

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

November 19, 2018
Start: 2:10 p.m.
Recess: 4:06 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: DONOVAN RICHARDS, JR.
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Andrew Cohen
Chaim M. Deutsch
Vanessa L. Gibson
Rory I. Lancman
Carlos Menchaca
Daneek Miller
Keith Powers
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Paul A. Vallone
Mark Levine

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Oleg Chernowski
Executive Director
NYPD Hate Crime Task Force

Mark Molinari
Deputy Inspector
NYPD Hate Crime Task Force

Dana Sussman
Deputy Commissioner on Human Rights
NYPD Hate Crime Task Force

Chelsea Goldinger
Government Relations Manager
LGBT Center
Manhattan, New York

Amit Ali
Program Manager
Arab American Family Support Center

State Senator James Sanders

Michael Cohen
East Coast Director
Simon Wiesenthal Center

Brandon Terrill Hicks
National Organizer
National Election Network

Audesa [phonetic] Ray
New York City Anti-violence Project

2 JOHN BIONDO: This a microphone check.
3 Today's date is November 19, 2018, Committee on
4 Public Safety being recorded by John Biondo
5 [phonetic], City Hall, Council Chambers.

6 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: [gavel] All right,
7 good afternoon. I am New York City Council member
8 Donovan Richards of the 31st District in Queens and
9 the Chair of the Committee on Public Safety. Thank
10 you for joining us today. I want to first
11 acknowledge the members of the Public Safety
12 Committee who are here: Queens Council Member Rory
13 Lancman, Brooklyn being represented by Council Member
14 Chaim Deutsch. We are here to discuss a topic that I
15 wish we did not have to address in New York City of
16 all places. We New Yorkers are proud of a lot of
17 things but our diversity has to be at the top of that
18 list. In my own district in Far Rockaway, we are
19 Black Americans of mixed ethnicities, we are White,
20 we are 25% Latino. We have a strong Hasidic Jewish
21 community, all of us living together, sharing the
22 subways, buses, restaurants and elected officials and
23 to most, if not all of us, a life shared amongst
24 different cultures and different ways of life is what
25 makes New York the greatest City in the world. There

2 have been times, of course, in our shared history
3 when there has been tension. I remember when I was
4 growing up, the Crown Heights riots and the tension
5 between the Black community and the Jewish community
6 that arose out of a tragic accident that pitted these
7 communities against each other. Eventually what
8 brought us out of that time was the recognition that
9 it is hard work to live together but work that has to
10 be done. Two vastly different cultures will of
11 course take time to learn and understand each other.
12 That kind of tension, even if I don't like it, I can
13 understand that it is part of growing up as a society
14 but what is harder to understand is the [Inaudible]
15 that we are seeing more and more today, not based on
16 the challenges of living together but based on the
17 belief that someone else is less of a person, less
18 deserving of life because of what they look like or
19 what they believe or whom they love. That is simply
20 anger and rage and a need to oppress and it makes me
21 sick that in the United States of America in 2018,
22 there are people out there who still think they need
23 to hate someone else, to kill someone else for their
24 differences. That's something I will never truly
25 understand. Given how inconceivable that kind of

2 hatred is, it is tempting to want to punish and
3 silence anyone who expresses these hateful
4 ideologies. In my gut I feel that way. When the
5 groups like the Proud Boys come to our City to spew
6 their wrong-headed nonsense, it's easy for me to lose
7 sight of what it means to live in a free, democratic
8 society. When the President of the United States
9 refuses to condemn white nationalism, I am ashamed of
10 who we are and I'm angry that progress has been so
11 slow. It is those moments that we need to rise above
12 our own anger and remember that as horrendous and
13 wrong as we know white nationalism, anti-Semitism,
14 racism of any kind to be the freedom of our national
15 depends on the protection of their first amendment
16 right to say what they believe. Our ability to rise
17 above them, to defend their rights even when they
18 attack us, that is ultimately what makes us better
19 than them. They are wrong to hate us for differences
20 we are born with or are given to us by God and we are
21 righteous because we cherish and defend their choice
22 to say that which we know to be false and wrong but
23 what we will not do is tolerate crimes committed
24 against those who have been marginalized and
25 persecuted throughout history. Decades ago there was

2 tension between the Black and Jewish communities but
3 today they continue to be unified by the inevitable
4 distinction toward the top of the list of hate crime
5 victims. Today and always we must remember that what
6 happened at the Tree of Life Synagogue in Pittsburgh
7 is what happened at the church in South Carolina.
8 Here in New York, our law says that a crime committed
9 in the name of racial or religious or homophobic
10 hatred will be punished severely. Our houses of
11 worship are sacred and they must be kept safe, not
12 with more guns and more violence but with laws.
13 Today we will hear from the NYPD about the Hate
14 Crimes Task Force whose officers have the difficult
15 job of knowing when to protect those who wish and
16 stopping those who wish to commit crimes. I know
17 there are challenges in that row and I know there is
18 more we can do to support their efforts. For that
19 reason, we are also hearing two related bills, Intro
20 1234 sponsored by Council Member Levine which would
21 require the Mayor to establish an office for the
22 prevention of hate crimes, to coordinate a response
23 to hate crimes amongst City agencies and Council
24 Member Deutsch and I are co-sponsoring a pre-
25 considered Introduction to require that office to

2 conduct education outreach to the community. The
3 NYPD has a huge role to play in keeping us safe but
4 as a society, we can't just rely on the police to
5 change minds and hearts. This is something we are
6 going to have to all do coming together. That being
7 said, I'm going to turn the mike over to Council
8 Member Deutsch who is the lead sponsor on. Thank
9 you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, Chair
11 Richards. Good afternoon, during the last several
12 weeks it seems that there is a new hate crime
13 reported nearly every day in the news. In fact,
14 there have been a total of 313 reported hate crimes
15 in New York City this year to date. That's nearly
16 one a day in 2018. In the United States at large,
17 hate crimes are on the rise as well. The most recent
18 numbers from the FBI indicate a 17% increase in
19 reported hate crimes as these numbers rise for the
20 third year in a row. My bill would require an
21 educational arm for the office of hate crime
22 prevention that would require outreach through
23 coordination with relevant City agencies, the NYPD,
24 interfaith organizations, community groups and others
25 to conduct effective education about the impact and

2 effects of hate crimes and work with the Department
3 of Education to create a curriculum that addresses
4 issues relating to hate crimes and teaches tolerance
5 and understanding. In an effort to be transparent,
6 my bill will also require public postings on the New
7 York City website about the populations reached by
8 the Division of Educational Outreach, 2) the types of
9 programs created or provided by the Division of
10 Educational Outreach and the names of the providers
11 of such programs and 3) any other outreach education
12 and prevention efforts made by the Division of
13 Educational Outreach. Our City is a melting pot,
14 home to New Yorkers from 150 different countries who
15 speak more than 80 different languages and 40% of New
16 Yorkers are immigrants. Mutual respect and
17 understanding of people with different ethnicities,
18 religions and belief systems can go a long way
19 towards creating a more peaceful, tolerant New York
20 City. Over the last several weeks, followed the
21 incidents in Pittsburgh where eleven individuals were
22 murdered, were slaughtered just only praying at a
23 synagogue. Since then we have experienced also here
24 in New York City with an African burial where there
25 was racial slur scrawled where we're joined by the

2 New York City Council's Jewish caucus and the
3 Black/Latino/Asian caucus united to speak out against
4 hate, bigotry and bias. Following that, I had the
5 opportunity to visit Ann Marie at the hospital, who
6 was stabbed several times, and was cursed at with a
7 racial slur. In addition in Borough Park on 13th
8 Avenue and 46th Streets, where a Jewish individual
9 was severely beaten on the streets in the morning
10 walking to prayers. We need to put an end to what
11 the motives are to these hate crimes and do a better
12 job in educating the public and also determining the
13 motives of reasons why these hate crimes occur so
14 today I'm proud to sponsor this bill with my
15 colleague and Chair, Donovan Richards, as well as my
16 colleague Mark Levine who has an additional bill to
17 provide an office of hate crimes. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, all
19 righty. You may begin. Also, we've been joined by
20 Council Members Justin Brannan and also Fernando
21 Cabrera. All righty and we will start hearing from
22 the first panel, executive director Oleg, deputy
23 inspector Mark Molinari and deputy commissioner on
24 human rights, Dana Sussman.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you swear to tell
3 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
4 to this Committee and answer all questions to the
5 best of your ability?

6 PANEL: Yes, all.

7 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: You may begin.

8 MARK MOLINARI: Thank you, good morning
9 Chair Richards and members of the Council. I am
10 deputy inspector, Mark Molinari, the commanding
11 officer of the New York City Police Department's Hate
12 Crime Task Force. I am joined here today by Oleg
13 Chernowski, the department executive director of
14 legislative affairs. On behalf of the Police
15 Commissioner, James P. O'Neill, we are pleased to
16 testify before your committee about how the
17 department investigates and works to prevent hate
18 crimes in our City. Whether it is the heartbreaking
19 and senseless murder of Timothy Kaufman, the
20 indiscriminate spray painting of swastikas on
21 synagogues or the unprovoked attack on Hassane Elbaz,
22 one thing is clear, weak and callous individuals are
23 attempting to breed fear and divisiveness. It has,
24 however, been heartening to watch the reactions of
25 New Yorkers in the wake of these heinous attacks.

2 The Council has also led in its response to those who
3 seek to promote hate. It was encouraging to watch so
4 many members stand with the Jewish Caucus after the
5 horrible attacks in Pittsburgh and the Black/Latino
6 and Asian Caucus after hatemongers defiled the
7 African burial ground monument, the final resting
8 place for some 15,000 Africans, individuals cruelly
9 torn from their homes for a life of involuntary
10 servitude. Time and time again, the people of this
11 City have not permitted New York to fall into the
12 darkness of hate and division. This City honors
13 those historically persecuted for their race, origin,
14 beliefs and identities and at its core, the
15 department exists to protect and serve every
16 individual and community, especially the most
17 vulnerable. I think we can all agree that an attack
18 on a member of a particular community, targeted
19 because of their race, religion, nationality, gender,
20 or sexual orientation is an attack on all New
21 Yorkers. New York City is the world's epicenter of
22 diversity and stands as an example of how distinct
23 cultures and religions and nationalities can exist
24 side by side, learning from one another, enriching
25 each other. One of the core pillars of our City's

2 strength is the kaleidoscope of people who call this
3 City home. Hate and intolerance have no place in our
4 society and attacks premised on hate and intolerance
5 weigh on the collective consciousness of not only the
6 targeted community but the entirety of the New York
7 community. Through November 11 of this year, there
8 have been 308 confirmed hate crime incidents in the
9 City which is slightly more than 303 hate crime
10 incidents reported through November 11 of last year.
11 While we have seen marked decreases in hate crimes in
12 certain categories during this period as compared to
13 last year, we've also seen significant increases in
14 others. For example, hate crimes motivated by
15 gender, ethnicity, religion generally, and Muslim
16 religion in particular are down 36%, 40%, 33% and 53%
17 respectively. However, anti-Black, anti-White and
18 anti-Semitic hate crimes are up 27%, 88% and 18%
19 respectively. I want to assure you that the NYPD has
20 zero tolerance of these vile and despicable acts.
21 While our collective message of tolerance may not be
22 able to win over the hearts and minds of bigots and
23 racists, we can work tirelessly to ensure those who
24 commit crime motivated by hate are apprehended and
25 brought to justice. The Department created the Hate

2 Crime Task Force in order to thoroughly investigate
3 such crimes and to ensure the apprehension of such
4 perpetrators. The largest such unit in the nation,
5 the Hate Crime Task Force consists of 18 detectives,
6 2 sergeants, 1 lieutenant, a captain and myself for a
7 total of 23 sworn officers who are specially trained
8 to identify and investigate hate based crime.

