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...I didn't... I wouldn't really expect you to have an answer today but I think it would be a good thing for us to know simply because we should know what's going on and, and that's part of my responsibility but I, I think it also helps us to make a case for how important our parks are and I think certainly everybody here recognizes that and, and most New Yorkers if not all New Yorkers understand how important our parks are there. As I often say, our parklands in... by themselves are larger than the borough of the Bronx which is pretty impressive because, you know the Bronx is over 42 square miles so that's something to

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 chew on but if ... its, it's not just the number of 3 people but I'd, I really would like to know exactly 4 how many events are occurring each... from, from small 5 things, you know little puppet shows to, to the 6 philharmonic which may be the biggest events that 7 happen in parks every year but... and we also, you know there's all kinds of stuff that goes on, you know I'm 8 not talking about baseball games and all that but 9 stuff done under the egress of the... of the Parks 10 Department working with other agencies or community 11 12 groups and like that. 13 ADENA LONG: Certainly, we understand, 14 and we'll work to get those numbers... [cross-talk] 15 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay... [cross-16 talk] 17 ADENA LONG: ...to you... [cross-talk] 18 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...I appreciate that very much. Mr. Gjonaj... we've been joined by Eric 19 Ulrich of Queens, we're... do you have any questions 20 Mr. Ulrich? 2.1 2.2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I just got here... 23 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I... okay, I'll 24 let you decompress a little, I... okay. You mentioned

before that recreation centers are kind of hubs for,

for communities, do... does the Department of Parks and Recreation leverage, leverage its centers for social services and benefits, outreach especially for of course the people that use the center who may be in other forms of need... other forms of social assistance such as case work or... etcetera?

MATT DRURY: Yes, I think in, in some... in some targeted efforts certainly for example voter registration forms per, per local law are made available out of recreation centers as they are at other sort of more traditional service agency hubs throughout the city, also I believe, you know in the midst of the NYC... I... the IDNYC launch, you know are, are at some of our centers served as hubs for, for sign ups and things of that nature so our... again as they are gathering community points, you know our centers have been utilized in that way and in many forms and fashion though, though they're... our primary... our primary mission of course is to sort of recreation, social and physical recreation benefits that, that occur there.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay.

Disability, disability access, people with

2.2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

disabilities, are our centers all handicap
accessible?

EMILY CHASE: Programming inclusion and access to our buildings for people with disabilities is something that the agency takes very seriously, our capital projects and citywide services divisions have scheduled and completed the important work to make our recreation centers more ADA compliant in areas that needed minor ADA upgrades to the interior based on previous inspections. All of our recreation centers currently have accessible entrances and pathways leading to them and we're really, really proud of our ongoing adaptive sports programming for children, teens and adults with disabilities due to our interior and exterior ADA accommodations, accommodations which allow us to offer these programs and to offer a consistent level of service to those with disabilities. We also have Christopher Noel, the agency's accessibility coordinator who's been instrumental in the agency's work in this area, he works very closely with our capital team to design with accessibility at the forefront of their mind and we believe we would rate high on a scale of one to ten in regard to providing overall disability access.

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. Thank you for that. How often do you inspect the centers for cleanliness and, and to make sure that everything is in proper working order and is there a reporting mechanism... how does... how does it... when you have a problem when something is broken how does it get fixed?

So, as an agency we take ADENA LONG: great deal and, and pride in the work that goes into keeping our centers clean, safe and functional and making them enjoyable spaces for our, our customers to play, learn and train. The centers are inspected at least twice for each tour of duty so if we have two shifts that are working in a center they're being inspected at least twice beyond that mentioned in our testimony is the... what we refer to as the RECAP program which is a version of the Parks Department TIP program which you're probably more familiar with, RECAP inspects each of our 36 rec centers twice a year, there are 12 features that are rated... that we're rated upon and so we receive the ... those ratings in terms of inspection. They look at both structural, cleanliness and other so that also helps inform decision making as it relates to any sort of

2.2

2 aesthetic improvements we have to make as well as any physical improvements in capital projects.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: If something breaks do you have in... generally in house or... I know we have Dr. Playground, I've seen Dr. Playground around I'm just wondering if you have Dr. Rec Center?

ADENA LONG: So, we have varying levels of maintenance and operation staff that are assigned to our centers so certain levels of cleanliness in terms of keeping it clean can... is done in house but we work hand in hand with our maintenance and operations trades division and citywide services trades divisions to address larger repairs and other issues.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. Mr. Gjonaj did you have a question?

