

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND  
MARITIME USES

----- X

November 29, 2018  
Start: 12:07 p.m.  
Recess: 12:33 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.  
16<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron  
Peter A. Koo  
I. Daneek Miller  
Mark Treyger

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kelly Murphy, Director, Real Estate Strategy Group  
NYC School Construction Authority SCA

Gayle Mandaro, Senior Director & Counsel  
Real Estate Strategy and External Affairs  
NYC School Construction Authority

Melanie La Rocca, Vice President of Operations  
NYC School Construction Authority

Ben Goodman, Manager of External Affairs  
NYC School Construction Authority

[sound check] [Gavel]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good afternoon.

Welcome to this meeting of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime Uses. I'm Council Member Adrienne Adams, the Chair of the Subcommittee. We will be joined by Council Members today. We-we are joined by Council Member Steve Matteo. Today, we will be holding hearing and vote [background comments, pause] and a vote on LU 278, a proposed site selection for a new 456-seat school, and votes on three additional items per earlier this month. I'll begin by opening this public hearing on LU 278 and application file by the School Construction Authority pursuant to section 1732 of the Public Authority Law for a proposed site selection to construct a new 556-seat intermediate and high school facility serving District 75 students. The proposed site is a 2.34-acre city-owned parcel located at 715 Ocean Terrace in Council Member Matteo's District in Staten Island. I now recognize 715 Council Member Steve Matteo to speak on the application.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you Chair Adams. Let me first state that I fully support the

1 construction of the new Hungerford School and  
2 Petrides Campus. It was 256-seat District 75 new  
3 schools needed to replace the deteriorating existing-  
4 existing school in Clifton, the school designed to  
5 ultimately accommodate up to 456 students and will  
6 provide a much better educational experience for the  
7 special needs students who attend. With all this  
8 said, this planning process is the only opportunity  
9 we have to get this project right both for Hungerford  
10 students and for those who are already call the  
11 Petrides Campus home, and I am committing to ensuring  
12 we anticipate and address any foreseeable issues now  
13 when we have this opportunity. There are too many  
14 issues I would like to raise that I believe must be  
15 adequately addressed at this stage of the process:  
16 Ingress/egress issues and parking issues. First,  
17 ambiguities regarding ingress and egress to both  
18 schools must be cleared up, and clear traffic flow  
19 pattern established at both schools for both cars and  
20 for buses. Moring drop-off and afternoon dismissal  
21 times are already chaotic at all schools. When we  
22 add in a second school to the mix, it could lead to  
23 more chaos unless a plan if firmly put in place prior  
24 to opening. While I understand it is currently  
25

1 contemplated to have ingress and egress take place at  
2 different place on the campus for the different  
3 schools, we need to ensure the plan works. The  
4 effects of a plan on safety on City Boulevard is also  
5 a concern as the piers will be heavily utilized to  
6 move students to and from the school. In addition I  
7 have to turn to both potential impacts on local  
8 surrounding residential streets that will be dealing  
9 with the effects of more vehicular traffic. Second,  
10 the parking situation must be addressed since the  
11 school that will be built on part of the campus main  
12 parking lot must ensure those valuable parking spots  
13 are replaced. So, our challenge is to figure out a  
14 way to construct the school finding adequate parking  
15 to ensure the campus remains as accessible as it  
16 always has been. As this process continues, I need  
17 to be comfortable that all aspects of the  
18 ingress/egress issue are addressed that parking will  
19 be created to replace those spaces that will be lost.  
20 I am hopeful SCA will show us hard numbers  
21 demonstrating what exists now, and what will exist  
22 once construction is completed. As I stated in the  
23 beginning, this project is needed, and is necessary  
24 and I look forward to its grand opening in September  
25

1  
2 of 2021. Now is the opportunity for us to figure out  
3 the traffic plan, how to get this done right, making  
4 sure that Petrides campus is as fully as possible for  
5 now and decades to come. So, I look forward to SCA's  
6 testimony. I want to also state I-I appreciate SCA  
7 working with my office on this project. I think we  
8 are very close to just making sure that we have these  
9 two issues addressed. I look forward to your  
10 testimony, and then I'll-I'll come back with some  
11 questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, Council  
13 Member. I echo the sentiments of my colleague. I  
14 now call upon Kelly Murphy, SCA, Gayle Mandaro, SCA,  
15 Melanie La Rocca, and Ben Goodman to give your  
16 testimony. Before you begin, Counsel will you please  
17 swear in the panel.

18 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right  
19 hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole  
20 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony  
21 before this Subcommittee in response to all Council  
22 Member questions?

23 PANEL MEMBERS: [off mic] I do.

24 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. You may  
25 begin.