9 Although we can agree that certain rhetoric is
10 disturbing and offensive, such rhetoric may not
11 always rise to the level of criminal activity. The
12 Hate Crime Task Force reviews every hate crime
13 reported to the department. If a hate crime is
14 established, the Hate Crime Task Force takes over the
15 investigation and has the ability to mobilize any and
16 all of the department resources, including
17 specialized units to apprehend the perpetrators of
18 these particularly heinous crimes. The Hate Crime
19 Task Force routinely mobilizes precinct detectives,
20 TARU, computer crime squad, intelligence bureau and
21 the community affairs bureau to assist in our
22 investigations. By combining our experience and
23 expertise and the skills and knowledge of these
24 bureaus and specialized units, we are able to make
25 more effective identifications, expeditious

2 apprehensions and build stronger cases for
3 prosecution, thereby ensuring real consequences for
4 those committing these offenses. At all levels, the
5 department is working diligently to develop stronger
6 relationships with members of the City's diverse
7 communities, to the implementation of our
8 neighborhood policing philosophy, the work of our
9 neighborhood coordination officers and sector cops,
10 our build the block meetings, community council
11 meetings, clergy roundtables and regular meetings
12 with advocates to just name a few, we are building
13 unprecedented levels of trust with those we serve.
14 This enables us to work with communities in the wake
15 of such incidents to quickly obtain relevant
16 information and allow our community partners to
17 meaningfully assist our investigation. The Hate
18 Crime Task Force also works closely with other NYPD
19 bureaus and members of the community in furtherance
20 of crime prevention. We continuously discuss
21 incidents to precinct commanders so that they can
22 appropriately deploy, patrol resources, and provide
23 extra protection at religious institutions and other
24 sensitive locations. Whenever there is a high
25 profile incident such as the Pittsburgh shooting, the

2 NYPD goes on high alert significantly increasing its
3 visibility and in many cases customizing its
4 deployment plan to discourage potential copy cats and
5 increase safety. We also brief community members and
6 Council Members immediately after such high profile
7 incidents to ensure our communities are aware that
8 even though an incident did not happen in New York
9 City, the department is implementing a plan and
10 taking action to ensure their safety as well as to
11 address any security concerns that may be raised.
12 I'd like to conclude by encouraging members of the
13 public to report to the department or to the New York
14 City Commission on Human Rights whenever they are the
15 victim of a hate crime or discrimination so that the
16 City can properly investigate and mitigate these
17 instances. We look forward to partnering with the
18 Council to get us to the day where Hate Crime Task
19 Force is no longer needed to exist. Thank you for
20 inviting us here to testify today and we are now
21 happy to answer any questions you may have.

22 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, human
23 rights? No testimony?

24 DANA SUSSMAN: No testimony, we're here
25 to answer questions if you have them.

2 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, awesome.

3 All rightly, so can we start with so, cases are
4 generally referred by patrol or precinct detective to
5 the Task Force so how does that, can you just walk me
6 through how that works?

7 MARK MOLINARI: Sure, generally you are
8 correct, yes. When a police officer comes in contact
9 with a member of the community through any means, 911
10 calls or the NCO program, when that member of the
11 community reports to the police they are the victim
12 of a crime and it could be of a possibly bias nature,
13 department protocol ensures that they notify a
14 supervisor, sergeant or lieutenant who then
15 investigates the circumstances and brings it to the
16 attention of an executive, a captain or higher
17 assigned to the precinct or the borough and once it
18 gets to that level, the captain assesses the
19 circumstances and if it's a, he deems it to be a
20 possibly biased incident, we are notified right
21 directly to the Hate Crime Task Force. We continue
22 to work from there which I can get into or if he
23 deems it to not be a bias incident, we still get
24 notified by that patrol executive about the incident
25 that happened.

2 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And how many cases
3 would you say each investigator handles on average at
4 a given time?

5 MARK MOLINARI: On average this year,
6 we're at about 23.

7 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So 23 and that's
8 adequate staffing in your opinion or being that we're
9 seeing, well, we've seen some slight decreases but
10 increases in certain areas, has that warranted any
11 need for additional staffing?

12 MARK MOLINARI: It has not warranted, we
13 are adequately staffed right now. We do have the
14 ability to reach out and get more staff internally
15 into the office if we need more but we also have all
16 those support units that I mentioned, all the
17 precinct detectives and other units, TARU, the list
18 that I went through, that if we need resources to
19 help us in our investigation we have complete access
20 to the department.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And you've just
22 announced the restructuring of the Hate Crime Task
23 Force from being under the SVD Unit now under, I
24 guess you could speak to that change. What warranted
25 that change?

2 MARK MOLINARI: Do you want to?

3 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, Council Member,
4 the, it was the top to bottom review that was
5 announced when the Chief of Detectives took office
6 earlier this year. He announced that he was going to
7 do a top to bottom review of not only SVD but the
8 whole bureau as a whole and the restructuring was a
9 part of that.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, so nothing
11 specifically eye popping, just a restructuring of
12 that division, okay and can you just walk us through
13 what's different now about it being from under SVD
14 unit into the new unit.

15 MARK MOLINARI: Previously under SVD you
16 had a Special Victims Division does child abuse and
17 sexual assaults and hate crime [Inaudible] was a part
18 of that unit. Pulling us out enabled them to just
19 work on those two fields and it pushed us into a
20 division where we have closer access to our support
21 units. Directly in the division with us is computer
22 crimes, major case squad. Further out into the
23 investigative group we have crime stoppers, crime
24 scene, the lab, many other specialty groups that we
25 have access to.

2 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: All right and can
3 you just go through how, what standard does the Task
4 Force use to evaluate whether something is a hate
5 crime opposed to a free speech?

6 MARK MOLINARI: Two things, we use
7 department protocol which establishes what's a hate
8 crime dating back to our patrol guide, dating back
9 the entries probably 40 years old but more
10 importantly, the New York State Penal Law 485
11 dictates what is a hate crime.

12 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So specifically,
13 so can you just run us through some examples if
14 someone spray paints a swastika somewhere or perhaps
15 if someone gets into a fight with someone on a subway
16 and they use a derogatory term. How would you
17 differentiate if it's reported as a hate crime?

18 MARK MOLINARI: Okay, we take the
19 information that comes in from the victim of it. We
20 use the parameters of the Penal Law, Article 485,
21 which to summarize as quickly as I can on it. It's a
22 crime motivated substantially or totally by the
23 identity, the ten protected identity groups, of the
24 victim so we take the incident that happened and
25 apply it to that statute. We could also reach out to

2 the legal bureau of the NYPD and the DA's office on
3 what we'll need to further a case and where these
4 cases lie based on case law so now, you gave a couple
5 of examples and yes, wearing of a swastika is a hate
6 crime, spraying of a slur against an identity is a
7 hate crime. Obviously an unmotivated attack on
8 somebody could fall into the hate crime parameters.
9 What we have to look at from there though is, was
10 that attack motivated by anything other than the
11 hatred and the discrimination against that identity.
12 You mentioned an assault also. If there was a
13 incident that proceeded the assault or the slurs
14 used, a push somewhere or a bumping into on a crowded
15 subway car or a crowded street, the motivation for
16 the attack could be the push and not the identity.
17 We usually use the example of like a car accident or
18 a road rage incident. The two people involved in the
19 car accident have some differences. Somebody may
20 express those differences, it may turn into a
21 physical altercation and somebody may use some
22 gratuitous slurs targeting any identity but the
23 motivation for that interaction is the car accident
24 and not just the hatred of the identity.

2 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And in your
3 opening testimony, you spoke of hate crimes certainly
4 being motivated in much different spaces this year.
5 Would you say that hate crime is being driven by
6 rhetoric we're hearing from the President or
7 Washington, D.C., does the NYPD have any idea why
8 we're seeing this surge in hate crimes in different
9 categories this year?

10 MARK MOLINARI: There is the surge in
11 hate crimes this year. The numbers that were
12 discussed, we are up slightly. In overall hate
13 crimes, we are down significantly in some categories
14 of hate crimes, some identities and we are up in
15 other identities.

16 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Can you speak to
17 the ones you're down in by the way as well, because I
18 know you mentioned it.

19 MARK MOLINARI: Sure, I gave a short list
20 in the opening statements but we are down in most of
21 our categories that we track and the ones we are up
22 in, we're up slightly in some categories and larger
23 increases in other categories but in order of
24 grouping them into what's motivating an increase
25 across the board in hate crimes and a decrease in

2 some and a increase in others, we can't target
3 exactly what would cause certain affiliations or
4 certain identities to be targeted more or less than
5 they previously were.

6 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So you don't,
7 you're not taking an official stance on if there's a
8 correlation between the rhetoric that we hear from
9 the President and folks in Washington, D. C. and a
10 lot of these hate groups who are popping up like the
11 Proud Boys, you're not seeing a correlation between
12 that and the increases.

13 MARK MOLINARI: None, no, I don't have a
14 stand on a direct correlation between the two.

15 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So you're not,
16 okay, so you're not officially saying there's a
17 correlation.

18 MARK MOLINARI: Correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, let's go
20 through so there's been a lot of talk around arming
21 individuals and houses of worship. What is the
22 NYPD's stance on that or what strategies would you
23 suggest houses of worship, synagogues, mosques,
24 churches use, or have you thinking about different
25 strategies to ensure that houses or worship feel safe

2 across the city in light of the Tree of Synagogue
3 massacres?

4 OLEG CERNOWSKI: So I think the
5 Commissioner has spoken out about this topic whether
6 it be after a school shooting that happened somewhere
7 in the country or one of the type of incidents that
8 happened in Pittsburgh that we have the largest
9 police department in the nation. We have 36,000
10 armed officers, sworn police officers and that we
11 should be tasked with the job of policing and it
12 should not be outsourced to individuals carrying
13 guns. I think the less guns, the better in this
14 sense. I think the message that we would like to get
15 across and the message that we put out as often as we
16 possibly can is that we have a service, a free
17 service. It's not a service for charge that we
18 provide to houses of worship and other facilities
19 that can request a security survey of their
20 particular facility. We, through our crime
21 prevention unit, will send crime prevention officers
22 to that location. They're gonna do a top to bottom
23 assessment that includes window glazing on glass,
24 video surveillance, security lighting, personal
25 safety, alarms and intrusion detective devices,

2 mechanical and electrical locking systems just to
3 name a few that we will have these individuals that
4 are specially trained go through a location and
5 create a report for the house of worship or whichever
6 the facility is and hopefully they're gonna implement
7 the recommendations that we offer. This is again,
8 I'm gonna repeat it, it's free of charge and it's
9 upon request so whenever we can through our clergy
10 roundtables, the community forums, we get the
11 information out that this is something that we offer
12 and we strongly recommend that locations that feel
13 vulnerable, take us up on that offer.

14 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And I agree with
15 that that more guns is not necessarily the answer but
16 what do we tell community members who are rightfully
17 afraid of what could happen given the circumstances
18 in Pittsburgh and, you know, so one of the other
19 things I've heard is that the NYPD also, so I know
20 you spoke of the crime prevention unit. How many
21 people are in that unit?

22 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I'll have to get back
23 to you. I don't have the exact number.

24 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, because I
25 have heard from houses of worship that there is a

2 backlog in those asked, partly because I think local
3 precincts may not have more than one crime prevention
4 officer perhaps so that may be an area we can look at
5 and then there's also another program. I don't know
6 if you could speak to it on where I believe, off-duty
7 officers and I know it's a paid service I think.

8 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure.

9 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Through the NYPD
10 that houses of worship could pay for.

11 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, the pay detailed
12 program is off-duty officers. Companies or
13 locations, for example, houses of worship can apply
14 to have an off-duty police officer provide security.
15 It's, I can give you more information on that program
16 that you can distribute to your constituents but
17 yeah, that is available.

18 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And are these
19 officers in uniform?

20 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, and what is
22 the availability of these particular officers? How
23 many, so how does that work? Does an officer request
24 to be a part of the program?

2 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: So yeah, officers would
3 obviously, it's not mandatory. Officers would
4 request to be part of the program and locations would
5 apply to have an officer stationed there. I don't
6 believe bars or locations that serve alcohol can
7 apply for this service but for a house of worship
8 could be a good example or a bank can apply for this
9 type of service and it's done through the Department.
10 There's a paid detail office that will review the
11 application and assign an officer if it's approved.

12 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And has the NYPD
13 taken a stance, have you seen much more of an
14 increase in applications over the course of the last
15 month or so?

