

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

----- X

November 29, 2018
Start: 12:07 p.m.
Recess: 12:33 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
16th Fl.

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Peter A. Koo
I. Daneek Miller
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kelly Murphy, Director, Real Estate Strategy Group
NYC School Construction Authority SCA

Gayle Mandaro, Senior Director & Counsel
Real Estate Strategy and External Affairs
NYC School Construction Authority

Melanie La Rocca, Vice President of Operations
NYC School Construction Authority

Ben Goodman, Manager of External Affairs
NYC School Construction Authority

[sound check] [Gavel]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good afternoon.

Welcome to this meeting of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime Uses. I'm Council Member Adrienne Adams, the Chair of the Subcommittee. We will be joined by Council Members today. We-we are joined by Council Member Steve Matteo. Today, we will be holding hearing and vote [background comments, pause] and a vote on LU 278, a proposed site selection for a new 456-seat school, and votes on three additional items per earlier this month. I'll begin by opening this public hearing on LU 278 and application file by the School Construction Authority pursuant to section 1732 of the Public Authority Law for a proposed site selection to construct a new 556-seat intermediate and high school facility serving District 75 students. The proposed site is a 2.34-acre city-owned parcel located at 715 Ocean Terrace in Council Member Matteo's District in Staten Island. I now recognize 715 Council Member Steve Matteo to speak on the application.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you Chair Adams. Let me first state that I fully support the

1 construction of the new Hungerford School and
2 Petrides Campus. It was 256-seat District 75 new
3 schools needed to replace the deteriorating existing-
4 existing school in Clifton, the school designed to
5 ultimately accommodate up to 456 students and will
6 provide a much better educational experience for the
7 special needs students who attend. With all this
8 said, this planning process is the only opportunity
9 we have to get this project right both for Hungerford
10 students and for those who are already call the
11 Petrides Campus home, and I am committing to ensuring
12 we anticipate and address any foreseeable issues now
13 when we have this opportunity. There are too many
14 issues I would like to raise that I believe must be
15 adequately addressed at this stage of the process:
16 Ingress/egress issues and parking issues. First,
17 ambiguities regarding ingress and egress to both
18 schools must be cleared up, and clear traffic flow
19 pattern established at both schools for both cars and
20 for buses. Morning drop-off and afternoon dismissal
21 times are already chaotic at all schools. When we
22 add in a second school to the mix, it could lead to
23 more chaos unless a plan is firmly put in place prior
24 to opening. While I understand it is currently
25

1 contemplated to have ingress and egress take place at
2 different place on the campus for the different
3 schools, we need to ensure the plan works. The
4 effects of a plan on safety on City Boulevard is also
5 a concern as the piers will be heavily utilized to
6 move students to and from the school. In addition I
7 have to turn to both potential impacts on local
8 surrounding residential streets that will be dealing
9 with the effects of more vehicular traffic. Second,
10 the parking situation must be addressed since the
11 school that will be built on part of the campus main
12 parking lot must ensure those valuable parking spots
13 are replaced. So, our challenge is to figure out a
14 way to construct the school finding adequate parking
15 to ensure the campus remains as accessible as it
16 always has been. As this process continues, I need
17 to be comfortable that all aspects of the
18 ingress/egress issue are addressed that parking will
19 be created to replace those spaces that will be lost.
20 I am hopeful SCA will show us hard numbers
21 demonstrating what exists now, and what will exist
22 once construction is completed. As I stated in the
23 beginning, this project is needed, and is necessary
24 and I look forward to its grand opening in September
25

1
2 of 2021. Now is the opportunity for us to figure out
3 the traffic plan, how to get this done right, making
4 sure that Petrides campus is as fully as possible for
5 now and decades to come. So, I look forward to SCA's
6 testimony. I want to also state I-I appreciate SCA
7 working with my office on this project. I think we
8 are very close to just making sure that we have these
9 two issues addressed. I look forward to your
10 testimony, and then I'll-I'll come back with some
11 questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, Council
13 Member. I echo the sentiments of my colleague. I
14 now call upon Kelly Murphy, SCA, Gayle Mandaro, SCA,
15 Melanie La Rocca, and Ben Goodman to give your
16 testimony. Before you begin, Counsel will you please
17 swear in the panel.

18 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
19 hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
20 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
21 before this Subcommittee in response to all Council
22 Member questions?

23 PANEL MEMBERS: [off mic] I do.

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. You may
25 begin.