1  
2                   KELLY MURPHY: Hello, members. Again, my  
3 name is Kelly Murphy and I'm the Director in the Real  
4 Estate Strategy Group for SCA and as you know, my  
5 colleagues are here. The New York City School  
6 Construction Authority has undertaken the site  
7 selection process for anew intermediate high school  
8 on a site on Block 683 on a portion of lot/lawn (sic)  
9 and it will be proposed Lot 320 in the future in the  
10 Borough of Staten Island. The prosed site consists  
11 of approximately 101,948 square foot. It's  
12 approximately 2.34 acres situated on he Petrides  
13 Campus located at 715 Ocean Terrace. The proposed  
14 site is owned by the city of New York with  
15 jurisdiction assigned to the New York City Department  
16 of Education and is located within the Todt Hill  
17 section of Staten Island, Community District 2 and  
18 Community School District 31. Under the proposed  
19 project the SCA plans to construct a new ISHS  
20 facility serving District 75 students across the  
21 Borough and will serve as a replacement for the  
22 Richard H. Hungerford School currently located at 155  
23 Tompkins Avenue. The Notice of Filing for the site  
24 plan was published in the New York Post, The Staten  
25 Island Advance and the City Record on October 1,

1 2018, and Staten Island Community Board No. 2,  
2 Community Education Council 31, the Citywide Council  
3 for District 75 and the City Planning Commission were  
4 all notified of the site plan. The Citywide Council  
5 for District 75 held a hearing on October 18, 2018.  
6 The Community Board, the CEC and chose not to hold  
7 public hearings. The SCA considered all comments  
8 received on the proposed site plan and affirms the  
9 site plan pursuant to Section 1731 of the New York  
10 Public Authorities Law. Pursuant to Section 1731 of  
11 the Public Authorities Law, the SCA submitted the  
12 proposed site plan to the Mayor and City Council by  
13 letter dated November 26, 2018. With that, we look  
14 forward to your comments and look forward to  
15 favorite-favorable consideration of the proposed site  
16 plan.  
17

18 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. Council  
19 Member Matteo, did you have questions?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you, Chair  
21 Adams. So, let's just thank you for your testimony.  
22 Thank you for being here obviously. Let's just go  
23 right into the parking. Can you tell me how many  
24 sports are on-on the Petrides complex.  
25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

KELLY MURPHY: And currently it's  
approximately 680 spaces.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And for the new  
school?

KELLY MURPHY: Um, I don't know. The  
new--well, it's--it's kind of complicated. So, the  
existing spaces will be restripe--

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay.

KELLY MURPHY: --which will get additional  
spaces from the existing space. There will be new  
spaces put on Safety City Boulevard, and for a net  
increase of 14 spaces to the current.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Fourteen spaces  
throughout the entire complex?

KELLY MURPHY: Just--just yeah to the  
facility, right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, so we're  
not losing any spots at all?

KELLY MURPHY: No.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Good and the  
restriping it--will that--that includes the upper  
portion of the parking lot now or just Safety City  
Boulevard.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

KELLY MURPHY: No, the Safety City

Boulevard are new spaces--

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Yeah.

KELLY MURPHY: --and the restriping also  
gets--gains us new spaces as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, and if you--

-

KELLY MURPHY: [interposing] Because the  
layouts will be different.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And my number for  
the new school is 174. Is that accurate parking  
spaces?

KELLY MURPHY: That, well that's what  
will be used, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: For the new  
school?

KELLY MURPHY: For the facility. For the  
staff and some of the--

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [interposing]  
I'm saying that those would kind of be designated for  
the new school right?

KELLY MURPHY: That's an operations  
question. I'm not sure about who--if they'll be

1 designated. They're not designated now. So, I can't  
2 really--  
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [interposing]  
5 Okay, well it's something we'll address as we're  
6 working for through the process.

7 KELLY MURPHY: No, I can't answer that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, and I'm—I'm  
9 please that we have a net gain of 14 spots.  
10 Certainly we don't want to lose any. So, I'm going  
11 to go right into my second issue and that's the—the  
12 traffic obviously. You know, as you know, the trees  
13 are very traverse on the campus not only during  
14 school not only in the morning and afternoon, but  
15 holding a lot of events. So, I just want to talk  
16 about how we plan on utilizing the second entrance  
17 where that's going to be, and how we don't impact the  
18 trees at the school now. So, if you could just talk  
19 a little bit about the plans for the new entrance,  
20 and how we're going to get staff and the students who  
21 are using the Hungerford School to—to the school  
22 without major impact on Ocean Terrace.