16 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I'm not aware, I can't
17 tell you but I can definitely look into that and get
18 back to you.

19 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, because I've
20 heard that they are backlogs and so I'm just
21 interested in knowing a little bit more about that
22 specific process. I'm just gonna go into a few
23 details and then turn over to my colleagues for
24 questions. So I know you're familiar with the Proud
25 Boys and in your testimony you spoke of if a hate

2 crime is established, the Hate Crime Task Force takes
3 over the investigation and has the ability to
4 mobilize any and all the department's resources
5 including specialized units that apprehend the
6 perpetrators of these particularly heinous crimes.
7 Can you go into where we're at with arrests? Have we
8 arrested all of the individuals who were responsible
9 for that particular incident and if you can't go into
10 specifics, I certainly can understand if there's an
11 ongoing investigation but I think the public does
12 have a right to know to a great degree what are your
13 protocols moving forward with hate groups coming into
14 our City and deciding that they're wreak havoc on our
15 streets.

16 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure so, in terms of
17 the investigation, you're correct. It is still
18 ongoing. There have been a significant number of
19 arrests made in that case but there are still
20 individuals outstanding so I really wouldn't want to
21 comment on that case at the risk of jeopardizing it.
22 In terms of hate groups, we monitor a large number of
23 these hate groups through our partnerships with our
24 other state and federal partners. Through our
25 Century program we have partnerships with over 500

2 law enforcement partners around the country where we
3 share information with one another, where these other
4 law enforcement agencies throughout the country can
5 provide us with information on the hate groups
6 operating out of their jurisdiction and we can
7 provide them with information that we have as well
8 through our Shield program. We partner with over 19
9 and a half thousand private companies that, to
10 include houses of worship, that we share information
11 that we gather from our Century partners and
12 information that we gather on our own. We share that
13 information in order to better secure the locations
14 and the facilities within our City and to offer
15 better protection to our constituents.

16 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So in that
17 particular event, you were aware they were coming.
18 Can you describe the context of the PD's role going
19 into an event so they were coming here obviously to
20 give a speech at the Republican Club. Can you go
21 into what was your role at that specific place and
22 what role would you play is a hate group is coming
23 in?

24 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, I think in that
25 particular case, there was a first amendment event

2 scheduled at that location. We provided police
3 resources to be present at that location. There were
4 no violations at that particular spot. However, when
5 one of the crowds dispersed and were being led away,
6 the opposing group circled around the block and the
7 tail end of the group being dispersed wound up
8 meeting up with the group that was circling ground
9 and they had an altercation. Our response was
10 relatively quick. Of course, we were policing the
11 event at the location where the event was happening.
12 However, the incident that has been widely publicized
13 didn't happen at that particular location. Our
14 response, we were there within a minute, under a
15 minute, and as soon as the officers were observed,
16 the individuals that were violating the laws
17 scattered and we've been developing cases, collecting
18 video and developing cases on all of those that had
19 run away from that location and we have made several
20 apprehensions.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And was there a
22 sense even with the conclusion of that event that
23 there may be a problem arising outside that you were
24 aware of or no?

2 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, the, again, the
3 individuals were being led away and there were a
4 group towards the back of that crowd that broke away
5 and there was a group that was present counter
6 protesting that wound up going in a different
7 direction and they met up offsite so that was the way
8 that particular event unraveled.

9 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Looking back at
10 that event and I know the Mayor certainly alluded to
11 the fact that things should have and could have gone
12 better, are there any new protocols you can speak to
13 because something evidently went wrong there and I
14 just want to make sure that we don't sweep it under
15 the rug and that we are strategically going to insure
16 that an incident like this doesn't happen in the
17 future and that arrests don't happen nearly a week
18 later after an incident like that so can you, looking
19 back, what are some of the things that the NYPD
20 looking to do, what are you looking to do better
21 moving forward to insure an incident like that
22 doesn't happen again?

23 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I think, I mean
24 in terms of the arrests happening a week later as you
25 said, I think we had a unique set of circumstances in

2 this case that we didn't have any complainants coming
3 forward and complaining of a crime so we had to
4 actually investigate this particular incident in an
5 unusual way in the sense that we started gathering
6 video, going door to door and knocking on buildings
7 that had potentially had surveillance that had
8 cameras and reviewing those cameras trying to
9 identify not only potential victims that we could
10 approach and get the victim to make a complaint but
11 also to identify crimes that didn't need a victim to
12 make a complaint so that was the lag in time so that
13 was the unusual nature of this particular incident.
14 Ultimately what happened was we did gather enough
15 video that we were able to make out crimes that we
16 were able to start making apprehensions.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And that was the
18 Hate Crime Task Force the investigator who

19 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: No, the Hate Crime Task
20 Force was on standby for that incident but ultimately
21 that was not a hate crime case. That was a regular
22 case.

23 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And what role
24 would they play knowing that a hate group is coming

2 into the City, what role would they play knowing
3 that?

4 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, the Hate Crime
5 Task Force and the inspector can correct me if I'm
6 wrong, the Hate Crime Task Force would be
7 investigating the hate crime after it happens.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So no pre-work.

9 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, the pre-work we
10 have done through other units within the department
11 through our intelligence bureau that partners as
12 again I mentioned the Century and the Shield program
13 partnering with law enforcement agency and private
14 partners outside of the City to gather the
15 intelligence on these various groups that may be
16 coming here and securing the City that way.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: But that didn't
18 happen in this incident so I just want to make sure
19 that, okay

20 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I mean it's not
21 that it didn't happen in this incident. I mean the
22 event, the clash between the two different group
23 happened for a particular group coming into the City
24 and engaging in speech however offensive it may be,
25 would not be a crime in itself, would not be

2 something that the department would stop but what you
3 actually had happen there was that two opposing
4 groups clashed, not at the site where the protest
5 happened where we had police officers and police
6 resources but offsite so that was the unique nature
7 of this particular incident.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And are hate crime
9 charges being considered in this or could you speak
10 to that?

11 MARK MOLINARI: As of now, as Oleg said,
12 we were a support unit to that. We did assist in the
13 investigation but it was handled by the precinct
14 detective squad. As of right now, on the information
15 we have, they are not being processed as hate crime
16 charges. It's still an ongoing investigation.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, last
18 question and I'm gonna circle back towards the end.
19 So there was an incident I believe on the train a few
20 weeks ago back in Brooklyn, Chaim certainly spoke on
21 that a second ago. Is the Hate Crime Task Force
22 investigating that incident?

23 MARK MOLINARI: Absolutely, the 70th
24 precinct, a female was stabbed on the train. She was
25 assaulted and later discovered that she was stabbed.

2 We are actively working on that case. We have a
3 sketch that went out. I don't have it with me.

4 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So Hate Crime Unit
5 is now investigating that.

6 MARK MOLINARI: I believe we always were.
7 I don't think there was, that came direct to us.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, okay. I'm
9 gonna go to, before I go to Chaim Deutsch for
10 questions, I'm going to acknowledge we've been joined
11 by Council Members Keith Powers, Paul Vallone, Carlos
12 Menchaca, Ydanis Rodriguez, and Daneek Miller.
13 Council Member Deutsch.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
15 Chair. Firstly I just want to start off by saying
16 thank you deputy inspector. You've been really
17 accessible and I know like really, literally 24 hours
18 a day, whenever you're called, you answer your phone.
19 I hear your kids in the background sometimes and then
20 I heard your colleagues at work in the background so
21 I always get an idea where you are but you always
22 answer your phone so thank you for always being
23 accessible. So my first question is today we're
24 hearing on two bills. Number one is Intro number
25 1234 by my colleague, Council Member, Mark Levine, a

2 local law to amend the New York City Charter in
3 relation to creating an office for the prevention of
4 hate crimes and the second bill is Intro number
5 something that's sponsored by me and Council Member
6 Richards. Do you support these two bills?

7 I think, Council Member, at this point
8 the administration is reviewing the bills. We're
9 certainly supportive of the goals of the bills and
10 what the bills are trying to achieve and the
11 administration is actively reviewing the legislation
12 to formulate a position.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, so in the
14 testimony that the deputy inspector, the testimony, I
15 don't see anything mentioned in testimony about
16 education outreach. You speak about investigation,
17 you talk about how many offices you have but there's
18 nothing in there about doing education outreach. Do
19 you currently have anyone like on a constant basis
20 doing education outreach?

21 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: So we, through our
22 crime prevention unit and crime prevention officers,
23 we do go out, whether it's houses of worship or upon
24 request really. It's not limited to houses of
25 worship and we provide best practices. It's not only

2 the security surveys, the formal security surveys but
3 oftentimes we're asked to come and speak to a gather,
4 a congregation and we send these crime prevention
5 officers to that location. They'll speak to the
6 gathering whatever it may be and talk about best
7 practices on security, how to be more vigilant, what
8 to look out for to be more safe so in that sense,
9 yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So in the
11 testimony it was mentioned 23 sworn officers are
12 specifically trained to identify and investigate hate
13 based crimes so the crime prevention officers that
14 are in a precinct, they're not trained in regards to
15 that so we have 300 hate crimes so far in 2018, and I
16 think that where we need to start is to educate and
17 do outreach to the public and to figure out, let
18 people know that, for example, if someone draws a
19 swastika, do people know what the meaning of a
20 swastika is? Do people know how it affects a
21 Holocaust survivor? Do people know how it affects a
22 community? Do people know how it terrorizes a
23 community and this is the education outreach which is
24 important like I mentioned that New Yorkers
25 represents 150 different countries, speak over 80

2 languages, as many cultures and people from different
3 ethnic backgrounds. We need to understand each
4 other's culture number one, and we also need to
5 understand why a hate crime what it does to someone
6 when someone puts in a racial slur on the African
7 burial, does that individual know what he or she
8 wrote, what he or she scrolled on the burial so doing
9 the education is not just to be proactive like if you
10 see something, say something but just to understand
11 what a hate crime, what a swastika means, the meaning
12 of a racial slur. Do you have anything in the crime
13 prevention unit that does that?

14 MARK MOLINARI: Council Member, if I may
15 just jump in. As your bill points out and as Oleg
16 mentioned here that we do support the purpose of the
17 bill. We do support education and in getting this
18 horrendous nature to stop and in the Hate Crime Task
19 Force dare I use the word reactionary but the
20 investigators there are investigators of crimes that
21 have already occurred. At my level of the Hate Crime
22 Task Force luckily I get to do a little more of the
23 outreach. I work with various department units,
24 crime prevention, community affairs and they schedule
25 presentations to educate the community on what a hate

2 crime is. I work with other city agencies, state
3 agencies and federal agencies to educate communities
4 on what hate crimes are, how to protect themselves,
5 how to identify them and how to report such
6 incidents. I also do trainings, I do train some of
7 the crime prevention officers. I do trainings on all
8 the supervisory ranks when they get promoted, the
9 detective investigative course and executive
10 development to teach what a hate crime is so we do it
11 on my end. Being the executive, being the commanding
12 officer, I get to do some of that preemptive work
13 that I enjoy doing so much and I do presentations for
14 many communities that if somebody is having an event
15 and they would like me to speak at and I get my
16 department authorizations to do it and I will present
17 to whatever group is having that. As far as the
18 members of the Hate Crime Task Force, they're there
19 doing the boots on the ground work horrifically after
20 event.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So do you
22 believe that we could do a better job by having more
23 people going out to schools, to community centers and
24 just to talk about, just to do educational outreach
25 on hate crimes?

2 MARK MOLINARI: You know, Council Member,
3 I think, as we said, I think the goal of the
4 legislation, getting the word out and speaking to the
5 impact of hate based crimes and the fear that it
6 instills in communities and individuals, that's a
7 good thing.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So you support
9 that?

10 MARK MOLINARI: Well, as an idea, of
11 course we support it.

12 DANA SUSSMAN: If I may just add from the
13 Commission on Human Rights' perspective, we are also
14 engaging in education and outreach. We have a
15 community outreach team in all five boroughs that
16 works with schools, houses of worship, community
17 based organizations, our sister agencies to discuss
18 issues of discrimination and harassment whether it be
19 in response to trends of hate crimes or whether it be
20 a proactive community engagement so that folks know
21 that the City is supporting them, that we have
22 resources available to them and that if they choose
23 to come to us as a civil enforcement agency or report
24 to the NYPD, that we are there, we speak their
25 language, we represent the community and so we're

2 also engaging in that outreach and education as well
3 in partnership with NYPD.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Can you tell me
5 like in Brooklyn south how many events that you go to
6 that you did education outreach on hate crimes?