1
2 KELLY MURPHY: Hello, members. Again, my
3 name is Kelly Murphy and I'm the Director in the Real
4 Estate Strategy Group for SCA and as you know, my
5 colleagues are here. The New York City School
6 Construction Authority has undertaken the site
7 selection process for anew intermediate high school
8 on a site on Block 683 on a portion of lot/lawn (sic)
9 and it will be proposed Lot 320 in the future in the
10 Borough of Staten Island. The prosed site consists
11 of approximately 101,948 square foot. It's
12 approximately 2.34 acres situated on he Petrides
13 Campus located at 715 Ocean Terrace. The proposed
14 site is owned by the city of New York with
15 jurisdiction assigned to the New York City Department
16 of Education and is located within the Todt Hill
17 section of Staten Island, Community District 2 and
18 Community School District 31. Under the proposed
19 project the SCA plans to construct a new ISHS
20 facility serving District 75 students across the
21 Borough and will serve as a replacement for the
22 Richard H. Hungerford School currently located at 155
23 Tompkins Avenue. The Notice of Filing for the site
24 plan was published in the New York Post, The Staten
25 Island Advance and the City Record on October 1,

1 2018, and Staten Island Community Board No. 2,
2 Community Education Council 31, the Citywide Council
3 for District 75 and the City Planning Commission were
4 all notified of the site plan. The Citywide Council
5 for District 75 held a hearing on October 18, 2018.
6 The Community Board, the CEC and chose not to hold
7 public hearings. The SCA considered all comments
8 received on the proposed site plan and affirms the
9 site plan pursuant to Section 1731 of the New York
10 Public Authorities Law. Pursuant to Section 1731 of
11 the Public Authorities Law, the SCA submitted the
12 proposed site plan to the Mayor and City Council by
13 letter dated November 26, 2018. With that, we look
14 forward to your comments and look forward to
15 favorite-favorable consideration of the proposed site
16 plan.
17

18 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. Council
19 Member Matteo, did you have questions?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you, Chair
21 Adams. So, let's just thank you for your testimony.
22 Thank you for being here obviously. Let's just go
23 right into the parking. Can you tell me how many
24 sports are on-on the Petrides complex.
25

2 KELLY MURPHY: And currently it's
3 approximately 680 spaces.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And for the new
5 school?

6 KELLY MURPHY: Um, I don't know. The
7 new--well, it's--it's kind of complicated. So, the
8 existing spaces will be restripe--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

10 KELLY MURPHY: --which will get additional
11 spaces from the existing space. There will be new
12 spaces put on Safety City Boulevard, and for a net
13 increase of 14 spaces to the current.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Fourteen spaces
15 throughout the entire complex?

16 KELLY MURPHY: Just--just yeah to the
17 facility, right.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, so we're
19 not losing any spots at all?

20 KELLY MURPHY: No.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Good and the
22 restriping it--will that--that includes the upper
23 portion of the parking lot now or just Safety City
24 Boulevard.

1
2 KELLY MURPHY: No, the Safety City
3 Boulevard are new spaces--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Yeah.

5 KELLY MURPHY: --and the restriping also
6 gets--gains us new spaces as well.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, and if you--

8 -

9 KELLY MURPHY: [interposing] Because the
10 layouts will be different.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And my number for
12 the new school is 174. Is that accurate parking
13 spaces?

14 KELLY MURPHY: That, well that's what
15 will be used, yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: For the new
17 school?

18 KELLY MURPHY: For the facility. For the
19 staff and some of the--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [interposing]
21 I'm saying that those would kind of be designated for
22 the new school right?

23 KELLY MURPHY: That's an operations
24 question. I'm not sure about who--if they'll be

1 designated. They're not designated now. So, I can't
2 really--
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [interposing]
5 Okay, well it's something we'll address as we're
6 working for through the process.

7 KELLY MURPHY: No, I can't answer that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, and I'm—I'm
9 please that we have a net gain of 14 spots.
10 Certainly we don't want to lose any. So, I'm going
11 to go right into my second issue and that's the—the
12 traffic obviously. You know, as you know, the trees
13 are very traverse on the campus not only during
14 school not only in the morning and afternoon, but
15 holding a lot of events. So, I just want to talk
16 about how we plan on utilizing the second entrance
17 where that's going to be, and how we don't impact the
18 trees at the school now. So, if you could just talk
19 a little bit about the plans for the new entrance,
20 and how we're going to get staff and the students who
21 are using the Hungerford School to—to the school
22 without major impact on Ocean Terrace.