23 KELLY MURPHY: Well, current Petrides  
24 operations will come and go as they do presently.  
25 With Hungerford, they will come and go through the

1 Safety City Boulevard entrance and we designed so  
2 that they come in and circulate around and come back  
3 out--

4  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And--

6 KELLY MURPHY: --on City Boulevard.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So, as it is now,  
8 in the existing school most of the students are  
9 bussed in--use a--use a bus.

10 KELLY MURPHY: For Hungerford, yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Yeah.

12 KELLY MURPHY: Almost no student or  
13 parent drop-off. It's all through Ambulet or small  
14 buses.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And we--we  
16 anticipate that obviously at the new school? No?

17 KELLY MURPHY: Based on our existing  
18 population.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: We are going to  
20 bring the buses in in the morning, and they are going  
21 to be directed to go back out the same way they came  
22 back in?

23 KELLY MURPHY: That's what the design  
24 encourages that circulation to come in and go back  
25 out.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay, and the  
3 same thing for afternoon?

4 KELLY MURPHY: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: And then we have  
6 no plans to utilize the existing entrance on Ocean  
7 Terrace and those neighborhoods?

8 KELLY MURPHY: No.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Okay. So, I mean  
10 those are the—those are the main issues. Obviously,  
11 we're all on the same page of—of—of making a school a  
12 reality and the kids certainly deserve it. So, I  
13 know where we are in terms of, you know, the  
14 direction where we don't—we have to work together,  
15 though, as we move forward to ensure that we don't—we  
16 don't have a mix of the vehicular and traffic from  
17 the trees at Hungerford. That's—that is extremely  
18 important for the safety of the students, for the  
19 safety of parents. We—we can make this work. We've  
20 just got to make sure that we're with, you know,  
21 having constant conversations with—with us, with DOT.  
22 We've got to get DOT in the same room to make sure  
23 that that these plans are—are—are realized so the  
24 school, which is going to be a great school, doesn't  
25 have any detriment to the existing—the campus. So,

1 I'm satisfied with where we are now. I appreciate  
2 the effort. I think we still have a little bit more  
3 work to do but that's—that's in the normal of—of the  
4 process of actually getting out there and looking and  
5 working together. So, I ask that you—that you ensure  
6 that we communicate, that we work together, and we  
7 bring in DOT and we make sure that the traffic plan  
8 is the right traffic plan, and—and make this work.

10 KELLY MURPHY: Yeah, we've been in  
11 ongoing talking with DOT, and we will continue to do  
12 so as we go forward and finalize design.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you. Thank  
14 you, Chair Adams.

15 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much  
16 Council Member Matteo. We've been joined by Council  
17 Member Brad Lander and Council Member Inez Barron.  
18 Thank you very much for your testimony today. Are  
19 there any more members or members of the public who  
20 wish to testify on those items? Okay, thank you.  
21 Seeing none, the public hearing LU 278 is now closed.

22 KELLY MURPHY: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.  
24 We are waiting for one more Council Member before we  
25 can take our vote. [background comments] Thank you.

1  
2 In accordance with effected Council Member's  
3 recommendations, we will vote on this item, and three  
4 other items for which the Subcommittee conducted  
5 public hearings earlier this month. We will vote to  
6 approve LU 278 for a site selection of a 456-seat  
7 District 75 school in Member Matteo's district. We  
8 will also vote to approve LU 238, the 238 President  
9 Street House and I now recognize Council Member Brad  
10 Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very  
12 much Chair Adams. I appreciate the opportunity to be  
13 here. So, yes, I guess you have three items on the  
14 calendar today that are in my district. So, thank  
15 you to you and your—your members for your work on  
16 them. Two of them are landmarks at 236 and 238  
17 President Street, and these are wonderful projects.  
18 I'm sorry that I was not able to be here for the—for  
19 the hearing, but they are just lovely buildings. One  
20 was the first building in Brooklyn to function as a  
21 kindergarten, and a lovely building, and then the  
22 other is just a gorgeous residential building. They  
23 functioned together for a while as church. It was  
24 actually the first Spanish language Methodist Church  
25 in Brooklyn. Joan Baez's father was the minister at

1 the church for a little while. So, this has got a  
2 lovely story. The residents—the residential  
3 buildings have come a co-op, and the residents  
4 themselves led the effort and are asking to have  
5 their building landmarked and preserved, the  
6 kindergarten building next door was at actually very  
7 real risk of being demolished and sold off, and—and  
8 redeveloped. So, this is a great action and I urge a  
9 yes vote, and I appreciate your support. On the DOT  
10 Brooklyn Fleet Service facility, on 14<sup>th</sup> Street in my  
11 district, I really appreciate your work and the work  
12 of the staff to achieve good modifications to it that  
13 will make it function better. That's a big fleet  
14 maintenance facility. It's moving from somewhere  
15 else. We need some place that all the DOT fleet is  
16 maintained obviously having lots of trucks coming in  
17 and out of a big maintenance facility. Not  
18 necessarily something folks are jumping up and down  
19 about, and this is directly across the street from  
20 the Sanitation garage and two blocks away from  
21 another Sanitation garage. In my community board, we  
22 actually house not only our own garage, but the  
23 garage for another community board. So, there's  
24 meaningful impacts. I appreciate the work that DOT  
25