7 DANA SUSSMAN: I cannot tell you
8 specifically. I don't have sort of neighborhood
9 breakdowns today, but I can certainly get that
10 information back to you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: You thinking
12 more than a dozen?

13 DANA SUSSMAN: In a, in a, I cannot say.
14 I know that we have, we have a Brooklyn office.
15 That's not located in Brooklyn south but that is
16 present throughout Brooklyn and we have responded to
17 68 incidents of hate crimes that were based on
18 religion in the past year, the majority of which were
19 anti-Semitic and the second most frequent was anti-
20 Muslim.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, I'll get
22 back to that in a second. I just want to touch upon,
23 you did mention you have a crime prevention, trained
24 crime prevention unit to conduct security assessments
25 in house of worships. They go out and they do

2 assessments to the house of worships and they
3 determine if, you know, you let them know what they
4 need to do in order to better secure their premises
5 so I, you know, there's a federal and state grant
6 from Homeland Security that go to house of worships
7 and there are many house of worships who received
8 already the funding back in 2016 and some of the
9 money goes, I mean, all the money, all the funding
10 goes for hardware, indoor hardware and outdoor
11 hardware which includes bollards. I have not seen
12 too many house of worships that have these bollards
13 installed outside because there's a whole process.
14 You have to go, you have to hire an architect, you
15 have to go through DOB, this is all after the
16 assessments and I was just alerted that people are
17 sitting on this funding and they actually cannot do
18 anything with it so I just set up a meeting for two
19 weeks now after Thanksgiving to bring together the
20 NYPD, DOB and DOT to try to streamline this process
21 but this has been, they've been sitting on the
22 funding since, for a few years without anything being
23 done and the funding is there. Are you aware of
24 that, the funding that people received the funding
25 and it's just sitting there and nothing's being done?

2 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I mean, I'm aware that
3 this funding exists but I'm not really, it's not
4 administered through the NYPD. I think it's
5 administered federally so I really can't speak to
6 that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, so I'm
8 looking forward to working with you to work together
9 with the other agencies to see if we could push this
10 process to move. This way we get the right
11 protection for all the house of worships in the City.
12 So going back to the hate crimes issue, so you
13 mentioned, there are 308 hate crimes in 2018. Do you
14 know the motives for each hate crime? Is that
15 information that you would have?

16 MARK MOLINARI: The identity that's
17 targeted?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: The motive, in
19 other words, is it a person who's emotionally
20 disturbed who committed the hate crime? Is it an
21 individual who just may not know what a swastika
22 means, the meaning of a swastika? Is it someone that
23 has hate in his or her blood? So the motive behind
24 why the hate crime was done because now everything is
25 a number, 308, all right and but we don't know the

2 motive of why each hate crime was done. For example,
3 I know you had several arrests recently and the
4 incident in Williamsburg, there was an arrest made so
5 what was the reason for that pipe being thrown
6 through the window of the synagogue, right?

7 MARK MOLINARI: Right, I know the
8 incident you are speaking about. I don't have a
9 breakdown of the motivating factors on why
10 perpetrators commit the crimes. That would have to
11 come from the perpetrator themselves and we would
12 have to track all those incidents and we don't have
13 that breakdown.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: But that's
15 something that the NYPD would have, the motives?

16 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: No, I mean we have
17 motive in the sense of was it an anti-Semitic, was it
18 anti-Asian, was it anti-Black, you know, those are
19 the motivating factors that make out the crime and
20 therefore those are the ones that we track.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So the incident
22 in Crown Heights where a Jewish individual was hit
23 with a branch, right, so I was told, what I heard,
24 what I read in the news is that the person was

2 emotionally disturbed. Right, it wasn't a hate
3 crime, right?

4 MARK MOLINARI: We put, we arrested him
5 for hate crime charges.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: He was, he was
7 charged with a hate crime?

8 MARK MOLINARI: By our office, yes. I'd
9 have to, I don't have the information.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: But after this,
11 [Inaudible] not so that's probably because I think, I
12 think they mentioned he was emotionally disturbed so
13 I think it's important to figure out what these
14 motives are from 308 and moving forward so this way
15 we as a City, we know what better resources to put
16 in. If someone is emotionally disturbed, we need to
17 put in mental health resources for these individuals
18 and for others and if it's someone who really it's a
19 youth that doesn't understand what that slur means
20 and just writes something because he or she may have
21 seen that slur written someplace else or seen it
22 someplace else, then we need to, you know, bring more
23 education to these young adults or to anyone whose
24 motive is because they may be uneducated about what
25 is a racial slur and what the meaning is cause many

2 times you have someone scrolling a swastika and it's
3 backwards so we know the person knows what a swastika
4 may be but doesn't know exactly how to draw it and
5 it's just someone who is not educated about the
6 meaning of what it means so I think it's important
7 that we do know each motive so this way, as a City,
8 we know what resources to put in and that's why it's
9 important to also do education to teach people
10 because I see that between the NYPD and what office
11 are you from?

12 DANA SUSSMAN: The New York City
13 Commission on Human Rights.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, and
15 between other agencies, there's not enough outreach
16 being done. This should be a regular curriculum
17 going around to schools, speaking at centers, you
18 know, just constantly to do educational outreach and
19 hopefully through that, people would better
20 understand what they may intend to do that they
21 won't, they won't do that so I think I'm done for now
22 but I'm glad that you support the idea of it and I
23 think it's really important and once again, I just
24 want to say thank you inspector, thank you Oleg for
25 always being available and I'm hoping that the

2 education outreach part of the bill passes because I
3 think it's a step in the right direction. We could
4 only do better, we could only do better than going
5 backwards. We need to move forward on this. Thank
6 you.

7 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, Council
9 Member Deutsch. We're gonna go to Council Member
10 Lancman, followed by Lancman, Council Member Levine.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Good afternoon,
12 first I want to thank Chair Richards for leading this
13 hearing on preventing hate crimes in New York. Look,
14 what I'm interested in knowing is whether or not the
15 NYPD is treating these white supremacists hate groups
16 as the domestic terrorist organizations that they are
17 and I am not seeing the level of intensity or
18 organizational resources or focus that we saw, for
19 example, after the 9/11 attacks or that is directed
20 towards more, shall I say, traditional terrorism. We
21 all know that hate crimes are on the rise in New York
22 City, in New York State and across the country and
23 it's particularly tragic that the Jewish community in
24 New York City would be in such a situation that a *New*
25 *York Times* columnist could credibly and write the

2 question, are Jews safe in New York but, of course,
3 it's not a problem that is unique to the Jewish
4 community and I'm concerned that as we hear about the
5 strategies and the technologies and the manpower
6 being dispatched to uncover plots of international
7 terrorists like ISIS and Al-Qaeda and whoever else
8 from that perspective wants to do harm to New
9 Yorkers, that we do not have that same focus and
10 intensity on domestic terrorists and that is what
11 these people need to be viewed as. They are not just
12 random individuals with awful ideas. Today it was
13 reported that at least one law enforcement agency in
14 the United States, Clarke County in Washington State,
15 seems to be under the impression that the FBI has
16 designated the Proud Boys an extremist group which
17 would mean that they would be subject to much greater
18 scrutiny, concern and investigative resources. I
19 have to tell you, I was profoundly disappointed in
20 the Department after the Proud Boys assault and
21 nobody was arrested on the spot and quite frankly,
22 and I don't want to relitigate this and I don't want
23 to parse the statements that were issued by the
24 Department's press office but there was a period of
25 time when the Department was more interested in

2 obscuring the fact that nobody was arrested and
3 nothing apparently was being done about what happened
4 on the streets of New York until people realized, oh,
5 we better actually act on this and then in terms of
6 the administration as a whole, New York State and the
7 federal government have funding streams available for
8 non-profit institutions such as a synagogue or a
9 Shaiva or a mosque that if they can justify they are
10 exposed to a enhanced threat of terrorism, whether
11 it's domestic or international, there's capital grant
12 funding that's available for them. Council Member
13 Levine and I, I don't know if it was last year or two
14 years ago, called on the City to likewise adopt such
15 a program and nothing has happened so I really think
16 it's time for New York City to join state and federal
17 governments and provide support to local institutions
18 that right now are scrambling for resources to be
19 able to protect themselves so first question. What
20 resources is the Department directing towards
21 combating white supremacism, this alt-right movement,
22 as a domestic terror organization?

23 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I think your
24 point is well taken but I think we're there in the
25 sense of viewing these groups as domestic terrorists.

2 The units within our intelligence bureau that
3 investigate terrorism, that investigate domestic
4 terrorism are the same individuals that investigate
5 these hate groups so we're already viewing these
6 groups as such and we're dedicating resources whether
7 it's through our LEADS unit, which investigates
8 suspicious activity and unusual incidents. Sometimes
9 we'll get a report that somebody suspicious is
10 videotaping around a mosque or around a synagogue and
11 the report will come in and part of the See
12 something, Say something program, complaints will
13 come in or allegations

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Let me jump, I
15 don't doubt that you follow up on tips, right, but we
16 know, for example, that the NYD has officers
17 stationed around the globe to work in sync with other
18 law enforcement agencies as we all combat the scourge
19 of international terrorism. Do you also have
20 officers deployed, I don't know, to Portland or to
21 Charlottesville or to other places around the
22 country? Do you regularly liaison with the Southern
23 Poverty Law Center?

24 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Yes, so we do have
25 officers deployed around the nation as well as what I

2 was mentioning in response to, I think, Chair
3 Richards questions that through our Century program
4 we partner with over 500 law enforcement partners
5 from around the national. That's an intelligence
6 sharing partnership where they gather intelligence of
7 groups that are operating within their jurisdictions
8 and share that intelligence with us. Then we would
9 share intelligence that we gather with them. That is
10 a very effective partnership and it doesn't end with
11 only Century, it also carries over to the Shield
12 program where we have over 19 and a half thousand
13 participants and partners.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Let me ask you a
15 question. I suspect, I hope, and I believe because
16 the PD does I think a very aggressive job of
17 combatting international terrorism, that somewhere in
18 your headquarters there's a list of known ISIS
19 supporters, or ISIS sympathizers or people who've
20 expressed interest in, this day and age ISIS seems
21 almost quaint, but whoever the latest group of the
22 day is, you know, go over to Syria and wage Jihad.
23 Do you have a similar list? Do you know who in New
24 York City are members of the Proud Boys?

2 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: We actively work with
3 both our federal and other state partners and
4 actually track white supremacist groups and other
5 hate groups both around the nation and
6 internationally so yes, we are monitoring those
7 groups.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Approximately
9 how many white supremacist groups are active in New
10 York City in the five boroughs?

11 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I mean that's not
12 information that I would share sitting at the table
13 here but if that's a briefing that you want to set
14 up, we can certainly do that with you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Okay, and do
16 you, what coordination is there with the FBI on the
17 constitutionally appropriate surveillance and
18 intelligence gathering when it comes to these groups
19 that operate in the New York City area or let me ask
20 it a different way. Maybe that's a hard way for you
21 to answer. I know that there's coordination with
22 task force, the FBI and other national law
23 enforcement intelligence agencies to keep track of
24 and identify and try to preempt and disrupt
25 international terrorists organizations operating or

2 seeking to operate in New York City. Can you tell me
3 that there is the same level of tension and focus and
4 coordination when it comes to the monitoring and
5 preemption of the white supremacist alt-right
6 movement?

7 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, I mean and the
8 task forces that we're a part of with our federal
9 partners aren't just limited. There are quite a few
10 of these task forces that we're a part of that
11 incorporate our state partners and our federal
12 partners and as I said, we view these hate groups as
13 domestic terrorists so yes, that bleeds over into our
14 collaboration with our federal partners and how we
15 monitor these groups and how we respond to these
16 groups.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: So let me ask
18 you this and this comes from the report, it was in
19 *The Guardian* and it's referencing a memo that came
20 out of Clarke County so I don't know the validity of
21 what's being said so let me ask you. The report says
22 the FBI categorizes the Proud Boys as an extremist
23 group with ties to white nationalism. Are you aware
24 of any such designation from the FBI?