23 KELLY MURPHY: Well, current Petrides
24 operations will come and go as they do presently.
25 With Hungerford, they will come and go through the

1 Safety City Boulevard entrance and we designed so
2 that they come in and circulate around and come back
3 out--

4
5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And--

6 KELLY MURPHY: --on City Boulevard.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So, as it is now,
8 in the existing school most of the students are
9 bussed in--use a--use a bus.

10 KELLY MURPHY: For Hungerford, yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Yeah.

12 KELLY MURPHY: Almost no student or
13 parent drop-off. It's all through Ambulet or small
14 buses.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And we--we
16 anticipate that obviously at the new school? No?

17 KELLY MURPHY: Based on our existing
18 population.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: We are going to
20 bring the buses in in the morning, and they are going
21 to be directed to go back out the same way they came
22 back in?

23 KELLY MURPHY: That's what the design
24 encourages that circulation to come in and go back
25 out.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, and the
3 same thing for afternoon?

4 KELLY MURPHY: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And then we have
6 no plans to utilize the existing entrance on Ocean
7 Terrace and those neighborhoods?

8 KELLY MURPHY: No.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. So, I mean
10 those are the—those are the main issues. Obviously,
11 we're all on the same page of—of—of making a school a
12 reality and the kids certainly deserve it. So, I
13 know where we are in terms of, you know, the
14 direction where we don't—we have to work together,
15 though, as we move forward to ensure that we don't—we
16 don't have a mix of the vehicular and traffic from
17 the trees at Hungerford. That's—that is extremely
18 important for the safety of the students, for the
19 safety of parents. We—we can make this work. We've
20 just got to make sure that we're with, you know,
21 having constant conversations with—with us, with DOT.
22 We've got to get DOT in the same room to make sure
23 that that these plans are—are—are realized so the
24 school, which is going to be a great school, doesn't
25 have any detriment to the existing—the campus. So,

1 I'm satisfied with where we are now. I appreciate
2 the effort. I think we still have a little bit more
3 work to do but that's—that's in the normal of—of the
4 process of actually getting out there and looking and
5 working together. So, I ask that you—that you ensure
6 that we communicate, that we work together, and we
7 bring in DOT and we make sure that the traffic plan
8 is the right traffic plan, and—and make this work.

10 KELLY MURPHY: Yeah, we've been in
11 ongoing talking with DOT, and we will continue to do
12 so as we go forward and finalize design.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you. Thank
14 you, Chair Adams.

15 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
16 Council Member Matteo. We've been joined by Council
17 Member Brad Lander and Council Member Inez Barron.
18 Thank you very much for your testimony today. Are
19 there any more members or members of the public who
20 wish to testify on those items? Okay, thank you.
21 Seeing none, the public hearing LU 278 is now closed.

22 KELLY MURPHY: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.
24 We are waiting for one more Council Member before we
25 can take our vote. [background comments] Thank you.

1
2 In accordance with effected Council Member's
3 recommendations, we will vote on this item, and three
4 other items for which the Subcommittee conducted
5 public hearings earlier this month. We will vote to
6 approve LU 278 for a site selection of a 456-seat
7 District 75 school in Member Matteo's district. We
8 will also vote to approve LU 238, the 238 President
9 Street House and I now recognize Council Member Brad
10 Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
12 much Chair Adams. I appreciate the opportunity to be
13 here. So, yes, I guess you have three items on the
14 calendar today that are in my district. So, thank
15 you to you and your-your members for your work on
16 them. Two of them are landmarks at 236 and 238
17 President Street, and these are wonderful projects.
18 I'm sorry that I was not able to be here for the-for
19 the hearing, but they are just lovely buildings. One
20 was the first building in Brooklyn to function as a
21 kindergarten, and a lovely building, and then the
22 other is just a gorgeous residential building. They
23 functioned together for a while as church. It was
24 actually the first Spanish language Methodist Church
25 in Brooklyn. Joan Baez's father was the minister at

1 the church for a little while. So, this has got a
2 lovely story. The residents—the residential
3 buildings have come a co-op, and the residents
4 themselves led the effort and are asking to have
5 their building landmarked and preserved, the
6 kindergarten building next door was at actually very
7 real risk of being demolished and sold off, and—and
8 redeveloped. So, this is a great action and I urge a
9 yes vote, and I appreciate your support. On the DOT
10 Brooklyn Fleet Service facility, on 14th Street in my
11 district, I really appreciate your work and the work
12 of the staff to achieve good modifications to it that
13 will make it function better. That's a big fleet
14 maintenance facility. It's moving from somewhere
15 else. We need some place that all the DOT fleet is
16 maintained obviously having lots of trucks coming in
17 and out of a big maintenance facility. Not
18 necessarily something folks are jumping up and down
19 about, and this is directly across the street from
20 the Sanitation garage and two blocks away from
21 another Sanitation garage. In my community board, we
22 actually house not only our own garage, but the
23 garage for another community board. So, there's
24 meaningful impacts. I appreciate the work that DOT
25