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you

Chairman. One of the six rec centers in the Bronx,

Owen Dolen Recreational Center which is a true hub

and offers so much to Bronxites, a portion of that

facility is being used by personnel for Parks

Department, confined space, limited space. I brought

this up in the past having Parks Department occupy a

portion of a recreational center is counterproductive

especially when the demand and the limited space that we currently have indoors, I wonder if this is throughout the other rec centers and my real concern here is that the staff keeps equipment there which could actually be hazardous to the wellbeing of the rec center and those that participate there; flammable items, machinery filled with gas, storage of other liquids that could be very dangerous...

Thank you Council Member, so ADENA LONG: with regards to Owen Dolen I'm aware of the situation which you speak, there, there is one wing that is used for maintenance and operations district operations, I can have a conversation with borough Commissioner Rodriguez Rosa regarding an alternative space for that staff but in terms of your... the second part of your question, our recreation centers are as disparate as they are alike in, in terms of function, while we do have some multi million dollar, 135 square foot centers many of our facilities are field houses that have been repurposed and in some cases even comfort stations that have been repurposed so sharing of space between recreation and maintenance and operations is, is quite frankly not that unusual

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 but with regards to the equipment we can certainly 3 address that. COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you, that 4 would be space that can be utilized for the 5 betterment of the rec center and offer more programs 6 7 and services, there's a demand for it, it's obvious and I know that it may not be easy to relocate park 8 staff and finding an ideal location for them but 9 certainly not at a rec center especially one that... 10 this rec center since you're familiar with it is so 11 12 small and every square foot makes a difference on 13 programming. 14 ADENA LONG: We appreciate your concern 15 and interest and again I'll speak with the borough 16

Commissioner and see how we might be able to address this situation.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And for the record I'm very fond of my borough Commissioner, I love her.

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

ADENA LONG: We'll be sure to let her know that.

> COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: We're all fond of Iris so... we've been joined by Council Member Costa

2.2

Constantinides if you have any questions Council

Member just let me know. When you have a rec center

that might not meet cleanliness standards is there a

process for it, do you shut it down, what do you do,

its... you know obviously people in close quarters we

want to make sure these places are clean, is there...

and I don't know if you've had this issue but I'm

just curious... you know we have a lot of people,

millions... three million people a year moving in and

out and we have, you know swimming pools and people

sweating and... you know all that good stuff.

ADENA LONG: We take the cleanliness of our facilities very, very seriously, it is really one of things that you expect as a client of a public facility to be in a safe, clean environment so generally we just take corrective action. If for some reason we don't have appropriate staff assigned to the center, then we will reassign staff or request staff from the district to come and assist us but its generally taken care of right away.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. The PEP officers, do... are they ever assigned or are they on a... on a tour of the district or you know how does that work with... in making sure that we have safety?

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

ADENA LONG: So, we have a... approximately a dozen PEP officers and three PEP sergeants that are assigned to recreation centers citywide, in addition to that we have approximately 47 park security service officers that are assigned to centers and during the winter we have a... we fluctuate an additional 50 or so odd staff come... surge into our centers because it's a little bit too cold for them to be on foot post out in the... in the parks so there is park security coverage at our facilities. I should note that the park security officers are not shielded so they're unable to write summonses or to affect arrests, but they do serve a wonderful and a very important role in being the eyes and the ears and serving... doing customer service and so on.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: And do you track crimes or the number of violations that occur, I know its not a big issue but I'm just curious?

ADENA LONG: So, we do track incidents that occur in our rec centers and we have a, a reported 432 incidents in the last year that were reported in or around the recreation center, often times we'll include incidents that occurred in a park if the rec center is actually located within a park.

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 The complaint types include locker break in, thefts, 3 assaults, graffiti and vandalism. 4 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. Can you tell me what the, the average opening hours of a 5 center are? 6 7 EMILY CHASE: We have a range of open... of opening hours at our centers, some open as early as 8 six or 6:30 a.m. and some close as late as ten p.m. 9 and we have a handful that are open on Sundays, about 10 ten I believe, most are open every... you know six days 11 12 a week. 13 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. Are there 14 any new centers being constructed or contemplated? 15 ADENA LONG: So, we are currently in 16 conceptual design phase for the Tilden recreation 17 center also known as the Shirley Chisholm recreation 18 center in East Flatbush, Brooklyn. CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Is that a new 19 20 center or ... 21 ADENA LONG: It will be a new center... 2.2 [cross-talk] 23 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: A whole new 24 building... [cross-talk]