25 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: No, I'm not aware, no.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Would you be the
3 person to be aware of it within the NYPD or is there
4 someone who might know?

5 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Somebody who may but,
6 and I'll look into that and get back to you with
7 that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Can you look
9 into that and get back to me?

10 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Absolutely, sure.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: And then, you
12 know you're sitting there. I feel like everybody's
13 ignoring you. I'm so sorry.

14 DANA SUSSMAN: It's my second hearing of
15 the day. It's fine with me.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Let me give you
17 an opportunity to be on the spot.

18 DANA SUSSMAN: Sure.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Would you agree
20 that the administration should join the state
21 government and the federal government in providing
22 resources to institutions that are at risk of
23 violence and attack because of their race, religion,
24 sexual orientation, etc. as those categories are
25 covered in the City Human Rights Law?

2 DANA SUSSMAN: I certainly cannot speak
3 to resources for law enforcement. I would readily
4 defer to my colleagues here at the table and to the
5 leadership of the NYPD. I can say that, you know,
6 the Council and the administration have supported our
7 work by increasing our resources over the past
8 several years and we've been able to be more present
9 in communities because of that, days of visibility,
10 community forums, events, programming in schools and
11 so we take that, our mandate very seriously and we've
12 been able to expand the work that we've done in the
13 past several years because of the support of the
14 Council and the administration.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Right, last
16 question if I may. Just back to the PD, is there an
17 individual who is the man or woman who is in charge
18 of the white supremacist desk at the intelligence
19 bureau or the white supremacist desk at the counter
20 terrorism division?

21 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, well it's a unit.
22 I wouldn't say it's a one individual but there is a
23 unit that monitors hate groups. I wouldn't call one
24 particular category. I wouldn't distinguish them.

2 Hate groups are hate groups and we have a unit that
3 monitors these hate groups, yeah.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: But that would
5 be all hate groups like

6 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I mean there
7 again, it's right. I mean that's what it would be.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Your ISIS's,
9 your Proud Boys, your

10 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: No, we're talking about
11 domestic. Yeah, we're not international is

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I'm just trying
13 to understand. That's a separate group?

14 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Okay, all right,
16 thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. I'm
18 gonna go to Council Member Levine.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Chair
20 Richards. Thank you to the panel. I want to talk
21 about Intro 1234 which I'm pleased to be the lead
22 sponsor of which would create an office in the
23 administration to directly deal with and coordinate
24 our response to the mounting threat of hate crimes in
25 this City. I don't have to rehash the statistics. I

2 know you've talked about them but suffice to say that
3 hate crimes are up now 40% since 2016 across a
4 variety of categories. This is a source of alarm for
5 those of us in the Council and I know you share that
6 alarm. When the City confronts major challenges like
7 this, we often establish an entity to coordinate
8 amongst the many agencies that are required to work
9 together. This has happened on the Mayor's Office to
10 Combat Domestic Violence. We established a new
11 office last year, the Office of the Civil Justice
12 Coordinator, for this purpose. They're even less
13 worrisome challenges like the Mayor's Office of Media
14 that have come together to coordinate in this fashion
15 and our legislation would do that now for the threat
16 we confront in hate crimes and this would be a way to
17 coordinate prevention, awareness, investigation,
18 prosecution, impact on communities, to review the
19 budget requests of all the agencies for programs
20 related to hate crimes, to report on the activities
21 of these various entities, to examine trends, look at
22 areas in the City which are more vulnerable to hate
23 crimes, look at the specific security concerns of
24 neighborhoods and schools and houses of worship and
25 to evaluate the effectiveness of our City's response

2 to this crisis to support victims of hate crimes, to
3 look at statistics in a deeper way. I can think off
4 hand of half a dozen agencies or more that we need to
5 be marching lock step together to face the challenge.
6 The part of education when it comes to prevention
7 curriculum, Human Rights Commission, the Mayor's
8 Office of the Criminal Justice Coordinator, perhaps
9 ACS for grief counseling, perhaps Department of
10 Sanitation or the Parks Department which are often
11 charged with removing hate crime graffiti, the
12 Mayor's Community Assistance Unit which is charged
13 with building ties between different ethnic and
14 religious groups in this City, so there I just
15 mentioned six or seven. I didn't see in the opening
16 testimony, I don't know if it was Oleg who offered it
17 but the opening, sorry, Inspector Molinari. I didn't
18 see in your opening testimony your position on this
19 piece of legislation. I'd like to give you a chance
20 to weigh in on that now if you could please.

21 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, Council Member.

22 The administration is still reviewing the
23 legislation, both pieces of legislation out there. I
24 can tell you certainly the goals of the legislation
25 are certainly supported. This is a very serious

2 topic that needs to be addressed through innovative
3 ways and to change the conversation, to change the
4 mindset so the administration is actively reviewing
5 both pieces of legislation to formulate a position.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: What are the
7 agencies other than the PD that could potentially be
8 involved in whether it's preventing or tracking or
9 responding to this threat?

10 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I mean as the
11 lead invest law enforcement agency in the City, we
12 would certainly have a role when it comes to hate
13 crimes, a serious role. I guess through education
14 and outreach there would be other agencies but I
15 think that would be part of the process that the
16 administration is going through in reviewing the
17 legislation.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, I just, I'm
19 sure you get this but I want to reiterate that we
20 need to attack this by, through education programs
21 that can help prevent hate crimes, that can help
22 promote greater mutual respect amongst communities,
23 that would be the Department of Education. We need
24 to continue the never ending work of building better
25 relationships between communities of faith and ethnic

2 and religious communities in the City that can often
3 be at odds. That's under the prevue of the Human
4 Rights Commission. We need to help communities that
5 have been victims of domestic violence and that might
6 happen in the form of grief counseling. I can see
7 that being a project for the Mayor's Community
8 Affairs Unit. We can go on and on but a rigorous
9 response, a strategic response and I would think the
10 most effective response requires multiple entities
11 within the sprawling org chart that is City
12 government to be coordinated, to be working together
13 on budget requests, on reporting and generally to be
14 working out common strategies and that is the
15 underlying goal of this legislation in creating an
16 office analogous to those that I've mentioned. We
17 would love to continue to talk to you at the PD and
18 all the relevant agencies about a way to get to this
19 goal together through this bill. Thank you.

20 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And we're also
22 joined by Council Member Gibson and Cohen. All
23 righty, we're gonna go to Council Member Miller for
24 questions.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Chair
3 Richards. Good afternoon, so I have a few questions
4 about and it's just a follow up to what my colleagues
5 have said and what you had mentioned about that
6 generally that this unit does not differentiate or
7 discriminate when it comes to investigating various
8 groups around hate crimes, and so what I want to talk
9 to you about is somewhat the staffing of the unit.
10 How many people are in the, how much staff do you
11 have? How many officers and civilians involved in
12 the hate crimes unit?

13 MARK MOLINARI: There's 23 uniform
14 members, 18 detectives, 2 sergeants, a lieutenant, a
15 captain and myself and we have a civilian who works
16 for us also.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And one civilian,
18 women, men, Muslims, Christians, Jews, do you know?

19 MARK MOLINARI: Currently right now there
20 are no females in. We've had in the past and they've
21 moved out through promotion or retirement. Whenever
22 we recruit, we recruit the best candidates for the
23 job.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: African
25 Americans, any?

2 MARK MOLINARI: Looking around my office
3 in my head, I'm gonna say two or three.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Muslims?

5 MARK MOLINARI: Three approximately. I'm
6 just thinking of my people individually. I don't
7 have an exact breakdown.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And I know that
9 typically what the unit does is respond to crimes and
10 so forth. Are there any preventive investigations,
11 surveillances, operations that go on within these
12 groups as well, within the unit?

13 MARK MOLINARI: Preventive observations
14 by my unit on particular

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Groups?

16 MARK MOLINARI: No.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, you only
18 investigate those who may or may not be involved in a
19 particular kind.

20 MARK MOLINARI: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Not ongoing
22 crime, criminal activities?

23 MARK MOLINARI: Well, if they're engaging
24 in ongoing criminal activities and we already have

2 them as perpetrators of a hate crime, then we
3 continue investigating them

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay

5 MARK MOLINARI: Or hopefully apprehending
6 them before they commit another incident.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Oh, absolutely.

8 MARK MOLINARI: But as far as pre-
9 incident, no. We don't track people who may commit a
10 hate crime.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay and you said
12 that there was some offline conversations that we
13 could have about a particular group that would not be
14 necessarily pertinent that we had that conversation
15 today but certainly the committee would be, make
16 itself available to have those conversations as well
17 to ensure that the resources were being allocated in
18 the proper way that the committee and the Council was
19 satisfied that it was being done equitably and that
20 each crime was given the type of consideration that
21 it deserved and so are there data to support the
22 amount of crimes that took place over the last two
23 years, where they took place and the resources that
24 have gone into those operations as well?

2 MARK MOLINARI: The crime numbers, yes,
3 the locations where they occurred, yes. I can get
4 that to you. The amount of effort that went into the
5 investigation, the amount of work that went into it,
6 I don't have a number for that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

8 MARK MOLINARI: Some investigations are
9 much lengthier than others, require much more work.
10 Some are equally heinous and not treated any
11 differently but just, dare I say, easier
12 investigation, a quicker investigation is done to
13 apprehend a perpetrator.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, and I know
15 that last week's defacing of the African burial
16 ground occurred on federal grounds. Because it
17 occurred on the federal grounds, did that prevent the
18 NYPD and specifically the Hate Crime Unit from being
19 involved and to what level of involvement can we see
20 and have we seen or can we expect any results in the
21 near future?

22 MARK MOLINARI: It is a ongoing
23 investigation right now but I could say we were
24 equally involved. Our partners in the federal
25 government have been fantastic with us. Federal

2 protective services who secures the buildings there
3 have been wonderful to us. I've been on the phone
4 with many of their executives and we've embedded one
5 of my detectives with one of their agents and they're
6 working together on the case.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so and we
8 have, you have received the kind of cooperation that
9 you expect to receive from another agency on this
10 particular case here?

11 MARK MOLINARI: Oh, absolutely.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And it wasn't
13 necessarily someone infringing on someone else's
14 investigation in that way that all resources had been
15 made available so that we could apprehend those
16 involved in this particular case? Just trying to get
17 to whether or not we had access, proper access
18 because it was on federal property. I know that in
19 the past it's been a little contentious when it came
20 to that.

21 MARK MOLINARI: They are placing no
22 restrictions on our access at all. We are working
23 hand in hand with them through the entire process
24 from the reporting day.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, thank
3 you very much and look forward to that further
4 briefing. Thank you, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, Council
6 Member Miller. Going to Council Member Cabrera.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
8 much, Mr. Chair. I want to commend you for holding
9 this hearing and also I want to commend the NYPD,
10 Inspector Oleg for the great work that you guys are
11 doing and the Human Rights Commission. I come from
12 the counseling field and I'm always curious to find
13 out the root of the problem rather than just keep
14 clipping as to the leaves if I may say, or the fruit
15 of the problem. Have you done, I notice in the
16 hearing, not the hearing, the press conference that
17 the Mayor held November 7, he mentioned that half of
18 all hate crimes in New York City, more than half were
19 targeting Jews and then 40 cases, maybe it's a little
20 higher now since you got out to 308, are targeting
21 Blacks so is there, here's the question that I have.
22 Have you done an analysis in all these cases, not
23 just this year, but through the previous years, what
24 are we talking about here? Are we talking about
25 individuals who go rogue on their hate or are we

2 talking about groups, hate groups, where we find
3 those committed as crimes are getting the ideology
4 and have official membership? I'm just trying to see
5 where are we getting the vast majority of the
6 problems from?