1  
2 did, and I thank the Administration for working with  
3 us to try to address some of those impacts especially  
4 in the context of the work we are doing for the forth  
5 coming Gowanus Rezoning, and so DOT has agreed to  
6 move forward toward rooftop solar on the facility,  
7 and to address onsite storm water management, to  
8 address some of the amount of impacts of this  
9 facility and that face Gowanus in general, and then  
10 to work with us both with Department of  
11 Transportation, but especially Department of  
12 Sanitation to make sure that the substantial number  
13 of public infrastructure trucks can—don't overwhelm  
14 the local playground, parking and other issues. So,  
15 with those new commitments, which they have provided  
16 today, I'm pleased to recommend a vote to approve  
17 with modifications to modify this application  
18 modestly, and then approve it with those  
19 modifications, and I thank you for your time, and  
20 this committee for its work.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much  
22 Council Member Lander. We did have a pretty good—  
23 very lively hearing on these items, and recognizing  
24 that the community was very much in favor of  
25

1 landmarking. So, we're really excited about this.

2 So, thank you very much--

3  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [interposing]

5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: --for your support.

7 We would like to acknowledge Council Member Treyger.

8 Who is also on the committee and has entered the

9 room. I will continue to go on with what we're doing

10 today. We will also vote to approve LU 239 the Hans

11 S. Christian Memorial Kindergarten, two historic

12 landmark designations by the Landmarks Preservation

13 Commission located in the Carroll Gardens

14 neighborhood in Brooklyn as was heard, Represented by

15 Council Member Brad Lander. The Subcommittee heard

16 testimony that the residents of 238 President Street

17 strongly support the designation of that building

18 while the owner of the Hans S. Christian Memorial

19 Garden opposes designation of that building citing

20 alternations to the structure in LPC's prior decision

21 to pursue designation after a 2007 request for

22 evaluation. However, LPC provided persuasive

23 testimony that alternations to the kindergarten are

24 reversible that that structure has significant

25 aesthetic value, and when taken together with the

1 adjacent building at 238 President Street which  
2 served as the Brooklyn Deaconess Home of the  
3 Methodist Episcopal Church. The structure at 236  
4 President has significant historic value both as the  
5 first purpose-built kindergarten in the city and as  
6 home of the first Spanish Methodist Church,  
7 Brooklyn's oldest Spanish language Protestant Church.  
8 Based on these findings and the support of Council  
9 Member Lander the Subcommittee will therefore vote to  
10 approve both designations. Finally, we will vote to  
11 approve with modifications LU 256, an application  
12 submitted by the Department of Transportation and the  
13 Department of Citywide Administrative Services  
14 pursuant to Section 197-C of the New York City  
15 Charter for the site selection and acquisition of  
16 property located at 25 14<sup>th</sup> Street in Brooklyn for a  
17 fleet vehicle maintenance and repair facility. DOT  
18 has committed to exploring sustainable energy systems  
19 in this building. Accordingly, our modification will  
20 clarify and ensure that this site is for a DOT fleet,  
21 not another agency fleet. This site is also in  
22 Council Member Lander's District. I now call for a  
23 vote to approve LUs 278, 238 and 239 and to approve  
24  
25

1  
2 with modifications LU 256. Counsel, please call the  
3 roll.

4 LEGAL COUNSEL: Adams.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on  
8 all.

9 LEGAL COUNSEL: Treyger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

11 LEGAL COUNSEL: By a vote of 3 in the  
12 affirmative, 0 in the negative with 0 abstentions,  
13 LUs 278, 238 and 239 are recommended for approval and  
14 LU 256 is recommended for approval with modifications  
15 by the full Land Use Committee.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.  
17 This vote will be held open for 20 minutes. This  
18 concludes today's business, but I would like to  
19 thank--[background comments] We will leave this  
20 meeting open. I said this--this vote is open for 20  
21 minutes. I would like to thank the members of the  
22 public, my colleagues, Council and Land Use staff for  
23 attending today.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I would just  
25 like to say especially thank you to Chelsea and to

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND  
MARITIME USES

21

Amy and Sean for helping on—on this morning's  
matters. Thank you.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Thank you.

[background comments/pause]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.

This concludes today's business. I would like to  
once again thank the members of the public, my  
colleagues, Council and Land Use staff for attending  
today's hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 21, 2018