ADENA LONG: Yes... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION 1 2 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Not a bathroom... 3 ADENA LONG: Full scale upwards of ... upwards of 30,000 square feet. 4 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: So, that's 5 pretty big, that's pretty... [cross-talk] 6 7 ADENA LONG: Yes... [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...large. Yes Mr. 8 9 Constantinides you had a question? Okay. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Yeah, thank you Chair Grodenchik, I appreciate it and good 11 12 to see you all. So, I have a question about rec 13 centers, what are the breakout per borough? 14 ADENA LONG: There are six in the Bronx, 15 eight in Brooklyn, four on Staten Island, 13 in 16 Manhattan and eight in Queens. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Eight in 18 Queens, how many in western Queens? ADENA LONG: I'm not as familiar with 19 20 Queens but I can name the centers. COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, 21 2.2 well the community... I guess the question that I have 23 is... [cross-talk]

2			CHAIRP	ERSON	GR)DEN	CHIK:	Wha	at's	the
3	what's	the	answer	becau	se	you	proba	bly	know	the
4	[cross-	-tal]	c]							

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Yeah...

6 [cross-talk]

2.2

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...the answer.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Its zero...

9 [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay... [cross-talk]

mean I think that there has been a call for a community center or rec center in western Queens, what is the park's capacity to add new rec centers or have outlook for opportunities to add one as we have things going on in our communities.

MATT DRURY: Yeah, expanding the park's portfolio acquisitions of any type are always something that the agency looks carefully at working with the Mayor's Office and OMB, as you can understand it's, it's certainly something as, you know massive as a new recreation center can, can be a real challenge but it's something we're constantly taking a look for those opportunities.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And how
3	do you fund how would you you know is it in, you
4	know in partnership with something a, a nonprofit in
5	the community, do you do it just sort of standalone,
6	how what is the sort of the best model if we were
7	to sort of like build one up from scratch?
8	MATT DRURY: Traditionally acquisitions
9	and, and the construction has, has been funded, you
10	know centrally and mayoral, but I believe the city
11	remains open to, to a to a variety of different
12	[cross-talk]
13	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Well I
14	mean the capital… [cross-talk]
15	MATT DRURY:you know partnerships
16	[cross-talk]
17	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:like
18	that but once you're actually running like what's the
19	best way to actually sort of have staffing and, and
20	that those things of that nature?
21	MATT DRURY: Yeah, again I think
22	traditionally, you know baseline, you know agency
23	funding is, is, is traditionally the best you know
24	the model that we've seen in place.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I know
that, you know we, you know have a lot of really
great things happening in our parks in western
Queens, very excited about the anchor park program,
very excited that we've been able to either fund or
see the renovation of half the parks and playgrounds
in our in, in my district but the and we're looking
to finish that loop before I'm done but we are
looking for a rec a rec space and it's something
that the community really needs and we I luckily
would hope to have the opportunity to sit down with,
with you and, and talk about opportunities to sort of
make that happen.

MATT DRURY: Yeah, we'd welcome that conversation, absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:

Wonderful, thank you, thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Is that going to come off the 30 million dollars that we're spending in Astoria Park?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: No, I'm going to ask for more.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, as long as I, I just wanted to be clear on that. Mr. Gjonaj you had another question?

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yeah, speaking about fairness and equity. How many pools do we have in New York City?

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Public pools you mean.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Public pools,
11 yes.

MATT DRURY: Indoor and outdoor... approximately 66, that's a combination of both indoor and outdoor.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How many... do you know the breakdown by borough?

MATT DRURY: Unfortunately, I don't, we'll have to get that to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Do you know how many are... there are in the $13^{\rm th}$ council district, a very important of the Bronx?

22 MATT DRURY: One of our favorites...
23 [cross-talk]

 $\label{eq:chairperson} \mbox{CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK:} \ \ \mbox{He has his own}$ beach though just, just for the record.

MATT DRURY: Orchard obviously Orchard
Beach is a jewel, you know a jewel in the crown of
the New York City beach system of course but as, as
to as to pools by council district we, we'll have t
get that to you as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, I'll answer that, zero.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I have one pool but its... your car is larger than it, its very small.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Council Member it's not always about you, sometimes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Yes, it is...