7 MARK MOLINARI: I apologize, looking at
8 the crimes we have, I've been in Hate Crime Task
9 Force for about 20 months now, getting in March of
10 last year, formerly working in Special Victims. I've
11 had some liaison work. I've worked on some of their
12 major cases for four and a half years prior to that.
13 I can take you to the last 20 months right now and
14 other than the gentleman that I mentioned in my
15 opening statement, Mr. Timothy Kaufman was murdered
16 in mid-town Manhattan by a member of an organized
17 hate group of Maryland who came up here for the
18 intent purpose of doing exactly what he did. Other
19 than that incident in my 20 months here, I have not
20 identified a perpetrator who was part of an active
21 hate group.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So I know we
23 spent a lot of time today talking about hate groups
24 so they are fundamentally here in New York City. I
25 know we can talk about the rest of the United States

2 and different states, fundamentally at the very root,
3 our problem is not stemming because people having
4 memberships into these hate groups which leads me to
5 the next questions. I know everybody always wants
6 the NYPD to do everything. Where, and so now I'm
7 gonna go to the Human Rights. You mentioned that,
8 commissioner, you mentioned that you have sufficient
9 funding. Do you work because I really believe at the
10 end of the day, we've got to educate our young people
11 because that's where the vast majority of them learn
12 the world view. Are you working with the Board of
13 Education? Is there a part of the curriculum that
14 addresses this issue?

15 DANA SUSSMAN: Sure, we, we're working
16 very closely with the Department of Education on
17 different initiatives. We provide human rights, what
18 we call Human Rights 101, education for schools. We
19 also have a more robust, a longer term project called
20 peer mediation where we train students to deescalate
21 conflict in their schools. It's an eight week
22 program and we also provide, we do workshops on
23 specific issues that the students are requesting so,
24 discrimination on the basis of gender identity, for
25 example, with the Gender and Sexuality Alliances at

2 different public schools and we have most recently
3 with the new chancellor been working sort of at a
4 higher level with the DOE on ways that we can
5 coordinate on a whole host of different human rights
6 related issues and curriculum so we are in many
7 schools currently and we are hoping to further embed
8 ourselves in schools across the City in the next
9 year.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So I'm happy to
11 hear number one that you had the peer mediation. As
12 a matter of fact I was in the very first group many,
13 many, many years ago to be trained through Columbia
14 University so I'm very happy that you have kept that
15 going but you mentioned something, we are many
16 schools which tells me we are not in all the schools.
17 What's preventing us to making it part of the
18 curriculum because really at the end of the day we
19 need something systematic and that's comprehensive
20 that we know is going to happen and then how do we
21 measure, do you have instruments that you are using
22 right now to measure, has there been a perception,
23 change of perception from our young people?

24 DANA SUSSMAN: I would have to defer to
25 the DOE with respect to issues around DOE curriculum

2 specifically. I know we are, we do a lot of outreach
3 to schools in neighborhoods where we know there's
4 been a particular incident or a series of incidents
5 or trends that we're seeing and we also, the schools
6 reach out directly to us as well so we're on the sort
7 of lower school level, we are in regular contact with
8 the schools that reach out to us or that we
9 affirmatively reach out to but as far as sort of a
10 district wide curriculum initiative, I think DOE
11 would be able to speak to that best and it may vary
12 school to school. I just don't have the information
13 available but we'd be happy to be part of those
14 conversations with DOE on ways to integrate human
15 rights, civil rights and, you know, respect and
16 dignity for all in school curriculum.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I see you as the
18 conscience of any commission here in the City and I'm
19 hoping that there will be a concerted or a concert of
20 voices. I think this has to happen. I know it's
21 long term. I know it's not a sexy project for us.
22 Some of us might not even see the results while we're
23 here in office or while you're working your
24 respective positions right now but we gotta start,
25 you already started. I just want it to cover in all

2 the schools. That is critical, it's critical and I
3 don't think issue, I know this role the NYPD plays
4 but really it should go down to the public schools
5 and the homes. At the end of the day it starts with
6 parents and working maybe through the media, social
7 media, getting the message out, working with the non-
8 profits to making sure that there is a change of
9 perception for those who need a change of perception
10 so thank you so much. Really appreciate all your
11 work. Mr. Chair, thank you so much for the allotted
12 time.

13 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, a few
14 follow-up questions. Oleg is not going to like this
15 one so I know we have the gang database, all right.
16 Is there a hate-a-base available the NYPD is keeping
17 tabs on, haters?

18 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I mean [Laughter]

19 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: [Laughter] It's a
20 serious question. I couldn't let you get away
21 without asking that question.

22 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Yeah, no I'm chuckling
23 at the name of that you

24 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: But in all
25 seriousness, you have a gang database. You say it's

2 important. It's a critical tool in your fight in
3 engaging and following gangs and you know, obviously
4 we have questions around transparency around it but
5 I'm interested in knowing, is there a hate-a-base?

6 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, yeah, I mean I
7 think the groups are monitored. How exactly, I have
8 to take a look at and I can certainly get back to
9 you. It may be an issue

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So there's no
11 hate-a-base?

12 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: No, no, that's not what
13 I'm saying. I mean, what I'm saying is that
14 obviously we're tracking these groups and individuals
15 affiliated with the groups. What the method is,
16 whether where it's being done through our federal
17 partnerships and through their database or whether we
18 having something independent, I'll look into it and
19 get back to you but I'll certainly get you an answer
20 on it.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And then so you do
22 follow folks' social media. Are you keeping tabs on
23 their social media as well or

24 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I mean, open source
25 information is certainly something that's available

2 to anyone looking to view what's out there so yeah,
3 I'm sure that's one of the things.

4 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And do you conduct
5 hate crime prevention measures via social media or
6 no, does the NYPD do that?

7 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: What do you mean
8 exactly?

9 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Hate crime
10 prevention, are there any measures that you take to
11 prevent hate crimes through social media? Are there
12 any, I mean do you have commercials, do you have any
13 video, are you doing any promotions on educating
14 people on what, you know, hate crimes are and what
15 the result of a hate crime could be?

16 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: All right, let me go
17 into a few different aspects of that. No, my unit
18 doesn't do any direct social media prevention work.
19 The Department does. The Department hosts events,
20 unity events, and they spread the message there about
21 tolerance and that does go out through the
22 Department's social media accounts. We also do have
23 information that we put out and we work with the
24 elected officials who work with community groups.
25 When there's an incident, we publicize it. It's in

2 the media and it's in social media equally to get the
3 message out that it has happened. This generates two
4 things. The biggest thing it generates is community
5 outreach, equal outreach that this is offensive.
6 That usually helps us identify through tips who the
7 perpetrator of this crime is. After incident, after
8 arrest, it's equally publicized and I do love seeing
9 the front page of a newspaper or the front page of a
10 social media site with an apprehension being
11 advertised because I think that it teaches people
12 that even if they have this kind of hate in their
13 hearts and minds, that acting on it is not going to
14 be tolerated in this City and they're going to be
15 investigated and they're going to be apprehended.

16 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So I would just, a
17 friendly suggestion. I think that NYPD is doing very
18 good at these media campaigns and perhaps this is
19 something you may want to play up and I'm assuming
20 people are under reporting, right, so can you speak
21 to national trends and do you feel like people are
22 openly reporting hate crimes or is a level of under
23 reporting just as we see with sexual violence?

24 DANA SUSSMAN: If I may, I'm going to
25 just jump in. The Commission issued a report on the

2 experiences of discrimination, harassment and bias
3 incidents faced by Muslims, Arabs, South Asian,
4 Jewish and Sikh New Yorkers and the report noted that
5 only about, a little bit less than 30% of individuals
6 who experience those acts of hate reported it
7 anywhere, whether it was the Commission, the NYPD,
8 local community based organization or house of
9 worship. Obviously that spans, a little over 3,000
10 people were surveyed and only those specific
11 communities identified so it doesn't speak to
12 everyone and everyone's experience but what it's
13 teaching us is there is significant under reporting.
14 I think there is for some people who wear visibly
15 religious garb they might experience things sort of
16 the small, not small, but the day to day sort of
17 every day injustices and sort of don't see a reason.
18 It's become so normalized for some folks that they
19 don't see a reason to report it, that they feel like
20 it's just not going to be worth their time in some
21 circumstances and I think for us at the Commission
22 it's become a real rallying cry around what we can do
23 to better be a resource to communities so that even
24 if they don't want to move forward with a complaint

2 with us or with the NYPD they know, it's important
3 for us to know what's going on so we can respond.

4 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you and let
5 me go into, so we didn't speak about the LGBTQ
6 community. How are hate crimes differing from those
7 against religious or ethnic minorities in that class
8 of hate crimes?

9 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: How, like the numbers,
10 the data we have on it? The sexual orientation
11 category is right now the number two highest group in
12 all hate crimes behind anti-Semitic groups and
13 slightly ahead of anti-Black incidents. Against
14 gender, it's single digits right now but a lot of our
15 other categories are lower so right now the sexual
16 orientation, we have 41 incidents of anti-sexual
17 orientation hate crime incidents which is exactly
18 tied with last years as of the year date at 41.

19 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And can you speak
20 of your community outreach strategy and then also how
21 do you respond in cases of hate crimes against LGBTQ
22 individuals? Does it differ from the way you would
23 respond in other cases? How do you

24 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: I'll respond simply
25 saying absolutely not. Nothing differs here, every

2 crime is investigated 100%. Every identity is worked
3 with 100%. There is no

4 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So there is no
5 difference in the way you respond.

6 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: There is absolutely no
7 difference in the way we work.

8 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And then on
9 education or outreach to that particular community.
10 Human Rights is more than welcome to chime in here
11 too as well.

12 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Yeah, we have through
13 our liaison program through Community Affairs, we
14 have individuals that are specifically tasked with
15 liaising with the LGBTQ community, with the Muslim
16 community, Jewish community so there are a number of
17 individuals within liaison unit that liaise with
18 these various groups with advocates within the
19 groups. We stay abreast of what the concerns are,
20 what potentially any fears are and we address them as
21 quickly as possible.

22 DANA SUSSMAN: And I would also just
23 mention that discrimination and harassment against
24 the LGBTQ community has been a huge priority for the
25 Commission and I hope that has come across in some of

2 the work that we've done. We've done days of
3 visibility after there's been homophobic, there was a
4 recent homophobic attack in fact in Williamsburg and
5 the Commission was out with the anti-violence project
6 on the day of visibility to ensure that communities
7 in Williamsburg knew that the City had their back,
8 that we were there as a resource and then we do that
9 work regularly. Unfortunately, I think the truth of
10 the matter is we're probably doing a day of
11 visibility on these kinds of incidents weekly at this
12 point but we are very much engaged deeply with LGBTQ
13 community based organizations like AVP and many
14 others to ensure that people know that they can come
15 to us with and also to hopefully prevent future
16 incidents.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, and just on
18 some of this too, can you just speak of your
19 interaction with the D. A.'s office so before you
20 make a determination to assign a case to the Task
21 Force, at what point do you involve the D. A.'s
22 office?

23 MARK MOLINARI: The determination

24 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And then, go
25 ahead.

2 MARK MOLINARI: I'm sorry, the
3 determination on assigning a case to the Task Force
4 is made by me. We take cases on, regardless, not in
5 speaking with the D. A.'s office. That determination
6 on what we're going to charge it as on our end is
7 what we do. As the case progresses, we'll reach out
8 to the D. A.'s office so every borough has a D. A.'s
9 office. Inside every D. A.'s office, there is a Hate
10 Crimes Bureau Chief. I'm on a first name basis with
11 all of them and as Councilman Deutsch had mentioned,
12 I'm on the phone with them constantly 24/7. We have
13 a great working relationship with them and as a case
14 progresses, especially a more elaborate case or
15 certain other criteria too, we'll be on the phone
16 with that Hate Crime Bureau Chief to determine what
17 else should we be doing to really make a rock solid
18 case here. We're not just making what some refer to
19 as jump collars where let's go out and grab the guys
20 identified and let's just grab them quickly.
21 Sometimes we have to put a little more investigative
22 work or a lot more investigative work into
23 solidifying a good tight case and work directly with
24 the D. A.'s office with that. We have a great
25 relationship with all of them.

2 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And how many
3 arrests, so out of your arrests let's imagine this
4 year, what is your conviction rate? What is the D.
5 A., what is your conviction rate? Do you follow?