1
2 did, and I thank the Administration for working with
3 us to try to address some of those impacts especially
4 in the context of the work we are doing for the forth
5 coming Gowanus Rezoning, and so DOT has agreed to
6 move forward toward rooftop solar on the facility,
7 and to address onsite storm water management, to
8 address some of the amount of impacts of this
9 facility and that face Gowanus in general, and then
10 to work with us both with Department of
11 Transportation, but especially Department of
12 Sanitation to make sure that the substantial number
13 of public infrastructure trucks can—don't overwhelm
14 the local playground, parking and other issues. So,
15 with those new commitments, which they have provided
16 today, I'm pleased to recommend a vote to approve
17 with modifications to modify this application
18 modestly, and then approve it with those
19 modifications, and I thank you for your time, and
20 this committee for its work.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
22 Council Member Lander. We did have a pretty good—
23 very lively hearing on these items, and recognizing
24 that the community was very much in favor of
25

1 landmarking. So, we're really excited about this.

2 So, thank you very much--

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [interposing]

5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: --for your support.

7 We would like to acknowledge Council Member Treyger.

8 Who is also on the committee and has entered the

9 room. I will continue to go on with what we're doing

10 today. We will also vote to approve LU 239 the Hans

11 S. Christian Memorial Kindergarten, two historic

12 landmark designations by the Landmarks Preservation

13 Commission located in the Carroll Gardens

14 neighborhood in Brooklyn as was heard, Represented by

15 Council Member Brad Lander. The Subcommittee heard

16 testimony that the residents of 238 President Street

17 strongly support the designation of that building

18 while the owner of the Hans S. Christian Memorial

19 Garden opposes designation of that building citing

20 alternations to the structure in LPC's prior decision

21 to pursue designation after a 2007 request for

22 evaluation. However, LPC provided persuasive

23 testimony that alternations to the kindergarten are

24 reversible that that structure has significant

25 aesthetic value, and when taken together with the

1 adjacent building at 238 President Street which
2 served as the Brooklyn Deaconess Home of the
3 Methodist Episcopal Church. The structure at 236
4 President has significant historic value both as the
5 first purpose-built kindergarten in the city and as
6 home of the first Spanish Methodist Church,
7 Brooklyn's oldest Spanish language Protestant Church.
8 Based on these findings and the support of Council
9 Member Lander the Subcommittee will therefore vote to
10 approve both designations. Finally, we will vote to
11 approve with modifications LU 256, an application
12 submitted by the Department of Transportation and the
13 Department of Citywide Administrative Services
14 pursuant to Section 197-C of the New York City
15 Charter for the site selection and acquisition of
16 property located at 25 14th Street in Brooklyn for a
17 fleet vehicle maintenance and repair facility. DOT
18 has committed to exploring sustainable energy systems
19 in this building. Accordingly, our modification will
20 clarify and ensure that this site is for a DOT fleet,
21 not another agency fleet. This site is also in
22 Council Member Lander's District. I now call for a
23 vote to approve LUs 278, 238 and 239 and to approve
24
25

1 with modifications LU 256. Counsel, please call the
2 roll.
3

4 LEGAL COUNSEL: Adams.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on
8 all.

9 LEGAL COUNSEL: Treyger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

11 LEGAL COUNSEL: By a vote of 3 in the
12 affirmative, 0 in the negative with 0 abstentions,
13 LUs 278, 238 and 239 are recommended for approval and
14 LU 256 is recommended for approval with modifications
15 by the full Land Use Committee.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.
17 This vote will be held open for 20 minutes. This
18 concludes today's business, but I would like to
19 thank--[background comments] We will leave this
20 meeting open. I said this--this vote is open for 20
21 minutes. I would like to thank the members of the
22 public, my colleagues, Council and Land Use staff for
23 attending today.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I would just
25 like to say especially thank you to Chelsea and to

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

21

Amy and Sean for helping on—on this morning's
matters. Thank you.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Thank you.

[background comments/pause]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.

This concludes today's business. I would like to
once again thank the members of the public, my
colleagues, Council and Land Use staff for attending
today's hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 21, 2018