[cross-talk]

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...it's about me... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...it's about my constituents its not about me, its never about me.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I would really...

perhaps this is a good opportunity Chairman to start

calling for a hearing in the future when it comes to

outdoor, indoor pools that are not afforded to all

city residents and we're fortunate to have the beach

and... Orchard Beach in particular and the shoreline

but certainly nothing is more comforting than a pool

2.2

in a controlled environment especially for the younger swimmers and the parents that we have and the families and there's plenty of space in the third...

you don't have to acquire anything, we have 2,700

acres of Pelham Bay Park, maybe you heard about it

that we can find a little corner to actually put a

pool in I think would go a long way to serve and

improve the quality of life that Bronxites should

enjoy, enjoy and be entitled to.

MATT DRURY: We're, we're always open to the conversation about the creation of new amenities, obviously a lot of complications come into factors making sure that our, our parks have a diversity of use but, but your point well taken, and you know obviously it's something we'd be happy to sit down and talk about.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Chairman will you make this a priority for us?

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Three o'clock, we'll have it done, it is... it is an important priority, it should be, we, we sometimes forget that we do live in one of the largest port cities in the world, New York Harbor, a great natural harbor, we have tremendous public beaches, the Rockaways, the

world famous Coney Island, Orchard Beach, which my
mother used in the 30's and the 40's as well as the
South Shore of Staten Island which is pretty much one
long beach, we don't have one in Manhattan yet
although there were suggestions made in the media I
think earlier this year but it is important I think
and its, it's extremely important that our young
people especially learn how to swim so from that idea
alone I think that Councilman Gjonaj has raised a
very valid point and speaking of water, I had the
opportunity to tour Baruch Playground earlier this
year which is on the lower east side in Council
Member Carlina Rivera's district and I noticed the
bathhouse there and I don't know whether bathhouses
come under the recreation division's I don't know
what the right Suzanne, I can't pronounce that word,
under your ages because as you probably know this
building has been closed to the public for 40 years
and it has a green roof because there are trees
growing out of it now so it's a naturally occurring
green roof and I'm just wondering if there are any
plans whether it needs to be demolished and started
over, its probably a very old building but it

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

obviously could be a tremendous amenity to the people who live there many of whom live in public housing?

MATT DRURY: Yes, absolutely, we're... you know the, the... it's a... the, the history of the structure as you mentioned and the structural conditions, you know the fact that there is literally... you know trees and, and other natural area... natural elements sort of literally growing out of the... out of the building now so our ... I believe there... I don't know that there's been a recent structural assessment, but we have... I... in the process of releasing a, an... a request for expression of interest in terms of reactivating the space and I believe that's been... that's been released and so I... I'll have to check on the status of that process whether we've received any, any responses so I'm, I'm not a structural engineer but I, I believe the anecdotal understanding is, is demolition may certainly be necessary.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay, I mean, and I assume that it is monitored, monitored so it doesn't collapse, we unfortunately have had some building collapses in the city, it's a very old structure, I don't know how old, but I just wanted to

COMMITTEE ON PARKS AND RECREATION put that out there because it's a park's facility. I know there's a lot of money earmarked for that park which is probably one of the less desirable recreation spaces in the city of New York currently I'm sure it will be much better when its redone, but just wanted to bring that forward because we are

talking about recreation centers.

2.2

MATT DRURY: Certainly, and it's something that's very much on our... on our radar.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay. Mr. Gjonaj and Mr. Costa, nope...

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You said 63 or 66 pools, indoor, outdoor?

MATT DRURY: I believe it's 66, a combination of indoor and outdoor.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: We have 51

Council Members, so you have a Council Member here that does not have them which means there are Council Members which enjoy the privileges of having several pools. Chairman I'm requesting on record that we have a hearing on fairness and fair share and equity citywide, no pool, I think the residents and the children of the 13th council district should learn how to swim in a controlled environment... [cross-talk]

Τ	
2	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Well we do have
3	Orchard Beach, we could pen off a piece of that and
4	we could do swimming lessons [cross-talk]
5	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: A floating pool
6	[cross-talk]
7	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK:and have a
8	floating pool… [cross-talk]
9	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ:I'm okay with
10	that also
11	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Or not floating
12	pool but we could you know use an area that would
13	be, you know sectioned off and because some people,
14	not me but some people would argue that you probably
15	have more parkland than any other Council Member in
16	the city of New York so… more than my thousand plus
17	acres in one park.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: More parkland
19	that needs to be maintained year-round and [cross-
20	talk]
21	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Well I'm looking
22	forward [cross-talk]
23	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ:I'm happy to
24	have the funding or we can divert some of the

parkland to your district... [cross-talk]