6 MARK MOLINARI: I don't usually follow
7 that. I don't have it in front of me. I can work
8 through the Department to get it but we don't usually
9 track that.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: All right, we
11 should so that's something I look forward, I won't
12 beat you up for it today but we should definitely
13 know, you know, what the outcomes of our cases are
14 and I think that that certain send a very strong
15 message to the public and those who would want to
16 commit hate crimes that this City has zero tolerance
17 and that goes back to that conversation around the
18 Proud Boys. You know, we weren't out there just
19 making rhetorical statements. We have to send a very
20 clear message that in New York City, that there is
21 zero tolerance for hate crimes and I'm not saying the
22 NYPD doesn't do that but, you know, the lack thereof
23 in arrests in that situation does send a message to
24 those white nationalist groups that it is open season
25 in our City and we want to make sure that we send a

2 very clear message that it's not. Let me just, last
3 question for me and then Lancman will close and then
4 we'll go to our panels. So obviously we know what
5 happened to the synagogues, the Tree of Life
6 Synagogue in Pittsburgh. I'm interested in knowing
7 did you receive calls from mosques as well and what,
8 have we done any outreach to them to offer them
9 education or security outreach information.

10 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: So, I mean, we work
11 hand in hand with the Muslim community aside from the
12 incident that happened in Pittsburgh. On the high
13 holy days, we augment our patrol plan and to pay
14 special attention to houses of worship, we have
15 liaisons that routinely interact with individuals
16 with community leaders in the Muslim community and we
17 partner with them. They'll come here or we'll go
18 there and we exchange information and keep them
19 abreast of what's going on. In terms of what
20 happened after the Pittsburgh incident, once we
21 became aware of the incident, we augmented our patrol
22 plan immediately after the incident where we
23 designated a patrol car in every precinct to focus on
24 houses of worship, not only to synagogues but also
25 churches and mosques as well in the particular

2 command and they were doing routine patrols
3 throughout the day I believe every half hour or hour,
4 going by also regular patrol vehicles were told to
5 pay special attention to houses of worship as they
6 were doing their regular patrol so, yes, we have
7 routine outreach, routine conversation and we
8 definitely pay special attention to make sure that
9 all houses of worship are secure.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Right and so I
11 want to thank you for that before I turn it over to
12 Council Member Lancman for questions. I do want to
13 add I certainly did hear that from my local precinct
14 and I was very grateful for it. You know, but one
15 car, and I just want you to know and I know you
16 mentioned patrols, is definitely not enough in an
17 incident like that. I have about 20 synagogues alone
18 in my district and I'm just counting the Rockaways.
19 I mean, I have about 15, 20 churches, about three or
20 four mosques so one car being dedicated is definitely
21 not enough. I know it's maybe a resource question
22 but it may be something we may want to reevaluate
23 moving forward, you know, because I think then we can
24 ease that conversation if people know that, I'm not
25 saying people don't believe PD is there for them but

2 I believe as the houses of worship feel more
3 presence, perhaps we can sort of move past that
4 conversation of well, should we arm individuals but
5 it really comes down to a resource question and if
6 houses of worship feel comfortable that the NYPD will
7 be there to respond to a great degree so I definitely
8 appreciate the work of my local precinct. I'll shout
9 them out, the 101, for being on the case but, you
10 know, we did a meeting last week and it's very clear.
11 It's very hard to get around with one car dedicated.

12 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I just want to
13 be clear. One car was dedicated as its sole duty
14 that night and the days after to visit every house of
15 worship but every patrol car in the particular
16 precinct, whichever precinct it was City wide was
17 tasked with paying special attention to every house
18 of worship in their command so one car had the
19 specific duty. However, every patrol car that was
20 assigned that was working that day was driving by and
21 paying special attention to every house of worship.

22 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And I want to move
23 past that, you have the NTO program. How are they
24 interacting with the houses of worship so that is
25 something I'm not going to critique here but just

2 something to be, to think about because for
3 synagogues for instance, they can't answer their
4 phones necessarily sometimes, you know, on a Saturday
5 depending on, you know, so or a mosque, you know,
6 there's different levels of access, right.

7 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Sure, I'll just add the
8 instant you brought NCO's, part of the NCO training
9 would be the crime prevention office actually having
10 time within the NCO training program. They have a
11 separate module that's dedicated to explaining to
12 NCO's the services that crime prevention provides so
13 as these NCO's are reaching out and making outreach
14 to the various houses of worship, they know that they
15 can promote this program where these houses of
16 worship can call and have us do a security survey for
17 them so not only do we do it during the larger clergy
18 meeting and larger meetings but we also have it as
19 one on one. We try to promote that houses of worship
20 and other sensitive locations actually utilize this
21 service that we provide.

22 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: All right, so I
23 would just say there are some communities that are
24 more insulated than others and I think being more
25 proactive in outreach efforts to houses of worship

2 around a City is critical in each command so I think
3 there's some work to be done there and I think the
4 NCO's are doing, I mean, we're gonna have a hearing
5 on that. I won't tell you they're doing a great job
6 because I got questions but they're doing good
7 outreach efforts. We can always figure out ways to
8 strengthen that and improve that so it's something
9 that we should look at as we move forward. Let me go
10 to Council Member Lancman and then we'll begin to
11 hear from our panels. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thanks, I just
13 want to get a little more nuance and flavor of how
14 you decide which groups will get monitored, which
15 individuals, which hate groups make the list and
16 which don't.

17 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well I, certainly I
18 appreciate the question but that's something that I
19 think we would be talking to you about not at the
20 table.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Well, okay.
22 Would those, well, why not?

23 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Well, I mean, we
24 certainly don't want to create a road map for these
25 groups to augment what their modus operandi is to

2 skirt the way we potentially would track and monitor
3 them or recognize them as being any particular group
4 so we would prefer to leave them guessing as to what
5 our methods are but we understand the function that
6 the Council has as an oversight body and we would be,
7 we'd welcome a conversation with you off the record
8 just so we could better answer these questions more
9 openly.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: All right, could
11 you tell me, this might have been asked before but
12 could you tell me how many groups in the white
13 supremacist genre are currently being monitored or on
14 the list?

15 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Yeah, I think that was,
16 my answer to that question was that we should have
17 the conversation off the record.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Okay, all right,
19 well I'm interested in having that follow-up
20 conversation with you. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you all for
22 coming out. Thank you.

23 OLEG CHERNOWSKI: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: All righty, we're
25 gonna call the first panel. Chelsea Goldinger, LGBT

2 Center, Amet Ali, Arab American Family Support
3 Center, Michael Cohen of Simon Wiesenthal Center. I
4 didn't see the State Senator had joined us. All
5 righty, why don't you come up. Did you fill out a
6 slip? You don't have to I guess. Why don't you come
7 up, James, State Senator James Sanders? All right,
8 you may have a seat. Sir, you want to come around.
9 You testifying sir? And I think I have, we'll just
10 go through these four. All righty, you may begin.

11 CHELSEA GOLDINGER: Hello, My name is
12 Chelsea Goldinger. I'm the government relations
13 manager at the LGBT Center in Manhattan, commonly
14 referred to as The Center. We are in support of both
15 pieces of proposed legislations so thank you, I guess
16 neither of those Council Members are here anymore and
17 to Council Member Richards, of course, for convening
18 this hearing. As I think we heard earlier today,
19 LGBTQ individuals are some of the top targets for
20 these hate crimes unfortunately. Last week actually,
21 the FBI released their annual date of report. What
22 was most interesting, nationwide of course hate
23 crimes have increased 17% according to this report.
24 The number of targets against both the, based on
25 sexual orientation as well as gender identity, it's

2 remained relatively constant. Unfortunately, with
3 the dramatic increase in the number of hate crimes
4 overall, that it's actually met an increase number of
5 folks targeted within this community. What's most
6 jarring about our community civically and I think
7 this is true from a lot of marginalized communities,
8 is a lot of folks don't come forward and report. I
9 know before we heard about the stats of the
10 transgender and [Inaudible] folks as low as in the
11 single digits. While that sounds really positive, I
12 think what we're alarmed about is that folks are not
13 actually comfortable coming forward to traditional
14 authorities and so we would love to see this City and
15 the Council work on kind of figuring out new ways to
16 reach these communities so that they can come
17 forward. I wrote about it [Inaudible] since I
18 submitted other reports basically that I've done work
19 actually asking community directly instead of through
20 police data. The estimates are like five to eight
21 times larger than what the estimate based on that
22 community. I think on the other side of that, the
23 biggest hurdle we also see is a lack of data.
24 Understanding the origin of these crimes as well as
25 sort of how they've happened, especially in our

2 community very often the forms and intake forms
3 involved don't have things like sexual orientation
4 and gender identity which make it really challenging
5 to combat these problems when we don't know how they
6 manifest and I did really appreciate the intent of
7 the Committee and Council Member Deutsch kind of
8 talking through what is the root of some of these
9 concerns. We'd also, we love the outreach idea. We
10 would want to make sure that that includes surveys
11 both before and after to make sure we're actually
12 doing the work we intend. We do have a lot of
13 experience over at The Center doing a lot of work for
14 main providers and we'd be happy to help with that so
15 thank you for your time on this issue and we
16 appreciate it.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, press
18 your button.

19 AMIT ALI: I want to begin by thanking
20 the Committee on Public Safety and to the entire New
21 York City Council for taking the time to understand
22 and respond to the rampant levels of hate crime that
23 unfortunately marginalized communities are facing
24 daily. My name is Amit Ali and I'm a program manager
25 at the Arab American Family Support Center where I

2 work with high school aged youth building healthy
3 relationships and leadership workshops. At the Arab
4 American Family Support Center we've been working to
5 strengthen immigrant and refugee families since 1994
6 by promoting wellbeing, preventing violence and
7 amplifying the voices of [Inaudible] populations.
8 Our organization serves all but over our nearly 25
9 years of experience, we've gained the cultural and
10 linguistic competency serving the growing population
11 of Arab, Middle Eastern, Muslim, Southeast Asian
12 communities. This past May, the Arab American Family
13 Support Center hosted the launch of the New York City
14 Commission on Human Rights report on discrimination
15 against vulnerable communities in New York City
16 leading up to and following the 2016 presidential
17 election. Many of our community members contributed
18 to the findings in this report, sharing their
19 personal experiences as victims of acts of hate and
20 the results are disturbing. Nearly 40% of those
21 surveyed reported being victims of physical assault.
22 One in four Muslim women who wear hijabs report being
23 intentionally pushed or shoved on subway platforms
24 and unfortunately nearly 70% of those surveyed said
25 they did not report the crime for fear of

2 retaliation. At the Arab American Family Support
3 Center, our community members regularly share horror
4 stories of mistreatment and visible acts of hate. We
5 recently supported a young woman who was afraid to
6 leave her home after someone on the street forcibly
7 removed her hijab. Another community member
8 experienced vandalism, the tires on his car were
9 deflated and racial slurs were spray painted across
10 the vehicle. Community members tell us that they
11 feel isolated and so not know where to turn in these
12 situations. Many are afraid to report crimes to
13 police or other agencies fearing that they will not
14 be taken seriously or their immigration status may be
15 called into question. The Arab American Family
16 Support Center is proud to have joined the New York
17 City Commission on Human Rights and a number of other
18 organizations including Jews for Racial and Economic
19 Justice, the Sauti Yetu Centre for African Women, The
20 Seed Coalition and the New York Chapter of the
21 Council on American-Islamic Relations. We would be
22 proud to work with you all in supporting victims of
23 hate, creating a community responsive effective
24 solution to under reporting and ensuring that all New

2 Yorkers know the acts of discrimination and hate will
3 not be tolerated. Thank you for your time.

4 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: You could finish
5 up if you want to wrap up with some following steps.

6 AMIT ALI: Yeah, just some following
7 steps, if you could actively stand with the
8 marginalized communities that are being unfairly
9 targeted and mistreated and I think the first step is
10 holding meetings like today, to accept our support in
11 your motion to create an office for victims of hate
12 as well as the second part of education and we would
13 also urge you to consider the cultural and linguistic
14 competency to guarantee accessibility for victims.
15 The Arab American Family Support Center is ready and
16 willing to assist in these efforts and finally ensure
17 that community members know that the Office for
18 Victims of Hate will be a safe zone where immigration
19 status will not be questioned. Thank you again.