2	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Well I'm looking
3	forward to you being a strong ally as we look to
4	increase Parks budget to have more maintenance and
5	other things that we need. I think I am done asking
6	questions and I want to thank you for your forth
7	rightness and for being here today and as I always do
8	at this point I would ask that you stick around, I
9	don't think this hearing is going much longer because
10	Emily Walker who is the only person signed up unless
11	Lynn Kelly is going to join her or she's going to
12	solo today or…
13	EMILY WALKER: Yes [cross-talk]
14	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Okay
15	EMILY WALKER: Is that okay?
16	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: That's okay,
17	which ever up to you know, we're always happy to
18	have Miss Walker who's a great advocate for Parks.
19	Thank you all.
20	[off mic dialogue]
21	EMILY WALKER: Hello
22	CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Miss Walker
23	[cross-talk]

24 EMILY WALKER: Yes...

2 CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: Thank you for 3 being... [cross-talk]

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

EMILY WALKER: Thank you... [cross-talk]
CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...here.

EMILY WALKER: Thank you Chair Grodenchik. Good afternoon, my name is Emily Walker and I am the Director of Outreach and Programs at New Yorkers for Parks. I would like to thank the City Council Committee on Parks and Recreation for inviting us to speak on the importance of our city's recreation centers today. The city's 36 recreation centers are a critical resource for New Yorkers, particularly in low income neighborhoods where obesity and asthma rates are high, and residents have limited options for recreation and fitness. In addition to the bricks and mortar facilities managed by NYC Parks, recreation programming run through the agency provides a wealth of opportunities for New Yorkers of all ages and abilities to improve health outcomes and build community. Although the agency may no longer highlight recreation in its name, we believe this component of the agency's mandate is an incredibly important service provided to New Yorkers and is one worth investing in. More and more public

health experts are acknowledging the key role that
our parks play in improving public health outcomes.
This idea has even caught on in the form of park
prescriptions from health care professionals to
encourage patients to engage in healthy outdoor
recreation as a means for treating physical and
mental health issues. In a city where we experience
inclement weather throughout the year, the indoor
recreation centers offered by our Parks Department
will play a critical role long term in improving
public health outcomes throughout New York City. In
2013, we testified before this committee to share our
concerns that the new membership pricing structure
would be would preclude many of New York's lower
income residents from being able to take advantage of
our public recreation centers. The agency's response
at that time, to implement lower cost membership
levels for young adults and seniors, was a meaningful
way to address some of the inequities raised by the
increased membership rate. Additional reduced rate
memberships for New Yorkers with disabilities and
veterans have also been a positive change in reaching
more New Yorkers, as is the discount offered to IDNYC
holders. We do still have concerns that the current

membership rate for adults may be cost prohibitive
for many low-income New Yorkers however and may have
the unintended effect of contributing to a drop in
overall attendance in membership at our public
recreation centers. For the nearly two million New
Yorkers living below the poverty line, the ability to
pay 150 dollar or 150 dollar up front fee for a year
membership, or even 75 or 50 dollars for a half year
membership may be completely out of reach. We also
want to note that the requirement to prove residency
may be prohibitive for those in transitional housing
or those experiencing homelessness. A look back at
recent Mayor's Management Reports from the past four
fiscal years shows a downward trend in membership and
attendance at rec centers. From the recent high point
in FY '16, there has been a steady decline in both
membership and attendance and the MMR from FY $^{\prime}16$ in
particular states that the increase in both
membership and rec center attendance for that year
could be attributed to the opening of the state of
art Ocean Breeze facility in Staten Island. We are
concerned that the momentum from that year may have
been lost and is an indicator that the city needs to
take a more comprehensive look at the factors that

impact New Yorker's ability and willingness to become
members and regular users of this critical open space
amenity. Again, recent MMRs also point out that drops
in attendance and membership can be in part
attributed to temporary closures of recreation
centers undergoing major capital renovations and that
was highlighted by the agency today in their
testimony. With rec centers relatively, few and far
between in this city of eight and a half million New
Yorkers, that is an understandable outcome. We
believe capital renovations for our rec centers, over
half of which were built prior to 1950, are essential
to the long-term usability of these spaces and we
encourage the city to proactively take on these
renovations as funding allows. We do caution,
however, that this work be done in a thoughtful,
thoughtful and pragmatic way. We'd like to use the
neighborhood of Brownsville, Brooklyn as a quick
example of why. The… in our recently published
Brownsville open space index report, we found that
the neighborhood residents disproportionately in that
community suffer from poor health outcomes and that
young residents in particular are in need of safe
spaces to engage in healthy recreation and activity