20 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, now
21 we'll hear from State Senator James Sanders.

22 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you, Chair. I
23 want to first acknowledge and thank the Chair for
24 being a forceful advocate on this and so many other
25 issues. The City is blessed to have really good

2 people at a good time and I'm sitting before two of
3 the best, Council Member Lancman, of course, you are,
4 have been a leader in this many years. Perhaps you
5 saw it coming, perhaps you saw that it could come and
6 both of you have been doing a yeoman's job on it.
7 Elected officials must lead the way in putting the
8 right climate out, a climate that says we will
9 tolerate, a climate that says that if you are
10 respecting the law of the land, if you are respecting
11 your neighbors then we will tolerate what you're
12 doing. We don't have to believe everything that
13 everyone is saying but you do have to tolerate. The
14 gold standard, you raised the right question, Council
15 Member Lancman, when you spoke of the right wing and
16 the City's efforts perhaps in dealing with them. The
17 gold standard in this is the Southern Poverty Law
18 Center and Berne Breath and both of them are saying
19 that there is an incredible rise in this. We say it
20 in New York where we saw the Proud Boys come down
21 here and bring their brand of madness and we saw, at
22 best, a lukewarm response from the police department
23 on this issue. I did notice that Council Member
24 Richards spoke out against that. You may have, I may
25 not have noticed yours but you certainly did. With a

2 change of government in Albany, we are really looking
3 to see what the City wants to do. You now have a
4 stronger partner in the North if you wish, that is
5 interested in seeing how we can effectively educate
6 people. First and first we believe that education is
7 the first and best defense of all of these things.
8 Educate and then to separate people from youth
9 throwing bars and things through, that's a type of
10 education and punishment, but an education to say do
11 you know what you've done, which is different than
12 what you would do with a group like the Proud Boys
13 who are very clear and they are existing to wreak
14 havoc if you wish so we've looking forward to
15 proposed legislation. We have some ideas of our own
16 but this City issue, City issues need to be put
17 forward by the City and we need to support that and
18 I'm here and my presence is to say that. It's good
19 to be on the other side of this table. Thank you
20 very much. I will respect the bell.

21 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you.

22 MICHAEL COHEN: Thank you, my name is
23 Michael Cohen, the East Coast Director of the Simon
24 Wiesenthal Center. The Wiesenthal Center is a global
25 human rights organization confronting anti-Semitism,

2 hate, terrorism, promoting human rights and dignity
3 with a constituency of over 400,000 families,
4 including about 150,000 in the tristate area.

5 Mr. Chairman, thank you for providing the Simon
6 Wiesenthal Center an opportunity to address the
7 Committee on Public Safety in support of the proposed
8 laws to establish a New York City Office of the
9 Prevention of Hate Crimes. I also want to thank
10 Council Members Richards, Deutsch and Levine and all
11 the co-sponsors for introducing these concepts in
12 combating hate that could be applied to
13 municipalities across the United States.

14 Mr. Chairman, unfortunately statistics don't lie.
15 Each year the FBI confirms that African Americans are
16 the number one targets of race based hate in the
17 United States and that Jews by far are the number one
18 target of religion based hate. Add that to the 24/7
19 bigotry on line and the specific recent massacres
20 both in Pittsburgh and in South Carolina and Texas in
21 those respective houses of prayer, our nation,
22 particularly minority communities have reason to be
23 deeply concerned. As New York City, the gateway of
24 our nation, home to every race, creed, color and
25 nationality, that fear punctuated with the recent

2 hate crimes targeting our communities proves the
3 needs for these initiatives being considered by the
4 New York City Council. Unfortunately, the tendency
5 after the headlines from tragedies such as in
6 Pittsburgh and South Carolina and the synagogue
7 murders in Pittsburgh fade from our front pages, it
8 is to lapse back to inaction bordering on apathy.
9 New Yorkers and their leaders cannot allow that to
10 happen. Just last week, the Simon Wiesenthal Center
11 proudly stood alongside interfaith clergy with
12 leaders from the Jewish, Christian and Muslim
13 communities as New York City Assembly Member Walter
14 Mosely and New Jersey Assembly Member Gordon Johnson
15 announced that they will work together to introduce
16 legislation that will recognize all houses of worship
17 as a sacred grounds in the eyes of the law
18 dramatically increasing the penalties for individuals
19 caught carrying unlicensed weapons in or near those
20 facilities while also ensuring that anyone committing
21 a hate crime in a house of worship with multiple
22 felony counts attached to it would be mandated to
23 serve their sentences consecutively and not
24 concurrently. Obviously legislation alone is not a
25 cure all for hate but with such initiatives we will

2 at least have the necessary tools to start fighting
3 back. As was reported, the digital footprint of hate
4 that the shooter in Pittsburgh left was enormous.
5 Unfortunately he is not the only one spewing such
6 venom and he is unlikely to be the last person to
7 embrace an act of genocidal hate and anti-Semitism.
8 The Simon Wiesenthal Center's digital terrorism hate
9 project has developed and begun to deploy digital
10 hate workshops for high school and middle school
11 students empowering our young people to identify and
12 deal with the tsunami of online hate speech. It is
13 up to us adults, a consortium of concerned citizens,
14 clergy, police, elected officials and social media
15 giants to work together to thwart this new and
16 growing source of hate and violence.

17 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Keep going.

18 MICHAEL COHEN: Thank you, in this spirit
19 we applaud the Council for its actions today. There
20 is no substitute for a government sponsored entity
21 that can help coordinate faster and more effective
22 responses to hate and better empower all segments of
23 New York City's unparalleled diverse population. We
24 urge the Committee and the City Council to support
25 both of these endeavors and the Simon Wiesenthal

2 Center stands ready to help wherever possible. Thank
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you so much
5 for your testimony and is there anything else we
6 could be doing outside of these pieces of legislation
7 and this is for anyone on the panel that you believe
8 would make houses of worship, synagogues, mosques,
9 churches, wherever folks worship at safer. If
10 there's any other recommendations you have, anyone on
11 the panel? Or an LGBT community too, transgender
12 community? Any, you can answer that question.
13 That's a question. All right, any,

14 [Laughter]

15 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: If there's
16 nothing, so these pieces of legislation are fine. Is
17 there anything we're missing?

18 CHELSEA GOLDINGER: I would speak on one
19 thing since we do have the Senator in the room. I
20 know we are very interested on the state level in
21 having better hate crimes reporting data. To our
22 knowledge that doesn't exist.

23 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay.

24 CHELSEA GOLDINGER: So food for thought
25 for you.

2 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And you feel the
3 NYPD has been dealing adequately with the community
4 based on your interactions with the people from your
5 community?

6 CHELSEA GOLDINGER: We have, it's
7 interesting that there is also a representative of
8 course in the Human Rights Commission and we do have
9 a really fantastic and robust relationship.

10 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Great.

11 CHELSEA GOLDINGER: They do a lot of
12 educational and awareness work with us directly. I
13 would say, you know, we sit on the Task Force with
14 the NYPD to deal in LGBTQ issues. I'm actually our
15 representative on that Task Force. I think the
16 biggest challenge is that, it's probably the same
17 with any of these communities, it's just that actual
18 comfort level with engaging governments. I think
19 again if there's any way to figure out a different
20 reporting mechanism that's not directly to the
21 police, I think that goes a huge way and alleviates
22 people's ability to come forward.

23 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And Mr. Cohen, let
24 me ask you a question. So I just did a meeting with
25 probably about 20 leaders in my particular district

2 from different synagogues and there's sort of a
3 little tension between the question of should we
4 armed or should we not be armed. What are your
5 thoughts I think when it comes to protecting
6 synagogues? Has your organization taken a stance?
7 Do you believe the NYPD's recommendation of using
8 crime prevention officers is the right way to go and
9 I know this is a sensitive topic. It's very hard,
10 many layers to it but is there any specific thing you
11 think we could do to strengthen houses of worship in
12 the City?

13 MICHAEL COHEN: Thank you for the
14 question and one thing I would say is what a lot of,
15 I know, synagogues are doing and I assume other
16 houses of worship also, is having training for their
17 congregants to be able to make sure that they
18 themselves could help, it's monitor and watch the
19 doors and train up how they can monitor for exits and
20 different entrances and who's coming in and out so
21 that first of all any congregant of their own house
22 of worship is going to have a much better sense of
23 who's coming in and out of their own synagogue or
24 whatever their house of worship and know who belongs
25 and who doesn't belong and I think those kinds of

2 training are things that can definitely be expanded
3 and are obviously a cost effective way of making sure
4 that there is constant monitoring of entrances and
5 protection. Obviously anything that could protect
6 our house of worship is going to be something that
7 we'd want to look into and see where that level of
8 comfort is and budgetary aspects are but we'd love to
9 work with you on any of those kinds of things and
10 whatever we can do to help.

11 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. All
12 righty, thank you all for your testimony. Oh, did
13 you have a, no you're good. Okay, all right, thank
14 you all for your testimony. On to our last panel
15 now. All righty, Audesa Ray from New York City Anti-
16 violence Project, Brandon Terrill Hicks representing
17 National Election Network. Last call, anyone else
18 wish to testify? All right, seeing none, okay, thank
19 you. You may begin.

20 BRANDON HICKS: Good afternoon, my name
21 is Brandon Hicks. I'm the national organizer with
22 National Election Network. National Election Network
23 fully supports the two pieces of legislation that the
24 Committee has put forward. National Election Network
25 is a national civil rights organization founded in

2 1991 by Reverend Al Sharpton. In May our crisis
3 director, Reverend Kevin McCall got a phone call
4 about a noose hanging on a construction site in
5 Queens and this was the second incident that
6 happened. A construction site in Manhattan had
7 previously reported having a poster with a person
8 being lynched on the poster. We take these issues
9 very seriously and we think that creating this Office
10 will help our crisis director in his efforts to
11 really tackle hate crimes in the City. As you know,
12 hate crimes are on the rise in the nation. In the
13 City there have been 34 anti-Black hate crimes
14 reported this year and the City's on track to have
15 more hate crimes reported this year than we did last
16 year and we actually had 325 reported. The FBI has
17 said that groups like the Proud Boys are on the rise
18 because they haven't drawn correlation between
19 Trump's hateful rhetoric and instances of hate but we
20 can draw those conclusions ourselves. In Kentucky,
21 the instances of anti-Black hatred with two people
22 getting shot in the parking lot of a Kroger, they all
23 have our members across the country really alarmed
24 and wanting cities to take action like you all have
25 proposed so again, we are, I don't want to rehash

2 everything that's been said today but we are in full
3 support of these two pieces of legislation and we
4 want to let you know that we're here to support you
5 in any way we can.

6 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you so much
7 for your testimony.

8 BRANDON HICKS: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Let the Reverend
10 know I said hello and Reverend McCall who knew me
11 when I had more hair but thank you so much for your
12 testimony today.

13 BRANDON HICKS: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: All right, we're
15 gonna begin to close out. I want to thank everyone
16 for coming out today and having a very important
17 conversation, I think a necessary conversation for
18 this City in a time where we once again continuously
19 see the rise of hate crimes happening across all
20 categories in our City and race and religions and we
21 need to make sure that we continue to send a very
22 strong message to those who would perpetuate hate
23 crimes that we have zero tolerance in our City for
24 that and the way to combat that is for all of us to
25 continue to stand together from all backgrounds,

2 whether we're immigrants, whether we're Black, White,
3 whether we're Jewish, whether we're Muslim and the
4 more we stand together, the more I believe we'll
5 start to see those numbers decrease. If they come
6 for one of us at night, they'll come for the other in
7 the morning. If they come for, and they have come
8 for a church, they have come for a mosque, they have
9 come for a synagogue and it's incumbent that we stand
10 against anyone who would break down who we are as a
11 nation so thank you for coming out. I want to thank
12 my senior legislative counsel, Dan Uateus [phonetic]
13 for his work and my senior policy analyst, Casey
14 Addison for their work in getting us through today
15 and now it is 4:16 and this hearing is now closed.
16 Thank you. [gavel]

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 4, 2018