We view our parks and rec centers as key to
improvi9ng such outcomes, but in Brownsville two of
these critical recreation resources are about to be
temporarily unavailable for a period of time as both
the Brownsville Recreation Center and Betsy Head Park
are slated for major capital renovations. Temporarily
losing these two critical park amenities will mean
that the residents and youth of Brownsville will have
even fewer opportunities for free, safe or low or no
cost programming that is vitally needed and we
believe it's when these assets are not available that
their public benefit is most magnified. Finally, we
want to note that in order for our recreation centers
to be a realistic option for active recreation, they
must be kept clean and in a good state of repair. The
FY '19 MMR found that 83 percent of city recreation
centers rated acceptable for overall condition and
while this was a slight increase over the FY '18
findings, it still falls short of the city's stated
goal of 85 percent of centers being rated acceptable.
NY4P believes that our public parks and recreation
centers must be clean and well maintained to convey
maximum public benefit and we encourage the
administration and the council to ensure that

2.2

critical maintenance and operations resources are
being allocated in the expense budget for parks to
ensure that our centers are being kept to the highest
standard of condition possible. The ability for New
Yorkers to take advantage of our public recreation
centers and programming is an equity issue that we
believe warrant that we believe warrants closer
attention and we hope today's hearing is one way to
help address that issue. Thank you very much for the
opportunity to speak and I welcome any questions you
may have.

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: I thank you for your testimony and as always its, its good to see the team from New Yorkers for Parks. I have been to Betsy Head which is one of the best playgrounds in the city of New York... [cross-talk]

EMILY WALKER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...and I know that

it is also an anchor park... [cross-talk]

EMILY WALKER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...and will be receiving along with four other parks and including Astoria Park, which I was thinking of earlier but I, I, I don't know that the whole park is going to close

because I think that this... the section of Betsy Head which is going to receive upgrades is on the other side away from the absolutely stunning playground that is there but... [cross-talk]

EMILY WALKER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: ...and if you haven't been to see it just... you know I don't know how often you, you get out to Central Brooklyn but its spectacular, it's just really one of my favorite playgrounds in the city, I haven't seen them all but the work that was done there and Commissioner Mara (?) was like a, a kid in the candy shop showing me it, it's just spectacular, it even has a sandbox which is not usual for a New York City park these days so really just spectacular. I don't have anything else for you, I don't know if any of the other members... Mr. Costa... we have been joined by Justin Brannan of Southern Brooklyn and also Jimmy Van Bramer who had another big hearing today to join us as well and I appreciate your testimony here and we will certainly put that into the record... [crosstalk

EMILY WALKER: Thank you Council Member.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

CHAIRPERSON GRODENCHIK: And this is the
last call. Alright, in that case I want to thank you
all for being here today. We will be having hearings
of course coming up in January and February before we
get to the preliminary hearing on the Mayor's budget,
right now I am expecting to hold with Councilman
Costa Constantinides and the Committee on
Environmental Protection, the hearing Resiliency in
Lower Manhattan parks, there has been a plan put
forward by the administration for a 1.45 billion
dollars in resiliencies to be woven into our park
system and we understand in many cases our parks are
on the front lines as we try to co-exist with mother
nature but we have not received I think that we
would all agree that an expenditure of that magnitude
warrants a full hearing before this committee, it
would certainly effect east Riverpark, John V.
Lindsay Park and I think other parks in the community
and so we're going to hear that and I'm also hoping
to hold a February hearing with the Women's Committee
on the lack of statues for women, honoring women in
New York City parks, there are only five. My math
tells me that New York City is almost 400 years old
so we're doing about one statue for a woman every 78

years or so, I think we can certainly do better, we
have announced that there will be a statue for the
late, great Congresswoman Shirley Chisholm outside
Prospect Park in Brooklyn but I know that we can do
better, we'll be looking at that I hope in the month
of February and with that I want to take this
opportunity on behalf of myself, all the staff
members here, our Counsel Kris Sartori, Patrick
Mulvihill, my counsel Steve Behar, Monika, who's name
I will get sooner or later, her last name, our new
budget person, my budget person Daniella Eras, Steve
Behar my Counsel and my other colleagues that are
still here to wish everybody a, a very, very Merry
Christmas and a happy Kwanzaa, I hope you had a good
Hanukkah and a happy new year and lets hope that 2019
is the best year ever for our New York City Parks and
with that I close this hearing at 2:21.

[gavel]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

December 31, 2018